
THURSDAY, 22 SEPTEMBER 2016

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. [Interjections.] Order please, members. Order! Before we proceed, a kind reminder to members. The audio is not centrally controlled therefore please push the talk button on the microphone set before you begin speaking. Members who are seated in close proximity of a speaker on the floor must therefore be aware that any loud conversation may interfere with the recording of the speaker's speech.

Lastly, members are reminded to keep their mobile devices on silent because any sound from these devices will interfere with the recording system. At this stage we do not have any members in the gallery so I would like to say we will proceed with the business of the day. I recognise the Chief Whip Mr Wiley.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Good afternoon Chief Whip. Good afternoon Madam Speaker. [Laughter.] Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198 precedence be given to the subject for discussion.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to.

We now move to the Subject for Discussion as registered on the Order Paper and I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

**IN VIEW OF THE CURRENT WAGE DISPUTE INVOLVING THE
ROBERTSON WINERY, THE NEED FOR A LIVING WAGE IN THE
WINE INDUSTRY, AND THE PLIGHT OF AGRICULTURAL
WORKERS IN THE WESTERN CAPE**

(Subject for discussion)

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters support wholeheartedly the industrial action led by workers at the Robertson Winery. The strike has been ongoing for almost four weeks now and the white bosses at Robertson Winery have been too arrogant to listen

and hear out the demands of the workers. Workers at the Robertson Winery have been resolute in their demand for a living wage of R8 500 per month. They have suffered for far too long. They have been dehumanised for far too long and they cannot take it anymore. They say enough is enough!

The management of the Winery has shown utter disregard for the plight of the workers, offering an increase that would amount to just over R200.00 per month. The gross wages of workers on strike in Robertson ranges from R95.34 to R115.00 per day.

Since negotiations started four months ago workers have been disciplined and calm, yet bosses refuse to compromise or negotiate. The Robertson Winery have offered their workers a daily increase that begins at R8.80.

The situation at Robertson Winery however, is not an isolated matter. It is an indication of what goes on in agri-business around the country and here in the Western Cape in particular. The nature and structure of our agrarian economy is premised on the super exploitation of black farm workers and this has been the case since South Africa passed the Natives Land Act of 1913.

Stats South Africa in 2013 reported that 65% of the employed farm dwellers earned R1 600 or less per month and a further 17.2% earned between R16 000 and R3 200 in 2011. However, 2.5% earn more than R25 600 per month. Farm workers continue to earn these peanuts despite the sectoral determination of 2013 following the farm workers strike in the Western Cape.

According to the Quarterly Labour Force Survey of the fourth quarter of 2014 only 51.1% have employment of a permanent nature, 25.2% had employment of limited duration and 23.6% had employment of unspecified duration. Over 92% of workers with employment of a permanent nature and 80.8% of workers with employment of a limited duration have written employment contracts. However, a mere 40% of workers with employment of unspecified duration have written employment contracts. Only 46.4% were entitled to paid vacation leave and only 35% were entitled to paid sick leave and only 5% were entitled to maternity leave.

All of this points to a very precarious state of existence in our agricultural value chain. Even though legally no-one is permitted to have slaves, the reality is that in South African farmlands black lives, blacks live a slave-like existence every single day. It is for this reason that we as the EFF support wholeheartedly the demands of the workers of Robertson Winery for a minimum wage of R8 500.

We further call on all to boycott Robertson Winery in solidarity with the workers and we call on all farm workers in the region to embark on solidarity industrial action in terms of any form of production in the surrounding areas, until the white bosses feel the pinch in their pockets.

To all farm workers in South Africa the EFF is your only hope. Your situation has not improved because the ANC was never a friend of yours. The DA is a friend to your white farm owner oppressors. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Schäfer, you may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, let us set this record straight once and for all.

- (1) The Robertson Winery agricultural workers are making above the minimum wage.
- (2) The Western Cape agri-workers are the highest paid in the country;
- (3) The Western Cape agricultural workers have the best working conditions in the country according to the United Nations International Labour Organisation.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Vertel hom!

[Mr R B LENTIT: Tell him!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, while I note this debate today to focus on the agricultural workers in the Western Cape, I find it most disturbing when the plight of agricultural workers is used as a football for hon member Mr Joseph to gather up some cheap political points.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Maybe if hon member Mr Joseph spent more time in my Committee and less time stirring up trouble like he does, he would understand that our Committee and the DA-run Western Cape and its farmers care a whole lot more about the plight of agricultural workers than he would care to admit. [Interjections.] He uses statistics that I believe do not speak to the Western Cape alone. Let me start with the wage dispute in the Robertson Winery.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Vertel hom!

[Mr R B LENTIT: Tell him!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: This dispute refers specifically to the bottling section and not the entire farm itself. A total of 303 workers are employed at the Winery. Now the hon member knows very well that minimum wage is set by the Minister of Labour.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Vertel hom!

[Mr R B LENTIT: Tell him!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: While the DA supports minimum wage, the thresholds are not in any way determined by us or by our farmers.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a DA farm.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: He knows that, and the issue around living wage must be taken to Minister Oliphant.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Vertel hom!

[Mr R B LENTIT: Tell him!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The average wage for general workers at Robertson Winery has been established to be above all in line with this Act and here is the Act, Madam Speaker.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Lekker jy!

[Mr R B LENTIT: Good old you!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The Act, the determination and I read it, the Sectoral Determination 13: the Farm Worker Sector. It is called “Basic Conditions of Employment Act” and I would like to read the last page and it says:

“From the 1st of March 2016 to 28 February 2017 the monthly minimum wage is R2 778.83 or R128.26...”

And that is as speculated in the Act [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your coalition partner.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: So the employment of all farm workers... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... is governed by this legislation. The minimum wages, the working hours, the number of leave days and the termination rules, but the real point to make here is that agricultural workers in the Western Cape enjoy the best working conditions and the highest wage levels in South Africa.

Ms M N GILLION: Then you were never there.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The outcomes of a study into the living conditions of farm workers was commissioned by the United Nations International Labour Organisation presented to the Portfolio Committee in the National Assembly in February this year. It revealed that agricultural workers in the Free State are paid 25% less than the Western Cape; workers in the Mpumalanga 25% less; Eastern Cape agricultural workers' wages are 30% less; KwaZulu Natal is 31% under the Western Cape and in Limpopo 51% below the Western Cape agricultural worker levels. [Interjections.] This is a province that cares about the plight of our agricultural workers. [Interjections.]

Furthermore, the United Nation's report has indicated that the Western Cape farms also offer longer seasonal employment at higher wages than those in other parts of the country and even more importantly the report stated that because the Western Cape fruit and wine farms have to adhere to internationally recognised ethical standards in order to qualify for exports...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ethical?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...they tend to be more compliant with labour, health and safety legislation. Winery employment practices and standards are benchmarked against standards set by the International Labour Organisation based in Geneva.

This is a province that cares about the plight of our agricultural workers. The Western Cape contributes to raising awareness amongst farmers and agri-workers alike on the labour legislative framework within which they operate for fair practice and these booklets, Madam Speaker, right here in three languages are here as proof to show for that.

We also have a dedicated Farm Worker Development Programme and the Western Cape has embarked on a provincial-wide Agricultural Worker Household Census. The Western Cape hosts the prestige Agri Awards as an empowerment and an upliftment project for agricultural workers aiming to give recognition for the important and valuable contribution to the agricultural sector in the province.

The Western Cape cares about the plight of our agricultural workers.

[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: O, luister nou daar!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, now listen to that!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Now just recently in a motion in this House we congratulated the Department of Agriculture for its international recognition by the United Nations Food and Agricultural Organisation, its Department's Extension Programme as being one of the best in the world and believe that other countries should follow suit and follow the model given.

This is a province that truly cares about the plight of our agricultural workers. Agriculture is the cornerstone of the Western Cape economy. It actually constitutes one of the three most promising sectors to create jobs and give opportunities to people living in poverty. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape has had the highest job gains since 2015 and this province has added jobs to South Africa's agricultural sector in 2015, and while the Western Cape has the lowest broad unemployment rate the real problem here lies at a national level. [Interjections.]

We understand the plight of our agricultural workers cannot change while South Africa still fails the farming sector at a legislative level because at every level the ANC has failed the people that work on our land. The ANC's dismal performance at Land Reform, its lack of success for support programmes, its failure to transfer land to beneficiaries, essentially turning beneficiaries, hon member Mr Joseph, into cheap labour for the State. This is

the real issue here and it will not help to address the future of agricultural workers working on farms. [Interjections.]

South Africa's agricultural sector remains in recession with the quarter on quarter contraction. Jobs are being lost and farmers are at risk.

In the current scenario where we stand today the National Development Goal to create the one million jobs in this sector will be a paper gathering dust on some shelf. We need to improve and promote trading of our products, drive the agri-processing industry forward to create thousands of jobs, support more equity share schemes that work and push to have better land reform for real redress. We consider agriculture a critical employer for the rural economy of the Western Cape and for this reason we understand that the future of agricultural workers to redress and restore their dignity remains front and centre.

Madam Speaker, the Western Cape cares about the plight of our agricultural workers. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr R B LENTIT: We are going to do this in 2019 from the Union Buildings!

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. In putting this perspective in addition to what my colleague has just said, the hon member Ms Schäfer, is that we are not only concentrating on one area. We are concentrating on the whole of the Western Cape because the responsibility of this Government is to administer everything that is in the Western Cape, not on the particular area alone.

Empowering the workers can only be beneficial to both the employer as well as to the employees. Ensuring that the skills are transferred is the only way that the agricultural sector in the province and in South Africa at large will be able to continue growing and contributing to the economy. The reality is that the South African agricultural sector is not producing as much as needed young farmers and agri-workers that are skilled enough to grow the sector to its full potential. Maybe it is a lack of being exposed to agricultural sectors especially from the young people. An education system therefore is needed that people are exposed to in agricultural programmes and re-stabilisation.

However, it is not all doom and gloom in the Western Cape. Casidra for example are under the watchful eye of the hon Minister Alan Winde and has a programme targeted specifically at the challenges mentioned above.

An HON MEMBER: Good work Minister.

Mr N E HINANA: Casidra entered into the memorandum of agreement with the Western Cape Department of Agriculture to administer the individual

project funds and we also entered into a service level agreement with the beneficiary representatives. Programme 4.1 of our farm worker development [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr N E HINANA: ...particularly focuses on enhancing the image and socio-economic conditions of agri-workers as well as their families. Casidra therefore ensures that they are provided with the development and life skills training to empower the quality of life and the production that they are ensuring.

Because we understand the important role that agri-workers play in the economic development of the province, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture allocated funds of R2.6 million for the purpose of farm worker development and 15 beneficiaries were approved for funding by Casidra to provide training to our agricultural workers. Some of these have managed to train the seasonal workers to create employment stability and enable them to take responsibility of their lives while Casidra has undertaken to conduct quarterly project visits; liaise with the project beneficiaries and ultimately provide comprehensive progress reports to the Western Cape Department of Agriculture.

Agri-workers and their family members are at times isolated from the mainstream social interaction and generally have little or no access to life

skills training and in most cases lack awareness of the dangers of substance abuse and the effects it may have. We need to educate and empower communities in this regard, and farmworkers are the community that is sensitive, that need to have proper guidance mentoring and education so that they can sustain the good lifestyle. I want to urge the Department and other stakeholders to develop mechanisms and innovative ways to generate interest in agriculture by the youth; go into schools and identify learners especially previously disadvantaged learners that can go and contribute positively to the growth of this very important sector that provides stability for the entire country.

We need to ensure that a younger crop of agri-workers and farmers is emerging if we want to continue reaping the rewards of this sector. We are pleased with the work that has already been done in developing agri-workers in the province and we are aware that there are shortcomings too.

I am optimistic that under the watchful eye of the MEC Minister Winde more is to come and the plight of agri-workers is going to improve as the examples made indicate that there is a potential growth and potential stability among the industry. Thank you Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

†Mnr L H MAX: Mooi!

[Mr L H Max: Good!]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. It is really quite ironic that hon member Mr Joseph from the EFF fresh from his party actually going into an unholy alliance with the DA... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Dirty alliance! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...in Johannesburg and in Tshwane and in PE wants to come here today and tell this House and the people of the Western Cape that the EFF is the only hope for workers.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please!]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is clear they have lost the right to even claim that, given that they have entered into a coalition with a party... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell them!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The Democratic Alliance, which has consistently taken a position against workers and against the rights of workers... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Mr Dugmore, will you please take your seat. Minister Winde, are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Will the member take a question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, will you take a question?
[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are not important.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: The member is not prepared to take a question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, if I do not take a question and if anyone else asks you if I will take another question the answer will be no, so let us get on with the business. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: We do not waste time. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: So on the one hand we have hon member Mr Joseph having sold out his constituency to the DA wanting to come here and pretend that the EFF still represents workers and the poor.

An HON MEMBER: But they never actually... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And secondly we have hon member Ms Schäfer.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...coming to this House and talking about minimum wages as if established companies such as the Robertson Winery cannot look at the situation, open their books and consider what is a fair wage to pay in this particular situation... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...except going back to a minimum wage declaration and saying they are paying slightly more than that. In this particular situation neither the DA nor the EFF has raised the issue of going beyond simply talking about the wage. Why is the DA not and why is the EFF not actually talking about the issue of workers owning a share or a consistent ownership of the Robertson Winery itself, because dealing with inequality cannot only be about wages. It has to be about ownership... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: O, vat hulle! Vat hulle!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, take them on! Take them on!]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and both the EFF and the DA which are not bed-fellows are silent about economic transformation when it comes to the ownership of Robertson Winery, but from the ANC, Madam Speaker, we

believe... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where are you coming from?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will tell you just now.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...that central to building a better life for all South Africans... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...has to be the ongoing focus on improving the lives, the living and the working conditions of our workers especially farm workers. [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: You want to nationalise... [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The ANC's goal remains the building of a united non-racial democratic non-sexist and a prosperous South Africa and it is critical that those South Africans working and living on farms and in the rural areas must feel the benefits of our democracy in their daily lives. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Concentrate on your schools.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We need to look back and consider the legislative and policy changes that have been brought about by the ANC Government since 1994; it is very clear when one considers this, that not only is it the political will needed to effect change in the lives of farm workers, but also that we have to focus on the issue of partnerships, the issue of ownership and in particular the attitude of employers and land owners. Since the democratic election in 1994 the ANC has worked hard to put in place measures to protect and advance the rights of workers and this is why the majority of workers continue to support the ANC. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...land reform is a complete failure. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The Basic Conditions of Employment Act has ensured that all workers have the right to organise, the right to strike and the right to establish trade unions and has laid down clear procedures to dealing with labour disputes. The ANC has made sure that there have been sectoral determinations regulating minimum wages for workers in the agricultural sector as well as domestic workers, but the point which both the EFF and the DA are forgetting is to focus on the issue of ownerships and we as the ANC suggests that it is important that Robertson Winery opens the books to look at what the possibilities are of ensuring not only a better wage for workers but actual inclusion in terms of the ownership and therefore benefiting from the dividends of Robertson Winery, and the EFF is silent about ownership. The DA is silent about ownership.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But why do you not do anything about... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: But you are not owning Robertson Winery.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The Unemployment Insurance Fund has been extended to benefit most workers and this benefit payment has increased from six months to 12 months.

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Oppas vir John Pretorius [Onduidelik.] [Tussenwerpsel.]
[Mr B D JOSEPH: Beware of John Pretorius [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Progress has been made over the last 20 years in regard to the delivery of basic services in the rural areas such as electricity, water, housing, schools, clinics and sports facilities in many of our rural communities. It is important to point out that nearly 5 000 farms across South Africa comprising 4.2 million hectares have actually been transferred to black owners benefiting over 200 000 families. Nearly 80 000 land claims totalling 3.4 million hectares have been settled, benefiting 1.8 million people. So we should not come to this House and deny progress which has been made by the National Government but clearly all of us should agree that that is not enough and that more needs to be done. In this process the ANC Government has attempted to build partnerships to make sure that we are all working together to achieve the transformation needed in the lives of the most poor and vulnerable. [Interjections.] In many instances these initiatives

have been supported by employers but in other instances it is clear that certain employers are not playing their part and that is why we repeat the call for the books of Robertson Winery to be opened to consider whether workers are actually benefiting in regard to the profits made by this company. [Interjections.]

It is here that the issue of political leadership becomes important. It is clear to me that the DA and the Premier of the Western Cape are not providing leadership when it comes to the issues of farm workers and the conditions of rural communities. All the Premier could do at the time of the De Doorns strike was to make a claim that workers were being paid more than the minimum wage. [Interjections.]

