

---

THURSDAY, 9 JUNE 2016

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

---

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon honourable members. Good afternoon guests in the gallery. It is indeed my pleasure to welcome you to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. I would like to request and inform the guests that you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings, which means no questions, hand-clapping or cheering, but we trust that you will enjoy the session with us. May we proceed? I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall

move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198 precedence be given to the motion on the Order Paper, the subject for discussion.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. I recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Madam Speaker, I move that the motion in my name on the Order Paper be approved please.

(Notice of Motion)

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party: That -

(1) an ad hoc committee be appointed to give effect to section 196(8)(b)(i) of the Constitution, 1996, read with section 4(3)(b) of the Public Service Commission Act, 1997, to consider applications and to recommend to the House a candidate for nomination by the Premier for appointment to serve on the Public Service Commission; and

(2) the ad hoc committee be comprised as follows: DA (5); ANC (2); EFF (1) and ACDP (1).

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to.

The next item on the Order Paper is the subject for discussion in the name of the hon member Mr K E Magaxa, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Mr Magaxa.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

**BRINGING MORE RESPONSIVE AND PEOPLE CENTRED LOCAL  
GOVERNMENT TO THE PUBLIC OF THE WESTERN CAPE**

(Subject for discussion)

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As we celebrate 40 years since the anniversary of the 1976 June 16 uprising we think of the multitude of young people who continue to face the brunt of unemployment, poverty and inequality.

The recently released Statistics South Africa publication looking at the social profile of youth reminded us that the youth remain adversely affected by the current global economic climate. As stated by the Deputy Minister in the Presidency, comrade Buti Manamela, during his budget vote to Parliament, National Government Expenditure on Youth Programmes amounted to R6.3 billion in the past two financial years. The figure does not represent government's entire fiscal spend on youth but only the resources ploughed

into the employment tax incentive; the Jobs Fund, the National Rural Youth Service Corps Programme, the Industrial Development Corporation, the Small Enterprise Financial Agency and the National Youth Development Agency. This figure does not include the money spent on youth through the Expanded Public Works Programme and the Community Works Programme where the majority of participants are youth; neither does it include the money spent through the National Student Financial Aid Scheme and the Sector Education and Training Authority.

This DA Western Cape Government refuses to participate in many of these programmes, which are geared towards responding to the needs of the young in this province. To prove the DA's refusal to improve the lives of poor black youth in the Western Cape, they refused to initially support the Employment Tax Incentive introduced by National Government to assist in addressing the issue of youth unemployment. They refused also to work with the National Youth Development Agency to assist young entrepreneurs in the province for obvious reasons, by the way. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Western Cape is the only province where the NYDA does not have a partnership with the Provincial Government.

An HON MEMBER: Says who?

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: You will understand why, because... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They looted the province.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...the NYDA will benefit the majority of young people who are black in general. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

An HON MEMBER: What about the coloureds?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Therefore the DA - coloured and black people in general. You do not even know your identity.

An HON MEMBER: Black in general.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: To the DA the only form of youth development is giving a young person a 12-month internship where they learn nothing and do not directly participate in the economy of the province because it is not in their interest to transform the economy of the Western Cape into an all inclusive one. [Interjections.]

The reason why you are in the DA is because you do not even understand

your identity. It is an identity crisis that finds you there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: At least the DA is consistent in one thing. It is consistent ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, sorry, may I ask you to please speak to me and not across the floor. Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am speaking to you. I do not need to look you in the face. At least the DA is consistent in one thing.

The SPEAKER: Address the Chair please hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is consistent in how it caters for its white coffers while leaving the poor people of the ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, will you please take your seat. There is a member on the floor.

'n AGBARE LID: Sit asseblief! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Sit please! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, a point of relevance.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I have been listening for almost three minutes. I am looking at the topic of the discussion and what the member has said. I can find no relevance. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Minister. I am giving the hon member Mr Magaxa time to get to the point. Hon member Mr Magaxa, if you could get to the topic of discussion, please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: This is my topic, if we have a problem of language here it must be clear, people must take things for interpretation, including you Madam Speaker, if you do not understand what I am saying. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me hon member Mr Magaxa, excuse me.

Mr K E MAGAXA: This is a point of relevance. This thing is relevant. I am saying if you have a problem with English... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, I do not have a problem. If I could address you, I would like to draw your attention to the fact that the topic of the debate is “Bringing more responsive and people centred local government

to the public of the Western Cape”, and I have allowed you the leeway to introduce your topic so there is no question of understanding. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: You undermine the Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. [Interjections.] To prove the DA’s refusal to improve the lives of the poor black youth in the Western Cape; they refused initially to support the Employment Tax Incentive introduced by National Government to assist in addressing the issue of youth unemployment.

The PREMIER: Nonsense!

Mr K E MAGAXA: They also refused to work with the National Youth Development Agency... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, you think it is nonsense.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... to assist young entrepreneurs in the province. That is also including the Metro Municipality in the City of Cape Town. The Western Cape is the only province where the NYDA does not have a partnership with the Provincial Government. To the DA the only form of youth development is giving a young person a 12-month internship where they learn nothing and do not directly participate in the economy of the province because it is not in their interest to transform the economy of the Western Cape into an



all-inclusive one.

At least the DA is consistent in one thing. It is consistent in how it caters for its white coffers while leaving the poor people of the Western Cape destitute. The fact is, since the DA came into government in this province, even in the City of Cape Town, new jobs have gone down, delivery of housing has declined, water and sanitation services have deteriorated and destitution has risen. The latest general household survey proved that basic services in the Western Cape have either remained the same or have gone down in the Western Cape under the Democratic Alliance.

In 2002, Madam Speaker, 98% of households had access to piped water in the Western Cape and in 2014 that number remained the same under your watchful eye, DA, while in the Eastern Cape the story is very different. In 2002 there were 56% of households with access to piped water and in 2014 78% was achieved. Since 2002 the percentage of households in the Eastern Cape with access to water increased by 22%. This is indeed an incredible improvement by the ANC-led Government in that particular province. More still needs to be done and we are confident in the ANC's commitment to truly uplift the lives of our people as the ANC Manifesto states. On sanitation in 2002, 92.2% of households in the Western Cape had access to improved sanitation and 94.6% in 2014. This is 2.4% improvement in service in twelve years.

The Eastern Cape on the other hand, 33% of household had access to

improved sanitation rate. [Interjections.] In 2002 - I am entertaining you on this Eastern Cape you have been bashing in terms of facts now, not rhetoric [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, please hon members.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In the Eastern Cape on the other hand, 33% of households had access to improved sanitation in 2002 and this increased to 78% in 2014. Nationally the percentage of households that continue to live without proper sanitation facilities has been declining consistently; between 2002 and 2014 it decreased from 12.4 to 4.9 during this period. The most rapid decline over this period was observed in the Eastern Cape which is minus 28 and Limpopo minus 15 and Free State minus nine and Northern Cape minus eight. When other provinces were battling with immense poverty and underdevelopment 12 and even 15, 20 years ago the Western Cape was placed in a better position in terms of infrastructure development because of apartheid. [Interjections.]

What is remarkable about a province such as the Eastern Cape is that it is fast catching up in terms of service delivery, despite the economic situation and the disadvantage caused by the government who are part of that side of the House. [Interjections.] While the ANC-led Government has been responding to the needs of our people in other provinces, the DA Western Cape is making the lives of our people worse off. You can compare this province and the City of Cape Town under the ANC and under yourself. All that we know

are lies and rhetoric from that side of the House. The DA claims that where they govern they govern best.

Yes, where the DA governs, it governs bad for some. It should govern for us.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, your time has expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It governs best for whites. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, your time has expired, thank you.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you Madam Speaker. We can see it is election season again when the Opposition call for a debate like we have today. The honourable temporary Acting Leader of the Opposition, Mr Magaxa, wants us to talk about responsive local government...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, let us talk about local responsive government. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: We are not short of leaders.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, I do that, and I want to start off by mentioning Oudtshoorn, Kannaland, Beaufort West, and Cederberg. [Interjections.] Who is in charge of those places, Madam Speaker? It is a disgrace. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, I think...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I think the temporary Acting Leader of the Opposition Mr Magaxa is completely confused...

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are the MEC for Local Government. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shame on you!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But, Madam Speaker, let me continue. In

2015 this Provincial Government responded to the public outcry over Oudtshoorn and took over a council that had been run into the ground by the ANC, ignoring the Constitution, ignoring any form of democracy, losing four court cases but still continuing. [Interjections.]

What we have since seen is the turning around of a town from a dysfunctional and a broken one. When it comes to responsive local government no-one and I repeat, no-one does it better than the Western Cape Government.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, at this point I just want to have this House note the very latest data from Statistics South Africa regarding the Non-Financial Data Census. This report measures the extent to which South Africa's 278 municipalities supply three basic services across the country with the focus on supply of basic services to the poor and indigent communities.

I am pleased to announce that according to Stats South Africa - it is not a DA report, it is Stats South Africa - Western Cape municipalities topped the list in the provision of three basic services in every single category, in electricity, in water, in sanitation, in waste... [Interjections.] ...speaking to the dignified life of our people. [Applause.] Madam Speaker, we cannot focus on one sector of the community. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We focus on the whole of the society. We need to provide services to all our people because all our people deserve a dignified life.

Furthermore, the differences between the Western Cape and other provinces are enormous. Maybe the ANC must listen to them and maybe they can be so ashamed that they can go out here and go and start to make a plan. [Interjections.] For example, Madam Speaker, the Western Cape has the highest proportion... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... of consumer units that benefited from the free basic water policy of 80.4%. The second-best province - the hon member Mr Magaxa mentioned the Eastern Cape - is the Eastern Cape with 43%. Shame on the ANC. Shame on the ANC!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Shame on you.

An HON MEMBER: Shame on the ANC!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The average for the whole of the country is 36%. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you not ashamed of that? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Now, Madam Speaker, if you take away the Western Cape with 80% this average will be under 30%. Shame on the ANC! [Interjections.] That picture is repeated on all other services. [Interjections.] Additionally, this information comes a week after the Auditor-General announced that 22 out of our 30 municipalities received a clean audit, the best in the country. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

This places the Western Cape municipalities with 73%. [Interjections.] The second-best. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon Minister, can you please take your seat? Hon members, there is too much noise from both sides of the House. We have a speaker on the floor and you simply cannot engage in this across-floor debate whilst someone is presenting so I am urging you please maintain yourselves and allow the Minister to present. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, it is tough if you

cannot deal with the truth. The second-best after the Western Cape with a staggering 73% is Gauteng with 33%. Shame on the ANC. [Interjections.]

The evidence is clear, two independent National Government Departments within the space of one week found the Western Cape delivers the best services... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: With a bucket system!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...and it is the best-run government in South Africa. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, in Constantia.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The great champ himself, Muhammad Ali who passed away last week used to say: "It is not bragging if you can back it up." Madam Speaker, in the Western Cape we can back it up. [Interjections.]

†Agb Speaker, as mense vra wat doen ons anders in die Wes-Kaap kan ek twee voorbeelde van programme noem wat nêrens anders in die land gebeur nie... [Tussenwerpsels.]



*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Madam Speaker, if people ask what we do differently in the Western Cape, I can mention examples of two programmes that are not administered elsewhere in the country... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Twee unieke Wes-Kaapse projekte wat net daarop gemik is om die mees kwesbare arme gemeenskappe te baat. Die eerste is 'n rook-alarm projek wat gemik is om rook-alarms in informele nedersettings te installeer. So kan ons baanbrekerswerk doen en mense se lewens beveilig. Die tweede projek is die elektrifisering van plaaswerkershuise om plaaswerkers meer onafhanklik te maak.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Two unique Western Cape projects that are solely aimed at benefiting the most vulnerable poor communities. The first is a smoke alarm project aimed at installing smoke alarms in informal settlements. In this way we can do pioneering work and render people's lives safer. The second project is the electrification of farm workers' houses so that farm workers can be more independent.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: National funding.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Taxpayers.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit is glad nie 'n nasionale program nie. Dis 'n Wes-Kaap inisiatief, die eerste in die land. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is not a national programme at all. It is a Western Cape initiative, the first in the country. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Hierdie projek wys duidelik dat die regering in die Wes-Kaap daarin glo om mense te bemagtig. Agb Speaker, ander provinsies val uitmekaar en die bewyse is daar. Sit net die nuus aan, bly net weg van die ANC-beheerde SAUK wat skynbaar net Teletubby-programme van goeie nuus wil versprei. U sien, hulle gaan baie vinnig van houding verander sodra hulle sien dat die enigste goeie storie in die Wes-Kaap is. Lees die koerante, kyk sosiale netwerk. Die publiek is kwaad, want mense is desperaat en ongelukkig en hulle ongelukkigheid spruit uit 'n

mislukte ANC Nasionale Regering.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: This project shows clearly that the government of the Western Cape believes in empowering people. Madam Speaker, other provinces are falling apart and the proof is there. Just switch on the news, but stay away from the ANC-controlled SABC that apparently only wants to spread Teletubby programmes of good news.

You see, they are going to quickly change their stance as soon as they see that the only good story is happening in the Western Cape. Read the newspapers, look at the social networks. The public is angry, because people are desperate and unhappy and their discontent emanates from a failed ANC National Government.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Kom ek gee u 'n rede waarom sê ek so. Verlede week het die Ouditeur-generaal waarna ek reeds verwys het, bekendgemaak dat ongemagtigde uitgawes in ANC-beheerde munisipaliteite drievoudig toegeneem het tot R15 miljard. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Agb Speaker, tot R15 miljard. Gaan lees die verslag dan sal u verstaan wat hy gesê het - tot R15 miljard. Die vraag is wat kan ons doen met R15 miljard? R15 miljard koop vir ons 130 000 huise. R15 miljard sit vir ons 250 000 kinders - waarop die acting leader of the Opposition so hard speel - deur die universiteit. Hulle steel die geld, agb Speaker, en daarom kan die mense nie hul opvoeding kry nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die grootste ANC-beheerde metro sedert 2011 het R20 miljard vermors. So kom ons plus nog 150 000 huise. Kom ons plus nog 300 000 jongmense se geleentheid wat weg is, dan sien ons wat doen korrupsie aan hierdie land, die ANC-beheerde Nasionale Regering se korrupsie. Ding is so sleg dat die Nasionale Regering oor plaaslike strukture erken dat dit so misluk het dat hulle 'n program begin het wat hulle noem "back to basics".

Agb Speaker, 22 jaar na ANC-regering sê hulle ons moet teruggaan na die basiese, "back to basics". Ek is trots om te sê die Wes-Kaap is lankal verby "back to basics". [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Let me give you a reason why I say that. Last week the Auditor- General, that I already referred to, announced that unauthorised expenditure in ANC-controlled municipalities tripled to R15 billion. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, to R15 billion. Go and read the report, then you will know what he said – to R15 billion. The question is, what can we do with R15 billion? R15 billion buys us 130 000 houses. R15 billion puts 250 000 children – about which the Acting Leader of the Opposition is so vocal – through university. They are stealing the money, Madam Speaker, and therefore the people cannot receive their education. [Interjections.]

The largest ANC-controlled metro since 2011 wasted R20 billion. So let us add another 150 000 houses. Let us add another 300 000 youth opportunities that are gone, then we can see what corruption is doing to this country, the ANC controlled National Government's corruption. Things are so bad that the National Government has acknowledged that local structures have failed so miserably that they have started a programme they call 'back to basics'.

Madam Speaker, after 22 years of ANC Government they say we have to go back to the basics, 'back to basics'. I am proud to say that the Western Cape has long gone past 'back to basics'. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons is nou al op 'n gevorderde gebied, soos elektrifisering van plaaswerkershuise om hulle onafhanklikheid te gee. Ek wil die agbare tydelike waarnemende leier van die Opposisie, mnr Magaxa, aan 'n paar dinge herinner. Dit spyt my om te sê maar dit is waar.

Die struikelblokke van die Wes-Kaap Regering as dit kom by die lewering van dienste of selfs beter dienste is ongelukkig 'n onbevoegde Nasionale ANC-regering. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit wil voorkom dat omrede ons soveel beter doen in die Wes-Kaap as elders trek ons provinsie telkemale aan die korste ent in terme van die begrotingsondersteuning. Kom ons kyk na die nuutste, die droogte waarvan almal weet. Tot die ANC is bewus van hierdie droogte.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are now at an advanced stage, such as providing electricity to farm workers' houses to give them independence. I would like to remind the temporary Acting Leader of the Opposition, Mr Magaxa, of a few things. I am sorry to say but it is true. The obstacles of the Western Cape Government, when it comes to service delivery or even better services, is unfortunately an incompetent National ANC Government. [Interjections.] It seems that because we are doing so much better in the Western Cape than elsewhere, our province is getting the short end of it every time in terms of budget support. Let us look at the latest, the drought we are all aware of. Even the ANC is aware of this drought.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You cannot even say it because you do not know what to say.

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, ons almal bewus van die droogte. Ons het aansoek gedoen in November verlede jaar vir droogtehulpondersteuning. Hoekom? Om die armste van die armes te help. Ons het aansoek gedoen vir R59 miljoen. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Onthou, hou nou in gedagte dat baie van hierdie hulp gaan aan gebiede soos Kannaland, Dysselsdorp waar ons boorgate moet sink om te sorg dat mense water het, water wat spreek tot “a dignified life for people.” Agt maande later - die droogte sleep voort en nog het ons geen sent van die ANC Nasionale Regering ontvang nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, we are all aware of the drought. We have applied in November last year for drought aid support. Why? To help the poorest of the poor. We have applied for R59 million. [Interjections.]

Remember, bear in mind now that a lot of this aid goes to areas like Kannaland, Dysselsdorp, where we have to sink boreholes to ensure that people have water, water that speaks to a dignified life for people. Eight

months later – the drought is dragging on and still we have not received a cent from the ANC National Government.]

We are told that the ANC National Government has no capacity to provide any funding for drought relief in the Western Cape - the same National Government that spent R10 million on cars for the President's wives - but there is no money to help desperate black areas like Dysselsdorp with their water challenges. [Interjections.] Shame on the ANC! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Let me end on a final positive note and mention one of the best programmes we are running to take government to the people. This programme is the Thusong Programme. Over the past 12 months we have reached... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Over the past 12 months we have reached 905 people through these Thusong Centres and 24 000 through the Thusong mobiles which, as you would be aware, target mainly the deep rural areas in our province.



The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can I appeal to all parties, let us just while we have a speaker on the floor allow the individual to present. Hon member Mr Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, can I address you on the time issue?

The SPEAKER: Yes you may.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I feel that in the time allocated to AWB, honourable Minister, who has just spoken, also covered an interruption, but in terms of me that was not happening. I looked on the watch when he was speaking.

The SPEAKER: Okay, hon member Mr Magaxa I am sorry, if I can explain. I am guided by the Table. If there is an interruption where we call the House to order the clock is stopped and once we get back on track then it is resumed.

An HON MEMBER: And you forgot to do that [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you the Speaker?

