

---

THURSDAY, 19 APRIL 2018

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the subject for discussion. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to precedence being given? No objection? Agreed to.

The House will then first start with the subject for discussion in the name of the hon member Schäfer; I see the hon member Schäfer.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

(Subject for Discussion)

### **LAND EXPROPRIATION WITHOUT COMPENSATION**

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The most extensive findings available on land reform and restitution in South Africa are to be found in the report of the High Level Panel chaired by former President Motlanthe and I quote:

"Experts advise that the need to pay compensation has not been the most serious constraint on land reform in South Africa to date. Other constraints, including increasing evidence of corruption by officials, the diversion of the land-reform budget to elites, the lack of political will, and lack of training and capacity have proved more serious stumbling blocks to land reform."

Mere months after the panel's findings the populists at the ANC Nasrec Congress Conference unanimously passed a resolution on expropriation of land without compensation.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Viva ANC, Viva!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The question must be asked: why did the ANC push for expropriation of land without compensation... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will tell you that.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...when the High Level report's findings clearly state that land reform failures have nothing to do with compensation and everything to do with the ANC's own corruption and lack of political will at National Government.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Is dit? [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is it? [Interjections.]]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the reality is that at the time of tabling of this report the budget for land reform was at an all time low, less than 0.4% of the National Budget with less than 0.1% set aside for land redistribution. The reality is that by 2014 the ANC had spent a combined R69 billion on land reform and redistribution with only a dismal 9% success rate to show for it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So what is your point?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: R69 billion could have bought 58% of South Africa's

productive agricultural land at market value. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But this money has gone down the drain along with any hope black South Africans have of getting their land back from the ANC. This is what the ANC has done with our land. [Interjections.] The party was desperate for a populous deflection tactic... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Our land, MEC. Our land that we...

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...since 1994 the ANC has had every chance, but failed to build the capable state by giving land ownership through redistribution and restitution. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: I know the MEC of Human Settlements do not agree with you.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: These continuous failures to effectively redistribute and reform South Africa's skewed land ownership drove the party's voter-basis to the EFF [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is another confirmation, I know... [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...threatening the ANC's success at the polls.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your poor research, such a poor research.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The adoption of land expropriation without compensation is clearly an elaborate cover-up of a track record of failure, corruption and diversion of land reform to ANC elites over the past 15 years.

Mr Deputy Speaker, expropriation of land without compensation is a repackaged land promise the ANC should have kept decades ago. [Interjections.] The DA believes that land ownership through redistribution...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, member, one second. [Interjections.] hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I just want to check if she can take a question from Mr Rodney Lentit that he has given to me. Rodney Lentit, you will remember him. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is not a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, you are not prepared to take a question? [Interjections.] You may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The DA believes that land ownership through redistribution restitution and land reform can be done by a government that prioritises and adequately budgets for this crucial service to our people in post-apartheid South Africa. Land expropriation without compensation is not necessary when you have a competent and capable state. [Interjection.]

We firmly believe in the equitable access to land through title deeds and ownership in line with Section 25 of the Constitution. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: South Africa's people must own the land they seek, not hand it over to the State. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order member, just one second. Hon member Davids and hon member Dyantyi you are both on the speakers list, so please await your turn and allow the member the silence to speak. Hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The DA and Provincial Government may not have the constitutional mandate to change the national policy... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle sal dit nooit hê nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You will never have that.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... that withholds title from black farmers but we take our crucial provincial mandate of supporting emerging farmers very seriously... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where Beverley? I have been looking for that report.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...unlike any other provincial government. This is why the Western Cape remains the only province in South Africa to provide dedicated support to emerging black farmers and land beneficiaries.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where Beverley? Show us...

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The ANC wants to lease land to South Africans in a never-ending cycle of dependency on the state. Similarly the EFF wants the state to be the sole custodian of land. [Interjections.]

Under the ANC and the EFF land policies black South Africans will never own land, will never amass generational wealth and will never have any form of fixed assets to leave to their children... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is because you do not want to give them any...

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The ANC and the EFF both seek to threaten black South Africans... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You do not want to give... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...in the same way the apartheid government did as service of the state at the mercy of ownership only afforded to a select few. Clearly, Mr Deputy Speaker, land ownership has now moved from private hands to state hands while black South Africans remain empty-handed. [Interjections.] But the ANC cannot even finalise its own position... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoor wie praat nou!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hear who is talking now!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...on expropriation with compensation, without the party being left seemingly split between those in favour of the motion and those not. [Interjections.] President Ramaphosa himself stated in an interview in London this week that land expropriation, and I quote: "...has not quite worked as we had intended it to work."

