

---

THURSDAY, 12 MAY 2016

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

---

The House met at 14:15

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated. I see the Deputy Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that? Agreed to. We will then start with the subject for discussion. Honourable [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: A point of order...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is with concern that the Premier of the Western Cape is not present at this particular event... [Interjections.] ...and we all know that we do not sit particularly often and I think it impacts on the order and the dignity of this House where despite us knowing that the Premier is supposed to be here... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order, order! Hon member Mr Dugmore, I want you to finish your point. Is that your point of order?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So my point of order is... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have heard the point of order, thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...is to ask whether you as the Deputy Speaker consider that this is a poor reflection on the House when the Premier is

absent. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, I am not going to allow a discussion on that. [Interjections.] The attendance of members of the House... [Interjections.] Order! The attendance of members of the House is under the control of the various Chief Whips and I am not going to make a ruling on that specific point. Hon Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. That definitely was not a point of order and this is not a platform to launch mayoral campaigns or any of those... [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. [Interjections.] Order! Order! We will now continue with the subject for discussion in the name of the hon member Ms Schäfer. [Interjections.] Order! Let us allow the member to start.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Allow the member to start with the subject for discussion. Hon member Ms Schäfer you may start.

**THE ON-GOING DROUGHT IN THE WESTERN CAPE  
AND ITS EFFECTS**

(Subject for discussion)

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are here today to debate a catastrophe, a drought that the ANC Government fails to see, fails to acknowledge and fails to declare a national disaster.

Research shows that the El Niño conditions have caused the lowest recorded rainfall between October 2015 and January 2016 across the many regions of Southern Africa in the past 35 years with the hottest temperatures measured in the past ten years. But what do we mean by drought? The definition of drought relates to how much rain falls from an expected or normal to being insufficient in an area. Research has stated that we are currently at stage 4, a socio-economic drought, which will have severe impact not only on the environment but also on communities regarding access to food and water. [Interjections.]

During the 1991/92 drought, the last time South Africa experienced the severe drought, a Government White Paper on disaster management said that 49 000 agricultural jobs and 20 000 non-agricultural jobs were lost. Farmers in Southern Africa are at a frontline of this catastrophe and are arguably the worst affected, not only is there financial ruin but also a sense of hopelessness and at total loss of dignity. Agri-workers and farmers face one

of the worst droughts in our recent history and my thoughts and prayers go out to them as they face their daily struggle. On the West Coast and in the Karoo we now see extreme drought affecting almost 400 settlements. In total almost 1600 settlements in the Western Cape are affected by this drought. The National Minister of Agriculture says there is no national disaster, but nationally more than 28 000 settlements are suffering.

A report presented in a joint Portfolio Committee meeting in the Department of Water and Sanitation recently has reported that almost 34 million South Africans are affected by moderate to extreme drought. As such, it is an absolute shame when Ministers in the National Government stubbornly refuse to declare South Africa's drought a national disaster. Minister Zokwana's only response has been an announcement of a measly R381 million for the entire country's need, R381 million. [Interjections.]

I think that is an absolute shame. [Interjections.] Government's reaction is merely piecemeal here and there with no clear coordinated disaster alleviation plan.

Organisations such as Agri SA have reported that the current drought is of such great intensity that it is beyond the ambit of any farmer to mitigate despite his or her resource base. [Interjections.]

It is estimated that it will take at least three years for farmers to recover from this devastating drought, but while the drought threatens farms with

bankruptcy it is estimated that the drought will result in an 11% food price increase before the end of 2016 which negatively affects the consumer. In March it was reported in the media that already food prices had increased by 8% just three months into the calendar year. In particular the cost of bread and maize is rising and we know that this will hit the poorest of poor in our country first.

Mr Deputy Speaker, South Africa is facing a growing crisis. The risk of vulnerable communities not having financial means to access to food is growing. Organisations have said that the agricultural sector will lose up to 30% of its commercial farmers and 80% of small scale farmers if Government does not assist with funding mechanisms. I say we have a national crisis on our hands. [Interjections.]

It is expected that the demand for grain will be in excess of seven million tonnes. Taking that into consideration our harbours and railroad logistics will be under severe pressure [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: There are even doubts that South Africa will be able to move such a record quantity of grain inland, given the weak railway system and the poor road logistics. This could cause bottlenecks in supplies and product shortages from time to time; more traffic and increased stress on our road maintenance budgets.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have a crisis. The Western Cape has requested R88 million from National Government in drought relief. However the Western Cape waits patiently for National Department of Agriculture to officially gazette the West Coast and Central Karoo Witzenberg, Prince Albert and Oudtshoorn and two district municipalities as drought disaster areas and while he considers our request, farmers have very real obligations that cannot wait on any onerous Government process. So while the ANC Government is dragging its feet the Western Cape has taken action.  
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay listen ... [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The DA-run Western Cape is truly committed to agriculture and it is the backbone of our rural economy and employment in our province... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, order, order member, please. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, you are the next speaker on the list. Please wait... [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Wait your turn, please.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...because we understand that agriculture is tightly linked to our food system and our food security. Emerging farmers are at most great risk and so the Western Cape Government is stepping in, in the interim, where National Government is failing, but without the additional assistance

from National Government however, we do not have the resources to assist the larger farms, which are crucial to job creation, our food security and to keeping food prices stable. Previously it has taken two years before National Government provided any emergency drought assistance. If they drag their feet much longer this time around we will face a full blown disaster.

The drought has certainly highlighted the importance of the Western Cape to promote sustainable Agri-practices and with the increasing scarcity of water farmers also cannot ignore sound conservation farming, and just next week I know we will see the launch of SmartAgri, our first time collaborative effort by the Western Cape Agriculture Department and Environment Affairs and Development Planning to develop a Climate Change Response Framework and Implementation Plan. SmartAgri responds to the need for a practical and relevant Climate Change Response Plan specifically for the agricultural sector of the Western Cape Province. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: En daar is niks om te [Onduidelik.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: And there is nothing to [Inaudible.]]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the people of this province cannot wait any longer. Equally so the people across South Africa affected by the drought cannot wait either. Enough is enough. We are a ticking time bomb. Give us our R88 million.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA calls on National Government in accordance with

the National Disaster Management Act to declare this drought a national disaster. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hear, hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me just make the point so that we have this House deal with the facts. [Interjections.] Let me at the outset share with you the National Development Plan directive. [Interjections.]

And I will get into its specifics that water is a strategic resource critical for social and economic development.

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And there is a growing concern about the potential impact of water-related risk. [Interjections.] South Africa ranks low, 128 out of 132 countries in Yale University's Environmental Performance Index and now this is a fact.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What are you doing about it?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: South Africa also ranks 148 out of 180 countries in terms of water availability per capita according to the 2012 World Water Development Report. [Interjections.]

Since South Africa is already a water-scarce country great attention will have to be paid and underline this, to its management and use, and this is what I am going to come back to, to its management and use. The issue of management and use should be our theme today and how this province and municipalities are governed. It is so because water is increasingly becoming a scarce resource. Demand for water is also increasing, leaving us with a big leadership and governance challenge. Water and energy remain the top global risk. Both the previous PERO and MERO in this House pointed this out. It pointed this out. [Interjections.]

I was hoping somebody there, as she started to at least say something right... [Interjections.] Now this DA Government projects itself as a champion of the NDP at least in their speaking manner and the PR exercise, but you will hear as we speak here that they have got nothing on the table, to at least implement what they call, as this Holy Bible, there is nothing on the table.

Let us therefore locate this drought debate within this broad context so that we do not fall into the trap of sensationalisation of serious issues like drought.

Drought is one of the 32 hazards researched by our Disaster Team in the

Province, along with swine fever and others. The key issue is having identified drought as part of the risk going forward, what is the actual plan to deal with its effects? We have heard nothing until she sat down and I am hoping that at least two Ministers that are coming will say something in this regard.

Drought affects everybody and we should not make the issue a political football as the Democratic Alliance seeks to do. Drought is not manufactured at Luthuli House or at the Union Buildings. [Interjections.] It should never be used for political point scoring. [Interjections.] The starting point is that drought is as a result of climate change... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Dyantyi, just one second. You are standing a little bit too far from your mike. We cannot hear you properly.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will be closer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They definitely will hear me now. That is for sure.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Honourable member?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Chair, can he start afresh so that we can...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Nice try, but ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I would have loved that. These points are worth repeating.

HON MEMBERS: No. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The starting point is that drought is as a result of climate change and global warming, which is a global phenomenon and the current El Niño which has confronted our part of the world. Climate change is a major challenge facing government everywhere in the globe.

The DA raised a similar debate in the National Assembly in February. They were blaming National Government so we were not surprised when she did. That is a DA template for not acting quickly enough and that the current drought situation requires a declaration for a national disaster. However, the water levels in the country do not call for that. For example the Western Cape has the fourth highest water storage levels - Minister Bredell will say that - nationally, and this is expected to increase with the upcoming rain season that is already under way.

Furthermore, the areas currently affected, Central Karoo, Oudtshoorn, parts of Eden District, West Coast, require a targeted approach to deal with and ring-fence and not give a broad-brush approach to it. There are however provinces which have been adversely affected. These are a lot worse, KZN,

Free State, Limpopo and Mpumalanga. Drought currently affects 173 of the 1628 water supply schemes nationally, serving approximate 2.7 million households or 18% of the total national population. Economic nodes are still at a positive water balance, as at February this year, 53%, however, still significantly lower from this time last year, which was 81%. Basically there is no need for a diversion of a national disaster. That is the point I am putting up.

These are the following Government interventions so far: the Department of Water Affairs, Water and Sanitation has reprioritised an amount of R502 million in response to mitigation measures for the drought. She could not even say that. Over and above this, the grant funded programmes such as RBIG, MWIG and ACIP have been refocused to mitigate drought related water shortages.

The Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries has allocated R381 million towards drought relief. The Land Bank has made available an amount of R400 million for concessional loans to commercial farmers affected by drought. Through the Agricultural Research Council, Government has also introduced a drought tolerant maize seed.

DAFF Government has already allocated over a billion to help farmers since the declaration in six provinces. Some chose to ignore as she did in front of us. DAFF has developed and it is implementing their mitigation and adaptation plans to take a long term view to climate change, not short-cut

measures. The National Disaster Management Centre is leading a coordinated response to drought working with various stakeholders, including this province. The National Joint Drought Coordination Committee has also established a task team to coordinate [Inaudible.] because any disaster you will never leave people because they are always going to be affected by it. There are many other interventions specifically in the agricultural sector to ensure that farmers continue to produce and I will leave that to my honourable member Sharon Davids to deal with.

At a legislative level, Parliament is spearheading the introduction of a Framework Climate Change Bill, which will incorporate all relevant applicable provisions of the Paris Climate Agreement COP-21.

In the Western Cape the Provincial Government is currently conducting a groundwater study in the Western Cape for the determination of potential yields and this is in its advanced stages. You should have at least mentioned that and I am hoping AWB †sal dit doen. [will do that.]

The City of Cape Town and the Province of the Western Cape did not under the current climate change [Inaudible.] the Save Water Campaign as run in other provinces. Instead the City of Cape Town just increased their rates. That is all they could do in response to the issue of drought. They want Treasury to give them R80 million for drought relief but they themselves have not even invested half that amount in drought prevention processes in the province. So far we have not had anything they are putting on the table.

Infrastructure arrangements have been put in place for municipalities. I am hoping Mr Bredell will say that, but let me conclude by the following, which also comes from the NDP in terms of what it is that you need to do around issues of water management and its use, so I would like to put a challenge to the DA, that will follow me. To tell us what they are currently doing in relation to water management and use in the province. Come back home.

I further specifically invite them to tell us their plans on the following: effective administration of water resources, issue of reprioritisation; the reduce of water demand and how they are doing on this; managing the agriculture use better because the bulk of the water that we are using is used by agriculture and they must also tell us what the plan on the table is for water reuse and issues of desalination.

We will sit down and listen to hear if they have a plan but I can tell you now I will not be disappointed knowing them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. [Applause.] [Interjection.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Haal uit en wys. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Come and show us. [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] The hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. This is one thing that we cannot politicise. This is one thing we cannot politicise and I want to emphasise, because this is a serious problem we are facing. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This one does not exist.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The total impact on animal and crop and horticultural production will have a reduction of 10%. 2017 harvest will also be affected as farmers may not have the water for post harvest irrigation. [Interjections.] Food prices will increase.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second member. Is that a question or a point of order, hon member Mr Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: It is a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, notwithstanding the fact that the hon member was not disrupted whilst he was speaking, but what becomes even more unacceptable is the point that he makes about the hon member Mr Christians. He says: "This one does not exist." [Interjections.] [Laughter.] You know. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: It is not nice to refer to members like that. This is an honourable member. It is not apples or potatoes. It is an honourable member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, order.

Mr M MNQASELA: Honourable. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! The point is taken. We are all hon members and I am not aware that the member did refer to him like that, but if he did say [Interjections.] Please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, food prices will increase due to the weak industry being most severely affected. Local wheat prices will be based on a poor dollar/rand exchange rate. We are sitting with a serious crisis. If we look at the dam levels 2015, Steenbras Lower had 49%. It is at the moment 39%. Voëlvlei was 44%. It is now 22%. Berg River was on 54%. It is now on 27%. We are sitting with a national crisis... [Interjections.] We are sitting with a national crisis and you know, when you look at the comparison about the food prices, you are shocked when you go to the food prices that have been increased severely.

Listen to this, Mr Deputy Speaker. Potatoes that every citizen need, the poor of poor need potatoes, in this current year potatoes went up eight times. Last year it was R33.00 a bag. Today it is R73.00 and R93.00 a bag. It is affecting the poor of the poor and we have people here coming to play

politics. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hundreds of seasonal farmworkers living in towns have been severely affected by the drought, and we say sometimes that we speak on behalf of farmworkers but when we need to help them we do not help them and that is a fact. Seasonal farmworkers will not have the extra work in the agricultural space because of the reduction of agriculture. Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time unfortunately has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: You must ask this member to keep quiet Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order! Before we continue, hon member Mr Dyantyi I have given you lots of latitude, too much in fact. I have reached the end of my patience now with that. There is a vast difference between making a constructive interjection and simply making noise and commenting on every sentence made from the other side. We cannot continue like this. Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. It is sad that the hon member Mr Dyantyi started off his speech by saying that drought and the water situation are in our minds.

That is precisely why the ANC cannot solve any problem because they think by not acknowledging a problem it will disappear and the only way we can tackle this problem is if all three spheres of government work together with the communities with the NGOs with Water Affairs. It is the only way. It is a joint effort that can solve this problem.

We are in a water-scarce country and the Western Cape is especially a vulnerable water-dry province. The latest drought situation the country has been experiencing is not unique to South Africa. Many countries across the world from India to Zimbabwe at this very moment are in dire straights with regards to water and this pressure is only set to increase into the future given climate change and population growth projections. Urbanisation will also put huge pressure on especially our cities in especially the Metro. [Interjections.]

In the Western Cape in 1996 there was an estimated four million people. Today we are at around 6.2 million in this province and our predictions show that the province's population will grow up to an estimated 32% over the next 25 years. As one example, Cape Town can expect another one million people to settle themselves here over the coming years. We need to plan for that and we need to be ready for that otherwise we will not be able to accommodate the pressures. [Interjection.]

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, landwyd is ons damme vandag gemiddeld 55% vol teenoor verlede jaar se sowat 80%. In die Wes-Kaap is ons hoofdamme vir drinkwater vandag 30% vol. Verlede jaar dieselfde tyd was dit 58% vol. Dit is 'n aanduiding van hoe ernstig die saak is. Die data en die voorspellings is belangrik omrede die uitdagings met water in die toekoms net gaan vererger indien daar nie behoorlik beplan word nie. Die groot probleem is die bevolkingsgroei wat so toeneem teenoor die reënvalpatrone wat in dieselfde stadium afneem. Inteendeel, daar word voorspel dat klimaatsverandering teen 2050 reeds daartoe kan lei dat reënval in die Wes-Kaap sal afneem met tot 30%. So aan die een kant verwag ons bevolkingsgroei van 32% en aan die ander kant voorspel ons reënval wat gaan afneem met sowat 30%. Dis duidelik dat die aanbod van water wat reeds onder druk is net nie gaan kan byhou by die aanvraag nie.

Water is nie net belangrik om oorlewingsredes nie. Dit is 'n kernbelangrike deel van ekonomiese groei. Sonder voldoende water word ekonomiese groei beperk wat weer beteken die stryd teen armoede, die stryd teen ongelikheid, die stryd teen werkloosheid word moeiliker. Daar is ook die impak van watertekorte op gesondheid. Sonder betroubare waterbronne is mense geneig om vuil water te gebruik en dit kan tot grootskaalse siektes lei. In die Vrystaat is daar byvoorbeeld op die oomblik in Rouxville-area 'n groot siektebedreiging met tot 20 000 mense wat al maande sonder water sit. Nog 'n voorbeeld van die groot impak van water is met betrekking tot riool. Ons rioolstelsel in Suid-Afrika werk grootliks met vars water en sonder voldoende water kan die noodsaaklike funksie oor die enorme uitdagings ontaard in

geweldige uitdagings in die toekoms.

Die Wêreldbank sê stede regoor die wêreld se waterhulpbronne kan verminder met tot twee-derdes teen 2050. Dit het weer 'n reuse-impak op ons kosproduksie en die huishoudelike inkomste, met families wat al hoe meer sal moet betaal vir water soos wat dit meer skaars raak. Watertekorte sal die mees kwesbare onder ons, die armes, gevolglik die swaarste tref.

