
THURSDAY, 13 SEPTEMBER 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, may I request that you remain standing please. We are going to observe a moment of silence for those who have lost their lives in the Denel explosion.

[Moment of silence observed.]

Thank you, you may be seated. Order please! Good afternoon hon members. To our guests in the gallery, good afternoon and welcome; thank you for being here with us today. I think it is important just to alert you to the rules of the gallery. You cannot participate in the proceedings and please ensure that all cell phones are on silent. Thank you.

I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the subject for discussion. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. It is agreed to. [Interjections.]

We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon member Dyantyi as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Dyantyi.

(Subject for Discussion)

**THE INSTABILITY AT THE WESTERN CAPE
MUNICIPALITIES UNDER THE CONTROL OF THE DA**

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. To welcome everybody in the House, our guests, and of course with the Premier, who is always not with us, welcome Premier. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is the first... [Inaudible.]

†INKULUMBUSO: Sundihlekisa.

[The PREMIER: Don't make me laugh.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA sold so many lies to the ordinary citizens and voters of the Western Cape.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: At the polls they got away with that. Their best adverts were, "We are the best-run province in South Africa."

†'n AGB LID: Dit is reg.

[An HON MEMBER: That is right.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: "We have the best-run municipalities."

The PREMIER: True!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They have in the last eight-plus years believed their own propaganda.

The PREMIER: Everyone does!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We stand here today to attest to a daily reality that the so

called best-run municipalities are falling apart one by one. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Try your luck!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Really! Do you believe that?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: From Knysna to Cape Town lived people experiences indicate that the best run Government does not connect with people's living conditions. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: No state capture.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: From Cape Town to George the same storyline. From Cape Town to Langeberg the same failures! From Cape Town to Swellendam more lies! From Cape Town to Stellenbosch - say no more. From Cape Town to Matzikama – †ek het geen woorde nie! [Tussenwerpsels.] – [I have no words! [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Your time is running out. You must get to the point!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die DA is baie trots op skoon oudits en *awards*.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA is very proud of clean audits and awards.]

†n AGB LID: Natuurlik, natuurlik ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Of course, of course yes.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is what matters to them. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tick that box! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You will hear them even today parading these at the expense of people's lives. They are so determined about clean audits because it is their alpha and omega, that when they do not get the clean audits they drag the Auditor-General to court. [Interjections.] Ask member Alan Winde, the DA's white Premier candidate.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Now you are racist!

The PREMIER: Now you are racist. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In books the DA... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Where is your white [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

An HON MEMBER: Where is your white Premier? [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek weet, ek verstaan dit is baie seer. Ek verstaan dit.
Eina!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I know, I understand it hurts very much. I understand that. Ouch!]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, order please members! [Interjections.]
Hon member Dyantyi, please address the Chair. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In books the DA comply in everything. In improving people's lives, †julle druipe! Julle druipe! [Tussenwerpsels.] [you fail! You fail! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Why do people come here?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Armoede, werkloos. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Poverty, jobless. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, kindly take your seat. Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: I rise, Madam Speaker, with respect I rise on a point of...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, there is a speaker on the floor. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: I rise on a point of relevance. It is the instability at the Western Cape municipalities under control of the DA. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Sit.

Mr M G E WILEY: We are three-and-a-half minutes into the speech and he has not mentioned them once.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip, hon Wiley, I will grant the hon member latitude. I believe he is building up towards his point. Hon member Dyantyi, thank you. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Armoede, werkloosheid gebeur daagliks onder die DA-regerings. Die DA gee nie om vir die lewe van arm mense nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Poverty, unemployment happen daily under the DA governments. The DA does not care about the lives of the poor people.]

†n AGB LID: En dit is ook relevant.

[An HON MEMBER: And that is also relevant.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Net hulle stemme is belangrik vir die DA.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Only their votes are important to the DA.] †You want black votes. You do not care for black lives. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Today is about the impact and the cost of DA failures of instability at municipalities to the ordinary citizens in this province and I want to get to that point. Whilst they are busy with in-fighting, factional battles between the liberals, Afrikaners [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Hoor wie praat!
Hoor wie praat!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear who is talking! Hear who is talking!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...the so called black caucus, ID remnants, exchanging seats and chairs, ordinary people are suffering. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Look who is talking!

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here is the real cost of instability by the DA municipalities. Let us go to the City of Cape Town here.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Here, right here, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Millions of under-expenditure on capital expenditure are a daily occurrence.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Nonsense!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let alone mentioning R173 million sent back to the Treasury because you could not spend it and that R173 million could have helped Siqalo in Mitchells Plain.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And Marikana in Philippi to develop their infrastructure.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are already doing that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You failed them because their lives do not matter to you.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: *Amasela e DA.*

[Ms P Z LEKKER: The DA are thieves.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: High tariffs in water and electricity... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi... [Applause.]

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: *Amasela e DA.*

[Ms P Z LEKKER: The DA are thieves.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry. The hon Bernard Joseph has arrived. Sorry, hon member Dyantyi, and the noise was drowning out your speech so I trust that he has now been welcomed. You may proceed. Welcome hon member Joseph. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. Please check my time, Madam Speaker. In-fighting and poor management of water resulting in this, the ANC stands with the Festus, the Theys, the Souma and Hector families who are taking the City of Cape Town to court for burdening them with debt.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We want the DA here today to confirm that they are going to use taxpayers' money to defend themselves against these poor

families. You need to say it here today.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Definitely they will not.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are punishing Cape Town residents for complying and saving water. In three months, one billion that you have saved.

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What is your problem?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us go to George whilst you are thinking about the City of Cape Town. The Western Cape is ranked the third-highest in service protest in July by the Municipal IQ.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ask Mr Dugmore!

Mr P UYS: Ask yourself!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Themba lethu, Lawaaikamp, Parkdene witness daily service protests. Marches by taxi owners on impounded taxis is an occurrence in George.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Exactly!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: DA failures.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

An HON MEMBER: There has been another one.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Rassie de Villiers... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What, for upholding the law?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou luister na dié een. Luister na dié een!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now listen to this one. Listen to this one!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: Was Dugmore there?

An HON MEMBER: What law? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Rassie de Villiers se brief, en hy sê in sy brief:
“Laastens noem De Villiers in sy skrywe sy misnoeë met die manipulasie van
die evaluasieproses ten opsigte van die aanstelling van ’n Direkteur van
Korporatiewe Dienste. Dit is waar die skeur in die DA-koukus begin het.”

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Rassie de Villiers's letter, and he says in his letter: "Finally De Villiers mentions in his letter his displeasure at the manipulation of the evaluation process with regard to the appointment of a Director of Corporate Services. That is where the split in the DA caucus started."] †It is one of your own who says that as he leaves the DA.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: *Amasela e DA.*

[Ms P Z LEKKER: The DA are thieves.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us go to Swellendam whilst you are having a pain in George. [Interjections.] In Swellendam - just listen to this! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are messing with our time.

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry members, interjections are allowed but not running commentary, please. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you Madam Speaker.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you Madam Speaker. They are messing with our time.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are talking of instability created by the DA. In Swellendam, just listen to this, Madam Speaker. They employ a tourism manager for a one year contract. The end of June they terminate the contract together with three other tourism employees but the MM signs an SLA with a manager for the next six months on condition - †nou luister hier: [now listen here:] He employs the three retrenched office staff out of his own salary.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Start 1 July 2018, this is *mos* illegal. There is no SCM process followed. That is in Swellendam under your own DA Mayor. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

†Me C F BEERWINKEL: Luister man!

[Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Listen man!]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: On 28 August 2018 they call him to a meeting where they want to fire him on ludicrous complaints of reasons against him, without revealing who complained. They give him two options in that meeting: “You stay on but it will become very nasty, uncomfortable for you...”

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Imagine!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: "...or you leave immediately and go quietly and we will pay you in monthly instalments until the end of December." †Daai is mos die DA! [That is the DA for you!] That is your DA under your watch. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So here is the thing here.

An HON MEMBER: That is your Government.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There are two contracts: one not terminated before the other starts. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They want to pay him on a monthly basis so that council books do not show the lump sum. That is why they get clean audits.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is how they do it.

The PREMIER: What? Where?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle hoor. Lekker gehoor!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You heard. Heard well!]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please speak to the Chair.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us to go Knysna. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us go to Knysna, also under the DA, for nothing else but keeping themselves in power. MEC AWB †wat hier sit, [who is sitting here,] is sitting on a DC outcome on councillor Velile Waxa pussyfooting in order to keep the DA in power.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is the same councillor who has been arrested for allegations of murder of another councillor. He is still sitting on it because if he acts on that the DA loses power in Knysna. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is a legal process. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sies, skande!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sis, disgrace!]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is not true. That is not true. Speak the truth here.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Skande!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Disgrace!]

†Me M N GILLION: Skande!

[Ms M N GILLION: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is not true!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The recent crime stats on the 11th, indicates something else more to the DA, whilst they think it is a police problem.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In the top ten in the Western Cape seven of the top ten comes from the Western Cape. It is poor communities and it is suffering because there is no infrastructure. The environmental design is not done. It is

not a police problem. [Interjections.] It is not a police problem. It is under your watch. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, your finger please!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members. [Interjections.] Sorry, hon member Dyantyi, take your seat. We need to get some semblance of order. Hon members, you cannot debate across the floor while we have a speaker on the floor.

Ms M N GILLION: Especially the MECs, especially the MECs.

The SPEAKER: So I am appealing to both sides of the House. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: It is the MECs. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The MECs, honourable MECs, please, your cooperation, both sides of the House. You may proceed, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. †Ek wil sê, agbare Speaker... [I want to say, Madam Speaker...]

†Die SPEAKER: Praat asseblief saam met my, dankie.

[The SPEAKER: Please speak to me, thank you.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die blou onnoseles is uitgevang.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The blue blockheads are caught out.]

†n AGB LID: Ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle is uitgevang en jy kan hulle sien.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They were caught out and you can see them.] †The Western Cape voters have now woken up to your lies.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Shame!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: 24 October and 21 November are test cases for the mood of the voters towards the DA in the province.

Mr D JOSEPH: You will not get a vote, nothing!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: De Doorns is ready for the ANC.

Mr D JOSEPH: You will not get a vote.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Knysna is ready for the ANC. Witzenberg is ready for the

ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will see you in these three wards in no time. I thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Sorry, to the guests in the gallery, you cannot participate in any way, so no clapping please. Thank you.

The next speaker is the hon member Mngasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I was listening to hon member Dyantyi casting aspersions on the Auditor-General. [Interjections.] The Auditor-General is a Chapter 9 Institution. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please! Please take your seat, hon member Mngasela. Hon members, you cannot drown the speaker out. He is trying to present and the volume from this side of the House is drowning him out please. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must listen!

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Mnqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, the debate says the instability at the Western Cape's municipalities under the DA control. †Sjoe! [Phew!] I thought I was lost... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...but the more I listen, the more I realise... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are always lost! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...the more I realise that the hon member that sponsored this debate missed a great opportunity. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Who are you to judge?

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and I must admit that when the ANC brought a motion to discuss instability in municipalities I was confused and surprised.

Mr P UYS: You are always confused.

Mr M MNQASELA: I pondered on whether basic advice from the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...to fix problems elsewhere in the country... [Interjections.] ...but I realise that this is a pure grandstanding trying to drive some semantics and missing the points because they are destined and obsessed with electioneering. [Interjections.] Now we are going to raise these issues and showcase what we are doing whilst they play games that side and I must say that it is clear that their own excuse here is to simply give us a very low performance. I actually rate them 33% and the ANC is used to that percentage if you look at the education system.

Mr D JOSEPH: No percentage.

Mr M MNQASELA: This House must disabuse itself from being attentive to deliberately misleading remarks by the Opposition who often go on a tangent rant... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Is that all you can say?

Mr M MNQASELA: ...trying to convince themselves... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We are waiting for those... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...let alone others that they are the answer to the problems facing this province.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons wag vir jou!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are waiting for you!]

Mr M MNQASELA: In fact, Madam Speaker, the people of this province have renewed our mandate in 2016... [Interjection.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Hoor-hoor!

[Mr D JOSEPH: Hear-hear!]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...with a staggering two-thirds majority...

†Me M N GILLION: Hulle jaag julle weg!

[Ms M N GILLION: They are chasing you away!]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and leaving them in the cold. They lost every single municipality that they controlled because why... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...people are clear the DA has a better story to tell. [Interjections.] The Auditor-General in 2016/17 MFMA report has given us a further applause by saying if there is anything that we can learn come to the

Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I told you. Those were the clean audits. Those were the clean audits. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: They say come to the Western Cape because local governance is about political leadership, administration that is sound and ensuring that the municipality delivers on the objectives that are set in the key performance indicators. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where are the clean audits? [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: So when you look at the IDPs of all the 30 municipalities and you look at the SDBIPs... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and you look at the budgets you can see that the DA delivers more than any other municipality in this country... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Then why are you sending the money back?

Mr M MNQASELA: ...because we are the best in governance.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Why are you sending money back?

Mr M MNQASELA: Nowhere had this been more prevalent than in this province that services are being delivered because the DA believes in the ethos of accountability at the centre of governance. [Interjections.]

I am taking you back to school, Governance 101. [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Ask George.

Mr M MNQASELA: Ethos of accountability at the centre of governance. This is best illustrated by the year-on-year unparalleled record of achieving the highest number of clean audits... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms P Z LEKKER: There is no accountability.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...which the ANC wants to throw out of the window because you fail at managing finances. They fail at managing finances.

An HON MEMBER: What I can say, you are very disappointing.

Mr M MNQASELA: We account for every cent that is being spent in this province... [Interjection.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Hoor-hoor!

[Mr D JOSEPH: Hear-hear!]

Mr M MNQASELA: And where that is not happening, we come after those municipalities. We have seen it in George when it was reported, hon Bredell was able to call on the Hawks within eight days and say “Let us go there.”

[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Why is the Mayor still there?

Mr M MNQASELA: On 31 May I stood here, Madam Speaker...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The Hawks.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and delivered the member statement commending Minister Anton Bredell and his Department on taking actions when called upon to do so. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must have [Inaudible.] That is your job.

Mr M MNQASELA: To keep true to our commitment of putting accountability at the centre of governance. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: The Mayor is still there.

Mr M MNQASELA: Minister Bredell and his Department implemented the Integrity Management Framework with reaffirms, anticorruption strategies and measures in municipalities, because we need to guard against money that is given to municipalities and make sure that those politicians and senior officials who confuse public funds with their own private purse are held to account.

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

Mr M MNQASELA: And we hold them to account and we have shown it [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Mr M MNQASELA: ...in Kannaland, we have shown it in Oudtshoorn. You must ask now where is Gordon April - slapped five years without an option of a fine. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is the only one! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: This programme, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! Sorry hon member Mngqasela, kindly take your seat please. Hon members, there is too much noise. Interjections are allowed but we cannot have running commentary and drowning out the speaker. There

is a speaker's list. You are allowed to interject but we cannot have all this howling at the same time. You may proceed, hon member Mngqasela.
[Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: How many minutes do I have, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Your time as with every other member will be monitored.
Thank you. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You always listen to...

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to say to my friends in the ANC this is a very interesting debate. It is a free lesson. You know, when the DA acts on its members who are alleged or found to be corrupt, we kick them out of their positions... [Interjections.] ...but the ANC, we have seen it from the National Government, there was an MEC in Gauteng... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Mark Donalds, Msebenzi Zwane, I mean †niyamazi *mos* mhlekazi lo [you know *mos* honourable.] †Mr Mark Donalds.
[Interjections.] So he was given a promotion to the National Assembly when he was found to be guilty. [Interjections.]

Now what we are doing in this province, we launched in 2017/18. That is why we are doing well. [Interjections.] That is why we are doing well. We launched a programme where we are saying the integrity management must be at the centre.

Mr P UYS: Where is it working? It is not working.

Mr M MNQASELA: And we launched it in the Central Karoo, when the ANC messed up Central Karoo we brought it there.

Ms M N GILLION: Ah please!

Mr M MNQASELA: And we launched it in the Eden District Municipality which is now the Southern Cape Municipality [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: And in George?

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and we have been saying that we need to monitor and account for money that comes in and money that goes out. [Interjections.] And that is the DA Government.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Swellendam ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: Again I say, Madam Speaker, accountability at the centre of governance. [Interjections.] The DA-led Western Cape does not tolerate

corruption. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You know the truth.

Mr M MNQASELA: I want to say to all the people who are sitting here and the guests listening to this beautiful conversation here, this is a very clear illustration of an ANC that cannot even provide opposition. [Interjections.] You have no debate.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What?

Mr M MNQASELA: You cannot even research properly. You are providing a weak and a very boring kind of a conversation here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: This should be a debate but you come here, no substance, nothing! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me!

Mr M MNQASELA: And I want to say that if you look at the Cango Caves, when you were in charge and what happened in Oudtshoorn, hon member Simmers, Madam Speaker, is going to tell that story. It is ugly. [Interjections.] It is ugly - very bad! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi! [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: I want to conclude by quoting from a song by Detroit - it was a hit song in the 80s and that song says...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh you want to sing!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and that song says: "Who's foolin' who? Na-na! Who? Who's foolin' who? Da-da-da." [Laughter.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mngqasela. Kindly take your seat, please. Your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: You can imagine; who is fooling who, because the ANC lives in some mystery, delusional farfetched world of dreams.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: We are not dreaming here. We are delivering services.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Enkosi!

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise, members, the hon Joseph is about to speak. Silence please.

An HON MEMBER: Two minutes!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You have two minutes hon member Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Now both sides will listen, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]
The investigation by the Hawks into several municipalities in the Western Cape has thrown the perceived good governance cry of the DA out of the window.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes!]

Mr B D JOSEPH: It shows that the corruption runs deep in the South African public sphere and needs to be addressed urgently. The EFF notes with massive concern that the DA-led Government and the ANC Government are in the same corrupt WhatsApp Group. Can one call it a matter of political egoism, that only the individual and in this case the DA interest is selfishness. Corruptions deprive the poor from effective service delivery...

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member Joseph, kindly take your seat. There is someone on a point of order. Is it a point of order hon member Olivier?

Mr B D JOSEPH: Just note the time, just note the time.

Mr R T OLIVIER: On a point of order, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes Sir.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is it parliamentary to call the ANC and the DA the same WhatsApp Group? [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: I do not think there was reference to any individual. Unfortunately that is not a point of order. You may proceed, hon member Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you. The majority DA voters in those municipalities are hopefully seeing the governing party for what it is - a bunch of unscrupulous characters hell-bent on enriching themselves.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It sounds like you are describing Malema.

Mr B D JOSEPH: The EFF calls on the Premier and the MEC responsible for Local Government to make space for those who are prepared to put everything in and to be of service to the people of the Western Cape. The DA in-fighting between Mayor Gesie van Deventer and Speaker Donovan Joubert has gone on for months which led to the Council agenda being compromised

where the Speaker did the not want to put the items on the agenda which did not comply with legislation and the Mayor pushing the way. This led to the Western Cape leader MEC Bongi abusing his position and striking a deal with Speaker Joubert to resign as Speaker at Stellenbosch Municipality... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member Joseph, kindly take your seat.

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...and taking up a Mayco position on the Cape Winelands District... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph, kindly take your seat please. There is a point or order please take your seat. Take your seat please. [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: How am I doing with time? They are trying to... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Are you rising on a point of order, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: I do realise that the hon member has been absent from the House for a long time... [Interjections.] ...but the protocol in this House is to address members as hon members, *ja*. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay sorry. Hon member Joseph, in your address members

are referred to as hon members.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The SPEAKER: You might have had a lapse, it is suggested.

Mr P UYS: He did say hon Bongi.

An HON MEMBER: He did, he did say so.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you, but also thank you to the member indicating that I am also hitting the DA where it hurts. [Interjections.] But then again it is the Western Cape run Provincial Government that funds the running of the Cape Winelands District Council expenses. Here the Province is now funding this additional Mayco position at the Cape Winelands District Municipality as this Mayco position did not exist in 2016... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph, kindly finish up.

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...after the municipal elections and was only created...

The SPEAKER: Your two minutes have expired hon member Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...funded when Joubert had to take it out of the face of Gesie van Deventer [Interjections.] [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, thank you. Hon member Tyatyam, just in terms of debate, parties cannot share their time with other parties. You can do it with your own members. That is your Rulebook. Thank you.
[Interjections.]

I now see the hon the Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, hon members, thank you very much. Before I start I want to take a moment to pay my respects to the three firemen who lost their lives while fighting a fire in Johannesburg last week.

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, could you kindly take your seat please. Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My apologies for interrupting you, Minister. Madam Speaker, I just wanted to ask why is the Premier leaving when he is about to speak, is it because he is not in his faction?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Well, I would not know. [Laughter.] Hon member Dyantyi, that is not a point of order. It is not sustained. Thank you. You may proceed.

An HON MEMBER: On the same WhatsApp Group!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, before I start I want to take a moment to pay my respects to the three firemen who lost their lives fighting a fire in Johannesburg last week. It is a tragedy that the ANC is taking this so lightly. Tragedies like this do affect the entire disaster and emergency response community. [Interjections.] My thoughts are with the community and their families and friends of those... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] ...concerned about Johannesburg. That is the point. That is the purpose. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Dyantyi, you have a speaking term. You cannot, we cannot have outbursts please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, we do respect everybody's life in South Africa. [Interjections.] Over the past few weeks we have witnessed an extraordinary event taking place; an event that is unparalleled to South Africa's history; an event known as the Zondo Commission of Inquiry into the State Capture. This Commission is investigating for President Jacob Zuma and his cronies ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, hon Minister, kindly take your seat please.