The SPEAKER: So unfortunately I take my cue from the Table who have the clock there, so do remember that the minute I call the House to order the stopwatch is stopped and once the honourable member proceeds it is then restarted but I will be very mindful and I am appealing to the Table staff to be mindful of the time and note your request. I see the hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The topic today is a more responsive and people-centred local government so when we look at the definitions this tells us about how we refer quickly to service delivery. Secondly, when it comes to people-centredness, are the people consulted, and is there corruption? It looks at thinking of the people and better use of municipal resources.

Now I have a few surveys here and I am not going to refer to certain things, but certain other things I need to refer to. In the City of Cape Town we still have 7 383 homeless people. If the Minister can just later on respond to say that is the situation according to Stats SA 2015.

Another question that I have for the Minister and the Ministers who will respond, are these developments going up; I just had a letter here from a Mr Jackson that said that an eight-storey luxury development is going up in Granger Bay, and the problem is that they were not consulted in various things. So I am just asking the question, in view of the traffic congestion that we have, did the City and the Minister consult about the traffic congestion

that will take place at the V&A Waterfront with all these constructions? He also he says that soon the rest of our historical spaces will be drowning in concrete. So although the DA is doing better than the ANC, we as the ACDP want to ask the DA Government, firstly, about the R28 million that was lost because of the Cape Town Cup, and also the R40 million a year that is wasted and lost because of the City. It is also reported that R50 million goes for advertising and included in that is the Premier and Mayor's show that they have weekly on the radio programme, so what I am asking... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians...

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am asking... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a good programme.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians, finish up, your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Can the government not reprioritise the budget to spend it where it is most needed. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members can we have some quiet please. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. We deserve a better future for our country. In 2029 just after ten years of a DA-run National

Government this better future is a reality. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Aikona![No man!] In your dreams!

Mr M MNQASELA: As envisaged in the Vision 2030 of the National Development Plan we live in a country which we have remade. We are the only political party that will live up to that promise. [Interjections.] A promise of a country that we have remade.

An HON MEMBER: It will never happen

Mr M MNQASELA: Our values, Charter, our freedom, fairness and opportunity is the only solution for an inclusive non-racial democratic and prosperous South Africa. [Interjections.]

Our local government in the Western Cape is already delivering the progress and true values that we desire for South Africa; where we are talking about a better vision of South Africa than the current South Africa that is being delivered by the ANC.

As revealed in the Household Survey of Stats South Africa, the Western Cape is the best in service delivery. I am not going to belabour the point that has been made by the Minister but it is worth mentioning that the National Development Plan sets out a target of 90% of dwellings having access to tap water and the Western Cape delivers 97.7%, and that is the highest in the

country, # DA good governance.

The National Democratic Plan sets out 90% of functional sanitation by 2019... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr M MNQASELA: The Western Cape delivers 87.8% in 2016, which is way ahead of the National Development Plan. The National Development Plan... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mngqasela, please take your seat. Hon members, Minister Bongi, the back-benchers of the ANC, please you cannot continue in this way. You cannot have this debate while there is a speaker on the floor. I am now appealing to both sides of the House, let us bring the dignity and decorum back here today. Thank you. You may proceed.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Enkosi somlomo. Ndicela ukuba kubekho sisimilo apha kule Ndlu, ingabi ngathi sidlala uqulukubhede nondize ngaphaya emlanjeni. Sisentlanganisweni ebalulekileyo apha.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Madam, Speaker. I ask that there be respect here in this House, it must not be like we are playing wrestling and hide and seek by the river. We are in an important meeting here.]

The National Development Plan sets out a target of electricity access of 90% by 2030 but the Western Cape already delivers 90% in this province and that sets us highest in the country. That is # DA good governance.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Because of apartheid.

Mr M MNQASELA: The National Development Plan sets a target of piped water of 100%. The Western Cape delivers 99.2% to the province and that is the highest in the country, # DA good governance. [Interjections.]

The National Development Plan does not have a target on the RDP standard sanitation but the Western Cape is already delivering on this target at 93.3%. # DA good governance. [Interjections.] Again the Western Cape has set a record... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: # DA good governance!

Mr M MNQASELA: It has been mentioned many times, that in this province we are the highest in terms of clean audits. The National Minister of Local Government says: "Ai, I do not believe in clean audits." We are saying the only way to beat the wastage of funds and the corruption that is taking place

in the public sector, is that you need to manage your funds; manage your [Inaudible.] effectively ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: What about the R5 million in Drakenstein?

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, our 2016 Local Government Manifesto presents hope for the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The DA member is stealing... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and the people of this country. We will create more opportunities and jobs. To the people of this province, let me say again that our local government will work very hard to deliver services to you and your family. We will deliver better services and help create jobs over the next five years. If we fail in delivering these services please vote us out in the next elections. Unlike this useless ANC, the DA is working towards a better tomorrow and in the Western Cape... [Interjections.] In the Western Cape it is the kind of life that other provinces in South Africa are yearning for. We are delivering the only hope to the people of this province.

We will make local government responsive. That is our manifesto. By attracting the next generation of municipal officials through graduate recruitment programmes so that we have qualified people for the job; people

who are fit and proper for the purpose and the task that lies ahead. [Interjections.] Not this kind of mishmash that you see in the ANC municipalities in and around the country. [Interjection.]

Where we govern we already fix potholes within 24 hours. We fix them. In Mpumalanga and other provinces you can swim in a pothole. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Go to Site C now... [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: We will stop corruption. No more tenders will be given to family members, cadres and friends. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr M MNQASELA: This notion of officials and politicians queuing for tenders and flouting rules and policies, we will put a stop to that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana!

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, is that on a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Madam Speaker, I must ask you that the terrible threesome on the other side please be brought to order. [Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Hon members, I am appealing to everyone to comply. When we have so much noise that it drowns out the speaker it becomes difficult and I understand that we all have points to make but let us, both sides of the House, please comply and allow the speaker to present. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I do not know to whom the honourable Chief Whip referred to, if he speaks about terrible threesomes. Everybody in this House is honourable.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: And I think that the hon Chief Whip must withdraw that statement.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip you are requested to withdraw that statement, not unless you can indicate if there any other threesomes in the House. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: I withdraw the words terrible threesome. They are honourable. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May we now proceed, members. Let us bring some order. You may proceed, hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, we must really do a lot more to create people-centred local government and the Western Cape is on the correct trajectory. We are well on track and thanks to the Western Cape DA-led Government we have delivered on the promise that we have made to the people of this province in 2011.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member Mr Mnqasela, thank you. Your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. [Time expired.] [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members I need to ask hon member Ms Beerwinkel to stand up. Will you afford your member the opportunity to speak? You may proceed, hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Kole, kole. Gooi kole.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Coals, coals. Throw coals.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

†Agb Speaker, laat my toe om die 22 munisipaliteite wat skoon oudits gekry het, geluk te wens dat hulle ag slaan op die opdrag van die Nasionale Ouditeur-Generaal; die wat teruggesak het te bemoedig en aan te moedig om die Departement van Plaaslike Regering en Tesourie knaend te pla om hulle

te ondersteun om ook daardie prestasie te behaal, maar vandag se bespreking gaan ook daarom of 'n skoon oudit omgeskakel kan word in goeie dienslewering. Soos almal teen hierdie tyd mos al weet, en ek hoop dat die DA hulle koppe uit die gat uit wil haal waar dit aanhoudend begrawe word oor die verskil tussen 'n skoon oudit en dienslewering, die Nasionale Minister van Plaaslike Regering het gesê 'n skoon oudit is nie genoeg nie. 'n Skoon oudit het te doen met goeie finansiële bestuur, regeringspraktyke onder leiding en met behulp van Tesourie. Daar is immers geen faset van 'n ouditverslag of die steekproewe wat die ouditeur doen wat die dienste wat gelewer word kan meet of vergelyk nie, maar kom ons kyk na die oorhoofse prentjie van hoe 'n skoon oudit geensins die dienslewering beteken nie.

Stats Suid-Afrika word gewoonlik hoog aangeskryf wanneer die ANC in 'n swak lig gestel word maar nou bevraagteken die DA hulle want die nuutste uitgawe haal 'n paar statistieke uit wat die Stad Kaapstad in 'n swak lig stel wat dienslewering aan die armes betref. Dienslewering in hierdie stad is van die ergste bewyse van ongelykheid. Foto's lieg nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Madam Speaker, allow me to congratulate the 22 municipalities that received clean audits, that they have heeded the instruction of the National Auditor-General; to encourage those who have done less well to continuously call on the Department of Local Government and Treasury to assist them to also achieve that goal, but today's debate is not about how a clean audit can

be translated into good service delivery. As we all know by now - and I hope that the DA will pull their heads from the hole where it is being buried all the time - about the difference between a clean audit and service delivery, the National Minister of Local Government has said that a clean audit is not enough. A clean audit is about good financial management and government practices led and aided by Treasury. There is after all no facet of an audit report or the samples taken by the auditor that can measure or compare the services that are delivered, but let us look at the overall picture of how a clean audit does not constitute service delivery at all.

Stats South Africa is usually held in high regard when the ANC is shown in a bad light, but now the DA is questioning them because the latest edition quotes a few statistics portraying the City of Cape Town in a bad light with regard to the poor. Service delivery in this city is the most severe proof of inequality. Photographs do not lie.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes, like this. Like this one.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, local government can never be responsive if it does not spend its budgets allocated to do exactly that. The Auditor-General expresses concern that irregular expenditures are on the increase up from R232 million in the year 2010 / 2011 to R340 million due to procurement irregularities and contract mismanagement. Again the City of Cape Town is a case in point where a contract had to be cancelled due to lack of oversight over the very committee that was adjudicating the allocation of

tenders. Public participation, the most crucial part of people-centred responsive governance, is at an all time low and has become a tick-box exercise even here where the specific line item was cut by almost 25 000 due to austerity measures and even staff cannot be appointed across the board in departments. Yet, when we, as the ANC, speak out against the decline in participation and we also decline a participatory representation at a CPA Conference, silence descends on this House as if we had committed a crime.

Why MEC Meyer did not question that the budget item on public participation in comparison was cut really needs to be interrogated. Who are the most important people that need our services - the Commonwealth countries or our own citizens?

Priorities are definitely skewed here. Where in the audit opinion of clean audits do you or a municipality tick the box or colour the assurances red for not doing public participation correctly or to keep communities informed?

In spite of all MEC Bredell's efforts to institute Ward Committees, that very people-centred structure that is supposed to help responsive municipalities, and even though the responsibility for its function ultimately rests with the speakers, there are still huge gaps right here in this very Metro but also in rural areas that need public participation the most. That is the very foundation of service delivery. Service delivery is not only the installation of sanitation and water and electricity connection. Our most important service delivery that we can deliver to our communities is to educate them, to speak

to them, to listen and respond to their needs because we ultimately serve them.

Across the province - now let me bring you to this wonderful delivery of all of these municipalities - at this stage we are dealing with a third quarter of municipalities' spending which should at least now be very close to 75%. However, municipalities have only spent 61% of the R35 billion of a total budget of R57 billion. [Interjections.]

The capital expenditure across the province amounted to 43% of R3.9 billion of a total budget of R8.9 billion and these delays were due to this SCM processes being delayed. However, these are all job creators. When you refer to 2011 stats and I wonder where you are, how late you are, 14 of 30 municipalities reported capital expenditure at a third below 40%. Some of them are Eden, 26%, Prince Albert, 22%, and even Beaufort West did better at the third quarter at 39% of spending on their capital budgets.

These are red flags indicating that the capital budget of at least 15 municipalities will not be spent in their current financial year, 15 of the 30. [Interjections.] 30 of Cape Town with the biggest concentration of inequalities, which you have just seen here now, have only spent 44% of its capital budget of R61 billion. Yet recently shack dwellers in Mfuleni had their homes bulldozed, which is tantamount to forced removals, but the informal housing programme is struggling to spend R12 million on its projects. [Interjections.]

Only 52% of its housing allocation in new developments has been spent and yet they are staring at underspending [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...of R8.4 million in the face. In total the City is scrambling to spend R439 million of its capital budget. R14 million of unspent money is allocated to upgrade District 6. That will also go unspent. Secondary cities like Drakenstein, George and Stellenbosch Municipalities have only spent 35% of their adjusted capital budget of R1.2 billion. Capital budgets are spent on job creation initiatives. That is the responsive government with service delivery. It is a common occurrence in Drakenstein that residents of Phikela, Swartberg, O R Tambo and Thembani have to march to the municipal offices because of lack of services.

An HON MEMBER: Because the Council is so *hardegat*. [Laughter.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Ironically that Mayor is now being promoted to Stellenbosch. How come the DA could not find a candidate in Stellenbosch because in terms of capital expenditure Stellenbosch did better than Drakenstein? In George violence erupts because of a top-down approach to transport service. Where is the responsive government public participation? [Interjections.]

Only a third of the R60 million housing budget was used and only in

Uniondale where the construction was so substandard and it also led to protests. R40 million of that budget had to be given back to Treasury. In the West Coast for instance there is no allocation for housing in Philadelphia. For the past 25 years - no housing delivery. Shocking!

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande.

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: 17 municipalities have creditors older than 30 days. Service delivery, responsive government, if you do not spend your capital budget you cannot create jobs. People cannot have an income so that they can service their debt as well. Capital grants even worse, transfer to municipalities. Only 48% of R3.6 billion has been spent at the end of the third quarter, leaving one quarter to spend the rest. So from the scenario that I have just spoken of... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, you can finish up please. Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am finishing. From the scenario that I have just painted it is clear that service delivery cannot happen as it should as government is not responding to the needs of the poor if they cannot spend their allocations. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!



The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You know Madam Speaker, I was asking myself why would hon member Mr Magaxa raise an issue of service delivery when his party where it is governing is so vulnerable. The Statistician-General, Dr Pali Lehohla, has found the Western Cape to be the best province in service delivery when he released his Non-Financial Census. In fact if you do not believe me, these are the headlines. “The Western Cape among the best; best service delivery.” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now to quote it for you the Statistician-General has found the Western Cape to be among the best provinces for service delivery as he released the Non-Financial Census of Municipalities yesterday. [Interjections.] The Census measures selected aspects of service delivery including water, electricity, solid waste management, sewerage and sanitation among others. Now this fallacy that we are delivering the best services in affluent areas, I mean, it is a clear indication... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, please members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... of ignorance from that side because you do not spend public money in areas that do not need it. We do not build houses in Constantia. So this argument that we are spending money in affluent areas is a flawed one. [Interjections.] Now we can talk about bringing ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, please address the Chair when you do your presentation. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. We can talk about bringing the best service delivery to local government or to local spheres of government, but if the centre does not hold, we will continue to have this problem. [Interjections.]

South Africa is on the brink of economic meltdown with the GDP contracting by 1.2% according to Stats SA report released just yesterday. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: You must listen, listen!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Escaping rating agencies' downgrade to junk status [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] This confirmation of our investment centres was based on our ability to grow the economy in the next few coming months or years but that is not likely to happen under this

ANC Government. Our biggest hindrance... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Minister Madikizela, please take your seat. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel throwing objects - I do not know what happened before that, but I saw you throwing something across the floor. It is not allowed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a sweet.

The SPEAKER: It is not allowed. Whether it is a sweet, it could have been anything else. [Interjections.] If I could ask the service officers to take the sweet and deliver it for you in future, thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Madam Speaker. I think you should actually address MEC Fritz. He was practically on his knees begging me for a sweet. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, unfortunately I could not see that. Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Madam Speaker, I take full responsibility, and would you like -

shall I throw it back? [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: No please do not. Please do not. [Laughter.] Can we get some order here now please? Thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, our biggest hindrance to growth in this country is the weak leadership of the ruling party in all spheres of government. [Interjections.] But particularly nationally. This is partly caused by the ANC's failure to manage its internal factional battles that are now exploding, especially in this province. We will be lucky if there will be any members left to vote for the ANC on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of August. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please Minister Madikizela, please take your seat. Is it a point of order hon member Ms Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, Madam Speaker. The hon member was the one who raised earlier on a point of relevance. The factions in the ANC have nothing to do with people-centred government in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, your concern is noted. You may proceed hon Minister Madikizela. If you can get to your point please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam

Speaker. The ANC has everything to do with the situation that the country, the provinces and the municipalities find themselves in. Now the ANC is the ruling party in this country and everything that I spoke about here, about the challenges that we are facing economically, have to do with the weak leadership of the ANC. So the member cannot say that the ANC has nothing to do with that.

Mr C M DUGMORE: But which faction are you part of? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, during every election... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which faction are you from?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: During elections, Madam Speaker, service delivery in the ANC municipalities take a backseat and the focus becomes internal with different factions jostling for positions. Unfortunately it is the citizens who suffer the consequences of that as we have seen in the last few weeks across the country. Here, for example, in the Western Cape the leaderless ANC is exploding with an exodus of members leaving the ANC even more paralysed. [Interjections.] That is why I am actually asking myself what is happening?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Madikizela, please take your seat. Is it a point of order hon member Ms Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you. Madam Speaker. I have been waiting patiently. We have been hearing the flow of the debate but now this member is really getting lost. Can we get to local government and leave the factions. We can bring it [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Baie seer!

[An HON MEMBER: Very sore!]

The SPEAKER: Your point is noted. Thank you. Minister Madikizela, relevance please. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I know that this is very, very painful. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You know your factions.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now that is why when I started... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can I please ask you - interjections are allowed, but ongoing running commentary that drowns out the speaker will not be allowed. Please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: But when are you coming back to the ANC?

The SPEAKER: Proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. That is why I asked myself this question when I saw the topic of the debate today as to what was going on in this member's mind. Now let me again just talk briefly about some of the things that he said, because he is now comparing cabbages with apples. Now let us look at the delivery record that he praised of the Eastern Cape compared to the Western Cape and I will tell you why. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why would you compare cabbages and apples?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now that is what he has done. I will tell you why this comparison is so flawed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who is the cabbage and who is the apple?

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: For example, Madam Speaker, between 2002 and 2015 the population of the Western Cape grew from 4.8 million to 6.2 million.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, sorry, please take your seat. You can make the point again. Hon Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I would like to know if can I ask the member a question?

An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you take a question? No, the Minister will not take a question, thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Because, Madam Speaker, the population of the Western Cape between 2002 and 2015 grew from 4.8 million to 6.2 million. Now let us look at the Eastern Cape that he is praising so much. The population of the Eastern Cape did not grow at all. In fact in 2002 there were 6.2 million people in the Eastern Cape and now there are 6.6 million. [Interjection.]

No, you cannot compare the two. We grew by almost two million. You cannot compare the growth of a few thousand and this one. So, that is why - in fact if he is saying that the services that we are providing as the Western Cape government have not gone down it means we have done very well because despite the massive population growth we have managed to keep the services. As we just saw now, we are the best performing province. Now again let me come to the point of this being Youth Month and about the fact that this party



is not doing anything for young people. There are so many things that this government is doing for young people.

Now we are not paying lip service or providing services to comrades and friends as we have seen the NYDA do. [Interjections.] So if you look at the number of programmes ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...that we have for young people in this province, for example we have the so called Youth and Skills Programme under Minister Winde. This programme has provided skills to 5177 young people and in this financial year for example they are targeting 2200 young people. Now what are they doing here is that they are taking young people with no skills. They skill them and match them with the companies or in industries that are driving the economy in the Western Cape. Out of those 5177, 4921 were placed, which means they now have jobs as we speak here today.