So wat kan ons doen of wat kan gedoen word om die probleem aan te spreek? Eerstens is meer doeltreffende gebruik van water kernbelangrik. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr Deputy Speaker, countrywide our dams are today 55% full compared to last year's approximately 80%. In the Western Cape our main dams for drinking water are 30% full. Last year for the same period it was 58% full. That is an indication of how serious the matter is. The data and the predictions are important because the challenges with water are only going to increase if we do not plan properly. The big problem is the population growth increasing so much as opposed to the rainfall patterns decreasing during the same period. In fact, it is predicted that climate change by 2050 can already lead to rainfall in the Western Cape decreasing by about 30%. So on the one hand we expect a population growth of 32% and on the other hand a prediction that our rainfall is going to decrease by about 30%. It is clear that

the supply of water which is already under pressure will not keep up with the demand.

Water is not only important for reasons of survival. It is a core ingredient of economic growth. Without water economic growth is limited which in turn means the battle against poverty, the battle against inequality, the battle against unemployment become more difficult. There is also the impact of water shortages on health. Without reliable water resources people are inclined to use dirty water which can lead to large scale diseases. In the Free State, in the Rouxville area for example, there is a large threat of disease with up to 20 000 people who have been without water for months. Another example of the great impact of water is with regard to sewerage. Our sewerage system in South Africa largely works with fresh water and without sufficient water the necessary function can in future develop into huge challenges.

Mr Deputy Speaker, a recent report by the World Bank warns that climate change will have a massive impact on the world's economies. The World Bank says shortages of water could strip off about 6% of the country's GDP by 2050. That would put South Africa's economic growth at roughly minus 6%.

The World Bank says water resources of cities all over the world can decrease by two-thirds by 2050. That again has a huge impact on our food production and the domestic income, with families having to pay more for

water as it becomes scarcer. Water shortages will affect the most vulnerable among us, the poor, the most severe.

So what can we do or can be done to address the problem? Firstly more efficient use of water is of extreme importance. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is hy.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Een groot probleem in baie plekke is die vermorsing van water. In sommige plekke gaan enorme hoeveelhede vars water verlore te wyte aan stukkende pype en slegte bestuur. Goeie bestuursbeleide en implementering kan dus 'n groot impak hê op watertekorte of om watertekorte aan te spreek. Nog 'n area waar verandering moet plaasvind is hoe die omgewing behandel word. Die besoedeling van waterhulpbronne en omgewingsdegradasie oor die algemeen moet aangespreek word. As ons nie ons voedingsbronne bewaar nie kan ons nie watersekuriteit verwag nie. In hierdie verband is ek trots op ons program vir die rehabilitasie van ons watersisteme. Die Wes-Kaapse Bergrivier Verbeteringskema vorder fluks ten spyte van begrotingstekorte. Tot op datum is meer as 100 000 plante suksesvol gekultiveer wat gebruik word vir rehabilitasie van die rivierbanke wat skoongemaak word van uitheemse plante.

Op voetsoolvlak help ons ons munisipaliteite met waterbesparingsbewustheidsinisiatiewe en die instel van beperkings. Ons het projekte regoor die provinsie aan die gang waar ons ou infrastruktuur vervang om lekkasies te vermy en te voorkom. So het ons byvoorbeeld onlangs miljoene rande in die Kannaland Munisipaliteit bestee waar waterinfrastruktuur opgradeer is.

Ons in die Wes-Kaap het tot nou toe plaaslike rampgebiede verklaar in Oudtshoorn, Prins Albert, Witzenberg, Sentraal-Karoo, die Weskus-munisipaliteite. Die situasie word deurlopend gemonitor en sal uitgebrei word indien nodig.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: One big problem in many places is the wasting of water. In some places enormous quantities of fresh water are lost because of broken pipes and poor management. Good management policies and implementation can therefore have a great impact on water shortages or to address water shortages. Another area where change needs to take place is how the environment is being treated. The contamination of water resources and environmental degradation in general should be addressed. If we do not preserve our food resources we cannot expect water security. In this regard I am proud of our programme for the rehabilitation of our water systems. The Western Cape Berg River Improvement Scheme is progressing well despite

budget shortages. To date more than 100 000 plants have been cultivated successfully that are used for the rehabilitation of the river banks that are cleared of alien vegetation.

At ground level we assist our municipalities with water preservation awareness initiatives and introduction of limits. We have projects going all over the province where we replace old infrastructure to avoid and prevent leakages. For example, we have recently spent millions of rands in the Kannaland Municipality where water infrastructure had been upgraded.

We in the Western Cape have until now declared disaster areas in Oudtshoorn, Prince Albert, Witzenberg, Central Karoo, the West Coast municipalities. The situation is monitored continually and will be extended if necessary.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape's plan for water is a pro-active approach that requires all spheres of Government and the public to become involved in the cooperative manner to ensure that water is managed properly. Other long term options to address projected shortfalls that are always being discussed include desalination of seawater, water re-use and deep aquifer water source that need to be investigated and implemented. We need to be very careful when we debate this because each of these will also have a negative environmental impact. In the Western Cape we believe if you want to improve people's lives you need a proper plan and that needs to be implemented properly and timeously.

When it comes to water this is even more important. Ongoing engagements with National and Local Government and disaster management entities remain vital to successfully manage the situation going forward.

In this regard we are also excited for the potential after raising of the Clanwilliam Dam wall. In addition Mr Deputy Speaker, you will be pleased to know that the Provincial Drought Management Plan has been drafted in collaboration with various stakeholders across this province. The plan was developed in line with the disaster management key performance indicators as stipulated in the Provincial Disaster Management Framework. Highlights from this plan include a drought management task team that has already been established and oversees the drought disaster risk assessments. The plan further outlines several drought risks reduction strategies including the application of good agricultural practices across the province.

The following is also addressed in the draft Western Cape Drought Plan: early warning systems and measures; data collection tools measures and educational and awareness initiatives. In terms of the response and recovery the Drought Action Plan identifies the possible management actions that should be implemented at certain drought trigger points.

That is in brief an outline of the situation and what is being done at present. It is clearly going to take innovation and hard work to make sure there is a sustainable future for everyone. I thank you. [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi Anton. [Onduidelik.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well done, Anton. [Inaudible.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Ministers, hon members, and the people of the Western Cape, the Democratic Alliance received an unwavering and a sterling mandate to govern the Western Cape on the 7<sup>th</sup> of May 2014; this against the wishes of the prophets of doom and gloom, whose desire for the people of this province is nothing but to divide them on the basis of race, class, gender and background. It is not by accident that two years later we remain resolute and undoubtedly confident that on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of August in the Local Government Elections the DA will receive a clear refreshing and resounding mandate from the voters of this province... [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

Mr M MNQASELA: We will win the majority of the municipalities in the Western Cape. I want to congratulate the following people, the Speakers of this province, the Mayors of this province, and the councillors, municipal managers... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and executive directors and area managers...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Mngasela, I have given you some latitude for an introduction but it is a rather long introduction before you get to water. This debate is about water. Get to the debate please.

Mr M MNQASELA: I am getting there, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is the political conversation. May I then carry on, where I started. You have disturbed me now, hon members. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

When we talk about water, we must keep in mind that it is a very sensitive essential service to all people. A recent survey indicates that 100% of the people of this province receive clean water as contrary to other provinces where the ANC is in charge. This is in line with the mission of the Western Cape Government and of course the plan to keep governing this province and keep making progress.

The Western Cape Government in its mission statement says: "We will promote freedom, opportunity for all the people of this province through delivering clean efficient cost effective transparent and responsive public administration among others."

Furthermore the province is the champion in driving water saving awareness programmes, through the Department of Local Government; I am not going to

belabour the points that have been made by the Minister of Local Government, a very competent Minister, unlike these useless Ministers in the other provinces. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: He is not a champion.

Mr M MNQASELA: Let me further state... [Interjection.] Let me further state that we appreciate the programme that has been launched by the National Minister of Water Affairs, the war on leaks. 7000 artisans will be trained nationally and in the province we are getting 680 of them and the challenge with this, which we do not appreciate, the National Minister did not consult with the province on which municipalities to target. For instance hon member Mr Dyantyi, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, he is saying here Central Karoo is a problem, but your Minister does not see it as a problem. Your Minister sees these municipalities as a problem. [Interjections.] She sees Kannaland, which we agree. She sees Bitou. I know what they want there. She sees Laingsburg. We know what they want there. She sees Cedarberg. We know what they want in these areas, but we will make sure that we *klap* you there because we are coming, the blue machine is non-stop. [Interjections.]

Let me further say, the whole question of water must be addressed, especially on the issues of negligence and wastage by both industrialists, by both the industrial and household users. We have on Tuesday this week had a presentation by the Department of Local Government. [Interjections.] ...and I must say that the issue came out quite strongly that those who owe the

municipalities the most are the industrial users and households, of more than 90 days debts that are owed to municipalities; 65% of that is for households and industrialists which are firms and big companies.

Now we need to address this because nationally the amount is even much bigger. In the province this talks to R6.4 billion and it is a very serious matter that we need to address. When hon member Mr Dyantyi said you are not answering questions, let me just say Mr Deputy Speaker, through you, when this debate was put forward it was against the backdrop that National Government is neglecting its mandate.

In 2015 with the Bill that we dealt with here in this Parliament, which was referred by the NCOP, the National Disaster Management Bill, some of the issues around the Bill intend to amend Section 43 of the Disaster Management Act of 2002. I can tell you that what it says is that municipalities must have now the responsibility to establish disaster management centres, without giving money to the kind of mandate they are given.

75% of the battle of this budget will come from municipalities and only 25% will come from National Treasury and we find that very, very disturbing. It is against the Constitution and also it is an unfunded mandate in terms of Schedule 4, Part B of Schedule 5 of the Constitution and those are the kind of issues that we need to address. No unfunded mandate must be given to municipalities. If you want a municipality to do one, two and three, fund

them. That is why in this province you opposed this unconstitutional Bill.

Let me further, Mr Deputy Speaker, take you and this House to the issue of the entire scope of services that we have done that we have provided in municipalities over and above the question of water.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, unfortunately that will have to stand over. Your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you very much. The ANC can see what we are doing in this province. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I am just laughing. I think Beverley - hon member Ms Schäfer, Beverley, you maybe were supposed to wait for after the 18<sup>th</sup> of May because according to the programme we are getting reports next week on the drought from the Department. So you are rushing yourself.

The ongoing drought affects the most vulnerable and poor communities mainly in the rural farming areas. The farmworkers and dwellers are constantly threatened with short-time layoffs, retrenchments and evictions. There was a price increase of basic goods and other services such as bread, maize meal, meat, milk, vegetables and fruit, while a few prices have gone up including municipal services such as water rates and other related services.

The poor communities are not exempted from paying for these price hikes.

Food production and food security depend on the ability of agricultural and farming sectors to produce enough foodstuffs and critical to that is the availability of water as the natural resource, amongst others. Farmers, Agri-businesses and food producers are therefore central and interrelated in the value chain and supply management system in the food production market.

The Western Cape still suffers from the aftermath of 2006 price-fixing of bread by major bread producers like Pioneer and who then connived to reduce competition through their involvement in a so-called bread cartel. This has had a far-reaching impact on the availability of basic foodstuffs namely bread, serial and maize meal.

Mr Nosey Pieterse of BAWUSA has accused the farmers of wanting to use the drought as an excuse to shed jobs on farms. He further stated that Government should only support those farmers who have shown commitment to secure jobs of their respective employees during these challenging times. He further maintained that farmers experienced drought once in a while, but farmworkers are in drought throughout their working lives because of low wages and poor and bad working conditions. He pleaded for the protection of the workers' jobs. As the ANC we support the call to protect farmworkers' rights and improve working conditions and employment security of farmworkers.

Food prices have gone up incredibly owing to the drought. Statistics South Africa has revealed that food cost has gone up by 9.8% year-on-year. With vegetables 18.7%, oils and fats 18.1%, bread and cereals 13.3% and sugar and deserts 11.7% increased the most. What concerns the ANC the most is the welfare and lack thereof, the impoverishment of rural communities who are the worst affected than anyone else by this drought. What we hear from this DA-led Government is the plea on behalf of the commercial farmers who are your constituencies by the way, so you are busy campaigning here... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: So daai is die ding.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is the thing.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: ...who are predominantly white farmers to declare Western Cape as a disaster area and in our Standing Committee we said to the Department why are they not advising the commercial farmers to take out security on their farms. They are not doing that. He was saying that the poor people love handouts but I think the commercial farmers now want handouts.

We hear very little about the emerging farmers and them to be assisted during this drought. The ANC is aware of the fact that many of them, if not all, do not have appropriate equipment and enough resources to mitigate the effects of the drought. What measures have been put in place to caution devastated situations and mitigate their plight?

In November 2015 the Minister of Water and Sanitation, comrade Nomvula issued briefing notes on the status of drought in South Africa. It was reported that the Western Cape dams were running at 70% on average down from 89% the previous year. It was also mentioned that the most affected area is the West Coast region. It was acknowledged and noted that other regions such as Central Karoo and Southern Cape, which were partly affected, had already taken pro-active measures to mitigate the impact of the drought through groundwater exploration and reuse of return flows. Furthermore, the Department proposed some drought response measures which include strict implementation of drought operating rules at all dams, including restriction, increasing the water mix especially groundwater utilisation, reducing operational risk by proper infrastructure operations and maintenance with associated skills development; implementation of water conservation and demand management programmes; emerging interventions by tanking and climate research as well as service authority municipalities.

The question that must be asked is whether the Western Cape Government has taken a keen interest to implement these measures to mitigate the negative impact of drought. The blind-sight attitude of the DA-led administration is devious and not assisting the good efforts by our National Government to mitigate the negative effects of this devastating drought, like the honourable that stood up and put the blue T-shirts forward instead of the drought. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What did you say?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Your blue T-shirts, your blue wave, you spoke more about the blue wave. You are not concerned about the issues of the farmworkers and the people that are affected by the drought. You come here and you make a political speech but out there you want to say to the people you are speaking on behalf of them in Parliament... [Interjections.] ...and it is not supported what is happening on the ground.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: In January 2016 Mr Colin Diener of Western Cape Disaster Management confirmed that the agricultural sector was hard hit in areas of Central Karoo and West Coast and that relief was provided in those regions as disaster zones. He further stated that together with the National Disaster Management Centre a very thorough assessment and classification were done and a decision was taken not to declare a provincial disaster but rather concentrate on those disaster zones in those affected areas, especially West Coast, Central Karoo and Southern Cape.

He further noted that, so seemingly the two Departments are not speaking to one another. Agriculture is not speaking to Local Government. He further noted that despite a major shortfall of rainfall the province still had a very strong groundwater system that will help alleviate the pressure over the rest of the summer.

He stated that the prognosis was that the Western Cape would survive this

period. That is your Disaster Manager, the provincial one. His attention to two things: they dispelled the myth that says the National Government does not care about the Western Cape and her people and dispels the myth that says the Western Cape Province is entirely in its drought. Who is fooling who? Are the officials lying to us or are we lying to ourselves?

In conclusion the National Government has awarded funds through the Division of Revenue Bill to provinces including the Western Cape namely Comprehensive Agriculture Support Programme, Ilima-Letsema Project Grants and Land Care Programme Grant; poor poverty relief and infrastructure development. These funds would have enabled the Western Cape Government to assist to a certain extent the emerging farmers. Impoverished communities heavily affected: this includes a R120 million investment through National Job Funds Projects which was recently launched and is to benefit 24 black fruit producers both in the Western and Eastern Cape Province. Our National Government is committed to move South Africa forward. Therefore the DA Government must not claim easy victories and I just want to make an example of claiming, they are saying the one thing and doing another.

Let us go to Philippi. They want to build houses now on the agricultural land where the ground water is very strong. It means you want to make sure you are speaking about drought but meantime you are busy destroying the underground water in Philippi. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. First of all can I thank the hon member Ms Schäfer for putting this debate onto the table and you know, we sometimes get stuck in this space that this debate is an agricultural issue and yes, it was an agricultural issue as that was the first impact or where the first impact is felt when we have droughts, but the big problem here is we are moving from that initial impact which hits agricultural to start with into a space that is going to affect every single person in this province. It is moving from an agricultural debate to a people debate to a resource debate; to an impact on the poorest of the poor debate; to a food security debate. That is where it is moving to and the biggest problem that we are suffering in South Africa at the moment is the lack of leadership around dealing with this issue as it moves from an agricultural problem to a problem facing every single person in this country; a problem facing everyone in sub-Saharan Africa. So you will see that the World Bank has upped the number of affected people in sub-Saharan Africa from 29 million people to 50 million people, that are going to be affected directly by this drought and listening to this debate it brought home again to me in listening mainly to the discussion that came out of the ANC's benches today that they are still stuck in the wrong space and it comes back to the lack of leadership in this space. So there is no leadership in the agricultural space in dealing with this issue. There is no leadership in understanding the impact of this drought; not immediately right now but what it is going to mean for the next

two and three years. This drought that we have just suffered last year, if we do not get rain this winter in this province it is going to affect us for six and seven years. At the moment we have an effect from two to three years even if we get rain and I have listened to some of the numbers, and maybe perhaps in the leadership space lies the biggest problem that we face in South Africa, the lack of leadership from the ANC whose job it has been. They were put to power by the people of this province to do exactly that, to lead us in these kinds of spaces; to lead us in this agricultural drought space but to lead us actually as the impact hits the people of this country. We have exactly the same problem, whether it is in the tourism space around visas. I heard people mentioning visas here; lack of leadership and commitment at the ANC level again.

The same thing from a Presidency space where there is no leadership and that is why this country is facing a downgrade again because there is no leadership or where there is leadership it is crazy leadership that does things like having five Finance Ministers that have an effect on every single person in this House's pension fund.