Why is this, we ask? Perhaps President Ramaphosa should consult High Level Report before adopting a rash land policy, and to get closer to the truth, Mr Deputy Speaker, let us review the cold hard facts on the ANC's record on land reform.



†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The Flagship 1995 / 1994 RDP Policy first set a target of 30% transfer of all commercial agricultural land by 1999. This goal was later deferred to 2014, then to 2025. Perhaps the ANC's Opposition here can tell us what is next - 2050? Many citizens have lodged land claims alleging historical injustices but the ANC Government does not even employ enough staff to process these claims. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is because of you that the land claims...

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Will the ANC Opposition explain this clear-cut incompetence to us today? Under current national policy the state buys land and leases it to black farmers, with no option for a title deed up until after 50 years. Perhaps the ANC Opposition will explain how on earth this lease-only policy for black farmers will ever redress apartheid injustices. Maybe they will also explain to us today... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, you are speaking of... [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...why corruption is so pervasive in land reform.  
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You benefited from the injustice.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: We hope they will tell us why elite secure farms only to run them into the ground. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You benefited from the injustice.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Tell us about the Gupta dairy farm.

Ms M N GILLION: Tell us about District Six... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Tell us about the R97 million farm given to a Luthuli House employee without any due process... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Tell us about District Six.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon, one second. Just before I see you, Chief Whip, I want to address the hon member Davids. I have already asked you to please contain yourself. You are giving a running commentary here and you are on the list very soon. Just await your turn. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would want to underline the point that you have raised please and ask that you enforce the Rules of the House. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, you may continue.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC's dismal track record speaks for itself. Rural and urban land reform is one of the ANC's biggest governance failures to date. The facts show that the DA is the only party that truly advances... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: In jou drome!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your dreams!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...equitable access to land through title deeds and ownership in line with Section 25 of the Constitution. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...criminal...

Ms B A SCHÄFER: While ensuring adequate compensation and growing a healthy and thriving economy. All it takes is sound and effective governance and a clear decisive political will to correct the injustices in our country's past. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, South Africa does not need land expropriation without compensation... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Is dit?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is it?]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: South Africa needs land expropriation without the ANC.

I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The hon member Magaxa.

Ms S W DAVIDS: We will educate you now. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, tell them, tell them. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think we must acknowledge that the history of the South African struggle is the history against colonialism that subjected indigenous black African people who were the majority into slaves... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Not black South Africans alone, other people too!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and landless in their own country.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It was other people also.  
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Millions of black lives were lost in the struggle led by

Bambatha... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...by Nxele, by Makana, by Langalibalele Dube...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, just one second, member, just one second.  
Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon member prepared to take a question to explain  
what he means by black? [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa, are you prepared to  
take a question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Later on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He can get me in the passage. Josia Gumede, Oliver  
Tambo, Joe Slovo, Lillian Ngoyi, Chris Hani and Nelson Mandela etcetera...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...in order to return... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, just one second. Hon Joseph.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You talk about black Africans... [Interjection.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the person opposite me, the hon member opposite me, makes such a lot of noise that I cannot hear what is being said in the House, please man.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Thank you for pointing that out. Hon Minister Fritz, I could not see you, but I suspect that he is referring to you. Please contain yourself.

Ms M N GILLION: You must stop your pettiness.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member Magaxa, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Puppet behaviour. Nelson Mandela, etcetera, in order to return African dignity through African ownership and accessibility to land. They all understood that colonialism is a crime against humanity.

Nelson Mandela and many of his comrades spent almost 30 years in prison in order to reclaim our land from white colonialists represented by both the National Party and the so-called Democratic Party, which until today remained representatives of white supremists, and interest. Hence, we cannot be surprised when the DA, which is a combination of National Party and DP, are vehemently opposing the resolution of the ANC to confiscate the land without compensation for the benefit of the poor black majority. They are continuing with their colonialist agenda to continue marginalisation and alienation of the indigenous black majority to the benefit of the rich white minority. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And the Khoisan people, what about the Khoisan? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Those thugs! Mr Deputy Speaker, since the Conference of Berlin, 1884, where the DA's historical predecessors mapped out and institutionalised the colonisation of the African continent, the quest to regain land has been in the hearts and minds of the majority of our country. In South Africa the establishment of the Union of South Africa in 1910 and the subsequent passing of the Native Land Act of 1913 further entrenched this historic injustice after Berlin, of which hon member Schäfer, you are a great beneficiary. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Native Land Act promulgated in 1913, dispossessed the African people of their land and allocated only 7%, honourable...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Schäfer.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Schäfer, you know... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...only 7% of the arable landscape of South Africa to African people. It was to be the first piece of legislation, followed by many other apartheid laws that would lay the foundations of racial segregation in this country.

