
TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before the Secretary reads the First Order may I just welcome all the guests on the gallery, and just remind them that they are guests here and not to participate in the debate. Do not stand up and cheer and clap. That is not part of the proceedings on the ground.

I will then see the Secretary to read the First Order.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address.

Debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the first speaker, the Leader of the Opposition, the hon member Magaxa. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi, gooi! Ons is hier.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw, throw. We are here.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As the curtain calls, bringing to the end the ten years of misrule of Premier Zille, I can imagine that the National Party / DA branch somewhere in another place, she has received a standing ovation from the likes of Louis Botha, Jan Smuts, Hertzog, Malan and Verwoerd. She has done a tremendous job to continue their legacy in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What a terrible start!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Allow me to mention a few things I think hon Premier Zille excelled on in keeping the legacy of the founding fathers of the DA alive. I think we all know that the DA is a commemoration of the old National Party, the Democratic Party. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...look behind you!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Firstly, she remained committed to the old apartheid that

Botha, Smuts and Verwoerd were renowned for. Every time she shouted in this House that I am a communist, I could sense that she was exposing her anti-communist stance. [Interjections.]

Like a true arch-conservative, with her German background, you could see the hatred in her face... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: What?

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...for communists and black people in her eyes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In the post democratic dispensation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] Just one second, Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that last comment saying her hatred for black people is an overtly racist comment, accusing a member of being overtly racist. Surely that is not permissible in the House. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I do not want us to be racist in this House but I will look at that specific comment, but you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Like a Coke Zero!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In the post-democratic dispensation no-one I know of hates black people like she did. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No man!

Mr K E MAGAXA: This hatred cut across all facets of life, be it calling them refugees or praising the legacy of colonialism, or through her undermining of the Minstrels. The latest stupid rant of calling for tax revolt is another example. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr K E MAGAXA: I do not take hon Zille's agitation for a tax revolt light. She knows very well that the repercussions can be significant. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Like Zuma! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is a calculated move aimed at collapsing our

democratic Government.

The PREMIER: What about corruption!

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is aimed at ensuring the Government is unable to pay social grants to the poor, build houses or pay for better education.

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: What about corruption!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Unfortunately Coloured and African people would be mostly affected. She is an unstoppable tsunami who wreaks havoc everywhere she goes. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: That is your Government.

Mr K E MAGAXA: For a period of ten years we were subjected to misinformation and repetition of empty promises that were never met. The people of the Western Cape grew tired of listening to this state of the province that only exists in the Premier's figment of imagination.

While we are all guaranteed the right to be equal citizens by our democratic Constitution, the majority of citizens in the Western Cape live within the hallows of servitude, reminiscent of the dark days of apartheid, where their abilities in the job market are equated to their biological features instead of

their talent.

The reality in the Western Cape is that the majority of citizens, mostly citizens of colour, wake up every morning to frustrations compounded by the reality of their poverty and their inability to break the chains that bind them to this cycle of poverty. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because your Government...
[Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The SOPA that was heard this past Friday was detached from reality. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: A capable government would not rely on the misrepresentation of facts and spreading of false data, which is also revealing of the DA's inability to administer adequately to all people of our province. Mr Deputy Speaker, using the expanded definition of the unemployment, the Premier indicated that the province was way below the national rate. Listening to the Premier boasting about these figures, a layman would believe the expanded unemployment decreased. In reality - let us face the reality - the rate increased from 23% in the 2017 to 23.7% in the third quarter of 2018. Despite all this, does this unemployment rate she brags about speak to racial dynamics of this province and the real socio-economic changes that

have been achieved?

The answer is in the PERO of 2017 where it is stated:

“Relative to their shares of the working-age population in the province, Africans are under-represented in employment, and whites are over-represented”.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because the ANC steals the money.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is this because of the resurgence and appointments of white males in senior positions in your administration? The answer is yes.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja, ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: How is it that one of the largest segments of the Western Cape Province remains under-represented or having access to decent jobs? The PERO 2018 further states that those Africans, both male and female who are employed, usually are in sectors that are low-skilled and those individuals are mostly without post-secondary education. Boasting about an unemployment rate should only occur when all people have decent jobs with decent pay. Not when they are forced into servitude.

The Premier’s SOPA ignores the real issues and reality facing the people of

the Western Cape. Rather, the province has become a homeland for the privileged few, mostly white, with access to tools, networks and relationships that allow them to advance their professional careers and likelihood to success rate. The Paper Video scandal is a case-in-point.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa, just one second.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, she does not like to watch. She does not like the
[Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is quite clear that we all know that the ANC was not here on Friday. How are they able to...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order Minister, order! [Interjections.] Order! Minister, you may rise on a point of order or a question. Do you rise on a question... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Is it within the Rules of Parliament for a party that did not participate, was not here to hear the debate...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer, order! [Interjections.] Order!

That is neither a point of order nor a statement nor a question. Please continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. No other young entrepreneur in the province has enjoyed such benefits besides your own son, hon Premier.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The opposite is true for the rest of other young entrepreneurs, especially young black professionals who are demoralised and forced to leave the province in multitudes, such as Tinyiko Ngwenya. Let me remind this house of Ms Ngwenya. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Eina! Eina, Premier!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ouch! Ouch, Premier!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: A qualified chartered accountant with six years of working experience who in May 2018 decided to move to Johannesburg. In her letter published in media outlets she explains:

“In the years that I lived in Cape Town, no matter how hard I worked, I never really felt good enough, and that inferiority complex was as a result of being a minority. Wherever I was, I was the only African person. I was the only African person in my investment team; I was the

only African in any given coffee shop, on any given wine farm. In Cape Town, I had no role models to look up to. There were no self-made, black professionals who were doing so well in their fields. Corporates in Cape Town always blame the slow progress in transformation on black professionals leaving for Johannesburg and never staying long enough to transform the organisations. How do you expect black professionals to stay, when you continue to create an environment that is not conducive to their success?"

Mr Deputy Speaker, this is a true reflection of Premier Zille legacy, deepened divisions and the creation of an environment where people of colour do not feel welcome or able to thrive.

In her maiden SOPA, the Premier noted these divisions as the Achilles heel of the province. That now she leaves office years later with the same divisions she inherited, still lingering in our society, is indicative of a wasted ten years - wasted ten years were stark.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Like Zuma.

Mr K E MAGAXA: When the ANC stepped out of power; crime and unemployment were at lowest points ever. The province maintained top position in quality of matric pass. We prioritised free house delivery for the poor. Ten years later, Premier Zille leaves the Western Cape a murder capital. Unemployment, especially youth, spiralled out of control, and she

abolished free housing policies.

The poor people in informal settlements and the backyarders should forget about free houses for as long as the DA is in control.

In her SOPAs since 2009 this is one fact she never hid, that free housing delivery is just not sustainable. That is the DA's belief. The poor people...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: People stealing!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In this SOPA she boasted about delivery of 212 967 housing opportunities since 2009. She must tell us how many of these were free houses for the poor who perish in informal settlement fires every year?
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because you steal the money.

Mr K E MAGAXA: When the Premier said "demand for housing is simply too high to sustain old models of free housing..." [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member, just one second! Hon Uys, before you speak... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Just a point of order, I think we have been tolerant with hon Fritz but I would like you to note this. He is shouting unbehaviourally...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: And he is creating a climate that was not... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear what you are saying. I wasn't aware that Minister Fritz was the talker. I saw the members behind him, but I want to appeal to that side of the House. Please allow the member the time to speak. Hon member Magaxa you may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why their problem is legacy issues.

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is not shouting... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: He is even threatening me. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, when the Premier said demand for housing is simply too high to sustain old models of free housing, I knew she was telling the people that in the promised 105 000 housing opportunities by 2022 none will be free housing.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the caring ANC Government remains dedicated towards

the provision of free housing for the poor and we can do it. We did it in the past in this province.

The DA-run Western Cape has annually returned unspent housing budgets back to the National Treasury. Mr Deputy Speaker, our people in informal settlements live under inhumane conditions without water or toilets. Whenever they took to the streets to demand better services, Premier Zille, in her attempts to silence the people, will cry deliberate sabotage to make the province ungovernable.

Opportunities for the development of housing and habitat of working people in the city have also been turned down by the DA, usually in favour of wealthy, mainly white, property developers.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a real statement... [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Brett Herron told the public that his plan to build affordable housing in Salt River to facilitate community integration and to alleviate evictions and homelessness in the inner city were thwarted by the DA. More worrying is the rate at which pockets of land suitable for affordable housing have been disposed by the DA, e.g. Tafelberg School site and Somerset Hospital land. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Who is the owner of that land?

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA has been deliberately increasing rates and taxes in its attempt to push out the historical communities such as your Bo-Kaap, Woodstock, Salt River and Observatory. Moreover, the people have been promised affordable housing through the Conradie Better Living Model. Since 2015 when she started making this empty promise, she leaves office having done absolutely nothing in this state.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because that works for her son.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker she also failed to deliver on her Broadband rollout promises. When it was launched in 2014 she promised to connect 2000 Government sites. She said by 2016 all sites would be connected with minimum speeds and by August 2018, 90% of sites would enjoy 100 MBPS speeds and 10% enjoying 1 GBPS. She said there would be 384 Wi-Fi hotspots covering almost every ward in the province. With Neotel they committed to spending approximately 25% of the value of their contract with local companies. In 2019, none of the above happened.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr K E MAGAXA: She brags about coverage reaching 1875 sites. This is 125 sites less than the planned target. She omits to tell that her Department was fingered by the AG for a negligible underspending due to the reduction of the target for the Broadband connectivity, which is underspending their lives actually. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the socio-economic hardships in the province have resulted in communities being held hostage to gang violence and its associated consequences. If the economy in the Western Cape is prospering so abundantly then why is the Cape Flats engulfed in gang-related crimes since the entirety of the DA-led administration? [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gee nie om nie. Dit is die rede.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They do not care, That is the reason.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me answer for you. Let me answer for you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Because you canned the gang units.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me answer for you: because the increase in the economic activity the Premier speaks about have only flowed into the hands of a few entitled and predominantly white sectors of our community. Violence and gang activity follow because people are frustrated and nefarious forces are able to take hold. When the ANC governed, we pushed implementation of Section 206 to its limits. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You steal the money.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Under the Premier Zille the role of Government was

reduced to mere oversight, using police Watching Briefs, Walking Buses, and Funding Youth Safety Religious Partnerships.

For a full ten years there was no meaningful contribution to combat gangs and crime in society. The situation got worse when the Anti-Gang Unit was deployed by the National Government, following a few other successful operations like Operation Thunder.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA role in the fight against crime has been to politicise the matter. The calls for deployment of the army and use of incorrect police to population ratio are but a few examples. The ratio of one officer to 509 residents for the Western Cape is incorrect.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We will talk to the SAPS. Do not worry, we are coming to the [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: According to official police information, the Western Cape police ratios are better than the national average of 1:375 in terms of the provincial capacity and national capacity which is 1:324. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And you believe it. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I think you are misinformed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Minister Madikizela, because you are damaged when intellectually you cannot understand that. [Laughter.] The ANC in the province will continue to engage the President to deliver on these promises... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...for the re-establishment of the Bambanani.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, order. Just one second. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, would the hon member take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa are you prepared to take a question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is bored. I will not take that question. I have to finish this first, and then she comes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fine, thank you, not now. You may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC in the province will continue to engage the President to deliver on his promise for the re-establishment of the

Bambanani against the crime programme so that we can involve our community fighting crime. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Like in the days when the ANC governed the province, we will have safety volunteers in every school and every street corner in the province.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons vat oor!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are taking over!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Before I leave this point, I want to warn MEC Winde to desist from playing palace politics on this issue. His R5 million commitment towards police reservists is either not thought through or has exposed his cluelessness when it comes to the subject matter. My humble appeal to the DA is to stop misleading the people of the Western Cape and fanning the flames to create a state of panic and racial disharmony. By the way, we are still awaiting full implementation of the recommendations of what we call the Zille Commission in Khayelitsha.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Houses in Khayelitsha are still without street lights. There are still no roads, and the recommendations are there, and you are

living tomorrow with empty promises.

An HON MEMBER: Managing BOSASA.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Our schools are affected by the issue of gangs and crime. On Friday learners got drunk and started attacking each other with knives and pangas and remember you delivered a lot of alcohol in those schools through the Bill you passed here. [Interjections.]

Me S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I couldn't help but to ask what has the After-school Game-changer assisted with really. The Premier boasted about increasing the number of participants on this Game-changer from 14 900 when it started to 18 000 this year.

The PREMIER: 80, 80.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, 81 000, I mean 81 000. The target was over 112 000 learners by 2019, not 81 000. Again she failed. It pains me to read in the newspapers that over 6 000 children have not been placed in schools in the province. By the way I did not only read. I witnessed that. I witnessed that.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is waar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I witnessed that. It is more than that, including my own nephew is among those people who are not at school.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis waar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The learners have missed out on a full term.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Matriculants in the province still wonder what happened to the Youth Gap Year Volunteer Programme promised to them by the Premier, where top matric and university graduates taking part in gap year would tutor children in the MOD Centres. Your record, Premier, is riddled with half-truths and empty promises.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It was a dream. †'n Nagmerrie! [A nightmare!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Not only is the quality of NSC results dropping in the province, but also the quality of the systemic tests results. In terms of languages in Grade 6, the province decreased from 40.1 in 2016 to 38.7 in 2017. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Those are facts, *nè*, the facts now. Listen, listen! Leave your phone!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In Maths the province decreased from 40.1 in 2016 to 38.6 in 2017. We observed the same trend in Grade 9, with a pass rate for language decreasing from 55.1 in 2016 to 53 in 2017. The Maths decreased from 23.6 in 2016 to 22% in 2017. What are you claiming to have achieved? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The retention rate?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talking about facts now!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Since 2015 the people in Manenberg have been promised a Youth Lifestyle Campus, a network of education and after-schools facilities linked by safe promenades and upgraded lighting and infrastructure. As she leaves office, none of the above had been realised. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No-no-no.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Instead she tells us about scenarios for how best to deliver for upgrading primary schools, and a brand new School of Skills, as well as a 590-bed Regional Hospital in that community. The challenges of

public healthcare in the province worsened after Premier Zille and her Cabinet closed down G F Jooste Hospital. Khayelitsha District Hospital and the Mitchells Plain have since been turned into places where people go to die. The blame rests solely on the Premier's hands. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No ways!

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is responsible for the state of health in this province. That continues to deteriorate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, ja, under your watch, under your watch!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC as an institution is aware of these mishaps that have occurred.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jou hande is vol bloed!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Your hands are covered in blood!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You claim, make a lot of noise but appreciate one thing about the ANC. When the State President of the ANC was addressing this country he has acknowledged and accepted and took responsibility for the problem that the country is confronting. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is still a problem.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And he did not only put them on the table. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: He did not only put them on the table but he made a challenge. He made a serious challenge to all of us, including you as an opposition... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Please stop there.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...that these are the problems that we need to collectively deal with as a nation, not rationalising these issues, you know, that is pathetic, but let me tell you... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are the problem... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me tell you. Let me tell you! Hon Premier Zille has not accepted any of the problems that confronted the province. Instead she hides all those problems. She never mentioned even that there are 6 000 students that are not at school, she hides that reality. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Wrong answer. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Instead of putting that reality on the table so that the society can assist in resolving that particular problem. What kind of a Premier is so ignorant but so fragile to raise the issues that we are facing and affecting the society? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: You know! Ramaphosa taking over our province and the country is an indication of changes coming with our organisation. The ANC organisation accepts that we have a lot of problems, including this corruption you are shouting about. [Interjections.] We never said as an ANC there is no corruption. [Interjections.]

There is a corruption. There is even corruption among our own ranks. We do not hide that. We are in the process of dealing with those problems. That is why as an ANC any person who is affected in the commission, any person who has been pointed a finger at by the Hawks, that particular individuals must face the law. That is what the ANC is saying, but we are expecting the same from the DA. You must say. You must not defend your son and how you give him the tender. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must not do that. You must also take responsibility for hon Minister Madikizela using... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... companies that benefited, the Department of Human Settlements, organising a lavish party at the One & Only. Take responsibility of that, Madam. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your time has almost expired.

An HON MEMBER: He is pointing fingers...

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Let me just finish this sentence: the time bomb that the socio-economic challenges bring to the people of the Western Cape cannot go ignored any longer. The only true change to the unbearable hardships faced by the majority of our people is the strength of well developed policies, best practices of tried and tested implementation mechanisms and the ability to self-reflect, admitted with dignity, mistakes, and aim to bring to life the goals of the Freedom Charter, as embodied in the ANC!

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi, mooi! [Applous.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, good, good! [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. The time has expired. Hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I just address you please. During that I deliberately left this till after the member had completed his speech. I just want you to be aware of it. During the member's speech he called people ignorant intellectually useless ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I just want you to be aware that when our members do the same you must then ignore us as well. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Evidence!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mackenzie, you have addressed me. [Interjections.] Order! Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Exactly! You want people to be nice. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do not point at me!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids! I will have a look at Hansard

and if necessary I will come back to the House. May I just appeal to the House in general, we are reaching the end of our term and it is becoming a volatile, a political volatile area that we are operating in. This House has always been a very vibrant House and we want to keep it that way.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I want to be able to hear the speaker then speak as well and sometimes the conversations and the dialogue between members shouting across the floor is simply too loud and I want to appeal genuinely to members to tone their voices and allow members to speak. They have the right to make a speech in this House.

I see the next speaker, hon Minister Winde, Minister of Community Safety.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Minister, before you start, hon

member Dyantyi, allow your member.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you just remind the people in the gallery they are not allowed to participate, before something else happens again, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will. I did not spot it, but as I appealed when we started... [Interjections.] Order! The gallery does not form part of the floor of the House and please do not clap or stand up and cheer - anything like that. You are not part of the proceedings of the House and I appeal to you please to abide by that. I then see Minister Winde to start his speech.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Ja, you said Day Zero yourself has arrived.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, on Friday we heard a speech from a Premier who made maximum use of an opportunity. Our policy of an open opportunity society showed you that when you put a government together with those kinds of policies... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where is Day Zero?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...you can at the end of your

tenure and ten years actually make a speech like she made.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want to thank the Premier for the opportunity that she gave me within her Government over this last ten years. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where is Day Zero?

An HON MEMBER: On 8 May the ANC days will be over.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I really am glad to see so many young people in the audience in the auditorium or in the gallery today.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They will know that whenever I have spoken to any of them I have said exactly the same thing. When you get an opportunity use that opportunity to make your life better. [Applause.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, you are campaigning now.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And the SOPA of the Premier...
[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ag, dit was swak!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, it was poor!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...showed what this Government has done with the opportunity that the voters gave us in this province...

[Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: You must tell them about [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...ten years ago and again five years ago. That opportunity showed itself not in what the hon Leader of the Opposition was talking about, about a figment of imagination.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He was actually talking about numbers and stats that were coming out of his Government, a National Government entity. Whether it be the presidency or Stats SA, these statistics are showing what this Government did with those opportunities: 24.8% jobs growth in the term of this Premier - the highest in South Africa by far.

80% of schools with internet connectivity under this Premier; using that opportunity to make a difference in people's lives - the best in South Africa; whether it be homes delivered, 212 967 homes or the hundreds of thousands of title deeds that get handed over; this was a real track record - a real track

record that showed how differences were made and again, hon Premier, I want to thank you for the opportunities that you gave me within this Cabinet.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Day Zero!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Premier, your unwavering commitment... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is the second time you said that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to ensure that the lives of all residents of this Western Cape were improved. [Interjections.] Your resoluteness in turning this province into a shining light for both the local, national and international communities...

Ms N D NKONDLO: The citizens.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...turning the Western Cape into a fortress that is economically sound, fertile and receptive to investments. Hon Premier, you gave me a number of opportunities and I really worked at each of those. I started off as the Minister of Finance in your Government. I held office... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... for Economic Development and Tourism. You then gave me the Agriculture opportunity and right now I have the Community Safety opportunity. [Interjections.]

You have given me a number and I will talk about those opportunities in a short while... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Tell us about the... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But hon Premier, before I get to talking about those opportunities I would like to talk about the ANC. I am not going to talk about the ANC how they have misused the last ten years worth of opportunity when they have been in government in South Africa.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The State of the Province Address.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: About Eskom, SAA, state capture, BOSASA, junk status.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The State of the Province.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The actual horrible state that they have left this country in. [Interjections.] I am going to talk about the ANC here in this Parliament, this Opposition who actually if you just listened to that speech that has just been made did not use the opportunities...

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Read your speech. Read your own speech. Tell us your speech.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They did not use the opportunity of Opposition. Now let us talk about last Friday, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Last Friday the ANC put out a whole lot of little banners on social media.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are angry about it.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They spoke about 28 000 people who were murdered in the Western Cape. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are angry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Interesting that crime is the responsibility of the National Government.

The PREMIER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So the ANC failed in that state. [Applause.] They spoke about 6 000 young people coming here to look for education opportunities, which we give year after year after year, but what they forgot to say is those 6000 young people coming to look for opportunities came from a failed ANC province [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Failed ANC provinces. They spoke about how the housing list has grown beyond all proportion. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: They were born here.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is because people come here for their opportunities. They come here for the housing opportunities. They come here for the job opportunities. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: They were born here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They come here for the health opportunities and they come here for the education opportunities. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: They were born here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister. Order! Order! [Interjections.]

Hon member Dyantyi, what is that?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I just want, if you will allow me Mr Deputy Speaker, to ask... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you want to ask him a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: To ask the MEC if the agrees...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister order, order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: If he agrees with Dan Plato, when the MEC says they do not think for themselves. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi! [Interjections.] Order! Do not abuse the opportunity when you raise on a point of order or a question. You ask the Chair to ask the Minister. Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. [Interjections.] You may continue. Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: My speech is timed.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, he wants to use his... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue, Minister, when they stop interjecting. [Interjections.] Order, hon Minister Fritz, hon member Dyantyi, allow the Minister to continue. Minister, you may continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, let us talk about last Friday. Last Friday the ANC had a plan. They decided that they were going to get themselves 3 000 people outside this Legislature and what they were going to do is they were going to stand up as the Premier started to make her State of the Province Address.

They were going to stand up and leave to go and talk to the people outside. That again was a failure, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are misinformed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I am not going to appeal again. [Interjections.] Please allow - Order! The Minister has the right to speak in

the House and there is too much conversation going on and shouting at the moment. Make an interjection but do not give a running commentary. Minister Winde, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that again was a failure because their timing was totally out. They did not have 3000 people outside this Legislature at 09:30 as was requested as part of their application.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The DA is failing. You are a failure because of this. You failed BOSASA?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They had 19 - one-nine! So they had to sit here and listen to half of the SOPA and of course they were getting constant messages...

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are a failure.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: "Do not come yet, hang on a second, we do not have any more people. We have now got 25. Now we have 40. Now we have 50..." and eventually they had to make a call when they had 300 people outside. There were just about more police officers...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and more people just coming to see what was going on than they managed to muster outside.

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Watch your speech!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And of course Mr Deputy Speaker, they then had to make their decision. I am not going to talk about the disgusting behaviour that they actually exercised on Friday last week. I am sure some of my colleagues will actually use that, but you know, it was interesting because they actually had to move out to go to another failure...

[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Actually we were waiting for more information about

[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I did not speak now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Were you not? It looked like, okay, so my apologies. Somebody there is giving a running commentary and that must now stop please. Whoever it was, stop the running commentary. Minister, you may continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The One & Only party.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They had to go outside to a truckload of failures. They had Brown Envelope Rasool on this truck. They had Rehash Beyleveld on this truck. They had Retired Ehrenreich on this truck. [Interjections.]

Another truckload of failures, talking to 300 people. They even had to bus people in from George to get to 300 - a total failure, Mr Deputy Speaker, a total failure. [Interjections.] But let us perhaps get onto some more serious issues in this province. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Some came from overseas!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: First of all I noted the hon member Magaxa, the Leader of the Opposition in this province, started off his speech speaking about his own people in his own party, the National Party people who sit right behind him. [Laughter.]

You know what I thought when he was making his speech, I thought of Ebrahim Rasool and Marthinus van Schalkwyk standing in this Parliament with glasses of champagne. He needs to get his facts rights. He has failed there again but, Mr Deputy Speaker, let us talk about the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Where the DA comes from.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want to talk about ethics within the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is the State of the Province Address.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want to talk about the behaviour of the ANC as we lead up to this campaign.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talking about the ANC!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So let us talk about an issue that I raised in this House the last time I had the opportunity to speak and I raised the issue about the ANC, Ebrahim Rasool and Faez Jacobs saying that the DA was colluding with SAPO in the anti-gang unit. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that a State of the Province?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, that is true.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I actually put the challenge to say come and prove it. We have not heard anything. I have just heard now that is true again. I challenge you Mr Dugmore...

Mr C M DUGMORE: You are undermining [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Bring the truth to this House. Bring the truth because I am telling you right now that he, Rasool and Faez Jacobs are lying. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The second thing, Mr Deputy Speaker, another lie - another lie. This was the one where Minister Bheki Cele came to the province and I've told you this in the House before, I challenged him to come back and show me otherwise. He was asked by a journalist while he was here giving a report back on the anti-gang unit and in that report-back a journalist asked him: "Why did you not ask the MEC in this province?" And he said: "I definitely asked the MEC in this province..." and half an hour later his office faxed through an invite but they have the wrong address because they sent the invite from the MEC in the Eastern Cape. They still had not sent my invite. So again, on a public platform this Minister lies. [Applause.] But let us get to the ultimate lie, Mr Deputy Speaker, let us get to the ultimate lie. You have heard a couple of times, whether it is outside in a campaign from Brown Envelope Rasool, you heard it again from the hon Leader of the Opposition: "Bring back Bambanani!" [Interjections.]

Guess who closed down Bambanani, Mr Deputy Speaker. Guess who closed

down Bambanani. It was the ANC that closed down Bambanani. [Applause.] So again Rasool is telling lies when he stands on a truck with the rest of his retired friends.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Acting on instructions from the DA.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He tells lies when he says the DA closed Bambanani. [Interjections.] It was the ANC. The ANC closed Bambanani actually... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Bring us - we did not close Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...within a month of the ANC firing Ebrahim Rasool as the Premier and it is interesting because if you go to have a look at - and the best way is to go and have a look at this Government's very own documents.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is such a poor speech. There is no State of the Province.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Go and look at this Government's very own documents. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is gossip and hearsay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is common knowledge that the Bambanani Unite Against Crime initiated by Leonard Ramatlakane as Minister of Community Safety was launched in February 2003, but directly after Ebrahim Rasool was removed as Premier in this province, Bambanani ceased to exist. It was closed down by the ANC.

Bambanani - if you go and have a look at the Annual Performance Plan of this Government in the ANC's time, in other words the Annual Performance Plan that we inherited after the election - you will find Bambanani only mentioned once in the whole of the Annual Performance Plan, once, and it was mentioned once because it was mentioned by mistake because it was in the document right upfront talking about the terms of reference.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your State of the Province Address?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: There was not one other iota of budget for it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are lost really!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: There was no mention of it, it was disconnected, discontinued by this Government, but also if you go back and have a look at the numbers, Mr Deputy Speaker; at that stage there were

8000 people being paid by Bambanani. The recruitment process was not through the Department. The recruitment process was through political means.

The PREMIER: That is right. That is right.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Political means - this was a political army. This was a political expenditure of State resources on ANC support.

The PREMIER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And that is why it was a good thing that the ANC canned Bambanani, but today as we stand here the piece of legislation that this province has put in place - the only province in South Africa with legislation like this... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is sitting there, she is nodding... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...the only province that actually talks about Neighbourhood Watches; enabling Neighbourhood Watches. [Interjections.] We are way beyond the 8 000 cadres that the ANC had in Bambanani. We are standing at 17 000 registered Neighbourhood Watches in this province that walk the streets to keep our communities safe. [Applause.]

These are the real heroes in fighting crime while the ANC messes around at the top, when they mess around in Pretoria where they are supposed to be managing SAPS, and of course that bleeds down to management right here in this province and that is also very, very disturbing, and that is why when I got the opportunity to speak in the National Assembly at the end or post the President's SONA I spoke about how many letters and I showed each one of them that this Cabinet or I have written to the Minister about policing, about resources, about our offering to help with bringing down crime in this province, and guess what, not one of them get answered - not one.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Because they do not make sense.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I then personally put each of these into a brown envelope - not with cash like Rasool, but with documents, and I sent them to the President... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: In fact he responded... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I would have not responded to that notice myself.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And the President is busy working on them as we speak. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: We are not your... [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sit down!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, if we are talking about this legislation and this political interference - not only in Bambanani and their cadre deployment - what really worries me is how our senior police officials are busy laying charges against each other. When a fish rots, it rots from the head... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Supported by the DA.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: There is no senior leadership...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: There is no senior leadership from the Minister or nationally in SAPS and it is affecting us in the province. These members of the Opposition keep on talking about crime. Crime and policing is a national competency. Every time I say, "give it to me", the Minister says "no." [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It starts with you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have no speech; you have... [Inaudible.] Where is your speech on the... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But quite frankly, in this province, the management in this province is an absolute disaster.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order Minister, just one second! Hon member Dyantyi, I have given you a warning and I am looking at you again. If you want to see the end of this debate you must please contain yourself now. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, you may continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you cannot address me on that. Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, you cannot!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, the answer is no! Minister, you may continue. You are almost done.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On what?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On what topic?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: On the address by the Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! No! Please take your seat. Minister, please proceed and finish off. You have one minute left. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please read out your speech.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. So as I say it is really deeply concerning to me. I have sent the details to IPID and I am not taking sides. I have cases from both sides in the police here. I have cases from both sides. Documents get stuck under my door. I get all sorts of stuff sent to me all the time. I send it through to IPID and we are calling for investigations but quite frankly I think we need to go beyond that. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that your speech?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I think we need to intervene with the President to say we need outside independent investigation into what is going on in our police management. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi, asseblief tog!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw, please do!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because there is too much political interference... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In the DA yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And from the Premier.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and this is where I need to use this space to talk to the hon member Dugmore, because the hon member Dugmore is copied in, in correspondence, where five of our senior police officers are also connected into that political correspondence, along with Lennit Max, Faez Jacobs and a number of other ANC members in this province.

†Die PREMIER: Skande!

[The PREMIER: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is really deeply concerning. [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is deeply concerning and we need to make sure that policing is dealt with properly. There is a separation between party and State and in this province, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a very serious issue. We cannot come and make real statements like we do about crime when this kind of stuff is going on behind the scenes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that all your speech?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not a speech!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. [Time expired.]
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister Beverley Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, while listening to the Premier's State of the Province Address last Friday on the administrative governance over the past ten years, I could only sit and marvel. Well done to this Government, as exactly as Minister Winde has said, for making the Western Cape truly a great province to live in, no matter what!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No!

An HON MEMBER: He did not say that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have come to the realisation that the ANC-led National Government urgently needs our intervention for South Africa to move forward.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Making promises to the privileged.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The success of this Government is in stark contrast to the failures of our National Government. This poor President Ramaphosa is scrambling to fix our broken country under the leadership of the ANC. Instinctively, I actually do feel sorry for him! I mean how can one man try to fix a broken system when it takes an entire team?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So, in the same spirit of Thuma Mina, I want to say, we can help. This is our blueprint for success.

We focused on a handful major things. We had a sector focused strategy in

Project Khulisa that set targets and held everyone accountable. We focused on reducing red tape. We focused on infrastructure-led growth in projects like the Saldanha IDZ and the Atlantis SEZ.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where are the results? You must show results!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And we are business friendly, which means that we attract investors and we are able to build partnerships with the private sector.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we did not have major budgets, there was no stimulus packages. We do not have the national mandate on economic policy. We do not have failing COSATU-driven, Communist-driven, national democratic policies that continue to fail to grow our economy.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not cry! Do not cry! Do not cry!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It has been reported that projections in the recent Medium Term Budget Policy Statement are that the ratio of South African Government debt to GDP will rise from 55.8% in March this year and peak at 59.6% in March 2024. Adding to that debt of State-owned Enterprises like Eskom, SAA and the SABC, we are looking at a debt projection of 70% of our total GDP in 2024. That is astounding!

How can we economically survive this fiscal cliff that the ANC Government has placed us in? No accountability! No ethics! No governance! But there is light, Mr Deputy Speaker, at the end of this dark tunnel; unless, of course, Eskom fails to keep the lights on! For that we shall definitely pray, but in this instance there is some small light. The Western Cape has developed this blueprint which has contributed to economic development and job creation and it is proof of it.

According to Stats SA, Mr Deputy Speaker, 39% of unemployed South Africans have never ever worked in their lives before and among the youth the figure is a staggering 60.3%. I mean how is this possible?

But in the Western Cape we are now half a million more people with jobs than there ever were in 2009. The rate of growth in our job numbers between 2009 and 2018 remains the highest in the country and it is not by accident. This province set economic growth and job creation as its number one strategic goal and it has worked.

President Ramaphosa and the ANC need not waste any more of taxpayers' money by setting up a team to improve ease of doing business and to cut red tape. We already have a blueprint in place that we are happy to share with him. If the plan is to move up at least 32 places on the World Bank Ease-of-Doing-Business rankings you are going to need our help. Our Red Tape Reduction Unit has already registered R1 billion in economic savings.

This weekend, Mr Deputy Speaker, I met the Nigerian model, Jemima, who is the star in a well known soap brand commercial. The R2 million commercial and 75 jobs were on a fine line when she could not get a visa for three weeks because the South African Mission in Nigeria's printers were not working. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Can you believe that!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Without a visa, it looked as if the entire project would have been shot in India. [Interjections.] Through the interventions by Raybin Windvogel and his team and with the support of DEDAT we were able to rescue the shoot and the 75 people who were working on it.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the President's announcement of his Economic Stimulus Package and his goal to reform policy to enhance economic growth sounded great at first.

We all know how much policy uncertainty has affected South Africa's ability to grow this economy and the first thing he mentioned was a change to the onerous visa regulations that hampered tourism and saw declining tourist numbers, for the first time in South Africa's history, in 2015. That was good news, right, but the wording was really the key issue. It talks about - in fact the changes were very slight. They moved from "must" to "may". They talked about "additional documentation for foreign minors no longer need to

be required”, that they used to “have to be required”, and guess what, the uncertainty of the word “must” or “may”, can you imagine, creates complete chaos at the airports and the onerous regulations remain in place. They remain a barrier to the ease of travelling and they remain hampering South Africa as a family-friendly destination. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We both work hard!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, the SONA speech again was one of the most tech-focused we have heard from a President in South Africa and we applaud this. However, in the Western Cape, we have been driving the focus on the development of tech skills and the uptake of young people in this sector for a number of years now. The greater Cape Town area was named as the most productive tech sector in Africa last year by Endeavour Insights. We have also just heard just today that Cape Town is ranked at number 30 on global property firm Savills, Tech Cities in Motion report.

While we welcome his focus on 4IR, this is not just something that the President can jump into when he does not even have the basics right. The fact that it took a year between the first announcing a 4IR Panel and actually appointing them is not ideal. This is not a steam train that will wait at the station while we run to catch up. It is a digital highway with no speed limits.

At the weekend, Public Enterprises Minister Pravin Gordhan stated that

National Government owed South Africans an explanation on how multi-billion projects such as the Medupi and Kusile Coal Plants failed.

Analyst Peter Montalto estimated that South Africa's GDP has most likely lost around R1 billion per load shedding stage per day since Sunday (10 February). Economist Mike Schussler recently told Fin24 that he estimated that Eskom earned about R4 billion a week in revenue. With at least 10% and at one stage 15% gone for much of the time during load shedding, the loss to Eskom to now is probably around R300 million to R400 million.

“That is more than the turnover of 95% of South Africa’s companies in a year and probably as much as 30% of the JSE-listed companies”, he said and he continued saying, “that with Eskom having no policy white paper laying out the details of a turnaround strategy, this very fact creates a huge credibility problem for National Treasury to deal with.”

Let us see how the Minister of Finance is going to explain this one tomorrow. And in the oil, gas and ship repair sectors, our focus has been on the development of the Saldanha Bay IDZ, which has that ability to unlock new job opportunities and investment. Already, working with the DTI, that investment of R3 billion has been secured with new investment in the pipeline.

We have also been working towards the readiness for the importation of LNG gas. While it is still a way off, as has been said before, we are ready.

[Interjection.] Gas will reduce our reliance on Eskom and we do not want to wait longer than we need to for that.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape a recent independent study, which I have here - has just been released - found that 72% of the land reform projects we support are successful.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: This is an external study. [Applause.]

We do not know the rate of success in the rest of the country because there has been no such studies elsewhere but Mathews Phosa, a senior member of the ANC, once said that nine out of ten projects in South Africa fail.

Many farmers have been farming for decades without leases. Here they are, from the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, which makes it almost impossible to secure any kind of financial backing. My predecessor, Minister Alan Winde has written to former Minister Nkwinti...

Mr K E MAGAXA: How did you become the Minister... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ...he writes a lot, I must say, to the Department's Deputy Minister Skwatsha countless times only to be met with stony silence. It seems to be a trend. [Interjections.]

This is not support, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is neglect in the extreme. The ANC neglects the vulnerable people in our rural communities. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has progressed despite the failings of ANC National Government and the economy. But when their dysfunctionality impacts sectors of the economy, the way that the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries has affected our ocean's economy, we cannot ignore it.

