
WEDNESDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2016

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good morning members. [Interjection.]

Hon member Mr Dugmore, it seems as if someone never got the memo.

[Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Allow the members an opportunity to take their seats.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, they never rang the bell. Madam Speaker, they never rang the bell. That was why, I think, there was no bell on the floor there and ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: (?) No, but we know it starts ten o'clock.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

An HON MEMBER: We know it starts ten o'clock.

The SPEAKER: Order members, it is the second last day and I am certain people are tired, but if we could just cooperate and work through the day as swiftly as we could. I think things might go a lot easier, so let us start again by saying good morning. Welcome to our guests in the gallery. Welcome to our second-last session and I think we are quorate so I would like to believe that we can begin. I would like to ask the Secretary to read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Plato.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, good morning, Madam Premier, hon members, good morning also to the officials and the guests in the gallery.

The recent incidents of attacks on our police officers in the province - those who diligently serve and protect us - are a harsh reminder of how vulnerable

we all are. We cannot tolerate such attacks. I have engaged the Provincial Commissioner on how best we can support their efforts to ensure that those responsible for these cowardly acts are brought to book and have subsequently issued a R100 000 reward on behalf of the Western Cape Government for information leading to the arrest and successful prosecution of those responsible. I wish to urge our communities to come forward with the information to help police in this regard. A reminder that we all need to do more in order to help create safer environments in our province.

We take pride in our achievements, especially those of good corporate governance. This year we received our seventh consecutive clean audit report from the Auditor-General. Every rand counts and needs to be well spent if we are to help change the safety circumstances of people in this province. I wish to congratulate my Department on this achievement.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We recognise, however, the challenges of doing the most we can with the limited financial resources made available to us. That is why we remain innovative in performance outputs and stay adaptable to the changing and challenging landscape to help ensure safer communities across the province.

The Department's original Budget Estimate for the 2016/17 financial year is adjusted to R289 844 000 from R292 016 000. This is as a result of funds

shifted to Vote 1: Department of the Premier, for the development of additional information technology to support the Community Police Forums through the Expanded Partnership Programme website as well as the IT development work required for the complaints system used by the Western Cape Police Ombudsman. The Centre for e-Innovation within the Department of the Premier shall coordinate these developments.

The remaining internal adjustments to the Department of Community Safety's budget are as follows:

Funding for Programme 1: Administration will decrease with from R1.855 million. This relates mainly to funds for compensation of employees and goods and services which had been reprioritised to be shifted to Programme 2: Civilian Oversight, and Programme 4: Security Risk Management, in support for the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer and the After School Game-Changer.

Despite the slight reduction, the programme will continue to provide the necessary support services to the rest of the Department.

Programme 2: Civilian Oversight, receives additional funding of R1.176 million, which sees their budget increase from R68.838 million to R70.014 million.

The bulk of the funding, R 759 000 is readjusted for the Alcohol Harms

Reduction and After School Game-Changer staff requirements. An additional R214 000 is being transferred to Western Cape Liquor Authority for the appointment of an additional liquor inspector which will focus on the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer areas.

An important aspect residing under Programme 2 is the Expanded Partnership Programme with the Community Policing Forums. Thus far, CPFs have accessed R1.5 million in support of the performance of their statutory functions. An additional R2.3 million is provided for the adjusted budget.

The rollout of the new Expanded Partnership Programme template saw improved performance of CPFs which translates to increased access to funding based on the payment for performance model used for CPFs. This has also resulted in a higher demand from CPFs for training and support interventions.

The 2016/17 Policing Needs and Priorities Workshops for the Province have been held at all 16 police clusters within the Western Cape and the respective safety plans have been compiled. These safety plans are in the process of being signed by the relevant authorities namely, the SAPS Cluster Commander and the CPF Cluster Chairperson per cluster. We look forward to signing all of these off and releasing the Provincial Policing Needs and Priorities Report early in 2017 in order for it to be considered by the National Minister of Police as is constitutionally required of him.

Our Court Watching Brief Unit visited 20 courts in the Metropole region and have monitored over 428 court cases.

The Watching Brief Unit is currently extending its services to the Mossel Bay, George, Knysna and Oudtshoorn courts in the Southern Cape.

Programme 3: Provincial Policing Functions continues to promote good relations between the communities and community organisations and the police to improve safety within communities. The decrease from R53.875 million to R50.691 million is largely due to the R1.597 million which was shifted to the Department of the Premier as mentioned earlier. [Interjections.]

The remaining R1.587 million has been shifted to Programme 4: Security Risk Management to support the resourcing of newly accredited Neighbourhood Watch structures.

The problems the youth face cannot be ignored and we collectively have to address them. We need to prevent our youth from becoming involved in negative social behaviours such as gangsterism, drugs and alcohol. That is why my Department invests heavily in youth focussed safety outreaches.

One of our primary initiatives, the Youth Safety and Religious Partnership Programme has seen R5.7 million provided for faith based organisations working in our communities as partners of the Department of Community Safety and the Western Cape Government at large, and partners to safety.

The R3.4 million provided for the December / January Festive Season holiday period will see the Department partner with at least 76 faith based organisations in 15 priority areas. This holiday period we aim to reach over 10 000 youth through these programmes, who are often at risk during school holidays.

Training of youth at the Chrysalis Academy is ongoing with its second 16 Bravo Course of 211 female students which commenced on 10 September 2016 and will see them graduate this coming Saturday, 3 December 2016.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: To date through the Wolwekloof Academy, the Department managed to successfully train 309 students through the following training courses. R12.507 million is provided for the EPWP programme... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...under Programme 3, of which R3.660 million is for EPWP youth trained at the Wolwekloof Academy.

One of the highlights of the Community Safety Outreach Programme this year has been the Walking Bus Initiative. Since May 2016, 28 Walking Bus

Initiatives have been launched to help ensure a safe route for learners to and from school every day. The Walking Bus Initiative is another example of how a proactive community who knows that safety is everyone's responsibility and who have heeded the call from the Department of Community Safety to help address the various safety needs within communities.

Participation in the Walking Bus Initiative by parents or participation in a Neighbourhood Watch is a necessary step in rooting out crime from within a community. I wish to thank the members of the Walking Bus Initiatives from participating communities for their commitment and continued resilience.

Other safety outreaches undertaken by Programme 3 include Women's Month celebrations, various community safety meetings, youth safety and opportunities outreaches, Prevention of Organised Crime Act awareness campaigns as well as safety kiosk handovers.

The Department of Community Safety is taking its awareness outreaches to the streets in support of 16 Days of Activism of No Violence Against Women and Children. This year, we are encouraging those who are suffering from abuse and those who know of abuse taking place, to break the silence around violence and abuse in our communities with the theme, Speak out - Silence to Strength.

We are taking our awareness campaign to communities, gathering on street corners, in parks and on open fields so that our message is not confined to

community halls filled with the converted. The message must reach the ears of the abusers and be imprinted in the hearts and spirit of the abused, and ring out to those that stand idly by in silence at the ongoing abuse. We all need to take the action necessary to end the abuse. I encourage every member of this House to support our community outreaches.

Programme 4: Security Risk Management sees a R1.691 million increase from R88.310 million to R90.001 million. The bulk of the increase is in sub-programme 4.1: Programme Support, and is for Neighbourhood Watch resourcing.

The Department has succeeded in getting the full support of the SAPS with the process of accreditation of Neighbourhood Watch Structures, under the auspice of the Western Cape Community Safety Act. There is a MOU in process of being signed with City of Cape Town and other stakeholders to ensure alignment of available resources to support accredited Neighbourhood Watch Structures.

In September 2016, the Department in collaboration with the Department of Health handed over equipment and certificates in recognition of the first accredited Neighbourhood Watch in the Western Cape to complete First Aid Skills Training. That was the Neighbourhood Watch of the Khayelitsha Town 2 area, as part of the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer. Neighbourhood Watches are being empowered with the necessary skills, equipment and support to provide holistic safety services to the communities

they serve, including first aid training.

For the Adjustment Budget, funding of R1 million was provided for the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game Changer, increasing the budget from R4.8 million to R5.8 million.

The Department's own revenue budget remained the same at R42.595 million. The bulk of the own revenue for the Department is from liquor licence fees which the Western Cape Liquor Authority collects on behalf of the Department. The estimated amount to be collected is R28.431 million.

Madam Speaker, in conclusion, through approving these adjustments, this House will allow the Department of Community Safety to facilitate better oversight over policing in the province, provide better support to the SAPS and law enforcement authorities working in communities, as well as communities at large.

Thank you very much.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Plato. [Applause.] Let us just give members a chance to settle in. We may proceed. I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Department loses approximately R2.17 million from its appropriation in the Adjustment Budget, which represents an approximate 7% decrease from the main appropriation. This budget shift, however, still benefits the Department of Community Safety because this money is being shifted to Vote 1 to the Department of the Premier's Centre for e-Innovation, to develop and improve applications for the web-based Expanded Partnership website. The Extended Partnership Programme in which oversight is co-produced with CPFs also creates a funding model for the CPFs. This system capacitates them to perform their duties as set out in the SAPS Act and at the same time adheres to good governance principles.

Currently not all CPFs are performing these functions and are not accessing the full amount of funds that they could be accessing. The Department is assisting to capacitate those CPFs so that funding can be supplied to them in a responsible and accountable way. Changes to the reporting template will make it easier for these CPF volunteers to report on their oversight activities and will make it more relevant, which is a needed and welcome development.

In addition, internal adjustments were made between programmes with Civilian Oversight in Programme 2 being one of the main beneficiaries of additional funds of R1.2 million.

This makes sense, as this is the Department's main constitutional mandate. The Department is defining oversight as contemplated in the Constitution of

the Republic and proving the catalytic effects that oversight can have.

The Ombudsman's Office receives an additional approximate R500 000 to help support the office of Advocate Pikoli. This first of its kind civilian police oversight body has been in operation since December 2014.

Since the start of this office it has already investigated 399 complaints, of which 342 have been finalised in the preliminary investigative stage. The top five police stations which recorded the highest number of complaints against them were Delft, Grassy Park, Mitchells' Plain, Milnerton and Ocean View.

The majority of these complaints related to poor communication, poor investigations and police behaviour. This is perhaps unsurprising given that detectives are overworked.

The Committee heard during our public hearings on police resourcing that there are difficulties presently with experience in the detective corps and that more senior and experienced detectives are needed to improve detection and conviction rates.

The Western Cape Police Ombudsman stated that the detection unit is under severe strain with a constant backlog of dockets. In the Cape Town Metropolitan area all police stations, all of them, with the exception of Claremont have detective to docket ratios in excess of the national norm of one detective to 25 dockets. The norm is the standard which is the considered

normal or appropriate as defined by the Public Service Commission of the Republic. In addition over 30 stations in Cape Town have detective to docket ratios of at least triple the national norm, which is something that needs to be addressed urgently.

I take the opportunity at this very sad time to extend condolences to the police officers that were tragically murdered in the last week.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear.

Ms M M WENGER: On or off duty, they dedicate their lives in service to the safety of all of us. We trust that the R100 000 reward offered by the Department of Community Safety will ensure that information is received to bring the criminals responsible to book. I also commend Police Commissioner Lieutenant-General Jula's efforts to improve training and increase police operations in crime-ridden areas to prevent more killings of officers and citizens.

In addition to the already mentioned budget shifts Programme 4 receives R1.7 million as this programme is now responsible for the accreditation, training and support of Neighbourhood Watch Structures in the province. A R100 000 additional money is allocated to the Neighbourhood Watch equipment and R280 000 goes to the City of Cape Town for school resource safety officers to keep children safe at schools.

Shifted funds also go to the Liquor Authority for a liquor inspector in support of the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer. In these tough times tough decisions need to be made and a laser-like focus on mandates and programmes that make a difference. This Department has spent the last few years shifting away from *ad hoc* projects and programmes that are unsustainable and which have little impact, and has focused its targets and budgets towards its core mandate of civilian oversight, community safety partnerships and a whole of society model, including Neighbourhood Watches and Community Police Fora and on advising on Government and asset safety in a holistic manner. For example the School Walking Busses that the Minister mentioned earlier is a real example of how the whole of society can impact positively on safety. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Believe it for yourself.

Ms M M WENGER: The Department of Community Safety has received seven consecutive clean audits and has over the years received several awards as one of the top performing departments in the country by the management performance assessment tool awarded by the Presidency and a few weeks ago it also won the bronze award for the best functioning provincial department in this year's Batho Pele Awards. It is clear that the Department runs a sound financial ship and is productively using the budget allocated to it and it has cut out wastage. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Who got the gold and the silver?

Ms M M WENGER: In conclusion Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

Ms M M WENGER: In conclusion Madam Speaker, we support the budget adjustment of the Department of Community Safety, Vote 4 for 2016. Thank you. [Applause.]

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] is getting more and more and more.

An HON MEMBER: Where are your members, you are answering...
[Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Speak to your chief, speak to your chief. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members, if I may, hon member Ms Davids, sorry, if I may address you all. There were many members who were not here at the beginning of the session and the request was around cooperation because we

have a fairly full programme and the next speaker is indeed the hon member Ms Lekker, so I would like to ask that you afford her the opportunity to present without interjections and heckling and engaging across the floor.

An HON MEMBER: She is not heckling. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are ready for everything. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, in the absence of the Chief Whip, may I ask that you manage your side of the House please. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please, members, thank you. You may proceed hon member Ms Lekker. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Yesterday this House missed an opportunity to rise in silence and give respect to the late former President of Cuba Commander Fidel Castro. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Commander Fidel Castro will be remembered by many freedom loving people... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You said Zuma to stay... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Ms Lekker, take your seat please. [Interjections.] Members, Minister Meyer, I am appealing to you to please afford the speaker an opportunity to present. I can understand heckling and interjection but we cannot simply have a go at each other, drowning out the speaker over a matter that is being debated. Again let me request your cooperation. [Interjections.]

Hon member Mr Tyatyam, I am in the process of trying to get order and you are adding to the disorder. You may proceed hon member Ms Lekker, thank you for your patience.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Commander Fidel Castro will be remembered by many freedom loving people around the southern hemisphere... [Interjections] ...for his unwavering support during the high days of repressive regime and unfortunately this DA-led Government has refused to give young people an opportunity to study medicine in Cuba. Long live the undying spirit of Commander Fidel Castro, long live.

An HON MEMBER: Long live!

Ms P Z LEKKER: On the 25 November 2016 Deputy President Cyril

Ramaphosa launched the sixteen days of Activism of No Violence against Women and Children campaign. This is very important in our quest to fight the scourge of unabated abuse levelled against the most vulnerable section of our society.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...once a year.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We resolve to double our effects throughout the year. The sixteen days are merely an illustration of our mission. In December 2015, I vehemently objected to the shifting of funds to the Department of the Premier.

This year the amount has increased to over R2 million. I think it is high time that the centralisation of power in this Department and her office's bully tactics over the other departments must be discouraged and challenged.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms P Z LEKKER: On the other hand, the most deserving... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Ms Davids you have a member on the floor. Members, Minister, please. Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: On the other hand the most deserving programme within

Community Safety, namely the Provincial Policing Function which is responsible, amongst others, for supporting CPFs is negatively affected by the shifting of funds to the Department of the Premier.

The DA-led Government is playing double standard roles. It is quick to criticise and put blame on the National Department, in particular the Department of the South African Police Services in terms of resource allocation, whilst it is the culprit in its own province. The consistent closure of public participation persists that must foster social cohesion and promote citizenry in the context of our hard won participatory democracy.

During the public participation processes on police resourcing we heard that the CPFs are not given enough support. The Western Cape Community Police Board confirmed our long held view that they complain that DOCS is not playing its leading role. Those DOCS officials disappeared ever since the CPF board has started to question DOCS' approach on the EPP. This clearly illustrates DOCS' attitude not to engage honestly and robustly.
[Interjections.]

There are many credible community initiatives that DOCS refuses to support or turn a blind eye towards. This ignorance has a devastating effect on community efforts to combat crime.

In 2015/2016 SAPS recorded that the Western Cape still has the highest rate of contact crime, including rape and murder, whereas affected areas are

predominantly poor areas, namely Nyanga, which has been declared the country's murder capital over three terms. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: The fact is this scourge requires a transversal approach in tackling the social ills and this Department continues to ignore this fact. AGRI Western Cape has also confirmed this fact during their presentation on the public participation on police resourcing.

While also the environmental design of these areas is the reason that a 19 year old, Sinxolo Mafevuka was killed in a communal toilet, which is about 70 metres from her home. Yet the MEC in this DA-led Department fails to engage his colleagues in blue to change the apartheid spatial planning divisions in the Western Cape.

The R3.5 million that is allocated for religious partners, yet it is another ploy by DOCS to disperse patronage to its cronies.

The Standing Committee requested an extension to broaden the applications. The office of the MEC has confirmed to give... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...to give the extension. However, the application forms

have not been forwarded to the Standing Committee and it lives a lot to be desired on the commitment to have partners that are honest rather than friends to the DA.

The DA led Government does not care about the plight of the historically poor and marginalised people of the Western Cape who continue to live in abject conditions. This adjustment estimates fail the people of this province.

The implementation of Recommendation 12 of the Khayelitsha Commission remains a headache as this Department now wants to do a turnaround. We are patiently waiting to see how you intend to manipulate it.

The adjustment budget is our last chance to salute the six police officers that were shot during the past week, amongst them Thanduxolo Ndiki, Mabhuti Nqwaba of Khayelitsha; last week Tuesday night constable Amanda Ladlokova was also killed. We honour all of our police officers and those fallen ones too. Thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor-hoor. Jou lekker ding! Jy is 'n lekker ding!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hear-hear. You good thing! You are a good thing!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, I would not want to see this House go to the dogs. So can we please get some order here? [Laughter.] I see the hon member Mr Christians. You may proceed. Good morning member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, it is clear that we are two-and-a-half years in this House and the ANC do not understand that the Department of DOCS got an oversight role. They are not the police. We say that day in and day out and they persist.