In their fervent opposition to expropriation of land without compensation, it seems as if the DA suffers from serious selective amnesia in as far as our colonial legacy is concerned. This amnesia is fully in line with their equal opportunity liberal posture, which denies the continued impact the legacy of apartheid has on the lives of the majority of this country, including myself, but not Schäfer, hon Schäfer. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is hy!



[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA of P W Botha and Helen Suzman think they can blackmail the ANC and destroy its leadership to this country by deliberately misleading society that the ANC is responsible for land grab that is currently taking place in the province particularly. They do not tell the people that in actual fact 72% of the land in this province is in white hands and the black majority cannot continue squatting in their own country whilst the white minority lives comfortable lives at our expense and wishes to give our land back when they wish. [Interjections.]

This party of apartheid and colonialism is failing to identify land and allocate people temporarily whilst they are still waiting for houses to be built despite claiming to have done an audit in this province a long time ago. Since the 1994 democratic breakthrough the ANC-led Government has been very sensitive and careful in executing its policies at times at the expense of its own people's interests... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is for sure.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It provided an opportunity to white South Africans who owned... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...its own people...

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...who owned this land that was stolen from the black majority to take their time and avail land for redistribution. How dare you think that we will buy the land you have stolen?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes!

Mr K E MAGAXA: You know, the willing buyer willing seller policy adopted by the ANC Government to create mutual cooperation among...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, just one second. Hon Chief Whip.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle is seer! Hulle is seer!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are hurting! They are hurting!]

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon Leader of the Opposition saying that those hon title holders in this House are thieves? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is baie seer.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That hurts a lot.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may respond to that. I read it differently, but can I ask you... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Eina, eina!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ouch, ouch!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! May I ask the member, you did not refer to a member in this House?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that correct?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are correct in that [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is the truth.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is a fallacy what they are saying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, dit is baie seer. Eina, eina!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, it hurts a lot. Ouch, ouch!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The willing buyer willing seller policy adopted by the African National Congress Government to create mutual cooperation amongst dispossessed and beneficiaries of colonialism could not improve accessibility of the black majority to the land.

It is in that context that the ANC Nasrec Conference resolved to fast-track the program of land redistribution through expropriation of land without compensation. The ANC President who happened to be the country's President explained serious conditions that should be considered carefully in the process of executing that particular program. He assured the nation that whatever the Government does to implement the policy, it will do it within the confines of the rule of law and it will not affect the food production. Instead it should increase food production in our country. It is only a person with no interest in the black majority like our hon member Schäfer, people like them, including that of this country, who would reject the statement presented by comrade Cyril Ramaphosa.

The ANC as a liberation movement wishes to extend its gratitude to revolutionary people's movements that have been consistent in putting the land question on the agenda of transformation of South Africa, from minority to the majority rule. From the Landless People's Movement to Abahlali baseMjondolo, from the miners at Marikana to the farmworkers in the

Western Cape; extraordinary citizens who have been working in their communities to ensure that the quest for land remains paramount, because there is no liberation. There is no freedom without the ownership of land. [Interjections.] In fact, if you are against the expropriation of land without compensation... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...you are anti-freedom.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are anti-democracy.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed!

Mr K E MAGAXA: You want to enjoy freedom alone. You are very [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The ANC heard the cries of our people.

An HON MEMBER: Speak to the Chair.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, if we all believe that money stolen from the state-owned enterprise by the Guptas family who happened to be friends of our previous President... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Of the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...including the Premier... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... including the Premier of this Province, Helen Zille...

An HON MEMBER: No, Zuma!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...should be returned back by those, to the rightful owners of our people, then now it is a farce that the stolen land... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... is not returned back to its rightful owners, who are the black majority.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Why would you like the Guptas to return the money but you do not want our land to be returned... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Because both our land was stolen, and the Guptas have stolen from the poor and we want those monies to be returned... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...as we want our land to be returned back. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You failed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Minister of Agriculture, Minister Winde.

(Cell phone in background: Song Michael Jackson: *They don't care about us.*) [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I do not know if you

heard the words of that song, but if I think about a landless person in South Africa that person would think about the ANC and think about Michael Jackson and you know those words: “*They don’t really care about us...*” [Applause.] Now Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: We do not care about the thief.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You do not care.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: We do not care about the thief.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I can assure you throughout this speech and the rest of the debate you think about the ANC and you think about the people out there, the ANC do not really care about us... [Interjections.]