Abalone poaching continues unabated. The Department is rife with allegations and communities are at the mercy of criminal elements. The fishing rights allocation process of 2020 is on its way, while the 2015 application was fraught with corruption. The total allowable catch allocations must balance environmental sustainability with people's rights to participate meaningfully in our economy. That track record thus far has shown that they are hopelessly inept at providing this balance.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The Western Cape has proven time and time again, hon Speaker, that it can

succeed where national has failed to do so. It is time that small-scale fishing is decentralised to the provinces in order to benefit local communities and regional economies. [Interjections.]

Finally, to the ANC and to the President: if you are looking for ways to solve your problems, I suggest you start by reading Premier Zille's SOPA debate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Uh-uh.

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: For a decade the Western Cape has combined its targeted economic approaches with good governance and accountability to create our recipe for success. And the proof is in the pudding, but there is only so much that we can do without the help of National Government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon Deputy Speaker, you do not get results like ours and you certainly do not get them by throwing money at the problems. Because if the Zondo Commission has to show us anything ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... it is

that our money is not safe in the hands of the people we are throwing it at.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time has expired.

[Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me first take this opportunity to welcome my guests in the gallery, Pastor Wayne Thomas and Dr Bishop Douglas Bell. Dr Bell, an influential bishop, has now thrown his weight behind the ACDP and I want to welcome Pastor Thomas and Bishop Bell.

[Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, today, 19 February 2019, the 19 February 2019, the ACDP want to serve notice on the DA and the ANC to say your time has expired ... [Interjections.] Your due date is 8 May 2019. The people of the Western Cape will vote you out. [Interjections.]

The ACDP will usher in godly governance. The voters will choose again, as the hon Premier said, a road less travelled and that is the ACDP, to come into power, Western Cape 2019. Just remember, and they all know the story of David and Goliath ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: They all know about the story about David and Goliath but let me teach them something further. The Bible says in Samuel, “David says to the Philistines: you come against me with the sword, spear and javelin, but I will come against you in the name of the Lord Almighty, the God of the armies of Israel who you have defied.” [Interjections.] Who you have defied. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The hon Premier highlighted it ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just one second, hon member. Order! The hon member is entitled to be heard, please quiet down.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The hon Premier highlighted in her speech everything about the Alcohol Harms Game-changer, focusing on recreational alternatives. But she forgot to mention, of course, the selling of alcohol and consuming of alcohol for fundraising at our schools. [Interjections.] And that was done under the DA Government, under the hon Helen Zille. [Applause.]

In fact, hon Deputy Speaker, the Provincial Alcohol-related Harms Reduction Policy Green Paper, led and championed by Premier Zille, highlights the danger of alcohol for children and adults. That is in the Green Paper and yet they pass that law. Everyone where we went was against that, alcohol selling at school for fundraising, but the DA with their numbers pushed it through.

And the voters will show their numbers on election day, 8 May.

[Interjections.] [Applause.]

Further reports indicated that 35 ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Give us vouchers.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Do you want a voucher? I will give you one because you are unemployed after 8 May 2019. [Interjections.] You will be unemployed, you will be unemployed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS : Further reports indicated that 35.2 ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Hon Fritz, just one second.

An HON MEMBER: Is the hon member willing to take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, he is not.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS : He is a backbencher.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Further reports indicated that 35.2% of the Western Cape pupils, in standard 6 – I am going to make it standard 6 because people understand standard 6 and standard 9 – are admitted to be binge drinkers, more than any other province.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is not acceptable.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS : They are binge drinkers at that age – at that age! Your time has expired. Your due date is 8 May 2019. The hon Premier in her speech spoke about 14 000 Neighbourhood Watches vetted. [Interjections.] The hon Minister now said 17 000. So what? Our communities are still not safer. Our communities are still in a mess and, like you usually do, you blame the National Government. [Interjection.] You blame. So when you blame – and the DA is definitely incapable to govern. Now remove yourselves or excuse yourselves. [Applause.]

The hon Premier has a way, and I see the DA as well, has a way of how to manipulate statistics. They mention the one and leave the other one on. Let me just give you an example. Let me just give you an example. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The matric pass rate increased from 75.7% to 81%, 2018, but the hon Premier refused to mention that they slipped from one to

third and that is what she refused to say, she did not mention that.

The hon Premier also mentioned 109 school resource officers were placed at 53 schools. But our children are still not safe. There was a survey done and our people, one out of six learners was not safe at those schools.

So I do not know why the hon Premier gives us certain statistics and the other she holds for herself. The DA has failed the people of the Western Cape and on 8 May 2019 the voters will remove you.

Hon Premier, how can you compare – let me tell you – how can you compare yourself to the ANC, of clean audits, in the Western Cape 83 and Gauteng 52? The people in the Western Cape have already rejected the ANC and ... [Interjections.] ... the EFF will stay a 2% party or will vanish after the 2019 election. [Interjections.] So you cannot compare the ANC or the EFF. They cannot compare the EFF. The DA does not have the political will ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... to address crime, social issues or the problems at our schools. Your expiry date is 8 May 2019. For too long, for too long the DA has instilled fear and has misled the people of the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: And they will be caught out this time around. The DA, on the watch of hon Premier Helen Zille – and hon Premier Helen Zille must answer this, she must answer us – why do you discriminate against Christian businesses? Why do you discriminate against Christian businesses? [Interjections.] Why should a Christian business doing business with the Government or any municipality ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... run by the DA in this Western Cape have a Halal certificate or Fatima must come to bless the business. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member – order – your time has expired. You can finish off the last sentence. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We believe that civil government must be under the authority of God and this is how we are going to get the Western Cape and South Africa on the right track. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order. †Die agb Simmers. [The hon Simmers.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Kyk, ek is ‘n bietjie nou geskok, ‘n bietjie geskok. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Look, I am a bit shocked now, a bit shocked.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. †Agb Simmers, u kan begin. [Hon Simmers, you can begin.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Baie dankie. Ek is ‘n bietjie nou geskok deur die Godsman se woorde, maar ja, oukei.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you. I am a bit shocked now by the man of God’s words, but yes, okay.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the true test of a Premier’s performance in any given province is determined not only by accomplishments in government but by the governing party’s performance during that Premier’s term. [Interjections.]

With this in mind, it is not only sufficient to judge hon Premier Helen Zille’s performance based on her government but based on the growth and popularity of a party in the province which she serves proudly.

After the ANC’s many misinformed claims made last week, one was that the people of the Western Cape have become tired of Premier Zille, signalling a political shift from the DA in the province – †Vader weet waarnatoe. [God know where to.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, I have some questions to pose to the ANC today. [Interjections.] Nee, nee, julle moet ‘n bietjie luister nou, hoor? If hon

Premier Helen Zille and the DA's days are indeed numbered, why has the DA support increased by almost 10% in the Western Cape between 2009 and the 2014 general election? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] You are going down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Similarly, if the DA is in decline as the ANC alleges – †en as julle net wil luister, luister na die feite, man. [Tussenwerpsels.] [and if you would just listen, listen to the facts, man. [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Why have ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. †Agb Davids en die ander lede, [Hon Davids and the other members,] please give him chance to speak. [Interjections.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: Why has our support increased in the east region of the Western Cape – [Interjections.] – from governing three municipalities and one in coalition in 2006, to governing outright majority in 9 municipalities out of 14 and two in coalition, growing our DA support across the east region

up from 51% to nearly 60% in 2016? [Interjections.] [Applause.] †Daar is die feite. [Tussenwerpsels.] [There are the facts. [Interjections.]]

But may I remind the ANC, that between 2011 and 2016 ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order. Hon Simmers, just one second. Hon Davids, I am not going to speak to you again. You are making a running commentary now and it is not allowed. Hon member Simmers, please continue.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Agb Adjunkspeaker, die waarheid maak seer. Oukei.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the truth hurts. Okay.]

May I remind the ANC that between 2011 and 2016 their support in the east region of the Western Cape dropped by almost 21%. [Interjections.] So I fail to see how hon Premier Zille's days are numbered when the DA has continued to grow in this province under her leadership. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

†Maar, agb Ondervoorsitter, kom ons gee nou meer oorweging aan die landelike kiesers, want die ANC beweer dat hulle alleenreg en voogskap het oor ons landelike stem in Suid-Afrika, terwyl hulle eintlik teer op hierdie landelike munisipaliteite net om die regering te verkies. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dan steel hulle die einste areas rot en kaal. Hoe kan 'n mens daarmee saamleef? [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[But hon Deputy Speaker, let us now give more consideration to the rural voters, because the ANC alleges that they have sole right and guardianship over our rural vote in South Africa, while they actually thrive on these rural municipalities just to elect the Government. [Interjections.] Then they still rob these same areas blind. How can one live with that? [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Verskeie munisipale- en tussenverkiesings in ons provinsie toon dat the ANC nie meer die alleenreg ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Various municipal and by-elections in our province show that the ANC does not have the sole right anymore ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon member. Order. Just one second. The noise level is too high in this House at the moment. I cannot hear the hon member speaking. He must shout and it is not necessary to shout. Please continue.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Verskeie munisipale- en tussenverkiesings in ons provinsie toon dat die ANC – amper sê ek AN-sies [Applous.] – nie meer die alleenreg en voogskap oor ons landelike kiesers het nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is feit.

In Januarie het die DA-wyk te Bergrivier die ANC-wyk afgerokkel met 'n oorweldigende meerderheid, terwyl ons ook in die afgelope Knysna tussenverkiesing met 'n yslike 400% in ondersteuning van 6.42% tot 26.97% gegroei het.

Ek moes dus weereens vir die ANC die volgende vraag vra: As Premier Helen Zille en die DA se dae getel is, waarom dan hierdie volgehoue groei onder die regering wat sy trots lei? [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Various municipal and by-elections in our province show that the ANC – I almost said the AN-sies [Applause.] – does not have the sole right and guardianship over the rural voters. [Interjections.] That is a fact.

In January the DA ward at Berg River took the ANC ward with an overwhelming majority, while in the recent Knysna by-election we have also grown by a huge 400% in support from 6.42% to 26.97%.

I must therefore again ask the ANC the following question: If Premier Helen Zille and the DA's days are numbered, why then this sustained growth under the Government that she is leading proudly? [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.] in the Western Cape eastern region,

where I am proudly from – †soos julle kan agterkom – [as you can gather] opportunity for the youth has multiplied under the DA and hon Premier Helen Zille. Being a tourist and hospitality hotspot, the Garden Route District Municipality launched the Absa Cater Care Programme in 2014 to tackle the high rate of youth unemployment in our district. The programme changed previously disadvantaged individuals in the hospitality sector to provide access to jobs in the local tourism industry.

To date the Cater Care Programme has an 89% success rate in placing learners in sustainable jobs in our region, with some learners having already completed a diploma in food preparation and patisserie. 70% of the Cater Care learners are also placed on a solid career path by qualifying for the National Youth Chefs Training Programme, of which last year's top student in South Africa was from this Cater Care Programme.

I am currently in possession of numerous testimonies from beneficiaries of the programme in which they express their sincere gratitude to hon Premier Zille for ushering in a government which has changed their lives.

It is no wonder why the DA support has increased by 400% in Knysna, considering the wealth of opportunities created for the local people by this Government under hon Premier Helen Zille's leadership. [Applause.]

But, hon Deputy Speaker, these successes are replicated across this province as well. [Interjection.] Hon Premier Helen Zille's Government, under the

Department of Economic Opportunities, 10 471 Western Cape learners have entered workplace-based learning programmes as part of the Western Cape Government's Apprenticeship Game-changer. Between the period of June 2016 and September 2018, hon Premier Zille has upheld her promise to create opportunity by investing in learnerships and artisan skills development to meet the increasing demand in our province.

†Agb Premier, namens ons landelike en uitgebreide Wes-Kaap gemeenskap wil ek u bedank vir u lewensveranderende leierskap deur die woorde aan te haal van die gedig "Hoop" deur A G Visser, en dit lees as volg.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

“Getors maar weer die sware las,
Die skouer aan die wiel gepas,
Die krag wat spier en senu sterk,
Die ‘ope sesame’ is: werk,
Die mag wat wondere verrig,
Die dryfveer van die wil is: plig.”

U het u plig gedoen. Ons gaan nou skouer aan die wiel sit om hierdie sukses van u voort te dryf. Baie dankie. [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Premier, on behalf of our rural and expanded Western Cape community

I want to thank you for your life-changing leadership by quoting the words of the poem “Hoop” by A G Visser, and it reads as follows. [Interjections.]

*“Getors maar weer die sware las,
Die skouer aan die wiel gepas,
Die krag wat spier en senu sterk,
Die ‘ope sesame’ is: werk,
Die mag wat wondere verrig,
Die dryfveer van die wil is: plig.”*

You have done your duty. We are now going to put shoulder to the wheel to drive this success of yours further. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I have to mention, the vitriol that was spewed here by the DA Premier candidate, which had nothing to do with SOPA, was just shocking, to say the least. The DA needs to stop running away from their social responsibilities, which is the real cause of crime, and not the police. But let me get to my speech.

Hon Deputy Speaker, while the new dawn is taking shape across the country South Africans are having renewed hope for the future, even amongst your

base. [Interjections.] That, hon Deputy Speaker, is the Ramaphoria we all know and talk about but which they fear.

Hon Deputy Speaker, not too long ago this party only had Jacob Zuma and Nkandla to speak about to give them relevance. [Interjections.] The worst thing that happened to them was Cyril Ramaphosa. †Nou is hulle wind uit. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Now they are winded. [Interjections.]] Your by-elections results show – and you should not cherry-pick your results to show your growth. GOOD is coming for you. That makes them scared of the upcoming elections. They fear what Cyril Ramaphosa has done for the country and the confidence he has given both business people and the investors and their leader Mmusi Maimane found that out in a rude way in his supposed SONA presentation. In short, hon Deputy Speaker, this party suffers from Ramaphobia.

What makes it worse for them in the upcoming elections, is their legacy of failure in this province.

On Friday the hon Premier delivered a SOPA speech, riddled with statistics and anecdotes and of your supposed legacy, and those who deserted the speech were labelled as political delinquents. All of those stats meant nothing to the people who are today in the gallery, not the whites who were here the other day. [Interjections.]

So let us look at your legacy and for this, hon Deputy Speaker, let me take

this House on a short human journey of people in the township and those in the leafy suburbs for which this party only caters, amidst their denials.

[Interjections.]

Unlike the DA speeches that criss-cross from province to national, hiding from their responsibility, it has no relevance even today to the people.

And while I am welcoming people, let me welcome the business people from Swellendam up there, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi, mooi.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, good, good.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This journey is the story of Nosipho, a single mother from the Cape Flats with a minor child. She arrived here in 2009 – someone who the hon Speaker later referred to as a refugee. This Nosipho is the domestic worker of Isaac and whose family who also arrived here in 2009, but he moved into a fancy house on the Atlantic seaboard.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Because of the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: On a daily basis Nosipho travels to Isaac's house by three taxis.

An HON MEMBER: Inhuman ... [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Later, three taxis later because this Government did not deem her worthy ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... or human enough for the MyCiTi bus route to go to her suburb.

Nosipho reports to work to look after little Simon, Isaac's son, while leaving her own minor child unsupervised. Nosipho cannot live close to work because this Government sold off opportunities to build affordable housing for her close to work, against public opinion and sound advice.

Nosipho gives motherly care and love to little Simon, all this while her own minor child must dodge gangster bullets, navigate through taxis and walk to the local overcrowded schools because you and your government, DA, decided to close schools on the Cape Flats, not on the Atlantic seaboard.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis waar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Little Simon gets dropped off on a daily basis and fetched by his mom's SUV or by Uber, but he never gets to see or feel the experience of a taxi.

That is the real legacy of Premier Zille.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let us just take a detour on this journey. Nosipho being a good mother, teaches her child healthy habits and behaviour and moral standards. But what does this DA Government do? They decide that it is okay to sell alcohol at school in the name of fundraising. In so doing, they not only undermine Nosipho's good teachings and parental responsibilities but also corporatise our society to the highest bidder. The most uncaring MEC of Education ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Schäfer.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... again was offering comments across the floor the other day when we spoke about privatising of schools, as "So what?" Double standards.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on her way home from school Thandi is caught in the cross-fire between rival gangs. If this happened to little Simon he would have access to the best private healthcare and well-resourced medical facilities within breathing distance from home. Not so Thandi. Thandi can only use public hospitals, if she gets there alive, because you, DA and your Government, failed to address the root causes of crime, which are drugs and gangsterism in our areas, not the police. [Interjection.]

This placed paramedics at risk when coming to our areas. If she does manage

to get to Khayelitsha Hospital alive, she will be just one of another 100 already waiting to be attended by overworked staff in a severely under-resourced health facility.

That is the real state of this province under the DA rule. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, Nosipho's brother, Mzi , has to cross the N2 to go to work in the airport industrial area on a daily basis but not over a footbridge, because this DA Government did not regard him human and worthy enough to have a safe pathway across the N2. Yet in Milnerton just up the road, not far from here, new footbridges are being built, old ones are being revamped at an exorbitant cost, where there is no danger and people use it to walk their dogs.

That inequality is this Premier's legacy.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let me take another short detour on this journey with Nosipho. Our Constitution provides for various institutions supporting democracy. One of those is the office of the Auditor-General. The role of this office is to ensure amongst other things, that corporate governance principles are adhered to when the Executive must deliver services.

In this regard the Legislature with its oversight mandate also must ensure that the Executive delivers, and if they fail, they must be held to account for it. Here we have a Premier candidate in the form of MEC Alan Winde, who, for two years, two consecutive years, failed to do so. And then ran to court.

Let us look at this Government's attitude towards the AG's office, hon Deputy Speaker. When it suits this Provincial Government under this party, especially at the National Government level, they endorse with much fanfare the findings and recommendations of the Auditor-General and the Public Protector. Yet in this very province as recently as last year when the Auditor-General's office made recommendations that did not suit them, they ran to the High Court with public money, hiding behind legal doctrines like the *sub judice* rule to dodge having to account to the Legislature.

So why is all of this important to Nosipho?

A provincial government that does not account or deliver services, fails its citizens like Nosipho, like Thandi, like Mzi.

So hon Deputy Speaker, at the end of this journey what have we seen?

We have seen a government that perpetuates rampant inequality in spite of their open society mantra; a government with policies that destroys social norms, cohesion and values; a government that entrenches white male domination in the workplace; a government that for years mismanaged natural resources like water, only to punish the ratepayers with higher tariffs.

[Interjections.]

While on the issue of Local Government responsibility ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Beerwinkel, just one second, there is an hon member on the floor.

Ms M N GILLION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think running comment is allowed but it cannot drown out the speaker – like two MECs and the hon member Mackenzie who do it the whole time. If you can just ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will have a look at that.