We cannot deny the fact that this Department is doing a sterling job. I sit on this Committee. I know what they are doing. They are doing a sterling job to create safer communities. So the important thing is when you vote against these adjustments you are voting against safer communities. You are voting against the establishment of the Ombudsman because money is going there and I, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I cannot say much, but I want to say we support... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: And we must come to this House and give credit where credit is due. I have never seen a department working so hard to create safe communities in the Western Cape. I have never seen that. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So I want to applaud the Minister and the HOD and his department for excellent work done and well done and we will support you, this Committee will support you going forward because we must create a better and safer Western Cape. I thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence... [Interjections.] Order please members, can we settle down. †Asseblief mense. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Please people [Interjections.]] In the absence of member Joseph of the EFF, Minister, if you would like to take up this slot. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I thought that that side of the House needed to be in Cuba today, because they are at the wrong place, it seems. [Interjections.]

Just to react on some of the issues raised, just very briefly, we will continue to fulfil our mandate. We will continue and work very, very hard to support our CPFs and Neighbourhood Watches. I am the first to say there are issues. There are challenges. We deal with the issues and the challenges.

You must remember we are working with people doing a voluntary job, not receiving a salary and that is why we need to caress them, do whatever we can for them but they are doing an excellent job. We support the CPFs financially and we also support Neighbourhood Watches as an entity financially. We do not neglect them, but what my honourable colleagues on that side of the House must realise about CPFs, their mandate is enshrined in

the Police Act and they are the prime responsibility of the South African Police Services and not the prime responsibility of the Department of Community Safety. One has to emphasise that. The comments are of such a nature... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We must take over the policing functions, then you must ask your National Parliament... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You must resource them.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to carry those functions over to the Department of Community Safety. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am aware the police prioritising the training of detectives and the police and manned resources in the province is a major problem. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry Minister... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But let me say... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Plato, will you please take your seat. Members this is unacceptable. We simply cannot have members other than the speaker engaging in an argy-bargy and the Minister is being drowned out. We cannot even hear him speak. So I am speaking to both sides of the House. [Interjections.] Minister Madikizela, I desire your cooperation please. Similarly hon member Mr Tyatyam on the other side. You may proceed Minister Plato. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dyantyi!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, we are working very, very closely with SAPS. We have a very good relationship but SAPS members agreed today that by taking away police reservists, by taking away the specialised units impacts severely on proper policing in the Western Cape and that is a fact. There are not enough police officers to patrol our streets like in the past and that is why we shout to the police leadership, even yesterday at our Minmec meeting with the National Minister of Police, my key message to him was bring back the reservists, bring back the specialised units almost immediately, otherwise we will see no change... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Bring back Bambanani. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...in what is happening in Cape Town. There are enough CPFs. There are enough Neighbourhood Watches. Bambanani's do not patrol the streets, definitely not, but let me also say...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: CPFs and Neighbourhood Watches are not negatively affected. They receive the support they need to receive from us. The police have a major role to play and that is why we support them. We support many organisations in our communities. We invest heavily, specifically in our poorer communities. YSRP is not deployed, no-one in my office sits on the YSRP. [Interjections.] The administration is driving the YSRP process and hon member Mr Christians, thank you for your continued support.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Plato. That concludes the debate on this vote.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will now read the second Order of the Day.

An HON MEMBER: Bring back Bambanani. Bring back Marius Fransman.

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, that will not be...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 1 – Premier - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon Premier. Madam Premier you may proceed. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dyantyi, if you would afford the Premier now the opportunity to speak. I am certain you will have an opportunity. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am just ready for that.

The SPEAKER: I am certain you are, but let us cooperate. Madam Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, The budget for the Department of the Premier has been increased by R23.7 million [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is a dictator... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...in this Adjustments Appropriation Bill. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is centralisation.

The PREMIER: The adjusted budget of the Department is R1.36 billion. The bulk of this adjustment affects the budget for information and communication technology which is precisely to decentralise and include people in power

and decision-making and relates mainly to the following:

Firstly, the reallocation of the Broadband Project funding to cater for the Microsoft licensing shortfall, and why is there a Microsoft licensing shortfall? There is a Microsoft licensing shortfall because the rand collapsed under the ANC Government and its choices nationally. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: That is why we need an additional R50 million to pay for licences because of bad governance nationally that is shorting our currency. [Interjections.] This budget shift is based on the project progress, because we keep making progress in the Western Cape, details of which have been shared with the Standing Committee on various occasions. Delays in building plan approvals and the installation of municipal power connections have impacted the Broadband roll-out, but I am still very pleased with the progress we are making.

Meanwhile, the Department's budget for software licensing came under severe pressure due to the impact of the Rand/Dollar exchange plummeting and that had to be augmented as a result of our weekend special Minister of Finance last year. [Interjection.] The 11-year cash-flow projections for the Broadband Project are not negatively affected by this shift.

Now secondly, the adjustment budget has been affected by the reallocation of

the 2015/16 cost of employment savings to cater for the Microsoft licensing shortfall. Now we had to save money from employing people to pay for the Microsoft licensing shortfall, all as a result of the crisis that this National Government got us into. The Department was able to fund some of the 2016/17 licensing shortfall from its 2015/16 compensation of employee savings.

Thirdly, the adjustment budget arises from the ICT requirements for Modernisation Projects and that is R12.1 million. Funding has been prioritised to ensure that the delivery of Western Cape Government Modernisation Projects remains on track and it really is very important to be IT enabled if we want to do proper governance and create a context for development and economic growth and job creation in this province.

Now there are also shifts from within the Department of the Premier. Business Process Optimisation project funds totalling R6 million, have been shifted also to the Centre for e-Innovation, for the implementation of the Service Interface Programme. This is a work group located within the Provincial Strategic Goal 5.

Various pilot initiatives are currently being undertaken to improve the experience of our citizens when engaging Government through either our frontline service delivery facilities, or via our digital channels, precisely the opposite of dictatorship.

Spend will focus on:

- Client relationship management;
- A queuing system prototype, which is already working very well;
- Infotainment monitors at health facilities where people wait and then can watch useful videos that give them good information around their health, around their children's opportunities but also entertain them at the same time; [Interjections.]
- And computers on wheels at Tygerberg Hospital, which will improve service. [Interjections.]

An amount of R1.1 million has also been shifted within Centre for e-Innovation for the operational maintenance of the Cape Access e-Centres and may I just add, Madam Speaker, that we had our what we call speed-dating interactions with our Mayors and municipal managers this past week and almost every Mayor from a rural area without fail said these Cape access e-Centres are absolutely magnificent, it provides wonderful access to the youth to connectivity and to alternative entertainment and information channels and that they just want them in every single rural community. [Interjections.] So I am really glad that we are going to be shifting money to do that. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, Cape Town has... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Cape Town has got connectivity almost everywhere, where people do not steal our fibre optic cables. Madam Speaker, I would like to express my appreciation to the Director-General and the management of the Department for their contribution to and the development of a very sound budget.

Now I would like to take the opportunity to answer questions from the hon member Mr Dugmore and the hon member Ms Davids. They asked “who won the gold medal in the Batho Pele Awards?” I am very pleased that this is one... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: ...of the unprepared questions without notice to the Premier that I can answer. [Laughter.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: On Community Safety [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: No. The Batho Pele Award for the best... [Laughter.] ...the Community Safety Department won the bronze award overall. So the question is who won the gold award overall, was the Department of the Premier in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes. [Applause.] [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: And in case... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: There was not a gold for Community Safety. There were medals for the best, second-best and third best department in the whole public sector nationally. Who was the best? [Interjections.] The Department of the Premier! [Interjections.]

No, they did not have a special award there. They had Batho Pele Awards for departments at National and Provincial level throughout the whole country.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: She came first.

The PREMIER: They had awards for the best department, provincial or national throughout the country. This is all departments, every one.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Who got the silver and the bronze?

The PREMIER: And the Department of the Premier got the gold.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Who got the silver?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: And the Department of Community Safety got the bronze. There is your answer, and if you want to know the answer... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Let us congratulate you. [Applause.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Who got the silver... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And I may also add humbly that the silver Best Head of Department was the DG, Brent Gerber, and furthermore the gold... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, you have problems there. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: And furthermore, the gold for the most ethical department was the Department of the Premier. So I have answered all of your questions in one fell swoop.

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Premier of the Western Cape...

The PREMIER: But I accept that very humbly, because actually the award goes to a very overstretched department who had to sacrifice several of their key posts in order to up the amount that we could pay in licensing because of the crash of the rand occasioned by the ANC at a national level and despite that they got gold. So I want to say to them congratulations and thank you very much, because the performance of our dedicated officials in all departments and the incredible work they are doing on the Game-Changers, I have just come out of four stock-takes, absolutely amazing. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: [Onduidelik.] Ek kan dit nie glo nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] I cannot believe it.]

The PREMIER: It has been a challenging year for Government, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: ...and I would just like to thank all Western Cape Government employees who have had to work harder and smarter as a result of financial austerity measures. Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Applause.]

The PREMIER: Questions without notice, I like those kinds... [Inaudible.]

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon member Mr Mitchell. You may proceed.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar kom klein Mackenzie. Ek hoor jy het oorgevat!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There comes little Mackenzie. I hear you took over!]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you. Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mitchell, please take your seat.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy het oorgevat.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He took over.]

The PREMIER: You have nothing to say on those subjects.

The SPEAKER: If I could address you hon member Mr Dyantyi. I think you must leave that for the book-club after the actual sitting. Let us confine ourselves to the business of the day please. You may proceed, hon member Mr Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Adjustment Appropriation Budget for the Department of the Premier sees an increase of

R23.7 million from the main appropriation. This increase is in the main in order to support other departments. The core aim of this Department is to embed good governance and to enable integrated service delivery in the province through a number of partnerships, innovation and people-centre approach across Government departments.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

Mr D G MITCHELL: The Department of the Premier continues to find innovative ways to move the province in the right direction. Game-Changers were introduced in line with the Provincial Strategic Goals. They are designed to ensure that our young people in particular are able to tap into the opportunities of the 21st century society and economy.

Recently the Apprentice Game-Changer was added to the already existing Game-Changers with an objective to achieve sufficient appropriately qualified technical and vocational skill people to meet the needs of prioritised economic growth areas in the Western Cape.

The Department had targets of introducing 32 500 qualified apprentices ranging from artisans, semi-skilled workers who achieved partial qualifications as well as top qualifications for already existing artisans. Because youth lives' matter in the Western Cape we applaud this initiative as it will assist in dealing with the serious challenge of unemployment among

the young in the province. We are committed to breaking the cycle of poverty that many in our communities are trapped in.

We need to create and continue creating opportunities for the youth in order to ensure that they become active citizens who can contribute meaningfully to our society.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

Mr D G MITCHELL: As part of the Department of the Premier's Game-Changer which provides Broadband and Wi-Fi across the Western Cape the Centre for e-Innovation will continue providing support to the WCED to ensure that the positives of the e-Learning Game-Changer are met. The e-Learning Game-Changer aims to enhance teaching and learning in our schools. The main objective is to use technology to enhance teaching and learning for all Western Cape schools.

The Department has also made significant progress on the roll-out of broadband to Western Cape Government Corporate sites, health sites, libraries, schools, Cape Access e-Centres.

At the end of 2015/16 financial year a total of 1022 sites were connected to broadband and more than 1300 new Wi-Fi hotspots and broadband sites will be completed by March next year.

As highlighted the progress was made in 2015/2016 financial year with the roll-out of broadband in the Western Cape. The Centre for e-Learning will now shift its focus to the use of broadband as a key enabler for attainment of the provincial strategic goal by ensuring that ICT is effectively used to contribute to the key targets as set out. With the shifting of funds between votes, the Centre for e-Innovation will get an additional boost to fund ICT requirements and modernisation projects as well as augment Western Cape Government licensing obligations. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] We are listening to you.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, the Department has shown its commitment to the youth because youth lives matter in the Western Cape. One of the Western Cape Government's priority programmes is the after-school Game-Changer that is intended to expand quality after-school programmes in the province. There are far too many children in our communities leaving each day and entering unsafe violent neighbourhoods and homes. Spearheaded by the Department of the Premier... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...the aim is to provide over 112 000 learners from no-fee schools with access to safe quality after-school programmes by 2019. This programme includes sport and recreation, academic support, including e-learning, arts and culture and life skills.

Madam Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to thank the DJ / the DG... [Laughter.] Okay, okay.

The SPEAKER: Members, let the DJ not rock this House. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, okay, I will...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mitchell, if you can just give the members a few seconds to compose themselves. I am certain they will come to order very quickly. Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, ja, that is the DJ of the Department, I would like to take this opportunity to thank the DG and his staff for the dedication and commitment to the people of the Western Cape and ensuring that we continue to provide the best possible services and opportunities despite the shrinking fiscal purse. We acknowledge that there remain challenges but we look forward to the performance of the Department in the next financial year.

The DA supports the Adjustment Appropriation for Vote 1, the Department of

the Premier. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Mitchell.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you DJ. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, let the DJ not rock this House now please. [Laughter.] Can we come to order? I see the hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Olivier and your cohorts across the way, thank you. You may proceed hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, thank you. I must confess that this is my first experience in that Ministry, I mean that Department of the Premier, of which with my only two days I attended, I am very frustrated and of course concerned. Though the Premier seems to be very pleased and appreciating the fact that her budget has been increased to R1.3 billion, and there has been some shift from other departments to her department, but my serious concern is a question of what that means because my whole experience looking at this R1.3 billion, I do not see any improvement in terms of the quality life of our people. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which is the most important thing.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Which I think is the most fundamental.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Exactly!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Instead this whole budget is used to recruit people to join DA... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Cadre deployment offensive.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And as an employment agent for the DA. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wys hulle.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Show them.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I say that because I know for a fact that there are people who could not make the list in other provinces who are recruited from Cope and other organisations including from the ANC and those people have been creating space in that Ministry. [Interjections.]

The budget is just increased. Another problem is that the budget is just increased to touch lives instead of embarking on a transformation of our society. What it means to her, the DA-led Government shifting huge sums of money from very critical departments such as Community Safety to the Premier, is that perhaps a vote of no confidence? Is that the DA agreeing with the ANC? [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Exactly, that is spot on.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...that that MEC, that MEC who has been consistently underperforming... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and needs to be removed. Why the DA is keeping honourable MEC Plato... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is op pad.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is on his way.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: While under his own eyes there has been a consistent increase in crime.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is op pad.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is on his way.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Instead now that money is shifted to the Premier. Does it mean the Premier agrees with us that honourable Plato is just kept for the sake of keeping me just playing constituency in support of the DA? [Laughter.] Or to confuse the coloured community or to confuse... [Interjections.] And I know him very well in that area... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...or perhaps to confuse the ganglords or to keep the ganglords under his... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: A point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, could you please take your seat. There is a member, your point of order hon member Mr Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Yes. I take exception of the fact that hon member Mr Magaxa ascribes the task and role and status of the hon Plato to just to safeguard the coloured community. That is a racist statement. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is parliamentary... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member Mr Kivedo your point has been noted. I will revert to Hansard and I will come back to the House on that. If I might ask, let us steer away from racist comments, but I will have to go back and check the record. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not racist.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Unfortunately in Mitchells Plain, hon member Mr Magaxa stays in Mitchells Plain, and I am not a coloured person. Therefore even you, hon member Ms Schäfer, can address you on that thing, to even consider that racist or you have to consider in hindsight on that. It means you have a very limited knowledge of Mitchells Plain.

The SPEAKER: Ja, hon member Mr Magaxa, if I would like to address you, I do not think I would want to enter into a debate with you on racism. However, a point of order was raised that indicated there could be a racist component and it is my duty as the Presiding Officer to test that assumption and revert to the House. As to your understanding of how much I know about Mitchells Plain is of no consequence to the proceedings so I would like you to proceed, and in your response... Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, the Premier's Department is reduced into more of a crisis department to intervene and to rescue poor performing departments and channel their programmes that they fail to execute into that touching lives mechanism, which is created by the DA to create confusion and bribe poor communities, and to me that is a serious problem. If this Department and the increase of that money can be used to create projects that are intended to improve, I think the Premier is not just a department, she is the head of this province and her role is supposed to be leading, to have its own independent operational budget, which will be used to improve the quality of life of our people; not to save the departments that are sinking. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.] Order please members. [Interjections.] Hon members, order please.

The PREMIER: I cannot believe it!

The SPEAKER: Premier, thank you. I see the hon member Mr Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Christians. Please take your seat. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, casting aspersions on a fellow member is inappropriate and unparliamentary. There are no praise singers in the House today and if you would like to take that discussion offline I recommend you do it somewhere else. You may proceed, hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I do not know if the hon member Mr Magaxa read this Blue Book or whether he was present when the Premier spoke, because that has no relation to what the Premier said, because the important thing for me is, and as we have called in the Premier with the broadband programme projects, we know how effective the broadband is. There is a lot of frustration, but the important thing is voting against this vote today will stop the licensing process. That is what it does and the important thing is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...that the Department of the Premier has got a transversal role. I believe that the Premier will be judged as leader of this province and the Premier has played an important role and I want to say well done, Premier, for receiving the gold award. We must do that, must we not? Well done, Premier, for receiving the gold award! But you see, the important thing is we must support... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The world is now moving in broadband ICT and a lot of the money is going there and we want to support the adjustments for the Vote 1. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Christians. [Applause.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Once again in the absence of the EFF, I see the honourable, the Premier. [Interjections.] Unfortunately, it cannot be done.

The PREMIER: Yes, well, I am wearing a red overall today so...

The SPEAKER: You may proceed Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I would like to thank

the hon member Mr Mitchell who is now the Chair of the Portfolio Committee, and I would like to congratulate him and thank him very much for his contributions. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members. Can we allow the Premier to proceed. Thank you.

†Die PREMIER: As ek my mond verbygepraat het vra ek om verskoning veral by die Hoofsweep ...