But Mr Deputy Speaker, let us put this whole debate into context. I think first of all this debate is in the context of a country that is looking for investment. It is in the context of a country that has junk status of SOEs that do not work. [Interjections.] The South African Airways (SAA) with constant bailouts just short of bankruptcy.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC.



The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: PRASA and Metrorail, specifically now the people of this country feel it, because it is not working. They do not care about us. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Metro failed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: From load-shedding potential coming now with Eskom, failures in the coal supply space... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, we are not speaking about investment...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Water Affairs and the bankruptcy of Water Affairs when we are sitting here with a one in 400 year drought.

An HON MEMBER: What is the context?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: This context that we find ourselves in where we have got dams like Clanwilliam and Brandvlei that are put on hold that could equal thousands of hectares of land reform potential when we could not even achieve 1% growth last year, when poverty in our country is growing, when

visas cannot be attained, and our President sits overseas and puts a formidable team together, a pride of lions - Trevor Manuel, Mcebisi Jonas, Jaco Maree and Phumzile Langeni. This is a formidable pride of lions to go out there and hunt this R1.2 billion worth of investment that we are looking for so desperately in this country, but the problem with this debate is this debate was like sending that pride of lions to the dentist before they had to go out and hunt. Their teeth had been pulled out. It was giving them the Mugabe handbook to say now go and look for some investment.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is what this debate does, but Mr Deputy Speaker...

Mr C M DUGMORE: But do you have a speech? Where is your actual speech?  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is not only an agricultural debate and of course I stand here as part of Agriculture; this is a debate about assets in our country. This is a debate about home ownership which my colleague, Minister Madikizela is going to address, but I will just put one point on the table if you look at the document produced by the economist, Mr Schussler, and he shows that already in our country, of first-time home owners 56% are black

and 33% are white. [Interjections.]

If we release RDP homes right now with title deeds like we are doing in this province... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: All the provinces are doing that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...we put another R2 billion worth of assets on the balance sheet of the people of this province. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: National is paying for that.

Ms S W DAVIDS: National is paying for that. National is paying for that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order members, Minister Winde. Hon member Davids, hon member Magaxa!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do not talk nonsense here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, please! Minister Winde, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, let us get to the agriculture component of this debate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Get to your speech.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Get to your speech. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: How serious are the ANC about land reform, really, how serious are they? I believe they are not serious.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We will tell you!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I believe they are not serious one iota because they actually do not care about us. If we have a look at the budget aligned to land reform in this country, specifically after the Committee under the Deputy President that the hon member Schäfer referred to; let us have a look at what budget is available. Of the National Budget, land reform gets 0.4% and of that less than 0.1% is allocated to actual land reform. Of that less than 0.1% is allocated to actual land reform. They are not serious about land reform one iota.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: They failed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: And guess what happens in the Land Reform Department, that budget that is supposed to be going to land reform, what do they spend it on? They have changed it to Agri-parks. They are not even putting it into land. They are putting it into Agri-parks. Now if I was them I would have stood up today and bragged about the success of the Agri-parks. [Interjections.] They cannot even brag about the success of the Agri-parks so they got failure upon failure. If we have a look at the reams and reams of documents on land reform it adds up to 90% failure of land reform in all of the other provinces that the ANC runs, 90% failure.

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] information in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Then we have a look at the Auditor-General. The Auditor-General has just put out the 2017/18 stats that looks at land reform and less than 9% of land reform targets have been met. Again, absolute failure from the ANC's part.

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] to you maybe, 9%.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They talk land. They talk land but they do not care about the people on the ground. They do not care about us - not one iota! [Interjections.]

This debate is actually the ANC being led by the nose by the EFF. Can you believe the ruling party of this country is being led by the nose by the EFF.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that your speech?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They do not care about land reform one iota. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Even Thuli Madonsela... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister, just one second. Hon member Davids, your last opportunity. You are going to miss your speaking turn at the pace you are going on now. Please contain yourself. You are the next speaker. Minister, please continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Even Thuli Madonsela agrees that it has been an absolutely tardy pace of land reform for the last 20 years, total failure of the ANC. Let us have a look at the National Development Plan and what the plan actually says that must happen. If you go to Professor Karaan he says we have to set up these Land Reform Committees that drive land reform in each region. It must be private-sector led.

Guess what? The ANC set up those Land Reform Committees. The concept of District Land Reform Committees was introduced in 2014 to drive land reform within the context of the NDP. Most of these are non-functional due to the lack of budget, number one, again no commitment to land reform, no budget put in place and then guess what the Department does? They do not let the private sector lead it - people who understand farming... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...no ideology...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...who are willing to share their knowledge, their mentorship in making a difference in land reform in this country. [Interjections.] No, they get totally sidelined and who do they bring in? They bring in their mates and their pals to head up those Committees. Not one of those Committees are performing in this province and guaranteed not one of those Committees are performing in any other province of this country. So let us continue with what happens between this province and other provinces with regard to land reform. [Interjections.]

