
THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Please remain standing. Before we continue with our proceedings, I would like to request that the House observe a moment of silence at the sudden passing of the National Parliament MP, hon member Timothy Khoza, and we wish the other MPs who are recovering a speedy recovery. [Moment of silence observed.] You may be seated.

Good afternoon, hon members, our guests in the gallery. Welcome to the sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and I would like to ask that you allow me to welcome a former clerk of the Legislative Assembly of Western Australia, Mr Peter McHugh, at our proceedings today. Mr McHugh,

feel welcome. [Applause.] Mr McHugh has recently retired after serving the Legislative Assembly in Perth as the Chief Executive Officer for nearly 27 years. Feel welcome, thank you. I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the Order of the Day which is the consideration of the report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the public hearings held to determine the impact on abalone poaching and the rest as in the Order Paper. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The poaching the abalone off the Western Cape coastline is a crime so detrimental and far-reaching, that it is slowly ripping apart the social fabric of our province's fishing communities.

Transnational crime, a flourishing illegal trade together with series of failures by National Government, have created an ideal environment for the poaching of these vast marine reserves. It is in this environment that local

gangs have seized an opportunity to control and facilitate the sale of illegal abalone to international buyers, bringing a tragic brand of organised crime and drug abuse to these communities.

As fishermen and women are increasingly denied [Inaudible.] by the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries to fish in our oceans, they too turn to this illegal trade to put food on the table. Indeed, a simple illegal act has snowballed into a multifaceted social ill, which is ravaging the Western Cape's small fishing communities. As a result, the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture took a unanimous decision in a series of meetings held on 21 and 28 September 2016, to conduct an in-depth investigation into abalone poaching in the province.

This decision was made with a view to urge Provincial and National Government to make the necessary interventions to protect our marine resources and the many people affected by the illegal trade along our shores. Thus the beginnings of the Committee's abalone report were put into motion.

Madam Speaker, having realised the importance of public input into this report, it was also decided that public hearings be held in various small fishing communities in the Western Cape, to give members of the public a platform to voice their concerns on the matter. On 3, 8 and 24 February 2017, a series of public hearings were held in Saldanha Bay, Gansbaai and Cape Town. From this interaction with some of the province's small fishing

communities, the Committee were able to obtain valuable input from first-hand accounts of the illegal trade.

The findings pointed out a series of alarming failures by various National Departments to protect the province's oceans, tackle gangsterism in the Western Cape, allocate fishing quotas to small finishing communities...

[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is fine, just get over it.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...and managing small harbour...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] all of them over.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...infrastructure within our borders.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We can run them better.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The extent of the... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...findings are as follows:

- The Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries has failed to

regulate and effectively coordinate their function to protect and conserve Western Cape's abalone and West Coast rock lobster stocks.

- They failed to follow the advice by the Department's scientific working groups to ensure the sustainability of marine resources.
- Failed to allocate small-scale fishing rights to existing fishermen...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] be surprised.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...who are living along coastal towns.

- Failed to effectively monitor and protect South Africa's vast coastlines with its partners.
- Failed to effectively control and inspect local fishing landing sites... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are useless!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

Ms B A SCHÄFER:

- Failed to enforce certification pertaining to confiscated abalone.
- Failed to provide enough vessels to guard the coastline and monitor

hotspots where poaching is rife.

- The South African Police Service have failed to provide enough visible policing in coastal communities where poaching is rife. [Interjections.]
- Failed to implement coastal marine units such as the Waterwings to directly tackle poaching.
- Failed to investigate and clamp down on police involvement in poaching syndicates.
- Failed to arrest and convict syndicates... [Interjection]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek kan dit nie glo nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I cannot believe it.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...and poachers more effectively.

- Failed to have an organised crime project investigation unit to dismantle criminal syndicates... [Interjection]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...by prosecuting its members and seizing their assets and effectively collaborate with the South African Navy to curb poaching, which is now, as we said [Interjections.] considered a transnational cry.

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members. There is a speaker on the floor.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The National Department of Public Works has also failed to maintain the 12 small boat harbours of the Western Cape, resulting in serious degradation of these public assets, an increase in crime and a failure to develop their economic potential.

Ms M N GILLION: That is not true.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But the Committee, Madam Speaker, has made the following recommendations to various Western Cape Government Departments to also further investigate:

1. That the Western Cape's Department of Community Safety liaise with the National Government for the establishment of specialised police units... [Interjection]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, sorry, there is a hon member on the floor. Would you kindly take your seat, please? Hon member Dyantyi, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, a question. I just want to know from her... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...if there is anything that... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...they have succeeded on.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is the question.

The SPEAKER: ...if you have a...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: If she can just show one thing...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...they succeeded with.

The SPEAKER: ... may I address you?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, if you have a question for the hon member, you need to pose your question through the Chair and I will ask the member whether she will take a question. So if you could take your seat. Hon member Schäfer, will you take a question? The hon member is not prepared to take a question, kindly take your seat, please. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I would just like to gently remind the hon member on the other side that it is a unanimous committee report. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is not a subject for discussion. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Hon members, let us – hon member Schäfer, before you rise, can I just ask you all to manage yourselves. Let us respect the dignity and decorum of Parliament. I will allow the hon member to proceed. You may proceed, hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks, Madam Speaker. He has got a lot to say because he does not sit on the Committee, but let me just point out again that the Western Cape's Department of Environmental Affairs – well, let us go back, because I asked for specialised police units to combat poaching along our coast lines [Interjections.], trained community watch organisations and together with SAPS, re-establish a coordinated joint operation on a full-time basis. [Interjection.]

That also the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, of this Government, look at a dedicated Green Scorpions for

abalone poaching through CapeNature. That a provincial prosecuting body through Biodiversity Crime Unit be set up. That the Department of Social Development investigate and implement a focussed substance abuse intervention strategy in Hawston and Gansbaai, and that the Department of Agriculture, through the Skills Game-Changer and private partnerships, look into skills development programmes and agriculture learnerships for fishermen and women, and local municipalities must be encouraged to develop a by-law in line with the City of Cape Town's, to take over or oversee the management of the small boat harbours in Cederberg, Saldanhaai, Bergrivier, Overstrand, Cape Agulhas and Hessequa municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: You will not get there.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, marine protection services and ocean governance is also identified as one of the four growth areas in terms of Operation Phakisa, the ocean's economy. One of the initiatives under this priority was to protect the ocean environment from illegal activities and to promote its multi-social economic benefits with the results by 2017.

It is evidenced by reports in the media, as well as written and verbal testimonies provided by fishermen and women [Interjection.] both at our public hearings, that this has not materialised. Many traditional fishers from coastal communities are turning away from fishing for a number of reasons. These range from dwindling resources, a skewed allocation of fishing quotas

resulting in the exclusion of most fishers, and choosing poaching as a more lucrative form of income rather than legal fishing.

It is evident, Madam Speaker, that National Government has failed to deliver on this mandate to protect, manage and grow our marine resources...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What is the [Inaudible.].

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...in order for small scale fishing to be ecologically sustainable and economically profitable.

Ms P MAKELENI: And what have you done [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...we also ask here that Minister Winde and the Government of the Western Cape seriously consider the recommendations we made by this Committee in that report, as we can no longer continue to ignore the impact of poaching on the plight of our people, on the future of our youth, subjected to growing up in this crime-infested environment and the future of the ocean's economy of the Western Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Nkondlo. Hon member Nkondlo, before you speak, hon member Makeleni, you have a speaker on the floor, if I may ask you. Interjections are allowed, but not an ongoing commentary. Thank you. You may proceed hon member Nkondlo.

Mr D G MITCHELL: She can interject now.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Good afternoon, Madam Speaker. Let me first give special greetings to my fellow women and yourself as the Speaker during this women's month. †Malibongwe. [Let them be praised.] [Interjections.]

The report of the Standing Committee presented to this House today presents the reality of the South Africa we are today, and indeed a long road to prosperity for all. The persistence of inequality and opportunities remains a stagnant feature of our colonial legacy.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, gooi. Gooi.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, throw. Throw.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Democracy alone is not enough if it cannot guarantee social economic rights of all citizens.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You better listen now.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The extent and effects of abalone poaching brings this

reality to us all at this stage in our country. Abalone poaching has been linked to transnational crime syndicates which exchange this resource for drug trade. Thus the connection mirrors street gangs and drug trade in our province. This places more priority on our efforts to fight drugs and crime in our communities, moreover as the source of this is poverty and inequality.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Very refreshing. [Inaudible.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: A cooperative governance approach yields better results as envisioned by our own Constitution, to eliminate unnecessary competition, party politicking at the expense of service delivery to citizens.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Schäfer.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The Eastern Cape Government is case in point where they led a successful abalone ranching done by community members and business people. They employ women and young persons. The Provincial Government, municipalities with harbours, and the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries are working together to create jobs and uplift members of the community in capacity building programmes which enable them to become owners of abalone ranches.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Eastern Cape? Wow!

Ms N D NKONDLO: The implementation of the small scale fisheries policy

must be fast-tracked to realise its objective - that of ensuring that small scale fishing communities maximise the benefit from the resources and other main beneficiaries.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You look embarrassed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: In this regard we must welcome the over R400 million that National Treasury has allocated for the refurbishment of 12 small harbours in the Western Cape, to resource the Department of Public Works' Development of Small Harbours Programme, which includes security upgrades. This is important and will go a long way, because improving physical infrastructure is indeed important in realising the intentions of the small scale fisheries policy.

It is also important, Madam Speaker, that through the Committee we agreed that the Provincial Department, through Minister Winde and also the relevant LED or municipalities, should be seized with the task of enabling small fishermen and women with the requisite capabilities so that they are able to maximise the opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good. They must do their work.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Now will taking over... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...and grandstanding in this House help to realise prosperity for all?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is Schäfer.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The marine resources indeed, hon members from the other side of the House, are a national competence, and the MLRA Act supersedes any by-law. So it is important for us as we engage in this programme, we understand that as a fact. We also know regarding the ocean's economy and the Programme Phakisa that here in the province the DA led Government has decided to call Khulisa, it does not help South Africans when all of us, when we have to realise our responsibility, portray a toddler mentality that comes to the House to grandstand and throw tantrums.

So it is important that we provide evidence of our capability, because amongst others, it is in this House that we have been asking for clear and a targeted SMME and localisation programmes beyond the red tape that are always told about.

In conclusion, Madam Speaker, we have to do more as Government, across all spheres and tiers, to give true meaning to the realisation of an inclusive economy, where race, gender and class cannot be the basis of one's socio-economic standing. I thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi, mooi! [Applous.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, good, good! [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] kwa-kwa-kwa-kwa!

The SPEAKER: Can we – hon member Magaxa, it is good to see you back in the House. Could we have some order, please? Thank you. [Interjections.] Order, please. Hon members, I am certain you can engage after – since you missed the hon member Magaxa, after the sitting, please. I see the hon member Christians. You may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, from the onset I must say I do not sit on this Committee [Interjection.] but this topic ... [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: This topic is in the public domain and in the interest of the people of the Western Cape, and that is why I want to throw my one minute in.

Madam Speaker, I want to thank the Committee, because public participation is important, but I think it is also important that we must agree at the moment National Government is failing us. They are not looking after our harbours and abalone and crime is increasing, and if this is decentralised, it will be

better for the people of the Western Cape. That is a fact. [Interjections.] That is a fact. The member now wants to mention a few renovations and stuff. There is a lot to be done at our harbours and our ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And from your side.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...fishing community is suffering. [Interjections.] Is suffering, because, as I believe, certain quotas are given to pals and friends and people that are connected to the ANC. That is the problem, Madam Speaker, and our people are dying out. Fishermen that were involved for years are no longer gainfully employed, and now are doing illegal abalone and all of those things. It is happening on the coast.

An HON MEMBER: So what are you suggesting?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But we must support the Committee and support their recommendations. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians.

†Mnr L H MAX: Gooi kole!

[Mr L H MAX: Throw coals!]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can we have a semblance of order, please. Thank you. [Interjections.] I now see the hon, the Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very, very much, Madam Speaker, and first of all, can I say that I really welcome this report. Obviously, and I will end off with how we as Government will need to deal with it once this Committee has finished the deliberation and obviously landed it with us, but I really do welcome it, because, as you have heard from some of the speakers, we have communities, specifically communities in our small towns, that are around our small harbours, that really are suffering.

There is huge pain and the reason for that pain is because of really shocking management, and we have had the word “failure” a number of times today already in this debate, and of course it is that absolute failure of the ANC Government at a national level, that caused this Standing Committee to go out and hold these public hearings, because it is such a disaster out there and having such a profound effect on families, on society out there, specifically around our coastal towns.

So I want to thank the Committee for doing the oversight, for going out there and having a look, and coming back with a whole range of reports, solutions and suggestions that we need to take up as Government, and I sincerely hope that the National Government also takes this report very seriously.

One of the areas of focus is skills, and I agree with it and you will know that it is a Game-Changer within the province, and I went to have a look already to see where we are already through the Skills Game-Changer, and I see that already through some of the aquaculture companies, Abagold, HIK and Doringbaai Abalone, we are already involved in skills programmes with those companies, because we do believe that first of all direct skills in aquaculture is one of the areas where we are going to really empower communities along the coastline, and we will definitely take this into a process to see how we can expand on it in line with the report.

There is a lot of noise around small boat harbours and it was very interesting listening to the first ANC input into this debate. Of course they were part of this oversight, and I am going to be really looking forward to the hon member Tyatyam's reply to this debate and to what I am going to raise right now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: First of all, we heard about the money that the National Public Works has given to Public Works for fixing these small boat harbours. Now obviously the hon member has been here for a few years in the House, but has not been listening, because this has been raised countless number of times.