Do you know how much your pension fund lost because of that? Your Pension Fund - each one of you, let alone the people out there, because of that stupid decision. [Interjections.] So the problem is Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...the problem is the lack of leadership. So we listened to some of the numbers that were put out there around dam levels and let me explain to you what actually is happening in our system. So if you have a look at some of our dams, let us have a look at the Steenbras Dam in 2014 sitting at 81%. In 2015 it sat at 64% and today it is sitting at 59%. Voëlvlei was sitting at 59%. It then went to 50% and it is now sitting at 18%. Let us look at Brandvlei. Brandvlei is the same thing. All of these are the same thing. Brandvlei, 49%, the next year with 36% and today we are sitting with 15.4% in the Brandvlei Dam. We are sitting at Clanwilliam at 9.47% as we speak right now in April. We are looking at 6.3% at Floriskraal Dam, 6.3%. And you know what happens with those kinds of levels if we do not get winter rains?

They will not even get to half of what the level of those dams were at the start of this agricultural year and that is going to affect not only the farms. That is going to affect every single person in this province because our towns are going to run out of water. Our towns are going to run out of water.

We heard talk about the effect on food prices. Let us have a look at the latest food price effect if we look at year-on-year change, and here is a graph. If we just have to look at this graph, the red line on this graph shows you what potato prices have done in January and February alone from last year at between R3 000 and R3 500 a tonne, starting in January at R4 500 a tonne and going almost to R6 000 a tonne now. That is what is happening because

of this drought, because of this drought food prices are now sitting - maize meal at 65% up year-on-year; the bread price 17% up year-on-year; potatoes 22% year-on-year; and this has a direct effect on every single person in this country. So the drought might be seen and discussed in this space generally as an agricultural issue but it has moved way beyond that.

It is a leadership issue and it is an issue that this country needs to embrace with much more vigour and especially we need our National Ministers to embrace it with much more vigour because there is zero leadership at the moment from that space and that is why I too wrote down when the hon member Mr Dyantyi said: "Drought is only in your mind." I see the hon Minister Bredell wrote down exactly the same thing. "Drought is only in your mind." Well, quite frankly, he then shows exactly where the ANC is in this drought space, exactly. [Interjections.]

Then we will move to something that someone is shouting about at me across from the other side of the floor, who obviously does not have a clue about what this is about either, because she first of all spoke and brought race into it initially. But let us talk about that because we still have not had action in this province from the National Government to help us with this drought. In this province we have still not had that action but in November last year it was my Department who made the initial R11 million available.

Who was that made available for, hon member? Who? You were in this House when we announced it. Now she is ignoring the debate.

It was made for emerging farmers. It was made for the new black farmers who just got into farming in this province. It was for them so that they could survive because we put taxpayers' money into putting them on the land. It was for them so that they could keep their farmworkers on the farms. [Interjections.] And then while we were still waiting for further leadership and funding coming from a national level then what happened? We again in this province stood up, stepped in to stand and make a difference for those specific people again.

Where were you when I was travelling the province going to see those farms and going to see what difference it made? [Interjections.] Where were you? You were sitting in your comfortable office down here... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...while someone else was writing your speeches. You were not getting to grips with the actual problem and you are not even to grips with that problem, let alone where we are moving to as a high-risk space in South Africa where this drought has got massive, massive implications for all of the people and specifically for the poorest of the poor in this province, but the hon member Mr Dyantyi says, "No, it is not an issue. It is all in your mind." [Interjections.]

"It is all in your mind." There is a massive, massive problem of confusion...

[Interjections.] ...of not understanding... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:. ... the complexity of this issue whatsoever from the ANC at a national level and from the ANC at this provincial level, even less; even less of an understanding of the magnitude of this specific issue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Workshop, workshop! Workshop!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But it was very interesting that when the hon member Mr Dyantyi stood up he initiated the discussion by quoting from the National Development Plan. Now thank goodness there is one person in the ANC who actually talks about the National Development Plan; only one! [Interjections.] No one else; only one! And that again on top of this confusion that is in this agricultural space and this drought space; when there is no leadership they are throwing other issues onto the table from a policy point of view which is really crippling... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, just one second. Hon member Ms Davids, please, no running commentary. Hon member Mr Magaxa, order. Minister Madikizela and hon member Mr Magaxa, allow the member please to continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...which is really crippling the basis of our food security and our food production in this country and this drought is just exacerbating and that policy mindless space is where we got a nexus between land reform and agriculture, who really do not understand their mandate. Between the two of them they are criss-crossing mandate. That member spoke the other day in a debate in this House about how are we going to get black people in this province to own land and farm the land that they own; when this very Department who is supposed to be dealing with this, the Department of Land Reform, guess what they did and I wonder how many of these members were in Beaufort West on Tuesday? Were you there?

An HON MEMBER: Were you there? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Were you there? [Interjections.] Where were you when the Department of Land Reform - this Department Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You were not there so please... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: You were not there. Do not talk about... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, the hon member at the back there. [Interjections.] Please continue Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: When the Department of Land Reform whose job it is to make sure that those black farmers get land, their policy does not allow them to own it.

They can only rent it but that Department is supposed to be spending money in this space, guess what they did in the Land Reform Department - built a gym, built a gym in Beaufort West so at least the people who would like land can go and exercise, but they can't get any land. We spend the money on the wrong things, we give wrong policy positions, we are totally clueless from a leadership space in trying to deal with this issue and all of the issues that our country is facing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And that is why ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! There is too much noise in the House. Hon member Dijana, you cannot shout at the Minister and the

members across the floor, at will.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, please continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And that is why, Mr Deputy Speaker, that is why we are in such a crisis in this country. Do you know that we have now dropped from the top economy in Africa, we then dropped to the second when Nigeria passed us and we have just been passed again by Egypt? This is under the watch of President Zuma.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We have dropped to number 3 behind Egypt.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just one second. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask whether the hon Minister Winde, who has never before refused to take a question, will take a question now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, are you prepared to take a question? The hon Minister is prepared.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the hon Minister whether he can indicate to us how many people live in Nigeria and, secondly, how many people live in Egypt and whether it is not ... [Interjection.] and whether it is not logical economics that bigger countries with bigger populations and rising youth should not, in terms of the African renaissance, actually grow their economies. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Winde, it is a little bit off the topic but you mentioned that the first time so, if you want to.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you. That is a really good question.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And I hope the hon member is going to put this in the mayoral

campaign, because this ... [Laughter.]

The understanding of the economy straight there and then – first of all, the devaluation of the Rand, he does not understand that part. The crazy decisions by President Zuma that take our Rand to pathetic status where we start to get junk bond status. So first of all, it is lack of political leadership, what we have been talking about all along.

Secondly, his logic, where he starts off by saying if there are more people in the country surely the economy will be bigger. So if we have a house of five people in it, the economy in that house is going to be better off than a house with two people in it. He really does not understand. Before he hits the campaign trail, if it is going to be a campaign trail for a Mayor of a big city, with a massive budget, he had better start doing some Economics 101 before he even starts on that trail. [Applause.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: You have not answered the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister, get back to the topic, please. Your time has almost expired.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So it gets back to how many people are in the household in Nigeria. I mean I have heard all sorts of excuses, Mr Deputy Speaker, on why we slipped from 1 to 2. On the number of people in Nigeria – they said let us

have a look at the electricity usage. I mean everybody is thinking of every single excuse under the book to try and justify. We need good political leadership in this country if we want to change things.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time has expired. [Applause.] Order! That concludes the debate on this subject. We now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. Interpellation 1, I believe stands over. Interpellation 2, the hon member Schäfer to Minister Winde. I see the hon Minister Winde.

*[Interpellation 1 standing over.]*

*Tourism numbers and impact of visa regulations*

**2. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

(a) What are the recent numbers in tourism and (b) what impact have the visa regulations had on these figures?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member Schäfer for this question.

The tourism numbers: first of all, in South Africa quarter 2, 2015, we experienced a 9.5% decline in arrivals. These were 2.226 million visitors as

opposed to quarter 2, 2014, which were 2.015 million arrivals over the same period as opposed to 2015, so a decrease of 9.5% quarter-on-quarter.

However, in the Western Cape we saw the opposite. First of all, in March our airport numbers – this is the time of the year where, really, domestic tourism starts to pick up again, post the holiday season. Although in the main tourism season we saw that over a million passengers came through the airport in March, which shows you that our domestic programme specifically around our events, from the Jazz Festival, to the marathons, to the cycling events, to what is happening in our Convention Centres and our new Convention Centre that has just opened, that is definitely having an impact.

For the period November 2015 to February 2016 compared to the same period, November to February '14/'15, there has been an origin and destination passenger growth of 7%, that was from 696 258 to 742 621 passengers through the Cape Town International Airport. There has been a 60% increase in O&D passengers coming through Qatar, that went from 34 951 to 55 772. And again there was an increase of O&D passengers from Turkey. That was a 53% increase, that went from 36 000 to 55 000. We also saw out of the European markets, including the United Kingdom which accounted for 45% of the arrivals, at 335 274 passengers during that period.

Again, also looking at future bookings, which means that our work in seasonality is really pulling through, the USA passengers forward booking numbers were up by 23% for the period April 2016 to August 2016 compared

to the same period, April 2015 to August 2015, and that was up from 10 844 to 13 301 passengers. Also the spend, two nights or more, were up by 16% and four person bookings were up by 25%. And then of course the China bookings, they were up by 52%, which is really good to see. So some of the interventions where we are actually allowing tour operators to work with bookings and visa applications in China now have really started to reverse some of those negatives that came from the visa regulations.

So I think, quite frankly, for us in this region the national numbers, although being down, our regional numbers were up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time has expired.  
The hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is really encouraging to see that the tourism sector is showing such a good recovery. We are very resilient to some of the challenges that we have been facing since 2014 and we are really seeing a comeback after certain legislation has been lifted or really relaxed. And I think particularly, and which I must note is encouraging, the number of visitors that have come to Robben Island has increased by 24.7% because we saw a steady decline of visitors to Robben Island over a period of years and it is encouraging to see and certainly, as the Committee, we will be taking and having a look at their new management partners, Coega Development Corporation, in terms of their managing of that island because it is a very important part, not only of South Africa's cultural

history, but obviously also for the Western Cape.

To go back to visa regulations, we know that we have been struggling since 2014 and particularly under Project Khulisa Tourism as a focused, strategic, economic growth point, that was impacting on jobs. We know that one in 12 jobs is a tourism job and that Minister Gigaba's stubbornness has cost the economy hundreds of millions.

So we are very pleased with the numbers but can you imagine if those records in terms of legislation on visa regulations were lifted, what the possible numbers could have been, but I will talk to that after I have heard my colleague in the House. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Schäfer. Hon member Ms Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is no doubt that there was a decline in our tourism numbers in 2015 and that 2016 has seen an increase. The important question to ask is why there was a decline and what informs the increase.

The Democratic Alliance would like us to believe that the decline is because of the visa regulations, but the factual data at our disposal proves that this is not the truth. When we look at 1 December 2015 to 7 January 2016, there was a notable increase in travel movement compared to 2014 and 2015. In fact,

the numbers show that when compared to 2013, there was a 5.3% increase in tourism numbers in 2015 when the visa regulations were introduced, as opposed to the previous years before the introduction of the regulations.

Furthermore, the contentious issues which were raised regarding the regulations were the unabridged child birth certificates and the DA was dancing up and down, saying that this regulation will drop our tourism numbers. Surprise, surprise. The numbers for child travel were actually higher in December 2015 than they had been before the visa regulations were introduced ... [Interjections.] proving once more that the regulations of the unabridged child birth certificates did not impact the tourism numbers.

Furthermore, there have been no fundamental amendments to the unabridged birth certificate requirement and the 2016 numbers showed a peak in our tourism numbers. What does this mean? It means that the visa regulations have actually had nothing to do with the slow tourism numbers.

The real truth is that the Department of Tourism failed to sell South Africa in 2015 and instead told lies to the media that it is because of the visa regulations, deliberately overstating the role of the visa regulations. The improvement in our numbers prove that it has never been about the visa regulations.

The DA has been insensitive to the issue of child safety and national security and created problems where there are none. Winde went on a rampage and

told us thousands of jobs and billions would be lost.

An HON MEMBER: Winde?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Hon member, MEC Winde ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable, order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... went on a rampage ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just finish off, your time has expired.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes. And told us thousands of jobs and billions would be lost with these regulations. He must tell us where.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where, MEC, because the numbers for the hospitality industry actually increased?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I find it amazing that my colleague over on the other side of the House is making such rash statements and saying that we are lying because actually I have quotes here from Minister

Hanekom himself ... [Interjections.] ..and have spoken to Minister Hanekom with regard to this and, to be honest and I quote here, he has said that he:

“takes a firm stance against the implementation of unabridged birth certificates.”

He has come out publicly against the visa regulations ...

†n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... and although in his real frustration, which he reported a few days ago, he said unfortunately he just cannot seem to get the unabridged birth certificates to shift as quickly as he would like but he is just waiting, because it is a matter of time, because it was a National Cabinet decision to actually lift the onerous visa regulations. And whether that it is a battle of political and ego wills, he says the changes will happen and I will quite happily invite Minister Hanekom to come and say that because he makes it quite public in all his reports and his media statements.

And then also, just to say again I think that specific sectors of the tourism market have been impacted by visa regulations and that is that South Africa has always been seen as a family orientated destination and that is where we are finding that visa regulations negatively impact on all those people that bring their families out here to experience our beautiful countryside and

beaches and all our family destinations here. And that is where we are finding it is a problem.

So while we welcome the increased numbers in China – and that is a direct correlation, as Minister Hanekom says here and I have his budget speech – that once they did not have to go and appear in person for a visa in China, that the travel agent could actually apply for that visa instead, the numbers have absolutely quadrupled and he reckons that China will be the fastest growing sector in visitors to this country for this year. We will wait and see those numbers next year.

And I would also just like to ask the Minister whether he has had any information or research on the direct correlation between visa regulations for the tourism market and child trafficking? There cannot be a correlation. [Interjections.] We have Acts that speak to child trafficking and SAPS enforcement on that atrocious space that happens in our country and across the world, but the question really is: do tourism visa regulations ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... actually have an impact?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.  
Hon Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. There has been quite a lot put on the table here.

I think, first of all, it is quite unbelievable what was said by the hon member Davids. I am actually going to ask Hansard for a copy of that speech and send it to Mike Mabuyakhulu who probably fumes the most – he actually fumes more about the visa regulations than Derek Hanekom. I think I am going to send him a copy because that will just drive him off the edge.

There is a massive problem around the visa issues and we heard now that it made no difference to child or family travel and I think the hon member must actually ask her speech writer where he is getting these stats from, because it had a direct impact on international travel – not on local travel, so probably they are getting confused and they do not know the difference between domestic tourism and international tourism. [Interjections.]

But this is a massive issue and it really is and primarily is a massive issue because it was not about our core, previous main markets, it was about the new markets and about Africa. It was about China, it was about India, those are the biggest markets that were being hit. Those are our BRICS partners. They are the ones where we saw the biggest drop-off and the biggest effect of

these visa regulations on our system and that is what our numbers were looking at.

The hon member, Chair of the Standing Committee, said that she was encouraged by the Robben Island numbers and I too was very encouraged by the Robben Island numbers. And then she mentioned Coega and I thought I had to just say one thing about that, and this shows you again. Now I have done some research on the Coega entity. It actually performs quite well. It was set up to run an industrial development zone. If you go and have a look at what they do today – it is an Eastern Cape entity like our new one that we have just passed the legislation for, for the IDZ – it is an Eastern Cape entity that answers to the Legislature in the Eastern Cape, but they build school fences in KZN, they build clinics in the Free State, they are now doing our harbours in the Western Cape.

It is a public works implementing agency, which actually says to us that National Public Works do not know what they are doing so they are giving it to an entity to deliver their services. [Interjections.]

But you know what my problem is? They might be excellent at delivering our harbours at Robben Island and whatever; the big problem is, if they had to build a failure, if they had to build a clinic in this province and the clinic fell over and a thousand people were killed, who would have the oversight of that clinic? The Eastern Cape Legislature – and that is the main problem that I have in this space.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has unfortunately expired. Your two minute slot is done.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you. [Applause]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then proceed to questions on the Question Paper. First question again hon Minister Winde. Hon member Mngqasela to ask Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, I am just trying to find it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He is busy with his organising ... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If Minister Marais is ready with the second one, we can continue that way. Minister Marais? [Interjections.] Hon member Hinana to Minister Marais.

**QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY***Gugulethu 7 Monument, Steve Biko Road: vandalism of***2. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

- (1) Whether the vandalism of the Gugulethu 7 Monument along Steve Biko Road has been brought to her attention; if so, what is her Department's plan to protect this historic site;
- (2) whether her Department has a plan to protect heritage sites against vandalism; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Hinana, for the question. The Gugulethu 7 Monument was unveiled by the City of Cape Town on Human Rights Day, the 21<sup>st</sup> March 2005. Although I am aware of the vandalism of the Gugulethu 7 Monument, this was never officially brought to my attention as it occurred about seven, eight years ago, before I took office.

The current situation is that the granite structures are still intact while the captions, photographs and biographical information of each structure have been vandalised and removed.

The vandalism of historic sites is a challenge for all spheres of government. The reason for vandalising monuments is mainly for stripping the monuments

of valuable metals such as bronze and copper. Heritage Western Cape will engage the City of Cape Town, who is the owner of the Gugulethu 7 Monument, in order for them to consider replacing the captions with material that is of little financial value.

Furthermore, Heritage Western Cape will engage the City of Cape Town to consider putting in place a management plan for its monuments.

