
THURSDAY, 14 JUNE 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon Uys ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: ... I rise on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Before you rise on a point of order, I would like to open the proceedings formally. Good afternoon hon members. To our guests in the gallery, feel welcome. Please be guided by the rules of the gallery that you are not allowed to participate but we thank you for your support in coming out today. And then I need to apologise to the members, we have had rain damage, a section just outside the door of the Chamber, which is why you were requested to come through the back entrance because it is quite wet and

mucky and they are busy effecting the repairs as we speak, so apologies for that but hopefully the matter will be resolved before the end of the day and we will be able to use the door to get out. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker and thank you for the opportunity. I rise on a point of order to ask you, why today, and I was very shocked to hear this at quarter to two, you did not want to allow eNCA to come into this Chamber and do a recording here. They had to use the live streaming of YouTube that you know they cannot. And it was really a big shock to me that you are really closing down on freedom of speech in such a way.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys your comment is sustained. I understand that is eNCA in the room so I am not going to deliberate further on ...[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, you must help us here because we are busy with the Rules. Why did you disallow them, why did I have to intervene thirty minutes before the sitting?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, let us take that to the Rules Committee. We have processes and protocols and we will talk through that at the opportune time. [Interjections.] It is not on the Order Paper today.

Mr P UYS: But no, no, Madam Speaker, this is such an important matter. It is freedom of speech, it is freedom of the media, it is a very important

matter.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: I just want you to tell us why you did it, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: The media has indeed been granted permission to be here ...[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: But after I had to fight for it ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, sorry it is not the way, it was not the way you believe ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr P UYS: Is julle so bang?

[Mr P UYS: Are you so afraid?]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, it was not the way you believe but you are allowed to think whatever it is that you would like to. I would like to proceed with the Order of the Day.

Mr P UYS: But, Madam Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am not going to ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Why?

The SPEAKER: ... entertain you. I am sorry. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Is it because of the Premier?

The SPEAKER: No. It has nothing to do with the Premier, hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: But what then?

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, this side of the House has absolutely no problem with the television cameras being here. [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P UYS: Why did you close it then, Madam Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, I did not and I am not going to elaborate here ...[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: But just explain it, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No. I am not going to get side-tracked.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, explain it.

The SPEAKER: The media is in the House, we will proceed. [Interjections].

So now we will move to Interpellations ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: I cannot believe this [Inaudible.] idea of freedom.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Speaker ... [Interjections.] Speaker, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I know you want to proceed. Can I address you? There has been a question raised. Are you now ruling that we are not going to respond ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That is exactly what I said so I am not going to be entertaining any further discussion on the matter. [Interjections].

Mr R T OLIVIER: Speaker, Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: This is the reason.

The SPEAKER: What is the reason? [Interjections.] Sorry, people I think we are at cross purposes here. The media is in the Chamber. We will now proceed. If you wish to take this matter up, you must address it through the

Rules Committee and we will deal with it then. I am not going to entertain it here today, hon member Olivier, I have ruled ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, no I accept that. Madam Speaker, I accept your ruling but I think you interjected when I was still speaking.

The SPEAKER: But you are telling me you want to talk about this very matter and I am saying ...[Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, I did not want to talk about it. I just wanted to indicate, on record, that you are not giving us an answer as to why, that is what I want to know.

The SPEAKER: No, I am not going to elaborate on the why, thank you. So we will now proceed with Interpellations. Somehow I think there is some cross purposes here. There are magazines being waved about and that had nothing to do with the decision. Hon member Uys, I think you are being misguided and disingenuous and I am not going to entertain it. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Not disingenuous. That is not true. I want you to withdraw that, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No, I will not. I refuse to ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: That is not true.

The SPEAKER: ... withdraw that. For you to say that the media could not come because of a magazine, that is completely unfounded too.
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Give us the reasons, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, sir, I am not entertaining that ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: But give us the reason.

The SPEAKER: I will not entertain that.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker ... Madam Speaker, please allow me to address you. You know you are the Speaker of this House ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

The SPEAKER: And I do not like to be undermined.

Ms M N GILLION: So please act as one. If our Chief Whip is standing up on a point of order ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat Chief Whip ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: I am still busy talking ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat Chief Whip.

Ms M N GILLION: I am still talking. If our Chief Whip is standing up on a point of order, he asks you to answer a question ... [Interjection.] No, no, please, you will get your chance. Madam Speaker, the question is why are you referring the Chief Whip today to the Rules Committee because this happened now, it was not even discussed in the Rules Committee. Fifteen minutes before two we realised that the media would not be allowed in the House. We need an explanation from you as the Speaker of this Legislature?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I have told you the media have been approved their opportunity to come into the House. I am now going to proceed with the Business of the Day.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: We will deal – Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can we not go on please ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes of course.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We have business to discuss here. [Interjections.] They want to grandstand. Go to *7de Laan* if you want that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So we deal with Interpellation number one and this is from the hon Dyantyi to the hon, the Premier. I see the Premier.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Draft Western Cape Commissioner for Children's Bill

1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Premier:

What progress has the Department of the Premier made with the Draft Western Cape Commissioner for Children's Bill since the submission of comments ended on 17 November 2017?

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Firstly, if the hon Dyantyi had attended the meetings of the Standing Committee, he would have been acquainted with the progress on the Bill since presentations have been made to the Committee, but I understand he was not there. I know he is not an official member of the Standing Committee but I would have to assume that this interpellation is evidence of his interest in the matter.

Had he attended he would have known that 561 comments were received on the Draft Bill and these comments had to be considered and amendments

made to the Bill as a result of the public comments. That process has now been finalised. On the 6 June 2018 the Provincial Cabinet approved the Draft Western Cape Commissioner for Children's Bill 2018, for introduction in the Provincial Parliament, subject to certification by Legal Services.

The Draft Bill has been submitted to the Speaker. Given all the legislation dealing with the protection of children, which has been passed by the National Assembly since 1998, it has been important to ensure that the Commissioner does not duplicate the work being carried out by other organs of state especially at a time of such tight budgetary constraints. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I rise as a father and I refuse to be told by you, hon Premier, that I am not a member of the Standing Committee. I am raising a critical issue here. Citizens of the Western Cape do not have to be members of a standing committee to raise issues about the Children's Commissioner. You cannot reduce this matter to whether I am a member or not. I refuse to accept your explanation. Get to the chase hon Premier and here is the issue hon Premier. Nine years in your role as a Premier, you will be remembered for breaking down what was good and existing in this province and for failing to establish a Children's Commissioner. That is your legacy that you go with. After taking office in 2009 this was your bold commitment. Nine years later, hon Premier Zille, we

still are where we were in 2009.

What were you busy doing? You were busy tweeting. Nothing about children. [Interjections.] You were tweeting about colonialism ... [Interjections.] and all sorts of things.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your legacy.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, kindly speak through the Chair please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. I am speaking through the Chair. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, do not point your fingers and ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You had funding for everything in nine years but still today you still do not have a budget for the Children's Commissioner [Interjections.]. Funding for everything. You even had funding for things we thought should never have been done.

Just in 2017, 66 child murders were committed, just in 2017. Five hundred children die in this province, yearly, according to your own Department of Social Development. 40% of those are child murders. This Premier, sitting

here, you are sitting with your hands with the blood of our children for not doing anything since 2009. [Interjections.] That is your legacy.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENT AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is cheap ... [Inaudible.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Under your watch, the life of a black child in this province does not matter. What matters for you, as a Premier of this province, are the black votes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

An HON MEMBER: Blame yourself, blame yourself!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: All of a sudden – and she has just confirmed that – all of a sudden, out of the blue, the Bill is being ATC'd on the 14 June. Here is the ATC. You know why she is doing that, because she saw the interpellation and then she started waking up. Oh, I must ATC this Bill. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is cheap politics, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi your time ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is cheap politics because if that [Inaudible.] was not there she was not going to ATC that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, please take your seat. Your time has expired. [Interjections.]. Hon members, before we proceed, we operate on the premise that everyone in this House is an hon member. We do not have 'he's' and 'she's', if I could direct you. Please accept the guidance. It is the hon Premier, the hon member and let us maintain the dignity and decorum of the House. I now see the hon, the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker. The hon Dyantyi knows there is a principle of legality ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For nine years ... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ... under the Constitution.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... that is what I am saying about it.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you will have a turn. Please, manage yourself. When you come back you interject and do what you need to. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is the Speaker. Why is he interjecting? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Premier kindly take your seat please. Yes, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, it is quite apparent that the ANC has led an orchestrated campaign for the cameras today. [Interjections.] They talk about a nine years lead-up to this. Well this is the first introduction to Interpellations that has been dealt with in this way.

Mr S G TYATYAM: What rule are you rising on?

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: I ask you to call the House to order please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: What rule are you rising on?

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. In terms of Rule 41, it is my duty to maintain – take your seat please, hon member Olivier. It is my duty to maintain order in the House. I am expecting that we will manage ourselves with dignity and decorum. This event is being live-streamed, it goes out across the world on YouTube and what example are we being to the citizens of this country if we manage ourselves in the way that we do? It is actually

appalling behaviour from adults and we call ourselves honourable. So I am appealing to everyone today, manage yourself with composure and with the dignity that the very word honourable deserves and means. Can we now proceed? You may speak hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I was addressing the principle of legality and constitutionally that means that various state institutions have very specific mandates that other institutions may not encroach upon. And indeed, the great tragedy of 66 child murders and five hundred children dying, 40% of whom are children who are murdered ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.

The PREMIER: ... is something that tragically, a Children's Commissioner can do nothing to resolve. [Interjections.] That is an issue for social workers under the DSD to spot the problems as they arise. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENT AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Exactly.

The PREMIER: It is a huge problem for the police to resolve and it is a problem for individual families to ensure functionality and commitment and care for children. The truth is the mandate of the Children's Commissioner, as spelt out in our Constitution, is extremely limited ... [Interjections.] and I

committed to it in 2009 but as John Maynard Keynes said so aptly:

“When circumstances have changed, I change my position”,

I canvassed many, many ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The PREMIER: ... opinions on this and people across the board said to me you will merely be duplicating other people’s functions and other institutions’ functions and it makes no sense to waste money. It is not as if nothing has happened since 2009.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are right. Children are dying ... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: An enormous amount has happened. In fact ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Premier ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: In fact, the Constitution came into effect in 1998.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon Premier. Thank you. Hon member Dyantyi, this is your opportunity to speak.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In summary the Premier is saying she is rethinking about

it but let me proceed and give you two quotes, one from your hon member ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi, please speak to the Chair and manage your finger please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay. One from her own member and a member of society and here is the quote: DA MPL Basil Kivedo said:

“Looking at the crises in schools there was a great need for a Commissioner.”

He disagrees with you completely. Let me give you something else.

“There is a crisis out there in many communities. Our young children are suffering and this Bill needs to be published. We need to get this process on the go as soon as possible. This is really long overdue.”

That is Jane Davis of the Community Chest.

They differ with you on this issue. So, you stood in this very same House nine years ago and you made bold to the citizens of this province that you, Hon Premier Zille, are going to establish a Children’s Commissioner. In the very same House nine years later, she says to us “I have actually thought about it”. It means it is not going to happen. Whatever she went through was

just a convenient process because she does not believe in the establishment of a Children's Commissioner.

That is the game you play with the lives of children in this province. That is a big transgression on your part. You have taken an oath of office in this House. Today I want to put it to you that it is a transgression and please be aware we are on you again with the Public Protector on this issue.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see, sorry Premier, I see the hon Mitchell.
[Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members there is too much noise. [Interjections.] Order please! [Interjections.] Can I appeal to both sides of the House for order. There is a member on his feet wanting to speak. Minister Madikizela ... You may proceed hon Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The fact that it has been ATC'd is exactly the commitment of this Premier. [Interjections.] The Premier ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr D G MITCHELL: It is not a point of order. It is my speaking chance.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mitchell has a speaking opportunity, so he is on his feet for his speaking opportunity.

Mr D G MITCHELL: The reality is, Madam Speaker, it took the Premier nine years. They failed within eleven years of being in government. [Applause.] [Interjections.]. Eleven years and it did not happen under 'Brown Envelope' Rasool. It did not happen so they must not come and play politics with the lives of the young people of this province. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Olivier. [Interjections.] Order please, hon members, there is a speaker on the floor. Hon Olivier, member Mitchell has a slot on the interpellations so he is speaking, it is his speaking opportunity. If you look at your list of speakers on the interpellations, hon member Mitchell has a speaking slot in this interpellation.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, where was hon Dyantyi when he was in the Cabinet, when 'Brown Envelope' Rasool failed to appoint the Children's Commissioner? He did nothing but today he wants to play to the cameras. Sickening!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, point of order.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Dyantyi kindly take your seat.

Mr M MNQASELA: Point of order, Madam Speaker. The hon Tyatyam says the hon member is lying and I would like that to be corrected by yourself hon Speaker. This is a House of Parliament, it is not some shebeen somewhere.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: Can you please help us.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, may I address you? Did you indeed say a member is lying?

Mr S G TYATYAM: I do not recall that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, it cannot be that you – we are talking about the very word honourable, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I am honest about it.

The SPEAKER: I will check Hansard.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Check the Hansard then come back.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Joseph before you speak, members I

really need to appeal to you, this is not a school yard where we make jokes. We are actually busy with the business of nation building and legislation and to come here and to make light of something that is very serious must be viewed in the strongest possible terms.

So I would need to accept that if the member said he forgot, that that is his version of reality, but I will reflect and go back to Hansard and if need to come back to the House. Hon Member Joseph, are you covered? Thank you. May we now proceed hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, yes. Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam no need to smile about that. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Hon Dyantyi you may speak. You may proceed hon Dyantyi. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please members stop the cross-talk while there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon Premier, may I invite you, even in the midst of your thinking about this, that at least there is a process that you have kick-started, it is today in terms of the ATC. Can I invite you, that with you, I am a volunteer next to you, in the name of Charnel McGraw, in the name of

Courtney Pieters, we must work so hard that we do not to have another child suffering the same fate, that will leave no stone unturned to ensure that we fast-track this process and that we will do everything in our power. And on behalf of those families, I want to lead you and I want you to follow me that, as this House, we apologise for those kind of deaths. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please members. I see the hon, the Premier.

Mr C M DUGMORE: A shocking dereliction of duty and misleading ...
[Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Coming from you?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Shocking and misleading.

The SPEAKER: Order please, both sides. Hon Dugmore the Premier is on her feet, please. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: And the Chief Whip was [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: The two of them, that is exactly what I said, both sides of the House.

The PREMIER: I hope that did not take my time, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: No, it did not, thank you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: There is only one lot of grandstanding and dishonourable grandstanding in this House today ... [Interjections.] and that is being done by the hon the Opposition. [Interjections.] It is bizarre to say that we have not done anything till yesterday. They know that there has been a very long process and from 2009 when I ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: If it were white kids dying it would be different. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ... when I made the statement that we would introduce this. I have consulted ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You are a racist Dugmore!