Ms M N GILLION: Where is the relevance now?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, is that a point of order?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am rising on Rule 41, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You have repeatedly allowed the Chief Whip of this House to get up and disturb our member and ask what the relevance is. What is the relevance of this when the topic here, and I am reminding you what the Chief Whip said. I am reminding you [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, instability in the Western Cape.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am reminding you that Chief Whip said the instability of the Western Cape municipalities under control of the DA. It has nothing to do with the Zondo Commission, nothing!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, I allowed the hon member Dyantyi latitude to get to his point. I will allow Minister Bredell the latitude. Get to the point please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker this is a political debate. This Commission investigating the former President Jacob Zuma and his cronies led by the three Gupta brothers, who robbed this country from hundreds of billions of rand... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, kindly take your seat please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...but I will come right here, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. Take your seat. Hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, the MEC knows that this is not just a mere political debate. There is a theme here that we must deal with.

The SPEAKER: Correct, correct.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is not general.

The SPEAKER: Correct, and I have urged the Minister for relevance, thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, and I will come right back here, Madam Speaker. I visited a place called Riverlands last night, a poor community... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Because of the DA.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...a community where there are good people living - poor people but good people, mothers, wives and children and the question is why do they still struggle? The reason is very simple - because of that party the ANC stealing the money of the poor. They robbed this country poor. They have stripped this country, Madam Speaker, and they have the audacity to put this on the table while they steal the money... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, please take your seat. Hon member Lekker. [Interjections.] Order members!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Can I ask MEC AWB to tone down his voice, please.

The SPEAKER: Okay, you need to request that I do that, thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, like always for everything the ANC makes a joke of everything. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is a spurious point of order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: This is a very serious topic Madam Speaker, because if you do not understand the finances - that is why the hon Richard Dyantyi mentioned clean audits. [Interjections.]

At least we have the money. If you steal the money there cannot be a clean audit. There cannot be service delivery, hon member. I will rather give back money and apply for that money to be rolled over than get it to the Guptas who fled to India with our money. [Interjections.] [Drumming in background.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, our people in this country... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I do not know why you are talking about the Guptas.

†n AGB LID: Die waarheid maak seer! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: The truth hurts! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Members, can we get some order, there is a member on the floor please. [Interjections.] Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Again I am rising on Rule 41.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Order must be maintained by the Presiding Officer.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It is your duty Madam Speaker, to call to order, a member who is not on topic. Clearly he is not... [Interjections.] ...and he is degrading the decorum of this House that you always remind us about. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down. My member is still on the floor.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Wiley is entitled to a point of order. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No Chair!

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Madam Speaker, this... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: When I speak he must wait. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, thank you, alright.

Mr M G E WILEY: This is obviously... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, you have to wait until I am done talking.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ag, jeez, when are you done?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, were you done?

Mr P UYS: Sit.

An HON MEMBER: Just sit down!

An HON MEMBER: No!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Rise on a point of order. Then I will sit but in the meantime you do not jump up while I am speaking.

An HON MEMBER: *Ja*. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Workshop!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, so now the dignity and decorum is completely gone!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please!]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, you cannot as a Speaker say the dignity is completely gone... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are causing it.

Ms M N GILLION: ...because hon member Beerwinkel was still on the floor and hon member Wiley jumped up... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: As always.

Ms M N GILLION: ...while she was still busy addressing you. The other issue is, Madam Speaker, the member, the Chairperson of this very important debate of Local Government... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Is banging on the desk!

Ms M N GILLION: ...is banging on the desk and you do not call him to order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: But you make the most noise!
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, so members let this not degenerate... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There are no answers there. †Hy skop alles wat voor hom is. [He kicks everything that is in front of him.]

The SPEAKER: Let proceedings not degenerate. Can I request cooperation from both sides of the House. [Interjections.] A point of order is a point of

order. Spurious interjections will not be... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He is not even listening to you Madam Speaker. He is not even listening to you. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: They continue with their own caucus there in the corner while you are speaking.

Ms S W DAVIDS: They do not have respect for you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela, can you return to your seat please, thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Mnqasela, sit down, Mnqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: No respect! [Interjections.] Nothing!

Mr M MNQASELA: There is one Speaker. You are not the Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, so please members then allow me to run the House in terms of Rule 41. Minister Bredell, if you could proceed.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you Madam Speaker. This is a

political debate and the Western Cape is not an island. We are part of South Africa.

†n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So the ANC, by protecting corruption we struggle to service our municipalities and I need to point it out to the sponsor of this debate.

†Me M N GILLION: Praat net sagter, ek kan nie hoor nie.

[Ms M N GILLION: Just do not speak so loud, I cannot hear.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: If they down their voices I will down mine, but Madam Speaker, the ANC protected their previous President Jacob Zuma on three occasions - not once, not twice, but three motions of no confidence. They motivated... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, thank you, take your seat please.

[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, hon member Beerwinkel raised the issue. You never ruled on that. I think it is important that you rule on that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: Please, again, this is not the point. If you have something to say about the Western Cape say it, but you have nothing to say. Please, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die DA is deurmekaar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA is confused.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, are they all seated, can I speak?

Mr P UYS: No, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes. Sorry ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: No, it cannot work like that.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: Minister... hon member... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, once there is a point of order you must rule on that and then another member can speak.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, it could be that it is all pertinent to the same issue, so I will listen to the points of order. You may proceed, Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. Madam Speaker, it is quite obvious that the ANC has adopted a strategy to try and disrupt this debate. [Interjections.] It is therefore at every opportunity; you have already ruled on frivolous points of order, I must ask you to please adhere to that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip, thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please! [Interjections.]]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You, are you telling us to bring the House to order? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, the story of the Western Cape is a very simple story. We are the best-run province in this country. That is the story of the Western Cape. [Interjections.] [Drumming

in background.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, the ANC just yesterday admitted to spending R17 million on legal fees under President Jacob Zuma, also allowing him an annual salary increase of R3 million rand. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, kindly take your seat. Kindly take your seat please. Hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Chairperson, I have addressed you on this behaviour of the member, Chairperson of Local Government,

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: He again did the same... [Drumming in background] ...and you do not call him to order, Madam Speaker. What is this? [Interjections.] This is not a circus here.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Gillion. Hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr M MNQASELA: The disruption that is taking place here is from that side. Now what I do, I clap. What I did, I clapped for my hon member because he spoke so well. I clapped for him. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay so... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: So I do not know the rule, how to clap. Give me the rule how to clap.

The SPEAKER: Members, thank you. May I - sorry, hon member Lekker. Kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.] Hon members, it is unbecoming to start doing this. [Drumming in background.] It just does not sound right.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: So please let us get back to the dignity and decorum of the House. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, so just to start off again, the Western Cape story is a very simple story. We are the best-run province in the country and we have all the facts to prove that. [Applause.] But the question is always why do we not get ahead of poverty...

[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You do not have a story to tell.

An HON MEMBER: No, it is the MEC.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...and that is what I want to try and point out because as long as you sit with a National Government stealing money then we will not have enough money to attack poverty and get to the front row of poverty. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, let me give another example and showcase how we operate. Did you know that during the Zupta years the ANC-led Government paid more than R260 million to the media companies of the ANN7. Eight of the nine provinces adhered to the ANC's call to fund this company. There was only one province - the Western Cape, who refused to waste taxpayers' money on a Gupta-led media campaign.

†Agbare Speaker, ek wil u tog nog iets uitlig wat baie seermaak vir die ANC in die ondersoek van die Zondo Kommissie en dis alles feite en dis alles daar. Die ANC se vorige *Deputy* Minister, Minister Mncebisi Jonas, het onder eed

gesê... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Madam Speaker, I just want to highlight something that hurts the ANC a lot in the investigation of the Zondo Commission and it's all facts and it's all there. The ANC's previous Deputy Minister, Minister Mncebisi Jonas, said under oath... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ...in sy teenwoordigheid van 'n prokureur is daar gesê dat die Valke 'n saak sal toesmeer omdat dit 'n DA-saak is. Agb Speaker, nou dit maak my benoud. Dit behoort almal in hierdie Huis benoud te maak, want ek kom terug na George toe. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...in his presence of an attorney it was said that the Hawks will cover up a case because it is a DA case. Madam Speaker, now this makes me nervous. It should make everybody in this House nervous because I am coming back to George. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, in George se geval soos wat die agbare Richard Dyantyi genoem het, in George se geval het ek die Valke genader maar voor ek daar kom, na 2016 se verkiesing het ons 29 munisipaliteite beheer uit die 30, die DA het 29 gewen.

Agb Speaker, munisipaliteite soos Beaufort-Wes, Oudtshoorn, Cederberg, ensovoorts wat al die jare onder ANC-bestuur was het ons oorgeneem. Dit was die eerste keer dat ons met forensiese eenhede binne die munisipaliteite hulle so ver kon kry om op die regte pad te kom, agb Speaker.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Nou agb Speaker, as ek kyk na wat die *Deputy* Minister vir ons sê oor hoe die Valke 'n saak kan toesmeer omdat dit 'n DA-saak is, raak ek vreeslik bekommerd want drie jaar later het ek nog geen uitsluitel gekry van die Valke nie - 'n ANC-instelling, 'n ANC-inmenging in goeie regering. Hulle is skynheilig, agb Speaker, hulle wil mense in armoede hou want hulle sien mense as 'n syfer. Hulle sien mense as 'n statistiek. Hulle dink as mense arm is sal hulle vir die ANC stem.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, in the case of George as the hon member Richard Dyantyi mentioned, in the case of George I approached the Hawks but before I get there, after 2016's election we controlled 29 municipalities out of 30, the DA won 29.

Madam Speaker, municipalities such as Beaufort West, Oudtshoorn, Cederberg, etcetera, that all those years had been under ANC management, we have taken over. It was the first time that we with forensic units within the municipalities could get them onto the right path, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Now Madam Speaker, if I look at what the Deputy Minister tells us about how the Hawks can cover up a case because it is a DA case, I am getting very worried because three years later I have not received any conclusion from the Hawks – an ANC institution, an ANC interference in good government. They are hypocritical, Madam Speaker, they want to keep people in poverty because they see people as a figure. They see people as a statistic. They think if people are poor they will vote for the ANC.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Waar is die DA? Waar is die DA?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where is the DA? Where is the DA?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Daar wag 'n verrassing vir hulle, soos in die 2016 verkiesing. [Applous.] Die mense is nie dom nie. Die mense sal

jou uitstem, agb Speaker. [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is a surprise waiting on them, as in the 2016 election. [Applause.] The people are not stupid. The people will vote you out, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

†n AGB LID: Ja, ja, DA. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes, DA. [Interjections.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, wanneer ons gaan na die polisdienste wat die agbare lid aangehaal het ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, when we go to the police services the hon member quoted ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, die syfer het nou net uitgekom dat ons 'n ongelooflike hoë kriminele syfer het. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, the figures have just come out that we have an unbelievably high crime rate. [Interjections.]]

Ms M N GILLION: You do not have a story to tell!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit is vrouens en kinders wat swaarkry.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is women and children that are suffering.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, sit down, would you kindly take your seat please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Madam Speaker...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Haai, *shame* man! Foeitog!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hey, shame man! Shame!]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Madam Speaker, through you, can you please help the MEC. He cannot continue to point at us here.

The SPEAKER: Okay, Minister Bredell.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can he please try and put his hands on the side. He must just speak. [Interjections.] That is what he is supposed to do. He must just speak.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Nkondlo. Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, poverty, inequality and finding solutions for this is a serious debate... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We know you said that [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Again as it is every year the bulk of the country's murder hotspots are in Cape Town. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle weet dit maar julle doen niks nie. Julle doen niks nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You know that but you do nothing. You do nothing. [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The national average, Madam Speaker, you see, let me just give you the stats.

The SPEAKER: Okay, sorry.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The national average of police per population is one officer for every 369 residents. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, in Nyanga there is one police officer for every 628 people. [Interjections.] This has been so for years. The question is why. If the ANC cares for black lives, why do they not give us more police so that we can protect the citizens because it is the police, it is a national function. It is not a provincial function. †Maar hulle is skynheilig agb Speaker. Hulle sê hulle gee om maar hulle gee nie om vir die mense nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] [But they are hypocritical, Madam Speaker.

They say they care but they do not care for the people. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, kindly take your seat please. Hon member Gillion.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Luister, luister daarso!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Listen, listen there!]

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I am rising on a point of order. What is the relevance of this debate? Is it crime? [Interjections.] Where is the relevance of the MEC in this debate? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Because you do not have a story to tell, that is why.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is niks om te sê nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is nothing to say.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I think that hon member Dyantyi talked to crime in his opening address and I think that is... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] the responsibility. I asked what they are planning to do.

The SPEAKER: Correct. I will ask the Minister to stay as close to the subject. Hon Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, can the hon member the MEC take a question?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No you have been away for too long.

The SPEAKER: I will check with him. Minister will you take a question?
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No, it is just for members who regularly come to Parliament, thank you. So can I continue? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, to the hon member Dyantyi, again the Western Cape story is a very simple story. We are the best run province in the country.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle doen niks nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are doing nothing.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And if you look at all the reports coming from the Presidency we are the best in providing electricity. We are the best in providing energy. We are the best in providing water, but Madam Speaker, we are the first to acknowledge that poverty has caught up with us and that is why this debate is getting very serious. [Interjections.] Because in the last five years 640 000 people moved to the Western Cape. We can ask why. Why do they flee ANC controlled councils and ANC controlled provinces, because there are no services. That is the fact.

We do not care. We will serve them but we need to get our rightful allocation from National Government. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Back to the beginning, Madam Speaker, if National Government - the government that the hon member belongs to, if they steal the money we cannot serve the poor, we cannot serve 640 000 extra people.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sit nou.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit now.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: They steal the money. They owe this country. They should apologise to this country because they do not have any story but corruption. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Alright, hon member Olivier, before you begin, hon member Joseph, can we please just for 30 seconds just... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC must apologise.

An HON MEMBER: Apologise? But we are not governing. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please! For 30 seconds just practice some quiet and then we can get started. Hon member Olivier, you may proceed.

†Me M N GILLION: Skande! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms M N GILLION: Disgrace! [Interjections.]]

†'n AGB LID: Gooi kole! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals! [Interjections.]]

†'n AGB LID: Gooi, tjommie!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw, chum!]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, Chief Justices there.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Vreet hulle broer, vreet hulle!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Chew them, brother, chew them!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, that is not nice!

Mr R T OLIVIER: The Premier in her absence, Madam Speaker, after this turbulence, you know, thank you for that 30 seconds cool-down. I thought I was in a rally at the stadium, but ja, we are back here.

Madam Speaker, this Government here across ourselves governs almost 30 municipalities... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Withdraw your finger!

Ms M N GILLION: Why are you worried about his finger only?

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...while the spin doctors and many of the praise singers on the other side... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, let us not - sorry hon member Olivier. We cannot have a debate about fingers now please. There will be no more finger-pointing today. Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, while the spin doctors and many praise singers on the other side may claim this as an achievement, for many voters it

was an opportunity to experience the rehash of apartheid policy after the democratic dispensation. This period has also helped to dispel the notion of the best run or corrupt free administration.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is hy. Gooi daai kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go. Throw those coals!]

Mr R T OLIVIER: The DA lies have been laid bare for everyone to see. Everyone has come to accept the fact that everything the DA touches turns to ashes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: The first one - it is marriage of convenience that the... [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, I am worried about his heart. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, I am sorry. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: May I continue. I know it hurts, Madam Speaker. I am worried. I am worried about my friend's heart. He has little ones. He must take care of his heart. I am worried. Everyone has come to accept the fact that everything the DA touches turns into ashes. The first one is the inconvenient marriage with my colleague here, the EFF in many municipalities, which renders those municipalities ineffective and paralysed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Not here hey!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Look at what is happening in Tshwane. You can make - you can take it yourself. [Interjections.] Look at what is happening in Johannesburg.

An HON MEMBER: Why are you outside the province?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Look at what happened in Nelson Mandela Bay.

An HON MEMBER: Come back, come back here.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, he is coming.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Metros that were run by the ANC are now dumped into nepotism and maladministration.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Different rules!

Mr R T OLIVIER: These municipalities are a carbon copy of the DA-controlled Western Cape municipalities which only exist to serve the interests of the minority white while ignoring the plight of the majority who suffers in harsh poverty. The skewed patterns of service delivery and collapse of governance in the municipalities led to a spike of service delivery protest

across the province. Since the beginning of this year we witnessed a number of violent protests, the worst being the Zwelihle one which needed the intervention of National to calm the situation.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Where is Dugmore?

Mr R T OLIVIER: The DA should take full responsibility for this chaos that erupted in municipalities...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is nie Dugmore s'n nie; dit is julle gemors.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not Dugmore's; it is your mess.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: People are genuinely frustrated with the legacy of apartheid spatial development... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, your finger!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...for the municipal officials undermining the people and deliberately disregarding the Opposition councillors, ward forums and ward committees. As we speak... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, kindly take your seat please. Hon member Mngqasela.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is it a praise singing now?

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I am scared. I have just been threatened.

Ms P Z LEKKER: What is your order? What is your order?

Mr M MNQASELA: I have just been threatened for life by hon member Gillion.

†UNksz M N GILLION: Haibo!

[Ms M N GILLION: No man!]

Mr M MNQASELA: She says she is going to do this to me. [Laughter.] [Slapping on desk.] I am scared.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Sorry hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can we get real serious here with my colleague. He is playing with you.

The SPEAKER: Did you do that hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: No!

The SPEAKER: Okay thank you, I will take your word.

Ms M N GILLION: He is playing. He thinks he is in a circus here.

Mr K E MAGAXA: *Ja*, he is too childish.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela, I have asked the member and she has indicated that she has not done...

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, the other member says I am childish.

Mr K E MAGAXA: *Ja*, you are.

Mr M MNQASELA: He has not finished insulting coloured people and calling them dogs as it was said in the media. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Hey, stop it now!

Mr M MNQASELA: The media says he insulted coloured people and called them dogs.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela, that is not relevant to the point.

Mr M MNQASELA: The same people who insulted Jews and called them criminals here.

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat. That is not a point of order.

Mr M MNQASELA: So this hon member says she is going to do this to me silently but because there is no Hansard to prove it. She said that, she says...

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you, hon member Gillion, can you just kindly take your seat. Please, hon member Gillion, allow me to just clarify.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, please, please. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, I need to clarify the statement made by the member.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are laughing.

The SPEAKER: Just to talk to Hansard, in terms of our Rules all members are considered honourable and if I ask a member, have you said or uttered or gestured in a certain way and the member says no, I have not, I have to accept that member's word in terms of being an honourable member. So if I never saw it and I asked the member and she said she did not do that I have to accept the member's word, hon member Mngqasela.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, if you will allow me to address you.

The SPEAKER: Yes you may.

Ms M N GILLION: The member is casting aspersions on me that I am lying. He is also casting aspersions on the Leader of the Opposition, again. Last week they came, they ran away with this in the sitting. Today, today we on this side are not going to allow that. This casting of aspersions on our Leader of the Opposition in statements that they must prove he did, I am not going to allow that Madam Speaker. As a Whip here I am asking you to speak to that member and ask him to withdraw that statement against the Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I read in the newspapers it said he said. That is the newspaper. You can take the newspaper to the courts. Do not come and play funny games here.

Mr P UYS: We are quiet about what the newspaper said on you.

Mr M MNQASELA: So Madam Speaker, I wish and it is only a wish, that we had proper cameras here. The hon member that did not act so honourable here misleads this Parliament, which is nothing unusual for them.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: She says this and she says to me she did not say it and now she prepares... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No sorry, hon member Mnqasela, I need you to take your seat - both members please. Take your seat, hon member Gillion. I have already ruled. I have asked the member. She responded. It is not my right to call a member out whether you are lying or not because I take the member at her word, and she is an hon member. So that is where the debate stopped. All the other stuff are not part of this debate and I am asking you to stick to the subject please. Thank you, you may proceed, hon member Olivier.

†Mnr R T OLIVIER: Ja-nee wat.

[Mr R T OLIVIER: Indeed, what.]

†Let us continue, Madam Speaker. Let us continue with the business of the day.

†Somlomo namhlanje xa sihleli kule Ndlu iOudtshoorn , iCentral Karroo, iBeaufort West bahleli abanamanzi namhlanje ngoba asijonganga izinto ekufaneleke sizijongile siyile Democratic Alliance, abantu bethu abahluphekileyo abanamanzi silibele ukujonga izinto zeZondo Commission, nguMEC. Siyambona indima ayijongileyo. Idebate yakhe ifocuse kwinto eyenziwa nguJacob Zuma, neZondo Commission neenton-nton hayi kule yokuba abantu bethu eOudtshoorn, eBeaufort West, abanamanzi as we speak. Zizinto ebekumele ukuba uzithetha kule debate asichazele ukuba uza kwenza ntoni na ngalo nto. Yiyo lo nto ke Speaker iipartners zabo ezifana neKDF zibagibisele phantsi kwebhasi zayosebenza ne-ANC ngoba ziyayibona apho indlela ibheka ngakhona.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Madam Speaker, today as we are sitting in this House the people of Oudtshoorn, Central Karoo and Beaufort West do not have running water because we are not focusing on important and pressing issues as the Democratic Alliance. Our poor people do not have water while we are busy focusing on the Zondo Commission by the MEC. We are aware of what his focus really is. His debate only focuses on what Jacob Zuma is doing, and on the Zondo Commission and on other things, not on the fact that our people in Oudtshoorn and in Beaufort West do not have running water as we speak. Those are the issues he should be talking about in this debate and explain to us what he is going to do about that. That is why, Madam Speaker, their partners like the KDF have parted ways with them and went to partner with the ANC because they see that is the way to go.]