Ms M N GILLION: If you just guide that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I did not hear that they were doing that but I will keep an eye on them. You may continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. While on the issue of Local Government, and their responsibility, why is it that Nosipho's suburb is under-serviced, lacks adequate sanitation and bulk sewerage services, yet Isaac and his family enjoy flush toilets and running water at the press of a button? When they asked, when the people in Nosipho's suburb asked for toilets, they were given porta potties. [Interjections.]

Nosipho lives this inequality by seeing what little Simon enjoys and takes for granted, and she sees what her daughter Thandi is deprived of on a daily basis in the same province, in the same city, under the DA rule.

Hon Deputy Speaker, those who deserted the SOPA on Friday were labelled political delinquents. [Interjections.] If I was at National Government I would speak about Eskom. I am at the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Those who perpetuate these real life inequalities in our areas ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. †Agb Fritz en agb Mackenzie, [Hon Fritz and hon Mackenzie,] order. Allow the member the silence she deserves. She is almost done with her speech. Hon member, you may continue. You have about 50, 40 seconds left.

[Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But hon Deputy Speaker, those who perpetuate these life inequalities in our areas, our workplaces and in our schools must then surely be apartheid's remnants still lurking in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: These inequalities, hon Premier, are you real legacy and no amount of marketing propaganda and spin doctoring or political rhetoric will change Nosipho's lived experience. You had 10 years to improve her standard of living, and millions of others. You failed dismally. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Applause.] Hon Minister Madikizela, Minister of Human Settlements. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I would like to thank hon Premier Zille for not only delivering a speech that gives hope to the people of the Western Cape and the people of South Africa during these dark days of our democracy, but for also laying a very strong foundation for the new term of government, which will be under the Democratic Alliance, as we prepare for the sixth democratic elections on 8 May.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please, asseblief! [please!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This year, hon Deputy Speaker, marks 25 years since the dawn of democracy in South Africa. We

have achieved a lot as a country since 1994 and we are grateful to those functioning state institutions like the Independent Electoral Commission that still ensures that we are able to hold elections every five years without fail, and it is something that we must take for granted because it is not happening in other countries.

We are also grateful for our independent judiciary and many men and women in South Africa who are still honest, hard-working servants of our people. [Interjection.] Hon Premier Zille falls into that category. We thank her for her passionate, inspiring and visionary leadership in the province of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

But unfortunately, hon Deputy Speaker, a lot has gone wrong in our country and our success as a country must never be compared to the previous government prior 1994. I think what the ANC does there, they are setting the bar very, very low.

We must compare ourselves with ourselves. We must compare what we have achieved and what we could have achieved if we did not have the rot that is happening in the National Government where it is estimated that almost R700 billion has been lost since 1994.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this debate comes at a time when several commissions are revealing the real state of our nation, a far cry from what was delivered by President Ramaphosa on 7 February. It comes at a time when we are

grappling with Eskom's devastating impact on our economy which will add more people to the list of unemployed South Africans, who are already sitting at about 10 million in South Africa. And yes, hon member Beerwinkel, Eskom does impact on the Western Cape as well. [Interjection.]

The contrast between hon Ramaphosa's State of the Nation Address and hon Zille's State of the Province Address is quite telling, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is an illustration of a failing National Government under the ANC and a progressing Provincial Government under the DA. [Interjections.]

This should make the choice for the voters on 8 May a very simple one. So it would be funny if it was not serious, to hear the ANC in this province making many hollow and empty promises on things they are failing to do elsewhere where they are in government. Because if you look at every promise that the ANC is making, I would want the ANC to show us where they have achieved what they are promising. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, just take your seat, hon Minister. Hon Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Can you tell the Ministers to keep quiet because they are ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I will keep an eye on them. I am not sure whether they are ... [Interjection.] ... but I will keep an eye. Hon Minister,

you may continue. Hon Fritz, I sense he is referring to you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please listen. Okay, you may continue.
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: On many challenges facing our country, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier Zille clearly outlined what we are already doing, not what we are planning to do. After 25 years in government the ANC is still planning to do things that we are already doing in this province. [Interjections.]

Let me just mention a practical example of what I am talking about. [Interjections.] On four issues that are very crucial in this time of our democracy ... [Interjection.]

The first issue is joblessness that we are grappling with in South Africa. The second one is the land reform that the ANC has been talking about. The third one is provision of basic services. And the fourth one, of course, is the energy.

Under hon Premier Zille we have created 508 000 new jobs since our term of office 10 years ago in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] A growth of 28.4% between 2009 and last year in 2018.

Our unemployment rate is the lowest in the country. Nationally – now let us compare this with what is happening nationally. Nationally, hon Deputy Speaker, under the ANC Government between the third quarter of 2008 and the third quarter of 2018 the number of persons who were in long-term unemployment increased by a whopping 1.7 million people. That is according to Stats SA. This means 170 000 people a year joined the unemployment queue during this period. Now that is the ANC legacy. [Interjections.]

A lot has been said about land reform by many parties, particularly the ANC blowing hot air. In fact, the ANC has now reneged on the promise that they made to fast-track land reform because that was a political gimmick in the first place. [Interjections.]

Since 2014 this Government has spent more than 500 million supporting 357 land reforms, which resulted in 72% success rate. Now compare that with only 10% success rate nationally.

We have also ensured that more than 103 000 people own the homes that they are living in. We have issued title deeds. They are not just resident in those homes but they are property owners. [Interjection.]

Now if you look at the provision of basic services, I mean hon member Beerwinkel told a very lovely story about Nosipho, about Mzi, but here is the reality. At least those people that she is making an example of, they are

working. It might not be a decent job but compared to the 1.7 million people that I spoke about that join the queue, they are better off.

14 out of 20 municipalities in South Africa with the highest access to sanitation are in this province, Madam Speaker. Access to piped water, electricity and waste removal is almost 100% in this province compared to other provinces, because we must compare apples with apples. [Interjections.]

We have achieved all this, Madam Speaker, despite the massive population growth of almost 2 million people in 15 years.

While President Ramaphosa is shocked and angry that we are experiencing load shedding, because of his government's failures to fix Eskom and our state-owned enterprises ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... under this Premier, Premier Zille, we have invested in renewable energy because we have realised that National Government is failing. And that is why 70% of South Africa's renewable energy is manufactured here in the Western Cape. [Interjection.]

We are now the fastest-growing green economy in the world, according to the rating agency bodies. [Interjections.]

Now this is the difference between the ANC Government and the DA Government. Now, realising how embarrassing it would be to hear this contrast, the ANC tried, without success, to mobilise people as a show of force on the day of the State of the Province Address.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It was stuck ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And they promised to bring 3 000 people but unfortunately only about 10% of the people that showed up. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now instead of listening to this incredible delivery record of the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape, they staged a walkout.

Now someone once said, the Western Cape ANC is the worst opposition. In fact, they do not know how to be an effective opposition. That person was putting it highly. [Interjection.] The ANC is so desperate to perform better in the Western Cape – now I say “perform better” because they know that they are not going to win, so it is a fact they conceded a long time ago – they are so desperate to perform better, to an extent that they are spreading these false narrative about their delivery record when they were in government in the Western Cape.

Now let me give you facts about their delivery record here, particularly in housing or human settlements. Now the ANC says it delivered around 20 000 during its term of office. Now I do not believe that is true. Now the truth is: no-one knows for sure how many houses the ANC delivered. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: I do not believe ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Here is the reason why ... [Interjections.] Now the truth is: no-one knows how many houses the ANC delivered in this province because, according to the Auditor-General – [Interjections.] – according to the Auditor-General ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... there are no records of that delivery. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There are no records ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But here is what I know for sure, Madam Speaker, here is what I know for sure, is when I took over this Department in 2009 ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Madikizela, kindly take your seat, please. There is too much noise on both sides of the House. We cannot drown out a speaker on the floor. So I am appealing to both sides of the House, kindly reduce your volume to allow the hon Minister to continue. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But here is what I know for sure: when I took over this Department in 2009 I discovered that 42 projects were blocked. Now the meaning of a blocked project is where money was spent and those houses were counted but they were non-existent or incomplete. [Interjection.] Affecting – listen to this Madam Speaker – affecting 887 families. This Department had to spend R71.9 million to rebuild those houses. Now that is the legacy of the ANC.

In addition to that, Madam Speaker, we had to rectify ... [Interjections.] in addition to that, we had to rectify 2 608 houses that were badly built by the ANC Government, spending over R43 million ... [Interjections.] as well were counted as part of the ANC legacy. In many houses built ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, in many houses built by the ANC up until today people have not received their title deeds. The study that we conducted ... [Interjections.] ... on many of these projects had even more shocking revelations, Madam Speaker. It became evident that many

houses that were built under the ANC Government were built without following due processes, like township establishment, like zoning, like pegging, et cetera. [Interjections.] Which means those people will never own their houses until all those processes are redone. [Interjections.]

Now again the ANC likes to come here and grandstand and pretend to care about farm workers. During their term of office not a single farm worker was registered on the housing demand database. [Interjections.] In fact ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... we started that process in 2011. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: To make sure that all the farm workers are registered on the housing demand database.

The SPEAKER: Hon Davids [Interjections.] ... hon Davids.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Many farm workers now are homeowners after we debugged that process. [Interjections.]

Now that is the shocking legacy of the ANC that they are bragging about. [Interjections.] We have created more than 213 000 housing opportunities that are verifiable.

Mr C M DUGMORE: How many houses are that?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is 21 300 housing opportunities per year, despite the budget cuts, in today's value compared to previous years. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You said there is no record.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now I also need to make this point very clear because the Leader of the Opposition misled this House. [Interjection.] We can go on record, there are annual performance plans that indicate that not a single cent of this Department was ever sent back.

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, you need to finish up, please. Your time has just about expired ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: As I conclude, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.] we still have many challenges in the Western Cape. We do not pretend that things are perfect here.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But we spend 82% of our budget on the poor and our track record ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] I now see the hon member Daylin Mitchell. Member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, when hon Premier Helen Zille ascended into government in 2009, her courage and determination directed this Government to embark on the road less travelled. I would like to use this opportunity granted to me to showcase how the lives of thousands of youth and other vulnerable groupings in our society have been changed by this caring DA-led Government over the past decade. [Interjection.] As a caring government, we have expanded social services to those individuals who are the most vulnerable across all communities in the province.

The youth and children were one of the key strategic priorities for this Government. In fact, Madam Speaker, the hon Premier dedicated her final term in office to the youth of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, I am reminded of my journey and how the opportunities

provided to me changed not only my life but the lives of my family. With a single opportunity the lives of my siblings changed. With one job in every household, the lives of the rest of the family could also change. [Interjections.]

But today I would like to pay tribute to every single person with disabilities, those fighting substance abuse, those women and children who have been victims of rape and other forms of violence, those people working hard to provide a life for their families and those youth who continue to lose hope as a consequence of a lack of opportunities.

Madam Speaker, over the past decade this caring DA-led Government under the trusted leadership and guidance of Premier Zille has continued to strive to build a society and Western Cape in which each and every single citizen can truly live a life that they value. [Interjections.]

One key imperative for the new administration was how the lives of our youth could be improved. Consequently, early on Premier Zille identified that a focus on youth development would be critical to any successful nation building initiatives adopted. After all, youth are not only the leaders of tomorrow but also the partners of today.

Young people, Madam Speaker, are social actors of change and progress. They are a crucial part of a nation's development. Their contribution therefore is highly needed.

A key component of this caring DA-led Government's success has been the emphasis on playing a supportive role and creating an enabling environment conducive to the empowerment and prosperity of the youth in our province. The progress made in this regard is a cause for huge optimism, not only for the Western Cape but for the rest of South Africa who remain in desperate need of a caring government.

Madam Speaker, the proof is in the pudding ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where is the pudding? [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: And here is evidence to highlight the immense progress we have made in expanding opportunities to the youth across the province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: This year, Madam Speaker, this year alone we will see 863 working opportunities provided to the youth from all across this province in the Premier's Advancement of Youth Project ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. There is too much noise.

Mr D G MITCHELL: The importance of this programme should never be underestimated. These 863 young people will not merely be earning a stipend

while working in various Government departments; more significantly, these people, these perfectly capable but underprivileged young individuals will be provided with an opportunity to learn and explore a range of new people skills, problem-solving skills and technical skills that other people will not have.

Furthermore, they will be able to set their own boundaries and how to become self-sufficient and responsible as they get to learn ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... their own way through real life experience. Madam Speaker, but since the DA took over nine Youth Cafés have been established which serve more than 10 000 young people every month. Youth Cafés remain pivotal to assist those young people who are not in employment, education or training. And through this initiative, Madam Speaker, this DA-led Government restored hope to those young people who would otherwise be left to fall by the wayside.

Under the experience of Premier Zille and hon Minister Fritz, the Minister of Social Development, this DA-led Western Cape Government have quadrupled the number of youth benefiting from Youth Development Services. [Applause.] From the shocking 5 600 in 2009 to 19 400 in 2018. [Applause.]

Madam Speaker, it appears in other provinces that the ANC has neglected the

importance of investing in the youth as to ensure that the leaders are tomorrow are equipped with the necessary tools to ensure that the country competes economically with the rest of the global world. This DA-led Western Cape Government differs tremendously from what one would find across the country.

Madam Speaker, when you pay attention to the beginning of a story, you can change the entire story. And today the Western Cape paid attention to the beginning of the story and has the highest percentage of children in subsidised ECDs in the country. In 2018 the number of children in funded ECDs has increased to nearly 80 000 ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... compared to 50 000 in 2009. This is achieved under a DA-led Government. [Applause.]

Madam Speaker, let me move over to substance abuse. Substance abuse is detrimental ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... to the progress of a society. Substance abuse is detrimental to the progress of a society. [Interjections.] The systematic

economic inequalities that remains a feature of apartheid's structural violence ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... have had a devastating impact on communities as a whole and family units in particular. Our people from previously disadvantaged areas suffer the effects of very high rates of unemployment, family disruption, domestic violence and alcohol and drug abuse. Having themselves at times been the victims of violence, Madam Speaker, they frequently exhibit the behaviour patterns that resulted from unhealed trauma. But in order to combat these highly complex issues of substance abuse, this caring DA-led Government has grown the network of funded substance abuse treatment centres from a shocking and a mere seven in 2009 to 53 working at 81 sites across this province. [Interjections.] this is achieved under a DA-led Government, Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker, no man, woman or child deserves to be left behind, regardless of their age, their race or ethnicity or whether they are a person with disabilities. This caring DA-led Government remains the only provincial government actively seeking to advance an inclusive environment in which one's individuality is not shunned upon but celebrated and welcome.

Like any person who does not have a disability, those persons with disability deserve every right not to only live a life of dignity but also to live a life that

they value.

In our pursuit of establishing in the Western Cape, where we are indeed better together, we have provided specialised services for persons with disabilities. Again, a shocking 120 people received assistance in 2009 ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: And since the DA took over in 2018 that has dramatically increased to 88 000 people. [Applause.] This goes to show what can be achieved when a government puts its people at the centre of government and a government actually cares. [Interjections.]

In conclusion, Madam Speaker, under – in conclusion, Madam Speaker ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, please. [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Under the greatest Premier our country has ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Under the greatest Premier, and actually, Madam

Speaker, this needs to go onto the record. [Interjections.] Under the greatest Premier that this country has ever seen post-democratisation, the last 10 years of a caring DA Government in this province will be remembered in the history of South Africa as the period South Africa bore witness to its first capable ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell, your time ... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: We, the youth of this province, Madam Premier, we salute you.

The SPEAKER: ... has expired.

Mr D G MITCHELL: I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, order please. [Interjections.] Hon members, may I ... [Interjections.] I will recognise you, hon Nkondlo, when all of this discussion has ended. [Interjections.] Hon Makeleni, I am waiting on you to recognise your member, please. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. To you, the hon Speaker of the House, hon members and our guests in the gallery, †Molweni [Greetings] today I place on record and wish to assert that this House must recognise and respect our existence as members, importantly as opposition parties that

represent constituencies and voters with an equal voice and right in our country's democracy. And any act to constrain that shall be met with full and unwavering resistance.

South Africa is a democratic country, a constitutional democracy and a multiparty state. It is a fact and it will remain so for a long time. What is baffling here in this House ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Hon ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: One of the things I think that comes out also of this debate that one needs to bring across, hon Speaker, is the challenge – I am not sure whether it is a result of illiteracy from the members of the DA and our hon members on the other side – this notion of not understanding the right of any citizen of South Africa to have freedom of movement. As people decide to move in any part of this country, a country of theirs, as part of the population register of this country ... [Interjections.] it is not because they are being done favours by the DA Government, and that must be understood.

And actually urban migration is something that is an international phenomenon and if members of the DA need a class, there is a conference by Stats SA with DSD to teach you, which I think you can attend, on the national migration and urbanisation. Because that is something that most countries are actually experiencing at this point, especially because we have got a youthful population. So I thought to just give you that for free.

Today, as we are about to conclude the term of this Parliament and this Executive, we ought to reflect on the legacy left within these walls. As we bid farewell to each other and hon Premier Zille, what shall we say was the journey?

Yes, let us agree with her. It was a road less travelled, not because it was the best – and as hon members here and many citizens with a particular outlook and profile, we surely say: good riddance. [Interjections.]

No longer as citizens, as countrymen and women with our children shall we be called refugees in the land of our forefathers, just because of the geographical issue of origin. No longer shall we be taken aback as we soldier on in healing our past, we are reminded of our pain, anguish and degradation ... [Interjections.] only to be told such a system that killed and maimed our brothers and sisters at Sharpeville and KwaLanga that that system brought civilisation and should be celebrated.

No longer our indigenous people, the Khoi and the South Africa, will be ignored and our identity as people of tradition and with structure frowned upon ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... by a government that is meant to serve us.
[Interjections.]

Thank you to democracy, as now we are given an opportunity to effect change as we did to the same system of apartheid that practised similar monkey tricks.

DA and your Premier Helen Zille, your time is up. Tell no lies. Claim no easy victories. Judge Mogoeng Mogoeng accepts the rule of law, hon Fritz, and tells for both the Legislature and the Executive that they are ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, please direct your enquiry to the Chair, not directly to the Minister.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Apologies, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... by the principle that they may exercise no power and perform no function beyond that, is that what is conferred on them by the law. In this sense the Constitution entrenches the principle of legality and provides the foundation for the control of public power.

As hon members of this House, we have to check how you, as a Premier and a member of this House, have upheld the rule of law. You have been, on several occasions, booted out of this House due to defiant behaviour against Rules of this House and ruling by the hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

As an hon member and a first person of this province, hon Premier, you have gone on a rampage through your Twitter rants and ravings to undermine the process of social cohesion.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms N D NKONDLO: And building unity and racial tolerance as you choose to use academic theatrics and innuendos in spitting on the painful past of the black section of the society that you are entrusted to lead, and some voted for you.