[The PREMIER: If I spoke too soon I apologise, especially to the Chief Whip...] †but I just wanted to welcome the hon member Mr Mitchell and I want to thank him for focusing on our key... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. [Interjections.] Order please. Sorry Premier, if you could take your seat please. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I just address you on these disruptions please. It bears in mind that in the absence of the Deputy Speaker it means that, well, on both sides of the House people are going to be asked to assist you in the Chair today. Unless some people want to have a seriously bad day at the office I suggest they start behaving.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Chief Whip. I think just on that point it is appropriate to indicate that the Deputy Speaker is not here today and tomorrow and we will be utilising temporary Chairs to relieve at certain

times during the day. I get the sense though that there is a whole lot of contestation or communication around positions in the various parties. I would like to ask if we could stick to the relevance of the topic of the day and perhaps use some other time to talk around who is who at the political zoo. Thank you. Your point has been noted, Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Hon member Mr Dugmore, the clarity is internally to the DA. I think you must ask that question of the Premier at another forum unfortunately. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dugmore! You may proceed.

The PREMIER: I would like to thank the hon member Mr Mitchell for focusing on the extent to which this Department and especially the Game-Changers that we are leading focuses on the youth. It is e-Learning, it is after-schools, it is apprenticeships, it is the Alcohol Game-Changer which is one of our most difficult and one that worries me the most.

In our discussions with various mayors this last week, almost every single one mentioned to me the devastation that is being wrought by alcohol and drugs and it is something that we have to apply our minds to, every single one of us because if you look at the Afrikaans word “verslawing”, which I think is a very good word for addiction, you can fight apartheid and beat apartheid, but when you become a slave of an addiction and when thousands upon thousands of young people are becoming slaves to addiction, we are enslaving our society more than we have ever been enslaved in the past. One Mayor from the West Coast gave me a figure that is so shocking that it

literally keeps me awake at night. They have an EPWP Programme there, a very good one and a very well-funded one. Of course they have many, many applicants because people are unemployed, they do not have the skills and they need EPWP and he told me that of all the many, many applicants 60% failed the drug- and alcohol test. You have to be tested for substance abuse before you give an EPWP, and 60% failed that test.

When we did a survey for disability because I am trying to find out where the children are that are being left behind who need support into tracks to support their disabilities. They came back to me and said that in one community, it was in Diazville on the West Coast, 33% of young people are living with a disability. I said that cannot be. That just cannot be statistically and when we disaggregated that statistic it was disability related to foetal alcohol syndrome.

Now do we understand what alcohol is doing to our future, because a child with foetal alcohol syndrome is not going to be able to learn any useful skill and, more than that, if our schools are filled with children with foetal alcohol syndrome, the children without foetal alcohol syndrome are going to be disadvantaged as well because they cannot go at the speed they should be going to get the qualifications, and to meet the standards they should be meeting so that they can pass their exams and become the best they can be in life and contribute to our society. We, as society, have to look at this and I raise this here because trying to deal with alcohol harms is one of the Game-Changers and one which is most difficult because we do not have any levers

on people's individual choices and lives and it has come to me so forcefully; and again in our After-schools Game-Changer where I was speaking to some students from the Year Beyond Programme where we take bright young matriculants and ask them to spend a year with us, getting a leadership qualification and helping us mentor and support our students in schools.

The ones that do the best, when I speak to them, are the ones who had solid parental homes with especially fathers who acted as role models for them and that is one of the big things we have to get right, because no government can stand in for a committed parent. So we cannot replace parenting and we have to stand up as one and argue for society based on the ethics and norms of responsible parenting. So I would like to thank the hon member Mr Mitchell very much for the contribution that he made to showing what we as Government are trying to do, but unless every single person understands that when you have a child your life is not your own anymore and you have a fundamentally bigger responsibility than that. We are not going to make progress as a society and we really have to.

Then I come on to the hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjection.] †Hayi! Siyakumkhumbula uMarius Fransman, nyhani. [No! We will really remember Marius Fransman.]

The hon member Mr Magaxa says he is very, very frustrated and I can see why he is frustrated. He mentioned that members are leaving the ANC and joining the DA. [Laughter.] That is really hard, but you know what, if he is

frustrated... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Because they cannot think for themselves.
[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: No... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Are you suggesting that black people cannot think for themselves, hon member Ms Lekker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: If the hon member Mr Magaxa thinks that he has had trouble in the past with people leaving the ANC to come to the DA, just wait for the future. Watch this space! So his frustration levels better rise if he is going to survive in the position he is in now.

I also note that the hon member Mr Magaxa gave the wrong speech, because he thought he was speaking on the Department of Community Safety's Adjustment Appropriation, because he spent his time attacking Minister Plato.

An HON MEMBER: Because of frustration.

The PREMIER: He spent his time attacking Minister Plato and I understand why he attacks Minister Plato. Minister Plato's oversight is exposing the fundamental inability of the ANC to run the National Policing Department properly and all of the very innovative things that the Department of Community Safety has put into place to expose that, starting from the Khayelitsha Commission to the Watching Briefs to the Neighbourhood Watches, to the CPFs to all of those things exposed day after day as the ANC's failures. No wonder the hon member Mr Magaxa is so frustrated and when we read in the newspaper that the Department of Community Safety nationally or the Department of Police Nationally - it is called the Department of Police Nationally - allegedly channelled R30 million to an NGO which involves the love interest of the hon the National Minister and that they could have got those services for free elsewhere. We know just why the hon member Mr Magaxa has to deflect attention to our oversight work.
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier if you could finish up, your time has expired.

The PREMIER: I thought I did not have any lack of time. Anyway, that is not a bad present for your love interest. All I want to say is that much of the

money that was used to support the drop in the rand in terms of the Microsoft Licensing Fees is going to be used to enhance public participation and increase oversight. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Premier. [Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: Slag hulle! Slag hulle! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Slaughter them! Slaughter them! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi! That concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Members, can I please ask you to cooperate. There is a lunch-break between one and two. You might choose to discuss these matters then. The Secretary will read the third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Department's Adjusted Estimates for 2016 were tabled on 24 November 2016 in this House. Provincial Treasury was allocated the main appropriation of R260 million. This is decreased by R6.9 million to an adjusted appropriation

of R254.5 million.

This amount results from an adjustment within the Vote following a R6 million reduction in compensation of employees in line with the CoE austerity measures requiring only critical posts to be filled while attrition could not be foreseen at the time the 2016/17 Main Estimates were submitted in this House.

An amount of R6 million was reallocated from 2015/16 financial year in unspent compensation of employees for drought relief / water shortage that was paid to three affected municipalities, namely Witzenberg, Oudtshoorn and Prince Albert.

An amount of R5.5 million was shifted to Vote 14: Local Government, and my colleague Minister Bredell will speak to that during his debate, for Municipal Support, strengthening of governance. In addition, an amount of R691 000 was shifted to Vote 6: Department of Health, to fund contract posts to support the LOGIS clean-up.

The following shifts were consequentially made within the Vote:

- Programme 1: Administration was increased by an amount of R6.8 million;
- Programme 2: Sustainable Resource Management was decreased by an amount of R8 million;

- Programme 3: Asset Management was decreased by an amount of R3 million; and
- Programme 4: Financial Governance was decreased by an amount of R1.9 million.

Furthermore, an internal shift from Programme 2 to Programme 1, because of the reclassification of the internship programme, was made to ensure that the expenditure is vested in the administrative powers and delegated authority and executed. This was also done to facilitate better accountability because the funding of the internship programme came from Programme 1 and it was currently located in Programme 2, so we are just busy cleaning up the accountability lines for that shift. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. [Interjections.] I recognise the next speaker. It is the hon member Mr Joseph.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Adjustment Budget for Vote 3 is a smooth process because of the good governance model of the Western Cape which is the best in South Africa. The Western Cape is capable to manage the R908 million in the adjusted estimates directed to various

departments. The departments will reallocate the money to various projects in line with the strategic goals. The Minister made it very clear that Government is committed to create public value... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And you believe this. You really believe it.

Mr D JOSEPH: The end result is continuous improvement in the lives of the residents. The role of Treasury is to monitor the performance of Government departments and municipalities. They do so with quarterly reports as a key instrument of expenditure patterns. Other instruments are the forums that are established for example the HODs of the departments, CFO Forums, municipal management forums; mayoral forums. That is established to enhance capacity building, leadership and accountability. The forums create opportunity for Treasury to advise on National Treasury and Provincial Treasury guidelines in particular the Public Finance Management Act as well as the Supply Chain Management Guidelines.

The good governance model of the Western Cape Government is drawing more investor confidence and more direct investment creates an upward trend in economic growth. The Western Cape is now the beacon of hope for South Africa.

The 2016 Adjustment Estimates inform the 2017 Medium Term Expenditure Framework and the austerity measures implemented by Provincial Treasury during 2016 provides the opportunity for departments to seek creative ways

for funding of programmes in an efficient manner.

All 14 votes have been affected with the biggest impact on public transport, health and education. Provincial Treasury received a small adjustment downward. The four programmes in Provincial Treasury will be affected by the additional appropriation and the Minister have quoted the figures. I am not going to repeat that.

Whilst the major part of the adjustment focuses on sustainable resource management I must point out to the House that good revenue collection practices must be maintained while own revenue needs a stronger focus. To this end the Standing Committee supports the funding for a feasibility study undertaken by the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.

Expenditure trends of the various programmes in Provincial Treasury are on target including financial obligations as per the economic classifications.

The Standing Committee as well as the Budget Committee requested various reports from Treasury. The Committee received the report in September 2016 on South Africa's multi-dimensional poverty index. The report highlights the aspect of poverty in relation to the traditional income of individuals and households.

Of concern, in South Africa and in the Western Cape we are told there are levels of unemployment, levels of poverty which impact on the living

standard of millions of people and the general wellbeing of people in our country in particular food security, and the poverty gap has a direct link to basic services for example access to water, sanitation and electricity and the bigger challenge is the infrastructure development and due to population growth particularly in the metros that brings a challenge to the infrastructure development in providing these basic services.

The other challenge is the rural areas where technical skills are not so easily available. Madam Speaker, in closing I would like to thank the Minister, Minister Meyer, the HOD for their leadership, the senior officials and all staff in the Department including the staff in our Western Cape Provincial Parliament. I need to acknowledge the relationship between the Western Cape Government and the private sector and the public sector and our strong relationship with the non-governmental organisations, who also received funding from the Western Cape Government.

Madam Speaker, I move that the House adopts the Adjustment Budget for Vote 3. I so move. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Joseph. I now see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Before the adoption, you now must listen to the

[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi will you afford your member the opportunity to speak. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just to mention the name.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This morning I find it very strange that buzzwords like Game-Changers and strategic goals are being bandied around here... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just concepts.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...the very thing that I raised during the debate yesterday on hard facts. Instead we were given a long lecture of what we should be doing and how we should be doing and what we should be saying. When in fact the debate today is about what is in this book and I am not going to start brandishing things around but this is the Adjustment Bill in which the adjustments for each department are noted. This book will give you each department and its adjustments within its vote or how it distributed it amongst other votes. That is what we are supposed to be discussing today.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give them the workshop.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yet most of the speakers are all over the place and

nobody is being called to order. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give them the workshop... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please members, allow hon member Ms Beerwinkel to do her presentation. Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Every adjustment in this book, in the bold adjustment is included in this Bill and that is what we should be discussing, not national and the other provinces and what Zuma is doing and what Marius is doing. This is what we are supposed to be discussing today... [Interjections.] ...but what does it have to do? Yesterday we were continuously reminded that this was what... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon member Ms Beerwinkel, can you sit down? Please members on this side of the House, behave yourselves, please, just behave. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Acting Chair. Yesterday we were continuously reminded of how we should have mentioned the page number and what is on the page. I am still trying to find on which page there are other provinces. On which page national is mentioned. My book is worked in. [Interjections.] My book is worked in, Acting Chair.

I would like to know how many of these DA members, when we had these

adjustment debates, opened their mouths in an oversight role to question anything, except where they were Chairpersons. [Interjections.] Except where they were Chairpersons. It is the ANC that puts up these departments and MECs and play the oversight role. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh come on.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Hon member Ms Beverley Schäfer knows I am telling the truth. Show me, they should show... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry hon member Ms Beerwinkel, hon member Ms Wenger, member, please. It is the last time I am going to call you to order. You are behaving like the EFF now, *nè*, please. [Laughter.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is now a nonsense waste of time, you know. You are wasting my time. Acting Chair, I would like to know or the MEC of Finance should ask his members how many of them during this debate of the adjustments took this bill with them to compare what is in this bill and what is in this book because that is what we are supposed to do as oversight members. He knows he is speaking against his better judgment. When he waves his arms across the ANC here and says we know nothing, because we do not construct sentences and spew numbers in the way that he wants us to do it. That is just absolutely disingenuous. [Interjections.]

I am not in the habit of responding to gutter behaviour and showmanship,

Acting Chair, but what happened here yesterday during MEC's response needs to be addressed. So I do not blame the Speaker yesterday for walking out. I am also not going to be silent on the MEC's patronising and insulting attitude towards the ANC proclaiming that we know nothing, because in the same vein I can say that he is also not the know-all of finance, because if it were not for the strong group of officials in Treasury that he inherited he would not be where he is. [Interjection.]

I, Acting Chair, consider myself to be an eternal student. I learn all the time. I certainly do not know everything, but I certainly do not know nothing. I know a lot about a lot. [Interjections.]

Acting Chair, can I please be protected from this MEC who mumbles all the time. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are protected, speaker, hon member Ms Beerwinkel, you are protected.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But let me also add that officials should be free to assist us without fear or question. They are not here to only serve the DA, the interests of the DA. This showmanship and double-standards just are unacceptable. None of us on this side of the House are here for finance lectures because we do not construct things in the way that they want it.

I yesterday made a conscious effort not to spew numbers, because testimony

is in the book. Anybody can open it without showing how the allocations in this Bill and in this book are not addressing the very Game-Changers and the very strategic goals and the very plans that they have. It is not being shifted in a way that addresses those problems.

How do you go off at a tantrum about how we should be discussing the principles of the Western Cape Adjustment Bill and then you spend your whole speech discussing other provinces and National? We know that this MEC has aspirations for National. The debate... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry hon member Ms Beerwinkel, can you sit down please. Yes, Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Over and above the lecture we are getting, there is no relevance to the actual budget. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: There is no substance whatsoever.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip, can you just sit down. Thanks. Go on hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How can the Chief Whip accuse me of not being relevant when I am talking about this blue book and this Bill, which is what

we are talking about? [Interjections.] This is what we are talking about, Acting Chair, not all over the place.

Mr M G E WILEY: Because it is not relevant.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I know what is in this book. Page through it, you will see, I have worked on it and this one, unlike most of your members. [Interjections.] How else do we discuss the shortcomings of the service delivery in this province if we are not aware of how this Bill does not allocate and prove where your priorities and shortcomings are, proving that your allocation does not mean or enhance the implementation of your Game-Changers and your policies?

Who distributes finance to any department without taking into account your Game-Changers and your strategies and your policies? That is what I was discussing because this does not do that. I could stand up here and regurgitate numbers and refer to pages, but what would that change, Acting Chair? This grandstand offered no alternatives as if there was any intention of accepting any alternatives that we would have put yesterday, when would there have been another adjustment budget if we had made any? This is not National. When was this second adjustment going to be? I do my work in oversight in every committee that I work in. I do that. So I will not be, and I will not also be silent about the way that the ANC is rubbished as knowing nothing. All is not good in the DA, Chairperson, but the ANC is also not... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry hon member Ms Beerwinkel, can you sit down. Yes, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Acting Chair, I just want to find out, is it parliamentary for the member to vent and throw tantrums instead of engaging? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry Minister that will be the last time when you raise with a thing that is not a point of order. Please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You see Acting Chair... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That was not a point of order. Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You see, Acting Chair, this is exactly the double standards. Yesterday when the MEC was ranting and raving, nobody stood up. But now that I am defending the ANC now it is a rant and rave. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel can you sit down please. Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Acting Chair, I just wanted on a point of order to say that you responded to the previous point of order, saying it is the last time. The

member is in his right to raise a point of order, if he wants to raise a point of order. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Mr Joseph is okay. Thank you, *nè*, for that correction. Thanks. [Laughter.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Acting Chair, it is common knowledge that it is the ANC members who play the oversight roles in the different committees that we sit in... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh no!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We do not sit quietly and ask nothing. You might remember that in Treasury some of the questions that were asked could not even be answered. How does that happen? Because we read the whole book in fact, because to be able to cross-reference and understand how shifts happen, you have to concentrate on everything here. So next time please do not generalise about the ANC and what we know and what we do not know. Treasury as usual has the task of distributing the DORA allocation to this province, as well as the Reserve Funds of their own revenue at their disposal. I am not going to repeat the numbers. You have heard it already, but what made this year's adjustment all the more difficult was because most of the adjustments had to happen within votes and within programmes.

Now a few votes shifted funds to other votes as well where there was under

budgets for example in Treasury as you heard, we have assisted Vote 14 and Vote 6, Health and Local Government to do what they thought is necessary, however under-funded. And just a correction, I think I heard the MEC say that the allocation to Treasury was decreased by R6.9 million. It is actually R6.1 million. As oversight role it remains our duty to monitor and question the utilisation... [Interjections.] ...the under-budget, the shifting and underspend of allocated main Adjustment Appropriation to votes. Treasury has to date spent an average of 44% of its budget across the different programmes.

Acting Chair, we are often told of how this Government is assisting municipalities with training. In fact this year they have under-budgeted for that line item to the tune of R1.2 million but the hidden fact is that we are not told that most of this work is done by consultants.

Savings were also made on the Municipal Governance Review Outlook, MGRO, and controlled investigations, but a R101 000 is under-budgeted for municipal training and meetings. Further consultancy work that is being planned for the casino and horse racing industry confirms that the MEC wants to use gambling as an alternative form of income. I will be the first to intensely speak about the social ills that come with gambling. . Is my time up Chairperson? Everybody is shouting 'time up' here.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have got 18 minutes, do not worry. You have got 18 minutes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Chairperson, on the question of why R1.5 million is set aside for consultancy work on the casino and horse racing consultancy work, again a lecture was given to us, forgetting that the exclusivity clause started in the time of MEC Winde, long time ago, and we spent many months working on amendments of bills and changing of laws for tax to increase that.