Do you know that the National Public Works gave money for the provincial harbour, small boat harbours to be fixed up, because a lot of them are in

really shabby looking state, belonging to National Public Works, but who did they give it to? Not to the Minister or the Department of Public Works in the province. They give it to the Coega IDZ in the Eastern Cape to come and fix the harbours in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Now first of all, how on earth does that work from an oversight point of view? Is this Committee going to go and have oversight at the Coega space to see what work they are doing in this province? I mean, that is the first basic around governance and financial management, and what is it? A total failure. That is why we are having this discussion, because of a failure at national level, and everything that they try to do, they fail again. So that is a total failure. So it will be interesting to see whether the hon member Tyatyam can quickly Google the National Department [Interjections.] and find out why they did it.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The second point as raised by the ANC was this blurring between Phakisa and Khulisa. How many years have you been in the House? Khulisa is the Western Cape project that looks at growing the tourism industry, the agri-processing industry and the oil and gas industry.

We as a government are very involved [Interjections.] in Operation Phakisa. We are key partners in that. We go to all these meetings. The problem is they

have all this nice talk, but you see very, very little action. In actual fact if you think about the small boat harbours and this specific issue, on 22 July 2014, and that was only when I got involved in this Department, but prior to that, we all know of the study on the 12 small boat harbours and for years and years – in actual fact, in excess of eight years this Government has been trying to engage with the National Departments, around small boat harbours. And still today, eight years later, there is no action, the money is given to some agency in the Eastern Cape, and we do not really see action around enabling an environment of small harbours that are actually going to make a difference to people on the ground where they live.

What do we do instead? How do we fail? We give fishing quotas to people in Pretoria, as we have heard earlier, friends, mates – we all know it, but what I am going to say in this House... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are supposed to be the best DA [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...is that in actual fact what we really would like, is we would like the responsibility of our coastline passed to this province.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Let us get the responsibility of this passed to this province. We

have heard a lot of noise about, “Well, show us what you have done.” Give us the responsibility and we will show you what we will do with fishing quotas, with small boat harbours, with really creating an enabling environment for growth and jobs, because where we do have that competency, every single time we report back to this House, we report on growth and jobs in those environments... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...where we have the competency [Interjection.], but it is failing wherever the ANC has that competency. [Interjection.]

I want to then also end off by saying, Madam Speaker, that obviously a report like this has to be taken, number one, very, very seriously. So I can confirm that this Government will take the report from the Standing Committee very seriously. We will obviously land it in our Departments, some of it talks to my colleague in Safety and Security, some of it talks to my colleague in Public Works, in Local Government. It actually comes through to a lot of our departments here in the Western Cape. We will take it into planning process. We are going into those MTEC planning processes, and where those competencies lie, we will definitely take it seriously so that we can see if we can land some of these suggestions in our own budget, seeing as they are not able to land them in national budgets. The National Department keeps on failing the people of our province involved in fishing. [Applause.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You said that a long time ago.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They are useless!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that all?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They are useless!

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members.

The SPEAKER: Hon members Davids and Magaxa. Order, please. Hon members, let us not get into mudslinging and name calling. We are to remain honourable in our intentions, please. Let me not get back to the Rules and the dignity and decorum of this House. The hon member Bernard Joseph is not here. I do not know if he is still on his way. So I would like to recognise the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Madam Speaker. †Minister, u wil nie hoor nie. [Minister, you do not want to listen.] I can see. [Interjections.]

The Department of Agriculture, Forest and Fisheries is mandated by the Marine Living Resource Act of 1998. Section 7, 9, 12, 39, 45, 47, 50 and 77... [Interjection.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What are they doing [Inaudible.].

Mr S G TYATYAM: Note that in the case of conflict in any of the legislation, the MLRA prevails when it comes to the management of marine resources and proclaimed fishing harbours. Therefore it means the cities can pass their laws, but the cities cannot infringe on the mandate of government to manage harbours, as these are under the management of the National Government Department. [Interjections.] That you must internalise. It will help you. [Interjections.] How does a provincial government that is struggling to fulfil its duties, want to take more responsibilities?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Do you believe that?

Mr S G TYATYAM: When already you cannot support small fishing communities. Where...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Do you support them?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Where is the assistance given to local communities?

Mr D JOSEPH: That is our mandate.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You do not that. [Interjections.] No. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are wasting his time now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member Tyatyam, just one second. Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Is the hon member prepared to take a question?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, you are not... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: SMS. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you prepared?

Mr S G TYATYAM: He can SMS, I will respond.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer appears to be no, Minister Winde.

Ms P MAKELENI: Send an SMS.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The DA just wants to take over national competencies at the expense of service delivery and under-expenditure [Interjections.] to try and compete with National Government.

Ms M N GILLION: Exactly.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Spending money on services already available in this case, you know. Therefore the DA must stop trying to push by-laws through local municipalities to try and take over harbours. It is not going to happen. It is a futile exercise.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But you are failing.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are exposed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But you are failing.

An HON MEMBER: Miserably.

Mr D JOSEPH: We want to help you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: This operation of small harbours will cost residents of those municipalities more in taxes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is costing them now.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] a great job.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It will cost more in tariffs. So do not try and put more burdens on our people. [Interjections.] It is important that our province must... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: What are the skills?

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...advance in cooperative governance, which is where we are failing in this province, to say the least. [Interjections.] Just yesterday, hon member Schäfer will tell you, we were at the APHA where the province was contradicting the City of Cape Town. They do not talk together.

You must stop those things. I am just asking you. Do your work properly. [Laughter.][Interjections.] You know? The point that we agree, we agree that the levels of poaching are a problem, but because of the new processes and the resources that have been put there, you can check in the last four weeks what has been happening. There has been a lot of arrests in relation to illegal poaching, if you do not know. [Interjection.] I can assist you and your

Department to feed you with that information.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Give one example.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Let me also say, Minister, you were complaining about Coega being given this responsibility, but Coega is already involved here in this province. The Saldanha IDZ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Coega is already intervening there, because they have the skill. [Interjections.] They have the skill, they have the know-how, they have done good in PE. That is why... [Interjection.] ... Wesgro decided they cannot run that thing, they must ask Coega to intervene. [Laughter.][Interjections.] So that is what is happening, thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. May I just respond to my colleague over on the other side of the House? Mandated or not mandated, through you, hon member Tyatyam, the scandals of National Government really are so extensive, they run so deep that actually this Government instead of taking the money to spend on the essential services that we have to

spend and that we should be spending on, have to take the money and fix up your mess. [Interjections.]

So the point is really that we are not mandated, but we are forced to actually look at the issue. But the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture has brought this report to be tabled by this Western Cape Provincial Parliament for review at the National Council of Provinces, because we do believe that this issue cannot be left at this level. It has to go right through, all the way to the National Assembly.

We want this crime to be investigated along each and every coastline in our country, just to assess the impact of this illegal activity on our communities, and we would also like, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, to hon member Tyatyam, further investigation into the selling of confiscated abalone by DAFF, and the report serves as an incentive for all provinces to hold our National Ministries to account in the wake of an evident and blatant failure to serve our people.

The poaching of abalone is just one of a slew of issues facing this South Africa, which our Government has seemingly ignored. We cannot allow our National Government to continue ignoring the needs of South Africa at the peril of her people. This must be investigated. But before I conclude, Mr Deputy Speaker, I really would like to thank my Standing Committee and my Committee Coordinator, Zahieda, for her work in producing this report. It is rather extensive. It is close to 100 pages and it took many months of hard

work.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I hereby table the Standing Committee report on the impact of abalone poaching on small scale fishing communities, for consideration by this House. I thank you. [Applause.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debate on this report. Are there any objections to the report being adopted by the House? Is there an objection from the ANC? [Interjections.] The ANC's dissension will be recorded. [Interjections.][ANC dissenting.]

We then proceed to Interpellations. [Interjections.] The first interpellation, hon Minister Bredell. I see hon Minister Bredell.

INTERPELLATIONS

Knysna, allegations of corruption in

- 1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether the allegations of corruption in Knysna have been brought to his attention; if so, what intervention has he taken?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie aan die agb lid vir die interpellasie. Die beweerde korrupsie in Knysna. Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die kort antwoord hierop is: Nee, ek weet nie. Ek het aan die agb lid geskryf, my kantoor het aan die agb lid geskryf op 26 en op 28 Julie per e-pos, om te vra kan ons meer inligting kry omdat ons ons eie oorsigrol baie ernstig opneem, en omdat ons ook die lede se oorsigrol baie ernstig opneem. Ek het die eerste oproep vandag 12:30 gekry van die agb lid, so nou weet ons ook hoekom hulle nie weet wat aangaan in die Staande Komitees nie, agb lid Wiley.

So wanneer ons klagtes ontvang dan gee ons altyd die munisipaliteit kans om hulle saak aan ons te stel, en dan sal ons Departement kyk na die feite en dan sal ons besluit op 'n forensiese ondersoek al dan nie. In hierdie geval is die kort antwoord: ongelukkig is ek nie bewus nie. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon member for the interpellation. The alleged corruption in Knysna – Mr Deputy Speaker, the short reply to this is: No, I do not know. It wrote to

the hon member, my office wrote to the hon member on 26 and 28 July via e-mail, to ask if we could get more information because we take our oversight role very seriously, and because we also take the members' oversight role very seriously. I received the first call today at 12:30 from the hon member, so now you know why they do not know what is going on in the Standing Committees, hon member Wiley.]

So when we receive complaints we always give the municipality an opportunity to put their case to us, and then our Department will look at the facts and then we will decide on a forensic investigation or not. In this case the short reply is: unfortunately I am not aware. Thank you.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ah ja, baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ons het nou gehoor die LUR vir Plaaslike Regering in die Wes-Kaap sê hy weet niks wat in Knysna gebeur nie. Hy sê self vir ons. Ons vra van korrupsie in Knysna, hy sê, "Ek weet niks nie." Dis die LUR [Tussenwerpsels.] vir Plaaslike Regering in die Wes-Kaap.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ah yes, thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. We have now heard from the MEC for Local Government in the Western Cape saying he

knows nothing about what is happening in Knysna. He tells us himself. We ask about corruption in Knysna, he says, “I know nothing.” That is the MEC [Interjections.] for Local Government in the Western Cape.] †We must be very worried. [Interjections.]

We must be very worried when an MEC says, “In order for me to know, you must tell me.” [Interjections.] That must be a big problem. [Interjection.] Really a problem. Because what it means - before I come to my issues - it means that the MEC is not hands-on about what is happening in this province. He knows he has got 30 municipalities and in his annual plan and strategic plan, he has got something about corruption, which we will go through, and we tick the boxes. Yet today he has been asked – the moment he got that question, he needed to stand up and go and find out what the issues are.

But let me help him. †Laat ek vir hom 'n bietjie help. In Knysna, LUR, daar is probleme oor korrupsie en een van daai probleme het ek self in hierdie Huis *during the annual report* vir u gevra. [Let me help him a bit. In Knysna, MEC, there are problems on corruption and one of those problems I myself asked you about in this House during the annual report.] I have in front of me about 12 allegations of corruption in Knysna by a citizen of that area, but I will not go through those 12. Let me just [Interjections.] – let me just take you to three first. Let me start with three. The first one is the illegal ISDF tender in Knysna.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: That is what I raised myself in the House with the MEC. †Vandag sê daai LUR vir ons, “Ek weet niks nie.” [Today that MEC tells us, “I know nothing.”] So he does not even know about this ISDF tender, which it is alleged that he is not far from himself. Maybe that is a reason why he does not know.

The second one that is being raised is the issue of the illegal appointment of Dawie Adonis. †Ek het daai ook self in hierdie Huis in ’n *motion ge-raise*. Dieselfde ding. Vandag, hy weet niks nie. Die derde... [Tussenwerpsel.] [I myself have also raised that in a motion in this House. The same thing. Today, he knows nothing. The third ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, your third one you can keep over for your next slot.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oukei, ek is op pad, ek kom terug.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, I am on my way, I am coming back.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Simmers?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek kom terug.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am coming back.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek wil net dankie sê dat mense laat weet wat die substansie van die vraag is, maar in elk geval...

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to say thank you that people indicate what the substance of the question is, but anyway...]

Mr Deputy Speaker, over the past few years there have been numerous allegations of corruption of which my colleague has now highlighted a few...

[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Start with the electricity.

Mr T A SIMMERS: ...of corruption levelled against Knysna Municipality. Yet no substantive information on the matters has been highlighted by any forensic unit or legal judgment to support such allegations. Sadly there are a few individuals who have taken it upon themselves to create a persistent misperception on the governance and effectiveness of this DA governed municipality.

The accolades that the Knysna Municipality have received from various National and Provincial Departments since 2011 to date, acknowledges the accountable and transparent governance the town and its satisfied ratepayers experience. A stark contrast to the intention of the vague allegations of corruption that is served before this House today. Shame, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Knysna is among the jewels in South Africa's tourism box. It attracts thousands of tourists each year. Until these allegations are substantiated with

facts about maladministration in the area, we have no reason to doubt the running of this area. †Gee die stawende feite, my kollega, dan praat ons weer. [Provide the facts to back it up, my colleague, then we can talk again.]

†Me M N GILLION: Wat van die Kaap? [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms M N GILLION: What about the Cape? [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Laat ek terugkom na die twee – MEC Bredell... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me come back to the two – MEC Bredell... [Interjection.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ja?

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes?]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: ...laat ons oor Dawie Adonis praat.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... let us talk about Dawie Adonis.]

†Do you know that since September 2016, the Knysna Municipality and council has failed to act on a complaint that he is unqualified for the position that he fills. Do you know that? †Dis nou Dawie Adonis. Dieselfde ding wat

ek hier gewys het in hierdie Huis *through a motion*. [That is Dawie Adonis. The same thing I showed here in this House through a motion.]