Now if you look at again at one of the programmes under Minister Albert Fritz, Youth Cafés, this is a programme that is rolling out across the province. Currently there are five Youth Cafés and they are providing services to a number of people. We have one in Oudtshoorn, in George, Mitchells Plain, Retreat, Vangate Mall, etcetera. [Interjections.]

Now again we know that there is still so much more to be done, but the reality is that if you look at the rate of population growth and the services that this government is providing and the fact that we are the best performing province in all indicators - it is not us who is saying that - it shows that we are the province that uses the money for exactly what it is intended for.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The biggest problem in other provinces is letting money get stolen instead of delivering services to the people. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, your time has expired. Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, just keep the tone down a little bit. I see the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, thank you for this opportunity to take part in this debate but in politics you select a topic for a debate based on your strengths, not on your weaknesses. [Laughter.] The ANC today chose a topic where they are weak, in fact, very weak. This shows the crisis in the ANC in the Western Cape. They are missing their former leader. The topic of responsive governance is indeed a strength of the Democratic Alliance and the DA municipalities run all over South Africa. The DA's local governments are responsive. The DA has a clear offer in this

local government election. I will offer our commitments in this election, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

THE SPEAKER: Order please. Hon Minister, kindly take your seat. Members, you simply cannot - hon member Joseph - do that and neither can the other side here. There is a speaker on the floor, you can speak but not at the tone that you are doing that drowns out the speaker. Please, hon members. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker, I hope you record my time. I have got a lot of ammunition here. [Laughter.]

THE SPEAKER: We have.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the DA has a clear offer in its election manifesto. The offer is very clear; stop ANC corruption, deliver better services and create jobs. That is the offer of the Democratic Alliance in terms of our election manifesto. The Local Government Manifesto addresses the issue of this debate, of this honourable member. Our manifesto has six pillars ... [Interjection.]

THE SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon Minister, please take your seat. Is it a point of order hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes, Madam Speaker. †Ndicela ukubuza ukuba ilungelo na intoyoba athi umphathiswa xa ethethayo akhombе omnye umntu ngelinye ilungu lesandla? [I would like to ask if it is right for the Minister to point his finger at another member when he speaks?]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I withdraw my finger.

Ms P MAKELENI: You must behave. Don't withdraw, behave.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the DA Local Government ...  
[Interjection.]

THE SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can I ask you to please address the Chair when you speak. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the DA Local Government election manifesto addresses the topic of this debate. The DA manifesto has six pillars. It deals with the subject matter of this debate that this honourable member brought to this House. The first pillar is to create opportunities. The second pillar of our manifesto is to provide responsive local government, the topic of his debate. The third pillar provides basic service delivery. The fourth pillar is stopping ANC corruption. The fifth pillar is providing meaningful redress and the sixth pillar is making our communities safer all over South Africa. The Democratic Alliance Manifesto is clear. On page one

of this manifesto, on page one... I will turn to page one of our manifesto.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. There is too much noise.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It makes reference to the subject of this debate, responsive local government. I will come back to this because it is found on page one of our manifesto but here is the contrast in this debate. When I saw this topic on the Order Paper, I thought the ANC is serious about responsive governance. So I consulted the ANC's Local Government Manifesto.

HON MEMBERS: Page one!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I found something in this manifesto in the case of the DA, responsive governance, you find it on page one of this manifesto. On the ANC manifesto you find responsive governance on the last page of the manifesto but it is not only found on the last page, it is on the back page of the manifesto. [Interjections.] But Madam Speaker there is ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... a reason why it is on the back page of the manifesto because it is on the back of their agenda. In the ANC ...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... responsive governance is not on the agenda ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, you are shouting.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, you will find it on the last page of the ANC manifesto and so the ANC is not serious about this topic.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members, there is too much howling going on here. There is screaming and shouting, this is Parliament, it is not some market somewhere where we all just launch into each other. Now, if there are questions to be asked by both sides of the House, reserve time after the sitting to discuss that. This is not the time to ask for definitions and explanations. It is a debate and responses are now forthcoming. †Asseblief, lid Davids, jy *scream* oor die banke, ek kan nie eers hoor nie. [Please member Davids, you are screaming across the benches, I cannot even hear.] And we say it in jest but hon members let us restore some dignity in this House so that we may proceed.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Even the Speaker [Inaudible] the circus.

The SPEAKER: Which Speaker? No, I am talking to all sides of the House. I am not singling out any one person here. So, I am going to ask the Minister to address the Chair. [Interjections.] Okay, can we all just ... honourable Dugmore, can we all just get to order please? Thank you. You may proceed hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, here is the story of the ANC. The word responsive governance is found on the last page because it is the last thing they are concerned about, about people in the Western Cape. This is no co-incidence. Responsive local governance is not on the agenda of the ANC. They ask what is responsive governance? It is everything that they are not doing, that is responsive governance.

†Agb Speaker, die ANC gee nie om vir die mense van Suid Afrika nie. Daarom agb lid kom daar verandering in Tshwane, daar kom verandering in Johannesburg, daar kom verandering in Nelson Mandela Bay, daar kom verandering regdeur Suid Afrika.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Madam Speaker, the ANC does not care about the people of South Africa. Therefore, hon member, there is change coming to Tshwane, there is change

coming to Johannesburg, there is change coming to Nelson Mandela Bay, there is change coming all through South Africa.]

Responsive governance is something that you can measure and the Auditor-General of South Africa has produced a report where you can measure responsive governance. Just eight days ago the Auditor-General, Kimi Makwetu, announced the 2014/15 local government audits which show that only 54 of the 278 councils and municipalities got a clean bill of health and almost half of them are to be found in the Western Cape.

Let us review the ANC's responsive governance, the topic that they have chosen here today [Interjections.]. Let us go to the Eastern Cape, the Auditor-General says the following about responsive governance in the Eastern Cape:

“Weak in internal control ...”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon Minister. Just one second. Is that a point of order or a question?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Relevance please, Mr Deputy Speaker, the topic is responsive centred local government in the Western Cape. Please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will listen carefully hon member Beerwinkel but allow the Minister to continue.



The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The topic of this debate deals with responsive governance and the track record of the ANC is nothing to write about because the evidence is to be found in the Auditor-General's report. The report confirms that where the ANC is governing there is no responsive governance in South Africa. The 20 worst run municipalities in South Africa are run by the African National Congress. The top 10 municipalities in South Africa are run by the Democratic Alliance.

So, 73% of the audits of municipalities in the Western Cape got a clean audit. In Gauteng the nearest is only 33%. There is no good governance where the ANC is running. There is no responsive governance where the ANC is running. In the Free State, the Auditor-General said that very little progress was made in terms of the number of municipalities with findings on compliance. There is no responsive governance in KZN. The only responsive municipality in Gauteng is Midvaal Municipality run by the Democratic Alliance.

All the municipalities in Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape and North West are dysfunctional municipalities. The audit outcome of municipalities has improved over the five years in the Western Cape from 2010 to 2015. The positive trend towards clean audits happened as a result of leadership within the Democratic Alliance municipalities. The Western Cape Government is a responsive government. We place emphasis on properly functioning ward committee systems. Our meetings are open to the public and provide access for discussions.

Just last night, the hon Minister of Local Government and myself went to Matsikama, an ANC-run municipality. Here is the agenda of matters that were discussed for the last two years by the local community in Matsikama but they failed to execute responsive governance. The hon Minister of Local Government and myself had to deal with all of these matters, where the ANC municipality had failed to deliver. So why ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, last night we saw responsive governance in action where the ANC was failing in responsive governance. [Interjection.] There are more examples of responsive governance in Swellendam. The Mayor opened a satellite office closer to the community, the Mayor leaves the town and goes to the community. That is responsive governance hon member [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order. Hon Minister your time has expired but I see the hon Olivier. Will you answer a question?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No. No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not prepared. You can finish your sentence, your time has expired but just finish off.

An HON MEMBER: Bye-bye.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, order. My apologies, you have got a minute left. My apologies.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have got a minute left.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Tyatyam? [Inaudible.] Say again?

Mr S G TYATYAM: All of us, you are the one that manages us. There is no way that a member when you tell a member that your time is up, you say no, no, no because tomorrow it is going to be me who says to you, no my time is not up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I interpreted that as being he is not prepared to take a question.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because he said, no, no, no ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Please take your seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: That cannot be allowed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I hear what you are saying.

Mr S G TYATYAM: They are not Speakers, you are the only one who is a Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Tyatyam. You have made your point. Take your seat please. Hon Minister, I erroneously stopped you. You have got one minute left. The hon member Olivier was on the floor. Did you want to ask a question? [Inaudible.] The Minister said he was not prepared. Hon Minister Meyer are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No Sir.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not prepared to take a question, so please continue hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, if the hon member is interested we offer a better opportunity for people under the Democratic Alliance. On page one you will find responsive governance [Interjections.]. The Democratic Alliance is clear [Interjections.] where we are running you will find better governance and on the third of August you are going to see the Democratic Alliance taking Johannesburg. We are taking Tshwane, we are taking Nelson Mandela, we are taking Beaufort West, we are taking

Matsikama, we are taking Cederberg, we are taking all over. And then after that hon member, we are going towards the Union Buildings. [Applause.][Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. The hon member Magaxa to reply.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Starting on a lighter note; the semi-illiterate hon MEC Madikizela chose to read a paper on us and omit the word “among” and instead said the best. The Western Cape is “among” - he could not read that. We urge the people in the Western Cape to join us on August 3<sup>rd</sup> and revolt against a racist, classist and corrupt DA Government in these upcoming local government elections. The hypocrisy of the DA has been uncovered.

The DA’s Mayoral candidate in the City of Cape Town is the most untrustworthy and unreliable person one can find. In 2010 before she sold her party to the DA for her own self-enrichment she said she was alarmed and deeply concerned about sanitation in Cape Town. She even accused the City of Cape Town of manipulating statistics for appearances as they have done even now in this debate. Just a year later, after she became Mayor of the City of Cape Town, all of a sudden 100% of informal settlements in the City of Cape Town have access to adequate sanitation. I do not know where the adequate sanitation is because there is a picture of her covering her face when she visited an informal settlement in Cape Town. [Interjection.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Just one second. Hon member is that a question or ...?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to rise on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A point of order, I am listening. Yes?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Does the House now allow that members of this House can show promotional material in the House? [Interjections.]. I mean ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

An HON MEMBER: ... it is worse. That is even nonsense you know [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Order! It is not normally allowed but as long as it does not disrupt the proceedings in the House it has been allowed from all sides before so I will not stop it for the moment. [Interjections.]. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have got a very nice newspaper I want to show them [Interjections.] because this is disturbing us. It is not true, it is utter nonsense that they are showing this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Please continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Just a year later, after she became Mayor of the City, all of a sudden the DA has adequate sanitation. The non-financial census mentioned by hon Bredell shows the Western Cape is the only province where bucket toilets went up. The Democratic Alliance is a corrupt, racist and classist party. The last five years in the City of Cape Town was proof of this. R5 billion in tender corruption prices for Cape Town Stadium and the BRT; the Bitou Mayor has been alleged to have sold jobs for sex and no action has been taken by the DA [Interjections.]; R70 million in a fraudulent tender deal uncovered by the Hawks; the scandalous wastage of R30 million with the Cape Town Soccer Cup; Chief [Inaudible.] taking workers' money from sub-contractors to pay himself.

The living conditions of people in Lwandle in Strand, in Imizamo Yethu in Hout Bay, Europe, Kannaland, Gugulethu, Siqualo, Kosovo, Philippi, Site C and Khayelitsha bear testimony to the sad reality that the DA is simply not bothered about them. While our people are in complete destitution the Premier of Western Cape took pictures on Sunday afternoon, in a leafy suburb of Cape Town, instead of addressing the issue of housing and special differences in the Western Cape. This Provincial Government has been caught with its pants down selling off land to private developers. We recently uncovered the sale of Tafelberg and we joined those who are calling

#stopthesale. In fact we are calling on all citizens of the Western Cape ...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, would you just finish off. Your time has long expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Tafelberg is not the only site which this Government refuses to use the land for social housing development, but instead wants to sell it off to private investors. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired. That then concludes the debate on this subject. We proceed to Interpellations. The first interpellation, hon member Tyatyam to Minister Bredell. Order. I see Minister Bredell.

## **INTERPELLATIONS**

### *Breedee Valley: eviction of community members*

- 1. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**



What steps did he take to stop the Breede Valley Municipality from evicting community members from their houses?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was not required to assist with any matter relating to the evictions in Breede Valley Municipality. The Breede Valley Municipality dealt with the evictions in line with their approved policy.

I want to take this opportunity to talk to the roles and responsibilities of Government, within the framework of the Constitution. Although we acknowledge the fact that the ANC has ignored Chapter 3 of the Constitution - and I am going to read it for the hon members and hopefully then they will understand that we have got three spheres of government and not levels of government - Chapter 3 of the Constitution:

“In the Republic, government is constituted as national, provincial and local spheres of government which are distinctive, inter-dependent and inter-related. All spheres of government must observe and adhere to the principles in this chapter and must conduct their activities within the parameters that this chapter provides.’

So, with that, it has got nothing to do with us if the Municipality operates within their legal framework. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is unfortunate that the Minister chooses not to respond and also not to actually act when people, ordinary people, poor people are taken out by a municipality that is under the DA. The MEC is saying that he is not going to respond because probably the Minister or the Municipality has not asked him to respond. It is unfortunate that these evictions are not only taking place in the Breede Valley Municipality. They are taking place in Breede Valley and they are taking place in the City of Cape Town. Now, in Ravensmead, there are people who are being taken out. In places like Mitchells Plain there are people who are now being taken out .

HON MEMBERS: Where?

Mr S G TYATYAM: We are talking of disabled people, we are talking of people who are unemployed, we are talking of senior citizens of our country, of our province.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In which areas?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Here in Ravensmead.

An HON MEMBER: Which area?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yet the MEC says to us he is not going to act unless the Municipality does. There were people in Breede Valley Municipality who are sleeping outside without the care of the Municipality under the DA. Is the Minister saying to us that the Constitution - because the people, the Constitution gives them rights; [Interjections.] that they must be treated with dignity, that the people must be respected, that the people must be protected but under the DA municipalities, under the DA-controlled Province, for the people there is no dignity.

And here the Minister comes and tells us that he does not see himself acting there. He only sees himself, collecting the money at the end of the month. That is what he knows because the lives of the poor people, the lives of black and white, the lives of people in the rural areas he does not care about. He only cares about those lives when they must vote for the DA to be in power but when it comes to service delivery the lives of the poor people are not taken care of.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: What on earth are you talking about?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because the evictions that are taking place unfortunately take place just before elections.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: In Johannesburg?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Here, in this province. Is the Municipality or the DA using that to scare people? That they must be afraid and they must continue to vote for DA because they are afraid to be thrown out of their houses?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Tyatyam, your time has expired. The hon member Mngasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We appreciate that people must have access to shelter and access to dignity as per the Constitution but we cannot promote lawlessness and have members of Parliament, trying in a very subtle way, to say it is right for individuals to grab land. I think Section 25 of the Constitution would be highly compromised. What I need to ask though Mr Deputy Speaker ...

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What has that got to do with evictions?

Mr M MNQASELA ... is if we have got issues like these in this country where there is a madam from hell according to this newspaper - where you chair the Labour Department in the National Assembly but you do not pay your own domestic worker at home - those are issues you know that we should ask ourselves. As members of Parliament we should ask ourselves whether, when we sit here in Parliament, are we exonerated from being called these kind of names? So that when we also pronounce on these matters we do not fuel and even lead protests to grab land here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. In terms of the policy of municipalities, people who stay in a house cannot just be evicted without a municipality giving them alternatives.

An HON MEMBER: Which policy is that?

Mr S G TYATYAM: In this case we have people who have been staying in Rawsonville and in Worcester South, some more than ten years and now today, in this winter weather, they are out of their houses because they are not willing to take card membership of the DA [Interjections.]. How can that be tolerated? Because those people ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... have rights like the MEC or any member of the DA has a right; to be under protection, to be comfortable in this particular winter and today we have people, particularly the frail, aged people in Worcester, who do not have a place to stay. So the answer that I want to know from the Minister is why he continues to sit down whilst ordinary, poor people, are actually suffering because of them. Why is the policy not followed?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS: Exactly, that is what they do. They follow their policy.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Why is the policy not followed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Your time has unfortunately expired. The hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you again, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me just ask the MEC, the Minister of Local Government - when we did the oversight visit to the Overberg District Municipality, we were told that there is a problem in terms of collecting traffic fines. Now I would like to ask this particular municipality whether, in terms of the traffic fines, especially issues of drunken driving [Interjections.], do we have any of the fines that have been referred to the Minister for intervention so that we can begin to deal with these kind of issues conclusively and ....

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and I want to further say ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mngqasela, I am listening carefully, you are slightly off the topic now, you have got a couple of seconds left if you want to bring it to the topic.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I do not know what I have done but I see the members do not want me to finish speaking. But let me go back to this point. I think that with the issue of people being afforded

an opportunity to live in any property of the municipality there should be... I think as members of Parliament... I appreciate what hon Tyatyam has done, I think we must applaud him for that but ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela, your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we must follow due process with a municipality. I chair Local Government and I do not see why it should be brought here to the Minister. I think ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has now really expired. The hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. I must mention another element of what is happening in the Breede Valley Municipality, where the municipality is in collusion with some of the farmers.

An HON MEMBER: Do you have proof?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. You must go to Stofland where people are evicted from the farms. They go and stay in one block there in Stofland and when they refuse to go again and work free of charge in their farm areas they are even evicted from those houses. This is what is currently happening there [Interjections.]. Yet they have people, MECs, they have researchers, they have everything in their Department and yet they are unable to find out those

things. [Interjection.] It is clear that you are not doing your job [Interjection.]. You are not doing your job. There is no reason why you should be kept as MEC if you are unable to deliver and to oversee what is happening. You cannot oversee a proper local government, what is happening, and you expect to sit here and earn millions of Rands.

The point is, Mr Deputy Speaker, when is the Minister of Local Government going to call the local government there in Breede Valley and actually read them the riot act and tell them not to evict people, particularly old people who have been staying for more than 10, 20 years in those houses?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We have been asking the ANC for the last five years to bring us some proof of evictions. They never bring the proof. They will never bring the proof because they do not have the proof. It is obvious that the hon member still thinks in levels and not in spheres of government. Where the DA governs, we act within the framework of policies. Obviously there are also poor people waiting to enter the housing domain so you need to be fair to all of them and I trust the Municipality will act within the legal framework.

It is also obvious that the hon member put this interpellation on here not knowing which function it is, either which Minister to speak to, so it is to



adhere to his PDMS. So I can rather ask him if I can give him some topics if he wants to talk to me. One is Seskona leaving the ANC this afternoon – that will be nice to debate. Another one that will be very nice to debate was when the PEC member of the ANC this afternoon announced in a news conference that you cannot vote for the ANC because you cannot trust them. That is what their own PEC members say. [Interjections.] So thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That disposes of the first interpellation. We proceed to the second interpellation. Hon member Davids to hon Minister Winde. Hon Minister?