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members! Premier, kindly take your seat.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Premier, take your seat please. Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Can you ask the MEC of Human Settlements to withdraw and apologise to member Dugmore for saying 'you are a racist Dugmore.' [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, did you want to speak hon Dugmore? Okay. Minister Madikizela I did not hear it, but did you say the hon Dugmore is a racist?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, I did.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, I did. Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: No, no. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can I address you? [Interjections.] Can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do not get excited. Sit down. Can I address you?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I am just allowing the member to continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Member Dugmore said if those were white kids you would have acted, that is a racist statement and I said that is a racist statement. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you. Minister Madikizela, it is unparliamentary to call anyone a racist. I did indeed hear the comment about the white children. I would need to look at it in terms of context and then come back to the House in need. But you would be expected to apologise to the member for calling him a racist. Withdraw.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I withdraw that he is a racist, but it is a racist statement, I am going to stand by that.

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The statement is racist [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Withdraw that statement that he is a racist.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am withdrawing that he is racist but the statement is racist.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Sit down ... [Inaudible.] doing your work [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, no, no.

The SPEAKER: Hold on, hold on. Hon Magaxa you cannot address hon Madikizela. Member Gillion is on her feet on a point of order, please take your seat. Thank you. [Interjections.] Members can we get some semblance of composure here. [Interjections].

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: I expect better especially from a member of the Executive Committee in this House. [Interjections.] Am I protected?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are.

Ms M N GILLION: And those who are laughing can laugh because it is not a laughing matter.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely.

Ms M N GILLION: When I raised the point of order, the MEC again stated “he is a racist I will not withdraw.” Then, Madam Speaker, he addressed you.

You never allow other people to do that, why did you allow the member, because he is an Executive member or because he is the Leader of the Opposition?

The SPEAKER: No, no, sorry.

Ms M N GILLION: He is the leader of the DA in this province.

The SPEAKER: Member Gillion you are wrong.

MS M N GILLION: No, consistency ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You are wrong on both counts.

MS M N GILLION: ... is very important, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, you are wrong on both counts hon member Gillion. I heard the comment by the hon Dugmore. "If it was white children". I heard that. So the response was to that comment and this is why I am trying to say there is a context that we need to understand within which the comment was made. I have asked Minister Madikizela to withdraw his statement. He has withdrawn the statement. I now see the hon Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I understand the impasse and I wish to plead with you. It does not help hon members when they want to correct a

wrong that they commit another wrong. Hon Magaxa said to hon Madikizela “you rude *kwadini*”. There is no *kwadini* here. A *kwadini* is a small boy. There is no small boy here. This is an honourable member of Parliament, so again you hear those remarks. The reality here, we are equally honourable members, so do not be tried by [Inaudible.] cultural – respect this Parliament.

The SPEAKER: Your point is carried. Hon members I will indeed go to Hansard and look at this entire series of comments and as I said revert to the House in need. So who, was it the Premier that was on her feet?

The PREMIER: I have not started.

The SPEAKER: No, you have not started. Sorry, hon Premier. I was dealing with derogatory statements that were being made but I am not going to get caught up in a ruling now. I will take the entire Hansard transcript and the audio and indeed if there was any word that was used that was unparliamentary, we will come back to the House. You may now proceed with your allotted time. Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. It goes without saying that I am totally committed to every single child and every single person in this province. I spend every single day trying to serve them and I did say in 2009 that I would set up a Children’s Commissioner, that the ANC having failed to do that during all its years of governance. [Interjections.]

The first thing that I did at that point was to go and consult widely amongst many organisations to whom the well being of children is very, very dear. And they said to me the Child Justice Act has just been passed ... [Interjection.] and it took eight years for the ANC to pass the Child Justice Act which creates the framework to protect children and they all said ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: ... that that has changed the terrain entirely and there will not be any additional thing that a Child Commissioner can add. So rather put the resources elsewhere like neighbourhood watches and other places to ensure that they can pick up children under threat and ensure that those things are fed back through the system.

I listen to experts and when I speak to experts and they explain to me how the terrain has changed I adjust my thinking. Not to do that would be obdurate and would defeat the purpose. So it took the ANC eight years to pass the Justice Act, the Child Justice Act, which created a different framework.

We tried through the proper processes to change the Constitution, although the ANC was opposed to the Children's Commissioner all those years, the ANC was opposed to the Children's Commissioner ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids.

The PREMIER: ... all those years. Suddenly they refused to work with us to change the Constitution and now we are doing what we need to do to bring in a Child Commissioner and that has been tabled and that has taken the wind out of the ANC's sails but it will not stop them grandstanding ... [Interjections.] because nothing will, Madam Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the first interpellation. We now move, members can we get some order here, there is way too much noise and badgering going on, can you please just settle down.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are settled now.

The SPEAKER: Okay, coming from you I accept that hon member Dyantyi, you are settled now. We now move to the second interpellation and it is from the hon Tyatyam to the Minister of Human Settlements. I see the Minister Madikizela.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Uncompleted houses: Freedom Square, Nyanga East

2. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Why have seven houses in Freedom Square, Ward 37, in Nyanga East,

been left uncompleted for the past four years?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Freedom Square in Nyanga was part of the broader Masiphathisane Housing Project. The approval was given to the City of Cape Town in April 2004 for an amount of R29,4 million to install services to 2 100 sites.

Approval for the construction of housing units was first given on the 29 May in 2008 and the amount was just over R14 million for 250 units for Phase 1. These projects consisted of eleven phases. Phases two and three were approved in November 2010. Approximately two years ago my Department made available an amount of just over R96,6 million for the successful completion of 900 units which form part of all phases.

However, before the construction could commence my Department appointed the Housing Development Agency or HDA to conduct a ground audit. It was then established that a number of units were constructed without internal services. My Department has since intervened and taken over the project from the City. We have subsequently made available a further amount of R6,1 million for 335 units to remedy the situation which includes the seven units.

A contractor has since been appointed for the installation of services to 335 units as well as for the construction of incomplete units and new units. It should be noted, Madam Speaker, that the seven units were constructed by a

private contractor who utilised his own funds without the approval of the City of Cape Town or my Department.

Given the fact that these units were constructed without approval, the possibility exists that they may have to be demolished subject to a structural engineer's report which will inform us whether or not the units were constructed in terms of the national norms and standards. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Let me first welcome the Subcouncil 14 Chair, Mrs Thandi Makhazi. I requested her to come here so that she can hear what the MEC is saying. It is not the first time, Madam Speaker, that I have raised this issue.

Four years ago when I came I raised the same issue and the term is closing and yet the problem is still sitting there. Nyanga, Madam Speaker, is one of the areas which has always been rated as the number one murder capital. The houses that are currently not finished are being used for rape, for robbery, for murder, for many other things, social ills in the area and yet till now those houses have not been finished.

I think it is important that we must really come home, home to the truth. How can a private company just decide to wake up and go and build, without the

knowledge of the City, without the knowledge of the Province? How does that happen? When the City was asked by the church why they were building, the City said they were not part of that arrangement, it was the Province involved there.

And I can tell you that there are persons in that private company who are friends or relations with other members of the DA here in this House and they were allowed to build in a place where there is supposed to be a church. In fact the court concluded, a long time ago, that those houses must be demolished because the church wants their space.

It is not a maybe thing, that it might or might not happen or it is a favour done. It must be demolished. So I think it is important that we must come closer to truth. What happened, why were those houses built, particularly building on someone else's property or land?

The third issue that I want to raise here, Madam Speaker, you know who the company ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam you need to finish up, your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: We want to know why did the Province wait till now and not intervene in the process because you are saying ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member Tyatyam. Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I am coming again, I am not finished.

The SPEAKER: You may come back. I see the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am confident that all the strategic approaches and key interventions of the Department will drastically increase the delivery of human settlements to our people in the Western Cape. Regarding the said houses that hon member Tyatyam has put forward the interpellation on, I think the Minister has explained about this process and I think it is not the first time that he has explained. We need to understand that there are processes that have to take place. [Interjections.]

Once the Department knew about this, the processes to attend to those seven houses were in place and now there is progress on them. But what I want to find out from the Minister are there any projects in the pipeline in the same area of Nyanga East and what will be done differently? What is it that he will do differently so that the Department not to have the same scenario? I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, please. I see the hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Let us come home to truth, MEC. Let us come home to truth because the infrastructure

that the MEC is talking about is not only for the seven houses, he says it is about three hundred and something. Houses that do not have toilets, houses that do not even have electricity and for the last seven years these houses have been left. Why are you, hon Minister, not moving and intervening?

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] do not care.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Why did you not intervene? I am not talking only about the seven houses that you have seen. The issue here, Madam Speaker, is that we have houses that also do not have water and we are saying that water is one of the basic needs of people and under you, who is supposed to know the conditions of the people of Freedom Square. You have neglected your role as an MEC.

Madam Speaker, it is not only Freedom Square. There are a number of other projects that are unfinished there in Nyanga, we are talking of Mpetha Square, we are talking of Mkhonto, Black City, all the squares in fact in Nyanga, they are not finished. And you promised when we raised this issue here that you were moving very fast, you were dealing with that situation.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Another broken promise.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Again. Unfortunately and I am saying for ...
[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Because it is black people. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Oh, sick! Sick!

The SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.]. Order please, there is a member on the floor. Order please members. Hon member Tyatyam, kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.]. Hon Tyatyam kindly take your seat please. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I would like your ruling on this matter. For the umpteenth time now at a crucial stage member Dugmore inserts a racial epithet. He said it is because it is black people. Now he is a white man and he constantly refers to black people in a denagrating fashion. I would like a ruling from the Chair as to whether this is in fact racist?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker thank you very much. I would like to address you on this matter. I have come to a conclusion as we as the ANC if one looks at the conduct of the DA as a party ... [Inaudible.], the absolute disregard and disrespect ...

The SPEAKER: Sorry.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... for schools attended by black people ...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: It is alright Chief Whip.

Mr C M DUGMORE: My comment is a political comment, my comment is a political comment that I regard .. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am sorry. [Interjections.] Will you take your seat please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I regard the DA as disregarding black people. Number two, I regard the DA that responds more to the concerns of the white community. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is a political statement. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Yes, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: With all due respect I have asked for a ruling from the Chair, if it goes to a Conduct Committee, he can explain himself to a Conduct Committee or an Ethics Committee ... [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley, earlier on Minister Madikizela raised and he addressed me and in fairness and being consistent, I afforded hon

Dugmore, however I must caution against the use of racial vitriol. We are here to build a nation, not to break down and please understand it in the context of the Rules of Parliament. You can say things ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Freedom of speech!

The SPEAKER: Freedom of speech is one thing but casting aspersions is another and unless it has been proven it is going to be very difficult so the whole tone of the conversation around a white child and a black man, let us just revisit what it is we are busy with here members.

What example are we to the rest of the country out there if we carry on and use this kind of language in a place where we are supposed to be setting an example? We are no example to anyone out there if we carry on in this manner.

Now I am asking both sides of the House, Minister Madikizela I am appealing to you especially. Hon Magaxa I am appealing to you too. As leaders, I expect you to lead by example and let us set the tone for the rest of the debate. Thank you hon Magaxa. I will revisit all of this and I will come back to the House. Hon member Tyatyam your time is nearly up so you may finish up please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No.

The SPEAKER: No, no you have had, your last session was two minutes, you still have time, carry on.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I think you need to speak to hon members please. MEC, when you visited the area in 2017 when we were busy with by-elections, you promised the candidate of the DA that if you win, these houses will all be finished in no time, that is what you said and it is a verbatim report from him.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: From who?

Mr S G TYATYAM: From the rapper that you decided to make a candidate.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So you listen to hearsay?

Mr S G TYATYAM: When are those houses going to be demolished so that we can have a church there? We want a church in the area.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam your time has now expired. Thank you. I see the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The DA in the Western Cape had to pay over R43 million to repair poor workmanship of RDP houses haphazardly built by the ANC during their term of office. [Interjections.]

The National Minister of Human Settlements has spent more than R2 billion to repair RDP houses that were poorly built by contractors in ANC run provinces. [Interjections.]. Over R43 million was spent by this DA Government to repair the houses built by the ANC. Now, hon member Tyatyam, these seven houses that we say are going to be fixed, this DA Government will do it, stop grandstanding. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: We will do it for you, do not worry. We will do it for you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Tyatyam if you could just ask your members to give you some airtime.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, it is very clear that the hon member does not know what she is talking about.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] It is obvious.

Mr S G TYATYAM: She does not know and I can tell her now she must at least – if you are talking about seven houses, that is your problem ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I built 19,000.

Mr S G TYATYAM: We are not talking about seven houses.

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Sorry, hon Tyatyam it is your own bench that is making a noise, not allowing you to speak.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I understand, Madam Speaker. I understand Maseko, her life has ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Not Maseko, the hon Maseko.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The hon Maseko's life has changed dramatically. [Interjections.] That is why she does not know informal settlements and I think it is important that here, Madam Speaker, we need to be consistent in terms of how we address issues.

The people of Nyanga are the same as people in other areas, they deserve better facilities. Nyanga has been rated as the murder capital. To date the infrastructure has not been sorted out in Nyanga. So the point is that besides the seven houses there are many houses where people at night must go and use outside facilities, toilets and many other things and we are saying if money was put aside for a private company to build there, who gave the company the money? [Interjection.]

Who gave the money? [Interjection.] Which part of the provincial Department gave the money because the City of Cape Town says they did not give the money, it was the Province. Also in the church case, the court case that the City ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, sorry.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The church does not have, the City does not have [Inaudible.]. Who gave the money from the Province?

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Tyatyam. I now see the hon, the Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I am not sure whether the member was listening when I gave the history of this project ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: He just forgot.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... but I will give you this in case you did not listen to what I said. Let me start by making the rules and responsibilities of the different spheres very, very clear. My Department by and large does not build houses. Our responsibility is different from ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Our responsibility is different from the local authority. What happened in the City of Cape Town, what happened in that particular project, Madam Speaker, I accounted for it in the Standing Committee in this House because it is indeed unacceptable that services were not installed on time. It is not my responsibility to install services but I also need to make this point very clear, we must not come here and mislead Parliament and try to grandstand ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who is misleading Parliament?

Mr D G MITCHELL: There are cameras.

The SPEAKER: Speak to me please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is not true, Madam Speaker, that I said to the candidate that if he wins I will finish those houses ...[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: What did you say?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: By implication it means I should not be fixing those houses because the candidate did not win. [Interjection.]. I was really appalled to see the situation.

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... but I just explained that we are busy fixing that mess. I just said that now. We already took over that project, we have already made funding available. These people were not listening when I was reading this. [Interjection.] We are already fixing the problem.

