

---

THURSDAY, 15 SEPTEMBER 2016

---

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The SPEAKER: Order! Before we proceed I would like to make the following announcements as a reminder about the logistical arrangements. To enable a member to talk, push the “talk button” on the microphone speaker unit fitted on the desk. There is one unit for every two to three members to share. Members speaking need not move to a microphone. The system is strong enough to pick up sound from your allocated seat. Members seated in close proximity of a speaker on the floor must therefore be aware that any loud conversation may interfere with the recording of the speaker’s speech.

In order to select your language of choice please press the “channel button” on your wireless receiver to select the correct channel. Channel 1 is English; channel 2 is Afrikaans and channel 3 is isiXhosa. The right side of the unit control is for volume control.

There will be tea and coffee available to members in the lobby and then finally, members who want to leave the Chamber must leave at the entrance at the back of the Chamber. The ablution facilities are to my right in the adjoining passage and the service officers are seated at the back by the entrance of the Chamber.

There are no telephone facilities. Members must therefore make use of their cellphones outside of the Chamber. Proceedings will be relayed to the normal television screens in the Provincial Parliament Building. I wish to thank you for your understanding and cooperation.

We will now deal with Questions as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the honourable, the Chief Whip Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Madam Speaker. In light of the fact that we have an official delegation doing NCOP duty as well as one of the Ministers at a Minmec I would ask that the following questions stand over. That is 6; 5, 6, 7, 8, 11 and 12. That is read in the sequence of the Order Paper.

The SPEAKER: Sorry. If you could just repeat that please Chief Whip, 6?

Mr M G E WILEY: On the first page 6.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: 5, 6, 7 and 8. Those are all on the second page and the third page, 11 and 12, if they could stand over please.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Have we noted the request around the questions for stand-over? Due to the NCOP and the members not being here, we have made provision for the carry-over.

We now move to Questions for Oral Reply. I recognise the honourable, the Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*New Questions to the Premier:*

*Conflict of interest: adviser in the Premier's Office*

### **\*1. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

Why she allowed her advisor, whose name has been sent to her Department for the purposes of this answer, to become involved in a potential development at Sea Point which lead to a conflict of interest?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. Before I go into my

reply I would just like to say that it appears to me that the battery on this has run down, so in case I need it I will be very grateful to have a wireless device that I will be able to pick up translation should I need it, because while I can follow much of the Xhosa, I cannot always follow all of the Xhosa, in case anybody wants to speak to me in isiXhosa.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Moenie worry nie... [Onduidelik.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry... [Inaudible.]]

The PREMIER: Okay. †Undincedile. Enkosi. [You have helped me. Thank you.]

The terms on which the Advisor was appointed in the Office of the Premier, mitigated against the alleged conflict of interest, as it provided for no involvement in any Western Cape Government projects in Sea Point. In addition it is not one of the powers granted to a Premier of a province to allow or not to allow a private company to buy property on the open market.

The SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question, the hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Did you follow that Madam Speaker? Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you Madam Premier, but I do not really know whether you answered the question. But let me ask you, Madam Premier; this Mr Gary Fisher, why was he appointed as an advisor in your office while we have a Department of Transport and Public Works who is supposed to attend to issues of land and

buildings and issues around that?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...still find him in court this morning.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie! [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members, if we could allow the Premier to respond.

The PREMIER: That is a very good point and there will still be many more questions on this subject that the hon the Chief Whip raises.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just answer this question that has been asked.  
[Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Chief Whip, wait.

The SPEAKER: Order please, Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, the reason is that we were engaging in a game-changer that has never been done before in the province and it looks to addressing the spatial and historical legacy of apartheid in a partnership with

the private sector to put together a housing model that will cater for different income groups in the same premises. [Interjections.] So the entire point was to do something that has not been done before. It is not for indigent people. It is for people who earn a limited and small amount of money, the missing middle, the people who do not qualify for RDP housing... [Interjections.] ...and so the major challenge has been to get the economics of that right, to get the partnership with the private sector right and that is why Mr Gary Fisher, understanding both the private sector and the public sector and the need to achieve our objectives within a particular budget and time framework, seems to be the best person to advise me on that particular game-changer and those were the terms of his advice to me. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Premier, some years ago you passed legislation and this House passed legislation so that you can pick up on officials and I believe advisors as well, when they work for Government and work within the administration that there is a proper check on them to see that they do not have any other interest. How come that you did not pick up the conflict of interest of Mr Gary Fisher in terms of there being legislation where you yourself said this legislation was groundbreaking and the first in South Africa?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Conveniently so.

The PREMIER: The reason is the conflict of interest was very carefully ring-fenced in terms of the terms of the advice that Mr Fisher was going to give to me, which was limited to one site around which he had absolutely no interest at all.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Madam Speaker. No, Madam Premier, that is not correct. Only when it was brought to your attention that there is a conflict of interest, you limited him to one project only and the question again is why only then and what legal advice did you seek and what did that legal advice direct you?

The PREMIER: I have never once discussed any other project in his capacity as my advisor with Mr Fisher other than the Conradie game-changer.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No. How do we know?

The PREMIER: That is the bottom line. That is why he was brought on board. So there was never any occasion to discuss any other project at all and where it was brought to my attention that that specification has to be stipulated, I did. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That is the final follow-up.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Premier, was it not suspicious to you that five months before Mr Fisher actually went out and he initiated the expression of interest in Tafelberg, his company bought a building close to Tafelberg. Was that not in any way suspicious then and at this stage now? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Go throw and fetch it.

The PREMIER: You know, Madam Speaker, it is really interesting that there are some really serious conflicts of interest in South Africa, for example [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Answer the question!

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I am coming to the question and I am building up to the double standards of the ANC because in this... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No, no!

An HON MEMBER: Answer the question. Leave the double standards.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is very rich!

Ms M N GILLION: Answer the question!

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Allow the Premier to respond.

The PREMIER: In this case I had no knowledge and I do not have to have any knowledge of what the private sector does in the Western Cape or Cape Town. [Interjections.]

That is the answer to the question. I had no knowledge. [Interjection.] I never asked any questions about it. The initial purchase was not made at any time that Mr Fisher was an advisor to me and no private sector entity has to ask me for permission, nor do I need to know about them. The bottom line is this: that when for example Dudu Myeni Zuma's son stays at the address of Jacob Zuma and then gets a fat cut of the PRASA tender, that is a conflict of interest. [Interjections.] So focus on the real conflict of interest and do not invent them.

Ms M N GILLION: Shame on you!

The SPEAKER: Thank you Madam Premier.

*[Question 6 standing over from 25 August 2016 standing over again.]*

The SPEAKER: We now move to Question 3 on page 1 and I see the honourable, the Minister of Finance. Am I moving too fast Minister Meyer?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are too fast for him. He is too slow. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Deputy Chief Whip, you will have an opportunity.

*New questions:*

*Fiscal policy: approach to*

**\*3. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Finance:**

- (a) What is the Western Cape's approach to fiscal policy and
- (b) How will it affect the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the Western Cape's approach to fiscal policy is set out in the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement 2016 to 2019 and two key fiscal risks have emerged that have a significant impact on the current and future MTEF budgets in the Western Cape.

The fiscal impact of the higher than anticipated public sector wage agreement and the weaker economic performance are negatively impacting on the fiscal framework... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am still shocked by this question... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: To maintain a stable fiscal base while giving effect to the policy imperatives of the Western Cape Government, the

following fiscal policy principles form the foundation for the development of the Western Cape Government budget policy underpinned by the MTEF budget approach. We have in the Western Cape tabled a balanced budget. We have adopted the principle of fiscal consolidation. We have adopted the principle and practice of fiscal discipline in this Government. We have adopted and practiced the principle of allocated efficiency and we have been able also unlike the ANC to set upper limits for personnel budgets and we have also been able to maintain stability and consistency, Madam Speaker, in the application of these fiscal policy principles, because we understand the dangers of the current economic situation in South Africa and our contribution is to showcase leadership in the fiscal policy environment because if the Western Cape succeeds we want South Africa also to succeed.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And because we are determined to assist South Africa with our contribution we have also adopted the following MTEF budget policy principles: constitutionalism, in other words only do what the Constitution allows us to do. Also, we have also adopted the principle of evidence-based practice. We do not simply throw public money around. We do proper research and see that there is evidence. Then we pilot the particular project before we abuse taxpayers' money. We also make sure that our budget allocations create what we call "public value", also with the application of the rule of law and partnerships... [Interjection.]

We also significantly have allocated money to the game-changers of this Government. We also adopted a whole-of-society approach. We also adopted the City-centric approach and all the research that my colleagues have spoken about can testify to the results of the City-centric approach and this Government has also adopted the Provincial Strategic Plans that are aligned with the National Development Plan.

