

---

THURSDAY, 1 DECEMBER 2016

---

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The SPEAKER: Please be seated.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, this is a query, it is very hot here today and in terms of blood pressure and whatever and I think it is a bit unfair, is there no way - we have fans in our offices on the fifth floor and the fourth if they can maybe go and get the portable fans. Please, otherwise I have to leave and go to a doctor, because I have high blood pressure. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Lentit, thank you. If I could firstly just greet all the members, good morning, guests in the gallery. There is a problem, a concern with the air-con in this building. We have spoken to the building manager. The technicians are on their way. The challenge is that the switches I believe are inside the Chamber that we are in which makes it difficult for them to work while the session is in progress. So if there is any work to be done it will be done in the lunch-break.

I hear your requests around fans from the fourth and fifth floor. It will provide a logistical challenge, but I am certain I could ask the administration to see if they could make a plan to deal with that so that we could assist you in some way.

It is our last day. It is very hot in here, so I am going to be appealing for co-operation. Let us try and move as swiftly as we can through the programme and hon member Mr Lentit if you do feel the need to leave you can just give me a signal and we understand your dilemma. Thank you.

Alright, if we could just settle down, I would like to call the House to order and ask the Secretary to read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Du Toit Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Madam Speaker, due to the changing pressures placed on the Western Cape Government to deliver services to our people, most notably as a result of the National Government's mismanagement of public funds, it is imperative that we reconsider our budget and reallocate funds to where they are most needed. In this way, we serve the people of the Western Cape as best we can with the very little that we have.

The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport's main appropriation is at R736 184 000 and the adjusted appropriation sees our budget decrease by R5 712 000. Despite the difficult economic environment in which we find ourselves, the adjustment of these funds will indeed assist the Western Cape Government in our mission to encourage excellence and inclusiveness in sport and culture through the effective, efficient and sustainable use of our resources. In moving to excellence we will and do create conditions for access and mass participation, talent identification and skills development ...

[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Onthou net, Max is die nuwe Voorsitter. Onthou dit. Hy is 'n nuweling daar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just remember, Max is the new Chairperson. Remember that. He is a newcomer there.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...which essentially creates an enabling environment for all who call the Western Cape home. Due to the National Government's inadequate planning, the budget of each provincial sport Department was cut by 10%, in our case, R9 234 000 to fund the National Sport Training Centre in Bloemfontein, which ironically is home to the National Minister of Sport. Therefore, the Department's Programme 4... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: [Onduidelik] in Bloemfontein. Ons is in die Wes-Kaap.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible] in Bloemfontein. We are in the Western Cape.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...Sport and Recreation has been the hardest hit as it decreased with a net effect of R5 832 000. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Order members, sorry Minister, if you do not mind taking your seat. Interjections are allowed but constant heckling and engaging and drowning out the speaker is completely inappropriate so I am appealing to both sides of the House. Afford the Minister to continue her speech. You may proceed Minister.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, just the relevance... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, as the Deputy Chief Whip I would accept you to set the tone please, thank you.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes, absolutely!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the relevance?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: However, we have increased our own revenue by R1.5 million generated by provincial museums' entrance fees and increased transfer payments to affiliated museums financed from the revenue generated.

In the face of the budget cuts to our Department, there is no doubt in my mind that our dedicated officials will continue to contribute to our vision of a socially inclusive, creative, active and connected Western Cape. I say this with confidence as we have Shaun Julie, our Director of Strategic and Operational Management Support, who recently was awarded a silver medal in the category of Best Public Service Leader in the Western Cape.

I implore our ANC members to engage with their national counterparts on the dire budget pressures under which the Western Cape Government must deliver, but more importantly to alert them to the fact that the people of the Western Cape are at the shorter end of the stick... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...and bearing the most brunt. For far too long has sport and cultural affairs been politicised, it is now time for us to join hands to take our beautiful country forward. While other departments are building houses, schools and infrastructure, we are tasked with building the nation. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi-mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good!]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mitchell. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports' main appropriation is at R736 184 000 and the adjusted appropriation sees the budget decrease by R5 712 000. As Minister Marais mentioned, the National ANC Government's mismanagement of public funds has a profound detrimental effect on the... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I see you are starting on a very wrong footing.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...prosperity of the Western Cape's athletes and local talent. If public funds were used for the intended purposes of sports development and promotion across the country and not pocketed for personal gain, we can only imagine how many Wade van Niekerks and Taliep Petersens would emerge from the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Through the DCAS programmes and projects in our communities we are made aware of the talent in the Western Cape. There are viable alternates based on positive youth development through sports and cultural affairs to reduce the social ills plaguing our society.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: [Onduidelik.] Julle kan nie eers daai doen nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] You cannot even to that.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: DCAS plays a fundamental role in strengthening the moral fibre which has been torn apart by racial, cultural, linguistic and political divides. Their programmes bring hope and a will to succeed and rise above all odds to not only better oneself but to improve the situation of the family and in turn the community as a whole. Although the budget was cut the Department will continue to re-ignite hope, pride, reconciliation, tolerance, respect and most importantly unity. [Interjections.]

We are forced to do with less resources as a result of careless spending as well as wasteful expenditure... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...by the National ANC Government. If funds that were meant to be utilised for service delivery did not end up in the comrades' pockets there would be enough financial resources to create opportunities for every citizen in the Western Cape. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You know what your problem is...

Mr D G MITCHELL: Instead monies are lost and the Western Cape receives less funds in the end. It seems to be an ANC trend because in the

municipalities governed by the ANC or one from the ANC in the recent elections, sporting facilities are poorly or not maintained at all. Cultural programmes are non-existent or not properly managed.

Madam Speaker, in conclusion... [Interjections.] ...I thank the Department under the stewardship of Minister Anroux Marais for her continued commitment to the sport and cultural loving people of the Western Cape, especially the youth who continue to benefit from the many sporting opportunities the Department makes available. The DA supports Vote 13: Cultural Affairs and Sports.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Mitchell. Before we proceed, members, can I call you to order please. Rule 39 says: "A member may not interrupt another member who is speaking except to call attention to a point of order or a question of privilege." Rule 38 says: "A member may not converse aloud..."

Now if I can hear your conversation while someone is speaking then it is clearly too loud so I am appealing to every single member, let us follow our Rules and let us get on with the important business of the day. I see the hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you Madam Speaker. On 25 November 2016

National Government launched 16 Days of Activism against Women and Children Abuse. This campaign is in line with the Moral Regeneration Movement, which is aimed at encouraging people to recommit to efforts of building communities grounded on positive values and rededicate to build a caring society in pursuit of creating lasting peace and prosperity in the country. During this campaign greater efforts must be made to popularise the Charter of Positive Values.

This Department must ensure that constitutional provisions inform its core functions and budget allocations. Section 81 of the Constitution of the Western Cape provides for the promotion of respect for the rights of cultural, religious and linguistic communities in the province.

Further the Western Cape Language Committee is mandated to amongst others, actively promote the principle of multilingualism; and actively promote the development of previously marginalised indigenous languages. The Western Cape Cultural Commission is mandated to promote cultural tolerance by running cultural awareness programmes.

This is instructive enough for this Department to ensure that more is done in this front, but what we have seen over the years that this Department suffered mostly when it comes to budget allocation both in the main and adjustment estimates budget cycles. This is done at the backdrop of the dying need out there to save our young people from the social ills affecting them. Our society is facing ever challenging erosion of cultural values and intolerance

between and amongst the divest communities. Daily we see and read about how learners from historically white Model C schools in this province complain about humiliation they suffer because of the colour of their skin and use of indigenous language.

These are some of the schools who were affected; like San Souci High School and Wynberg High School; to name just a few. This Department has been quiet and done nothing whereas the crisis squarely falls under its core mandate.

However, poor farm dwellers and workers are subjected to racial abuse by farm owners. How domestic workers, service station labourers who earn meagre wages are the constant victims of racial abuse and assault by their employers? However, ordinary citizens in the public spaces like shopping malls are ridiculed and sometimes assaulted as the result of the racial stereotypes.

We cannot leave these matters in the hands of the police and the judicial system alone. This Department and the relevant entities must step up and join the efforts towards eradication of the so called “Berlin Wall” within our fragile society. This is a ticking bomb and this Department cannot be a bystander like they are doing currently.

This Budget Adjustment Estimate does not recognise these challenges and the role that supposedly should be played by this Department. The R5.7 million

could be effectively used to bridge the social distance between communities, including creating platforms for social dialogue amongst citizens to foster unity and cohesion.

We remain critical of the way in which sport and recreation programmes are treated. This programme at the centre of mobilising young people to sport and cultural activities is away from alcohol and drug, substance abuse and gangsterism. It is through this programme that young people's potential to excellence is discovered.

The R5.8 million reduced from sport and recreation does not sit well with me because it is through school sport and culture that young people can be nurtured. Equally the standard of school infrastructures in terms of quality playing grounds and proper multi-purpose school halls is a matter of concern to me, including the recruitment of qualified coaches and support staff to each and public school. Overall this Adjustment Budget, this Adjustment Estimate is failing to meet the dire needs and expectations of citizens in the sports and cultural fraternity.

We have been taught all along that the effects of late filling of posts will not affect the critical posts. However, in this Department the Directorate of Enterprise Content, Nomaza Dingai who left the Department for National last year, has still not been refilled and these people under that Department are left without leadership. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She says she is building communities.

Ms P MAKELENI: We see on a daily basis people, young people resigning in this Department and this is among the reasons that they have given is the lack of promotion. This points out the same thing that people are overworked yet they do not feel appreciated. [Interjection.] When there are vacancies they are not considered. Instead positions are frozen. Young people will not settle for any exploitation. They will leave because this is not fair to them.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gee nie om nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They do not care.]

Ms P MAKELENI: The Department is rolling over the R5.7 million. I find it hard to swallow this as there are so many things that they could have done...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni can you please take your seat? Hon member Mr Dyantyi, if I may address you. You are entitled to an opinion which you do not necessarily have to share with the House. Your interjections are allowed but when they drown out your very own speaker it actually becomes a problem so I am appealing to you to cooperate and allow us to get on with the business of the day. Thank you. Hon member Ms Makeleni, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

No there - sorry hon member Mr Tyatyam, if I may address you. There is one

speaker on the speaker's list and it is the hon member Ms Makeleni. It does not say Makeleni and Dyantyi. So if I could call you to order. Please afford your member an opportunity to speak. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you Madam Speaker. The R5.7 million that has been rolled over, I find it very difficult to swallow and there are a lot of things that this Department could have done, for example... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms P MAKELENI: ...there are only 51 cultural organisations in the province, whereas there were hundreds of applications that were made to the Department and they can only assist 51. This R5.7 million could have assisted there. This province has four sports focused schools and one of them is the George High School, which we all know when we went to do our oversight the situation of that school is not the same as the one in the City of Cape Town. This money could have been used to improve the lives of the students there. They have been crying and how long must the children in the rural areas complain in order for them to be heard by the Department?

The Province is talking about the Game-Changer which is the MOD Centre. In 2014 we were told that there are only 181 out of 1400 schools and this money could have been used to build another MOD Centre, yet they decided to roll over the money. Last year it was reported that there are only 114

MOD Centres and this year still the same report. There is no improvement of the MOD Centres that are performing to the expected level and in fact when I have done my own oversight all the ones that I have been to, there is no exceptional level there. Maybe their level is too low for my liking. In fact when receiving the Annual Report this Department could not give a proper report on the school Game-Changer and we are still waiting for that report to come to the Committee to date.

We have also as the Committee requested that the Western Cape Province Sports Confederation must give the financial report and this is the second year we are waiting for that report of which most of the money of this Department goes to this federation for implementation and how do you know that you are getting the value for money when this federation does not come and account for the money that has been used? I wonder what could they do there.

The Sports Councils like the one in Khayelitsha has been requesting money from this federation and they are not getting any joy and that money is being rolled over.

The Department dumped money to the Conservation Management Plan for Early Cape Farmsteads, which was not budgeted for, but for some reason the Department see it necessary to prioritise it and this is the opportunity of course to everything else that needs money in this Department. There are a few programmes that deal with cultural interaction. We live in a province

that is seriously segregated and the Department is to take cultural diversity and connectedness seriously. In fact to date we are still waiting for [Inaudible.] This province does not seem to be interested in putting one in place and yet the cultural and the traditional leaders are complaining all the time and we still see fit that we should roll over money to the next year.

DCAS is facing millions of rands for legal fees. The Heritage Commission presented this and they said that there is no money to pay for these legal fees and yet it was not budgeted for and still we feel it necessary that we must roll over money. I wonder how long must we wait for these things to be done, Madam Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No he is fine, he is not speaking today.

The SPEAKER: Ja, I am waiting for the hon member Mr Dugmore to take his seat. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I said the ACDA is not speaking today. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: On that point I recognise the ACDP, the hon member Mr

Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] You know the ANC is notorious for misleading the public. The important thing is everybody knows it is because of the mismanagement of National Government that departments must cut down. Those are the facts. [Interjections.] Those are the facts. You see, you come here and you criticise and all the other provinces you are governing have irregular expenditure that is increasing all the time. Instead of coming... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...you have a Department that has an important role in communities by unifying people. They are doing splendid work when it comes to sport. Libraries we heard about, youngsters flocking to libraries, reading the books, instead of complementing the Department and giving suggestions how they can run the Department better you come and you talk all about everything else besides the budget... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So the ACDP supports the budget. Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please members. Order

please members. Hon member Ms Makeleni and hon member Mr Christians, if I could call you to order please members. We are presiding over... [Interjections.] Order! We are presiding over votes and this is not the time to scream and shout at each other. We will maintain the dignity and decorum of this House so please it is very difficult if everyone is heckling at the same time. It is hot, we complain about the heat. It is a long day, yet we have time to do all this mudslinging and at the same time, hon member Mr Dyantyi, the table manages the time. I do not mind if you want to be the timekeeper but please do it quietly, because the Table is in charge of the time and let us get on with this so we can get through the affairs of the day. I recognise the honourable, the Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. †In die afwesigheid van agbare Ricardo Mackenzie wil ek net vir hom sê baie dankie vir sy rol as Voorsitter wat hy die afgelope jaar gespeel het. Dan welkom aan agbare Lennit Max. Ek glo ons gaan 'n goeie verhouding hê en dat sy oorsigrol baie in detail sal wees.

Dankie aan elke komiteelid vir die oorsig en dat julle ons altyd op ons tone gehou het. Dan baie welkom aan Cecilia Sani, wat vandag by die Departement aansluit as die Direkteur vir Biblioteekdienste.

Dan aan elke lid baie dankie vir julle bydrae met vandag se aansuiweringsbegrotingsdebat en dan wil ek net sê,

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[In the absence of hon Ricardo MacKenzie I want to thank him for his role as Chairman that he has filled over the past year. Then, welcome to hon Lennit Max. I believe we will have a good relationship and that his oversight role will be very detailed.

Thank you to every Committee member for the oversight and that you kept us on our toes. Then welcome to Cecilia Sani, who joins the Department today as the Director of Library Services.

To every member, thank you for your contribution in today's Budget Appropriation debate and then I just want to say,] †clearly hon member Ms Makeleni does not understand the financial situation. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Really? No, that is not true.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: But I am very happy... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: I am very happy to note that she agrees... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: But I am very happy to note that she agrees that we are *Better Together*. [Interjections.] Let us rather spread unity than division and then about our MOD Centres, we would love to increase the MOD Centres but with a cut budget due to the national mismanagement we are running thin on funds for this. [Interjections.] I thank you so much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Marais. That concludes the debate on this vote. [Interjection.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: Thank you Secretary. I recognise the Minister, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker; Madam Premier; the Leader of the Opposition; our Cabinet

colleagues and members of the House.

We have increased the cost of employment budgets, the compensation of employment budget from R189 million to R196 million by shifting money from subsidies to Opscap and this is the result of the 7.5% salary increase when we budgeted for only 5.5%. We also allocated our revenue retention, which is additional to our allocation and we allocated it as follows and the total amount of this revenue retention is R20.173 million. We gave R3.4 million to our project, the Sonskynvallei Project, which is in Mossel Bay. This will contribute to our SCCCA, the Southern Cape Coastal Condensation Allowance, and we allocated R900 000 to Beaufort West and when I went to Beaufort West one of the challenges that was raised by people of Beaufort West, particularly very old people who are living in the houses that are old and these people understand that they will not benefit again, they pleaded with me to find a solution because they are living in houses where toilets were built far away from their houses; I then agreed that I will make a plan and this R900 000 goes towards the first phase of making sure that we are bringing those toilets closer to their homes and we are doing the same in Gugulethu. R1.642 million will also go towards that. Again it is an old problem in old Gugulethu houses, we are going to bring toilets of those old elderly people closer to their homes.

We are going to give R916 000 to Prince Albert Municipality for bulk infrastructure. Because of the two Ministers next to me who are really killing me, because the Municipal Infrastructure Grant is not enough for many

municipalities, from time to time we use our discretionary funding to assist municipalities so R916 000 will go to Prince Albert towards bulk and also R13.315 million will go to Cederberg for the same function which is bulk infrastructure.

We are shifting R3 million to the upgrading of our old rental stock. I think it is one of the issues that I raised before that we have to make sure that our rental stock is self-sustainable so that people are able to pay, so that we can maintain the rental accommodation. R3.78 million is shifted to pay for rates and taxes and a further R817 000 towards municipal services.

Now we are busy transferring land to municipalities and I think once we complete this process of land transfers we will be able to get away from paying for the rates that are mentioned here. We are shifting R1.5 million from SHRA and this is because we anticipated tenders to come in very high. Unfortunately they came lower and the research projects on social housing that we do in conjunction with SHRA will be completed within the funding already transferred to SHRA.

R750 000 is allocated to the African Centre for Cities of the University of Cape Town in terms of the research partnership agreement and because of our strong emphasis again on women and youth empowerment, we sponsored the annual general meeting of South African Women in Construction which is a group of women that we are in partnership with. We are working very hard, particularly in this province to assist SAWIC because we see them as a very

important partner in our housing construction and therefore we are working together with them to make sure that they are properly empowered, and we also co-sponsored the Ikamva Investment Holdings with the Department of Economic Affairs that is in Agriculture for R100 000.

So in a nutshell Madam Speaker, those are the shifts within the Department.

I thank you.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Madikizela. I recognise the hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The Department of Human Settlements Western Cape under the DA Government is committed to accelerating service delivery, whilst promoting social cohesion through the development of integrated and sustainable human settlements and that would allow communities to access social and economic opportunities.

Its aim is to provide settlements that offer basic and socio-economic services. The integrated human settlements include well located land release, timeous transfer of title deeds and implementation of the catalytic projects which are projects located close to the areas of economic activity.

A major challenge for the Western Cape and the rest of South Africa is

satisfying the ever increasing demand for housing opportunities. Under the stewardship of Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela we have seen the Department achieve a number of successes in three priority areas by directing more resources to the upgrading of informal settlements increasing affordable GAP housing and prioritising housing allocation to the most deserving.

In these adjustment budgets bulk services is a priority to the Department and it is what the Standing Committee have been communicating to the Department that that has to be prioritised because it unlocks the housing opportunities. It is for this reason that we welcome the adjustment budget in the Western Cape for Human Settlements.

The whole of Government and the whole of society approach assured that we shift away from merely building houses but we create communities that we can be proud of. We have increased the COE budget to R196 million by shifting money from subsidies to Opscap and I am not going to repeat everything that the Minister have said because you already have that and you have the blue books also to see that. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry, oversight is on this side.

Ms L M MASEKO: All I have to say is that I want to thank the Minister for this visionary leadership and I am confident that again with this adjustment budget together with his team they will continue implementing a sterling job of creating housing opportunities for all deserving beneficiaries in the

Western Cape.

In conclusion, Madam Speaker, we have to acknowledge that our country is facing a national leadership crisis under the ANC Government and this largely impacts on the most vulnerable in our communities and broader society. The reality is that South Africa is operating under a constrained economic outlook. Therefore it does not help that the ANC Government continues to mismanage and waste public money that should have benefited the most vulnerable in our communities.

†'n AGB LID: Vertel hulle!

[An HON MEMBER: Tell them!]

Ms L M MASEKO: Today we just saw in the papers, a probe into PRASA's R24 billion in projects. The entity has lost nearly R14 billion irregular expenditure. How could one entity in one year have R14 billion in irregular expenditure?

According to the AG's report a total of R42.3 billion has been lost through irregular expenditure ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...by National Government departments and entities. [Interjections.] The cherry on the top is the Water and Sanitation Department

that is particularly responsible... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...to restore the dignity of our communities. They incurred an irregular expenditure of R782.7 million in 2015/16 resulting in an accumulated figure of R2.5 billion. These are funds that could have built hundreds of houses, schools, hospitals etcetera. I will not even go to the Nkandla and the Guptas.