Ms P Z LEKKER: There is nothing happening there now.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What I just said now is that the seven houses ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: There is nothing happening there now.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... are likely to be demolished because they were built without approval from the City or the Province. So, many things with regard to the challenges that were there, that is what we are busy fixing now but then we will put the money aside. That is what I have explained from the word go.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But let us not mislead this House by claiming that I said things that I did not say. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes, hon Lekker ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: He must not mislead the House.

The SPEAKER: An interjection is allowed but a running commentary is certainly not. That concludes Interpellation No. 2, we now move to Interpellation No. 3 and it is from the hon member Davids to the hon Minister. Minister Madikizela. I see the hon, the Minister.

[Debate concluded.]

Land grabs and violent service-delivery protests: steps to be taken

3. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What steps does he intend taking to ensure that the spate of land grabs and violent service-delivery protests come to an end in the province?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I need to start by saying that it is not the responsibility of the Department of Human Settlements to stop land grabs and if anyone thinks that, then I think that that person is missing something. Now I must say that it is unfortunate that we are in this situation where there are a wave of land grabs across the province and the country, partly because of the motion that was tabled by the EFF, supported by the ANC, which then encouraged people to do what they are doing, to grab land all over. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It has always been the responsibility of the land owner to protect his or her land. It is not this Department's responsibility. In our own parcels of land that we own, we have partnered with the law enforcement or the Metro Police from City of Cape Town and also the security companies to make sure that when our land becomes invaded we act immediately as a Department of Human Settlements.

We also, as I said, partnered with the Anti Land Invasion Unit from the City of Cape Town and in some cases we take it upon ourselves to apply for eviction if people invade our land but it is not our responsibility because the question here is put in such a way that it is our obligation and responsibility to stop the land grabs.

It is the responsibility of all of us, especially those who have encouraged it to happen. Because, the reality here Madam Speaker, is that there is a political motive driven by the ANC and the EFF to invade land in a number of areas in this province ... [Interjections.] and it is the responsibility of the leadership of the ANC and the EFF to make sure that they stop that. So they must not now come here and pass the buck for a problem that they have caused in the first place. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please. There is too much noise on the floor members. I see the hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to say to the MEC, part of governance, you love the law *mos* and the rule of law, part of governance is to respond where you are, respond to the community where you are governing ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, please address the Chair, sorry.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... and you are governing in the Western Cape ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, the spate of service delivery protests and land grabs in the province are getting out of hand because people are generally fed up with substandard services and being ignored by the Provincial Government. The housing backlog is increasing. The backyarders and their struggles are the least of the priorities of this Provincial Government.

The Human Settlements Department and municipalities are failing to use their budgets to build houses for the poor people. Money has been sent back. All this is happening at a time when suitable land for housing development is given to private property developers for their private interests and the Mayor of Drakenstein said: "They are doing that because they want to have a bigger revenue income.'

He said why they are doing that. He gave a reason. It is that nothing is done. If nothing is done, if there is no response, MEC, from the Provincial Government, it then means these protests will continue for a very long time, and it is not the EFF, it is not the ANC that is sitting behind it. It is not because of land expropriation without compensation. It is because of the DA Government in the Western Cape that is not giving any response to the community.

So what I want to understand from the MEC is what programmes are there in his Department to bring an end to the state of land grabs and violent service delivery protests, because he just said that his Department is only protecting the land that they are responsible for.

So I want to know, MEC, what is your Department going to do about land that does not belong to you but it is being grabbed because the land and violent protests go hand in hand.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, this Provincial Department of Human Settlements acknowledges the plight of those in need of adequate housing,

especially during the cold and rainy season. [Interjections.]

However, invading land is not the answer. The protests are characterised by violence, roads are barricaded and property destroyed. The Department remains committed to its housing agenda and is continuing work on its three strategy priorities:

1. Directing more resources to the upgrading of informal settlements programme;
2. Increasing affordable or gap housing with an emphasis on the FLISP pipeline of 10,057 units by 2025; and
3. Prioritising the neediest for free housing.

As the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements we cannot prioritise land invaders over those who have been registered on the Housing Demand Database for many years. In addition, prioritising certain projects due to protest action will mean that other existing projects are delayed as a result. The Department therefore urges all citizens who need housing assistance from the Government to register at their local housing offices. Citizens that are already registered are also encouraged to ensure that information is up to date at the local housing office, particularly if contact information has changed since registration.

My question now to the Minister is: what is being done to ensure that housing database lists are streamlined for qualifying and deserving recipients? I thank

you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am disappointed in the Standing Committee Chair of Human Settlements because what she is saying and what is really happening in the province is not the same.

In a response, the Minister, in a newspaper article, said that they are streamlining the databases of municipalities, but I want to say, through you, Madam Speaker, to the Chairperson, it is because of people that have been on the database for 20 years. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: That is it.

Ms S W DAVIDS: They are the land invaders, not people that have been on the database for a year. It is people that are there – I want to mention one example, Madam Speaker. One example is the lady that is 65 years old, Sara Koopman. She has been on the database for 37 years. 37 years. She is invading land with her children and her grandchildren. So it is not about people that are just applying for a house, it is about people that have been waiting for years.

Over the years MEC Madikizela has made public remarks such as: “The people think all land available in the province should be used to build

houses". This was his response to the demand for land, for housing closer to the CBD and place of employment. This shows that MEC Madikizela prioritises private interest over the plight of the people. What is happening in Steenvilla is a case in point, the Tafelberg issue and Bo-Kaap, Woodstock – there is such a large... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Scottsdene.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Scottsdene, Valhalla Park – you can mention all of them, Madam Speaker. It is happening because there are no responses from the government of the day, the DA Government in the Western Cape. We cannot lay the blame on the City or whoever. We are accountable to the people of the Western Cape, and I am including myself.

So it is us who must account and give a response to them on the issues within the community. The Minister even said... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon member, thank you. I see the hon Maseko. You will have another turn, hon member Davids.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. It is quite interesting to hear that the hon member is saying that she is disappointed in me whilst we are doing the oversight role ourselves. One of the things that we identified is the issue of informal settlements, and I can give an example. [Interjections.] We have an informal settlement called Kanana in Langeberg in Robertson. That

informal settlement mushroomed in 2016, and already they have taken the municipality to court to say that they must be given services.

That means that informal settlement is going to be prioritised and those old people that she is talking about... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Not she.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... those services are going... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who is she?

The SPEAKER: Hon members.

Ms M N GILLION: Who is she?

The SPEAKER: The hon member.

Ms L M MASEKO: You learn quickly, I am proud of you. Member Davids is going to ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is honourable member Davids.

Ms L M MASEKO: Member Davids now is really saying that old people – she knows what the challenge is... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who is she?

Ms L M MASEKO: The policy... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Who is she?

Ms L M MASEKO: ... the policy of the Human Settlements Department is if a person invades land you have to give an alternative house when you remove them. It is a problem for the Government, it is a problem for the municipalities. That is something that we have to talk about as the Standing Committee... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... me and her taking responsibility. [Interjections.]
Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Ms M N GILLION: Still she!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, let us not do the “he, she” thing. We are all hon, †*asseblief*. [Tussenwerpsels.] [please [Interjections.]] †Janee, ek verstaan dit. [Yes, I understand it.] That is why I am raising the point. I am not directing it to you, hon member Gillion. You may proceed, hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You were asking who “she” is, I have responded.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, I see this as a very serious issue, because people are getting killed within these violent protests and land grabbing, people are getting hurt, bullets are flying around. So this is not a thing of “he” and “she”, this is a thing of what is happening, the reality.

As we speak today people are experiencing flooding in informal settlements and may wake up in the morning and their property has been vandalised. The MEC visits a number of communities. He was at [Inaudible.] in the recent past where he begged them to be patient with the Government. That the MEC did.

What is it that they must be patient with, MEC? Are we asking them to keep calm while you give their land to developers for profit? What is the Government doing to build houses for the poor in the province? Hon member Maseko, Chair of the Standing Committee, what is the Government doing? You just said you build how many houses? You did not build one house, because as the province we do not build houses, the municipalities are doing that for us.

Which pockets of land closer to places of employment in the province are earmarked for housing delivery, MEC? In the townships, what is the plan to

protect pockets of land that are earmarked for development? Because we must now move, MEC. We must move, as this Department of this Province, to give an answer to the communities. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I think I must correct something here, because we can be accused of anything or everything, but we cannot be accused of being non-responsive.

I was there in iSiqalo in Mitchells Plain. I was there in Zwelihle. You can talk about any area where there has been protest action and I was there. So you cannot accuse me of being non-responsive.

†'n AGB LID: Daarsy.

[An HON MEMBER: There you go.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The second issue that I want to deal with here is that it is not true that it is old people on the waiting list who are invading land. There are instances – no-no-no-no, no. I am basing this on facts not fiction.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is on the database.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There are instances of course

where people who have been on the waiting list for a long time have been invading land, but by and large the majority of people who are invading land are younger people who are not even on the waiting list.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now it is true – let me...
[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Why are they not on the waiting list?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They must register to be on the waiting list.

Now let me agree with hon member Davids here ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Over the last two days I have had a meeting with all the municipalities, and the issue that the hon member Davids is raising is a very concerning issue because she is correct, that ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shhh!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... there is no alignment in some instances at municipal level between the Housing Demand Database and the privatisation of beneficiaries who get houses. And we must get that right. That is the reason why I had this meeting with the municipalities, because... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Why must people... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is true... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... be older than 40 then?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is true that there are many people still on the Housing Demand Database who are yet to receive a house when younger people have received houses, and it is something that we are dealing with, because the hon member Davids is quite correct.

But, again, I will go back to the roles and responsibilities. That is why, from time to time, we will have to intervene on the roles and responsibilities of municipalities, because we do not allocate houses, we do not plan for houses. Planning and allocation happen at that level. Our role is different.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But I am intervening because

of these concerns that are coming from people who have been waiting for a long time.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Interpellations. We now deal with Questions as printed on the Question Paper, and I recognise the hon the Premier.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

Racial intolerance in the province

1. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Premier:

Given the recent increase in racial intolerance in the province:

- (1) What steps has she taken to address this issue;
- (2) whether she or any of the members of her Cabinet has had any meetings with the South African Institute of Race Relations in the past few months; if so, what was the nature of the meetings;

- (3) whether she will make copies of the minutes of these meetings available?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The question is based on a personal opinion of the hon member, and it is therefore my personal opinion that it reflects the deliberate strategy of the ANC to stoke racial tension in this Province.

†n AGB LID: Mmm, hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Mmm, hear-hear!]

The PREMIER: Number 1, I refer the hon member to my reply to Question 1 on 31 May 2018. It contains a comprehensive reply, which I am not going to repeat here.

Number 2, Madam Speaker, I do not recall any occasion that my Cabinet has met with the South African Institute of Race Relations in recent months. However, the Chief Executive Officer of the SAIRR did approach me in my capacity, for a meeting earlier this year, as he wanted to talk about liberalism and the future of the Institute of Race Relations.

†n AGB LID: Van wie praat jy nou?

[An HON MEMBER: Who are you talking about now?]

The PREMIER: It should be borne in mind that the party, of which I am a

member, and all its predecessor parties have a very long working relationship with the Institute, going back to the apartheid era where the Institute cooperated with the Progressive Party, the Progressive Reform Party, the Progressive Federal Party and the Democratic Party Members of Parliament, to submit questions to National Party Government Ministers to gather statistical information which was used in their very well-known annual survey of race relations.

And Number 3 falls away.

An HON MEMBER: Falls away?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, hon Premier, for responding to my question. I just want to ask her this follow-up question.

I think you will be aware that on your doorstep, in the southern suburbs where you reside, or you stayed ... [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: She lives in Leeuwenhof.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... for most, for the biggest part of your life, in that area, especially in this term, your term, we have had more than five racial-related incidents where ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And there is a question somewhere?

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... certain black people were physically attacked by white people, and my question is did you do something about that? Is there any particular initiative – as a leader in the province, have you seen it as an issue, as a leader of the province, understood where we come from as this province, particularly in South Africa?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Yes, I did, and in fact I wrote quite a bit about it in the book that was published at the end of 2016, which was the year that we had a lot of challenges, and there was a campaign being run to try and depict the City as a racist city, and I then invited anybody who was going through any incident that they thought was racially motivated in the City, to approach me and the Mayor did exactly the same thing.

I followed up on a number of incidents that were brought to my attention, and as far as I know we got to the root of them, and some were extremely problematic in the context in which the hon member Magaxa raises, and some were not.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mackenzie and then hon member Magaxa.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon Premier, given the history of the South African Institute of Race Relations, is the Premier aware, or perhaps the Premier can give us information, has the SAIRR previously met with the ANC or its predecessor organisations, such as the UDM ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... to work on democracy? Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are talking about race issues here.

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question.

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The PREMIER: Actually that is a very good question, Madam Speaker, because some time ago you will recall that the South African Institute of Race ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Some time ago the South African Institute of Race Relations ran a campaign saying “Know your ANC”, and it was a campaign, I think, based on research either commissioned by the ANC or done with them. So...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is just a diversion.

The PREMIER: ... the interesting thing is that I think that they have met with the ANC quite a number of times. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a diversion.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Magaxa.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us come to the real questions now.

The SPEAKER: This is the third follow-up.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Premier, I would also like to take you back a bit. In light of your colonialist tweet in 2017, would you not perhaps acknowledge that your tweet also contributed to putting paraffin on that fire?

Mr M G E WILEY: Which tweet?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The colonialism tweet. There was only one tweet.

[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I mean the colonialism tweet that is not really bad.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja. It is going to haunt you forever.

The PREMIER: The ANC's deliberate misinterpretation and their whole campaign with bots and trolls has been aimed at dividing people in South Africa.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?!

The PREMIER: And that is where the damage has been done.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Premier's efforts to

bring about racial reconciliation are legend in this province. [Interjections.]
Can the Premier recollect any efforts by the ANC in this province to bring about racial reconciliation?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a sweetheart diversion. That is what it is.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, that was the fourth question. Sorry, hon member Magaxa.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The bottom-line is that the only thing the ANC has left in its armoury is to sow racial division.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh no! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is all it does from morning till night. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! Order! Hon member Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: That is all the ANC does... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ... from morning till night. They try to mobilise race groups against each other, because they have done some simple arithmetic. They know... [Interjection.] that if they turn white people into the enemy and the

problem in South Africa then they will win elections.

And so they cannot even stand by their former President Nelson Mandela, who said quite clearly, far more than I did, about the legacy of colonialism and, for example, the benefit of education a part of that legacy brought. That is what President Nelson Mandela said. I do not remember them kicking up a fuss. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stand on your own!

The PREMIER: Moeletsi Mbeki... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: Moeletsi Mbeki actually said... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You tweeted on your own. On your own.

The PREMIER: Moeletsi Mbeki actually said something that I would never say which is that Africa was better off under colonialism. I would never say things like that, but just because the ANC can see potential for dividing people on the basis of race... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is Moeletsi Mbeki?