Do you know, MEC, about the tender itself? That the Knysna Creative Heads Consortium headed by Chris Mulder, a locally based major property developer, was granted the initial tender to plan the future of Knysna. Are you aware of that? [Interjection.] I am trying to help to get to this, because you said you do not know anything.

Mr M G E WILEY: You still do not know what is happening.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Did you read it on Facebook? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am reading to you. I will give you this when I am done. [Interjections.] Are you aware that when this issue was raised both you and Alan Winde failed to act? Do you remember this?

An HON MEMBER: We have answered.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is corruption that you do not know about.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We do not need to answer [Inaudible.]

read your emails.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We do not need to investigate that. You do not read e-mails..

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am trying to help the MEC. What is coming out clear just on these two cases, is that the DA goes around trying to be the champion of anti-corruption when it is happening in their own backyard. This best-run DA Government. They hide it, they pretend as if they do not know about it. They pretend as if they are clean, and now we are giving you some facts about all of these issues.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What are the facts? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you aware, MEC Bredell... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...that many of these issues have been brought even to

the attention of the Public Protector?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Is u bewus daarvan?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you aware of that?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: At least that one you know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired. The hon member Mackenzie.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek kom terug. [Tyd verstreke.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am coming back. [Time expired.]]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you for the debate. Mr Deputy Speaker, one can just start with interpellation and the question is whether the allegations of corruption in Knysna have been brought to his attention. If so what intervention has he taken?

Now what the Minister Bredell did was something probably out of the ordinary. He wrote to the hon member, his office wrote to him to ask him...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to substantiate his allegations. To this point he said he has got 12 allegations, but he has not substantiated or added any value to what he said in this interpellation.

So the hon member Dyantyi has actually wasted the time of this interpellation [Interjections.] because clearly from what he is saying now, there are no allegation been written, and Knysna Municipality is probably one of the most functional municipalities. They received four consecutive clean audits, many a festival and we have seen recently during the Knysna fires, how the community has come together to rebuild Knysna. [Interjections.]

So instead of helping to contribute to the rebuilding of Knysna and taking things forward, the hon member gives spurious allegations, no substantiation, he did not bother... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to respond to Minister Bredell's office, who wrote

to him... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: So clearly he has nothing to stand on. Thank you.

[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Hon member Dyantyi, your last two minutes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me just read the MEC a message from one of your councillors. Councillor Martin Young.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: How do we know you [Inaudible.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Dr Martin Young. In referring to a crime busting citizen, Mike Hampton, in Knysna. He says [Interjections.] – he says:

“You seem not to realise that you are in a no position to negotiate. I am surprised you even tried. We hold all the cards.”

This is a DA councillor.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI:

“And have all the power to make your life really and truly miserable.”

That is a DA councillor, threatening somebody who is fighting crime.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is what the Premier is doing to me now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And he says, he goes on:

“Jail is more than likely your next Knysna destination.”

That is a DA councillor. Now the question I want to ask – because they have not acted on that. These things are happening every day. Not only in Knysna, everywhere where the DA is in charge. I want to ask the MEC the question: Do you think Mike Hampton is out of his mind for raising these issues?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is he insane? †Is hy mal? [Is he insane?]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please give me that, that this person is not to be taken

seriously, and the second point I want to make, to help you, would you be prepared, MEC Bredell, to call for an SIU investigation in Knysna, to get to the bottom of all of these issues instead of just rubbing these things off, that there is no problem, there is no corruption. Would you do that? So that at least you know, †want u weet mos nie. [because you of course you do not know.]

An HON MEMBER: He cannot investigate himself.

Ms P MAKELENI: He will never.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order. Order. Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I would like to refer this House to three recent investigations, where the Provincial Forensic Team went in and did sterling work to get to the bottom of the alleged corruption.

These include Oudtshoorn, Kannaland and Beaufort West. I wonder if the hon member Richard Dyantyi would like to explain what those three councils have in common. You see, they are all ANC run councils. [Interjections.] Now the problem that I have got ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi, order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem that I have got is that if any member in this Parliament is aware of any corruption, they should go to the police and lay a charge, otherwise they are guilty of corruption.

†n AGB LID: Ons het daai gedoen.

[An HON MEMBER: We did that.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And you have not done that. Okay.

On the Knysna issue; the Knysna issue was investigated by the Public Protector, it was investigated by my Department, it was investigated or they appeared twice before the Standing Committee [Interjection.] or the Petition Committee in National Parliament.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They themselves [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There was an outcome and the outcome sometimes is “no”. No is an answer, Mr Deputy Speaker, but Richard... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Soos... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Like... [Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...the hon member wants to make politicking out of a lot of rumours. If he has got facts he must lay a charge at the police station. I am not going to pronounce if members of the public are insane or not. Members of the public have got the right to write to us, to put their concerns on the table, and we will need to be fair and listen to the other side. We will investigate if necessary, and we will come to a conclusion. We will not sweep any kind of corruption under the carpet. We, as a Department... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Is jy seker?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you sure?]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...will act, irrespective of the political party that is in charge or not.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons sal krap waar julle [Onduidelik.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will scratch where you [Inaudible.]]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We appreciate the public...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order. Minister – hon member Dyantyi, please calm down a little bit. Give the Minister a chance to respond now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Have you met the brother?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We always appreciate the public's involvement in our councils, their comments and because they also do have an oversight role over us, and that is a very serious role.

But we must also acknowledge the fact that the council is doing very good work. We have seen it in the current disaster. So you see, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a pity that the hon member Dyantyi, who could not tell us beforehand so that we can prepare a docket for him... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister...

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...and come to this House, then we would have dealt with it. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell, your time has now expired, and the time for this interpellation is finished.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ja.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand there is an arrangement that Interpellation 2 be withdrawn. We then move onto Interpellation 3. Hon member Botha to Minister Fritz. I see hon Minister Fritz.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nee, daai is 'n *sweetheart question*.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, that is a sweetheart question.]

Youth Cafés, accessibility to disabled young people

3. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether Youth Cafés are accessible to disabled young people so that they can also access the various skills development opportunities at these cafés?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. It is quite a serious matter that the hon member is raising. I want to start off by saying that one of the biggest challenges, Mr Deputy Speaker, is the whole issue of

accessibility in all buildings, in all our Government buildings. This question specifically pertains to Youth Cafes and out of all the Youth Cafes that we have, unfortunately we get buildings from municipalities and some places you cannot find buildings. Hon member Makeleni will tell you how difficult it is just to get venues that are conducive for youth work in a particular area.

So unfortunately of the eight Youth Cafes that we have there is only one that is fully accessible for people living with disabilities, and if we talk about accessibility in terms of people living with disabilities, we are not just talking wheelchairs. We are talking all other kinds of disabilities.

An HON MEMBER: Like what?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Like people who are blind and having particular patterns against the wall that assist them with moving around, for people who are hearing impaired to be able to look at signs. So it is a bit broader, hon member of ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] I am impressed [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, thank you. The recently launched Groot Brak Youth Café, which is a newly built one, where one could build in new specifications to deal with people living with disabilities. That is fully accessible for people living with disabilities, and we are very, very proud of that specific one, right up to, you know, the toilet

facilities and wheelchair accessibility for that.

Mr R T OLIVIER: At least there is no alcohol or anything in the Youth Cafés.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, what?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No alcohol.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, unfortunately not. [Interjections.] Sorry? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Only at schools.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Only at universities. Through the disability desk led by Mr Jeremy Opperman, the Department is already in the process of assessing all our local and regional office and Youth Cafés. I want to make this point, because you know the work that Mr Jeremy Opperman has already done with accessibility, and you can ask Minister Grant, who is not here at the moment, how he pressurised the whole Public Works Department to assist with making buildings accessible. [Interjections.]

This assessment that he is busy with will continue and we will continue also to invest and to do a kind of retro fitting of all our buildings, specifically Youth Cafés, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Lorraine Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thanks to the Minister. I want to say that for one or other reason there is always a tendency to neglect those who are vulnerable and disabled in our society, and the unfortunate reality is that this is seen in various sectors and across the board.

Now I have to commend you, Minister, and your Department for establishing seven Youth Cafés in the province so far, with the recent one being opened in Southern Cape Community of Groot Brak Rivier. It is also pleasing to see communities such as George, Oudtshoorn, Mitchells Plein, Vangate, Nyanga Junction and Vrygrond are all benefitting from the various initiatives and programmes at these Cafés.

I have to congratulate you and your Department for ensuring that the Nyanga Youth Café not only has components of the MOD Centre, but it is also fully accessible to people who are physically disabled, and it is imperative that we continue to send the message out to our young people, that our facilities cater for youth needs as well.

We should further continue to make our communities aware that our facilities are open to any person, regardless of their situation or circumstance. In fact, the message we should be driving home through our Youth Cafés is that this facility has been established to improve young lives.

It is vital that every single Youth Café, whether established or still in the pipeline, be user friendly for all our disabled youth. We have an opportunity to also improve their lives, so let us build that wheelchair ramp, Minister, if we have not done so. Let us build the railing if we have not done so. Let us ensure that there is a bathroom that can be used by a physically disabled person. Let us also ensure, Minister, that computer programmes are installed for the visually impaired.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Makeleni.

†UNksz P MAKELENI: Enkosi Sekela Somlomo. UMphathiswa namhlanje usixelela ngento yokuba le Nkqubo yeeYouth Café ingaba nendawo enye kuphela apho abantu abatsha abakhubazekileyo.... Ngoko azilungiselelwanga ukusetyenziswa ezi Youth Café. Kunjalonje kudala ndithetha, ndiphakama mhla nezolo kule Palamente into yokuba iiYouth Café kule meko zikuyo azizinzanga. Umzekelo yinto yokuba iYouth Café bayayivala okanye bayayivula eMitchells Plain. Enyanisweni imali abayichitha kwiiYouth Café abakwazi kuyilinganisa ngenyanga ukuba yimalini na abayichithayo yaye bangenza njani ukuqinisekisa ukuba iiYouth Café ziyakhula ngokwezicwangciso zeSebe. Okwesibini, siva into yokuba ezi Youth Café azifikeleleki kanye kwaba bantu batsha bezilungiselelwe bona, yaye andiqinisekanga ke ngoku ukuba ngubani lo sizenzela yena ezi Youth Café xa kanti abona bantu batsha kuluntu lwethu abakwazi ukufikelela kuzo. Enyanisweni ezi Youth Café azikwazi kulinganisa ukuba ngoobani ezibancedayo kwaye sele zince abantu abangakanani, kodwa imali yona

sixakekile siyayigalela. Ndicela uMphathiswa ukuba akhe asinike into ebhadlileyo sive yokuba ngoku ukubheka phambili ukuba sithini isicwangciso sokuqinisa ezi Youth Café, enyanisweni azikhuphe kuzo zonke iindawo zoluntu ngoba iiYouth Café zona ziyimfuneko, kodwa ndisoloko ndimxelela ukuba makahlale phantsi asijonge isigqibo anokuthi asithathe ngezi Youth Café ngoba uzingxamele yena kuba engenasicwangciso sisiso solutsha lwaseNtshona Koloni.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The MEC today tells us that the Youth Pafé programme has only one place where youth with disability can access them. Therefore these Youth Cafes are not user friendly. And I have long been standing up and talking for days on end in this Parliament that the Youth Cafes in their current form are not sustainable. An example is [Inaudible.] they open or close in Mitchells Plain. In fact they cannot quantify the money they spend on Youth Cafes per month and how they can ensure that the Youth Cafes grow according to the plans of the Department. Secondly, we hear that these Youth Cafes are not accessible to the very young people they were meant for, and I am not sure now who we made these Youth Cafes for if the very youth in our society cannot access them. In fact these Youth Cafes cannot quantify who exactly they are helping and how many people they have helped, but we are busy pumping in money. I appeal to the MEC to please give us something sensible and tell us what his plan is now going forward to strengthen these Youth Cafes. In fact

roll them out in all communities because Youth Cafes are really needed, but I often tell him to sit down and look at the decisions he makes about these Youth Cafes because it seems he is in a hurry as he has no plan for the youth of the Western Cape.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, mooi.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, good.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As far as the built environment is concerned, it is important to note that it should be barrier free, accessible and adapted to fulfil the needs of all people equally. As a matter of fact, the needs of persons with disabilities coincides with the needs of all persons.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Youth Cafés in this province should offer the opportunity for all young people to be integrated into becoming active participants in a society, and lead a life they value. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, that being said, it is also important to note that in some exceptional cases, this is not possible due to the actual structure or buildings available for the use and the implementation of the Youth Café model.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can leave that to the MEC. You are not the MEC.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He must explain himself.

Mr D G MITCHELL: I am confident that we will remain focused on providing a whole of society approach to dealing with the societal problems facing young persons with disabilities in this province. Although more can always be done within the limited scope of the allocated budget, I am confident that all our programmes and initiatives being implemented for the youth, with the working partnership with various stakeholders in the Western Cape, will ensure that every person living with a disability, is accorded the very same rights we celebrate and enjoy, that they are empowered to lead lives they value. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Makeleni.