In conclusion, Madam Speaker, allow me to take this opportunity to thank the Department of Human Settlements in the Western Cape. I look forward to seeing and being part of all the projects in this Department under the leadership of Minister Madikizela, and I would appreciate also to see that they are implementing during the next few months the projects of the bulk services that are really a thorny issue for the Opposition and I know that we will be delivering to make sure that they keep quiet for a change.

I also want to thank the members of the Standing Committee for the role they play in helping share the direction in the Department through our oversight duties.

Madam Speaker, the DA supports the Budget Appropriation Bill for Vote 8.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Freedom Charter states, “There shall be housing, security and comfort.” It is good to note these when we speak about our budget.

These aspirations were later codified in the South African Constitution which further provides for:

- Everyone has the right to access to adequate housing.
- The State must take reasonable legislative and other measures, within its available resources, to achieve progressive realisation of this right.
- No one may be evicted from their home or have their home demolished, without an order of court made after considering all the relevant circumstances. No legislation may permit arbitrary evictions.

It is therefore important to note that the issue of the right to adequate decent housing is one of the fundamental and constitutional rights that this Government must strive to fulfil. The Western Cape Government has that responsibility to provide shelter in terms of the abovementioned constitutional provisions; not to use Human Settlement Department in order to mobilise support from the African communities and coloured communities, but to execute their responsibility to provide housing for all.

Further, there is a causal link between what is reflected in the Annual

Reports and the Adjusted Estimates of the Provincial Expenditure. However, this Government must concede that since 2009, it has failed dismally to provide adequate and decent housing for all deserving citizens of this province. Instead, in many cases, this Government had to be forced through mass protests and court rulings to build and provide houses for the poor and the working class communities.

The informal settlements have grown under the DA-led administration. This includes many displaced communities for a variety of reasons to temporary relocation areas and incremental development areas. These underdeveloped areas end up being densely populated permanent residences with no proper infrastructure and no proper basic services, namely dignified sanitation and sewerage system, road infrastructure or lighting. I think I am passing every day towards Mfuleni, which is exactly this experience.

Is it any wonder that Stats South Africa found this province to have the highest, hon Minister Madikizela, number of bucket toilets, and that this figure is growing? This adjusted estimate should have prioritised these poor areas and provided improved and much more humane services.

According to the research commissioned by Ndifunda Ukwazi, it found in theory: “The Western Cape Province and the City of Cape Town’s Spatial Development Frameworks seeks to address the exclusion of black, coloured and Indian people from Cape Town’s CBD and hubs of economic activity. In contrast and in reality, the distribution of affordable housing in

post-apartheid Cape Town is far away from the City Centre with mostly white and affluent neighbouring suburbs. Developments such as Pelican Park, Happy Valley, Blikkiesdorp, Wallacedene, Delft, and Atlantis are now home to thousands of poor and working class people.”

They are used as a dumping zone, in fact, for the poor. A case in point here is the recent Tafelberg site in Sea Point and Old Biscuit Mill in Woodstock. We call on this Department through adjusted estimates to find money and buy back that land on behalf of those families and not to allow private developers to evict them. In fact this Government collaborated with the white developers in Sea Point to bribe the people that are supposed to be returned to their land and this Government led by the Premier is actually spearheading that process of undermining land redistribution. [Interjections.]

Who can forget the residents of Wynberg who were threatened with forced removals to make way for the My CiTi bus routes? This Government does not value the constitutional rights of the poor people of the Western Cape.

This is the most important because the people out there must know if their taxpayers' money is spent wisely free from corruptive tendencies and illegalities. In fact it is corruption to use this Human Settlements in order to buy votes.

In the Annual Report session it was reported under Programme 1 that there was an under-expenditure to the amount of R4 million which was shifted to

Programmes 2; 3 and 4.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, sorry, there is a point of order, if you can take your seat please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you Madam Speaker, I raise on a point of order. I just want to point to the fact that the hon member Mr Magaxa made a very serious allegation in accusing this party of corruption. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the point of order? That is parliamentary. That is not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: If there is no empirical, verifiable proof.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Just give me a chance. [Interjections.] If there is no empirical proof... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, sorry... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...of corruption then it cannot be proved.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, your point of order is noted. If you could take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am still on my feet. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, I have noted your... [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: No but I - just a second... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo if I could just... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I do not want... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, before you proceed, if I could address you. What you are making is not a point of order and I cannot allow you to put forward an explanation at this stage. I will however go back to Hansard and review the content if it is so required. [Interjections.] If you could take your seat please. Thank you.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is becoming your culture honourable, to disturb me when I am speaking. It is for the second time for nothing, for a nonsensical issue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr B D KIVEDO: No, excuse me Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, sorry, if you could take your seat please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Hon member Mr Magaxa, it is not that I am disturbing you. [Laughter.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Okay so... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Definitely not!

The SPEAKER: Honourable... [Interjection.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: With due respect... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo!

Mr B D KIVEDO: With due respect, you give me reason to disrupt you. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Okay, members, if I could address you. A point of order should be raised on a procedural matter and we cannot now get lost in

frivolous points of order or spurious points of order. Similarly we must not cast aspersions on a member's dignity in terms of how we talk to each other so let us keep it honourable and let us maintain the decorum of this House. You may proceed, hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is bad that in these adjusted estimates it is decreasing by a further R6 million. What I do not see though is how can the R1 million shifted to Programme 2 be classified as over-expenditure in that programme; whereas at the same time, it is not reflected in these adjustment estimates.

Perhaps more needs to be explained: Why in Sub-Programme 4.2, Housing Properties Maintenance, there are two amounts of R220 000 and R941 000 earmarked in different columns for municipal services due to the slower than anticipated transfer of properties to the City of Cape Town? What are these properties and where are they?

An additional amount of R1.8 million is earmarked for rates and taxes due to slower than anticipated transfer of properties to the City of Cape Town. What is this and why? It is wrong to allocate R1.9 million for the filling of professional posts that are vacant. This is the root cause of rollovers that we have witnessed in the past.

It is equally wrong to spend R750 000 on research projects which are omitted in the main budget. Currently the Department is defending a lawsuit amounting to R87.2 million. Where is this money going to come from? The

adjusted estimates do not provide clear clarity or direction in this regard.

This unexplained expenditure is susceptible to misuse of tax payers' money and threatens the ability of this Department to provide more affordable houses to the poor. We cannot sit back and condone such behaviour in terms of our mandate as elected representative of the people. It is our responsibility to ensure accountability is adhered to in a most transparent manner.

The Western Cape Housing Development Fund recorded material losses of R38.8 million which were written-off, and in addition to the impairment of R78.4 million that was incurred as a result of a provision for doubtful debts. This is a travesty of justice. The Executive Authority must take the blame and account for these losses.

Taking everything into account in terms of how this Department has misdirected public funding by focusing on non-core functions, this money could have easily build houses, schools, improve roads infrastructure and lighting in many poor and disadvantaged communities in this province. I am inclined to call for a forensic investigation into the spending patterns and prioritisation of projects and programmes in this Department.

Another serious matter that is supposed to be a frustrating process in this, the people who have been on the waiting list for more than 20 years in Somerset West are still on the waiting list, despite the fact that people who arrived in

that same community after them who have never been on the housing list, have been allocated housing by a housing committee that is dominated by DA people who are not even people who are supposed to qualify to be in the Housing Department. As a result masses of African people are not on the list and in fact are not even allocated houses and people... [Interjections.] ...and the Minister had an audacity to only respond to those two individuals who happen to stand up for the benefit of the community and included those two and left the masses of people who are left homeless who have been in that particular area precisely because they are not DA members. [Interjections.] I rest my case. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Sorry, are you done hon member Mr Magaxa? Are you finished?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the Minister. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Mr Christians.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, my apologies, hon member Mr Christians. You know there is such a call for... [Interjections.] Order please! Hon member Mr Christians you have a minute, thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Madam Speaker. The important thing is R3 million is going to upgrade rental stock. [Interjections.] Did these members ever walk there and see how proud those people are when the houses are upgraded? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I mean did they ever walk where there are no facilities, toilet facilities and this is what the budget is doing, bringing dignity back to the communities and that is what we must do. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am talking about... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: If you could take your seat please. Hon member Mr Magaxa, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, Madam Speaker. I wish you to rule on this one. Is it... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which rule?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Under which rule?

Mr K E MAGAXA: No-no-no... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, there is only one speaker.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I just want to address the Speaker just to assist. Is it acceptable for a member who never put a foot - let alone in joining us in our oversight work as Human Settlements... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: It is not a point of order, you are asking me to elicit an opinion on something that I am not familiar with because I do not have attendance registers or anything with me, but members, if I may, something else has crept in here now and it is around pronunciation. This can become very ugly because if any one person slips up with a word we are not all conversant fluently in English, Afrikaans, or isiXhosa, and there are many words that are said there that are not sounded out the way it should be and I do not think it is fair to laugh. You might want to in your head say “okay, it should not be ‘exacel’ (as pronounced), it should be ‘exactly’, but it is not for us to deliberate on, so if we could display some tolerance I would request your co-operation in that regard. You have a couple of seconds, I take it, Minister. Minister? [Laughter.] Hon member Mr Christians. Can you inform me? [Interjections.]

Sorry? [Interjection.] Thank you very much for your support. You have 30 seconds hon member Mr Christians. You may proceed, 30 seconds.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, what they forget, I sit on SCOPA. I engage with these departments and these Ministers on a regular basis so I know exactly if there is one person that can speak on all the departments, it is the SCOPA that can sit and speak about that. But I welcome it because it is going to bring relief to our people that do not have facilities at their homes. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Christians. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: ...ten seconds.

The SPEAKER: No, let me call you to order hon member Ms Davids, you were here yesterday and you will be here later during the day, so I am requesting your support. I see the honourable, the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, let me take the opportunity and thank the Chairperson of the Committee who is making sure that we are kept on our toes as a Department. I want to thank her for her leadership and I think you are correct, Madam Speaker, that the increasing demand is contributing to the challenges that we are facing. In fact if you look at the latest Community Survey that was presented by Stats SA recently of 2016, it clearly indicates that this Province

of the Western Cape grew by 1.7 million people in 13 years, between 2002 and 2015. Now that is Swaziland and Lesotho combined.

Now if you take that into cognisance you can clearly see that indeed the resources that we have will never be able to deal with the demands that we are facing and you are also correct that if we do not deal with the problems of bulk infrastructure we are running the risk of coming to a standstill because all our plans will not materialise.

You know every time hon member Mr Magaxa speaks, my heart just sinks. I do accept that he has got a limited understanding of this Department but we, in Standing Committee meetings, that is where we thoroughly explain some of the things that he raises here and I am not going to really respond to all the issues, but I think I will respond to one or two things that he has raised and I am very happy though. There is one thing that I am happy about, that he actually quoted the Constitution correctly, because the Constitution is very clear when it comes to housing that we must make sure that there is access and that is a word to underline, access. There is nowhere in the Constitution where it says we must provide free houses. That is the first thing and the second thing, he quoted it correctly when he said the Government must make sure that that is done within its available resources and at the current rate the resources will diminish under this ANC Government and if we continue in the way that the ANC is governing the resourcing that we have will continue to diminish and that will impact on us delivering on human settlements.

[Interjections.]

Now you spoke about Mfuleni as well. Mfuleni is the most concentrated development area in the City of Cape Town. There are about eight projects in Mfuleni currently happening at the same time and there are other projects that will be happening next to Mfuleni like your Forest Village that you are busy with, so the point that I am making here, you have raised the issue and mentioned Mfuleni about underdevelopment and yet Mfuleni is the most developing area. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The TRC that has been there for years.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The TRC, no, we do not build TRCs. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, Minister Madikizela, could you please speak through the Chair, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now again I would want to request the member to read the Community Survey Report of 2016, this year, because the fact that this province has the most buckets, I mean it is so far-fetched I do not even know what to say. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: It is not true.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is completely untrue. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now if again - here is another hypocrisy from... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Here is another hypocrisy from hon member Mr Magaxa; you know, he keeps on talking about where we are developing currently as this Government. His party have been in power for more than we have been, by the way, and I would be very happy if he can take me to one area - one, not many, one - that clearly indicates integrated development that you keep on preaching about. There is none. It does not exist. In fact the development that you are talking about that are right at the outskirts... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...were started by you.  
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You people dealt...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now if your definition of 'dealt' is... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, if you could take your seat please, Minister Madikizela. Hon member Mr Magaxa, you had an opportunity to speak. You should have utilised every single second of it, thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Ja, he must talk to me and so must you speak to me, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now on the issue of rates and taxes that are paid to the City and I think we have explained this several times at our Standing Committee meeting, the land that we own, we are responsible for paying rates and taxes and I think the member must understand that, but we took a decision to devolve that land to the City and of course we have done a lot in terms of doing that. Most of the pieces of land have been devolved to the City but not all of them and that is why we are still paying for those that we own because the process has not been as fast as we wanted it to, in anticipation for accreditation so we will be devolving the land to the City but you must pay for rates and taxes because we own that land and again you speak about the rollovers. This adjustment is about additional funding. I mean I do not know how this member reads the Appropriation Adjustments. There are no rollovers in this. We have not lost

any money. In fact through revenue retention we are bringing in more money than that we are now distributing to the municipalities that I spoke about.

Now you spoke of material losses for the housing fund and again we explained this and it is the lack of understanding that I spoke about. We spoke about this. We have old debtors, I mean these are people that have been paying for years, and we took a decision as Department, because these people are poor people by the way, they can no longer afford to pay. They were our debtors way before 1994 and after the introduction of the subsidies to people who are getting houses for free we took a decision and said: "Well if you can no longer afford to pay we will look at your debt, subsidise you so that we can write off your debt and you become the property owner and I cannot think of any right thinking person who can challenge that, because we are empowering the poor. We are saying you have been paying, it is enough, you can no longer afford to pay. We are writing off your debt so that you can become the property owner." That is what we are talking about here. I mean, so I do not understand.

Now lastly, Madam Speaker, I do agree with hon member Mr Magaxa on the last point that he raised. In fact that is exactly the point that we are dealing with now even though he tried to cast aspersions on me, the issue of making sure that we prioritise the right people on the waiting list is critical and I fully agree with him there, and this is exactly what we are doing. If we look at our three strategic goals where we are saying we need to prioritise the right people, we need to make sure that we upgrade informal settlements and

unlock the challenges that exist in affordable housing, we are actually saying that we must make sure that all municipalities have credible housing demand databases or waiting lists so that we can make sure that the people who have been waiting for years are the ones who are prioritised, and I would be very happy for him to work with me in that regard, because I want to make sure that we do exactly that. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will now read the 3<sup>rd</sup> Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I rise to speak to the Adjustment Estimated Appropriations Bill for 2016/2017, and today I dedicate this speech to a young boy called Noah Basson and all children and people living with autism in South Africa, and I emphasise South Africa. Not Western Cape, South Africa. I think we must do far more for everyone.

As with all other departments, my Department has had to execute its mandate

within an increasingly constrained economic environment. We have faced this challenge head-on, as our commitment to delivering quality services remains unchanged. We will always do that.

In this regard, this Budget Adjustment seeks to ensure that our citizens are always put first. So the amount to be appropriated by this Department is R2.4 million.

I have gone into detail before at the Committee meetings regarding the many other shifts made by the Department, and these are now a matter of public record, and I think we had incredible interaction with the whole Committee, and I did not see hon member Davids there with all the other members of the Committee, so I am a bit surprised that she is responding to this vote.

However, let me once again highlight the key shifts and adjustments made. One of the major shifts involves R1.157 million which was received for danger allowance from the re-allocation of the 2015/2016 Compensation of Employees savings. These funds were allocated, and increased the overall COE upper limits in line with the warning issued by Provincial Minister Meyer regarding the unsustainable state of the wage-bill, especially in light of its often adverse impact on service delivery spending. I think this is a point that I think we need to emphasise, because we have just seen how this impacts on service delivery.

My Department has requested legal opinion as well as guidance from

Department of Public Service Administration on the implementation of the Danger Allowance resolution that is in the Bargaining Council. We just do not understand it. It is so broad so we just want some clarity on that.

My bottom-line is a simple one, service delivery to the poor should always come first, and sometimes I wish we can go deliver service to Constantia also because no one is asking for services there. That is why the other major adjustment we made was the provision for vehicles to the value of R1.2 million, which was sourced from the 2015/2016 revenue retention. This will go towards our child care and protection services, and this will mean social workers will have more vehicles to go out into the communities, and render the service much more efficiently and effectively.

The other adjustments made are also in line with our efforts to improve efficiency and effectiveness. A notable shift in this regard was just over R6 million shifted from the Kensington Substance Abuse Centre, and re-allocated from what were once outsourced services to our own services, and I tell you it makes a massive, massive difference. This has enabled greater quality control and improved operations.

We have also continued to focus on improving the quality of services rendered to people with disabilities and people living with disabilities, especially intellectual disabilities. R367 000 was shifted from the non-compliant NGOs in other provincial programmes, and allocated to funding the training of NGOs and own staff on mental health issues, especially those

dealing with people living with intellectual disabilities. This will greatly improve our ability to render tracking, referral and supportive services. This is a very, very important service, for children living with disabilities and including the expansion of our residential care for this programme.

Ladies and gentlemen, hon members, this is what our shifts and adjustments should always be about: service delivery and continuous improvement. The Department has adopted a zero-tolerance approach to non-compliance, the waste and the underspending of funds both within the Department and amongst our over 2 000 funded NGOs, and I want to really make that point, that if NGOs are not compliant, unfortunately after we have tried everything to support them, we will stop funding them, †want daar kom mense net weg met moord. [because people there get away with murder.]

As we make these adjustments and shifts, I am constantly reminded that during the year ahead we will need to accommodate an approximately R40 million reduction in the Department's projected budget – R40 million. And I can tell you this will require a significant further internal reprioritisation to secure the Department's essential services. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As alluded to by the Minister, the Department of Social Development's main appropriation is at R1 964 438 billion, and the adjusted appropriation increased by R2.4 million. The DA

welcomes the R2.4 million adjustment appropriation allocated to mainly Programme 2: Social Welfare Services within the Department.

The Western Cape Government cares and acknowledges the work that this unit is doing within the Department. Key to the efforts of this Department has been the ‘whole of society approach’ adopted by the Minister, which involves building partnerships with the private sector, NPOs and individuals in our community. Our women, children and senior citizens are abused on a regular basis. When our women, children and senior citizens are abused then they need our social workers and community workers on the frontline to assist. These community workers and social workers are dedicated and committed and they render the service to these vulnerable groups within our communities.

Danger allowance can never be compensation for the risk that social and community workers endure on a daily basis in the line of their duties, however, I want to reiterate that they do their business with the commitment and the passion that they have. Many community and social workers are agents of change within our dysfunctional families. However, I call on the Minister and his Department to address those officials who still do a disservice to the clients that they serve.

It is services of this nature that are rendered by these kinds of officials that tarnish the image and reputation of the service unit, as people would normally generalise about unsavoury experiences.

Together with the Department of Health as well as the Department of Education and NGOs, the Department has realised the initiation of referral pathways for children and youth with disabilities. The project aims to improve the efficiency of services delivered to these children. We are confident that this initiative will go from strength to strength and reach more children in the Western Cape.

Services to older persons and persons with disabilities will continue to be provided by the Department. A number of funded and assisted facilities, residential cares as well as services centres will help in this regard.

I welcome the fact that NPOs are to be more strictly monitored in complying with their obligations they committed themselves to. I also wish to applaud the Department and the Minister that all NPOs who do not comply will not be treated on the same line, that there are different corrective actions in place to assist each and every NPO on their merit.

Madam Speaker, through you, I want to ask Minister Fritz to convey the sincere gratitude from the Standing Committee to his HOD, all social workers, community development workers, all officials in his Department, for the services that they render to our communities.

†Agb Speaker, laastens wil ek ook net hierdie boodskap laat aan die Opposisie, en hierdie is 'n boodskap van 'n voormalige Wes-Kaapse LUR genaamd Cecil Harradine, en ek haal, hy het gesê:

“Min mense weet hoeveel hulle moet weet om te weet hoe min hulle werklik weet.”

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Madam Speaker, finally I just want to leave this message to the Opposition, and this is a message from a former Western Cape MEC named Cecil Harradine, and I quote, he said:

“Few people know how much they have to know, to know how little they really know.”]

The DA supports Vote 7. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Botha. Order, please members. I see the hon member Davids.

†Me S W DAVIDS: Dis baie goed om niks te weet nie want dan leer jy darem iets, want as jy alles weet kan jy niks leer nie.

[Ms S W DAVIDS: It is good to know nothing, because then at least you learn something, because if you know everything you cannot learn anything.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Today, 1 December 2016, the World is commemorating

World Aids Day. We remember all men and women who are infected and affected and those who died in this epidemic. We acknowledge that many families have lost their loved ones, including children who were left as orphans. This has resulted in too many child headed households. As public representatives in this Parliament, we must ensure that vulnerable children are supported.

We must applaud the efforts undertaken by our National Government in the fight against HIV and AIDS. Our Deputy President Cyril Ramaphosa said:

“We are inspired by the many actions taken by South Africans ...”