The PREMIER: ... they take things that their leaders have said before and then pretend that it is somehow unique and ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The PREMIER: ... racist when the DA mentions it, or anybody in the DA mentions it. [Interjections.] It is in all our history books, our modern history books. The legacy of every bad event in history has a mixed legacy.

Ms M N GILLION: You tweeted on your own.

The PREMIER: That is History 101. Everybody knows that, but it is convenient in the ANC's attempts to sow racial division, to twist what I said, because they never quote me, they always twist what I say ... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Your tweet was... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ... in order to divide people, and we have not bought into that ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Well done!

The PREMIER: ... but the Public Protector bought into that, and we will see what the courts say. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Your tweet was very clear.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Magaxa... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It does not need to be misinterpreted. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The question is concluded.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I just want to check with you... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, sorry, we have had four follow-ups. [Interjections.] That is the end of that question. I now look at Question number 4, from hon member Kivido to the hon Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo, I see the Minister.

Question standing over from Thursday, 7 June 2018, as agreed to by the House:

Ebola outbreak, in the event of: measures in place

4. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Health:

Whether her Department has measures in place in the event of an Ebola outbreak in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. The risk of Ebola haemorrhage fever cases being reported in South Africa is very low. However, the surveillance for viral haemorrhagic fevers must be ensured.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

In the Department we manage this through Tygerberg Hospital, a facility dedicated to contain the virus should patients be identified, in conjunction with the Committee of Disease Control, Board Health Services and EMS. Suspected cases seen at the hospitals in the Western Cape can be managed and treated in consultation with an infectious disease specialist. Health workers who might be treating the patients with a suspected or confirmed illnesses are at a higher risk of infection than other groups.

In order to protect themselves the following measures are in place:

- In addition to standard healthcare precautions, health workers should strictly apply recommended infection control measures to avoid exposure to infected blood, fluids, contaminated environments or objects such as a patient's soiled linen or used needles.

- They also should use the provided personal protection equipment, such as individual gowns, gloves, masks, goggles and face shields.
- They should also not reuse protective equipment or clothing unless they have been properly disinfected.
- They should change gloves between caring for each patient suspected for Ebola.
- Invasive procedures that can expose medical doctors, nurses and others to infection should be carried out in very strict, safe conditions.
- Infected patients must be kept isolated.

I just want to emphasise that the last Ebola cases in South Africa were diagnosed, I think, in 1976, that of two health professionals. One was a doctor returning from Gabon where he was treating a patient. He survived but the nurse died.

In South Africa we do not have Ebola cases but because of the recent cases that have been... [Interjections.]

†UMnuQ R DYANTYI: Wawungekazalwa nozalwa ke ngoko.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You were not even born then.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... found in the DRC, within the Port Health, at a national level, through the National Institute for Communicable Diseases, we are implementing precautionary measures. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, Minister Mbombo, for answering the question. Given that Ebola can be such a highly contagious disease and also lethal and deadly, what is the possibility of compulsory immunisation in the Western Cape or in South Africa in general?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Because it is a virus you will not have immunisation for such, and also because the last case in South Africa was in 1976. But also noting the climate of the DRC, the forest and so forth, the chances of the Ebola coming from South Africa – I mean the chances of a person being infected from within is very slim, unless you get it from an already infected person who is coming from those areas, those parts of West Africa.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you again, Minister Mbombo. According to the report back of the World Health Organisation regarding statistics and also the prevalence of Ebola in the DRC, what is the present *status quo* regarding the disease? Is it under control or is it still

prevalent?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you mean in the Congo or here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here or in the Congo? Just ... [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I was going to ask where? In DRC or in South Africa? Because in South Africa we do... [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: In the DRC. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No man! That is not fair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: According to a recent HHO report, they did indicate that they have contained it. So far there have been ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is an international Minister of Health.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... I think, about 27 deaths but it is contained.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is outside of your jurisdiction.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then move on to next question which is Question 2 under New Questions. Hon member Mackenzie to Minister Plato. Minister Plato, Question 2.

New Questions

Monwabisi and Mnandi Beach: safety plan

2. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Community Safety:

With reference to the recent attacks on Monwabisi and Mnandi Beach:

Whether the South Africa Police Service and other law enforcement agencies have a safety plan for these high-risk areas; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and also thank you to the hon member for the question. The police has a festive season plan implemented from September to January. During the remainder of the year the following actions are put into place to address the high-risk areas:

- Regular patrols.
- Joint static operations.
- Law enforcement as a static base at Mnandi Beach, which operates between eight o'clock and five o'clock, daytime, and is manned by

officials of the City of Cape Town.

- After hours law enforcement is on standby.

Responding from the side of the City of Cape Town, the following is in place:

- The City's Metro Police and law enforcement patrol the two areas on a daily basis on a 24-hour patrol system in order to check on the safety of the facilities.
- The City is also looking at the lighting at the facilities in order to improve the safety of the two sites.
- Members of the public are also advised not to visit these areas after hours as this creates opportunities for criminal actions and criminal elements due to the geographic layout of the facilities and distance from the main roads.

Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Mackenzie.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Minister, for the answer. Minister, is your Department of Community Safety in any way involved with the local law enforcement, and are you providing any assistance to the neighbourhood watches in those areas, particularly on those particular beaches? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: All these safety facilities are under the auspices of the City of Cape Town, and as I have indicated, there is a law enforcement base at Mnandi Beach, and it quite a way from the residential area. So, no, neighbourhood watches, regarding the safety of these facilities, are not involved.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question, which is Question 3. Again hon member Mackenzie to Minister Winde. I see Minister Winde.

Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha: township tourism

3. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

Whether he and his Department have any plans to promote and develop township tourism in places such as Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

How does his Department deal with the skills mismatch, the gap between an individual's job skills and the demands of the job market, of the youth in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and to the hon member for the question.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism, our project Khulisa, has a targeted strategy to grow tourism or the tourism sector in the Western Cape. The project aims to increase awareness of the Western Cape in key markets and sectors, and improve accessibility to Cape Town and the regions, and boost the attractiveness of the region through competitive offerings.

Township tourism plays a vital role in highlighting tourism attractions with a focus on culture and heritage in areas not adequately explored as yet, or areas that have huge potential. Township tourism is becoming increasingly more popular as visitors to the province look for more authentic experiences away from the mainstream attractions. Through township tourism visitors are taken on guided tours through the Western Cape off the beaten track.

Of the vast number of townships across the Western Cape, a handful are tourist friendly due to their proximity to cities, established routes and infrastructure. These include Langa, Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha and Gugulethu. All these tours are conducted by registered and qualified tour guides who have also grown up in these townships.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has a guide registration office and provides development services and help to these guides once they have qualified.

We also focus on furthering the tourism guide support, we focus on event support via Wesgro. This is through budding events, brewing events and

mainstream events. We also focus on business through entrepreneurial support and the funding support. We have Wesgro doing media hostings and visits of international marketing agencies that get taken on these tours. We also promote events and experiences like cycle tours through the region and also home stays.

I have personally also been on a number of these routes and been with a number of these guides, and it really is exciting to see the different cultures and how they are able to be sold to our tourists.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie first and I will come back to you, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Minister, and thank you for the feedback. It is really great to see what the Department is doing, but are these events and the different programmes that your Department has had, how is it advertised to the Auntie Dinahs and Mrs Khumalos in Mitchells Plain, and where do they get to register for these services? [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] Auntie Dinahs. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So first of all, obviously we also work with the local tourism authorities. The marketing happens through brochures and through electronic media. As I said in my reply, we also have hosted visits and hosted tours

where we bring international buyers of products into the region. They get taken to these spaces, so that is how they get marketed through those local tourism offices. Even in the City, specifically, they now have mobile marketing operations, which actually go to high footfall areas, so that you actually take the marketing material to the market.

And then perhaps lastly to that question, I think one of the biggest drivers now to experiences is the new partnership that was developed around the Airbnb using the region as a test site for their global experiences product offering, which would take people surfing, which would take people bike riding, which would take people into culinary experiences, and that is really giving you market access to a massive global market.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. With due respect, MEC, the question is whether your Department has any plans to promote and develop township tourism in places such as Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha? Very specific.

Now here is the question, because you have been into regions and townships except Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain. You have routes like Swartklip and Spine Road that connect this. Can you tell us, specifically, what have you invested in Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha in the form of these marketing initiatives, in the form of what you have funded in those areas? This is the

very specific question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much for the very specific question. If you listened to the very specific answer ... [Interjections.] which I gave you, I said these include Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha. So you obviously did not listen to a single... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... word that I said, number one. Number two, the rest of the answer was all about exactly what we do about investing... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It was not in Mitchells Plain.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... into those experiences, into those businesses that are in the region, in making them viable, in taking them to markets. Obviously the hon member did not listen to the answer. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Because you do not have an answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must sit down.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, MEC, given that these are risk areas and that you are investing in these areas, is there any safety mechanism or plans in place to ensure that small businesses can thrive and create jobs and so on and so on. We all know, on a daily basis, there is no safety in these areas. How do you link the two... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No, there is safety in those areas.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... in terms of safety and so on? †Wag, jy is nie die MEC nie, man.[Wait, you are not the MEC, man.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much for the question. It is an issue and it something that people ask about often. I was not in Mitchells Plain, but yesterday I was in Philippi, along with my colleague, Dan Plato, specifically around businesses asking us this question, and in actual fact I have been to visit Woza Philippi, which is the business organisation, twice in the last 14 days ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is fine and good, that is good.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to raise specific... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must come to Mitchells Plain or Khayelitsha. That is the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Hon member!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Sir.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to raise specifically that issue around safety, but when you ask about it when we were with Airbnb in Khayelitsha...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy, [there you go,] you are coming now. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Not where Richard lives, he does not live anywhere near Khayelitsha.

An HON MEMBER: Where does he live?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: It is a question around safety, a question that international visitors ask... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... a lot.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But if you look at the number of visitors that actually go to these restaurants and to these B&B's, Airbnb's, and I must admit there are certain markets that are easier to sell and other ones that are more difficult, but still the numbers are there.

So it is not really an issue that is deterring right at the moment, except perhaps with some of the unrest that we are picking up at the moment, but I have not picked up any specific tourism-related issues that are linked to that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member – sorry, hon member Dyantyi, I will give [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He was after me. He was too late ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi! He is the questioner and the questioner normally gets two if it is possible, so I am giving him his second bite at the cherry.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Alright.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Given the question by the hon member Olivier about safety and security, in particular in Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha, and given the Department's mandate, would the Minister perhaps give clarity where does policing fit in into providing safety and security in those areas?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is also a very interesting question, because I was actually saying to my colleague, Donald Grant, a bit earlier that it is interesting in Economic Development, the Department of Economic Development, what percentage of our time, manpower and even budget now is now going away from the core business of economic development and tourism to safety and security.

So if you remember last year we were very involved in the ATM fraud issue... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because you do not admit the root causes. That is the

problem.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... which was happening in the City. The second is now the safety project that I was talking about earlier, in Philippi specifically, and obviously we are spending more and more time there.

And then of course we have a programme within the Department called Tourism Safety and that is really being expanded upon now, using technology, using collaboration, working together with different departments. So we are finding that security is something that people are questioning and safety around tourism and the support there. You know that if you were in the Standing Committee, they questioned us on this the other day and we have got a small unit and we are having to expand that unit now, because their reach is being asked for and their services are being asked for more often, and we are putting more money and more time into it.

So yes, security is an issue, but at the same time I think when working with Minister Plato and his Department, looking at the community watch systems and how we link those in those partnerships are also critical in making sure that the businesses in Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha, amongst many others, are sustainable and viable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move to Question number 4. Hon

member Uys to Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell?

Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and

Development Planning: International tour - May 2018

***4. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether he and his Department had undertaken an international tour during May 2018; if so, (a) what was the purpose of the tour, (b) who accompanied him, (c) what was achieved and (d) what were the total costs?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie vir die vraag. Die Wes-Kaap Regering en die Staat van Beiere in Duitsland het reeds vir jare 'n sterk bilaterale samewerkingsverhouding. Die verhouding het ontstaan by die ondertekening van die ooreenkoms tussen die twee streke in 1995, en het oor die jare heen van krag tot krag gegaan.

As deel van die ooreenkoms is ek genooi om die hooftoespraak te lewer by die wegbreekessie van die IFAT, die wêreld se grootste handelskou, oor water, riool, afval en roumateriaalbestuur. By die handelskou is daar verskeie uitstallings wat strategieë en innoverende oplossings aangebied het met betrekking tot water, riool, afval en roumateriaalbestuur. Tydens die spesiale

geleentheid oor Suid-Afrika op 16 Mei 2018, het ek die Wes-Kaap se Regering se strategie teenoor die aanspreek van die klimaatsveranderings aangebied, en in besonder waterbesparing en bestuur, aangesien die provinsie tans 'n verlammeende droogte beleef.

Die sessie was gemik daarop om 'n geleentheid te bied om idees oor toepassing en markverwante ontwikkelings in die omgewing en in Suid-Afrika uit te ruil. Daarmee saam het die Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning se Direktoraat Lugkwaliteitbestuur, wat aktief besig is met die lugkwaliteitsbestuursprogram, gekoppel aan die klimaatsverandering, betrokke geraak by die gesamentlike projek met die Beierse Staat Ministerie van die Omgewing en Verbruikersbeskerming oor die Provinsie se omskakeling tot klimaatsvriendelike lugverkoeling en bevringspraktyke.

Die projek sien die twee regerings saamwerk om uitlaatgasse van gevaarlike chemikalieë, soos die HFC, tot die atmosfeer te beperk, wat in lyn is nie net met die ooreenkoms wat in 2016 bereik is, Kigali, wysigings tot die Montreal Protokol, die “HFC phase-down” nie, maar ook 'n bydrae tot die bereiking van die Parys-ooreenkoms se doelwitte wat in 2016 bekragtig is. Die samewerkingsprojek het reeds op 1 Oktober 2017 begin, en sal loop tot 20 September 2020, en word ondersteun deur Beiere, met 'n begroting van 360,000 Euro, sowat R4,725 miljoen.

Tydens die wegbreeksessie van die IFAT met 'n sterk Wes-Kaapse tema is ek

versoek om te reflekteer op die heersende droogte in die Wes-Kaap, met spesifieke verwysing tot die strategie en die tegnologie wat ons in plek gestel het om Dag Zero te voorkom. Daarbenewens het ek sterk klem geplaas op die feit dat ten spyte van die voortslepende droogte die Wes-Kaap oop bly vir besigheid en besoekers. Die byeenkoms van die handelskou het die afvaardiging voorsien van waardevolle geleenthede om met ander kenners in die bedryf te vergader, en beste praktyke met hulle te bespreek rakende dienslewering en nuwe tegnologieë.

Saam met die handelskou was die doel van die reis om te konsulteer met die nuut aangestelde Minister van Staat, van Federale Sake, van hoof van Beiere se Staatskanselary, die Minister van Omgewingsake en Verbruikersbeskerming, die voorsitter van die Hanns Seidel Stigting, en om samesprekings te voer met die sektor en industriële kenners oor water- en droogte-aangeleenthede.