And then the second part of the question, in terms of the National Heritage Resources Act No. 25 of 1999, the maintenance and repair of monuments and the land on which they stand are the responsibility of the owner and the landowner respectively. At this moment the overall management responsibility of the Gugulethu 7 Monument lies with the City of Cape Town. However, it is important that when any sphere of government and its entities have erected monuments, communities take ownership of them, protect them and use them as cornerstones of social inclusion.

As a Provincial Government we also encourage communities to use public monuments as a stimulus for economic opportunities, for example heritage tourism.

Given that the Gugulethu 7 occupies such an historical and important role in the healing process and in building an inclusive Western Cape, Heritage Western Cape will consider declaring this site a Provincial Heritage Site. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. Ja, I accept the response that you gave, especially that the Western Cape Province should encourage the community to use such monuments as a source of tourism, but I want to ask the Minister: what can be done or what can the Department do in order to protect the environment where those monuments are? As they are now, they are exposed, they are not fenced, they are not protected. Whoever wants to pass, whoever wants to steal those granite stones, it is easy for them because there is no protection and several times they have been rebuilt. What is lacking is that there is no protection and the value of those people who died there, needs to be protected. Can the protection of that site be one of the priorities of the Department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: As I have said, this is mainly the responsibility of the City of Cape Town, but given that Gugulethu 7 occupies such an historic and important role, as I have said already, in building an inclusive Western Cape, the Heritage Western Cape will consider declaring this site as a Provincial Heritage Site. And I think we must engage the community to let them know what the value of these monuments are and I think that is the only way that we can get their co-operation in protecting these monuments.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there another follow-up? Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. My question to the MEC: I want to know is there any plan from the Department, in relation to public participation, to people knowing exactly what the seven people who are part of this monument did?

An HON MEMBER: That is a new question.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Is there any plan in terms of public participation, in terms of the community? Is there any plan from the Department?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the City of Cape Town.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I think the question is clear. Hon Minister Marais?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: It is a new question but if we do proclaim it as a Provincial Heritage Site we will have public participation.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then go back to the first question.

Hon Minister Winde?

*Energy Game Changer: implementation of*

**1. Mr M Mngasela asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

Whether his Department has dedicated champions in the identified local municipalities to promote its endeavour to implement the Energy Game Changer; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I apologise to you and the House for not being ready for that question. The answer was hiding somewhere between Tasheel RSA Limited, Intersite Investments, visas and the Guptas and the Duduzani Zuma companies, but I have managed to find it.

An HON MEMBER: And the Mayor.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, nothing to do with the Mayor. Can I say to the hon Mngasela, thank you for the question?

Last year the Premier announced that the Western Cape Government would embark on an Energy Game Changer to stabilise electricity supply following the inability of Eskom to ensure this. Eskom's failure had a highly negative impact on the economy and investment and we have stepped in to mitigate

these effects.

The Energy Security Game Changer was partnered with six municipalities in the Western Cape and is prioritising its initial work with these municipalities. The municipalities were chosen on the basis of their size, as their aggregate electricity consumption represents the majority of consumption in the Western Cape. The six municipalities are: the City of Cape Town, Saldanha Bay, Drakenstein, Stellenbosch, Mossel Bay and George.

The Western Cape Government, together with Green Cape, has worked intensively with these municipalities to ensure that they put in place the necessary by-law, policy and tariff that will enable rooftop solar photovoltaic installations.

The main resource champion of these municipalities has been the electrical services manager who is supported by the relevant municipal manager and chief financial officer as policies and tariffs need to be developed and implemented.

The Western Cape Government and Green Cape have also liaised with local municipalities with a view to putting the necessary legal framework in place. In these engagements the primary point of contact has been the electrical services manager.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to Question number 3.  
Hon member Hinana to Minister Plato. Hon Minister Plato?

*Crime hotspots*

**3. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Where are the main crime hotspots in the province which his Ministry has prioritised in terms of its capacity to deal with violent crimes?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much and also to the hon member for the question.

The Department of Community Safety has prioritised the following policing precincts in terms of its mandate as crime hotspot areas. There are a number of them outside of the metropolitan area: Paarl East, Saldanha Bay, Villiersdorp, Worcester, Beaufort West, Touws River, Oudtshoorn and, I need to say for other categories, other towns might fit in if we are talking about certain other criminal activities in some other areas as well.

In the metro we are looking at Khayelitsha, Masiphumelele, Nyanga, Gugulethu, Mitchells Plain, Kraaifontein, Manenberg, Delft, Philippi East and that includes Hanover Park, also Bishop Lavis, Mfuleni, Atlantis and Cape Town Central. Here we are talking about crimes such as murder, drug-related crimes, attempted murder and assault and so forth. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Follow-up, hon Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I want to check with you, those priorities, in those identified hotspots, have they yielded results for reducing crime and what is the nature of the priorities that assisted in terms of fighting crime?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are working very closely with the police. You must understand, the first entity in the country to fight crime or any form of crime is the South African Police Services.

We unfortunately do not have any investigative powers and operational policing powers, but through our programmes, through our projects, we try to intervene as far as possible. We do also receive requests from police to zoom into an area with our programmes and projects and we do that on a week-to-week basis. There are results; from time to time some good results, but we even go back to an area more than once due to the criminal nature of a specific area. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Lekker, a follow-up?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Having noted that Masiphumelele has been identified as one of the hotspots, are there any preventative measures that have been put in place, by the Department, in

ensuring that SAPS is supported in fighting crime in Masiphumelele?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: [Inaudible.] Mitchells Plain.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, as I have said, programmes and projects. The South African Police Services did recently, a couple of weeks ago, put a satellite police station in Masiphumelele to try its best to curb crime. Currently they are looking for a piece of land to build a fully-fledged police station but once again, what we can provide, as I have stated before, are programmes and projects – yes, we are doing that even in Masiphumelele.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No further – is there a follow-up question?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, you can continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Minister has not actually responded as to whether there is any form of support rendered to SAPS by his Department. That was my question. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I don't think the member has listened to what I have said. I answered that question already. Again, we do

not investigate. We have no [Interjections.] operational control over the police. That is why I am saying programmes and projects, alongside the police, are exactly what we are doing. Thank you. [Interjections.] Open your ears, then you will hear. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! We then proceed to the following question. Order, hon member Lekker. Next question, [Interjections.] Question number 4, Minister Madikizela?

*Free housing*

**4. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

- (1) Whether the National Minister of Human Settlements has indicated that free housing to all is not a sustainable option; if so,
- (2) whether his Department has any strategic and innovative plans to respond to this statement; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Whether the National Minister of Human Settlements has indicated that free housing to all is not sustainable: yes ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, no. The current Minister - on 21 October 2014 the National Minister of Human Settlements, Ms Lindiwe Sisulu, indicated that Government free housing projects were not sustainable. She further indicated that, I quote:

“Our intention in giving free houses was to right the wrongs of the past and make sure that we can give our people dignity and that group of people are not people below the age of 40. You, the young people, have lost nothing.

I am quoting what the Minister said, just bear with me:

“You, the young people, have lost nothing to apartheid. None of you are ever going to get a free house.”

Now you can go to [www.news24.com](http://www.news24.com) to get ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us welcome the Speaker [Inaudible.] first. She is in the House. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN ... to get that statement. But to further qualify what the Minister was saying, Mr Deputy Speaker, because I do not want to give the impression here that there are different views between myself and the Minister because I have also been saying this – to contextualise this. We were very disturbed and I think all of us, to see the skewed patterns of

housing allocation where you still have very old people, 60, 70 - in fact there are people up to 100 years who are still waiting; when you have younger people in their 20s receiving houses from the State. And then the Minister said we need to prioritise older people first, and so this is the context of the statement that she made.

Now the second part of the question, what are the plans; whether my Department has any strategic and innovative plans to respond to this statement? Yes, I think we have. That is why, if you look at our strategic goals in the province, we have three strategic goals.

The first one is to make sure that those people who are living under bad conditions, whether they are over 40 or under 40 - we have got to make sure that informal settlements are improved and upgraded by making sure that there are access roads when there are fires, there is water, there is sanitation, there is electricity – that is what we are doing, because we believe that way before you get a house, you must improve your living conditions. That is the first thing.

The second thing, in line with that statement by the Minister, we are now addressing the skewed pattern of housing allocation. Well, we are saying: let us start with older people, disabled people [Interjection.] when we allocate houses.

And thirdly, we are now dealing with the challenges that exist in the affordable market so that we can really strike a balance, because if we build more and more free houses and don't balance it with those people who are earning just above the threshold, we are running the risk of creating poverty traps for municipalities. So those are strategic interventions that we have made in response to the statement by the Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Is there a follow-up question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, I just want to ask the Minister: did the National Minister say you should interfere with projects that were already there, even prior to that particular statement she uttered? Did she say you must interfere with projects that were already there and already in process of being implemented and then change the beneficiaries on that basis? Did she say that?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, your response?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I do not know how to respond to this question, honestly, because it is not very clear.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me make it clear.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I do not understand what you mean by interfering?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Sit down.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon member Magaxa, I do not think it is your place to tell the Minister to sit down. I will manage the proceedings. You may ask your second question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I just want to ask, Sir, did the National Minister give you authority to interfere in projects, including changing beneficiaries on projects that were already in place and being implemented, even prior to the statement being made?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me first make the hon member understand that I do not need to be instructed by the Minister to do anything. [Applause.] I understand my responsibility as outlined in the Constitution. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I understand my responsibility as clearly stipulated in the Constitution.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The issue of the existing projects, let me perhaps explain that. The existing projects that were there even before the statement was made, simply said to me – which was the right thing to do – that if those projects are under construction, whether they were approved before or after the statement, but the allocation has not been made yet, it was an opportunity for me to do the right thing.

In fact, I have been saying this way before the Minister even made this statement, that we cannot continue with a situation where we prioritise younger people over older people. In fact, I made the same statement as early as 2012. So when the Minister made that statement she was actually saying something I have already said. So it is not interference; it is an intervention to make sure that the right thing is done, that mistakes are corrected. So it is within my powers, as the responsible person in this project for Human Settlements, to make sure that if certain things are not done correctly, I then intervene – not interfere, intervene and make sure that they are done correctly.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Magaxa.

An HON MEMBER: She has woken up, eh? Eh?

The SPEAKER: I see you, hon member Maseko, for a follow-up and then we will have the next one.

Ms L M MASEKO: Yes. Hon Minister, I just want to find out because we have a programme of sustainability versus the physical allocation landscape as it is now. Are the strategic and innovative plans that the Department has in place now going to be [Inaudible.] or will there be a challenge in implementing those strategies that we have in the Department?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Chairperson. I have partly touched on that, because we have about 16 programmes within the Housing Code. That simply means that looking at the challenges, you can then identify programmes that will assist you to deal with the challenges, taking into cognizance the limited resources that you have.

So the critical question that I have to answer is: which programmes can assist us, as Government, to deal with the plight of the people and make sure that we get to as many people as possible and that is why I spoke about UISP, which is the Upgrading of Informal Settlements Programme. Because if you use that programme to deal with the plight of the people there, you are able to assist as many people as possible because if your focus is only going to be on one programme where you build top structures, you run the risk – I mean we spoke about the rate of population growth here – of assisting very few people year in and year out. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Please, hon Minister, would you care to take your seat, please?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is just too difficult to hear because of the two Ministers here who are on another cruise altogether.

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are not here.

The SPEAKER: Ministers Winde and Grant, a request has been made, if I could ask you to manage your conversation.

†n AGB LID: Dis lid Gopie wat praat, nie hulle nie.

[An HON MEMBER: It is member Gopie speaking, not them.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That was a frivolous interjection. The racket coming from him is double our quiet conversation in the bench. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dyantyi, I trust I have addressed the

situation. Can we get quiet on both sides of the House, please? Thank you.  
Hon Minister, you may proceed. [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We are having a little [Inaudible.] meeting right now.

The SPEAKER: Order. *That* is irrelevant. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So what we are saying here, just to respond directly to the Chairperson, in terms of the strategic interventions, is that, one, we must upgrade informal settlements, make sure that people are waiting under improved conditions because current conditions in many areas are really appalling. That is the first thing.

Secondly, is to make sure that we correct the skewed pattern in terms of housing allocation, prioritise the right people. That is the second intervention. And, thirdly, to address the plight of those people who earn too much to qualify for a free house but too little to qualify for a bond from the bank. So those are three strategic interventions that we have made. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes.

The SPEAKER: This is the final question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, it is the second.

The SPEAKER: The final follow-up question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon MEC Bonginkosi Madikizela, is it true that you are interfering – I think that is the relevant word, not intervening, interfering – with projects that are already in the planning process and so on, for example, the project in Site B had prior beneficiaries, cutting across age. Now, is it correct therefore to interfere when the project had its own beneficiaries, PHP, for example?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Okay, let me try and slowly explain this to the member. The processes of a PHP project starts with the identification of beneficiaries, workshopping them, putting together a business plan and forwarding that business plan as an application to the Department.

Now, the fact that you have a business plan with the names on it of people who might be 18 and 19 does not necessarily mean we are compelled, as Government, to prioritise those people. It does not mean that at all. So we can then make sure, look at that business plan, look at the composition or the

profile of it and look at the individuals that are there and take a decision.

Let me just give an example, if you are on a beneficiary business plan of 200 people and out of those 200 people, fifty are younger than 40, you can then say: we are going to approve this project with 150 beneficiaries, because what needs to be understood here is that we look at this globally, not just at the specific area. Because you cannot give a house to a 21-year-old in Site B when there is a 70-year-old in Wallacedene waiting for a house.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Even if he doesn't have parents?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So, but that is what I said – no, no, if you do not have kids you do not qualify for a house at all. You do not qualify for a house at all if you do not have kids.

Mr K E MAGAXA: If you have got kids that are [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, you are not a priority, so ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon member Magaxa, the Minister is responding to your question, thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister. You cannot engage the Minister while he is responding. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I was 25, by the way, when I

had my first child – that is the point, you know, that many people do not understand. The fact that you have kids, if you have kids and you are 21 and there is a 50-year-old who has got kids as well, the priority is that 50-year-old because that person has been waiting far longer than you. That is the point that we are making here.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He is a DA member too.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So the issue is not whether ... [Interjections.] ... you qualify or not, the issue is whether you are a priority or not ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... in terms of the criteria that we are using. That is the difference. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order please, hon members. We now move to Question number 5 and that is to Minister Winde.

*Emerging fruit farmers*

**5. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

A new fund to support emerging fruit farmers has been established: (a) what impact will the fund have on job creation in the Western Cape's citrus industry and (b) how will the fund promote farming opportunities in previously disadvantaged communities?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Perhaps before I answer and I do not know if I am allowed to abuse this space, but there was a question here about whether the person, a 50-year-old, is a DA member. The reason is that most people in this province are DA. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] So, thank you to the hon member Schäfer for this question. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have not said [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is how you get into power. Thank you very much for this question. First of all, the interventions through the fund are targeted, not at the citrus industry or this was for the fruit industry, but in actual fact it is within the fruit industry and they are the deciduous fruit industry such as pome, apples and pears and stone fruit: apricots, peaches, nectarines and plums, so that is where the main focus is. At this stage we project that 550 new jobs would be created through this intervention, 24 smallholder groups have been identified to benefit from this fund, targeted at 100% black owned entities, four of which are based in the Eastern Cape.

The planned interventions will assist in the commercialisation of these entities through increased production and access to formal markets, both domestic and export, and in addition these farmers will receive continuous mentorship from their commercial counterparts – those are the partners in this deal – and through the Department’s commodity approach.

And then (b), the jobs fund is aimed at the commercialisation of smallholder farmers, mainly beneficiaries of land reform programmes. The majority of these are targeted at our rural and previously disadvantaged communities and this is where employment opportunities will be created.

The targeted projects are in three fruit producing districts of the Western Cape, namely the Overberg, the Cape Winelands and the Eden District.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any follow-up questions?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to know what is the contribution from the Western Cape Department to this R120 million. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Obviously what happens when – I am not sure if the hon member knows how a jobs fund application happens and it has got to be a partnership. So the partnership in this case is commercial farmers, through Hortgro, which is the membership body. Our Department was involved in the submission

through to National Treasury and it forms part of our bigger programme for which we have invested R259 million, so it is part of that programme where we help emerging farmers.

We will obviously be involved from a support basis, like extension officers and any area around commercialisation and that will link through to our funded programme, through Khulisa, as well as linked in to Wesgro, where we have an agricultural desk, because it is about creating an enabling environment for these farmers to get market access, both locally and internationally.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-up questions?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, my specific question: what is the amount that the Department has contributed towards the R120 million, because the commercial farmers have contributed R20 million, the National Department has contributed an amount – what was the contribution from the Western Cape Department in this deal?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So the initial R120 million is exactly as the hon member has said, so our contribution has been in kind, in the production of the actual application. We were involved in six applications, I think, to the jobs fund

and our support now comes at the second round and it is critical that that support is part of the decision making process that National Treasury wants to see.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further follow-up questions? Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Just a yes or a no, through you, Madam Speaker, to the MEC. Was the Department involved from the beginning of this deal or did they just come on board? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Are you asking was the Department involved from the beginning of this scheme? Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, please. If there are no further follow-up questions I will move to Question 6 and the question is to Minister Schäfer.