†Madam Speaker, let us speak a bit about Noel Constable.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Who is Noel Constable?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Let me tell you now, if you do not know him. I am worried about your heart. Noel Constable said they did not have the blessing of the people to support the Democratic Alliance due to its racial skewed service delivery as well as corrupt and maladministration patterns. This too causes instability and in-fighting in Knysna Municipality where the DA councillors were forced to vote out one of their own as they were tired of corruption and

maladministration.

The situation turned ugly when the DA leader, honourable the leader Minister Madikizela tried to force an elected Mayor to resign. In George, Melvin Naik lost confidence of a corrupt DA caucus in the municipality which was hell-bent to cover up corruption and maladministration.

Hon MEC Bredell, who knew this allegation, folds his arms. When the Hawks raided the office, and this is where I want to get to, when the Hawks raided the offices of several municipalities in the province to investigate allegations of corruption and uncover evidence of wrong-doing he first accused the Hawks of being anti-DA. He said it.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: You said it, you said it. You said they were anti-DA.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Now you were in the rally a few minutes ago. You address the rally a few minutes ago. [Interjections.] It is only fair to conclude that all instabilities around municipalities occurred due to the fact that you have an absent MEC. How can we forget the MEC was not aware of the forensic report into allegations of alleged wasteful and irregular expenditure amounting to millions at the Stellenbosch Municipality [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It was their report [Inaudible.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: He said he does not know. *Ja*, but you did not know as an MEC you were absent. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Why have you not taken action on the Knysna Council recommendation [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...to remove Velile Waxa who is guilty of bridging the code of conduct of councillors? He did not know.

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

Ms M N GILLION: How can you not know?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Independent investigation by Bowman Gilfillan Attorneys shows serious allegation of cover-ups and corruption in Cape Town and this MEC did nothing when Mmusi Maimane threw the report out of the window and reach an agreement with De Lille to cover up corruption as long as she resigns. [Interjections.]..

So they have been screaming there is corruption, corruption and they are covering up now because they could not show what was wrong. The evidence is that the municipalities are collapsing because we have an MEC working closely with the tame Chairperson of the Standing Committee who cannot hold his own executive to account. They become mouthpieces of MECs instead of playing their oversight role. [Interjections.]

The DA infighting also plays a critical role in this chaos. The instability is caused by... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... racial tension in the DA.

Over the past year we witnessed a number of black DA members, and mostly former ID councillors who have... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, kindly take your seat please.

Mr M MNQASELA: None of us are listening to you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph and hon member Tyatyam, that is inappropriate. You are having your own private debate across the floor... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: We are not listening.

The SPEAKER: No-no, hon member Mngqasela, that is another angle now. Kindly refrain from engaging. You may proceed, hon member Olivier.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] a serious issue here.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I will proceed, Madam Speaker. Over the last year we witnessed a number of black DA members, and they must listen [Interjection.] – black DA members, mostly former ID councillors, who have fallen out of favour with the powerful liberal faction, including hon Helen Zille, and were ostracised.

This situation led to what we came to understand as the continuing DA great [Inaudible.] meltdown.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Why are you so worried ... [Inaudible.].

Mr R T OLIVIER: Rhenda Stephan of Matzikama... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, your time... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... Evert Manual...

The SPEAKER: Sorry, your time has expired; finish your sentence please.
[Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, let me just conclude by saying ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I am happy for the drama that took place here that took most of my time, but that House there, that MEC and his whole debacle...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... are failing our municipalities, and hence everyone is leaving that municipality... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... because of the failure of that DA led, including the...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... Leader of Opposition.

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired.

Mr R T OLIVIER: We welcome the ... [Interjections.] candidate. Amandla!
[Applause.]

†‘n AGB LID: Mooi, mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good!]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, the time is managed by the Table staff. I have no control over the time, and I take my cue from the Table. So it is inappropriate to suggest that you have been short-changed, thank you. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, no, can I address you on that? I do not question the timing of the staff, but I am saying of all this drama, of the praise singers here, that played itself out during the time when I had to – *ja*.

The SPEAKER: Oh, but it did not detract from your time.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I think the decorum of the House was a bit...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... *ja*, challenged, *ja, ja*.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Simmers. [Interjections.] Hon members, we are talking about decorum here. Let us compose – hon member Mngasela, if you continue I am going to have to – please. [Interjections.] Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Simmers.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Firstly let me start off by thanking hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.] for the subject for debate that he has chosen, which is “Instability of the Western Cape’s municipalities under the control of the DA”, and listening to the hon member’s speech it is clear ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! We just... [Interjections.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... he is trying to emphasise instability.

Now, Madam Speaker, as governance and administrative instability at local government level has a medium to long-term measurable effect, allow me to illustrate two well-known case studies within our province and certain key indicators, to highlight what is real unstable governance and its effect on much needed service delivery in our communities.

Kannaland and Oudtshoorn Municipalities ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Like George. [Interjections.].

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... reside in the Klein Karoo area of the Garden Route district; in case the members forgot. [Interjections.] In both instances, the municipalities experienced challenges with governance stability due to an ANC-led or... [Interjections.]

†ILUNGU ELIBEKEKILEYO: Hayi suka man!

[An HON MEMBER: Go away man!]

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... ANC affiliated coalition government from 2011 until 2016. This instability in oversight saw a breakdown in service delivery and financial viability to the extent that they could not even pay their creditors and Eskom, and others threatened to take further action. †Lyk my die ANC hou van die ligte af-*switch* waar hulle regeer. [It seems to me the ANC likes to switch off the lights where they govern.]

After undertaking a thorough diagnostic assessment to understand the status of both the municipalities and evaluating the circumstances that led to this general breakdown in governance, the Department of Local Government and the Provincial Treasury, introduced different forms of Section 139 interventions; accompanied by a Section 154 support plan in each of the municipalities.

In both instances the Department of Local Government also spearheaded forensic investigations that saw several officials being charged and dismissed in terms of municipal disciplinary processes, and the commencement of criminal cases with the South African Police Service. These cases remain ongoing.

In the case of Oudtshoorn Municipality, the intervention yielded positive and sustained results.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not true. [Inaudible.] lying!

Mr T A SIMMERS: While Kannaland Municipality showed signs of improvement ... [Interjection.] it still remains on the Province's radar for ongoing support.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr T A SIMMERS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Madam Speaker, a point of order. That hon member is constantly disrupting the debate ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And he is the sponsor of the

debate. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am interjecting.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can the hon member keep quiet for a change? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Fritz, kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.] Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you, Madam Speaker? Through you, to the hon member, that I interject and I have no apology for that. If he does not like my interjections he should not be here. That is all I will say.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, just in terms of the Rules, an interjection is allowed, but ongoing interjections that become a running commentary, I am going to have to rule on. Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Simmers.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Dankie, agb Speaker.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Madam Speaker.] †Let us zoom into the two case studies I referred to of instability in our province, and focus on the historic and current financial management; grant fund utilisation; capital expenditure performance, and for Oudsthoorn, yes, the Cango Caves. These indicators will highlight the real impact of real unstable governance and its

effect on much needed service delivery in our communities.

Financial management, and I will start with Kannaland Municipality. For the period from 2011 till 2016, the ANC was a coalition partner here. This municipality saw conditional grants being misappropriated and these funds being absorbed in operations resulting in unauthorised expenditure of grant receipts and excessive spending on frivolous litigation added to the depletion of huge costs to service delivery where in many instances it had ground to a halt. †Die ANC was deel van hierdie gemors. [The ANC was part of this mess.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: While Kannaland Municipality is showing signs of improvement... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... it still remains on the province's radar for ongoing support.

Oudtshoorn Municipality; once again the ANC was the senior partner in coalition here. With the commencement of the intervention and associated

Section 154 support package in 2016, the financial situation of this municipality was as follows – just to remind the hon member across the floor: the debtors collection rate stood at 86%, adding to cash flow challenges and debt remained uncollected and creditors not paid, which resulted in arrears amounting to R110 million, the biggest portion being Eskom. Once again with the ANC Government it seems they want to switch off the lights.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is ANC Government.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Two years after the initial intervention – and this is now where a DA Government governs – all creditors in arrears have been settled. [Interjections.] And all new invoices are paid within 30 days.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr T A SIMMERS: The debtors' payment rate increased to 95%, as we speak, ending 30 June 2018. The Municipality has also generated, for the first time in four years, an operating surplus of R52,5 million for the year ended 30 June 2018; funds we as the governing party here can be sure will be utilised for projects to uplift the quality of life of the residents of Oudtshoorn; something the ANC-led coalition could never do properly for the five years up to 2016. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They steal the money.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, kindly take your seat please, hon member Simmers.
Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Can the hon member take a question?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Take your seat and I will ask. [Interjections.] Hon member Simmers, will you take a question?

An HON MEMBER: You cannot decide for him.

Mr T A SIMMERS: He must come to the Committee, Madam Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. He will not take a question, hon member Tyatyam, thank you.

Mr T A SIMMERS: MIG utilisation, Madam Speaker. Once again I will just focus on Oudtshoorn for this round. Prior to the provincial intervention in Oudtshoorn, conditional grants such as the Municipal Infrastructure Grant, the Integrated National Electricity Programme and the Rural Bulk Infrastructure Grant were spent on general operations, to an amount of R32 million; of which R8,8 million still today need to be accounted for.

As a result of this, Madam Speaker, capital programmes could not be completed. †Hulle het dit ook op 'n stop gesit, wraggies. [They also put a stop to that, really.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Hulle steel alles, man.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They steal everything, man.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: Under the current DA-led Government, the Municipality is well on track to fully spend their 2018/2019 allocation within the allocated timeframe.

Thirdly, capital expenditure. Now, Madam Speaker, capital expenditures are of importance for the realisation of a municipality's IDP objectives and their long-term vision.

Oudtshoorn Municipality: sadly poor expenditure of their capital budget prior to the 2014/15 financial year was mainly as a result of grant funding being utilised to fund general operational expenses. “Chinese bookkeeping” †noem 'n mens dit in *plain* Engels. [one calls it in plain English.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What happened to the [Inaudible.].

Mr T A SIMMERS: As a result...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What happened to that ANC [Inaudible.]?

The SPEAKER: Order please.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: O, die klip-en-sand man? Ek weet nie, Minister Winde.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Oh, the stone and sand man? I do not know, Minister Winde.]

As a result, capital programmes could not be completed to uplift the lives of the poor in Oudtshoorn, but, Madam Speaker, life is not always dark in Oudtshoorn. Under the current DA-led Council the Municipality's capital expenditure is now improving year on year, and I am proud to announce that they have managed to budget from their own funds for capital expenditure with R11,5 million for the current year, and R14,5 million for the year 2018/19. †Iets wat die ANC nooit kon doen in hulle vorige vyf jaar nie. [Applous.] [Something the ANC could never do in their previous five years. [Applause.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: In jou drome.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your dreams.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: And last, but not least, Madam Speaker – and, yes, I will

talk about the Cango Caves, hon member Dyantyi. Prior to the 2016 Local Government elections, the Cango Caves experienced serious operational challenges... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just talk, do not [Inaudible.].

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... and a result suffered... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just talk.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi...

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... reputational damage. †Kom sien my agterna dan kan ons lekker praat. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Come and see me afterwards then we can have a good talk. [Interjection.]]

Amongst other problems the Caves did not have a dedicated budget for its operations, and its accumulated reserves for maintenance was utilised to cover operational expenses of the Municipality – once again “Chinese bookkeeping” – but oddly enough it was also utilised by the local ANC Government as their petty cash from time to time.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr T A SIMMERS: That is a fact; it was proven.

Madam Speaker, subsequent to the provincial intervention, I am happy to report that operations have stabilised and visitors' numbers have increased to a record figure of 250,000 in the last cycle; as compared to previous years.

In addition, the Caves generated an operating surplus, once again, for the first time in the last few years, of R2,38 million for the first time since 2016.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thanks to COGTA; thanks to COGTA [Inaudible.].

Mr T A SIMMERS: And the bulk thereof is being ploughed back as capital refurbishments.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Simmers... [Interjections]

Mr T A SIMMERS: It is not being used for a party's petty cash.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up. If you could finish your sentence. [Interjections.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: Madam Speaker, in Afrikaans we have an idiom I believe that describes the ANC at all levels of government perfectly as the real destabilisers... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: ... en dit sê:

“n Man van twaalf ambagte en dertien ongelukke.”

Baie dankie. [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: ... and it says:

A Jack of all trades, a master of none.”

Thank you. [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Simmers. The hon member Christians.

†n AGB LID: Pastoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Pastor!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, it is a fact that most of our municipalities under the control of the DA in the Western Cape are unstable, but the question is... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a good start.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... but the question is, was the ANC doing better when they ran the province? [Interjections.]

Now let me take you back to the City of Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The City of Cape Town, the only metro in the province, has regressed from a clean audit to an unqualified audit.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is so true; that is so true.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: And the blame and the fingers were all pointing to Mayor De Lille.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But Mayor De Lille hit back by saying as a Mayco we must take responsibility and also the senior managers in the City of Cape Town. But you see, Madam Speaker, the DA wanted to get rid of Mayor De Lille at all costs ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is right.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... telling me that the priorities of the DA are put in front of the priorities of the City of Cape Town.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Who will ever forget the water debacle that we are still facing today? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Day Zero.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Our people saved water and were penalised...
[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... for saving water.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole man!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals, man!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I think next year at the polls we will see the results.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: People will vote as a result of what they experience under the DA Government.

But, Madam Speaker, let me tell you this, Oudtshoorn was a big disgrace under the control of the ANC.

†n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The municipal manager was jailed for corruption.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Sand en klip.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Sand and stone.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So it tells us, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We intervened there.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... that even if the DA rules or the ANC rules it is all just the same. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, we want to urge the voters of Cape Town and the Western Cape to give the ACDP a chance in 2019 and we will deliver better services when it comes to the running of the province and municipalities. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. [Interjections.] I see the hon the Minister, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Minister Winde, sorry, before you begin, hon member Dyantyi is on his feet.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can the Minister please take a question before he starts?

The SPEAKER: No, sorry, hon member Dyantyi, it does not work... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ask him if he can take a question.

The SPEAKER: Yes, if you can take your seat I will ask the Minister. [Interjections.] Sorry. Minister Winde, will you take a question?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, I will definitely take a question, but probably about five minutes into my speech because it might change the hon member's mind about asking the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek wil praat met hom.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to talk to him.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you run the risk of being sent out if you continue in that manner. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He sponsored the debate.

The SPEAKER: It is your debate, hon member Dyantyi.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, dit is myne, ja. [Tussenverwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, it is mine, yes. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed. Minister Fritz, allow me to run the House please, thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I hope the Table is watching the

time here please.

The SPEAKER: Yes, they are watching, thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Madam Speaker, first of all the hon member Dyantyi just stood up to try and interrupt me as I started the speech.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to ask a question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The reason that he was doing that is because he knew... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You cannot read my mind, Sir.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... that I was going to say, what I am going to say. [Interjections.] That this hon member once again puts on an Order Paper a question... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... that he actually needs a workshop about... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... before he puts it on the Order Paper. He needs to understand that if he wants to get shot in the foot... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... he needs to put these kind of ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... orders on the Order Paper.

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I really want to – now that he is refusing to take the question... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, the question has been declined and there is no debate around the fact that the Minister has said no. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You come after this.

The SPEAKER: You will speak after the Minister, thank you. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I do notice that there are two minutes for the hon member at the end of this debate.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry about the two minutes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But this debate, once again, brought by the ANC, an absolute damp squib. The interesting thing is ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You cannot even take [Inaudible.].

An HON MEMBER: Shush!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The interesting thing is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... that as the hon member starts to speak he uses the words...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, take your seat please. Yes, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, this cannot go on.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr M G E WILEY: This hon member on the other side there, it is his debate... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: He is ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr M G E WILEY: He constantly wants to interject to get his point across.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: He interjects; stands up; he interjects... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Exactly!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... but the fact of the matter is he has got two minutes to reply at the end of it. So any objection that he has he can raise there.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: He is turning this House into a farce.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Sit down, you are not the Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down.

The SPEAKER: Hon members...

An HON MEMBER: Coming from you?

The SPEAKER: ... can we get some order please? Let us just calm down, compose yourselves. Hon member Dyantyi, you will get two minutes at the

end of the session. Minister Winde will not take questions now. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

So the first thing he talks about is saying the DA best run municipalities in South Africa is our own propaganda. So I will show you that this is not DA propaganda; these are judgments made by the Auditor-General, the Statistician-General, the Minister of COGTA ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Clean audits, that is all you know.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... these are statements made by the ANC run and led Government in South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So it is not our propaganda that we are believing; we are just repeating what the ANC and some of these state owned, or these enterprises say about us and how we run our province and our municipalities.

He also then goes on to talk about infighting. Now that is seriously rich coming from someone in the ANC who at the moment cannot even get their branch meetings to take place, and I am not sure when your congress is going to happen because the month has come and gone. [Interjections.]
When are you going to be able to even... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... select a chairman in this province? [Interjections.]

So he must not come here and hope to run a debate with real hard facts... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and then come and raise these frivolous things because that is why this debate is a damp squib from this individual member. [Interjections.]

But, Madam Speaker, let us actually have a look at the audit outcomes. Let us have a look at... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is all you know; audit outcomes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... Minister or Dr... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... Zweli Mkhize. Let us start there with him.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Audit outcomes.

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi, I am going to refer you to Rule 44. It says a member ordered to withdraw – so listen carefully:

“If the Presiding Officer is of the opinion that a member is deliberately contravening a provision of these Rules, or that a member is in contempt, or is disregarding the authority of that Chair, or that a member’s conduct is grossly disorderly, he or she may order the member to withdraw immediately from the Chamber for the remainder of the day’s sitting.”

Members, we are guided by Rule 44. The next outburst I will send someone from this House. So I am asking you please to manage yourselves with composure and not carry on the way you are. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you?

The SPEAKER: I am not entertaining any debate on my advice. You may.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you for reminding us about that rule that we know. I hope that that is not – so far, there is nothing that has been gross about my interjecting, and I hope it is not an attempt to silence me from interjecting

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, take your seat. I do not wish to silence you, but your outbursts are bordering on disorderly. Your hands are all over the place and you are getting quite emotional; so just compose yourself. [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

And that goes for every single member in this House. You do not have to scream and shout; manage yourselves with dignity, and if you are quiet enough you will actually hear the other person speak. Sometimes it is good to listen to understand. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

So I will again say, I will start with the South African Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Dr Zweli Mkhize, who says in his budget vote in the National Assembly; he speaks about the

257 local governments, and he says one-third of them, 87 municipalities to be correct, remain dysfunctional or distressed by political instability or interference, corruption and incompetence.

Now I want to ask this House: those 87 municipalities, guess who runs those 87 municipalities... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who runs Knysna?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in South Africa?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Ah, excellent. Very well done.

The SPEAKER: Order please. Minister Winde, kindly take your seat. Hon member Beerwinkel?

An HON MEMBER: Who runs George?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yôh, really, Madam Speaker, I do not know anymore. Rule 43... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You never knew in the first place.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Excuse me... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... I can give... [Interjection.] I will not even bother. I am not even – it is not even worth a response.

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Rule 43... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, it is a waste. You will be wasting your time.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker – exactly, thank you.

“The Presiding Officer, after having called attention to the conduct of a member who persists in irrelevance or repetition of arguments, may direct the member to discontinue his or her speech.”

Madam Speaker, you have the means and you have the authority to call these members to order who think that they are in the National Assembly. They are not. This is the Western Cape. The topic is about the Western

Cape. It is about municipalities in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] If they have a problem with National, go and debate there, not here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, we are not.

The SPEAKER: ... sorry, take your seat please, Chief Whip.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What rule [Interjections.] – again, again... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, take your seat please. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Again!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Please, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Relax [Inaudible.] relax.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... would you remind the Chief Whip to rise on a

point of order before he just jumps up like a jack in the box and starts speaking. [Interjections.] Yes. Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Because he does not obey rules.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But we have to ... [Interjections.] – no!

The SPEAKER: Okay. So – hon members, if someone is on a point of order and I am listening to that individual and the Chief Whip stands up and I have not recognised him... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The SPEAKER: ... he cannot speak.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: So I am appealing to the members, if someone is on their feet, kindly wait until the individual has taken his or her seat. I am going to allow Minister Winde the latitude, as I did with hon member Dyantyi at the beginning, because I think he is going down a road to make the point.

So, Minister Winde, can I call you, on a point of relevance, to get to the point about the municipality? Sorry, Chief Whip, I am still busy speaking. Yes?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I would just like to say for the record I never speak to the Chair until I am recognised.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Whether I am on my feet or not. I want you to rule please. The hon member Beerwinkel has now twice raised, and in a patronising fashion, has gone and addressed you and then tried to put her point of order across. [Interjection.] Can you please penalise the two minutes the ANC still got to get from the time that she has taken because ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, this is now their strategy. They are creating a debate within a debate. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon members, we are pretty close to the end ... [Interjections.]. I have my Rule Book. [Interjections.] Can we just do 30 seconds again? Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, and in relevance as this part of the debate talking about the instability at the Western Cape's municipalities under the control of the DA; and those 87 municipalities that I was talking about, mentioned by the Minister of COGTA; those 87 municipalities are not in this list in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] So it is exactly the opposite.

Let us take the second thing that the hon Minister spoke about municipalities, and let us see if these are in the Western Cape. He speaks about the R16 billion owed by municipalities to Eskom in South Africa and guess what? Guess what? [Interjections.] Some of those municipalities are in the Western Cape, that owe money to Eskom, and guess who runs those municipalities that owe money to Eskom? Guess who runs those municipalities? [Interjections.] Yes, it does not take rocket science to actually guess which ones they are.

So the hon member Dyantyi, think again when you bring a motion to this House. Think again.