Madam Speaker, the second part of the question. The Western Cape Government strengthened its approach towards fiscal consolidation with the aim to deliver services while maintaining fiscal stability. Now we are in a situation really in this country, this Government can no longer afford and I have been told by my Cabinet colleagues that they cannot afford any further cuts because we have been showing extreme fiscal discipline in this Government, and we do not see the same level of discipline in the National Government... [Interjections.] ...in fact to the extent that in a debate about the SAA people have referred to the SAA as a black fiscal hole... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The question is not about the SAA. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Because of the misuse of taxpayers' money in the national space the rest of the country must now also suffer and the Premier and myself will soon meet with President Zuma and we are going to tell him in no uncertain terms what we think about this because certainly we cannot afford this situation... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: The people of the Western Cape suffer.

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not relevant to the question.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is very relevant.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not relevant.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The abuse of your President of taxpayers' money... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Answer to your fiscal policy.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: My fiscal policy is about fiscal consolidation.

The SPEAKER: Order please, members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And the fiscal policy of this Government is directly affected by the abuse of your President. [Interjections.] The theft of taxpayers' money means there are less money available to build schools, to build clinics in this province and we are about to meet your President eye to eye on this matter, even up to the Constitutional Court, because we had now enough of his abuse of taxpayers' money, so we are now sending a notice to

you, Pierre, you are on the list later on, by the way. [Interjections.] We will come to you.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, you need to refer to members as “honourable members” please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is very hard.

Ms M N GILLION: No it is not hard, it is a rule. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is difficult... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: It is the hon member Mr Uys.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, because we respect the rule of law, I will refer to the honourable members and the honourable Deputy new Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

But also, what we are doing here, and we have been engaged with the National Treasury, we will implement fiscal consolidation and we have already done so in all the various departments. We have set upper limits in terms of the compensation of employees, the upper ceilings and I am very happy to say that many provinces do not know how to do this and it is in our interest to save South Africa. [Interjection.] They are now coming to the Western Cape to find out how we are implementing COE-upper levels but we

are happy to do so because we want to save South Africa.

Also, to achieve the desired COE outcome upper limits it was applied in all the departmental budgets informed by the current headcount and attrition rates and the stage reached in the recruitment process; the longer term strategic includes work toward identifying an approach aimed at assessing the adequacy of staff structures to provide departments with the necessary tools to target the current growth rates in personnel, and departments have committed to remain within the upper limits through proactive management of personnel headcounts.

Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Meyer. Is there a follow-up question? I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you, Minister Meyer, for the response. I just want to ask the Minister, given the global or fiscal economic challenges which the President always hides behind when he has to answer on the economic challenges, I want to ask the Minister, what is the factors in South Africa that impact or influence fiscal policy and particularly these issues that we have to deal with in the Western Cape? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He has run away from the question you asked.

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: What are the domestic factors, Minister Meyer? Thank you.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. A follow-up question has to be relevant to the question. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Exactly! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I do think that there is a link, if we can allow the Minister to answer.

Ms M N GILLION: Very conveniently, very conveniently. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker and hon members, I think that question asks us to be frank in South Africa in terms of where we are currently without economic problems in South Africa. [Interjections.]

I think let us be frank: our economic problems in South Africa certainly are influenced by the global economic performance but what we are now seeing more and more, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and we must be honest and frank with this assessment. South Africans can and we must do better, but what we are now seeing that most of the economic problems that we currently experience in South Africa are self-inflicted and I would very much like to talk to some of those particular matters.

Unfortunately the Central Government has a formal policy. They made a formal policy statement towards fiscal stability but unfortunately that commitment is only on paper. What we see in practice is the following: firstly, we see fiscal expansion. We see more money and resources being thrown at failed state-owned enterprises like the South African Airways, and I am now talking about more and more failed state-owned enterprises. This cannot be attributed to global economic challenges. This is a problem of mismanagement of our own state-owned enterprises, and hon member Mr Joseph, the situation will get worse because the President has now appointed himself as the chief of this SOE body.

Now he does not understand what he is doing, so you know what will happen. These SOEs have been described as a fiscal black hole so this cannot be attributed to the global economic situation. It is a reality that we have to face here. We have to fix the state-owned enterprises.

Secondly, I think what we see apart from fiscal expansion, we are also going to see the more people talk about there is less money, the more the President just simply appoints people as if there is unlimited money, but as we have

seen from last year during the debate on Zumanomics, that is his understanding of the economic rule of demand and supply. He simply demands more. That is the fiscal expansion, but there is a second trend hon member Mr Joseph, what I call “fiscal erosion”. If you choose a path of fiscal expansion while your economy is not growing... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why do you not just give us something else. There is nothing new about that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and you have fiscal expansion... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and you have less tax capacity, you need to be taught a little bit, because revenue base is not growing. You will certainly meet fiscal erosion. Fiscal erosion is when you are destroying your potential revenue base by adopting wrong economic policies. [Interjection.]

Some municipalities that are run by the ANC are already on this road of fiscal erosion. The sheriff in the town of Thabazimbi came to that municipality, left us by the ANC. They took out all the furniture. Today the sheriff came again. Last week they took out all the furniture, all the cars and the fire-truck. That is what is happening under an ANC municipality, hon member Mr Joseph. That is what the ANC is doing. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But hon member Joseph, you must also know what the ANC has done. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer please address the Chair, thank you. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: They came, Madam Speaker. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, maintain your composure please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Today they came to fetch all the other stuff. The DA Mayor now in that town sits now with the result.

The SPEAKER: The Minister has the option to prepare a response to a question so if you could afford him that opportunity I think we could move forward. You may proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Unlike the President that doesn't answer questions in Parliament we are answering those questions here, but there is a surprise coming to them later on. They are going to be shocked. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Dis mos nou maklik!

[An HON MEMBER: But that is easy now!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Not now, some of my other Cabinet colleagues. Also colleagues, I think I do not want South Africa to fail. We do not want South Africa to fail. We want South Africa to succeed and because we want South Africa to succeed we must do everything in our power to make sure that South Africa does not fail. We want South Africa to succeed, but the President misunderstands... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Maybe give him another hour. Give him another hour.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The President misunderstands the severity...

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the depth and the scale of the problem that we are currently facing. He makes a big mistake if he thinks he can solve our economic problems by going to Brazil and Russia, because they are already in a deep recession. Hon member Mr Joseph, I think there is a solution.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can you allow me please.

The SPEAKER: Will you take your seat please, Minister Meyer. Hon member

Ms Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, there was a follow-up question.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Ms M N GILLION: An unprepared follow-up question but you allow the member to answer with prepared minutes in front of him on an unprepared question. [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Okay, hon member Ms Gillion, thank you. I noted your point of order. Whether the Minister chose to speak off the top of his head or off a piece of paper, I have no control over that. He is responding to a question that has been put and unfortunately there is no limit to saying whether it must be off a piece of paper, so if we - I hear exactly what you are saying, and Minister Meyer, I would like to call you to the point of relevance pertinent to the question... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I will respect your ruling... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: But there is no rule that says the Minister cannot read his response to a question, unfortunately.

An HON MEMBER: He is well prepared.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: “The Minister is well prepared”, says a colleague.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down! [Interjections.] Sit down now.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, may I call you to order please. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay Madam Speaker, I will also try to assist. I think hon member Ms Gillion, I came to the part of my discussion to say there is a solution. There is a clear-cut solution out of this economic situation.

Ms M N GILLION: Do not address me; address the Speaker.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I would like to address you, since you do not understand the basics of economics, so I must address you.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I had enough of the arrogance of this member. To make the accusation that “you do not understand economics”, that MEC is really out of order now and I think he owes me an apology and it is not a laughing matter because we cannot take this House for a joke and the members for a joke.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Would you like to write an exam on that?

The SPEAKER: Your point is noted. Minister Meyer, you have heard the point of order in terms of casting aspersions.

An HON MEMBER: May I address you Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, I am just busy.

An HON MEMBER: May I address you?

The SPEAKER: Just in terms of the comment that you made regarding the member's understanding.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Firstly, I withdraw my statement and secondly I apologise... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Unconditionally.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...unconditionally, and I will not do it again.

The SPEAKER: Please do not do it again. Thank you. [Laughter.]  
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But I am honest when I say I will not do it again.

The SPEAKER: Sorry members, if I can appeal to you, we are busy with the business of Parliament and I concur with the members, it is not a matter to be taken lightly but at the same time if we are soliciting responses, we cannot require a response that suits the listener or the questioner so let us be tolerant. The sound system is very, very sensitive and every little thing gets picked up so whilst there is a speaker on the floor let us afford that individual the opportunity, but I am asking all members present, let us stick to relevance, let us try and stick to the business of the day so that we can move forward. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is not sticking to relevance.