As an hon member and the Leader of Government in this province you have undermined the Western Cape Provincial Constitution by ignoring Section 17, Section 71 and Secion 78 provisions which make it compulsory for the appointment of Commissioners of Children and the Environment. Only through pressure, not by adherence to the rule of law, you succumbed and currently are introducing a Bill in this regard. And all this came at a cost of 50 children's lives during the first half of both 2017 and 2018.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Your claim to fame is growing the economy of this province. Can you demonstrate the equitable distribution of this economic benefit? Who is it grown for and who are its players? How far have you

gone in correcting the inequalities of the past, especially in a province where the colonialism project was launched?

The Western Cape [Inaudible.] shows that inequalities in income distribution within the Cape Metro remain the highest in the province. [Interjection.] Inequalities in income distribution are generally high in almost all the regions, with a Gini coefficient closer to 1 than zero in the past 10 years.

So tell us, who has this economy been grown for?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Under the ANC Government between 2004 and 2009 the Western Cape economy grew faster than the period of the DA governance, that is a fact. Under the ANC the Western Cape grew by an annualised 5.5%, but under the DA it has been 1.9%. [Interjections.]

In a 2018 Mercer's Quality of Living Study, it ranked Durban the best city and the highest locally and internationally ranking number 87 and Cape Town number 94. You have Mayor Mashaba to ask why. [Interjections.]

Gauteng created the largest number of jobs in 2018, with 172 000 new jobs; KZN was second with 135 000 new jobs ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... followed by Limpopo with 59 000 and then Western Cape with 29 000 new jobs. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The number of people employed in Gauteng, the number of people employed doubled from 2.6 million in 1996 to 5.163 million in 2018. And yet you boast ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... that 8 000 jobs were created over the same period. And you want to compare yourself ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, kindly take your seat. There is too much noise. Please hon members, I am addressing you. [Interjections.] You are drowning out the speaker. I cannot hear the hon member. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: And you want to compare yourself with Gauteng. I am sure it is a product of maths lit. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape economy shed jobs in the agricultural sector due to drought and the poor management and planning of the Cabinet. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: That led to the scarecrow manufactured by you and your party, Day Zero. Its effects on the hospitality industry, as confirmed by Wesgro [Inaudible.], that January 2018 income for 18 of the city's top hotels was 10% to 15 lower than it was in 2017. Even Minister Alan Winde was dressed unparliamentarily here in this House with a Day Zero T-shirt and was quoted saying, "the Day Zero message was bad for business".

An HON MEMBER: So what!?

Ms N D NKONDLO: And it need to be [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: But what did you do [Interjections.] but what did you and your DA Government do? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Minister Fritz. [Interjections.]
Order please. Hon Nkondlo, kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.]
Members, there is a member on the floor. Is it a point of order, hon Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Yes [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Hon Speaker, is it parliamentary for the MEC who is disturbing this House the whole day to make signs like this? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We will look at Hansard!

The SPEAKER: Hon Gillion, now [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You are not the Speaker! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I cannot look at Hansard, but I can ask the Minister to desist as with your finger, desist from doing the action Minister. [Interjections.] Please. Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: But Speaker, I had raised when the Deputy Speaker was in the Chair [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: ...regarding Minister Fritz's behaviour. The whole day, Speaker, the whole day [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Shall I send him to the naughty corner?

Ms M N GILLION: It is unacceptable for an MEC to behave like this.

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, I am cautioning you as per a point of order, which is sustained. Please compose yourself. Hon member Nkondlo, you may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. But what did you do in your DA Government? You transferred this crisis to the taxpayer and introduced exorbitant tariffs that the ANC has managed to expose your Darun City with cases of litigants from rate payers that were not willing to be used as cash fodder for Day Zero. This was worsened with the imposed water meter devices, introduced in the Cape Flats townships which are mainly faulty and led to families going for more than three days without water – a basic right of SA citizens, guaranteed in the Constitution, that you swore to uphold and protect.

We ask you to provide us - as we have been painfully asking over the past 10 years - with a detailed account of these jobs, so as to take comfort that indeed the citizens' promised jobs are in fact matched and employed as reported. All I hear is job opportunities. What is your response to Wynand Viviers, 64-year old, Angora goat and sheep farmer, living about 30km outside of Beaufort West and has been running the family business since 1976. He has this to say, "There is no good reason ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon Nkondlo, kindly take your seat please. Minister Fritz, are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Is the very hon member prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please, Minister Fritz. [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo, will you take a question? [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: No, sorry.

The SPEAKER: The member is not prepared to take a question. Thank you, Minister. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You disrupt the speaker's list.

Ms N D NKONDLO: He has this to say, "There is no good reason to bring your children to the family business". He says this as a matter of fact and most farmers in that region are opting to sell. Where is the lauded business rescue plan of the then Minister Winde, and now acting Premier and Premier candidate? Should Western Cape voters pull wool over their eyes of your performance and put their faith and generational legacy in your hands?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms N D NKONDLO: With Minister Bredell, your drought management interventions have evaporated into thin air, as Laingsburg and Beaufort West are hard hit by effects of drought, whereas the other regions are taking a

moment's sigh of relief because of the rains. The Gift of the Givers, with the Geoscience Council, had to come to the rescue with donating additional boreholes as water shedding becomes the order of the day and some boreholes are drying up.

What has been your record, hon Premier, and your DA Party, in the eyes of SMME's and fulfilling your constitutional obligation and noble fight you pull for all who care to listen to your association with Steve Biko, a man who understood and fought till his last breath, about a black man's right to freedom including economic freedom.

You have built an economy running a budget with a total expenditure of R62,7 billion as per the PERO of 2018. You tell the public that you spent about R80 billion since 2009 in public infrastructure, excluding funds from private sector. Tell us, how much and what percentage of this went to Grade 1 to 4 and Grade 5 to 9, CIDB graded contractors, with the former as both sub-contractors and main contractors in those jobs? How much and what is the number of these contractors, how many of them are from local areas, and the regional economies where the actual works had been done?

From the provincial budget spent, a group of black and non-Halal is sitting in this gallery, led by Ms Funa Kampeta, Ms Xolani Tjando and Nolo Vuyondjoko. Their complaint has been a catering specification from about four of your departments, since around 2016 to date, led by one of the noisy Ministers in the House, Minister Fritz [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, your time has expired. You may finish your sentence.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We have asked [Interjections.] on the Halal certificate, what we are asking is for you, Premier, to answer, because this matter was brought to your attention. As I conclude, thank you hon Speaker [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: The road travelled made the rich richer and the poor even poorer and we shall meet in 2019.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause] [Interjections.] Is it a point of order hon Mnqasela? [Interjections.] Quiet – order please members.

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon Speaker [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr M MNQASELA: Your ruling on the guests participating in that corner, Honourble Speaker †ndifuna ukuthi mababukele mabangaqhwi kula kona akukho potsoyini apha. [I just want to say they can watch and stop clapping their hands. This is not some kind of disco or club.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you, hon Mnqasela. [Interjections.] If I may, I need to just alert the guests that you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings. That includes no clapping, interjections, heckling. So please be guided by the Rules as they are printed on the wall and on the reverse of your tickets. Failure to honour that request will lead me with an option to ask you to leave the gallery. I now see the hon Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Premier, Madam Speaker, members of the House, in this House, guests in the gallery, specifically the youth from Mitchells Plain. It is good to see you again. Good afternoon.

Madam Speaker, I want first to commend the Premier for her excellent SOPA on Friday [Interjections.] The way she showcased the change we have brought this province, ten years ago when the DA came into power. †Siyakubulela ngesikhokhelo osinike sona. [We really appreciate the leadership you have given us.]

They may throw dirt on your character, but one thing is for sure, deep down they know you have no match in the history of post-democratic South Africa to manage the best province in terms of service delivery [Interjections.]. At a personal level, I just want to thank you for giving me the opportunity and probably because a member of the Opposition did mention about a black African woman who has to leave the Western Cape, I want to indicate the opportunity specifically, that now I am able to say I am the first ever woman

– I am the first ever black African - to have ever been the Minister of Health in the Western Cape. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Not only in the DA, not ever in the ANC, not ever in the National Party. Not ever in any other parties. [Interjections.] But it wasn't [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.] May we get some order please? Thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: As I was responding to member Magaxa about that and it is not about my colour, it is about fit for the purpose. [Interjections.] There was a ... [Interjections.] Because member Magaxa mentioned something about the lady was a chartered accountant. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Tyatyam, you cannot drown out the speaker, please. Collectively all the noise is drowning out the speaker. May I request please, you can engage the Minister after the session with the questions you have. You may proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes. Thank you. Thank you also for prioritising Health in your Budget allocation. The Western Cape allocates a

bigger percentage of the provincial budget to Health, compared to other provinces. [Interjections.] It is, it is! [Interjections.] It is!

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Western Cape has ten years of good governance. [Interjections.] In a capable state, delivering services efficiently, honestly and cost effectively. We have worked hard under pressurised circumstances to keep our promises of delivering quality health for all [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, you are – sorry, Minister Mbombo please take your seat. Hon Lekker, you are speaking so loudly that I cannot hear the Minister on the floor. May I request that you keep your tone down whilst we have a speaker? You are allowed to talk but not so loudly that you drown out the speaker. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Work hard under pressurised circumstances to keep our promises of delivering quality health for all and to make sure that every rand goes to quality service delivery, especially for those who most need it. I need also to emphasize that we do not have clinics or any health facilities and provide any kind of facilities in the rich areas.

We have no clinics in Bishopscourt, we have no clinics in Clifton [Interjections.] We have no clinics in Bantry Bay. [Interjections.] 75% of the

total population of the Western Cape are being serviced by us. I must indicate that the National Health System is experiencing serious service pressures [Interjections.]

The effects of a depressed fiscal climate and a high bearing of communicable disease, continue to be felt throughout service platforms. Patients experience longer waiting times due to the demand for health services that has been on the rise over the past few years. Now, with the load shedding that is happening, all health problems that are coming from the drought, it will impact more on health, especially when there will be a time that there will be a total shutdown of the electricity.

Health departments across the country are on the verge of collapse and when we look at what we have offered citizens in this province over the past decades, we have realised that Western Cape citizens enjoy the best care, compared to the level of services elsewhere in the country [Interjections.] Yes! There is still more to do. Yes, there is still more to do. Whilst we have done a lot, yes, [Interjections.] Western Cape faces challenges [Interjections.] Yes, we err and find ourselves on the wrong sides of patients' expectations, but what matters is that each incidence becomes a lesson ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...for further improvement. We apologize and

do not dismiss where we went wrong. Western Cape is a victim of its own success. People do come in and migrate, in search of seeking jobs [Interjections.] better schooling, better education and better health care services, just like me, who are coming from the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.]

Some come purely to access essential services that are lacking in their provinces and you must know that the most people who migrate, not only the Western Cape, also to Gauteng, are where we find that there is a higher unemployment. Yes, we have major challenges on waiting times, but eventually people would be seen and get the best treatment. Yes, some patients may take longer to be admitted, because of the high demands, but compared to other provinces, our waiting times are as a result of service demands! [Interjections.] It is because of the service demands, because ANC fail people from other provinces. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Davids [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We have seen the exodus of doctors and nurses leaving those provinces in search for better working conditions in the Western Cape, as they cannot take it anymore because of those conditions, where you will find that there is no equipment; there is mismanagement of funds; there is looting; there is corruption.

I can name an example. Free State. The AG found that it is the worst performing department – the Health Department. KZN Oncology crisis and

the [Inaudible.] crisis. Eastern Cape Province's medical malpractice stand at R23 billion. Actually their liability is not on their budget [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: GP [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] Northern Cape [Interjections.] Northern Cape infrastructure is appalling. Some buildings have still been unfinished for the past five years [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Service providers do not get paid. [Interjections.] Limpopo is sitting with R2 billion needed to solve their health crisis. [Interjections.] In the North West, we cannot tell about the North West because they are under administration. Mpumalanga has got R1 billion debt [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is too much noise! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We do have the good story to tell. In the Western Cape, people live longer than in any other provinces. Do you know why? [Interjections.] We invest in the lives of the people. [Interjections.] This essentially speaks to the quality of care and access to health care in the Western Cape. A healthy population is an economic investment. Sick people cannot go to work and thus impact on their income. We create a healthy

population. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, we not only live longer, but also here in the Western Cape, 91,5% of the citizens have access to health services within 30 minutes of their residence. In the rural farm areas, we provide transport – you should see how many buses, our buses, pick up people from 230 points across the province. [Interjections.] The system is unique to the whole Western Cape and it is only in the Western Cape! We are the only province to have digitised patient records in public health care.

This is to improve the waiting times, access and coverage. The ANC has a 5-year in-house strategy that has expired in 2017 and no implementation. So that is why almost all the MEC's in the 8 provinces come here, and we teach them how to do it. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, the President Cyril Ramaphosa, promised us the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...world when he announced the President's stimulus package intended to strengthen the human resource. With this package Western Cape will receive an additional 204 interns ... [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekker!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...and a total of 125 other posts. We want to thank the President, for prioritising, because we have been talking about the critical posts, but to date we only got money for 204 medical interns, 125 posts – dololo – there is no money! This is exactly what caused that Gauteng and the Northern Cape last month did not have salaries, but I also must add that that money is the money that is an under-expenditure from the NHI that they have been preaching about.

So, whilst we might be thanking the President, there was no money anyway. In the Western Cape our staff comes first. It is unacceptable that two decades post-democracy, young doctors still work 30 hour-shifts without a break. It is only in the Western Cape where we reduced those hours. We reduced those hours and then we even made a suggestion to the national interns of how they can legislate this. We gave them guidance. [Interjections.]

Lastly, Madam Speaker, we heard the National Minister talking about the NHI in the SONA debate. We need to understand that the Minister has been there for over 10 years as the National Health Minister. With the NHI that was approved through the ANC Congress in 2003, the question is, why do they now want to implement the NHI, when they all along could not? Why? It is because they want to loot. [Interjections.] It is because they want to loot. They want to centralise. If 8 MEC's politicians had messed up, how can you put all the health of all the 9 provinces under one politician? They want to loot. How do we entrust ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...for starters [Interjections.] If a manager ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo, kindly take your seat. Both sides of the bench, Minister Meyer, I am sorry that I need to call you out, for fuelling this discussion. Similarly on this side of the bench. It is disrespectful to engage in a debate whilst there is a speaker on the floor. Compose yourselves please. You may proceed, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: If NHI is about fixing the Health Services, explain why the Health Sector budget has been reduced tremendously? R7 billion for the past three years, when they have reduced the Health Sector. So, explain again, how come this money that the President has promised us, does not come from the National Treasury budget, but they are using the money meant for something else.

Explain how come that the National Government has managed to save and bail out the SOE's, the SAA and the SABC – have you ever heard at any time that they say they will bail out Health Services? Yet, the National Minister keeps on saying that the Health Services are under stress. So, it must not be about their prioritising health. Nobody has been prioritising health.

So, Madam Speaker, in the Western Cape we are well on our way to universal

health coverage. We are not waiting for them, [Inaudible.] NHI, but we are making the point that we are piloting, and we are not leaving anyone behind. Tomorrow we are meeting with those MEC's of the province of the Eastern Cape, the province of the KZN, and we will be assisting them. Watch this space! We are already working with those provinces. To conclude, I want to thank the head of Health and the entire team for their hard work and dedication to this Government.

The SPEAKER: Please finish up, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Clean and accountable governance reinforces public trust in the way that we manage the public purse and to all the 32 000 employees who are part of my team, I want to thank them for their bravery in dealing with the pressures we deal with on a daily basis [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: At least they know that when they go low, we go up. We are professionals, first and foremost. We will always be like that. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I now recognise the hon member, Mireille Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. To quote James Clarke

[Interjections.]

“A politician thinks of the next election. A statesman thinks of the next generation.”

An HON MEMBER: Hear! Hear!

Ms M M WENGER: Friday's SOPA and reflection on 10 years of good governance showed ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: ...that thoughtful leadership and statesmanship by the Premier and this Cabinet has left this province a better place for the next generation.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-Hear!

Ms M M WENGER: There is still a lot of work to do and there are too many people out of work, and services are under strain and lives can and must be improved, but ours is a belief in the future. In a better future, in a better South Africa for all. The Democratic Alliance is working and fighting for the next generation and not just the next election. I wonder if the same could be said about our colleagues on the opposing benches [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You cannot!

Ms M M WENGER: The ANC's real State of the Province campaign could certainly said to be thinking of the next election, but failed to think of the next generation. They were politicking on what is wrong and not what could be right. Politicking on attack and not on solutions. The ANC would do well to look internally at the departments that are run by the National ANC Government.

The Criminal Justice System is a National Government running system. The conviction rate for gang-related murders and attempted murders is 3%. If the ANC genuinely cared about delivering justice, they would tackle this head-on. If the ANC were really serious about crime, they would join us in fighting for police resources.

During the ANC's tenure as government of the Western Cape the National Government gave the SAPS in our province on average 1 260 new police recruits each year. By contrast over the last 10 years that the DA has been in government, the National Government has only given the SAPS an average of 570 new police recruits each year. That is 40% less than what the ANC gave itself. There is no way that the ANC can claim to care about crime or safety.

If anything, they have a lot of explaining to do to the people of this province. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier delivered her State of the Province Address, which showcased 10 years of good governance. The ANC showcased a

flopped protest, where there were more police present than protestors.

Their real State of the Province did not table an alternative. Not a single quality proposal [Interjections.] much like today. A lot of criticism from the Opposition benches, but no credible alternative. No thinking on how to tackle these very real problems. No bold or better ANC plan to make lives better [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We do not have to!

Ms M M WENGER: Today, if ever, is a good opportunity to talk about the real State of the Province because yes, there are many things that do not work in the Western Cape. There are many things that hinder development and a better life. So, let us be honest. There is no bold or better ANC plan. How could there be, if almost exclusively those things that are a barrier to progress are run by the ANC?

The ANC cannot keep the lights on, and the price estimated at R12 billion, is paid by ordinary South Africans. [Interjections.] Increased electricity costs exacerbated by rolling blackouts. Load shedding is killing jobs and making life harder for South Africans. Eskom has been the ANC's [Inaudible.] task. Task team after task team, it has not been able to fix Eskom because it lacks a coherent plan that its alliance partners can back and it lacks the political will to implement.

Power production is a national power and similar to bulk electricity supply, bulk water supply is also in short supply. The national Department of Water is dysfunctional as a result of staff shortages and corruption and the real impact was an almost catastrophe in Cape Town last year. Again, the ANC lacks a coherent plan and the political will to tackle corruption. These very real challenges directly impact on us. They directly and negatively affect the residents of the Western Cape, and what does not work in the Western Cape, is run by the ANC.

Let us also talk rail, Mr Deputy Speaker. The failure of the nationally run rail service is vast. Metrorail in the Western Cape has not had functional CCTV cameras since 2015. [Interjections.] Nearly 50% of Metrorail policing vehicles are not working and Metrorail in the Western Cape does not have enough trains to function at minimum capacity, but the ANC is silent on this.