Not once did the DA or the Premier raise the issue of ownership of those industries in De Doorns and simply focused on the issue of a minimum wage which hon member Ms Schäfer is doing here today. [Interjections.] The most you will get when raising issues of evictions in this House is please provide us with the information about dismissals. Why this is important to follow-up on each and every incident of evictions, this in essence is the reactionary approach from the DA. We do not see an ongoing focus on the DA in this province on the plight of our farm workers. It is not just about achieving a living wage. What is required is a comprehensive programme which includes both economic transformation of the agricultural sector itself, land reform, which fundamentally changes ownership patterns... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Where is the ANC doing this?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and it is also about the social conditions in our farms, housing, education, and recreation facilities.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Where is the ANC doing that?

Mr C M DUGMORE: To deal with inequality in South Africa, wages can never be the only focus, as the ANC we believe that economic transformation must be focused not only on growing the economy and creating jobs but also ensuring that workers such as the workers at Robertson become co-owners of the enterprises and the farms where they work and are also provided with access to land and capital to become farmers themselves.

What is required in the wine industry is to ensure that each and every worker not only earns a living wage but that workers benefit from being shareholders in the very enterprises themselves. In this way workers share in the profit which is earned and become part of actually deciding on wages and benefits within that particular business, but we hear nothing about ownership from the DA or the EFF. Simply a debate about minimum wages and what is a living wage. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Where are you doing that?

Mr C M DUGMORE: We need to focus on the issue of ownership in the wine

industry and across the agricultural sector. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Give us examples of what you are doing.

Mr C M DUGMORE: If workers are earning both a wage and also benefiting from annual dividends and a share of the profit it is clear that we will begin to make progress in regard to dealing with inequality.

Another critical issue which impacts on the lives of farm workers in our province is the ongoing threat of evictions from the places they reside in on the farms. Despite National Legislation regarding the extension of security of tenure it is clear that many workers in our province continue to face evictions. As the ANC we welcome the current process, which is under way in the National Assembly where public hearings are being held to receive input on the Extension of Security of Tenure Amendment Bill.

One of the new measures being proposed is the establishment of a Land Rights Management Committee tasked with identifying and monitoring land rights disputes. It is proposed that farm workers will have representation on these committees and that the committees will be able to intervene and try and resolve disputes between land owners and occupiers.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I will conclude now Madam Speaker, so this relationship is an unequal one and we as the ANC supports that intervention as part of a comprehensive package of measures. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Dugmore. I see the honourable, the Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, good afternoon and thank you very much for this opportunity.

The plight of the agricultural workers in the Western Cape cannot be used as a political plaything by politicians in this House to try and gain political points from farm workers.

†'n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: When we talk about the plight of a specific group of people who have been previously marginalised and even exploited we have to consider what this Government is doing to ensure that the cycle of poverty, inequality and unemployment is broken. We have to ensure that Government's interventions and programmes reach those most marginalised still after 20 plus years of democratic dispensation and we, all of us in this House have to work collectively to ensure that each person in this province is treated with the dignity they deserve and have access to the

opportunities they need to live their own life to their full potential and ensure a brighter future for our children than we have been exposed to ourselves. That is why, Madam Speaker, we have to discuss the plight of farm workers today as the plight of the rural population in this province. This includes considerations of people access in rural communities to education, to health care, social services and people feeling safe.

Over the past weekend I visited the towns of Ashton, Montagu and Robertson to follow-up on a couple of the safety interventions the Department of Community Safety has had in the area over the last couple of years.

During the previous financial year, 2 620 students have graduated from the Chrysalis Academy here in Cape Town of which 982, that is 37%, came from rural areas. In total 73 graduates have come from the rural area of the Robertson Valley. 35 students enrolled at the FET Colleges through my Department's assistance. Through the Chrysalis Academy my Department is trying to break the cycle of poverty, inequality and unemployment through the upskilling and exposure to experience which youth enjoys at the Chrysalis Academy. The plight of rural communities and especially rural youth cannot be ignored and we collectively have to address them through the opportunities that education, jobs, social programmes and safety programmes offer to expand their future possibilities.

We must continue to assist the poor. Our interventions must be real. More needs to be done. In the Western Cape we partner with the religious fraternity

in the Youth, Safety and Religious Partnership Programme which provides educational and developmental alternatives to youth at risk during school holidays. I have to say also in the rural areas specifically the Robertson Valley we have partnered with a number of the rural religious fraternity to do just that, to look after the plight of the youth to ensure for them a better, brighter future and the Department of Community Safety will continue doing that. Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Plato. [Interjections.] Thank you. Can we proceed with our speakers list, order please members. I see the hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you Madam Speaker. The agricultural sector in the Western Cape contributes a great deal to the Western Cape and South African economy as a whole.

We therefore cannot ignore the women and men who play a pivotal role in ensuring the sustainability of this sector and contribution to food security in Western Cape.

The sector faces one of the biggest droughts [Inaudible.] at least and even though this is the case the sector has remained a formidable contributor to the GDP of the Western Cape. We need to acknowledge that the agricultural

sector in the Western Cape is one of the top producers in terms of size and this provides a great deal of employment.

Earlier this year Minister Winde indicated that we have set ourselves the goal of adding up to 100 000 jobs to the agri-processing sector by 2019. 70% of the new jobs in South Africa's agricultural sector were created in the Western Cape. These great figures are testament to growth in the industry.

This further highlights the importance of the sector to our province and overall GDP of the country. This sector contributes nearly 3% of the GDP of this country. In the past we have seen labour dispute over wages and what is happening in Robertson Winery is no new issue. Wage negotiations will take place and we trust that the relevant leadership will do all possible to ensure wage negotiations are concluded soon. We also trust that a fair minimum wage will be negotiated and work on the farms will resume.

The new minimum wage rate that came into effect in March this year was determined by the National Department of Labour, increased to R2 778.83 up from R2 606.78 in the 2015/2016 financial year. It must be stated that the sectoral minimum wage has been set by National Government and if anyone should bear the brunt of this wage protest it is National Government.

They have continuously failed to take leadership and ensure that workers receive fair compensation for their services. What I want to focus on today is the plight of agri-workers in the Western Cape with respect to employment of

62.63% of individuals living in agri-worker households that have permanent jobs both on and off the farm they live on. It is also important to note that the Western Cape agricultural sector added most jobs to SA agri sector in 2015.

This is important because the Western Cape Government is determined to grow the sector and has a range of support programmes for workers to ensure they are empowered and capacitated to do their jobs more efficiently.

A major concern for us is the plight of seasonal workers who only have jobs during certain times of the year and have no income during other times. It is critical for us to find means that we create more permanent jobs for these workers in order to ensure that poverty is eradicated. We can start by providing these workers with more essential skills to allow them to get better more consistent income. This is exacerbated by the labour legislation, which applies to the permanently employed staff.

The reality is that labour legislation does not do well to cover the plight of seasonal workers who will not always be employed in the following season for a number of reasons.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not your speech.

Ms L M MASEKO: In conclusion I want to acknowledge the work that is being done by the Western Cape Government in supporting the sector and

ensuring that those... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...women and men who work tirelessly in often uncomfortable conditions are being capacitated so that they too can realise more of the spoils of their labour. It is indeed a very important sector for the economy of this province and needs to be protected and again, in conclusion I just want to say to hon member Mr Dugmore that I still remember that during the uprising the National Minister, Minister Oliphant, came and said the minimum wage is R70.00. She took leadership and messed up because there were employees that were earning about R150.00 and had to take it down. [Interjection.] Now we cannot always in the Western Cape be the ones that sort out the mess that National is doing. They must lead. If they want to lead they need to come and consult so that we can advise them because they are messing up this country and we have to fix it.

I thank you Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please members. I see the hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Good afternoon. I rise today to say it is sad to hear what a member of the Standing Committee of Economics and Agriculture and the Chairperson of the Standing Committee

are saying, because this is indeed a serious case of the agricultural sector in the Western Cape but also of the Robertson Winery. There are people in the gallery today that are listening to how we are not taking their issues seriously as a government in the Western Cape. They voted for the DA but now the DA is not there for them. You are making politics. [Interjections.] You are making politics out of serious issues... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... of the working class.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But you belong to different factions.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, there is no faction here. There is an agricultural ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: There is no faction here. There are agricultural issues. Sadly 24 years into our democracy workers are still subjected to slave wages and poor working conditions. Robertson Winery pays wages ranging from R95.34 to R155.00 per day and that is for general workers. The strike is not only about general workers. It is about mechanics, scheme workers, packers and all of that and there are not 300, there are 465 workers that are currently

working there. Now they are using temporary workers because the permanent workers are outside on the strike.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Temps, temporary workers.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, they are using temporary workers. I want to argue that this must not be seen in isolation from how farm workers in the rural areas are treated by the employers. They all live for very long from...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry hon member Ms Davids please take your seat. Hon members we certainly cannot have a tit-for-tat at the back there. †Asseblief! [Please!] You are not even paying attention. Can I call you to order please? We have a speaker on the floor and it is disrespectful to engage in your own little argy-bargy there while someone is trying to make a point up front here. So please do respect the speaker on the floor. You may proceed, hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. They all live for very long on meagre wages and under substandard conditions from their counterparts in urban areas. It was only in 2013, after the protracted violent farm workers uprising when it was exposed that many wine workers were living on less than R69.00 per day, Maseko, and not R159.00 - less than R69.00 per day. Three workers died during that strike after farmers appointed heavily armed military style security companies with air assistance to protect their farms,

where it was an onslaught against striking workers.

That prompted our National Government to intervene and increase the minimum wages to R105.00 per day.

The DA-led Government criticised the National Government for its intervention, siding with the farm owners. Farm owners resisted the new minimum by introducing other conditions which saw workers having to pay for rent. Now workers, after that increase in salary, have to pay for rent for their children that are 18 years old and older. They have to pay now to be taken to hospital or to the doctor. They have to pay to take their children to school now. They now even have to pay for electricity which amounts sometimes to amounts of R500.00 per week which is the whole salary of the husband and then they must only live on the salary of the wife. [Interjections.] They received accommodation for free before. They received those things for free before 2012.

It seems the only language known to the wine producers and farmers in general is that of strike action by the workers in order to listen and adhere to the workers' demands for living wages and improved conditions of work.

Robertson Winery continues to make annual profits both locally and abroad. They can afford to offer sponsorship and reward their customers with costly accolades such as holiday trips, expensive wines and flashy sport cars.

It is concerning too that the DA-led Government is quiet on the strike whereas we know that they were in the forefront of condemning the R105.00 increment in 2013. Clearly they represent the interests of white monopoly capital. For them it is best to trash workers' rights or entrench exploitation of workers and their families. It is not surprising that Agricultural and Tourism MEC, Alan Winde, showed his opportunistic tendencies by jumping on the wagon, praising the growth of the Western Cape agricultural sector on 1 March but they have been silent on the strike since it started in August 2016.

Mr B D JOSEPH: [Inaudible.] R105.00 a day.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Equally so, the same hypocrisy is shown by the EFF's conduct whilst forging a unity of convenience with the rich DA as they pretend to preach the so-called left-wing rhetoric of being on the side of the poor. It will not be long for the poor people and the working class in this country to see who they really worship at night.

Hon member Mr Joseph of the EFF, you are claiming you want land and you want everything to be nationalised and taken away but you are sleeping in the bed of the people that have it. [Laughter.]

They dine in expensive restaurants, wear expensive clothes and drive in most expensive cars. Yet during the day they conduct press conferences in front of impoverished townships like Alexandra. Your leader is standing in Alexandra

saying: “We care for the poor. We care for the plight of the poor. We fight for the workers ...” But you are sleeping at night with the people that are doing wrong things to the workers and the poor.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... and eating sushi from the bodies of people. [Laughter.] All the social ills faced by agricultural workers are under the nose of the DA-led administration which has no political will to alleviate their suffering. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Sorry hon member Ms Davids. There seems to be opposition within the Opposition. Can you please... [Interjections.] Hon members, kindly allow hon member Ms Davids to proceed. You may proceed, hon member Ms Davids.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But where are you at night that you see that?

Ms S W DAVIDS: I am all over MEC, do not worry. [Laughter.] I just want to say again also, Madam Speaker, through you to the hon member of the EFF, Mr Joseph, that that is why the farmworkers opted to vote for ICOSA and the ANC and not for them because they know they are just making claims that they cannot produce.

An HON MEMBER: They support us.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They supported the DA.

Ms S W DAVIDS: There are 32 houses that are facing ... [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, order hon members. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, I said for ICOSA and the ANC, not the DA. [Interjections.] There are 32 houses that are facing evictions. Many more are facing retrenchments. The other issues that workers are still facing are illegal deductions ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: MEC, keep quiet please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: To name but a few, Rustig Farm owned by Nico de Kock in the Hex Valley; on a neighbouring farm owned by Michael Laubsher, a cancer patient is evicted and a mother of four children from the farm; on Lemoenbult Farm managed by Attie Van Rensburg the owners cut electricity to workers' houses. In Wellington a farm owner migrated overseas and evicted his workers after the new local owners took over the farm. [Interjections.]

Research sanctioned by the International Labour Organisation, ILO, observed

that while the Extension of Security of Tenure Act of 1997, the ESTA, makes provision for the Rural Development and Land Reform Minister to facilitate off-site developments to extend the security of tenure of workers, little evidence could be found of any such development in recent times.

Many farmworkers and their families continue to suffer due to illegal evictions as employers react to Government reforms which seek to improve working and living conditions against workers. It is not entirely clear whether the considerable growth of these informal areas is part of a voluntary movement off-farm, the result of in-migration from other parts of the country, or because of persistent evictions of farmworkers.

Recently it has been alleged that the Western Cape has been hit by a wave of farm evictions suggesting that the latter has been one of the main causes leading to the expansion of rural towns, and in the gallery, Madam Speaker, we have some of the 32 families that were evicted by these different farms, and they voted DA. They even have their DA T-shirts on here but still they came to the ANC the next day and we are assisting them. We are currently going to court with that municipality.

Ms M N GILLION: Amandla!

Ms S W DAVIDS: The result has been that farmers have become increasingly defensive to protect their profit margins. Government's evading statements of land reform had further increased producers' perceived perceptions of their

own vulnerability. The research shows that producers have increasingly passed risk onto workers through the process of casual workers and making further cost savings by recruiting outside workers that do not stay on the farms and that is the problem that you get especially in the rural areas of Boland. They are making use of people that are not staying on the farms while the farmworkers that stay on the farms then become unemployed. A positive spin-off of the De Doorns strike is the realisation among key industry players in both the producer and worker camps that their fortunes are intertwined. Their willingness to engage each other presents a key opportunity.

We need to engage the farming community. We cannot come here and report on laptop research. We need to go out there, go into the communities as we do public hearings, on every issue. Let us do public hearings on the issues of the farm working community and learn from them. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell them, tell them.

Ms S W DAVIDS: We cannot also come here with Bosman's Farm in Drakenstein in Wellington that is a farm ... (intervention)

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell them, tell them!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... that is owned by the farmworkers and the farmer. It was given to them in 1998. Now that farm is exporting wine. The farmworkers

have their own brand now. Those are examples that we must use to make changes on the other farms. [Interjections.] We have the opportunity now to bring about change in the Western Cape. Hon member Mr Joseph, Dennis Joseph, I can stay in the Western Cape but you like to go overseas so I am also now going overseas and nationally. [Laughter.]

Government has become part of this social dialogue and we reshape the macro-economic environment to enable both producers and workers to move forward. We are saying... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, can you finish up please. Your time has expired.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, the ANC is saying as hon member Mr Cameron Dugmore has said, “we do not only want to have a salary; we want to have shares.” Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Can we have a semblance of order please. I now see the hon the Minister, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I am not too sure where to start because we have a good question here that needs to be answered and we need to understand that in this environment we need to have a fair process and we do have an opportunity within our democracy to negotiate between

employers and employees and we need to make sure that we have a fair outcome, but if I take this debate that we are in... [Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: Educate them, educate them!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...one wonders where the policy space is in this discussion and specifically from I think two of the speakers from the ANC, the hon member Ms Davids and the hon member Mr Dugmore. Where are they in the policy space?