The SPEAKER: Your concerns have been addressed. Minister Meyer, can I ask that you proceed with the guidance I have just afforded you. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I will conclude to say that in the final analysis the solution out of this fiscal situation in South Africa apart from dealing with the structural issues... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis 'n grap!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a joke!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...like skills mismatch and the energy situation... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis 'n grap!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a joke!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I think there is a way out of this. The way out of this is to proceed wherewith the Western Cape has done and that is promote fiscal discipline, fiscal consolidation and put us on a path of fiscal sustainability. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Meyer. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, may I address you? In the same token as hon member Ms Gillion raised, the Minister had to apologise. It is inappropriate and unparliamentary to refer to the Minister as †“jy is 'n grap” [“you are a joke”] and that is what I have heard. So I would like to ask you to withdraw that comment please, thank you, and apologise.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek vat daai terug. Ek vat dit terug.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I withdraw that. I withdraw it.]

The SPEAKER: And you withdraw and apologise. Thank you. People this is the business of Parliament. This is not some kindergarten kind of thing where we have a go at each other and I would like to believe we have been through an election campaign. We are now here to get on with the business of making

this province a better run place and the only way to do that is actually to apply our minds to the business at hand. So can I please appeal to all members. Let us work in the interest of getting the lawmaking process done and deal with the issues rather than this tit-for-tat that is currently happening now. It is inappropriate and completely uncalled for in my opinion. Thank you.

Are there any follow-up questions?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit kan nie... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It cannot... [Interjection.]]

†Die SPEAKER: Is daai lecture klaar nou, soos jy sê?

[The SPEAKER: Is that lecture finished now, as you say?]

Okay. Hon members, unfortunately we cannot read the response upfront. We do not know what the response is going to be. [Interjections.]

Ja. So let us go to Question 4, again to the Minister of Finance and it is a question from the hon member Mr Joseph. I see the hon, Minister Meyer.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nog, hier kom nog 'n ander een.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: More, here comes another one.]

The SPEAKER: Deputy Chief Whip, can you please be tolerant and afford the

Minister an opportunity to speak. Thank you.

*Budget to the People Programme*

**\*4. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Finance:**

(a) What are the purpose and aims of the Budget to the People Programme and (b) what impact does it have on cooperative government?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Taking the Budget to the People is an initiative born out of the need and the acknowledgement that the general citizenry wants to be assured that public financial resources are managed in a responsible, effective and efficient way. More importantly the majority of South Africans also want to know to what extent the allocation of Government funds will bring to their communities. As the public representative responsible for finance in the Western Cape I am ultimately accountable to the taxpayers and as a result I have taken the responsibility to showcase to the various local communities in the province the manner in which the Western Cape Government is improving the lives of its citizens by means of effective and efficient budget allocation. To this extent the purpose of the "Taking the Budget to the People Initiative" for 2016 and 2017 financial year is to provide an overview of the current economic climate and the 2016/17 national budget priorities. We also share and discuss with the local communities and the public representatives and the

stakeholders the values and the principles and the strategic goals that underpin the provincial budget. We also use this as an opportunity to share the Western Cape 2016/17 provincial budget with specific reference to that geographical area within the context of what projects we are funding in that particular area, not only for a particular year but also our long-term planning that we do for the next three years.

We also use this as an opportunity to provide an overview to the local communities as to which key infrastructure projects we are planning in that particular community in partnership with the local municipalities.

Then Taking the Budget to the People also aims to foster a better understanding of the manner in which the Western Cape Government spends its public funds and the “Taking the Budget to the People Initiative” also contributes to strengthening intergovernmental cooperation because we also provide a platform for representatives from the Provincial Government and the Local Government to meet in good faith and mutual understanding and to discuss common interests and concerns and basic service delivery. We also use this as an opportunity to inform local communities of the Western Cape Government’s priorities for a particular year. We also use it as an opportunity to consult with the community role players such as municipal officials, interest groups, business chambers and members of the general public on the budget priorities and the impact thereof and we also try to promote through this exercise a culture of community engagement in the budgetary process. So this is what we have been doing in terms of “Taking

the Budget to the People”, also to visually demonstrate what money - the taxpayers’ money - is buying in terms of the services of a particular financial year. I thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer. I see there is a follow-up question from hon member Mr Joseph, or hon member Ms Gillion and then hon member Mr Joseph. Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the hon Minister to share with this House the dates, places and events. When was the budget taken to the people of the Western Cape?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai was net ’n droom. Daai was net ’n droom.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That was only a dream. That was only a dream.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I see where this question is leading up to. I have made specific dates available. I will come to this member or to this House and I will give specific dates when I was there. I have specifically asked my officials... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is uitgevang!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He has been caught out!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...that we will not do this in the run-up to the election because I do not want to be accused that I abused the platform to canvass for the election. That was a clear instruction to my staff: “Do not do this before the election. We will do it after the election.” Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: They do not know.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Joseph. [Interjections.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Ja, dankie agb Speaker. Ek het 'n soortgelyke vraag gehad ook van hoe die gemeenskappe betrek word by die Minister se begrotingsprojekte.

[Mr D JOSEPH: Yes, thank you Madam Speaker. I had a similar question on how the communities are being involved in the Minister's budget projects.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Check your notes.

Ms M N GILLION: Check the notes now. [Laughter.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: En dan wil ek net vra, die Minister het genoem van infrastruktuur. Ek wil net vra aan die Minister hoe evalueer die Minister hierdie infrastruktuurprojekte wat in die gemeenskappe uitgerol word? [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: And then I just want to ask, the Minister mentioned infrastructure. I just want to ask the Minister how does he evaluate these

infrastructure projects rolled out in the communities? [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, one of the instruments that we have established now in the Government is a Ministerial Infrastructure Committee and members of the Cabinet that serve on this committee is the hon Minister of Transport and Public Works, Minister Donald Grant, as well as the hon Minister of Education in terms of educational infrastructure, hon Minister Schäfer and the hon Minister Mbombo, the Minister of Health. We have at the last Ministerial Infrastructure Committee as a result of the size of the infrastructure budget of Human Settlements also taken a resolution to include the Minister of Human Settlements in that Ministerial Infrastructure Committee. So three things happened.

Firstly, on a quarterly basis I report back to the Cabinet about their infrastructure spending and trends and patterns that we observe.

Secondly we are also now involved in regular oversight visits to these various infrastructure because this Government has now budgeted R26.7 billion for infrastructure. This is a huge size of the budget over the next three years, and for this particular reason we have now at an official level between the Treasury and the three various departments also institutionalised a Technical Infrastructure Committee to monitor the progress of that particular Committee. So hon member Joseph, we have put the necessary infrastructure

coordination mechanisms in place. We have also now put in place at the political level executive oversight to monitor the spending, but not only the spending, but also to see what type of risk there is in these projects and so Minister Grant alert us to these particular risks so that we can intervene much earlier in this particular infrastructure projects. So we do this as part of our Executive oversight and we certainly would also appreciate members of the various legislative committees to assist us in doing legislative oversight because we certainly want to see that the infrastructure spending in this province creates public value, and I am very satisfied that what we have seen in the last three years particularly, is that we have radically fundamentally transformed infrastructure spending but also the output as a result of that particular spending across the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Is that a follow-up question, the hon member Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I would like to ask the MEC a follow-up question whether he could give this House a commitment that in terms of his so called “Budget to the People Programme” that every single municipality in this province will be visited and briefed about the proposed contents of the budget. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Kannaland.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, firstly this Government has adopted an approach of demand-led so those who request certain things we prefer that we first go to them.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi daai concepts. Gooi daai concepts!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw those concepts. Throw those concepts!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But one of the things that we have also tried to do, I have also requested my staff if we have visited a particular area in the last eight months, that we certainly go to other areas where we have not been to cover the footprint. It is not my intention to visit every single municipality in one year and that is why we have tabled a medium-term budget policy statement over the next three years and it is certainly my intention to visit every single municipal area, not necessarily a municipality. In some areas I have decided that I will do it in a district area where we have the district municipalities all there and present in that space, but if it is a big municipality and there is a bigger urgency need for such an intervention I will consider, to be fair, because I think what I hear the real question is, will you be fair in terms of the visits? The answer is certainly, absolutely yes, hon member Mr Dugmore.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is actually no.

The SPEAKER: If there are no follow-ups on that question we will then now move to Question 9, which is a question to the Minister of Transport. I see the Minister.