*Residential Units: Philippi Horticultural Area*

**2. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

Whether his Department supports the application by developers who are applying to build residential units in the Philippi horticultural area?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker and to the hon member Davids for asking this question. The only problem is it is a difficult question

to answer because it does not point to anything specific. It just asks me whether my Department supports the application by developers who are applying to build residential units in the Philippi horticultural area.

Now I need to perhaps say to the hon member that next time she wants an interpellation and wants some detail, she should first start by perhaps asking for an erf number or a [Interjections.], because ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order hon member Davids.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and perhaps her Chief Whip should help her in this case. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So, I need to ask her which part of the total 3,652.4 hectares of the Philippi horticultural area is she talking about? Is she talking about the 2 638.2 hectares which is consolidated horticultural area; or the proposed Sheffield Road alignment which is 176.5 hectares; or the Skaapkraal Holdings 160.41 hectares; or perhaps the Vanguard Drive Island which is 231.03 hectares; or perhaps the area rezoned by Province which is 445.9 hectares - a total of 3 652.4 hectares. I need to know which application she wants me to talk to because my Department has to comment on all

applications that come through and depending on where it is, they will apply their minds to that specific application. So if she would like to have some detail, if she could give me the erf or the specific application that we are talking about I will let her know how my Department commented.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Davids?

Mr D JOSEPH: [Inaudible.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Denis, I am not you. I do not allow people to think for me, I think for myself. Thank you. I want to come to this. My question is very clear. I am speaking about the Philippi area and I am speaking about the whole. I am speaking about - here I have the map Minister. If you do not have it, here it is. The application of the developers was not for specific areas. I am coming to my point.

My next question to you Minister, I am going to ask you again, are you supportive of this development, yes or no? And then my second question to you is: MEC Anton Bredell gave a report on this and the request from this community is, whether the MEC, Anton Bredell, will support their request of no development to happen on the agricultural land. My second question to the MEC is: will he interact with MEC Bredell to support the community?

They spoke about responsive governance. The definition of responsive governance is that you speak to the needs of the people and the timeframe

when you respond. These people have been interacting with the Municipality of Cape Town for several years. They have written letters to the MECs here in this Provincial Government but up till now, no answers. My question again Minister: are you supporting this development, yes or no? You speak about job creation and you speak about small scale farmers. This Philippi area includes all of those things that are the responsibility of our Department of Economic Development and Agriculture.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Beverley Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think we really do need to be absolutely clear here on what we mean, as Minister Winde has said. I would really like to take you back to a report tabled to the Economic Environment and Spatial Planning Committee of the City of Cape Town. This report was tabled in 2012. It is an extensive 40/50 page report and the report tabled the role of the Philippi horticultural area in securing the future of the city. And I really encourage you to read it because it acknowledges the fine line, the balance needed between developmental pressures that the city faces with that of arable and arable farming space that Philippi offers to food security to the city. And that really is what it is all about. So it is very important to understand. What are we talking about? Are we talking about the south-east quadrant that is largely not arable that may be possible to use or are we talking about the south-west quadrant which is extensively used for small-holder farming which produces about 50% of all vegetables supplied to the

city, as much as 50 different horticultural crops and currently employs about 3,500 people seasonally?

This we cannot ignore and I am sure if the Minister knew exactly what was being referred to he would support that because he is the Minister of Agriculture. I must also note that in 2014, after this report was tabled by the City of Cape Town's Department, that Minister Bredell released a media statement where he spoke very specifically to the agricultural sections of the Philippi horticultural area where he did not support that, based on the fact that is highly arable land. So we need to be very clear on what we are understanding here. What do we mean when we ask this question because we cannot mislead the public? There is some land there that is not arable that cannot be farmed but there is a possibility to look to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, seemingly the Chairperson of the Standing Committee is also now confused. When the people of this community engage with the Municipality of Cape Town they engage as the agricultural community of Philippi which includes Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha and all of those surrounding areas. There was never once that they spoke about a certain erf. The erf that they were speaking about is where the development is going to happen. We are speaking here about - Minister Winde you are laughing - 4 000 farm workers, we are speaking about jobs, we are speaking here about underground water.

We are saying there is drought here in the Western Cape, we are saying we have a shortage of water but you are laughing when it comes to a resource that we have, without a dam. We have a resource of underground water in the same area that can provide water even for households but you are sitting and laughing there Mr Winde. What a shock. I still want to know, MEC Winde, because this is what these people are asking. Are you in support because you said to me you wrote a letter that you are not in support of this? So you can say it in the House today?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon Beverley Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think that that is really unreasonable that hon member Davids makes accusations like that because to be honest she knows how dedicated I am to this portfolio, to protect food security, both in this city and in this province and I really do want to, I have the reports here. The companies have put applications forward, and really I am going to say it again, for the south-west quadrant application erven which are from 539, 541, 554, 574 and so I can go on. There are about 20 of them and the south-east quadrant applications erven are from 579, 582, 587, there's another 10 of them. The point is that it is actually different spaces and we need to understand it in order to make an informed decision going forward and we would ask the Minister, will you make an informed decision based on the specifics of the application that gets submitted to this Government?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids again.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am speaking about the whole Philippi agriculture sector, not about certain erven and that is what I am saying, even what the Standing Committee Chairperson said about MEC Bredell. MEC Bredell, in January 2014, did not give his permission for a small scale of the west side of that development. I am not speaking about a section of the development. I am speaking about the whole development because the request of the community is that the Province, the Government, the Agricultural Department must assist them so that in future they can actually expand. Why are we not assisting them to expand and take the housing developments to other land? Why do we want to develop where people's needs are exploited? Why do you want to do that MEC? You said to me you are not in support of this. Say it today in this House. You said it to me out there. Say it here in this House today.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, it is now your time to say.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. This is very difficult because this hon member is obviously all over the place. She needs to prepare before she comes to the House with these kind of questions ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... because the Philippi horticultural area, as I started right in the beginning, is a make-up of a whole lot of different spaces. There is Renosterveld - she spoke about the aquifer. I can assure you that my Department and Minister Bredell's Department, if someone asks for an application for a housing development on the Renosterveld, the answer would be no. If someone came and asked for development rezoning rights on the agricultural space which is being farmed at the moment, my Department would say no. But this individual here in the House, this hon member comes here ...

Ms S W DAVIDS: I asked you specifically about [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... not doing any homework whatsoever and if she had just read some of the newspaper articles before asking this question she would know that there are different applications. There is Uvest private land owners application - 96 hectares. She would know the Oakland City application - 472 hectares. She would be able to ask me and you cannot give a generic answer because you will be held liable but if she asks me for a specific zone area, my Department applies their minds and in those cases I will tell her right now, as I said to her outside there, my Department said no.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you.



The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And that is part of a process that went to the National Department of Agriculture and it is on those specific erven but she comes here and she asks how long is a piece of string? She needs to do her homework before she comes here to try and ask some question like this.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You didn't do your work [Inaudible.]. You need to do your work [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, allow the Minister to respond now. You have had your turn.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: She also referred to a map. There are 17 maps in this document if she wants to have a look at it. She obviously does not have that information either, she can Google it and get that information. It is very easily available and as an honourable member of this House, she has been here for quite a few years, she should know [Interjection.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: She should know how to ask a question in this House. [Interjection.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Your time has now expired. Hon member Davids, I am not going to talk again. I am competing with you for the attention of Minister Winde. We now proceed to Questions for Oral Reply, the first question standing over, hon member Hinana to hon Minister Mbombo.

### **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 2 June 2016, as agreed to by the House:*

#### *Day-care hospitals: complaints about treatment*

**1. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Health:**

Whether her Ministry has ever received any complaints from members of the public about the treatment they get at day-care hospitals; if so, (a) what is the nature of the complaints and (b) what remedial action was taken to solve the problem?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. For the 2015/16 financial year, the Department had about 6,629 complaints received via the standard process and also 889 via the complaints hotline. The nature of the complaints vary from staff attitude, waiting times, cleanliness, safety, security and also includes alleged negligence.

Now in terms of the remedial action, the complaints are dealt with in terms of the National Complaints Management Protocol for the Public Health Sector of South Africa and also the Provincial Policy on Managing Adverse Incidents.

All our hospital CEOs and Facility Managers have complaints resolution targets built into their performance agreements and these complaints have to be acknowledged within five working days, either in writing or telephonically. The complainant is informed on when the person can expect a response and the person is given a reference number. The complainant's details are then registered on the Department's information system which we call Sinjani. Then what happens is once it is acknowledged it gets investigated and then feedback is given to the complainant. All of this is supposed to happen within 25 working days according to the policy.

In addition to that, all the health facilities have got forums for review of complaints and compliments in the form of what we call the Quality Assurance Committee and also Departmental Monitoring and Evaluation Meetings. In some cases, especially where there are high-risk complaints we have to look at the root causes and analyse them and then an attempt is made to address the root causes. If, for example, the complainants are not satisfied they are welcome to even go directly to the Minister of the HOD, where we report this, and it will be investigated by the Independent Health Complaints Committee in accordance with the Western Cape Independent Health Committee Act No. 2 of 2014.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up hon member Hinana? You may proceed.

Mr N E HINANA: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is a follow-up. In relation to the complaints that have been responded to, on today's front page of the *Cape Times* it is said that the General Household Survey indicated that 45% of people responded to say that they do not get satisfaction from the services provided by the Department. What is your response therefore on that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. There are two things; one, the report in the *Cape Times* is responding to the Stats SA report of the survey they conducted in 2015. I think the main thing is the interpretation of the statistics because if you look at the statistics, according to the Stats SA, they say that 45.5% in the Western Cape are very satisfied and only 14% of those surveyed indicated that they were dissatisfied. But the point is that even for those that are dissatisfied what is it that you are doing about that? As I indicated earlier, the complaint system is well established but the question is that how do you link that with patient satisfaction? Because the research is about where they ask people whether they are satisfied or not and it is around households because we also have to link patients' satisfaction with health outcomes.

One person might say he is satisfied, but you find that the quality is not up to standard and it impacts on the health outcomes. For example, our life expectancy is the highest in the country. It is 66 years and 68 years, for women and men respectively. For children, mothers, maternal mortality, PMT prevention of mother-to-child, when it comes to the health outcomes, it was still the highest. If you look at HIV and Aids in terms of the number of clients that are on anti-retrovirals and the TB cure rate, the point I am trying to raise is, that whilst there are such kind of patient satisfaction in terms of the complaints, how do you link that with health outcomes?

So we are very good at that but it does not take away the mere fact that Ms X somewhere, in that corner of the hospital or province complains about the clinic, that you dismiss that and then make an argument about the statistics. Hence we try by every means to see to it that we have reduced waiting times, improved staff attitudes and see that we reprimand those who do not produce quality with dignity and respect.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, follow up?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Minister mentioned, when she was listing the complaints, the cleanliness of health facilities and she also mentioned that a complaint must be answered within a certain period of time. What happens in a case where people are complaining about the cleanliness of a facility and how is it handled in that timeframe?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I indicated earlier, a complaint is a complaint whether you are complaining about staff attitudes, whether you are complaining about an adverse risk kind of a complaint but depending on the severity of it. The issue is the same for cleanliness. The response must be within five working days if you are complaining about anything to do with a particular health facility but in terms of severity it can take a maximum of 25 working days.

As I indicated, every CEO, every health facility manager has the complaints system embedded within their performance agreement and also they have got targets. Fortunately, as I indicated earlier, it needs to be logged in the system so that is why, even in my office, I am able to see if I want to find out whether the CEO of the Mitchells Plain hospital is managing complaints. I am able to track them in terms of the frequency and also whether that person is responding to those complaints. That is part of the whole system as I indicated. It is a National Health Protocol and also we have got a policy around that for adverse reactions. But the point that we are making is that if it so happened that a complainant is not satisfied, there are also various ways of up-scaling the complaint to the highest level. When it comes to rendering a service of a quality care we do not compromise with that, hence you will find there is a whole issue of how to reprimand and how to disinsensitise that particular facility or the person responsible.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, another chance?

Ms D GOPIE: Hon Minister, have you received anything in connection with Eerste River Hospital, the cleanliness of Eerste River Hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, but I was at the Eerste River Hospital on the 12<sup>th</sup> of May, that is International Nurses Day. At the time I was there I did not see any problems related to cleanliness. But also remember that with a hospital facility, within five minutes, or 10 minutes or 15 minutes, depending on high service pressure or high traffic of patients, even if it was clean five minutes ago, when I go there within 15 or 30 minutes it may change. What is important is that we still have to maintain that cleanliness, so we cannot leave the blood lying there and all of those kinds of things. But on the 12<sup>th</sup> of May I was there at Eerste River.

Ms D GOPIE: Because they knew you were coming.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Then we proceed to the hon member Dugmore. Is there a follow-up? It is the last opportunity, you may use it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC whether she thinks that it is important that the Local Health Facility Boards are also involved in listening to and bringing to her attention complaints which are laid at our public facilities?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We will actually be discussing the Bill later on. The Act is there but now we have included the Health Committees. It is

part of their responsibility to report such and also to discuss with the health facility. The chairpersons of the board have got a direct link even to the Minister because they are appointed through the Minister, so it is part of all the discussions that take place. Also, they can do the rounds within the facility to look at such things and also members of the public can even directly report to them in terms of that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move to the next question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just to follow up on that ... [Interjection.]

.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately we have reached the maximum allowed per question so we move to Question 5 standing over. Hon member Uys to Minister Mbombo.

*G F Jooste Hospital: building of*

**\*5. Mr P Uys to ask Ms N Mbombo, Minister of Health:**

- (a) Where and (b) when will the new or future G F Jooste Hospital be built?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The G F Jooste District hospital is to be replaced by a regional hospital and it is going to be in the same sub-district



currently as the G F Jooste, in Klapfontein, which is in Manenberg, so the replacement hospital is still going to be in that area but we are looking for a bigger site.

In terms of the details on the aspects of construction, that will be communicated later once the process is finalised. In terms of when: it takes about three to five years to build a hospital but only once the site has been identified. So therefore the date cannot be provided yet in the light of certain conditions preceding the actual building because we do not have the exact site so it is still in discussion. We have not finalised it yet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, MEC. MEC, in April this year you said the land has been secured and engineers and architects are already looking at the site. Why did you say that then? Is it not true that you said it was secure?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Not the site, we said that is part of the concept. When you talk about the construction of the health infrastructure it has about 8 phases. From the phase AX1, it talks about the concept up the last part where you get the keys. So the first four phases of the construction - actually there is no construction because it is about dropping the plan.

For example, we already have some hospitals that have been built like Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain and other new hospitals. So the engineers take the existing plan and architectural structure and then drop it in a certain area where we anticipate we are going to have it. But I did not say they are at the site, I said they are busy with part of the phases in terms of the construction. So the site is still being finalised, as I indicated earlier, we cannot communicate now because it has not been finalised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. No, MEC, you said you secured the site and I would like to know why did you then say you want to avoid unnecessary objections against the site, that you are not going to say where the site is?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You build experience, for example when we started with discussions around Hout Bay, we ended up having a lot of objections and also in other different areas. So that is why it is better to have that kind of a discussion with community involvement in terms of the building. The infrastructure development is already there, because for example in the case of Hout Bay, three different communities were fighting and we decided we don't want that. So we are trying to vote based on experience, we are trying to avoid that kind of situation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Is it correct that I hear that you are only going to consult when you start with the building? As the MEC, what consultations did you have with the community, and what consultation do you plan with the community?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I indicated earlier, there are eight phases for the construction of the health infrastructure. Phase one for example is about the concept and all of that. Usually when you start with the actual building, it is around phase four or five. So what I am saying is that the stage where we are at, is not the stage where we consult.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is dangerous.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We don't. You don't because first of all, for example the first part of it, in terms of the business case, we have to send it to National. That you don't consult, you don't, because you have got various stages of doing the consultation in terms of public engagement within the health system.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your last opportunity.

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, is it then correct to understand from the MEC that she will not tell the community, or consult the community before the election, where the site will be, because she is worried that they will object against it, but only tell them after the election where it will be?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Manenberg Steering Committee is already engaged with the Western Cape Government, because it's not only the Hospital that is being targeted in that area. It is the whole of the precinct related to youth, lifestyle and all of those. So already the Manenberg Steering Committee, which is a representation from the different sectors: the school, health and all of those, that are part of that. So it is already happening and it is also inclusive of the VPUU in terms of safety.

So what I am talking about is the specifics around the health sector. Currently they are all represented in the Manenberg Steering Committee, which is the community.

Mr P UYS: You are not telling them.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question. Hon member Gopie, to Minister Mbombo again, Question 10 standing over.

*HIV. AIDS and Tuberculosis: medication*

**10. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Health:**

Why is medication that does not appear on the Essential Medicines List prescribed to patients with HIV, Aids and tuberculosis?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Medication, we provide medications per national guidelines, for example Bedaquiline is a new drug that is approved by the Medicine Control for drugs – for people who are resistant to the TB, but that one is not on the EDL, but all other drugs they're part of the EDL. Remember that, for drug resistant TB. This started in 2015, it is not part of the EDL, but we are following the EDL, Essential Medicine List – Essential Drug List. We are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, your first supplementary.

Ms D GOPIE: Hon Minister, in terms of kids that have HIV and TB – kids, children. In terms of children that are also using medication for HIV and TB, when are you planning to make a syrup or something easier for them to take, because when you take a tablet and you crush it, it gets toxic?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You are raising an important point. Remember some of these are discussed at a national level, because it affects all of us, the issue of the syrup, and also because now and again you get different strains of TB, like there was no MDR, there was no XDR previously. So you will find that with the pharmaceutical companies they keep on developing all of those.

So all these discussions in terms of a syrup and all of those things, new infections, the testing and all of those, are done at a national level. At a provincial level we are engaged through our contract suppliers and also to see

what it is that we can provide, but as I indicated earlier, this is part of the National Guidelines. So for now, at provincial level, we are not there, but we are engaged with National, with the other provinces, around that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If there is no follow-up question, we proceed to new questions. Question number 1 Hon Uys to Minister Bredell.

*New Questions*

*Eden District Municipality: regional dumping sites*

**\*1. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What is the situation regarding the regional dumping sites in the area of the Eden District Municipality?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie mnr die Adjunkspeker vir die vraag. Daar word tans net een streekstortingsterrein beplan vir die Eden Distrik. Die Eden Distrik Munisipaliteit het in 2007 begin met die beplanning van die streekstortingsterrein om die munisipaliteite van George, Bitou, Knysna en Mosselbaai te dien ten opsigte van die beskikking van vaste afval. Hierdie munisipaliteite se stortingsterreine se lugspasie was uitgeput en hulle het volgens die ooreenkoms begin om die Petro SA stortingsterrein

in Mosselbaai te gebruik.

Die besluit om die moontlikheid van die ontwikkeling van 'n streekstortingsterrein te ondersoek is geneem nadat Petro SA aangedui het dat die fasiliteit net benut kan word tot Desember 2013. Sedertdien het Petro SA die sperdatum verleng tot 1 Januarie 2017.