There was no social media graphic or poster on the ailing and failing rail and the challenges that commuters face. Commuters who do not have a reliable safe or clean train service to get to and from work, because what does not work in the Western Cape is run by the ANC. But instead of facing these challenges to fix them, the Opposition has instead resorted to gimmicks and gutter politics.

Last week the ANC ran a campaign ahead of the SOPA which laid bare the ANC's cognitive dissonance. The ANC is suffering an acute case of double think - of simultaneously believing two contradictory things. So, on the one

hand the ANC places responsibility for safety at the DA's door, to the extent that they put out the most distasteful social media banner, depicting a dead body lying in a road, with a person holding a gun over them and basically blaming the DA for murdering the Western Cape.

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Ms M M WENGER: On the other hand they ardently affirm that the President and the Police Minister are responsible for safety in the Western Cape, because they produce slogans for this very same march which read "Thank you President. Anti-gang Unit brings safety". They also claim credit for the unit which the DA has been calling for for 10 years! [Interjections.] Perhaps if they had listened to the DA a decade ago, there would be no need for such sinister social media adverts and less people in this province would've died.

Perhaps Mr Deputy Speaker, we should try broker a deal with the ANC. [Interjections.] If they stop telling lies about us we will stop telling the truth about them. Point scoring and inconsistency, like the ANC on crime, will not earn its respect.

So, today's debate should therefore not be about a performance but rather the action that follows, yesterday, today and tomorrow and that should be the real test of our resolve. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] We are taking note of the different comments of the various political parties. One that I would like to respond to but not waste time on, is the ACDP and †ek wil graag weer in Afrikaans vir hom sê, waar hy in sy kantoor sit en luister na die toespraak, moet ek vir hom sê hy moet Kolossense 3 vers 9 lees, as ‘n Godsmen en dat hy nie moet lieg vir die mense in die Huis nie. [Applous.] [I want to say to him in Afrikaans, where he is sitting in his office listening to the speech, I must say to him he should read Colossians 3 verse 9, as a man of God, and that he should not lie to the people in the House. [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, agb Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

†Die AJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Joseph, ek hoor die sentiment van wat jy sê, maar die woord “lieg” teenoor ‘n ander lid is nie parlementêr nie. Jy kan dit versag deur te sê “onwaarheid”.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Joseph, I hear the the sentiment of what you are saying, but the word “lie” directed at another member is unparliamentary. You can soften it by saying ‘untruth’.]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Ek sê hy moet Kolossense 3 vers 9 lees. *Unless*, as u sê hier is nie Christelike waardes in die Huis nie [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B D JOSEPH: I say he should read Colossians 3 verse 9. Unless, you say there are no Christian principles here in this House [Interjection.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Nee! [Applous.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! [Applause.]]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Dankie.

[Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Joseph – Orde! [Tussenwerpsels.] Maak Kolossense ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Joseph – Order! [Interjections.] Does Colossians ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Hy het geluister, hy ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr B D JOSEPH: He has listened, he ... [Interjections.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Hy het geluister. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr B D JOSEPH: He listened. [Interjections.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde. Agb Joseph, verwys Kolossense na die woord “lieg”?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Joseph, does Colossians refer to the word “lieg” (lie)?]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Ja.

[Mr B D JOSEPH: Yes.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: In orde, dan kan u aangaan.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In order, then you can proceed.]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Om dit direk aan te haal. Dit sê “Lieg niet vir mekaar nie”. [Applous.]

[Mr B D JOSEPH: To quote it directly. It says “*Lieg niet vir mekaar nie*”. (Do not lie to each other). [Applause.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Goed. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good. [Interjections.]]

An HON MEMBER: Can you repeat? Repeat!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Deputy Speaker, I have listened to the speech of the Premier on Friday [Interjections.] it is quite clear that the Premier [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is great!

Mr B D JOSEPH: That the Premier, for the past nine, ten years [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She is the best in the country!

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...has wasted the time to get this the drafters of the speech to raise these issues. The same issues over and over again. However, I would like to raise five areas of concern that we have, that have not come out clearly within the speech of the Premier. The one is crime. The second is education. The third is health. The fourth is jobs and unemployment and the fifth is land and minerals and housing, water and sanitation. [Interjections.]

Now starting with crime [Interjections.], I have not heard the Premier to be clear about crime. She constantly referred to the annual policing plan of the police. The safety plan of the police, but there is nothing where she speaks to it [Interjections.]. I would have loved to hear the issue about the national crime prevention, about the alcohol abuse and how the other departments will get involved ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You were not there.

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...in the provincial crime prevention. Whether I was there or not, it has not come out in the speech of the Premier and I was here, if you have not noticed.

An HON MEMBER: You were here. [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: In terms of priority crimes the Western Cape specifically have four areas of priority crimes. The one is murder, rape, shebeens, alcohol abuse and drugs and investigation and the lack thereof. Now these are the areas that the Western Cape is crying about, especially murder in the Nyanga policing precinct, Philippi policing precincts and those areas.

The concern of the shebeens, the late night opening of shebeens and no proper control although the previous MEC of Community Safety was walking around with the Neighbourhood Watch, but what was he doing? Did he really address crime within these areas where they could have addressed the issue of rape and the only way that you could address the issue of rape is to ensure that we address it in such a way that you look at the lighting in these different areas and what to do about it. Now, the specific areas of alcohol abuse and drugs, nothing have come out in the Premier's speech. She was not clean.

An HON MEMBER: And you were here?

Mr B D JOSEPH: I was here, [Inaudible.] [Laughter.] Nothing has come out clear from the Premier. We need to be clear. The people of the Western Cape are listening to those areas of concern, especially hearing someone is being promoted here as a very good leader - I do not know what she is leading. In terms of education ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Ja, she has said nothing. She has not even spoken [Interjections.] and she will get in trouble for tweeting and not listening because she will send the wrong tweets here. Especially at night. [Interjections.]

So, in terms of education, we raise concerns in the Western Cape about alarm bells about Matric passes over the past years and how they have improved, but what about the kids that fall through the cracks? Those that have started in Grade 1 or Sub A, whatever you call it, and then the percentage of them has come down drastically. [Interjections.] How do we address these types of issues if we want to address poverty in the Western Cape? [Interjection.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid, orde. Jou tyd is verstreke, maar jou laaste sin.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, order. Your time has expired, but your last sentence.]

†Mnr B D JOSEPH: Here. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Gelag.] [Lord. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]] The area of land and minerals, let me jump into the land and minerals [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr B D JOSEPH: It is quite clear that we have a lot of challenges within the Western Cape, that we have a lot of minerals that we can exhaust to pay for these types of education. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member, your time has expired. [Interjections.] I see the [Interjections.] Order! Hon Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Minister Gordhan said, “We, the ANC, owe South Africa an explanation on how Eskom failed.” Now let me tell you, Eskom announced in 2007 [Interjections.] that it was to build two mega-coal powered plants. Medupi, at the cost of R70 billion and Kusile at the cost of R80 billion.

To date these two power stations have cost taxpayers amounts of R208 billion and R239 billion respectively. Not only are they not finished yet. The bits that are done are hardly working at all. [Interjections.] If the two plants delivered on schedule, we would’ve had 9 600 Mega Watts extra electricity – in other words, no load shedding! Coal plants were in the beginning a bad idea to start off with. If we had a government with any vision it would have been a green energy project.

†Maar agb Adjunkspeaker, ek is geskok as ‘n Christen en ‘n persoon wat glo in Jesus Christus in die ACDP se uitlatings vandag, om eerlik te wees met u. [But hon Deputy Speaker, I was shocked as a Christian and a person who

believes in Jesus Christ in the ACDP's comments today, to be honest with you.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja vertel hulle! Unconstitutional.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, tell them! Unconstitutional.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN PLAASLIKE BEPLANNING: En die ACDP moet vir my verduidelik waar regeer hulle in die land, want hy praat soos iemand wat regering verstaan, maar ek moet kategoriees dit regstel want dit is op rekord nou deur die ACDP geplaas – daar is geen DA-raad wat teen enige geloof sal diskrimineer nie. [Applous.]

Agb Adjunkspeaker, die DA sit nie mense in bokse nie, nie op ras nie, nie op geslag nie, en nie op geloof nie en die agb Christians moet dit as 'n populêre standpunt gebruik en dan uithardloop voor hy nog iewers gaan sit het om te luister nie.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, as 'n Christen is ek baie trots om deel te wees van die DA se program, "Let's build one nation with one future for all." [Applous.] Ek sal baie graag vir die ANC en vir die President [Tussenwerpsels.] Cyril Ramaphosa wil vra, hoe dink hulle gaan groot besighede of industrieë belê in hierdie land sodat ons geleentheid [Tussenwerpsels.] kan skep vir ons jeug, terwyl daar geen krag is nie? Agb Adjunkspeaker, daar is geen sin in vir enige besighheidsman om dan hier te belê nie.

Die Wes-Kaapse regering, onder die leiding van die agb Helen Zille, het besef dat die ANC die regering op nasionale vlak pateties bestuur het en daarom het ons oor die afgelope 5 jaar baie hard gewerk om die provinsie energie-onafhanklik te maak sover moontlik en binne ons beperkte magte.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, vandag kan ons die resultaat sien, want verlede jaar was so plus minus 75% van alle werksgeleenthede wat geskep is in Suid-Afrika, geskep in die Wes-Kaap. As die ander provinsies maar na die tafel toe sou kom. Hierdie werk is geskep te midde van die ergste droogte in ons geskiedenis.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, dit gaan als oor bestuur, kundigheid en 'n waardestelsel in Suid-Afrika. Die Wes-Kaap is steeds in die midde van 'n droogte. Sekere dele van ons provinsie het genadiglik deur die droogte getrek maar daar is ander dele soos die Karoo waar dit nog baie swaar gaan.

Verlede jaar was die stad Kaapstad se watervlakke besig om heeltemal leeg te loop. Die stad se daaglikse gebruik voor die droogte was meer as 1 miljard liter water per dag. Daar is verskeie veldtogte geloods, onder meer die Dag Zero-konsep en persoonlik dink ek dit was 'n reuse sukses. Dit het mense laat besef dinge is ernstig. Dit het mense laat besef dat die bron is onder druk en mense het na die tafel gekom en ons het besparings bereik waar ons die waterverbruik met die helfte verminder het, na 500 miljoen liter water per dag.

Ek wil baie dankie sê aan al ons inwoners in die Wes-Kaap vir hul uitsonderlike poging om hande te vat met die regering. Dit is 'n ongelooflike prestasie wat behaal is deur goeie kundige bestuur en deur samewerking van die gemeenskap. Hierdie soort inisiatiewe was noodsaaklik omdat die ANC nasionale regering vir dekades nie belê het in nuwe watervoorsiening en infrastruktuur in die Wes-Kaap nie, wat natuurlik 'n nasionale funksie is, agb Adjunkspeaker.

Projekte soos die Clanwilliam-damwal was vir jare vertraag. Uiteindelik, heeltemal gestop deur die voormalige Minister Mokoyana en as die ANC nog 'n ondersoek wil doen kan hulle my Departement van Waterwese ook gaan ondersoek [Tussenwerpsels.] Kom ek vertel u van die Karoo-dorpie waar die water uitgeput is. Beaufort-Wes,- Kannaland- en Laingsburg- munisipaliteite. Die rede hoekom hierdie dorpe sukkel is weens [Tussenwerpsels.] die Opposisiepartye se onvermoë en swak beplanning.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, hierdie munisipaliteite bestee al vir dekades tussen niks en absoluut minimum aan infrastruktuurprojekte in hulle gemeenskappe. Die geld gaan skynbaar grootliks aan salarisse. Gaan kyk na hoe die Opposisie-beheerde rade aanstellings manipuleer om hulself te bevoordeel ten koste van die inwoners. Dit is totaal onaanvaarbaar.

Vandag sit Kannaland, Beaufort-Wes en Laingsburg met enorme waterprobleme, met een gesamentlike faktor – ANC-beheer.

[Tussenwerpsels.] Nou dat daar ‘n droogte is, is dit eenvoudig ‘n nagmerrie. Plekke soos Calitzdorp byvoorbeeld, het die munisipaliteit niks onderhoud gedoen aan die suiweringswerke nie en die gevolg was dat ons moes inspring om die aanleg skoon te maak en reg te maak om te verseker dat die dorp water het. Ek moet vir Oudtshoorn-munisipaliteit bedank, wat oor Desember sy ingenieurs en sy kundigheid gebruik het om daardie munisipaliteite by te staan.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And the ACDP must explain to me where they govern in the country, because he speaks like someone who understands government, but I must categorically set that straight because it has now been put on record by the ACDP – there is no DA council that will discriminate against any religion. [Applause.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA does not put people in boxes, not according to race, not according to gender, and not according to religion, and the hon Christians must use it as a popular standpoint and then run out before he has gone to sit somewhere and listen.

Hon Deputy Spaker, as a Christian I am proud to be part of the DA’s programme, “Let’s build one nation with one future for all.” [Applause.] I would very much like to ask the ANC and the President [Interjections.] Cyril

Ramaphosa, how do they think large businesses or industries will invest in this country so that we can create opportunities [Interjections.] for our youth, while there is no power? Hon Deputy Speaker, it does not make any sense for any businessman to then invest.

The Western Cape Government, under the leadership of the hon Helen Zille, realised that the ANC had governed pathetically at national level and therefore we had worked very hard over the past 5 years to render the province energy independent as far as possible and within our limited powers.

Hon Deputy Speaker, today we can see the result, because last year plus minus 75% of all job opportunities that had been created in South Africa, were created in the Western Cape. If only the other provinces would come to the table. This work was created in the midst of the worst drought in our history.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is all about management, expertise and a system of values in South Africa. The Western Cape is still in the middle of a drought. Certain parts of our province have mercifully pulled through the drought, but there are other parts like the Karoo where it is still a heavy struggle.

Last year the City of Cape Town's water levels were in the process of running completely empty. The City's daily consumption before the drought was more than 1 billion litres of water. Various campaigns were launched,

amongst others the Day Zero concept and personally I think it was a huge success. It made people realise that the situation was serious. It made people realise that the source is under pressure and people came to the table and we reached savings where we had reduced the consumption by half to 500 million litres of water per day.

I want to thank all the citizens in the Western Cape for their exceptional effort to take hands with the Government. It is an unbelievable achievement that was realised through good expert management and the cooperation of the community. These kind of initiatives were essential as the ANC Government has for decades failed to invest in new water supply and infrastructure in the Western Cape, which of course is a national function, hon Deputy Speaker.

Projects like the Clanwilliam Dam wall were delayed for years. Finally, totally halted by the former Minister Mokoyana and if the ANC wants to conduct another inquiry they can also investigate my Department of Water Affairs [Interjections.]. Let me tell you about the Karoo towns running out of water. Beaufort-West, Kannaland and Laingsburg Municipalities. The reason why these towns are struggling is because of [Interjections.] the Opposition parties' incompetence and poor planning.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these municipalities have for decades spent between nothing and the absolute minimum on infrastructure projects in their communities. The money apparently mainly goes into salaries. Go and look at how these Opposition controlled councils manipulate appointments to their

own advantage at the cost of the citizens. It is totally unacceptable.

Today, Kannaland, Beaufort-Wes en Laingsburg are stuck with enormous water problems, with one common factor – ANC control. [Interjections.] Now that there is a drought, it is simply a nightmare. In places like Calitzdorp, for example, the Municipality had done no maintenance on the purifying works and the result was that we had to intervene to clean out and repair the plant to ensure that the town has water. I have to thank the Oudtshoorn Municipality, who has used its engineers and its expertise over December to support those municipalities.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am raising these examples to drive awareness about the necessity for good management and good governance in every sphere of government. We do not have a hope if we do not have good, ethical, incorruptible leaders making informed decisions for the benefits of their communities in every sphere of government.

Taxpayers' money is being looted on a large scale by the ANC, its cronies and deployed cadres. It is simply a fact, it is no longer an opinion. There is such a long list – I will mention one or two examples. Khusasa. A company by the way, where President Cyril Ramaphosa's son was allegedly given large [Interjections.] contracts, but do not forget about the Gupta family who owned, it seems like [Interjections.] the entire ANC NEC. Some believe the impact of the Gupta's on state capture [Interjections.] could have been as much as a R100 billion [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Can you imagine the impact that that money would have had [Interjections.] on our schools and our hospitals? Hon Deputy Speaker, let me explain to the ANC what R100 billion can buy us [Interjections.].

With R100 billion we can build 625 000 houses. We can wipe out the backlog in housing in two provinces if the ANC has not looted the State! [Interjections.] We could have built 80 hospitals, 80 schools, hon Deputy Speaker. That is just the beginning because if you look at where I start off with, the ANC wasted plus/minus R300 billion on the electricity generated capacity in this country. [Interjections.] Just add up, and you will see that the ANC does not care about the poor people. The ANC wants to keep the people in poverty! [Interjections.]

How much damage has been caused, hon Deputy Speaker? How many opportunities have been lost? Too many to count, I would imagine. †Agb Adjunkspeaker, terwyl daar groot vrae hang oor die koppe van provinsies soos die Vrystaat en Gauteng, kan ons met trots hier staan en sê ons provinsie en die dorpe onder ons toesig lewer jaarliks die beste ouditresultate.

Die belastingbetaler weet, die DA-regering [Tussenwerpsels.] staan vir goeie bestuur en daadwerklike aksie en verantwoordelikheid. [Tussenwerpsels.] In

die 2017 finansiële jaar, van die 257 munisipaliteite - net 33 skoon oudits. Van daardie 33 was 21 skoon oudits in die Wes-Kaap. Agb Adjunkspeaker, 'n rekord om op trots te wees. Waar die DA regeer is daar 'n impak.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, while there are big questions hanging over the heads of provinces like the Free State and Gauteng, we can proudly say our province and the towns under our supervision annually achieve the best audit results.

The taxpayer knows the DA Government [Interjections.] stands for good governance and actual performance and responsibility. [Interjections.] In the 2017 financial year, of the 257 municipalities – only 33 clean audits. Of those 33, 21 clean audits in the Western Cape. Hon Deputy Speaker, a record to be proud of. Where the DA governs, there is an impact.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, we are also proud of our track record we have in turning around troubled municipalities. For years Oudtshoorn was another troubled municipality until the 2016 elections. The town had been so badly managed by the ANC coalition [Interjections.] that even the Congo Caves, one of the few tourist attractions, had been stripped of its assets and was in danger of being closed down. [Interjections.]