I hear the hon member Mr Dugmore saying “land ownership”. I have just come from the Oversight Committee on Agriculture in the National Assembly and one of the ANC committee members asking the Department of the Western Cape around policy positions on land ownership. Where land reform is putting money in there are targets set through the National Development Plan but ownership of land is not on the table. That political party believes that you should have a lease and not own the land.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Exactly! [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So let us get to the real nub when it comes to agricultural land and that party does not believe that individuals should own a piece of land. It says they should get a lease, but you know what they do [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Do you know what they do? Then even within their policy they still do not even give a lease to that individual or that family. In actual fact there generally is not an individual or a family. They try to farm through committee without a lease. Set up for failure, that is exactly where the policy comes from that space. That is in land reform. What about the minimum wage? Whose policy and which department and in which level of government is minimum wage set?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I ask you. We are debating that in this level, this provincial level of Government but where does that policy space sit and listen to what is coming out of the mouths of the Opposition.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Start your speech now! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Just listen to what is coming out of their mouths. So I think that the ANC really do not even know what their own policies are and they come

here and they try to put forward some of the nonsense that they spout. [Interjections.] And perhaps - to put this into context - perhaps we should ask ourselves the question about minimum wage and what is paid to farm workers, specifically on a farm perhaps say what about Minister Zokwana's farm and what kind of farm worker salaries - R27.00 per day. What about Thandi Modise? Let us talk about her farm. What about Nosey Pieterse? But perhaps we would not go down that level. Let us talk about the actual space that we are in at the moment, and we must understand that we have policies and we have legislative frameworks within which we work, number one.

Mr L H MAX: Workshop, workshop!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But number two, we must also understand the unintended consequences and this is where I must say to the hon member Mr Joseph, you cannot use this kind of debate and this kind of negotiation as a membership drive. You cannot do that. [Interjection.]

†Mnr L H MAX: Ja! Haai shame!

[Mr L H MAX: Yes! Hey, shame!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Because you really, really are going down the wrong road and I will tell you why, because the hon member Ms Davids spoke about and I said in the beginning that we have space in this country to negotiate between

employers and employers and we respect that space and we have even got regulatory environments to take it further, like the CCMA, etcetera, and this case has already been to the CCMA once and it can continue in that space, but we must also remember there are sometimes unintended consequences. The hon member Ms Davids spoke about the tragic loss of life and we have to remember De Doorns. We remember Marikana. We remember these things and we must be very sensitive to these kinds of issues when we are dealing with people's lives and their incomes. We need to be very sensitive.

Mr L H MAX: That is right. That is the future of South Africa.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We need to be very sensitive. We also need to be sensitive to the unintended consequences because in 2008 in this space permanent farm workers made up 60% of the work force. Post 2009 it became 33%. So remember that there are unintended consequences. When the hon member Ms Davids was speaking she said something and I said to her you must ask the question why? Why do these things happen? When people are put off farms, why does that happen? What is the reason and we need to go and start looking at the nub and that is where we play because that is policy and legislation and we ask ourselves those questions around unintended consequences.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So what are the reasons? Tell us!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Then of course... [Interjections.]

Mr R D LENTIT: You! You are the reason!

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Then of course we are dealing with, and this debate has moved on to farms, but in actual fact the discussion that is happening at the moment is amongst workers that are actually in the agri-processing space. So it is on farm but it is actually one step beyond farm and I am not sure if the members of the Committee have looked at the BFAP baseline yet that has just been released? It is a very interesting document to look at. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hulle sal nie weet nie. [Tussenwerpsel.]

[An HON MEMBER: They will not know. [Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And specifically when you think about the context in which we are talking which is about wine, and if you go and have a look at the wine industry outlook and it shows you where they have gone and done the research of where what lies on a farm and on the next, in the value chain of agri-processing. So if you have a look at net income on a wine farm, what does this House think that the net income is on a bottle of wine that costs

R29.99 retailed in a store? How much money on a R20.00 or a R30.00 bottle of wine in a store is net income on a farm? A guess!

†Me P Z LEKKER: Antwoord die vraag asseblief.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Answer the question, please.]

An HON MEMBER: R5.90?

†'n AGBARE LID: Kom, kom!

[An HON MEMBER: Come on, come on!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Fifty-two cents! It is 2%. Then let us have a look at the producer production costs, it is 7%, R2.19 or the wine manufacturing costs, 4%, R1.29. The VAT and excise, in actual fact what Government takes is R5.71 at 19% and this is what we are fighting about in this space here, and so when we come along and say we have to negotiate at 150% we need to be sensitive to these kind of discussions because at the same time we have also got a South African context that we sit in where in real terms more than half of our population do not have a job in this country.

You know I was looking at some stats the other day from Stats SA considering a minimum wage which you heard from the Chair of the Standing Committee at R2 778. You take that more than 50% of our country sits unemployed. If you took a farm worker on minimum wage as the sole

breadwinner in a household, do you know that that household is in the top 50% of income in South Africa?

That really puts it into context of where we are as an environment, as an economic environment, as a space in which people have to - as honourable Plato said - reach their full potential in life where they can see opportunity going forward so in the context of this debate we must remember that our Reserve Bank Governor says nought percent growth in this country going forward. We know that the rating agencies are sniffing around again.

An HON MEMBER: Who is it, Moody?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We know that the rating agencies are sniffing around again and a downgrade, what is that going to do to that number that I have just mentioned now? A shocking number that we cannot be no-where near proud of as a minimum wage income with an unemployment rate that we have in a country that is of the highest in the world.

We must understand that this debate that we are having at the moment is a sensitive debate, it is a debate that we have to make sure that we understand the full context of, and in this country we need that party to understand the implications of individuals in households, whether they are employed or unemployed, and the plight that they have while the President is doing what he is doing, while the rating agencies are threatening us, while they are

threatening our Minister of Finance, while they really are putting the whole economy of our country under serious, serious threat.

The threat that they are putting our economy under is actually putting farmworkers under pressure, who are now, as I told you, the lucky ones with an income and with the rest of our population we do not even see hope; that political party is putting those people under such tremendous pressure. I think they need to wake up and realise what is happening, and if they do not even understand their own policies, I am really, really worried, because they should be having this kind of discussion in their caucuses and understanding that they better start dealing with this in their congresses, because they are taking this country one way. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That hon members, concludes the debate on that subject. We now move to Interpellations. We now proceed to interpellations as printed on the Question Paper, and I think the first one I see is the honourable the Minister Madikizela.

INTERPELLATIONS

Housing beneficiaries

1. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether the housing beneficiary data for prospective housing qualifiers are updated regularly in the Western Cape to reflect, among others, changes in prospective beneficiaries' income or changes in prospective beneficiaries' addresses?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. During the registration process the prospective qualifiers are urged to update their information as soon as any changes occur. This is in respect of specifically their income, addresses and contact details. At least once a year municipalities will communicate with applicants longest on the data base to update their details. This is usually done by publishing an article in local newspapers, via SMS's, telephonically or by requesting them to update their details on-line. When prospective qualifiers are selected for an opportunity and where information on the applicant may become available, this is also updated on the Western Cape Housing Demand Database.

Ultimately it is the responsibility of the applicant to inform the municipality of any changes to their circumstances, but the biggest problem in this particular issue, is not so much about the people who are on the housing demand database. The biggest problem is to strike a balance between the number of people who are living in squalor who are not even on the waiting list, versus those who have been waiting on the waiting list for years, when we provide housing opportunities that are so limited. That is what we need to fix when it comes to the Housing Demand Database versus the people who are living in informal settlements.

To a certain extent some programmes within the housing code are addressing this, but we have to make sure that the principle of first come first served is applied, so that people are able to respect our own processes in terms of making sure that when they have been waiting for a house for a very long time, there must be an assurance that they will be prioritised when it comes to the provision of a house. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, the reality is that the people's circumstances change for the better at times, and we need to ensure that these individuals who upon applying for housing initially who qualified for a particular type of housing opportunity, are not allocated free housing or excluded, because they now do not meet the criteria they met before.

We thus need to ensure that each housing development comprises of a number of options where we will cater for all those who seek housing opportunities. GAP housing, for example, is a policy that addresses the housing aspirations of people who earn between R3 000 and R15 000 per month and do not qualify for their free housing, and do not earn enough to obtain home loans.

We therefore emphasise the need to ensure the constant updating of the database and that municipalities have a system. Maybe with help from the Department, you can make sure that they have their data updated, We know the projects usually come after about 10 years in some of the municipalities,

and you will find that because circumstances have changed there, the development that comes there does not talk to the data that they do have. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me start by adding my call for the database to be updated on a regular basis. We live in a country where every time we try to do well for our people, there are those who constantly try to make a quick buck here and there. By updating the database on a regular basis, it will ensure that we get rid of fraudulent people on the database.

In the past we have found people that were already allocated houses re-appearing on the list again. However, much progress has been made in tackling fraud and corruption in the allocation of housing opportunities, and cleaning up the beneficiary database. However, more needs to be done to ensure that we do not allocate to undeserving beneficiaries. Regular updating of beneficiary details will mean that the Government can monitor them more closely and will thus be able to detect any irregularities, and subsequently deal with them.

The Western Cape Government is committed to delivering housing opportunities to qualifying individuals. We cannot allow criminals to take away from our most deserving communities. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is an attempt to deviate from the objectives of the allocation guidelines, which is to facilitate a fair, equitable, transparent and inclusive selection and housing allocation process. Any such act must be closely monitored to ward off corruption and nepotism. Prospective qualifiers cannot undermine the existing beneficiaries on the housing list. The Department must ensure that the backlog is dealt with and beneficiaries receive their houses.

The ongoing housing protests in communities like Oscar Mpetha Square in Nyanga and Langa Old Flats, emanate from this reluctance to honour the already completed recipients database. Some finished houses stand empty which allows for thuggery, raping and killings. During 2010 in Lorentia Park Phase I of Somerset West, 200 houses were built. A DA-led, Beneficiaries Committee which was tasked to oversee the transparent and inclusive housing list, has changed the waiting list and one may ask why? [Interjection.]

Consequently the Committee has further manipulated the beneficiaries list. It is alleged that family, friends and acquaintances were all of a sudden high on the list as beneficiaries.

It is feared that similar things may occur during phase II of this project. We call on a thorough investigation to be done by the Department of Human Settlements, the Office of the Public Protector or HAWKS. I thank you, Mr

Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. If we talk about the database in terms of housing allocation, I want to say to the Minister that if the Department of Home Affairs can monitor the allocation of an ID to a person who is coming from the Eastern Cape or wherever but he cannot apply from wherever he is, the database for Human Settlements also has to be like that so that people from other areas, people who are issued with housing cannot go and apply and form part of this database.

In order to facilitate the allocation of housing opportunities in the province, the Department of Human Settlements in the Western Cape undertook to develop a system of managing and planning for the demand of housing in the Western Cape. The idea is therefore that a citizen gets registered on the municipality housing database, to stand in line as a beneficiary of a housing opportunity once it becomes available, but it cannot be a double portion for everyone, wherever he goes he gets a house.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Just finish your sentence. Your time has expired.

Mr N E HINANA: One would expect the database to be periodically updated. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Municipalities must be open with their processes to communities to have credible beneficiary lists. Beneficiary lists must be handled in a transparent manner to encourage reputable allocation of houses. It is thus crucial for the Department to assist the municipalities to handle and keep their databases updated. We need to ensure that municipalities evaluate their communities' needs and ensure that we provide integrated projects that speak to everyone's needs.

We cannot discard persons on the list because they no longer qualify for one type of housing opportunity that they had applied for. Furthermore we need to clamp down on individuals attempting to obtain opportunities in a fraudulent way. If we regularly update people's profiles, we will ensure that duplications are also avoided. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. Let me say Mr Deputy Speaker, that the process of registering on a housing demand database and applying for a subsidy are two different processes, and I do agree with some sentiments that when a project is about to start, because you register on the Housing Demand Database and the project starts 5 years after

that, or 10 years after that. What is important is that we must know before the project starts, and that is why what we are doing now is we are working with the municipalities to profile their Housing Demand Database, because for you to know that there are 100 000 people there is not enough. You must know the different incomes of these people so that that can then inform the type of housing options that you must build for those people beforehand.

What is currently happening is that we have this Housing Demand Database. You start a project which in many municipalities, especially outside Metro, are BMGs and they profile these people on the Housing Demand Database, only to find that by the way, many of these people do not qualify for BMG, and then that is where you start to apply for a different option which is something that needs to be done upfront.

Hon member Dijana, no committee can change the Housing Demand Database because people register at a municipal level. So if ... [Interjection.]

Ms T M DIJANA: But I have got ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, no, no. You cannot change the Housing Demand Database. If you have a profile we are very happy for you to bring it to the fore, because what happens is that people apply for subsidies to the municipality and to the province, and then a list of those who qualify will be taken back to the municipality, back to the developer so that the qualifying beneficiaries can then end up in houses.

So if for some reason you are saying there are people who are changing that list, I would be very happy for you to bring it to my attention so that we can deal with it. Then lastly ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired, but you can have one last sentence.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Okay. Lastly many people are raising the issue of updating the Housing Demand Database and I think I spoke to that at length. We spent more than R2 million as the Department, assisting all municipalities to make sure that their Housing Demand Databases is updated.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That takes care of the first interpellation.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the second interpellation, hon member Joseph to hon Minister Schäfer. I see hon Minister Schäfer.

Transport assistance to learners in boarding schools

2. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Education:

Whether there any plans by her Department to change the policy which

will allow learners in boarding schools to receive transport assistance?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. No, hon Joseph, as I have told you repeatedly, as much as I would like to change the policy given the current financial climate, there is no possibility of revising this policy at present. I am not sure why the ANC-led administration prior to 2009 did not change it, however given the extreme financial pressures we are facing, as well as the prospect of further cuts, I am unable to change it now, despite the will to do so.

Last year I asked my officials to review the policy looking into two aspects. Firstly, how do we assist learners in hostels that cannot afford the remainder of the hostel fees after the subsidised amount is being taken off, and secondly, what can we do about transport to and from the hostel on Mondays to Fridays if there is no weekend supervision. Unfortunately, the position we find ourselves in as a result of National Government negotiating wages above inflation, for which they have not given us the money, is that we had a shortfall of R1.3 billion over the MTEF as of last year. This is likely to increase given that the increases are inflation linked.

Costs of learner transport have also risen dramatically from R147.6 million in 2009/2010 to R359.7 million this year largely because of increases in the population throughout the Western Cape. We currently have over 15 000 in 164 hostels across the Western Cape. Of these 5 800 learners are receiving hostel subsidies from the WCED. The estimated implication for them to

receive subsidised transport in addition to the hostel subsidy is approximately an additional R23 million per year, which we simply do not have. This does not take into account the other issues which I would also like to amend.

We currently transport more than 50 000 in our poor rural areas to get to and from school. This comes at a cost of R359 million for learner transport. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Denis Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you hon Minister for that response thus far. The DA in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It's not the DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: The Western Cape Government, controlled by the DA in the Western Cape, recognises the learners' circumstances, especially those in far remote geographical areas and that it is very difficult regarding attending schools and receiving the basic right to education.

Now the purpose of the policy is to support learners and the policy is very much guided and entrenched in our Constitution, and there are many cases in the Western Cape where there are boarding schools that are linked to a school, and of course the transport policy does not directly speak to the

boarding schools.

The policy that was updated on 6 May 2013 also reflected on this point about learners that the Department is struggling with in terms of do they support it or do they not support it? In fact, the indication I am getting is that if there is support for transport, they cannot support the boarding school at the same time. Now that brings a disadvantaged situation to those learners who need transport to get to boarding school and where currently so many community people and leaders are helping to get those learners to school, because it is pointless having a boarding school and having learners who cannot get there because they cannot afford it. I think that is the point that I want to bring over to the House today. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon member Wiley must speak to it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo is not here, I see the hon member Olivier.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Verduidelik die ding asseblief tog.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please explain this thing.]

Mr R T OLVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, many learners who are attending public schools, mainly from rural communities throughout the province, are still struggling to access adequate school and learner transport. The minimum 5km radius is proving to be equally inadequate to many learners.

These children are forced to walk distances in the dark, mostly during the winter season. They become victims of criminals to and from school. There are instances where learners are subjected to hijackings, robbery and young girls threatened with assault and rape.

Previously in a debate on learner transport I suggested that the radius must be reviewed and reduced to 3km in certain areas, subject to in-depth study and analysis by the affected stakeholders in the area and accessibility ...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Speak to Joseph.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...to public transport. Even provided learners' transport has caused many tragic incidents and accidents that forced Western Cape Education to launch an investigation on pupil transport in the province in August 2012 by a civic society organisation, and SADTU forced the Department to release that confidential report. One wonders whether this report was ever released.

In June 2015 about 200 learners from Wolseley, Stellenbosch, Wellington and Grabouw, handed a memorandum to the Western Cape Department, demanding learner transport. Therefore, the contemplated boarding learner transport policy change cannot be supported in its current form until the preceding challenges are addressed adequately by the Department of Education.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Joseph again.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think the point I want to make is that the Department has a policy on transport for learners which is well covered, and I think the policy is clear. The issue that I am raising today, particularly on behalf of my constituency, but also many other constituencies, is saying that transport to primary schools is covered, but the boarding school issue is not covered.