*Garden Route Primary School: overcrowded classrooms*

**\*6. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Education:**

- (a) What the situation is regarding overcrowded classrooms at the Garden Route Primary School, Mossel Bay, (b) how and (c) when will the problem be addressed?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Garden Route Primary School experienced strong growth in demand in the foundation phase in 2016. WCED has allocated four mobile classrooms to the school to meet this growth in demand. The contractor was handed the site on 13 April 2016 and is currently completing the installation of the mobile classrooms which will be ready for use in two weeks' time.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-up questions? I see the hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thanks for the answer. May I ask the MEC: the mobile classrooms; the four that you referred to, is that the final solution and do you plan to put up a second school in the Asla area?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We are experiencing extreme growth in the entire area. At the moment we are looking at using mobiles that have been at Phakamisani Primary School. There is a school identified, there was a UAMP meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup> April and Mossel Bay was identified for a new primary school in Asla Park, but I do not have dates yet as to when it is going to be built.

The SPEAKER: Honourable Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, will there be additional educators as well? Seeing that there will be four additional mobile classrooms and if it is not sufficient, would you look at additional educators?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As the member well knows, we are under incredible budgetary constraints as a result of the nationally negotiated wage increases as well as the financial situation. We are battling to keep up with the teachers that we need at the moment. I cannot guarantee that there will be at this point. We are doing everything possible to try and cut funding everywhere we can, to provide extra teachers everywhere we need them but we do not have enough for everywhere.

The SPEAKER: A third question?

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I want to ask the MEC: that additional allocation from National, that R50 million, I am sure you are aware of that, that you received the last month or so – what proportion will go to this specific primary school and how would you utilise that for Garden Route Primary School?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Madam Speaker, that is an entirely new question. I have to get you the answer, I do not have the proportion with me, whether it is going to that particular school or not. I know it was used for

invoices which we had from the last financial year already that we had actually overspent.

The SPEAKER: No further questions. Hon member Olivier, this is the final follow-up.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, given the response now by the MEC to this question, is the approach across the province going to be that where we have got this challenge, the solution from the Department will be mobile classes? I believe that we now have constraints, not only at this primary school but it cuts across the whole province. So is the approach therefore that to alleviate this problem it will be mobile classrooms besides the other planned schools already?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Madam Speaker, we have, as the member knows, detailed UAMP which is the five-year plan for building schools across the province. We are building new schools all the time. We have handed over about another two already so far this year, so it is not the only solution but it certainly is a solution and where we have large numbers of learners at a school we will use mobile classrooms where we have to, because we simply do not have enough money to build a new school everywhere we go.

As you know, we had an additional 25 000 learners coming into the province this year and we simply do not have money to build 25 new schools per year,

nor do we have the ability to build that many schools in one year in any case.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We now move to Question 7. Minister of Human Settlements.

*George Municipality: housing allocation, reduction of*

**\*7. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Why the housing allocation to the George Municipality has been reduced for the 2015/16 financial year?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Why has the housing subsidy to George Municipality been reduced? I need to perhaps correct the question. The housing subsidies remain the same across the country. It was not the housing subsidy that was reduced, it was the indicative figure in terms of the allocation that was reduced and the main reason for that is that as is normally the case in various projects.

The Thembalethu Informal Settlement Upgrade Project was delayed at the procurement stage and one of the reasons why it was delayed, through you Madam Speaker, to hon member Uys, is that the municipality had different plans in terms of how to build these houses in Thembalethu but the community had other plans.

For example, I was just there, I think three weeks ago, where I had a meeting

with the beneficiaries who are insisting that they prefer PAC instead of contractor built. So it is one of the reasons why the project was then delayed. And as is normally the case, if there are delays in a specific municipality or a specific project, we then use the money elsewhere. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Follow-up question, hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thanks, MEC. The George Municipality, in official documents, indicated that there was a delay in the approval by your Department and the delay was really with the PAC, that committee. Can you just tell us who is the PAC and why was there a delay in the approval for George Municipality?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. The PAC is the Project Approval Committee in my Department but I think, as I said, this problem – through you, Madam Speaker – of people not being happy with the option that was taken, because as you would know, hon member Uys, that when we build houses we use different approaches. For example, we follow the procurement process, we appoint the contractor or we use the provision in the policy as well – I spoke about PHP – where beneficiaries themselves have a choice in terms of the service provider that they want to build for.

So because there was this unhappiness, they ended up even writing a letter to

me, the beneficiaries, and after receiving that letter obviously we could not proceed and go ahead because in any case, even if we went ahead, appointed the contractor, we were going to face massive resistance from the community, which is normally the case.

I strongly believe that if people are especially asking for something that is within the policy of Human Settlements, we have got to accede to that request. Where we are now, I think I will be going to George on the 23<sup>rd</sup>, if I am not mistaken, to make sure that within the policy we agree that those people who prefer PHP are actually given what they want.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon member Uys

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, clearly, MEC, when there is a cut from R60 million to R20 million, it cannot just be because of the beneficiaries. I mean this is not the first time now that we are reinventing the wheel. Why the cut of R40 million to George's community and how are we going to catch up on that?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Perhaps I need to also clarify this, Madam Speaker, that municipalities do not get a housing allocation, because again there seems to be confusion here. Housing or Human Settlements is a concurrent function between National and Provincial Government, not municipalities. No municipality accounts for housing, by the way.

When they allocate funding, we give indicative figures. It does not mean that we are entitled to that money. Based on the business plan that we receive from municipalities, we give indicative figures, that in this financial year this is what we are going to get.

Now if there are delays and there are problems, we can easily shift that money to a project that is moving. The first choice is, we tell the municipality, if there is no project that is moving, we shift it to another municipality.

But, by the way, George Municipality - in fact, if you look at their track record, they actually received more than the allocation that was due to them or indicative figure that was due to them because of this as well. There were projects in other municipalities that were not moving; we ended up taking the money to George.

So it is a normal practice in the human settlement space where, as the Department of Human Settlements, at this level, we have to make sure that the money is spent within the province. The reason for R40 million, hon member Pierre Uys, is because this is where the biggest chunk of this money was going to be spent in Thembalethu. Thembalethu is one of the catalytic projects that were identified jointly by the National and Provincial Government, where we will be building about 15 000 houses and this portion of houses that we are talking about form part of the catalytic project.

So that is why such a big chunk of money was spent, our intention was to spend it there. How we are going to catch up? I mean again at the beginning of the financial year, because Thembaletu is a catalytic project, that simply means that more money, especially in all catalytic projects, will be dedicated to areas like Thembaletu.

So we have not lost that money *per se* but, as I said, the fact that they are losing it now, we know that it is an issue in George but some municipalities lost it in the past and George benefited. So it is a normal practice.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. This is the final follow-up.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. MEC, thank you. Are you now convinced that the project is on track again and when can we see some progress in terms of the project being implemented?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. As I said, hon member, before the end of this month, I am just not sure and I think I will share this information with you, I think on the 23<sup>rd</sup> we have a meeting with the municipality, with the beneficiaries, because at the last meeting we took a resolution to say that beneficiaries must get what they want.

If they want PHP, they must get that because it is part of our policy. So what they have done now is to consolidate the list of the beneficiaries and at the

next meeting verify that list and reallocate the funding so that we can continue with the project. So I am very much confident that we are track. We will start that project very soon.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now move to Members' Statements. I see the DA.

**STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:**

Mr D JOSEPH: The recent NCOP, Taking Parliament to the People, follow up visit to Eden District was a good example of good governance in the Western Cape. Reports presented by the leaders of the delegation, all ANC members, indicated that good progress has been made by National Departments, Provincial Departments and Local Government.

The Chairperson of the NCOP, hon Modise, described the NCOP follow-up visit to Eden District Municipality as satisfactory progress in all spheres. The focus was on the people, not on political parties, were her exact words. The Western Cape Government will ensure that the outstanding issues and concerns that were raised will be dealt with.

Madam Speaker, this is a clear example of how other provinces can show good governance and good leadership. This was a clear demonstration thereof. I take this opportunity to thank the staff of the NCOP, as well as the staff of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, for the part they played in

making Taking Parliament to the People a positive experience. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Joseph. I see the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Once again, and I am sorry that the Chief Whip is not here, Madam Speaker, because I do not like to talk when he is not. Once again the DA Chief Whip was found wanting in terms of interpreting laws and regulations and in this case the interpretation of what the powers and functions of the Public Accounts Committee is. The bullying tactics employed and fear instilled in members of this House to defy the Chief Whip has once again raised its unpleasant consequences.

In spite of what the Standing Rules regarding committees say, the Chief Whip on the day came running to intervene in a decision that SCOPA wanted to take which was quite within its mandate. There are in the Standing Rules three sections that spell out what SCOPA as a Committee is entitled to do.

The one is in Chapter 8 of the Standing Rules that deals with spelling out which committees this Parliament has and specifically Rule 69, under Chapter 8, gives the Public Accounts Committee legitimacy.

The second one is Rule 87 which spells out the general rules of committees and the final one which spells out the specific rules that apply to Public Accounts as a committee is Chapter 3 and specifically rule 98. Its composition is determined by Chapter 2 and Rule 74 and by the way, Madam

Speaker, the heading of Rule 74 as it stands is also incorrect because the heading refers to number of committees as opposed to the number of members to a committee so I hope that the relevant committee will deal with that amendment.

These specific rules were what we as the ANC members used to support the decision to have a prevalent matter of Scottsdene's School brought on to the agenda by summoning the Minister of Transport and Public Works and his Department to come and explain. Member Wiley's incorrect advice and intervention caused a fracas in the meeting which ended up in us having to vote on the matter. So today we are back on that topic because at our SCOPA meeting yesterday, we as the ANC were vindicated by means of a letter from the Acting Secretary confirming that we as the ANC were indeed correct in our interpretation of the rules that govern the Public Accounts Committee.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, you have two minutes allocated for statements. You have run out of time.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Can I just finish, Madam Speaker? We have continuously reminded the back benchers of the DA that their purpose in this House by means of questions and statements and inputs is an oversight role, not one of praise singing and being stifled by the Chief Whip because they want to create opportunities for Cabinet to grandstand about things they already know.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Beerwinkel. I now see the DA.

Ms L J BOTHA: The House notes that today, South Africa, alongside other countries in the world over, celebrates International Nurses Day, under the theme ‘Nurses: A force for change: improving health systems’ resilience.’

Today we pay tribute to the commitment and the dedication shown by nurses in the Western Cape and elsewhere towards the realisation of a health system that delivers quality care to all patients. Further we also acknowledge that health systems are only as strong as the people in them and people can only perform at their best in a safe and secure environment.

We further acknowledge that crime and violence are a societal issue which threatens the effective functioning of the health system and thereby all people in the Western Cape. It is therefore important that the House welcomes the appointment of the Deputy Provincial Commissioner for the South African Police Services, Major General Patekile, to the Western Cape Provincial Health Council to assist the Department with the fight against crime at health facilities.

We believe that by working together, not only with SAPS, but with other departments, civil society and most importantly, communities, we will be able to meet the threat that often presents itself at our door, thus to ensure that our nurses and other health workers are protected and are able to function in a safe and secure environment. Madam Speaker, I thank you.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi, mooi, mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good, good!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the EFF I see the DA.

†'n AGB LID: Hulle is nooit hier nie. [Onhoorbaar.]

[An HON MEMBER: They are never here. [Inaudible.]]

Ms M M WENGER: In tabling the budget of the South Africa Police Services, Police Minister Nhleko gave a commitment to better policing and particularly visible policing. He spoke about crime and Back-to-Basics. One of the three pillars of his approach is to enhance police visibility and “more officers in uniform”.

This would be welcome because the Western Cape has a severe shortage of police officers. We have vacancies in the thousands and 85% of our stations are understaffed.

But, Madam Speaker, the Minister said one thing and budgeted for another. Crime is a priority in our country and province. The population is growing and therefore the number of police officers should grow as well. We would have hoped to see additional allocations of 10 or 20 000 more officers nationwide. But if we look at the budget between now and 2019, South Africa will get a net total of 20 more officers. Not 20 000, 20. Two zero.

There will be no increase for the next three years in the number of crime intelligence officers and no increase for the next three years in the number of visible police officers. This is a serious oversight in how the national police budget has been allocated. 20 additional posts over 3 years for our country is not enough. Our communities are not safe, they are not safe enough for the National Government not to increase the number of police officers.

We owe it to the men and women in blue who put their lives on the line each day for us and who, despite difficult circumstances, fight on to make our communities safer. We owe it to them to ask the Minister and his Department to go back to the drawing board, to reprioritise the police budget and make a better plan for our police. Thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, today the ANC would like the House to note that this DA-led Government continues to obstruct the fight against crime and refused to testify against gangsters like the Cape Town Councillor, Barbara Ras, and that others like Willie Jaftha pleaded for a softer sentence for a convicted murderer of a dangerous gang in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Oh yes, oh yes!

Ms P Z LEKKER: They make it difficult for SAPS and the criminal justice system to secure proper sentences... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... for hardened criminals that terrorise our communities and therefore, as the African National Congress, we are here today calling on the Standing Committee on Community Safety to have a full briefing with the Western Cape Education Department's manager on its programme on safer schools and show us the directives to deal with, amongst other things, dangerous weapons, searching, access control, crime reduction and plans or reactions to other emergencies at schools; and that the Community Safety Department reports on measures to assist ... [Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: What about Fransman?

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: .... schools and the implementation of policies like the Integrated Gang Strategy for youth at risk; and calls on MEC Dan Plato to desist from befriending hardened criminals that elevates them to role models for youth prone to follow in the footsteps of gang lords and drug dealers in the area. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: What about Fransman?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ACDP.

Mr R B LENTIT: The justice system, Fransman.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape wants to voice its concern after receiving complaints about the requirements of certain tender processes at Groote Schuur Hospital. It is very clear that the recent tender requirements set out by the Department of Health for Groote Schuur Hospital clearly discriminate against religious businesses.

Businesses were invited to bid for the opportunity to deliver food, such as fresh bread and poultry for a one year period. However, one of the requirements are that they must all produce Halaal certificates and all businesses must be Halaal. The Groote Schuur tender meeting which was scheduled to take place on Wednesday, the 20<sup>th</sup> of April 2016, was subsequently cancelled due to numerous businesses protesting against these requirements. The businesses believe that the tender requirements are discriminatory in nature against other religions.

The ACDP in the Western Cape expresses its concern and believes that these prejudicial requirements for what clearly is a public tender is unacceptable. The tender requirements show a lack of religious tolerance toward businesses that are not selling Halaal certified products, nor operate from Halaal certified premises.

We believe that businesses should openly have the right to tender, irrespective of whether their products are Halaal or not. Furthermore, the ACDP in the Western Cape feels that all the businesses should equally compete for a public tender.

We urge the Minister to review the tender requirements so that everyone can benefit. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Members if I may, when I saw the ANC I went straight to the ACDP without recognising the DA. So if I can just self correct I would like to see the DA, after which I will see the ANC and then we will finish with the DA. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is fine. The ACDP and the DA together, that is fine.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, last weekend we celebrated Mother's Day and I would like to take this opportunity to wish all mothers a belated a Mother's Day. I am honoured to have been raised by a single mother and grandmother. Both played a pivotal role in shaping the man I have become and for that I am eternally grateful.

†'n Huis is niks sonder 'n moeder nie. [A home is nothing without a mother.]  
Despite the many challenges facing the women in our communities, mothers have always played a leading role in raising and educating children. Their

resilience was also shown when they were at the forefront of the liberation struggle and at the forefront of our lives. Indeed as the saying goes †‘wathinta umfazi wathinta imbokodo’. [You touch a woman, you touch a rock.]

I therefore would like to celebrate and honour the women in this House and in Cape Town, South Africa and indeed in Africa and the rest of the world, and thank them for the role they have played in ensuring that we have a bright future. As men in this House and in this country, let us play an active role. We need to support and protect the women in our lives and communities at large.

Madam Speaker, I say this because too often we read stories of crimes committed against women and children and it is sad to see that as men we allow this sort of thing to happen. Domestic violence and abuse against women has a direct impact on the lives and the future of our children. We not only destroy the women but ultimately destroy the young ones and we destroy our future.

So in support of women in our society I would like to stand here and say:

#NotInMyName. In the words of Antjie Krog:

†“Ma ek skryf vir jou ‘n gedig.

Sonder fensie leestekens, sonder woorde wat rym.

Sonder bywoorde.

Net sommer ‘n kaalvoet gedig.”

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

“Mother, I am writing a poem for you.

Without fancy punctuation, without words that rhyme.

Without adverbs.

Just merely a barefoot poem.”

I would like to add: †Moeders ons stuur ons liefde sonder fensie voorbehoud, net ons kaalvoet liefde. [Mothers, we send love without fancy reservation, simply our barefoot love.]

†Viva amanina. [Long live women.] †Vorentoe moeders vorentoe. [Forward, mothers, forward.] Rise Mothers Rise. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The ANC celebrates the victory of the applicants against the Western Cape Provincial Government regarding the sale of the Tafelberg property. For many years domestic and other workers who rent in Sea Point have been saving up to take advantage of social housing within the

CBD and Sea Point in particular. Instead of a clear strategy of land release of well located provincial and municipal land for integrated housing, the DA has avoided doing this at all costs.

Instead, they have cherry picked a few prime pieces of State land for disposal to create an impression that they want to push back apartheid special legacies. Nothing, Madam Speaker, could be further from the truth. The DA promised us all an integrated housing strategy. She then misled the House saying that it had been done. Then she said MEC Madikizela was busy with it. Then we saw an advert calling for consultants to do it. It is now 2016, two years later and we have no integrated plan using State land. [Interjection.] There is no political will. Simply put, the DA is actively opposed to provide social and affordable housing in the City. They are beholden to certain selected property developers. They are beholden to greed. They have been captured.

It is time for a broad coalition, across party political alliance, working with Reclaim the City and Ndifuna Ukwazi, to come forward with plans not only to provide social and affordable housing on well located State land and also private land, and not only in Tafelberg. You cannot bemoan the apartheid legacy in this the most divided city in South Africa and do nothing about changing this reality.