*[Questions 5, 6, 7 and 8 standing over.]*

*R60 road: building of extra lanes*

**9. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether there are any plans to build extra lanes on the R60 road between Worcester and Robertson for trucks to pull aside to ensure that other motor vehicles can safely overtake them; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Madam Speaker, and thank you to hon member Mr Max for the question. The question was whether there are any plans to build extra lanes and just for the record, I think it is the R62, not the R60 between Worcester and Robertson.

The answer is yes, the Department has identified a project to do periodic maintenance work on the R62 between Worcester and Robertson for which a consulting engineering company has already been appointed. During this project the provision of passing lanes will be examined and considered for the said road. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question? I see the hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to ask Minister Grant, thank you for the response, Minister. Is there any timeframe for these additional lanes to that particular road please?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The process will unfold as the project rolls itself out. I have no timeframes at the moment, but obviously if it is urgent and considering the findings of the difficulty on that road with regard to safety, then obviously it will be fast-tracked as far as possible.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. The hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC if he can give us an indication as to the spend in this financial year on this particular project... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: His mike is not on.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, your mic please, your microphone. Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask, thank you Madam Speaker, what the PO-spend is in this current financial year and what the total spend on this

project will be at conclusion.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I do not have that information before me. We have over 800 projects but I can obviously get those details to hon member Mr Dugmore around the R62 between Worcester and Robertson.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. No further follow-ups? Okay, we will then move to Question 10, which is again to the Minister of Transport and Public Works. I see the Minister.

*150 Lyners Street & 18 Franklin Street, Worcester*

**10. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

- (1) Whether the houses situated at 150 Lyners Street and 18 Franklin Street, Meirings Park, Worcester, belong to his Department; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether there are any plans to repair these houses for the use by Government officials; if not; why not; if so; what are the relevant details;
- (3) whether his Department has a plan to prevent further vandalism of the properties; if so; what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Madam Speaker. Dealing with part one of the question, yes, both properties are registered in the name of the Provincial Government of the Western Cape.

Part two, no, there are no plans to repair these houses specifically for the use of Government officials. However, both properties were advertised in the open market through an open bidding process. The bids have been awarded and the occupation of the Houses will take place on completion of the repairs; and then the third section of the question: yes, quotations were invited for the appointment of security services at both properties with the closing date of Thursday 25 August 2016. The quotations were adjudicated and letters of appointment have been issued to the successful service providers.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up question? That disposes of Question 10. We then move to Question 13, which is a question to the Minister of Local Government. I see the hon Minister Bredell.

*[Questions 11 and 12 standing over.]*

*Poaching in the Western Cape*

**13. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What (a) measures does the Department have in place to deal with

poaching in the Western Cape and (b) are the effects of poaching on the unique biodiversity of the Western Cape?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Speaker, baie dankie vir die vraag. Die antwoord: in die Wes-Kaap word marinebiodiversiteit deur die Nasionale Departement van Landbou, Bosbou en Visserye gereuleer. As deel van die Wes-Kaap Kusbestuurprogram en die implementering van die Phakisa Marineprogram is vennootskappe tussen die Departement en sy publieke entiteit Cape Nature en die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisie aangestel waar moontlik en wesenlik stroping van marinehulpbronne te bekamp; stroping word gereeld aangespreek of stropers word gereeld vasgetrek en gearresteer.

Die Kaapse Natuurbewaring as natuurbewaringsreguleerder werk gereeld op land saam met die polisie, die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisie om patrollies te doen en padblokkades op te stel sodat onwettige stroping van byvoorbeeld wild en skaars beskermdes plantespesies en diere bekamp word. Onwettige jag van wild en stroping van beskermdes plante word met die wet gestraf.

Cape Nature se Biodiversiteit Misdaadeenheid het groot suksesse gedurende 2015/16-boekjaar behaal met die bekamping van veral stroping en die onwettige handel van renosterhoring en olifant-ivoor. Die onwettige stroping van 2248 vetplante vanuit die Knersvlakte noord van Vanrhynsdorp het geëindig in 'n vonnis van 12 jaar tronkstraf opgeskort vir vyf jaar en 'n boete van R2 miljoen wat wel betaal was of word. Die onwettige stroping en die

vernieling van plante en diere het 'n negatiewe impak op die unieke biodiversiteit van die Wes-Kaap. In die marine-omgewing is hulpbronne soos Weskus-kreef, perlemoen en kabeljou op die rand van uitwissing en veral in die marine-omgewing kan dit ernstige nagevolge hê omdat spesies en ekosisteme soos kettings inmeekaarskakel. Op land kan die stroping van skaars plante soos verskeie vetplante lei tot die plaaslike uitsterwing van verskeie spesies wat byvoorbeeld net op sekere plekke of in sekere ekosisteme voorkom.

Die stroping van unieke en skaars diere soos sekere skilpaaie en die dwergadders, albei baie gewild by oorsese onwettige troeteldierhandel, kan verder lei tot die uitwissing van hierdie spesies weens die verhoogde aanvraag. Al die geld en energie wat in die bekamping van stroping ingepomp word verhoed die Departement om effektiewe bewaring te implementeer asook om die biodiversiteitseconomie te stimuleer. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Madam Speaker, thank you for the question. The answer: in the Western Cape marine biodiversity is regulated by the National Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. As part of the Western Cape Coastal Management Programme and the implementation of the Phakisa Marine Programme, partnerships have been established between the Department and its public entities Cape Nature and

the South African Police Service, to effectively and where possible limit poaching of marine resources; poaching is regularly countered or poachers are regularly caught in the act and arrested.

The Cape Nature Conservation as nature conservation regulator regularly cooperates with the police, the South African Police Service to undertake patrols and set up road blocks to combat illegal poaching of game and rare protected plant and animal species. Illegal hunting of game and stripping of protected plants are punished by law.

Cape Nature's Biodiversity Crime Unit has achieved great successes during the 2015/16 financial year with the reduction of especially poaching and the illegal trade in rhino horn and elephant ivory. The illegal stripping of 2248 succulents from the Knersvlakte north of Vanrhynsdorp resulted in a sentence of 12 years, suspended for five years and a fine of R2 million that was paid or are being paid. The illegal stripping and the destruction of plants and animals have a negative impact on the unique biodiversity of the Western Cape. In the marine environment, resources such as West Coast Lobster, Abalone and Cob are on the brink of extinction and in the marine environment especially it can have serious consequences as species and ecosystems are interlinked. On land the stripping of rare plants such as various succulents can result in the local extinction of various species which are only found in certain places or in certain ecosystems.

The poaching of unique and rare animals such as certain tortoises and the

*dwerghadders*, both very popular in the overseas pet trade, can further result in the extinction of these species because of the increased demand. All the money and energy pumped into the fight against poaching prevent the Department to implement effective conservation as well as stimulate the biodiversity economy. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Lentit, a follow-up.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I want to find out from the Minister about these people; when they are arrested and charged because this is what you normally hear, they get arrested, they get charged, but what is the success rate in terms of prosecution; can the Minister just explain that to us, please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon member Mr Lentit. When we started off that was a big concern for Cape Nature and myself. We have met with the court system and we have said that it seems like our magistrates in the rural areas, especially, do not get the seriousness of the environmental offences, so we had the system of interaction and also with the police. Currently I think the cooperation is very good and therefore you can see in the judgment where they fined the people R2 million or 12 years in jail, suspended for five years, it is serious offences, serious fines and hopefully we will now build on this. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: There is a follow-up from hon member Ms Dijana. I see the honourable member.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you Madam Speaker. My question is how many cases have been reported on poaching?

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, I do not have it in front of me. We can certainly get it, but I think it is something that you as the Standing Committee can actually do, invite the Cape Nature legal head to come and explain the whole operation to you. It is not only the people they charge but also the involvement in roadblocks; the involvement with SAP, to be visible. I think we need to focus on prevention and we do not at this stage get there or get there as much as we want to, to the prevention side, because of the stripping of our environment currently. We are very worried and I think it will be a good interaction with the Standing Committee if you invite Cape Nature to come and explain this to you. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. Any further follow-ups? There are no further follow-ups. That is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now come to Questions to the Premier without Notice. I recognise the hon member Mr Dyantyi, the Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition party.

**QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, she cannot ask herself the question, so.

The SPEAKER: No sorry, I was focussing on the Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, and she does not know it beforehand. Madam Premier, as the curtain comes down on you, the 2016 Crime Stats have again put the spotlight on the seven year crisis. Do you agree with me that for seven years the DA Government has failed the people of the Western Cape on the prevention of crime?

The SPEAKER: I see the hon, the Premier.