Die hoof van die Departement van Plaaslike Regering, die Hoofdirekoraat Munisipale Monitering en Ondersteuning, die hoof van die Ministerie, sowel as die Direkteur Lugkwaliteitbestuur, Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning, het my vergesel op die internasionale reis na Duitsland.

Na die voltooiing van die geskeduleerde afspraak is die volgende uitkomstebereik:

- Die versterking van die bilaterale verhouding met die Staat van Beiere.
- Die vergadering met 'n nuut aangestelde Minister, dr Herman, hoof van die Kanselary van die Ministerie van Staat vir Federale Sake.
- Die vergadering met die Minister van Omgewingsake en Verbruikersbeskerming, dr Hooper.
- Samesprekings met dr Ungerer, hoof van die Internasionale Betrekkings in Beiere Staatskanselary, om sake te bespreek en 'n konsep projeklys saam te stel om hom te ondersteun in die volgende finansiële jaar as deel van die bilaterale ooreenkoms, is gefinaliseer en potensiële areas vir nuwe projekte is geïdentifiseer.
- Die versterking van die verhouding met die Hanns Seidel Stigting en gepaardgaande projeksteun vir die volgende drie jaar, is bekragtig.
- Die bilaterale gesprekke met die konsul-generaal van Suid-Afrika in München.
- Kennisname en invordering van idees en strategieë danksy die insette van die kenners in die veld van water, waterbesparingstrategieë en die Wes-Kaap, en hoe die Wes-Kaap kan verbeter.
- En die internasionale platform is gebruik om strategieë te deel wat gebruik is om Dag Zero in die Wes-Kaap te vermy, en die geleentheid is gebruik om sleutelstrategieë rondom die droogte te herbevestig.

Die totale koste van die reis was plus-minus R385,000. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the question. The Western Cape Government and the State of Bavaria in Germany have for years had a strong bilateral cooperative relationship. The relationship originated with the signing of the agreement between the two regions in 1995, and over the years has gone from strength to strength.

As part of the agreement I was invited to deliver the main address at the breakaway session of the IFAT, the world's largest trade show, on water, sewerage and raw material management. At the trade show there are several exhibitors that presented strategies and innovative solutions with regard to water, waste and raw material management. During the special occasion on South Africa on 16 May 2018, I presented the Western Cape Government's strategy on addressing the climate changes, and in particular water conservation and management, as the province is currently experiencing a crippling drought.

The session was aimed at offering an opportunity to exchange ideas on the application and market related developments in the region and in South Africa. Along with that the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning's Directorate Air Quality Management, that is actively

engaged in the air quality management programme, linked to the climate change, became involved in the joint project with the Bavaria State Ministry of the Environment and Consumer Protection, on the province's switch to climate friendly air conditioning and freezing practices.

The project sees the two governments cooperating to limit gas emissions of dangerous chemicals such as the HFC, to the atmosphere, which is in line not only with the agreement reached in 2016, Kigali, amendments to the Montreal Protocol, the "HFC phase-down", but also is a contribution to reaching the Paris agreement's aims ratified in 2016. The cooperation project had already commenced on 1 October 2017, and will continue until 20 September 2020, and is supported by Bavaria, with a budget of 360,000 Euro, about R4,725 million.

During the breakaway session of the IFAT with a strong Western Cape theme, I was requested to reflect on the current drought in the Western Cape, with specific reference to the strategy and the technology that we have put in place to prevent Day Zero. Apart from this I have strongly stressed the fact that in spite of the continuing drought, the Western Cape remains open to business and visitors. The attendance of the trade show provided the delegation with valuable opportunities to meet with other experts in the industry, and discuss best practices with them regarding service delivery and new technologies.

Along with the trade show the aim of the trip was to consult with the newly

appointed Minister of State, of Federal Affairs, the head of Bavaria's State Chancellery, the Minister of Environmental Affairs and Consumer Protection, the Chairman of the Hanns Seidel Foundation, and to have discussions with the sector and industrial experts on water and drought issues.

The head of the Department of Local Government, the Chief Directorate Municipal Monitoring and Support, the head of the Ministry, as well as the director, Air Quality Management, Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning accompanied me on the international trip to Germany.

Following the completion of the scheduled appointments, the following outcomes have been achieved:

- The strengthening of the bilateral relationship with the State of Bavaria.
- The meeting with a newly appointed Minister, Dr Herman, head of the Chancellery of the Ministry of State for Federal Affairs.
- The meeting with the Minister of Environmental Affairs and Consumer Protection, Dr Hooper.
- Discussions with Dr Ungerer, head of the International Relations in the Bavaria State Chancellery, to discuss matters and draw up a draft project list to assist him in the next financial year as part of the bilateral agreement, were finalised and potential areas for new projects were identified.
- The strengthening of the relationship with the Hanns Seidel

Foundation and associated project support for the next three years, was ratified.

- The bilateral discussions with the consul general of South Africa in Munich.
- Noting and collection of ideas and strategies thanks to the input of the experts in the field of water, water conservation strategies and the Western Cape, how the Western Cape can improve.
- And the international platform was used to share strategies that were used to avoid Day Zero in the Western Cape, and the opportunity was used to confirm key strategies around the drought.

The total cost of the trip was plus-minus R385,000. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen opvolgvrage nie? Dan beweeg ons aan na die...
[Tussenwerpsel.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No follow-up questions? Then we move on to the ... [Interjection.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. Just in terms of that cost. Can you

specifically indicate the names of the hotels that you utilised during that period and how much it cost per night? In Bavaria.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister Bredell.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENT AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, obviously I do not have the list... [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: But you know which hotels.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENT AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... in front of me, but we can forward it to you, because I can promise you it was not luxury. It was clean, but it was not luxury and we... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not enough.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENT AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... will send the list any time.

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENT AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We have got nothing to hide.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, ons beweeg aan na die volgende vraag. Vraag 5, dit is – ekskuus, opvolg?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we move on to the next question. Question 5, it is – sorry, follow-up?]

†Mnr P UYS: Nee, ek wil net opvolg hierso.

[Mr P UYS: No, I just want to follow up here.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: 'n Opvolg op Vraag 4. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A follow-up to Question 4. [Interjections.]]

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek wil net hoor, dit was 'n handelskou. Nou dis gewoonlik nie die plek waar 'n mens die geleentheid kry nie. Kan u net verduidelik hoe het dit plaasgevind dat u dan nou hulle moes toespreek by die handelskou, of is dit vooraf gereël?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to hear, it was a trade show. Now that is not usually the place where one gets the opportunity. Can you just explain how it came about that you had to address them at the trade show, or was it arranged beforehand?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek was genooi as die hoofspreker, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, soos wat ek in my toespraak gesê het, en dit is omdat ons gegaan het en dit is 'n geweldige geleentheid, dit is die grootste handelskou in die wêreld – 3,200 uitstallers.

So ons het toe ook van die geleentheid gebruik gemaak om met ander rolspelers te vergader want ons was daar, en dit is presies wat ons gedoen het, en ek dink ons kan regtig trots wees op hierdie ooreenkoms. Soos die agb lid Uys weet, dis in 1995 geteken. Ek dink dit is een van ons sterk, ek wil nie sê *twinning*, maar ooreenkomste waar beide partye baat vind. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I was invited as the main speaker, Mr Deputy Speaker, as I said in my speech, and that is why we went there, and it is a tremendous opportunity, it is the largest trade show in the world – 3,200 exhibitors.

So we also used the opportunity to meet with other role players because we were there anyway, and that is precisely what we did, and I think we can really be proud of this agreement. As the hon member Uys knows, it was signed in 1995. I think it is one of our strong, I do not want to say *twinning*, but agreements where both parties benefit. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Agb lid Uys.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Uys.]

†Mnr P UYS: Kan ek vra, het die Departement hulle verbind aan enige iets om daar te koop? Dit is 'n handelskou het u gesê, en 'n handelskou is baie belangrik. 'n Mens het al die stalletjies daar, nou watter baat het 'n mens gevind by hierdie stalletjies?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P UYS: May I ask, has the Department committed itself to buy anything there? It is a trade show, you said, and a trade show is very important. One has all these stalls there, now what benefit did one gain at these stalls?]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie waarde.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: A lot of value.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ons gaan definitief nie net om te koop nie en ons het nie tenders in ons sak nie, en agb lid Uys weet presies hoe dit werk. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit gaan om kennis, dit gaan om kennis te deel, kennis te ruil, nuwe tegnologie te ondervind en in praktyk te sien hoe dit werk, en daarmee kom deel ons dit, en ons sal 'n volledige verslag, soos wat ons met enige oorsese reis doen, inhandig, en ons sal in die toekoms daarmee werk.

Die Hanns Seidel Stigting, byvoorbeeld, die een investering wat hulle in ons doen is R4,7 miljoen. Ons almal weet dat lugverkoeling belangrik is, ons almal weet dat die manier waarop ons yskaste werk is ongelooflik belangrik, en as ons 'n bydrae kan maak tot Nasionale Regering se internasionale ooreenkomste wat hulle teken sodat ons ons *footprint* kan afbring, is ons meer as bereid om dit te doen.

Verder het die Hanns Seidel Stigting ons gehelp om agt modules te ontwikkel wat ons tans beskikbaar stel in gemeenskappe oor die rol van hulle raadslid, die rol van wykskomitees en, en. Hulle het ons ook gehelp met die ontwikkeling van die Nelson Mandela-baai Universiteit, oor 12 modules vir opleiding vir raadslede. Daar is geweldige waarde vir ons in, maar weereens ons staan nie bakhand nie. Ek dink die Hanns Seidel Stigting sowel as die Staat van Beiere leer ook by ons. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are definitely not just going to buy and we have no tenders in our pockets, and hon member Uys knows exactly how it works. [Interjections.] It is about knowledge, it is about sharing knowledge, exchange knowledge, experience new technology and see how it works in practice, and with that we come and share it, and we will submit a full report, as with any overseas trip, and we will deal with that

in future.

The Hanns Seidel Foundation, for example, their one investment in us is R4,7 million. We all know air conditioning is important, we all know the way in which our fridges function is unbelievably important, and if can make a contribution to National Government's international agreements that they sign so that we can reduce our footprint, we are more than willing to do it.

In addition, the Hanns Seidel Foundation helped us to develop eight modules that we currently make available in communities on the role of their councillor, the role of ward committees, and, and. They also assisted us with the development of the Nelson Mandela Bay University, on 12 modules for training for councillors. There is tremendous benefit in it for us, but again, we are not begging. I think the Hanns Seidel Foundation as well as the State of Bavaria also learn from us. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi, die laaste geleentheid.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the last opportunity.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much. †U is uitgenooi as 'n *main* ou daar, 'n *main speaker*. [You were invited as a main guy there, a main speaker.]

†'n AGB LID: Hy is die *main* ou. [Tussenwerpsel.]

[An HON MEMBER: He is the main guy. [Interjection.]]

†'n AGB LID: Hy is nie 'n *main* ou nie, maar 'n gasspreker.

[An HON MEMBER: He is not a main guy, but a guest speaker.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So tell us, so what was the specific topic that you were invited to speak on? Was it Day Zero? What was it? [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister Bredell.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het dit in my vraag geantwoord, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit het gegaan oor die rol van klimaatsverandering en hoe ons die droogte en ons waterkrisis bestuur. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I have replied to it in my question, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.] It was about the role of climate change and how we manage the drought and our water crisis. Thank you.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ah, so Day Zero.

Ms M N GILLION: Day Zero.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, ons gaan voort nou. Vraag 5, agb lid Uys aan Minister Marais, Kultuursake. Minister Marais.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we proceed now. Question 5, hon member Uys to Minister Marais, Cultural Affairs. Minister Marais.]

Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport

International tour - May 2018

***5. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

Whether she and her Department had undertaken an international tour during May 2018; if so, (a) what was the purpose of the tour, (b) who accompanied her, (c) what was achieved and (d) what were the total costs?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dankie, agb lid Uys, vir die vraag. Ja, ek en lede van my Departement het in Mei 'n internasionale reis onderneem. Die doel van die reis was om die sewende wêreldkonferensie oor vroue en sport, in Gabarone, Botswana, vanaf 16 tot 21 Mei 2018 by te woon.

Eksel, dr Lyndon Bouha, die hoofdirekteur Sport en Ontspanning, Crystal Pather, assistent-direkteur Sportbevordering, Stacy McLean, mediaskakelbeampte. Ek was ook vergesel deur twee BBP-beskers, sersant Kurt Nefdt en adjudant-offisier Japie Lewin, en die volgende uitkomst is bereik:

- Die groep het 'n baie benodigde geleentheid ontvang om te kan skakel met sleutelbesluitnemers in die sportwêreld en ander akademici in die wêreldwye sportnetwerk, en kon ook beste praktyke vir ander in die sportsektor leer.
- Dr Bouha het 'n referaat by die konferensie gelewer wat hom in staat gestel het om sy kennis en beste praktyke met ander op 'n internasionale platform te deel.
- Die Departement was ook blootgestel aan onderwerpe wat vroue in sport beïnvloed, naamlik om gesond te wees en goed te speel, laat hulle lei, hulle storie vertel, verwelkom en bemagtig almal deur sport.
- Sport binne die grense.
- Veilige spasies.

En die totale koste van die reis na Gabarone, Botswana, word op R112,256 beraam. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

†The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you, hon member Uys, for the question. Yes, members of my Department and I undertook an international trip in May. The

purpose of the trip was to attend the seventh World Conference on Women and Sport in Gaborone, Botswana, from 16 to 21 May 2018.

Myself, dr Linden Bouha, the chief director of Sport and Recreation, Crystal Pather, assistant-director Sports Promotion, Stacy McLean, media liaison. I was also accompanied by two VIP protectors, sergeant Kurt Nefdt and warrant officer Japie Lewin, and the following outcomes were achieved:

- The group received a very necessary opportunity to liaise with key decision makers in the sporting world and other academics in the worldwide sports network, and could also teach best practices to others in the sports sector.
- Dr Bouha delivered a paper at the conference that enabled him to share his knowledge and best practices with others on an international platform.
- The Department was also exposed to subjects that influence women in sport, namely to be healthy and play well, let them lead, tell their story, welcome and empower all through sport.
- Sport within the boundaries.
- Safe spaces.

And the total cost of the trip to Gaborone, Botswana, is estimated at

R112,256. Thank you.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: So dit was Botswana, nie oorsee nie?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: So it was Botswana, not overseas?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.]

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Kan ek net duidelikheid kry, LUR? Wat het u vir hulle geleer oor sport in u Departement? Of is dit sport, plaaslike sport? Is dit netbal, is dit hokkie? Wat het u gedeel daar met mekaar?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can I just get clarity, MEC? What did you teach them about sport in your Department? Or is it sport, local sport? Is it netball, is it hockey? What did you share there with each other?]