As the ANC, we support the calling of an all-in conversation of social housing groups, property owners, PHP projects, backyard dwellers,

Department of Public Works and Property to advance the campaign to integrate the City. We need all spheres of government, parastatals and private land owners to attend and we must be guided by the need to provide well located land for integrated human settlement.

We must expose narrow agendas that put super profit ahead of basic needs. This is about confronting our past, being honest about the inherited white privilege that continues to exist. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to make an appeal to those who offer to purchase Tafelberg, I am appealing to them, to please meet directly with Reclaim the City and the domestic workers and hear their pain. Let us move our country forward together, starting in Tafelberg. There shall be houses, security and comfort for all.

An HON MEMBER: That is political posturing.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Madam Speaker, the hon member just referred to the Premier as having misled the House. I believe that is unparliamentarily and is casting aspersions on her character which should be done by way of a substantive motion.

The SPEAKER: I will peruse Hansard hon Minister and I will revert with a ruling. At the same time, hon member Dugmore, if I may address you? I have allowed you to present your member's statement even though there is already a Notice of Motion appearing on the Order Paper as moved in the previous sitting, which then means that I have allowed you to continue but the matter is on the Order Paper to be discussed in the House. So, the probability of it coming forward would in effect mean that I should have not allowed the statement to be made. I just thought I would alert you to the guidelines once a motion is on the Order Paper; what the process is to be followed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I thought I would just address you on that. I think, Madam Speaker, in your absence, you would recall that I wrote to your office and was responded to by the Deputy Speaker, requesting as a matter of urgent public importance and notwithstanding various interpretations of the *sub judice* rule that in fact this House does debate the Tafelberg issue. You would recall, as I am sure the Deputy Speaker referred to you, that that was refused. I was not allowed. And although it does appear on the Order Paper, there does not appear to be any indication of a willingness of the Programming Authority, led by the Chief Whip, to allow this debate to happen. So respecting the *sub judice* rule I just wanted to make that point.

The SPEAKER: It will be scheduled for programming as I said in my guidance. I cannot give you an exact date. That will need to be agreed. The final statement is the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you. Madam Speaker, as a member of Parliament, a representative of our people and a mother, I am concerned that we are losing sight of the project of reconciliation.

From hurtful racism on social media platforms to incitements to violence that we hear from late-comer political parties.

Why are South Africans choosing to talk themselves into chaos? Why are we volunteering to move away from reconciliation towards racial and political intolerance? I do not think that we are taking seriously enough the threat that intolerance poses to our own safety and that of our children.

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

Ms L M MASEKO: To be unwilling to work together in nation building because of racial or political differences is an instance of intolerance. It is a step towards hatred and towards violence. Violence that destroys public goods like infrastructure. Violence that hurts and kills our youth.

We are unwilling to listen to one another. We prejudge one another but we refuse to listen to one another. We are depriving ourselves of diversity.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L M MASEKO: It is South African's greatest asset. We must reconnect.

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. Hon member Magaxa, we have a member on the floor. If you would afford the member the opportunity to present her statement. Hon member Magaxa. Thank you. You may proceed hon member.

Ms M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am saying that we are unwilling to listen to one another. We prejudge one another but we refuse to listen to one another. We are depriving ourselves of diversity. It is South Africa's greatest asset. We must reconnect ourselves with the ideas of unity in diversity. Each of us represents a story that weaves into the tapestry that is our nation. Why must we now unravel?

The unravelling is taking shape in the form of these social issues, but they are in part due to the fact that our people are suffering without jobs. We must not lose sight of the need to develop our country. To do that we must all work together. And I repeat. We must all work together, hon member Magaxa. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Maseko. That is the end of members' statements. Hon member Magaxa. Thank you. Can we get some order? We are now going to move to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Lentit.

**MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

(Notice of Motion)

Mr R B LENTIT: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the opportunities and challenges of the environmental, economic and social impact of climate change in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the role of Arts and Culture in shaping and addressing social inclusion in the Western Cape and South Africa.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the equitable share allocation to the Western Cape and the impact thereof to the residents.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Makeleni, no, Lekker. Sorry my apologies. Hon member Lekker you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We are from the same clan, Madam Speaker, there is nothing wrong. singoNkwali ooBhukula. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that the DA's favourite neighbourhood watch system has been infiltrated by extremist right wing Suidlander elements in Vredendal who terrorise and assault local people of colour and to investigate the DA's role in protecting and harbouring these racists in community structures.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any more motions where notice is given? Hon member Mr Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing racism in the Western Cape after

recent racist remarks made by Western Cape resident, Matthew Theunissen.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House calls for the suspension of the Eden District Municipality's senior DA councillor Tertius Simmers who is investigated for allegedly forging a police letter.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Order. Are there any more? Order please members there is a speaker on the floor. Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Motion with notice:

That the House investigates claims that the Ravensmead community reported to the City a number of times that the fence around the retention pond where 7-year-old Tyler-Johan Jansen drowned, was broken and posed danger to the children, but the City never responded.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other motions? Okay if there are no further motions we now – Sorry hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the failure by the City of Cape Town to spend its budget allocation for housing in the consecutive years while this municipality has a housing backlog of 400 000.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates negligence and poor service delivery in provincial hospitals.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Lekker? No, not? Alright that then concludes motions where notice is given. Can we now move to Motions without Notice. I am going to need assistance here. Hon Mnqasela, hon

Joseph and then the hon Mitchell. That's the first three and then I will move to the next round. Thank you.

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the police for the arrest of a man for the kidnap and murder of a young girl, Anelisa Dulaze, who went missing on her 21<sup>st</sup> birthday in January. Last week her body was found in Makhaza. It is her memorial service now as we are sitting here. I move that this House extends its condolences to the family, friends and community of Makhaza and hope that they can now find closure on her disappearance and I hope her beautiful soul rests in peace.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, loved ones, friends and colleagues of Dene Smuts who passed on. Dene Smuts was a DA Member of Parliament and Editor of *Fair Lady*. This House

commends her efforts to help build a free, just and open society in South Africa. Her contribution towards a democratic country and in particular our Constitution must be recognised. May her soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I see the hon Mitchell and then I will recognise hon member Gopie, hon member Botha and then Mathlodi, the hon member Maseko. Thank you. Next round.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Khayelitsha psychology graduate and registered councillor, Banetsi Andreas Mphunge for offering mobile counselling clinic services aimed at destigmatising mental illness to Khayelitsha residents. May he reach his long term goal to have a fleet of mini-buses throughout the country where vulnerable youth can seek out services in a judgement-free space. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I see the hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes all our hardworking nurses well on Nurses' Day today and thanks them for the sterling job they are doing to look after the frail and the ill.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the callous manner in which two brothers, learners at Monument Park High School in Kraaifontein, assaulted their principal, Mr David Jantjies, in his office, resulting in him being hospitalised. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I see the hon member Maseko.

†Me L M MASEKO: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye met die gesin, familie vriende en almal in Wellington betuig met die ontydige, sinlose en wrede moord op die skrywer, Winnie Rust. In die woorde van Breyten Breytenbach: “Winnie Rust was ’n landelike engel, elegant en diep gelowig.”

Sy was die dogter van C P van der Merwe, ’n voormalige hoof van die Wellingtonse Opleidingskool, broerskind van Boerneef, ’n skrywer in haar eie reg. Winnie Rust was ook betrokke by die breër Wellingtonse gemeenskap. Haar ontydige heengaan word diep berou. [Applous.]

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, family friends and all in Wellington on the untimely, senseless and cruel murder of the author Winnie Rust. In the words of Breyten Breytenbach: “Winnie Rust was a rural angel, elegant and deeply religious.”

She was the daughter of C P van der Merwe, a former head of the Wellington Training School, niece of Boerneef, an author in her own right. Winnie Rust was also involved in the wider Wellington community. Her untimely death is deeply mourned. [Applause.]

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. [Cheering.] [Laughter.] Hon members that was diversity in terms of language. Let us appreciate diversity. [Applause.] I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that this year, on Freedom Day, we celebrated the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of our glorious National Constitution, which guides us and protects all South Africans in a country where all enjoy dignity, equality, freedom and human rights in a non-racial, non-sexist unified democratic and open society. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I see the hon member Dijana and then hon member Hinana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the handing over of the Beaufort West Youth Hub of R52 million by President Jacob Zuma on Tuesday, 10 May 2016 to develop skills and combating social ills in the area of the Central

Karoo. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Hinana, after which I see hon member Uys and then I see the hon member Max. Hon members I need you to work with me please. Let us try and keep the roster going. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South Africa Police for the progress they have made in arresting a suspect for the murder of an 83-year-old grandmother, Nomalizo Khuthu, her three grandchildren and a 53-year-old man in Nyanga two weeks ago. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections? Agreed to.

Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its empathy with all the train passengers that have fallen victim to the series of violent protests that have plagued the rail transport system over the past few months. In addition, that this House also extends its gratitude to employers that have shown compassion with their workers who spent hours on the trains between work, school and home. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections? Agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the decision by the SABC, as initiated by the COO, Hlaudi Motsoeneng that, as of today, 90% of all music played on radio stations within their stable, which reach over 18 million listeners from all language groups, should be music produced by local artists and urges all the station managers to consider including the following South African musicians, both well-known and not yet widely known, for playtime;

Don Laka, AKA, Brenda Fassie, Busi Mhlongo, Mirriam Makeba, Brown

Dash, Lebo Mathosa, T Kay, Papa Wemba, Mahlatini and the Mahotella Queens, Simphiwe Dana, Thandiswe Mazwai, Abdulla Ibrahim, Hugh Masekela, Jonathan Butler, Ricardo ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Not that one. [Laughter.]

Bayete, Siphos "Hotstix" Mabuse, Wendy Oldfield, Driemanskap, Lionel Bastos, Kyle Shephard, The Weekender, Woodstock Live, Karen Kortje, Auriol Hays, Trudy Rushin, the Delft Big Band, Black Noise, Prophets of the City, Sakhile, Allou April, Frank Paco, Adamu, Goodluck, Tressor, Das Kapital, Mix n Blend, Los Tacos, Manny Walters, Den Dey and the Concrete Lions, DJ Invisible, Mshoza, Mandoza, Ringo Madlingozi, The Soil, John Sekunjalo Pretorius/Jpre, Johnny Clegg, Bienyameen Camroodien, Julian Wenn, Elton Goslett, Jamie Jupiter, Saxit, Blac Pearl, Jitsvinger, Andre Lotter, Tim Parr, Bright Blue, James Phillips, Corporal Punishment, Big Sky, Penguins in Bondage, The Psycho Reptiles, Falling Mirror, Ballyhoo, Rabbitt, Zahara, Clout, Basil Coetzee, eVoid, Sketchy Bongo, Jimmy Nevis, The Awakening, Jesse Clegg, Goldfish, The Helicopters, Watershed, Jimmy Dlodlu, Karen Zoid, Opposite the Other, Camagwini, Zama Jobe, Lira, Kelly Khumalo, Cassper Nyovest, Mtee, Zakwe, Duncan, K.O, Sylvia Mdunyelwa, Ginger La Etto, Basil Manenburg Coetzee, Alex van Heerden, Zola, Sizwe Zako, Mzwakhe Mbuli, Freshly Ground, Sibongile Khumalo,

Judith Sephuma, Zonke, Letta Mbuli, Caiphus Samenya, Khayelitsha artists such as Lenoon Tom, Vuyani Qali, Xabiso Damba, Image, Rattex, Rhayi Zandila, DJ Ben Daza, Vuyi Mahlasela ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Dugmore, please take your seat, sorry there is a point of order. Is it a point of order?

Mr D JOSEPH: No. We are not objecting about the list. He can submit the list but I think it is unnecessary, unfair that the speaker makes this motion in this context. I think its deliberate and he is making fun of the people. [Inaudible.] must be serious.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph I have noted your point of order. Hon member Dugmore, can I ask that the motion is noted and that we put the list - be taken as read, that you provide the list to the Table and we will consider the list as read.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, could I address you briefly. I will obviously abide by your ruling. I do have a 159 names in all but I just want to say that the reason why I felt particularly strongly about reading out these names was that earlier on today when the news broke - and many people know that at one stage he was the MEC for Arts and Culture and he started the Western Cape Musicians Association with Whitey Jacobs and others and when they heard that I wanted to do a motion they really felt that we should actually get these names.

Because there is huge excitement in the country about this, but I respect that we have limited time and I will formally have to give it one of the officers. And please hon Speaker and members, if you have other names [Interjection.][Laughter.] I think we must all try and lobby for these names and get them played.

[Remainder of list as tabled by the hon member Dugmore]

Dorothy Masuku, Mafikizolo, Gugulethu Tennors, Micasa;

and the following spectrum of musicians over the Cape Flats, Beaufort West, Mossel Bay and West Coast:

Sabastian Petersen, Sammy Webber, Celeste Williams, Timothy Nxumalo, Robbie Jansen, Claire Phillips, Lesley Javan, Janis Groenewald, Lyle Syster, Richard Ceaser, Valentino Europa, Alister Isobell, Don Vos Prins, August Van Der Westhuizen, Sade van Schalkwayk, Samuel Jacobs, Johannes Kerkorrel, Piet Joseph, John Walton, Sprinbok Nude Girls, Valiant Swart, Arno Carstens, Die Antwoord, Andre Lotter, Desmond and the Tutu's, Kathy Raven, Tonia Moller, Carsten Rasch, John Trafford, Syabulela Master Blaq, Jamie Jupiter, Dookom (Isaac Mutant), Miss Celanious, Ashleigh Rhoda Davids, Robyn Arendse, Matthew Budden, Roger Bashew, Ernie B St Clair, Reza Kotha, Kesivan Naidoo and Shane Cooper.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Maseko and then hon member Botha and then hon member Gopie.

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Helen Zille, the Premier of the Western Cape, for being acknowledged as the third most admired person in South Africa by the Global Market Research firm, YouGov. I so move.  
[Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Okay, so it is not agreed to. Hon members there is too much noise, can we settle down please. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the nursing sister, Hester Johnson of Cape Town, for her 46 years of selfless caring and service excellence to patients in the Western Cape. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon members, may I just go back. In the furore over the 159 names, I forgot to ask if there are any objections to the motion. Let's just get this right. If there are no objections then the motion is agreed to. Just on a technical point I would like to correct the situation. Thank you. I see hon member Hinana and then hon member Gopie. I will just get and try everybody going. Thank you.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the condemning by the Public Protector, Thuli Madonsela, this week of the former Minister of Social Development, Edna Molewa, for instructing Department officials to organise food parcels at an ANC Youth League political rally event in Heinz Park in Philippi in 2009. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? Yes, there is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Dijana and hon member Lekker and then I will come back to hon member Maseko and hon member Mitchell. Hon member Magaxa, you will get the next round. Thank you. Sorry, hon member Gopie, you may proceed and then next two ladies behind you.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the actions by the security guard and a floor manager of the Pick 'n Pay store in Mitchells Plain, by humiliating Iris Beukes, 59-years-old and her grandchild, Tylo, after Tylo allegedly broke a chocolate bar on Saturday, 22 April 2016. A security guard confronted them and a floor manager threatened to take them to jail.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to. I see the Hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends National Social Development Minister, Ms Bathabile Dlamini, for caring for the Beaufort West community and handing out blankets at a recent visit to the elderly pensioners on the 29<sup>th</sup> of April 2016 and further notes that Provincial MEC, Albert Fritz, pettily prohibited Western Cape Social Development staff to attend this official event and even threatened them with disciplinary action if they did. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 45 Slangrivier residents who have received their title deeds from Mr Bonginkosi Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements. 12 of the recipients were elderly beneficiaries. Amongst them is a 72-year-old, Ms Marie Hartnick, who was overjoyed to receive her title deed. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mitchell.

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die tragiese dood van Shane Visagie, 'n Graad 6-leerder aan die Worcester Primêr in 'n motorongeluk betreur. Ons innige meegevoel met sy geliefdes, familie en skoolvriende. Mag sy siel in vrede rus.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House mourns the tragic death of Shane Visagie, a Grade 6 learner at the Worcester Primary in a car accident. Our deepest sympathy with his loved ones, family and school friends. May his soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Lekker, after which I see hon member Wenger and hon member Mnqasela then I will come back to this side. Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the African National Congress Youth League in the Western Cape for its End Racism in Rugby mass picket in front of SARU offices in Platteklouf.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its deepest condolences and sympathy with the parents, family and friends of six-year-old Saadiqah Lippers, who died tragically in hospital after a stray bullet hit her in front of her grandmother's house in Bokmakierie on Tuesday, the 5<sup>th</sup> of May.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mngasela.

†Mnr M MNQASELA: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die tragiese dood van Shane Visagie, 'n Graad 6-leerder aan Worcester Primêr in 'n motorongeluk betreur. Ons innige meegevoel. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House mourns the tragic death of Shane Visagie, a Grade 6

learner at Worcester Primary in a car accident. Our deepest sympathy.

[Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Masizole, if you could take your seat please. There is a point of order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Rule of the House, Madam Speaker, is that if a motion has been read, a similar one is not read. Two people have read exactly the same motion.

Mr M MNQASELA: It is not the same. It is not the Afrikaans that you are used to. This is the real Afrikaans.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela, it is the same subject matter. It might not be worded the same but it is the same subject matter.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. There is only one Speaker here and I will listen to the Speaker. Madam Speaker, I move without notice.

That the House extends its appreciation to the Mossel Bay Municipal Manager, Dr Michele Gratz, for the knowledge, expertise and leadership quality that she brought to the municipality. We saw clean audits in this municipality for 4 consecutive terms. We thank her for

her excellent service, not only to the people of Mossel Bay, but also to the Western Cape and South Africa. We wish her and her family well going forward. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be written on the Order Paper. Where am I now? I think it is hon member Magaxa and then hon member Hinana and hon member Maseko. Let's do it in rounds of three.