This province is the only province in South Africa that audits land reform; if you cannot measure, how on earth can you manage? We have just heard, the Auditor-General says less than 9% of the projects have been enacted in the 2017/18 financial year... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down if that is your speech; if that is the only thing

you are going to tell us, you should sit down. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Less than 9%. You should be hanging your heads in shame because of that. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: If that is the only thing you are going to tell us...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In this province we get challenged by the National Department to say, "Land reform is our responsibility." I agree. In the ones that we measured, in audit of the land reform projects in this province, who initiated that land transfer? It came from the National Department, but we in this province, in the last few years, have put more than R500 million in support of land reform. That is why we get a 62% success rate. [Applause.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We support those black farmers on their farms.

Mr C M DUGMORE: One percent.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We make sure that they are productive.



Ms M N GILLION: One percent.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Where they fall short we support them. We then add to that. The private sector that I spoke about in those Committees, we add another R80 million to that, not from Provincial Government budget or from land reform budget. That other R80 million comes from the eleven commodity groups in this province, the private sector.

They come on board as well for another R80 million per year support that they give to the National Department's project, but of course the biggest problem of all is around land ownership, and I do not know how many times I have to bring this list of these farmers who have been promised land by that National Department to this House ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] the way you treat our people.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And every single time you read this list, lease expired, no lease, no lease - five, six, seven years in a row... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And that is a lease. We are not even talking about land ownership

here, and of course, is the whole point of this debate not about land ownership?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You do not care about our people out there. You do not care about land ownership in this province. You do not care about land ownership in this country [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: One percent.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And you have proven so. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And now I hear the one percent, and thank you very much for the ANC for raising that one percent. Their Minister has just finished the land audit.

Ms M N GILLION: It is your Minister as well.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: In the Western Cape we actually went in 1994 from nought percent, we are now sitting at 4.9% in this province; 4.9% in this province. This is the land audit, but let us actually have a look at land ownership and why is this land issue becoming such a big debate? Why are you being led by the nose by the EFF? Why are you not standing up proudly stating some of the successes of land ownership in this country? [Interjections.]

KZN went in 1994 from 45.4% to 73.5%. The Free State went from 1.6% to 7.9%, in North West from 34.5% to 45.3%; in Gauteng from nought percent 39.1%; Mpumalanga from 10.6% to 39.7%; Limpopo from 38.6% to 52%. [Interjections.]

Why are you not talking about that? Why are you not mentioning that in international markets? You are being led by the nose by a small minority party, a small minority party called the EFF... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You do not have the guts to stand up. Should I say, you do not have the balls to actually stand up and tell people what is actually happening. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You prefer to go to market with a Mugabe plan. [Interjections.]

That is totally unacceptable to those individuals who have worked damn hard on that piece of land that they have ownership on already. We need to make sure that we put more energy into land ownership in this country but we do not need to make it a negative to bringing investment into our country. We do not need to continue with the debate like this where you are standing up defending the debate, which one would think that you were yourselves talking to the Mugabe handbook... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Davids.

An HON MEMBER: Oh! Oh!

†Me S W DAVIDS: Ja, lekker lag! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, have a good laugh! [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is not surprising that

the MEC Winde is going on like Donald Trump about land reform, because he was the one that sold Tafelsig to the developers, Tafelberg to the developers.

[Interjections.]

It is also not surprising that hon member Schäfer brought this debate. One has to ask why not hon members Madikizela, Maseko, Mnqasela or even Kivedo? [Interjections.]

Does member Schäfer understand or care about the suffering of the landless masses that live as pariahs in the land of their birth? It is clear that the purpose of this debate is to protect minority privileges. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Listen, listen!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: The DA is now posing as defender of the Constitution, denying the profoundly transformative mandate of the Constitution. Section 25 of the Constitution does not make property rights absolute, but it prohibits the state from arbitrarily depriving anyone of property. So, we need to dispel the DA lies of “swart gevaar”. The ANC is not going to chase white people into the sea or take people's property away from them.

For years the DA that is now opposed to the accelerated land reform programme, claimed to be outperforming all other provinces on land reform.

Besides the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform rejecting these claims as baseless, we all know that it is a blue lie of Minister Winde. What the DA wants is further exploitation... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, just one second. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: That was a direct imputation upon Minister Winde, to come and say it is a blue lie.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, a blue lie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If the member said that, it is unparliamentary.