The Western Cape is in South Africa, so we are speaking about South Africans:

“From all walks of life over many years to fight AIDS. Thanks to your efforts, we have the biggest HIV treatment programme in the world, with nearly 3.5 million people on life-saving ...” ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Premier, you had your chance yesterday. Leave me now to speak, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: "...we have the biggest HIV treatment programme ..."  
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, sorry. Can I address you? If you need to speak to the Premier, please do it through the Chair. Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker for that correction.

The SPEAKER: Guidance.

Ms S W DAVIDS: And guidance, thank you.

"Thanks to your efforts, we have the biggest HIV treatment programme in the world with nearly 3.5 million people on life-saving antiretrovirals."

We are moving South Africa forward. Amandla! It surprises me that the Social Services Welfare sub-programme is losing more than R6 million, whereas the administration is gaining more than a million Rand. More financial resources are needed there. This is the only programme which is the loser. I am particularly concerned about the shifting of funds for non-core functions such as:

- Payment of leave to the total amount of over a million Rand
- To fund the shortfalls of posts prioritised and filled amounting to over

R16 million;

- To fund CPI increases to outsourced services, property payments and security services amounting to more than R8.6 million.

We also do not see much support for youth at risk. While youth alcohol or drug abuse is on the increase and gangsterism is rife, we do not see increased efforts to fight this challenge. [Interjection.] This Department likes to play around with trimmings, but the real challenges of MOD centres are still hanging in limbo.

I want to say through you, Madam Speaker, to the MEC, that we know that social workers are very scarce in this province, but there is a lot of NGOs, MEC, that are doing that service, but they do not have funds. You are speaking in your Adjustment Budget about non-compliance of NGOs. I am challenging this Department to go and do a thorough investigation in all your regional offices, because they are assisted by NGOs, but those NGOs are not getting any funds from this Department, and there is one NGO in the Drakenstein, your Boland regional office, that is assisting at the courts and isiXhosa is their name, but they are not getting any funding.

They are assisting your social workers in your office also, but they must close down now at the end of this year, and they are working 24 hours a day, they are sitting at the courts the whole day and after court, they also have programmes with the children to get them off drug abuse and off alcohol abuse. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Davids. I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, we support Vote 7, we welcome the R300 000 that will go to train NGOs. That was one of the things that we dealt with at SCOPA and the Minister and his Department explained non-compliance, and we went through that. So they are putting money in training. We want to see that NGOs comply, otherwise you cannot give them money.

So that is one of the things that I am very happy to see, and I am also happy to see that more vehicles are going to be made available for workers and social workers. So that is the point. The point is you see where the money is needed and you then direct it in that direction.

I think we have a passionate Minister. You hear him. I called him Minister Nurse one day, because he was so involved in the Nurse case and so on, because he is passionate, he knows what he is doing. So I want to compliment him and his Department for the work well done. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon member Makeleni, it is unparliamentarily to tell someone who has a right to speak to sit down while he is speaking. I heard that, that is the sensitivity of the mic that I talk about. So let me request your co-operation please. I recognise the hon

Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I also just want to take the opportunity to firstly thank hon member Lorraine Botha as the Chair of the Committee, for a job well done. I have attended many of the Committee meetings and the Committee operates within a very good atmosphere. It is good to actually attend the Committee meetings. Of course in the House you see the complete opposite, because they all agree in the Committee and in the House – that is why I am quite amazed at it, and hon member Davids, I just want to say these issues were all discussed within the Committee and explained. Because you cannot expect us, like all these state employees ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if I could ask you to address the Chair please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, Madam Speaker - to get inflation related increases and then we do not try and give it over to NGOs. We really try as far as possible. Our NGO social workers you are talking about earn far less than our own social workers. They earn a fraction of what our people are earning, and those people are many a time seasoned social workers.

And so for the first time last year for instance, this year we could not do it, we gave them a 40% increase towards their salary. Again, there are NGOs and NGOs, and I really want to say there are people who really suffer and

dedicate their time. I want to say to this House we need to still go and get our own services to the level that we support and render services to a child who is traumatised, a child who needs trauma counselling, and I will not defend anyone who is not doing that. I think I am on record as doing that.

In fact, I must announce in this House that we are going to sit from around December, but specifically mid-January and we are going to really review all our funding to NGOs and the way in which Extended Public Works' money and programmes are given out. We have sensed that there is some kind of patronage involved, †wie se kind en wie se ma en wie se pa en wie se dogter, en jy kry sommer ouma ook op die program as jy nie mooi kyk nie. [whose child and whose mother and whose father and you even get grandmother on the programme if you don't watch carefully.] So we are going to review all of that and really look at that.

Lastly, I really want to say a sincere thanks, I do not know whether they are here, the HOD and his staff, his management team and every single staff member, be it the man who travelled all the way yesterday from Worcester, Mr Eland, to come and see Minister Winde to deal with the whole issue around farms; really dedicated people and people passionate about the job. I really want to pay tribute to them and say thank you very much for all the work that they are doing.

To the women who make the tea, we forget many a time the people who make the tea and who clean the place, † ons vergeet van die mense wat baie keer die

belangrikste werk doen. [we forget about the people who often do the most important work.] You will notice I did not mention the ANC anywhere, because there is nothing really left. I had a very good speech with hon member Davids, but last night I had the honour of attending a gathering of a whole lot of former ANC activists in the Western Cape, and they basically felt so left out. They launched the Ashley Kriel kind of bursary fund there last night, because our guys who died within the struggle are just completely forgotten by this ANC who sits here today in this House. [Interjections.]

So, it is an unfortunate situation, but I was there representing the Province, because not one of them was there. So it was good to represent the Province. They were all at Fidel Castro's memorial the other day, but no one would come to the youngster who died for our own struggle. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Order, please. Chief Whip, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: No, not on a point of order but with your indulgence, Madam Speaker, we are ahead of time, so I have spoken to the individual speakers and the MECs with regard to the votes after lunch. So, with the concurrence with my colleague on the other side of the aisle there, if we still maintain this time trend then we can at least fit in Health before lunch and possibly Education, if I can have his concurrence. I have spoken to the

speakers on the other side as well.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote. Before we proceed, may I ask we are now at the 4<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day, we have been assigned 45 minutes per debate, we are running ahead of time. Would you want to continue until as close to 13:00 as possible? So I take it the House is in concurrence with the point that the Chief Whip raised? So may we then proceed? I will as the Secretary to read the 4<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. I see the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon Premier, Speaker, members and colleagues.

A caring, capable government does its best to improve the citizens' lives. A capable government must also constantly evolve and adapt in order to provide its people with the best opportunities to get ahead in life. At the end of the day our purpose in government is to do our best to provide our people with a dignified life. I believe this Department continues to do excellent work in driving this mission, despite ongoing challenges including financial

constraints.

The Department's officials constantly visit our municipalities and as a result of these oversight visits, we have made some changes to our budgets, based on the realities on the ground.

In short, our budget's base-line has increased from approximately R218 million to approximately R239 million thanks to the assistance and support of Provincial Treasury. The increased amounts to R21 million. Initially we have prioritised towards achieving the desired impact needed by reducing Programme 1, and increasing Programmes 2 and 3.

The bulk of the shifts can be attributed as follows: R10 million has been allocated to assist in combatting the ongoing drought. We have seen in the past year that five municipalities in the Western Cape have been declared disaster areas and other areas are severely affected too.

We have received R5.5 million in additional funding to provide additional support to our municipalities and to strengthen governance in our councils. R1.5 million has been shifted between votes for the development of infrastructure at Goedverwacht in the Breede Valley Municipality. There has also been a reallocation for 2015/16 employee's compensation which was reallocated towards drought support in the amount of R3.8 million.

†Agb Speaker, ons bly bekommerd oor die impak van begrotingsbesnoeiings

op ons Departement oor die langtermyn en die effek daarvan op dienslewering. Nietemin is ons bly om vordering te sien regoor die provinsie.

Ek bedank graag Graham Paulse, die hoof van die Departement vir sy harde werk en elke persoon in die Departement vir die afgelope jaar se samewerking wat ons van hulle ontvang het. Hiermee lê ek die gewysigde begrotingsvoorstelle voor aan die Huis. Ek dank U. [Applous.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

Madam Speaker, we remain concerned about the impact of budget cuts to our Department in the long term and its effect on service delivery. We are nevertheless pleased to see progress throughout the province.

I would like to thank Graham Paulse, the Head of Department for his hard work and every person in die Department for their co-operation over the past year. With that I submit the amended budget proposals to the House. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Mnqasela.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Enkosi Somlomo. Ndiza kuthetha isiNtu sakowethu. Siza kuqala nje ukuthetha, ndifuna ukubulela intsebenziswano yeKomiti ngoba sisebenze kakuhle kakhulu namalungu, ohloniphekileyo uMnu Dyantyi, ohloniphekileyo uMnu Max nohloniphekileyo uMnu Hinana. Ngoba injongo

yethu ibicace gca, ukuba asiyanga kuhlala phaya, sitye amandongomane simane sichubana neenzipho. Umsebenzi wethu kukuqinisekisa ukuba senza umsebenzi wokugada umsebenzi wokuba iinkonzo ziyeziswa ebantwini . nokuqinisekisa ke Somlomo ukuba xa kukho ingxaki, njengokuba kukho uMphicothi zincwadi Jikelele, umane ezixela ezi zinto, athi phaya kukho ingxaki, phaya kukho ingxaki. Fakani isabhokhwe ngapha. Siyayenza ke loo nto siyiKomiti. Xa sisafika ngo 2014 saxelelwa ukuba kukho ingxaki eOudtshoorn, kukho ingxaki eKannaland, wathi uMphicothi zincwadi Jikelele tsibani niyiKomiti noMphathiswa. Satsiba umtsi ocacileyo ovakalayo saya kungena eOudtshoorn. Sayibulela ke into yokuba uRhulumente weNtshona Koloni watsiba ngesantya ukusebenzisana noRhulumente kaZwelonke beqinisekisa ukuba iOudtshoorn iyalunga, ngoba kaloku ukuba urhulumente akakulungelanga ukuziswa kweenkonzo ebantwini kutyiwa imali yehla ngomlenze, izandla aziphumi epokothweni , abantu abakwazi ukufumana iinkonzo abazilindeleyo.

Yiyo loo nto kwanyanzeleka ukuba singahlali sithule, kodwa siphume sihambe siye phaya ngoba umsebenzi weKomiti yethu thina ayikokuhla sifunde iincwadi, kufuneka siphume siye apho kufele khona ithole. Sizibone ezi zinto ngamehlo sizijonge ntsho, sithi apha kufuneka kulungiswa apha, aphakufuneka kulungiswe. Loo nto siyenzela ukuqinisekisa ukuba xa kuthethwa ngobudlelane baphakathi koorhulumente siyakwazi ukuyenza loo nto singaphozisanga maseko. Ndifuna ukuthi ke, kobambeke uSomlomo kweso sihlalo, mama, siyibambile le nto siyiKomiti esiSigxina yooRhulumente beMimandla ngoba injongo yethu sifuna ukuqinisekisa ukuba senza

okulungileyo ukuqinisekisa ukuba abantu bafumana iinkonzo ezibalungeleyo ngokoMgaqo-siseko weli lizwe. Ukuba ujonge uMgaqo-siseko, iSiqendu 152 neSiqendu 153, uyacacisa ukuba umasipala kufuneka enze ntoni ukuze izinto zenzeke ngendlela efaneleileyo. Eyokuqala kukuba amanzi makeze ebantwini, acocekileyo. Izindlu zangasese mazize kufutshane ezindlwini. Ndimvile ke uMphathiswa wezokuHlaliswa koLuntu eyibeka kakuhle le nto, ndavakala ndiqhwaba ngaphakathi kuba kaloku kumnandi xa iinkonzp zisiza ebantwini.

Ndiyafuna ukuba ndiyichaphazele into ebihethwa nguMphathiswa woRhulumente beMimandla, uMphathiswa uAnton Bredell, apho ebecacisa ukuba le mali sithetha ngayo iya phi. Ngoba ke nangona ingeyomali ininzi, yimali karhulument5e ekufanele ukuba thina siyiKomiti siyigade ukuba iza kuya kwezi ndawo siyiKomiti besinomdla wokuba iye kuzo. Siye sajonga ke kwintlanganiso ebesinayo siqwalasela lo mcimbi. Sathi hayi yonke le nto ihamba kakuhle, urhulumente usemgceni. Siyancoma ke Mphathiswa ngokuba ubahoye oomasipala, amanzi angapheli ezindlwini.

Ngoba kaloku xa kuphele amanzi abanemali eninzi baza kuzenzela iindlela bathenge namanzi asezibhotileni. Ongenamali nale yokuthenga ukutya uza kuyithatha phi imali yokuthenga amanzi asezibhotileni? Yaye abona bantu basebenzisa amanzi amaninzi, uthi urhulumente xa enika ingxelo ngabantu abasezindlwini ukodlula amashishini, kanti kuqala ibingamashishini ebesebenzisa amanzi amaninzi ukodlula abantu basezindlwini. Kodwa ngoku siyayibona into yokuba ngabantu abasezindlwini abasebenzisa amanzi amaninzi ukodlula amashishini.

Siyafuna ke ukuyicela into yokuba sibabongoze abahlali, ukuba mhlai ulapho endlwini ubukele umakonakude ngoku, umamele irediyo, hamba uyokwenza ezi zinto kuthiwa zenze kula maphulo. Ukuba kuthiwa yivale impompo, yivale impompo xa uxukuxa. Ungayivuli impompo, oko amanzi ayagxagxaza. Kuba abantu abazi ukuba wenza njnani na xa ufuna ukonga amanzi. Ngoku amatyala afika emakhulu, abantu abawahlawuli. Ityala liphaya koo R 9 bhiliyoni abantu abahlawuli, kuba nangona umntu ewasebenzisa la manzi engawagadanga akanayo nemali le yokuwahlawula.

Ngoku siyafuna ukuba makubekho iinkqubo, urhulumente makabe ngathi uysasondela koomasipala. Mababe namaphulo agqale ngakumbi kubantu ababazindlwini. Sisebenzise iiCDW ezi, zingene ezindlwini. Sisebenzise nale nkqubo yeCWP, iNkqubo yoMsebenzi wasekuHlalani, izame kusebenzisa eli solotya lokungena ezindlwini, bade bababonise ngokwenza oomakhulu kuba awuzukukwazi ukuxelela umakhulu ukuba yonga amanzi, vala impompo. Ikhumshile kakhulu loo nto. Ngena endlwini uthi makhulu, yivale xa uxukuka, umbonise uthi khangela iindawo ezivuzayo, uyijonge loo nto. Ikhona ke inkqubo ebizama ukuqwalasela loo nto, ebizwa ngokuba yiWar on leaks. Ndiyayixhasa ke loo nto kuba enye yezinto ezenzayo kukuncedisa abantu ezindlwini ngokuzisa abasebenzi bemibhobho yamanzi bangene ezindlwini, bangene ezitalatweni bavale ezi ndawo zivuzayo. Ngoko ke, ngokubalulekileyo nangokukhawulezileyo mhlali ngaphambili, sicinga ukuba ayiyonto ingenakwenzeka into yokuba sicele abantu ukuba bongwe amanzi. Kwaye sibacele abantu ukuba noko, bangasese bathi ngoku bawabonayo amanzi ukuba ehlile emadameni, kuba ehlile amanzi emadamanei,

baqhubekeke bona benkcenkceshela yonke imihla. Ukuba uyambona umntu ukuba uyankcenkceshela, hamba uye kumxela kumasipala uthi hayi apha kuyankcenkceshelwa amanzi avulwa imini yonke. Ngoba umntu ufuna ukuba ibe luhlaza igadi yakhe, kodwa akanayo imali le yokuhlawula. Kanti ke oomasipala mababe ngathi bayangena apha ezipokothweni bafake uzipho, ukunyusa amaxabiso kwaba bantu bawachithayo amanzi, ekubeni sisithi sukudlala ngamanzi, umntu uyadlala ngamanzi. Bayadlala abantu ngamanzi.

Neendawo zokuhlamba iimoto. Mayingavulwa imibhobho ingathi umntu udlala ngamanzi emlanjeni. Indawo yokuhlamba iimoto mayisebenzise amanzi kuba ke ngamathuba emisebenzi, ngakumbi ezilokishini. Mabayenze kakuhle le nto, bagalele nokuba kusezinkonkxeni. Akunjalo malungu eNdlu yoWosimthetho? Ukwenzela ukuba umntu athathe inkonkxa afake ilaphu ayenze le nto, kodwa angathi ngeli xa ashokoxekileyo amanzi athathe umbhobho , akanalo nexhala kuba akukho nesenti elahlekayo kuye kuba akawahlawuli nala manzi. Siyafuna ukuba benze amashishini, kodwa zama ukulolonga lo mcimbi sithetha ngawo wamanzi. Okokugqibela ke, ndicinga ukuba into esiyivileyo ebalulekileyo kolu hlengahlengiso lohlahlo mali kukuba bafuna ukuqinisekisa ukuba enye imali ixhasa oomasipala, ngoba bayazi ukuba kweli phondo sinkqenqeza phambili asinantanga, ngomcimbi wokuqinisekisa ukuba izimali ziphathwa ngendlela. Ngoba asiyithathi imali engeyoyethu, senze ingathi yeyethu. Ufumanise ukuba umntu uyatya, nesisu sihamba phaya, nomqolo sewude wagoba utya imali yabantu. Usebenza kwaba masipala ingathi uqhuba ivenkile yakhe encinci.

Sithi ke ngoku kwaba beDA oomasipala, uthi uRhulumente kaZwelonke noMphicothi zincwadi Jikelele, izinto zihamba kakuhle, bayavuya yindlela esiqhuba ngayo. Loo nto ayithethi ukuba siza kuhlala phantsi sigcakamele ilanga. Asizukuhlala phantsi emthunzini Somlomo. Ndifuna ukuyicacisa le nto yokuba njengokuba siyiKomiti nje, siza kuhlala siqinisekise ukuba ezi zimali zisetyenziswa ngendlela efanelekileyo , izabelo zolingano xa ziye koomasipala zifika zisetyenziswe kwezi zinto. Abanye oomasipala ufumanisa ukuba ufuna ukuthatha izabelo zolingano, aye kuboleka imali ebhankini ukuhlawula elinye ityala. Sikhe saba naloo ngxaki apha, kuMasipala waseKannaland, siye kunqanda amanzi engena endlwini. Befuna ukuthatha imali abayiboleka ebhankini ukuhlawula elinye ityala. Wakhe wayibona phi into yokuba uye kuqhatha uPeter kuba ufuna ukuhlawula uPaul? Sithi ke ngoku masingayivumeli loo nto siyiKomiti,. Siza kuyijonga siyiKomiti loo nto. Yiyo le nto xa sihleli iintlanganiso, iingxelo zekota, siyaxoxa ngazo. Iingxelo zonyaka, siyaxoxa ngazo. Asiqali kuzixoxa ezi zinto xa sifika apha. Siyaziqwalasela kakuhle phaya kwiKomiti. Yiloo nto ke ndinomdla kakhulu wokuba ndithi olu hlengahlengiso lohlahlo mali siluxhasa ngomxhelo omnye ngoba naphaya ekomitini akukhange kubekho mntu uthi hayi asiyifuni le nto, asiyithandi le nto. Ndiye ndabona ke ukuba abantu bayithandile le nto ngoba iKomiti yethu ithathe imizuzu engaphantsi kwelishumi, sayigqiba sahamba, kuba bekungekho mntu unezinto afuna ukuzithetha athi mna andiyithandi le nto. Wonke umntu ebenomdla, saphuma ke ngokungxamisekileyo bonke abantu bonwabile. Yinto yokuba ke umsebenzi wethu siwenze apha phakathi enyakeni, Mgcini sihlalo.