In Oudtshoorn, when the Province finally saw the books, about 400 people

extra were found on the payroll. The negative impact it had, had been on service delivery and the Capex investment. [Interjections.] Within two years of the provincial intervention the situation has turned around. Today the Cango Caves is back to its former glory and tourism numbers had seen record levels. There are jobs being created and we can even rely on Oudtshoorn to ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... assist the smaller municipalities with technical services. It was Oudtshoorn's engineers who helped Kannaland with its challenges during December. I am also proud to announce the decision to go ahead with the Blossoms Water Project. A project, costing R92 million to ensure a secondary water source for Oudtshoorn. [Interjections.] It will make an enormous difference to the town. The Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning can stand up and look back with pride at the last five years' accomplishments.

According to STATS South Africa, the Western Cape is the province where poor households benefit the most from policies of three basic services: electricity, sewerage and sanitation [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Nonsense!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, the difference between the Western Cape and other provinces is day and night. Consider the delivery of three basic services, 76.4% in the Western Cape. The second ranked province, the Eastern Cape, 41%. The other provinces are even worse off, but I think this is part of your legacy, Premier. I repeat, an independent study have found that when it comes to delivery of three basic services to the poorest of the poor, no-one does it better than the Western Cape. I thank you, Premier. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, another highlight [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Another highlight from my Department is the regional socio-economic programme known as RCEP. This is another innovative programme whereby we are making better living spaces in all our communities and where we aim to redress apartheid spatial legacies through better integrated development. Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. †Minister, jou tyd is verstreke. Jou laaste sin. [Minister, your time has expired. Your last sentence.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There are so many to mention. 1.3 million people being touched by our [Inaudible.] Programme [Interjections.] I

can go on and on and I want to thank the Premier because [Interjections.] this happened under her leadership. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. Minister Debbie Schäfer, Minister of Education.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On Friday the Premier showed us how, when the voting public is prepared to swim upstream and vote differently to the rest of the country, they reap substantial rewards. She also showed what is possible when you have a capable state and an accountable and responsive government. Imagine where we could be now if we had had that for the last 25 years. We do indeed have a good story to tell in the Western Cape.

The ANC could not even organise their own protest properly and notwithstanding the *Weekend Argus* report [Interjections.] that "Wale Street was a sea of yellow, black and green", we saw the reality. A protest that was [Interjections.] supposed to start at 09:30, commenced at about 11:30, and it was clear that the few hundred people, outnumbered by police [Interjections.] were not particularly interested in what Mr "Brown Envelope" Rasool and the permanently acting Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There is too much shouting across the floor here.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... Khaya Magaxa, had to say. [Interjections.] We really cannot blame them. Mr Deputy Speaker, in her speech, the Premier addressed many issues in education, and I want to thank her for the full account she gave of the challenges we face. [Interjections.]

She also highlighted our numerous achievements. [Interjections.] So, today I want to focus on just a few issues of particular importance, to highlight just how well we have actually done in the face of extreme difficulties [Interjections.] inflicted largely by the ANC's corruption and mismanagement of our country [Interjections.].

The first topic I wish to address is the matric results. The Premier spoke about our improvement from 75.7% in 2009 to 81.5% in 2018. And yes, we dropped over the last two years, but there are important reasons why. The Premier mentioned the first reason, which is our retention rate from Grade 10 to 12, [Interjections.] which remains by far the highest in the country. [Interjections.]

There is also the impact of our increasing class sizes and decreasing budgets in real terms which we have been warning about for years now, will have an impact on our results. But the other significant factor is the impact of the MEO or Multiple Examination Opportunity on the pass rate. The DBE recently held a Lekgotla where one of the senior officials was at pains to try and convince everyone that there is no smoke and mirrors in the release of the matric results. [Interjections.] But even as he did so, he still failed to

reveal the statistics [Interjections.] of the number of learners per province and the percentage of the matric cohort that they comprise over the last three years, who have written the MEO. And this is where the smoke and mirrors comes in. It does not take a mathematical genius to figure out that if you reduce the numbers writing the final exam by removing the weak ones from the system ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...you will get a higher pass rate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We know you are here, hon Dyantyi. Please contain yourself. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I know you do not want the ANC to hear because they do not like to know the truth. So you are obviously going to get a higher pass rate if you kick out the weaker learners and stop them from writing the final examination. [Interjections.]

I am very confident when I say that there is a strong correlation between the results in each province and the percentage increase over the last three years of learners writing the MEO. To put it simply, the higher the increase in matric pass rate the higher the percentage of the cohorts in that province writing the MEO [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] remember.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am really worried. [Interjections.] I am also confident that the Western Cape has the lowest [Interjections.] percentage increase in those writing MEO's, and unlike in other provinces, we do not force our weak students not to write the final exam.

An HON MEMBER: Hi, man, fix the schools man!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The question needs to be asked, given that I had publicly challenged the DBE and each province to make these statistics public, we have done, why have they still not done so? In addition Minister Matshego has for the last two years been reporting internally on what she has called an inclusive basket of criteria for the NSC, which takes into account important indicators such as the percentage [Interjections.] of physical science and mathematics passes, the [Inaudible.] rate, distinctions and bachelor passes.

Minister Matshego indicated in a parliamentary reply that the new inclusive basket is a more integrated approach to reporting that reflects the key indicators of learner performance. We agree, although now I think the percentage writing the MEO's should also be included. So again I have to ask, why has this not still been made public? Is it perhaps because for the two previous years the Western Cape has been number one and may well be again last year.

So, people must not tell me there is no smoke and mirrors. Considering the huge increase in numbers in our system over the last five years in particular, and the above factors, I am proud of the fact that we have been able to increase at all and certainly that we have been able to maintain a pass rate of over 80% and I am proud that we have focussed, and I hope the next government will continue to focus on keeping as many children in school as possible. And ensuring as many as possible obtain their NSC as that gives them far better opportunities in life. That is what a DA government works for.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I now turn to ICT and the Fourth Industrial Revolution about which the President spoke at SONA. The Premier also spoke about what we have achieved in this realm especially over the last five years, and it is a lot.

The focus on the Fourth Industrial Revolution is very important but the President's response is fascinating. Hand out a tablet to every child over the next three years. Well, that will really solve the problem. Firstly there needs to be internet connectivity at every school, which there is not, except for the majority of those in the Western Cape. Secondly the criminal justice system is so dysfunctional that they will be stolen soon after they are handed out with no consequences. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ha, what are you saying?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thirdly, where is the money coming from? [Interjections.] And fourthly, I sure hope, now listen to this, I sure hope they are solar powered because the National Government has no political will or expertise to fix the energy crisis that we are in as a result of Eskom's mismanagement and corruption. [Interjections.]

So, we could quite feasibly be sitting with a whole lot of tablets and nothing to charge them with. The ANC cannot even agree within itself what they are going to do about Eskom, and they are allowing themselves to be held hostage by the unions which means that nothing will be done anytime soon to fix it. [Interjections.]

Mr President, we don't need tablets. We need teachers and we need schools and we need the ecosystem first that needs to be in place [Interjections.] in order to effectively utilise technology in education. [Interjections.] We also need increased technical support for schools and teacher development to name but a few. We have done remarkably well in integrating ICT, but there is still a lot to do and the President's apparent ignorance of what e-Learning involves is quite astonishing. Although I guess he was shocked to learn what we have all known about Eskom for a long time now. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She is insulting everyone [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: So anything is possible. [Interjections.]

The ANC has also made much of the number of unplaced learners in the

Western Cape and they're quite correct, but have they spoken to their colleagues in other provinces about their unplaced learners? In some provinces the data is so bad, I do not think they will even be able to tell us what their numbers are. In others they offer places to learners and if they refuse those places, they simply remove them from the list of unplaced learners. So they can say that they are no longer unplaced [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Whether they are actually in school or not. [Interjections.] But quite honestly [Interjections.] for the ANC to be posturing about unplaced learners and over-crowded classrooms is like Lincoln's definition of a hypocrite. A man who kills both parents and then complains he is an orphan.

The situation we find ourselves in is a direct result of ANC corruption and mismanagement and a direct result of the DA's good governance to which people are flocking in their numbers. [Interjections.] Since 2014 we have had an increase of 113 000 learners in our system. This year we are anticipating an additional 25 000 once the figures are final. The cost to the Department, excluding infrastructure, for the 113 000, is R1,84 billion. Instead what the ANC has delivered is an additional R1,9 billion over the next three years and we have to fund [Interjections.] as a result of nationally negotiated wage increases, plus they have cut, listen to this, they have cut the infrastructure budget ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... infrastructure grant by R132 million over the last three years. [Interjections.] In addition, our infrastructure grant for growth was increased for growth around R298 million over the 2019 MTEF but it's been cut again by another R250 million, leaving us a marginal increase of R48 million on the indicative allocation received in respect of the 2019 intake.

That is not even enough for one school. [Interjections.] So, what exactly are we supposed to do with the 25 000 extra learners per year for the last two years when the money we need is simply not forthcoming? In contrast a money web article last year suggested that flawed tender processes and corruption could be costing South Africa R400 billion a year.

That money could have ensured we had no teacher shortage at all. No school shortage and schools with far better facilities than many of our older schools enjoy. But instead the Guptas are planning another R100 million wedding in Abu Dhabi. And with our money we have to keep on telling our teachers to please hang in there [Interjections.] And then the ANC wants to take us to the Human Rights Commission. Be my guest! I will join you there and lay a counter charge. [Interjections.] The numbers are frightening and the only thing that will solve it is money, plain and simple.

Obviously, all these extra people require accommodation. Premier mentioned

our achievements in infrastructure. 132 schools and 2 057 classrooms since 2009. That is just over one new school and 17 classrooms per month and yet this is still not enough to keep up with the persistent demand for schooling in the Western Cape. Our schools are literally bursting at the seams and the response from the ANC – cutting the Education infrastructure grant for the two outer years of the MTEF. But I guess that's okay. We will have tablets, right?

The Premier also mentioned our ground-breaking Bill that was passed in November last year which will pave the way for the school evaluation authority. We are currently busy finalising the regulations and this will be a revolution in education in South Africa.

Unsurprisingly, SADTU has now been informing their members not to allow classroom observation as the Premier has not yet proclaimed that the Act is enforced. This will be remedied soon and the section allowing for classroom observation will be enacted and will be enforced. We will not allow SADTU or any other union to stop us observing teaching and learning in the classroom. [Interjections.] I cannot imagine why they would want to except if they are trying to protect people who are prejudicing the chances of our children.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly what they are doing!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The intention is to improve teaching and

learning in the classroom [Interjections.] What possible legitimate ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... objection could there be to that? It is my sincere hope that the new administration will drive this forward aggressively. I also look forward to seeing the chief evaluator appointed within the next few months and the school evaluations published for communities to see our schools in their communities and our province as a whole, are performing. [Interjections.]

There are many safety interventions we've also been busy with which I shall discuss in more detail in my budget speech. Unfortunately once again, many of them [Interjections.] are being necessitated by the ANC's decimation of the independence and the effectiveness of the criminal justice system, which is affecting our people on the ground every day including our schools. [Interjections.]

Over the last week and a half school grounds in Pacaltsdorp have been illegally occupied. We obtained an interdict and the police are only today having a meeting to discuss how they can deal with the problem, while people will carry on invading the property. After we have had to spend R3,5 million of money we ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...desperately need for education purposes
... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, just finish off. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...to try and protect the school property.
Finish off. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Your time is long due!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired but just finish off.
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker,
[Interjections.] I think there is a good saying that says the tallest trees catch
the most wind and I think the Premier will be seen as one of the tallest trees
in this province and in this country. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]
Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...we are having this debate at a time when we have had democracy in our country, led by the African National Congress since 1994. [Interjections.] And the State of the Province Address happens within that context and that context is that when we look at what has been achieved as a country since 1994. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Junk status!

Mr C M DUGMORE: We can look at the fact that 9 out of 10 ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Load shedding!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...of all of our public schools are no-fee, reducing the burden for poor parents who otherwise could not have afforded access to school. [Interjections.] We should remember, Deputy Speaker, that in 1994 only 51% of learners were enrolled in public schools across the country, now 81% of all eligible learners are in school and are learning. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, DA!

Mr C M DUGMORE: In 1994 only 347 000 were enrolled in our universities. Now over one million students are enrolled in our universities [Interjections.]

In 1994 only 50% of learners passed matric, but in 2018 78,2% of learners in our country passed matric [Interjections.] We also know that 3,2 million houses, when we talk about the context of the province in our country, 3,2 million free houses have been built since 1994. In 1994 there were only 3 million recipients of social grants. We now have 17,5 million people receiving social grants [Interjections.] In 1994, ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...this includes our province, only 36% [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must say that to the voters!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...of people had electricity in their homes and now 84% of South Africans have electricity in their homes. [Interjections.] In 1994, in terms of the adult literacy rate only 51% of adults could read and write. Now 94,3% of adults in our country can read and write. [Interjections.] In 1994 51% had access to clean and drinking water including in our province, that was part of that, and now 88,6% of South Africans [Interjections.] have access to clear water.

The National Student Financial Aid Scheme, which also benefits all learners, irrespective of race, it goes to the issue of poverty and income, but only R70 million was spent in 1994 on bursaries ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: How much money was stolen?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... now over R15 billion in 2018 is spent on bursaries. These are things – but the ANC, as our Leader of the Opposition indicated today, we are the first to acknowledge that not only have there been mistakes amongst all these achievements ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mistakes?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and not only has progress been stalled in certain areas.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is not mistakes, man, it is failures.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And that commitment [Interjections.] and that level of honesty is what is [Interjections.] inspiring South Africans ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and giving them trust in the oldest liberation movement on this country, that we have the ability to reflect [Interjections.] to renew and to self-correct, but no one – and that is why opinion polls indicate that over 61% of South Africans will vote for the African National Congress [Interjections.] led by Cyril Ramaphosa [Interjections.] because

they believe ... [Applause.] that their organisation has the ability to self-correct, and that is why all of us, as the Leader of the Opposition have said ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Put them in jail.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... welcome all these commissions, because the truth [Interjections.] must come out.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: [Inaudible.] prison.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Those that are corrupt in ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Jy was nog nie [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: You have not yet been [Inaudible..]]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the private sector and in the government sector ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Exactly!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... must be dealt with. This liberation movement, the African National Congress, [Interjections.] is leading and is giving an example, but unfortunately we have a situation where in the Premier's State of the Province Address there is not one acknowledgment of any mistakes or

any weaknesses.

MEC Schäfer talks about education. When the ANC governed this province, we had a particular [Interjections.] provision for a basket of posts that were redress posts, because many of our schools are not fee-paying and cannot afford governing body posts. This basket of posts helped poor schools to appoint math teachers and science teachers. It helped with redress.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr C M DUGMORE: But that basket of posts no longer exists [Interjections.] under this Provincial Government, because they have prioritised in terms of the equitable share, they have prioritised ICT ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Give us more money.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... which we also support, but in the process ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Give us more money.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... they have undermined the redress and that actually comes right down to the fact that when you look at the Premier's speech, she talks about what the long-term vision actually is, and that vision is very

revealing.

She says that the long-term vision of this province is highly skilled, innovation driven ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC has no vision.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... resource efficient ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: You cannot talk about vision.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... connected, high opportunity society for all. Nowhere do we have any mention of redress, which is a prerogative of our Constitution and what has happened in the matric results in this province?

If you look at District East ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] redress.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the poorest schools, that is where the matric results have dropped, in the main that is where they have dropped. That is where the achievement of 60% has actually dropped in those schools, and that is because you have not invested enough in the safety of those schools. The school safety budget in this province has not kept pace with inflation.

So while the Premier [Interjections.] talks about an opportunity society, it is the neglect of the poor which has characterised this DA Provincial Government's last tenure.

An HON MEMBER: Yebo!

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is the reality, because redress to the DA is a swear word, as much as it is contained in our Constitution, where you have to use resources to effect redress.

Not in one of the Premier's speeches since 2009 has she talked about inequality, has she talked about ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... broad-based black economic empowerment, and that is why the economic ownership structures of our province have not changed for 10 years. [Interjections.]

We also ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... [Inaudible.] jobs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dugmore. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was rising on the running commentary on that side.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, okay, fine.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because we cannot hear the speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That has been dealt with. Hon member Dugmore ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We cannot hear him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... hon member Dugmore, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We understand it is painful. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Read your own memo, inequality is there. Read it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I see I was stopped at six minutes, but when Premier Zille reflected on the 10 years of DA Government and she gave credit to those who decided to take the road less travelled in 2009 ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and vote against the national trend, it is clear that many of those voters are now regretting that decision, especially those voters from working class communities of Cape Town. You can see when the Good Party has a meeting in Mitchells Plain it is packed out. The DA battled to fill that hall and all that was in their hall in Mitchells Plain [Interjections.] was their public representatives. That indicates that those people [Interjections.] who feel that Patricia de Lille was mistreated [Interjections.] are disillusioned with the DA.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Your meeting.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr C M DUGMORE: This term of office, Mr Deputy Speaker, presided over by the DA, can be described as 10 years of broken [Interjections.] promises, of missed opportunities and of the cynical neglect of the majority of the poor [Interjections.] African and coloured and white in this province. A neglect of the poor.

Critical to the quality of life in any community is where the people feel safe and in fact are safe. When the DA, under the leadership of Premier Zille,

took over this Government in 2009 there had been a steady decline in the rate of murder. This was progress made by the ANC. Under the DA contact crime has increased [Interjections.] by 17% by 2013. There have been a record number of child murders under this DA Government. The crime stats for 2017 and 2018 saw a number of police stations in the Western Cape having the highest number of recorded murders compared to police stations in other parts of the country. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are under-resourced by [Inaudible.].

Mr C M DUGMORE: So as this 10 years come to an end, the real legacy, the real Western Cape that the DA leaves us with is a shocking legacy of a province which is more violent [Interjections.], which has greater levels of substance abuse ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and a culture of gangsterism ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that is more embedded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dugmore, just one second. Hon

Minister Winde, is that question? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Will the hon member take a question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The MEC Winde needs to be patient because I am going to expose him and his Department ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... for the abuse of ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... R7 million of taxpayer's money.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, I assume that is no.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just sit down!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The reality is that while the DA talks of a whole society of approach and a delivery unit, their approach has been focused essentially,

as per that vision, of preserving the privileges of the haves and neglected the needs of the have nots. [Interjections.]

Premier Zille never talks about inequality [Interjections.], the DA never talks about redress. The resolution of crime and gangsterism needs a dedicated focus on the causes of crime in the most affected communities. It is not surprising that the situation has worsened. It is both the absence of political will and the failure to develop an integrated and targeted approach backed-up by resource allocation, but what makes it worse, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that the Premier comes to this House and actually misleads us and the public.

Mr D JOSEPH: Come on [Inaudible.] say that.