I would for the sake of a working relationship, Acting Chairperson, that this MEC really tries to stop doing the work of their other counterparts and meddling in other provinces, and trust them to do their own work in the other provinces as their oversight work. Why preach to us about other provinces here in the Western Cape when we cannot change any allocations that are made. That is a debate for National with the DORA. We are not the National Assembly.

I want to finally thank, Chairperson, the HOD and the Department and the rest of the Treasury Department for their hard work during the year and the assistance given, also to our clerical staff who help us during the year to get through our work as it is planned on our programme, and the good reports that we normally have in terms of what we discuss during our meetings when we have committee meetings. Thank you. [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor-hoor! Baie mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hear! Hear! Very good!] †Some fresh air there.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you hon member Beerwinkel.

Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, yesterday we heard from the Minister about noisemakers and lawmakers. I think the noise makers have no contribution to this debate, and he referred to me as his friend. Now as a friend and colleague I want to tell him he is growing in his job and he is doing a good job. He is giving good leadership. That is what the Minister is doing.

Hon member Beerwinkel referred to all the negative points. Now the three municipalities that the R6 million is going to, if the ANC votes against that, they are saying R6 million must not go to the three municipalities that need drought relief. [Interjections.] So I have got a suggestion: We take the members to the ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please hon members. Sorry hon member Christians, can you sit down please. Hon members can you behave? Give the hon member a chance to speak, thanks.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So, Chairperson, we support this Bill, and I always say in the Budget Committee, we always say, this is a competent Minister with a competent Department and we applaud them. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you hon Minister. Hon Minister

Meyer, you can have your last words.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chairperson, thank you for this opportunity to respond to the debate on Vote 3 of the Adjustment Budget of the Provincial Treasury. Hon Chairperson, let me just again report back to this House that the Provincial Treasury has attained its third consecutive clean audit. I want to thank my HOD for his dedication and the staff for keeping to our commitment to good financial governance.

I have also tabled a Fiscal Risk Statement during the tabling of our Western Cape Medium-term Budget Policy Statement, and hon Chairperson, the Cabinet has prioritised the ongoing drought, the shortage of water and climate change as real priorities as we move forward. We are now in this Adjustment Budget making available R6 million for water and drought relief for the rural areas, and I would hope and trust and believe that all members of this House will be supportive of this drought relief and my hon colleagues, the Minister of Local Government and the Minister of Environmental Affairs and the Minister of Agriculture will also further speak about this matter during their debate.

I would also like to thank the Standing Committee and the Chairperson, Mr Denis Joseph and members of the Committee for supporting the adjustment of Vote 3. This Adjustment Budget meets the requirements of the benchmark set out by the National Treasury and I therefore also move that the House adopts the Adjustment Budget on Vote 3, the Provincial Treasury.

I would also like to just mention that I have consulted the minutes of the Standing Committee on Finance, chaired by hon member Denis Joseph and I saw in the resolutions of the Committee that all the members made proposals and I want to thank all of them for their support and the proposals that they made during the Committee.

Hon Chairperson, I have also informed the Standing Committee, when I appeared before them, about our future plans with respect to what I call domestic resource mobilisation. I have tabled it last week, you will find it on page 27 of the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement, but I will first have to do some further consultations with the Western Cape Cabinet in the beginning of the new year and then I will table further announcements that were now talked about in my main budget, but as I indicated, only after consultation with the Western Cape Cabinet. Thank you Chairperson.

[Debate concluded.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you hon Minister. We have come to the end of the debate. We are now going to ask the Secretary to read the fourth Order. Thank you.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister, you may speak.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Chairperson, hon Premier, members and colleagues. The role of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is twofold.

One, we safeguard the natural environment of the Western Cape for future generations while two, ensuring sustainable development of the environments in which we live.

Without development there can be no growth and if there is no growth, the triple challenge of poverty, unemployment and inequality will be impossible to overcome. So it is a tricky balancing act we must maintain, often with many conflicting interests and agendas complicating decision making.

The way we handle this is by making informed decisions based on the South African environmental legislation. This year the national budgetary issues have had a tough and negative effect on the Department and CapeNature. In short, the Department's budget bottom-line has decreased from R550 million to R543 million, more or less a decrease of R7 million.

For CapeNature the decrease is particularly concerning. Operational costs keep increasing and yet the budget is shrinking. This may affect the

achievements of targets and the increased roll-out of projects across the province. The impact to the bottom-line is mainly seen in the transfers and subsidies by the Department that decreased by R7 million due to a roll-over of CapeNature's infrastructure allocation. This relates to the delayed implementation of a new development at Kogelberg Nature Reserve. Various other transfers and changes were made too.

†Ek is trots op die werk wat die Departement en CapeNature doen en ek wil weer 'n oomblik neem om die Departement en CapeNature se mense te bedank vir die harde werk en hulle goeie gesindheid. Ek wil die Departementshoof Piet van Zyl en dr Razeena Omar bedank vir hul leierskap.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[I am proud of the work of the Department and CapeNature and I just want to again take a moment to thank the people of the Department and CapeNature for their hard work and their good attitude. I want to thank the Head of Department, Piet van Zyl and Dr Razeena Omar for their leadership.]

†Both of these civil servants won great awards in the past year for their hard work. Mr van Zyl won the top award in the Premier's Provincial Service Excellence Award in the category for Best Public Servant Leader, and Dr Omar was awarded with a Lifetime Achievement Award at the 2016 Annual Awards of the Wildlife and Environment Society of South Africa. So congratulations to the two officials. [Applause.]

It is a pleasure to work with both of you and your dedicated teams. Hon Chairperson, with those few comments I present the Adjustment Budget Estimates for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. Thank you. [Applause]

†Mnr M G E WILEY: Mooi!

[Mr M G E WILEY: Well done!]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you hon Minister. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much. Hon Chairperson, the DA welcomes the R5 million that is appropriated from provincial funding for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning to coordinate the Drought and Water Security Plan. According to the 2017 - 2020 Medium-term Budget Policy Statement, the funds will ensure a coordinated approach as part of a climate change strategy in terms of water for sustainable growth and development.

The Ministry and Department continue to support projects that are aimed at climate change issues. This includes the development of climate change adaptation plans by municipalities to ensure an integrated approach. Hon Chairperson, this coordinated approach is key to achieving water and food security which correlates with the Department's Climate Change Strategic Framework, and its Water Management Plan for sustainable growth and

development in the Western Cape.

In the past few months we have seen our country experience one of the worst droughts that we have ever seen. Many parts of our country have been grappling with Stage 4 water shortages which is a socio-economic drought. This has continued to have a severe impact on the environment and our communities where access to water and food security is concerned.

Drought has a negative impact on food production, food processing, the employment of agri workers, on agri processing and ultimately the social wellbeing of the family unit. During the 1991 and 1992 drought period which was the last time South Africa had experienced a severe drought, a Government White Paper on disaster management at the time indicated that 49 000 agri jobs and 20 000 non-agri jobs had been lost. Thus the impact of drought is not just limited from seed to crop by commercial farmers, emerging farmers and small scale farmers, and from picking and packing by agri workers, but also impacts on the dependants of the agri processing sector to transform products that originate from agriculture to produce consumable staples.

One can only imagine how the drought has affected families already living in poverty. On the West Coast and the Karoo we now see extreme drought affecting almost 400 settlements. In total almost 1 600 settlements in the Western Cape are affected by the drought. The drought has cost the fruit producing sector in the Western Cape R722 million in the last quarter of

2015/2016 financial year.

As of May this year the Western Cape Government has made R23 million available in aid of drought stricken farmers and a further R11 million was allocated to 8 emerging grain farmers. There is a need to find innovative ways to save as much water as we can and to manage our water resources wisely in order to retain and sustain the little that we have.

The Drought and Water Security Plan of the Department is an enabler for high economic growth which contributes to the GDP of the Western Cape and South Africa, but most of all it is a plan and framework to secure our water and food security commitments. Hon Chairperson, this appropriation is welcomed as it complements the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning's capacity as the lead department for Strategic Goal 4.

The Department is bound, through its Climate Change Response Framework and its Spatial Development Framework, to develop our urban rural areas in order to improve the living conditions of our poor people. In essence, the Western Cape Government has identified and revisited policies that are hampering water security. This is evident in the R25 million Adjustment Appropriation for drought relief, which is a priority.

The Departments of Environmental Affairs, Agriculture and Local Government are the key role players to coordinate the Water and Food Security Programme which is led by Minister Bredell and his Department.

This serves as another example on how the Provincial Government is working together with all stakeholders to identify issues that relate to better water retention, responsible water usage and ultimately finding sustainable solutions to our water issues. Because we understand that water is an essential resource that needs to be managed properly, it became imperative that a water management plan for the Western Cape was developed by the Western Cape Government.

Hon Chairperson, in the main allocation Provincial Treasury allocated to the Department a total of R550.9 million that has now been adjusted to R543.7 million. Programme 5, which is Bio-diversity Management and CapeNature will benefit from this reallocation from the 2016/2017 to the 2017/2018 financial year. The funds will go to CapeNature capital expenditure for the Kogelberg Nature Reserve.

Hon Chairperson, this is how the DA is part of the solution to encourage and educate all stakeholders on the importance and consequences of preserving such a valuable resource which is water. In conclusion, as somebody once said:

“The environment is in us not outside of us. The trees are our lungs, the rivers are our bloodstream, we are all inter-connected and what we do to the environment ultimately we do to ourselves.”

Hon Chairperson, water is a human rights issue. Thank you to the DA

Government for their value-based leadership. It is visionary leadership like this that can only benefit the next generation and the generations to come. The DA supports the Adjustment Appropriation for Vote 9. I thank you. [Applause.]

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Well done!]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. The next member, hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, hon Chairperson. One thing that is again pointed out sharply by this Adjustment Budget is that this DA-run Western Cape Government's CapeNature agency remains a major fiscal dumping site.

In the past and again in this vote today we see massive monetary amounts shifted towards this entity. What boggles the mind is the fact that the Nature Conservation and Enforcement Agency, as the operating agent of this Government, is the custodian of more than 30 nature conservation areas covering about 835 000 hectare of state land in prime nature scenic regions with unequalled beauty and vast facilities.

Yet, it is in no position to produce any significant own revenue either at the gate or otherwise to sustain its massive expenditure budget. In the past financial year, the Annual Report revealed that CapeNature in total brought

in R40.5 million, while it remains dependent on almost R300 million of state funding.

What boggles the mind even more is that CapeNature spent more than R27 million on marketing and communication.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

Ms T M DIJANA: Almost as much as what it raises with very little to show for all that expenditure. On the other hand huge amounts are spent ...
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lentit, you had your chance, please. You can proceed.

Ms T M DIJANA: On the other hand huge amounts are spent to improve and expand infrastructure under CapeNature. Perhaps that over-bloated Department of the Premier with its centralising tendencies needs to take CapeNature under the wing and help it get some direction?

But CapeNature keeps on sucking up funding from the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. Cape Nature is one of a number of sycophantic entities that feed heavily on this Government – like Cassidra, Wesgro and even Agri Mega that collect a lot every year for all sorts of reasons.

Of the R12.2 million taken away from Biodiversity Management by this Department in this Adjustment Budget, R12 million will find its way to CapeNature. This time it is meant for the Kogelberg Reserve on the urban edge of Cape Town. One will have to keep a close eye on that project to make sure the money is spent for what it is intended and not moved away again into some other money burning programme.

Overall this Department's budget is decreased by R7.3 million as a result of all kinds of savings amongst others on air quality management – a priority project of all things. What is not explained is those so-called surpluses that are achieved, while the financial indicators are that the Department paced its spend rather well.

Almost three quarters of a million Rand is given to the Premier's Youth Intern Programme. Why must a line department now in this Adjustment Budget fund this programme? Was it not properly budgeted and resourced? Then we see a few vague references to more EPWP jobs and staff compensation that need better unpacking.

R5 million is given for water programmes from the provincial revenue slush fund. A further half a million Rand is transferred from the Department of Economic Development and Tourism. If this sounds confusing, an outsider will then understand why the DA is perceived to play musical chairs with the Adjustment Budget.

Then there are the two sponsors of a quarter of a million Rand each for the DA's favourite Mossel Bay and Theewaterskloof to support their municipal spatial development framework.

A further indictment is the fact that there is an over expenditure to be made up from this Adjustment Budget, and it was to pay an events promotor to stage the Department's Greenest Municipality Competition. One can only begin to guess who this consultant is and why a big department like this, together with its controlling team in the Premier's Department, could not rise to the occasion to present this event on their own, instead of outsourcing it at greater expense.

In our budget and oversight processes we need to follow the money more, and in the case of CapeNature, it needs to be interrogated more vigorously as even its Annual Report was too vague and not giving us enough information. CapeNature needs to be put in ICU and as public representatives we must take out the magnifying glasses to inspect and check this agency out. It needs spotlights into all dark corners without exception. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you hon member. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson. The aim of this Department is to promote a resilient, sustainable, quality and inclusive living environment to support human wellbeing. So, Chairperson, I believe the

adjustment is directed to assist that.

I do not understand that members do not understand that this is the place where we adjust budgets to spend the money on the people of the Western Cape. That is why you have adjustments. You say I have not spent money on employees, I want to redirect the funds and that is why we are here.

So, Chairperson, my biggest problem is that people do not know that this Parliament can make these appropriation adjustments and that is the purpose of this meeting. The important thing that I just need to say is, of course, I believe the Department welcomes the R5 million for sustainable growth and development. It is important. We are in a crisis, we have drought problems and we know CapeNature and we know the Department, their primary job ...
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member, your time is expired. Can you sit down? Thank you. Yes? Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Chairperson. To the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, thank you very much. Thank you Rodney for your hard work, your commitment and I know you have already pointed it out to the Department and myself that your focus next year will be water and we will work very closely because we do realise that water is so important for us to build our economy and to give people a dignified life, and

I think your focus is spot-on.

To the ANC, sorry that when you must criticise that you tackle the wrong entity. Since 2009 I can tell the shift that we have managed to make in CapeNature is just unbelievable. The Board is a professional Board, it is a Board working towards a better environment for our children and their future, and we have managed last year and I am going to quote a percentage. I do not have the figures 100%, but I think we managed to increase our tourism with 38% in CapeNature and that is what we are trying to do, get people in the Parks because we said that the Parks cannot be there only for the rich, the Parks must be there for the people within this province.

We need to get our schools in the Parks, we need to get our poor communities in the Parks and it is all part of the education programme and CapeNature is doing sterling work on that. Kogelberg is so popular and that is why we are going to expand on Kogelberg, because it is so popular. It is nearly 100% full. You want the Youth Programmes on the one hand, and on the other hand if you put money to youth programmes there is a problem. I do not understand that. We need to get our youth in our Parks ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We need to train them, there are a lot of job opportunities within our Parks and we need to push that. The Greenest

Town Competition is one of the fundamental and good competitions within this province. Hon Chairperson, I am at a stage where I want to force the municipalities to participate in that competition. We have also looked at the competition and I am busy with the team that we are also going to flag the worst municipalities. We cannot sit in a DA-run province where children live from a dumping site, we will not allow that, we are going to close them down. So we will not allow that, so we are not going to let municipalities off the hook by not participating. So I have warned the Mayors already and they will be part of that.

To the ACDP, thank you very much for your contribution. With those few words, hon Chairperson, I will present you the Adjustment Estimate Budget for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†Mnr M G E WILEY: Mooi!

[Mr M G E WILEY: Well done!]

[Debate concluded.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote and the debates for now. We will suspend and resume at 13:30, but lunch will only be ready at 12:30. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 11:49 and resumed at 13:30.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good afternoon members, welcome back. So we will now continue with the business of the day and I will ask the secretary to read the 5th Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, Deputy Speaker; Cabinet colleagues; honourable Leader of the Official Opposition *in absentia*; honourable members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament; officials of the Western Cape Government; ladies and gentlemen:

It is my privilege to present the adjusted estimates for the Department of Transport and Public Works for 2016/17. The Adjustments Budget process is, as honourable members of this House will know, an important tool in the management of a range of circumstances as stipulated in the PFMA – circumstances which have arisen since the tabling and acceptance of the main budget. Given the wide-ranging nature and scope of the services provided by my Department, including broad support for a number of the seven Game-Changers to which the Western Cape is committed, it is inevitable that a number of adjustments will occur and will have to be accommodated and

accounted for.

The budget of my Department of R6.788 billion increases by R304 million to R7 092 664.000. The amount is made up from roll-overs from the previous financial year, a relatively small amount of R25.1 million, revenue retention from previous financial years, mainly related to increased own revenue from over-collected motor vehicle licence fees of R243.177 million and shifts between programmes of R35.857 million.

If I start with the roll-overs from the previous financial year; of the R25.102 million:

- R2 million rolled over from the previous year to support the enhancement of the Microsoft Enterprise Project Management System to respond to departmental specific needs.
- Then R1.622 million from the previous financial year to provide for the development of a Better Living Model as a key Game-Changer intervention of the Western Cape Government.
- Thirdly R1.263 million rolled over from previous year to subsidise the Drakenstein Municipality for the upgrade of municipal proclaimed road MR208.
- Then, Chairperson, R717 000 rolled over to provide for the reseal of Eendekuil-Het-Kruis Keerom Road.
- Then R17 million rolled over from the previous year for road safety marketing projects inclusive of monthly radio campaign, high quality

television commercials, community based and social media initiatives and research.

- And then under this category R2.5 million rolled over from the previous year to support the Minibus Taxi, Metered Taxi and Small Bus Operators.

Then from increased own revenue, R15.746 million:

- R7.746 million reallocation of an unspent transfer amount received from the City of Cape Town to provide for additional routine road maintenance projects on the provincial proclaimed road network.
- And then R8 million from increased motor vehicle licence fees collections to provide for agency fees payable to municipalities.