Ndiyafuna ukubulela iNdlu yalapha ePalamente ukuba isiphe eli thuba. Ndibulela kakhulu iSebe Sihlalo, kuba iSebe liyayiqonda into yokuba asizanga kudlala amapetyu apha, xa sihleli nabo, sibuzisa izinto siyiKomiti sizama ukuqonda ukuba imali ethile iya phi, aba masipala nibaxhasa njani. Ngoba sinoomasipala abathandathu abafakwe phantsi kwenkqubo yeCandelo 137 loNgenelelo. Bayayicacisa ke le nto, sibabuze ukuba kwenzeka njani, niyoyisakala apha? Bayivume loo nto. Ndizama ukuthi ke liSebe elithembakele kakhulu, noMphathiswa ngumntu oqonda kakhulu xa simbonisa izinto, uthobekile. Xa siphakamisa imiba, uyasabela. Ndifuna ukuthi ke siyayibulela kakhulu loo nto, masiqhube ngale ntsebenziswano. Kodwa siqhubeke nasekubekeni umnwe kwinto ethi oomasipala, ngoba lelinye inqanaba likarhulumente. Mabayazi into yokuba umsebenzi wethu, siza kubagada, siza kubaxhasa apho kufuneka sixhase khona, sigxeke apho kufuneka sigxeke khona. Kodwa intsebenziswano ibentle kakhulu kweli thuba sithetha ngalo. Siyayincoma ke loo nto siyibulela. NoSalga usebenzisene kakuhle kakhulu nathi. ngokweCandelo 163 loMgaqo-siseko, bayayazi indima yabo, yaye sisebenzisana kakhulu. Ndiyabulela kakhulu. Siyaluxhasa kakhulu ke olu hlengahlengiso lohlahlo mali. Enkosi kakhulu.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I will speak in my mother tongue. To start with, I want to thank the Committee for their co-operation because we work very well with the hon members Mr Dyantyi, Mr Max and Mr Hinana because our objective is very clear, that we are not there to sit and

eat peanuts, and polish our nails. Our mandate is to ensure that services get to the people, and to ensure, that when there is a problem - and we have an Auditor-General who constantly points these things out, and says there is a problem there, crack the whip this side. We do that as a Committee. When we arrived in 2014, we were told that there was a problem in Oudtshoorn, there was a problem in Kannaland. The Auditor-General told the Committee and MEC to go there. We rushed to Oudtshoorn. We are therefore thankful that the Western Cape Government hastily cooperated with National Government, making sure that Oudtshoorn gets right, because if Government is not ready to deliver services to the people, monies are embezzled, communities cannot get the services they are expecting.

That is why we were forced to not to sit and keep quiet, but to go out there because the duty of the Committee is not to sit and read books. We must go out where the problem is. We must see these things with our own eyes, and say we need a solution here. We are doing that so that when we talk about governmental relations, as they say, we are able to do that immediately. I want to say we are hands-on with this as the Standing Committee on Local Government because our objective is to ensure that we do the right thing by ensuring that communities get the right services as per the Constitution of this country. If one looks at Section 152 and Section 153, they are clear on what a municipality must do for things to go well. The first one is that water must be brought to the communities, clean water. Toilets must get closer to houses. I listened to the MEC for Human Settlements outlining this. I applauded him in my heart because it is good when services are brought to

our people.

I want to touch on what Anton Bredell, MEC for Local Government said, where he was explaining where the money we are talking about goes. Because although it is not a lot of money, it is Government money that we as the Committee must look after, and make sure that it goes to the places where as the Committee we want it to. We considered at a meeting we held to deliberate on this matter. We said all is going well, the Government is on track. We command , MEC, that you care about the municipalities, there must always be water in their houses.

Because when there is no water those who have money will go and buy bottled water. Where will a person who does not have money to buy food get money to buy bottled water? And the people who use a lot of water, the Government says in its report, are households more than businesses, but before it was businesses who used water more than households. But now we see that it is households that use water more than businesses.

We want to request and we plead with the residents, whoever is home watching television, listening to the radio, go and do the things they say you must do in these campaigns. If they tell you to switch off the tap when brushing your teeth, do so. Do not let the water run non-stop. Now debts are too high, and people do not pay. The debt is around R9 billion, people cannot pay because although they use the water, they do not have the money to pay.

Now we want to have programmes, the Government must get closer to municipalities. They should have programmes, especially for households. We must use the CDWs to visit houses. We must also use the CWP, Community Works Programme, for them to try and use the house visits clause, and show the grannies practically because one cannot tell a granny to save water, turn off the tap. That is too complicated. Go inside the house and say granny, turn it off when brushing your teeth, and show her and say, look for leaks, and monitor that. There was a programme that tried to address that: War on Leaks. I support that because one of the things it does is to help people in houses get plumbers to visit them, go to the streets and close leaks, urgently and quickly. Chair, we think it is not something we can do to ask the residents to save water and to ask the people not to continue with watering every day because the dams are low. If you see someone watering daily, go to the municipality and report that. Because people want their gardens to be green, but they do not have the money to pay. Municipalities must dig deep into their pockets and pinch, to increase tariffs to those who waste water.

And car washes. Taps should not be left running as though they are playing with water from a river. Car washes must use water because it is job opportunities, more so in townships. They must do this well, and use buckets. Is it not so members of the House? So that a person must use a bucket to soak a cloth, and do their thing, but not use a pipe while water is scarce, because they are not losing a cent. We want them to set up businesses, but try to save water. Lastly, I think one thing of importance that we heard from this Adjustment Budget was that they want to ensure that some of the money

supports municipalities, because they know that in this province we are the best in ensuring that monies are handled efficiently. Because we do not take money that is not ours and pretend it is ours. You find a person spending, they have a big tummy and a skew back from spending people's monies. They work in these municipalities as though they are running spaza shops.

We are now saying to DA municipalities, National Government and the Auditor-General say things are fine, they are happy with our performance. That does not mean we shall sit in the sun. We are not going to sit in the shade. I want to explain we, as a Committee, will ensure that these monies are used efficiently, when equity shares go to municipalities they are used for these things. In other municipalities one finds that they want to take equity shares, take a loan at a bank to settle a debt. We had that problem with Kannaland Municipality, we had to intervene vehemently. They wanted to take money they had loaned from a bank to pay a debt. Where have you seen one robbing Peter to pay Paul? We are saying, as a Committee, we should not allow that. As a Committee we will look at this. That is why when we meet, we discuss quarterly reports. We discuss annual reports. We do not start talking about these things when we get here. We look at them as a Committee. That is why I am so keen to say we support this Adjustment Budget fully because even at the Committee nobody said no, we do not want this. I then realized that the people like this because our Committee took less than ten minutes, and we were done and gone, because there was no objection. They all were interested, and as we left everyone was happy. That is because we do our work during the year, Chairperson.

I want to thank the House for giving us this opportunity. Thank you very much to the Department, because the Department understands that we are not here to play games. When we sit with them and ask them questions as a Committee, trying to understand where certain monies go, how do we support these municipalities because we have six municipalities that have been placed under Section 137 for monitoring? I am trying to say this Department is very honest, and the MEC is a person who understands well when we point out issues, he is humble. When we raise matters, he responds. I want to say thank you very much for that, keep on with the co-operation. But we should also continue stressing that municipalities, because they are another sphere of government, must know that, as is our mandate, we will monitor them, support them when needed, and criticise when we have to. But co-operation was good over the period we are talking about. We commend and thank you for that. Salga also worked well with us. In terms of Section 163 of the Constitution, they know their role, and we work very well together. Thank you very much. We support this Adjustment Budget. Thank you.] [Applause.]

*[Hon member Ms L M Maseko takes the Chair.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I recognise the ANC member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ANC member?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable member Dyantyi, I

recognise you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now you are talking. Honourable member. As I start, I thank the Minister for his input and leadership and also following up on the Chairperson and my colleague. †Uthethe kakuhle nto yakuthi. [You spoke very well my brother.] †He said a mouthful, but I just want to say this: As you were speaking so eloquently in isiXhosa, that side was not interested in what you were saying.

†Bebengazifakanga neziya zinto. [They did not even use their devices.] †They did not, so just for you to know that, except the Minister. [Interjections.] But let me proceed, Acting Chair. You see if they had a good opening batsman that side, they would have started this way. Both the General Household Survey combined, 2005 - 2015, as well as the Stats South Africa of 2016, says the following:

“The Western Cape has the highest rate of universal access to improved drinking water resources in the country, 99.4%.”

99.4%. Can you clap for that? [Applause.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, and maybe before you finish clapping ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... here is the caveat.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi, please address the Chair.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here is the caveat, just before they finish clapping. It follows Chair, and says:

“The Free State follows by 99.3% as well as Northern Cape 99.1”

But here is the caveat. In 2007 the Free State was the worst affected province as well as the Northern Cape. The issue I am bringing just after they have clapped, is that if you are to compare the Western Cape, Free State and Northern Cape, and speak of progress, you would know that the Free State and Northern Cape have progressed and these are the provinces that have improved their people's lives better than the Western Cape. Please clap for that as well. [Applause.] I thought you would continue doing that – wow! I just wanted to make that - but let me continue on that note. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi, can you sit down?

Let me address you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Address me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes. Can I address you?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, please address me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, can you sit down? Will you sit down?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You address me when I am standing as a speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, I am the Chairperson, you sit down.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can you check my time please.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you are going to address the Chair and then there is no action that you are going to say the House has to do. Address me and attend to the business of the day. Thank you hon member, you may continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me apologise for doing it for you. I will ask you to do it. Thank you, Chairperson. Now here is the one that follows, that actually the Metros with the highest percentage of households with access to improved sanitation facilities were the City of Johannesburg, 96.9%; Nelson Mandela at 94.6%; and Cape Town came third. Just for us to continue in this, remember this is Stats South Africa. To continue the trend of hard truths and what hon Magaxa was saying, actually the last part says:

“The highest number of households still using the bucket system is the Western Cape.”

I just wanted us to start on that note, because we are speaking about municipalities. Do you know the reason why we perhaps have that? They will only tell you about urbanisation. It is part of it. There is more to it. So let me get back to my Minister and the Department.

In terms of this Adjustment and his Department, and I want to liken him to, he is a good driver, he drives a new car, but †die probleem is daar is ’n waentjie in daai kar, daai waentjie wat hy nou trek is stukkend, daai waentjie val inmekaar, daai waentjie loop en val, en daai is die Departement. [Tussenwerpsels.] [the problem is there is a little wagon in that car, that little wagon he is pulling is broken, it is collapsing, that little wagon is running and falling, and that is the Department. [Interjections.]]

†Here are the reasons: we continue, and even in this Adjustment it reflects that there is under-expenditure as a result of staff leaving in the following sub-programmes:

- Corporate services
- Municipal administration
- Capacity development
- Municipal monitoring

In all of those sub-programmes you have got a similar thing. †Nou daar is jou waentjie wat nie reg is nie. Jy dryf 'n mooi kar maar al wat ek nou vra is dat kyk maar terug net vir 'n minuut, klim op daai waentjie, maak daai waentjie reg, want dis nie reg nie. [Now there is your little wagon that is broken. You drive a smart car but all I am asking is look back for just one minute, climb onto that little wagon and fix that little wagon, because it is broken.] †This is your problem, because it is going to be of no use. [Interjection.] †Jy het tyd om te praat, gee my tyd om te praat asseblief. [You have had time to talk, so allow me time to talk, please.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Did you do that when you were [Inaudible.]?

Mr Q R DYANYI: Can I be protected ...?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are protected member. If you address me you will be protected member ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am talking to you. I am addressing you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Continue hon member.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am addressing you, †nou praat ons mense, nou praat ons. [Now we are talking people, now we are talking.] And in fact, another point I want to ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, there is a point of order.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, yes, thank you. I just want to know how I can ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is the point of order hon member?

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes, I just want to know how can I inform the translators that the member speaking is misleading the House and all the people listening? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order hon member. Hon member Dyantyi, you may continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much. I still want to stay †op die waentjie. [on the little wagon.] †I want to stay here because that is our concern, both on the Annual Report and this Adjustment.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy moet dit doen ja, nie ek nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He has to do it, yes, not me.]

†But we also have got the challenge of the shifting of funds. If we talk about the CDWs, there are delays to finalise something that we dealt with 2 years

ago. District offices for your CDWs, because you cannot speak about public outreach when you do not give support and help in that regard.

When they came to us they gave us an important breakthrough and intervention which says part of the problem of the staff leaving, and I am coming closer to him, has to do with the nature of the Department, that they needed to fix that and the commitment made was they are going to review that organisational structure.

It is very clear from this Adjustment that there is no intention, there is nothing going in that direction, it is clear that when you have come to 2017 you are going to have to tell us about the same thing, when we supported you about that saying please go ahead with this, but there is no visible action that demonstrates that you are ready and are even adjusting towards that.

We have a lot of shifting of funds between votes which comes to about over R7 million for that matter, which for me is a concern, because if in 9 months' time you shift votes to that amount, it says that is bad planning in my own book, when you look at the percentage of that and what those shifts are about. Because they are less about issues of real disasters and so on. And so let me continue. It is a Dyantyi book.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: A very thin one.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Dyantyi kom nou huis toe.

[Mr R B LENTIT: Dyantyi come home now.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, you cannot interject all the time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The next point I want to come to hon Chair, it relates to the issue in this book, the Municipal Electricity Master Plan Grants. There are those municipalities that have been listed there, about 4 of them, and one of those municipalities is a municipality that is not even able to spend, as indicated yesterday by hon Dugmore, George Municipality. A rich municipality, but yet you have that municipality being assisted with the Electricity Master Plan. So something there is just not right and I would like the Minister to respond to that when he rises.

I also want to make this point, Chair, before I wrap up. Up until this point, maybe until yesterday, because the speaker must come after me, I think I have misunderstood him, the hon member of the ACDP, because the local government elections have demonstrated that actually that party is going towards extinction, it does not exist.

Now I understand why he has to play the role he must play, because †hy maak sy eie bed in daai ander kant, because in 2019 moet hy ‘n ander kant gaan slaap. Hy sal niks meer kry in die ACDP. [he is making his own bed on that other side, because in 2019 he has to go and sleep on another side. He

will get nothing more in the ACDP.] †I now understand why you must play that role which is not oversight, which is not opposition.

So, Madam Speaker, with my time allocated to me, let me also go to this book in front of me. [Interjection.] My time has not expired yet. I still have a lot of time.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I do not think so.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am there already, and I am glad you are listening so quietly. I am really impressed by that. I wanted to raise the issue about the drought, because yesterday we were told, and I am interested about that, when I asked them the question how much are you putting in, we were told about R61 million. So it is clear out of that R61 million the bulk comes from the Department of Local Government, which is about R10 million from what we have here, and I will be interested as we look around how much Agriculture – that is the point I think we missed yesterday, how much are they putting in to contribute to that R61 million? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I just finish then?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Finish, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, just to finish. My time just expired very quickly, but let me just make this last point, hon Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: 61 and the bulk is 10.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, that is why I was saying address the Chair.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am addressing you. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time has expired.

HON MEMBERS: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am trying to finish.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am trying to finish my last sentence.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time has expired member, thank you very much.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am trying to finish my last sentence. [Time expired.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise the ACDP, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson. This is the same person that was Minister and he does not understand local government. I do not know how it works. [Laughter.] So while he was in the sky he was fired I believe. He still does not understand local government.

From provincial level, you fund R10 million for drought relief, you do not say anything about that. You do not say anything about the R5.5 million that goes to strengthen local government, that is the bread and butter issues, and you are not addressing that. You are not addressing the R3.8 million that goes towards drought relief in Witzenberg. You do not address it.

So that is my problem. My problem is you would think that you are an expert in local government and you know nothing, you know nothing. I will tell you the ANC lost 3 million votes in the previous election. You are not coming back in 2019, you are not coming back. You are not coming back in 2019. I will be here 2019. [Applause.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ANC is declining and non-existent, that is what I say. So, Madam Chair, I support the Vote. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member Christians. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Acting Speaker. To the hon Chairperson, thank you very much hon member for your guidance, your leadership, your oversight role that you play in the Department. We have worked together and you have done a very good job within your oversight role, and I want to thank you for that.

Our difficult municipalities were those normally being governed by the ANC. It was very difficult to get the information out of those municipalities so that we could act on it. What is very important in this Adjustment is that everything that we have put the money towards is to provide dignity to poor people's lives.

In a drought situation it is the poorest of the poor that will suffer. We must realise that a lot of economists and people try to make out a case whether we are in a recession or not, and if you walk the streets and if you work within the poor communities, you will realise that we do have a food recession within this country.

It is very important that everything we do and where we put our money towards is to support the poorest of the poor so that they can live a dignified life. As we sit here we have also pulled together KZN, all the coastal

provinces, KZN, Northern Cape, Eastern Cape and the Western Cape, to discuss, and we have actually started a forum, how we can join our resources, our knowledge to create a space where we can support one another when there is a coastal disaster and so forth.

So everything we do it is to better the lives of our people. But, hon Chairperson, the problem that we have got it, and you know that the hon Dyantyi did not even attend the session where he could have asked us these questions. He was absent. You see, and we have picked it up here, it is because the ANC is a party of †*base* [bosses] and not leaders. The DA are leaders. The ANC wants to be the boss of the community. [Interjection.]

That is why the ANC, hon Chair, wants to keep the communities in poverty, because then they are in control of their lives. [Interjections.] The DA wants to lead the communities out of poverty so that they can stand on their own feet and make ... [Interjection.] and that is why they have lost 3 million votes, because the people might be poor but they are not stupid.

So, hon Chair, the hon member Dyantyi talked about the Free State and, and. We are very proud of our service delivery record, and we are the first to acknowledge that we will not rest until a 100% of the people have got all the services they deserve, because that is our role. But urbanisation, population growth, it is a huge problem, and we in this province realise that and we are busy planning for the next 30 years.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Go and learn from Gauteng.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are busy planning for the next 30 years.

An HON MEMBER: How to lose.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: If we go to Gauteng the only thing we will learn there is how to lose an election. So I will not go there currently. We realise that services are crucial and while we need to deal with urbanisation, the populations in the Free State and those provinces are shrinking. So they do have other challenges that they will need to address. On the whole bucket issue, we have announced in this province that no person should use a bucket.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is an announcement.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And we need to eradicate all buckets.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We need to, when are you ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And we are busy with it all the time, but the stats are not right and the hon Dyantyi knows it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Haibo!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We have proved it because we walk the streets. That is why we have a programme for backyarders, because a lot of people who said to Stats South Africa that they have got a bucket, do not have a bucket. They are in the backyard and when there is a problem between them and the resident, they lock them out and they cannot get to toilet facilities and things.

There is a lot of other things at play here. [Interjection.] The fact is - you are too young to even try that, you are too young to even try that. We as a Government need to provide dignity to people. The same with the personnel. When personnel leave it is not always a bad thing. Maybe it is because we train them. We are part of the bigger picture, not only in the Western Cape, in the whole of South Africa. A lot of personnel members use better opportunities, it is part of a growth path within the Department, and although we want to keep everybody, if there are better opportunities we cannot keep them, they must go. Some of them will go back to municipalities. It is a good thing because we help and we contribute to a better labour market in South Africa.

But the problem that I have here today and the problem that the Chairperson has, is that if the hon member Dyantyi is trying to make a joke out of local government, it shows you the lack of understanding of the ANC. It is actually much broader than that, because we have sat with a National

Government where we have had six Ministers of Local Government in seven years. It is impossible to vest anything there.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They still haven't found the right one.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: They cannot find the right one who understands it. On public outreach we do not only have CDWs, we want to expand, we realise the importance, but we have got a Thusong Programme that reaches millions of people to help them, and we drive that.

Just, lastly hon Chair, to the ACDP. You know the ANC is a shrinking party, for them to give advice to you, †ek dink dit is 'n bietjie voorbarig want hulle gaan nie weer terugkom nie. Baie dankie, agb Speaker. [I think it is a bit cheeky because they are not going to come back. Thank you, Madam Speaker.]

[Debate concluded.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the 5<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 6 – Health - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I recognise the hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Acting †Mam‘uSpeaker, [Madam Speaker], hon Premier, members of the Executive, members of the House. I rise here tabling the final Budget Adjustments for the Department of Health.

In the beginning of the 2016/2017 financial year we started with a budget of R19.982 billion. The adjusted appropriation is now R20.144 billion, which presents us with an increase of R161.752 million. Due to the tough economic times we find ourselves in, it has been crucial that certain adjustments be made to the various programmes for optimum use of the resources that we have, and also to prioritise, because we must show that we are a responsive government. Despite the turbulent economic times the Department has adopted stringent financial approaches in order to cushion the blow for the actual services. That is why we have done everything in our power to shield those we serve. For example we ensured that we saved from our revenue, almost about R52 million over the 2015/16 financial year.

While tough decisions needed to be made for this to be possible, it has been the buffer that we need to keep our services going. In addition to that, we have bagged a multi-million rand grant from the Global Fund to assist with the fight against TB and HIV amongst women and girls. We are one of only two provinces in the country to be awarded with this grant so that we can pilot it using innovative project skills.

Because today is 'World Aids Day', I want us to take the whole issue of HIV prevention into our hands. It has been alluded to previously that we might have a country that has got the largest ARV programme in the whole world, yet with new infections, especially of the young girls - members in case you are not aware, every week 2000 young women aged between 15 and 24 get infected - if you count 2016, we have had about 270 000 new infections. That is five times greater than infections of any country where women are infected. [Interjections.]

Now in terms of an innovative approach for young women and girls the implementation has already commenced in April 2016 and was officially launched in October 2016 and will be rolled out, as part of the pilot in the Mitchells Plain and the Klipfontein area which includes Gugulethu, Crossroads, Philippi, Nyanga, Hanover Park, Manenberg etc.

It is an ambitious programme, targeting specifically ages 19 to 24 years in addition to the existing programmes that we have. The key population operation is the focus for this year because you cannot do everything for everybody and because we are seeing girls engaged in sexual relationships with men with an age difference of about 8 years. It will deliver a package of care, based on an evidence-based approach that goes beyond the health sector by addressing the drivers that increase young women's risk to HIV including poverty, gender inequality and poor education. This initiative will provide a basket of services including self empowerment, coaching, parenting and caregiver programmes, and a combination of socio-economic incentives

aimed at HIV prevention approaches.