Mr P UYS: Who is your ...[Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Affordability for poor communities, particularly disadvantaged communities, is important. The policy is asking for the review. In fact, the policy makes provision for a review when the circumstances necessitate it, and that is why I am raising it with the Minister so that when the need arises, and I think the need is now, the policy is reviewed in terms of bringing fairness to learners who are in boarding schools and need transport. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Schäfer to respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please tell him again. There is no policy. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon member Joseph, you have my sympathy with regard to the plight of many rural learners. The policy was in fact updated last year and as I have said, we can update policies until the cows come home, if there isn't money there isn't money.

Now the 5km radius as far as the Learner Transport Policy is concerned, actually is in fact National policy. There are many people in the ANC provinces who go 12km to school every day. The fact of the matter is the Education Department cannot transport every single child from their home to their school. It is just not possible.

Education also cannot take responsibility for every social ill that exists in the country. I sympathise with people having to also be subjected to crime and so on, but that is not my mandate to worry about. [Interjection.] No, it is actually SAPS. By the way, hon member Dyantyi should know that having been the previous MEC for quite a while. So I do sympathise hon member Joseph. It was reviewed last year. If we get more money we will review it again. Minister Meyer is laughing. I am going to have to ask him. I did ask him in the last MTEC presentations for more money for learner transport, it was not given to me.

So unless you get more money from National Government after they stop wasting it and giving it to the Guptas, then we will be able to look after our learners better, but I can assure you we are doing absolutely everything possible to look after our poor learners in particular. Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, order. We then proceed to the third interpellation. Hon member Maseko to Minister Madikizela. I see the hon Minister.

Basic services to rural towns

3. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether his Department is supporting municipalities to supply basic services to the rural towns, for example missionary towns?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Missionary towns are privately owned and administered by the churches.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order hon ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: However ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Can I just say to the new hon Deputy Chief Whip there is a certain dignity and decorum attached to the new position that you find yourself in, which I am still trying to find. So just bear with us for a little bit. Please continue Minister. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: However, hon member Maseko, we have been approached by a number of these churches on the issue of providing basic services in these areas, and also in some instances they wanted to partner with us to formalise houses for the people who are living on the land that they own, but we have been very consistent in terms of the response that we have given them, to say that we cannot spend public funds on private land.

What we have been saying to them is that ... [Interjection.] But that is the reality. Really? I am surprised that there are members of this House who do not know that. But what we have been saying is that we must be given an assurance that the houses or the properties where these people live will be ultimately transferred to them, and if they can enter into a land availability agreement with us that gives us an assurance that indeed that will happen, we can then get involved in the provision of services, and also ultimately the provision of formal houses in those areas. So that is what we have been saying to those churches.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, we did get results from the Standing Committee after asking this question; because of the uncertainty about ownership, planning and delivery of services in these missionary towns are difficult. The history and the resulting land claims are difficult to solve and we need to expedite and fast-track this process so that

people can start living on productive land with proper services.

I am therefore happy to see that out of the 2 039 title deeds registered since the DA came into government in the Western Cape, 1 977 title deeds have been handed over to the beneficiaries from these missionary towns through your negotiations. Successful rural development is critical for the long term sustainability of rural municipalities, and despite the challenges faced in these rural towns, the Western Cape Government remains committed to providing basic services to all people of the Western Cape, both in rural and urban areas.

Yes, I am happy with the progress of the title deeds transfer in the mission towns of the Western Cape, but I ask that we make a last effort to resolve the last existing cases expediently so that everyone can receive the land and basic services that they are entitled to

Another thing, hon Minister, that I wanted to mention to you is the issue of water services in those municipalities, the bulk services. Let me not say water services - the bulk services within those municipalities. If the hon Minister can intervene to help those municipalities to make sure that much as they are in the mission, on privately owned land, their basic right to water in those missions has to be prioritised so that they can also be helped with that. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, as mentioned by my colleague, service delivery needs to be afforded to all citizens of the province, irrespective of the residential area. Whether it is urban or rural, the service has to be provided. The people of the Western Cape have put their trust in the Democratic Alliance to ensure that they receive the quality services that they have continued to receive in the past.

We cannot stand here and pretend that all is good and that the people are happy. One would expect that the database of people falling under the missionaries is also known. This would require checking on the citizen situation to ensure that they still qualify in order to get the services. The other thing that has to be the responsibility of the Department is that these churches, as much as they are mushrooming all over the place, need to take responsibility that each and every service they are getting, they are paying for. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The tale of two cities is the true reality when it comes to the delivery of basic services to the people of the Western Cape. The municipal services are skewed towards the rich and affluent at the expense of the poor, marginalising historically disadvantaged communities. The rural communities, that include missionary households, are the worst affected by the lack of basic services, such as adequate housing, safe water, sanitation, proper roads and lighting.

In many areas there is still a huge housing backlog which forces residents into informal settlements and poverty. There are a few schools far from the learners' homes. The rate of unemployment is often high and limited to farms or in retail. This causes economic distress amongst the communities, which leads to moral decay and all sorts of social ills, especially amongst young people. There is therefore no need to treat missionary towns as if they are different from other poor rural communities.

The Integrated Development Plans are designed to be a catalyst for service delivery priorities and ensure that rural people's quality of life is improved, their dignity restored and valued at all times. DA-led municipalities can do much more for rural poor, including missionary towns. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lentit.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA has made great strides in ensuring that basic services are delivered to the people of this province, and we are committed to continue to work hard to improve the lives of our people. Our Government has put in place programmes that seek to develop rural areas and provide people with opportunities that will ensure that they make positive contributions to their communities.

To illustrate this, Theewaterskloof Municipality was the first to implement service level agreements in all towns to narrow the gap of community service needs and municipal service delivery abilities. Furthermore the municipality

has a very successful town management model that ensures that local government services and democracy are extended to our poor people. The same has been seen in the missionary town ... [Interjection.] You have never been in Theewaterskloof. That is your constituency. †Dit is hoekom julle Villiersdorp verloor het. [That is why you lost Villiersdorp.] You are never there. [Interjections.]

The same has been seen in the missionary town of Genandendal, where I am on regular basis, where the municipality delivers services such as waste removal, quality water, housing and infrastructure ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R B LENTIT: ... maintenance. Lastly, Mr Deputy Speaker, our role and responsibility are to support these rural communities and ensure we create a conducive ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Your time has expired.

Mr R B LENTIT: ... environment for them to grow. Without hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Successful rural

development is critical for the long term sustainability of rural municipalities. The Western Cape Government remains committed to providing basic services to all people of the Western Cape, both in rural and urban areas. The Provincial Strategy Goal 5 of the DA-led Western Cape Government commits all Government departments to embedding good governance and integrated service delivery through a number of partnerships and spatial planning.

What is clear is that people in the Western Cape are most fortunate when compared to every other province in terms of getting access to basic services. A number of challenges face rural municipalities as they do not have great sources to generate revenue and it is therefore up to the Western Cape Government to find means to ensure that service delivery is not hindered due to lack of revenue. Embedding good governance measures ensures that money is spent wisely and where necessary. It is the right of all citizens to receive quality services and the Department of Human Settlements understands the role it has to play in rural municipalities, and so do the other departments.

With the recent local government elections, it has been clear that the people of the Western Cape are more than satisfied with the work we have done, hon member Dijana, and have thus given us another 5 years to continue providing the best possible services in all our municipalities. They have once again shown that they have confidence in the DA-led Western Cape and we intend to ensure that they are happy with their choice. Again, another 5 years, hon

member Dijana. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. Order. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I understand that members have pre-prepared speeches, but it is always important to listen to the answer and understand whether your speech is relevant. Now you cannot say areas must be treated equally, I mean we must follow the law here. I cannot go to land that is owned by a farmer for example, and just build houses there. The law is very clear ...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The missionary ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But it is privately owned land. That is the point that I am making. In areas where we have succeeded ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Minister Bredell, hon member Dugmore, just the one speaker on the floor. The Minister is trying his level best to be heard. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In areas where we have succeeded with the approach that I alluded to before, we have made progress, we have provided services, we have built houses, but the point that I am

making, in terms of the law you cannot, besides the rudimentary services, you cannot provide or spend public money on private land.

So you cannot then argue that services must be provided equally on public and private land, because the law does not allow that, and that is the point that I am making. Even though you have a pre-prepared speech, listen to the response and then please try to change your argument, especially to you hon member Dijana, because this is directed to you.

Now, another point that you made, you spoke about services that are provided to the rich. You must understand this Department does not build houses for rich people. Perhaps you need to understand, that for you to qualify for a house you must actually be poor. Your income must be zero up to R15 000. Those are poor people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So none of the rich people belong to that income category.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, your time has expired. Just finish off.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So again, when you make your argument, understand.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That concludes the interpellations. We move on to Questions. The first question to the Premier will stand over. We move on to Question 6, standing over. Hon member Kivedo to hon Minister Grant. Hon Minister Grant?

Fatal taxi crashes

6. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether his Department has any plans to deal with the spate of fatal crashes, specifically involving taxis; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department has many initiatives aimed at addressing fatal crashes on our roads. Through these initiatives we aim to address all fatal crashes not just crashes relating to taxis. Specific in the initiatives that focus on taxis include fatigue management programmes and the drafting of legislative provisions to compel the mandatory registration of all taxi drivers.

Other initiatives underway in the Department include firstly a comprehensive communication campaign which targets all road user types, including taxi operators. The campaign includes the use of various media types such as

television, radio, film, print and social media.

Secondly, the introduction of evidentiary breath alcohol testing to reduce fatalities on our roads caused by the inappropriate use of alcohol.

Thirdly, obtaining approval for the employment of 30 additional newly graduated traffic officers from mid-July 2016.

Fourthly, the development of a safety implementation plan that tackles road safety by:

1. Improving the current legislative environment.
2. Coordination between different stakeholders responsible for road safety.
3. The collation and management of provincial road safety data.
4. Developing evidence driven, integrated district safety plans for each traffic centre that focuses on education, engineering, enforcement, monitoring and evaluation.

And finally:

1. The use of technology as a force multiplied for the roll-out and maintenance of average speed over distance systems.
2. The deployment of handheld technology to traffic officers to allow them to enforce smarter and be more efficient.

3. The development of monitoring platforms to ensure that traffic officers are monitored more effectively.

Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, and now the follow-ups. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC whether his Department has allocated any resources to advanced driving courses for the taxi associations that they can specifically focus on the improving of driver skills of their members?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer is no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the Minister what is the impact of the new speed over distance system over this period?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The system is evolving, but I just want to say for the hon member of the House and the public at large, that we envisage it is going to be very effective in helping us

pull over serial offenders on the system, through advanced number plate recognition onto those provincial cards as well as the handheld devices.

In other words, we will know when a car which has got a number of warrants, enters an average speed over distance zone, and then for example if you go up Sir Lowry's Pass, you will find a surprise waiting for you up on the plateau just before the Grabouw turnoff. There will be 2 or 3 cars there, and one police car as well, to ensure that that driver, if it is a serious offence, will be arrested.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Could the MEC explain to us the reason why his Department is not allocating resources towards advanced driver training? Is this because he believes that it is unnecessary or that he has not thought about it, that his Department does not have the resources? Could he please explain to us whether he does not think investing in driver skills would contribute towards safer roads?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I certainly think that driver capability is absolutely fundamental to reducing the carnage on our roads, because 82% of accidents are caused by drivers, but I have met at least three advanced driving schools in my office, where they have been to

present their plans and what they do in terms of normal competitive applications for large commercial companies, for example who are driving trucks or driving taxis.

That is a private sector initiative and what we will do is facilitate and encourage it and say thank you very much for that initiative. It is not something, with limited funds, that I can decide to spend money on because it is a private sector driven issue. We will welcome it, we will collaborate with our officials, but there is no real rationale for me to support and empower those companies through financial support of them, but we are very grateful for the work that they do.

I have even been to visit one and if I had time I would like to take an advanced driving course myself, but then I have only been driving for probably 45 years, ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move on to the next question. Question 5 standing over from Thursday. Hon member Kivedo to hon Minister Schäfer. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 15 September 2016, as agreed to by the House:

Foundation phase: mother-tongue instruction

5. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Education:

What is the current take of her Department on mother-tongue instruction in the Foundation Phase?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] not here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not here but I am asking the Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, I was told that this was going to stand over. The right to speak in one of the official languages is enshrined in the Constitution as a fundamental right. Mother-tongue education is important to us as teaching learners in their home language is educationally sound.

There are various factors that can affect the reality however. These include the fact that parents may decide on a language of learning and teaching that is not the home language of the learner. Many parents prefer their children to learn in English as they see this as opening up more opportunities for them internationally. There are also not enough teachers to teach in the home language of every learner at every school. In addition, people migrating to South Africa do not even speak one of our official languages very often.

We are dependent on having a sufficient supply of teachers who are able to teach the required language, which is not always the case. It is up to the

governing body of a school to decide on the language of learning and teaching at the school.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. No follow-up? Hon member Olivier, do you want to follow-up?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes please, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Sweetheart question.

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, let's engage on the sweetheart one. MEC, what you have now responded, is that a policy view of the Department? Is that the policy position of your Department, that response you gave us now?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I was not asked what the policy view of the Department was. It is the current take of my Department. The policy of the Department is that the governing bodies of schools are entitled to determine the language of learning and teaching at the school.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a further follow-up? Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, is the MEC in support that mother-tongue instruction at foundation level assists in further development of a learner in the more senior grades? Is that the take of the Department if it is not the policy position?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is difficult to answer whether I support mother ... [Interjection.] Sorry, can I answer?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Whether mother-tongue at foundation level is assisting in the more senior levels is complex, because as you know in grade 4, then the languages usually change to English or Afrikaans. So sometimes it happens that the learners experience difficulties because they are talked to in another tongue in foundation phase, and then they have to switch over.

So part of what we are doing in our mass strategy for example, is ensuring that they are taught the mass concepts in their home language as well as English to try and mitigate that problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question which is Question 6, hon member Kivedo to hon Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell?

Flooding - winter 2016: magnitude and impact of

6. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What is the magnitude and impact of flooding during the winter of 2016, especially in informal settlements?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. In die afgelope jaar was daar groot impak en ernstige voorvalle van oorstromings in die wintermaande, veral in die Stad Kaapstad se informele nedersettings. Gedurende 2016 April tot Julie was 'n geskatte 26 000 huishoudings bygestaan met etes, komberse en babapakke.

Die oorstromingsvoorvalle wat plaasgevind het was binne die vermoë van die stad en hulle was dus in 'n posisie om die oorstromings effektief en doeltreffend te bestuur met hul eie hulpbronne. Die Stad Kaapstad het 'n gevestigde vloed- en stormtaakspan wat gereeld vergader en fokus op wintergereedheid waarby verskillende departemente binne in die stad en die provinsie sit om risikoverminderings-, verligtings- en paraatheidmaatreëls in plek te plaas om die impak van vloede veral op informele nedersettings te beperk.

Die doel van die taakspan is om die oorstromingsituasie in die stad te monitor en vir vinnige reaksie aan geaffekteerde gemeenskappe. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the past year there have been great impact and serious incidences of floods in the winter months, especially in the City of Cape Town's informal settlements. During 2016, April to July, an estimated 26 000 households have been assisted with meals, blankets and baby packs.

The incidents of floods that took place were within the capability of the City and they were thus in a position to manage the floods effectively and purposefully with their own resources. The City of Cape Town has an established flood and storm task team that meets regularly and focuses on winter readiness where various departments within the city and the province are represented to put in place risk reduction, relief and readiness measures to limit the impact of floods on especially informal settlements.

The aim of the task team is to monitor the flood situation in the city and react quickly in aiding affected communities. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, is daar 'n opvolgvraag? Die agb lid Dyantyi?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, is there a follow-up question? The hon member Dyantyi?]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: In die afwesigheid van agb Kivedo staan ek op.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I rise in the absence of hon Kivedo.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Eerwaarde mnr Kivedo.

[An HON MEMBER: Reverend Mr Kivedo.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, yes.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Die Agbare ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: The honourable ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, daar is Afrikaans *lessons*, ek is beskikbaar vir daardie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, there are Afrikaans lessons, I am available for that.] †Just a follow-up question to the Minister in the light of his response. So far during this 2016 flooding, exactly how many municipalities, would you share with this House, were affected and how many informal settlements were affected?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. So, obviously we do not have that information. That was also not the question. The fact is that we have got a very good Disaster Management Centre in the Western Cape. The question was specifically focused on the City of Cape Town, who have got their own resources and obviously the provincial side will focus more on the smaller municipalities who do not have that.