Mr D G MITCHELL: She did say that.

Ms S W DAVIDS: A blue lie, Chief, okay, I will just withdraw the name of Minister Winde, but the DA is telling a blue lie. Fine!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you refer to a specific member in the House?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, Winde... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then you must withdraw the statement.

Ms S W DAVIDS: But I withdraw that, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I will then say it is a blue lie of the DA. What the DA wants is further exploitation of farm workers through the share schemes. We are speaking about the share scheme, one in Drakenstein, the Paarl Road Share Scheme where the people are evicted.

A big developer built houses there that is now costing R1,5 million. What happened to those farmworkers? They are in a *blikkieskamp* in Mbekweni.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Next to the station now, evicted from the land where they grew up, the land that they were working. Why are you not checking that the lands that they are using, that the soil is still good for agriculture but they are using it for big developers in Drakenstein. [Interjections.] If you go to Drakenstein, the whole road up till Drakenstein Prison, you will see Boschenmeer, Paarl Valley and you will see Val de Vie. Where are those farmworkers? In a *blikkieskamp*. [Interjections.]

What the DA wants is further exploitation of farm workers through the Share Scheme. In the Western Cape this model only benefited the skewed landownership to the detriment of farm workers who were robbed of their

dividends and later evictions when the land is sold.

The spate of land evictions in the province gives a clear picture of how the Western Cape fails in land reform. Between January last year and February 2018 this year in the City alone more than 6 600 shacks were demolished and families displaced. This is what the DA understands as land reform! Historically it has always been about taking land away from the majority, for the benefit of a minority.

The resolutions of the ANC in its Nasrec Conference was clear to pursue with greater determination the programme of land reform and rural development as part of the programme of radical socio-economic transformation. Expropriation of land with or without compensation will take place as an instrument in the interest of achieving land redistribution, security of tenure and land restitution. This process will be legal as it will be guided by Sections 25 and 36 of the Constitution.

The ANC will finalise the Expropriation Bill with criteria for when no compensation in the case of expropriation will be just and equitable. For instance unused land, derelict buildings, purely speculative land holding and also where occupants have strong historical rights, like District Six, and title holders do not occupy or use their land, such as labour tenancy, informal settlements and abandoned inner-city buildings.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Al julle *buddies*



[Onhoorbaar.]

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT All your buddies

[Inaudible.]]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is clear that the DA's opposition to expropriation of land is only to protect the unused pockets of land and derelict buildings inside the city which it reserves for big property developers. This fight is not about the rights of the people, hon member MEC Winde. It is for the rights of the big developers' interests. This is what this fight is about, Beverley, because for you and Winde it is only about investment, investment, investment against the humanity. Expropriation with or without compensation will be done in an orderly manner... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: ...to give dignity to the landless masses... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, order! Just finish off, your time has expired. Finish that last sentence.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Okay. It is also crucial as it will address the legacy of apartheid spatial planning where the majority were dumped in distant poverty traps like in Atlantis, Elsies River and Khayelitsha.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member your time has expired.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me thank hon member Schäfer for bringing this motion to the House so that we can set the record straight as the Democratic Alliance about our stance on this matter, but also tell the people of this province and the people of South Africa the real intention by the ANC and EFF for wanting to amend Section 25 of our Constitution.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry, we will tell you about that. Speak about the DA. Do not worry about the ANC. The ANC can speak for itself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, this debate comes just eight days before the 24<sup>th</sup> Freedom Day Commemoration on the 27<sup>th</sup> of April.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which the ANC brought...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I say commemoration and not celebration, because many people of our country have not yet tasted the freedom that we are talking about.

Ms M N GILLION: You forgot. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is because of that freedom that you can sit there.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, what was central to the struggle for freedom was economic emancipation and true land ownership. Now we do know about our history, hon member Magaxa ... [Interjections.]

The key question here is what have we done about it? [Interjections.] What has the ANC done about that particular history that we are talking about? [Interjections.]

We want to make it very clear here, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Joining one party after the other... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We want to make it very clear here, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this Government... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are the most opportunistic under the sun.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...is fully committed and

supports... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, allow the member to speak, please. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: That was a direct imputation on the integrity of the hon Madikizela. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I did not hear, hon member Magaxa, what did you say?

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I said he joins all political parties for his own benefit...

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] ...under this democracy, that is why we have to appreciate democracy, it improved his life.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, please take your seat. You have made your point. [Interjections.] Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: The hon member Magaxa is misleading the House... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no!