Gedurende die omgewingsimpakstudie-proses het die konsultante 'n deeglike gedetailleerde negatiewe karteringsoefening gedoen en slegs drie moontlike terreine is geïdentifiseer. Die eiendom aangrensend aan die Petro SA stortingsterrein was as die mees geskikte perseel geïdentifiseer.

Die terrein is gelisensieer deur die Departement van Omgewingsake op 5 Februarie 2014, en die Eden Distrik Munisipaliteit het die grond gekoop vir 'n bedrag van R5.8 miljoen.

Die befondsing van die streekstortingsterrein is 'n komplekse proses en Eden Distrik Munisipaliteit het daarom besluit om 'n Artikel 78 ondersoek in terme van die Wet op Plaaslike Regering Munisipale Stelsels te doen om die konstruksie en die bedryf van die stortingsterrein deur 'n openbare/private vennootskapoooreenkoms te befonds.

Die Provinsie se Oorsigkomitee is gestig deur die Departement van Omgewingsake Ontwikkelingsbeplanning om die proses te fasiliteer. Die Komitee bestaan uit verteenwoordigers van die Departement van

Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning, Plaaslike Regering, Tesourie, Provinsiale Tesourie asook geaffekteerde munisipaliteite. Die verkrygingsproses om die diensverskaffer aan te stel is tans in 'n finale stadium om afgehandel te word.

Die deelname aan die streekstortingsterrein sal 'n toename in koste vir die munisipaliteite en die inwoners inhou, maar sal meer ekonomies wees as om afsonderlike munisipale stortingsterreine te ontwikkel. Dit kan grootliks toegeskryf word aan die streng norme en standaarde vir stortingsterreine wat in 2013 deur die Nasionale Departement van Omgewingsake aanvaar word. Baie dankie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys?

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Dankie LUR vir die antwoord. Hoe sal die vullis en die afval vervoer word na hierdie streekstortingsterrein, en sal alle plaaslike stortingsterreine van munisipaliteite sluit wanneer hierdie een wat u voorsien nou dan in bedryf sal kom?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dis natuurlik die idee dat ons die ander sal sluit. Die ander is reeds of baie van hulle is al gesluit. Hulle gebruik tans Petro SA. Ons moes die onderhandeling verleng het want die onderhandelings om die studies te doen vir die nuwe gesentreerde



stortingsterrein het ander syfers uitgeskop as wat ons verwag het.

Dis baie duur tans, dis regtig baie duur, so ons is besig met planne en beramings, ons is selfs besig met Nasionaal. Die nuwe eerstewêreld standarde maak vullisverwydering geweldig duur en hopelik kan ons hier 'n wenresep op die tafel kry wat ons dan ook sal uitrol na ander streke toe, want ek dink my eerlike opinie is dat ons het so 'n bietjie agtergeraak met vullis. Ons het baie aandag gegee aan water, riolering en elektrisiteit en vullis is besig om ons in te haal.

Ons sal die vullis na hierdie spesifieke terrein toe meestal per pad vervoer. So ons is besig om daarna te kyk, en dis deel van die ekstra koste. Ons sluit nie 'n plek soos Oudtshoorn in nie, want hy's anderkant die berg. Dit sal te duur raak.

So ons is besig in die finale stadium om te kyk waar kan ons koste bespaar, hoe kan ons kostes bespaar, maar ek dink dit sal ook in die Staande Komitee 'n redelike debat nog raak oor die hantering van vullis in die toekoms. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker for the question. Currently only one regional dumping site is being planned for the

Eden District. The Eden District Municipality started in 2007 with the planning of the regional dumping site to serve the municipalities of George, Bitou, Knysna and Mossel Bay with regard to the handling of solid waste. The air space of these municipalities' dumping sites was exhausted and in terms of the agreement they started using Petro SA's dumping site in Mossel Bay.

The decision to investigate the possibility of developing a regional dumping site was taken after Petro SA indicated that the facility could only be used until December 2013. Petro SA has since extended the deadline to 1 January 2017.

During the environmental impact study process the consultants did a thorough detailed negative charting exercise and only three possible sites had been identified. The property adjacent to the Petro SA dumping site was identified as the most suitable site.

The site was licenced by the Department of Environmental Affairs on 5 February 2014, and the Eden District Municipality bought the land for an amount of R5.8 million.

The funding of the regional dumping site is a complex process and Eden District Municipality has therefore decided to do a Section 78 investigation in terms of the Local Government Municipal Systems Act to fund the construction and operation of the dumping site by a public/private

partnership agreement.

The Province's Oversight Committee was established by the Department of Environmental Affairs Development Planning to facilitate the process. The Committee consists of representatives of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, Local Government, Treasury, Provincial Treasury as well as affected municipalities. The supply process to appoint the service provider is currently in a final stage of completion.

The participation in the regional dumping site will involve an increase in costs to the municipalities and the residents, but will be more economical than developing separate municipal dumping sites. It can mainly be attributed to the strict norms and standards for dumping sites that were adopted by the National Department of Environmental Affairs in 2013. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the MEC for the reply. How will the rubbish and waste be transported to this regional dumping site, and will all local dumping sites be closed when this one you are envisaging comes into operation?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is of course the idea that we will

close the others. The others are already, or some of them are already closed. They currently are using Petro SA. We had to extend the negotiation because the negotiations to undertake the study for the new centralised dumping site produced different figures from what we had expected.

It is currently very expensive, it really is very expensive, so we are busy with plans and estimates, we are even busy with National. The new first world standards render waste removal very expensive and hopefully we can find a winning recipe on the table that we can roll out to other regions, because it is my honest opinion that we have fallen behind with waste. We have paid a lot of attention to water, sewerage and electricity and waste is catching up with us.

We will mainly transport the waste to this specific site by road. So we are busy looking at that, and it is part of the extra costs. We are not including a place like Oudtshoorn, because it is beyond the mountain. It will become too expensive.

So we are busy in the final stage looking at where we can save costs, how we can save costs, but I think it will become a reasonable debate in the Standing Committee about the handling of waste in future. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, ons gaan voort na vraag 2, agb lid Uys na die agb Minister, Debbie Schäfer.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we move on to Question 2, hon Uys to

the hon Minister, Debbie Schäfer.] Hon member Uys, is it a follow-up question?

†Mnr P UYS: Asseblief.

[Mr P UYS: Please.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will allow it.

†Mnr P UYS: Kan ek net vir the LUR vra, dankie. U voorsien in privatisering of 'n semi-privatisering van hierdie stortingsterrein as gevolg van die koste betrokke daarby. Wat is die model wat u op die tafel gesit het van u kant af saam met die munisipaliteit vir hierdie privatiseringsmoontlikheid?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: May I just ask the MEC, thank you. You foresee privatisation or a semi-privatisation of this dumping site as a result of the costs involved. What is the model you have put on the table from your side along with the municipality for this possibility of privatisation?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die ondersoek, soos ek gesê het, ons het dit nog nie finaal afgehandel nie. Natuurlik kyk ons na alle opsies. Ons soek vennootskappe om ons te help om te befonds want dit is baie duur. Ek meen

ek kan nou al sê – daar's sekere munisipaliteite waar die vullistarief met 67% sal moet styg om dit haalbaar te maak.

So die presiese syfers sal ek liever wil verskaf in 'n Staande Komitee waar ons dit dan kan debatteer as dit goed is so met die lid. Ek het nie syfers by my nie, ek het nie daardie model by nie, maar ons kan dit enige tyd bring na die Staande Komitee om dit daar met julle te kom bespreek.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The investigation, as I have mentioned, has not been finalised. Of course we are looking at all options. We are looking for partnerships to assist us to fund because it is very expensive. I can say it now, there are certain municipalities where the waste tariff will have to increase by 67% to make it viable.

So the exact figures I would rather provide in a Standing Committee where we can debate it, if it is in order with the member. I do not have figures with me, I do not have the model with me, but we can bring it to the Committee at any time to come and discuss it here with you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?]

†Mnr P UYS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dankie. Ek het gehoor dat die vullis gaan vervoer word van Bitou af na Mosselbaai toe. Dit maak mos nie werklikwaar praktiese sin om vullis so ver te vervoer en dit dan in 'n streek se punt te gaan stort nie. Ek verstaan nie die logika daaragter en die somme wat gemaak is nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. I have heard that the waste will be transported from Bitou to Mossel Bay. It does not really make practical sense to transport waste that far and then go and dump it in a region's site. I do not understand the logic behind that and the figures that were produced.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit is hoekom ek vra, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dat ons dit in 'n Staande Komitee moet debatteer en die hele verslag soontoe bring. U moet onthou dat wanneer jy begin ernstig kyk na herwinning, het jy volumes nodig. Jy sit ook met ernstige probleme in Bitou met grond, ons het nie die geskikte grond daarvoor nie.

So daar is verskeie aspekte wat hier in berekening gebring moet word. Ons is selfs so ver om te begin debatteer om 'n projek te loods waar ons werklik mense kan kry om hulle nat vullis uit te haal, want dit is wat die chemiese reaksie veroorsaak. As jy die nattigheid verwyder kan jy die res eintlik redelik goedkoop stoor.

Natuurlik dan ook die herwinning doen, maar ons moet ook erken dat tans in Suid-Afrika is ons baie agter – ook agter met tegnologie op herwinning, want eintlik skei ons tans net vullis. Ons doen nog nie werklike herwinning nie. Werklike herwinning kom waar jy waarde toevoeg en wanneer jy massas van ‘n produk het wat jy dan weer gaan verkoop.

So weereens, ons is as Departement bekommerd. Ons het baie huiswerk hierop gedoen, ons sal dit enige tyd met die Staande Komitee kom deel. Baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is why I am asking, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we debate it in a Standing Committee and bring the whole report there. You have to bear in mind that when you are seriously looking at reclamation, you need volumes. We also have serious problems in Bitou with land, we do not have suitable land for that.

So there are various aspects that have to be taken into consideration. We are even at the stage where are debating launching a project where we can get people to remove their wet waste, because that is what is causing the chemical reaction. If one can remove the wet, the rest can actually be stored reasonably cheaply.



Of course then also do the reclamation, but we have to admit that currently in South Africa we are very far behind – also behind with technology on reclamation, because actually we are currently only separating waste. We are not yet doing real reclamation. Real reclamation is when you add value and when you have a mass of a product that you can then again go and sell.

So again, we as Department are concerned. We have done a lot of homework on this, we will come and share it with the Standing Committee at any time. Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your last opportunity.

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, dankie LUR. Ek wil net vra of u Departement reeds in gesprek is met LUR Grant en sy Departement oor die moontlike opgradering van die hoofpaaie en of daar enige kosteberekening daar rondom gemaak is.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, MEC. I just want to ask whether your Department is already in discussion with MEC Grant and his Department on the possible upgrading of the main roads and if any cost analysis has been done around that?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nee ons het nog nie daardie gesprekke

aan die gang gesit nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No, we have not yet started those discussions.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the second question, hon member Uys to Minister Debbie Schäfer. Hon Minister Schäfer?

*Uitsig Secondary School: challenges*

**\*2. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Education:**

- (a) What are the challenges that have been identified at the Uitsig Secondary School and (b) how will these challenges be addressed?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Uitsig High School is a 50-year old school, known more colloquially as one of our remaining “plankie schools” that has endured years and years of increasing vandalism. This, together with the natural deterioration of the building, has led to an increased concern over the safety of its learners and staff employed at the school, and as a result of this, on two different occasions last year we initiated a voluntary relocation

of the remaining learners to surrounding safer schools. Both these efforts were thwarted by COSATU's Tony Ehrenreich, for reasons known only to him, but which in our view did not put the best interests of the affected learners or staff in the forefront.

Apart from the age of the building and the materials used to build it at the time of its erection, a major challenge has been ongoing burglary and continued vandalism of any upgrades that are made, despite numerous efforts by Safe Schools and the school itself to ensure security is maintained. Measures that we have taken include raising the height of a wall used by gangsters to enter the school grounds, installing razor wire and deploying additional security guards. Safe Schools has over the last two years invested almost R300 000 on security reinforcements at this school.

Despite these security enforcement measures, the school is continuously targeted by vandals, with the school's latest incident being reported only on Tuesday last week, when basins in the ablution facilities were stolen.

Following thwarted attempts to voluntarily relocate all the remaining learners to safer sites, the Department of Transport and Public Works commissioned a technical report by an independent agency to assess the condition of the school on behalf of the WCED in May 2016.

The WCED received this technical report on 16<sup>th</sup> of May 2016. The report raised some serious structural concerns. We therefore immediately sought to

find an alternative venue to accommodate the learners of Uitsig as a temporary measure.

The report condemned the asbestos roof sheeting throughout the school, along with fascia's, barge boarding, gutters and downpipes.

The report condemned all structural, non-loadbearing prefabricated panels used for the walls, although it found that the concrete frames are in a moderate condition.

The ablution facilities are in an extremely poor condition due to ongoing vandalism, and constitute a health risk, according to the technical report.

Other concerns include electrical reticulation that does not meet prescripts.

The DTPW advised the WCED on 25<sup>th</sup> of May 2016 that portions of the existing facilities are not safe for continued occupation and that extensive repairs were necessary before the entire facility can be safely occupied. The WCED then requested a quantity surveyor's report and structural engineer's report, in order for us to determine the way forward given this information. These reports are still being prepared.

In the interim and as a precautionary measure, the WCED arranged to accommodate these learners and staff at Ravensmead Secondary whilst learners wrote their mid-year examinations.

Staff, learners and parents agreed to the move, but then changed their minds, reportedly under the influence of Mr Tony Ehrenreich of COSATU who organised protests and threatened violence if the WCED proceeded with these plans. They insisted, despite our concerns remaining, in those portions of the school that “they” regarded as safe. This was against the recommendation of the WCED and the DTPW. Our primary concern is the interests and safety of the learners and once we have the necessary reports that have been now requested, these will guide the decisions that need to be taken as to how to move forward in a way which prioritises the education and safety of the learners and staff at the school.

But the fact remains that vandals have damaged the school relentlessly over the years, and continue to do so despite our best efforts, to the point that further investment in repairs and security on an ongoing basis is becoming increasingly futile, and may well soon be classified as fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

In the meantime I can say the biggest challenge, quite frankly, with this school is one name, Mr Tony Ehrenreich.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the MEC. MEC, the question that anybody will immediately ask you is, what did you do over the last five years for that school, and maybe you can tell us today, and

why did the condition deteriorate at that school to an extent that now they must go to another school that is really far away from them? So just help us. What did you do to stop this process and to get to a process where we stand today? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am very pleased you asked that question hon member Uys, because I could well ask your Mr Dugmore the same question when he was MEC, because he did absolutely nothing whatsoever. He did nothing whatsoever.

What we have done, as I have already said in my reply, is that we spent about R300 000 on measures to improve, and upgrade and secure the site, but the school has had the very same problems back then as it has today.

The current Government has invested hundreds of thousands of rand in security infrastructure over the past three years, which is hundreds of thousands rand more than you did when you were in government.

We have put up fences, barbed wire and security guards. And there were repairs to the roof in September 2014. We have also liaised with the SAPS who have undertaken to increase patrols at the school. Safe Schools and Operation Ceasefire have also worked with the school and the surrounding community dealing with gangsterism.

So we have actually done quite a bit, but given that it is a “plankie” school which ultimately has to be replaced, we actually are not going to spend millions and millions on it.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Botha, opvolgvraag?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha, a follow-up question?]

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to know from the Minister, in light of this, how many schools did the WCED replace since the DA has taken office? [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon member Botha. When we took over Government in 2009, it was quite apparent that there had been very little investment at all by the previous administration in the upgrading and maintenance of our schools.

We inherited a backlog of over 200 schools and between 2009 and 2014 the WCED replaced 28 schools, with new brick and mortar structures and over and above that, with the assistance with the Osidi Programme, we are set to have completed an additional 44 schools from 2014 to the end of this financial year.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister just one second. I see a hand. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I tend not to understand the question of hon member Botha, because for me it is a new question. It has got nothing to do with Uitsig.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It may be a new question, it may be related. I am not sure. The Minister is prepared to reply to the question. Minister, the ball is in your court, if you want to reply?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, thank you [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. I am busy replying and I am quite happy to do so thank you.

We have in fact then, in total, since 2009, replaced 72 schools and we still have quite a long way to go thanks to the backlog that we have inherited. You may well be interested to know that between 2004 and 2009, the ANC replaced how many? Three schools. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question?



Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

†Me M N GILLION: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, my vraag aan die agbare LUR is as volg. Ons het nou baie mooi gehoor van al die skole wat in die program was. Hoekom was Uitsig nooit deel daarvan nie? En dan wil ek ook van die LUR weet: die verduideliking rondom the ‘safety’ van die skool, en die verduideliking rondom die spandering op die veiligheid van die studente. Dit klink amper asof alle skole in ‘gang-related areas’ gesluit gaan word deur die LUR.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, my question to the hon MEC is as follows. We have now heard a lot about all the schools that have been in the programme. Why has Uitsig never been part of that? And then I also want to know from the MEC: the explanation around the safety of the school, and the explanation around the expenditure on the safety of the students. It almost sounds as if all schools in gang-related areas are going to be closed by the MEC.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. That is actually two

questions. Uitsig has in fact been on our plan. It has been on our replacement plan. It hasn't yet been done at this stage, but at this moment we are obviously every ... [Interjection.] Can I just answer your question? Would you like an answer or not?

Obviously every year we have to look at our list for replacement and maintenance and new schools, given ... [Interjection.] It is a very long list, and given the increases in learners that we have to accommodate every year, which this year was 25 000, we have to change our list, unfortunately, from time to time.

We revise it according to our needs, taking into account the utilisation levels of the schools, and given that Uitsig has 265 learners as opposed to other schools which have over a 1 000, we have to prioritise.

Mr P UYS: You are not answering.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Kivedo was the last person I saw.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Although we are zooming on Uitsig in terms of maintenance, I am asking a general maintenance question. Could the Minister please give this House an indication as to the amount of money being spent on maintenance of schools in the Western Cape annually? Please. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much. Yes, hon member Kivedo, thank you for that question. It is important in the context to see how many schools we have to maintain within a decreasing budget.

We started off in 2009 with R73 million a year. We have actually reprioritised our – sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. There is too much noise on this side.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We have actually changed our whole approach to maintenance and instead of being a defect based approach, we look at to see that our schools are maintained ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Shame on you!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... properly as far as we possibly can, so that it doesn't cost an inordinately larger amount by the time that it degenerates. This financial year we have actually allocated R425 million as opposed to what we had as R73 million in 2009. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. Was it a point of order?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes. I would like to understand Mr Deputy Speaker, how an MEC responds to a follow-up question and a new question, but reads it from the book that she has got in her hand? How do you know?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon Minister your time has expired. We have had the four questions. I cannot respond to that one. Hon member Olivier, the four questions have been exhausted already.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Can I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, I'm trying to listen to your member.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I address you on that one?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On what point?