So let us move on to the next person, and I want to quote from the next person. This is the Auditor-General, Kimi Makwetu and let us have a look ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... at what the Auditor-General says... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... about the municipalities in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please. Hon members, you have a member on the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I have waited beyond five minutes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am ready now; can the Minister take a question?

The SPEAKER: Okay. The Minister is busy, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As he promised.

The SPEAKER: Are you taking a question, Minister? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No!

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, there has been a request. Will you take a question?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No.

The SPEAKER: The Minister will not take a question, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He promised!

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, Minister Winde. [Interjections.] Order please!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Will you take a question?

The SPEAKER: No, the answer is no. The Minister said no.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why?

The SPEAKER: He has the right of reply, hon member Dyantyi. [Interjections.] You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: So again, let us talk about the Auditor-General [Interjections.]

...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I just want to ask, Madam Speaker, through you, if the MEC and hon Premier, can refer or make reference to the Auditor-General, given the fact that his reports... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... are challenged by the Auditor-General. He does not obey the Auditor-General ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... agriculturally.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] You may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Agriculture [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry – that was not a point of order; that was frivolous.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So coming to the municipalities in the Western Cape ...
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] in your Department.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and this document which actually talks to the audit outcomes in South Africa, and the kind of audit outcomes... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are not listening to you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and guess what? When you read this document and you see the red blocks in this documents guess which municipalities the red blocks are in this document?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And let us narrow that down, and not every single DA municipality is a perfect municipality; that is what management is all about. [Interjections.] But let us have a look at irregular and fruitless expenditure across all municipalities... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Including [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... including the DA run municipalities in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Including your Department. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So in South Africa... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...irregular and fruitless expenditure runs into 69... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Like Knysna.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ... R69 billion.

Ms M N GILLION: Tourism in Knysna.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: When we come down to the province we also have some of this irregular and fruitless expenditure in the Province of the Western Cape.

[Interjections.] But guess which municipalities they are sitting in?

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is your Department.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Guess which municipalities they are sitting in? They are sitting in Laingsburg, they are sitting in Beaufort West, and they are sitting in Bitou.

Ms M N GILLION: And Knysna.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: That is where the majority of the funding... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell us about George.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ... is misappropriated; and guess who runs those municipalities, Madam Speaker? Guess who runs those municipalities? If we look at the total on irregular expenditure in South Africa, R28,209 billion; the Western Cape has got R160 million, 0,57% of that money; and if we look at fruitless and wasteful, 0,16%; and the majority of even that small amount, guess who runs those municipalities in this province? [Interjections.] The ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So, Madam Speaker, I am sure I have got a little bit more time... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Tyatyam is on his ... [Interjection.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... so on that I wanted to say... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat, there is a member on the floor. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker... [Interjection.] under whose control are those municipalities?

The SPEAKER: You cannot ask me a question, hon Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The topic, under the DA control. We are dealing with DA control.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: And are they doing?

The SPEAKER: I am sorry. That is not a point of order. The Minister is ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: But under the DA control.

The SPEAKER: The Minister is addressing the DA in the province as far as I can hear.

Mr S G TYATYAM: He must tell us what are they doing to solve ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, that is not a point of order. Thank you. [Interjections.] †Minister Fritz, jou vinger asseblief. [Minister Fritz, your finger, please.] You may proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

Then the last person I am going to talk about is the Statistician-General, and the last time he released the Non-Financial Census of Municipalities in South Africa, he made the statement that said the Western Cape is the best province for service delivery in South Africa. [Interjections.]

And on that point [Interjections.], I am prepared to take the question from the hon member Dyantyi.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, thank you. There is your – no-no, your opportunity for a question. Your opportunity for a... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We still have time?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good.

The SPEAKER: No-no, this is the question to the Minister you have requested.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good. Thank you, thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Do you not waste your time.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Can we come to the question now?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He felt that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please speak to the Chair, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... he does not want to be...

Mr D JOSEPH: Do not waste your time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because it was becoming embarrassing for him to first promise... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ask your question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... and then... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... you have... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, I am asking a question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, hon member Dyantyi – sorry, Chief Whip, I just need to ... [Interjections.] Hon member Dyantyi Sorry Chief Whip, I just need to ... hon member Dyantyi, may I alert you? You wanted to ask a question; the Minister said five minutes later; you then came back and asked, “Will the Minister take my question?” He said no. The Minister has now afforded you an opportunity to pose the question, so please do pose your question. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: No, give him the opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. †Is daar nou 'n vraag? [Is there a question now?]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I am asking my question. All I am saying is that he felt very embarrassed for breaking his promise. [Interjections.] And here is my question... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, the question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here is my question to him.

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is he doing?

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Can we please stop this... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... absurdity and abuse of the Rules? This is absolutely frivolous nonsense. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: This is embarrassing.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, let us get on with the business.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You needed to ask a question, please get to your question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. Hon Minister Winde do you not feel very embarrassed... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: No.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... as a member of this Executive Council, and now you are touted as this liberal Premier candidate, that you... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: That is an opinion.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is not a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... in everything else that you were praising about the audits, that in the DA that you are actually the black sheep? Because your Department that you are leading... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: You are making a statement.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... Agriculture and Economic Development... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Sit down, that is a question!

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat, please, Chief Whip. Sorry, he is busy with his question. [Interjections.] Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I – Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.] I am completing my question.

The SPEAKER: Please do, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please let us ask – can we ask *baas* Wiley to sit down please? The question is ... [Interjections.], and I will finish my question... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will finish my question ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, kindly take your seat please. There is a member on the floor.

Mr D JOSEPH: The member is making opinion statements and not asking a question. He must ask a question please.

The SPEAKER: Alright, let us – take your seat please, hon member – everyone take your seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You must protect ... [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, this is abuse.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, everyone is referred to as an hon member †Daar is nie “base” of “madams” hier nie asseblief [Tussenwerpsels.]. [There are no *base* or *madams* here, please. [Interjections.]] So let us please manage ourselves. Thank you. Let us – members, please, just contain yourselves. Hon member Dyantyi was asking a question; he went down the road ... [Interjections.] and I have asked the hon member to get to the point of his question. Hon member Joseph, do you want to rise on a point of order?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think the statement that hon member Dyantyi made is unparliamentary; he must withdraw his statement about the “baas” that you referred to. I ask that he withdraws it, it is unparliamentary.

An HON MEMBER: What is it unparliamentary [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As a person who has contributed to this democracy... [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Het jy nie jou pille gedrink nie?

[Ms M N GILLION: Did you not drink your pills?]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... I would like to ask...

The SPEAKER: Order please! You have a member on the floor.

Ms M N GILLION: But the MEC does not stop.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I contributed to this non-racial society; I fought for it.

The SPEAKER: So is it a point of order, hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is it parliamentary for hon member Wiley, after he has been asked to sit down, to pull the arm of hon member Joseph to ask a question that he could not even ask? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is it parliamentary to do that?

The SPEAKER: Alright. Sorry. Hon member Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I want to appeal, Madam Speaker, I am rising on a point of order and I would like hon member Dyantyi to withdraw. We have hon members here, we do not have “baases”. He just called our Chief Whip a

“baas”, and I would like you, Madam Speaker, to ask him to withdraw that because that is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: He said “he” also. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, so – hon members – hon member Tyatyam, I did not see it. I am sorry. So I cannot rule [Interjections.] – you might have seen it, same as earlier on when hon member Mnqasela said something; I never saw it. I cannot comment on what I do not see, and I cannot rule on what I do not see unfortunately. Yes, hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Ms M N GILLION: You ruled on the issue that I was accused here of making signs to an hon member.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Ms M N GILLION: Now you are referring again to that, that, “I did not see this”. Madam Speaker, I have asked in this House not to have aspersions cast on my integrity.

†‘n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor.

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.]

Ms M N GILLION: And now you are doing the same, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I used the example, hon member Gillion, it was not...

[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: But you are doing the same now, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I am sorry, it was not intended to cast any aspersions on you. It is exactly the same act; I never saw. In your instance, same as I never saw... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: No-no-no, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... what happened in this instance.

Ms M N GILLION: I do not take it lightly, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Well, I am sorry, but that unfortunately is... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: But that is casting aspersions because it happened in this sitting.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are casting aspersions on my integrity.

The SPEAKER: You indicated... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: I told you I did not do it; you believed it, but you are coming back to that. What are you referring to then?

The SPEAKER: No, I said to you that it was used as an example.

Ms M N GILLION: And the MEC Fritz is not the Speaker here.

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Thank you. So kindly take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are not the Speaker in this House.

The SPEAKER: ... if I recall, did you say, "Please ask *baas* Wiley to sit down?"

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, I did.

The SPEAKER: Okay. That is considered unparliamentary; would you withdraw that please?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, “baas” is “boss” in English, and the boss of this Parliament is the Chief Whip, which is Chief Whip Wiley.

An HON MEMBER: On your side, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is his title... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... for all of us here. Hon Chief Whip. So I am trying to – I am admitting to you I said “baas” Wiley... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... I could have said “boss” Wiley or Chief Whip. †Hy is mos die baas van die Huis! [He is the boss of the House after all!]

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Hon member Dyantyi, I am sorry, that is pushing it. [Interjections.] We unfortunately do not use the term “baas” in this Chamber; we refer to the hon Wiley, the hon Chief Whip. So I have asked you to withdraw your statement please, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, alright. Hon Chief Wiley, you are a Chief Whip for all of us. †Jy is nie die baas nie. [You are not the boss.] So I withdraw. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, jy was nooit die baas nie,

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, you were never the boss,] †I withdraw. Can I now finish my question?

The SPEAKER: That was not very parliamentary, hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Ask your question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I withdraw. He is not †“die baas”. [“the boss”.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the very point hon member Gillion raised. If you have ruled do not go back there. I have ruled, †nou gaan jy nog terug daar. Asseblief man! [now you are going back there. Please man!]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie, baie dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Minister Winde?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. Thank you. I hope the MEC is listening to me. MEC Winde... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The question, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the question. That is what I want to complete because I could not complete it.

The SPEAKER: So please do.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because of Chief Whip Wiley. Can you please tell this House that you are going to stop harassing the Auditor-General because you are looking for a clean audit when your Department has failed?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I did refer to fingers. Before you respond, Minister Winde, there is a member on the floor. Hon member Lekker?

†Me M N GILLION: Fritz hou nie op nie man.

[Ms M N GILLION: Fritz does not stop, man.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Can I ask you to kindly request hon member Fritz to withdraw his finger? I thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It is very difficult, but, members Fritz and – thank you,

hon member Lekker. [Interjections.] I saw hon member Beerwinkel's finger right across the passage. There are just – and if anyone will remember, earlier on I said no more fingers; so please put your hands in your pockets. Alright? Minister – thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sorry, Madam Speaker. Member Fritz is asking me where he must remove his finger from. That is what I am laughing at. [Laughter.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Uit jou *pocket* uit.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: From your pocket.]

The SPEAKER: There are people watching this on YouTube. This is supposed to be the highest House in this province, where rules are meant to be made and people lives are meant to be improved; and we reduce it to what it is currently. It is appalling behaviour and it completely unacceptable.

Now we understand why people think Parliament is a circus because of the very way in which we manage ourselves.

So I am speaking to everyone, and I am asking now that you follow the Rules and that you cooperate, and at least treat each other with respect. I am speaking, hon member Tyatyam, take your seat. That you treat each other with dignity and respect. That is all it requires. It is not rocket

science at all.

Now you might want to score cheap political points and do grandstanding, but do it in a way that it does not reduce the Chamber and the proceedings of the House to what it is right now.

So please, I am appealing to you all, any hand gestures, fingers, whatever it might be, please just contain yourselves. Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam, you are up and down, can I help you?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, finally. Madam Speaker, I just want to understand. From what you are raising... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Workshop.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... is there any rule that you are referring to on what you are raising? Because we are on YouTube we must not smile, we must not cry ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Well, I have seen... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Is there a rule? Because currently we do not have a rule here.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, Rule 41 talks about the dignity and

decorum of the House; and that applies whether we are here or whether we are out there.

An HON MEMBER: Why does You Tube [Inaudible.]?

The SPEAKER: Wherever we go and well, YouTube might see you pointing your finger or picking your nose; that is the point I am trying to make.

So we are not just in this House, we are out there and we need to be an example to the citizens of this province. That is the point I am trying to make. Thank you. You may respond, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

So I started off this debate saying that this motion put on the Order Paper by the hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not the question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... was a damp squib... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ... in actual fact the ANC got a hiding on every single point on these issues.

The second thing is I then give him an opportunity in the House to stand up and ask a question. He fails dismally again in asking a question... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and in actual fact I am surprised... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Answer the question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... the hon member Beerwinkel did not stand up and ask him what the relevance was of the questions he was asking, because he actually asked two questions in one.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The answer to the first part is no, and the answer to the second part is no. [Interjections.]

So, Madam Speaker, it is in this province where, if we take the top 10 performing municipalities in South Africa, nine of the top 10 performing municipalities in South Africa are in this province and are DA run. [Interjections.]

The top performing, for the last seven years, clean audit municipality is where? DA run in this province. [Interjections.] The 91,000 title deeds that have been handed out to beneficiaries of houses, are where? In municipalities in this province. Where the DA governs; we govern way better than the ANC. The ANC keep people in poverty; they keep people... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down, you are grandstanding.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... poor. They have the municipalities where the sewerage runs down the streets, where they fail to deliver and then they stand up and they bring these kind of arguments to this House. They fail again. [Applause.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You are grandstanding.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dyantyi. Hon members, this is the last two minutes of this debate. Hon member Dyantyi, you have two minutes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Quick responses. Having listened to the entire debate, especially from that side...

[Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: You have nothing to say.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... I have the following to say.

Mr M MNQASELA: You have nothing to say.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: One: when Deputy Mayor Ian Neilson, followed by others, start to say to citizens, “We are reducing your tariffs,” this is what you need to liken them to. They are likened to an abuser who has abused his victim and is giving them flowers. That is what the DA is doing to our communities.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You abused communities with high tariffs; now you are saying, “We are reducing them.” †Sies [Sis] on you. That is the first thing I want to say to the DA. That is a message you must take out here.

An HON MEMBER: Hayi!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: In Afrikaans sê ons dit is ‘n verkiesingsfoefie wat

julle doen. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: In Afrikaans we say it is an election gimmick you are doing. [Interjections.]] †Let me go to the next one.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Dyantyi, kindly take your seat.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will be checking my time. I will be checking – that was just the first point.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat! Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Madam Speaker, there are two minutes and I want to know the relevance of what he is saying.

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He is supposed to sum up.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, we will get there.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What is the relevance?
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He is supposed to sum up.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry, hon member Dyantyi, take your seat please.

Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. The hon member is a very good member of my portfolio. I would like to ask him a question... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What is your point of order?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... if he is prepared to take a question?

The SPEAKER: Okay, sorry, I will ask him. Thank you, take your seat.

[Interjections.] Take your seat please. Hon member Dyantyi, will you take a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will take his question off-line.

The SPEAKER: Okay, he will not take the question now, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Off-line, over coffee.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The second point I want to make, and I thought we made this point upfront and they have missed the entire point, the DA. We said the DA is good in complying and then parading clean audits. They have done it here, because their clean audits are not translated into improving people's lives. When are you going to get this? [Interjections.] Tell us about the awards; they mean nothing. When people choose to vote, as they will do, they are not thinking of clean audits; they are thinking about work, they are thinking of poverty, and all of those things. These are the things that you do not care about.

So you have missed the entire point about this. [Interjections.] So bad. They have stood here; they have just become auditors. Member Winde thinks he is an auditor here. He tells us about how good they are. We said you are complying in the books but you are irrelevant and you fail on improving people's lives. You have no answer to that. [Interjections.] There is no answer to that.

The next point, Madam Speaker, the third point, the MEC of Local Government, instead of responding to this debate he chose to fly to Pretoria instead of being here and giving us answers. [Interjections.] He went to DeZondos, he has got this obsession with Zuma. Maybe we need to

give him a coffee with Zuma so he can speak to Zuma. He has got this obsession [Interjections.]; he never answered any of these questions. [Interjections.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member, your time has expired. I will allow you a last sentence. [Interjections.] The last sentence. [Interjections.] Just finish off quickly please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: *Ja.* [Interjections.] The last sentence...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order! [Interjections.] Hon member, conclude please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The last sentence, Mr Deputy Speaker: I want the MEC for Local Government, in the next sitting, to answer the dossiers that are coming from Theewaterskloof... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... that have been submitted to your office.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, your time has expired. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, you have just cut me. I wanted to ask whether the hon member is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: His time has expired unfortunately.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Alright.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of this debate. We move on to Interpellations. I see the hon Minister Madizikela.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Communicare: unfair rental practices

1. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether he has taken any steps to hold Communicare accountable for the unfair rental practices that had been reported?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to hon member Gopie for the question.

Communicare is a registered, non-profit company under the Companies Act.

It is not a state entity. It has no shareholders and does not pay dividends. All profit made is ploughed back into the organisation to make a social impact.

Communicare manages a total of 3,374 units, of which nearly all rentals are discounted between 30 and 80%.

Communicare has a variety of rental units which are rented at different prices, depending on the size and allocation. It aims to provide for households earning monthly incomes of R15,000 and below, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Communicare's overall performance, when measured against [Inaudible.] benchmarks are as follows: rental increases of 6% for 2017, in line with CPI as the average CPI for 2016 was 6.59% with rental increases for 2018 set at 7%.

Vacancies are below the 2% benchmark. Tenant turnout is below the 2% benchmark. Rental collection is above 95%, and in some of the rental units, like in Bothasig, is 100%.

Now the important point here about this question to note, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that evictions can only be granted through courts after due processes have been followed; having considered the provisions of PIE or the Prevention of Illegal Evictions Act, and unlawful occupation of land. No landlord may evict any tenant in their own capacity, but a landlord may give notice to vacate

should a tenant be in breach of the lease agreement.

It must be noted that since July 2017, Mr Deputy Speaker, 14 evictions were granted by the Magistrate's Court in Communicare's favour. This represents less than half a percent of Communicare units, and thus cannot be considered as mass eviction.

In addition, prior to instituting eviction procedures, Communicare follows a process of engagement with a tenant to understand the reasons why a tenant may not be paying their rental. If the problem is of a short-term nature, Communicare may offer tenants financial relief of three months; and that has sometimes been extended to six months by Communicare. However, if rental default persists after engagement processes have failed, the landlord is empowered to approach the courts to ask for an eviction order. The magistrate ultimately decides if there is ground for eviction. If there are grounds for eviction then eviction is granted.

And I must add, Mr Deputy Speaker, lastly, that we have been following the issue of Steenvilla very-very closely, and we have in some instances come to the party, as a Department, where we offered some of the affected people, particularly elderly, alternative accommodation; but what is important here, as I outlined the process which is followed before eviction, is that we must make sure that we are pushing the poor in instances where poor cannot afford to pay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But lastly, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In the case where people who have demonstrated that they can pay but refuse to pay, this is the process that is followed, and that social housing institution has no choice but to follow this process.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, Communicare was formed in 1929 by citizens concerned about the housing conditions in Cape Town. In 1930 it was [Inaudible.] the first housing development in Crawford, followed by a large scale model village in Brooklyn in 1931. In 1938 Ruyterwacht Township was established. In 2009 Communicare celebrated its 80th anniversary. It accepted its responsibility for the role it played in victimising people in the past, and committed to never again be party to unfair discrimination.

Communicare is a social housing partner of the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town. MEC Madikizela's Department as well as

Human Settlements in the City make funds available to Communicare every year. As we speak, pensioners who have lived in Ruyterwacht and Brooklyn for most of their lives are being victimised and threatened with eviction. Every year on 1 July the rent goes up. For children who live with their parents, their income is also considered when the monthly payments are determined.

The question therefore to MEC Madikizela is why is he turning a blind eye to all the injustice and victimisation of tenants by Communicare, when this Department gives funds to Communicare for social rental, to improve quality of life of our people?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, like the Minister mentioned Communicare is a registered non-profit company under the Companies Act. The following legislation provides fundamental principles and guidelines which the Rental Housing Tribunal operates from. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, Act No 108 of 1996; the Rental Housing Act 99; the Unfair Practice Regulations and the Procedural and Staff Duties Regulations published in terms of Act 50 of 1999; the Prevention of Illegal Eviction from an Unlawful Occupation of Land Act 1998; and the Consumer Protection Act of 2008, Act No 68 of 2008.

The functions of the Tribunal are to harmonise relationships between landlords and tenants in the rental housing sector; resolve disputes and unfair practices; inform landlords and tenants about their rights and obligations in terms of the Act; and to make recommendations to relevant stakeholders pertaining to issues related to the rental housing sector.

Now my question to the Minister is therefore: are there any companies who are exempt from the above legislations, and consequently the scrutiny of the Rental Tribunal Forum?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms L M MASEKO: I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie again.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, since 2015/2016, which started with the large-scale eviction of people, including pensioners who have been paying rent to Communicare for over 40 years, the MEC has been silent. Communicare has won the majority of cases that were brought before the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal.

Mr John Adams, who is one of the tenants and eviction activists fighting for the right of Communicare tenants is here with us today, accompanied by a pensioner, Mama Nunjolo, age 67. That are also going through the same

victimisation. He too has been victimised and suffered for years under the partnership of the Western Cape Government and Communicare. He recently won his appeal, but Communicare has now decided to take him to court to force his eviction. How can you expect a person that is getting a disability grant to pay over R3,000 rent?

The silence of MEC Madikizela and the Rental Housing Tribunal's failure to hold Communicare accountable, confirms the long held suspicion that the MEC Madikizela's Department and all their entities are captured by private property developers, as well as social housing partners, who are allowed to get away with these crimes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Again the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, in doing our oversight role, one of the oversights that we did is to visit the Rental Tribunal, and it was quite clear that the Provincial Department of Human Settlements is in fact committed to challenging unfair rental practices as it adheres to, and has taken the appropriate steps in terms of the legislative framework; including the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and Rental Housing Act.