Looking at the breakdown of the adjustment, out of R161 million, almost half is dedicated to HIV Aids. Of that, R48 million is based on our savings from the previous financial year where we had to put more money into ARVs because the grant for the ARVs has decreased hence we gave that to the City of Cape Town which also offers these kinds of services.

R4.5 million is retained from the money we had been allocated through the Global Fund for the 2015/16 financial year.

R24 million which we have just received now, is part of the R270 million for funding from 1 April 2016 to March 2019 that has been allocated for the Women of Worth Project, as I mentioned earlier.

Now if you look in terms of the shifts we have, we have a shift from Vote 3 to us from Provincial Treasury to fund contract posts in the Department for the effective management of the supply chain programme, where we use the programme LOGIS and then we have a shift that goes to Vote 1 to the Department of the Premier to fund the ICT requirements for Infrastructure for various clinics and hospitals. If we truly want to move towards a health system that is conducive and responsive to everything, it means that we have to keep on updating our ICT Health Information System that is part of the building blocks to strengthen the whole of the health system.

In terms of the adjustments, in terms of the roll-outs, as part of the 'whole of society approach', we work closely with the NPO's hence the R3.2 million from the 2015/16 comprehensive care for vaccines and tuberculosis that was meant for the NPOs is being rolled over because they always submit their claims very late.

Then for Programme Six, for the training of community health workers, we rely on the NPOs for that training, hence for community based services we are asking for R2.5 million that was meant for the EPWPs, for all those community based services that are offered by the NPOs.

In terms of the infrastructure, R59 million is coming from 2015/16 as part of the Health Facility Revitalisation Grant that is awarded by National. We are asking for the roll-over because as I always say when it comes to health infrastructure, the building might be completed but if you do not receive the machinery on time or the [Inaudible.] on time because you get it from overseas, it means you have to shift to another programme, which is for example in this case, Health Technology.

In terms of the National Health Insurance Grant we received R4.7 million to again strengthen the information systems. I must just mention, Madam Speaker, that this one is from a direct to an indirect grant and we are the only province that has been tasked to provide what we call the Disease Related Grouping Investment Model in terms of disease renaming, so this money is meant for that. I just also want to indicate again that half of this

R161 million goes to HIV and AIDS.

I want to just thank everybody and especially the HOD and congratulate her because it is her first budget and it is my first budget and I want to thank the staff as it was a collective work. I also want to thank the Community Development Committee who spent hours pouring over each figure on each page to ensure that their constitutional mandate is met. We appreciate the passion with which the Committee has worked in terms of this budget and also to hold us accountable and ensure our obligations are met. I hereby table the budget. Thank you.

†Mnr M G E WILEY: Mooi!

[Mr M G E WILEY: Well done!]

HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Strategic Goal 3 commits the Western Cape Government to increasing wellness and tackling social issues. The Department of Health, under the watchful eye of Dr Nomafrench Mbombo, is tasked with providing quality health care to the citizens of the Western Cape whose overwhelming majority are without medical insurance of any kind. The Department remains committed to promoting healthy and inclusive communities that take as, Minister Meyer put it, ownership of

personal safety and wellness. The Adjustment Appropriation reflects a R161 752 million increase from the Main Appropriation.

These are welcomed resources and I am pleased that this will be used in ensuring that the people of this province have access to improved quality health care. I cannot state enough the importance of the 'First 1000 Days Initiative'. The first 1000 days of a child's life are critical in their development and this programme is aimed at raising awareness of this crucial stage. The Department identified three pillars which are critical in ensuring the healthy development of children. They are ensuring the health and nutrition of both mother and baby, providing mothers and babies with support from fathers, families and the whole community, providing the right stimulation for the babies learning needs and giving them a safe, substance abuse free environment which promotes wellbeing.

This is one of the priority projects of the Department and we will continue to monitor the success of the programme as it ensures the safety of both mother and new born child. Another priority programme for the Department is the HIV and TB Outcomes, as the Minister has just alluded to. It is the '909090' Strategy and the targets for the programmes are by 2020, 90% of people living with HIV will know their status. By 2020, 90% of people that have been diagnosed with HIV infections will receive sustained anti-retroviral treatment and by 2020, 90% of all people receiving anti-retroviral therapy will have viral suppression. The Department is making positive strides towards achieving this strategy.

The Western Cape on the Wellness Campaign, better known as 'WoW', partners with the Provincial departments and NGOs and other stakeholders to promote healthy lifestyles by promoting better eating habits and increasing physical activity. I mentioned this programme, Madam Speaker, because a few weeks ago I stood here and urged members of this House to get screened because studies reveal that globally one in two of the 450 million people living with diabetes are not aware that they have the disease. Today I want to again urge you to make use of our health care facilities and get screened. I care for all the parties in this House.

Madam Speaker, in conclusion let me once again thank the Department for its continued commitment and dedication to making quality healthcare available for all our communities in the Western Cape. It is through their efforts that we see amongst others the following successes:

- Infant mortality rates declined by 15% between 2008 and 2011.
- Under five mortality rates have declined by 7% in 2013.
- Maternal mortality rates have decreased dramatically since 2008 and this can be attributed to the successful roll-out of the PNTC programmes.

I just want to thank the important role that the dedicated staff of the Department of Health continue to fulfil in ensuring that we have a healthy and well informed society. The pressure and environment they work in can be quite unfavourable at times, but day in, day out, they go out with one task at hand, to deliver services to all in the Western Cape. Madam

Speaker the DA supports the Appropriation for Vote 6. I thank you.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, let me take this opportunity and say that last night as I attended a memorial service of the late El Commander Fidel Castro, the Revolutionary President of Cuba ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms D GOPIE: ... I learned that Cuba has opened the doors to train student doctors from South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Hon members there is a speaker on the floor. Thank you.  
[Interjection.]

Ms D GOPIE: I learned that Cuba has opened the doors ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, would you take your seat please. There is a point of order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon member prepared to take a question?  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I will ensure that I ask. Hon member Gopie, are you prepared to take a question?

Ms D GOPIE: Not now.

The SPEAKER: The member is not prepared to take a question.

†Mnr C M DUGMORE: Kole. Gooi kole.

[Mr C M DUGMORE: Coals. Throw coals.]

Ms D GOPIE: I learned that Cuba has opened the doors to train students from South Africa, however it was a sad moment for me when Deputy President Cyril Ramaphosa told the audience that it is only the Government of the Western Cape that refuses to be part of this programme.

I was disappointed and I then wondered whether this Government is serious in improving poor health care in this province. [Interjection.] It is common knowledge that our health care centres and institutions are short of medical practitioners, yet this Government does not want to take this golden opportunity offered to us by the Cuban government.

Recently we heard the shocking news that a practising doctor who was working with expired ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Gopie. Hon members behind you are

detracting. If I could ask hon member Lekker, you have a speaker on the floor as well as the hon members on this side. Thank you.

Ms D GOPIE: Recently we heard the shocking news that a practising doctor who was working with an expired licence and who was employed through an agency raped a patient in Nyanga Clinic. Upon his arrest more evidence came to the fore that there were other similar cases in Mitchells Plain Hospital. The irony of it all, this Department pleaded ignorance instead of taking responsibility.

The Department of Health is confronted by many challenges of service delivery from overcrowded clinics, to fewer beds to accommodate patients in the hospital. In hospitals like Eerste River it has become the norm for patients to sleep on chairs for up to four days whilst being treated. On the other hand, diseases like diabetes are on the rise in this province. It is reported that in Coloured communities it is worsening with one in four adults likely to be infected. Elsewhere, in Beaufort West Hospital, allegations of racism and inefficiency have emerged, with patients claiming senior medical positions are reserved for whites regardless of the competence of black staff.

We can ill-afford non-use of budgeted public funds. This Department is the culprit in this regard. Why is the revamping of Tygerberg Hospital put on hold while roll-overs are the order of the day?

Instead of committing to improved services for the poor this Department can

still afford roll-overs of more than R74 million Rand. Looking closely at some of the reasons given for the roll-overs are lame excuses of;

- Claims for City of Cape Town not being submitted timeously resulting in accruals.
- EPWP delays in the filling of training posts resulted in accruals due to the delay in the appointment of professional services and slow progression on scheduled maintenance projects.
- Slow progress on sites, poor contractor performance, delays with procurement and outstanding final accounts.

Clearly all these reasons are mere incompetency and gross negligence on the part of the senior management and executive authority. Why is there a change of heart in replacing GF Jooste Hospital? These adjusted estimates should have adequately catered for this hospital.

The reasons for these roll-overs are not acceptable and must be condemned in the strongest terms. The shifting of funds, R1 million Rand, from programme 8, Health Facilities Management to the Department of the Premier is not supported because this very same programme has roll-overs of R62 million Rand. Service delivery will suffer severely because the state of our health facilities is worsening and we are doing this, on this World Aids Day, this budget today. Thank you. [Applause.]

†‘n AGB LID: Hoor-Hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gopie. I see the hon Christians. Hon member Dyantyi maintain your composure please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, typical ANC. What are they for? What are they for? Because hon member Gopie speaks about the R2.5 million roll-over for the EPWP Programme but she is not saying that it goes for training of our community based NGOs. Do they know what these people are doing for the poorest of the poor, treating them, being there for them, especially the elderly? But all that they do is complain and Madam Speaker, I want to just conclude because my minute is up, we support this budget and we thank the Minister and her Department for the work done in the poor communities. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Could we get some order please members. I see the hon minister, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the inputs. Thank you to my Chair for the inputs, hon member Christians for the inputs and also hon Gopie for the inputs. I do not want to stand here and lecture people because most of what has been said now, these are the things that are already in the fore. I am not sure whether even the Deputy President has seen the evaluation by the provinces that have sent students to Cuba up to the point that they are no longer doing it because ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...the report shows that not only is it expensive but when they come back, because they are only exposed to primary health care, the level of their skills is limited. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members, allow the hon Minister to speak. Hon member Magaxa. Hon members, this is not a debate across the floor now, the Minister is responding to inputs, if we could afford her the opportunity to complete her presentation. You may proceed hon Minister. Sorry, hon Minister could you take your seat please. Is it a point of order hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Yes, Madam Speaker, I just want to know is it parliamentary for a member to say †‘moenie kom lieg nie’, ‘moenie hier kom lieg nie’ [‘don’t come and lie,’ ‘don’t come and lie here’]?

The SPEAKER: I cannot say that I heard that, if you are willing to say which member it is.

Ms L J BOTHA: It is hon member Lekker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, may I address you? A point of order has been raised around a statement that was made. If you could stand up please. Sorry. Minister Meyer I saw that and that is inappropriate and the member is

standing.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I am taking offence as he had no right to do that.

An HON MEMBER: What did he do?

Ms P Z LEKKER: He slapped me on my right hand [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, I cannot ask you to withdraw your slap but it is inappropriate.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I apologise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Sorry?

Ms P Z LEKKER: I did not hear what he said [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: It is your own members who made the noise. [Interjection.].

Ms P Z LEKKER: I am the one who is taking offense [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I apologise.

The SPEAKER: Now, hon member, if I could address you. A statement was made and you would know what the statement was, did you indeed make that

statement?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Come again.

The SPEAKER: A statement was made †‘moenie hier kom lieg nie’ [‘don’t come and lie here’]. Did you indeed make the statement?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Oh yes, I did.

The SPEAKER: Would you withdraw the statement please.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I withdraw, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker. You may take your seat. You may proceed hon Minister Mbombo. Thank you. Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As I was saying the quadruple burden of disease that is in South Africa, starts with interpersonal violence and injuries. If you count the number of injuries and violence happening in Cuba versus South Africa ...

The second part of it is the issue of the maternal and child health if you look at how many complicated deliveries are happening in Cuba versus South Africa. The third part is HIV/Aids and also other communicable diseases. If you count how many have TB, also what the prevalence of HIV in Cuba is

versus South Africa - I can count all of those.

So the evaluations that have been performed by the provinces that are sending students to Cuba, they found that whilst it is a noble intervention, there is a limitation in the response in terms of what is happening in the context of South Africa.

Number two, money-wise; the money comes from the provinces and then goes to Cuba and then the comparison of how much you spend on sending a student to Cuba versus South Africa - we have got about 8 medical schools in South Africa and those schools are known everywhere in the world for producing the best. What the country needs to do is to invest in the resources so that they increase their numbers.

And then number 3, primary health care is the South African approach. It has always been their approach. So it is not about students going outside to learn primary health care. Actually South Africa is the 'transcentre' when it comes to PHC even before 1987 when it was declared a part of the Health Charter. So actually when we say decolonise health sciences it means bring it back to what we already have. We do not have to go outside and probably the Western Cape; in not sending students to Cuba, it has already decolonised because they do not have to learn Marxism. So we are here.

Mr S G TYATYAM: What?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, exactly. [Interjections.] Now the second part of it.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon member Tyatyam. Hon members, the Minister is responding. I think the ideological debate can take place at lunch time. You may proceed hon Minister. Hon member Magaxa. Order, please hon member Magaxa.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: For any complaints, the ill treatment of patients, there is no way that one can justify it and if it happens it is everybody's responsibility - if that person picks up the ill treatment of a patient or even for example like the issue that has been mentioned about the rapes. So that is why any ill treatment we respond to, so that is why in every facility you will get a hot line number, a please call number, an 086 number and all of those. So we cannot make any justifications because as I always say, health is a human right as well.

The ICT health information system as I indicated is part of the 'bleeding' box on strengthening the health system. So in order for the clinic to communicate with the hospital you need an information system because it is no longer the case where people carry folders. In order for Beaufort Hospital to communicate with Groote Schuur, it needs an information system. At some time I will make an announcement as to where we actually are, not only in South Africa or the province but in the whole world, to have a system that can talk to another across local governments, even across every part of the

health programme. So for that part of it, the [Inaudible.] system, it is something that needs to be done so we have done a lot of innovative approach testing and testing all of those. But lastly, again as I indicated, half of the adjustment goes to HIV/Aids and I am hearing that this budget cannot be accepted. There is an objection. [Interjection.] So am I right that I am hearing someone say they cannot accept these adjustments? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon Minister would you take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi, if I may address you? It is the honourable Minister or honourable Nomafrench, that is not the way we do it. Thank you. You may proceed hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am not sure whether I heard correctly that someone said no, this money cannot be given for ARVs, no, this money cannot be adjusted to provide for young girls and women - because it is half of it. What I am hearing is that someone is washing their hands very safely for today, we [Inaudible.] slogan that says "it is in our hands" - they take some action. I hear that someone says 'no it cannot happen'.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Someone is saying that youth are not important but when we talk about HIV/Aids we talk about the country's economy, because the youth are the future of our economy. With unhealthy youth it means we will not have a healthy economy so I am disturbed that this is

being objected to when half of this adjustment goes to HIV/Aids. Thank you.

[Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: I thank you. That concludes the debate on this Vote. Proceedings will now be suspended and will resume at two o' clock. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 12:30 and resumed at 14:00.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good afternoon members, welcome back. I am pleased to announce and I am sure you would have noticed the air-con is working so it is a lot cooler in here. Before we suspended there were quite a few members nodding off and I really felt for everyone who was all hot and bothered. So we will now continue with the business of the day and I will ask the Secretary to read the 6<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 5 – Education - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I have highlighted the extremely difficult financial situation we face on numerous

occasions and in numerous fora, and do not intend to do so again. When we look at this Adjustment Budget and see the addition of almost R300 million, it does not look too bad, given the constraints we face.

Unfortunately, about half of it is for the repair of three of our ASIDI schools that were finished over a year ago and that we have been unable to occupy for the whole of this year. Not that we are not grateful for everything we get, but it is unfortunately not going to allow us to appoint more teachers or provide more infrastructure.

In terms of this vote, the budget of the WCED will increase by over R283 million to bring the Adjusted Budget for the year to just over R19.5 billion. R142 492 million of that is the amount I refer to as being available from the DBE for the Education Infrastructure Grant for the purpose of the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative.

I have previously raised concerns about the increases in the cost of food that are affecting our Nutrition Programme. We are thus very pleased that an additional amount of R1 724 million has been made available to cover increases as a result of food inflation, especially because of the drought. Our Nutrition Programme currently feeds 474 472 children two nutritious meals every day, and is vital for learners in our poor communities, as it not only provides them with food they otherwise would probably not have, but also contributes to their ability to learn better.

In terms of reallocation of funding, the WCED reported an under-spend for the 2015/16 financial year of just over R126 million. This sounds horrific given the needs we have, but this was caused by the ceiling placed on the cost of employment by Treasury, and the fact that it takes a certain amount of time to fill posts. When one is dealing with a budget of R19 billion and a staff of 40 000, there will always be some delay. We did not want to take the risk of overspending in the current financial climate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] sitting next to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In addition we were not permitted to reallocate that money to other needs. We requested that this amount be re-allocated to us in the 2016/17 financial year.

We are pleased that this amount has been given back to us by Provincial Treasury. Of this amount, just over R66 million will be allocated to assist our schools in addressing their municipal debt arrears. The main reason for the steady increase in municipal debt by schools is that the amounts we are able to give do not keep up with the increases imposed by municipalities' year on year.

Many municipalities are trying to assist our schools with lower rates for service charges. Unfortunately others do not see it as their responsibility. I am appealing to municipalities to allow for special rates and service charges for our schools, especially those that cater for poorer communities.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] does not even listen to you. He is not even here.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: R59.5 million of the R126 million will be reallocated to relieve the financial pressure on public ordinary schools for both the 2016 and 2017 financial years. Schools are under immense pressure as a result of the increase in learner numbers in the province, the increase of conditions of service and the lack of concomitant budget.

Included in the increase is a roll-over of funds from the 2015/16 financial year of just over R40.8 million due to committed expenditure for the roll-out of LAN at schools for the e-Learning Game-Changer, as well as for the Grade R – 3 project. In addition, over R4.3 million has been rolled over owing to committed expenditure for learner furniture and equipment.

Despite the current financial climate and the budgetary constraints we face, the WCED continues to support pro-poor initiatives that assist our schools.

These initiatives include the compensation for fee exemption of poorer learners, learner transport and other forms of funding to schools. This year, the WCED made available over R47.5 million to assist schools which struggle to collect school fees. The original budget set aside for the Compensation for School Fee Exemptions was R46.3 million, with approval

being obtained to exceed this budget in order to cover the costs of 100% of applications for fee compensation. I am pleased that we were able to provide fee compensation to schools in cases where fee exemptions have been granted for some of our poorer learners, while I am cognisant that this has placed additional pressure on an already constrained budget.

There is no doubt that we face tough financial pressures at the moment. We have to do more with less and I would like to thank the Department for making every effort to effect savings and efficiencies which have enabled us to do extraordinary things with limited resources.

I would also like to thank and congratulate Mr Leon Ely and his team for achieving a second clean audit for the 2015/2016 financial year. This is as a result of strong internal financial controls and reflects the commitment and innovation of our financial managers.

Thank you too, to Provincial Treasury, who have had an unenviable task in trying to accommodate our needs and priorities, and my Cabinet colleagues, who have persisted in doing everything reasonably possible to assist our frontline services to maintain the best possible service delivery under the circumstances.

I would like to thank Mr Basil Kivedo and his team and the Standing Committee of Education for their enthusiastic support of the Department and interesting questions that we are asked and the spirit in which it is conducted.

I would also like to end by saying a heartfelt congratulations to Mr Brian Schreuder on his appointment as my Head of Department until March 2019. We have a difficult task ahead of us over the next few years, and I know I can count on his ongoing professionalism and support as we navigate it.

I request this House to approve the Education Adjustment Budget for the 2016/17 financial year.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer. I see the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker and I also thank the Minister for her very positive inset and I think three aspects that really stood out in her speech. Firstly, in spite of the budgetary constraints, we still kept very firmly to our vision and objective in terms of delivering quality education in the province. The second one is that still creating an enabling environment to provide job centred education, education that leads to jobs and leads to employment and I think that is very important. And then the third aspect that the Minister highlighted is the working in of synergy amongst the different entities and I think to me this is extremely important.

I think in terms of the Adjustment Budget, the whole rationale behind it is actually to enhance these objectives, and due diligence has been followed to achieve this. I am on the same page as my colleague, the hon member Magaxa so that means at times we concur, we both speak from the Freedom

Charter. Colleague Magaxa, the doors of learning and culture should be opened and it should never be burnt down, like in Vuwani in Limpopo. [Interjections.] Yes, let us keep it open, all of us [Interjection.] No, all of us, DA and ANC because it is an asset for our kids. Your kids are also at school, my kids, †*boetietjie* [little brother] [Laughter.] is at school so let us keep it open.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Providing everyone with an opportunity to get an education is the most important contribution that the Government can do to create a fair society and this is what we want. The DA-led Western Cape Government puts its money where its mouth is and what a sweet mouth that is hey? [Laughter.] And that is why we have increased the budget ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo if you could take your seat please. Hon member Dyantyi has got a point of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is of relevance. [Inaudible] if Mr Olivier can just take over and speak to us.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi? Sorry, if I may address you hon Dyantyi. Your first point on relevance, I am monitoring to see where the hon member comes to the appropriations but in terms of handing over, I am the

Speaker and I manage this House. So you may proceed hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The DA-led Western Cape puts the money where their mouth is and that is why we have increased the budget for the Department of Education with R283 million.