Chairperson, then the shifting of funds between votes, R35.857 million:

- R1.016 million shifted from Vote 1: Department of the Premier for the installation of a perimeter fence and electric gate at the Provincial Training Institute.
- And then a debit balance R5.651 million shifted to Vote 1: Department of the Premier as a contribution towards the procurement of ICT infrastructure to finalise projects on the Modernisation Programme.
- Then, R30 million shifted from Vote 5: Education for the continued provision of co-funding for the implementation unit capacity to deliver education infrastructure relating to new schools and maintenance.

- R9.7 million shifted from Vote 5: Education for the acquisition of land for educational purposes.
- And R792 000 from Vote 5 for additional accommodation for education.

The next category then the Asset Financing Reserve financing of R75 million:

- R70 million of that, from 2014/15 over-collected motor vehicle licence fees retained in the Asset Finance Reserve to be transferred to the Municipality of George for additional operational and infrastructure support for the George Integrated Public Transport Network, one of our flagship projects.
- Then R4 million, with the transfer to the Municipality of Stellenbosch for the development of Non-Motorised Transport infrastructure as part of the Provincial Sustainable Transport Programme.
- Then R740 000 revenue retention from 2014/15 from motor vehicle licence fees retained in the AFR to be utilised for the roll out of District Safety Plans in order to develop a safe road based transport system across the Western Cape.
- And then under this section, finally, R260 000 revenue retention from over-collected motor vehicle licence fees retained in the Asset Financing Reserve to be utilised for the acquisition of evidentiary breath alcohol testing machines.

Chairperson, if I move on to revenue retention, by far the biggest amount,

R152.431 million:

- R2.548 million of arrear rental fees utilised for payment of arrear rental fees for Riverlands Primary School in Malmesbury as per court order.
- R39.951 million from over-collected motor vehicle licence fees to be utilised for project C1040, the resealing of Eendekuil-Het-Kruis Keerom Road.
- Then R30 million also from motor vehicle licence fees, basically to be utilised for project C982, Reseal of Holgaten-Uniondale Road.
- Then R16.954 million revenue retention from over-collected motor vehicle licence fees for project C821, Rehabilitation Porterville-Piketberg Road.
- Chairperson, then R10 million revenue retention once again from the same source, motor vehicle licence fees utilised for the maintenance of the Average Speed Over Distance system.
- And R2.349 million revenue retention for the acquisition of kiosks for the distribution network required by the George Integrated Public Transport Network.
- Next item is R26.934 million revenue retention again from motor vehicle licence fees utilised for the acquisition of an Integrated Fare Management Service required for the George Integrated Public Transport Network.
- Two further amounts R695 000 for the installation of video conferencing facilities at Gene Louw Traffic College and traffic centres to reduce costs in the future and time travelling for meetings.

- And finally R23 million revenue retention from over-collected motor vehicle licence fees to be utilised for increased agency fees payable to municipalities in respect of the collection of motor vehicle licence fees.

Hon Chairperson, a brief glance through the list of adjustments will identify a number aimed at improving the road network and enhancing safety measures on that network. I would like to take this opportunity of confirming that our intensive holiday season road safety plan is already in operation and will be officially launched on the 13th of December. Thank you.

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon Max.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole Max, gooi kole. Gooi hulle.

[Mr Q R DYANTI: Throw coals, Max, throw coals. Throw it.]

Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, in terms of Section 107 of the Constitution of South Africa, we as public representatives have to swear faithfulness to the Republic and obedience to the Constitution, and in terms of Section 114 of the Constitution, it is this Parliament's role to execute oversight over the Executive, and they call it accountability.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And he does it [Inaudible.]

Mr L H MAX: Now this Department received R304.136 million additional to its existing budget and as indicated yesterday, this Department is responsible for all departments' infrastructure, and as a result it causes challenges, and let me deal with those challenges.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Go for them.

Mr L H MAX: First of all the Minister mentioned about George Integrated Public Transport [interjection] which was aimed to be reliable, affordable, safe, convenient and we really support that as a Committee. We cannot go against anything which is there to better the lives of our people, but what is unacceptable is the fact that hooligans try to destroy that infrastructure, which cost millions of Rand to the taxpayers.

The other thing which we as a Committee are not satisfied with is that the very institution, that organisation who manages that, failed to submit financial reports, and the Department already extended the due date to obtain those financial reports, and we trust that if they fail again, that the Department will take action. Then we have had the Sea Point Main Road Tafelberg property ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have a weak MEC, there is no action there.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr L H MAX: So I just want to say ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Max, can you kindly take your seat please. Hon member Dyantyi, I need to address you. Interjections are allowed but please try not to be disruptive. I know you have lots of good words and words of appreciation, but if you could contain it until after the sitting, I am sure it would benefit us all. You may proceed hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Now the Tafelberg issue is a very complicated and a very sensitive issue and a very important issue for different reasons, and the Premier is busy with that particular issue in conjunction with the Department and the Minister responsible, and regardless of negative publications in the newspapers I believe that the Government will make the right decision in the best interests of service delivery and the people of the Western Cape.

Then we have schools. We had a situation where at Park View, Wesfleur and Williams Valley Primary Schools, Filcon failed to perform accordingly. A R106.4 million was the contract and the replacement value was R116.6 million, and on top of that, if Filcon was not good enough we face another problem where Scottsdene High, Hawson Primary, Delft Primary and Masakhane Primary in Gansbaai are structurally not safe.

Now this causes a problem for the Education Department because the Education Department must ensure that our people are educated and if there are structural problems and our children are being deprived or placed at risk,

that is serious. However, the Department explained to us they followed due process and they did their checks and balances. However, processes are not always 100%, and as a result of things which were beyond their ability, these problems occurred.

However, I call on the Minister and the Department to review those processes, to ensure that we are not finding ourselves in the same position.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are supported there, you are supported.

Mr L H MAX: Rail transport. If you read today's newspapers you will have seen how people complained about the congestion on our roads. Public transport is the solution to that problem, and rail transport is one of the biggest transportation means of people in the Western Cape. However, the Department does not have executive powers over that - it is a national entity - only consultative. I must say I am very happy with the presentations by the entity as well as the Department's contribution to facilitate processes, but once again hooligans and criminals are destroying our economy by vandalising the rail infrastructure. I call on the South African Police Services and my colleague here, hon member Wenger, to also put pressure on the police to put systems in place, the intelligence, so that we can deal with this accordingly.

Then we sit with public transport, taxi violence. Now the Vrygrond issue is an age old issue and Uber is a new player in the game, a new kid on the

block. Now Uber also experienced problems and although the Department is saying that they do not have any legal right to intervene because they do not issue licenses to Uber, I appreciate the fact that they say that they do try everything possible to address the particular issue.

Now the fear and the concern is that the conflict in Uber can ignite the existing conflict which is already in the taxi fraternity and that will pose a very serious threat to the safety of our people in the Western Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The MEC does not understand.

Mr L H MAX: I hope and I trust that the Minister will do everything possible in his power to address that particular issue.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oor my dooie liggaam.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Over my dead body.]

Mr L H MAX: Now a very sensitive and a very important issue is road safety, the policing thereof. It was in the papers about how many traffic officers there are and according to the figures I have got it is only 502 operational officers, but we welcome 30 new recruitment appointments as we said last week on Wednesday. However, it is not enough.

But we are also very mindful of the financial constraints which our country faces, that we cannot employ 200-300 people at a time because you have to

provide them with the necessary equipment and therefore we welcome this.

The other point - the increase in drivers' licences. For the 2014/2015 financial year, 294 427 new licensed drivers of vehicles were added to the roads, and in 2015/2016 another 280 271 were added to the roads. It gives you in these two years, financial years, 574 698 new drivers on the road. That is now with the exclusion of those unlawful drivers, and therefore it is important that there is a proportional link between law enforcement initiatives as well as the increase of drivers on our roads.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die LUR praat nou.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The MEC is speaking now.]

Mr L H MAX: But the problem is those traffic officers, whether they are 5 or whether they are 200, need to be managed properly and therefore we have got 13 – if I am correct – traffic centres where the managers are responsible to oversee discipline, the operational and so forth, but we have struggled with the Department since 2014 to fill those positions, and I cannot be apologetic about that. As a police officer of 27 years, as a General ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

Mr L H MAX: ... I understand the importance of command and control, and in the absence of proper supervision you cannot expect a desired outcome.

So I appeal that the Minister looks into this, puts his finger there and monitors the process. We have been informed that last year the posts were advertised and it was closed on the 27th of September, but there were no appointments and it is again advertised. So we hope this time around that that will be, because funds were made available. It is not extra money which they are getting.

But the biggest challenge for the Department is whether they have got 6, 7, 800, is to retain them, and the problem is that salaries are the main cause why this Department is losing that resource, and salaries are not confined to the Minister because it is a provincial entity, provincial function and a national function. It is determined on a national basis. So, the Minister cannot put something there to make it more attractive to those officials, and therefore they become a feeding source for the City.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Brand hom, brand hom!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Burn him, burn him!]

Mr L H MAX: For the City. So these 30 people which we gained now, the recruitment and training, there is no guarantee that next year we will still have the same number because if there is a vacancy in the City or other municipalities who offer a better salary, they are gone. So that is a huge challenge.

I just want to say that as long as the people of the Western Cape have an

insatiable appetite for security, I have an insatiable appetite for the staff to underwrite that security.

So there is one thing which I am not happy about with the Department, and that is De Novo. De Novo is a community, a farm community just adjacent to Kraaifontein. One evening when I was returning from my constituency in Delft, at about nine o'clock, a councillor called me and said can you help us, we are sitting with a problem in De Novo where the Department of Public Works do not want to listen and assist us.

So the next morning I was there. What I found there was this adjacent goat and pig pen which poses a serious health risk to the children at school there. The flies were sitting on the children's bread. There are old buildings which are declared as heritage buildings and this one wall at the school is about to fall on these children and they indicated a lot of other things.

I then reported to the Minister and I called them. I called them to explain what is going on, because we are public representatives. You get the word? Public protector means the protector of the public. I am a public representative where I represent those people of De Novo.

So, in this presentation, which is of much concern to us, the Heritage Council of the Western Cape indicated that on the 18th of September 2013, they requested a letter in terms of Section 34 from the Department and then that work could be done. As at the 20th of September 2016, 3 years later ...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is still the same.

Mr L H MAX: ... the Department still has not issued one letter.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Mr L H MAX: ... and it deprives those people of services they are entitled to. Now I cannot tolerate such behaviour, I cannot. I am a person who will commend good service, but I cannot accept that a government or officials fail for 3 years to issue a letter which will benefit a community, and I hope that the Minister will really investigate that.

Our roads, really, and that is where I commend this Department, are some of the best in this country ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In spite of the MEC.

Mr L H MAX: ... and let me tell you – no, I am not saying the MEC is wrong. There are a lot of other factors.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is what I am saying to you.

Mr L H MAX: This Committee is pleased. Wherever we go we see

development, we see new roads and that is a force, it is a motivation for the people of the Western Cape that they have got the right government in place. I do not want the De Novo issues to come up, because when I go to the people outside and I talk about this Western Cape Government, I want to tell them this is the Government for you.

The Government Garage, I must say that Mr Koegelenberg is a man so near to my heart. He is a real manager – you know, nowadays we are very *†ras mal* [race mad.] He is a white man, but let me tell you: management, leadership, proper financial management and everything runs well. That Government Garage is in good hands. But I am very concerned about the fact that Treasury last week indicated that DTPW achieved the lowest percentage of targets of all the departments of 41%. We did not as a Committee receive that report as yet, so I cannot say what went wrong. Maybe the Minister – I do not know whether he received it as yet - but they actually produced it to us.

I would like to say that this Committee and as the Chairperson, I support this adjustment and the additional money of R304 million and I trust that this Department will utilise it to address those challenges which I indicated here. I would like to say, Madam Speaker, a big thank you to my fellow, I almost said comrades [Interjections.] colleagues in this Committee and also the hon member Dugmore on the other side. You know people ask why Churchill was successful in the World War?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Educate them, educate them.

Mr L H MAX: He was successful because he listened to his enemies and he believed them.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wow.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr L H MAX: Now, hon member Dugmore is not my enemy, but once he criticises I listen and I believe him, and I work on those things which he mentions.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek is so baie bly.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am so very happy.]

Mr L H MAX: I want to say thank you to Ms Shireen Niekerk for her promptness, professional and effective conduct. She is really an asset - as my colleague, hon member Lentit mentioned yesterday - to your staff complement. It is my last speech in this Department [Interjections.] and I would like to say to the Minister of Sport and Culture, she is not present here now, that I am looking forward to working with that Department. However, it must be very clear to people that I work with facts, not personalities [Interjection.] and if facts are not right I scrutinise and interrogate it, and I cross-examine. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Max.

The SPEAKER: Can we get some order please. I see the hon member Dugmore. Hon member Dyantyi, allow your colleague to speak please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, I think we will definitely go back to Hansard one day and read the speech that has just been delivered by hon member Max again, because I think when the story is actually told about how our democracy, nationally and in this province, is maturing and the issue of oversight is discussed and researched, I think that what we have here and I think that is why in some ways it is actually a tragedy, that it appears that the Executive-minded leadership of the DA has decided to remove someone who I think without a shadow of a doubt, could be described as someone who has lived the issue of oversight.

That does not mean that that hon member has given any favours to any other political parties, but he in fact I believe has showed that it is possible to be on the one hand loyal to your party, but also be uncompromising in terms of your role in oversight.

We are beginning to see 20 years after democracy and you look at the different legislatures, you even look at the National Assembly. I think there is an emergence of an encouraging tendency that oversight is in certain areas becoming more robust and I think provided the oversight does not take on factional terms, that you might be chairing a committee and be taking on a particular Minister because he or she is not in your faction, that the oversight, the development of our democracy also needs an emergent, strong

culture of oversight, irrespective of who is involved, and I want to pay tribute to hon member Max and the way that he has led this Committee.

I think it has been an example and I think it actually leads to more effective oversight and it made sure that that Department is much more prepared when they come to those meetings, because they know they are not going to get special protection just because there is someone from the same party as their MEC in the Chair.

So I think whatever has led to this decision, the internal factional workings - we all know that hon member Max, according to the media, teamed up with Theuns Botha, lost out to hon Madikizela and Bredell and others - it would seem a pity that because he is now exercising oversight, that because of DA internal factional politics, they have decided to remove him. But what I know is that even though one might argue from the media - and I am getting back to this adjustment now because we are dealing with the Department that in fact is the worst of all the Departments in regard to the second quarter preliminary performance of not meeting its targets.

So obviously you need to have oversight, but I have full confidence that when MEC Max moves to Culture and Sport, whether that particular MEC was seen historically or otherwise as part of his grouping or not, I know that he will apply the same oversight there. I think it is a lesson to all of us and we respect the role that you played, and we hope that others, nationally and in other provinces, follow that example, from the ANC as well and that is

what I am saying. [Applause.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But we are dealing with a Department who in terms of this Adjustment Appropriation I can only describe as a missed opportunity. As hon member Max has said, this Committee, ANC and DA members alike, have been raising since 2014 a very particular issue and that is the underfunding of provincial traffic officers and their management. This has been a cross-party issue that we have raised and here we have an adjustment with R304 million additional funds coming into this vote.

One would at least have expected that the 132 vacancies that still remain in this Department for traffic officers, besides the 30 that have recently been appointed, that this would have been an ideal opportunity to fill them. I am not sure if all of the members are aware that in fact there has been a 57% increase in road fatalities. If you compare November 2015, where there were a 107 deaths, when you compare the same month in 2014, there were 68 deaths. That is a 57% increase and for December 2015, when there were 131 deaths on our roads, there was a 32% increase in road fatalities when compared to December 2014.

Now, when you go further into those statistics and you ask who is actually dying on our roads? 80% of those dying on our roads in the Overberg District from 2005 to 2016 are so-called Coloured and African people, and my question is to the DA, MEC and to the Premier and all of those deciding on budget priorities, if 80% of those being killed on our roads in the

Overberg were white South Africans, would we have the same level of lethargy in terms of filling these particular vacancies? [Interjections.] And those are real issues that we need to focus on.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, if you could take your seat please. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, you already ruled this morning that these racial allusions that are made are unacceptable. Now that is another classic example to say that we take decisions and we govern on the base of race which is simply and factually incorrect.

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is not a point of order at all.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, if it is on the same matter?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, it is on the same matter.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can we get some order please. There is a member on the floor.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is the same matter because members, if they want to have point of views they must not use them as if it is a point of order. It is his views ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Are you rising on which rule?

Mr S G TYATYAM: I am calling him on a point of order, because he is wrong in what he is doing. He cannot dictate in this House. Hon members in this House have a right to raise whatever they think is important to them. So he cannot be told how to say things because of him.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, thank you. I have listened to both points of view and – order please members. Whilst we have freedom of speech in the House, I do not think it is appropriate for racial slurs to be bandied and thrown about, and I discussed and I talked about it earlier on in the day. If I could interpret what was said, if white people were to die would they get more budget as compared to Black and Coloured, and that is the statement that the member made, and it has a connotation to it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No ways.

The SPEAKER: It certainly has - hon member Magaxa, I am busy speaking, and I am talking to how I interpreted that statement. So whether it is a point of order or a fact or an opinion, we would need to deliberate on it. I am going to take guidance from the Table and tomorrow when we get back I will provide guidance to the House on the statement that was made, but again we must try and resist from talking about black, white and Indian. We are South African. [Interjections.]

No, because I would like to believe we – hon member Tyatyam, we are here to build a nation – should do it by recognising ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is your opinion.

The SPEAKER:...everyone as South Africans firstly.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is a DA opinion.

The SPEAKER: You might want to call it an opinion, but I am not going to allow racist comments and slurs to be made in this House. So I will ask the hon member Dugmore to proceed and I will take guidance, and I will revert to the House and I have spoken on it, so there is no more discussion. We will allow the hon member Dugmore to proceed. [Interjection.]