We are also busy doing the same with fire fighting services. That is why we have got that programme now where we are going to place fire trucks in smaller municipalities. I think it is our role. The City of Cape Town does have a very good Disaster Management Centre, very up to speed, up to date and they have got enough resources. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dyantyi, second question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the City of Cape Town, did your Department, through the City of Cape Town, help Philippi and Khayelitsha that were affected during 2016?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It depends on the kind of help. We help them with the planning, we are part of the whole planning system. Not financially, because they do have the financial resources to deal with it themselves.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then proceed to the next question, Question number 7, hon member Olivier to hon Minister Schäfer. Hon Minister Schäfer?

Vandalism of schools: June-July holidays

7. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:

- (1) What was the total cost of damage to schools during the June–July holidays;
- (2) whether her Department has any plans to prevent vandalism and burglaries; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The estimated cost of damage to schools during the June-July holidays is about R320 000 that are we are aware of. The Safe Schools division of the Western Cape Education Department adopts a whole of society approach to school safety issues, which requires all role players to accept roles and responsibilities for school security.

Safe Schools developed a checklist for schools to complete before the start of every school holiday. The principal is the accounting officer and must ensure that adequate means are being employed to reduce the possibility of burglary and vandalism. The principal therefore needs to be contactable at all times.

The role players include the principal, the school safety committee, Safe Schools, the Department, the community, law enforcement services and service providers. Safe Schools has developed procedures for principals to follow to ensure that safety measures are in place at the start of school holidays. Safe Schools arranges additional security patrols at schools and at

clusters of schools as required, depending on the risk profile of the schools concerned.

Safe Schools also works closely with law enforcement to ensure visibility and to respond to incidents as required. The principal is the accounting officer and must ensure that adequate means have been employed at schools to reduce the possibility of burglary and vandalism. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is a follow-up? Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC, R320 000. Is this amount escalating or reducing compared to the previous years, and is it all schools in the province that have been calculated to such an amount? Is it reduced or is it escalating?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do not have the figures as to whether it has increased or reduced. I can get it for you if you want it, but the issue is that that is the amount that has been reported to us. Some schools do manage to fix things on their own, so it could actually be more than that, but that is what we are aware of.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Second question, hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, this R320 000 is then being financed by the Department, is that so?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then – is there a further follow-up? Hon member Olivier, your third opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I am directed by the Deputy Chief Whip. [Laughter.] MEC, the role of the Department in the process you have explained, that the principal must be involved, that there are other stakeholders involved, that must ensure in my view the reduction of that amount, to reduce the vandalism and break-ins at schools; what is your specific role in that process as a Department?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I know the hon member is battling to find follow-up questions, but I have actually answered already. I have answered the question already. Safe Schools liaises with stakeholders, principals at school and at many schools governing bodies are involved as well. They get the community involved and we found many schools would actually make a real effort to get the community around the school to assist, and that has made a huge impact on actually reducing vandalism at school. So we do coordinate all of these things, we ensure that the high risk schools are able to get extra measures and we fund those measures as far as we can.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your last opportunity.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I know that as much as I battle with questions, the MEC battles with answering the questions. That is tongue in the cheek.

MEC, I know we might not totally resolve the problems, but what is your view on the unacceptable amount in terms of damages at school level? What do you foresee must take place?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Every single cent that is spent on vandalism and burglaries and crime is unacceptable to me, because it takes it away from delivering other services that we desperately need.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we proceed to the next question, which is Question number 8, again hon member Olivier to hon Minister Schäfer. Question 8.

Equal Education: social audits

8. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:

Whether her Department will be implementing the recommendations of the social audits conducted by the organisation Equal Education; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The only report I have received from Equal Education, as the hon member Olivier would know if he was aware of the news, is the one that was handed to me late on Tuesday afternoon, the 20th of September this year. On a cursory glance of the 185 page document, it appears that much of the information contained therein is in fact information that they have received from us in prior applications.

There are also a number of photographs of schools that are elected to be in the Western Cape, but there are no names given which makes it very difficult to respond. The memoranda refer to a number of issues that are not the responsibility of the Education Department, and which will have to be answered by the relevant organisations. However, we will be studying the report and giving a response as soon as we are able to do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your first opportunity to ask your supplementary on this question.

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, very easy question. Can you confirm or deny that this report you only received now, formally on Tuesday 20th is a report that Equal Education wanted to give you a month or two ago which you refused to accept. Can you confirm or deny it?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I did not know what they wanted to give me. They arrived at my personal home a few months ago, at quarter to six in

the morning, trying to intimidate my family and I did refuse to accept anything from them at that time. I am not prepared to involve my family – I am the public representative, not my family. That was the only time that they ever tried to deliver something to me, despite repeated requests prior to that occasion to give it to me. They delivered some documents to my Department during a protest a while ago, and they then wanted some answers from me. I had not seen it myself. My district directors are dealing with it.

I told them I had not received it and if they wanted me to respond, they must please give it to me so I can have a look at it. They refused to do so, but decided to rather come to my house in the morning and supposedly give me something which they refused to do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I wonder, this interesting organisation, Equal Education, do they also do these reports in other provinces? Most specifically our neighbouring province, the Eastern Cape?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: To my knowledge they have done no similar audit anywhere. They have done something in Gauteng, they did a sanitation report. The only thing that I have seen in the Eastern Cape is they have managed to read a report from the Eastern Cape Legislature and made some statement on that, thinking they were very smart, but to my knowledge

they have never done any similar kind of audit. In fact, as I say most of the information that appears to be in this report has actually been gleaned from prior applications to my officials who have to spend hours and hours and hours collating it for them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, back to the province and to the Equal Education report. MEC, if this report was given months ago to your Department, did the Department brief you on this report?

Now it was conveyed to you, are you aware of it besides that you did not want to accept anything at your residence, which we accept but when it was then delivered to your Department, were you aware of it and have you looked at it?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This report was not delivered to my Department at all. There were many, many – and I called them loose papers and they are very upset about it but that is what they were. There were a number of piles of documentation that was delivered to my District Directors. There was a difference of opinion as to whether they in fact also received a CD. Some seemed to have received a CD also, which I was not told about when I answered the question. But this report, as it is here, was not delivered to me or my Department until Tuesday.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I wonder if the Minister could tell me, is this the same organisation that ANC Marxist and part-time policeman, Jeremy Vearey belongs to? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a new question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am not sure whether he belongs to it or not but what I have noticed is that Equal Education's colour scheme is actually meant to be black and yellow but lately it has gone very much towards red and black, which remarkably resembles COSAS, and I suspect they might be involved. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. We proceed to the next question which is Question 11, hon member Wenger to hon Minister Plato. Hon Minister Plato.

SAPS officer shift changes

11. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:

What is the South African Police Service's policy on attending to reported crimes and emergencies that occur during officer shift changes?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much to the member for the question. The reply is as follows:

Complaints do not fall away as a result of shift changes. All shift commanders must ensure that all complaints received during the tour of duties must be attended to. They must also make sure that the complaint is logged in the prescribed manner.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger, follow-up?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I am aware of a particular incident in which a crime occurred during a shift change. When the victims phoned the police station they were simply told that the police could not assist them because they were in a shift change. Given that this then is not the policy of the South African Police Service, should this occur in future, how should members of the public take this matter up to ensure that the policy is in fact followed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Definitely complain to the Station Commander or to the Police Ombudsperson. They can also lodge a complaint with my office.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Oliver, follow-up?

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, just my understanding, maybe I am wrong. Is it correct that the current team on shift will leave the station immediately when

the other shift gets into office? So, the one does not leave before the other team has come in. Is that correct?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is my understanding. They have to make sure what they have done during the day - there needs to be a transfer of information, handover, whatever you call it.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Handover.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is also fine with me but that is the procedure that needs to be followed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question, which is Question number 12, hon member Wenger to Minister Plato again.

Western Cape 10111 call centre: call scanner

12. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the call scanner at the Western Cape's 10111 call centre has been repaired; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for this question as well. The call scanner at the Western Cape's 10111 call centre is functional and in full operation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. That is good news indeed because we know that that call scanner had been broken for several years so at least now it can be tracked. On the topic of 10111, the National Police told the Portfolio Committee in the National Parliament yesterday that only 70 out of 150 [Interjection.] I'm getting there ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. I will listen carefully. Hon member, if you could ...

Ms M M WENGER: ... only 70 out of 150 stations in the Western Cape are linked to the 10111 call centre. Does the Minister have any indication of how long it will take to link all Western Cape police stations to the 10111 system?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that information I do not have. I can get the information and provide the member with that information.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We proceed to the next question. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, new questions. Hon member Uys to hon Minister Madikizela. Hon Minister Madikizela?

New Questions:

WesCape Project

***2. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

- (1) Whether he and his Department support the WesCape Project; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details; and
- (2) to what degree will this project be to the advantage of the poor in the community?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is a proposed project by the way and in 2012/2013 - one of the issues with that particular area in terms of development was the issue of the urban edge - the City amended their Spatial Development Framework to include the urban edge to reflect the long-term view of the development potential that might happen in that particular area.

To date I have not seen any municipal planning approvals or application of environmental authorisation. During the Spatial Development Framework amendment process - this is the second part of the question - it was indicated that the proposed project will consider making 50% of the total potential housing units available as affordable housing opportunities, 100 000 units, but as indicated with no applications yet being submitted these are simply speculative at this stage. Thank you.

The DUPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This was a very big

announcement by yourself, the Premier and the Mayor of the City of Cape Town and we all know this. Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to ask them why a new city 25 kilometres away from the existing city that we have, and why don't you want to look at in-fill and densification seeing that there is land available and not take people 25 to 40 kilometres away from the city?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me correct what the hon member has said. I was never part of any announcement about the WesCape Development. [Interjection.] I am responding to your question, I'm going to correct that part. I was never part of any announcement that was made about the WesCape Development. Let me say this, hon member Uys, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, the point here is that we need to develop new cities or new towns and this is the potential that is coming with this development. [Interjection.]

Now you talk about the proximity of this development but the reality is that as you know, if you look at that particular node, the proposed WesCape Development, the Atlantis to Saldahna, you know as well as I do that that is the next development node for this Government, in fact not only for this Government. All spheres of government are investing massively in that particular direction because the reality here is that the in-fills that you are talking about, will not give us the kind of numbers that we need if you look at the challenges that we have in terms of massive in-migration in the city and the province. So the reality here is that we need to look for bigger pieces of land, create new towns and cities rather than focusing on in-fills that will

not give us the numbers that we require.

An HON MEMBER: Shame.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. So, we hear that the MEC is distancing himself from the Premier and the Mayor but thanks for that answer ...

Mr M G E WILEY: He is just correcting [Inaudible.]

Mr P UYS: No, no, no. Mr Deputy Speaker I want to ask what would be the [Interjections.] No, I can say that. Mr Deputy Speaker, what is the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the order? What is the order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip... Order! Just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: The hon Chief Whip from the ANC there is alleging that the Minister was misleading the House. [Interjections.]. All he was doing was

correcting an allegation from the other side.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order, hon members. That is not a point of order, it is a debating point and the hon member must continue.

Mr P UYS: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, to ask the MEC, development would be very difficult there so what magnet would you use to get investors in that specific area to also make it viable, with job opportunities for people there? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What do you care? [Inaudible.] parastatals [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me just say, hon member Uys, the proposal was discussed at various platforms. The real issue that was raised about this development by the way - the issue of proximity is not the real issue here - is its close proximity to the power station and I think that is an issue [Interjection.]. No, no that is an issue that was raised by environmentalists.

But if you look at the potential yield of this development and the kind of mixed development that is proposed here, I think in principle I would certainly support that if we are able to address the concerns that were raised. The issue of the distance that you raise, I think I have covered that in my

initial response, that we need to create new towns rather than focusing on the city centre and in-fill and build a hundred units in a small area - if you were to take the example of Cosmos City [Interjection.] No, no, I am responding.

Take the example of Cosmos City, a similar approach is being followed there, take the example of a similar development that is happening in Durban in KwaZulu-Natal because we need to look for bigger pieces of land that will accommodate massive numbers of people. Look at mixed development, your commercial part and also your residential part and that is what we are looking at here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your third opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I did not hear what magnets would be used but okay, maybe there is no answer to that. I would like to ask a question around the 16 kilometre radius and that was not an environmentalist it was by the National Nuclear Regulator and the City of Cape Town Disaster Management, they are against this proposal. What is your comment on that?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, I think I have partly commented on that. The point here is if you look at the potential lead of that particular development, we need to strike a balance between the concern that was raised and the potential yield. Part of the second question you asked was what are the things that will attract investors? By the way there are a number

of investors that are interested in it. I am not sure whether you are aware of that.

If the issue of the proximity of this particular project to the power station is addressed we can really attract a number of investors who are willing to invest in a development of that magnitude. But from where I am sitting, as the MEC, hon member Uys, we have to take any concerns that are raised by anyone for that matter seriously, sit around a table and look at views across the board.

We have seen in the past situations where some environmentalists or some departments would raise certain objections but the real issue here is that we need to find common ground to address the real issue of massive population growth and in-migration. We will not be able to address the challenge of housing, as you suggest, by just looking at in-fills, that we accommodate a hundred people when we have massive population growth of hundreds of thousands of people who are coming to the city. That is why, by the way, we have been talking to a National Department of Public Works to look at bigger pieces of land like Youngfield, Wingsfield and that is why we have not written off the possibility of developing in that area because of the massive opportunities that it brings to solve the challenges that we are facing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, your last opportunity.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you MEC. Can I just

ask you, you do have a strategic plan looking forward? What is the budget that you have allocated for this project?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think I did say that there is no project at this stage. It is a proposal and this proposal still has to go through various processes as you know until all the issues that have been raised are sorted out. Only then can we start talking about the budget that we can put aside to partner with the private sector. But as I said, standing here, I see massive potential there. If we can address those issues - because by the way, hon member Uys, this development is a private sector-led proposal.

The proposal is actually saying, to us as Government, we need to come to the party by providing bulk infrastructure which I think is doable if these issues can be addressed. Otherwise it is not a development that is going to be led by us - it is going to be a private-sector led development, which is exactly what we need to do as Government. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question which is Question number 3, hon Denis Joseph to Minister Bredell. Hon Minister Bredell?

Water levels of dams

***3. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (1) What is the situation relating to the status of the water levels of dams in the Western Cape; and
- (2) whether it is necessary to impose water restrictions; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Dankie aan die agbare lid. Ek gaan 'n kort opsomming gee en dan gaan ek die agbare lid toestemming vra om die antwoord in te dien want dit is redelik dik en daar is tabelle.

Dit gaan oor waterbesparings; tans is die Kaapse damme 61,25% vol teenoor verlede jaar dieselfde tyd, 90,75% vol. So ons kan die som maak. Ons het amper 30% minder water tans as wat ons verlede jaar gehad het. Daar is verskillende damvlakke op verskillende [Onhoorbaar.] so ek gaan nie heeltemal daaroor lees nie. Ons het hierdie jaar 50 na 75 millimeter reën minder ontvang as verlede jaar so ons is redelik bekommerd, ook sit ons in 'n scenario waar die langtermyn weervoorspelling is dat dit eerder droeër gaan raak as dat ons 'n natter winter het. Die 20%-waterbesparing is ingestel en dit staan, ons is besig daarmee en alle dorpe aan die Weskus, aan die agbare lid, is onder 20%-waterbesparing, sowel as Stellenbosch/Drakenstein en die

Kaap. En daarmee, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, gaan ek net 'n beroep doen dat almal moet gehoorgee, want water is 'n lewensbron wat vir ons almal noodsaaklik is en vir ekonomiese groei, so ek vra dat ons dit indien, dit is tabelle, met die toestemming van die agbare lid. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon member. I will give a short summary and then I am going to ask the hon member permission to submit the reply as it is quite thick and contains tables.

It deals with water savings; at the moment the Cape dams are 61,25% full compared to the same time to last year, 90,75% full. So we can do the sum. We have almost 30% less water than what we had last year. There are different dam levels at different [Inaudible.] so I am not going to read about it all. We have received 50 to 75 millimetres of rain less than last year, so we are quite concerned, we also have a scenario where the long term weather forecast is that it is going to become more dry rather than us having a wetter winter. The 20% water saving has been introduced and it stands, we are busy with that and all towns on the West Coast, to the hon member, are subject to that 20% water saving, as well as Stellenbosch/Drakenstein and the Cape. And with that, Mr Deputy Speaker, I am going to appeal that all should oblige, because water is a life source essential to all of us and for economic

growth, so I ask that we submit this, there are tables, with the permission of the hon member. Thank you.]

†The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That will be tabled.

[Reply as submitted in writing and tabled by the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.]