The PREMIER: As he did before... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: As he did before, he said that the hon Madikizela is the biggest opportunist there is. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: But he is.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at Hansard and if necessary I will come back to the House on that.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He is.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...you are an opportunist... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am not fazed by...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa. You are testing the Chair now.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am not fazed by this member's pettiness, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Pettiness - that is why you are chasing away [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The truth hurts!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now we want to make it categorically clear, that this Government as my colleagues have said here, is fully committed to land reform both in terms of land restitution. Those people who were dispossessed of their land, they must get their land back or they must be compensated by the State for their land and we are also saying as this Government...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon member Schäfer does not agree with you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, that is your policy.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Land redistribution must be fast-tracked by the Government so that many of our people who are living in ghastly conditions in informal settlements are able to own land. Unfortunately this has not been the case under the ANC Government. [Interjections.] Due to the lack of political will, incompetence and corruption, as it was cited by the High Panel Report, which was chaired by the former President Kgalema Motlanthe. All these things have nothing to do with Section 25 of our Constitution, and let me tell you Mr Deputy Speaker, and tell the people of this province that amending Section 25 will not expedite land reform in South Africa.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Exactly, they do not get that.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This motion to expropriate land without compensation is nothing but a populist posture by the EFF... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...hoping to increase its vote in 2019. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What is wrong with that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Not wanting to be outdone by the EFF the ANC hopes to hide its failures and its being opportunistic by supporting this motion. [Interjections.] The impact of this decision is already felt across the country because we have seen a number of land invasions already because many people are interpreting this motion as a licence to grab land. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The “swart gevaar” again.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Under Dugmore’s leadership.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But Mr Deputy Speaker, let us look closely at this motion because I am worried that many people who are jumping up and down supporting this motion, some of them have not even read the motion itself.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Exactly!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now I want to confine myself to points 4 to 6, and I certainly hope that people read this motion. Point number 4 of this motion is saying:

“We further acknowledge that the current land reform has been fraught with difficulties since its inception in 1994...”



I wonder whose fault that is. [Interjections.]

“...and that the pace of land reform has been slow with only 8% of land transferred to black people since then and that the recent land audit claims that black people own less than 2% of rural land and less than 7% of...”

Well the stats are wrong, but this is an admission by the ANC Government that it has failed our people.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now the fifth point is that it recognises that the centre of the present crisis is Section 25. Now that could not be further from the truth. The property clause protects private property rights and requires the state to pay compensation when expropriating land in public interest for a public purpose. Now I must state it very clearly here - in fact, let us look at what Section 25 says, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Now Section 25 says it merely protects the property rights from arbitrary state interference as the hon member said. Now deprivation that is not arbitrary is permissible, which means land can be expropriated for the public interest and public purpose. Thus compensation remains a requirement for expropriation but not a pre-requisite and therefore this ANC Government cannot hide behind this and say the reason why land reform is slow in South

Africa is because of that. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You want us to buy the land but...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now the issue that has been raised here of the willing selling willing buyer is not in the Constitution. It is the policy position that was taken by the ANC which has failed dismally and there are many reasons as stated in the High Panel Report why the policy has failed. [Interjections.]

Now what you are not telling us hon member Magaxa, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, you speak a lot about land that must be taken from the people who stole it. You do not even know which land you are going to expropriate. You do not even know who owns that land. You do not even know where that land is. [Interjections.] Now then you are posturing, that is my problem here... [Interjections.]

Now the Department of Human Settlements in this province is not only building houses, because that should be the centre of our debate here, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are boasting as this country for having built more than four million houses over the last 24 years... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...which is a good thing, by

the way... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Not in this province.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But what we should be talking about is what are those properties doing to make sure that the people of this country are liberated economically by using those properties, because what is not happening in other provinces, which is what is happening in this province, is that many people are settled into houses without any title deeds, which means they cannot participate in a very wealthy property market in South Africa... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: That is right.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...currently worth R6 trillion. Now that is what we should be talking about. We must not just build houses. We must make sure that people get title deed so that they become part of this property market which is so wealthy in South Africa. Now since 2009, Mr Deputy Speaker, this Government under this Department has given 91 000 title deeds to people and this is very important, because it is a step to address the injustices of the past for those people who were dispossessed of their land.

Now we must make it very clear, that as the DA the reasons why we are opposed to this motion, I have touched some of the reasons, it is our view

and the views of many sober-minded South Africans... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is this whole clause not to be applied to you?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...that Section 25 is not the problem when it comes to land reform in South Africa, but it is the Government, the ANC Government's inability to implement it.