Mr R T OLIVIER: On the four questions that you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may do that, yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, if one looks at the Order Paper and the question, it is around the issue of Uitsig. Now two of the questions were not related to Uitsig, and hence it does therefore limit us from asking the questions pertaining to the school. And I want us to look at this issue,

because we have still got questions relevant to the question. General questions are being asked to limit the four questions ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take the hon member's point. The Minister is at liberty to respond in a way that she wishes and she may respond to the regional question or to the responses which came – or the questions that were asked. But we have exhausted the four opportunities and we proceed to the next one. Order. Question 3 has been withdrawn. We go onto Question 4, hon member Magaxa to Minister Madikizela.

*Department of Human Settlements: capital budget*

**4. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether his Department (a) reprimanded and (b) intervened when the City of Cape Town's Human Settlements Department failed to spend its capital budget for two consecutive years; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. This question is not clear. Whether his Department reprimanded – can you listen Pierre? [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who is Pierre?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Whether his Department reprimanded and intervened when the City of Cape Town's Human Settlements Department failed to spend its capital budget for two consecutive years. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, I am reading the question so that I can respond to it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Unexesha lokwenzani kakade wena?

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What do you have to do with your time anyway?]

An HON MEMBER: Tell her, tell her!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What is confusing about his question is because the City has not failed to spend – by capital budget I assume you mean the Human Settlement Development Grant, because that is what the City accounts for to me. So for the record, the City has met its target on the Human Settlement Development Grant in the last financial year,

the target of 4 500 housing opportunities and on financials as well, so that is my response to this question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the City of Cape Town has not spent R430 million of its capital budget on human settlements, and I think the hon Minister is aware of that, and that is why the question asks whether his Department (a) reprimanded, or (b) intervened when the City of Cape Town's Human Settlements Department failed to spend that particular amount in two consecutive years.

If not, why? If – so what are the relevant details? I will ask, Mr Deputy Speaker, for the Minister to answer that particular question. Whether he has reprimanded the Department for failing to spend such a huge amount of money, which amounts to R430 million? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think the member must really go back and learn the different grants that are allocated to City and who accounts for those grants. Because that is where the problem is. He doesn't understand.

Now the City's allocation, from this Department to the City, is the Human

Settlements Development Grant. Now I assume that he is talking about the Urban Settlement Development Grant that comes directly from Treasury to the City. The City does not account to me for that grant, because that grant is the same as the Municipal Infrastructure Grant.

It was a combination of MIG and HSDG that formed USDG, which comes directly from Treasury to the City. The City does not account for it to me, so I do not intervene or reprimand the City for that particular grant.

So that is what needs to be understood here. The City accounts to me for the Human Settlements Development Grant, not this capital budget because the capital budget is the City's budget and it does not account to me for that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Carry on. Hon member Magaxa second question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask if the MEC, who is the MEC for Human Settlements, and the amount of R430 million has to do with Human Settlements. Is the MEC is not responsible for any money that is supposed to be spent on Human Settlements.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I told you what I am responsible for.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me explain again, because



the problem here is the lack of understanding from this side. I mean, not only the hon member that asked the question, the rumblings are a clear indication of how little these people know about different grants. Now ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I just explained here now that I administer Human Settlements Development Grant, HSDG. And the City spend that grant and met its target. The USDG – again, this question is not even specific, I am just doing them a favour by explaining this.

Now USDG, this grant comes directly from Treasury. It is administered in the same that MIG is administered. So you cannot then ask me whether I intervened and reprimanded the City. The City does not account to me for USDG. That must be understood.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I just want to find out, maybe let me put it directly. Regarding the money that was allocated to the City for the Human Settlements project, did the City use all that money or did they not use the money for the IDP projects that were in place? Because it seems to be, from my colleague, that there is no separation of the money that comes to the City. Specifically, where are

you responsible for the Human Settlements project? Is there any underspending from the City of Cape Town? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister? Order. Order. The hon Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. You know people talk about workshops. In fact, I think there are people in this House who are beyond workshops. I don't even think a workshop will help, if people really cannot get this through their skulls.

Just to respond to the Chairperson of the Standing Committee here. The response is clear. In terms of the grant that is administered by me, that the City accounts for to me, that grant was spent and the City met its target.

So, I think what needs to be done is that member must go back, educate himself on the different grants that are allocated to the City, and also educate himself as to who accounts for those grants. So, that is what the member needs to do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, your last opportunity.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to be specific. The Mayco member responsible for Human Settlements in the City of Cape Town acknowledged that they are struggling to spend the money, and he is saying

that he does not know about this now. That is what he said to me.

But I want him to workshop me on this issue, because he seems to be running a workshop here which I appreciate. I want him to confirm here that he is not responsible for any money spent by a Department, that happens to be under him, on Human Settlements. He is not responsible for any expenditure outside what he calls the conditional grant. Anything beyond that in the Department or in the City is none of his business. Can he say that here to me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. Thank you for that opportunity. Now, currently, before you build any houses, you need to put in infrastructure first.

I think it is very important for members to understand that for you to build a house, you actually use thirteen different grants from different departments: electricity from the Energy Department, water from the Water Department, MIG, that comes from Treasury, etc.

You use thirteen different grants to put a house together, a complete house. Now you have MIG, for example, which is the Municipal Infrastructure Grant that comes directly from Treasury to different municipalities.

Now in all the eight metros in South Africa, a decision was taken to augment

the MIG and establish what is currently known as the Urban Settlement Development Grant and the accountability still is with Treasury. So that money comes directly from Treasury to all the Metro's.

By the way, it is not only used for Human Settlements. That is what members need to understand. It can be used for other services like your ambulances, roads and transport. It deals with the infrastructure in Metros. So that is why that whole grant is administered by Treasury. It is directly allocated to Metro's by Treasury.

So, that is what I want this member to understand. The accountability in terms of this grant is exactly the same as MIG. The Human Settlements Department does not account for MIG. That is what you need to understand.

Now let me further explain it. It is like – hon member, because maybe you will understand this better - it is like you asking me about the grant that must supply water in order for me to build houses. It is like you are asking me why I do not reprimand the Department of Water for not spending its grant in order for me to be able to build a house. It is exactly the same thing. That is what I am trying to explain to you.

Even though some of that money is used to benefit Human Settlements, Human Settlements does not account for it in the Province. That money comes directly from Treasury. That is my response.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question. Question 6, hon member Mitchell to ask Minister Fritz. Hon Minister Fritz?

*Youth Development Programmes*

**6. Mr D G Mitchell asked the Minister of Social Development:**

- (1) Whether his Department, in conjunction with other stakeholders, has programmes for youth development in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether his Department is involved with youth development programmes offered by non-governmental organisations (NGO's) in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you and I want to say thank you to hon member Mitchell. Yes, the Department of Social Development is the lead Department in the implementation of the Provincial Youth Strategy and that is the 2013 strategy.

The Department has a vision that by the age 25, all young people of the province should be economically self-sufficient and independent, healthy with a positive family, personal and social relationships, and should be active in the community. And in order to implement the strategy, the Department partners with several NGO's whose programmes are aligned to the strategy.

It is important, Madam Speaker, to note however that the DSD is not the only department that has programmes that focus on young people. The draft audit of provincial youth targeted programmes shows that the Province invests in excess of R500 million annually on programmes that target young people. And I want to repeat, R500 million annually on programmes that target young people.

Therefore a critical element of the implementation strategy is to ensure that this investment has more effective returns in terms of developmental outcomes and impact. My Department is currently developing a draft set of quality standards that will ensure that all our youth targeted programmes are aligned to the provincial Youth Development Strategy, and that our investment has the maximum and necessary impact on the development trajectories of young people of the province. Because I think sometimes we just invest and I am sure the hon members would like to see returns on their investment.

The second part of the question: yes, the Department is involved with youth development programmes offered by non-governmental organisations. The Department through its transfer funding process, funds 25 non-governmental organisations for the provision of youth development programmes throughout the province.

These programmes include life skills, whatever that is, training, technical skills, and technical skills training - that I know what it is - job readiness,

training, mentoring and youth café services ... [Interjections.] opportunities. Ja, you *mos* know. †Julle het mos gehardloop met ‘life skills’ agter elke bossie. [Gelag.] Niemand weet wat dit is nie. [You have run with ‘life skills’ behind every bush. [Laughter.] No-one knows what it is.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Is there a follow-up hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you. Madam Speaker, can the Minister explain the impact ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Firstly, thank you to the Minister for the answer. I am very interested to know what impact this R500 million investment has had, and how many youth across this province have benefited from it?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think one of the important parts of the impact is where we have taken young people into any one of the programmes across the province, whether it is in Minister Bongi Madikizela’s programme, where he trains young people within human settlements, or Minister Winde, or within my own programme. But across the province there are huge pockets of development going out,

coming from youth.

There is, however, still a very big gap. And I want to speak about this gap. You know the fact that we still have rampant gangsterism on the Cape Flats speaks to the fact that the R500 million investment, we need to go review and we need to look at how to better review and use that so that we can create impact.

And also one of the specific issues of that really for me, for instance on Monday, I visited a particular area in Khayelitsha, where I visited six homes, and I found five young people who happened to be disabled. Now three of them were both physically and mentally severely disabled, and they are part of our Youth Development Strategy. And unfortunately it needed me as the Minister to go and detect them.

Now I will not apologise, and I want to say it in this House, and I want to have everyone as witnesses, that when I say and when we all say that we need to deliver services, we need to stop going to these one day big events, including DA events, let me make that clear. We will hold people responsible who work within this Government, to be at service delivery points, to go find those people who are disabled and not to sit in their places; so that we can give them a life they can value, and the freedom that they deserve. Not this nonsense that everyone goes everywhere and then no one cares about whether people deliver services.



So, you can have a hundred pickets in front of my office on the 14<sup>th</sup> of June - we will work together with the social workers who want to work with us, and youth development workers and community development workers, who want to deliver services to people where it is needed, and stop playing around with the lives of people and call it life skills. That is my point about life skills.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, is it a point of order hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Follow-up.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister will you take a question? Is it a follow-up question? Yes, sorry? I saw the hon member Mitchell, but you are allowed to pose a question. You may proceed hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. He is even allowing me to ask a question. I hear the hon Minister talking about the stakeholders, and we have been hearing for the past couple of years, how the NYD has cleaned its image, and even getting a clean audit but today in this province they are still not regarded as a stakeholder that the Department can work with.

I just want to check what would be the reasons, including the other stakeholders that are young people, self-initiated structures like the Metro Development Council, for the Minister not working with those that are genuine and youth based?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I think that is a brilliant question. I know Minister Bongi struggled a lot with this side, but I think that was a very good question. [Laughter.]

Let me really say from my side, because I am also the Minister. There are people who run operational issues. But just today - there are three days. Yesterday, today and tomorrow. They are having three days of intense workshops from the Youth Development Unit within the Department, having stakeholder meetings with everyone.

So I just want to say from my side, and I think hon member you know my *bona fides*, we speak to everyone. I have no issues with people. I don't look at the colour of the T-shirts that they wear. I speak where we can make a difference to the lives of people, and specifically young people and specifically the most vulnerable, like those young people who are disabled.

I think we need to speak to everyone, we must stop playing games. I haven't got time to play games. There is too big a need. [Interjection.] No, I do not come from your school, I do not play games.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Sorry hon member Magaxa, hon member Mitchell had a follow-up and then I will see you.

Mr D M MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to find out, the Minister in his first response alluded to the Provincial Youth Strategy that they are busy drafting, the quality standard. By when will those standards be completed?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is also a very important question.

An HON MEMBER: As usual.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: As usual. In our Department there are norms, the creation, which together with the National Department - just for the record hon members, I have no issue with the National Minister. I think highly of the National Minister.

So, whatever the *Cape Times* reports and the rubbish that Aneez Salie writes, it has got nothing to do with me. He can write his things and he can have his own inventions. According to me, I have a very good relationship with the National Minister.

So, I will work on every level and in every field where we can make a greater impact with everyone. Those norms and standards - and remember the Court in the latest case that we just won, asked that those norms and standards first be developed by National and then it comes to us, and then we do it and implement it. And it is a great, great honour to be of service to young

people.

But let us get all our people on the train, so that all our staff here who want to play political games here in this building that I work in, let them come and stop playing games hon member Mitchell. I am asking, I am not accusing – I am asking: do not entertain them, because we have young people who are unemployed and we want to make a life and a difference for them.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the hon member Magaxa. Last follow-up.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. I just want to check with the Minister in the light of all that you have said here rhetorically. How do you reconcile the instructions you have given to the Social Service Department not to forward the reports pertaining to children that are victims of the evictions on farms?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You have given those instructions.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Oh you know more than me about instructions.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, you publicly ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member, you know more

... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Please hon members, address the Chair.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Madam Speaker, the hon member [Interjections.] I am not fighting him! I am just asking – you know I don't have a fight with anyone.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: If the hon member says so, I think I must – this is part of the misinformation that is being spread about the Department.

Mr P UYS: Don't tell us.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I don't even have a clue what he is talking about, me giving some instruction. What I can tell him, if he refers to the *Cape Times* article, because then you have misread the article completely. Let me just quickly say - and I don't think it is that, but what I basically said, and I copied in the Regional person, the supervisor for Beaufort West. I copied her in. So it is not someone leaking it, I copied her in on it, to make it transparent. And you know what I said hon members? I said please, social workers and developmental workers, community development practitioners, please make sure that you are at the service

delivery points.

So when a child gets raped in Beaufort West on the other side of town that there are services for that child. Then they are not all at a party and with the Minister at some place. And stop fighting with the Minister. The Minister did not even know that people wrote directly to some junior officials. She did not even know that.

So I just want to make the point. I think there is misinformation. I do not know of anything where I gave an instruction that we shouldn't – but please ask me hon Leader of the Opposition, ask me, because I can answer you. Do not listen to [Inaudible.] Hon member Tyatyam, I do not want to comment but please ask me if people want to have some clarity on anything.

The SPEAKER: That's it. We move to the final question. Are we still okay with time to the Table? The final question is from hon member Wenger to Minister Plato. I see the Hon Minister.

*Manenberg Police Station: shortage of detectives*

**7. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether he is aware that there is a shortage of detectives at the Manenberg Police Station; if so, when will the station receive detectives to fill these vacancies?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you and also to the member for the question. Yes, I am well aware of the fact that there is a shortage of detectives at the Manenberg Police Station, as well as many other police stations across the province. I have said before, in a statement, that 85% of our police stations in the Western Cape are under resourced and that what counts for Manenberg, counts also for many other police stations in the province.

The shortage of manpower at police stations is a major problem, a major issue and it really hampers police visibility, specifically in our crime-ridden areas, in our gangster-stricken areas and drug-stricken areas. SAPS informed me that they are in the process of placing members from visible policing to the detective service, based on suitability for investigative functions.

We further hope that the men and women that are currently busy with their training will be placed at various police stations soon, to alleviate the plight of manpower shortages. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. Madam Speaker. My first question is: is the Minister not concerned that the police are moving visible police officers to serve as detectives in Manenberg, considering that in 2010 there were 137 visible police officers at Manenberg and now, six years later, there only 98 visible police officers for Manenberg, which means there's been a large

decrease in visible officers for Manenberg, yet those are still going to be further removed to act as detectives?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, it is a concern, yes, I agree with the hon member. I think SAPS can only do with the manpower they presently have. I am well aware of the manpower before at the police station, versus what is now at that station. There are various reasons for the shortages. Men retired, men took packages and things like that, and that made an impact on the shortages across the board. But as I have said, they can only do with what they have currently, that is why we put a lot of emphasis on the men and women busy with their training, to fill those shortages. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Wenger and the member Gillion, and then hon member Lekker, in that order.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Given that the norm for police to docket ratio, is already at a high 1:40 – one detective to forty dockets, while at Manenberg, because they have such a dire detective shortage, its 1:170, which makes their workload almost impossible. When will Manenberg receive additional detectives, so that they can have a manageable case load?

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister.



The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, as I have said a minute ago, that it is a major concern. I did address the shortage issues with the Provincial Police Commissioner already. He finds himself in a catch 22 situation. He can only do with what he has currently got. He is well aware of the fact, and as I have said it is not evident in Manenberg alone. It is evident in Athlone, in Elsies River. All over we find a dramatic shortage of manpower, but we do address the issue. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Gillion. Will you forego? I see the hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I am appalled and I think I must raise my disappointment with hon member Wenger. It is disingenuous and manipulative of her conduct to ask such questions when she got the responses when we had our oversight visit in Manenberg.

The same questions that she is raising, were raised by her specifically. I do not understand ...[Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: Point of order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...why she is raising ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, please take your seat. I have got two members on a point of order. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Rules are very clear.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, can the member please sit.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat hon member Lekker.

Mr M G E WILEY: The process during question time is that a question is posed to the Minister, not to the previous questioner. That is the first thing, and secondly it is a question that is posed, not a statement.

The SPEAKER: Order, thank you. Hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to raise a point of order ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Ms M M WENGER: As a member of this House ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please, hon member Lekker. When member Wenger is done, you can raise your point of order. Okay. Will you all sit down!

Ms M M WENGER: I am raising a point of order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member, no.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, I have hon member Wenger on the floor and then you will have a turn to raise your point of order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, that was an introduction that I was making.

The SPEAKER: Just hold on. Minister Meyer, remain calm. Hon member Lekker, please take your seat. I will allow hon member Wenger to raise the point of order, after which hon member Lekker will have an opportunity. May we proceed please?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As a member of this House, I am entitled to pose questions to the Minister, particularly questions that I have asked in my name, and I have a follow-up ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Point of order!

The SPEAKER: Order, order please.

Ms M M WENGER: I would like to raise a point of order against the member who is preventing me from performing my oversight function. Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is not a point of order!

The SPEAKER: Your concern, your point of order is noted. Hon member Lekker, you have a point of order?

Ms P Z LEKKER: I did not have a point of order. I was going to ask a question, but then I started with an introduction.

The SPEAKER: Okay, well then if you can hold on. Thank you. Hon Member?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Hold on, please. Just hold on. We have had three questions hon members. †Minister Meyer, wees kalm asseblief. [Minister Meyer, be calm please.] There is one supplementary question that can still be posed, and that is by hon member Lekker, because hon member Gillion forewent her question for hon member Lekker, so you may proceed hon member Lekker.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, may I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, for a MEC, the conduct of the Minister is really unacceptable and I think there is only one Speaker in this House, and it is not the first time that MEC Meyer is coming out with this kind of conduct. I am asking you Madam Speaker to please reprimand the MEC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Meyer, you are the Minister and I am the Speaker. Shall we proceed in that manner if that is appropriate with you? Hon member Lekker, you may pose the final supplementary question to Minister Plato.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. My question to Minister Plato is: when are the students that are currently at college going to be placed with the detective division of Manenberg SAPS?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, that is a brand new question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Minister you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker  
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, sorry, a question was posed, allow the

Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do not have the answer to that question, thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes Questions. Order, hon member Davids, a point of order?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, take your seat.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Is it parliamentary for a MEC to say to another member: you are a fool, the fool. Is it parliamentary? MEC Plato just said it to hon member ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am sorry, I never heard that, but if it is – okay. Hon Minister Plato, may I address you? Did you indeed utter those words?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, my response was in relation to her rude response to me.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: If she gives it, she must not cry

if she gets it back. If she wants me to be polite, she is also an hon member and she must learn to be polite as well.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hold on, can you all just take your seats very quickly, please. I just want to address – please take your seats. Hon members, I am not privy to these little debates that happen across the floor. Normally one side initiates it and I if I am lucky I see a response and then often I am deemed biased because I am only dealing with the respondent.