The PREMIER: No, I do not agree, Madam Speaker, with the hon member Mr Dyantyi that we have failed the people of the Western Cape on any measure. The people who have failed the Western Cape are the National Government that has the primary responsibility for policing. All we do is have oversight functions and we have pioneered methods of oversight that have never been thought of or implemented anywhere else in the country and our oversight has gone extremely well right through from the watching briefs in our Courts to make sure that cases are presented properly and professionally, right through to the Community Safety Act, which provides for neighbourhood watches, much more regular crime stats and a whole range of other things.

So the one massive let-down for the people of the Western Cape has been the South African Police Service but I really do hope that under Commissioner Jula and under certain other of his District Commissioners we are going to turn a corner.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Premier. The follow-up?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible – mic off.] ... I understand her to be saying †“my hande is skoon” [“my hands are clean”] but hon Premier what is your answer to the murder of innocent children in Bishop Lavis; to the stoppage of teaching and learning in Bulumko through gangsters - which is Recommendation 12 of the Khayelitsha Commission; two attacks on medics in one day? Besides hon Nomafrrench Mbombo saying “I am angry” – what are you saying to these communities if this is not a crisis?

The PREMIER: What I would say is that Mr Nathi Nhleko must sign the Memorandum of Agreement that the Khayelitsha Commission ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So they can continue dying.

The PREMIER: ... proposed ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I hear you.

The PREMIER: ... so that we can work together to implement the

recommendations ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wow.

The PREMIER: ... of the Khayelitsha Commission. Up till now the police in the Western Cape and ourselves and the Metro Police have done whatever we can to implement the recommendations of the Khayelitsha Commission. The one glaring omission is the fact that Minister Nathi Nhleko has up till now refused to sign the Memorandum of Agreement to regulate the co-operation and to ensure that certain things are done by the police.

Gangsterism is a terrible problem in the Western Cape and that is why we need a much fairer allocation of police and we need a much better allocation of resources for the Western Cape to deal with that problem. I must say when we have applied our Anti-gangs Strategy, through the Metro Police in certain places, which is far-far less adequately resourced in terms of personnel and other infrastructure than the South African Police Service, we have achieved success but we could spend 100% of the Municipal Budget, which is not meant for that purpose, on trying to deal with gangsterism and it would still be a major challenge.

What we need to deal with is broken families, absent fathers, drop-out rates in schools, all of those crucial issues which create a context for gangsterism to flourish.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: A child killed in a class - broken down families.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now that ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Dyantyi, please take your seat. Is it a point of order, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: This is a point of order. Making an allusion of this nature against the Premier is absolutely unacceptable.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down, [Inaudible.] †Nou staan ek op. [Now I am rising.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, I am presiding, I would ask you to refrain from commenting directly across to members to sit down but please be mindful of your comments as you move along. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I think he has pressed the panic button too soon.

Mr M G E WILEY: Cheap shot [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Switch it off – through you, Madam Speaker. Now that you know hon Premier that blaming National Government does not solve the problem, what is your last word of commitment, real commitment to the innocent citizens losing their lives to assure them that they too will get City Improvement Districts; as you get in Sea Point, as you get in Claremont, as you get in Bellville, because in Bonteheuwel they do not have it, in Khayelitsha they do not have it; for them to understand that they stay in one city not in two cities in Cape Town, where others are better, others are killed, are murdered, where others are on beaches?

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. My commitment to the people of the Western Cape is that we will work very-very hard to take over National Government by 2019 so that we can manage the South African Police Service ... [Interjections.] and get a better service.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] until 2019. They are dying now.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: The very interesting thing by hon member Dyantyi's interjection is that he is accepting that his party lets people die, and he is asking what I am going to do between now ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ...and 2019? Now it is a tragedy, it is a complete tragedy. Every person who dies and especially every child who dies, leaves us all bereft. It is tragic and the death of one child is one child too many.

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] that does not have anything to do with us.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We cannot do the police's work.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We cannot do the police's work.

†Me M N GILLION: Asseblief.

[Ms M N GILLION: Oh, please.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are a sleeping Minister. Now just keep doing  
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Keep quiet.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, can I please ask you to refrain from engaging each other in this way. The Premier is actually on the floor responding to a follow-up question, so can we afford her the opportunity? You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Hon member Dyantyi has made the startling admission that under the ANC people will continue dying and they will wait until the DA takes over in 2019 to stop it. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: In the meantime ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: In the meantime I think it is critically important, I think it is incredibly important for the hon members to urge their National Minister to sign the Memorandum of Agreement to get a fair allocation of police to deal with corruption in the police force and to do their primary mandate properly so that we can continue to apply oversight. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] those people who are dying. We get your message.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, if I could - please members a question

was posed, a response was given.

Mr K E MAGAXA: A very poor response actually. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Can we get back to the business of the day, we now need to move to the second question to the Premier. I see hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. Madam Speaker, noting that the DA has done very well in this election ...

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... with the Western Cape notably growing from 57% to 63%, and the ANC dropping from 33% to 26%, and nationally from 53% which was 61% in 2011, and the DA growing from 23% to 27%.

Now the question is the following – there is only one Speaker by the way. Madam Speaker, the question is this: Is there any relationship between the manner in which Government provides services to its people ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: Unfortunately no [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and the way in which people eventually vote ...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Hon member Magaxa, you are not the Premier.

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon member Magaxa [Inaudible.] an election.

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: But the question is addressed to the Premier please.

Mr M MNQASELA: There is one Premier. You will never become the Premier in this province, not anywhere in this country for that matter. Now the question is: Is there any relationship between the manner in which Government provides services, and in fact ultimately delivers services to its people ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, it is just *swart gevaar*.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and the way in which people decide ...

Ms M N GILLION: That is a long question.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... how to vote in an election? Thank you very much, Madam Premier.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mngqasela. I see the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, may I just advise that the hon members of the ANC stop shooting themselves in the foot, because the hon member Magaxa said that the only reason that the DA is growing is through *swart gevaar* tactics. So he is suggesting that black people vote for the DA because of *swart gevaar*. That is a very, very confused message, a very confused message because by far the vast majority of new voters for the Democratic Alliance were black South Africans.

Now to answer the hon member Mnqasela's question and to keep it within the terrain of what I may answer as the Premier, what is critical is to have competent government through an effective State. All the literature will tell you that a country can only succeed if it has a capable State. That is the bottom line and that is one of the things we have sought to do. I am very pleased to say that we have got the basics right, we got 100% in our Departments' unqualified financial audits and almost all completely clean audits. Health got a financially unqualified audit, but there were some other matters in the Department with a R19 billion budget.

So we have got all of the basics right there, and we come top every single year in all of the MPAT metrics, and the ANC often says well that is just getting the routine things right. What I think is very important is that when you get the routine things right, it is a good foundation on which to build innovation and to build new projects, which is how we are driving the game-changers.

So I think that you can see that where you have a capable State and people can see the difference of a capable State over time, you do get a commensurate increase in voters. And that is a very important thing, because if we did not have that we would not be able to run a democracy in South Africa. So in this election if you were to look at where that is reflected, the hon member Mnqasela's constituency of Overstrand would be a very good example. Certainly Mid-Vaal would be a very good example, and equally you will find the places where the ANC is in decline, at war with each other, really going down, such as Tshwane, such as the Western Cape - that is why they cannot get more than a quarter of the votes at the moment and in places across the country.

So I think that good governance and good service delivery make an enormous difference to votes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They fight too much with each other.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. Madam Speaker, the Premier made a profound statement on the ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ask the question.

Mr M MNQASELA: Do not get excited. I am still speaking. The Premier made a profound statement on the cleanliness and the ability of Government to provide services and to govern properly. My question is: Recently when I was in the NCOP representing this province, there was a debate on the clean audits ...[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker ...

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and the Premier is saying that the manner in which Government administers its business is very important.

†'n AGB LID: [Onhoorbaar] stadig asseblief.

[An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] slow please.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Now I want to ask the Premier ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela, please take your seat.

Mr M MNQASELA: There are many Speakers here today.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi, you cannot sit in your chair and ask me a question. Allow me to recognise you, stand up on a point of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is not asking a question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela, if I can ask you, the follow-up question must be relevant to the original question and let us try and keep it short and sharp. I am not trying to contain you, there is a question around relevance, but you may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: At least the ANC showed you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please do respect the Chair. You are the Deputy Chief Whip and not the Speaker. Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker for giving hon member Dyantyi's job description profile. [Laughter.] My question is the following: I would like to ask the hon Premier whether clean audits are something that she encourages, that Government should carry on getting as a way to ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She already said that.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... assist in ensuring that there is trust between people and Government? So I would like to check that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Clean audits are a South African invention. They do not exist anywhere in the world. Financially unqualified audits do, clean audits

are to try and get our house in order in South Africa, and they have three components. The one is financial, the other is predetermined objectives and the third is compliance with all laws and regulations.