In noting these successes, does the Minister plan to roll out the Rental Housing Tribunal in other rural towns within the province or is it only going to be confined to the City? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Again hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, why are areas like Ruyterwacht, Drommedaris and Brooklyn still under Communicare and not moved to the City of Cape Town like has been done in areas like Belhar Extension? It belonged to Communicare before and it was moved to the City of Cape Town. Why are these areas still under Communicare?

And the MEC must tell us what will appeal to his conscience and force him to take action against Communicare? Must people buy him cake seeing that he sold the people over a slice of cake? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Maybe I should start by making the hon member understand how social housing works; because from all the contributions that have been made by the member it is very clear to me that something is missing here.

Now for any social housing project to work there are four very important players. It is National Government through SHRAH; it is Provincial Government that contributes to make that accommodation affordable to the people; it is a social housing institution that contributes about 10%; and then it is that local authority that puts equity in terms of land so that that rental can become affordable to the people that we are catering for.

I think it must be noted here Mr Deputy Speaker, because I do not want us to try and play cheap politics with this thing; I have said here in my first response, that in instances where people are treated unfairly, I have personally asked for the evidence to be presented before me, and that evidence has not been forthcoming. And I would like to challenge the member here, if there is a pensioner that is being charged R3 000 a month, I would like the member to bring that pensioner to me so that I can deal with that, because in terms of the Rental Housing Act, no one may be charged more than 30% of his or her income. If you are a pensioner you may not be charged more than 30% of your income. So I will take this up Mr Deputy Speaker, because I take this matter very, very seriously and the last thing that I want to see is where pensioners can no longer afford to pay in a rental housing unit. We 'right-size' them as I said. If they are struggling to pay, we take those people and offer them what is called a BNG house so that they get away from continuously paying in a situation where they can no longer afford to pay.

That is the role that this Department has been playing to deal with some of these issues. But people must provide evidence if they are claiming that they are being victimised and I have not seen that evidence forthcoming.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, the time has expired for this interpellation now. Interpellation 2 has been withdrawn. We go into Questions, Questions Standing Over From Thursday, 30 August. Question number 9, hon Makeleni to Minister Fritz. I see Minister Fritz.

[Debate concluded.]

[Interpellation 2 withdrawn.]

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Questions standing over from Thursday 30 August 2018, as agreed to by the House:

Sexual violence in schools

9. Ms P Makeleni asked the Minister of Social Development:

With reference to the Sexual Violence in Schools in South Africa (SeViSSA) Kwanele Study that was conducted by the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC), which proved that sexual violence is commonplace in Khayelitsha schools:

- (1) Whether his Department has taken any steps to address the challenge; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether any assistance has been given to affected learners; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy

Speaker. To the first part of the question, the answer is yes. The details are as follows: Referral Pathway: the region has established agreements with the Department of Health, Thuthuzela Centres, Western Cape Education Department, South African Police Service and the Department of Constitutional Development and Justice.

Once a case has been identified by the school social worker or educator, a completed Form 22 will be submitted to the Department of Social Development, and in Khayelitsha specifically, the district office will attend to it. In the event of a crisis, the school will call a social worker to further investigate and intervene at the school and from there the child is taken for medical examination at the Thuthuzela Centre.

The second point is the Child Protection Register. The Department of Social Development Khayelitsha records, and reports on a monthly basis, all reported cases of sexual abuse to the provincial office. Monitoring processes are in place to ensure that all reported sexual abuse cases are investigated and that the children are safeguarded and the social work service is activated.

For the period to April 2017 to July 2018, 145 Form 22 cases have been reported and investigated by the free social work services delivery teams. Then there is the 24-hour Child Protection Service with social workers on stand-by to render the crisis intervention service after hours. The service is active from four o' clock in the afternoon to half past seven in the morning, during the week and on weekends and public holidays, 24/7. It is also

available on Christmas day.

Educational and intervention programmes: there are four child protection programmes that were implemented during Child Protection Month in Khayelitsha in collaboration with SAPS and the Western Cape Education Department. Parenting skills are on our programmes: 54 biological parents attended the Khayelitsha programme; 217 community members attended educational programmes on sexual, child abuse, violence against women and children and substance abuse in Site B at SAPS and during May, June, July 2018 the assistant probation officer facilitated in collaboration with the NGO Iliso Care Society the YOLO programme, that means 'you only live once' in 11 schools in Khayelitsha.

This is an accredited sexual education programme and 1 700 learners were reached. The same programme was implemented during the June 2018 holidays in Site C and Town Two in Khayelitsha to 40 affected foster children. The Say Stop Programme for young sexual offenders, diverted from a criminal justice system is in place and 30 young offenders are registered for the programme that will run over 10 sessions in September 2018.

Now the second part of the question Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, assistance has been rendered and the details are as follows and there is a whole long list which I am able to give to the hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then you may table that, if that is a request?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes.

[List as tabled by the Minister.]

Statistics	Intervention Programs
<p>Sexual Abuse Cases reported: Form 22's received: 145 cases reported for child abuse (April – July 2018).</p> <p>Social Workers provided therapeutic counselling and assessments for the children and parents.</p> <p>A 24-hour Child Protection Service is active and crisis intervention services are provided by Social Workers in the Region, including Khayelitsha.</p>	<p>Educational and Awareness Programs during May and June 2018 71 children attended Child Protection Programs in Site B, Khayelitsha.</p> <p>54 parents attended Parenting Skills programs from Khayelitsha.</p> <p>482 children/ learners attended sexual educational programs at Ikhusi Primary School, Khayelitsha.</p>
<p>Stakeholders: DSD Khayelitsha Nonceba Counselling Centre Thuthuzela Forensic Centre SAPS (Site B, Harare and Lingelethu) Department of Education PASCAP ILLISO Care Society</p>	<p>Multi-sectoral Intervention 15 May 2018 – Chumisa Primary School Inter-sectoral collaboration meeting with Nonceba Counselling Centre and PASCAP to address issues of sexual violence against children in Schools.</p> <p>Social Workers were allocated 11 individual cases for affected learners. Therapeutic counselling was provided by Social Workers</p> <p>Intervention Plans Educational program facilitated by DSD Social Workers at Chumisa Primary School scheduled for the 5th of September 2018.</p> <p>Parents and Children Parenting Program scheduled for Saturdays (6th, 13th, 20th and 27th of October 2018).</p>

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No follow-ups, we you can then move on to the next question which is Question number 11. Hon Magaxa to Minister Winde.

Job losses: second quarter of 2018

11. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

With reference to the Quarterly Labour Force Survey for the second quarter of 2018 that indicated that 50 000 jobs were lost between the first and second quarters in 2018:

Whether the Provincial Government has any plans to avert more job losses in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker and to the hon member for the question. The Western Cape employment growth from quarter 2009 to quarter 2018 has outpaced national employment growth by more than 60%. A strong indication that, in a difficult national economic environment the province has outpaced national in the most important of economic indicators, employment growth.

We have achieved this due to strong economic leadership, a commitment to working with the private sector and clearly formulated programmes such as our Game-Changers and Project Khulisa. The quarter labour force survey for the period April to June 2018 indicated that 77 000 new jobs were created in

the Western Cape over the past year representing a 3,2% increase. The Western Cape also recorded an expanded unemployment rate of 23,2%, almost 14 percentage points less than the average national of 37,2%. The Western Cape, which contributes less than 15% of the national economy, created 40,7% of all jobs in the past year.

Having said this, it is well known that our economic climate is dependent on matters relating to investment deterring national regulation, investment deterring corruption, National Government's position on land reform and the strength or lack thereof, of critical infrastructure including transport and energy infrastructure. These factors have an important impact on the Western Cape economy too which would have no doubt, grown even faster had we been able to fix these.

We have also been hit by several climatic conditions in the last while such as the drought, which is still a reality in our province. In this respect we have done well to weather the storm, recording a year-on-year increase of 2 000 jobs in this sector. Obviously as the rains have started, it has started to make a difference in parts of our province but in the northern parts of our province, the Beaufort Wests, the Oudtshoorns, the Ladysmiths, they are still in a desperate position with regard to not having any rain and very, very little dam water collection thus far.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, M Deputy Speaker. I think it is necessary before I make a follow-up to explain the question or to re-read the question because I think the Minister is unfortunately involved in some defence mechanism. My question is: because the fact here is that we have lost 50 000 jobs in the first and second quarter of 2018. That is the fact here and therefore I am asking my question in relation to that fact. I am asking a simple question, what is the Department doing, what mechanisms are in place? I am interested in the mechanisms in place.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much for that follow-up question and without going into the numbers, because we can, obviously, 50 000 jobs down in that quarter on quarter: 65 000 jobs were in the rural areas which is the knock-on impact primarily of the drought. The City started to show the turn-around, so we started seeing the jobs coming back. 15 000 jobs on that quarter in the province. On a quarter and quarter is always difficult in a seasonal economy like ours which has tourism as well as agri-processing. But what are we doing about it is the question, the follow-up question that the hon member asks, and that is where we come in with cutting red tape, we come in with enabling

SMMEs, four and a half thousand SMMEs helped in that period.

We come in with our Project Khulisa, where we hopefully this weekend, early next week, in an international market, will receive the top award in the world for our Airlift programme. That increased where we were battling to find 1% growth in our country over the last few years, in actual fact starting off the beginning of this year with a projected 3% growth being downgraded to 1,4% growth and I think by the end of the year, judging by what is happening in our country at the moment, we will be lucky again to achieve 1% growth.

Those counter programmes that we are running in the province, actually show you when you look at the jobs numbers, despite a drought, despite Avian Influenza, despite junk status, despite the policy debate that is going on, the effect on the national rating agencies, on our rating as a country, how the World Economic Forum views us from all of those indicators and how we have dropped substantially in those indicators, despite all of that, this province still manages to create jobs 60% faster than the national average. Sitting at 77 000 jobs up this period ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is more unemployment.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... year-on-year where we have the fastest growing jobs in South Africa amongst all provinces, and it happens because of those kind of projects and interventions.

Businesses confidence index in this province is higher than any other province in South Africa and has been there in those positions for years ... [Interjection.]. So those are the kind of interventions that we put in place, as a government, and you can see the facts are in the job numbers and when you measure us against other provinces, you can see exactly, that is exactly where those job numbers count and of course the unemployment rate too. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you Minister for only responding on the second part of the question. But I want to ask, perhaps in terms of trying to fast-track the situation, so that we are not negatively affected, as the Western Cape, further by this technical recession that we are facing. Is it not perhaps time for the Minister to try to adopt some of the strategies of the ANC Government in the Western Cape, because as the Western Cape we have always had a better employment rate compared to other provinces, it is historical ... [Interjection.], it is not new, you did not discover anything new. But I just want to check, if perhaps you can introduce, because crime might be one of the contributing factors to the situation. Can we perhaps try to deal with issues of adopting strategies, co-operating with, I mean partnering with some private companies in water, in every kind of situation, to train students ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... and also adopt Bambanani so that we can at least involve ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... communities in fighting crime ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... giving some incentives ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... also the ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: If the hon member wants to give a speech why does he not put it in as an interpellation then he can speak for minutes [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Yes I am watching very carefully. The member is almost done with his question so I want him to conclude with that question. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... including community health workers, something like that that will expand the public sector in partnership with the private sector ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I think you have explained fully to the Minister.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... to sort of find a lot of people jobs so we can address the crime problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you may respond to that long question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. First of all, definitely no. My job is the economy. Bambanani is a project that was run through Community Safety and so definitely not in my Department. Although I know that the ANC from a policy point of view and obviously also from an ANC card carrying member point of view, probably used it as a way in which to channel Government funding to individuals ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is rubbish!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... who were ANC members, and then it was seen as a job or

income, but definitely not on my watch.

But of course the issue that is raised is crime and I have already reported to this House where we do intervene on crime issues because it is something that is negative to the economy and we have already mentioned the kind of work that we have done around ATM fraud, the kind of work that we are doing right now around security on Table Mountain.

And of course there is a new project within the Department that the Standing Committee can interact with, as we start to develop the new project which is called Securitech where we actually start to see how we could enable that environment in our region.

We have become very, very good at fintech and it is really good to see how fintech is gaining its own momentum; Katlego Maphai just receiving R250 million investment into his company called Yoco. Really, really exciting to see because that is what we need, we need entrepreneurs who are creating real jobs. But of course we will, from an economic point of view, put strategies together that will deal with the question that was asked about crime.

But we will also measure these things and we will see if they work, if they do not work, we change them and we bring other programmes in place and of course we will be moving into another five year strategy very soon and we will take all of these mechanisms that we have intervened on.

Another point raised by the hon member is skills and skills transfer and you will know that through the Apprenticeship Game-Changer, we really are trying to change the way that skills are developed in our region.

I think as South Africa, we made a mistake when we first formed our new democracy, when we started to look at the role of skills training and how that would happen, in specifically FET College spaces, and the point that the hon member brings is business partnership and we actually did away with that business partnership in our system.

So in South Africa we did not have apprenticeship type skills training programmes specifically for artisanal skills and we, in this province, are really trying to get that back again and we budget, personally, in my Department, R70 million a year for that. We were very successful with the Work and Skills Programme which eventually ended up with the South African Government making a tax regime change for youth employment, which of course we can also be proud of. That came out of this province and the push came from this province, we eventually got that to change at a national level.

These are things that we intervene with and I think this is where we are seeing those successes and that is why we see percentage wise, 60% more job creation in this province than anywhere else in the country. And then of course we could go into the policy discussion and the policy environment and I am happy if there is a follow-up question on policy because we can talk

about that too.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will move on to the next question which is Question 12. Hon Nkondlo to Minister Winde again.

Unemployed farm workers

12. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

With reference to the Quarterly Labour Force Survey for the second quarter of 2018 that indicated that 27 000 people have already lost their jobs in the agricultural sector in the Western Cape and are constantly facing eviction:

Whether his Department is assisting the unemployed farm workers; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much to the hon member for the question, First of all, the primary reason behind the decline in agricultural employment is the seasonal cycles of farming combined with the impact of the drought, depending on the measurement, one in hundred or one in four hundred year drought. But despite this, we have still created 2 000 more jobs in this sector in the second quarter of 2018 when compared to the same quarter in 2017.

And of course we did the work with BEFAB to look at where the risks lie, but I must also use this opportunity to say specifically to the agricultural sector that, thank you very much for the resilience that you show as an industry because you have put programmes in place to try and minimise the job losses and of course, as I said earlier in the previous question, the impact we are feeling now is not necessarily directly in agricultural jobs, it is actually in jobs in our municipalities and rural areas which is a knock-on effect of that drought and specifically still, those municipalities that have not had winter rains yet. They really are under huge pressure.

The next part of the question is about evictions. All legal and illegal evictions are dealt with in accordance with specific processes as per the Extension of Security of Tenure Act 62 of 1997. These processes are mandated or a mandate of the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform and administered as such by them. This Department maintains the database of all evictions pertaining to agri-workers and farm dwellers.

However the Department has a sub-programme, Farmworker Development, the only one of its kind in the country and this assists evicted agri-workers through the facilitation of access to appropriate departments and municipalities through its referral system, where we bring in the Department of Labour or we will bring in the judiciary, we will even lay charges if there are illegal evictions in that entity ... [Interjections.] in order to link them to the services and support programmes during this process and as and when this Department is made aware of such cases, as happens in this House from time

to time, and I hear an interjection from one of the hon members who raised an issue in this House last time we were here. I intervened, we went and investigated that farm, we have sent the individual member three emails, we have also sent the Chief Whip an email in answering, and we still have not had a reply back from the detail on those interventions that were raised in this very House by this unit. We are proud of this unit in the way that it intervenes and protects abuses, because we need to protect these kind of abuses.

Then of course there is the other side of it which links to evictions and the decrease in agricultural jobs although we have seen a turn-around in this province. If you take, since 2014, in agricultural jobs we have seen more agricultural jobs in this province than ever before. Percentage wise, definitely more agricultural job creation than the rest of the country. But those evictions do happen and that is where the honourable Madikizela, in conjunction with our municipalities, has even started to budget now for percentages of budget for housing allocations to make sure that they are allocated to agri-workers. And this in those municipalities that are taking it up, is also starting to make a big difference specifically for farm workers who are moving off farms.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Minister. One of the things you referred to is a referral system. Are you able to provide to this House, how many you

have referred and how many have actually received jobs after that referral? You are saying when people lose jobs, one of the strategies that you use is to help them by referring them to municipalities and also through the Department of Labour, so I am requesting numbers of the people that you have referred and how many have been placed? Am I clear now?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes, very clear and thank you very much. Obviously I would need to have that as a separate question or we will get the detail for you. But for example when we had the Avian influenza and if a duck farm, who had 100% cull of their total ducks on the farm, then had to be put under quarantine, that is when we brought the Department of Labour in. The Department of Labour were brought in and two things happened from that. The first is that we actually made sure that we could put people who had lost their jobs onto training programmes, so a number of people ended up on training programmes, then also having a look at how that referral goes to other jobs or also, that we could sustain those people without a job, for a period of time until the quarantine was over and then of course, as those jobs were picked up those people were taken back into employment.

So definitely we can provide you with those details and it happens we have got a very, very good working relationship and when one of these issues happen, whether they be evictions and we deal with Chris Nissen who comes on board, we then have those discussion in the Department with our unit and we bring in the Department of Labour and so of course this happens on a

fairly regular basis. We have built up quite a strong relationship, specifically when we have seen the down-turn in the economy and where those jobs have been put under pressure.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Minister. Hopefully I will get the information that you are referring to. Can I quickly also ask about the issue of farm evictions? To date what would you say is the percentage of evictions that you have intervened in, as the Department, and out of those farm evictions what are the specific underlying reasons that you are engaging with the farmer? I am raising this, because at one point we engaged with Women on Farms and we found that there was little engagement with the actual farmworkers in those farms. So I am trying to understand how spread is your engagement both with the farm owners and the farmworkers, but also what are the underlying reasons for the evictions?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes, so obviously those details and percentages you will have to ask me a question on and I will supply you with those answers.

But, if we talk about Women on Farms, the last time, in Simondium, when the Women on Farms held their last meeting, guess who arrived at the meeting of Women on Farms? None other than myself. And it was very interesting the way that I was treated at the meeting because they were totally surprised that

I arrived.

What happened then is I proceeded to sit down with individuals who raised issues, because I sat there and listened to the whole meeting, I made sure I targeted those individuals who raised questions. [Interjections.] I wrote down the questions. The Farmworkers Support Unit then, over the next week, visited every single one of those complaints. Then we wrote a report and I asked a whole range of questions of Women on Farms and again, it is three to four emails. You should ask that in the question, ‘how many times have you interacted with Women on Farms’, and I will send you copies of the emails.

And guess what? To date, not one answer, not one reply to those questions .. [Interjections.] and interestingly that that invitation went to myself, it also went to Chris Nissen who did not go to that meeting, but it also went to the Department of Labour. And what I found really interesting in that meeting at Women on Farms ... [Interjection.] was the attack on the individual who came along from the Department of Labour. He was attacked, just on-going. I cannot imagine that someone from that Department would go back to a Women on Farms ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Mr Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... meeting again. It was very interesting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister, just one second. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can I request that the Minister tries to answer the question. I understand that there ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You will have another opportunity to get ask a further question and you can address the Minister then.

Ms N D NKONDLO: No, there is a specific question I asked him, not about his excursion to meet with the Women on Farms which is what he ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have conveyed your sentiments. Hon Minister you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question was a percentage and I said you need to put that in a question to me and I will get you the percentage, the actual cases I will also supply that ... [Interjections.] if you provide a question on that.

So then the question was about Women on Farms and the individual member asked me [Interjections.] about Women on Farms and that is what I am replying to. And of course, if you ask a question I will give you the answer. And so very interestingly, specifically in Simondium, and I mean we do know that there are especially agricultural accommodations that are not acceptable, and we need to work on that ... [Interjections.]. But it is very interesting.

I would actually personally like to invite the hon member to come out to Simondium to have a look at a project that was launched there not so long ago, with my colleague Minister Madikizela and individual ... [Interjection.] farmers in conjunction with the Municipality, working on a seven year project where 30 households were built and these are amazing. They have set an amazing benchmark here: marble-top kitchens, depending on the family needs, whether you needed two bedrooms or three bedrooms, an unbelievable agricultural development for housing and what is more ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... the development was put in place right next to where Women on Farms were raising the issue. It was put in place where individuals get title deeds, it really was amazing and we need to give all credit where credit is due with this kind of investment that takes place in rural areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we move on to the next question, Question number 19, hon Gopie to Minister Fritz. Minister Fritz?

Juvenile centre at Matzikama

19. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether his Department has plans to build a juvenile centre at Matzikama; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to hon member Gopie. As per the provincial strategy for the provision of child and youth care centres within the Western Cape, the Clanwilliam Centre is the only juvenile centre for the West Coast. So it is right there at the top, very near to Matzikama in any case. What we are busy doing now is a 30-bed extension, with Minister Grant, to specifically look at children in conflict with the law to accommodate more children from that Matzikama area.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: The hon Minister said we are busy with a 30-bed extension at Clanwilliam and which area transports juveniles to Malmesbury?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Again it depends. We are

talking specifically about child and youth care in terms of the Child Justice Act, specifically children under 18 and Malmesbury has slightly older children. They are over 18 and again it depends. If it is an awaiting trial child, the police have the responsibility. If it is a sentenced child into our custody, we will transport them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think maybe I do not understand the question but the question is referring to Matzikama and the MEC is answering on a centre in Cederberg.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister you may respond to that.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me make it very clear to the hon member. We cannot honestly build a youth care centre for children in conflict with the law in every town. So you cannot have it in Matzikama, but there is one just down the road from Vredendal, down the road from Clanwilliam. It is a very modern centre and caters for most of the West Coast children under 18 in terms of the Child Justice Act. If you are older then you will go to Malmesbury Prison. There is a youth centre in Malmesbury for older children that are known as juveniles. But, in terms of the Child Justice Act, if it is a child awaiting trial, that falls within the Department of Social Development and they will be transported by us. By the way our social workers will also because they all fall within us. If you are older than 18 it

will be the police that will transport you.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Gopie jy kan nou volg.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Gopie, you can now follow.]