†'n AGB LID: Goeie goed.

[An HON MEMBER: Good things.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Of was dit eintlik krieket?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Or was it actually cricket?]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb lid Uys. Ons het oor sport in die algemeen in alle kodes gepraat, maar spesifiek die vrou en sport, en dat die vrou nog steeds nie die gelyke geleentheid kry as mans op internasionale vlak nie. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Uys. We spoke about sport in general in all codes, but specifically the woman and sport, and that women still not get the equal opportunities as men at international level. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys, tweede kans.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, second chance.]

†Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. So kan u vir ons sê wie het dit almal bygewoon? As ons nou praat van “internasionaal”, was dit Afrika of net Suider-Afrika?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. So can you tell us, who attended it all? When we speak of ‘international’, was it Africa or only Southern Africa?]

†'n AGB LID: Wil jy 'n *attendance register* [Onhoorbaar.].

[An HON MEMBER: Do you want an attendance register [Inaudible.].]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Internasionale afgevaardigdes het dit bygewoon, hoofsaaklik [Tussenwerpsels.] hoofsaaklik Afrika-lande, Suid-Afrika en dan van ons Afrika-lande, maar dit is 'n internasionale kongres, en mense het gekom van oor die hele wye spektrum van die wêreld.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: International delegates attended it, mainly [Interjections.] mainly African countries, South Africa and then some of our African countries, but it is an international congress, and people came from across the wide spectrum of the world.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ons gaan aan. Agb lid Olivier, is dit 'n opvolgvraag?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We continue. Hon member Olivier, is it a follow-up question?]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, would you and the chief director be able to present what you have learnt out of this? Which would benefit our athletes in the Western Cape? Now from other countries that were there, not from our own experience. That that you have learnt, can you share with the Committee so that we see how it is being implemented? [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you.] Yes, we will be able, if the Standing Committee invites us. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question, which is Question number 6, hon member Hinana to Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell.

Municipalities: service-delivery budgets

6. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What has his Department done to assist municipalities who are struggling to spend their allocated service-delivery budget for the 2017/18 financial year?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, municipal service delivery budgets are funded from various sources:

- National Funding, DoRA Funding;
- the Municipal Infrastructure Grant, MIG Funding; and
- the Regional Bulk Infrastructure Grant, RBIG.
- Provincial funding – Department of Local Government drought relief;
- as well as service delivery capacity building grants.

The Department of Local Government Directorate, the municipal infrastructure, has a dedicated team to assist municipalities who are struggling to spend their allocated service delivery budgets. This technical team assisting the municipalities consists of professional engineers and construction project managers.

A team of drought engineers was also appointed on a contract basis to provide technical assistance to our municipalities, with specific regard to the drought and water augmentation projects.

The municipalities are assisted in their capacity to function from a technical perspective and are supported by:

- Providing monitoring and evaluation and technical support on the MIG projects;
- the implementation thereof;
- coordination with the Municipal Infrastructure Support Grant, MISA, to provide technical support;
- support and assistance with the appointment of technical directors by serving on selection panels and the interview panels;
- temporary appointments or secondments of technical staff to under-capacitated or struggling municipalities;
- liaison and coordination takes place with key and sector departments, the Department of Water and Sanitation, the Department of Culture and Sport, MISA and MIG, to support struggling municipalities where required;
- one-on-one support is given to municipalities where specific challenges are encountered regarding legal or environmental or financial issues, and specifically where challenges are encountered with slow spending of their funding.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi first.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes, I am first before member Mngqasela.

Thank you very much, MEC, for that response. Let us just be specific here. The City of Cape Town spent only 39% of its capex, 39% of its capital expenditure. I am interested in the Department of Local Government. Have you, up to now, summoned the Department, the City, but also spoke to the leadership of the City about what the intervention plans are to improve that situation? Because we know, just as an example, of R167 million that had to be sent back as a result of them not being able to spend it. That is Local Government. Please answer now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the percentage is not correct and we must remember this question is a bit premature, because we are not at the end of the financial year of the municipalities.
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So what? Mr Deputy Speaker, we have

got a team, and I have said it here, we have got a team working, sitting down with municipalities on a monthly basis, consisting of financial experts, technical experts, helping municipalities, supporting municipalities and yes, we summon them, we interact with them and we do get their cooperation.

We are the only province of the last five years consistently spending more than 90% of our MIG. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, in the first quarter we saw the contraction of the economy by 2,2%... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Under Ramaphosa.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... where we had the fanfare of 'Ramaphoria' and all of that. [Interjections.]

Now my question is... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: My question is – and also the drought that we had in this province and nationally.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is your question?

Mr M MNQASELA: What impact does that have on the Department being able to support municipalities? What impact – because it is difficult, there are crumbs. It is difficult. I need to know from the Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We do operate in a very difficult environment. Climate change does impact and is going to impact throughout this country. Obviously when we need to shift money from our budget, there is no extra money, so we needed to shift that, round about R50 million, and other projects will suffer, but we had to do that to get us through this drought crisis.

So yes, the long and short is that it is not easy, but we do have the expertise to keep the ship on course and we will pull through at the end of the day. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Simmers next.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Simmers?

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Dankie, Minister. Hoe vergelyk, vir dieselfde periode, die bestedingspatroon van munisipaliteite in ander provinsies, want kom ons begin appels en appels te vergelyk, dan kan ons mos nou die werklikheid sien. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Minister. How does the spending pattern for the same period of municipalities in other provinces compare, because let us compare apples to apples, then we can see the reality. Thank you. [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, as ons kyk na die onafhanklike verslae van die afgelope vier weke, dan staan die Wes-Kaapse munisipaliteite kop en skouers bo alle ander munisipaliteite uit. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.] So daar is geen vergelyking met ander munisipaliteite nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, if we look at the independent reports of the past four weeks then the Western Cape municipalities are head and shoulders above all the other municipalities. Thank you. [Interjections.] So there is no comparison to other

municipalities.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi, last opportunity.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou is ek op, ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now I am up, yes.] †Hon MEC, do you know and if you do, can you please just tell this House how many municipalities, besides the City of Cape Town, have not spent, as indicated in this question, on their capital expenditure?

An HON MEMBER: It is a new question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not a new question, it is here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, you may... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want him... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... to be specific and give us a list.

An HON MEMBER: It is a new question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, I agree with the Chairperson of my Standing Committee, it is a new question, but we have got nothing to hide.

An HON MEMBER: It is still a new question.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are all in this together and we all recognise that when you have got money you must spend it, so I will be more than happy to provide the list to the Standing Committee. They can work through it. I think there are two or three municipalities. We have got a colour code and it leads towards the red... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which are those?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and there are – no, there are reasons

for that... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which are those?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and I will present that to the Standing Committee. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the [Interjections.] – order! – next question, Question 7. Question 7, hon member Dyantyi to Minister Bredell again. Minister Bredell.

City of Cape Town: impasse caused by racial tension

7. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether he and his Department have taken measures to resolve the impasse in the City of Cape Town caused by the racial tension in the DA that is negatively affecting service-delivery in the municipality; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy, nou praat ons.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go, now we are talking.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... the attempt by the hon member and the ANC to project their race-based national and provincial election campaign on the Democratic Alliance is noted ... [Interjections.] and will be shared with the electorate of South Africa in general, and in the Western Cape, specifically.

In any event, the reference to racial tension in the Democratic Alliance is rejected with the contempt it deserves ...

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... whereas the question implicitly refers to the decision by the Municipal Council of the City of Cape Town to designate all delegated powers and legislative authority of the Executive Mayor to the Executive Committee, which is required to make all such decisions by consensus, I wish to inform the hon member that I have received all the information and that I have requested from the Speaker of the City of Cape Town and based on the assessment of the decision and legal advice, I am in the process of addressing correspondence to the Executive Mayor and

the Speaker on my view.

I will, as soon as possible thereafter, issue a statement which I will make available to the hon member and, if needed, also to the Provincial Parliament.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon MEC, I want to be very specific and put this to you. Are you saying to this House today that there are no divisions, in-fighting or problems in the DA affecting service delivery in the City? Can you just tell us that? [[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want you to deny it.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... if it is the perception of the hon member, that perception is wrong. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So you are denying it?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No man ... [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, despite all of that, none of the metros in the country received a clean audit, none of them, and the AG is worried. The AG says in this report... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag please.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... this is a very serious problem. And for Cape Town, as the Metro, how is it... [Interjection.] possible, hon Minister, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, that Cape Town continues to function and we continue to see greater service delivery in this area? How is it possible? How does it do it? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, if you look at, again, not the ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: We know it is not happening.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, again, if you do not look at the politics but the independent reports, the City of Cape Town is the best run metro... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... in the country.

An HON MEMBER: Ag please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Saying that, we all know there are challenges and there are various reasons... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a DA problem.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... for the challenges.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just be specific.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The population growth is one of them, immigration is one of them. We sit with a population growth of 30% and we all need to work together to better services. We all acknowledge that, but we live in the best run city in the country. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on? Hon member Simmers?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are just mocking me, that is your only problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Simmers?

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Jammer. Minister, gegewe my kollega se, die ondertoon van sy vraag as't ware; op enige stadium oor hierdie periode, het die Stad Kaapstad u enigsins 'n rede gegee om Artikel 106 van die sisteemwetgewing toe te pas? [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Sorry. Minister, given my colleague's undertone so to speak; at any stage over this period, has the City of Cape Town at all given you a reason to apply Section 106 of the system legislation? [Interjection.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wat is jou plan!? Wat is jou plan!?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is your plan? What is your plan?

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Dankie.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wat is jou plan?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is your plan?]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Jy moes nou geluister het. Jy moet jou ore oopmaak.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: You should have listened now. You should open your ears.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

†Me M N GILLION: Met wie dink jy praat jy?

[Ms M N GILLION: Who do you think you are speaking to?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie aan die agb lid vir die vraag. Die Stad Kaapstad is baie ver van 'n Artikel 106 af. Nog nooit het ons dit oorweeg nie. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to the hon member. The City of Cape Town is still far away from a Section 106. We have never considered it. I thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question, which is Question no. 8. Hon Tyatyam to Minister Winde. Minister Winde.

Israeli economy and opportunities

8. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

- (1) (a) What is the Government's assessment of the Israeli economy and (b) what are the opportunities for the province;
- (2) whether Wesgro has visited that country to attract investment for the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You were saved by your faction.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker and to the hon member. I wonder if I am

going to be asked this question of other economies but thank you very much. What is the Government's assessment of the Israeli economy?

Well, according to the BMI forecast the Israeli's real GDP is expected to grow at approximately 3% in the coming year. The Bank of Israel has mitigated appreciatory pressures on the Shekel by strongly intervening in the foreign exchange markets. A faster than expected appreciation of the Shekel would delay the recovery of the export sector. Israel is ranked third on the BMI's operational risk index in the Middle East and North Africa region.

The country leads the region in our labour market risk index with a score of 71.2 out of 100 and is second only to the United Arab Emirates in the logistics risk index. That said, Israel is handicapped by a weaker score in the crime and security component of the overall operational risk index.

Moreover, the country does not have normal diplomatic relations with most Arab states, which restricts travel and trade within the rest of the region. And then of course, the second part of the question, opportunities for the Western Cape.

The largest exports from the Western Cape to Israel can be attributed to natural or cultured pearls, precious or semi-precious stones, precious metals, metals clad with precious metal and articles thereof, imitation jewellery, coins, which amounted to R141 398 261 in 2017.

Exports of edible fruit and nuts, peel of citrus fruits and melons have increased from 2016 – that was R25 970 980 to 2017, that increased to R48 768 720. Exports of beverages, spirits and vinegar remained relatively consistent from 2014 to 2017 but decreased from R6 666 136 in 2016 to R5 838 099 in 2017.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. Rest assured, MEC, I will ask about other economies. So, do not worry. I am going to Bavaria and many others, the Federation of Germany.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are just in Israel.

Mr S G TYATYAM: In terms of this question, the interest MEC, is that in the last two weeks we have seen the interest of the Premier in terms of Israeli companies and it is affirmed by her report, the kind of exchange, the trade that is taking place. It is clear that the Premier, as the head of Government, will be interested in visiting many of those companies. But then I would want to also understand the MEC. Why, if this side of Government, the Western Cape, speaks well of Israel and yet when someone, the MMC in Jo'burg speaks about ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member. Just get to the follow-up question of this question. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ja, I am going to the question now. [Interjections.] Yes. Why, when an MMC in Jo'burg speaks well of Israel, is she suspended?

An HON MEMBER: What?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order member. That has got nothing to do with this question as far as I can see, but the Minister is free to respond in a way he wishes to respond. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, allow the Minister ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Now that was a very long way of getting around to the question and my answer is, I do not know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then follow up. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Bearing in mind that Israel sits in the Middle East, where does the Minister believe is the biggest market opportunities for the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much for that question. Obviously we look at

taking our markets or our trade all around the world. If you look at the Middle East itself as an export region and you look at the Wesgro website, which is probably the best if you want to look at other countries as well, with regard to our trade; if you look at that whole region, the UAE is actually our biggest potential.

The Western Cape exports to the UAE account or to the whole of the Middle East, the UAE accounts for 43% of our exports. Kuwait then follows with 7.32% of our exports, followed by Turkey at 6.9%, Israel at 3% and then following Israel, Oman at 2.72% and then Jordan at 0.62%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, a focused question relating to the original question or to the response of the Minister. I am listening to you. Carry on.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, you can supply me with questions if mine are not really right for you. I just want to understand, MEC, how much has Wesgro spent in terms of inviting and actually having Israel invest in the Western Cape? How much thus far?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is for Israel.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Tyatyam. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Now we are getting to the question which I anticipated.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So thus far, Wesgro has not visited Israel. I have not visited Israel ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Because we obviously build it on strategic directions on where we can find the best trade and investment and as I read out some of those trade numbers and specifically looking at those markets, that has not happened thus far. Secondly ... [Interjection.] on the tourism side, what we also do is we follow South African Tourism's lead on these markets. [Interjection.] and we also look at return on investment because of course that is what my job is in this Government. It is about growing our economy and it is about creating jobs and of course we will focus our energy on where we will get the best bang for our buck.

Obviously, we would like to visit every single country and trade with every single country and grow every single country's relationships with ourselves as a region in South Africa, but unfortunately we do have limited funds and so we have not managed to visit all of these countries and especially if they

are not on the strategic top plan, which links to Project Khulisa.