I have made a ruling hon Magaxa, I will come back to the House tomorrow. Can we please allow the hon member Dugmore to proceed, thank you. You may proceed hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I just want to draw your attention as well as everyone in this House that documentation provided to our Committee about the statistics of road fatalities specifically indicates that 80% of the people who died on our roads were classified as African and Coloured. The question that I am raising which I think is legitimate, is that when we look at our Constitution and we look at issues of redress, we are

obliged to particularly have redress measures in regard to people who historically are disadvantaged, which clearly would be those who have been classified African and Coloured. I am saying in the context of road safety and the issues that have been raised about not only the 132 vacancies, but also the managers of these officers, that that should be a priority, because we can spend, as this Adjustment Budget shows, R70 million on media campaigns, we can have all the technology, but the reason why this road safety plan is not going to work effectively is that it does not have the human resources to back it up.

Now when we get into the issues, I would agree with the hon member Max that the manager of GG, Mr Koegelenberg, is one of our best managers. He has managed so well that in excess of R1.6 billion in reserves have been built up over the last couple of years, and R750 million of those reserves have been transferred to the Provincial Revenue Fund. Funds like that being invested with a fairly standard asset manager should at least deliver a 10% return, which is R75 million in a year. Let us assume that.

I want to tell this House that the cost of equipping and training 132 traffic officers, which is a once-off cost, would be R38 million. The cost of then paying those traffic officers for a year would in fact be R37 million. I am arguing if this Province and this Department was serious about issues of road safety, you would not only have a technologically and a media driven campaign, you would also employ the officers to actually perform that.

So the reality is that we have an adjustment here of R304 million and a simple R38 million to equip those officers and then to put them on the payroll over the medium term would have been able to be found in the Provincial Asset Reserve.

The fact that they have not been found is a clear indication of this Department not focusing on a pathology which by and large affects historically disadvantaged communities if you look at it. It affects everyone, but in terms of the balance, the weight of those fatalities falls on historically disadvantaged communities, and that is what the DA leadership is not seeing.

So when one of their members stands up and raises issues which in fact is to their credit, because they are raising issues of safety which affects our communities, then they are regarded as a trouble-maker, and I think that is a slippery slope once you begin to undermine the issue of oversight, when these facts are actually pointed out.

I would also like to draw one's attention to a very difficult issue. Out of Asset Financing Reserves, R75 million has been made available. R70 million of that is going to the George Municipality which is then going to be transferred to the George Link. It has been 2 years and on this we are all united in the Committee, that the George Link has failed to provide annual financial statements to the Department. The Department has promised us that today is the deadline, the 30th of November, and I think it is important that when MEC Grant responds, he needs to tell this House whether those annual

financial statements have actually been produced, because today was the deadline actually given to us by the Department.

If those annual financial statements have not been provided, surely this House should express itself and make the argument that that money that is going to be voted for, if the majority is going to vote for this adjustment later on today, that those funds, the R70 million, should not be transferred to the George Municipality. How can you continue for 2 years to allocate funds which end up at George Link, which has failed to provide annual financial statements, and we want to say that we are in favour of good government.

Now when you raise those issues, are you a troublemaker or are you actually contributing to oversight? The MEC for Finance, I hope he also responds to this issue. I have raised the issue with you, MEC, in the initial discussions, that George Link has not accounted for 2 years, yet we continue to allocate funds, in this adjustment as well, which must go to the George Municipality.

How can we continue to do that when the accountability has not actually been exercised, and then at the same time want to punish someone who chairs a committee, who raises these issues together with the ANC. These are issues that affect all of us, not a political party, and I think as our democracy matures we need to see more and more of this kind of oversight from the ANC as well as the DA in the National Assembly and in local and provincial legislatures, because that can only strengthen the quality of our democracy if people without fear or favour raise the issues which affect our people. Thank

you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, thank you. I cannot comment on a lot, but I want to comment on the financials of the George Link. You know, I am SCOPA Chair. We called them in for the financials and what the members of SCOPA heard is that the funding has got nothing to do with the financial statements. They do the work and you pay. The financial statements are a separate issue, and that is how the ANC comes and misrepresents the facts. The hon member is misrepresenting the facts. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So what I am saying is, as SCOPA we ask them and the Minister will explain what the problem is there, but the important thing was that the financials have got nothing to do with the funding. They do the work and they produce the evidence and they get paid. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The financials are something to do with us, and the members of SCOPA know that, but hon member Dugmore comes with facts that are skewed, facts that are not real. So I do not know what they are doing, but the important thing is that we as the ACDP supports the Vote.

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, please hon members. Hon members, can we not cast aspersions, can we please maintain order. In the absence of the EFF – hon member Olivier, can we maybe proceed? Thank you. I have now taken my instruction from the hon member Olivier. I may proceed. I see the hon Minister. Minister Grant.

Order, please hon member Dyantyi. Sorry, Minister before you proceed, hon member Christians and the ladies, if we could afford the Minister an opportunity to speak. Thank you. You may proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, firstly I would like to thank the members who have taken time and trouble to participate in the adjustments debate. They have made my job actually quite easy, Madam Speaker, because I am only going to respond to the matters which are related to the Adjustment Budget.

Firstly to the hon member Max, I will deal with the issues around funding of traffic posts for both you and the hon member Dugmore at the end. I want to address you on the issues about De Novo and the wall. I do remember quite clearly answering questions in Parliament about this quite comprehensively and I fail to see that this matter, apart from the delayed letter, has anything to do with the Adjustments Budget, but I will certainly look into it to see if that was the case. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: As far as the funding from the Government Garage is concerned, that really is a one-off, it is not recurring income coming in to my Department, and therefore the funding of traffic posts is an ongoing expense.

I also want to say that the issue raised by the hon member Dugmore about the amount of money transferred to George Municipality for GIPTN, of that R70 million, R40 million is for infrastructure, it is to support the project and that money does not go to George Link. As far as I can remember the 30th of November ends at midnight tonight, so therefore I do not know yet whether they have provided my Department with the financial statements, but in the event that they have not provided the financial statements to us ...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I will not do that. I will operate in terms of the contract which is between George Municipality and George Link, because they are the operators on the ground.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Right, then I want to also say categorically to this House, that if there is one thing that both myself and my Department are very sensitive about it is the question of the deaths on our roads. Those come on my phone in the middle of the night, I see them day in and day out, so if the members of this House think that myself and my Department are not sensitive to this matter, we most certainly are, and we will continue to do what we can. Because road safety in our opinion is not just a matter of more traffic officers, and many of the items in today's budget highlight the important additional steps that we are taking towards a holistic solution to our traffic problems.

The members of the Standing Committee must surely remember their recent visit to Caledon, where they were taken through the District Safety Plan, and they must also remember certainly another presentation given to the Standing Committee as to the strategy going forward and how we intend to deal holistically with the shocking carnage on our roads. Madam Speaker, then let me also say that I really ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, I am just collecting to see what is worth responding to actually.

The SPEAKER: Minister Grant, please address the Chair in your response, thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I want to finally say to the Provincial Parliament, that I have taken notes of all their criticisms and comments, and that I will address it with my Department in due course, and I would like to thank hon member Max in particular for his advice, and management of the Standing Committee and wish him well in his new endeavours.

Madam Speaker, I propose this budget for consideration, the Adjustment Budget of the House, thank you. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debate. The Secretary will read the 6th Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the Minister. Hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Gooi water en kole!

[Mr R B LENTIT: Throw water and coals!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Madam Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity. We are tabling this Adjustment Budget during an exciting time for the Western Cape's agriculture sector.

Two and a half years ago when I got Agriculture added to my other portfolio of Economic Development and Tourism, bringing the whole of the economy together in the region, it was just post the mining indaba that took place in this region where the world came together to talk about mining, but they came to Cape Town to talk about mining, and I thought why do we not all bring African agriculture to talk about agriculture in Africa, why don't we do exactly the same thing? Why don't we have an Agri indaba, an African Agri Investment Indaba. Let us talk about policy, let us talk about the ecosystem, let us talk about trade within Africa, let us talk about food security 50 years and beyond.

I am really, really pleased, glad to be standing here today and to say to you that Africa's largest agricultural gathering, the African Agri Investment Indaba is currently taking place in Cape Town.

It started yesterday and carries on today, and the continent's leading investors, agri businesses, senior government officials and industry experts are in our region to discuss how we can expand agriculture in Africa, to become the world's food basket.

In addition to boosting production, we envisage an agricultural sector in our continent which is owned by its own people, which drives inclusive growth, where we are committed to building a sector where hard working individuals have the freedom to access opportunities to improve their circumstances. A sector in which all people, regardless of rank, are treated fairly.

Madam Speaker, on that point I would like to really thank my Department for helping the organisers to come together with this conference. I want to thank the other sponsors and funders to make this conference a reality. I also would like to take this opportunity to thank Minister Zokwana for helping us with this conference and opening it yesterday, to Mr Nhlanhla Nene who also came to the conference yesterday to speak to fellow MECs from Gauteng, who came along to speak at this conference, because this conference is not about the Western Cape, it is not about South Africa, this conference is about Africa, and I want to thank all of the those partners who came together to make this a reality.

Here in the Western Cape we are seeking to add up to 100 000 agri-processing jobs to the economy under the banner of Project Khulisa. These jobs will largely be created in our rural areas.

With this mid-term allocation, we are providing an additional amount in excess of R25 million for drought relief. These funds will assist emerging grain farmers in the West Coast specifically, and at the onset of the drought, many of these farmers, who are important employers in their communities,

faced an uncertain future. As yields failed to materialise, it became clear that many would struggle to cover the costs of operations.

The Western Cape Department of Agriculture, through its commitment to supporting land reform, had already placed significant investment in these black farmers. We are determined to walk the road with them, to ensure their enterprises grow into thriving agri-businesses.

This allocation brings to R61 million the total amount the Western Cape Government has committed to drought relief in the past year. It includes an R11 million reallocation from the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme.

My office received a letter from the National Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, advising that the Western Cape has been allocated R12 million for drought relief from the National Government. These funds are to be distributed directly to the beneficiaries, and I would like to urge the National Government to ensure this money is dispensed as a matter of urgency. Every day is another step closer to a farm operation being forced to shut its doors as a result of Government red tape. We cannot afford to drag our feet on getting this support to the farmers who need it most, and of course it does concern me that the province is not integral in the allocation of this R12 million, but we do trust that the National Department will allocate it correctly and make sure that, as I said, it is done speedily.

As part of our drought relief funding we also put money towards Smart Agri, the Climate Change Response Strategy we developed in partnership with the industry and academia. To achieve future growth, we have to protect the sector against the impact of extreme weather events, and there is no doubt it is going to get worse over the next medium term. Smart Agri is the result of two years of extensive collaboration between the Western Cape Government, specifically the Departments of Agriculture and Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, and the University of Cape Town's African Climate and Development Initiative, and a wide range of stakeholders in the private sector.

One of Smart Agri's priorities is conservation agriculture, which advocates minimum tillage, year-round soil coverage and crop rotation process of farming. Due in part to the conservation agriculture, farmers in the Swartland have seen good yields in wheat crops, despite a challenging year or low rainfall.

With the introduction of no-till seeding methods, combined with crop rotation practices that we have pioneered through the Long Term Crop Rotation Trial at Langgewens, our research farm in the Swartland, we are currently producing nearly double the amount of wheat on less than half the area previously planted, and of course that is also with just about less than half the rainfall.

I am happy to report that at last measurement almost 98% of all of

agricultural farming in the Swartland area is now implementing this process that is being developed through the research.

As we make progress in mitigating the impact of the drought on the agricultural sector, we are going forward with our plans to open markets for the Western Cape produce.

Under Project Khulisa we are seeking to boost the number of exports to key markets, and to ensure that our produce can be internationally accredited for export. We are constructing a residue testing facility, and for that R6 million is allocated for the development of this facility, and as you know we already allocated, but with the Rand/Dollar exchange rate, we have had to put this extra R6 million into this process, and this is to allow opening up of access to markets.

But already on the back of Khulisa we have seen companies like Excellent Meat, looking at the Halaal sector specifically, 250 tons worth of exports per month coming from their factory in Athlone. We are seeing Distell moving further into international markets. We have seen exactly the same thing from Capespan and of course AgriProtein looking at feeding of animals specifically, from poultry to other animals in the agri sector. We have seen really world cutting-edge technology development in this space, and they are also increasing their footprint across the world. So far we have seen 50% now of South Africa's total exports in the processed goods coming from the Western Cape alone, in excess of R50 billion worth of export. We have made

excellent progress in growing agriculture, and we also aim to continue in this vein, we need to do a lot more.

With those points, I would like to thank, first of all, the HOD and her team for bringing us to this space, for the dedication which they put into this space, but then also of course every single person involved in our specific plans, whether it be Khulisa and within Government, and then of course not forgetting every single person involved in the agricultural space and the agri value chain across this province. I really, really thank them for that. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. Madam Speaker, yesterday I touched on the three challenges that lie front and centre for this Agricultural Department and we know that if, as we said, effective land reform by National Government is failing across the country, that drought and water challenges will continue to put food security at risk. We speak so much about drought, but we do not, I think, underestimate the real impact that drought is having not only on this province, but on this country. So the Western Cape Department of Agriculture has to date, since the start of drought as the Minister has indicated, spent R61 million to assist farmers and agri-workers. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, if you could take your seat please. Are

you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to know if she thinks the drought is caused by the ANC.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: You have got water on the brain.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the procedure is to first ask if the member would take a question. Not to just pose your question. I will overlook it this time. You may proceed hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes, I do think so, Madam Speaker, for the record.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: He is indeed the Deputy Whip, and yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. So, once again I am reiterating that this Department is the leading Department that focuses on the plight of farmers affected by adverse weather conditions and drought. It should be noted that the Western Cape can only provide financial support to livestock farmers, with the maximum of 50 large stock units per farmer. That is only one third of their total number of animals. The Disaster Drought Framework only

allows livestock and not crop farmers, to be assisted.

What I must add is that the funding currently available is only approximately 50% of the amount required to provide all our farmers, that is 564 emerging and 218 commercial with fodder for one and the delayed funds from National Government of R12 million will also go to drought relief on top of the resources already given by this government's own budget. R12 million is only 2.4% of the R500 million of the total amount that National Government has given to drought relief.

It is so disingenuous when the ANC criticises the fact that this Department did not spend its measly R12 million it afforded to our drought stricken areas as it arrived. Why? Because the support from the disaster declaration by the Western Cape Cabinet was approved on 25th November 2015 - that is a year ago - and sent to the National Disaster Management Centre, who only responded in January 2016 by classifying the West Coast and the central coast districts as well as local municipalities of Witzenberg, Prince Albert and Oudtshoorn as disaster areas. Secondly, the Western Cape November 2015 estimate for assistance was based on the estimated number of animals that need to be supported for a period of only five months and the price of fodder was then R63 million. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: In January 2016 the re-estimate was updated due to the

large increase in fodder prices at that stage and then estimated at R88 million. Just note that you only gave R12 million. And then during May, as DAF had requested, the estimated cost came slightly down to R59.3 million, but it does not equate to the R12 million you gave us. So how much did we get? Well DAF authorised the reallocation of some of the cost grant and aimed to support the emerging farmers towards drought relief for our emerging farmers.

So, the Department managed to reallocate about R12 million, R6 million in the 2015/6 and about R5.5 million in 2016/7. Just with regard to the developing farmers, to date the full cost reallocation of R11.463 million was utilised to provide fodder to developing farmers since March 2016. An amount of R6 million has also been utilised to pay for inputs for our emerging grain farmers, who lost their crop last year due to the drought. Another R1.5 million has been paid for this last year to provide a monthly livelihood support to the emerging grain farmers and their agri-workers and I really commend the Department for taking initiative, moving money around to do that, because we cannot afford for emerging farmers to actually become unsuccessful at this stage.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What are you doing?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: A changing climate, a rise in input costs and an increased competition for water is challenging South African producers to attain higher yields with much less water. We welcome the fact that the

FruitLook Project has received an essential R6.4 million in essential funds. And as the Minister explained, FruitLook is an open access online platform that monitors vineyards and orchards and builds on satellite imagery and weather information. The researching and implementation of smart agri tools as he said, to ensure more effective conservation farmers, is welcomed and supported.

We welcome these tools, such as the Cape Agricultural Mobile Information System, the CAMIS. The cellphone version of the Cape Farm Mapper, a spatial decision making smart app. These are very important in order to move forward with adverse weather conditions.

Recently a portal called Green Agri was also launched by the Western Cape Department of Agriculture and GreenCape. This includes smart agri production plans of sustainable farming practices, balancing farming and conservation needs, resource efficiency and waste minimisation.

We welcome the R3.4 million allocated for veterinary services towards the I-Tech system and we still, as a Committee, raise the concerns around the shortage of vets in our province.

I commend the agri processing focus of Project Khulisa. We have seen that in 2015, China became South Africa's sixth largest export market for packaging wines by volume and the largest in the Asian region. China customs stats also revealed that South Africa doubled its market share from

2% to 4% in volume terms and in China for the first half of 2015.

We encourage the Minister to look at something quite different and to look at the international best practice monitoring and auditing systems for farm worker conditions on our farms - farmers being audited by each and every major importer and these audits should be streamlined and the information should be shared through an established forum.

This working together relationship will create more efficient and effective oversight of complaints around the working conditions of farm workers. These international best practices should be extended into all the commodities of the agricultural sector. A proactive approach to ensuring that agriculture continues to deliver on its potential, hon Minister, is more effective and so that unfortunate labour conflicts such as the Robertson Winery can be avoided.

I want to ask the Minister and his Department to also continue to invest in economic opportunities for our fishing communities along our 12 small boat harbours. We need to continue to create alternative opportunities for fishermen who are losing their livelihoods because DAF fails to allocate fishing quotas to our local fishing communities.

More importantly, DAF has failed dismally to act as the effective implementing arm to curb abalone poaching which is robbing our people and the Western Cape's ocean economy of opportunity for jobs and growth.

Finally as Chair of the Standing Committee, I would like to thank the Minister and his Department for the immense work they do for this valuable sector of the Western Cape Province. I must commend the Department, which for the third time in four years has rated their Annual Report in the province, including first in the country as being the most consistent Department in the country, as assessed by SAIGA.