Ms D GOPIE: During our oversight we picked up that Matzikama juveniles are being transported to Malmesbury and that is why I am asking this question, because at the moment, being rural areas that are running short of vans, to use vans to transport juveniles to Malmesbury, taking police out of their duty to go to Malmesbury, and they do not have enough vans, so that is why I am putting this question. Also there is a shortage of police and now how many hours do they have to travel to Malmesbury?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The answer is in your own language. As I just said now, a child is determined and defined as someone under 18. A juvenile is defined as over 18 to 21 and you are talking about juveniles. They have got nothing to do with me. I deal with children, in terms of the Children's Act and in terms of the Child Justice Act, and I think that is the distinction we must just make. The police do not take children, social workers drive children to our centres and I have seen this right there in Clanwilliam, from Vredendal to Clanwilliam, and you know the distance, and from Van Rhynsdorp to Clanwilliam. That is our centre.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. We then move onto the next one. It is a question that has been moved from a written reply to oral

reply. Hon member Mitchell to Minister Madikizela.

Question for written reply, which was not replied to, published for oral reply in accordance with Rule 206

Construction of toilets at existing houses

In Rustdene, Paddevlei Paddavlei and Mandlenkosi

1. Mr D G Mitchell asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

With the reference to the R1,9 million allocated to the Beaufort West Municipality in March 2017 and the subsequent addition of R400 000 for the construction of internal toilets at existing houses in Rustdene, Paddavlei and Mandlenkosi:

(a) how many toilets have been built, (b) how much did each toilet cost to build, (c) how much money is left of the budget, (d) who were the beneficiaries of these toilets, (e) how was the selection process of these beneficiaries conducted, (f) what tender process was followed to contract the person employed for this project and (g) what are the labourers' (i) names, (ii) daily worksheets and (iii) rate per day?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Before I read my response I just want to start by saying that I am really aggrieved about what happened there ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Ja, this is an embarrassment.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... and I would want to really ask member Dijana to go with me, when we are going to deal with this in that particular town. Just to give context to this, Mr Deputy Speaker, there are a number of areas around the province, where you find that there are old houses that were built years ago, and there are very old people who have ablution facilities or toilets far away from their houses.

If Swellendam wants to make an application we can also consider it because we have done it in Saldanha, we are doing it in Gugulethu and we are now doing it in Beaufort West. Now it has always been my view, Mr Deputy Speaker, that when we do this, we must use locally based people to do these things so that we do not give this work to big contractors or captains of industry.

Now that was the agreement we had with the Beaufort West Municipality when we made this funding available. With reference to this particular question, my Department and under my discretion, approved R1,9 million and we anticipated there that if a toilet costs between R15 000 and R20 000, you could actually build more than 100 toilets with that amount of money. And then the Municipality added R400 000 on top of that R1,9 million which took it to R2,3 million.

Now what makes me feel so aggrieved Mr Deputy Speaker, is that we entered

into a memorandum of agreement in March 2017 between the Municipality and my Department and as I said, that memorandum of understanding spelt out very clearly how we wanted this to be done.

To answer the question: when I visited the Municipality, I think about three weeks ago, we discovered that there were only six completed toilets and others were at various stages of completion and the Municipality had committed to only do 21. Now with six completed and others at various stages of completion and out of R2,3 million, the Municipality indicated that they only had about R160 000 left.

What clearly happened here, because I received a report, is that I get a sense that the Municipality interpreted what they were supposed to do very, very wrongly. Because instead of focusing on building the toilets, they used most of the money just to employ people. Now there were more than 216 people employed Mr Deputy Speaker, to build those six toilets and they were employed for more than a month. Now the question is, if you have more than 200 people employed for more than a month to build only six toilets, what were they doing? Now I really feel very aggrieved about this, and I will be going back to have this conversation with the Municipality, because the people who are left in jeopardy, are those very old †gogos [grandmothers] and those old †tamkhulu [grandfathers], for which this money was meant, so that we can deal with the situation of fixing the toilets. So that is the response to this question and that is why I am saying, I feel very disheartened by this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Given that there has been a lot of corruption in that municipality in the past will he be able to get a list of those contractors, the people that worked on that project, in order to be able to hold someone to account?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not want us to try and politicise this issue because ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I cannot believe that member Gillion, I just cannot believe it. [Interjection.]. The response that I have given here paints a very bad picture. It does not matter who governs but let me just get to the question. This was done under the coalition of the ANC and the KDF ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: In March 2017?

HON MEMBERS: No!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, let me ... [Interjections.],
let me get to that ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can I respond to that,
Mr Deputy Speaker? The memorandum of understanding was entered into in
March 2017, but the work started between March and April this year.
[Interjections.]. No, no I cannot believe that there are members who want to
justify this. I cannot believe it that there are people who want to justify this.
Now to answer your question Chief Whip ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: To answer your question Chief
Whip, I have requested a report and I have not finished with the report of all
the people who were working and the so-called team leaders that were
working there and the exorbitant amount of money that was paid to those
people and I will be making a follow-up because these people must be held
accountable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My question is around this issue in Beaufort West. Taking into consideration that we have always heard that there is no capacity in Beaufort West, what has your Department done to capacitate Beaufort West for this project? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now look that is an important question. Hon member Dijana my Department ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Minister, just one second. Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The member said †“ek praat †nie met jou nie.” [“I am not speaking to you”.] It is unparliamentary to speak like that to a Minister [Interjections.]. Please † “ek praat nie met jou nie”, [“I am not speaking to you”,] we do not talk like that in this House. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I presume it is was an interjection across the floor which I do not find unparliamentary but it is perhaps rude. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, just to respond to member Dijana's question. Hon member Dijana if you look at the modus operandi that you suggested for this project, there is really no need for any capacity to be added here, because what we expected from the municipality, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, is to get people to manage those labourers, or the people who have these skills because we wanted plumbers, bricklayers and all we needed, which we provided by the way, was project management in partnership with the Municipality in order for this to be done properly.

But that was never done and that is why we are in this situation now where people were just employed willy-nilly. In actual fact this money was used as a slush fund just to employ people without necessarily doing what the money was intended to do. So this is not a question of the Municipality that needed to be capacitated quite frankly. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I have got two opportunities left and I will give one to Mr Uys and one I will get back to Mr Wiley afterwards. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you hon, Mr Speaker. We need to understand this very clearly from the MEC. This was allocated in March 2017, what did his Department do up to March 2018 to see that this got implemented because a year lapsed and nothing happened. But, hon Minister, when you started to say you are very concerned, I am also very concerned and you will have to

answer that. This is the first time, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we saw an MEC not answering a written question and it was forced onto the Order Paper to answer it orally, so there is something wrong in your Department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I can see what hon member Uys is trying to do here. [Interjections.] Let me answer the question. We entered into a memorandum of understanding, as I said in March 2017, and unfortunately it was during a time when there was instability in that municipality and that is why this project ended up starting early this year, according to the report that I received.

The project then started early this year, and as I keep on saying, the understanding has always been that this money was to be used to build toilets, not to be a slush fund to employ people. Now as far as the second part of the question is concerned, there is nothing wrong in my Department, and you know that very well.

Now the reason why it took so long for us to respond is because we were waiting for this report that I just spoke about here now. The question was put to me by the member, but because we wanted to get this information from the Municipality so that I could have all the information when I answered the question, that resulted then in the delays and that is why the question was moved from written reply to the oral reply. There is absolutely nothing wrong

with my Department. [Interjections.]. I just want to make ... [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Minister has already said that he is prepared to chase this down without fear or favour ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The question!

Mr M G E WILEY: He is prepared to chase this down without fear or favour. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Allow the member to ask his question.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I ask the Minister, why does he think it is on the other side of the House that there is so much objection? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am actually dumbfounded,

Chief Whip, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, that there are people who try to justify this. I am actually dumbfounded. So I do not want to stand here and speculate. As I said, I want to believe that every member of this House would be concerned with this, and that is why initially when I started with my response, I mentioned member Dijana deliberately, knowing that she works there ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: We want you to do something about it.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Exactly and that is why – in fact I could have done something about it already, Chief Whip, through you, because I was due to go back to that municipality two and a half weeks ago, but unfortunately the Mayor requested for me to hold that visit because he was bereaved and I respected that. The Mayor of the town lost his mother [Interjection.].

So I am still due to visit this so I can get answers on this so that those people can be held accountable. So I will be very happy if the hon member on that side of House, who works there, can go with me, so that we can deal with this thing together, because this is a very serious matter for me and we need to hold those people accountable. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question, New Questions, the first one will stand over in the absence of the Minister of Education. Question 2 hon Magaxa to Minister Grant. Minister Grant?

[Question 1 stands over]

New questions

Louwville High School, Vredenburg

2. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

- (1) (a) How much was spent on the new Louwville High School in Vredenburg and (b) what was the reason for the delay in its completion;
- (2) whether there was overexpenditure on the budgeted R65 million; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer to question (1) (a) R64 548,179 was spent to date on both construction costs and related professional fees. The construction final account and professional service provider final accounts, are in draft and due once agreed.

(1) (b) The main reasons for the delays of completion by the contractually determined target date include the following: Firstly, the discovery of an asbestos 300mm rising water main during mass excavation requiring re-routing and installation of a new UPVC water main pipe increased the cost by

R2,36 million.

Secondly, additional classrooms and the enlargement of the forum required by the Western Cape Education Department during construction included the consequential revised fire design increasing the construction cost with an additional R2,475 million. Thirdly, groundwater inflow delayed the scheduled levelling of platforms, excavations and strip footings, resulting in delays with cause proven beyond the contractor's control.

The answer to part 2: in terms of the gate approval system of the Western Cape Infrastructure Delivery Management System and the service delivery agreement provisions adhered to by both the Western Cape Education Department and the Department of Transport and Public Works, the approved amount and including abovementioned additional costs, amounts to R70 179 481. This number represents the budget currently allocated by the Western Cape Education Department for the all inclusive project costs and is the revision of the previous budget amount of R64 098 000 as was contained in the Western Cape Education budget vote 5 of April 2016.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you hon Minister. At least I must commend you for answering all the questions, I did not have to repeat the questions again.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a big improvement.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I just want to check with you that when you talked about the reasons for delay you also made mention of additional classrooms and some water which is more for engineering processes. Is there a number of classrooms that were initially determined by the Department when it was planning this school? Did they have an actual amount or number of classrooms that were supposed to be there? What made the number change on implementation? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The reason for that was when we design a school then the Western Cape Education Department budgets for a certain number of children at that school. In the lead up to the contract it was found that there was greater demand in that area than had been anticipated. [Interjection.] So whilst they were under construction the decision was made because there was the land available on that particular site to build some more classrooms. So that is the reason why there was a slight budget increase to accommodate more children at the school. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, second question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My other question is in relation to the engineering challenge which involved the water. Could the

engineers that were planning the building of the school not anticipate or know that the land had those challenges prior to beginning the building of the school?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, to reply to the hon member, what our Department does is it gets all the plans that are based at the municipality for that particular site in terms of prior work done in that regard and from time to time we do get surprises. We get surprises also when we build roads, we suddenly find that there are water pipes underneath roads when we are excavating roads so this is not unusual.

We simply adapted and we completed the project, basically a little later but there was more capacity but within the revised budget.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I must say you are not surprising me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, just for my own knowledge once you are busy implementing a project, obviously there have been procurement processes before that that determines what the cost of this project is. Now if there are revisions in between how do you handle that procurement?

I am not sure but don't you give preference to the current service provider or contractor and bypass the normal procurement process? I just want to get a

link between that, how does it work? If you have already started implementing and now there are all of a sudden changes and there has been a scope of the project in the beginning?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the relevance to the question is that there was no new contractor. There was negotiation done between the contractor and our Department with the concurrence of the Western Cape Education Department just to expand the existing contract with budget supplied from the WCED.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon member Uys, last opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC may I ask you, you were previously MEC of Education and now of course Public Works ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And he messed it up.

Mr P UYS: ... did you ever build any school within budget, any school?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He will not remember.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The answer is yes.

Mr P UYS: Which ones, just one?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mapule High School in Knysna.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto the next question which is Question number 3. Hon Magaxa to Minister Madikizela.

Land owned by Provincial Government

Availability for low-cost housing

3. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether pockets of land owned by the Provincial Government, especially those closer to places with opportunities, will be made available for low-cost housing; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes the Provincial Government has made a number of pieces of land that are well located, available for development. Those pieces of land are at various stages of development. Prime examples of these developments are the old Conradie Hospital in partnership with the Department of Public Works; Forest Village which also ticks the boxes in

terms of integrated human settlements.

We are busy now with a development right next to Mitchells Plain because when we talk about integrated human settlement projects and inner city development, we are not only referring to the City of Cape Town, we also have a project that we are about to launch in Bellville which we will be launching on the 25th of this month. We are also about to do a sod turning ceremony in Goodwood, next to Goodwood Station where we will be providing more than one thousand housing opportunities there.

We are also busy now with the Somerset Hospital precinct and with Woodstock sites that we are doing in partnership with the City of Cape Town. So there is a list. I mean the list is endless and in all these areas we will be providing more than 10 000 housing opportunities, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr P UYS: Low cost.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are talking about mixed development now, not just low cost but if I can just quote the low cost only because I am not sure what you are referring to, because we are talking about BNG which is low cost; we are talking about social housing which is low cost and then FLISP units are also low cost because if you look at FLISP units they cater for the working class.

These are the people who are earning below R15 000 and there is a strong

view currently, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we should now go beyond R20 000 because the majority of people that are considered to be wealthy, who are earning up to R20 000, are those people that belong to the working class and we should consider also bringing them in as part of those people that are assisted by the Government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the MEC. I think hon MEC when we talk of low cost housing, me and you, taking into consideration our background, our emphasis always will be RDP houses first and foremost and then social housing of course, but it is a category that is above our base. Therefore I would like you to take me through if you can, in terms of low cost houses in Somerset, for example, when will the first project start because you know your days are numbered? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You could be kicked out any day now.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Thank you, hon member. You have made your point. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Actually you took the words out of my mouth, Chief Whip. Through you Mr Deputy Speaker, to the Leader

of the Opposition. I think as we said, to be realistic here, for us to make inner city development feasible, Leader of the Opposition, we have taken an approach of doing mixed development. So what we do is that we have a certain percentage of BNG, a certain percentage of social housing and then FLISP and then you have the upper market because you want to make sure that the project is viable so that the houses that they accommodate are able to cross subsidise those at the lower markets, so that you do not have a situation where the people at the lower market are paying a lot of money.

So that mix is critical if you are to make sure the development is feasible. If I can give an example, because that is the approach that we are going to follow, of the Conradie; it is 51/49 in Conradie, although we are saying 51% of the houses must be for people at the lower end of the market and these are your BNG but also I think I need to emphasise this point because it cannot be that in 2018 we still consider people who are earning six, seven thousand as people who are earning a lot of money and that is why the emphasis now is not only on the BNG. Now I can just share with you that more than 40% of the houses that I spoke about are specifically, Leader of the Opposition, BNG. Those are your BNG units but then you have your social housing and then your FLISP which I think is very, very important for us to start addressing the challenges that exist in that particular market for the working class.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move onto the next question. Question number 4 has been withdrawn and Question 5 will stand over in the absence

of the Minister of Education. We move onto Question 6, hon Gillion to Minister Mbombo, Minister of Health. Minister Mbombo.

[Question 4 withdrawn and Question 5 stands over]

Under expenditure and underperformance

Department of Health

6. Ms M N Gillion asked the Minister of Health:

With reference to the quarterly performance summary report for quarter 3 and 4 of 2017/18, which exposed under-performance and under-expenditure in her Department:

Whether any measures were put in place to address the challenges that led to under-performance and under-expenditure; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question, hon member Gillion. When you speak of quarters 3 and 4 it does not paint the bigger picture because at the end of the Annual Report, which is 2017 and 2018, all those that have been mentioned in the quarter 3 will have been in progress. For example, those at the end of the Annual Report have actually been achieved. In quarter 3, out of those 19 indicators, five underperformed but at the end of the whole of the quarter, in the year, they were achieved.

In quarter 4, of the 141 indicators there were three at the time that were not achieved or underperformed, but by 2017/18 only one that ended up not being achieved. So in the overall Annual Report which we are supposed to table, I think in the next month, you will find that of the 150 indicators that we had, only two were not achieved or underperformed which is the one that I am responding to.

So one was in Programme 2, which is District Health Services, specifically the case fatality rate on malnutrition. Now you are asking the question what have we done in regard to that. What we picked up at the time was that it was about not separating the case fatalities for diarrhoea, the case fatalities for pneumonia and the case fatalities for nutrition which ended up generating a wrong denominator.

What was required as part of that indicator was that with malnutrition you can only diagnose it individually, you cannot diagnose it when the patient is presenting with other diagnoses. We have changed this. So that is where we are, hence when we come to the first quarter of 2018 this will have changed.

The second one is related to health infrastructure maintenance; I think there was another explanation of about R58 million at that time. The issue there is where contractors do not complete the work on time. In terms of the measures we put in place, where instead of having an annual contract or a contract until they are finished, you have term service contracts where we are able to track the contract instead of waiting until the end of the year and only then

we find out they did not perform. So that is where we are. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you MEC. Mr Deputy Speaker, my question refers to the quarterly performance report for quarter 3 and 4 for the year 2017/18. MEC, the usual suspects in this Department are the EMS and Health Facilities Management. Again these two programmes remain the Achilles heel of this Department. I want to ask the MEC to tell us what she plans to improve on the performance of the Department moving forward, specifically on these two items: EMS and the Health Facilities Management because according to that report, it is again those two? EMS is one of the issues that is highlighted in this province and then also the Health Facilities Management. Now can you just ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member you have asked your question.

Ms M N GILLION: ... explain to us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister you may respond.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Health Facilities Management is Programme 8 and I have already explained what the reason was for that underperformance. It was related to the maintenance and as I explained, instead of waiting for

the end of the year in terms of evaluating and asking the contractor to account, we have term service contracts; that part I have explained.

With the EMS, the issue of the priority one response during the time that there was underperformance, was as a result of the delays related to the assaults where staff ended up having post-traumatic stress disorders. In terms of the reply on the underperformance where we did not meet the target related to priority one response, there was a time where we shared the safety plan that we have around that. So you will find that some of those priority ones are affected by the social system that impacts on that. So whilst we might have a plan in terms of the whole issue about red zones and being accompanied and so forth, it makes it difficult to guarantee to what the extent of priority one is - 15 minutes in the Metro from the time of the a call up to the time that the ambulance arrives in the Metro. And then in the rural areas I think it is around 20 to 30 minutes depending on where you are. So there are those kind of challenges that we have.

However at the end of 2017/18, although in that quarter 3 or quarter 4 there was an underperformance, at the end of the whole of the year we managed to pick it up, hence you will find those targets are achieved.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, can the MEC give us this guarantee that at the end of this financial year, that all the infrastructure that was budgeted for, will meet the target

100 per cent?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are in the second quarter of 2018. I cannot guarantee that. I cannot, but what matters is: are there any mechanisms in place so that we do not have a similar experience like in quarter 3 and 4 where we ended up having the underperformance. So hence, learning from the last year's 2017/18 experience we have put measures in place, as you have asked, so that we avoid that situation. So we are monitoring throughout. I think when we present to the SC now for the first quarter of 2018/19 or for the second quarter of 2018/19 that is probably where we will be able to see the effects of measurements that we have put in for 2017/18, but I cannot guarantee whether they will be effective.

That is why we are doing monitoring and evaluation with our monthly meetings, with the HOD and myself and also with infrastructure ministerial task meetings with the Ministers of Public Works, Treasury, Finance and myself and then Education and sometimes Human Settlements, dealing with infrastructure. We have all those mitigation factors where we identify the projects that seem likely we will end up not being able to achieve. And then for us, we will identify like 2017 and so forth, and then we look at those so that you do not wait until the end of the financial year.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you MEC. What I

understand from you is that Public Works is responsible but you cannot only rely on Public Works, and therefore you have to put different mechanisms in place in your own Department to actually monitor, because you say when you get to the third and fourth quarter, if you just leave it to Public Works you are going to be in trouble.

Now what is this parallel structure that you had to put in place in the Health Department and I am not criticising you for that because of the lack of proper performance in Public Works, you had to do it. [Interjections.] Now look at ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr P UYS: ... the accommodation. What is happening there? Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Grant is creating an impression that this MEC is not good enough to answer questions ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys get to your question.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sies man!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sis man!]

Mr P UYS: She is good enough to answer ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: ... and I am asking her the question what mechanisms did you have to put in place to actually counter the problems created by Public Works?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: With regard to infrastructure regulations in terms of National Treasury, each and every aspect of maintenance has got different responsibilities. Public Works, for example, in terms of the capital infrastructure relating to maintenance, it is divided into refurbishment and all kinds of fancy names which relates to National Treasury, who have changed their regulations.

So what I am getting at is there is maintenance that we are responsible for in terms of the day-to-day, the routine and so forth. This is what member Gillion is asking questions about and then there is bigger maintenance, for example in the Cederberg where the whole ward needs to be closed down and refurbished, which is completely different.