Now sometimes there are contradictory laws and regulations as we know. So for example we can be required to fill positions within 90 days, but we also are required to vet every single person before they get into a position and often that vetting cannot be done within 90 days because we are awaiting reports from other entities, etc., etc. So there are great complexities and it is true that there is sometimes a trade-off between compliance and delivery, and there is sometimes a temptation to look for out-puts rather than outcomes, which are much more important to get the impact and the effect of what you are trying to do.

So while it is incredibly important to have honest government and clean government, and while it is important to start measuring what we are achieving, it is also true that under the current system, all of the tick box exercises and compliance regimes can make it very constrained and difficult for delivery. That is why we must now move on to impact based auditing and the kind of auditing that tells us what we are achieving. [Interjection.]

It seems that the hon member Dyantyi is welcoming everything that this Government does, not only in Community Safety [Laughter.] but also in auditing, and I think he must join us and help us get his government out, which in fact is imposing all of these systems that he opposes. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: No he is not very far off.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, we have to get to Question 3 and I notice that the hon member Beerwinkel is not in the House. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr P UYS: She fell ill so our apologies for hon member Beerwinkel.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, so in the absence of the hon member Beerwinkel we will move to the next question. [Interjection.] Hon member Dyantyi, please contain yourself. Hon member Schäfer? You may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Through you to the Premier. Hon Premier, how does the Western Cape's strategic goals and game-changers relate to the National Government's 9-Point Plan for South Africa?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Remember the 9 points. How many out of 9?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me come to that. The question as I understand it asks me to relate our Provincial Strategic Plan and our game-changers to the 9-Point Plan nationally.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, us and them, us and them.

The PREMIER: No, no.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is what you do.

The PREMIER: There is no us and them, there is no us and them. In fact it is very interesting the extent to which ... [Interjection.] The hon member Dyantyi just clearly does not know what the 9-Point Plan is, just like the President, because otherwise he would not be saying us and them. He would not be saying us and them, because in fact if you look at the National Development Plan and if you look at the 9-Point Plan, and if you look at which provincial government has got its own Provincial Strategic Plan and game-changers to implement it, this one in the Western Cape is entirely aligned.

I think we need to start with the 9-Point Plan, Mr Deputy Speaker, and it is a very important framework and it is the summary of the National Development Plan, and the things we have to achieve in order to get economic progress and economic freedom, which is what this side of the House stands for: genuine economic freedom for all.

The first is obviously energy security, and at the time that the 9-Point Plan was formulated we did not have energy security in South Africa. We still do not, but energy security was number 1.

Number 2 was the entire agricultural value chain. Now both of those speak

directly to our game-changers. We have an Energy Security Game-changer, which has achieved an enormous amount, with small scale embedded generation, liquid natural gas and a whole range of other things. Secondly, the whole agricultural value chain is central to the concept of Khulisa which is our growth plan which has three major pillars on which it rests. One is agricultural value chain and agricultural beneficiation, which is agri-processing. The second is oil and gas and all back industries from that and the third is tourism.

So the agricultural value chain fits right in there as does the third point of the 9-Point Plan, which is mineral beneficiation, and although we do not have a big mining industry in the Western Cape, we focus very much on oil and gas and the back servicing of oil and gas, as our contribution to that particular goal. Then there is the critical notion of IPAP, which is the fourth point. It is the Industrial Policy Development Plan, IPAP, Action Plan, Industrial Policy Action Plan. I know the IPAP is the Industrial Policy Action Plan, Development Plan, whatever. Industrial Policy Action Plan and it is absolutely right and that says how we can reindustrialise South Africa's economy. Very, very important.

Part of our entire Energy Game-changer and the green economy looks to getting industries established in that area, and very importantly driven in the Atlantis Special Economic Zone. Oil and gas create tremendous opportunities for industrialisation. Agri-processing creates tremendous opportunities for industrialisation. The revitalisation of the textile industry

and clothing industry creates tremendous opportunities for that.

So in all of those areas, Khulisa and the Department of Economic Development are taking it very seriously and aligning of number one: strategic planning priority growth and jobs to the 9-Point Plan nationally. Also with skills, you are not going to have industrialisation and development without the right skills and that is why we are putting enormous efforts into that area, for example through our game-changer of e-learning and the apprenticeship game-changer, which is absolutely critical if we are going to develop industrialisation.

The next point of the 9-Point Plan is to encourage private sector investment. Now private sector investment only comes where there is good governance, where there is no corruption, where there is security for the future and where the infrastructure and where basic services work, and so we have been trying to do that to create the context for private sector investment.

The next point in the 9-Point Plan is the worker relationships and here we are doing a lot to get people into what are called decent jobs, by preparing them through, for example, the Premier's Advancement of Youth Programme, through our partnerships on what is our version of the Youth Wage Subsidy, and a whole range of other things, and of course our skills game-changer is absolutely critical in ensuring the people can get the skills they require to get the jobs so we do not have to import the skills as the sectors of the economy start growing that we are putting so much attention on.

Then we have another very important series of issues on the 9-Point Plan. One of them is Phakisa which is the Oceans Economy, and of course oil and gas are absolutely pivotal. The development of Saldanha Bay as a deep-water port and the development of the other harbours are also absolutely critical.

SMMEs are also very important and many of our strategies are designed and devoted to ensuring that SMMEs, which is another point in the 9-Point Plan, are focused very much and throughout on especially the reduction of red tape and our Red Tape Unit.

And then finally infrastructure, which is the last point of the 9-Point Plan, in fact Phakisa is, but infrastructure is critical and as you can see we devote a lot of money to capital infrastructure and to maintenance. Now in our Provincial Strategic Plan, we have:

1. Jobs and growth;
2. Education and skills and everything that goes along with it;
3. Health, safety and social security;
4. Sustainable and viable living environment; and
5. Good administration.

You will see how all of those align with the 9-Point Plan and the game-changers being alcohol harms reduction, being after schools, being broadband, being better living model, being energy security and being e-learning. All support the main thrust of the 9-Point Plan. Thank you,

Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It's not too bad but I am missing ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, follow-up?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, through you to the Premier: Hon Premier, you are showing clear alignment of the two plans as we see clear alignment with our plans and the National Development Plan, but there has been a great deal of criticism of the President's, they call it the 9-point sham and they even call it a useful to do list, and the question really to you is what do you believe will set the Western Cape's trajectory and outcome ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... on a different path with regard to your strategic goals and game-changers? So in other words, what principles will ensure that the Western Cape will achieve the necessary growth and environment for jobs and growth in this province?

The PREMIER: The key thing, Mr Deputy Speaker, through you, is that we do not just talk, we do.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Now the 9-Point Plan is a very important framework, but it means nothing, it becomes a 9-point sham if you do not actually implement the policies required to bring it to life. Now if you look at what President Zuma says and what he does, I do not even think he knows what he says, because he has mentioned the 9-Point Plan at least 50 times this year, but he does not know what a single item is. He mentions agriculture in a broad context, but he does not talk about the agricultural pipeline and beneficiation which is what the 9-Point Plan actually mentions as point number 2.

So he does not even understand his plan. So when it comes to what Jacob Zuma does, he is looking for the next deal.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The honourable Jacob Zuma.

The PREMIER: The honourable Jacob Zuma - he is looking for the next deal behind the scenes, he is looking how he can benefit his family and his friends, and that kind of corruption is absolutely inimical to any plan for the future. So whatever the honourable Jacob Zuma says, he undermines by what he does and that is what makes the Western Cape different. We do what we say and we say what we do. Thank you.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No further follow-ups? Then we proceed with the Order Paper. We move on to Statements by Members. I see the DA first.

Hon member Joseph.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ongoing gang shooting and killing of innocents in the Western Cape, in particular Cape Town, and in other provinces, are forcing us to reflect on what the *Cape Times* yesterday defined as “the dark period.”

Mr P UYS: Do you read the *Cape Times*?

Mr D JOSEPH: Whilst the dark period of apartheid and the crimes against humanity and discrimination were replaced with our democracy and nation building, we are as a nation challenged to eradicate gangsterism, which has now become a monster, bordering on signs of mafia operations.

This statement is an urgent call for more police, more special task teams, a call to all stakeholders, lawmakers, law enforcement communities, and to this Parliament as well, that unless we declare gangsterism as a crime against humanity, the everyday killings, the destabilisation of civil society, future generations and history, will point to us as leaders. Gangsterism must now be defined as a national crisis. I so move, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC, hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ANC is deeply concerned at recent reports of discriminatory practices at certain schools in our province. These reports came to the fore after recent protests by learners at Pretoria High School for Girls. The ANC welcomes the initiative by the National Department of Education which has produced a booklet to guide all school governing bodies in reviewing and drafting of school codes of conduct.