To my Committee members who together focus on ensuring that the agricultural sector continues to be a thriving and transforming space, I thank you. And finally to my Committee Co-ordinator, Zayda Adams, thank you for your hard work and support. Madam Speaker, the DA supports this Adjustment Budget for Vote 11, the Department of Agriculture. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. This Adjustment Budget for Agriculture looks like funny bookkeeping. And now the MEC's going to say, ja, the ANC does not know what they are talking about, but if you look into the adjustment budget book, you will see that all over money is being shifted from slower filling of posts; there are savings, then they shift the money. The money is shifted to goods and services and then you have a lot of savings on compensation of employees.

If you listened to the AG when he came here, he said to us that that is classified as a risk because there is a lot of savings on this compensation of

employees. When you speak to the Department, they will say, no they want to recruit people in these positions, but they cannot find the correct people.

I have been in this portfolio for two years and it has been going on for two years. There is no one in South Africa that they can recruit to come and work in this Department in certain positions. There are so many entries, it is not clear in this Department's Adjustment Budget that they know budgetary processes and budgetary practices because they are taking money from this side to that side, but it is all things that you need to budget for beforehand. Like when you advertise a post, you need to in your organogram, if the post is there, to budget for that post but in this Department you see money being shifted to another side because there is an unforeseen post that they need to fill. So, I do not understand that.

We see an overall increase of R28 million. Of this, sustainable resource management accounts for a massive R24 million. [Interjection.] We also see that R10 million became available to the province. Of this R7.5 million is directly for food security and drought. While we welcome this, because drought is a serious issue within our province, I think that when we say that National is only give R12 million, we must ask what is the Department doing in building a relationship with National to see that they get the funds they need for the drought in this province? You cannot come and say National is not giving money while National is giving money to this Department, but this Department wants it in February and National is saying we are giving it to you in June. But where is the communication between the two departments?

A slush of funds ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: A slush of funds?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There is no such thing.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: This is much more than what the Finance MEC mentioned earlier about drought relief provisions. With all the shifting around of various amounts, the R20 million that goes to public co-operative and private entities is not fully explained, because it was explained in our Committee but they said, just look at the book, we gave you an explanation there but there is no detailed explanation why they are doing that.

Another strange entry is the one of R15 million for machinery and equipment. Surely this could have been taken care of in the Main Appropriation Budget? That also goes for the R6 million that will be used to upgrade a laboratory to international specifications. Surely the need for this did not arise midyear?

There is also a big noise made about the additional income of R1 million. We asked the HOD about the R1 million. She said the R1 million was for the

installation of prepaid electricity meters that the Department did for saving of electricity but it also become an income to them. They made an income of R1 million with the prepaid electricity meters. I do not know if that is a function of this Department, to make an income with prepaid electricity? So, that was also a question that we asked in the Standing Committee, if this Department is now into the resale of electricity like a municipality because that is a function of a municipality, to sell prepaid electricity?

There are also numerous entries of savings and a long list of various donations – from the Farmer’s Union, Agri Western Cape, to state agency, Wesgro. Even a local agricultural society in Prince Albert is mentioned. Is this paid to secure opportunities for the MEC?

The Department would do much better to plan, estimate and control its budget better, because that was one of the issues that came from the AG, that the Department must do better estimates and have control in the budget, because previously there was a wrong estimation and then they said it was a mistake and they corrected it.

They rely heavily on late shifts in the guise of the Adjustment Budget process. This Adjustment Budget cannot be treated as a tool to balance the books and hide possible embarrassment later. In some cases, it is clear the Department bit off more than they could chew and now tries to make good by swiftly moving funds around.

We saw the Agriculture MEC encourage visitors to drink wine instead of water as there is a drought in the province. It made various headlines in newspapers today. This is ironic as it comes from an MEC of the DA-run Western Cape Government that professes to have a Game-Changer called alcohol harms reduction, in a province where too many farm workers and rural people still suffer the consequences of the former repressive *dop* system where people were remunerated with cheap wine.

The Premier spoke earlier this morning about foetal alcohol syndrome in children. It is because of the *dop* system that we have those children today and now the MEC publicly says you don't need to drink water, drink wine, because of the drought. Shame on you! Shame on you, MEC! [Interjections.] You cannot make a joke out of the ills in our society. We are here to assist our society to become a better society. We cannot say go and drink wine, because there is no water. The Government must put its money where its mouth is and be seen to lead in the fight to reduce alcohol harms and not encourage more drinking of alcoholic beverages that in fact harms mostly poor people. It is no joke at all, because we see... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, if I may ask, can you address the Chair please?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Okay. Sorry, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: We have seen the documentary of Tom Heinemann that is overseas now. In that documentary, it was said that in the Western Cape specifically, farm workers are slaves and they are slaves because this was one of the things that was identified. They are slaves because of the *dop* system. Our Chairperson spoke now about the living conditions of the farm workers. We spoke for two years in the House about the living conditions of farm workers in the Western Cape and we were not listened to, but now because it is an international thing, the documentary is run overseas, now everyone is jumping on the wagon of living conditions of farm workers in the Western Cape.

MEC, we must put our money where our mouth is. The farm workers in the Western Cape need us, because at the end of the day they are giving us the production. It is not technology. It is not research that is giving us the production, it is the farm workers that get up at two o'clock in the morning and go to bed at eight at night, that are giving us the production. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Davids. I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Agriculture is important to the Western Cape and South Africa and also to Africa. The important thing is that the ACDP welcomes the money that goes to drought relief. That is what we need.

Member Sharon Davids spoke about farm workers. I am glad to see that farm workers become farm owners and I know that the Department is busy with that and that is what we must see ... [Interjection.] That is when our people are liberated, when they are given land and they are equipped to follow on. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So, the important thing is, I just want to repeat what I said this morning. I do not think the ANC understands that this is the place where the department Ministers come and they say listen, we want to shift some funds. We want to adjust this budget. That is why we have this debate and they have not given any reason why - and you know Madam Speaker, we sit in committees and we debate these things and we can influence committees. Madam Speaker, we support this vote. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] every vote.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, it is a participatory exercise and in the absence of the EFF, I now see the Minister. Hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and thank you very much

to the members who participated in this debate. First of all, to the Chairperson of the Committee, hon member Schäfer, thank you very much for your input.

You did focus a lot on the drought, as others did, and of course this is the big issue that is facing us all. I spoke about it too. I did notice that while you were speaking that the hon Whip on the other side of the House kept on asking, what are you doing, with question marks, all the time. [Interjection.] And that is exactly the question that should be asked of the ANC, is what are you doing other than just talk? So far, for the drought, from a National Government point of view in this province, it is zero. All we received is a letter to say we will allocate R12 million to the drought. [Interjection.] One year late. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What we have done, and I will tell you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, please speak to the Chair. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: R61 million is what we have done already. The best performance in South Africa on mitigation of drought. The best performance. So, you can keep asking, what are you doing? He must open his ears and listen, but I

think he does not want to listen because he is too embarrassed that his own political party is doing nothing. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sê dankie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Say thank you.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Absolutely nothing! This is a knee jerk reaction because they are failing the real people who are feeling the pain of this drought. And perhaps further to that, the hon member spoke about farm worker audits and I think that is a good idea. We need to have these audits, but perhaps what I can also do is mention, if the hon Minister Fritz would allow me, that we will probably go public with it with a lot more detail. But, only this morning did the hon member, Minister Fritz and myself and our two departments meet, because we as Agriculture have a process of doing farm worker audits ourselves.

We visit every single farm worker household across the province and we have been doing this now for two years, which gives us really good data, but the question is, are we bringing this data together? Are we linking it with the Department of Education, because what it is telling us is how many kids are dropping out of school, etcetera, etcetera. We need to fix that structure. At the same time we have social workers on these farms. Are we feeding that information back, because I agree with every member in this House. We need to make sure that where the problems lie, specifically with the most

vulnerable people of our province, we put systems in place to identify these problems. And there I agree with the hon Davids. We don't need a journalist from another country to come and tell us where these problems are. We need to actually find early warning mechanisms of putting them on the table, but I will get to the hon member Davids shortly.

With regard to the small boat harbours, I also agree absolutely and that links to the harbours themselves. It links to the poaching. It links to the allocation, as you say, of the quotas. It is a real big issue and the problem with, we have got a full operation in South Africa of how we develop the coastal economy, but quite frankly I am not seeing the action that I think we should be seeing out of Project Phakisa and I think ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talk about Khulisa. Leave Phakisa.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The difference between Khulisa and Phakisa. Khulisa has got projects and they report back on a six weekly basis with a dashboard. Phakisa is supposed to be doing exactly the same thing. It is run by the President and it is supposed to be doing exactly the same thing. And you know that those dashboards are online. You can go on your phone right now and have a look at those dashboards. Everything has got a red light on it. Why? Because the President is so busy with all of his other nonsense, that he is not doing his job and actually following up on the programs of projects and that is why we are failing the people of our province again, the most

vulnerable in this process, because the President is somewhere else. In actual fact, he is trying to keep himself out of jail as we hear at the moment. That is his biggest worry. That is the truth and it is very, very painful.

Now to the hon member Davids. She starts off by saying “funny bookkeeping” and then she mentions the adjustments appropriation. Adjustments. I don’t know if we need to have a separate workshop or the Minister of Finance must run special programmes for the ANC here.

Adjustments are where you correct for the unseen or foreseen, because you make your budgets a year in advance. In actual fact, more than a year in advance. And of course, it is very difficult to spot the unforeseen, to plan for drought. I mean if we are correcting the books and adjusting for droughts and we do it, we did it last year at this time and we are doing it again this year at this time. We still haven’t got the National Government’s adjustment in the drought supporting. It has not happened. Now she says the laboratories ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: She obviously did not listen at all in the Standing Committee where the appropriation for the laboratory is the increase in the Rand/Dollar exchange rate of providing this facility so that we can get better access to markets.

The Rand/Dollar exchange rate is just an excuse from the ANC, that is all that they see, when in actual fact the real reason for that amount of money having to be found somewhere else for this project, is again because of the failure of that side of the House's President ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to operate an effective, efficient government that gives us an economy that we can work with. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, Temporary Chair ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is a failing economy because of how the ANC is trying to run this country. They are running it into the ground. 0% growth rate means that you are in big trouble as a country and all you do is smile and laugh. It is unbelievable. Unbelievable. Then of course, she comes up with her real clanger ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Too much noise.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Her real clanger, as the Opposition member to this vote, and she says you must please build a better relationship with the National

Department. You must please build a better relationship with the National Department and you don't have one. Now, I am not sure if the hon member knows or not ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Speak to me.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... but I would very much like her to have a word with her DG or her Minister or her Deputy Minister. There is a whole lot of them that she can go and talk to, and ask them about the relationship between the Western Cape and the National Department. Ask them about the three months of this year that our Government's HOD, Ms Joyene Isaacs, spent three months at National to help the National Department of Agriculture get themselves sorted out because their systems were all over the place. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The ANC [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Unbelievable. Unbelievable. And we must build a better relationship? [Interjection.] We must build a better relationship, but yesterday I spent the morning with ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ... Minister Zokwana. I think that the relationship is actually to be built within the ANC. [Interjections.] because it sounds like the whole of this ANC is in the Zuma camp. This is the Zuma camp sitting here in this province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, if I can call you to order. You are not in your seat and you are not at liberty to do what you have just done. Please be aware of your actions. I should say, as hon member Dugmore says, you need to behave better. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The next point she raises is around prepaid meters and the nearly R1 million that was brought in. So, we had to have a look at our energy efficiencies across the Department and we entered into a program that had a look at where we were spending money on electricity. What was happening? Whether machines were left on at night? Where were we wasting electricity? We have a number of households at Elsenburg, a number of people that live on the Elsenburg property.

A number of them that live on the property, rightfully live there because they work for Elsenburg, they work for the Department and it is part of the package that they receive when they get employment on the property but there are a number of households on the property who are tenants. There are a number of them and we are involved in a court case at the moment, because

for years they have not paid their rates and taxes [Interjection.] But of course, at the same time there are people on the property who are receiving electricity, every month, paid for by the Department. So, that needed to be rectified.

Prepaid where meters were put in place so that the tenants on the property could pay for their share of the electricity that they use and that is where the prepaid meters come from. That is where that income comes from, which is commendable that the system has now been fixed and I want to thank those individuals that are paying their fair share. Those individuals have been living there for 30 years and those are the individuals where I want to see land transfer happening. I want those houses transferred to those individuals so that they can actually have ownership of those properties ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Promises. Empty promises.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and we are busy working on that program. Then of course the hon member spoke about the *dop* system and I want to just remind the hon member that this is not the first time she has spoken about the *dop* system. She has spoken about it two years ago, and I remember it very well. I wrote her a letter the next day and said to her, you have made the following allegations in the House about the *dop* system. Please furnish me with the details because I would like to go to the police station and lodge the accusation at the police station. That was two years ago. Do you know

Madam Speaker, to date I still don't have an answer. So, she stands up here every time making these allegations but there is no substance to back the allegations. So, I will put that challenge to her again now publicly.

Mr D JOSEPH: Make noise.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Please, if you are too scared to lay the charge at the police station, give the information to me, I will personally go and lay the charge at the police station, because what you are talking about is illegal.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is illegal. So, let us ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... ask her to please see if she can put her money where her mouth is this time.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] did not do anything [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister if you could finish up please. Hon member

Dauids.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And then to the hon Christians, thank you very much for your input. You spoke about farm owners and that is exactly what we need. We need owners of farms, but unfortunately at the moment the ANC is still buying up land in the province second to none, still no leases, still no land ownership. Their policy is no land ownership for black farmers.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Winde. That concludes ...
[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids. There is a time and place to do that. That concludes the debate on this vote. The Secretary will read the seventh order of the day.

[Debate concluded.]

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 5 – 2016].

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: I see the hon the Minister, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Through this mid-term allocation request, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism aims to build on the momentum it has achieved in growing the economy and creating jobs, through its focused approach on Project Khulisa and our Game-Changers.

We have the lowest unemployment rate in the country, and we continue to attract significant international investment into our province's key sectors.

This month, I attended the launch of the French Tech Labs, an incubation hub for tech entrepreneurs. The French Information and Communication Technology sector is amongst the largest in Europe. Through the French Tech Lab, our entrepreneurs will now be able to tap into world-class expertise and this was an R11 million investment.

A few weeks before I attended the opening of DVT, the biggest tech and ICT testing facility in the Southern Hemisphere, opened in Paarden Eiland. We had Rise, a Barclays Bank investment of R220 million into the tech sector. We see this all on the back of the kind of work that the Department has been busy with around the Bandwidth Barn for many years and the Barn in Khayelitsha linked to our broadband rollout.

When talking about investment, in October, Marriott International unveiled

its R2 billion plan to add over 500 hotel rooms in Cape Town's city centre. This is in a partnership with the Amdec Group, Marriott International is developing three properties in our region.

These investments are excellent news for our economy and speak to the business confidence international firms have in the Western Cape. As a Regional Government, we continue to operate in a constrained national environment and we also have increasing demands on public money and the call for us, is to innovate, have a look at our approach and continue creating an environment in which investors, despite that international space, feel comfortable to invest. On top of the Marriott and the tourism space, we have got Tsogo Sun building two new hotels plus two more to come. Radisson putting two up. Zeits Macher, the new Silo Hotel going up. The Leo Collection putting in over R1 billion. The Ritz Hotel revamp and the Ambassador Hotel revamp.

That all coming on the back of the projects around Project Khulisa, where we are aiming to create another 100 000 job posts in tourism alone. If we link that to just one of the Khulisa projects, being the Air Access project, that Air Access project in the last year has seen the increase of 404 000 seats for aircraft. Nine new different air legs flying directly into the City of Cape Town and as of last week we are now having 19 flights from London and Gatwick directly into Cape Town. 19 per week. And that on the back of SAA, if you remember not so long ago, deciding that the London-Cape Town flight was not viable.

So, it really is great news to welcome all these direct flights and that is an 18.6% growth rate, just in new international arrivals on top of what we were having before and I would like to really commend the Air Access team for their hard work in bringing all these new flights into the system.

In the 2016/17 financial year R1 million has been allocated towards the building of capacity of our data dashboards. Sorry, I skipped a line there.

The Air Access team – in this Adjustments Appropriation we give them another R5.5 million to boost the efforts that they have already and we are specifically focusing at the moment on getting a direct flight out of Shanghai in China and a direct flight out of the USA. So, we give them a little bit more money for that.

In 2016/17 we give another R1 million towards data dashboards and capacity because data is one of those issues that really, really is worrying me at the moment and we see a lot of sector growth in our region and we need to actually try to get to grips with the growth in those sectors which perhaps are not included in the SIC-codes that have been in place for so long, and hopefully we can start to get some better data coming in through that system.

We are also making progress with the establishment of our Madiba Heritage Tourism Route. Through this Adjustment Budget, R1.7 million will be allocated to fund the memorial statue of former President Nelson Mandela at the City Hall. This is a going to be part of that route where I think everyone

in this House will know the speech that Madiba made on the balcony of the City Hall and you all know what that photograph looks like, what those paintings look like, where Madiba was standing on that balcony with all the people standing around him and hanging on the balcony. It will be a replica of that moment. So, the tourists can come from now and into the future and be able to be part of that specific moment in our history. This is a joint initiative between ourselves and the Province and the City of Cape Town and is set to be completed in the 2017/18 financial year.

Along with tourism, agri-processing was identified as one of the Western Cape's most fastest-growing sector ...[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Are you still talking?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Our efforts to add another 100 000 jobs in agri-processing including boosting the wine exports and strategic markets ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Minister Winde, will you please take your seat? Hon member Magaxa, the Minister has been afforded x amount of time and I do not think that that comment was appropriate, because if his time had run up I would have been alerted by the Table staff. Thank you. So ... [Interjections.] There is an allocation on the speakers list which we can work by. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The hon member knows that he is also always at liberty to ask me a question if he would like.