So what I am responding to now is maintenance that we are responsible for, whether it is painting the walls or the floors and so forth plus also technology. So that is the R58 million that I am responding to, the one that we are responsible for.

In terms of the arrangements with Public Works it is not necessarily within

maintenance where you will find those arrangements. We started 2017/18 where we used all our budget and they have been efficient. It is always related to capital infrastructure. For example, like in Vredenburg Hospital where the contractors were left to go to court and so forth.

In Witzenberg, whilst we have opened a clinic in Prince Hamlet for example, the delay with the Wolseley one is because of the contractor that is managed by them. So there are those kinds of problems in terms of a separation. That is what I am trying to explain.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on? Hon member Gillion, do you want to follow up? You may follow up, the last opportunity.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, since we are talking about the performance of the Department and the measures to address the underperformance, I just need clarity from the MEC, if she can answer me, when will the Hout Bay Day Hospital be opened?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Is that not a new question.

Ms M N GILLION: It is not a new question. It is in the public interest. MEC Fritz, I am talking to the MEC of Health ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, concentrate on your question to the Minister.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes, the Hout Bay Day Hospital. And then also, MEC, what plans do you have in your Department to address this issue that is coming up in the public every day about the shortages in Khayelitsha Hospital?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It appears on the face of it like totally different questions. Hon Minister if you are in a position to respond to that, you may respond.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay. Starting with the latter, the last parliamentary sitting we had, the member had a question for oral reply around Khayelitsha and I then responded in her absence. Secondly, on 25 or 26 September the Standing Committee has also asked us to talk about Khayelitsha so there will be more time to respond around that. So I dealt with that one.

With regard to Hout Bay, coincidentally on Monday – I am looking for member Mackenzie – he is not here; this Monday I am doing an oversight visit at the Hout Bay Hangberg CDC and then we will follow up with a street meeting where I will respond to those issues and you will get the answers then.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move to the next question. Thank you, hon Minister. Question 7 ...

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] open.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I thought you were asking about the new CDC, the new ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No that one we opened long ago. Long ago.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. We have disposed of that question. We move to the next one which is number 7. Hon member Kivedo to Minister Winde. Minister Winde?

I-CAN centres in deep rural areas: plans to roll out

7. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

Whether there are any plans to roll out I-CAN centres in the deep rural areas; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The I-CAN Centre in Elsie's River was set up in the 2014/15 financial year and was designed as a proof of concept project. The design of its infrastructure and its skills

programmes were comprehensive in order for DEDAT to test an ambitious public access centre model in practice.

At the end of the I-CAN Elsie's River proof of concept period which is 2017/18, it was concluded that although the model was highly successful in Elsie's River, the model would be too costly for the Department to replicate on scale across the whole province.

We realise from the project that given the economic challenges facing citizens in an impoverished community there will always be a requirement for Government to co-fund such initiatives and as such, high initial capex costs would limit the scalability. The Department also believes that public access centres such as an I-CAN cannot remain dependent on Western Cape Government funding to sustain themselves.

Although the Elsie's River centre has significantly reduced its dependency on DEDAT funding year-on-year, it has taken a huge effort and almost four years to reach this juncture. DEDAT has therefore refined the model to determine how it could reach its objectives of delivering access to digital skills for citizens but with more efficient and more cost effective programmes and project design.

A major component of setting up I-CAN Elsie's River was the extensive investment in infrastructure. This related to both the building and the ICT and various systems. This placed a major constraint on funding to scale the

same model. To mitigate this DEDAT has amended the project design and methodology. Instead of setting up new bespoke centres such as the I-CAN Centre in Elsies River, across the province, the Department plans to leverage existing facilities and ICT infrastructure already present in the market.

DEDAT thus aims to create an effective, extensive decentralised network of sites in both rural and urban communities where local operators and entrepreneurs are empowered to deliver digital skills content to their local communities. To roll out and scale the delivery of digital skills in this manner, DEDAT will work in partnership with other Western Cape Government departments, private sector stake-holders, academic institutions and local community networks and operators.

The scale of the challenge is too massive for any one stake-holder to tackle alone. In order to test the methodology and required ICT systems, DEDAT plans to initiate the network with seven rural sites and three urban sites, including the I-CAN Elsies River in 2018/19 and 2019/20.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question. Question number 8, the hon Schäfer to Minister Madikizela. Minister Madikizela?

Farmworkers: housing and accommodation

8. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

(a) What projects has his Department planned to provide housing and accommodation for farmworkers in the Western Cape and (b) with which agricultural municipalities is he working with to address this?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Again just to contextualise the answer to this question and say that the unfortunate thing here, hon member Schäfer, is that when I took over this Department, farmworkers were almost treated as if they are aliens in terms of benefiting from houses that we were building and what we then did, as this Department, for the first time, we then insisted that municipalities must include ... [Interjections.] ... farmworkers on their housing demand data bases or your so-called waiting lists. Since then, in most of our projects that we are doing in rural areas, farmworkers are now benefiting from those projects ... [Interjection.].

But I can just highlight a few projects where farmworkers benefited massively. For example, in De Doorns, a number of farmworkers benefited there and also there are projects that were specifically done for farmworkers. Haarlem is one example where, in partnership with the farmer, the service providers, we as the Department built eight beautiful projects in Haarlem. In fact that project won a National Govan Mbeki Award. Also in Simondium, the project that my colleague Alan Winde spoke about, there is a beautiful project that is catering only for farmworkers.

But also just to mention other areas where farmworkers have benefited massively is in Klapmuts, for example, in Rooi Dakke that we are busy with in Rosevalley in Oudtshoorn, in Friemersheim in Mossel Bay and McGregor that we are busy with now. We have completed 418 houses and a number of people who are there, are farmworkers.

So in a nutshell, in most of our projects, if not all, outside Cape Town where farmworkers reside, they are now benefiting from our projects and I can give you the list of those projects where farmworkers are now really benefiting from our projects. And, lastly, our current project that we are busy with which is the biggest project outside the City of Cape Town, which is Transhex, farmworkers will also be benefiting from that project in Breede Valley.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, are you checking, in terms of the IDPs of municipalities, what are the checks and balances to ensure that all municipalities take some responsibility as a percentage and in those checks, is there a stated percentage of their budget that must be allocated to farmworkers, farmworker housing?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In fact member, hon member Schäfer, we are going beyond just monitoring. I have been very encouraged by the goodwill of the farmers themselves. Farmers are saying, because of the

approach that we have been using, 'Look, let us partner in this challenge', it cannot be just the responsibility of Government to provide houses for farmworkers.

There are incidents where farmers are saying 'Look, we can make land available, you can provide homes for our workers' and that land you will find it is big enough for us to provide homes for other people. And, in some instances farmers are saying 'Look, if you can provide land for our workers we will put in money for top structure'. So those are the kind of partnerships that we are now embarking on as a Department, which is a very good thing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My question to the hon Minister is: you just said now that there are a lot of projects happening. What public participation was there with the farmworkers because farmworkers were moved out of their areas and currently the majority of the farmworkers now stay in urban areas and are moving back, staying on other farms because they cannot cope with the pressure of the urban areas? So what is your Department doing about that? Was there ever public participation with the farmworkers in moving them and then my ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One question only. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There are isolated cases, hon member Davids, where in our engagement with the municipality – because

remember the issue of public participation when it comes to the planning of projects, it is done by municipalities - where municipalities are saying, 'Well, a particular area, those workers prefer to be housed there,' and the one example that I can think of off the top of my head is the Velddrift Project in Berg River, where you find that in some instances.

But, then you find that there is this big debate between the Department of Environmental Affairs and Planning and ourselves on the issue of providing homes in an area that is not economically viable. There is that big debate but there are instances if I can just say where we went ahead, where the initial plan was that those people who are living in rural areas or in farms, that they must be moved to towns. But when we took a decision, I can think of Merweville, I can think of Matjiesfontein, where we went there, instead of just approaching those communities and taking them closer to town we ended up doing projects there because we engaged the people and the people said this is a community, there is no way that we can uproot them.

So there are isolated instances where we look at the situation and then provide homes where farm ... [Interjection.] Yes, like Simondium for example.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Davids you may follow up.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, did your

Department ever think about the clause in the Esther Law that said you can do on-site development where you can build houses for the people on the farms?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, but the big debate with that Esther Clause is that we want a situation, because in the past we had projects where we were doing on-site development in partnership with farmers, for example. But our problem, hon member Davids, has always been that those farmworkers do not own those homes because they are built on private land.

So it became a partnership with farmers just to house people, not for ownership. And the reason why we opted for farmworkers registering on our housing demand data base and also partnering with farmers to make land available, so that we can spend subsidy money and ultimately transfer that land to people. So that is why we ended up moving away from on-site development where the land is owned by farmers and opted to build for farmworkers on land that will ultimately be owned by those farmworkers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, your last opportunity.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon MEC, there is also a big debate about people in the urban areas or veld that your Department is giving farmworkers preference over them. There is a big debate on that also. What is your percentage on your subsidy to farmworkers against people

staying in those areas?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you. Well it varies, hon member Gillion, but it is between 5% and 10% of every project that we are doing where we insist that a certain percentage must go to farmworkers. The reason why we opted for that, hon member Gillion, is that you find that this farmworker is 70 years old, he or she can no longer work but because of the fact that he or she is not on the waiting list it becomes a problem for him or her to get a house.

That is why we then opted for that, to address that. Let us rather put a percentage so that you accommodate those most deserving farmworkers without necessarily compromising the housing demand data base or waiting list of the municipalities. So there is some kind of agreement and synergy there between ourselves and municipalities because over and above that there is a percentage for disabled people etcetera, etcetera. So, in order for us to be fair to all these groups there is this percentage of farmworkers, between 5 and 10%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is the end of that question. We move onto the next question. We are going to Mossel Bay, hon member Uys to Minister Grant. Minister Grant?

Divisional Road 1597, Voorbrug Road, Great Brak River: poor condition of

***9. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether the poor condition of Divisional Road 1597, Voorbrug Road, Great Brak River, has been brought to his attention; if so, when the road will be upgraded and properly maintained?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the member for the question. Divisional Road 1597 is a three kilometre gravel road leading from a provincial trunk road to the inner municipal boundary of Groot Brak River from where the road becomes a municipal street and it is known as Mossiesnes Laan. The road does not carry enough traffic to justify or prioritise its upgrading to surface standards at present. It is maintained under the normal gravel roads maintenance programme by the Garden Route District Municipality on behalf of this Department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, MEC. Are you aware of the new housing development that is taking place closer to Groot Brak and that that has put more and more pressure on that specific road?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy

Speaker, yes, I am because I visited the site on 6 September, this month, as a result of a routine visit for the upgrade of the R102, so I am very clearly aware of the priorities and the issues around that particular road.

The information I have at my disposal is that it was ripped two weeks ago, we brought in some material, compacted it and improved the side drains but this last weekend we had heavy rain, about 40mm in that area, but the road was inspected on Monday and the latest report I have had is that it is in fair condition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC, who is responsible for the funding of that road? You did refer to the District Municipality. Are they purely an agent for your Department and if so, to what degree do you subsidise and fund the upgrading and upkeeping and maintenance of that road?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the District Municipality has a maintenance function and for that particular road we basically scarify it eight times a year, in terms of the bladed cycle for that road.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC, are there any future plans for upgrading this road seeing that you visited the site? You know there is more movement of traffic, you know there is a new housing project happening there, that is not only the doing after District Municipality of course, but also what is happening in Provincial Government and therefore there is at least some responsibility from your side or at least Provincial Government to upgrade that road to a proper level and maintain that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, I am acutely aware of that particular area but what we do based on reports from our engineers and planning ahead, we have a plan for the upgrading of roads until 2029. We are currently spending R3,558 billion a year on our road network, some of which goes into upgrades but mostly it is into maintenance, and basically if I look at the nett asset value of our roads structure, infrastructure, we are currently at about R78 billion.

If we would take our existing road network and replace it, at current market value it would cost us R102 billion. What I am saying to you, there is a decline in the net asset value of our asset base on roads and we probably need about R1,5 billion more annually to catch up the backlog of not only the maintenance, but also with the economic growth to service the needs of the economy. But we have to make choices in Cabinet and we do, and we put our priorities largely in Education and Health, as front serving departments

within the Government, largely aligned to the interests of the poor and the marginalised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC, with district municipalities under even greater pressure to deliver specific services and roads, is just one, what is the total budget of the Garden Route District Municipality in terms of their total road maintenance budget per annum or per financial year?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not have the accurate information, but I can certainly provide it for you. We have got it. Please just be in touch with my Ministry and I will let you know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of that question. The last question will also stand over in the absence of the Minister of Finance, and that brings us to the end of questions. We move on to Statements by Members and I will first see the DA. Hon member Joseph?

[Question 10 stands over]

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D JOSEPH (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Pressure is building up for our new President Cyril Ramaphosa and the ANC ruling party, to give direction on a turnaround strategy for our weak economic situation. The technical economic recession referred to by analysts is evident in the lives of people who are struggling to survive, in particular, the 9,6 million people who are unemployed.

Whilst we recognise external factors like the higher oil prices and the trade war between super economies, we as a country must look internally on what we have and what we can control.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we need clear policies. We need a safe environment for our citizens, businesses and tourists. We need a clear policy on land reform which includes more property rights and title deeds to our people.

The 1% VAT increase, which is merely a penalty on all South Africans to cover for the State Capture during the Zuma-administration, must be scrapped. And also, the under collection of SARS' R50 billion revenue, is due to political interference and that political interference in Government institutions must stop.

State owned entities running at a loss worth billions of taxpayers' money whilst the current president was actually in charge of state owned entities. The answer is private, public partnerships for state owned entities.

Ms M N GILLION: Go to National.

Mr D JOSEPH: In closing, the best recovery plan for South Africa is to vote the ANC out of power ... [Interjection.] under 50%, so that the DA can implement its inclusive economic policy for all. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC repeatedly said there are lies and then the lies the DA tells. The last category is the worst as it relies on fake news and half-truths. Those that peddle those lies clutch at any kind of straw.

Mr D JOSEPH: That from the ANC.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA was so excited when one Sammy Claassen initiated a slanderous falsehood against myself. Denials and even affidavits by senior leaders at the same event where it is averred that I made certain pronouncements – and the published text of my speech – also disproves the false claim that excited the DA.

Appropriate action will be taken against Claassen as he brought the ANC into disrepute. But Claassen did not have the power to broadcast his falsehood beyond his limited cabal.

Ms P MAKELENI: Ja. Desperation.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA rushed in to assist, starting in this Legislature and abused the privilege and protection of this institution unashamedly to launch its attack and defamation against me, to hurt and humiliate me as the Leader of the Opposition.

The DA even made a poster of that false statement. The DA went further to take this smear and libel outside the Legislature with the same posters and allegations and took the defamation nationally.

Some put it on their Facebook, and I will deal with those as per the legalities that govern us. [Interjections.] I have therefore briefed my lawyers to put the DA to terms. Ignorance is no defence for criminal actions. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: Blame your own party [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no, do not [Inaudible.] lies!

Mr M MNQASELA (DA): The Democratic Alliance ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... in the Western Cape is deeply saddened by the explosion at the Rheinmetall Denel Muniton depot in Macassar that tragically claimed the lives of eight employees.

As the families, friends, co-workers and indeed the residents of the Western Cape wait to learn the causes of the blast, the National Government is keeping everyone quiet and waiting, despite the Disaster Management Act which was amended in 2015, stating that the:

“National Disaster Management Centre must make available applicable disaster management plans of organs of state to the relevant provincial and municipal management centres.”

This obliges the National Disaster Management Centre to intervene, yet to this point, they have not. Mr Deputy Speaker, it is the responsibility of the national Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Dr Zweli Mkhize, to ascertain the cause of the explosion and how he intends to deal with this and contain not only this but future ones.

We know that Denel, as a state owned enterprise, has fallen victim to the ANC’s brand of looting and plundering as a result of the state capture. It is therefore fundamentally important that Denel, together with the National Government, undertake urgent safety audits at all their sites. [Interjections.] to intercept potential similar incidents from happening.

An HON MEMBER: Shoo!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, we must fight for the truth behind this blast to emerge in order to find closure for these families. We must equally fight and guard against such disasters from happening in future. Mr Deputy Speaker, may the souls of the deceased rest in peace.

Ms M N GILLION: Including this building!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the EFF, I see the DA again. I see the DA. Hon member Philander?

Ms W F PHILANDER (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Abductions and kidnappings cannot be ignored. We can no longer ignore the insidious spike in abductions and kidnappings reported, particularly in the last few weeks. A recent media statement by the SAPS claims that they cannot confirm or deny the alleged spate of kidnappings. The statement further calls on communities not to incite “unnecessary panic and paranoia”.

Mr Deputy Speaker, more than ever it is essential that SAPS, under the ambit of an indifferent ANC-led National Government, drives awareness of human trafficking and kidnappings within our schools and community forums. They cannot simply pacify the very rational concerns of the Western Cape’s parents and guardians.

Yet, nearly every day we read of yet another child or young woman who was abducted or nearly kidnapped. At this time nearly 1000 children are still missing in our province. Where are our children being taken? [Interjection.] And who is taking them?

There are further reports of at least 13 confirmed cases of abductions in communities across Cape Town since 8 August. In three of the 13 cases, the victims were sexually assaulted. To this day some children do not go to creches or schools because their parents fear for the safety of their children. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, to parents, guardians and our communities, the primary protectors of our children – we have to become more vigilant as to the whereabouts of our kids. We also have to do our part in order to protect our children at all costs.

I want to commend the Provincial Department of Community Safety ... [Interjection.]

†ILUNGU ELIBEKEKILEYO: Hayi!

[An HON MEMBER: No!] [Interjections.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: ...who has pioneered the innovative Walking Bus Project within our communities to transport our learners safely to and from school. [Interjections.]

I further welcome the Special Unit appointed to look into these cases ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W PHILANDER: ...and may this Unit ensure that each and every case is investigated and very swiftly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired. Your last sentence.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the people of this province are not stupid. They know who is responsible for the safety of the people in this province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired.

Ms W F PHILANDER: The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, order!

Ms W F PHILANDER: ...will continue ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W PHILANDER: ...in whichever way possible ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon member Philander, if the Chair asks for order then you must conclude your speech. Your time has expired. I see the ANC. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): The ANC has noted the recent gang violence on the Cape Flats and the increase in gang killings in areas such as Bonteheuwel, Ocean View, Mitchells Plain, Manenberg, Nyanga, Delft and Lavender Hill.

These killings have been confirmed in the announcement of the latest crime statistics. These gang murders have been going on for too long and have disrupted the daily peaceful lives of our people. We have recently seen how angry our people in Lavender Hill have become with the Democratic Alliance Government by chasing away the opportunist, MEC Dan Plato and Helen Zille who once again want to play politics with the lives of our people. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is a lie!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The attempt by Plato and Zille is the latest to reinforce the politics of failure. The Provincial and City Government have failed the people on the Cape Flats ... [Interjections.] Our people have suffered for eight years under the DA City and Provincial Government ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is an admittance by your National Minister ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...whose only strategy has been to blame the National Government while they have a city police ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is lying to the House!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that they themselves actually manage. It has been eight years of ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Minister Plato ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...of promises and no delivery on safety.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Hon Minister Plato, you said somebody across the floor was lying. If you did say that that is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He said it is a lie.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I said his statement is a lie because the National Minister of Police ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not ask for an explanation. I simply wanted to ask ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I did not say – I said his statement is a lie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: His statement?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Right.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will accept that. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: He said he is lying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is in order. Hon member Dugmore you may continue. [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: He is lying. That is not true. Do not support it because he said so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think the Minister has to withdraw and apologise, because he said, “you are lying”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, I did ask the Minister in fact whether he said that. He declined. He said he did not say it, but I will go back to Hansard and if it appears that he did say it, certainly that would be unparliamentary and I will come back to the House on that.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is very clear that the truth hurts, because the City and the Province have had eight years to deal with this problem and all they have made are promises and blaming the National Government.

It is clear that only the ANC can change the balance of forces in regard to the gangs. To this end we will be calling on our National Minister to intervene in this carnage by urgently addressing the safety concerns of our people on the Cape Flats.

Everyone remembers the impact of Bambanani. Everyone remembers that it was this DA Provincial Government who actually disbanded the Bambanani

government ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You disbanded it! The ANC disbanded it!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and they have not been able to deal with it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, your time has expired but I see the hon member Gillion behind you.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes. Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem is the MEC is making a running commentary all the time. Is it because he is getting hurt by the statement?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, you made your point. I will look at that. [Interjections.] I will control that.

The MINISTER OF THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: [Inaudible.] rubbish.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next is the DA again. Hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY (DA): Thank you. For the record, Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC disbanded the Bambanani's. [Interjections.] The latest crime statistics

on the country and this province in particular, are a disaster!

Irrespective of one's political persuasion, these statistics are a grave threat, not only to ordinary people and communities, but also to the fundamentals of an orderly, constitutional state.

Let us not forget that these crime figures are up to 18 months old. So what has the Minister and his Department done since to rectify the crisis? Now, only this week does the Minister say specialist units must be re-established, years after this side of the House asked for this.

Only now does the Minister say they that he will recruit more police, only after allowing thousands of Western Cape residents – men, women and children – to die violently because SAPS has only a token 50% of its meant to be strength. [Interjections.]

A Public Service Commission report, the Premier's Commission of Inquiry and civil court actions had to be undertaken to bring attention to this matter ... [Interjection.]