Of course, as the hon member knows, I think the team that we have and the decisions that we make has really shown that we are doing the right thing as a region within South Africa, because specifically the member as coming from the ANC, which is in government in the country, one would think that he would be standing up proudly promoting this province. Because if we just think about the jobs that were created in the last quarter, out of 165 000 jobs in the whole of South Africa, 123 000 came from this province.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: 123 000 out of 165 000 [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Break it down! [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...in the third year of a drought. So, I think that is what shows that the decisions that we are making, the strategies that we put in place ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ... how we go to market ... [Interjection.] the countries we interact with, what our plans are, our delivering with the amount of budget that we have and of course if the hon member wants to come here and ask questions that are perhaps supposedly trick questions, he probably needs to go back and think about those questions beforehand, because you know, he can ask me these questions. I have got no problem in answering them and probably it is much better to put the direct question into the Question Paper, because then I can give him a direct answer immediately. We do not have to wait for three follow-ups. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, the last opportunity.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. So, bearing in mind that only 3% of business is done between us and Israel, where is the Minister, and I assume that some of that as you did mention was agri-processing of fruit and produce, where in its neighbourhood would be our biggest source of agriculture going into that region, Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So, I think still that would again be the UAE and I think that goes into the UAE on the back of our agri-processing strategy and links directly to the Halal Strategy, because that is a key market as we know. It is worth trillions of dollars.

We know that when we did the work on the Halal markets, that when the

global consultancies were engaging with us, they were saying that we were one of the very, very few governments involved in a Halal Strategy. Primarily around the world it was the big Unilevers, the Nestlés, the big dominant market businesses and global market businesses that were also following the same track.

So, I think primarily it would be the UAE as the key market, but of course we will interact with these different markets and specifically Israel differently. Each one has their own strong points. I know that for example, from a silicone Cape point of view, there seems to be a lot of interaction, because out of Israel you are seeing a lot of tech enablement.

So, as a government we will not necessarily be focusing on that, but you will definitely see businesses working on it and of course this is what the global market is all about. It is about finding those competitive edges and working with the advantage that we have as a region into those markets to again, as I say, at the end of the day, boost our economy, grow our economy and make a difference to people's lives, where we actually reduce our unemployment rate. That is what we have got to be focussing on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. The time allowed for questions has expired. The outstanding two replies will be printed in Hansard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move on to Statements by Members and I

see the DA. Hon Joseph?

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Public Protector is a Chapter 9 institution tasked with investigating corruption, maladministration, and other abuses of state power.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes!

Mr D JOSEPH: With this in mind, the Public Protector's recent report released this week is, and I quote "legal nonsense". [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have been waiting for this!

Mr D JOSEPH: In basing her judgement made regarding Premier Helen Zille's tweets on a severe misunderstanding of the South African Constitution.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute!] †You ... [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The Public Protector is not only showing a worrying lack of legal knowledge, but she continues to act outside of her mandate. She is surely not fit for office. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... just like former President Jacob Zuma.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want you to rule in terms of the Public Protector's Act. Nobody is allowed to attack the Public Protector and also say what the hon member just said.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is a statement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am .. [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: No, it is not. You are not allowed to, even in a statement

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I am not *au fait* with what is in the Public Protector's Act, but our Rules allow the reference to such office holder. [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What happened to freedom of speech?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We only [Interjections.] Order. [Interjections.] We are only curtailed by the positions that this House actually appoints people in. So, for that purpose I will allow the member to continue.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for that ruling. I would like you to consider the legislation and Hansard on this please. I believe you are allowing the member to continue, but it is wrong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow the member to continue, but I will also look at Hansard and come back to the House if necessary.

Mr D JOSEPH (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We have already seen this gross misapplication of the law in the Public Protector's case against the South African Reserve Bank last year, in which remedial action made to the Reserve Bank's constitutional mandate were set aside by the North Gauteng High Court. The Public Protector acted outside of her mandate by ordering the bank's mandate to be changed, even though she has no power to make such an instruction. [Interjections.]

Similarly, the Public Protector has said that action must be taken against the Premier for her tweet, making completely false claims that the Premier stirred up racial violence. This is not only untrue ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr D JOSEPH ...it is a clear misapplication of the law and yet another move made by the Public Protector outside of her mandate. The House already dealt with the Premier's tweet when the ANC asked for a debate as a matter of public importance. The ANC was defeated. [Interjections.]

We see that the Public Protector does not protect the public, but rather protects the interests of the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your dreams!

Mr D JOSEPH: This recent judgement shows worrying levels of legal competency in the Public Protector's office, which actually places ...
[Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute!]

Mr D JOSEPH: ...the public at risk. The Public Protector must finish, go and rather join the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay just give us ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Dyantyi, I am biting my tongue. Please contain yourself. The ANC?

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole! Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals! Throw coals!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC unreservedly welcomes the findings by the South African Public Protector against hon Western Cape Premier, Helen Zille, for her tweets that not every aspect of the so-called legacy of colonialism was bad.

The Public Protector found the Premier violated the provisions of the Executive Ethics Code; her tweets harmed and impacted on the dignity of people, were offensive and insensitive to a section of the population, reopening a lot of pain and suffering of the victims of apartheid and colonialism – particularly considering the position of influence she holds; negative responses show the divisions of the past are still not healed; she violated the code and Constitution’s preamble provisions and her conduct constitutes improper conduct in terms of the Constitution.

The findings are binding, and the Legislature must now censure the Premier by holding her to account. This process must be sped up.

Mr D JOSEPH: Illegal!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC has been vindicated for its opposition to these pronouncements despite many efforts by the DA to silence the ANC for calling out the infringement in this Legislature.

The ANC consistently held the position that people were hurt and that the Premier may not make such dissident pronouncements. The ANC repeats its

demand that the Premier must go – and she must go now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA, the hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: We say the Public Protector must go!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order [Interjection.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Last week on 5 June, during our oversight visit to the SASSA pay point at the Belthorn Community Hall in Athlone, it was deeply concerning to note that beneficiaries have not been informed about the impending changes, with regards to the new Post Bank cards and other developments happening at SASSA.

I therefore call on SASSA to drastically improve how it communicates with beneficiaries, and how its services are delivered at cash pay points. The Agency has a September deadline, but my concern is that some grant beneficiaries will be left in the dark, as SASSA is not communicating with them.

As the custodian of social security services, this poor communication and service is unacceptable. Communication cannot only happen on the agency's website, but it should also be in all local community newspapers and on radio

stations.

SASSA should also clearly indicate that beneficiaries with disabilities will be visited at their homes. What is further unacceptable, is that only four SASSA staff members were allocated to a pay point on that day. More than 150 beneficiaries were present, but when we as a committee left at 10:30 in the morning, only 10 beneficiaries at the time, were assisted.

As the DA we will continue to ensure that each and every SASSA office and pay point in the Western Cape adheres to the values of the agency and that our communities are treated with dignity and respect.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In the absence of the EFF, I again see the DA. [Interjections.] I see the DA, hon Maseko. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. True to the belief that all must share in the wealth of the economy, the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements, under the DA Government, has deliberately set aside a threshold of 50% of the Human Settlements Development Grant to benefit the SMME contractors in general, and the historically disadvantaged in particular.

Furthermore, to encourage participation of women and young people the

Department committed to spend 30% of the grant to contractors with women and youth representation. To achieve this the Department has opened the frameworks for contractors and professional service providers for all and sundry to register and be kept in a database.

Resulting from efforts made in mainstreaming the historically disadvantaged into the economy, an amount of more than R1,4 billion which constitutes 64% of the Human Settlements Development Grant, was spent on HDI contractors in the previous financial year, a percentage we hope to be exceeded in the current financial year, given the drive the Department embarked upon to encourage participation of the HDI contractors in the sector.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Department of Human Settlements, for the 2017/18 financial year, already created 1 735 job opportunities.

Since 2009, 160 HDI contractors, including professional service providers with HDI statuses have been empowered. Over 11 000 job opportunities translating into nearly 3 500 full time equivalents have been created since 2009. Indeed, the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements under the DA has turned the Western Cape into a construction site and it rocks. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your mind it rocks!

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC. Hon member Dyantyi, it is now your opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI (ANC): The DA has tied itself into a knot that cannot be undone. The latest revelation by the newly elected Knysna Mayor, Mike Willemse, is that the Hawks are investigating corruption charges against the ousted Mayor Eleanore Bouw-Spies' administration. She was kicked out by an ANC motion of no-confidence.

Knysna people claim that the rot goes right to the leadership of the DA and the hon Premier and MEC's know this and that some MEC's may even be implicated.

The NCOP has further voted that the Knysna allegations should be investigated or pursued – and to no surprise only the Western Cape voted against this.

Knysna is one of the DA's leadership postulations of a well-run municipality. This has been exposed and overturned. The evidence is, there is a serious problem in that area.

Is it any wonder then that people feel the DA is leaderless and on the slippery slope to more decline like in so many other DA-run municipalities, including the Cape Town Metro. The DA lurches from crisis to scandal.

And like in Cape Town, the Knysna Mayor, Mike Willemse, defies the DA's wishes to be removed. Shame on the disarrayed DA for wanting to sweep the dirt of corrupt Knysna under the carpet! Who is protected by the DA cover-up? Who wants Willemse booted out? Amandla, Willemse! [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: That is misleading.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA. Hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On Saturday 16 June, this province and the nation will celebrate Youth Day, a day when we commemorate the Sowetan uprising of 1976 ... [Interjection.] and mourn the loss of the young Hector Pieterse and so many others.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You should have elected this guy the leader!

Mr L H MAX: This DA-led provincial Department ... [Interjection.] of Cultural Affairs and Sport is committed to the upliftment of youth. This is demonstrated through its numerous after-school programmes, which include but are not limited to the City of Cape Town's educational programmes, the Neighbourhood Schools Programme, the Grade 4 Remedial Programme, the e-Learning Programme, the MOD Year Beyond Programme, its MOD and DSD centres and its low fee schools. It is clear that the youth are a central priority for this caring DA Government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in light of this important day ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, in light of this important day, I remember the wise words of Tata Madiba. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ag, come home man!

Mr L H MAX:

“To the youth of today, I also have a wish to make: be the scriptwriters of your destiny and feature yourselves as stars that showed the way towards a brighter future.”

I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi man! Mooi, mooi, mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, man! Good, good, good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): The ACDP in the Western Cape wants to congratulate the Mayor of George, Mr Melvin Naik, for standing up for his

Christian convictions ... [Interjections.] and ask other Christians in the DA to do the same!

Mayor Naik condemned the upcoming Boston Gay Choir Concert, being under the banner of the George Municipality. [Interjections.] Mayor Naik said on *Heartbeat FM* and I quote:

“I heard that it will go out under the name of the banner of the George Municipality, but as the Mayor of George Municipality I want to make a statement,” he says. “This all due to my Christian conviction and belief system - it does not carry my approval, this concert.”

Now Mayor Naik is in trouble with the Province, because according to Western Cape DA Leader, Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela, his statement is not in line with the views of the DA.

This matter is now referred to the DA’s Federal Legal Commission for further investigation. [Interjections.] Mayor Naik put his statement into context by saying and I quote:

“I am saying this without judgment against anyone, no discrimination against anyone. All of us are equally made by God. All that I will do is bless these men and I will keep on praying for them.”

What is wrong with this statement? Are Christians in the DA now being

unfairly discriminated against? My question to millions of Christians voting for the DA is why do you vote for a party, if when you express your Christian views you are crucified?

The ACDP is calling on the leaders of the DA to stand with Mayor Naik on this issue and speak against unfair discrimination. The ACDP is calling on the leaders of the DA to stand up for righteousness. Stand up for your Christian beliefs and do the right thing.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Amen!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Convince your caucus not to pursue this matter and convince your caucus not to refer this matter to the DA Federal Legal Commission. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

An HON MEMBER: Amen!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

†Mnr P UYS: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek dink die Grondwet is baie ernstig oorskry nou hierso. Dit is werklikwaar,

[Mr P UYS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think the Constitution has been seriously violated here. It is really] †the principle of right to equality. What we heard

from this hon member is really coming out against gay people [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, that is not what he said!

Mr P UYS: That is exactly what he said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: That is what he said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr P UYS: And I think he must withdraw what he said here. It is unconstitutional.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. †Agb lid, ek het dit nie so vertolk nie, maar ek sal tog na die Hansard kyk en terugkom as dit nodig is. Ons het vryheid van spraak in die Huis, maar ek hoor wat die agb lid sê.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon member, I did not interpret it as such, but I will nevertheless look at Hansard and come back if it is necessary. We have freedom of speech in the House, but I hear what the hon member is saying.]

I see the ANC. ANC. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The DA is in total disarray and it cannot even spread the same message. The DA cannot agree what its own position on the Palestinian and Israeli question is.

The DA's Jo'burg Mayor, Herman Mashaba, summarily banned his DA Health member of the Mayoral Committee, Dr Mpho Phalatse, who tweeted that the City of Jo'burg and she are friends of Israel.

No sooner did she publicly write that, when her Mayor jumped in to suspend her at the behest of the outraged EFF political bedfellows of the DA. Mashaba quickly backtracked as he came under pressure and Jo'burg has a twinning agreement with Ramallah on the West Bank, which is the head office of the Palestinian authority.

Now knives are out for Mashaba as various anti-Palestine pressure groups want Phalatse reinstated. We all know why. It is because the DA leader, Mmusi Maimane, seemingly is a friend of Israel as he visits and meets with Israeli leaders. [Interjections.]

We also know in this Legislature that there are those that support Israel. No wonder less people trust the DA.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Like Alan Winde.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It has lost the confidence of many in the Western Cape and other areas and clearly there is no control in the DA over those that so publicly declare their love for one group in Palestine and Israel. When will the DA suspend other public representatives who are in love with Israel? I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA. Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to follow on my colleague, the Lennit Max, relating to the youth and I would also like to quote Mr Mandela when he said that “the youth are our greatest asset and we dare not betray them.”

I would also like to just refer us to this last weekend and the leadership role that the youth are playing today where, first of all, the young Siya Kolisi led our national rugby team to victory over the English.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja! [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And then later that weekend our Sevens Rugby Team won back the World Championship as far as the Sevens Rugby is concerned. These are people in their mid-twenties, early twenties, some of them teenagers who are leading the way and showing us how to be a multi-racial society, how to conduct ourselves in a positive and healthy way. [Interjections.]

When I listen to the stuff that goes on this House here, we as adults, we are betraying our youth. [Interjections.] In every respect, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is not a single aspect that I can hear coming from the other side of the House that is part of nation building. [Interjections.] It is about nation destruction. It is about driving wedges. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: They do their very best ... [Interjections.]

M N GILLION: Where is the respect?

Mr M G E WILEY: With all due respect, the Rules of the House say you may not read a speech. You can debate a matter and you can make a spontaneous speech, which is what I am doing now and the difference between me and the members on the other side over there, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Mr S G TYATYAM: There is a difference!

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, there is a significant difference.

Mr S G TYATYAM: We want a statement!

Mr M G E WILEY: I am here standing for nation building and my colleagues here are standing for nation building. [Interjections.] Those members on the other side there are not able to say a single good thing about the Western Cape. [Interjections.] The only province, which is a beacon of hope, both at provincial level and local government level ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... as adjudicated by their own Chapter 9 Institutions to say that we are a beacon of excellence for this country. [Interjections.] Yet they are incapable of saying a positive thing about the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

All we hear is this constant rhetoric from people like hon Dugmore, and by the hon Magaxa over there, who constantly want to drive wedges and foster race hate. [Interjections.] We have a very narrow window of opportunity in our country, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has come.