[(1) As of 12 September 2016, the overall state of dams in the Western Cape were 61.25% full compared to 90.75% last year. However, this varies across catchments as follows:

Catchment	% full this week	% full in 2015	% full in 2012
Berg	71.70	72.98	98.84
Breede	56.70	103.99	86.91
Gouritz	44.59	66.31	88.77
Olifants/Doorn	99.71	90.34	98.92

From the table it can be seen that the current capacity is lower than last year and considerably lower than in 2012 when good rains were received. It should be borne in mind that last year's levels were also lower than previous years of higher rainfall. According to the SAWS (South African Weather Services) historical rainfall records for the

Western Cape, over the past two years have been approximately 50-75mm below average rainfall.

- (1) The Department of Water and Sanitation (DWS) issued a notice on 8 June 2016 that all sectors, including municipalities, served by the Western Cape Water Supply System (WCWSS) must implement 20% restrictions on water use. The WCWSS comprises the Theewaterskloof, Berg River, Wemmershoek, Voelvllei, Upper and Lower Steenbras dams. The target before restrictions are lifted is 75% full storage capacity across the WCWSS. In terms of the WCWSS Water Reconciliation Strategy the water supply and demand for the WCWSS is modelled and based on the modelling results, recommendations are made on the required restriction levels for the coming hydrological year.

The South African Weather Service's (SAWS) seasonal climate outlook for September 2016 to January 2017 indicates that the development of a weak La Nina in spring and summer has become less likely. Therefore, spring rainfall is largely expected to be below-normal. There are indications of above-normal rainfall for early summer but this is uncertain due to the long lead time of the forecast and the weak La Nina conditions. All indications are that temperatures in spring and summer will be warmer than normal - which has implications for increased evaporation from surface water storage and increased water stress for the agricultural sector. The SAWS seasonal outlook also states that most

of South Africa is still experiencing drought conditions and that this will persist for some time even if significant rainfall occurs in summer.

According to the latest Western Cape Drought Monitoring Situation Report compiled by provincial Disaster Management, all towns in the West Coast have imposed restrictions of 20% on water demand. The City of Cape Town, Stellenbosch and Drakenstein Municipalities also have 20% water restrictions in place. The City is preparing for the possibility of imposing further water restrictions. At a provincial level, there is significant groundwater in storage which can be tapped into for emergency supply. However, this requires careful monitoring to prevent localised depletion of groundwater resources.

In the light of the above information on dam levels and the seasonal climate forecast, it is clear that the drought situation in the province will continue and the actual impacts will only be visible in the next season (2017). Therefore, it is prudent to maintain water restrictions even beyond the target of 75% full storage capacity in the WCWSS.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: †Enige opvolgvrage? [Any follow-up questions?]

†Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon Minister satisfied that there are sufficient deterrents by way of regulation or laws for those people who flout the restrictions?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, definitely we have got the Green Scorpions, we have got them in each municipality monitoring the situation. That is why you will also see in the municipal domain where people have got their own private source of water, like a bore-hole, they will put it on their gate, they must put it on.

Still where they find people using the hose to wash their cars they do get huge fines. If you look at the results, the savings overall, I think we can be pleased. The co-operation of the residents realising that water is a life source, I think that we must compliment the residents for that; as to those who do not listen, then we deal with the legal system and I think it is working quite well currently. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Uys?

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Kan ek vra of daar enige ontsoutingsaanlegte beplan word op hierdie stadium teenoor dit wat reeds in plek is, en die ontsoutingsaanlegte wat wel daar is, of hulle weer in bedryf gestel gaan word?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P UYS: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. May I ask if any desalination plants are being planned at this stage as opposed to those already in place,

and if the desalination plants that already exist are going to be put into operation again?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ja, ontsouting; ons kyk na ontsoutingsbeplanning, ons sal ook moet kyk, met Minister Winde se Departement, wil ons veral ook kyk na die IOS in Saldanhabaai, in daardie area sal ontsouting 'n groot rol speel. Wat betref ontsoutingsaanlegte in Sedgefield en daardie gebiede, dit word gewoonlik deur ons gebruik in vakansieseisoene omdat die ontsouting nogtans baie duur is, dit is baie duurder as gewoonlik want dit gebruik baie energie, altwee bronne is baie skaars by ons. Ek dink wat vir ons as provinsie belangrik is, is dat ons waterplan sluit die hele totaal in; ontsouting is 'n manier, ons moet ons ondergrondse water beskerm so boorgate moet ook gemonitor word oor spilpunte, ensovoorts. En dan ook iets wat 'n makliker een is waarby ons almal kan betrokke raak, dit is om reënwater te oes, daar kom geweldig baie reënwater van ons dakke af, en dit is 'n proses binne ons munisipaliteite, ons maak dit deel van bouplan-goedkeurings; as die huis bo 'n sekere waarde is, moet jy 'n tenk langs hom hê; ekself het groentenks, en ek kan vir u sê hulle is almal vol en ek onderhou my hele huishouding eintlik op reënwater. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes,

desalination; we are looking at desalination planning, we will also have to look, with Minister Winde's Department, especially at the IDZ in Saldanha Bay. In that area desalination will play a big role. With regard to desalination plants in Sedgefield and those areas, it is mainly used by us during holiday seasons as the desalination is very expensive; it is more expensive than usual as it uses a lot of energy, both resources are very scarce with us. I think that what is important to us, is that our water plan includes the whole total; desalination is one way, but we have to protect underground water and boreholes must also be monitored over pivots, etc. And then something which is an easier one, where we can all get involved, is to harvest rain water, there is a lot of rain water coming off our roofs, and it is a process within our municipalities, it is part of our buildings plan approvals; if a house is above a certain value, you must have a tank next to it. I myself have green tanks, and I can tell you they are all full and I actually support my whole household on rain water. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Joseph?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph?]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker en dankie aan die Minister vir die inligting. Ek wil net graag by die Minister weet indien daar beperkings ingestel word of indien munisipaliteite beperkings moet instel waar nodig, wat is die finansiële impak op sulke munisipaliteite en hoe bestuur hulle daardie tekort aan inkomste?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the Minister for the information. I just want to ask the Minister, if restrictions are imposed or if municipalities have to impose restrictions where necessary, what is the financial impact on such municipalities and how do they manage that shortfall in revenue?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Dankie aan die agbare lid vir die vraag. Dit is 'n moeilike een vir die munisipaliteite en daarom het ons nou al geruime tyd aangekom en die Staande Komitee sal ons regtig moet ondersteun, ons sal moet kyk oor die langtermyn na 'n nuwe finansiële model vir munisipaliteite, ek is oortuig daarvan, nie net van distrikte nie, ook van plaaslike regering want dit strek wyer as net water. Natuurlik as jy minder water verkoop is daar 'n verlies op jou begroting want jy maak wins op water, maar so ook met elektrisiteit, en as ons al hierdie goed bymekaar begin tel dan kan munisipaliteite geweldige verliese ly en daarom sal ons hulle moet ondersteun. So op die kortermyn is die besparings nie te ernstig nie, hulle kan binne die begroting werk maar ek dink as ons al die bykomende items gaan bytel soos elektrisiteit, energiebesparing, ensovoorts, kan dit 'n impak hê. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for the question. It is a difficult one for the municipalities and therefore we have for quite some time now been busy on this, and the Standing Committee will really have to support us. We will have to look over the long term at a new financial model for municipalities, I am convinced of that, not only with regard to districts, also local government, because this goes further than just water. Of course if you sell less water, there is a loss in your budget because you make a profit on water, but this also applies to electricity, and if we start adding up all these things then municipalities can suffer severe losses, and therefore we will have to support them. So in the short term the savings are not too serious, they can work within the budget, but I think if we are going to add all the additional items like electricity, energy savings, etc., it can have an impact. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.] †We move onto the next question, Question 4, hon member Kivedo to Minister Madikizela. Hon Minister?

Ex-MK combatants: construction of houses

4. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

When will the construction of houses for ex-MK combatants start?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. This project has already started. The contract was awarded on the 31st of May. It is 113 houses that we are busy constructing in Blue Downs for military veterans and they will be done in two phases. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a follow-up hon member Wiley?

Mr M G EWILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I wonder if the hon Minister can tell us how the determination was made between combatants from one military armed service and from another military armed service?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think some time ago we did clarify the criteria that were used for who we are talking about here. When we talk about military veterans we are talking about everyone who was involved in the war pre-1994, so it takes everyone into cognisance. By the way, these are criteria that are used by the Department of Military Veterans nationally and we took the cue from there in terms of the criteria and the definition of who is a military veteran. So all these people are people who belonged to MK, APLA, SADF etc., so these are the definitions in terms of the National Department of Military Veterans of who the military veterans are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley, a second one and then I will come back to you now. Hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. Given that there were eleven different factions that made up the Veterans Association, has the Minister's Department in fact challenged the legality of favouring only one of those eleven factions that made up the SANDF? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister? Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, it does not, Mr Deputy Speaker. It does not favour one particular faction. I think as I said [Interjections.] No, look perhaps [Interjection.] No, no, no. We are talking about military veterans here and in fact if you look at my response, even though the question says when will the construction of houses for ex-MK combatants start, I think the response from my side is very clear. I will show the response to anyone who is interested in it. I steered away from just MK and I spoke about military veterans.

If we are to look at the definition of military veterans it includes everyone, hon Chief Whip. So, it includes all the eleven factions that the Chief Whip spoke about so this particular project is for military veterans. Let me just be clear there, it is not only for ex-MK members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, hon Minister, for that comprehensive response to those questions. My follow-up and my interest, in the absence of the hon member Kivedo, is: out of the 113, if I got you right, how many out of those 113 are ex-MK combatants, as the question is asking? He is very clear in his question, ex-MK combatants, that is what he is asking. He is interested in that.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I cannot give you the specific details in terms of the numbers as to who belongs to where because as I said we took our cue from the National Department in terms of the definition as to who is a military veteran. So, we really did not want to embark on it being a counting exercise to see how many belonged where in the past. So we just followed the criteria and took these people through our housing subsidy system and those who qualified were then identified as beneficiaries. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Is there a last follow-up?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Besides Blue Downs do you have any plans in any other areas like Khayelitsha for the ex-MK combatants?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I do not have any plans, Madam Speaker, for ex-MK combatants. My Department will not prioritise a certain faction or certain group of military veterans. I deal with military

veterans in terms of the definition that was given to us by the National Department of Military Veterans. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. We now move to Question number 5 which is a question to the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport.

Khoi grouping: non-governmental organisations

5. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

Given the proliferation of non-governmental organisations for the Khoi grouping, how does she deal with the different groups in order to agree on basic commonalities and plans of actions going forward?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie vir die vraag. Daar is voldoende bewyse van die verrysing van die Khoisan-groepering. Die Provinsiale Regering het egter in die verlede, en benader steeds, die saak op die volgende manier:

‘n Inter-ministeriële komitee is gestig om te reageer op bekommernisse van die Khoisan-groeperings en om dit aan te spreek. ‘n Inter-ministeriële komitee het die Khoisan-groeperings by Spier in Stellenbosch geraadpleeg. Daar is ooreengekom dat die Khoisan tradisionele leiers vergaderings moet belê om sake wat verband hou met kultuur en tradisies te behandel aangesien hulle die bewaarders is. Die Provinsiale Regering is steeds verbind daartoe

om te verseker dat gesprekvoering plaasvind met almal wat in die provinsie woon. Die regulatoriese raamwerk wat Khoisan- en tradisionele leiers bestuur is egter nog nie deur die Nasionale Regering gefinaliseer nie. Alhoewel die wetsontwerp nog nie gefinaliseer is nie, gee my Departement en die openbare entiteit, naamlik die Wes-Kaapse Kultuurkommissie, aandag aan sake wat met kultuur verband hou. Die Wet op Wes-Kaapse Kultuurkommissies en Kultuurrade, Wet 14 van 1998, maak voorsiening vir die registrasie van verteenwoordigende kultuurrade gebaseer op die beginsel van vryheid van assosiasie en daar is tans 28 geregistreerde kultuurrade waarvan 17 Khoisangroeperings is. Geregistreerde kultuurrade ontvang finansiële en ander vorme van ondersteuning van die Departement en die Wes-Kaapse Kultuurkommissie; en laastens, dié wat nie geregistreer is nie ontvang ook aandag gebaseer op die meriete van die saak wat onder my aandag gebring word. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you for the question. There is ample evidence of the rise of Khoisan groupings. The Provincial Government has in the past, and still approaches, the matter in the following manner:

An inter-ministerial committee was established to react to concerns of the Khoisan groupings and to address them. An inter-ministerial committee consulted the Khoisan groupings at Spier in Stellenbosch. It was agreed that

the Khoisan traditional leaders should convene meetings to deal with matters concerning culture and traditions as they are the custodians. The Provincial Government is still committed to ensure that discussion takes place with all living in the province. The regulatory framework managing Khoisan and traditional leaders has, however, not been finalised by the National Government. Although the Bill has not been finalised, my Department and the public entity, the Western Cape Cultural Commission, are dealing with matters concerning culture. The Western Cape Cultural Commissions and Cultural Councils Act, Act 14 of 1998, provides for the registration of representative cultural councils based on the principle of freedom of association and there are currently 28 registered cultural councils, of which 17 are Khoisan groupings. Registered cultural councils receive financial and other forms of support from the Department and the Western Cape Cultural Commission; and finally, those that are not registered also receive attention based on the merits of the cases brought to my attention. Thank you.]

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Are there follow-up questions? No follow-ups, we then move to Question number 6 and the question is addressed to the Minister of Human Settlements. I see the hon Minister.

Bromwell Street, Woodstock: evictions

6. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What intervention has been done to prevent the people of Bromwell

Street in Woodstock from being evicted?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The Bromwell Street eviction is a private matter between the landlord and the tenants but even though the court order does not compel my Department or the City to provide alternative accommodation, I visited those families immediately, a day after I was told about that particular eviction, and we did offer, particularly to the old lady that was there, Mrs Brenda Smit, some kind of assistance in terms of alternative accommodation.

Now, Madam Speaker, we could only offer alternative accommodation where we are currently building or where we have an accommodation as the Department of Human Settlements, but unfortunately Mrs Smit turned our offer down and cited the issue of the distance. But immediately after that, in fact a couple of days after that, the Mayor also did intervene to try and find a reprieve for the tenants and eviction was then extended to the 26th of September 2016. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any follow-up questions? The hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Could I ask the MEC whether his Department and the City have attempted to identify well located land in that vicinity, whether it is National, Provincial or City land, where the possibility of a social housing development could be considered to cater

for the needs of the Bromwell Street families and others in that area? Has there been any effort to identify land in and around that area?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I do not think this question is realistic and I will tell you why, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just say no.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, no, I will tell you why. When you deal with an emergency, because let us assume that there was land that was identified, you know very well that we are dealing with a family that has been evicted now. Even if there is land available, the processes of turning that land into a house will take years. So when you deal with an emergency you provide accommodation where you can.

So, the issue of whether the City or the Province has land in that particular area is another matter altogether but even if the City or the Province had land there, we have to follow the criteria in terms of allocation because there is no guarantee that even if we had land there we are going to start with the people who are being evicted at the expense of people who have been on the waiting list for years. The principle of first-come-first-served must apply because if you do that you run the risk of undermining your own processes and policies.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Second follow-up?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Could I just ask what particular accommodation was offered to the individual that the MEC referred to? You referred to accommodation that was offered which was then turned down. Could he please explain to us what that was?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We looked at an area where we are currently developing and that is in Delft. We offered a free BMG House. As you know these tenants are renting at the moment, and this was not the first time by the way where we have done that. We have done that with other families as well. Some are now home owners in Pelican Park and some are now home owners because as I said, we look where we are developing currently. We offered that family an opportunity in Delft and she turned it down.

The SPEAKER: Any further follow-ups? No more follow-ups, we then move to Question 7. Again the question is directed to the Minister of Human Settlements. I see the hon Minister.

Neruna Estate in Plumstead

7. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

(a) What is the cause of the standoff between his Department and the

residents of Neruna Estate in Plumstead and (b) how is he planning to resolve this problem?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It would seem, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon member Dugmore, can you please switch off your microphone. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It would seem, Madam Speaker, that the cause of the unhappiness of the tenants stems from the fact that they will not be allowed to purchase the units. My Department is not selling these units. They are provided for rental accommodation because we have a responsibility here to strike a balance between who needs accommodation to rent and people who need free houses.

So, as a Department, we are building a number of houses across the province for people who qualify for free houses, but at the same time, we have to make sure that we have a rental stock for people who do not qualify for free houses. That is why we cannot sell each and every rental accommodation and turn it into ownership because you will be depriving those people who do not qualify for a free house of an opportunity, and that is why we have a number of rental units, as the Department, that we keep particularly for those people. My Department is in the process of amending the lease agreement in respect of all its rental properties and the purpose of the amended lease agreement is

to comply with the Rental Housing Act No. 50 of 1999 and Consumer Protection Act No. 68 of 2008, as well as to assist my Department in improving the Tenant Management System.