†UNksz P MAKELENI: Sekela Somlomo oogxa bam apha bayavuma ukuba ayamkelekanga into yokuba, enyanisweni nam ndifuna ukuxhasa ukuba akwamkelekanga ukuba ulutsha lwethu olukhubazekileyo lungakwazi ukufikelela kwiiYouth Café. Enyanisweni akukho nto ingunobangela. UMphathiswa yena sifuna ukuva ukuba uza kwenza ntoni ukususela ngoku ukubheka phambili ukuqinisekisa ukuba ulutsha lwethu luyakwazi ukufikelela kwezi Youth Café kuba ndicinga ukuba zenzelwe bona, hayi thina bantu badala. Ngolu hlobo lokuba xa ndijongile kwezi Youth Café iba ngabantu abadala, hayi ulutsha.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Ms P MAKELENI:Mr Deputy Speaker, my colleagues here agree that it is unacceptable that, in fact I too want to stress that it is not acceptable that our disabled youth cannot access Youth Cafes. In fact there is no justification, there is no excuse. We want to hear from the MEC what he is going to do from now going forward to ensure that our youth can access these Youth Cafes because I think they have been made for them, and not us adults. When I look at these Youth Cafes there are always adults, not the youth.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is clear to me that there is a true desire from the Minister and his Department to ensure that our disabled young people also have... [Interjection.] access to these fantastic opportunities he highlighted.

The various partnerships that his Department has with the NGO sectors, such as the Sozo Foundation in Vrygrond, Wonderful SA Foundation in Groot Brak, RLabs in Vangate Mall and Mitchells Plain, Amandla, EduFootball in Nyanga and SUFF in George and Oudtshoorn, also indicate how important they find it to ensure that these sectors who do amazing work in our communities are included.

Mr Deputy Speaker, my hope however is that as the Youth Café programme is

expanded in the future, we will also see more partnership with NGOs working with disabled young people. I do think the Minister would agree with me that this will ensure that more of our vulnerable and disabled young people would therefore find it easier to access the fantastic opportunities that are available at the Youth Cafés.

We have an opportunity to continue building that inclusive society by ensuring that our disabled youth are not left behind. I would like to ask the Minister how many disabled youth thus far have successfully accessed the Youth Cafés and of that number, how many of them have found meaningful and sustainable jobs through the Youth Cafés?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Fritz to respond.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I just want to make a very important point, and I see a lot of our speakers today spoke about the most vulnerable. For the record I think one of our first priorities in everything we do is to actually look at the most vulnerable people in our society, but we also believe, ladies and gentlemen and hon members, that we need to look at - in Mitchells Plain specifically - the needs for disabilities. Look at what we need to cater for all the youth who are there, and let me just give you a practical example. One of our next Youth Cafés that we plan and I hope - possibly not this financial year - is the Worcester Hub.

Now we also know Worcester is the capital of people living with disabilities.

There we have already gone into discussions with Apple around the amazing work that they have been doing around people who are blind, but also deaf and – sorry?

Ms S W DAVIDS: What are you doing about the seven?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can you just listen to what I am saying, because one of the members is asking me what the future plans are. Now did he not just ask me what our future plans are? Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

You know, sometimes I must take a chill pill when I come to this House. Not some, not in the green variety, in something other variety. Hon member Davids. So the point I am making – I just want to make the point to all the speakers that of course we will focus and make sure. We work in Government, you know, we are having a huge fight in our own Government to get accessibility... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons weet daai.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We know that.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...for our own people.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So we are moving, but Rome was not built in one day. We must continue to progressively realise the needs

of all our people.

I also want to make the point that inclusivity will always be the priority for us. We will be inclusive and the hon member Botha asked how many people. There is a whole lot. I know of a couple personally, nè, and it is not only wheelchair bound people. There are also people who – I remember one young person who I personally interacted with, who had Cerebral Palsy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And that kind of interaction...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, just finish off, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That kind of interaction is continuing. I want to again say, we will do everything to make it inclusive and we will get there. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, your time has now really expired. That is the end of that interpellation.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Questions on the Question Paper, Question number 1 to the Premier. Hon Premier.

An HON MEMBER: hear-hear!

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Commission of inquiry into violent crimes against children

1. Ms P Makeleni asked the Premier:

In the light of the rising number of violent rapes of children and child murders, whether she will reconsider the establishment of a commission of inquiry into the matter; if not; why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed. The premise of the hon member's question is incorrect. No decision has yet been taken on a commission of inquiry into child killings.

On 6 July 2017 my office issued a media statement pointing out that reporting by mainly independent media on this matter was inaccurate and the NGOs seeking publicity on the matter were being economical with the truth. I have the entire media statement here, spelling out exactly what the facts of the matter are.

Late in May a group of NGOs came to see me to ask me to establish a commission of inquiry into child murders. I said all the information that had come to me to date pointed to children being murdered by people they know within the confines of their homes.

This is very, very difficult to police, by definition, and equally you have a situation where many of these cases have been investigated very fully and the perpetrators found so there is a vast body of information that currently exists. I said if there is any indication that indeed a further commission of inquiry would help to find out more information or how to resolve this particular issue, I would be very interested in looking at it but I first had to establish that, because it takes a very long time and a lot of money and a lot of planning to set up a commission of inquiry, and at the beginning, it is worthwhile knowing that some real value will come out of it. So I said, and I asked them if they would please forward to me six cases that they had in mind, which we would then get experts to investigate in detail to look at all the common factors in those killings, all the variables, all the unanswered questions and all the challenges in trying to prevent child murders and if we felt that there was information that could not be gained in any other way but through a commission of inquiry, then we could go ahead and establish one.

I said the investigation by experts would be rapid and quick and could happen immediately, unlike the long drawn out process of establishing a formal commission. We had a very cordial conversation. They left with the undertaking that they would send me the names of six cases that they wanted

an urgent investigation on, and I am yet to receive those names.

Instead, I am afraid, statements have been made. Allegations have been made that have absolutely no foundation and the purpose seems to be simply to get publicity on the matter. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Uh-uh, do not go there.

The PREMIER: I think... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do not go there.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, you can go.

Ms M N GILLION: Uh-uh, we do not play with the people [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Allow the Premier to continue please.

Ms M N GILLION: We do not play politics.

The PREMIER: It should also be noted, Mr Deputy Speaker that the Institute of Race Relations has said that nearly 900 children were murdered in South Africa between 2015 and 2016, 900 children.

Professor Shanaaz Matthews of UCT said on *Cape Talk* that the numbers are slightly higher in the Western Cape than in other provinces, but it is a serious problem throughout South Africa. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is actually very high...

The PREMIER: ...and I have not noticed any pressure on National Government to appoint a commission of inquiry. Professor Matthews said that children under the age of five... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Your DA does not do work... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...are most vulnerable... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is their problem.

The PREMIER: ...and that it is these children that are most likely to be killed at home. Too often children are killed by someone that they know and someone that their parents have left them with and this is the conclusion of an expert into this particular issue. So if our research into six particular cases, that can be chosen by the NGO sector, illustrates to us that we can find more information and a feasible course of action, potentially, by appointing a commission of inquiry, I will do so. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, follow-up.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. †Ndiyacinga ukuba umama ka...[Akevakali.] usapho lwakwa Ruiters, nabo bonke abazali abanabantwana abancinci abakhulayo kweli phondo, ngenene bayafuna ukwazi ukuba bangenza ntoni na ukuze le meko iphele.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[I think the mother of ... [Inaudible.] of the Ruiters family and all the parents who have little children who are growing up in this province, are really wanting to know what they can do to have the situation stopped.]

†And all we need to know, will you consider doing it and if not, why not, just based on the commission of inquiry, I hear the story of the NGOs and all but at this point in time I am sure this question represents †ngumbuzo wabo bonke oomama nootata abakhulisa abantwana. [It is a question from all mothers and fathers who are bringing up children.]

The PREMIER: Okay, the first part of the question was that many parents, including the Ruiters family, of children who have been murdered, want to know what is happening about it to stop this in future and the challenge here is... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is very good translation. Get to the answer. Good translation. Now get to the answer.

The PREMIER: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

†INKULUMBUSO: Ndithetha isiXhosa. Ndithetha isiXhosa mna.

[The PREMIER: I speak isiXhosa. I speak isiXhosa.]

†And I also got the end-bit but I will not translate that for you today. The bottom line is this: that if those families can help us by saying what the police or Government agencies could have done to prevent the killings of their children in the research that we want to do, it would be helpful. These cases have in the main been thoroughly investigated by the police. Most of the cases - not all, but most of the cases - have been resolved and it has been found that children are killed by people who their parents have left to look after them or by people who know the children well and the children have no reason to fear or distrust them.

Now that is a massive problem and when you ask the Government what the Government is doing about it, I have to be sure that there is potentially something that Government can do about it, rather than having a public spectacle and so I am very keen to research in depth including talking to the parents, six cases, so that we can see is there anything that further work

through a commission of inquiry could uncover and is there anything potentially that the Government can do that we are not doing.

Many of these cases also involve substance abuse. It is very difficult and we are doing all we can to try and change behaviour in relation to amongst other things substance abuse, but these issues that happened in the privacy of people's homes amongst people who know each other are incredibly difficult to police and prevent.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you hon Mr Deputy Speaker. A few years back the same Premier did not see any inquiry, the Khayelitsha inquiry too costly.

An HON MEMBER: Do not go there.

Ms M N GILLION: No, I am going there. I am going there. This inquiry, the commission of inquiry that was requested by civil organisations in the Western Cape, my question to the Premier is, is it true that the Premier said it will be too costly?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: No, it is not true. It is not true and I am very angry that they keep reporting it as such.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do you get angry?

The PREMIER: I do get angry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: You cannot.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue Premier. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Look who is talking! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order people, we are busy with a very important subject here.

The PREMIER: It is a very important subject indeed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: The reason that I appointed a Commission of Inquiry into Policing in Khayelitsha was because we had to find out why over 90 people had been killed in vigilante murders and what we could do about that.

Ms M N GILLION: 25 children is not enough?

The PREMIER: Now the reason that we could appoint a commission of inquiry was that we had done a lot of work beforehand. We found out that there were many unanswered questions and we went through a long process of about 18 months to two years before we were able to legally set up that commission. It proved to be very worthwhile because excellent recommendations came out of that commission of inquiry. The structure and the hierarchy of the police was adjusted in Khayelitsha. The issues that were at the root of the problem were addressed and as a result vigilante killings have dropped dramatically. They are almost non-existent today. So the point that I am making is this. There were a lot of things we did not know and did not understand and could not get to and, in the run-up to calling that commission, we found out what they were.

I have not said that establishing a commission to investigate the murder of children is too expensive. I have not said that at all. I said before we establish something that is so expensive, we must find out what questions we have unanswered, what answers we need to the questions and if there is any role a Government can play in the circumstances that are unearthed by the context of child murders. That is what I have asked.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Because it is in any case going to take time and a lot of time if you want to go through the legal process of establishing a commission. And the NGOs went out of the meeting with me very happy. They would

bring back six names. We would do the preliminary investigation and make a determination after that. So why do they not do that? Why are they jumping up and down, being economical with the truth, to put it very mildly... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes.

The PREMIER: ...instead of coming back and helping me get on with the process that they want.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

†'n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you Premier for that response. My follow-up, Madam Premier... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Good response, good response.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is it not so that the exercise of six case studies in rugby terms, kicking for touch, because why is it not important for you...

†'n AGBARE LID: Het jy die bal gesien?

[An HON MEMBER: Did you see the ball?]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...instead of spending three months time for case studies of six children and go straight to attending to the problem and establishing the commission. Why are you kicking for touch?

Mr M G E WILEY: No-no, you have a concussion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Madam Premier, if you want to respond to that one. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I hope you watch rugby. [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: I am not kicking for touch, because if we call a commission of inquiry we have to have proper terms of reference. We have to know what they have to investigate. We have to understand the issue that we want investigated very deeply and we have to understand if anything can be done by whom and what the questions are that are unanswered that still need to be addressed. We have to know that and so I need to get two or three experts who understand this field to go into it and let me know.

If they come up with a finding that says the variables are very limited, the common factors are very substantial, these are the common factors, and therefore what we need to do is look into this and this, then I will be able to

do it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can then put that in your terms of reference in a separate exercise.

The PREMIER: But you cannot just go blundering into things. You see Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

You see Mr Deputy Speaker, thus speaks a Minister in the Government of former Premier Rasool that blundered into commissions of inquiry that were thrown out by the courts twice, because they just blundered into them. They made announcements for political reasons and the courts threw them out. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are just like them... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And those established the precedents... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do not forget about that.

The PREMIER: Those established the precedents of how careful you have to be with establishing a commission of inquiry.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: If anybody can see that there is any possible political motive at all... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: The Erasmus Commission... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...just like we are seeing now from the ANC, it is null and void. [Interjection.] You have to know exactly which questions you want asked and answered and you have to go through the process properly.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You just had a commission now.

The PREMIER: It is starting a process to do this research and get it together and let us do that. Let us do that and let us stop playing politics with children's lives. Let us stop playing politics with the most vulnerable people in our society and when I have an agreement and a very cordial meeting with the NGOs it will be enormously helpful if they did not go out, twist my words and pretend that we do not care in this Government. We care profoundly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, the last opportunity. Then it is four.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. All in all the Premier is telling the parents of the Western Cape children that she is not going to establish the commission of inquiry. Is that what you are telling them?

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Listen now!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

*INKULUMBUSO: Andifuni nokuva.

[The PREMIER: I do not want to listen.]

†I have said nothing of the sort. Now you see, this is how things get totally distorted Mr Deputy Speaker, because I...

Mr C M DUGMORE: They think it is a joke.

The PREMIER: You see this is the problem. We are dealing with ...

[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: This is not a joke Premier. Children are dying here.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, exactly.

Ms M N GILLION: Ja, you are saying it is a joke.

The PREMIER: We are dealing with children who are dying, Mr Deputy Speaker, and we are dealing with heartbroken parents and to try and use them

as a political football by distorting... [Interjections.] ...by distorting my words... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: By distorting my words and by manipulating what I say are actually... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: And you must take responsibility for that one. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...are actually showing contempt and hypocrisy towards that community. I have met with the precise parents that you have mentioned. I have spoken to the two mothers that you referred to and I know the circumstances of those ghastly murders.