Mr M G E WILEY: We dare not miss it. [Applause.][Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. That is the end of Members Statements. We move on to Motions. [Interjections.] Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon Gillion, I am also talking to you. Any motions

where notice is given? Hon member Gillion?

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the state of health under the DA Government in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Why are you laughing ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ...MEC? Why are you laughing?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: People are sitting in queues the whole night ...!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: ...but you are laughing! So, you are laughing about our people [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the importance and effectiveness of public participation.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the upsurge in service delivery protests under the DA in Western Cape rural towns.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there any further on this side? Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the energy readiness of the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Any further? Then we move on to the next section. Motions without Notice. I see hon member Mackenzie first.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its condolences to the Adams and Brandt families in Colorado, Mitchells Plain, over the tragic death of their two infants, Zaythoon Brandt who was 2 years old and her 7-month-old baby sister Zaynura. The sisters were fatal victims of a house fire in Colorado, Mitchells Plain. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the attack on a Western Cape mosque this morning in Malmesbury where two devotees were stabbed, and their attacker shot dead; notes another worshipper was wounded by the stabber; commiserates with the community and wishing the injured man a speedy recovery as this violence occurred on the eve of the end of the holy month of Ramadan. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its grave concern at the regular and continuous absence of the EFF member the hon Bernard Joseph from proceedings of this House and its committees, ostensibly occupied with party-related

matters; secondly, that it notes that the hon member Joseph failed to take up his party's opportunity to propose a subject for discussion for today; and thirdly, deplores his absence from official parliamentary activities while being funded by taxpayers to fulfil his constitutional role as a public representative.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is then carried. Are there any further on this side? Hon Skwatsha? [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Do you want to ... [Interjections.] Hon Mngqasela. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies. I am coming to hon Tyatyam. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns in the strongest terms possible, the unfortunate comments of intolerance by the Mayor of George Mr Melvin Naik, on his attack on the LGBTI communities during the application by the Boston Gay Men's Choir to host the Gay Pride March in George next week. That this Parliament promotes the right to sexual orientation, as contained in the Bill of Rights of the South Africa; and further notes that his views are archaic, and his conduct is despicable for a holder of

public office and we must condemn the hon member Christians inputs here ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr P UYS: Ja, sê dit!

[Mr P UYS: Yes, say it!]

Mr M MNQASELA:

...for promoting hate. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order member!

Mr M MNQASELA:

...to continue in this [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I did not promote hate. He must withdraw that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will. Order! I have already given a ruling that I will look at the member's statement and if necessary, come back to the House and I agree with the member, no hate was promoted in this case. Member Mnqasela, I think that was an unfair comment.

An HON MEMBER: Withdraw!

Mr M MNQASELA: I will replace that with "division". I withdraw "hate".

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: Promoting division ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and unfair treatment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will see the next person. Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that thousands of the members of the Muslim community will on Saturday end the Ramadan fast by celebrating Eid and urges the Western Cape Provincial Government to take extra

measures to ensure the security at over 200 mosques given the tragic killings which occurred at a mosque in the West Coast. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Elsies River High School Choir for earning a spot in the South African Choral Eisteddfod. The national choir competition will be held in Johannesburg at the end of this month; that the House wishes the Choir all the best as they will be keeping the Western Cape flag flying high. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without

notice:

That the House notes and condemns the killings that took place on the Cape Flats this week; notes further that Oscar Losper (47), his wife Eureko Porcia Losper (45) and their son Chad Dilgee (25) were shot dead in execution style at their home in Klipfontein on Sunday evening; further notes in a separate incident in Grassy Park, a former volunteer law enforcement officer of Cape Town, Steven de Kock, shot and killed his wife Samantha, before turning the gun on himself in front of their 6 year old son on Monday in their home; while Brandon Solomon was shot and killed while refereeing a soccer match on Sunday in Elsies River, and conveys condolences to all these families.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Kivedo first and then I will come back this way.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the brilliant work done by The Project for the Study Alternative Education in South Africa (Praesa) by translating educational literature from English into isiZulu and isiXhosa. Yesterday, Prasea delivered 3 000 copies of *George's Secret Key to the Universe*

written by Lucy and her father Stephen Hawking to children in Molo Mhlaba Primary School in Khayelitsha. The book was translated into both isiZulu and isiXhosa; notes that this initiative is in line with the Western Cape Education Department's commitment to advance mother tongue languages in schools. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Hon MEMBER: Afrikaans!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Davids first and then I will go to hon member Schäfer.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes, with resentment, that in the cold winter rain in Cape Town, Steenvilla families, including elderly women and children, are forced to sleep in a field outside their homes as the heartless DA Government evicted them last week; notes further this is another way showing the DA is more ruthless than the apartheid government; and calls on the National Government to intervene.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Government, Wesgro, the City of Cape Town, and the Department of Trade and Industry for the official designation of the Atlantis Green Technology Special Economic Zone in Atlantis, intended for the manufacturing of green technology components and services. I here so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: DTI! [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gillion first.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the head of the Western Cape Health Department, Ms Beth Engelbrecht, told Parliament's portfolio committee last week that Tygerberg Hospital was in such a dilapidated state that it will have

to be shut down and replaced; notes further that Engelbrecht and Keith Cloete told the committee the hospital had very old infrastructure and waiting times are longest there; and calls on National Government to intervene before Tygerberg vanishes in front of our eyes like the G F Jooste Hospital. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the – is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Davids first.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the shoddy workmanship and poor maintenance by DA-run municipalities place people's lives at risk, as a pregnant woman was hospitalised after the landing of the stairs to her Clarke Estate council flat collapsed and she fell to the ground on Monday night; wishes Melissa Finch (32) a speedy recovery; and calls for an investigation into the matter, as residents are blaming Cape Town for

not upgrading the ageing flats.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion ... [Interjections.] Are there objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry. There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Tyatyam now.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cabinet approved the decision to designate the Atlantis Special Economic Zone; notes further the SEZ is intended for the manufacturing of green technology components and services; and commends Minister Rob Davies for taking this bold step.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There was a very similar one previously, but I will have a look at that one. If there is no objection to that it will carry on, then. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest condolences to the family and friends of Samantha de Kock, from Lotus River who was shot and murdered by her husband earlier this week; Samantha de Kock was a teacher at Battswood Primary School, near Ottery. Her colleagues say that she was well-known for having a great sense of humour, being a dedicated educator and someone who could always be relied on. We wish that her dear soul rest in peace and our thoughts are with all of those who were close to Samantha. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I also think in this case was there almost a similar one from hon Beerwinkel earlier, but we will have a look at the contents, and if not, then it will be taken further. I take it there is no objection to that motion? Then it is agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes South Africa's Public Protector found against Western Cape Premier, hon Helen Zille's colonialism praising tweets as they constituted improper conduct in terms of the Constitution and calls on the Western Cape Legislature to speed up appropriate action to hold hon Zille accountable and welcomes the verdict.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Misleading and misdirected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion ... [Interjections.]

There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. There are objections, sorry, there are objections. We take note of that. Not agreed to. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Springboks on their win against England, beating the Roses with a score of 42-39, on Saturday 9 June 2018. That the House further wishes the Springboks well in their future challenges and Tests. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the ongoing inability of the DA Provincial

Government to deal decisively with the taxi violence and once again calls on the MEC for Transport to implement the recommendations of the Farlam Commission.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to that? [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the winners of the Comrades Marathon, Bongimusa Mthembu and Ann Ashworth; further notes that the renowned marathon embodies hard work, dedication, perseverance and pride and calls on all South Africans to do the Comrades Marathon at least once in their lifetime. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cabinet has approved the long-awaited National Health Insurance Bill which aims to provide healthcare to everyone that is free at the point of delivery, financed in a way that sees the healthy and wealthy subsidise the poor and sick; welcomes this move and commends the Cabinet on this announcement.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to that motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Max?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He has just arrived. He is not ready.

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the BlitzBoks who ensured a remarkable double for South African rugby over England this weekend when they successfully defended their Paris Sevens title, a victory over England that also meant Neil Powell's team have retained their World Sevens Series title instead of Fiji taking home the title, having come into the final weekend in the number one spot. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice and also against the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest condolences to the family friends and loved ones of Adam Bezuidenhout, from Sneeuvlokkie Street in Rondomskrik in Swellendam, a municipal worker of Swellendam who was accidentally run over by a municipal truck and was fatally injured. He was the sole bread winner. He leaves behind his wife and two children, the youngest being two years old. May his dear soul rest in peace.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie first.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that Senegal, Egypt, Morocco, Nigeria and Tunisia

will be representing the African continent on the world football stage at the 2018 FIFA World Cup that kicks off in Russia today; further wishes them the best in their bid and hopes that the continent will finally have its first winner. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Davids first.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the beautiful lady, Tamaryn Green, from Paarl on becoming the newly crowned Miss South Africa.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I suspect there was one before, but if not then – is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. It will be dealt with in that line. Hon member Christians first.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Mitchells Plain Crisis Forum who was awarded R5 000 after they were nominated in a competition honouring community projects by HomeChoice. This Forum was established after the brutal rape and murder of Stacha Arendse. The Chairperson of the Forum is her uncle and they consist of 30 members who assist victims of rape and murder. The ACDP admires and appreciates the group of individuals who avail themselves at the hour of need. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the magnificent contribution played by the FynArts Festival in Hermanus, currently taking place in the Overstrand Municipality, in the period 8 to 17 June 2018. With over 20 lecture presentations, 26 workshops, 13 exhibitions, 10 sculptors, 19 galleries with their own exhibitions, 11 food demonstrations and 21 performances;

Further notes, the socio-economic impact of this event which leaves a significant and an indelible long-term benefit to the Whale Coastal

town, through the FynArts Development Fund. We congratulate the event organisers, and all stakeholders involved. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you again, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House sends its deepest condolences to the family and loved ones and colleagues of the late Ms Sheila Cupido from Trestreet Swellendam, a teacher at Bontebok Primary in Swellendam, who passed away yesterday. She was a loved person in both the community and the school. May her dear soul rest in peace.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House thanks all those members of the public who participated in making suggestions on the renaming of the Cape Town International Airport and urges the Department of Arts and Culture as well as the National Department of Transport to further engage with all constituencies in order to arrive at an appropriate name for the Cape Town Airport. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being – are there objections? Not? No objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Davids first.
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the Battalion Football Club from the Cape Winelands which has been promoted to the ABC Motsepe League, the third tier of South African football; calls on all people from the Western Cape, particularly in Mbekweni Paarl, to give them all the support they need and calls on the Western Cape Government to give the necessary backing and resources to the team.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Just a point of order. I want to know, are we now going to congratulate everyone who went to church last week? Everyone who went to funerals? I mean, we will sit here the whole day. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister. [Interjections.] This is the opportunity to move these motions and to give effect to what you want to say in terms of your constituencies. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Speak to your caucus.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just one second. Hon member Davids and Minister Fritz, just allow member Schäfer to continue.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Government and Wesgro

for the launch of the Western Cape's ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Schäfer, just one second. Hon member Olivier, is this a point of order?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can I just address you as to whether maybe you should consider asking the hon MEC to apologise to this House for undermining this very important legislative ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, I did not read it that way, but ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is. He thinks that we are playing here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. The member wanted to get information and I think I supplied the information that this is the opportunity for these types of things. Hon member Schäfer you may continue.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Western Cape Government and Wesgro for the launch of the Western Cape's new cycle route – the “Cederberg Circuit”. This route is the third in a network of routes promoting cycle tourism in the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? It is agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes on Saturday the country celebrates Youth Day in commemoration of the 16 June 1976 Soweto student uprising which altered the course of the country's history; notes further that Western Cape youth, in solidarity, took to the streets marching for their freedom which resulted in dozens of them murdered and hundreds of them incarcerated; salutes the heroes of our struggle who laid down their lives for the freedom of the people; and calls on the Government to prioritise the development of young people in the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the increase in violent service delivery protests in the rural Western Cape towns and the DA Government's inaction ...

[Interjection.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Ms M N GILLION: Can I be protected from that woman? They are working on my nerves!

An HON MEMBER: That is unparliamentary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, are you done with your motion? Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion – is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, an objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be reported on the Order Paper.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: But member, there is an objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The objection has been recorded. Hon member Mngasela?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] working on her nerves today!

Mr M MNQASELA: I wish to start without you working on my nerves. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. We are almost there.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just bear with us. We are almost at the end.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you for protecting me. I move without notice:

That the House notes with a great sense of gratitude a young man, Dr E Eurene from Caledon Hospital, who despite being off duty came to the rescue of a young girl involved in a car accident while driving with her family in Grabouw on Friday 1 June 2018. That the House further notes that Dr Eurene's selflessness in his service to the people showed dedication to saving lives; it is not just a job, but a calling, which allowed him to go beyond the call of duty while resuscitating the young girl. His actions are commendable and exemplary to many of our young people. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Are there any further? Hon member Lekker? [Interjections.] Hon Minister Fritz and hon Davids, allow your member to continue. Hon member Lekker you may continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the confiscation of abalone worth R5 million in the early hours of yesterday morning, after police responded to a tip-off that a vehicle was on its way to the harbour town of Gordon's Bay; notes further that after a high speed chase the driver abandoned the vehicle and fled on foot and has not been arrested as yet and commends SAPS for the swift response and umpteenth arrest of poachers. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Are there any further? For the last time? Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes South Africa as a non-permanent member of the UN Security Council; notes further this election affirms Africa's and the world's trust in this country as well as indicating that South Africa remains a very influential player in global politics; commends President Cyril Ramaphosa and Minister Lindiwe Sisulu and congratulates the Cabinet. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay that DA provincial leadership ordered newly elected Knysna Mayor, Mark Willemse, to quit as his election is regarded as an overthrow. [Interjections.]

Notes further following Willemse's defiance, the DA leader, Madikizela, was quoted to say Willemse does not have the mandate of the DA and it cannot be held to ransom like that [Interjection.]

Condemns the DA hypocrisy as it has been advocating for a vote with

conscience and yet its members are punished for it; and supports Willemse as he rescues that Municipality of Knysna. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to that? [Interjections.]

There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any more?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the bitter war between the DA and Cape Town Mayor, Patricia de Lille, continues after reports that the Mayor's right-hand man, Loyiso Nkohla, was summarily suspended; and calls on hon MEC Bredell to rein in the City before the total collapse of government in the metropolitan municipality. Hopefully you agree with this one.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection will be recorded. [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? For the last time. Then we have concluded this as well.

Order, can I get order of the House please? Before we adjourn I must just remind members that the CPA general meeting will take place now immediately in the House in the Chamber. So, I call on members not to leave. It will not take long and on that basis the House is then adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:16.