Because if you look at those lease agreements, you will know they were drawn up a long time ago, before these Acts were passed, and that is why it is important for us to amend these lease agreements. So, the monthly rental payable will be calculated in terms of the monthly income, which is between 25 and 30%, and will remain below the market value.

My Department has been engaging with tenants who have issues of concern with the revised lease agreement. Qualifying tenants who are unable to afford to pay the monthly rental will be afforded an opportunity of owning a BMG house and we have done that for some of those tenants. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Follow up?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. So is the MEC indicating that some of the residents there who cannot pay the revised rentals will actually be evicted? Is he actually saying that?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I have made this very, very clear in all the areas where we own rental accommodation. No-one is being evicted. We have given people options that if you can no longer afford to pay - in fact we have been very generous. In fact there is no landlord who does

that by the way. If you cannot honour a lease agreement, the landlord chucks you out in the street, but, as this Department, we have not done that.

We have said if you can no longer afford to pay because your circumstances have changed, we will give you an opportunity to own a free BMG house and that is an offer that we have made to all tenants who cannot afford to pay and I think that offer is very, very generous. Some of the people have taken up that offer, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any follow-ups? Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: In other words, is the MEC stating that for those families who cannot afford and also do not exercise an option to move to a distant BMG house, that they will proceed with evictions against those particular families?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Absolutely.

Mr C M DUGMORE: They will. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Any further follow-ups? We now move to Question 8 and it is a question to the hon Minister Winde.

Mitchells Plain: rising robbery cases

8. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

What is his Department doing to ensure the safety of business owners and customers amid the rising robbery cases in the town centre of Mitchells Plain?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, crime impacts residents and businesses across the province. Policing is a mandate of the National Government. The Ministry of Community Safety has been active in lobbying for additional law enforcement resources in the Western Cape and I also meet with MEC Plato from time to time on these kind of issues.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you talk to each other?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, my follow-up question for the MEC is: is he aware that the majority of people that are being robbed are small scale businesses?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, a second follow-up? [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, is he aware that there was a woman that was almost killed, she is still in hospital because of that robbery?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: My answer must also be no. You need to give me more detail.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I will give it. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Out of touch MEC. Out of touch.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi. The Minister will be provided with the information. Are there any follow-ups on this question? No more? Let us move to Question 9, it is again directed to the Minister. Hon Minister Winde?

Tokai flower sellers: eviction from former Porter Reform School

9. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

Whether the eviction of the Tokai flower sellers and their employees who live on the former Porter Reform School has been brought to his attention; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker, the answer is no [Interjection.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: The Minister said no, he is actually - I want to know is there any, because the Minister does not know ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I want to ask the Minister, if he gets this information if he will speak to the Premier because it is the Premier and the MEC of Public Works who are doing this eviction?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, I actually should address you on both of these questions because the hon member has just asked if I will speak to the Premier and the MEC of Public Works on this issue. She knows very well who this question should be addressed to. But do you know what? My office on both of the questions, the previous one which should have been addressed to the Minister of Community Safety and this one, which should actually be addressed to the Minister of Public Works, engaged with the Whip of that party to say if you really want the answers on these issues you need to engage in the correct space. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And guess what? The Whip says no, no, no we must answer these questions. Now you see this really goes to the heart of it. So, quite frankly Madam Speaker, I think that my message to the hon member Davids is: of course if anybody raises things on the previous question, when communities ask me about policing things - Minister Plato will know that we have had a few engagements in Drakenstein, specific focuses on this kind of issue - of course we will engage.

There are 660 000 businesses in this province, 9 700 commercial farms and 11 500 smallholder farmers and we will engage on any issues in any of those spaces if you raise the specific issue that you want to deal with. But in this House if you want a question answered you need to ask the question to the relevant Minister and the Whip needs to know that. Quite frankly this Whip does not have a clue. [Interjections.]

I think the Deputy Whip should be asked these questions in future [Interjections.] because it looks like he is actually showing some promise in this House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I cannot wait. Just on Wednesday, yesterday, Madam Speaker, we had the community of Overberg, in our Standing Committee, coming with the illegal taking out of abalone. It was said there that MEC

Plato could not even help them. There were different departments discussed there. Madam Speaker, this is an economic issue. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: May I? Sorry [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: If small businesses are being robbed it means it is taking our economy in the Western Cape down when it comes to the income of those small businesses. If people are evicted who are doing business, if the Minister does not know these things he must go to the ground and stop having his party's table politics.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Davids, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: With respect, you know there is quite a lot of tolerance with regard to the inadequacy on the other side there but really it has a limit.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: You may.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Quite frankly I share hon Minister Winde's dilemma on the issue. I think I am addressing you because this issue resides with your office, as the Speaker. The questions are submitted in your office. You are from time to time are able to say this question cannot ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Redirect.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Therefore this question should not even have proceeded from your office if it is irrelevant. The fact that it is here, you have deemed it to be relevant to be here and therefore you have got to rule the MEC out of order. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Sorry. I have noted the concerns and I am sure the Table staff have – hon members can we please ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: No, no. I am just talking to what was said here now around the screening of questions, how motivations, how motions get done, the wording and all of this and that so we will have a conversation.

However, in terms of the question, the Minister got up, he responded, there were two follow-ups and then there was a bit of deliberation. We need to get back to the question. I note the concerns of the Deputy Chief Whip as well as Chief Whip Wiley and I will have to engage the administration in terms of the Table staff, programming, that whole piece, so that whole point is noted.

I cannot though, say if the Minister chooses to say it is the Department of Community Safety, he is giving a response. As the Speaker, I am presiding over procedural matters, I cannot talk to a response. So, that is why I am

saying we would need to have that conversation.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: But Minister Winde was first to ask if he could say something. Minister Winde, do you want to use this as one of the four follow-ups? Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So, I understand that the last question, it was not really phrased as a question from the hon Davids but perhaps just to add in and I am glad that the real Whip stood up there and addressed this issue [Laughter.] because ...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... this could have been a real question to me if the hon member Davids had perhaps written to me about the flower sellers or perhaps the flower sellers had engaged with me as a business. But, we did exactly that. We searched our data bases, we went to see if these businesses, whether they were in Mitchell's Plain or whether the flower sellers had actually engaged with my office with my Department.

We actually went through. I mean we took this as a very, very serious

question and we went through and we searched to see if we had been asked to engage and we picked up that we had not been asked to engage and so it could have been an absolutely legitimate question which perhaps could have even been a clever political question to try and catch me out because I did not answer the people's reply. But we really looked to see.

We took it very, very seriously and when we could not find it, we then went back to the Whip to say unfortunately we cannot answer this question, it does belong, as it is, in a different department so I agree with the real Whip that stood up, but of course I am also happy to answer any further questions from the hon member Davids.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, we have Whips and we have Deputy Chief Whips, there are no reals or actings. I think if we can just stick to the protocol and the business. The hon member Davids has a follow-up question.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, it is a simple question, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Let it [Inaudible.] to the original question.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes. If the selling of flowers is economics and if retail shops are economics? That is all I want to know. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, do you wish to answer that question?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I take the word on real Whips. I apologise and I will say Deputy Whip, who should perhaps be the Whip. But there are actings and I am not sure where the Acting Leader is but maybe the hon member Davids, because she is next down the line, is actually the Acting Leader.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, will you please take your seat. There is a member on the floor. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C W BEERWINKEL: On a point of order, Madam Speaker. You have made your ruling about who plays what role and what their titles are. It is very unbecoming for the MEC to continue to be sarcastic and divide members on this side of the House.

The SPEAKER: Your point of order is noted. Hon Minister Winde, do not sow division, please deal with the issues.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I understand the question from the hon member Davids and of course, I mean any activity that happens in this province, where someone derives an income from that activity or is able to employ someone through that activity or is able to purchase something from some other business or person or individual, is about the economy of this province. So, the answer is yes. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: If there are no more follow-ups can we move to Question 10 and the question is directed to the Minister of Community Safety. I see the hon Minister.

Gang-related killings in Delft

10. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) (a) Whether the South African Police Service has an operation strategy to address the gang-related killings in Delft, as reported in August 2016; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details; and
- (2) whether any arrests have been made in connection with these killings;
- (3) whether the South African Police Service has an integrated violence strategy for the Western Cape given the recent transfers of officers heading Operation Combat; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you very much for this question. The South African Police Service has an operation strategy in place to address gang related killings in the Delft Policing Precinct.

Visible policing is deployed in identifying problematic blocks where gang violence has occurred in the past month. Further additional resources comprising of provincial units are deployed under operational stabilisation, over problematic periods, when most incidents of serious crime occur in the Delft policing area.

Arrests have been made, a number of people are still in jail. SAPS in the Western Cape has an Integrated Anti-violence Strategy to address problematic areas and stations. Operations are conducted and co-ordinated on a provincial level. The strategy includes also other agencies of government such as Metro Police, Law Enforcement, also communities through the Neighbourhood Watches as well as the auxiliary officers that were deployed in Manenberg to deal with these problematic areas.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Max, a follow-up, the first one?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to ask the Minister, given the fact that he says that they do have a strategy in Delft; now if their strategy was in place, how was it possible that it only happens after 31 killings that something has been done? Why, what, when was this strategy implemented, when was it created and why not before, because if it is one killing, there was no strategy, two killings no strategy - 31 killings. So I just want to know whether this strategy was developed after the 31 killings?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. We regret the 31 deaths, the police should have acted quicker, they were a bit slow. It is 31 almost in one month, one and a half months would be more precise. Police did deploy quite a number of extra police officers in the area. As I have said, the Stabilisation Unit, more visible policing, police officers were drawn from other adjacent police stations into the area to stabilise the area.

The problem of SAPS, and I organised a number of community based meetings and the hon member was present at many of the meetings in the Delft area, is when a person is going to shoot and from where the person is going to shoot, and that is the trick. That is very, very difficult for the police. That is why SAPS relies a lot on information from its partners such as CPF members, Neighbourhood Watch members but also ordinary members of the public that phone in, that detect problems, that are aware of gangsters, where they roam around, where they are standing around and for the police to come in and come and do their stop and searches.

But SAPS' real issue is they do not know when a person is going to shoot. Maybe I also need to say, maybe from my side, they confiscate a lot of guns and I think one of the biggest problems we are facing in all our violent stricken areas, is the availability of guns. Over 30 plus, up to 40 guns get confiscated by SAPS on a week to week basis. The problem is where are the guns coming from? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Max and after hon member Max, in fact the hon Makeleni, who is wanting to speak. So if you do not mind, hon member Max, can she take the follow-up? You may proceed, hon member Lekker. Sorry I was looking at hon member Makeleni there. Hon member Lekker, you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. My surname has and always will be Lekker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: My apologies.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, noting that the intention of the strategy is to dislodge, disorganise and disrupt the gang activities in the areas, my question would therefore be: the very same strategy has got all the organs of State including the Provincial Department, which by the way is the Provincial Department's strategy. I want to check and understand from Minister Dan Plato, what form of assistance is his Department putting into the strategy itself, not undermining the fact that the death of 31 people in Delft is unbearable and unbecoming. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. A couple of issues: what we find with the gang violence from area to area is when the police with all their forces and strategies move into a specific area,

the violence shifts to another area. It is exactly what happened in the Delft case. Delft is now currently okay, not a number of shootings the last couple of weeks but now you find it in other areas and that is how these guys play their game with the policing forces. But the question is what are we, as the Western Cape Government, doing?

We immediately make sure that all our partners in the Delft area are in place, functional partners such as the CPF, a vibrant CPF in place, they attend all the meetings with the police; a vibrant Neighbourhood Watch. Quite a huge number of Neighbourhood Watch people also function in the Delft area and we continue with our assistance to the two entities.

We also started our 'Walking Bus' drive in the Delft area. That also helps a lot. That dislodged and up-commanded a number of people that are at home to walk with children in the morning from home to school and in the afternoon back from school, back home to ensure a safe space, a safe passage for them. We also engage with the religious fraternity for the upcoming holiday periods to keep as many of the youngsters as busy as possible. To keep, in a major attempt, them away from anti-social behaviour and other wrong things.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Max and thereafter I see the hon member Joseph which will then be the four follow-ups and will be the end of Questions for Oral Reply as we have exceeded the 60 minutes. Thank you. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to hear from the Minister, given his answer: how many arrests were made in connection with those 31 killings and when were these extra police officers deployed and if he can say, what is the ratio between police officers and community members?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, take your seat please hon member Max. Hon member Dyantyi, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: On a point of order. The hon MEC, if you could call him back to his place, if he wants to interject. Hon Minister Fritz.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, that is a bit rich coming from you I must admit, talking about interjections but I will certainly caution the hon Minister. [Laughter.] There is a speaker on the floor, thank you. You are not in your seat Minister Fritz. Okay? [Interjections.] Order, please. [Laughter.]

There is the last question addressed by hon member Max to hon Minister Plato and then the last follow-up is the hon Bernard Joseph, who is with us. He wants to pose the last follow-up question. [Interjections.] Sorry, the first, hon member Joseph, let us not get in a twist here.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, the two [Interjection.] questions are if the member wants a specific date ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... when these forces were deployed ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Dyanti, we just talked about interjections. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is my friend, he is my friend. If the hon member Max wants the exact date I can provide him with an exact date, it is available and the number of arrests. It was at the public meeting. SAPS had a tally of 14 arrests up till now but since we had the meeting, I do not know. That information I can get for the hon member as well. And then the ratio, that is also a new question, I am willing to provide you with that information as well.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Bernard Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you. We are playing with semantics when we ask questions pertaining to crime that is affecting the people of the Western Cape but also noting that the National Government has failed dismally to implement the National Crime Prevention Strategy. [Interjections.]

As an overarching position that they should have to implement the Crime

Prevention Strategy. I do not know if they know what the Crime Prevention Strategy is. [Interjections.] However my question ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your question please.

Mr B JOSEPH: No, you won't disrupt me. I am used to this type of politics. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr B D JOSEPH: However, the question to the MEC is very clear. In terms of the strategy that was mentioned and the dynamics in terms of the semantics of the words, to use the words of the Provincial Government, did they implement policing that meets priorities in the area of Delft, to get to the root causes of crime in that particular area and what was the outcome of those discussions with the community? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Joseph. Order, please members. The hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, I said it in the National Council of Provinces yesterday, I want to say it again. With issues such as crime we must not play politics with crime. When flying, bullets do not ask which political party you belong to. Many, many families get hit with death and assault and the emotional stuff that goes along with that and I

would urge us, please, let us stay away from things like that.

I think let us rather combine our efforts to try and find a long lasting solution. Gangsterism is a very, very bad thing in many, many of our communities. You find gangsterism in Khayelitsha and Nyanga, you find it in Elsies River, you find it also in Manenberg.

Looking at the number of funerals attended over the last couple of weeks, to see how our kids died as a result of a gangster gun, we as leaders cannot allow a thing like that to continue. We must work with SAPS - this morning we sat with SAPS. Last week Friday I sat with the police about the violence and I am happy with SAPS's strategies in place but SAPS cannot do it alone. All of us in the community must play our part to reduce the violence in our communities. We must find those guns, where they are coming from because that currently, today, is one of the root causes of our problems. But with regard to the policing needs and priorities, those are in place.

The Delft community at the meetings; hon Max was present and other councillors and community leaders. The combined strategies and efforts are in place. The fact of the matter is we must find those behind the shootings. Like we plan, they plan and they shoot when no-one expects it and that causes all the drama in the community. We must get that right and I am not here to criticise the police and say there must be a police officer in each and every street to prevent a shooting from happening. That will never happen.

That is why families and individuals in the communities must also come forward with the necessary information. Those shooters, those killers are not from outer space, Madam Speaker. They are from inside the communities themselves and we must bring that issue down from inside the community. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That now concludes the Questions for Oral Reply. We will now have an opportunity for Member's Statements. I see the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms B A SCHAFER (DA): Madam Speaker, today I would like to highlight the importance of democracy in the schooling system and how it is currently being disrupted by misinterpretation of the term transformation by the current generation of learners and students in South Africa.

The on-going protests at universities and schools indicate that these institutions are being used as soft targets to drive political agendas. I have reason to believe that the current protests at schools and universities are being orchestrated by various powers behind the scenes. The on-going protests and behaviour at schools and universities pose a threat to the stability of our education system and therefore also our future as a society.