Mr D JOSEPH: Shame ANC, shame.

The PREMIER: The bottom line is this: I am not stalling. I am not kicking for touch. I am waiting for the NGOs to get back to me and I am not asking them... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are running away, Premier.

The PREMIER: I am not asking them... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: I am not asking them to do the research for me. I am asking the NGOs that came who represent the sector that is trying to look after children in various ways, to give me six cases and we would take it from there. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are running away.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms M N GILLION: So you are running away.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the second question. Hon Botha to Minister Mbombo. Minister Mbombo, Question 2. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, where is Minister Mbombo now? She is on holiday.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is her birthday.

An HON MEMBER: A birthday party. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She is never around.

Measles: prevention of outbreak

2. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Health:

With reference to the recent measles outbreak and reports that 29 people have been infected in the province, what measures have been put in place to address this and to prevent another incident like this in future?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for asking this important question related to the vaccines, which is very crucial. In terms of the 29 people related to the outbreak, the first thing that we did, because it happened at the three schools in Stellenbosch, what we did was to vaccinate all those who were closest to the point of the outbreak, so there are about 2 425 learners. Then the second phase was to vaccinate those that are outside the proximity, inclusive the Drakenstein area, for those children who are younger than five years old and we vaccinated about 15 500 learners. Then in addition to that in terms of the campaign for those children who are already being vaccinated as part of their normal routine programme between Feb and March, between May and June we also had campaigns where we vaccinated about 384 139 children, under five-year-olds, where we made about 82% of the coverage.

I think just to add is that the reason we were so prompt and swift in terms to respond to that, some of you might recall that the very first measles outbreak in South Africa, that was 1992, which I recall when I was still a student then, when we had 22 000 of the measles cases and then the next one was in 2009,

18 000 people. The outbreak I think was in Joburg in one of the schools there so that is why when we - this year 2017 - had three outbreaks, one in Cape Town, one in Gauteng and the other one in the North-West, we acted very swiftly because you do not want a repetition of what happened previously. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we move on? The next question is Question number 3, hon member Makeleni to Minister Fritz. Minister Fritz.

Death of baby at playschool in Hangberg, Cape Town

3. Ms P Makeleni to ask Mr A T Fritz, Minister of Social Development:

- (1) Whether his Department has established the circumstances that led to the death of a 23-month-old baby girl at a playschool in Hangberg, Cape Town; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether there was a delay in the registration of this facility; if so,
 - (a) why and
 - (b) what steps are being taken to ensure that similar incidents do not occur?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you once again for the question and you know, it is one of those serious questions; an unfortunate kind of question.

To the first part of the question. South African Police Service are in the process of determining the cause of death and we are awaiting their final report on that.

To the second part of the question, there was no delay in the registration of the facility. The facility is unregistered. That is the point and like other unregistered facilities at ECD Centres, it has received capacity building from us already and assistance in that regard specifically. To try and get them to meet the Children's Act, specifically the norms and standards of the Children's Act, given this specific incident the owner kind of temporarily suspended her operations at the centre although the Department insisted that she closes until we can get some clarity on where she is going legally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move on to the next question, Question 4. Hon member Dugmore to Minister Grant. Minister Grant.

Pedestrians being killed on roads

4. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What is his Department doing to reduce the number of pedestrians killed on roads in the province?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy

Speaker, I welcome this opportunity to speak about this important aspect of road safety. For the period 1 January 2017 until 21 July 2017 pedestrian deaths accounted for 46% of the total deaths of provincial roads.

The Safety Home Calendar is the Department's road safety marketing platform. The aim of the calendar is to coordinate road safety initiatives amongst those responsible for road safety in the province.

The calendar prioritises pedestrian safety in seven out of the ten road safety themes covered by the calendar. Safely Home is managed to sustain the momentum from the First Kiss Seatbelt TV commercial through the release of the Ubuthakathi in December 2016. This television commercial deals with pedestrians and alcohol and ran from December 2016 to March 2017.

This advertisement won international recognition when it was released in December 2016 coming second in ad forums pre-Christmas ranking of the best ads in the world.

Ubuthakathi is currently being re-screened on TV, in cinemas, on digital screens in taverns, commuter interchanges, inside taxis and at petrol station forecourts. It is also being promoted on Twitter, Facebook and on YouTube.

In the 2016 / 2017 financial year approximately R12.5 million, 63% of the budget was allocated to pedestrian road safety with the majority of the spend being on the distribution of Ubuthakathi in the media.

International acclaim and awards means very little, however, if impact is not being experienced on the ground. A return on investment analysis on Ubuthakathi is scheduled for March 2018. However, it should be mentioned that pedestrian fatalities statistics for 2017 have been very encouraging because 77 fewer pedestrians have died in the period 1 January 2017 to 21 July 2017, compared to the same period in 2016. This relates to a 16.27% decrease in pedestrian fatalities for this period.

In addition the Department also focuses on educational initiatives such as scholar patrols, community education in areas where there are identified hotspots and the distribution of visibility bands and tags to make pedestrians more visible.

Finally, from an infrastructure perspective road safety, which includes pedestrian safety, is taken into account with each and every road infrastructure project. For example we have just completed two projects, the Suid-Agter Paarl Road and Slent Road where pedestrian walkways mainly for schoolchildren have been built along the whole length of the two rural roads, i.e. about 15 kilometres in total length. This important topic and other initiatives were discussed in depth at a recent meeting in my Ministry involving my Department, the City of Cape Town and SANRAL.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask a

follow-up question and that is given that the Minister has mentioned the media campaign in particular the production of various videos which have been broadcasted in the media and as well as on social media; could the Minister indicate to us how much was spent on the aborted video which many people regarded as insulting to people from the Coloured community?

Mr M G E WILEY: That is a new question, I think.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I speak under correction, but I think it was nothing because it was donated and it was taken, when it came to my attention when I received a complaint, we took it off the website. It was not in the public domain. It was on YouTube on the website and we took it off so there was no cost to the taxpayer at all. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Hinana. I will give you another chance hon member Dugmore. First hon member Hinana.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is it not my question, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But it is not necessarily your chance for all the supplementaries. Hon member Hinana, I will come back to you.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister, many of the pedestrians that are involved in these road fatalities are said to be drunk. What contributory factor is alcohol... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Very good.

Mr N E HINANA: ...to the death on the roads of the pedestrians especially during the festive season and on weekends?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the statistics we get from the Department of Health mortuaries indicate that more than 60% of the pedestrians who die on our roads have ethanol in their blood.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, I will see you now.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to follow up by asking the MEC that given on the one hand that the province has an Alcohol Harms Reduction strategy that as your reply to hon member Hinana indicates that alcohol is a key issue in regard to pedestrians, and you yourself being a former MEC for Education, can you reconcile yourself with a view that there should be alcohol sold at schools, which could in fact contribute for instance if people might be leaving a school meeting after a function, that

it could contribute to the problem which we are talking about, so can you reconcile yourself with that proposal from your colleague MEC Schäfer and supported by the Cabinet? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, that is quite a clever question. I will leave it to the Minister if he wants to respond to it. It is not necessarily directly related to the question but Minister, you may respond.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, my understanding is that the issue would not have a direct effect on the children, because that is what your question implies.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And the adults... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Because the children obviously would not be sold alcohol under any circumstances at schools. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last question hon member Dugmore, then we are finished with this one.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, our understanding of the draft Bill is that this is about being able to sell alcohol to parents at functions which take place at the schools. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a different question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So I would like to ask you, do you think this has the potential to impact... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: After school.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...on the position of pedestrians, given that a lot of people in many communities, if this had to go through, could potentially walk from where they are... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, order, one second. You are asking the Minister for his opinion, which is first of all not allowed. Secondly, it is not related to his Department, I think, but the Minister can respond if he wants to. [Interjections.] The Minister does not wish to respond. Then we move on to Question number 5.

An HON MEMBER: It is not a relevant question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier to Minister Schäfer.

Western Cape Provincial School Education Amendment Bill: tabling of

5. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:

Which processes were followed in relation to tabling the Western Cape Provincial School Education Amendment Bill for consultation at the Council of Education Ministers?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is no specific process of requirements that a Provincial Bill be tabled at a CEM meeting, which is not a decision-making body. Likewise it is also not a requirement that CEM consult on such a bill. We have a provincial legislative process which we follow. In terms of this process the Bill was published in the *Government Gazette* for public comment on 25 August 2016.

Comments were processed, the Bill amended and it was approved by the Provincial Cabinet. However, subsequent negotiations have taken place in September 2016 with SGB Associations, the Principals Forum, South African Principals Association as well as the Teacher Union. The due date for submission of comments on the Bill was 23 September 2016.

Ms P MAKELENI: The DA benches are so empty today.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Busy caucusing... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On 6 October 2016 DBE shared information that unions were meeting with Minister Motshekga on the Bill. An e-mail was then sent to the Chief Director at DBE Legal... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No wonder it is so quiet.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...requesting information on the date of the meeting between teacher unions and Minister Motshekga. We received no response on this.

A meeting of EDCOM legal sub-committee were scheduled for 13 and 14 October 2016. Advocate Lynn Coleridge-Zils of our Department had placed the draft Bill on the agenda. This meeting was cancelled, not even postponed, as they said there was only one item on the agenda, which was our Bill.

The submission date of 27 October 2016 from DBE was only submitted to us on 12 December 2016, almost two months later and three months after the deadline. Notwithstanding, we took their comments into account.

On 10 April 2017 the acting SG, Mr Tau Matshidiso, made a presentation on the draft Bill at EDCOM. On 11 and 12 May 2017 Advocate Coleridge-Zils again placed the draft Bill on the EDCOM legal sub-committee agenda where she also made a presentation. It was placed on the previous CEM agenda and was withdrawn for further discussions between us and the Department. Thank

you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, do you want to follow up?

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC thank you for the response that there is no requirement or process to engage with the counterparts, but I think the question really was or intended to understand whether you did not view the advice or the support or the knowledge of other MECs with regards to alcohol on school premises, given that your national legislation on the Schools Act is really explicit on alcohol being prohibited at school.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The irony of the matter is that other provinces are calling to support my Bill because they require this provision in their provinces. The point is, it was there, it was published for public comment. Any province could and should have seen it for public comment and could have commented on it if they so wished. They did not do so and the fact of the matter is we do have policies in the Provincial Government which we have to continue to implement. This was discussed in detail with Cabinet with our Alcohol Harms Reduction Unit and if people do not want to raise their concerns through the public participation process, how much more must I do? It is being discussed and has been discussed with them subsequently

and they are welcome to put their views forward, but at the end of the day it is provincial legislation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up, hon Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to ask the Minister did the Department of Basic Education submit comments on the Draft Amendment Bill?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thanks hon member Botha. Yes, they did, three months after the deadline but as I say we did take them into account nonetheless. I have also had informal discussions with Minister Motshekga on the matter and as I say we have gone through a detailed process also on EDCOM where the Department itself withdrew the matter, cancelled the meeting, because they clearly did not regard it as important enough to make submissions and discuss it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Schäfer, have you in your own personal capacity had any discussions on the Bill with education stakeholders?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much hon member Kivedo for that question. The Department arranged various stakeholder meetings with

stakeholders, which I attended initially. I am just trying to find the dates for you. It was during September and October last year with the teacher unions as well as governing bodies, associations, principal associations, etcetera. So I attended all of those meetings initially to set the scene and then the Department engaged further with them. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That seems to bring us to the end of Questions. We move on to Questions to the Premier without Notice. The first question by the hon member Olivier.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:

Mr R T OLIVIER: Premier, the first question, yes, relevant to this last question here. Madam Premier, your Cabinet took a decision on the insertion of Section 45(B) of the Western Cape Schools Act. [Interjection.] I just want to ask from you Madam Premier, given the enormous challenge of alcohol abuse and social challenges brought about because of use of alcohol, did you support the decision in Cabinet for this insertion of this clause?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, we always have to look at the problem anything is trying to resolve, any amendment to a law is trying to resolve. The problem is this. Currently in all the provinces schools are holding fundraisers at night after school hours such as wine auctions and other things

to raise funds. They may have another event like a cheese-and-wine in which they would like to serve a glass of wine and all of these things are happening illegally at the moment. We either have the option of heavy-handed policing and we do not control the police, so we cannot send the police onto every school premises to check, and when there is real crime going on I would not want to use the police's time consistently in this way. So we discussed a process whereby this could be done legally rather than the illegality currently happening... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Across the country.

The PREMIER: And there has to be for example an application...
[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Are you going to legalise cocaine?

The PREMIER: ...and a process that has to be gone through... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja what is next!

The PREMIER: ...and a liquor licence obtained for a specific event that sets rules and criteria that govern that.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Are you going to legalise Tik now?

The PREMIER: Now the bottom line is this... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Sjoe!

The PREMIER: The hon Leader of the Opposition, the hon Magaxa...
[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am afraid of you.

The PREMIER: ...tries to say that that means we are going to legalise illegal
drugs on our schools.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is what you are saying.

The PREMIER: That is not what I am saying at all. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: We are getting that from you.

The PREMIER: Alcohol is perfectly legal.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The PREMIER: It gets used in fundraisers all the time.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Not at schools.

The PREMIER: And the bottom line is... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: They are going to legalise it at school.

The PREMIER: ...that if we are trying to solve a problem of illegality, we have two options... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] ...you allow people to drink.

The PREMIER: ...to get respectful of rule of law, we have two options. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: The first is that we can find a way of policing this properly... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: How are you going to control this?

The PREMIER: Or we can make a process whereby it can be authorised in a controlled environment.

An HON MEMBER: Please man!

The PREMIER: And we certainly will not grant permission for any sales of alcohol while children are on the premises. That is totally unacceptable.