†Ek wil onder andere noem, agb Speaker, dat ten spyte van die afwaartse spiraal in die ekonomie en ook drukfaktore veral die aanhoudende droogte is daar geweldige druk op die begroting geplaas rondom die voedingskema. Maar desnieteenstaande het die Onderwysdepartement besluit om voort te gaan daarmee en het tot selfs die getal begunstigdes vermeerder en ek dink dit op sigself is 'n groot pluimpie. 500 000 begunstigdes word deur die voedingskema begunstig ten spyte van die feit dat klimatologiese faktore buite ons beheer is.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[I would like to mention amongst other things, Madam Speaker, that in spite of the downward spiral in the economy and also pressure factors of the continuous drought, massive pressure has been placed on the budget around the feeding scheme. But notwithstanding, the Education Department decided to continue with it and to even increase the number of beneficiaries, and I think that in itself is a feather in our cap. 500 000 beneficiaries benefit from the feeding scheme in spite of the fact that climatological factors are beyond our control.]

The Adjusted Budget includes several key interventions to further improve the Department's performance. The E-Learning Game-Changer will give access to high speed internet, giving poor learners the same opportunities as others and prepare them for the future. I am therefore happy an additional R49 million is set aside for the ICT implementation. A recent survey showed that 87.3% of people said 'yes, we are ready for e-learning' [Interjection.] And for the DA, yes.

Another important programme is the Early Childhood Development Programme with additional funds provided to promote participation in Grade R. The R30 million extra in the Adjusted Budget will therefore be most welcome and let me also reiterate to say that it is not only about ECD but it is about resourcing, it is about institutional capacity building, it is about trained facilitators, it is about the wellness of the learners, it is about health issues, it is about the safekeeping and all these, and that is intact. †Dit is so. [That is so.]

To improve results in underperforming schools, it is important with the new innovations that they can be tested and expanded if successful. I therefore welcome the Collaboration Schools pilot programme giving public schools a chance to improve, through partnerships, with an allocation of R80 million in the Adjusted Budget.

†Mag ek miskien net baie vlugtig noem, ek wil baie kort wees vandag; mag ek net vlugtig noem dat hierdie skool verbeteringsplan het nie net 'n

kwantifiseerbare inslag nie, dit gaan oor kwalitatiewe verbetering ook. Dit gaan oor bronverskaffing, dit gaan oor institusionele kapasiteitsbou, dit gaan oor metodologieverbetering, dit gaan oor die geheel van die skool dat dit 'n nuwe entiteit moet ... [Tussenwerpsel.] Is dit so? Jy stem saam, baie dankie. †Thank you, hon member Dyantyi. †Ek het geweet - jy moet net hierdie kant van die bank kom sit, né? [Tussenwerpsel.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[May I just mention briefly, I want to be very short today; may I just briefly mention that this school improvement plan does not only have a quantifiable base, it is about qualitative improvement as well. It is about provision of resources, it is about institutional capacity building, it is about methodological improvement, it is about the overall improvement of the school so that a new entity should... [Interjection.] Is that so? You agree, thank you.] Thank you, hon member Dyantyi. [I knew - you just have to come and sit on this side of the bench, hey? [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi. Hon member Kivedo, if you could speak through the Chair please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Education is one of the most important means by which we can relieve the plight of our children and rid our communities of poverty. It is only through improved educational outcomes that freedom, fairness and opportunity can offer the foundations on which our children can build to

realise their dreams. All our children. Wonderful hey? All our children. This education budget shows that the DA-run Western Cape Government is committed to redress the past, and by redress I mean redressing the past, not knocking down statues - †hulle voel mos nie die hamerhoue nie, man. Ons doen nie sulke goed nie. [Gelag.] [They do not feel the hammer blows, man. We do not do such things. [Laughter.]]... and give opportunities for everyone to create a fair society. In conclusion, I want extend a warm word of welcome hon member Dyantyi. [Interjection.] I like all people.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I like all people.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo, if you could take your seat please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Yes, I am sorry.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, it is a debate. To pose a question to the member across the floor without asking me if the hon member would take a question is unparliamentary. Thank you. You may proceed hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. I am going to conclude now by just extending the following thanks. In the first instance, God our Creator, for carrying us through this whole year, in our parliamentary sittings, in our dealings with

each other, in our engagements with one another, in our collegiality, in the fact that we could work together for a better province, for a better South Africa, for a better world. Thanks very much for that. [Applause.]

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Good!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you very much to Minister Debbie Schäfer and her Ministry for their relentless efforts in making education work in this province.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Swak!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Poor!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: The WCED officials, our Standing Committee especially for the collegiality and also the team work and the spirit in which our meetings have been conducted and also for their support. Thank you very much also to our Committee Co-ordinator, Wasiema Hassen Moosa; the media and research team, Josh Mfondu, and Stian; the parliamentary support staff; the media.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You like the media.

Mr B D KIVEDO: The school communities which we served, the staff, learners, SGBs and all other stakeholders involved in the field of education;

all my colleagues for their support; all the members for their inspiration and support.

I hereby table this budget, Madam Speaker [Laughter.] and I ask the House to accept it and last but not least, before I table it, this is the bottom line. I want you, hon member Dyantyi, to pay particular attention to our Premier Ms Helen Zille, who steered the boat and who kept the boat afloat and most of the time on course, even through rough and sometimes stormy waters but always steering it to clear and calm waters. I thank you so much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I thank you hon member Kivedo. I now see the hon member Olivier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now we are talking.

The SPEAKER: Hon members if you could afford the hon member an opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Shh, shh.

†Die SPEAKER: Hoor nou hoe sê agb Dyantyi “shh, shh”.

[The SPEAKER: Just listen how hon Dyantyi now says ‘shh, shh’.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now we are talking.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Somlomo, ndicela nifake eziya zinto. Mandiqale kule ndawo yokugqibela. Ndiyacela eliSebe, le DA. Ndifuna ukuboleka kobekekileyo uDyanti, laa mzekelo ebewenzile wokuba uMphathiswa wooRhulumente beMimandla ufana nemoto entsha, kodwa urhuqa inqwelo endala. Eli iSebe lijike nje kancinci. Iofisi yezopolitiko okanye okwisikhundla saloo ofisi, inkokheli yeli Sebe ifana nemoto endala etsala inqwelo entsha. Ndinga ukuba masiqale apho, masiqale apho. Okokuqala kufuneka sijonge abantwana besikolo umzekelo, ukuba bayakwazi ukubala, ukufunda, le nto ibithethwa kakuhle nguSihlalo, unyanisile. Eziya njongo zicacile sizibona kakuhle yaye siyazixhasa. Kodwa masijonge into ayenzayo. Uye kusithathela umthetho wokuzisa utywala ezikolweni, yiNtloko yeSebe leyo. Ngoko yinto yokuqala leyo endifuna siyijonge. Kodwa ke ayimoshakalanga kuye, imoshakele phezulu. Linelishwa eli Sebe. Iqale kwiNkulumbuso ngokuya yayisenguMphathiswa wayimosha kwayena, yeza kuMphathiswa uGrant wayibaxa ngakumbi. Namhlanje sinesikorokoro. Masiqhube ke size kolu hlahlo mali lwethu. Ama R 283 ezigidi zohlengahlengiso lohlahlo mali siyawamkela. Xa imali isiza siyakwamkela oko. kodwa masijonge ngenye nganye into eyenzeka apha, masiye apho. I R142 lezigidi, yaye uMphathiswa unyanisile, uthi isiqingatha sale mali siya kwinto ebifanele ukuba igqityiwe, nantso ke ingxaki iqala apho. Banikwa imali ukuba mabaye kwenza eziya zikolo zeCassidy, bazenze ezithathu bazenze zigqityiwe. Naba ooKraaifontein naba ooHawston. Abantwana abakwazi, bezifanele ukuba zivuliwe, ezinye kulo nyaka uphelileyo, ezinye kulo nyaka. Abantwana abakwazi ngoba abakwazanga ukusinika imveliso eza kukwazi ukuba abantwana bakhuseleke kuyo. Ngoko kuthetha ukuba le mali

igalelwa engxoweni evuzayo. Lilonke kukoyisakala kweSebe ekufuneka likwamkele ukuba loyisakele kumsebenzi walo wokuqinisekisa ukuba linikezela ngemveliso elungele ukuba abantwana bakwazi ukungena kuyo ilungile.

Ngoku uMphathiswa uthetha ngemali ezileyo yesondlo sabantwanandicinga ukuba nathi siyayamkela loo mali ivela kuzwelonke. Laa R 1.74 yesigidi ivela kuzwelonke siyayamkela. Kodwa xa ufunda phaya ukuba izele ntoni, ngokoMphathiswa lo wezimali. Uthi le mali ikhutshelwe ukuba, yaye ndifuna ukuyifunda ngesiNgesi. I R1.724 lezigidi kwezemfundo evela kwisibonelelo sikazwelonke sesondlo sabantwana bezikolo ukuze isetyenziswe ekonndleni abafundi nootitshala ngethuba lokufunda elongezelelweyo ukukhawulelana nezxesha elilahleke ngethuba kwakuphazamiseke ukufunda kuba kwakonakele iziseko. Uthetha enye into ngoku yena ngale mali, uthi yongezwa ngenxa yamaxabiso okutya nembalela. UMphathiswa wezezimali uthetha enye into. Yinto yokuba boyisakala phaya ukuba izikolo zakhiwe, kwafuneka abafundi basiwe kwezinye iindawo kwafuneka babonelele ngokutya nothutho. Kulapho loo mali iya khona. Nangona siyamkela, kodwa kasiniki ingxelo epheleleyo yokuba yeyantoni.

Ndigqithe, ndize kweyona inkulu nendicinga ukuba ndiza kukhe ndihlale kancinci kuyo, le yeziseko. Eli Sebe kwiVoti 10 kususwa imali iya kubo, ama R40 ezigidi aya phaya. Lelona Sebe lisebenza kakubi kakhulu eli. Alikwazi ukuba izikolo mazakhiwe, kanti iUN ikhuphe imali ukuze kwakhiwe izikolo. Kungokunje izikolo azikwazi kwakhekha, azikwazi ukulungela ukuba

abantwana babe kuzo. Ziyalibaziseka kuba isizathu esisinikwayo leli Sebe kukushokoxeka kwabasebenzi nokukwazi kweli Sebe ukusebenza. Ngoku nantsi imali kukhutshwa imali ukuze kuthengwe imihlaba kulungiswe nezakhiwo. Ingxaki yam kukuba eli Sebe alizukukwazi ukuyichitha le mali, ngoba lisibonisile ukuba liyoyisakala. Sibuye size kwiSebe elifumene !00% lokufezekiswa kweenjongo. Ngokuqinisekileyo bekuya kuba lihlazo ukuba zingafezekiswa ezo njongokwesi sihlandlo. Iinjongo ezintandatho? Kwaye yiloo nto le ithethwa nguNondyebo, uthi ezemfundo zifezekise iinjongo zazo ezintandathu. Kodwa, ukodwa omkhulu, kufuneka siqaphele ukuba ziinjongo ezintandathu kuphela. Eli ke liSebe eline R19.6 bhiliyoni, mabayenze loo nto. Boyiswa kwaleli leMidlalo lingenamali linama 31 eenjongo. Ukuqhayisa ngokufezekisa I 100% yeenjongo kanti ufezekisa izinto ezintandathu. Ngoku ziinjongo ezinzima. Azinzimanga ezamanye amasebe? Ngoko yingxaki. Yiyo le nto ndibuyela kulaa ndawo ndisithi iNtloko yale ndawo yingxaki, yaye ukuba abakazukuyitshintsha iseza kuba yingxaki ukubheka phambili.

Masigqithe, masigqithe kancinci, ngoba sifuna ukuyixhasa le nto. Sifuna ukujonga iindlela zokuyixhasa ngoba kakade iza kunceda abantwana. Oko ndiyijonga ndijonga ukuba yeyiphi indawo endinokuthi ndiyivume, kodwa yingxaki. Ngoku masijonge ngoSeptemba. Ngomhla wama 30 kaSeptemba kwiZiseko Mphathiswa xa sijonga imali, ingxelo ithi. Asiyongxelo yam, yingxelo eyandlalwe kuthi. Ndiyafuna kodwa ndincedise, nceda undincedise. Umzuzwana Sihlalo. Xa ujonga phaya kwisishwankathelo sesiphumo senkcitho yekota yesibini,ngomhla wama 30 Septemba 2016. ISebe ngomhla wama 30 Septemba kunyaka mali ongaphambili belichithe ama 49.7%

kwiziseko. Yiyo le nto ndisithi eliya Sebe leMisebenzi yoLuntu liyingxaki. Kwangexesha elinye kulo nyaka ngama 46.6 %, ngoko sibuyela emva, sibuya umva ngokomseenzi wethu kulaa nkalo. Ngoko nangona siyifumana imali, isiqingatha sayo siya kwinto ebifanele ukuba igqityiwe. Ndinga ukuba uMphathiswa kufuneka aphakame xa ephendula athi siyayivuma loo nto. Ngokungabeki kwethu esweni lowo ufanele ukujongana nalo msebenzi wokuqinisekisa ukuba izikolo zinikezelwa ngexesha, yaye zikwimiko elungele ukuba abafundi bangene kuzo kwangexesha. Siyavuma ukuba sibe yinxalenye yokoyisakala kuba besifanele ukubeka esweni, sijonge uyilo yonke loo nto. Kodwa ingxaki ilele ekubeni bobabini uMphathiswa weMisebenzi yoLuntu nowezeMfundo abanalo ulwazi lokuba kwenzeka ntoni kumasebe abo.

Ngoku masize kulo mba, nesiwuxhasayo le yokuba masincedise izikolo, umzekelo kulaa ma R56 ezigidi okuba masincedise izikolo ukuhlawula iindleko zeenkonzos. Ewe, ngoba izikolo azikwazi ukuhlawula. Mna ndifuna ukwenza isiphakamiso ukuba baza kusithatha aBaphathiswa ngoba kuthiwa siyagxeka oko. ndifuna ukwenza isiphakamiso sokuba athethe noMphathiswa wezeZimali, acele uMphathiswa woRhulumente beMimandla kunye naye, bakhe bathethe nooSodolophu naBalawuli booMasipala ukujonga ukuba nguwuphi na umfuziselo onokusetyenziswa ukuncedisana nezikolo ukuba zingahlawuli amatyala eenkonzo angaka. Okwesibini kwakhona neqela elisebenzayo elibeke esweni ukuba akukho kusetyenziswa kakubi na ezikolweni, ukuba iinqununu azikubeki sweni ukusetyenziswa kakubi kweenkonzo. Ngoko siza kuba neliya qela laphakathi kwamasebe lisebenza

ngobambiswano. Ngoku uMphathiswa uthe kuthi uthethile nooSodolophu abambalwa, yaye bayaqhankqalaza. Ngoku ufuna iNdlu yoWisomthetho. Ilungile ke loo nto, singawubeka umthetho, kodwa obuya budlelane phakathi kwala manqanaba mabini, oorhulumente bemimandla nephondo abuzukuthi xa siza kuthi simise umthetho ebantwini ibe yingxaki. Sithi khanihlale kuba ama 80% aba masipala ngabenu, benithe nibaphumelele. Yintoni ngoku le inzima ukuthetha nabo, kutheni beza kuqhankqalaza xa nithi mabanincedise? Ewe ngama 80%, ndiyavuyisana nani kodwa noyisakele. Sebeqhankqalaza ngoku xa nibacela ukuba banincedise ukujonga ukuba bangazinceda njani izikolo malunga neendleko zeenkonzelo. Ewe ngabenu, kodwa sele beqhankqalaza, 80%, nokuba ithini na loo pesenti. Yiyo le nto ndiphakamisa ukusekwa kweqela eliphakathi kwamasebe, mhlawumbi naBaphathiswa neeNtloko zaMasebe ziqwalasele lo mba nabanye baBalawuli booMasipala nooSodolophu ukujonga ukuba asinakuhlangabezana na, kuba yingxaki ngenene le. Okokugqibela Sihlalo, ukuba asikazakhi izikolo, ukuba asikatyali imali ezikolweni ebezifanele ukuba sele zinikezelwe, kuthetha ukuthi abafundi bethu, laa miyinge besizama ukufikelela kuyo yama 36 ngomntu omye kubanga aphakamileyo nama 34 kumabanga aphantsi ayinakufezeka. Xa kujongwa bayanda abafundi abezayo, nakulo nyaka uzayo kuza kuza abanye, kodwa inkqubo yethu yeziseko zethu azimmelani naloo mngeni. Isicelo sesokuba xa iSebe leMisebenzi yoLuntu lifumana imali, aninayo na enye iarhente yomiliselo ngaphandle kweSebe leMisebenzi yoLuntu? Kuba eliya Sebe alikwazi nokulungisa imiiba yalapha ecaleni kwendlu. Andiqinisekanga ukuba bayakwazi ukwakha izikolo. Ngoko ngelo nkqaku Sihlalo, nangona

ndifuna ukuxhasa, ngoku kufuneka basinike isizathu sokwenjenjalo. Ndiyabulela.

**[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]**

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Hon Speaker, please use your devices. Let me start with the last part appeal to this Department, this DA. I want to borrow from the hon member Dyantyi, the example he made of the MEC for Local Government who drives a new car, but is towing an old trailer. This Department has turned completely. The political office, the office bearer, the leader of this Department is like an old car towing a new trailer. I think let us start there. We must first look at school children, for example that they can count and write, the Chair has stated this well, it is true. Those objectives are clear, we can see them and we support them. But let us look at what she is doing. She brought us legislation that allows alcohol at schools, that is an HOD. That is the first thing I want us to look at. But the damage did not start with her, it started long ago. This Department has bad luck. It started when the Premier was MEC, she made the damage, then came MEC Grant and made things worse. Today we have a wreck. Let us continue and come to this Adjustment Budget. We welcome the R283 million of the Adjustment Budget. We welcome money when it comes. But let us look one by one what is happening here. R142 million, and the MEC is right when she says half of that amount goes to things that were supposed to have been finished, that is where the problem starts. They were allocated funds to go and build Cassidy schools, they built three and they are complete. There is Kraaifontein and Hawston.

The learners cannot move in, they were supposed to have been opened, some last year and others this year. The learners cannot move in because they could not give us a product that was safe for children. That means this money is going down the drain. All in all it is the failure of the Department which they have to admit, of failing to ensure that they deliver a product that is suitable for learner occupation.

Now the MEC talks about money they received for child nutrition, and we welcome that money from National Government. We welcome the R1.74 from National. But when one reads what the money is for, according to the MEC for Finance, he says this money has been given so that, and I want to read this in English - R1.724 million to education from the National Nutrition Grant to be used for the nutrition of learners and educators during a recovery camp for time lost when learning was interrupted due to infrastructure damage. Now she says something else about this money, she says it has been allocated because of food prices and drought. The MEC for Finance says something different. It is because they failed to have schools built, and learners had to be taken to other places and provided with food and transport. That is where the money goes. Although we welcome it, she does not give us a full report what it is for.

Let me move on, and come to the big one on which I think I will dwell on a bit longer, the infrastructure money was shifted in Vote 10 to this Department, R40 million went there. This is the worst performing Department. They do not build schools, but the UN has allocated money for

the building of schools. Currently schools are not being built, they are not fit for pupil occupation. They are delayed because the reason we get from that Department is that they are short staffed and have no capacity. Now here is money, allocated for the purchase of land and refurbishing of buildings. The problem I have is that this Department will not be able to spend this money, because they have shown us they fail. Let us get to a Department that achieved 100% of its targets. Obviously it would have been a disgrace if they had not achieved the six targets. Six targets? And that is what Treasury says, that they achieved their six targets. However, let us note that they had only six targets. This is a Department with R19.6 billion to do that. They are beaten by the Department of Sport that has no money and 31 targets. They boast about achieving 100% of targets while talking about six targets. They say these are complicated targets. Are targets in other Departments not complicated? That is a problem. That is why I come back to where I said the HOD is the problem, and as long as they do not change the HOD, there will always be a problem going forward.