Mr C M DUGMORE: She claims that ... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Bring a substantive motion.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the ratio of Western Cape police officers in our province to residents is one to 509. If you, if she had bothered to simply look at the South African Police Annual Report for 2018 / 2019, it is very clear there that that national ratio is 1.375. In our province, if you look at the fact that we have 20,457 police personnel according to Stat South Africa, the mid-year population last year was 6,621,000 ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: What is the shortage?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that works out in the Western Cape ...
[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: What is the shortage?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... to one police person for 324 ... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... which is much better than the [Interjections.]
national average, yet she comes here ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and she claims ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, just – order! Hon member
Dugmore, just one second. Hon member Wenger?

An HON MEMBER: No! The answer is no.

An HON MEMBER: You are wasting our time.

Ms M M WENGER: Will the hon member Dugmore take a question?
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey, sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But moving on ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Unless hon member Wenger gives the correct information, because I am sure she is misleading the Premier who in turn is misleading us.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Now in her speech ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... Premier Zille ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... argued ... [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: [Inaudible.] point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that the condition for sustained ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... progress ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... towards prosperity – sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, just one second. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon member just accused me of misleading the Premier ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

Ms M M WENGER: ... and the House, which I think is objectionable and I

would like you to rule on that, please. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Referring to an hon member as having misled the House or misleading the House is in order, as long as you do not add “deliberate” or [Interjections.] “intent” into it. [Interjections.]

So it is okay, you can continue. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, I did not say she was ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Lekker!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... I did say she was misleading the Premier, and the Premier therefore is misleading us. That is what I said. [Interjections.]

In her speech Premier Zille argued that conditions [Interjections.] for progress require rule of law, culture of accountability and a capable state.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Something the ANC does not [Inaudible.].

Mr C M DUGMORE: Now hon member Nkondlo has already referred to the fact that the Premier and the DA Government ignored the highest law in this province, the Provincial Constitution, by simply failing to implement two commissions which were required by the law, this is double standards. [Interjections.] But the issue of accountability which I want to get to now ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You did nothing [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... I want to ask ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Stop your comments [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... how committed, Mr Deputy Speaker, is Premier Zille to accountability and in particular to the accountability of her MECs for the use of public resources and the respect for procurement processes.

Is the Premier prepared to cooperate with an investigation into the allegation that one of her MECs ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... approved a closed tender amounting to R6.84 million to a single service provider for work done for simply two months ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just listen to this.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... from 6 October 2014 until 1 December 2014. Almost R7 million for less than two months' work for only one service provider, giving no one else an opportunity.

An HON MEMBER: Jô! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: I am referring, Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... to bid number ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: I am referring, Mr Deputy Speaker, to bid number EDT006/14, awarded to McKinsey, yes, McKinsey, by the Department of Economic Development Tourism. This is at the time when MEC Winde occupied this portfolio. It is clear that this work could have been done by officials of the Department ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yoh!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and they in fact indicated that.

Secondly, will the Premier establish from MEC Winde how many times [Interjections.] he had met representatives of McKinsey in both an official and an unofficial capacity before the work was allocated exclusively to McKinsey without allowing any other service providers the opportunity to tender. [Interjections.]

What we need to ask was was the view of the Bid Adjudication Committee when this matter was discussed with them initially?

I believe that this matter, and I am happy that the Chair of SCOPA is here, needs to be investigated by SCOPA. We need to call in the officials of this Department, we need to call in McKinsey, we need to call in MEC Winde, to explain why when officials could have done this and they were told that the officials could do it ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Call it Fransman.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... they gave it to one.

So we want to know what is the relationship between MEC Winde and McKinsey.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yoh! [Applause.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: We want him to tell us and explain that particular relationship. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Bring it on!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Because that is what we need.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Bring it on!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is very clear ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is coming, it is coming.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... it is very, very clear ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member Fritz.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that there is one set of accountability for some and there is another set of accountability for others, and I trust that this House will get to the bottom of this matter because clearly you cannot pay one service provider almost R7 million for two months' work, and you do not give an opportunity to anyone else to tender. That is what needs to be

explained. [Interjections.]

When we look at the Premier's speech we also find a complete absence, a complete absence of any reference to the indigenous people of our province. We know that since Premier Zille was appointed this DA Provincial Government has never met the Griqua Royal House, the Congress of Traditional Leaders, the Cape Khoi, Koranas – in fact in 2011 Premier Zille ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... declined an invitation to attend the Adam Kok commemoration at the Castle. This Legislature, hon member Dyantyi and others from that side, went around to the whole province where the majority that went to the public hearings expressed support for the National Traditional Leaders and Khoisan [Interjections.]. Well, they expressed support. But it is the Democratic Alliance who has opposed that legislation, which means that this province does not want to set up a House of Traditional Leaders for the Western Cape, nor do they want to set up a House of Traditional Leaders in local municipalities. [Interjections.]

So that is very, very clear that this Government undermined ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is the National Government

... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the rights of the indigenous people ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that this particular Provincial Government gave no recognition, and that is why you can see in Black River Park the DA continues ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order. I will attend to it, hon member Uys, I think you are rising on the same point of order. There are too much noise coming from the back corner there and constant interjections. Do not make it a running commentary, please. The noise level is too high. Hon member Dugmore, you may continue.

An HON MEMBER: But he must not mislead the House.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So what is fact is that the DA voted against the rights of indigenous people in this province ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... like the Koi, the San ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You did not support them.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the Contralesa leaders, they voted against it ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... and they have no interest to establish a House ...

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You did not support it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... of Traditional Leaders in this province. The DA voted against it in the NCOP. It is a matter of record, and this province in the public hearings expressed support for that.

An HON MEMBER: We voted against the undermining of them.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So we then have a situation where under the leadership of the Premier the spirit of colonialism and subjection goes on ...

[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Ag, come on.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... because you fail to recognise the indigenous people

of this province. [Interjections.] That is the legacy which is being left by this particular province.

We then have a situation [Interjections.] which I would like to refer to, where Premier Zille has raised the issue of housing delivery. I want to remind this particular House that we put forward a motion when we asked, as a matter of public importance, when MEC Madikizela was informed and in a Premier statement, that he had already in 2014 completed a housing strategy for this province. Complete with which properties were going to be released, etcetera. That has never ever been given to this House.

So the Premier in 2014 already misled this House [Interjections.] that there was a comprehensive strategy for housing delivery. The Provincial Property Committee ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... has never reported to this House since 2009, which shows that they never intended to release provincial properties for housing in this province, preferring to blame National Government for not releasing Ysterplaat. That is the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... problem, there has been no political will.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dugmore, your time has expired. [Interjections.] [Applause.] Please come to order, please come to order before I see the next speaker. [Interjections.] The next – order! The next speaker is the hon member Mnqasela. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker. †Enkosi, Sekela-Somlomo. Ndifuna ukuqala ndithi kuNontsapho iDA imi emva kwakho iyakuxhasa nentetho oyenzileyo yePhondo. Sibabonile ooxam, amahlungulu bekwela bezehlela bedlala uphuca bengakwazi ukuthetha yingxaki xa ujongene nabantu abanganento yokwenza. Abananto yokuthetha kuba abananto yokwenza.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to start by saying to Nontsapho that DA is fully behind you and supports you and your State of the Province Address that you have made. We have seen all those idiots going up and down not knowing what to do and they are stuck now, the problem when you are dealing with people who do not have anything to do. They just get stuck with lots of words because they do not have anything to do.]

†Voters in this province ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are you calling the Premier names?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... because they know that they are the bosses, they will hire us here this side after the 8 May elections.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: But they will fire those ones on the other side ...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You wish, man!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... because they are useless, on the May election.

[Applause.] [Interjections.]

Now let me come to the issue of the Khoisan people. [Interjections.] The Nama, the Griqua, the Korana, the Cape Khoi, rejected the ANC Bill. [Interjections.] The Traditional and Khoisan Leadership Bill. They told us, we went around this province in five districts ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we went to each and every corner of this province. They said, "This Bill is not fair, this Bill is not just and this Bill is discriminatory. [Interjections.] This Bill is not fair!" [Applause.] They rejected it, but because the Democratic Alliance believes in the question of justice, but we also believe in the question of fairness, we said, "We will not

support a Bill that sees Coloured people, Khoisan people, as certain class citizens in this country.”

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Because you think it only matters close to the elections to come and put wool over the face, the eyes of Khoisan people. They reject you, they rejected this Bill. On record they rejected it. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

And, hon member Dugmore, you were not there, you do not even belong in this Committee, you were not anywhere close when we talk to the people. They rejected it. [Interjections.]

Hon Premier, when you spoke here you said to the people of this province, young people, “I will give you a data of 3 Gigabyte ...” ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... “... for free.” That is what young people are getting from this Government, and you said, “If you have to top up when the 3 Gigabyte expires, you will only pay R15.” That is what has been promised to young people, and you are saying here, “She said nothing.” Maybe you were not here because you had to speak to the matters outside, because you are not taking your job seriously here in this Parliament. [Interjections.]

On corruption. The Premier candidate here of the Democratic Alliance says to the voters of this province, “When you vote I commit,” that is what Alan Winde says, “I commit to putting all my Ministers on a lifestyle audit [Interjections.]” We have been calling for the lifestyle audit in the National Assembly for years. [Interjections.] What does the ANC do? Zero. Zero. Because you promote corruption. You promote corruption. [Interjections.] You are an African National Corruption, that is what you are. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Because we have seen how you have stolen money in the National Government with R80 billion in irregular and wasteful expenditure. [Interjections.] R80 billion in the national departments, R28.4 billion in the 257 municipalities in this country, and 99.9% of those are ANC governed.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: In ANC governed provinces. [Interjections.] In this province that represents 0.1%, and all of those have something to do with ANC governance because of the small coalitions that do not make sense here.

So let me tell you something. The problems, Mr Deputy Speaker, are in the supply chain management. What does that mean? Let me educate them. [Interjections.] It is how you manage your wallet, the public purse. The problem with the ANC, they confuse public purse with private wallets.

[Interjections.] [Applause.] That is the problem.

In Oudtshoorn, when we had an ANC government there, the Mayor and his friends [Interjections.], used some cookie jar where they would say to a girlfriend, “You want to buy fish and chips? Go and take there. [Interjections.] You want to buy a cold drink? Go and take there.” Thinking that it ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... is their private wallets, when it is Government money. That is the difference between us and the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: But also equally we are saying here to South Africans, “When you go and vote for the Democratic Alliance ...” ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... “... we promise...” ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member, order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... “... South Africans that those who steal money from

the people will not get less than 15 years behind bars, minimum. Minimum.”

[Applause.] We want to see where are those who are stealing money today, instead of sending them to jail.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: They are sitting in the benches.

Mr M MNQASELA: You promote them to Ministers, you send them to National Government and that is why they steal more there with this Bosasa nonsense and others. [Interjections.]

Now let me get closer to finishing. Let me tell you this – no-no, it is fine. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: I understand your temperature, but let me tell you this, I increase temperature, it is good. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Lekker.

An HON MEMBER: Lekker! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: When ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... I listen to hon member Dugmore speaking, [Interjections.] and I thought that this is a person who does not believe in that Government must work with the private sector, that is what Government must do. You must allow private sector to do the things that the Government cannot do, but do so within the rules. They think because they have been stealing we also steal. You see when you are a thief, when you see somebody stealing you think that, when you see somebody else doing something right, you think they are stealing because you know you are a thief. [Laughs.] [Applause.]

Maybe you could have told us about his wife doing business with the Criminal Justice System, and tell us what is his wife doing, how is she doing it, because maybe he thinks ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: What is the issue?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... the same thing that he himself and his wife are doing ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... the DA Government is doing it to other people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Mr M MNQASELA: We are governing clean governance ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just finish off your speech.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... honest governance ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Whose wife is that?

Mr C M DUGMORE: What is the issue?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... for all people of this province, not for some people, because ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that is one South Africa for all people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Your time has expired. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Come to order first, please. I see the hon member Wiley. Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, I have had the privilege of being a public representative in this country since

the mid-1980s.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Daarsy!

[An HON MEMBER: There you go!]

Mr M G E WILEY: First as a Ratepayers Association, then transitional councils, and from 1994 until now, albeit with broken service, at provincial and national level. I have met some extraordinary people, but most of them are my own countrymen and women who astounded me the most for their generosity of spirit and their willingness to see South Africa succeed, irrespective of their ideological differences. For the sake of this debate and my argument, I will mention some of these people.

I spoke in three presidential debates and on each occasion Mr Mandela referred to my contribution directly in his reply, because I took the line of being constructive and positive. I had appealed for reconciliation about building bridges and about historical importance.

I have served with and interacted with Mr Sisulu Senior, Mr Kathrada, Mr Terror Lekota ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So where are you going with all [Inaudible.].

Mr M G E WILEY: ... Mr Mbeki Senior, to name a few of the ANC stalwarts. [Interjections.] Kader Asmal acted as an umpire at the parliamentary cricket

side which, of which I was the convener. Trevor Manuel was a regular player, as was Johnny de Lange. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Bantu Holomisa was the right wing and I was the left wing in the parliamentary rugby side. My abiding memory of these individuals was their dignity, their graciousness in victory. They had a keen understanding of what was required to build a nation, and although their past suffering was undoubtedly still fresh in their minds, they felt that little would be achieved by harping on it.

They also understood that they had inherited a functioning state. They simply wanted to put ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr M G E WILEY: ... their long overdue imprint on a country and spread the opportunity that especially whites had enjoyed, to a much larger audience, but they also listened and I would like to think that some of the contributions by both myself and my colleagues are still apparent today.

Personally I was deeply affected by the humanity and the Ubuntu, and so it is that we come to today's debate and last Friday's speech.

In any reasonable circles, the content of the Premier's speech, based on empirical data derived from a variety of independent ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... and accredited institutions ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, empirical data?

Mr M G E WILEY: ... that we all quote from, would be celebrated. Celebrated as an outstanding achievement, more so in South Africa of late, but by every measurement and commentary, this country is in dire straits under ANC rule. Economically, intellectually and morally ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We save the country.

Mr M G E WILEY: I have never ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... expected much from this Opposition ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... either on Friday or today. They lived up to the

unenviable task of hate-filled race baiting, truth-twisting and a complete lack of accountability as the governing party. For any of the myriad of disasters facing our once prosperous and beautiful country.

I cannot think of a single redeeming feature of the current ANC and its leaders, especially in this province. I would be at a loss for words. Can you think of anyone?

Mr D JOSEPH: Yoh!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: A lot!

Mr M G E WILEY: Just one, hon member Dugmore ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are the last person [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ... by his own admission, says they have made mistakes, but after exposure, public exposure. All I see is a dissolute, desperate and destructive bunch of ne'er-do-wells who are more concerned on acquiring goods for themselves ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are the last one [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ... than on delivering the goods for others. They are mean, insecure and crude.

An HON MEMBER: Look who is talking [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Many are too young to even have experienced apartheid. Their abominable behaviour in storming out of the Chamber on Friday was a low point even for them. If, as alleged ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Look who is talking.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... the words “fucking old white man, you stole our land” and “*voertsek*” were in fact uttered [Interjections.], then this country and all its citizens need to be afraid. [Interjections.] Because this is the ilk of the leader of the ANC is satisfied with. [Interjections.] Unrehabitable venal racists and incompetents ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... who see no harm in accosting their elderly, the infirm, the isolated farmers, the youth, the skilled and the essential role-players, and children. [Interjections.] One can only shudder what venom is spread over the dinner table because what we see happening in classrooms should send a shiver down the spine of any reasonable person. [Interjections.]

Last week I listened [Interjections.] to President Ramaphosa reply to the SONA debate. He called for all South African to pull together. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: I agree, but not with a quaint and dangerous narrative that one has to vote for the ANC to achieve this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: It has to be done ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just one second. Hon member Nkondlo, you are giving a running commentary now. Please contain yourself.

Mr D JOSEPH: You must apologise. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: It has to be done in spite of the ANC millstone, but he has his work cut out, because the worst divisions are within his own party. Surely as President of the ANC he cannot agree with what happened on Friday in this House. Surely he cannot agree with the weasily, cowardly arguments put by Ebrahim Rasool, trying to justify the unjustifiable.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Bring it on!

Mr M G E WILEY: But then the question does need to be asked ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: Bring it on, we are waiting.

Mr M G E WILEY: .. how bankrupt is the ANC to allow Rasool, a discredited [Interjections.] and dismissed Premier, to be allowed to have anything to do where the public trust is involved.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, discredited.

Mr M G E WILEY: Did they think his extended ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your eyes.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... stay in Washington would bring about amnesia? Goebbels, the Nazi propagandist say that you should accuse your enemy of what you are guilty of, and now listening to hon member Dugmore, he could be a clone.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is teaching you.

Mr M G E WILEY: One such lie being peddled by the ANC is that the DA is politicising SAPS, as referred to by Minister Winde. Quite how this is achieved by a party that is only an oversight in another sphere of government, is a mystery. The truth lies in the reverse. Currently an overtly ANC faction of the senior echelons of the Western Cape SAPS is doing its best to subvert the authority of the Provincial Commissioner, indiscriminate promotion of 600 ANC cadres within police ranks, and the gross abuse of the Minister's special advisor, Leonard Max.

I quote from a current circular distributed by Faiez Jacobs, [Interjections.] the Secretary of the ANC, to all CPFs in so-called coloured area:

“Hello Comrades ...”

It says:

“Please note the following notice from the Provincial Secretary’s office: Comrade Bheki’s visit.”

And then it lists nine different venues and nine different dates, and it ends off:

“Signed by Lieutenant-General retired Leonard Max.”

And it is distributed by the ANC.

“Special advisor to the Minister.” Following his cell number [Interjections.]. My deep concern is that all the SAPS station commissioners [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, my deep concern is that all station commissioners [Interjections.] in the areas concerned, were instructed

repeatedly to ensure that there were full crowds when Leonard Max came to see them, because the Minister does not come, only Leonard Max. Is it to sell the Bambanani project, which he discredited himself? [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: He is confused.

Mr M G E WILEY: But the President has also called for decisive action. He showed decisive action when last year he instructed the SANDF, of which he is the Commander in Chief ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are everywhere.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... to change the Armed Forces Week from Limpopo to the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Tell us about the [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: I doubt there is a single citizen in the City who is not aware of their presence at the moment [Interjections.]. The rolling thunder of artillery and fast jets has rattled windows and terrified persons and animals, but, Sir, why stop there? Over 200 citizens have died in Mitchells Plain in the last recent months ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... and SAPS are suffering dire shortages in manpower. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, I wish to address another matter.

The hon member Christians ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, your time is almost done. Please conclude.

Mr M G E WILEY: The hon member Christians sermonised to us [Interjections.] and notwithstanding his repeated flagrant untruth, he stated that the DA has no political will to fight crime. I would like to alert the hon member Christians that he is the Chairperson, meant to be the neutral Chairperson of SCOPA, with a full advantage of all the facts.

I end by saying, I paraphrase the hon member, "We give notice." [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] That ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that supposed to inspire?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, hon member Dugmore – order! The Chair wants to speak now.

That concludes the business of the House, the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:41