Ms S W DAVIDS: What is the ACDP saying now?

The PREMIER: It is not in school-time... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Is the DBE supporting it?

The PREMIER: ...and the way that this is twisted and manipulated...
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The ACDP supports this... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the way it is twisted and manipulated you would think that we were going to serve alcohol from the tuck shop at break.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The PREMIER: We are not going to do anything of the sort. [Interjections.]
This is to legalise and regulate something that is happening all the time anyway...

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who is asking for this, which schools are asking for

this?

The PREMIER: And we are absolutely going to be certain that the regulations are... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Which school is this? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...unionised schools. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Which schools are asking for this?

The PREMIER: The bottom line is... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What school are you telling us about?

The PREMIER: The irony is this: that what we are trying to do in Khayelitsha for example and in every area... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: We do not drink at school.

The PREMIER: ...is to establish the rule of law. [Interjection.] Now I would like to tell the hon member Magaxa what we are doing in Khayelitsha.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do not go there.

The PREMIER: We have got hundreds and thousands of illegal shebeens.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, answer his question.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, answer his question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We are talking about schools here. [Inaudible.]
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Allow the Premier now the freedom to respond please. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is referring to... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: The Premier must answer.

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is provoking. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, you may continue.

Ms M N GILLION: The original question is not answered.

The PREMIER: The original question is answered.

An HON MEMBER: Oh yes. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: No.

The PREMIER: So I would like to then go on to the interjected question which is this: what are we doing in Khayelitsha? What we are doing in Khayelitsha is exactly the same, trying to establish respect for the rule of law. Now the first thing is there are thousands of illegal shebeens in Khayelitsha. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Now you want to open those legally to schools.

The PREMIER: And what we do want to do now... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Your logic is very poor. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: My logic? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, exactly!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, it would appear that the Leader of

the Opposition has got anger management issues. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Chief Whip, point taken. Hon Leader of the Opposition, please take that, please heed that. Member, you may continue.

The PREMIER: I have spoken about how we are trying to establish the rule of law at schools by setting up a regulatory environment that we can properly control and monitor. I am also now explaining how we extend that logic to the other illegal processes with alcohol, so for example the thousands of illegal shebeens have to be either legalised or closed. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They are not saying anything about that.

The PREMIER: And that is why we are working very hard... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: There is no children.

The PREMIER: ...to ensure... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There are many.

Ms M N GILLION: We are talking about schools.

The PREMIER: ...that those shebeens that can be legalised and monitored and controlled are, so that conditions can be set for their continued sale of liquor and monitored and that others are closed down. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You disappear. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Until you have established the rule of law you can make no progress... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do you know why you want alcohol to be sold at schools? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...and it is very interesting that the hon, the Opposition, is so het up about this, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: One and only.

The PREMIER: ...because if you go to many of the illegal shebeens you will find on occasion... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa!

The PREMIER: ...school children in uniform drinking at them and that is a very serious problem.

An HON MEMBER: Nonsense!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Nobody takes you seriously.

Ms M N GILLION: The one and only.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up hon member Olivier? You, only hon member Olivier is entitled to a follow-up.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ekskuus! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Excuse me! [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is Questions to the Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Workshop! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who takes you seriously? Leave the legal...

An HON MEMBER: Workshop!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, you may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Premier, the question is as much as you want to regulate illegal alcohol use on school premises, the question is what type of a message your Government with this decision is sending out to those

institutions of learning even if we are bringing alcohol to premises, whether it is for fundraising or for whatever the purpose might be...

An HON MEMBER: After hours.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...whether it is after hours, because some of the teachers will be using some because they are adults, and it is on school premises. The question is those are institutions of learning and how do you therefore bring alcohol into those school premises and what kind of message is your Government and yourself as the leader sending?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. The message that we are sending out is that we will no longer tolerate the illegal use of alcohol in our schools.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, but you can abuse alcohol. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your last opportunity. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not want to regulate... [Inaudible.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is the private schools... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, can the Premier tell us, this illegal

activities that she is now or that the Cabinet or the Department seeks to regulate, which schools, can she indicate where is it taking place currently at which schools, and who has requested this to be regulated and what was the reasons or what was the indicators to yourselves that warrant for this legalisation of this thing?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am not in a position to name individual schools here, because literally I could not do that with any certainty. What I do know is that functions are regularly held on the school premises by parents-teachers associations, by governing bodies, fundraising functions, other events, all sorts of things happen and currently although there is very little abuse that I know of, in fact no abuse of alcohol on school premises at such functions has been brought to my attention as yet. It is illegal even to serve one glass of wine at such a function and that kind of thing is happening all the time across the board. So we want to legalise it, control it and be able to monitor to and that is the purpose and it should not be twisted and manipulated.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is the wrong purpose.

The PREMIER: There is going to be no alcohol available to children. There is going to be no risk to the children at all and I would just like to advise the hon, the Opposition, to help us more in ensuring that children do not find

their way into illegal shebeens to drink alcohol just off the school premises.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the second one. Hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Premier, the Standing Committee of Economic Opportunities and Tourism and Agriculture visited the PHA yesterday and there was also the Department that looked at it and the Department of Agriculture announced that it would be conducting a study determining the future of the PHA. I want to know, Madam Premier, what is the Western Cape Government doing to protect the PHA?

An HON MEMBER: Good question. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The important thing is that there are processes whereby one deals with applications such as any application around the future use of the PHA and the point of entry into this Department is the Department of Environmental Affairs and Planning and it is not for me to try and override and give instructions. That process will run its course and we will follow the rule of law thereto.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Christians, do you want a follow-up?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Premier, I also visited the area not so long ago

and... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But not yesterday?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Not yesterday, ja, but what the question is, that the farmers supply the City with 200 000 tons of vegetables yearly and Mr Sunday, that is the spokesperson, said: "We stand to lose 18 000 hectares of land for mining and urban development." What are you saying about that, Premier? It is an issue in the media and people want to know what is the Western Cape Government doing?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon member Christians. [Interjections.] All of these facts will have to come into the process of consideration. This is precisely what has to be evaluated in the decision-making process and I do not want to pre-empt that. In fact, I have no role in pre-empting it because if I do then the process gets rendered invalid. So what I am sure the process will look at, amongst other things, is the amount of land that is still under-productive farming in the Philippi Horticultural Area and the amount of land that has already been used for sand-mining and what the future of the different pieces of land should ideally be, and all the issues, including the role of urban agriculture and the use of various land parcels for challenging problems in our broader urban environment will be weighed up and decisions will be taken by experts applying their mind on the facts and not on political interventions.

The bottom line is this: that one must take positions that are expressed by people with vested interests seriously and from whence they come but one has to balance all of these against each other, because one has seen in every single question that has come up here today issues being profoundly distorted, primarily for political reasons to score points and not to serve the public. I am not saying this applies to Mr Sunday at all, and I do not know what he is referring to, but I do know that there are different land parcels in the Philippi Horticultural Area, some of which are being very productively used, some of which have not seen a vegetable grow for about 20 years and obviously one cannot just have a blanket approach to all of that land in exactly the same way. [Interjections.] I have been there often. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: When was the last time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No further follow-up? We can then move on to the next question. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi daai *sweetheart question!* Gooi dit!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw that sweetheart question! Throw it!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: To the Premier, Madam Premier, it is reported that the National Department of Water Affairs is bankrupt, as we have seen in the media. Has the failure of governance had any negative effect on managing the

drought in the Western Cape?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi die *sweetheart question!*

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw the sweetheart question!]

An HON MEMBER: And a sweetheart, like the water crisis.

The PREMIER: It has. Thank you very much. This is a crucial question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sweetheart.

The PREMIER: You see Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must not tell us about another department...

[Inaudible.] [Interjections.] It is very sweetheart.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable!

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, there is almost nothing that any sphere of government can do in South Africa without the support and help of another sphere and usually both spheres, and water management is one of them.

Now as we all know the local Government has the responsibility to reticulate clean water to citizens. The National Government's job is to build and maintain the national water infrastructure. That is dams and canals and

pumps and weirs and all of that sort of thing and we in the province, primarily, have an oversight function... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which you failed.

The PREMIER: ...as for example we have with policing. Now oversight is a really important thing and of course to have oversight there has to be a water plan and we do have a water plan and we have had a water plan going up to 2030 for several years, in fact for over ten years, and it has served us very well till 2014, and in 2014 the dams were overflowing in the Western Cape so we had many dams that were 100% full. However, since then, we have had some dramatic impacts of what we believe are the effects of climate change.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It was not just climate change. ... [Inaudible] is another thing. Do not run away from there.

The PREMIER: And the projections and the predictions of the meteorologists have not been fulfilled, because we were convinced and certainly led to believe and not through thumb-sucks but through scientific evidence, that we could expect annual winter rainfall in a specific range, between high and low, and for the last two years that has been well below the low measure that we thought was a minimum.

Now that has generated a crisis and it has required that we completely change the plan which we are currently doing and we have put an enormous amount

of effort into finding ways of managing the water that we have, of reducing demand for water, of ensuring that we have alternative sources for water but particularly to ensure that the Government is creating an enabling environment for entrepreneurs to come in and solve the water crisis in exactly the same way as they came in with the green energy solutions to help us solve our energy crisis, and we do believe indeed that the water economy is going to be as vibrant in the not too distant future as the green energy economy is today, which has been noted as the fastest growing green economy in the world. So our job has been to monitor what is happening and to facilitate as much as we can the step change that is needed.

Now we asked a long time ago well in advance for the Western Cape to be declared a disaster area. That was initially refused by the National Department of Water Affairs... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that where you want to go?

The PREMIER: ...which set us back in our water-husbandry attempts.

†'n AGBARE LID: Asseblief!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh, please!]

The PREMIER: Then eventually the National Department did agree and we were very relieved but that does not mean that the National Department is exempt from its responsibilities... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Coming back to your...

The PREMIER: ...and now they were supposed to have maintained the dams, the weirs and the canals but we have found that they have not done so because there apparently is no money for doing so.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, blame the ANC.

The PREMIER: The money that used to be used to maintain the dams and the weirs and the canals was taken from user charges. Now because the Department is R4.3 billion rand in the red, that money that used to be used for dam maintenance is being used to compensate officials as recurrent expenditure, and so there was the beginning of the draining of the weir for example on the Leeuw River and we thought it was happening, but apparently, I am informed, that in fact it was stopped halfway through, and we lost water to the extent of 7.5 million cubic metres that I understand would have been sufficient... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Such a poor attempt really.

The PREMIER: ... to provide all of greater Cape Town's needs for two weeks and that was because of the unmaintained weir. Equally there are so many cracks now appearing in the canals that feed the Voëlvelei Dam that much water is draining away thereto and that is why we are having to divert money from other provincial priorities to fulfil a function that is a National

Government competency and we are now having to use provincial money diverting it from things that are our competencies to serve a National Government competency. Now that is completely unacceptable and what makes it even more unacceptable is that it was brought to my attention earlier today that the National Government has denied that it is not maintaining the weirs and the canals. Well, we would very much like to take them and show them, because we do not just sit here and get reports in our offices. My colleagues Minister Winde and Minister Meyer have actually been out there to see and came back absolutely shocked and I have a whole stash of photographs in my possession... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It depends what factions of the DA that is.

The PREMIER: ...as to what is going on. So the consequences of a failing national state are absolutely devastating and there is no way that any province or any local authority is going to escape the consequences. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is fine, no follow-up.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Madam Premier, I mean, this is truly shocking news and I know that as committees we have engaged in this matter extensively but what action are you really going to take now to

compensate for the money that you have had to spend for the failed National Government Department?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a poor PR exercise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you are having a running commentary there. It is interfering now with the proceedings in the House.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I understand it gets...

The PREMIER: Well you see, this is the big problem, Mr Deputy Speaker, because we will send them a bill and I will raise it at the President's Coordinating Council but Treasury has turned off their tap - not their water tap, but their money tap. There are major and serious allegations relating to tender irregularities in both the Lesotho Highlands Water Scheme and the raising of the Clanwilliam Dam wall, which are two critical projects. The Clanwilliam Dam wall was supposed to be raised by now and in fact I only found out that the project had been delayed indefinitely when I was up in the Clanwilliam area two weekends ago and farmers told me that they had heard this through the grapevine, and I came back and I asked questions and found out that that indeed was so. So these are the ways that this news hits this Government and it is very, very serious indeed, so we will divert our money because we cannot allow our farmers and in fact the areas that feed off these dams that have not been maintained to run dry, but we will bill the National Government. If they do not pay I will ask for legal advice as to how to ensure

that National Government fulfils its obligations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Schäfer your last opportunity.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Madam Premier, is there any risk that the Western Cape Government will fail to get a clean audit because it has to spend money doing National Government's job?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, clean audit. Really! [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: Well you see, this is a critical question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: This is a critical question.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please!] †What is critical about this now? That is a basic function.

The PREMIER: The issue, Mr Deputy Speaker, is this: we have to prioritise delivering water. It is not our competency to maintain the dams and the weirs and the canals. It is not our competency to reticulate water. Those two belong to National Government and Local Government respectively. What is our job

is oversight and to make sure these things happen. What the Constitution is silent about is what you can do if they do not happen.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The PREMIER: And that means that we have to rush in there and put our own money in. Now as you may know the Auditor-General... [Interjections.] ... looks at how you are spending your money in line with your competencies, with your APPs, with your predetermined objectives and if you spend millions of rands suddenly on something that was not in your Annual Performance Plan or that was not a predetermined objective, it can easily go down as irregular expenditure, even though it was critically important to ensure that a life-giving resource continues to reach people and so there is this trade-off. Now when there is such a stark trade-off between whether people can get water or whether we get a clean audit, there is no doubt. We go for people getting water, even if it means forfeiting our clean audit, but I need to highlight the risk of that because Government failure at a national level can cause us to get qualified audits in the province when it has nothing to do with us. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The time for Questions to the Premier has expired. We now move on to Statements. I see the DA first, hon Mitchell.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D G MITCHELL (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As we celebrate women this month, we not only celebrate the great strides women have made in our national struggle for freedom, but we take into consideration and raise awareness on the many plights with which our women and particularly girl children, are still confronted.