It is clear that at Sans Souci many of the learners who felt aggrieved by the school's policy to prohibit the speaking of any other language on the school grounds while wearing school uniform, had not been adequately represented by the school's RCL, the Representative Council of Learners. The allegations concerning the alleged racist conduct of certain teachers at the school need to be fully investigated as well. At the same time allegations of schools levying fines on learners who arrive late for school and also fining young learners, female learners, who fall pregnant, have come to the fore.

All these issues underline the need for a much more serious look at how far we have progressed regarding the transformation of all of our schools, former Model C schools, as well as schools that used to be administered by the former House of Representatives and Department of Education and Training. As the ANC, we believe that the DA MEC has not consistently been involved in driving a transformation agenda in our schools by, for example, ensuring that our schools seek, in the employment of teachers, to create diversity in our schools.

We believe that greater diversity of the teaching staff at all of our schools will assist with both transformation and diversity. We believe that the DA has not adequately supported the RCL structures in our schools and essentially left them to their own devices. This has resulted in many RCL members not utilising their representation at the SGB to raise issues of concern as they affect learners.

Much greater effort is required to build the capacity of our learner leaders and also create platforms where these representatives can meet with other learner leaders, and work on building a culture of democratic participation at our schools.

Such support will also empower learners to deal with challenges which have emerged, such as gangs at school level. We would also like to salute the many schools who have actively created the space to review the existing codes of conduct to ensure that in word and deed they reflect our Constitution.

As the ANC, we call on all parents, learners and teachers to become actively involved in the process of reviewing the codes of conduct at all of our schools.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time has expired. I see the DA next. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. This week Mr Anton Bredell, Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs, released a statement highlighting the state of our dams in the province. Last year around this time the overall dam level average was sitting at roundabout 91%. This year the dam levels are sitting now at just over 60%. This is far below what we hoped to see at this stage, and we should therefore not become complacent about our water saving efforts.

Although we have had some rain over the past few weeks, what is clear is that we are in for a rough time this summer. This is worrying as we go into the summer season where rainfall will be scarce and the demand for water will increase drastically. Water is critical to all of us and with the holiday season approaching, we can expect large numbers of holiday makers and tourists to our province, and this will increase the demand for water substantially.

We need to ensure that people use water sparingly at all times to save the basis of our living. Saving water is an essential practice for all of us and it is the responsibility of all of us to save water. It should come naturally as a response to the challenges arising. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I do not see the EFF. Then it is the DA again first, again the DA. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B SCHÄFER: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, once again people of South

Africa have been let down. Once again they have been lied to by government and once again the ANC government has failed to show any real intention to redress the needs of our people. Recently the Constitutional Court struck down the Restitution of Land Rights Amendment Act, signed into law by the President in 2014, because public participation, misinformation and poor drafting made this legislation unconstitutional. The Con Court cited the NCOP in particular, that has failed the people of South Africa.

It is a complete disgrace how rushed this process was. We know that it correlated strongly to the 2014 national election campaign and people's hopes were dashed and taxpayers' money was wasted. The Act, which re-opened a new window for claims, was declared invalid, and the Commission would have to first settle all claims lodged since 1998 in the next 24 months. More than 100 000 claims have been put on ice. To the ANC, what a shame this is.

Individual landownership with support is a solid foundation from which we give historically poor South Africans a start to economic transformation. For every South African to succeed they must be given the opportunity to own their own piece of South Africa, with their own title deeds as their dignity and future depends on it.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA supports land reform that expands opportunity, brings about equitable access to natural resources, increases productivity, promotes food security and contributes to economic growth and employment.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC, hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Violent crimes and murder of mostly youngsters continue unabated in this province. The latest Crime Stats 2015/2016 shows the Western Cape has 7 of the 10 precincts with the highest number of murders in the country, namely Nyanga, Gugulethu, Harare, Khayelitsha, Delft, Kraaifontein and Mfuleni. There seems to be neither the political will nor strategy at this Provincial Government to fight crime while people feel more unsafe.

To some of the communities, this is not the first time crime stats are so high. The DA led Government fails its provincial constitutional obligation as in Section 66 (1) (d) to promote good relations between the police and community that could help to fight crime.

The body of teenager Lekita Moore was found brutally murdered and mutilated on Sunday and the next day Xavier Bester was fatally shot in the head close to where Lekita was found.

These gruesome murders preceded the stabbing that led to the closure of Bulumko High School in Khayelitsha. It is clear the DA led Government does not care about the fight against crime and violent killings, entrenching the dictum "black lives do not matter". The Western Cape is falling apart

under the denialist DA Government who claims all is well here. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA again, hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The people of the Western Cape are saying everything is well in the Western Cape. The results prove that. I stand here today happy that [Interjection.] it is becoming increasingly evident that the DA is fast becoming South Africa's beacon of hope. Over the past decade, South Africans have increasingly lost hope in the ANC administration, not only in the Western Cape but all over the country as the Metro results have shown.

The DA is committed to protecting the Constitution of this country that is being trampled upon by President Jacob Zuma and therefore respects the rule of law and the processes of the people. We just came from the Local Government Elections where the will of the people in parts of the country was loud and clear, that voting for change means loving South Africa and the Democratic Alliance is the party to govern this country.

†Urhwaphilizo esilubone kuKhongolose kule minyaka luyoyikisa, kangangokuba abantu ebebecinga ukuba ungumbutho ozisa inkululeko, babonile ukuba ungumbutho woohlohlesakhe. KuHlohlesakhe, kwakukho umlinganiswa ekwacusithiwa nguMaqhankqa. Ukuba ngaba niyatyana ningabantu beANC niya kutyana niphele.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]*

[The corruption that we have seen in the African National Congress is frightening, so much that the people who have always seen it as an organisation that brings freedom, have seen that it is an organisation of self-serving people. In the radio drama *Uhlohlesakhe* there was a character called Maqhankqa. If you are killing each other as people of the African National Congress, you will kill one another until you are finished.]

Because this is what Uhlohlesakhe is saying. That killing amongst yourselves is what is going to collapse the ANC, but the most prominent leader of the ANC, Frank Chikane, warned the ANC that if you continue with this trend, there are three possibilities that you are going to encounter, but because the ANC doesn't want to listen, doesn't want to take any warning, it happened exactly as the Reverend said. He warned that the ANC may lose the metros and major cities in one to five years; we witnessed that.

He further said, the ANC is going to lose some provinces in the next four to five years; we are witnessing that. We sent Mmusi over there to Gauteng and we sent Trollip to the Eastern Cape and they are paving the way for what the Minister of Finance, Ivan Meyer, is saying that he sees Mmusi Maimane occupying Pretoria.

The last warning that he gave the ANC, that was not taken into context, was losing the national election in the next nine years and his prediction was in

2019.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to welcome the news that the leader of the ANC, Jacob Zuma, has eventually paid the money that he was asked to pay back, because despite the fact that he was trampling on the Constitution and undermining the rule of law, he was screaming, kicking ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member your time has expired.

Mr N E HINANA: He did pay back the money.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, evictions spread like wildfires across the province and the DA is silent on this matter. People are told the DA won in the province and therefore it can do as it likes. The Western Cape is for two kinds of people: the tourist for whom it is a Monte Carlo for the rich and the other for the poorest of the poor, the so-called "*influxers*" or "*inkommers*" - for whom the Western Cape is unwelcoming.

Workers with nowhere to go are kicked off farms; poor people are kicked off plots with all their worldly possessions destroyed and as we speak, in this uncaring Metro of Cape Town, people are brutally evicted in Lwandle, in the Strand.

The uncaring DA supports the growing suffering of people, while not addressing the social and other issues affecting them. Little support is given to small scale or beginner businesses that are also evicted from various areas to ensure the income of big business. Small farmers in rural areas like Oudtshoorn are neglected.

Here too, we are evicted from our regular Legislature Chamber [Laughter.]; four new schools were condemned; various provincial clinics or schools are dangerous and as we speak now, in Milnerton, social workers have to sit in their cars due to sick Government buildings. Shame on the DA.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: It is not a Government building. We rent it actually.

Ms M N GILLION: It is your responsibility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA. The last one, the DA. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA in the Western Cape embraces the importance of celebrating Heritage Month as it is an important reminder to all South Africans of how beautiful and special all our cultural differences are. This month marks the importance of how democratisation in 1994 promoted an environment where all the people of South Africa, within their freedom, celebrate their cultural differences in a

way that not only expresses the nation's unique cultural diversity, but unified the nation after a long period of cultural adversity.