Many of the on-going disruptions have deprived students who want to learn,

as well as their fundamental right, that is the right to a quality education. In this sense their democratic and constitutional rights are being transgressed. There have been on-going calls from our students for radical transformation in the education system. I argue that this term has not only been misinterpreted but in fact misused. Transformation cannot simply mean replacing one thing with something else. Transformation is in fact normative, value laden, dynamic and a process that takes time.

It is in this regard that the structures that promote freedom are in fact being used inappropriately. We should use the correct channels and protocols to share our grievances. Too many of these protests have in fact become acts of criminality. The DA in the Western Cape promotes the use of resources efficiently and effectively with regards to education in the province. We believe that education is pivotal to promoting fairness and providing those who are less fortunate with an equal opportunity in society. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI (ANC): Thank you, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: From Trollip, Mashaba, Msimanga and De Lille, we heard the following - they were all giving us the narrative that when they get into these cities they are going to deal with corruption ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes, of course.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... they are going to deal with cadre deployment. Currently as we speak, even before the ink dries ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... there is crisis in the DA, there is hypocrisy in the DA. The DA as we speak is at pains to justify its political appointment of a special advisor to a Mayor of one of these cities, the City of Cape Town. A special advisor that gets paid over R700 000 per annum.

This is an advisor that, not so long ago, Patricia de Lille described as a person who has got no integrity, that his integrity is worth about as much as the poo he throws, that he caused damage of R20 million. He was called a thug, a criminal, lawless and a political predator. The same described person has been welcomed with open arms.

An HON MEMBER: Are you jealous?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... by the very same Mayor who had described him in these kinds of words. The DA is known for lecturing us about “fit for purpose”.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, your two minutes for statements has

expired, unfortunately. It is two minutes per statement.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, I have put it down there.

The SPEAKER: Your two minutes has expired unfortunately.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My last sentence, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, statements – there are ten member statements of two minutes each.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am in two minutes.

The SPEAKER: It is not a matter of being fair or unfair. I have a clock here and if you are finished within the two minutes, well and good. If you go over the two minutes I need to draw your attention to the fact that your time has expired. Now, you might have used your statement in a different way but I will allow you ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am finishing my sentence. I am waiting for you.

The SPEAKER: Finish your sentence.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA has therefore been found wanting on its cadre deployment and “fit for purpose” rhetoric. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dyantyi. I see the DA.

Ms M M WENGER (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. Yesterday marked International Day of Peace which is observed around the world on 21 September each year. This day has been declared by the United Nations as and is intended to strengthen the ideals of peace, both within and among all nations and peoples.

As representatives of the people, it is therefore our challenge to promote the ideals of peace within our communities and our province. I am reminded of that beautiful prayer published for the first time in 1912 in Paris in *La Clochette* and widely attributed to St Francis of Assisi. These words are apt and should be our daily guide:

Lord, make me an instrument of Thy peace;

where there is hatred, let me show love;

where there is injury, pardon;

where there is doubt, faith;

where there is despair, hope;

and where there is darkness, light.

FA Hayek notes in the Constitution of Liberty that whenever it is necessary that one of several conflicting opinions should prevail and when one would have to be made to prevail by force, if necessary, it is better to determine which has the stronger support by counting numbers than by fighting. Democracy then, he said, is the only peaceful method of change that man has yet discovered.

As parliamentarians we must work to strengthen our young democracy, in the interests of peace, to build and protect her independent institutions, to guard against state capture and to shape inclusive and participatory societies and institutions. [Interjections.] It is therefore fitting that September is also the month in which we celebrate International Democracy Day. [Interjections.] It aims ...

Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, surely the Table should decide when my two minutes are up and I actually quite frankly ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon member. You are wasting your own time. I will allow you time to finish.

Ms M M WENGER: I find these interruptions quite distracting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not think it

is up to the ANC to determine when my two minutes are up. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member. Just one second. The only clock being used is the one at the Table and we are following this clock. Whatever time she started she has some seconds left on this clock, so please continue.

Ms M M WENGER: We aim to promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels. Let us give considered thought and action to these two important days.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired.

Ms M M WENGER: I would like formally raise a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may raise your point of order.

Ms M M WENGER: Throughout my statement, I have had calls from the ANC saying my time is up and certainly it is not up to the ANC to determine how long my two minutes are or when the clock is done. It is for you to decide and I would like you to rule on that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I have already ruled on that. The next

speaker is the EFF. EFF? No? Then the DA again.

Mr D G MITCHELL (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As Heritage Day edges closer, I want to use this moment to help our youth understand what this day means and why it is such an important holiday on our calendar. To some it is just another day to braai meat and have fun but the true meaning of this momentous day is much more. Heritage Day is a day that all South Africans should be using to reflect and celebrate what makes this beautiful country of ours so special. We have many cultures, customs, religions, languages and so many other things that make us different but we have strived to be a South Africa united in our diversity. It is our heritage that affirms our beautiful diversity and in so doing has shaped our national character of a rainbow nation. This idea was shared by our former President, Nelson Mandela. [Interjection.] Really?

The late former statesman once said:

“When our first democratically-elected government decided to make Heritage Day one of our national days, we did so because we knew that our rich and varied cultural heritage has a profound power to help build our new nation.”

Mr Deputy Speaker, when we braai this coming Saturday, I would like us to reflect on who we are as a society and where we come from. Let us acknowledge our past and celebrate the great strides we have made as a

rainbow nation, united in our diversity.

Heritage Day will forever be an important day to honour and celebrate as it is a time when we come together as a nation to rejoice and be proud of the cultures and traditions we originate from. As youth of today, we are often told that we have lost our cultures and that we do not respect our traditions. Let us use this day and prove them wrong. Tell them, this is my heritage and my future. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC. Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, it is clear that the DA's "Better Living Model Game-changer" for the former Conradie Hospital site in Pinelands provides a smokescreen which hides the reality that the DA in the province and the city have no plan to integrate the city and provide housing for the poor and working class.

Once again we have an announcement that this initiative will provide housing for 12 000 people in 3 000 units that will be built there. Despite a commitment by the Premier to provide a strategy for integrated human settlements within Cape Town in 2014, her MEC has not been able to produce such a plan. As a minimum one would expect that such a plan would list all public land owned by the City, Province and National, which is identified for human settlements and also a list of privately owned land identified for purchase or possible expropriation. This has never been provided by the

MEC. That is why we have ad-hoc approach.

For example, MEC Madikizela's own Department wanted to use Tafelberg for social housing. This was vetoed and instead an attempt was made to sell the land to the highest bidder. The DA has not come clean about the possible conflict of interest by consultants appointed by themselves. A Better Living Model in one area only will not resolve the housing challenge. Only an open and transparent plan to identify each parcel of land that is available for housing and the allocation of resources to develop that site will begin to address the problem. Instead we have an announcement by the Better Living Model which is a piecemeal approach. It is time that the Premier must honour her promise to provide a housing plan for Cape Town. Two years have passed since that promise was made and no delivery has been made.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the DA. Hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, it is time that we deal with the challenges commuters are facing in the Western Cape. Massive economic and population growth in Cape Town cause immense pressure on our roads and on public transport.

The DA therefore welcomes Minister Donald Grant's intention to propose the passing of a Western Cape Public Transport Framework Bill, to give effect to provincial policy on public transport and to better coordinate the work of municipalities across the province.

An unreliable rail service is now a liability instead of being the backbone of the public transport system. Historical underinvestment has created a desperate need for replacement and refurbishment. Almost daily disruptions in service and an increase in rail safety incidents are leading to increased private car usage, increased congestion, overcrowding on trains and a pressure on other modes of the public transport system.

The current situation for our commuters is becoming unsustainable. Therefore the DA supports the Western Cape Government's efforts in working with PRASA to improve the efficiency and operation of the rail system. Cape Town's long-term Public Transport Network Plan, and the further expansion of the MyCiti system is crucial to ease the current congestion and the current unacceptable commuter situation. The MyCiti route through South Road to give the poor commuters easier access to economic opportunities must go ahead.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the current situation hampers growth and locks people into poverty. We have to improve the situation for our commuters. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC. Hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER (ANC): Our children continue to die in and around Western Cape schools while this Provincial Government passes the buck on who is

responsible for the Safer Schools Programme.

On Tuesday we saw how the Departments of Community Safety and Education shamefully fell around on who is responsible for the programme and who should fund it. These Government departments seem not to be communicating.

On the same day we heard that National Government must again pay more than R90 million to fix the four condemned new schools built to inferior standards. It is ironic, as the Departments of Education and Public Works are running around with all sorts of excuses while they previously stated they will recover the money from the erring parties.

It is clear our future leaders and their safety in schools are not really a priority for this Government as was exposed in a recent safety and sanitary audit.

Despite statements to the contrary, this Government must take up its role and sort out its mess to ensure children are not shot, stabbed, raped and assaulted while they have to learn at schools in this province.

It is clear that the DA Government do not really care about the poor, ordinary people and learners of this province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA?

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, earlier this month a mother called police for help. She asked for help because her daughter was misbehaving. The results were that her 15-year-old was raped by one of the police officers on duty at the Montagu police station.

Police stations represent safety within our communities, not where crime is committed. This is exceptionally problematic. As it stands, we are already trying to bridge the gap between the police in the province and the people who live in the Western Cape with regard to issues of trust.

One would think that a police station would be one of the safer places to be but this past incident begs to differ. I request that the Western Cape Government in partnership with SAPS and all the communities in the province come together to alleviate crime.

In addition, I call for there to be increased mentoring around how SAPS officials treat those that they have taken into custody and that we develop processes such as a police register for those applying to SAPS to ensure that anyone who has a history associated with crime can be monitored and are not hired.

The DA in the Western Cape acknowledges that the safety of all South Africans is a right and a necessary prerequisite to ensure all peoples are giving an equal opportunity in this society. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of members' statements. We go to the Order Paper again. Motions on the Order Paper. I am looking at the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, the hours of the sitting on Friday, 30 September 2016, shall be: 08:30 to adjournment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that? Agreed to. We then move further. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: I am working very hard, Mr Deputy Speaker, I must say.
[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It looks like it. Keep up the good work.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House welcomes and supports the Social Audit Report,

conducted by Equal Education on Safety and Sanitation in Western Cape Schools, which painted a gloomy picture about education in the province and calls on the MEC's of Education, Community Safety and Social Development to accelerate the implementation of all the demands given in the final report handed in on Tuesday. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there any further? No further? Hon member Dyantyi? [Interjections.] No, notice was taken of that. That will ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, was that a motion with notice or without notice?

HON MEMBERS: With notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: With notice. Notice was given of that. With notice.

Mr M G E WILEY: Okay.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wasting our time. Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House institutes an investigation into City of Cape Town, Patricia De Lille's, five overseas trips this year that have so far cost the ratepayers over R2.2 million.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. There is no chance for objections now, just simply notice taken. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the Western Cape Education Department and the Education MEC are compelled by the 2014 Cape Town High Court order to provide adequate security for teachers and learners in schools; and calls on Premier Helen Zille to reign in MEC Schäfer for failing to ensure the safety of pupils and teachers in the province; and demands that the Western Cape Education Department fully implements this order. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry. Mr Deputy Speaker, the first one was a motion with notice. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. No, they were all - they are giving notice now of motions which may be ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: I understand that but at the last motion, you asked if there were any objections, which is a motion without notice.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, if I did ask for objections that was a mistake. I did not ask, as far as I know. I simply said ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I should have said notice taken. That ends the story. Notice taken. There is no chance for objection at this stage. Notice taken. Who is the next person? Hon member Olivier.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi, gooi, gooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw, throw, throw!]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes more complaints about teachers discriminating against learners at Western Cape schools have come forward even after

MEC Schäfer's advisory to schools to review their codes of conduct – the latest being a teacher in Dunoon who allegedly cut a Grade 5 pupil's hair; and orders the MEC to give more direct leadership to all schools to review and amend their codes of conduct as well as to protect learners from further discrimination and victimisation. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Are there any more? Nothing further? This side, any further? Then we move on to Motions without Notice. Are there any motions without notice? Hon member Lentit.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest condolences to the family of honourable Basil Kivedo, on the sudden passing of his brother Merwyn. Our thoughts and prayers are with his wife Candace Kivedo, his children Kyla and Loni and his family and friends.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon

member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family of Mischka April, the teenage girl from Lavender Hill, who was shot four times in the head and face in the early hours of Monday morning; her death comes after four other people were killed in the area in the previous week; and calls on the police and this Provincial Government to intensify the fight against gangs.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the resignation of the former Leader of the Opposition, Mr Marius Fransman. Mr Fransman was a colourful and at times entertaining individual and while we say farewell to him from our ranks in this House we look forward to his appearance before SCOPA in the future. *[Interjections.]*

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the former Anglican Archbishop of Cape Town, Desmond Tutu, a speedy and full recovery as he was discharged yesterday from hospital after he was readmitted over the past weekend for the treatment of a minor infection and also commends Deputy President, Cyril Ramaphosa, for visiting the “Arch” in hospital this week.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Mduduzi Tshabalala, popularly known as Mandoza, and extends its condolences to his family and friends. Mandoza died on Sunday, 18 September 2016, after losing his

battle with cancer at the age of 38. The hit song “Nkalakhata Godoba” was a hit maker. May his soul rest in peace.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Paralympic team on their success at the Rio Paralympics. The team collected a total of 17 medals of which 14 were from the Western Cape. I move so.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Joseph at the back.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Chloe Danielle Gilbert for attaining first place for the full contact Karate South Africa 2016 Junior Knockdown Championships on 10 September 2016 at the Velodrome Centre.

That the House congratulates the Karateka of Portlands and that the House further commends the Karate DO-Jo of Portlands Wood and Woodlands and also commends Sensei Gavin Smith for the good work being done in Woodlands and Portlands. I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Thuleka Duke, the co-owner of ATG Ekasi Handbags and Clothing from Gugulethu, who recently secured and international client which will see her merchandise sold on the global market.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing away of Allister Sparks and sends its condolences to the family and friends of this renowned journalist, historian, and former editor of the *Rand Daily Mail*. Allister Sparks passed away on Monday after a short illness. May his soul rest in peace.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House, with reference to Rule 98 of this House, resolves that SCOPA must investigate any outstanding matters stemming from the business of SCOPA of the 4th Parliament, with specific reference pertaining to the Auditor-General's Report of 2012 relating to the use of consultants in the Departments of Public Works and Transport and that of Health. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Joseph?

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Dyan Buis gelukwens, 'n oud-Riversdaller en Hessequa se goue seun wat serebraal gestremd is en ook 'n inspirasie was by die Paralimpiese Spele, wat uitgeblink het as 'n atleet met besondere gawes, geduld en passie en deursettingsvermoë. Hy spog met twee Paralimpiese medaljes, brons vir verspring en goud wat hy Saterdag, 17 September, tydens die 400m-finaal losgehardloop in 'n rekordtyd van 49.46 sekondes. Ek stel so voor. Dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Hon member Dyantyi?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Dyan Buis, formerly from Riversdal and Hessequa's golden son, who is cerebrally handicapped and has been an inspiration at the Paralympic Games and excelled as an athlete of special talents, patience, passion and determination. He won two Paralympic medals bronze for long jump and gold, which he won on Saturday evening, 17 September, during the 400m final in a record time of 49.46

seconds. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dyantyi?]

†Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA always advocated to fight cadre deployment and has now become the proponent of jobs for pals where it governs, as the appointment of Loyiso Nkohlhla as executive support officer to City of Cape Town's mayoral committee member for utility services, Ernest Sonnenberg, is a case in point and further proves correct the ANC assertion that he was bought to leave the ANC for the DA; and calls on the Provincial Treasury to investigate whether this appointment has contravened the MFMA.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that? Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ongoing dissatisfaction and unfolding saga around the dismissal of South Peninsula High School principal, Brian Isaacs, with the accompanying calls for his reinstatement by community members. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection? It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Lentit, do you want to move? You may move.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns Kenny Kunene for attacking Julius Malema, Commander In Chief of the EFF, on *Morning Live* yesterday.
[Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to that? There is an objection? It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Hank McGregor for winning his 7th canoe world title this past weekend in Brandenburg, Germany. I move so.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further? For the last time, hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisers of the Sanlam Cape Town Marathon for once again cementing its position among the continent's most popular road running events.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes on Saturday we celebrate National Heritage Day, wishes all well on this important occasion and also notes this day of history and heritage this month is under the theme "Celebrating our

human treasures by ascertaining our African identity” with emphasis on our living legends in order to preserve and promote our cultural heritage.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, just a supplement to hon member Mackenzie, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Hank McGregor and Jasper Mocke on winning the K2 at the World Canoe Marathon Championships.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further? For the last time? If that is the case, then we have come to the end of the business of the day.

The House adjourned at 17:45.