Today, I rise, Mr Deputy Speaker, to be a voice for those many voiceless, those innocent young girls that fell prey in the hands of perpetrators. Perpetrators that are very often known to the victim. Perpetrators that in most cases are supposed to be the protector, the provider or the supporter. Mr Deputy Speaker, where are we heading as a society?

Just yesterday the media reported, and I quote, “Girl (6) Raped and Paid R5” in Bonteheuwel not too far away from here, the horrific act being detailed by the media, where an innocent young girl was exposed to the most traumatising and horrific act that could ever happen.

It is our duty as elected Members of Parliament to ensure that our women and girl children are equipped with the enabling environment their potential requires to reach its optimum. We are also mandated to ensure women are protected against abuse of any form, and in the recent spike of the sexual crimes against our girl children, the DA has been and will continue to advocate for the full might of the law to prevail and to reduce the social ills contributing to this behaviour.

In this month, may we remember all those innocent young victims and as a community stand up for our children and say, enough is enough. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the ANC. Hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Premier can try her best with the usual DA spin, deception, smoke and mirrors, but her reputation suffered irreparable dents. Not even a panel beater can save her legacy anymore.

She just hangs onto her position for the power, pay and perks, but she is a hot air balloon that is cut loose to drift off into the sunset. She is now the lone ranger in her one-horse town. She is left to defend herself, like last week when she became the first Premier to face two motions to be ousted.

After the debate, she tried to put up a brave face, but soon ran over to the ANC to cry and protest for being exposed. This is the Premier who conducts worthless investigations into her MECs, sidestepping the State's investigation agencies. [Interjection.] She is the head of this Government who employed a covert information gatherer to spy for her, using illegal means.

She clutches at straws in putting up a fabricated defence why the DA asks for secret votes in the National Assembly, but she does not freely offer it here in this House where it is in control.

This Gogo must now go and play with her grandchild. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is no longer fit for purpose. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA. Hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): “Sustaining Breastfeeding Together” is the World Breastfeeding week theme for 2017. Mr Deputy Speaker, this week marks breastfeeding week around the world. Breastfeeding is not a practise that is most talked about, especially in this platform as it still carries a lot of stigma. We only get to talk about it when a mother gets ill-treated while breastfeeding her child in public.

Those who follow the news would remember the case of a mother that breastfed her infant in one of the big retail stores in Cape Town. She was thrown out of the store and that is the only time that we, a lot of women, gathered behind her and boycotted the store.

The First 1000 Days project in the Western Cape Government Strategic Goal 3, is aimed at promoting good nutrition for mothers and children by promoting exclusive breastfeeding for the first six months of life.

The Department also supports breastfeeding through its health facilities as it

adopted an initiative called the Baby Friendly Hospital Initiative, known in South Africa as the Mother Baby Friendly Initiative (MBFI) – an international strategy.

This initiative seeks to promote, protect and support breastfeeding as the optimal infant feeding choice and to create a breastfeeding conducive environment in the maternity wards.

Mothers who are unable or choose not to breastfeed for various reasons are also supported. To date 100% of the public health and three private birthing units in the Western Cape are accredited with Mother Baby Friendly Initiative status.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, it was pleasing to read in the *Cape Times* on Monday, 31 July 2017 that, and I quote, “a third of South Africa’s children under six months old are now exclusively breastfeeding, and this represents a nearly five-fold increase over the past 25 years.”

Finally, when we encourage breastfeeding, we are celebrating women. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I just need your guidance. Have we gone beyond the EFF? No. So, the sequence then is, after the DA, in the absence the EFF, I see the DA again. Thank you.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. Much work is desperately needed to ensure that those who are arrested with regards to cases around violence against women and children, are in fact arrested. However, as a society at large we must acknowledge that the police cannot fight this battle alone.

Children who become violent men were mostly victims themselves, of trauma, racism, bullying, corporal punishment and brutalising institutions. And here when I am talking about “institutions”, I am also including the families, the churches and the societies who encourage the patriarchal system, a system that teaches and educates the dominance of males over females, which results in the abuse of women and children, who are the victims.

As National Women’s Day approaches next week, I would like to use this opportunity to remind the people of our province of the part that they can play in preventing acts of injustice committed against our women and children. Research completed on the stories of violent men’s lives show that the best chance we have of preventing violent crime, is to ensure that infants and children are not exposed to violence or toxic stress at home and are warmly cared for. It is equally important to ensure that children are protected from violence at school.

Madam Speaker, we must limit the factors that lead to violence as this is our best chance of ensuring that we can look forward to living together,

regarding and respecting women and children as human beings. The way in which we respond to children who experience violence, neglect and abuse today will determine the level of violence we will experience in more years to come. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Ms M N GILLION (ANC): Madam Speaker, allow me first to greet all women leaders in the House. †Wathinta abafazi. [You strike a woman.]

HON MEMBERS: †Wathinta imbokodo. [You strike a rock.]

Ms M N GILLION: At this, the beginning of Women's Month the question arises in the Western Cape, how many more women and their children must be killed before this Premier and the DA-run Western Cape Government prioritise their plight?

The female Premier does not even take an active lead to champion issues of vulnerable women, children and people living with disabilities. They are grossly neglected by this DA Government. Women and their children are too often killed, raped and abused.

Shockingly this Government claims to get clean audits, but alarmingly women and children still suffer immensely. Women and their children feel the pain most of DA-induced evictions and high-handed dealings. They suffer

the hardships of this uncaring Government in killer fires and floods that leave them destitute. It is a shame that whole families are too often killed by devastating fires that destroy dwellings.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Gangsters!

Ms M N GILLION: Too many grandmothers and their grandchildren die in a province where about 200 people perish every year in informal settlement infernos, while this Government only has eyes for bookkeeping.

This Premier and her Executive Council run with money and special planning permission arrangements when the insured rich DA supporters suffer fires like in Knysna or Hout Bay, but are rarely seen in poor areas.

This year during Women's Month this Government again will mostly ignore our mothers, wives and sisters. Shame on the DA Government! †Malibongwe.
[Let them be praised.]

HON MEMBERS: †Igama lamakhosikazi, malibongwe. [The name of women must be praised.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the DA.

Mr B D KIVEDO (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon fellow members, support staff, members of the media and distinguished guests - equality for

women is progress for all in society.

Society at large has for far too long allowed women to remain silent, uneducated and in doing so remained disempowered. Even with the mobilisation of the global education community around progress in learning outcomes, there has been little impact on improving women's literacy since the early 1990's.

Madam Speaker, it is imperative that this International Women's Day, instead of just calling for girl's education to continue to make progress, the African education community should leverage messages around girls' education and women's empowerment to jumpstart this urgent shift.

There is an increasing need in Africa to target spaces where attention to girl's education is most needed. We continue to witness gender disparity in Sub-Saharan Africa, and South and West Asia remain more than other regions and if not addressed, the gaps in those areas will continue to increase. To improve the lives of young females in our society, we need to implement gender-specific policies at all levels of government to ensure that issues such as security and cultural norms around girls attending school and learning, are addressed.

Madam Speaker, the educated girls of today become the women leaders of tomorrow. Investing in women and providing equitable education opportunities are not just decisions that influence the day-to-day lives of

girls in school. They can provide girls and women with lifelong skills. The next wave of girls who attend school and learn will receive skills to improve their future livelihoods and in turn champion education for their own daughters. I thank you.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Madam Speaker, an article dated 27 July 2017 highlighted yet another household has succumbed to a shack fire in Philippi East where an entire family of six burnt to death, the youngest victim was only two years old.

The people of the community are still traumatised by the disaster that took place. Residents at the scene said they tried to help the family when they saw the towering flames, but the shack was locked from the inside and they could not rescue anyone.

The City's Fire and Rescue Service spokesperson said the cause of the fire is still being investigated. Madam Speaker, one life lost is one life too many. Something drastic must be done to address this ongoing problem. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I thank you. I see the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, Madam Speaker. It is necessary to defend the ecological integrity of the Philippi Horticultural Area as a unique, historical agricultural area and promote the sustainable use of the PHA's natural resources. The support of training, development and capacitation in the arena of food and farming will deliver long term gains.

We advocate for and promote the progressive realisation of the right to food, advocate for and promote market reform to protect consumers and farmers with a specific emphasis on the emerging farmers; and tackle agrarian and land reform issues in the small-scale farming area to support a broader land reform model.

We are against the inappropriate urban and industrial development, illegal waste disposal and mining in the PHA. We condemn the proposed Oaklands City and UVEST Developments in the PHA.

During the times of water supply shortages, it is necessary to preserve the Aquifer in the PHA. The 3 000 ha PHA farmlands is the last remaining recharge zone or catchment area of the Cape Flats Aquifer and must be protected from development.

Protecting the PHA means protecting the Aquifer and protecting the Aquifer means protecting the farmers' source of irrigation water and the future potable water for the city. And in this regard from the engagement yesterday, we should also further call on Minister Winde and the Department to further

ensure that they take the engagement with the stakeholders in the area seriously, because one of the commercial farmers indicated yesterday that indeed we are engaging and talking about their future, but they are not included in the discussions.

The DA has been found wanting with their contradictions. On the one hand, they have a stated objective to roll out the red carpet to developers for party funding through kickbacks, compared to the need for food and water security. It seems hon Schäfer, hon Winde and Bredell are all conflicted by different interest groups that are not aligned to the City's Mayor De Lille. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. Sorry, hon member Wenger kindly take your seat. Hon Minister Schäfer, is it ...?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Madam Speaker, the [Inaudible.] comment cast aspersions on us as members of this House and I submit that it is unparliamentary.

†UNksz M N GILLION: Haibo, haibo!

[Ms M N GILLION: No man. No man!] †That is a statement.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer, I heard your point of order. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry. Madam Speaker, could I also address you on

that, because it appears that MEC Schäfer is raising a point of order around a matter which clearly did not make personal references to actual members in regard to conduct and I think that at the end of the day, I think the DA, Madam Speaker, is sensitive to the issue of ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, your point ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... actually rolling out the red carpet for developers as the DA.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon member Dugmore. I have noted both points of order. I will revert to Hansard. I will get guidance and I will come back to the House on it. Minister Meyer, do you have a point of order? Thank you. So, may we move on? I see the DA. [Interjections.] Order please members. Hon member Tyatyam.

Ms M M WENGER: I am using this microphone, Madam Speaker. We seem to have a technical problem.

The SPEAKER: There is, which I am aware of, thank you. You may proceed.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, in recognition of Women's Month, I would like to dedicate this time to the many brave and committed women in our province who directly contribute towards making our communities safer places.

They are founding members of neighbourhood watches; they are often the patrollers in reflective jackets who are out late at night and all hours of the day. We are increasingly seeing that women are the ones who lead community safety initiatives and lead by example by getting involved in their communities and in their CPF's.

These women are the mouth, the eyes and the ears of their respective communities [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms M M WENGER: They give expression to the concerns and fears that we face, and they take steps to do something positive. Our women are so fearless we find them patrolling the worst of the gang-affected areas. Sometimes where even the police fear to tread. To these women, we say "thank you" and we encourage more women to become involved.

The international community at large is increasingly recognising that women's participation is essential to achieving and sustaining peace in societies. Women are proven agents of change and should be able to do even more. In the year 2000 the UN Security Council passed a historic resolution on women, peace and security. It calls for women to participate in peacebuilding, to be better protected from human rights violations, and to have access to justice and services to eliminate discrimination.

But Madam Speaker, we should not just be taking the time in August to recognise women's agency, but every month. We know that our voices, our capacities, and our real gender perspectives are critical to local dialogue and to making better policies. It is women who serve as agents of change and who are vital for more peaceful communities. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Members Statements. Hon members, can I just draw your attention? Let us manage ourselves with honour and maintain the dignity and decorum of the House. We now move to Notices of Motion. Before I proceed on this section, last week I had difficulty with all the hands.

Please bear with me and let us try and proceed in an orderly fashion so that I can be fair and allow every member who wants to submit a notice of motion the opportunity.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Joseph. I see the hon member Gillion. I then see hon member Olivier and hon member Hinana. I need the Table staff to help me here. Thank you.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of state capture on the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

HON MEMBERS: What?!

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I now see the hon member Gillion. [Interjections.] Order please, hon members. Let us not – we could go down a road with language. Let us please be tolerant. Thank you. Hon member Gillion, you may proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the reasons for increased child deaths in the Western Cape and the failure by the DA Provincial Government to ensure child safety in the province, following reckless utterances by DA Social Development Minister, Bertie Fritz, shifting the responsibility onto the parents of these kids. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

†AGB LEDE: Hoor-hoor!

[HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates racial prejudices in the Western Cape schools under the DA Provincial Government and the role of school codes of conduct with stereotype provisions that allow it.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increasing role that women play in society and whether crucial Government institutions are supporting and recognising their roles.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I will now move to the next round. Do I see any hands? I see the hon member Wenger. We are still busy with Notices of Motion. Thank you.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of gang violence on service delivery in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mackenzie, do I see you there?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No.