In this instance, according to Minister Plato, there was an exchange of words and I cannot say that I know what was exchanged but hon Minister if you said something unparliamentary I would like to ask you to withdraw that please. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Withdraw please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: If my expression was unparliamentary I duly withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. May we now proceed to statements in the House. Hon members, please play nicely. It is our last day we are about thirty minutes away from going off on the election break so let us compose ourselves. We are now going to deal with statements and statements are two minutes per member. Two minutes for statements. I see the DA. I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

## STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Dankie agb Speaker, ons weet nou die ANC is in 'n krisis, nie net in die Wes-Kaap nie maar ook in die hele land. In Hessequa het ses prominente ANC-lede na die DA toe oorgeloop en sowat 500 ANC-lede het alreeds na die DA toe oorgeloop, maar wat die ANC doen is hulle beloon mense wat met hulle verskil met pangas en sommige word ook gedood [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is baie duidelik dat die halfvol stadions van die President en mnr Cyril Ramaphosa nie kan keer dat die mense wegstap wanneer hulle toesprake maak nie. In die ANC word die mense hardhandig hanteer en agb Fransman en agb Prins dink dat hulle saam met die President bo die wet verhewe is. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ons wil vra, wie gaan laaste lag? Die een wat laaste gaan lag is nie die President nie. Vroue van die ANC-assosiasie besit luukse motors, 9 miljoen rand en meer, terwyl ons land 'n rommelstatus nader. Ons weet dat onder ons Minister van Finansies se leierskap het die munisipaliteite se ongekwalifiseerde oudits verbeter, en daarvan is ons bewus. Agbare Speaker, of die ANC dit wil weet of nie, waar die DA regeer, doen ons dit met minder hulpbronne en fondse en ons sal die fondse aanwend in die Wes-Kaap vir al die mense waar die DA regeer. Ek dank u.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker, we now know that the ANC is in a crisis, not only in the Western Cape but also in the rest of the country. In



Hessequa six prominent ANC members have joined the DA and about 500 ANC members have already joined the DA, but what the ANC does, is they reward people who differ from them with pangas, and some are also killed. [Interjections.] It is quite clear that the half-full stadiums of the President and Mr Cyril Ramaphosa cannot prevent the people from leaving when they make their speeches. In the ANC people are treated roughly and the hon Fransman and hon Prins think that along with the President they are above the law. [Interjections.] We would like to ask, who will have the last laugh? The one who will have the last laugh is not the President.

Women of the ANC association own luxury motor cars, R9 million and more, while our country is getting nearer to junk status. We know that under the leadership of our Minister of Finance the municipalities' unqualified audits have improved and of that we are well aware. Madam Speaker, whether the ANC wants to know it or not, where the DA governs we do it with less resources and funds and we will utilise the funds in the Western Cape for all the people where the DA is in government. I thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. On June 16, 1976 a great revolution erupted and was led by school-going young people of South Africa. In this month of June we remember their courage. All they had was each other, however they were met with batons and beaten up, detained, shot and killed by security police and the army.

On the 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the 16 June 1976 student uprising, the youth of today must continue with vigour and follow the legacy of the martyrs of our revolution.

The student struggle in the institutions of higher learning must in the first instance recognise the gains achieved under the democratically elected Government since 1994. Secondly, they must raise their bread and butter issues and engage the authorities in a constructive and coordinated manner.

The destruction and burning of public property must be condemned in the strongest terms, at all times. It has no place in our young democratic noble country.

The ANC-led Government has made strides in improving quality of education and access to higher education. The introduction of no fee schools and funding through NSAFAS are but some of the initiatives to improve education in our country.

In addition, the National Youth Development Agency is one of the vehicles that have been created to bring young people into the economic mainstream. The NYDA must continue to bring youth skills development and build more entrepreneurs to create more jobs.

We continue to find youth in townships like Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain destitute and without employment. Many of them are frustrated and turn to

alcohol, drugs and substances abuse including criminal activities, yet Premier Zille and Mayor De Lille say it is well in the City of Cape Town.

Young people want their own youth organisations like the Metro Youth Development Council. This is one of the youth structures that are not recognised in the province ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, your time has expired.

Ms P MAKELENI: Youth are forced to accept the Youth Cafés. In conclusion, in the ANC we have more young men and women standing in line to take South Africa forward.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Ms P MAKELENI: The Youth of South Africa will keep the legacy of June 16 and the legacy of the father of our nation, Nelson Mandela, alive. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: The DA, hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, during the last week the Standing Committee on Community Development heard with horror from SASSA and the Department of Social Development. I sat there amazed at the level of corruption that is plaguing what is supposed to be a vehicle for social assistance for the most vulnerable in our society. But I remembered that

SASSA is a national run entity and would be no different from other state-run entities under the stewardship, or rather lack thereof, of the ANC.

Corruption in South continues to take away from the most vulnerable in our communities and no matter how hard we try, there are those that are just hell bent on looting from the public purse. Then again it should not surprise us because the honourable No 1 is facing 786 charges for corruption amongst other things and yet he continues to receive support from his minions in spite of the clear violation of the Constitution. If corruption goes all the way to the top, I should not be surprised that SASSA, PRASA, SA Post Office, SAA, Eskom, SABC and other state-run entities are all in this mess.

†Agb Speaker, korrupsie sal altyd wen as goeie mense niks daaraan doen nie.

[Madam Speaker, corruption will always be the winner if good people do nothing about it.]

I urge the people of South Africa to vote for change where we don't govern and make sure we continue making progress where we govern. Corruption will bring this country to its knees if it continues unchecked, and we certainly can't trust the ANC to do that for us. †Ek dank u. [I thank you.]

The SPEAKER: In the absence of the EFF, I see the DA. [Inaudible.]

Unfortunately I follow a speaker's list for Statements. It would have been the EFF and then the DA. Unfortunately you have to wait your turn because there is a speakers list. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, today we gather here for the last time before the local government elections are held on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of August 2016. As the Democratic Alliance we present to the communities of the Western Cape that they must exercise their choice but before they exercise their choice they must take a clue from what the Auditor-General is saying, so that when they exercise their right to choose they have a guarantee that their choice is going to yield dividends.

It is evident that the DA delivers to the people and spends money where it should be and does not loot funds meant for the most vulnerable in our society. The members of Opposition in the House put up many pamphlets but what they don't tell the people is that the majority of those pamphlets that they raised are under the leadership of ward councillors belonging to the ANC. [Interjections.] The question you have to ask is when the filth piles up what is the responsibility of the councillors?

The communities of the Western Cape, the voters, must therefore make up their minds to see whether what has been raised is what they want to continue seeing in their areas or that they must vote the ANC councillors out so that their areas are cleaned up.

Time and time again the people of the Western Cape have trusted us to lead them, and time and time again we have not disappointed them. This has been confirmed by independent and high profile former ANC members like Terence Nombembe. He agreed with what is being said about the Western

Cape Government. This was also confirmed by former SARS Commissioner, Pravin Gordhan, that the Western Cape Government spends their money adequately and sufficiently. This in stark contrast to those that choose to vote for the ANC in other provinces.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Hinana, your time has expired.

Mr N E HINANA: The recent audit reports on the performance of municipalities once again confirm this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, the passing of the Expropriation Bill by the National Assembly was an important milestone in the on-going process of transforming South Africa into a united, non-racial, democratic, non-sexist and prosperous country - a country without inequality and poverty. It represents another milestone in the implementation of the Constitution of our Republic as adopted by the duly elected representatives of the people.

Our Constitution requires legislation that will guide the expropriation of property in a manner consistent with its provisions. It is indeed a sad day when the internal divisions within the Democratic Alliance have resulted in a rear-guard attempt to sabotage the operation and implementation of the Expropriation Bill.

We have a situation where on the one side are those members of the DA, as few as they may be, who understand and support the need for equity and redress and on the other side you have those, who constitute the majority within the DA, who are there to block redress and land redistribution to protect essentially white privilege.

In our province we have seen the liberal caucus, led by the Premier, Helen Zille and supported by former National Party members, who are land owners themselves, blocking this progress. Then you have members on the other side of the House, in the Standing Committee, such as members Max, Hinana and Mngqasela, who clearly want to support this Bill but are being whipped into line to place obstacles in the way of progress. The DA will go down in history as a fighter for privilege. The DA will go down in history as a fighter against the landless and the poor. The DA will go down as a manipulator of the poor, who uses these people for votes only and then forgets them after elections. And that is why the DA is a party in decline, a party which offers no hope to the majority of our people. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, your time has expired. Thank you. Your two minutes is up. I see the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, today I stand here before this House to mourn the passing of not only a great athlete, activist and the world's greatest sports personality but because we have lost a man that we can and all should have learned from. Even in death he will continue to teach us life

lessons.

A man who when faced with adversity stood firm for what he believed in. This was a champion both in the ring as well as outside the ring. Muhammad Ali was a human rights activist and despite losing everything at some stage, he would not let that affect his dream of becoming a success.

I say we can and should learn from him because many of us crumble at the sight of trouble and the sight of adversity in our lives, some have sold themselves for riches and positions instead of standing up for what is right and for the people, as did Ali and his friend, the late former President and a lover of boxing himself, Nelson Mandela.

Madam Speaker, I wish to extend and acknowledge the legacy of a mega-sport star, like no other and Muhammad Ali left us with pearls of wisdom like the following:

“He who is not courageous enough to take risks will accomplish nothing in life.”

And one of my personal favourites:

“It isn't the mountains ahead to climb that wear you out; it's the pebble in your shoe.”



May his life's legacy, like that of his dear friend and former boxing lover, the late Nelson Mandela, continue to inspire all of us to be all we can in service of mankind. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, let us not cast aspersions please. I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the ACDP urges the Minister, Albert Fritz, to intervene at the Libertas Home in Somerset West. It was reported yesterday in the media that pensioners living at the Libertas Home in Somerset West may end up in the streets because they were served with a termination lease by the Helderberg Society for the Aged.

Many of the pensioners are worried because they simply cannot afford rental places in the neighbouring retirement villages. It even saddens me further when one of the pensioners, a 77-year-old man, had a heart attack two days after that. He says the whole event is what he thinks of when he wakes up and it is the last thing that he thinks about when he goes to bed.

Many of the elderly simply need stability, independence and a place to die in peace. It is with outright shame that the people of Libertas Home cannot even have these basic rights. The ACDP feels that the elderly of Libertas should not be evicted unless they are provided alternative accommodation that they can afford. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. †Gedrag in hierdie Huis word gereguleer in ons Reëls en is op almal van toepassing en derhalwe is dit geheel onaanvaarbaar dat die agbare DA-hoofswep, wat veronderstel is om te lei deur voorbeeld, hierdie einste Reëls male sonder tal net verontagsaam.

Dit is natuurlik sy goeie reg om by die enige Staande Komitee in te loer en insette te lewer maar dit is nie sy reg om die spesifieke reëls wat op 'n Staande Komitee van toepassing is, na hartelus net opsy te stoot om sy eie agenda te dryf – soos om by Skoor te wil weet hoeveel amptenare aan 'n unie behoort.

Dit is ook algemene kennis dat wanneer bogenoemde lid by 'n komitee instap, daar 'n lyn of 'n spesifieke kookusbesluit is wat hy wil kom afdwing of 'n spesifieke LUR wil beskerm.

Ons in Skoor is deur hierdie einste Hoofswep herhaalde kere verkeerd ingelig oor die vertolking van wat Skoor se spesifieke pligte is, maar die DA Hoofswep verontagsaam die einste Reëls wat ons ander veronderstel is om te eerbiedig – op 'n gereelde grondslag.

Male sonder tal sal hierde einste agbare lid selfs hier in die Huis op en af spring om die Speaker se werk oor te neem. Sy optrede hier versterk net die

openbare persepsie dat die DA bloot deur haat, deur nyd, vir persoonlike vooroordele en vervolgingswaan aangedryf word.

Dis hoog tyd dat die DA iemand aanstel in daardie pos wat sy eie lede sal respekteer en die respek van hierdie Huis sal afdwing – wat spanbou sal bevorder en persoonlike vetes as 'n onding sal verklaar. [Applous.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Behaviour in this House is regulated by our Rules and applies to everyone and therefore it is totally unacceptable that the hon DA Chief Whip, who is supposed to lead through example, ignores these very Rules time and again.

It is of course his good privilege to appear in any Standing Committee and give input, but it is not his privilege to brush aside the specific rules applicable to a Standing Committee as he pleases to drive his own agenda – like asking SCOPA how many officials belong to a union.

It is also common knowledge that when the said member walks into a committee meeting, there is a specific line or caucus decision that he wants to enforce or wants to protect a specific MEC.

We in SCOPA have been repeatedly informed incorrectly by this very Chief Whip on the interpretation of SCOPA's specific duties, but the DA Chief Whip ignores the very Rules that the rest of us are obliged to honour – on a

regular basis.

Time and again this very hon member will jump up and down even in this House to take over the duty of the Speaker. His behaviour here only strengthens the public perception that the DA is merely driven by hate, spite, for personal prejudice and delusions of persecution.

It is high time that the DA appoints someone in that position who will respect his own members and gain the respect of this House – who will promote team building and declare personal vendettas as abominable. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. On the 3<sup>rd</sup> of August we will again see democracy at play. When analysing election results, it is evident that there is a paradigm shift where voters break ranks with a certain political party that deviates from their founding principles.

This is also the opportune time for the voting population to exercise their democratic rights for better and improved services. The political party of choice in the Western Cape is the DA. The DA does not rule by intimidation – †en ons regeer ook nie ons munisipaliteite asof dit ons eie skatkiste is nie. - [and we also do not govern our municipalities as if it is our own treasure chests.]

The growing internal conflict within the ANC proves yet again that they cannot be trusted to govern anywhere in this province. They are too busy fighting amongst themselves for positions and power instead of fighting for the people they claim to represent. And when the ANC has power, like in other provinces and the few municipalities here in the Western Cape, they don't know what to do with that power. It is only the DA that uses ballot-box power as a mandate to improve lives.

We are a party committed to creating equal opportunities for all to taste the fruits of our hard fought democracy. We are a party committed to tackling the social ills facing the people of this province.

In the DA we pride ourselves on bringing change to places that continue to suffer under ANC leadership – and we pride ourselves on bringing continued progress to places we govern.

Madam Speaker, in boxing, when your opponent stumbles, you must punch hard, very hard. I want to encourage my DA colleagues in this House and all over South Africa, the ANC is stumbling. Go out and canvass damn hard and remind voters of their constitutional heritage. We will see you in the streets. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. Order please. That is the end of member's statements. Hon members, we now move to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Mitchell and after hon

member Mitchell, hon member Gopie.

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates Youth Development in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Ms Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the horrendous state of health care facilities in the Western Cape under the DA and the low levels of satisfaction experienced by patients.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Ms Lekker?

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi, Sekela Somlomo.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.]

I give notice that I shall move:

That the House joins the NPA, Western Cape High Court, and Development Community in condemning DA Premier Zille's deceptive claims that the gang conviction rate in Mitchells Plain magistrate's court is a mere 0.7% and calls on the Premier to correct the figures and desist from using baseless claims to score cheap political points as that brings embarrassment to this House and Province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Are there any further? Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the high incidence of corporal punishment in Western Cape Schools; and why the WCED ignored the social audit findings by the Equal Education.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: What findings?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there any further? Hon

member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the unacceptable high number of bucket toilets still used in Western Cape, despite the enormous resources we have in this province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there any further? Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House institutes an investigation into whether the conduct of the DA-run, Cape Town appointed, so-called Straatwerk Ministry Project, is legal after allegations have surfaced that employees are not formally employed and that they are treated like slaves.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there any further? For the last time, nothing more? Then we proceed to motions without notice. I see the hon member Max first.



**MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works and Mish-Al Booley, Keegan de Waal and Taufeeq Khan, who have progressed from being candidate engineers to becoming professional registered civil engineers who are managing a number of road infrastructure projects. They received the necessary training, support and on-the-job experience for professional registration from the Department's Professional Development Programme - PDP. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Makeleni first.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness that the greatest boxer of all time and anti-racism activist, Muhammad Ali, is no more; that he also suffered from respiratory illness; that Ali passed away on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of June 2016 at the age of 74 and calls on the House to salute this global icon and conveys condolences to his family, friends and fans.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Lentit first.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the Muslim community of the Western Cape and all over South Africa, a spiritually fulfilling and blessed month of Ramadan.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Hinana first.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House:-

- (a) congratulates and extends its gratitude and appreciation to the Public Protector, Thulisile Nomkhosi Madonsela, affectionately

known as Thuli Madonsela, whose term of office comes to an end in September;

- (b) acknowledges the manner in which she executed her duties without fear and favour or prejudice towards South Africa and its people; and
- (c) thanks her for the services which she rendered and wishes her well in her future endeavours.

I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 26 June 2016 marks the 61<sup>st</sup> anniversary of the Freedom Charter and further calls upon our Government, NGOs and other community formations to devote time to courageously fight for achievement of values espoused in the Freedom Charter.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon

member Mackenzie?

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die volgende vier leerders van die Laerskool De Villiers Graaff op Villiersdorp gelukwens met hul opname in die Noord-Boland Atletiekspan: Petri Lottering, Pierre Mostert, Kayleen Muggels en Jamie-Lee Franse.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb lid Joseph eerste.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following four learners of the De Villiers Graaff Primary School in Villiersdorp on their selection for the North Boland Athletics team: Petri Lottering, Pierre Mostert, Kayleen Muggels and Jamie-Lee Franse.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Joseph first.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die 74-jarige Penny Ackerman gelukwens dat sy haar bestuurderslisensie vir die eerste keer gekry het. Sy het tot die gevolgtrekking gekom dat sy vir baie jare bestuur het sonder 'n lisensie, dat dit nie wettig was nie en sy nie verder meer deel wou wees van 'n korrupte stelsel nie en het dus die moeite gedoen om haar bestuurderslisensie te kry. Ons wens haar geluk.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb lid Gillion?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 74-year old Penny Ackerman who has

received her driver's licence for the first time. She came to the conclusion that she has driven for many years without a licence, that it was unlawful and that she did not want to be part of a corrupt system any longer and therefore made an effort to get her driver's licence. We congratulate her.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gillion?]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges and welcomes the intervention by Home Affairs Minister, Malusi Gigaba, after his meeting with the LGBTI communities, and calls on officials who deliberately frustrate the process of registering affairs of these communities to account, especially when it comes to their marriages.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the eight South Pensinsula High School pupils who jetted off to New Jersey, USA yesterday, to attend the Global Classroom Partnership 20<sup>th</sup> International Conference promoting global awareness by extending learning and teaching across borders and the list follows: Amy Schippers, Jody Jane, Keshia Linnett, Nikita van der Vendt, Ashley Jacobs, Dominique de Villiers, Caleb Wolf, Thaakirah Mosavel and Megan Hanslow.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa first and then the hon member Christians.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay reports that Syferfontein residents in DA-run George must share a bucket toilet between ten households and four taps for 86 households on average; notes that this further affirms the StatsSA report that the use of bucket toilets was worst in the Western Cape, and calls on the national Department of Water and Sanitation to intervene to assist these neglected people.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? Is there an objection? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House, in the light of us celebrating forty years since the Soweto uprising, congratulates the youth, Lineque Paulse. Paulse is the youngest of six children in Railton, Swellendam. She describes many challenges that she faces as a teenager with teenage pregnancies but instead of all of that she has decided to study to become a medical doctor and wants her life to be an example to the community and also the family. She wishes to bring about change in the community. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mitchell?