Over the past 22 years, South Africa has excelled with regard to taking the necessary strides in establishing a nation where all of its people are embraced under a rainbow nation, which has and continues to be guided by the principles of our inclusive Constitution. The DA in the Western Cape recognises and promotes the values that are in-tied by our Constitution as without these values our heritage would be lost.

As we celebrate our heritage this month, we call upon all South Africans to take action in all spheres of life to not only acknowledge their own identities but work towards promoting unity in diversity among various spheres of South Africa's society. The DA in the Western Cape thus believes that with freedom, fairness and everyone having an equal opportunity, one's heritage can promote a unified society.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, during this Heritage Month I want to urge all members of our society to go out of their way to explore the rich heritage that we share as a nation, embrace and celebrate the cultural diversity that we have and work towards creating a unified multi-cultural and multi-racial society. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That ends the Statements. We now move onto Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon

Dijana?

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the insufficient CCTV cameras in crime hotspots in Khayelitsha and other townships or Cape Flats communities and the negative impact it has on the fight against crime. I thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that. The hon Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the implications of the High Court finding of 15 September 2016, wherein Mr Fransman's desperate attempts to avoid scrutiny by this Parliament's SCOPA were dismissed with costs.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the large scale sale of immovable properties belonging to both the Provincial Government and various municipalities under the DA administration in this province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the extension of the land claims period and the impact of the Constitutional Court ruling, declaring the law made by the National Parliament in 2014 unconstitutional, because people have lost trust in the ANC. I thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the HIV and TB prevalence rate in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken of that one. Are there any further? Nothing under this heading? Can we proceed to the next? We come to motions where notice is given. Hon member Schäfer, do you want to get up? No?

The HON MEMBER: Without.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh sorry, without notice. My apologies. Hon member Schäfer?

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Grace and Archie Pick, respectively 81 and 89 years of age, for their dedication and active service towards causes that really matter, as well as serving on the Ratepayers Association and as active citizens of Sea Point. I hereby move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Ms S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the increasing business and cash-in-transit robberies in the Western Cape; further notes that the DA run Provincial Government is promoting them as it has done nothing to address the situation, and commends the South African Police Service that it has intensified its fight against criminals.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes Archbishop Desmond Tutu a speedy and full recovery after undergoing minor surgery to contain an infection.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Paralympic Team for its successes in the Rio Games so far. The team has won a total of 9 medals, which includes 3 gold, 3 silver and 3 bronze medals. I move so.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dugmore, do you still want to move your one?

Mr C M DUGMORE: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Department of Social Development and

Minister Albert Fritz for opening the Substance Abuse wing and orientation at the Saartjie Baartman Centre in Manenberg. This is going to be an amazing service, one stop service centre for abused women. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Education MEC, Debbie Schäfer, to ensure and also actively lead a review of all schools' codes of conduct in the province, following various protests by learners against racism, victimisation, prejudice and discrimination in various Western Cape schools.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion? There is an objection ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Actively lead. Actively lead.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon Leader of the Opposition?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I move without notice:

That the House commends the Bromwell Street families in Woodstock for standing up to the cruel DA led City of Cape Town Council. Its business partners want to evict them from their homes and send them to Blikkiesdorp and condemns the City for prioritizing profit over people's needs and dignity.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to that motion? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the Wakefield family of Matroosfontein on the passing of their beloved wife, mother and aunty, Gertrude Wakefield. We wish strength to her husband Bernard and the rest of the family. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Minister of Social Development for the launching of a new Reading Room at the Nooitgedacht Primary School and thanks Grand West Sun International for the sponsorship of the Reading Room. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Is there an objection?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that a former DDG in the Department of Community Safety has been arrested by the Hawks on charges of tender

irregularities with security at clinics; commends the Hawks' fight against corruption and calls for further investigation into other tender irregularities, corruption and fraud under the DA in the Western Cape Government. I move so.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mnqasela? Order. Just one second.

Mr C M DUGMORE: On a point of order to ask Mr Deputy Speaker, could you remind us, with that motion moved by hon member Dijana, did the members of the DA object to that motion? Just for the record.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have already ruled that there was an objection.

Ms M N GILLION: They did object.

Mr C M DUGMORE: They did object. Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The previous one ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Against pursuing ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: We objected because it's already been done. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you on this matter please? The ANC once again are coming with these doubled edged type motions, where ... [Interjection.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Sit down!

Mr M G E WILEY: We don't have a problem with the motion but we have a problem with the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr M G E WILEY: We have a problem that it is moved without notice, because we ... [Interjection.] They should have debated these matters. So we object to this motion without notice.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. I am not going to allow a long debate. It is a very clear cut case. I have asked two questions. The first question is whether there is an objection to the motion without notice and the second one, against the motion itself. [Interjection] There was an objection against the motion being moved without notice. That is the issue, therefore it will be printed in the Order Paper.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The substance of the motion wasn't an issue here. We proceed. The hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House encourages and commends the intentions by the Minister of Local Government, Mr Anton Bredell, for instituting Section 105 and Section 106 of the Municipal Finance Management Act intervention in Kannaland Municipality. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to the motion being moved without notice? It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Prince Albert Hospital, Laingsburg Hospital and the Beaufort West Hospital for receiving international accreditation in the Baby-friendly Hospital Initiative, which includes breastfeeding towards the reduction in infant mortality and to promote best practices on how mothers could feed and care for their babies. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness that a 14-year old boy from Plumstead Primary School committed suicide at his home last week, allegedly because of constant bullying and ridiculing by certain teachers at the school; notes further that the WCED's intervention has only been

to assist teachers with counselling to deal with trauma experienced by the children and calls for a full investigation into the matter and possible action against those teachers who may have been involved.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further?

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Minister of Finance, Dr Ivan Meyer, and Minister of Local Government, Mr Anton Bredell, for their efforts to save the Beaufort West Municipality from complete financial disaster.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

HON MEMBERS: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I haven't even asked the question, but there is an

objection. It will be put on the Order Paper. Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Honourable Dyantyi, yes. I move without notice:

That the House institutes an investigation into the DA run City of Cape Town's R7-million golden handshakes for two of its senior executives, one being a professional collector of parting cheques, Gerhard Ras.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Corruption, corruption.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can't hear. No objection to the motion itself?

Mr P UYS: No objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection. I am going on to the next one. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape Provincial Transport

Regulatory entity has suspended the operating licenses of 29 taxi operators of Uncedo George Taxi Association and cancelled the license of another taxi operator, following the protest last year in this town, and now calls on the Department of Transport to deal with the unresolved issues which have contributed to the tensions in Go-George Project. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Maseko first.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Premier Helen Zille for being able to outline the National 9-Point Plan, while President Jacob Zuma only outlined one. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed in the Order Paper. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that social workers are forced to work from their cars, consulting clients on their back seats, as they can no longer work in those dilapidated offices in Milnerton; condemns the lacklustre response and blame shift from the Departments of Social Development and Transport and Public Works and calls for a speedy intervention from this DA run Provincial Government. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

Ms M N GILLION: No, no, no, no. Do not shift the blame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Any objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Ms M N GILLION: Do not shift the blame.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: It is an objection, it is an objection.

Ms M N GILLION: Don't shift the blame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Blame it on Ministers ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order!

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon member Mnqasela. There are only two opportunities to speak and that is when the Chair asks you for a question or a point of order. You cannot simply raise and make a comment like that. Now you can speak and you can use your opportunity to give your motion.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Ms Helen Zille, the Premier of the Western Cape, for the release of her book, titled “Not without a Fight”. Thank you very much.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. It will be put on the Order Paper. Hon member Joseph?

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Albertinia Museum waar die wêreld se grootste handgebreide trui uitgestal word, asook die dames wat die trui gebreihet, gelukwens met hul prestasie om die *Guinness Book of World Records* te haal. Hierdie trui wat die Suid-Afrikaanse vlag uitbeeld, sal in die *2017 World Record Book* van die *Guinness Book of Records* aangeteken word. Ek stel so voor. Dankie.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. †Hon member Dyantyi?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Albertinia Museum where the world's largest hand-knit jersey is being exhibited, as well as the ladies who knit the jersey, on their achievement of securing entry into the *Guinness Book of World Records*. This jersey depicting the South African flag will be recorded in the *2017 World Record Book* of the *Guinness Book of Records*. I so move. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.] †Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I move without notice:

That the House notes that for a second consecutive year the City of Cape Town has underspent on its capital budget for housing projects, condemns this bad budgetary practice by the City and calls on the National Government to intervene.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

HON MEMBERS: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? For the last time, both sides, are we done? If there are no further motions, we then come to the end of business for today and that concludes the business for today and the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:00.