Let us move on, let us move on a bit because we want to support this. We want to look at ways of supporting it because it is going to help children. I have been looking at it trying to figure out which part to agree with, but it is a problem. Now let us look, in September. On 30th September 2016 with infrastructure, MEC, when we look at the money the report says. It is not my report, it is a report that was tabled to us. I want to, but please help me, help me. Just a second, Chair. When you look at the expenditure outcomes of the second quarter, on 30 September 2016. At the same period in the previous

year the Department spent 49.7% on infrastructure. That is why I say the Department of Public Works is a problem. At the same time this year it is 46.6%, therefore we are moving backwards in that space. So although we do get the money, half of it goes to something that is supposed to be completed. I think the MEC must stand up and say when she responds that they agree. By not monitoring whoever is in that chain of ensuring the provision of schools on time and in a condition suitable for pupil accommodation - we agree that we were part of the failure by not monitoring and inspecting the design and all that. But the problem is that both the MEC for Education and Public Works do not know what is happening in their departments.

Now let us come to this issue, which we support, that we must assist schools, for example that R56 million for the assistance to schools with their service debts. Yes, because schools cannot afford - I want to make a proposal if the MECs will accept, because they say we always criticise. I want to propose that she speaks to the MEC for Finance, ask the MEC for Local Government to speak to some Municipal Managers and Mayors to see what model can be used to assist schools to pay such huge debts. Secondly, a Task Team to monitor the abuse of services at schools, whether principals monitor the use of services at their schools. Therefore we would have that Interministerial Team working collectively. Now the MEC told us that he has spoken to a few Mayors, and they are resisting. Now he wants the Legislature. It is fine, we can legislate, but that relationship between those two spheres of government, Local Government and Province, will it not be a problem when we legislate? We say to you, sit down. 80% of those municipalities are yours, you said you

won them. Why is it difficult to talk to them, why would they resist your request for assistance? Yes, 80%, but you failed them. They are already resisting when you ask them to see how they can assist with service tariffs. Yes, they are yours, 80%, whatever the percentage is they are already resisting. That is why I suggest the setting up of an Inter-ministerial Team, maybe with MECs and HODs with some Mayors and Municipal Managers to see if we cannot meet each other half way, because this is a real problem. Lastly Chair, if we do not build schools, if we do not plough money back to schools that should have been handed over, that means our learners, the ratios that we were trying to reach, 36:1 at high school and 34:1 at primary will not be achieved. Taking into account that we are getting more learners, even next year we will have more learners, but our infrastructure programme does not stand up to that challenge. The request is that when the Department of Public Works gets money, do you not have another implementing agent, except the Department of Public Works? Because that Department cannot attend to minimal issues. I am not sure if they can build schools. On that point, Chair, as much as we would love to support, they must give us reasons to do so. Thank you.] [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Member. I see the ACDP.

*[Hon member Mr L H Max takes the Chair.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. I see the

ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, thank you very much. I want to just quote what Nelson Mandela said. He said:

‘Education is the most powerful weapon which can be used to change the world.’

That is why, Chair, with the budgetary constraints, with the reckless governance of the ANC at National Government, our poor children are suffering. We welcome the Nutrition Programme because some of our children ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: I just want to ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is it a point of Order hon member?

Mr S G TYATYAM: My point of order is that Mandela did not say all of this because ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order. Sit down please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: He is supposed to close quotes. You must close quotes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sit down please. I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chair. You know I wish that the ANC could go to the communities. This School Nutrition Programme is sometimes the only food they receive. Weekends are a difficult time because they do not have food. How can you not support this Adjustment Budget? How can you vote against it if you care for the poor? So they are all talk and no work. Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, acting Speaker. Hon member Kivedo, thank you very much for your kinds words and once again for your constructive chairing of your Committee. I completely agree with you, I am very glad †*boetietjie* [little brother] is at school and I hope he is enjoying it and having a good time.

e-Learning is coming on very nicely, thank you. By the end of this financial year we should have the vast majority, if not all of our schools connected to Broadband and there is a lot of excitement in the districts regarding e-Learning and a lot of training going on over weekends that our teachers are attending.

Collaboration schools I have dealt with in the second reading debate and yes, it is a welcome initiative for a system that needs drastic improvement as we have recently seen from the release of the TIMSS results.

Hon member Olivier, I am not really quite sure what you are talking about in many respects. Learners must read and write, I completely agree with you and well, that is a good point. They certainly must read and write and it is a huge concern that far too many of them still are not reading and writing properly, which is why we have introduced the Grade R - 3 Project to try and ensure that we have excellent HODs to improve the reading and writing at the school, but it needs to be spread far wider than that if we get money.

My Bill has got nothing to with this budget at all, save to say as I have said before: the National Minister is also looking at something similar. We need to look at the reality that the alcohol problems that we face are not caused by adults drinking at school functions, because it is currently illegal and the problem is existing right now. So that shows you that it is not the cause.

So, as far as the schools are concerned I agree with you, it is very frustrating. It was a private sector company in fact that made the mistake. There are guarantees in place that we can recover the money, but unfortunately it takes a huge amount of time to do that. We have to first go through a lot of processes to quantify the damages and ensure that we fix them in the meantime before we can actually claim for them. So that is a concern and it has been very frustrating for me and for the learners at the school. As for

moving backwards we are certainly not moving backwards at all, we are moving forward very nicely in fact. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] a note.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: You are giving me a note? That is nice. Right.

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: R66 million, yes, you are opposing that. You are opposing the norms and standards funding to schools which is very unfortunate. As far as the issue of the municipalities is concerned, I have spoken to a lot of municipalities already. [Interjections.] As I said it is very – can I speak please or not?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Continue.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, one moment please. Hon member Olivier, can you stand up please? In the short time that I am actually chairing here, I cannot recall that I actually afforded you the opportunity. I acknowledged the Minister, not you. Can we have order please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Chair, can I address you on that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, you do not have – sit down please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Chair, but at least allow me to address you. Maybe ...  
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Right, address, address.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, I am following the Rules Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No. Address.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Chair, is it parliamentary that I am being misrepresented by the MEC, because I did not object to anything? I made a recommendation what to do with the R66 million. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order. That is not a point of order, hon member.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I am addressing you ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that is not a point of order. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Mr Chairperson. As far as the service charges are concerned; as I say it is very dependent upon individual municipalities and I have made a proposal at KEM that we in

fact look as a sector at introducing legislation in this regard because then it will be compulsory for them to grant us special service charges.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is nice when hon member Max comes to your rescue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: He did not come to my rescue at all. I was in the middle of a sentence when I was interrupted by continuous commentary.

As far as ASIDI infrastructure is concerned, the R142 million, of that R91 million is actually for the remedial work. The remainder of R51 million is in fact the funds that were later transferred to us. And regarding the expenditure rate, as at the 30<sup>th</sup> of November, it is in fact 67% already and I have no concerns. You cannot look at last year's expenditure now and say the really important part is the end of year expenditure and I have no doubt at all that we will be on track and spend all our money.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Watch this space.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, I mean it is not only buildings that will help us reduce the teacher/learner ratio, it is also teachers which, thanks to the ANC mismanagement, we cannot afford.

Hon member Christians, thank you very much for your support, it is much appreciated. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon Minister. This concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the 7<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I see the hon Speaker.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Chairperson, hon Premier and members. Thank you for the opportunity to present the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's Adjustment Estimate for 2016/2017. The Adjustment Budget that is presented amounts to R129.321 million. This is R1.5 million less than the main budget.

When determining the Adjustment Budget, we took into account our actual expenditure for the period 1<sup>st</sup> of April 2016 until the 30<sup>th</sup> of September 2016, and the projected expenditure from the 1<sup>st</sup> of October 2016 until the end of the financial year. We looked at our planned targets and the likelihood of the attainment thereof.

We came to the conclusion that we will attain most of the targets. The implementation of the ERP system will however be achieved later than planned, and this was as a result of an extended procurement process. We

have now selected an ERP system and a service provider to assist with the implementation thereof.

We also looked at efficiency measures and at savings of R756 000 will be realised in this regard. These savings are mainly from subscriptions, catering and travel. We have also projected an underspending in compensation of employment mainly due to vacancies that were filled later than expected.

There were also savings due to fewer than anticipated contributing members, fees for Parmed, and an over provision for Provincial Gazettes. On the other hand we had to make provision to cover unfunded additional costs of legislative sector activities which is often informed from the NA and the National Council of Provinces. These activities included a youth day celebration, Women's Parliament, as well as the high level panel public hearings on the impact of key legislation which takes place on the 5<sup>th</sup> and the 6<sup>th</sup> of December. We expect that the cost to the Provincial Parliament will amount to R512 000.

In summary, R1.887 million was taken from Programme 1 and R387 000 was added to programme 3. The net effect, as mentioned earlier, is R1.5 million that will be added to the 2016/2017 budget of the vote of ERP related expenditure. As I alluded to in previous debates, and also to the POC, many other legislatures have secured state of the art ERP systems which could start at anything like R40 million, and we have really tried to maintain and cover our costs by securing not a Rolls Royce, but a system that could do the job

equally well.

In conclusion, I wish to thank the Parliamentary Oversight Committee under the Chairmanship of hon member Wiley for his support and robust oversight over the vote. I also wish to thank hon member Uys, in his absence, for his constant unpacking and ‘please explain’, it keeps us on our toes and I think it has added value to the oversight process.

Lastly, I would like to thank the Deputy Speaker, but most importantly I would like to thank the Secretary and each and every single individual at WCPP who have worked willingly and with great commitment despite the constraints that we face, and who manage to make the Western Cape Provincial Parliament the Parliament that it is. We are certainly becoming a beacon within South Africa and if we continue in this way we might become, not might, we will become the best regional Parliament and in fact we are looking at the best Parliament in Africa. So I would like to say thank you to the team of people who have made it happen. I thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I see the Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Chairperson. On the face of it, the Adjustment of only R1.5 million within Vote 2, as just described by the Speaker is minimal and needs little amplification. However, it does not tell

the full story and it is important to remind ourselves of the critical role of a legislature and a democracy.

The three legs upon which most countries function, also known to political scientists as the Trias Politica, are the legislature, the executive and the judiciary. The legislature makes the laws and oversees compliance. The executive governs and delivers within those laws and the judiciary ensures the enforcement and renounces any breaches of the law.

In order to give effect to the balance of the structure, it is vital that each leg of this potentially fragile system, where each leg must enjoy a measure of independence, is adequately resourced. Although this Legislature is inextricably linked to the ways of our Provincial Treasury, the health of the legislature must be seen by all of its members as an essential part of its very existence and commitment to our democracy.

The Western Cape Parliament is currently faced with multiple challenges and not the least of which is the increasing austerity measures which are being applied as a result of a shrinking national economy. One does not want to turn this debate into a political slanging match, but one would be simply dishonest if we did not admit to one another that this declining economy is peculiar to the National Government and the bulk of the other provinces, while the Western Cape Province is showing positive growth with an increase in employment figures and overall excellence in government.

It is also a fact that this Legislature does more with less, than any other legislature and it makes interesting reading to compare the various legislatures in South Africa.

The Minister of Finance, a man being driven by figures, may find these comparisons interesting. The province with the highest legislature budget is Gauteng with R594 million, 372 staff to service 73 members.

The Eastern Cape has a budget of R465 million, 364 staff and 62 members, while the nearest approximation to us is the sparsely populated Northern Cape with a budget of R161 million, 122 staff and 30 members. The Western Cape trails with a cost of R120 million, 107 staff and 42 members.

It is the comparative per member cost that is really revealing. Mpumalanga and North West Provinces cost in excess of R9.5 million per member per annum. The nearest other province is less, but not by much more, while the Western Cape currently spends only R3.59 million per member. Almost R2 million per annum less than our northerly neighbour, the Northern Cape. Comparisons may be misleading but it is as an indicator. Possibly a red light as well.

More importantly, the fact that the WCPP manages to deliver a quality service is a tribute to their motivation, dedication and an indication of solid leadership.

Western Cape Provincial Parliament is also routinely asked by the National Legislature, most notably the NCOP, to provide assistance in national programmes for example, next week's legislative conference which the Speaker alluded to.

Based on past experience this is largely an unfunded mandate. To the Secretary Doctor, Dr Lawrence and his staff, we thank you all for your willingness to service. Other challenges which have had to be confronted of late have been the discovery and subsequent evacuation as a result of asbestos within the Legislature.

The contingency plans have been seamlessly implemented to ensure that we can continue our work and hence we find ourselves temporarily spread around in order to complete our vital work. Similarly, the conversion to the necessitated FAMPLA, GRAB and ERP systems is seriously underfunded and one would sincerely hope that the sparse funding given will be sufficient to maintain the standards we have come to expect of our Parliament, but there is no more fat on this particular cow.

More historical challenges remain the complex relationship with the Department of Public Works and the shared tenancy of 7 Wale Street. It is a fact that space at the Legislature is at a premium and the building as a whole is beginning to take strain under the weight of increased traffic.

Dysfunctional lifts, leaking roofs, burst pipes, IT overloads and lapses in

security, both in equipment breakages and staff duties, make for challenging times and these matters are going to have to be dealt with sooner rather than later. We must prioritise these matters in future budgets.

In conclusion, Chairperson, I ask that the House supports this Adjustment Budget and would like to take this opportunity to wish all the members of the House and the staff Western Cape Provincial Parliament, a safe and fulfilling festive season and Christmas. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Chair of the session and the former Chair of Transport and Public Works. [Laughter.] My apology that I am pushing the Chair, but you will hear when we speak, part of the problem about this Chair.

Let me just start by thanking the Speaker for what you have put forward and say, perhaps just to remind ourselves, because I am rising with an inclination that as hon member Olivier was saying, looking at reasons for us to support this budget.

The aim of this Parliament is that it must be a parliamentary administration that will provide quality parliamentary and corporate support to enable members to fulfil their constitutional functions and to facilitate public involvement in parliamentary activities by, and I am just going to list the

three:

- Investing in appropriate skilled staff. Mark that.
- Providing a secure environment that is conducive to empowering and enabling members and staff.

If you just read that and you understand the cry that hon member Lentit made this morning, we already know that even before we make an assessment we are very far from even coming close to that. We have failed dismally. I am pushing it Chair, because of where we are. Just on that point.

The third one says: managing resources effectively, efficiently and economically and I am going to come back to that.

This is what is supposed to drive us. This is the mantra. This is the aim that we are supposed to achieve. The Speaker, in her conclusion, thanked the staff for playing such a good role, but before the Speaker sends out her thanks to the staff, perhaps she will listen to some of the following things.

This Legislature seems to continue to be a backup for the Provincial Treasury so that they must always be reminded that Provincial Treasury must come and fetch from this Parliament. Even with the change in financial regime for Parliament and Legislatures, we see this subservient Legislature like in many other years again, has this urgency to give back money or show some savings, as they call it.

What is interesting is the sweet way in which the Adjustment Budget entry refers to R1.5 million “became available”. As a result of savings due to an unfilled position for a Deputy Secretary for the institution this time the amount will be rolled over for some other purpose that I will share with you later.

It is especially strange that the Legislature is right now in the middle of a process of shedding staff members. We saw earlier this year a report by the SY Secretary highlighting the plight of workers who are paid too little, overworked and demoralised. A recipe for slavery conditions. This is the staff that the Speaker is thanking.

There is a report on her desk about how to deal with this. I have just read to you the aim about investing in skilled, trained staff. Managing your resources. That is just hot air. So, when you talk about practice, she cannot live up to that practice. This is what we are talking about. So, I do not know what she is thanking staff for, when she cannot look after the staff, because this institution is not a service delivery institution that must build houses as Minister Madikizela does. Your best assets in this institution are your people and these are the very people that you are not able to look after and I will come back to that.

We do not see a significant adjustment to ease the pain and problems of the workers, but what we see, the money saved as it is in the Adjustment, goes straight into a kitty for enterprise resource planning, of all things. This

really feeds the negative perception that the DA does not care for people or the poor working class.

We need a more tangible commitment to those people who work and keep this place going. Let me just give you a few examples about the staff and how we look after them. The people who have carried us through up until this point, as we rise today, in this Parliament, they leave with no hope. They are demoralised. Two examples:

1. The sub-programme on Human Resource Management. None of the targets were achieved and the reasons for deviations are not acceptable, especially staff constraints which are in all units, but the leader of this institution will get a performance bonus.
2. The sub-programme on Public Education and Outreach. This is almost non-existent. You have all targets being achieved, six out of six. Despite such an achievement the manager did not secure a performance bonus for the year under review.

What does that say to you? It speaks about some animals being more important than others.

An HON MEMBER: Animal Farm.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is *Animal Farm*. That is the book – she is. Where is consistency here? There is no consistency. Let me also talk about the ERP.

In the Annual Report we interrogated this issue, because the blockage in the ERP is purely bad planning. Simply put, it is like starting a match and only introducing the rules at half time. That is why we are stuck. I hope you understand it better now. You start a match and then you change the rules after 45 minutes, because you are behind in terms of the team. That is the only excuse the leader can give us on this particular issue. To make things worse, you do not have anything put on the table to say, this is how we are going to fast-track it. There is hope that it will happen on its own.

So, I am saying therefore, Chair, I am trying to see a reason why we on this side should support this, but when you have got staff that work under these conditions, you give us no option. Why should we support a budget that is so inconsistent? Staff are not looked after. Even the members are running up and down. Hon member Wiley calls it “discovery”. That is the reason why we are here. Member Wiley says it is “discovery”. We have discovered that there are problems where we were. That is a very nice discovery. According to me that is not “discovery”, that is incompetence and bad planning. You will not understand until I take it through offline.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi, will you please address the Chair?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I respect you, Chair. [Interjection.] †Ek het nog baie tyd. Moenie worry nie. Ek het nog baie tyd. [I still have a lot of time. Don't worry. I still have a lot of time.] †Chair, even if you take this Adjustment,

every sub-programme - Office of the Speaker - because if you are speaking about austerity measures, we should not be talking about any trip that any of you takes.

How can you speak about austerity measures, but you continue to travel? It cannot be.

An HON MEMBER: Holidays, holidays.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot be. The office of the Speaker - underspending is due to the Treasury Office not established in that office, meaning that even the CFO, the financial management, in the Speaker's Office is not established and hence there is underspending.

You cannot blame that on "discovery" . That is incompetence. †"Kry dit soos dit is." [Get it as it is.] The Office of the Secretary - I thought I would see him here. I do not see him. Underspending because of vacancy. I can go on and let me do that. Sub-programme 1.3, Finance ... [Interjection.][Time expired.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, order. Hon member Dyantyi, your time is expired. Thank you so much. I see the ACDP, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, is this the same MEC that was fired in

the air?

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms P MAKELENI: Where were you?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: That wants to lecture us?

Ms P MAKELENI: Where were you?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, I want to thank the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker for their leadership. I think, as members, we are treated well. I do not think this is the platform where you come and vent for the staff. I think the member must go and speak to the Speaker behind the scenes if there are staff problems, but we want to compliment the staff for excellent service and I want to tell the ANC members if they vote against the adjustments here, their funding will be cut! That is my recommendation, hon Chair. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Christians. I am glad to hear that you are in charge of the purse. I recognize the hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chairperson. I must appreciate the fact that the hon member Dyantyi is not only an expert in local government but HR and I

believe he has taken on Drama 101 now too. So, if we could get to the matter at hand. We have occupied the building across the way for a really long time and the fact that the blue asbestos has surfaced now, I think it is an indictment on the previous government who should have then found it then already. So, we do not simply go around putting blue asbestos into buildings. It is there by nature of the design.

I must say though the project to remove the asbestos is well on track and we will have a briefing by the Department of Public Works tomorrow to advise on the progress in that regard. I must also apologise to the members for the inconvenience of having to use this facility. Unfortunately, we could not expose our members to the Chamber whilst the blue asbestos was there [Interjection.] So, we are grateful for the opportunity we were afforded [Interjection.] to use this facility. Chairperson, can you protect me, please?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Madam Speaker, one moment. Hon members, I do not think we have a choir here. Please afford the hon Speaker an opportunity to address the House with regards to her vote. Thank you. Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chair. So, in terms of accommodation we have listed it and the Parliamentary Oversight Committee is the place where these matters are deliberated at length. The Internal Arrangements Sub-Committee which both the Chief Whips, hon member Uys and hon member Wiley are on, the members and the parties have been appraised. I do believe though, if

there is a communication problem within the party, we cannot be held accountable for that.

Then I would like to talk about the Financial Management of Parliament Act. Yes, hon member Dyantyi, there is still a provision for a Treasury Officer. You know why? The [Inaudible.] who initiated this actual situation that we find ourselves in, cannot tell us what that Treasury Officer looks like or what that person needs to do.

So, in terms of the Financial Management of Parliament Act, we alerted the National Assembly to the fact that there was a problem in 2014 and they proceeded to go ahead and now we face a real problem.

In terms of Treasury, we do not give money back to Parliament in terms of FAMPLA. So, whatever roll-over we have will stay with us and I think that is something the members need to appraise themselves on. I provided the Minister of Finance with a draft letter regarding our engagements going forward, because Parliament, rightfully so, should be maintained in its own space and we should respect the separation of powers.

I do go to the Minister and I do engage him around funding and the fact that if you look at our 108 staff, or our positions we have, compared to the very next province and I think it would be useful ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just stay here [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No-no, I don't. Hon member Dyantyi, you have been afforded an opportunity to speak, so I would like to respond.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Speak to the Chair.