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:



Dat die Huis medelye oordra aan die gesin, familie en vriende van die jongman, Jason Canterbury, wat op 7 Junie voor die hof in Bishop Lavis doodgeskiet is.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb lid Makeleni?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of the young man, Jason Canterbury, who was shot dead on 7 June in front of the court in Bishop Lavis.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Makeleni?]

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House:

- (a) noting with sadness the sudden death of the legendary actor, director and playwright, Nyembezi “Tears” Kunene who died peacefully late on Saturday evening, 4 June 2016, at the age of 74, following a long battle with diabetes;
- (b) that he is renowned for his work on the popular comedy series *Umzini WeZinsizwa*, as Mcunu, the senior hostel security guard and;
- (c) that he also played fan-favourite, Jabulani Dlomo, the uncle of of Sibusiso Menzi Ngubane on the SABC1 soapie *Generations* between 2007 and 2009;

therefore calls on the House to convey its sincerest condolences to his family, friends and fans.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. First the hon member Botha and then I will come to hon member Olivier.

†Me L J BOTHA: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis *Son* se senior ster-hofverslaggewer, Tanya Menges,

gelukwens met haar aanwysing as die Deon du Plessis poniekoerant-joernalis van die Jaar op Vrydagaand by die Media24 Nuuslegendes Toekennings.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb lid Olivier?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Me L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the *Son* senior star court reporter, Tanya Menges, on receiving the Deon du Plessis Tabloid Journalist of the Year award on Friday night at the Media24 News Legends Awards.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Olivier?]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the growing support and calls from the public for the reinstatement of South Peninsula High School principal, Brian Isaacs, and calls on the Western Cape Education Department to bring back their principal. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Ms Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the renowned cartoonist, Jonathan Zapiro, better known as 'Zapiro', for being voted Number 2 on the Top 10 cartoonists list in the world by online lifestyle magazine *Top Ten*.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa and then I will get to hon member Kivedo.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the decisive clarity provided by the Statistician General to the lies peddled by the DA that methods and standards used to measure sanitation in the recent General Household Survey are out-dated; and encourages the DA to accept the fact and reality that the use of bucket toilets has increased in this province under their watchful eye.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Kivedo?

†Me L J BOTHA: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis René Wolmarans, 'n matriekleerder van die Hoërskool Outeniqua gelukwens as Nedbank en die Wes-Kaapse Regering se opstelkompetisiewenner wat gefokus het op die positiewe effek van alternatiewe energiebronne op ekonomiese ontwikkeling in Suid Afrika.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb lid Tyatyam?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates René Wolmarans, a matric learner of the Outeniqua High School, as the Nedbank and the Western Cape Government winner of the essay competition which focused on the positive effect of alternative energy sources on economic development in South Africa.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that software companies Zailab and the Zoe Incubation Centre have partnered to establish a state of the art Call Centre in Eindhoven, Delft to train and employ hundreds of people, young people, in particular, from the area and surrounding communities in efforts to create more jobs for young people, and commends the two companies for this initiative that will contribute towards the upliftment of young people.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Corin de Waal van die Hoërskool Dirkie Uys gelukwens met haar insluiting in die onder-17 skoletennisspan wat vandeemaand in Engeland gaan deelneem. Corin was ook vanjaar die naaswenner in die dubbelspel-eindronde in die NWU-Pukke ITF-tennistoernooi op Potchefstroom en die wenner in die onder-16 dubbelspan in die SA Junior Nasionale Tennistoernooi in Bloemfontein.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Hon member Dugmore?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Corin de Waal of the Dirkie Uys High School on her inclusion in the under-17 tennis team that will participate in England this month. This year Corin was also the runner-up in the doubles final in the NWU-Pukke ITF tennis tournament in Potchefstroom and the winner in the under-16 doubles in the SA Junior National tennis tournament in Bloemfontein.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sympathises with Sizeka Mbandezeli (23), who had a stillbirth at the Karl Bremer Hospital, and notes that she blames the negligent and uncaring attitude of nurses in the City's Delft Day Hospital who turned her away when she first went there, and therefore calls on the MEC to investigate these serious allegations.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon



member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes there is consensus among domestic workers in Sea Point that the Tafelberg School site be used to champion a new model of low cost housing; notes further that this is an opportunity to undo the legacy of segregation which is still evident in the province and commends the workers for their activism.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Kivedo?

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Primêre Skool AME en Hoërskool Monument Park beide in Kraaifontein gelukwens met hul ATKV-handevatprojek waarvoor elke skool R30 000 gekry het om in die gemeenskap te ploeg. Daar is 'n traumahoekie by AME ingerig waar kinders wat trauma ervaar het 'n paar uur van die harde houe van die lewe kan wegkruip. Alhoewel Monument Park nie die rykste skool is nie het hulle met

hierdie projek bewys wat gedoen kan word wanneer jy in 'n gemeenskap saamwerk om 'n skool beter te maak.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Hon member Olivier?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the AME Primary School and Monument Park High School, both in Kraaifontein, on their ATKV support project for which each school received R30 000 to plough into the community. A trauma corner was established at AME where children who have experienced trauma can hide from the tough lashes of life for a few hours. Although Monument Park is not the richest school they have shown with this project what can be achieved when you cooperate in a community to improve a school.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion without notice? Any

objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Olivier?]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the R4,7 million donation by Oasis Investment Services to the Department of Basic Education for the advancement of teacher and caregiver skills and for the upgrading of facilities around the Cape Flats, and lauds the organisation for this good gesture. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Ilhaam Groenewald and Monde Tabata who were recently elected as board members of the South African Rugby Union and believes that this is a step in the right direction towards transformation in rugby after the ANC Youth League in the province called for it; commends the SARU Executive for heeding the transformation demands and wishes both success in their new roles.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Joseph?

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die rolprentmaker, Wim Steytler, gelukwens met die aanwysing as een van vyf jong rolprentmakers uit Afrika wie se draaiboek *Uitlander* danksy inisiatief verder ontwikkel gaan word. Hy is in 2014 by die Cannes Lions in Frankryk met 'n Jong Regisseursprys, silwer, vereer. Steytler is die kleinseun van die skrywer en dramaturg Ria de Klerk en 'n boorling van die plaas Diemersfontein te Wellington. Ek stel so voor.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Agb Gopie eerste en dan kom ek terug.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the film maker, Wim Steytler, on his nomination as one of the five young film makers from Africa whose script *Uitlander* will be further developed through initiative. In 2014 he was honoured at the Cannes Lions in France with a Young Director's prize, silver. Steytler is the grandson of the writer and playwright Ria de Klerk and was born on the farm Diemersfontein in Wellington. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion without notice? Any objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gopie first and then I will come back.]

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the General Household Survey findings that the level of satisfaction with health care facilities at only 45,5% in the province was the lowest in the country compared to other provinces; condemns the DA for allowing the decline of our public health care and calls for an urgent intervention from National Government. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. †Ek sien die agb lid Kivedo. [I see the hon member Kivedo.]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die volgende 19 atlete van die Hoërskool Brackenfell wat WP-kleure verwerf het vir verskillende atletieksoorte gelukwens en die lys is soos volg:

Elitha Sylvester (hekkies), Nadine Liebenberg (hekkies), Kylin Mouton (800 m), Inge-Lynne Jordan (400 m), Alichia Arries (100 m/200 m), Tyrique Adams (200 m/400 m), Inge Liebenberg (gewigstoot/diskus), Rozanne Liebenberg (spiesgooi), Michelle Steyn (hekkies), Waylin Booyesen (verspring/hekkies), Waden Bonze (driesprong), Mareliza Rabe (hoogspring), Johanette Duminy (gewigstoot/hamergooi), Ruan Combrinck (hamergooi), Jean-Louis De Lange (hamergooi/gewigstoot/ diskus), Liam Pietersen (hekkies), JP Vorster (spiesgooi), Jayson Weber (100 m/200 m/400 m), Hanro Crous (spiesgooi).

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Hon

member Hinana, you have been waiting for some time.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mnr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following 19 athletes of the Brackenfell High School who have gained WP colours in various athletics events and the list is as follows:

Elitha Sylvester (hurdles), Nadine Liebenberg (hurdles), Kylin Mouton (800 m), Inge-Lynne Jordan (400 m), Alichia Arries (100 m/200 m), Tyrique Adams (200 m/400 m), Inge Liebenberg (shotput/discus), Rozanne Liebenberg (javelin), Michelle Steyn (hurdles), Waylin Booyesen (long jump/hurdles), Waden Bonze (triple jump), Mareliza Rabe (high jump), Johanette Duminy (shotput/hammer throw), Ruan Combrinck (hammer throw), Jean-Louis De Lange (hammer throw/shotput/discus), Liam Pietersen (hurdles), JP Vorster (javelin), Jayson Weber (100 m/200 m/400 m), Hanro Crous (javelin).

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion without notice? Any objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Hinana, you have been waiting for some time.]

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the young Kraaifontein ceramicist, Simphiwe Mbuyana well, who is on his way to France to showcase his excellent and creative work in Galerie Irene Hamilton in Vallauris from 4 August to 30 September 2016.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the relocation of the Premier Soccer League franchise, Mpumalanga Black Aces, to Cape Town after it was bought by the former Ajax Cape Town boss, John Comitis; notes that this sale and relocation brings more opportunities for young aspiring footballers in the province as there will now be two teams in the Premier Soccer League; calls on the City of Cape Town and the Province to give the necessary support to this new Cape Town soccer club, in the same way that Mbombela Municipality and other backers assisted and; lauds John Comitis for bringing back the glory days of football to the Western Cape where we will revive tappy again.



*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that DA George Housing Mayco member Henry Jones appeared in court for illegally selling subsidised plots and RDP houses.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the City of Cape Town for retaining its number 1 position for hosting association meetings, according to ICCA Country and City rankings. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House debates the illegal watermelon market next to the Breede Valley Municipality that is used to fundraise money for the DA election campaign by the husband of the Breede Valley Municipal Mayor.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that a motion without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that Minister Schäfer has raised her objection to a motion by member Olivier calling for the reinstatement of Mr Brian Isaacs given that she will in all likelihood sit in the appeal of this matter.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

HON MEMBERS: So what?

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Order! Are there any further. Order! For the last time are there any further notices of motion? Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its condolences to the family, friends and fans of the acclaimed actor, Nyembezi “Bob” Kunene ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: This has been done already.

Mr L H MAX: ... who died at the age of 74 after a long battle with diabetes. [Interjections.] Bob immersed himself in the creative industry as a way of inspiring society to greater heights. Nyembezi developed many young theatre petitioners through his many theatre projects.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, I understand that could be a duplication. We will look at the wording and if so it will not appear on the

Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. You know that was a very nice motion that other one. [Laughter.] I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape for once again being the province that received the most clean audits in South Africa. The Western Cape received 73% clean audits, while the second best performing province is Gauteng at 33% and KZN received 30%. Well done to the Western Cape and to the municipalities and a hearty thank you to all the members of this House whose diligent oversight has made this excellent performance possible. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Dugmore but I don't see his motion in front of him. [Laughter.] Hon member Dugmore, do you want to give a motion without notice? Is it signed already?

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, I am still going to sign but I would like to move this motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow the opportunity to sign it immediately after this.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deep concern that a former MEC of this House and currently a DA member in Hessequa, Mr Theuns Botha, has actively encouraged his son to stand against his own party in the Hessequa Municipality. [Laughter.]

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is there an objection to that? There is an objection. Hon member Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, he chanced his arm in a big way there and he misled you because there is nothing written there. In fact he deliberately misled you.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I cannot judge that but I had the sense that he was improvising as he went on. [Laughter.] but if it is on paper then I must accept it. Are there any further for the last time? Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Laughs4paint charity project, coordinated by Suandra Patel of the non-profit-organisation Khusela Ikhaya, and brand ambassador, Stormers and Springbok rugby player, Scarra Ntubeni, that raises funds for fire retardant paint to help save lives in informal settlements such as Riemvasmaak. What a noble public/private participation project. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its disappointment with the Working on Fire team so ceremoniously sent to Canada to combat fires and who have now decided to down tools over a wage dispute.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

An HON MEMBER: What?!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the Molander kids from Mitchells Plain well for the National Karate Championship taking place in Bloemfontein later this year and notes with gratitude MEC Marais and her Department's assistance to make this possible. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Stephen "Big Boss" Keshi, the former Nigerian coach; further notes that he won the African Cup of Nations as both player and the coach and; our condolences to the Orlando Pirates players because he is not going to coach them anymore.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Are there any further? If not, then we proceed with the Order Paper. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration and Finalisation of the *Western Cape Health Facility Boards and Committees Bill* [B 1 B – 2016].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon members of Provincial Parliament, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, thank you for this opportunity. Upon my appointment as a Provincial Minister of Health, I made several promises and one of those is applicable today. I promised to never lose sight of the selfless efforts of everyday people in communities who work tirelessly and give of themselves, as volunteers, as members of the Health Forum, clinic committees or hospital boards. Their efforts are crucial to achieving a shared vision of an inclusive health sector which protects the dignity of all our people. It is these people whom I acknowledge and speak of today. I pledged then to give communities a more prominent seat at the Department's health decision making table. I promised to put weight behind the words "nothing about us, without us" when it comes to health matters.



The Western Cape Health Facility Boards and Committees Bill that I am tabling before this House today is the fruit of that promise. The Bill will bring greater community representation, participation and diversity to the governance of our health system by not only continuing to recognise traditional facility boards at hospitals but by also demanding community participation and representation at local clinics and community health centres.

This participation is not a “nice to have”. It is a Constitutional requirement under Section 195 which requires that – I quote:

“People’s needs must be responded to and the public must be encouraged to participate in policy making.”

Equally so, the National Health Act, 2003, under Sections 41 and 42 places an obligation on governments to promote the consultation and participation of communities in health care, through various structures, composed of various members of each community. Public participation within public institutions is important for deepening democratic governance.

By increasingly creating an enabling environment for public participation we provide a platform where the public’s ideas, values and interests can be taken into account and allow for a truly responsive public service. We cannot build a health system which promotes the rights of our citizens and secures their well-being if our clients continue to be nothing more than passive recipients

of the health care services.

The strength of this Bill lies in its ability to marry the Province's vision for healthcare whilst also strengthening the provisions of the Constitution and National Health Act and this is done by creating a structure within which communities may influence the work done within the health system. The Bill empowers the communities to take ownership and responsibility for health services in partnership with health care workers.

Recognition without the provision of necessary support would be meaningless. Section 18 of the Bill recognises the need to ensure that communities will now be brought into the Government space and capacitated so as to play their role. For the first time, this Bill gives communities the opportunity to advise and make recommendations to the Provincial Minister, the management of the primary health care facilities, the Head of Department or municipality concerned on matters relating to the Committee's functions.

This will finally give these committees a greater stake in the management of the health system. Section 31, paragraph 3, of the Bill empowers communities with power of oversight, giving them insight into the performance of their facility and placing them in a better position to work with facility managers and achieve the vision of quality health care.

Through this Bill, communities and the Department will indeed be able to work better together and to reject this Bill is to continue to shut the voices of

the communities. I move to table this Bill for consideration by the House.  
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lorraine Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is indeed an honour and a privilege to stand here today to address the House on the progress we have made on this Bill. Many hours of public hearings were spent and a gruelling travel itinerary has all led us to where we are today. The Health Facility Boards and Committees Bill aims to provide for the establishment, functions and procedures of boards established for hospitals and committees, established for primary health care facilities and to provide for matters incidental thereto.

As the Minister alluded to, upon becoming Minister of Health for the Western Cape, Minister Mbombo promised to formalise a policy framework that would amplify the voice of communities especially up to Provincial Health Council level. Today that promise is fulfilled. A total of eight public hearings were held by the Standing Committee and it was pleasing to see the turnout as the public and other stakeholders voiced their opinions on the matter. We thank them for availing themselves and ensuring that all avenues of the Bill are informed by the people the Bill is intended to benefit.

The implementation of this Bill will encourage active citizenry within the health system and improve communication between the health facilities and

communities. This will give communities ownership and a platform for contribution towards the health system rather than just making them passive recipients. This they will be able to do as the Bill states that 50% of the members of the board and committees have to be members of the public. This ensures that the platform to raise the concerns and highlight gaps that affect the health care system is made available and thus ensures that we continue to provide quality health care to the people, with the people of the Western Cape.

I want to thank the members of the Standing Committee for their role and the vigour with which they interrogated the matter and engaged with the Department of Health to ensure that all concerns of the public had been raised and addressed.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I also want to thank the Minister and her Department for reaffirming their commitment to delivering quality health care for the people of the Western Cape. It indeed is an honour to stand here and support this Bill. I thank you.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Health Care Services Bill will improve service delivery immensely we believe. We also believe that with

communities taking ownership this is a step in the right direction. We, as the ACDP, want to compliment the Standing Committee for the public hearings and also the Minister for tabling the Bill. The ACDP supports the Western Cape Health Facility Board and Committees Bill. I thank you.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The South African Constitution enshrines community participation in the running of public institutions to ensure accountability and transparency which is a basic ethic of participatory democracy.

The notion of social cohesion and active citizenry are thus alive in the Bill of Rights. For too long communities longed for recognition and their voices to be heard on matters of quality health care in public care centres and hospitals. This Bill responds to that outcry and clearly defines the important role to be played by members of the community in the facility boards and committees. Critical to the appointment of members to the board and committees is the consultation with the relevant stakeholders and a minimum 50% of the members coming from the communities. We hope that the MEC will always exercise caution and not just pay lip service during this very important component of the establishment of boards and committees. We call upon the MEC to genuinely consult with all relevant stakeholders and communities unlike what happened in Hessequa.

One of the key elements during the public meetings was the need to induct and train members of the board and committees. It is the responsibility of the

Department to ensure that the training manuals are in place and of excellent quality to enable the members to ably perform their duties. It must be well funded in terms of the main budget, be part of the Annual Performance Plan and accounted for in the Annual Report.

In conclusion, we equally call upon the members of the community-based and non-government organisations in the health care arena to grab this opportunity and really play their part truly. The future of quality health care is in the warm hands of the community activists who are passionate about the issues of improved quality health care in our communities, especially for the poor and the rural parts of the province. Finally, the ANC supports the Bill.  
[Applause.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you to the Chairperson of the Standing Committee. Thank you to all the Standing Committee members, the public, in absentia, who participated in the public hearings and most importantly to thank the Department for that. I have noted some of the concerns that have been raised. To the members of this House, I move for the House to consider this Bill. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the

debate on this Order. Are there any objections to the Bill being finalised?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Health Facility Boards and Committees Bill.*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will now be sent to the Premier for her assent. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:10.