Then of course within the agri-processing space, including wine and brandy to China and Angola, but we are also looking at the Halal market; our initiative to promote Halal exports to new markets receives R1.7 million.

Project Khulisa's third focus area is oil and gas, driven by our flagship project, the IDZ project. The IDZ will deliver a significant contribution to the creation of opportunities for jobs and growth. It is estimated that 1 500 people from 30 different occupations are needed to repair one rig. By the time the IDZ comes online, there will be a demand for 18 000 jobs in Saldanha and that moves forward over the medium term to 60 000 jobs.

The IDZ concluded the purchase agreement of the Industrial Development Corporation land at the back-of-port and for that we have invested R100 million and that money is being appropriated in this Adjustments Budget.

Through the Western Cape's Apprenticeship Game-Changer we have set a target of introducing 32 500 qualified apprentices into the labour market by 2019. To reach this goal, a total of R191 million is allocated to the Apprenticeship Game-Changer over the medium term.

Along with skills, energy is another of our economic Game-Changers. We are

positioning the Western Cape as an energy node, backed by significant public and private sector investment into clean energy projects. And very interesting was the Moody's finding that the green economy in South Africa is the fastest-growing in the world and 70% of that manufacture finds itself in the Western Cape. 60% of those companies are based in the Western Cape and I think that is really, we want to give a ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It has got nothing to do with the DA.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and give real commendation to GreenCape and the role that they have played in that space. Today there are already 218 approved solar photovoltaic PV installations in Cape Town alone and we are trying to get the rest of the 2000-odd that are in the system into the registered space. That represents 7.7MW of capacity. Also in the roll-out across the municipalities, at last count 11 municipalities have systems in place to approve applications, and this out of 16 in the country as a whole.

On that point, I have written to the National Minister of Energy, yet still to receive an answer, on the decision to exclude Saldanha Bay from the first phase of Gas-to-Power Program. I do not think that that is correct. Definitely the amount of work that has been done around Saldanha and because it is such a big project for South Africa, we need to make sure that Saldanha is included in that gas-to-energy link.

And perhaps while talking about the West Coast and specifically industrialisation, we are also looking at Atlantis and I know we have already had the investigation and the inspection from the DTI, that happened last Monday. And perhaps that leads me to a point that was made by the hon member Tyatyam yesterday, when he spoke about the Industrialist Program. I am very glad that he brought it up, but instead of waiting for him to bring it up now in this debate, I will report back to this House on the Industrialist Program and the role that this province is playing.

We have the second most number of industrialists by province in South Africa, only topped by Gauteng. At the moment we have 49 approved industrialists through the DTI program and 16 in the pipeline and through the IDC program we have 19 already approved. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Order please. I see the Hon Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Despite as we say, the weak economic outlook in the country, the Western Cape continues to out-perform ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon member Schäfer, please take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I realise, Madam Speaker, that previously you allowed her - that hon member Schäfer is speaking from a seat that she is not allocated. Can she please go back to her place and then start speaking? Not where she is standing.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But my arm, it is very difficult ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Hon member Dyantyi, due to her broken arm and the incapacity of her situation in her specific seat, hon member Schäfer has asked that she sits there where she can have freedom of movement as it impacts on her arm. You might understand that she has had a broken arm and I have acceded to that request.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well she cannot sit between Kivedo and Hinana.

The SPEAKER: I hear you. You may proceed, hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, so despite the weak economic outlook in the country the Western Cape continues to outperform all other provinces. As I stated yesterday, the 2015/16 financial year has experienced very tough economic conditions including those difficulties with the change in global environment and Brexit and the European Union, all of which create uncertainty in the tourism and trade sectors of our province.

The continuous budget constraints that this Department faces forces them to leverage funding through public-private partnerships. And this has been very effective at all levels and we commend them for taking this small budget and stretching it a long way.

We cannot underestimate the importance of investment into infrastructure and we know that where you see all those cranes in the air and the building projects going on, we know then that our economy is being stimulated. Where the economy is stimulated the job opportunities will grow and so we welcome the R100 million investment into the purchasing of the Saldanha Bay industrial development land from the Industrial Development Corporation and we think that this is a very exciting one.

We as a Committee look forward to the latter part of next year, when the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone is open for business. We all know that the West Coast Industrial Plan will be a massive boost for the thousands of jobs to be created, as the Minister has mentioned and for the many, many young people to be upskilled as artisans for employment into the oil and gas sector.

One of the biggest challenges facing not only the Western Cape, but South Africa at large, is not just to create wage related job opportunities but to increase our skills base. This Committee is equally disappointed that Saldanha Bay was not identified as a port for the importation of natural gas into the preliminary information memorandum released by the National

Department of Energy. We too, call on Minister Joemat-Pettersson to give Saldanha the 600MW allocation for natural gas in the West Coast, that she gazetted in May 2016, because we know that it is essential in order to maximise the potential of the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone.

Tourism is doing very well despite the challenges of the visa regulations that still hamper Cape Town being marketed as a family destination. The focus of our tourism strategy within Project Khulisa includes positioning the Western Cape as Africa's cycling capital by ensuring that we have world class leisure cycling infrastructure and systems. And this stretches right into rural areas in the province and stimulates economic growth across our rural small towns.

Secondly, maximising our culture and heritage tourism through the development as the Minister mentioned, of the Madiba Legacy Tourism Route and so we welcome that extra money that is allocated towards this project. And finally marketing the province as a leading food and wine destination and we have just seen that one of our Western Cape female winemakers being awarded as a world class, world's best wine maker.

But the real growth stimulator for tourism is as mentioned by the Minister is that Air Access strategy that is driven by Wesgro. And that Cape Town's Air Access Initiative is a partnership between Government, our Airports Company, Wesgro and the airline industries in order to stimulate that international trade, bring in more foreign direct investment and obviously, tourism to maximise economic growth within this province. And I too must

commend Wesgro for landing those eight direct flights and new routes between July 2015 and December 2016 and adding those 408 400 seats. We welcome that extra funding that is going to be allocated to the Air Access Project as we continue to see tourism improve in this province.

We know that the tourism sector has confidence in the work that this Government is doing, because again, as the Minister mentioned, that proof of the R2 billion investment that is being made by the private sector into the Western Cape which will add more than 500 hotel rooms in the City Centre is a big welcome.

And agri-processing, as mentioned in my previous Vote speech, we know will also stimulate economic growth both in and outside of our metros and so we welcome that added money which has been made available to fund the promotion of the Halal export market.

South Africa is the world's fastest-growing green economy according to an independent report and most of this business we know, sits in the Western Cape and so we welcome the R3.8 billion towards energy projects. We commend the Provincial Government, Wesgro and GreenCape for attracting the R17 billion investment into renewable energy projects since 2009 and we know that the proposed Special Economic Zone in Atlantis stands to deliver an expected one billion and one thousand two hundred jobs to the economy.

I would like to thank the Minister and the HOD, Mr Solly Fourie, and his

Department, our entities Wesgro, for the work that they are doing to stimulate the economy and create an enabling environment for jobs to grow. Their continuous engagement with our Standing Committee and ensuring that as an oversight body we are always welcome to be part of the many functions and events taking place. We really appreciate that. To my colleagues in the Committee, I thank you for being focused on our objective, to ensure that this province continues to grow jobs for all its people and to my Committee Co-ordinator Zayda Adams, I would not be able to do this without you. Madam Speaker, the DA supports Vote 12, the Department for Economic Opportunities, Tourism and its entities. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Schäfer. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Praat mooi.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Speak well.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me start by “*praat-ing mooi*”. [Laughter.] Let me congratulate the Department and its entities on the opinion it received from the Auditor-General. I think we have done well in making sure that we sustain good audit standards. But we must also say as mentioned yesterday, that unqualified audits or clean audits do not necessarily add value to people’s lives or change their lives for the better in terms of the entire community if service delivery is lagging behind. So, it cannot be this or that. They must go together.

In analysing this report it is important that we must do it in line, in terms of how do we advance the objective of the National Development Plan? We cannot do it outside of that. I think it is important to mention just three of that nine-point plan, which I think are critical for this Department:

One is in relation to the effective implementation of a higher impact Industrial Action Policy Plan, which I think is [Inaudible.] of course what the Minister raised in relation to Operation Phakisa, which has a number of directions that it is taking but I think our province is benefiting quite a lot from that. The last one is unlocking the potential of the SMME co-operatives, township and rural enterprises, which today, I must say that I am going to at a later stage spend more time on this one, Madam Speaker.

All these three points above, speak to the Western Cape's Strategic Goal 1; in creating opportunities for growth and jobs. Therefore it is quite important that we must always thank the ANC that continues to plan and support all nine provinces, regardless of whether they voted for the ANC or not. They are all in South Africa. They must be supported. This is what the ANC believes. So, we must thank the ANC in terms of that. [Interjections.]

It is of concern that the Department has continued to have perpetual roll-overs, which I think the Department must be able to deal with. I am not going to speak about those of Saldanha and so forth. We understand. It is a new project that the Department is speaking to, but it is important that we must speak to other funds that are being rolled over, particularly for projects

that are supposed to add and multiply a positive spin to the economy.

Amongst them we can talk about the City of Cape Town. We have rolled over R65 million and last year we also did the same thing. It is quite important, Madam Speaker. I know last year it was because the City of Cape Town had not paid its part. I think since the Provincial Government, also the City of Cape Town – it is one government in my view - it is important that you must speak to your colleagues to actually do their part and make sure that they pay on time because many people could have benefited in this process. I am not benefitting, because of that. So, really, you must impress to Madam - that side, the Mayor. The second part is the broadband stream ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member Tyatyam, I thought I missed something about Madam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Mayor, yes.

The SPEAKER: Madam Mayor? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, no-no, you cannot have our Madam speaking to the other Mayor because nothing will happen. We won't get that money. So, you must go yourselves and speak to the Madam. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you. Another roll-over which you cannot see is the broadband and on top of that broadband, hon Minister, we now have the addition of another R2.8 million which has been added which was supposed to have been used for the Saldanha Wireless project, which has been cancelled. The reality of that is that many people who could have benefitted in Saldanha are not benefitting at the moment. That is a cause of concern that we cannot budget, we cannot plan and put objectives in terms of our budget and not deliver because you might have people, many of them, who would have expectations that they would benefit out of this. So, I think it is important that we have to deal with those things; and then ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is enough.

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is enough? Okay. [Laughter.] As the provincial economy continues to shed jobs, the Department has continued to underspend on some of the programmes, particularly in Programme 2. Let alone that Programme 2 was underbudgeted, hon Minister, the fact of the matter is that that programme is supposed to deal with entrepreneurs, that programme is supposed to deal with, let us say, township economy that must be injected and uplifted.

Continuously we see a DA that is allergic to supporting our people to change

their lives. [Interjections.] You must prove me wrong, Minister. This can be attested by the fact that our communities continue to be trapped as a result of the erstwhile oppressive Group Areas Act.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Progressive.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Oppressive. Right English. As old as they may be no economic development and activation have been seen not only in financial terms – we are ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Quit while you are ahead.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You know part of the Group Areas Act has put us where we are. You can look in most of your Cape Flats. Look at Langa and look at Pinelands.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Where do you live?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Look at Pinelands. You can see where development is happening. Even in Langa there is not even a business that is developing to that effect. There is no complex that is being developed, but here in Pinelands everything is being developed. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. Hon members, we are almost at the end of the day. Can you please afford the speaker on the floor an opportunity to finish?

Mr S G TYATYAM: So therefore, by not assisting the poor communities we are not being able to inspire entrepreneurs in these communities. In Netreg, there is nothing happening. That is why you will find that our children, our young people there are always involved in other things. We must see as we have here in Cape Town or in Pinelands, the business co-ops which are coordinated either by Province or by local government.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, if you could finish up your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I must raise it with you now. The talk shows that we have here, that are called budget debates, are not going to change anything. You know the budgets are already concluded by Cabinet, it does not assist. It differs from what we have nationally where there is BRRR, where portfolio committees are able to impede and make sure that they change those budgets. Here it is just a talk show. So I think it is important that we need ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, we need to look at how we can change the Act in

order to address that particular issue so that at committees we do not get budgets that we cannot change.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because we cannot agree with this budget. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, I think hon member Tyatyam agrees with the budget.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon member Makeleni, can you allow member Christians to speak please. You have a minute hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the primary responsibility of this Department is to create an enabling environment to create jobs. That is the Department's job. So, what I heard and what I read is, when you have these budgetary constraints, what do you do? So, I want to compliment the Department and the Minister for the public-private partnerships. That is the way to go. You create partnerships in order to create jobs and that helps our people. So we support the budget, including hon member Tyatyam [Interjection.] supporting the budget so that we can in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I mean we must look at the facts. In the Western Cape we have the lowest unemployment rate. That is a fact. So, it is the initiatives of this Department and the Minister and especially with their public-private partnerships, creating jobs. So, Madam Speaker, we support this budget. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians. Hon members, we have been through a long day. I think there is just one more. Could I call everyone to order please. In the absence of the EFF, I recognize the honourable, the Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. First of all, can I thank the hon member Schäfer for the role that she plays as Chair in the Committee, for her commitment to the economy of this province and for her continued availability at all of our events. I really, really do appreciate it. So, thank you very much. Thank you also for the role that you play in pulling the Committee together in making the suggestions you do in helping us all together, deliver on a better eco-system and environment for creating jobs.

You spoke about Saldanha Bay, the gas, the IDC property, and unfortunately, the point that was raised by me and again by you where we do see National Government playing with the people of this province, when you come along

and you don't determine or give us an allocation for gas-to-power in Saldanha Bay. Really, that is playing politics, because all the work that was done by Prof Jim Petri, this province did that work. He came in here, did the work. We personally went and took it to the Chair of Eskom, the CEO of Eskom. We took it to the Minister of Finance. We put all of that work in process to actually get gas as part of an underlying component of our energy supply to this country and then of course just to get absolutely side-lined is a political decision. It really, really is shocking.

You also spoke about the airlift and public-private partnership and I think that is really a public-private partnership that is working unbelievably well, because regarding the private component of the partnership, it is not as if it is a public-private partnership on some development where somebody in the private sector comes along to us and wants to put a project together.

We put the project together between the City of Cape Town and the Province. Wesgro went out and got some great traction in the airlift space and then we went and spoke to business and they very happily said they will join us in that project, and they are putting money in. They are putting hotel beds in. They are putting in mechanisms so that we can actually create attractive marketing platforms so we can make it viable for a number of these airlines to come directly to us.

You also spoke about the green economy and the kind of work that GreenCape is doing, the energy Game-Changer. All of this is really about

creating an enabling environment so that businesses can start up and get going.

The hon member Tyatyam, you really did start incredibly well and thank you very much. You said in your "*mooi praat*" that you congratulated the Department. I appreciate that. Thank you very much for that part.

Mr M G E WILEY: It just went downhill from there.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, I am not going to say then it went downhill from there. But what I do want to say, you then come along and you talk about the value of audits and in actual fact it is not only about audits. But audits are a component of good governance and if you really want to create an enabling environment that is the basics that you have got to get right. You have got to get the good governance right. You have got to make sure that you spend your money properly. You have got to make sure you have the processes and programs in place and that is part of that trust that the public have to have in our system.

So it is very, very important, because only once you get that stage right, can you move to the next stage which is really making sure that you turn the efficiencies of government into service delivery excellence. And that is why so much time was spent in the first term of this Government, to get that space right so that you can really start getting traction in the next stage of delivery.

And perhaps now I am not exactly sure which component in the ANC you belong to, but there is one of them that needs to be really well explained to and I am happy to come and help you if you need to explain it to them.

You spoke about the NDP and Phakisa. It was interesting. I said to you earlier in the previous debate that I spent the morning with Minister Zokwana and we were actually going through the exhibition centre. In Project Phakisa, especially around aquaculture, it is quite amazing to see the traction of aquaculture in this province versus the other provinces. I mean it really is. It is amazing and some amazing projects are really way, way ahead and I see you did recognize that and this is where really joined-up government makes sense.

Then you spoke about the roll-overs. The point around good governance and process and coming to an adjustments budget is also part of the process of good governance and you know, we don't want to roll over money. We want to actually spend that money, get it done and dusted so we can move onto the next project. But sometimes and in the roll-over space, that is the Madiba Project, the Legacy Project because there is public participation. Or perhaps in the CTICC because it is planning, it is a partnership between the City and the Province. It is as you said, one component pays, then part of the agreement another component pays. You have got to make sure that your planning approvals are in place. If you get those things right, you then can pay the next tranche. But you have got to try and gauge it. Are you going to get it before March or after March? And when you cannot get it in line, well

then you ask for a roll-over because this is about good governance and making sure you are making the right decisions. And exactly the same thing applies to Broadband and that is what we try to exercise all the time.

You then move to; this province continues to shed jobs. Well, please read the last quarterly report because there were actually 50 000 more jobs. So, you must actually go and check your numbers before you come here. And then of course, you spoke about – what was the last point you made? You made a point about changing the budget and I noticed that in the Standing Committee process you made no other suggestions on how the budget should be spent, because quite frankly not only in the Standing Committee process, at any time, in no debate have you stood up in this House saying, we think this money should rather be spent here or there. Say it. That is your job in the oversight space in democracy, and try and convince us through the debate that we actually need to be spending money in a different space. We will take that on board and in the budget process [Interjection.] of course we can take those kinds of things on board, because the process takes time ... [Interjection.] over time and I am sure we can land those. But you don't actually really need to spend too much time on it because in 2019 we will have a look at the national side as well.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Should I say that again? You don't have to worry, because in

2019 we will have a look at the national side of the budgeting process as well.

To the hon member Christians, I first of all really appreciate what you have said. I want to thank the Whippers for making sure that you always get some time to speak in all of the debates and then of course the point that you make around PBP, they are really, really important. We need to make sure that we do this together. I think that is why, in the Western Cape we say: the Western Cape Government – Better Together. It is about building those partnerships. So, thank you very much. With that, Madam Speaker, thank you very much.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debate on Vote 12 and it also concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 15:39.