The SPEAKER: No? Okay. Any other notices of motion? Hon member Olivier, your hand is up. Are you speaking or - hon member Nkondlo I see you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the dark future faced by commercial and emerging farmers in the Philippi Horticultural Area as the City of Cape Town plans to allow property development by big businesses, damaging the historical and unique aquifer in the PHA.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any more notices of motion? May we now then

proceed to Motions without Notice. Are there any motions? If you could help me. I see hon member Kivedo, hon member Mackenzie and then the hon member Magaxa and hon member Dugmore. I will go in groups of four, so please work with me. Thank you.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Speaker.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I am sorry.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr B D KIVEDO: My fault. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest condolences to the family and friends of hon ANC member Timothy Khoza from Mpumalanga, who passed away yesterday after being involved in a car accident near Paarl. Three other hon members, namely Nomalungela Gina of the ANC, Ian Ollis of the Democratic Alliance and Cynthia Majeke of the United Democratic Movement sustained injuries during the accident and have been admitted to the Paarl Mediclinic;

that this House wishes a speedy recovery to all three hon members who sustained injuries whilst on their way to conduct oversight visits at schools. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. Thank you. I then see the hon Mackenzie after which I see hon member Magaxa.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the recent appointment of Ms Caroline Peters and Ms Rochelle Philander as Chairperson and Deputy Chairperson of the Mitchells Plain Hospital Board; further noting that both women have strong community links and that they will focus on improving the services provided by Mitchells Plain Hospital to the Community. I move so.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection. I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am not there.

The SPEAKER: Are you not there? So, then after hon member Magaxa, hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family of grandmother Yvonne Griqwa (57) who died tragically in a house fire with her two grandchildren, Jaden (2) and Jordan (3) at their home in Kariba Court, Hanover Park on Saturday afternoon. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? We will now go down the next round. I see the hon member Christians, hon member Hinana, hon member Simmers and hon member Gillion and then I will get to the next round. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates a 10-year-old beauty queen, Keegan-Lee “Apple” Croy from Hanover Park. She was named the winner of a modelling show in Bellville, where she won 4 gold medals and a platinum sash. She also reigns supreme as the Western Cape modelling

champion in her age group. The young beauty queen wowed the judges with her response to the question “What will you do to change the world?”, by saying, “I will change women, child and drug abuse. Drugs are destroying our communities and killing our children.” The ACDP is proud of this young girl’s achievements.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, the next speaker in the sequence I called. It is hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Democratic Alliance, affectionately known as the DA, for retaining Ward 4 in yesterday’s by-election with a resounding 61%. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, let us not deliberate on the outcome. I see the hon member Tertuis Simmers.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that emergency tariffs and tougher water restrictions have been put in place with immediate effect in George as the town's main water supply, the Garden Route Dam dropped to 44.82% on Wednesday 2 August 2017.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? The fourth person in this sequence, hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that today marks exactly a year since the 3 August 2016 Local Government Elections; further notes that the DA-led municipalities have seen tremendous progress during this period and congratulates the voters for their punctilious decision to put responsible governments in their localities.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Members please work with me. I am going to start the next round of four. Any hands? I see the hon member Kivedo, hon member Olivier, hon member Gillion ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: No [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Gillion, then before we get into - you may proceed and then I will see the next two members.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the MKMVA for honouring families of struggle heroes MK guerrillas Ashley Kriel, Coline Williams, Robert Waterwitch and Anton Fransch by presenting to their next of kin a spear and an ANC flag as a token of appreciation for their roles in fighting the apartheid regime.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I see the hon member Kivedo.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dankie, agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy meegevoel uitspreek teenoor die familie en geliefdes van wyle Hennie Serfontein, oud-joernalis, skrywer, historikus asook Dakarlid, wie met die destydse verbode ANC in Dakar, Senegal, samesprekings rondom 'n moontlike nuwe politieke dispensasie gevoer het; ons loof hom vir sy onskatbare waarde tot die totstandkoming,

vestiging en versterking van demokrasie in Suid-Afrika. Mag sy siel in vrede rus. Ek stel so voor. Baie dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of the late Hennie Serfontein, ex-journalist, author, historian as well as Dakar member, who had discussions with the then banned ANC in Dakar, Senegal, around a possible new political dispensation; we praise him for his invaluable contribution to the establishment and strengthening of democracy in South Africa. May his soul rest in peace. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is no objection. The next hon member. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Western Cape High Court Judge, Elizabeth

Baartman, postponed the application to evict 202 farmworker children from the Grootkraal Primary School near Oudtshoorn to make way for a game ranch, because of DA Education MEC Schäfer's failure over six years ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... to comply ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: We are hon members in the House.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes. MEC Schäfer.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: So, hon MEC Schäfer.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER:

... failure over 6 years to comply with a court order; notes further the judge directed all parties implicated including hon MEC Schäfer, to file a report indicating the extent to which each had complied with the 2011 order and Constitution; hails this judgement as a progressive outcome

putting learners before the big business generating profit. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. The next round. I see the hon member Mackenzie, hon member Dugmore, hon member Makeleni. If we could just deal with those three and help me maintain order. You may proceed, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Mr Gavin Burgess who retired from Highlands Primary School; further noting that he served as teacher, Deputy Principal and Principal at the school and various schools for the past 40 years.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections? There are no objections. I see, who is the next person? The hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with shock that 5-year old Kaithlyn Wilson from

Riebeeck West, on Sunday became the umpteenth child to be killed in the province; notes further two men, the mother's ex-boyfriend being one of them, have been arrested for the murder; welcomes the arrest of the suspects; conveys condolences to her family and friends and calls on the DA Premier to urgently establish a commission of inquiry into the carnage, as the blood of future victims will be on this Government's hands.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. I see the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes and commends the intervention by PRASA, that is, the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, to deploy armed guards on Metrorail trains to reduce attacks and robberies on staff and commuters. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being – no objections? I see the hon member Gopie and then we will start the next round. Hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that two initiates died in the Western Cape during the traditional winter initiation season; conveys condolences to their families and friends; and calls on the DA Cultural Affairs MEC Anroux Marais to account for these deaths. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to – there are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Gillion and then I see hon member Dijana. Thank you.

Mr M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the outcome of the Labour Court who set aside the demotion of the two Western Cape top cops, Jeremy Veary and Peter Jacobs. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the concerns by the National Department of Water and Sanitation over the lack of seriousness and urgency by the DA-run City of Cape Town in addressing the water crisis and calls for a more decisive intervention from the Municipality to save water, especially in business and affluent areas, as the informal settlements only account for 4% of usage. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Mngasela and then hon member Davids and then hon member Botha. Order please.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and sends condolences to the family of the 10-year old Gershwin Johnson from Kleinmond, who was stabbed to death yesterday morning. Young Gershwin and his brother were on their way to school when they were attacked and he suffered the fatal stabbing. This is yet another senseless killing and I further call on this House to condemn in the strongest possible terms all of these attacks on our children. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections. I see the hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House supports calls by the residents of the Phumlani Village informal settlement for an urgent independent investigation into corruption allegations in the allocation of houses in the New Horizon development in Pelican Park, and calls on DA MEC Madikizela of the Western Cape, to account to this House. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections. There was one last person in this round, hon member Botha and then I will see hon member Kivedo, hon member Olivier and hon member Mngasela and then I will get to the next round. Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the family of Mr Martin Kotze, an official of Cederberg Municipality, who died yesterday morning. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections. I see the next hon member.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy meegevoel uitspreek teenoor alle beseerde taxi-pendelaars wie tydens gister se ongeluk met die bussie van die LP's vir Basiese Onderwys gebots het. Ons bid hulle almal 'n spoedige herstel toe. Ek stel so voor. Baie dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to all injured taxi commuters who crashed into the minibus of the MP's for Basic Education during yesterday's accident. We pray that they will have a speedy recovery. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are no objections. The next hon member please. Sorry, I am just getting guidance from the Table. Sorry hon member Olivier, it was first hon member Mnqasela and then we will get to you. Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with great sadness the death of Ms Novoti Ntsabo, who passed away at 02:45 am at Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital in Johannesburg. She is the mother to Councillor Lindile Ntsabo of the Overstrand Municipality. May the family find solace in the love of the Lord during this difficult time. May her beautiful soul rest in peace. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. I see the hon member Olivier and then I will start the next round.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the gangsterism plaguing Cape Flats communities now spills into schools resulting in teachers resigning and some schools struggling to fill vacancies; notes further the so-called bulletproof

fencing of Western Cape Government is not effective as a teacher's car in Blomvlei Primary School was struck by a stray bullet; and calls on this DA-run Provincial Government to comply with its obligation to ensure that learners and teachers are safe on school premises.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections – there is an objection. The notice will be printed on the Order Paper. The next hon member. Hon member Dijana, hon member Kivedo.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls for more resources to be invested by the Department of Community Safety to curb gang killings in Bishop Lavis, which are reported to be 15 after two weeks, as well as in other gang ravaged areas like Bonteheuwel, Hanover Park and KTC and reminds hon MEC Dan Plato that his job is not to always nag and complain, but to take reasonable actions and assist to protect people in the province. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? Yes, there is. It will be printed on the Order Paper. The next hon member, please.

Let us maintain our honour. Hon member Kivedo.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dankie agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy meegevoel uitspreek teenoor die gesin en geliefdes van mnr Willy Jacobs van Bonteheuwel, die koerantafleweraar van ons gemeenskapskoerant in my kiesafdeling Tygerberg 1, wie tragies deur twee honde doodgebyt is. Mag sy siel in vrede rus. Ek stel so voor. Baie dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family and loved ones of Mr Willy Jacobs of Bonteheuwel, who delivers the community newspaper in my constituency Tygerberg 1, who was tragically killed by two dogs. May his soul rest in peace. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? I think we are getting to the end of the session. Any other? I see the hon member Olivier. I

see hon member Max and hon member Gillion. Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls for an urgent review of all school codes of conduct in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. [Interjections.] The next hon member please. I called out three names. It is hon member Max. Order please, members. Hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and wishes all the best to the 24 members of the South African Athletics team that will, as from tomorrow 5 August 2017, participate in the IAAF World Championships in London; that this House especially notes our star athletes and world champions, Wayde van Niekerk, Caster Semenya, including javelin thrower, Sunette Viljoen, along with our very own from Mbekweni, Paarl, the Rio Olympic long jump silver medallist, Luvo Manyonga.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There are no objections. I see the hon member Gillion. Thank you. Order please members.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that the ANC Western Cape is taking the DA Premier, Helen Zille, to court to force her to appoint a Commissioner for Children following the deaths of 25 young children since the beginning of this year; [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M N GILLION:

Notes further that Premier Zille does not prioritise saving children's lives and recently complained that a commission of inquiry into the child killings would be too expensive;

welcomes this latest move by the ANC and commends the ANC holding the Premier to comply with the promise of eight years ago and her constitutional obligation. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? [Interjections.] Order, please.

Mr M G E WILEY: In the Questions to the Premier without Notice she stated very clearly that she did not say that. Now member Gillion has repeated that fallacy. [Interjections.] This is ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please Chief Whip.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. There is a speaker on the floor. I am listening to the Chief Whip on his point of order. Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, the remedy for untruths that are told on the other side, when a person has been lying, is to come and correct the statement.

This has been done by the Premier yet they constantly repeat it despite the fact that in the same sitting she has corrected it repeatedly. Now, surely there is a remedy for this?

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, I have heard your ... [Interjections.] Order, please. Hon members, let us just contain ourselves. This is a motion without notice. If there is an objection we will state that there is an objection and the motion will then be printed on the Order Paper. That is the procedure. So let us not lose our way in terms of our procedures here.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, a point of order please.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can you direct to hon Wiley – this is not “they” sitting here. Generally he is not complying; he does not respect this side of the House. We are all honourable here, whether he likes it or not.

The SPEAKER: The point is taken hon member Gillion. I would like to just draw everyone’s attention to the need to refer to everyone in the House as honourable members. Chief Whip?

Mr D JOSEPH: We object to the motion.

The SPEAKER: Well, the objection is noted hon member Joseph and it will therefore be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I would like – you made a comment just now which I think I object to. I will write to – I would like you to withdraw that comment please? [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, that is in contempt of the Speaker. He is not allowed to object against the ruling of the Speaker and I think you should point that out to the Chief Whip and take it further.

Ms M N GILLION: You are not the Chief Whip of the Speaker. You are the Chief Whip of the DA.

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members. We have got through a long day. We are close to the end. I am asking that we follow – Chief Whip, please take your seat – that we follow the procedures as we would normally do and I have taken cognisance of the comment so let us not get into a sledging affair here. Chief Whip, I will hear you on your point of order.

Mr M G E WILEY: No, I will write a letter.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any – hon members, I have the right to review the Hansard to go through every single word for word and then revert to this House. I have however made a ruling that in terms of Motions without Notice the recourse is to object and the motion then gets printed on the Order Paper and I stand by that so we will continue. Are there any further motions without notice? I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes worries raised by trade unions about the failing

DA Collaboration Schools Project during a Basic Education Portfolio Committee oversight visit in the Western Cape earlier this week, including the process followed for staff appointments that differs from that of Government in public schools; and calls on MEC Schäfer to work with the stakeholders to address all these concerns.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the shooting of three police officers and a security guard during the foiled robbery at a liquor store in Nyanga on Monday and welcomes the speedy arrest of four suspects and wishes the wounded SAPS victims, Constables Jiza, Nyobo and Xhwitha as well as the security guard, a speedy recovery.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. Are there any more motions without notice? Hon member Tyatyam again. I see you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends National Trade and Industry Minister, Rob Davies, for his plans to designate Atlantis as a Special Economic Zone in a move that will stimulate the economy of the region and province and encourages the Minister to accelerate his move to other investment programs that he has already brought to the area to create more jobs.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. Are there any further motions without notice? I think we have exhausted this session. Hon members, before we adjourn I would like to remind members that the Budget Committee meeting will commence in the Chamber after the adjournment of the sitting. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:08.