Mr K A MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the 16<sup>th</sup> Commission for Employment Equity report was released last month showing a bleak transformation picture for the Western Cape specifically and that whites were still leading top level management with 68.9% while Africans were at 14.3%, and welcomes the Labour Minister's 6 months ultimatum given to South African employers who do not meet the employment equity criteria to rectify the situation, hoping that the Western Cape Provincial Government will also rectify its situation.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commemorates May as Africa Month and celebrates Ideas and Culture exchanges under the theme “Building a Better Africa and a Better World”, aimed at promoting unity and regional integration for the continent’s development and advancement.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and community of Ashton with the passing of Ezette de Koker, after a short illness. Ezette was a woman who believed in giving selflessly to the extended community. May her soul rest in peace. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Dr Wright, a University of the Western Cape PhD graduate, for being nominated as one of the top finalists for the most innovative project on the African Continent Award. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections? Agreed to. I see the hon member Magaxa. I see the hon member Max and hon member Maseko. Hon member Dijana I will come to you with the next round.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that a recent StatsSA report revealed the number of people living in informal settlements increased from 76% in 2002 to 80% in 2014 and that the second highest number of these was in the Western Cape with a 521 000 housing backlog. Of this 400 000 are registered in the City of Cape Town, where its Human Settlements Department has not used 58% of its capital budget at this stage and calls on the National Government to intervene urgently to resolve the quagmire.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There are

objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges the courageous bravery of Darryn August, who unselfishly helped a pregnant lady on the train and whilst in the process of doing so fell victim to robbers and was pushed off the train. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Maseko.

Mr L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Bonginkosi Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements, on the launching of the Belhar Housing Project tomorrow. When completed this R1.3 billion project will house 629 rental accommodation units. 192 units are for those who earn less than R3 500 per month and 437 units will be allocated to beneficiaries who earn less than R7 500 per month. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Order, order please members. Hon member Dijana and then hon member Olivier.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the launch by National Minister, Nomvula Mokonyane, of the Worcester Bulk Water Supply Project worth R100 million that will provide water to 180 000 people. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns with contempt the destruction of public property and vandalism witnessed during the recent protest across the country, such as in Vuwani, Du Noon and Grabouw. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Lentit and then hon member Dugmore and hon member Max.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis *Rhino Tears* van die plaas Vernon in Klapmuts erkenning gee vir hul bydrae van R750 000 aan Erebewaarders om die stryd tussen stropers beter toegerus voort te sit en by te dra tot die bewaring van renosters.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R B LENTIT: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges *Rhino Tears* of the farm Vernon in Klapmuts for their contribution of R750 000 to Honorary Wardens to continue the battle against poachers better equipped and to contribute to the protection of rhinos.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Dugmore, then hon member Max and then I will come to you hon member Tyatyam.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House noting that charges of *crimen injuria* have been laid against a sitting DA councillor from the Hessequa Municipality and who is also the top candidate on the DA's candidate list for the 2016 local elections, Annemarie Joubert, who is alleged to have said †“Ek is nou klaar met die ...” [“I am now finished with the ...”] and she used the K-word allegedly, after a community meeting in Riversdale.

Therefore calls on the DA leadership and the Speaker to immediately suspend councillor Joubert pending the conclusion of the case against her, Case No. CAS64/5/2016 registered at the Riversdale South Africa Police Services on the 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2016 and further calls on the Human Rights Commission to urgently investigate the complaint that has been laid.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Max.

†Mnr L H MAX: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Suid-Afrikaanse span wat vanjaar in die Pan-Afrikaanse Wiskunde Olimpiade (PAWO) gewen het, gelukwens. Altesaam 45 hoërskoolleerlinge van 8 Afrika-lande het deelgeneem. 5 van die 6 SA-

deelnemers is Wes-Kapenaars en goue medalje-wenner, SangEun Lee, is vir 'n tweede agtereenvolgende jaar as die koningin van wiskunde aangewys. Sy is ook die algehele wenner van die kompetisie. Ander Wes-Kaapse deelnemers was Ralph McDougall (goud), Timothy Schlesinger (silwer), Hannah Clayton (silwer) en Rauseenah Upadhey (brons). I so move.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African team that won this year's Pan-African Maths Olympiad (PAMO). Altogether 45 high school learners from 8 African countries participated. 5 of the 6 SA participants are from the Western Cape and gold medal winner, SangEun Lee, was appointed as the queen of maths for the second consecutive year. She is also the overall winner of the competition. Other Western Cape participants were Ralph McDougall (gold), Timothy Schlesinger (silver), Hannah Clayton (silver) and Rauseenah Upadhey (bronze). I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the decision by the Minister Mike Masutha, to put on leave Judge Mabel Jansen, following her racially loaded comments on social media which caused outrage amongst members of the public. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates all the 10 entrepreneurs allocated to the kiosks along the Provincial Parliament buildings in Long Street and wishes them success in their endeavours.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Schäfer?

†Me B A SCHÄFER: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Graan SA se NAMPO gelukwens het met hul 50-jarige bestaan en bedank vir die wêreldformaat diens wat hulle aan die graanverbouers van Suid-Afrika bied. Die eerste uitstalling het 8 deelnemers gehad en 203 mense het dit bygewoon. Vandag spog NAMPO met 650 uitstallers en bykans 70 000 besoekers word geakkommodeer.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Maize SA's NAMPO on their 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary and thank them for the world format service they are providing to the maize farmers of South Africa. The first exhibition had 8 participants and 203 people attended it. Today Nampo boasts 650 exhibitors and almost 70 000 visitors are accommodated.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its appreciation to the Ward Councillor, the Risk Reduction Unit, Neighbourhood Watches, clergy, business representatives and community representatives for their efforts to prevent the ongoing violence in Masiphumelele in Fish Hoek.

THE SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates and wishes the two young cyclists, Thulasizwe Mxenge from Khayetlisha and Marco Abrahams from Belhar everything of the best. Earlier this year the two were selected from a group of 12 when they participated in the Cape Cycle Tour in Franschoek by the HotChillee Development Rider programme. They will be going to Switzerland for a month's intensive training before going to London to compete in the London-Paris Cycle Challenge in July. I move so.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Good!]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to.

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Universiteit van Wes-Kaapland se vroue-strandvlugbalspan gelukwens met hulle oorwinning oor die span van die Tegniese Universiteit van Pretoria tydens hierdie week se Varsity-reeks wat by die Universiteit van Wes-Kaapland in Bellville gehou is.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the University of the Western Cape's beach volley team on their victory over the team of the Technical University of Pretoria during this week's Varsity Series that was held at the University of the Western Cape in Bellville.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Richard Stander van Atletiek Boland geluk wens met sy aanstelling as Waarnemende Uitvoerende Hoof van Atletiek Suid-Afrika.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Richard Stander of Athletics Boland on his appointment as Acting Chief Executive of Athletics South Africa.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Bellville golfer, Gerlou le Roux on retaining the South African Mid-Amateur Stroke Play Championship earlier this week in Pretoria. I move so.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the schools well that will be participating in the Artscape High School Drama Mini Festival scheduled for May 22 – 30.

I move so.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon Mngasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on Sunday the 16<sup>th</sup> of May 2016 it will be exactly a year since the passing of Mr Christopher Foulkes, a proud Cape Town businessman, a philanthropist and a member of the Cape Town Club. He was loved by many and lived a great life. That the House wishes his family, his wife Michelle, his son Daniel and friends strength during this period. May his soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Mackenzie.

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betuig met die gesin, familie en vriende van die 30-jarige Nicolette Serenge van Constitution-Hof in Lavender Hill wat op Saterdag 7de Mei tydens 'n bendeskietersy haar lewe tragies verloor het. Hierdie onnodige geweld laat nog 3 minderjarige kinders wees. Dankie.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of the 30-year-old Nicolette Serenge of Constitution Court in Lavender Hill who on Saturday, 7 May, during a gang shootout tragically lost her life. This unnecessary violence is leaving another three minor children as orphans. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. Any more, Hon Member? Hon Mackenzie, I take it you're finishing up now?

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Mike Horn, die Suid-Afrikaanse-gebore avonturier voorspoed toewens op sy seetog, wat sonder gemotoriseerde vervoermiddels, van Monaco na Antarktika en dan oor die Stille Oseaan na die Noordpool sal reis. Hy het op Saterdag 8 Mei op die *Pole to Pole* Ekspedisie vertrek en beoog om teen Junie in Suid-Afrika aan te kom.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes Mike Horn, the South African born adventurer, all the best on his sea voyage, travelling without motorised transport from Monaco to the Antarctic and then across the Pacific Ocean to the North Pole. He left for the *Pole to Pole* Expedition on Saturday, 8 May, and envisages arriving in South Africa by June.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie. [Thank you.] Are there no objections? Agreed to. Okay that then concludes, if, have you got one more? Okay, †laat hy maar nou aangaan. [Gelag.] Okay, [let him then continue. [Laughter.]] I recognise the hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the Olympic torch which will be lit in Kleinmond, Overberg this weekend and will move across the Western Cape Province as a symbol of the Olympic spirit and the values for which the Olympics stands. The joy of effort, fair play, respect for others, the pursuit of excellence and the balance between body, will and mind. I move so.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you Hon Mackenzie. Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. If there are no more motions without notice, we will now move to the draft resolution. The next item on the Order Paper is the draft Resolution in the name of the Hon M M Wenger. I see the Hon Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: That the House notes –

- that the under-resourcing of the South African Police Services (SAPS) in the Western Cape is having a negative impact on school learner safety;
- that when schools in distress or under threat call their local police stations for assistance, the police response is poor or none at all;
- a recent attack where a Grade 9 learner from Modderdam, Mitchells Plain, was stabbed by gangsters, even though the school had pleaded for police back-up 20 minutes before the incident took place and did not arrive to prevent this crime; and
- that when the police and Western Cape Education Department partnered in 2013 in Hanover Park and where SAPS increased visible policing around the school and created safe corridors for learners to get to and from school, learners were remarkably safer and the number of incidents decreased drastically; and

Therefore resolves:

That the Provincial Police Commissioner be requested:

- (a) to submit a report to the Standing Committee on Community Safety, on how SAPS will be adequately resourced and by when;
- (b) to ensure that all vacancies be filled as a matter of urgency;
- (c) to prioritise school safety; and
- (d) to ensure that visible policing is fully implemented and increased, in particular around our schools.

Thank you Madam Speaker. “Have you ever been at sea in a dense fog, when it seemed as if a tangible white darkness shuts you in and the great ship, tense and anxious, groped her way toward the shore with plummet and sounding line. And you waited with ...”[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms M M WENGER: “Beating heart ...”[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon Members.

Ms M M WENGER: “And you waited with beating heart for something to happen. I was like that ship before my education began. Only I was without compass or sounding line and no way of knowing how near the harbour was. Lights, forgive me, light was the wordless cry of my soul and the light of love shone on me in that very hour.”

Helen Keller wrote these profound words about the importance of education.

As our late president Nelson Mandela said:

“Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world.”

Madam Speaker, there is no doubt about the importance of educating our young citizens. It is essential for the development of our society and

fundamental for the development of young minds. We owe it to our children to provide them with good quality education and this can only be achieved if we are able to provide safe learning environments at school and on the way to school.

I therefore rise to debate the Draft Resolution I have put forward in this House, because our education system is at risk. It is at risk because we have an under-resourced police service in the Western Cape and this fact is having a negative impact on learners' safety. When schools in distress or under threat call their local stations for assistance, the police response is oftentimes poor or none at all. Our most valuable asset, our children and our future, can and must be our priority, and so too should their safety be the police's priority.

We know that when the police and the Western Cape Education Department partnered in 2013 in Hanover Park and where SAPS increased visible policing around the school and created safe corridors for learners to get to and from school, learners were remarkably safer and the number of incidents decreased dramatically.

This means that with proper visible policing and police response, in conjunction with the Education Department and other role players, our children can be safer. We need to continue this partnership and expand it to all vulnerable schools. But where it fails is when we do not have the proper response from the police. The numbers show unequivocally that the Western

Cape is simply not getting the levels of police resources that it ought to. The Constitution clearly sets out the mandate of the South African Police Services. Section 205 states that the objects of the South African Police Services are:

- To prevent, combat and investigate crime,
- To maintain public order,
- To protect and secure the inhabitants of the Republic and their property, and
- To uphold and enforce the law.

We have over 2000 vacancies in the Western Cape police. We have 14% less detectives than what we should have and in visible policing, which is a crime prevention mechanism, there are over 2000 less officers patrolling our communities than what we should have.

Should all the granted posts be filled, it would mean approximately 20 additional officers on the ground for every station in this province, of which 4 would be detectives. The lack of officers is compounded by the number of officers that leave the service each year, totalling just over 1000 in the 3 previous financial years. This is compounded by the fact that the National Budget for the next 3 years only makes provision for 20 additional police

posts. Yes, our National will only get 20 additional police officers between now and 2019. On average that is less than 1 additional officer per province per year, less than 1.

A national police budget of R80 billion cannot even provide for more officers to make our communities and school learners safe, but the national budget can somehow find R4 billion for a luxury jet for the President. Madam Speaker, these priorities are completely skewed and must be reviewed. Safety for all should be a priority and not luxury air travel for a few. Why can't the President fly on SAA?

It is clear that we must urgently fill the thousands of vacancies in our province. We must resource our police and ensure that they have the tools needed to fulfil their constitutional mandate of protecting our school children and our communities. I therefore urge the House to support this Resolution so that the Provincial Police Commissioner can be requested to submit a report to the Standing Committee on Community Safety on how the police will be adequately resourced and by when, to ensure that all vacancies are filled as a matter of urgency, to prioritise school safety and to ensure that visible policing is fully implemented and increased, and in particular around our schools.

The tragedy is that these requests we are making should be the norm. We should not have to beg Government for the basics and a basic level of policing. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you, Madam Speaker.] Hon member Wenger wants SAPS to report to the House on how SAPS will adequately be resourced and fill all vacancies so that school safety is prioritised, and to implement visible policing around schools. Perhaps we should be asking this DA-led Provincial Government what happened to the Integrated School Safety Strategy that was developed by the ANC in 2003?

It is because of this Government's narrow politics that they dismantled it because it dealt with the involvement of CPF's at schools, which are a direct link to the community. It dealt with the skewed distribution of budget and programmes of this DA-led Government.

I would be failing if I did not mention the infrastructural problems, including the toilets, which all contribute to the ability of SAPS to properly, effectively and speedily police these areas. We are not suffering from amnesia. Even an ordinary person from the street can see that the Western Cape Provincial Government has failed to ensure safety for its citizens and instead it is looking for a scapegoat, and SAPS is unfortunately becoming its punching bag. Go out there and tell the people that you have broken the morale of good police officers most of whom are working hard and honest. Stop bringing politics in where it does not belong.

The DA must also confess that it has fostered mistrust of SAPS by members

of the community through its continued reckless remarks and the deaths of many in the SAPS are as a result of your loose utterances. Section 12 of the SAPS Act, Act 68 of ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, can you please take your seat. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, can the hon member indicate whether she is implying that the deaths are a result of any members of this House?

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, you should be asking if the member will take a question. Would you take a question?

Ms P Z LEKKER: No.

The SPEAKER: No, the member will not take a question.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Section 12 of the SAPS Act, Act 68 of 1995 stipulates that the Provincial Commissioner has the responsibility to determine the distribution of the strength of SAPS under his jurisdiction among different areas ...

Mr R B LENTIT: Why doesn't he do it?

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... areas, stations, offices and units. The Western Cape

staff establishment is 22 055. The actual number at the moment is 21 097 and the surplus is 958. In fact, we are rating third in terms of the number of SAPS members allocated throughout the Province.

Mr R B LENTIT: You are happy with the shortage.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I want to state that the hon member is disingenuous and opportunistic. Besides, she is not telling the Western Cape that since ...[Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: She is bragging there is a shortage of policing.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So we have enough policing?

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Since the ANC came into power in 1994 ...[Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: She is bragging.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The metro alone ... [Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: She is bragging.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, will you please take your seat. Hon members, you cannot engage in a finger pointing exercise while there is a speaker on the floor. I am going to ask both sides of the House to manage yourselves. Thank you. Hon members, please. You may proceed hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Besides, she is not telling the people of the Western Cape that since the ANC came into power in 1994 the Metro alone had more than five new police stations built. She is not telling the people that the Western Cape was given its fair share of SAPS members like any other province.

She goes on to argue that the police response at school during gang violence is poor or none at all. Where is the rogue Metro Police in this debacle? Have they now become a specialised unit that only jumps to protect the DA executives when they campaign in the townships? Metro Police remains an untouchable entity to this Provincial Government because it is under the control of a politician who is busy ticking the boxes as and when SAPS performs its duties. Hence it is not coming to the plate and this Provincial Government is quiet about it.

Violence in schools must be viewed as a symptom of our socio-economic problems of squalor and moral degradation. Crime and violence is exacerbated by high unemployment, poverty and social deprivation, including the availability of drugs and alcohol. Unemployment and poor living conditions lead to anti-social behaviour because of having no sense of

belonging, thus some have a low self-esteem, poor academic performance and learning difficulties which in the end result in incidents of school dropouts.

Becoming a member of a gang therefore fills the space of these youngsters, because they feel wanted, safe and taken care of. Needy families are drawn by promises of food, money and rent. People are paying money for protection under the false pretence of security, while young girls are targeted and offered free lifts to and from school by gangsters. In return they are introduced to drugs and prostitution.