The SPEAKER: I will speak to the Chair ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi. One moment, Madam Speaker. I do not think I need your assistance, hon member Dyantyi. Please allow the Speaker to address the House. Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chairperson. Let us talk about a province like Mpumalanga. Mpumalanga has 30 members. We have 42. Mpumalanga's actual staff is 194 compared to our 101 ... [Interjection.] So, there is a serious ... [Interjection.] And if you think Mpumalanga is a problem ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! Order!

The SPEAKER: Chairperson ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! Order! One moment, Madam Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: This side of the House, the Opposition

side. There is a noise which is totally unacceptable and I think Madam Speaker has the right to address this House without any interference. I do not mind if it is politically related, but you cannot go on with this noise and shouting in the way that you do. And if there are members that are guilty on the other side, it is also applicable to you as well. Hon member Olivier do you want to address the Chair?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Please, Chair. I think we are all honourable members here. Secondly, some of us were quiet. What you are now saying includes us, when you are saying this side of the House. So, we will ask you Chair, to address the member that is out of order, not generalise because you are including those who are attentively listening to Madam Speaker. So, I am just raising that, Chair, that we are not general ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Olivier. Let me make it very categorically clear. It was difficult to differentiate who the person was. It was a choir. A choir! So, without any further ado, please co-operate and allow Madam Speaker to address the House. Madam Speaker? [Interjection.] Please, please hon members. Your co-operation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chairperson. So, as I said, Mpumalanga has 30

members with a 194 staff. It gets worse. The North-West Province has 33 members and they have 208 staff. So, this document which was on the front page of *City Press* has been brought to Treasury's notice and we cannot become an employment agency to the nation.

So, despite the fact that we only have 100-odd staff members, I do believe we are doing well. Let us dispel the myth that the hon member Dyantyi has talked about, shedding jobs. If the hon member Dyantyi has a question, he should come and knock on my door and ask me, not operate in a grapevine that goes down the corridor, because we are not shedding jobs. We heard the Minister of Finance tell us about capping the cost of employment. So, we can now work with the bums on seats and we can actually improve the numbers so that we can give the support to committees, to plenary and to PEO. To say that Public Education and Outreach has not done anything is unfair. Mr Ferndale and his team have run with the Youth Parliament. They have run with all these initiatives and I would like to add that when it comes to the compensation of employees it is not my place as the Speaker to interfere and to say who gets a bonus or who does not get a bonus, because we should be guided by policies and procedures. And I understand that there are people who feel aggrieved ... [Interjection.] Hon member Dyantyi, when we talk about consistency, then we need to define and understand the meaning of that word.

So, what I would like to say, we have done well under the circumstances and when I say "we", I talk about the staff. Talking about skill: we have a very

highly skilled workforce. People who are professional. They ...  
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You found them to be like that.

The SPEAKER: Well, call it what you will. The hon member Dyantyi might say they have been found. I think in the role of the administration, we are there to serve all members, irrespective of their political affiliation and I would like to believe that the staff are non-partisan in the way they go about their business and I really do believe the staff, who are the heroes of the day, go out of their way to ensure ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! Order!

The SPEAKER: Chair, if I may address you. ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! Order! Order! Hon members, it is the last day today that this House is sitting and I do not think it will be very nice if somebody is going to be asked to leave this House before it adjourns officially. Can I have your co-operation? Madam Speaker, you may continue.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I am speaking today in my capacity as the Head of Parliament. So, I am not wearing a party colour. I am talking to a work force that is here to ensure that all our 42 members get the service afforded

to them that we profess in our vision and in our mission.

Let us talk about that ERP tender process. Unfortunately, we do not jump the queue and do tenders for pals. So, the fact that our ERP system has taken a little bit longer, is because we have crossed every single 't' and dotted every 'i', unlike in many other provinces where we hear what happens in the procurement system. We have, as Parliament, followed [Interjection.] the tender and bid adjudication process to the letter. I am certain that once the ERP system comes in - it is not just about finance, it will convert HR - all the other departments will come on stream to the ERP system and I think the purpose would be to make life easier for our members and to enable our staff to do their work more efficiently.

I must again apologise for the inconvenience, but I do trust that come February 2017, we will be able to go back into the Chamber and we will all be back across the way and we will actually have our State of the Province Address back in our old home Chamber.

Chairman, it would be remiss of me not to thank the Deputy Speaker, in his absence; he has been a huge support and he has provided guidance in a manner that I can only say is exemplary and I would also like to thank my Head of Office, Jannie Uys and the team in the Speaker's Office, despite the numbers, we only have four or five staff members. In the Eastern Cape there is something like 20 people in the Speaker's Office [Interjection.] and despite these challenges we still produce. So, I would like to thank each and

every member for their support in making WCPP the Parliament that it is. I thank you. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Madam Speaker. That concludes the debate and this Vote. I request the indulgence of the House to afford the Temporary Chair to vacate and the Speaker to occupy her rightful place.

*[The Speaker takes the Chair]*

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I think it would be remiss of me not to thank the temporary Chairs at this stage. I do believe that the hon member Davids, hon member Maseko and the hon member Max have very dutifully assisted and I think they have done us proud. So, thank you to every member who has assisted with the program today. [Applause.] Will you clap, hon member Dyantyi? [Applause.] Thank you. Here comes the Secretary. You might do an individual round of applause or you might do it joined. The Secretary will now read the Eighth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedules, *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation and Bill* [B5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. Hon members, parties are now going to be afforded an opportunity to make declarations. You have the option of

making a declaration now to cover all the votes or to make a declaration on each of the votes. Hon member Dyantyi as the Acting Chief Whip. Will it be one declaration for all votes?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It will be one.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, one. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: One.

The SPEAKER: One. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: One.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We have concurrence. All three Chief Whips have agreed. So, I now put Vote 1, the Premier. Are there any objections? No objections? Sorry, if I might, hon member Magaxa will deliver his report before we put the votes. My apologies, thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The ANC notes with concern the fact that the DA still treats this Legislature with disdain and as a personal fiefdom. The Adjustment Budget is not a toy to do all sorts of bookkeeping, hide inefficiencies or dump money.

The ANC over days asked for more investment to grow the township

economy. Some of the DA people clearly did not even understand what that means.

The ANC asked for real and improved investment into poor and working class people's lives. The DA does not care for the poor and therefore does the minimum. Instead it favours unlocking opportunities for its rich and big sponsors buying blue T-shirts for all, including the changing of the colours of the Legislature.

The DA keeps on badmouthing the National ANC Government, but it has no policy or principle to offer as alternative. Instead, it is driven by hate and anger to the point of self-destruction. It is a party devoid of everything.

In this House we saw the DA stoop to ridicule and insult something that poorly reflects more on the DA than anyone else.

We have the hon member Christians that acts as a DA "imbongi" in the House to justify praise singing as if he is seeking a position in the DA.

Ms P MAKELENI: He is.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He should actually move to the fifth floor to sit with the DA as he is there, forsaking his opposition role more than being in his own office. I guess this one will not be represented come the next election.

The ANC welcomes the extra investment by the ANC National Government to

the Western Cape. We cannot however endorse or rubberstamp the DA's directionless and clueless expenditure.

We cannot support a further amassment of funds in the over-bloated Department of the Premier.

The ANC cannot support the DA who closes down the democratic space and lays all sorts of flimsy charges against our members and it tried to use flimsy charges in order to undermine and shut down its Opposition. The ANC cannot support this Adjustment Budget and want to have it noted as such.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Magaxa. The ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, we support the Appropriation Adjustment Budget. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order please, members.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members. We have done well. Choir practice is later. Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This side of the House

supports the Adjustment Votes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Okay. We will now go to the votes. I put Vote 1, the Premier. Are there any objections? No? No objections, agreed to. [Interjections.] No, we note the report of the ANC. It will be recorded, that is why, the objection will be recorded. So, it will be noted. [ANC dissenting.]

Thank you. We now go to Vote 2. I put Vote 2 ... [Interjection.] Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYAYTAM: I just want to get clarity from you. It is going to be recorded as what?

The SPEAKER: As an objection.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Okay.

The SPEAKER: There was an opportunity. Your report will be tabled and there will be an objection next to the Vote. So, we will now, I put Vote 2, the Provincial Parliament. Any objections? The objection of the ANC will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 3, Provincial Treasury. Any objections? There are objections. The ANC objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 4, Community Safety. Any objections? There are objections. The ANC's objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 5, Education. Any objections? There are objections. The ANC objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 6, Health. Any objections? The ANC objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 7, Social Development. Are there any objections? Yes, there are objections. The ANC's objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

Okay. Are you with us, hon member Makeleni? Okay. I put Vote 8, Human Settlements. Are there any objections? Hon member Magaxa? The objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 9, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. Any objections? Yes? There is objection. The ANC objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 10, Transport and Public Works. The ANC's objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

Order please, hon members. We are doing well. I put Vote 11, Agriculture and Economic Opportunities. Any objections? No objections? There is an

objection. It will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 12, Economic Development and Tourism. Any objections? Okay. Hon member Max, you have now had confirmation. The choir says, yes. Vote 12. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 13, Cultural Affairs and Sport. Are there any objections? Are there objections? The ANC's objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.]

I put Vote 14, Local Government. Are there any objections? Hon member Dyantyi. You might have missed it. There are no objections to Local Government? [Interjections.] The ANC's objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.] Okay. Hon members, can we get some order now that we have had all the objections noted?

Ms M M WENGER: On a point of order, Madam Speaker. This is a very serious matter and these budgets affect citizens lives and I do not think it is appropriate for the amount of laughter that is coming from this Chamber. And I would like to ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger, your point is noted. Thank you. Hon members, let us get back to the dignity and decorum of the House. These are indeed serious matters we are busy with as they do affect citizens out there and I do expect that we have a duty to ensure that we take it seriously and do not make light of it. I would now say that the decision on the votes has been

completed. I now put Clauses 1, 2, 3 of the Bill. Are there any objections?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Agreed to. I put the Schedule. If there are any objections? No objections to the Schedule? So, there was no objection to Clauses 1, 2, 3, but you are saying there is an objection to the Schedule? No, there is no objection.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No-no-no, there is no objection. Yes. I just wanted to make sure we have passed the budget. I just wanted to clarify that, because I did not get that from you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, we are still on the budget process, but as I work through I said I now put Clauses 1, 2, 3 of the Bill. Any objections? No objections? And no-one objected and it went through. So now I am at the next point which says, I put the Schedule. So now I would ask, are there any objections? [Interjections.] So, you have not objected to the Clauses but you are objecting to the Schedule? Okay. [Applause.] [ANC dissenting.]

Can I then say, I put the Title. Are there any objections to the Title? Okay, so you object to the Title. [ANC dissenting.] [Laughter.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Including the Schedule.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, I have – order please, hon members. Order, please. I have ensured that all your objections have been recorded.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, Madam Speaker. This is like a point of order and it is a procedural point. There is clearly no direction on this side. They are wasting everyone's time! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! Hon Minister Fritz, that was not a point of order – excuse me, hon members. That was not a point of order. It was an observation, but there was a bit of confusion, but I heard what member Beerwinkel said, and we will proceed. So, the Secretary will now read the Ninth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Finalisation of the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B5 – 2016]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon, the Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, on the 24<sup>th</sup> of November I came to this House to table the Western Cape 2017-2020 MTBPS and the 2016 Adjustment Estimates. The total budget of R55 billion, that is the main budget, is adjusted in the Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill to R55.916 billion. Both the MTBPS and the Adjusted Estimates of expenditure were further tabled at the Budget Committee for approval.

The various budget votes were also extensively discussed in the relevant Standing Committees of this House. I wish to thank the hon members for participating in the various debates of the respective budget bills. I wish to extend a special word of thanks to Premier Helen Zille and my Cabinet colleagues for their full support and understanding of the difficult fiscal environment.

In putting together this Estimates of Expenditure our accounting officers, the CFO's and senior managers have once again proven their financial expertise and commitment in dealing with the hard truths facing this Government, while at the same time remaining committed to achieving the strategic objectives and the Game-Changers of the Western Cape Government.

A special word of thanks to the Director-General, all the Heads of the Department and my accounting officer, Mr Zakariya Hoosain and the Head of Fiscal and Economic Services, Mr Harry Malila and the Head of Governance and Asset Management, Mr Aziz Hardien and staff of the Provincial Treasury for their hard work.

Madam Speaker, I now move that the Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill 2016 be finalised.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Meyer. As there is no list of speakers, are there any objections to the Bill being finalised? Yes. The objections will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.] The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.*

The SPEAKER: The Bill will now be sent to the Premier for assent. The Secretary will read the 10<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day. Order, please members.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of *Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the Children's Second Amendment Bill* [B 14B - 2015] (NCOP) Ratification of Final Mandate. Rule 216 1(b) 222(b) and 224(a).

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the Children's Second Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill? No objections. Agreed to. The Secretary will now read the Eleventh Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of *Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill* [B15 – 2016] (NCOP). Ratification of Final Mandate. Rule 216 1(b) 222 (b) and 224(a).

The SPEAKER: The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support

this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment? Sorry. Is it a point of order hon member Joseph? Sorry I thought it was, you were calling me to order.

Mr D JOSEPH: No, Madam Speaker. Sorry. I would like to speak on the final mandate, on the ratification.

The SPEAKER: Alright. So, am I allowed to complete this, hon member Joseph? Thank you. Let me go back. Conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill? There are no objections. Agreed to. Hon member Joseph, the program does not make provision for comment at this stage because the question that is put is to support the Bill and there were no objections and it has been agreed to. Thank you.

Then hon members, we are almost home and dry. I think there are one or two more things, but there is a matter that I would need to reflect on and in our sitting yesterday there were numerous points of order which were raised. I did indicate that I would reflect and together with the Table staff review the Hansard and I would need to deliver a considered ruling and the ruling in this instance, hon member Dugmore, is relevant to your speech in the House yesterday.

So, I will say, during the debates on the Adjustments Appropriation Bill on the 30<sup>th</sup> of November 2016, the hon member Wiley raised a point of order, requesting me to rule on whether the remarks made by the hon member Dugmore during his speech were acceptable and therefore parliamentary. In his address to the House, the hon member Dugmore said, and I quote,

“Now when you go further into these statistics and you ask, who is actually dying on our roads? 80% of those dying on our roads in the Overberg District from 2005 to 2016 are so-called Coloured and African people. And my question is to the DA, MEC and to the Premier and all of those deciding on budget priorities, if 80% of those being killed on our roads in the Overberg were White South Africans, would we have the same level of lethargy in terms of filling these particular vacancies?”

My initial response to this point of order was that, even if we have freedom of speech in the House, I do not think it was appropriate for racial slurs to be bandied and thrown about. I nevertheless indicated that I would consult Hansard and come back today to rule on the matter.

Hon member Dugmore furthermore drew my attention to the fact that the documentation provided to the Committee contained the information that 80% of the people dying on the roads were classified as Coloured and African. He asserted that what he raised was legitimate in that, and I quote:

“If we look at the Constitution and we look at issues of redress we are obliged to particularly have redress measures in regard to people who historically are disadvantaged”.

I have absolutely no issue with that statement whatsoever and regard it as a fair comment. My problem though is with the latter part of his statement, where in the form of a question to *inter alia* the Minister and the Premier, hon member Dugmore asked whether we would have the same level of lethargy in filling these particular vacancies, if 80% of those being killed on the roads in the Overberg were White people?

Having studied the Hansard I cannot come to any other conclusion than that the latter part of the above statement, albeit in the form of a question, has direct racist overtones and the inference could be drawn that the Premier and the Minister are involved in racial practices and that service delivery activities are prioritised along racial lines. I regard that as being unparliamentary and therefore request the hon member Dugmore to withdraw it unconditionally. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, would it be, I hear your ruling and I must admit in terms of convention in this House I understand that there has been a tradition that when a member has raised certain issues and you decide to take that under review, that there is some kind of convention that one actually discusses that with the member before making an announcement, because I am now being confronted with having to apologize unconditionally

without having been asked to come and see you before. So, on the one hand I just want to ask for your view on that convention and then secondly, once you have responded to that, would you give me an opportunity just to address you on this matter?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, I have taken cognisance of your comment. I have never in terms of a ruling consulted with the member. The decision is made in the House that we will consult with Hansard. The Table staff review Hansard and we come back to the House with a ruling without any engagement with any of the parties. So, there is no precedent and I have never in the 30 months that I have been here, engaged with a member about a ruling before bringing it to the House.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, you know, while I respect your ruling and the fact that you have every right to make the ruling that you have, I cannot in good conscience, given that I think the view that I expressed is raising issues of equity, of equality and dealing with the issues which impact on different, at a conscience level I would have difficulty in abiding with your ruling as much as I respect it and therefore, Madam Speaker, I would have major difficulties in apologising unconditionally for that statement because I think that it cannot be construed as unparliamentary. It is actually comment. It is not unparliamentary.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, if I could address you then on Rule 44. I refer you to Rule 44 of this House, that if a Presiding Officer is of the

opinion that a member is deliberately contravening a provision of these Rules, or that a member is in contempt of or is disregarding the authority of the Chair or that that member's conduct is grossly disorderly, which yours is not, he or she may order that the member withdraw immediately from the Chamber for the remainder of the day's sitting. So, in terms of Rule 44 and considering that you are not willing to apologise, I am asking you to withdraw from the Chamber please. Sorry. Hon Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, can I address you on a point of information?

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon Minister Grant. I am still busy with the ruling and the point of order and I have asked the member to withdraw. Is your point of order relevant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is relevant to the decision that the hon member may make.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Then I will afford you the opportunity to raise your point of order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I have the latest statistics from the Road Traffic Management Corporation ...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not relevant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is relevant because these are national statistics and for the last two quarters nationally the number of people ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No Speaker, Speaker, no-no-no ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...who died on our roads ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: He had an opportunity yesterday to raise ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, please. Hon Minister Grant, you can take your seat. A point of order relates to a procedural matter. You are bringing content which would talk to whether the statements made by the hon member Dugmore ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Are relevant ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ... are factual, but I cannot in terms of the Rules on a point of procedure, because it will open another debate and then we would need to refer. So, I have asked the hon member Dugmore to apologise, failing which,

he has not apologised, I have asked and requested hon member Dugmore to withdraw from the Chamber for the rest of the day. Thank you.

Then hon members, let us get back to business. As is our tradition I will now afford representatives of parties an opportunity to address the House on the occasion of the end of the year and the end of the session. This will indeed be our last session and we will reconvene in February some time. I see the ANC. No-one is saying anything. Nothing from the ANC? The EFF in absentia cannot be noted. I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I think it is important just to say something and Madam Speaker, I want to wish all our members well over the festive season wherever they go and wherever they are, that they will drive safely. I want to just to read the prayer of Jabez over all of our members. The New International Version says:

“Jabez cried out to the God of Israel, ‘Oh Lord that you will protect me. Oh, Lord that you will bless me over and over again. Enlarge my territory. Keep your power with me. Keep me from evil and keep me from harm.’ ....”

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Now Madam Speaker, this is a blessing that I speak. If you don't want it, you don't want it. But I speak to those that want it and I want to bless them with the prayer of Jabez:

“And God granted his request.”

Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians. I now see the DA.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is your fellow racist party. [Interjections.]

UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Enkosi, Somlomo.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity. I also want to take the opportunity to wish all the members of the House well as we take a break from what has been a very challenging year. It is so unfortunate that we have come to the part where we have to wish each other well at a time when one of the members had to leave, but I want to emphasize the point, Madam Speaker, that the issues that we debate in this House must not result in a situation where we lose who we are. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Abuse power [Inaudible.] authority.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We must not lose ...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you had an opportunity to speak. You could have exercised that option. If you could afford the Minister an opportunity to speak. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, we are first and foremost South Africans, residents of the Western Cape and we are here representing all the people of the Western Cape out there and I think we must never lose sight of that. So, we might differ here but we must not forget the bigger picture. We must not forget that many people out there are looking at us, irrespective of our different political parties, to be exemplary in the manner in which we deal with the issues that affect them. So ...  
[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] money from the [Inaudible.] for nothing.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: With those few words ...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa. Could you take your seat please, hon Minister? Hon member Magaxa, I address you in terms of Rule 39 and I am asking you to cooperate. The Minister is on his feet. Your party was afforded an opportunity to speak and you chose to forego that opportunity. So, if you do not mind, we need to maintain order until the sitting is done. You may proceed Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: With those few words, Madam Speaker, I once again want to take the opportunity to wish everyone well. I hope that we will all get a well-deserved rest after a very challenging year. It has been an election year and we want to thank all the voters of the Western Cape and the citizens of South Africa for having exercised their democratic right. I think indeed our democracy is maturing and I hope that we will get back in one piece, more energised to deal with the issues that affect the people of this province. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. If I may in closing wish all the members well on behalf of the staff of Parliament. We trust that you will have a blessed festive season. Please drive safely. Do not drink and drive and come back in 2017. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

House adjourned at 15:40.