But this is not the only national department in complete shambles in this province. Transport is completely incapable of holding PRASA to fulfil its primary role of transporting commuters. Less than 50% of its rolling stock exists and commuter numbers are down by 50% and those ones are subject to violent crime every day. Despite a ConCourt ruling to do its job. And

yesterday the City and Province fulfilled its undertaking, albeit an unfunded mandate, to assist PRASA to deploy trained peace officers on trains, at the great expense, R36 million, while PRASA failed to uphold its end of the deal to contribute to its legal obligations. [Interjections.]

The Fisheries Department has effectively collapsed its administration of the marine resource, putting many thousands of artisanal Western Cape fishermen and women out of work. Just yesterday hon member Schäfer highlighted the rampant corruption allegations against the second highest official in the Department, and today NEHAWU is marching to Minister Zokwana's office in Pretoria to demand his resignation for protecting that official.

What about Water Affairs, Home Affairs, Eskom, Defence, Intelligence, Correctional Services, Justice – just take your pick – and soon SANPARKS is going to make headlines.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member. Your time has expired. [Interjections.] The ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Mr Deputy Speaker, it is with great concern that I need to emphasise that crime is still an enormous problem in our communities. The latest crime statistics are shocking and a great area of concern.

I said it three weeks ago that Minister Dan Plato and the Western Cape

Government, has failed the people of the Western Cape when it comes to their safety. [Interjections.]

Last week I asked a question to the Premier, why Minister Plato was absent from a community meeting ... [Interjections.] in Sub-council 18 in Mitchells Plain where communities were discussing crime.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I explained to you why.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: At a meeting held on 26 July 2018 in Somerset West, Minister Plato said the problem with vagrants on the streets is because Christians and religious groups and the public are giving these vagrants food and money. [Interjections.]

Again ... [Interjections.] Again ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Again a senior DA member attacking Christians and other religious groups and I have got the minutes in my hands of what he said. I have got the minutes in my hands and that is what he said. [Interjections.] That is what he said.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem with this is ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... that if Christians and religious groups ...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Christians, just one second.

Hon member Lekker, your next door neighbour pointed out that there is a running commentary from that side and the same is happening on your side now. Please contain yourself.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem is, if Christians and religious groups do not support vagrants, it would be an extra burden on the state.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Minister Plato is essentially criticising the good work of these religious groups.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the people of the Western Cape are good people and we will assist communities in need, sleeping on the streets. Mr Deputy Speaker, thereafter he also in that meeting attacked the police ... [Interjection.] by saying, where are they? They do not know what is happening. When last was the Minister of Police in the area of Somerset West?

Today I must ask the Premier to remove Minister Plato because he is incapable of doing his job [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The member's time has expired. [Interjections.] I see the ANC. Hon member Nkondlo.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No, it is not lying. Do not accuse me of lying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

An HON MEMBER: We read it in the newspaper what he said!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: This member is accusing me of lying. I have got the minutes here.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I want him to withdraw that, because I am not lying. Here is the minutes. He must then tell the people to record the minutes correctly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Irrespective of the minutes, Minister Plato, if you used the words “He is lying” that is unparliamentary.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: [Inaudible.]

Mr P UYS: Do not explain!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I need to set the record straight.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That meeting was last night.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And at that meeting that was not said. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. That is not the point.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Not by me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I said his statement is a lie. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: His statement is wrong

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please take your seats, all. Minister Plato, there is a simple question to your side. Did you refer to a member across the floor as having lied? That is the only question at stake now. If it is not, then you must say so ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I said, what he had said is a lie. It is not correct. [Interjections.] What was said, what he picked up what was said in the meeting is not correct.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is fine, Minister Plato. I will refer to Hansard and confirm ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I know exactly who said that, Speaker. It was said by a councillor.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. That concludes this point. I will refer to Hansard and if necessary, come back to the House Hon Nkondlo you may start. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I want the member to proceed in silence.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: You are incapable of doing your job! Incapable of doing your job!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is an odd report in the official ATC titled "Report on Official Visit to the Bad Island". Apologies Speaker. "To the region of Lazio, Italy", authored by someone claiming to be the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Economic

Development, Tourism and Agriculture.

To our knowledge the Chairperson of the said Standing Committee of this House is hon Beverley Schäfer who travelled on an official trip to upper Austria in July, as per Section 5 of the Member's Guide describing "Official Travel".

When such trip ended, as members authorised for this trip, but also from the said Standing Committee, we were never officially informed of Ms Beverley Schäfer undertaking any trip to Italy on our behalf. Yes, we saw her being ferried abruptly outside of the delegation.

This can only be that the hon Beverley Schäfer undertook a one-person excursion to the Italian region of Lazio and such can never be regarded as an official trip.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Exactly!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Sub-section 5.1.1 under Visits initiated by the Speaker, and 5.1.5, Visits undertaken by Standing Committees, prescribe and define what official travel is. Unless proven otherwise, we ask that the hon Beverley Schäfer declares this trip and all relevant authorisation received for it.

If any report to this House, it should include who paid for this trip? Who

authorised or gave permission for such an expensive break? Member Beverley Schäfer must tell this House who mandated her to visit Lazio, Italy.

Is she already getting ahead of herself, given the grapevine in her party faction, to take up from her darling MEC Alan Winde? Is she using and manipulating this House to drum up her charade and ride into the Executive? Can Member Beverley Schäfer please rise up and explain herself? [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA. The DA. Hon member Simmers?

†Mnr T A SIMMERS (DA): Daai is interessant, jong.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: That is interesting, man.]

†Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. At the head of the picturesque Cango Valley, lies the spectacular underground wonder of the Klein Karoo, the Cango Caves. Situated in a limestone ridge parallel to the well-known Swartberg Mountains, you will find the finest dripstone caverns, with their vast halls and towering formations.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Cango Caves boasts a number of pioneering firsts. It is South Africa's oldest tourist attraction. It was the first to be protected by environmental legislation, with the Caves Regulation being published in 1820. It was also the first law designed to protect an environmental resource in South Africa. It was also the first to employ a full-time tourist guide.

This cultural heritage site is without a doubt one of South Africa's oldest tourist attractions and the heritage site is an example to follow, if under good governance and sound financial management.

Sadly not too long ago, due to poor governance and financial mismanagement of this heritage asset by an ANC led coalition, we nearly saw the invaluable heritage asset on the brink of disaster.

Since September 2016, the Cango Caves, through its new DA-led Council and prudent financial management, implemented a turnaround strategy enabling it to operate and to become self-sustainable. This also led to the site receiving a record of 250 000 visitors for the 2016/17 cycle.

The Cango Caves is ultimately a world class heritage showcase and under good governance it can reach its full potential. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Members Statements. We move on to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: With notice?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: With notice.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the growing crime rate in the province.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the housing backlog under the DA in the province.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Any further? Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the latest crime statistics.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: What?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that.

An HON MEMBER: What did he say?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Latest crime statistics, I think Mr Wiley said. [Interjections.] Any further. We move on to the next category then. The motions without notice. Hon member Mngqasela?

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House mourns the tragic death of eight employees, who died in a blast at Rheinmetall Denel Munition depot in Macassar; wishes their families and all loved ones strength during this difficult period; acknowledge that this Parliament condemns the National Government for the dereliction of duty in failing to protect these workers; further notes that this Parliament expresses gratitude to the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town leadership for their efforts to provide relief and comfort to the families of the victims and the entire community of Macassar. May their souls rest in peace. †Siyabulele. Enkosi. [We thank you.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to the motion being moved without notice? It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: A better version. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes eight workers died at the Rheinmetall Denel Muniton ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker it is the same...

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... depot blast outside Somerset West last week; welcomes the quick response from the National Ministers who commiserated with the families; and conveys sincerest condolences to the families of Jamie Haydricks, Bradley Tandy, Steve Isaacs, Triston Davids, Nico Samuels, Jason Hartzenberg, Mxolisi Sigadla and Thando Mankayi. May their souls rest in peace.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr M G E WILEY: It has already been moved.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not entirely the same. So we will look at them afterwards, but at this stage it would appear to be different angles. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Simmers?

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and celebrates the official opening of a new heritage trail in the Gamkaberg Nature Reserve, which stretches between Oudtshoorn and Calitzdorp, on Friday, 7 September, by Minister Anton Bredell; that the House further notes that the new route is of special spiritual importance and it records the lifestyle and stories of the Khoi and San community through 40 rock sketches which are between 1500 and 2000 years old. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its sincere sympathies to the family of a Grade 9 learner at Swellendam Senior Secondary School, Marinda Amsterdam, who committed suicide; and calls on the Provincial Government to put measures in place to prevent such adolescent suicides in the future.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House wishes our colleagues and friends from the Jewish Community who recently celebrated Rosh Hashanah, the Jewish new year, we say Shana Tova, which means “a good year” and we wish them well over the fast period which lasts 10 days.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the personal travel journey by the hon DA member Beverley Schäfer published ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Boring!

Mr S G TYATYAM:

...in the official Legislature ATC; notes that ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Boring.

Mr S G TYATYAM:

...the mandate and permission of her trip is totally unclear; notes she elevates herself now to a messenger between international role-players and this Government of which she is not, and even a National Government Department, of which she not a member; further notes she drags the Legislature into an untenable position where she acts as a subservient and helper to MEC Alan Winde.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ugh!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the
Order Paper. Hon Lekker, it is now your time.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: [Inaudible.] for that. That is silly!

Mr P UYS: No-no ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: That the House ... [Interjection.] †Uyangxola wena ucinga
kuphi apha? [You are making a noise. Where do you think you are?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that studies have shown a casual relationship
between early life experiences of rape offenders and them perpetrating
rape on their victims and calls for an urgent investigation into whether
the high rate of child abuse and rape in the Western Cape can be linked
with the abduction and rape of young boys by National Party/DA
paedophiles on Bird Island and elsewhere in the 1980's. I so move.

[Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being ...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the runners up who were recognised for their invaluable contribution to the human settlements family at the Govan Mbeki Awards on Friday 31 August 2018. These key players include the best Integrated Residential Development Programme. Joint first runner up was the Paternoster Housing Project of Saldanha Bay Municipality and Prince Albert 243 Housing Project of the Prince Albert Municipality. The best Enhanced People's Housing Process Project, the

first runner up is Sisonke Housing Project of the City of Cape Town and the second runner up Manenberg Housing Project by the City of Cape Town. The best Upgrade of Informal Settlement Project, the first runner up being the Joe Slovo Square in Riviersonderend in Theewaterskloof Municipality and the second runner up, White Location in Knysna Municipality.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is statement!

Ms L M MASEKO:

The best Emerging Woman Contractor in the Subsidy Market ...
[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is too long!

Ms L M MASEKO:

The first runner up being Masiqhame Trading 28cc ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Ja, that is too long.

Ms L M MASEKO:

...and the second runner up ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Allow the member to conclude.

Ms L M MASEKO:

Hlumantombazana Civil and Construction. And the best Established Woman Contractor in the Subsidy Market being the first runner up Ukhana Projects and the Youth Contractor in the Subsidy Market being Phiweka Kwaza. I so move, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that Cape Town's incorrect water

billing continues; at first it targeted unsuspecting ratepayers which helped it gain over a billion rand in profit and has since moved to installing water meters at homes of late people; notes further that Gordon Langford, 59 years old, is hopping mad after his parents' house in Milnerton received a blue device in August, despite the property being vacant for more than two years without water usage; and calls on the City to scrap all the incorrect water bills and exorbitant tariffs. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that motion being moved ...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Ms M N GILLION: You do not feel their pain.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You do not feel their pain.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the recent incident of a robbery on a train travelling on the Northern line on Friday evening where commuters were robbed and then flung off a moving train, during which incident one of the commuters died; this House therefore calls for serious investigation into this attack and conveys its condolences to the family of the commuter that died.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to that motion being moved without notice, nor against the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great sadness the passing of Ayanda Renene, 16 years old, Sphamandla Qoji, 17 years old, and Kuhle Kunene, 19 years old. All from Qhayiya High School in Zwelihle, Hermanus. These young souls full of energy to confront life, were all taken away from us in a tragic car accident two weeks ago; further notes that the House sends its heartfelt condolences to the families of the deceased, school

mates, teachers and the whole Overstrand community. May their souls rest in peace. †Ndithi kubahlali qina mhlali qina. [I say to the residents, be strong residents, be strong.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam first.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the hon MEC Alan Winde has for a second consecutive year not fully accounted to this Legislature on the work of his Department of Agriculture and both the Department and management elected to dispute with the A-G on a terminology basis; and notes the initial report was due a year ago ... [Interjection.]

†Me P Z LEKKER: Skande!

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Disgrace!]

Mr S G TYATYAM:

... and now missed the second annual report season too; further notes this MEC wants to be the next Premier, but cannot fulfil his legal duty

to report to this House ... [Interjections.] and calls on the MEC to submit his reports and deal with differences and fallout with the A-G later. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections to that. [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Simmers?

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is how you tell ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Ek gaan maar stilbly.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: I am rather going to keep quiet.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, you may proceed.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the discovery of the oldest known drawings by

Homo Sapiens; a 73 000 year old sketch in ochre crayon, in the Blombos Cave near Still Bay in the Southern Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Lekker first.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi, Sekela Somlomo.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.] †I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the families of victims who died in shack fires that gutted the province last weekend, displacing dozens and killing four people; a 15-year old from Phumlani Village, Pelican Park, as well as three people killed in Ncede Street, Philippi and calls on the Provincial Government to prioritise housing development for poor working class families. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Davids, now your turn.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes reports of alleged suicide by two patients in the Paarl Hospital last week; notes further that the patients were in different wards as one jumped out of a window while the other hung himself in a bathroom; conveys condolences to the families of the patients; and calls on the MEC to provide answers on how patients who are in hospital can commit suicide.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the McGregor Housing Project from Langeberg Municipality for winning the Govan Mbeki Award for the Best Integrated Residential Development Programme. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the drought that has again placed Beaufort West in the Central Karoo under severe pressure as water supply to this town runs dry and the Provincial Government for the umpteenth time faces its negligence to adequately assist this community to deal with this most basic need; notes the community is worried about fires and emergencies as at night water supply is completely turned off; also notes the hon Premier Helen Zille does not care about the people without adequate water supply, but will only visit the area for politics to lobby votes. I thank you. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the – is that an objection? [Interjection.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Simmers?

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends Rosevalley UISP from Oudtshoorn Municipality for winning the Govan Mbeki award for the Best Upgrade of informal Settlement Project. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that from 3 to 9 September the country celebrated National Book Week to encourage a culture of reading and writing skills which are critical in the world today and commends all the South Africans, especially ANC comrades who reached out to our people through the #ThumaMina campaign. [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Why are you laughing [Inaudible.]?

Ms D GOPIE:

...by giving books to school libraries, reading to the children and supporting teachers. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to that motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion itself?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. Hon Mngqasela, I see you.
[Interjections.] Is there an objection? Was there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, I did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, I did not see that. There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Mngqasela you were standing?
[Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: I am rising on a different matter, hon ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I am listening.

Mr M MNQASELA: We should not call hon members by their first names. We are all hon members. Hon Gillion said to hon Joseph, "Keep quiet, Dennis".
[Interjections.] You know, you do not do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mngqasela, your point is made. [Interjections.]
Your point is made, but we will continue. Hon member Maseko?

†Me M N GILLION: Hy gaan Hermanus toe. Wat doen hy daar?

[Ms M N GILLION: He goes to Hermanus. What is he doing there?]

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends Nokhanya Services (Pty) Ltd for winning the Govan Mbeki Award for the Best Established Woman Contractor in the Subsidy Market. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the hon Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Economic Development, Tourism ... *[Interjections.]*

An HON MEMBER: Mr Magaxa!

Mr S G TYATYAM:

... and Agriculture visited Italy in July this year on an excursion that did not appear on the Legislature's programme or part of her competency; further notes the member in question had meetings with South African

emissaries in Rome ... [Interjections.] to collect information which could be readily available to her, but visited to the cost of taxpayers ... [Interjection.] which she did not actually report to the committee.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr S G TYATYAM:

Also notes that this postulation is viewed as an open political positioning to get a job as an MEC, should MEC Alan Winde be successful in taking over ... [Interjection.] hon Premier Hele Zille's position. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Maseko? [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker., I move without notice:

That the House commends ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO:

...Vicmol Construction for winning the Govan Mbeki Award for the Best Emerging Woman Contractor in the Subsidy Market. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the cruel evictions of poor farmworkers in the province reached a tipping point following the eviction of three families from Simondium in Franschhoek over the freezing weekend; notes further the silence of the Provincial Government when over 200 families were evicted from farms in the province this year alone and indicates that they are in support of the ongoing kicking out, and calls for a moratorium on all evictions in the province. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

†ILUNGU ELIBEKEKILEYO: Haibo!

[An HON MEMBER: No man!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Maseko?

Ms M N GILLION: They do not feel the pain of the people.

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends Protea Park Housing Project from George Municipality for winning the Govan Mbeki Award for the Best Enhanced People's Housing Process Project.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to that?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Rudi Petersen and Jerome Boy from Swellendam who have been selected for the 12-man squad to represent South Africa at the 2018 Homeless Soccer Cup in Mexico in November; and commends the Sport Development Team of Railton Foundation for making this possible.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Belhar Gardens Rental Estate from the City of Cape Town for winning the Govan Mbeki Award for the Best Social Housing Project. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms P MAKELENI: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper. There is an objection. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that hon member Beverley Schäfer undertook an international one-person tour and postulated as a member of the Western Cape Executive; [Interjections.] further notes the member submitted a report to the Legislature that is filled with anomalies which clearly

distorts the respected separation of powers and predisposed her position as a committee chairperson to conduct oversight over the Executive and calls on the member to stop acting as the player, referee and Rules Committee in this instance. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible.] committee!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Are there any objections to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to the motion being moved without notice. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great sadness the passing of Mr Peter Eustace, a philanthropist and a wonderful human being who lived a phenomenal lifestyle as a member of the Hermanus community. The community of Hermanus has lost a true democrat and a constitutionalist of note, who believed that the DA is the only hope for South Africa's future. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Mr M MNQASELA:

Further notes that this Parliament expresses our heartfelt condolences to Peter's wife, Alice, their children and the DA Overstrand family [Interjections.]. May his soul rest in peace. †Qina mhlali qina. [Be strong, residents, be strong.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper Hon member Beerwinkel?

An HON MEMBER: You, are you applying to be reappointed?

An HON MEMBER: That is not what he said.

An HON MEMBER: He has failed already!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends its heartiest congratulations to the principal and staff of VRT Pitt Primary in Swellendam for winning the following

awards at the Overberg National Teachers Awards ceremony:

First runner up in Excellence in Primary School Leadership:
Ms Slingers; First runner up in Primary School Teaching:
Ms Kirschner and the principal himself, Mr Isaac Langeveld for
Leadership.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes another provincial department failed to timeously report on its annual work as the Environmental Affairs and Development Planning Department of the hon MEC Anton Bredell also entangled itself on a difference on terminology with the A-G; notes the A-G notified the Legislature in a special report that its report is delayed; calls on the MEC and his management team to set aside their differences and submit the Annual Report as required. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P UYS: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that? There are objections.

[Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Zuksem Project for winning the Govan Mbeki award for the Best Emerging Young Contractor in the subsidy market. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes Heritage Month in September this year, we also celebrate the centenary of Mama Albertina Sisulu and Tata Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela; further noting it is the first year we celebrate Mama Winnie Madikizela Mandela's birthday on 26 September in her absence; notes further we remember the birth of Mama Lilian Ngoyi, doyenne of the Women's Struggle, born on 25 September 1911, as well as Elizabeth Liz "Nanna" Abrahams, the veteran trade unionist and freedom fighter, who was born on 19 September 1925 in Paarl; and celebrates the contributions they made in their lifetimes. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls for an investigation into whether there was any corrupt relationship between the former Environmental Affairs and Tourism Minister, John Wiley, and his friend and wealthy businessman Dave Allen; notes further that on Bird Island a stone plaque was discovered which was issued by the Minister John Wiley to Dave Allen in 1985; Allen was also given a permit to dive near a vessel that ran aground on the island in 1755; this vessel, the *Doddington* was carrying

a consignment of gold and silver to India when it was wrecked and calls for investigation to discover what happened to the gold as the alleged perpetrators who got permits to salvage the *Doddington* claimed not to have found any gold there. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections there?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections to that motion. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Railton Foundation, the churches, the community organisations and especially the guest speaker, Diana Ferrus, a renowned poet and story teller for making the Women's Day event a phenomenal success in Swellendam across racial, religious, age and gender barriers.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the move by the Minister of Police, Mr Bheki Cele who, subsequent to his visits in the Scottsdene area and having heard the cries of the community regarding gang violence, on 5 September 2018 a satellite police facility has been put up in Scottsdene and police visibility has been increased; the community has expressed appreciation of this intervention and to date no incidents of shootings have been reported as this becomes a deterrent to gang related activities and crime in general. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes former DA councillor and convicted fraudster, Wilma Brady, received a 10-year jail sentence, suspended for five years

and 25 months correctional supervision for her crimes of aiming to defraud and pretending that she was authorised by the Provincial Housing Department to conclude contracts with developers; notes this happened on then Mayor Helen Zille's watch.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is carried. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sincere condolences with the family and relatives of the late Jan Domingo in Suurbraak who ended his own life tragically during the week; at the time of his untimely death he was a resident in Slangrivier.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that according to the book *The Lost Boys of Bird Island*, it was not the only location where the rape of young boys took place, as other locations included former Minister John Wiley's confidante, Dave Allen's house in Schoenmakerskop near Port Elizabeth as well as a beach house in Witelsbos in the Tsitsikamma Forest belonging to a National Party Government's Minister and notes further that these secrets were disclosed by Allen shortly before his death.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? For the last time. If not, then that brings us to the end of the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:35.