The recent upsurge in gang violence and deaths in the Cape Flats, under the watch of this DA administration and the City of Cape Town, which is incapable and simply unwilling to end the mayhem, has resulted in several unnecessary deaths of innocent school children. It is clear that the police alone cannot be held accountable in fighting gang violence when this DA lacks the political will to address chronic service delivery failures all over the Cape Flats.

Religious groups are supposed to publicly appeal against gangsters, but instead this DA-led Provincial Government is giving out money to religious groups to arrange food parcels for the day, or rather run a feeding scheme. Oh yes, there is a Safe Schools Call Centre. Supposedly traumatised learners and educators must be referred to either a psychologist or a social worker, but truth be told, there are only 58 over-worked social workers available for schools. Only 1 for 58 schools. All those affected had to be put on a waiting

list and their cases will be prioritised.

The Department of Education brags about installing alarms systems, but this is only put in the administration block and none of the classrooms has an alarm or emergency button and leads to most classrooms being vandalised. Your typical example would be Bulumko High School. Car hijackings are the order of the day, while Walter Teka in Nyanga is one of those ...

An HON MEMBER: No policemen [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... where a departmental official was almost hijacked and the person narrowly escaped. And what is this DA-led Department of Education's counter strategy on school grounds ...

An HON MEMBER: More policemen.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... because they continue bragging but nothing is done? Let us stop demoralising SAPS and have an integrated safety strategy. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This draft

Resolution could not have come at a better time. Section 12 of the Constitution in the Bill of Rights provides that everyone has the right to freedom and security of the person, which includes the right to be free from all forms of violence from either public or private sources.

Section 205, as my colleague touched on, sets out the responsibilities of the National Police Services, our SAPS. Sub-section 1 provides that SAPS must be structured firstly, to function in the national, provincial and where appropriate local spheres of government. Sub-section 3 sets out the objects of the SAPS, which are to prevent, note, the objects of the SAPS:

- Prevent, combat and investigate crime,
- To maintain public order,
- To protect and secure the inhabitants of the Republic and their property, and
- To uphold and enforce the law.

It is no secret that in the Western Cape we are faced with the scourge of gangsterism which has been plaguing some of our communities for decades. Unfortunately in communities where gangsterism is prominent, it can and does spill over into our schools. In 2008 the then ANC-led Western Cape Government brought out a gang strategy which they love to say we are not

implementing because it was an ANC idea. The reality is though that we are in fact implementing a large part of it. The other reality is that the strategy extended far beyond the mandate of Provincial Government into the areas of SAPS, Justice and Correctional Services, over which we have no control, nor do they, but the ANC has a little issue with separation of power.

This issue is a complex one that requires a multi-pronged, multi-stakeholder solution. This is clearly highlighted in the 2008 strategy as well. So we are not saying for a minute that SAPS is the only party responsible. However, they play a crucial role in addressing the criminal manifestations of gangsterism, along with Correctional Services, the NPA and the Department of Justice. Where the police are present, the gangs are not. I want to make it clear that we receive very good cooperation from the SAPS in many places in the Western Cape from officers who are doing their utmost under very difficult circumstances, but they are severely constrained because firstly they are under resourced and quite frankly, in some cases they are just downright ineffective.

This morning we arranged with SAPS to conduct a search and seizure operation at Fezeka Senior Secondary School in Gugulethu. The School Safety Committee requested their intervention as a result of learners being seriously threatened by other learners where there are two competing gangs. This is simply unacceptable when schools should be a safe haven for education to take place. Our Safe Schools confirmed this morning that the planned operation was going ahead as scheduled at eleven thirty. By eleven

forty, there were a few officers on site, but no dogs as promised. It soon appeared that they were totally unprepared for the operation. They then advised that there had been a miscommunication and that they were not prepared. Fortunately the acting Station Commander assisted in quickly organising officers, but after an hour the promised sniffer dogs which were in the area, had still not materialised. They then proceeded with the search, whereupon it became quite evident that they had no clue whatsoever about the proper procedure to be followed in these operations.

Regardless of the resource constraints, ignorance of basic procedures is just plain unacceptable. If this is how they conduct an operation, planned in consultation with the Office of the MEC for Education, no wonder we have so many problems with crime. It is also true that there are far too many cases where the SAPS is simply unable to assist. We receive many such complaints, but 2 examples are:

- At Aloe Secondary, on 9 March 2015, the secretary reported that a learner was stabbed at seven twenty on the school premises. The school contacted SAPS and was informed that the police only had one van, so they were unable to say when they would be able to respond. By ten thirty SAPS had still not responded.
- A year later, on 10 March 2016, at Bishop School of Skills, the principal reported that he had received a threat that gangsters would be coming to the school as a result of an incident in the community the previous day.

The school contacted SAPS to request support patrols and were informed that the vans were attending shootings in Bonteheuwel and therefore they could not have any assistance, because there were no people to come and assist.

- Last month after a learner from Modderdam High School was stabbed on the school premises, I was so angered that I requested an urgent meeting the Western Cape Police Commissioner, General Jula, to discuss how they plan to comply with their constitutional duty to keep our learners safe, especially in the light of his stated commitment to address the gang problem in the Western Cape. Today is exactly one month since I requested this meeting, but I still do not have a confirmed date. I also issued a press statement on the issue. Shortly thereafter, General Jula himself publicly admitted that the Western Cape is the most under resourced province in South Africa.

Hon member Lekker, you must read the newspapers, with 85% of our stations being understaffed. This could be as a result of the 2 392 posts that have simply not been filled. As my colleague also said, if these posts were filled every station would have an additional 20 police officers on the ground, of which 4 would be detectives. The under resourcing often occurs in high risk areas which exacerbates the problem even further.

The inability of SAPS to support at critical times is a great concern, as it leaves our learners uneducated, vulnerable and at the mercy of invading

gangsters. It also puts inordinate pressure on the other spheres of government and Government departments to step in where they should not have to. We do everything possible in Education to ensure the safety of our learners while they are on the school premises. Our Safe Schools Directorate has behavioural intervention holiday programmes and infrastructure interventions. The Western Cape Government as a whole has many interventions for youth at risk, and we are partnering with the Metro Police and law enforcement of the City of Cape Town, the only people who really do consistently respond well, with the School Resources Offices and the Stabilisation Unit.

Our game changers also are very much focused on the youth, especially after school. Because of the security measures that the WCED has put in place in schools, the schools are very often places of refuge when gang violence takes place in the community. When gang violence flares up in Hanover Park and Manenberg, many learners reported that they felt safer at school than they did at home. But we cannot protect our learners on their way to and from school and it is not the job of teachers and principals to fight off gangsters in the school. It is quite clear that unless each role player takes their role seriously and properly complies with their responsibilities, no strategy will ever make a difference in combating gangsterism and violence in our schools.

So let us analyse the requirements of Section 205 of the Constitution again. It is quite evident that SAPS is not structured to function at a provincial or local level in the Western Cape as there are simply not enough people to

effectively deal with the issues at hand, nor is the training remotely adequate. From the school context alone it is evident that SAPS is not making any major in-roads in preventing, combating and investigating crime and that they are failing dismally in protecting and securing our learners. Not because they do not want to in many cases, but because they simply do not have sufficient resources, both human and physical. Plainly and simply, it is more than evident that Minister Nhleko and the National Government are in yet another crucial respect, in breach of the South African Constitution and the cost is the safety and sometimes lives of our people in general, and our learners in particular.

From my experience this morning, I have seen first-hand the disarray of the SAPS and their complete unpreparedness to deal with the serious issues. The police need to be resourced and properly trained to deal with these very serious issues in communities like Gugulethu.

Madam Speaker, I would like to propose an amendment to the Draft Resolution that the third bullet be amended to say that school safety is prioritised and proper training given to all SAPS members in the Western Cape in search and seizure procedures as a matter of urgency. I so move. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Schäfer, if you could submit the amendment as you have it recorded, thank you. I now see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, under resourcing of SAPS in the Western Cape is a major concern at our schools. Although safety is SAPS' primary responsibility, we need an approach from all spheres of government. But the biggest problem that children have in the townships is getting to school and getting from school, and that is the responsibility of SAPS. Should children stay at home because they don't feel safe going to school? Like the Minister said: in the corridors of the schools they are safer than on their way to school.

I have just been to a school in Delft the other day and a learner said to me that you can get access to any drugs at school, any drugs. And that is a problem and he told me that they are already recruited at school now to join gangs and gangs are now seen as a profession.

The important thing is that we, as a Committee, have said over and over again that we are under resourced in the Western Cape and those positions are critical and must be filled. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of hon member Joseph, I see the Hon Wenger. Order, please.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In response to some of the speakers, the morale of police officers; the thing that is breaking the morale of police officers is the fact that National Government is not giving police enough resources to do their work efficiently and effectively. Police killings

are ruthless and unconscionable, and we have to make every effort to protect our officers and in order to do that, we need to do two things. The first is we need to properly resource our police and secondly we need to build trust. A 2011 research paper by the ISS on how to stop ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Ms M M WENGER: ... police killings included the need to stop police brutalities in South Africa. They noted that using more force in their action with criminal suspects is unlikely to improve officer safety. It is said it will play into systemic police brutality which will cause civilians to become fearful and less cooperative with the police, and therefore it is very important that we also focus on the issue of building trust between communities and police.

The problem with the deployment of police is that the Provincial Commissioner's hands are often tied and the Commissioner is not able to determine the resources, because the theoretical human resource formula is what produces the allocation of officers. So what the result is, and that was one of the major findings of the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry, that those areas that have high crime levels and which need the most number of police officers, are those that receive the least number of police officers. So the allocation of police resources is completely skewed.

Another instance of where the SAPS Act should empower the Police

Commissioner but it doesn't, is on the specialised police units. When the Western Cape Government took up the issue of reintroducing specialised police units with the Commissioner, the then Commissioner, it became a political football. He referred us to the National Minister, the National Minister referred us back to the Provincial Commissioner, the Provincial Commissioner referred us back to the National Minister, and it took years and years of lobbying before the specialised units were eventually, or are going to be re-established.

On the issue of new police stations they do not address the problem of resourcing, because what happens is that they rob Peter to pay Paul. Let us look at, for example, the Lentegeur police station, hon member Lekker. We can wax lyrical about new stations, but new stations don't mean more officers. When Lentegeur police station was opened in 2013, it only received a nett total of 10 new police officers and the rest were redeployed from Mitchells Plain. In fact, let me just find my notes, it is concerning that under the circumstances of high levels of crime and violence, Mitchells Plain lost 20% of its police officers to Lentegeur. 126 were transferred from Mitchells Plain to Lentegeur when it opened and a further 28 were transferred to Lentegeur from elsewhere, and a nett total of only 10 new posts were created for the new station, which means that between the two new stations, the area only received 10 extra officers. And furthermore Mitchells Plain was not on the list to receive any of the new 668 entry level posts that were recently recruited.

Perhaps ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: Perhaps hon member Lekker would like to tell the House why the police recruited 6 299 new officers during the ANC's term of office in the Western Cape, but only 2 300 during the DA's term of office. And if hon member Lekker thinks that we have enough police officers, I would urge her to tell that to the residents of Nyanga, where just last week the CPF marched to the police station because they do not have enough officers. I would urge her to tell that to the family of Warrant Officer Brits in Klapmuts who was the only police officer on duty that night, and because he was the only police officer on duty ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: ... criminals came in and murdered him. He was murdered and this is the most brutal illustration of how proper ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: ... resourcing is important for not only protecting our communities, but our police officers themselves. I urge her to tell the same to the people of Khayelitsha who have less than one officer for every 700

residents. I ask her to tell that to the people of Touws River where on a weekend there is only one police officer on duty on the weekend for the whole station. I ask her to tell that to the residents of Lavender Hill, Steenberg, which only has enough ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: ... officers to police half of the sectors. Of the four sectors only two can be patrolled because they do not have enough officers, and which is the sector that doesn't get patrolled? Lavender Hill, the one that needs it the most. So it is quite clear, Madam Speaker, that we need more police resources and the vacancies need to be filled as a matter of urgency, not only for our communities, but importantly for our school learners. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Wenger. That concludes the debate. [Interjection.] Order, please hon member Lekker. The question, sorry?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, I was hoping that you would intervene and stop Chief Whip Wiley for breaking the line after he came late.

An HON MEMBER: Huh?

Mr M G E WILEY: How long have you been in Parliament that you know

where the line is?

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. Order, order, please hon members. I am not going to make a ruling on that, because I can't say that I was privy to what happened. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But you saw it. You saw us. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: We now move to the question before the House, which is - hon members - the motion printed in the name of the hon member Wenger on the Order paper, upon which an amendment has been moved by the Hon Minister Schäfer. In Minister Schäfer's presentation she put forward an amendment and if I could read that amendment before I put it as it is proposed. The amendment says ...

“That the 3<sup>rd</sup> bullet will be amended as follows: That school safety is prioritised and proper training given to all SAPS members in the Western Cape in search and seizure procedures as a matter of urgency.”

That was the amendment that has been put before the House. I now put the amendment as proposed. Those in favour of the amendment will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: And those against will say “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. I now put the motion as amended. What is wrong hon member Tyatyam? Are you ...? Okay. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Okay. There is an objection. [Interjections.] Sorry? Hon members, there were ayes and noes. The ayes had it and I now have to put the Draft Resolution as amended. Okay? So we have the Draft Resolution and the question I need to ask: Are there any objections?

HON MEMBERS: No.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. [Interjections.] I now put the question: those in favour of the amended Resolution, that is the question: those in favour of the amended Resolution?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: And those who are not in favour, obviously.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Olivier, sorry that concludes the process unfortunately. We have been through a process of ayes and noes and yes's and no's and we now have an amended Resolution. So we will now move to the Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Budget Committee on the *Division of Revenue Bill* [B 2 – 2016] (NCOP)(Ratification of Final Mandate).

The SPEAKER: When the House could not sit these past few days, the Legislature received the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate was then sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill? No objections?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: Agreed to. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on the *Expropriation Bill* [B 4D – 2015] (NCOP) (Ratification of final mandate).

The SPEAKER: Order. When the House could not sit the past few days, the Legislature received the Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on the Expropriation Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate was then sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I see the hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, the Standing Committee on Public Works in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, of which I am the Chairperson, has conducted several public hearings with the opportunity for the public to do written and oral submissions. Based on these submissions, the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works in the Western Cape, proposed amendments to the Bill, to be negotiated in the NCOP's Select Committee on Economic and Business Development. Because the Committee failed to take into consideration any of the amendments, the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works in the Western Cape could not support the Expropriation Bill as is.

Some of the issues, amongst others the Standing Committee found, were with definitions, the term "legal disability" and "property". The definition of expropriation is as wide as God's grace. Expropriation is an extreme

intervention into property rights and can prohibit investments to South Africa. It can have cataclysmic consequences for economic growth. We are disappointed with the decision not to take our proposed amendments into consideration and fear it will hurt our economy, which will prevent people from accessing jobs.

Madam Speaker, it would be wrong for anyone to infer that the Democratic Alliance is against the appropriation. Appropriation is enshrined in the Constitution of South Africa. All we say as the Democratic Alliance is that it has to conform with the principles of the Constitution. I thank you.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dugmore, you were not in the House. I did call for parties to make a declaration, if you wish to make a declaration. Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Madam Speaker, our country has made progress since 1994 and having put in place democratic institutions and provided basic services to millions of our people, the second phase of our transition must be all about economic and social transformation. We need ownership of this economy by the black majority: African, Coloured and Indian, we need faster growth and we need land redistribution. This Bill provides exactly this opportunity and it brings direct alignment with the Constitution. The DA's decision to oppose this Bill is disgraceful, anti-transformation and a naked attempt to uphold what can only be described as

white privilege.

Every concern raised at the public meetings and by the members of the DA were comprehensively dealt with the by the officials of the National Department of Public Works. It is clear that the DA is determined to delay transformation in court. This is the DA of Helen Zille and Mark Wiley. [Interjections.] It is not the DA. It is not, Madam Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Dugmore, if you could take your seat ...[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is not the DA ...[interjection.]

The SPEAKER: If you could take your seat please. There is a point of order. Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The names referred to by the hon member there, the individuals are honourable members. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, if you could refer to the members as honourable in your address, please. Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay. This is the DA of the hon Zille and the hon Mark Wiley. It is not the DA of the hon Alan Winde, it is not the DA of the hon Lennit Max, it is not the DA of the hon Mnqasela. They know what their

party is doing is wrong. You will be remembered in history and Madam Speaker, the members ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The members of the DA ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, please take your seat. Hon Masizole, I am sorry, no, no. Hon member Mngqasela has risen on a point of order. Yes, I know, I understand.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He was not in his seat.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mngqasela, if you want to raise a point of order you need to be in your proper seat in the House.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. Thank you, I was guided accordingly. [Laughter.] Thank you. Madam Speaker, I would like to ask the hon member a question. Will you take a question, Sir?

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Dugmore, will you take a question from the member? Okay, the hon member will not take a question.

Mr M MNQASELA: He is scared [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, these hon members should not be surprised that you will fail to grow the base of the DA beyond the glass ceiling which your retired leader Helen Zille managed to bring you to, using a dose of *swart gevaar* and scare tactics. I, Madam Speaker, hereby call on the voters of our country and the voters of the Western Cape to punish this party of privilege, of anti-transformation, of unashamed pretension ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... of minority wealth, the party which some are beginning to say is the party of one percent. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The ACDP, would you like to submit? No further reports. [Interjections.] Okay.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I wasn't there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members can we get order please. I would like to now pose the question: are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's Delegation in the NCOP not to support the Expropriation Bill?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: I would like to add that the ANC's objection will be noted.

[ANC dissenting.]

That concludes the business of the day, the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:53.