As we said, we have been saying this. This was confirmed by the report which was chaired by Kgalema Motlanthe. This motion says "all land". Now that is another problem here that we have as the Democratic Alliance.

An HON MEMBER: All land.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It says that "all land must be expropriated and be kept by the state." Now the question is, which state? The state that cannot even run a spaza shop, because if you look at all the state-owned enterprises currently, they are all falling apart. Surely we cannot really task the state to administer the land reform and make sure that people are given land properly.

Now this undermines the efforts to economically emancipate black people in particular by taking away the right to own property and subject them to state tenancy. What is even more worrying is that the current state as we have been saying, cannot be trusted, given all the shenanigans that are happening in the

state-owned enterprises. My colleagues have said... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: You sell the land.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: My colleagues have said that if you look at the facts here in terms of the reports... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why did you sell Tafelberg... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: If you look at the facts, Mr Deputy Speaker, because this is what we should be focusing on, if you look at the facts you look at the 90% failure rate nationally. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will give you more facts just now.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now the question is why do you have this failure rate nationally, because it is true that many people... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just listen!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...almost 90% of the people who received land initially have sold that land back. The reason for that is

because this is a box-ticking exercise for the ANC Government.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Those people were never supported with the required skills to make sure that that land becomes productive, but also they were not given the necessary financial assistance to make sure that that land becomes productive, which is something completely opposite to what we are doing in this province as we heard from Minister Winde, the amount of money that we are putting into the land reform so that those people become economically active. Now, another problem that we have is that while we are talking about this issue of expropriating land without compensation, the current Government is even failing to deal with the land claims that are currently before that Department.

Mr D JOSEPH: Uh-huh, yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They are useless!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This was confirmed by the Minister, the former Minister Gugile Nkwinti when he was answering a question in Parliament, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.] ...where he admitted that actually there are more than 6 600 land claims that still remain unresolved and yet we are jumping the gun now. We want to expropriate land. We want the state to be the custodian of this land.

Now over and above that there are 4 300 Government-owned farms that are yet to be distributed by Government to poor South Africans.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Skande!

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now what is the Government doing about that?

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Skande!

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have almost two million hectares of residential land that is owned by Government, which still remain unutilised. What is the Government doing about that? We have your Wingfield, we have your Youngsfield in this province, and we have been talking to the National Government to make sure that they release this land and they are not doing anything about it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is the Premier's fault.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now it is very, very important Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...that we must not play to the gallery about this particular... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister, your time has expired but you can finish your last sentence.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, the last point that I want to make is that we must heed the call and the advice of the current President of Zimbabwe.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He is saying to us as South Africans: "Do not do it." We must learn the lessons from that guy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Bernard Joseph.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw!]



†n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

Mr B D JOSEPH: The deprivation of the black majority of land ownership, economic development and restoration of our dignity, has continued for more than 366 years. It is definitely not doing justice to that criminal act. The Western Cape is notorious for land grabs by white people, they call it encroachment, a trend still ongoing in Stellenbosch, inter alia, and is supposed to take the land in restoring the dignity of our lighter-skinned Afrikaans speaking Africans. They were massively affected by the genocide towards their ancestors, extinguishing languages, cultural values and norms. A massive redevelopment programme has to be initiated and executed by Government to re-establish the lost identify. [Interjections.]

The return of the land to the rightful owners will go a long way to bring back dignity to our once proud owners of property, livestock and individuals making a living from nature, until the white man came and regarded the inhabitants as sub-humans according to the Western standards. The EFF wants land to be returned to the people of South Africa. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which one?

Mr B D JOSEPH: The EFF approach is that land should be transferred to the ownership and custodianship of state, which will administer and use land for sustainable development purpose.

Mr D JOSEPH: Where is the owner?

An HON MEMBER: Oh my word!

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...in line with the Freedom Charter and a new vision of agrarian revolution. [Interjections.]

The state should also provide implements and related extension services to help those who work the land, to use it productively. Furthermore the state's procurement of food should prioritise small scale farmers so that small scale farming becomes a sustainable economic activity. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister. Member, just one second. Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I know that the member does not have a lot of time but would the member take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is the member prepared to take a question? The member has 20 seconds left.

Mr B D JOSEPH: After my input.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: I just wanted to know if he owned his own home or...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, order. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, you may proceed.

Mr B D JOSEPH: May I ask, Mr Deputy Speaker, what is the time left now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Twenty seconds.

An HON MEMBER: You have ten seconds left!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Once the state is in control and custodianship of all land, those who are currently using the land or intend using the land will apply for land-use licences, which should be granted only when there is a purpose for the land being applied for - a maximum of thirty years can be placed on all land leases applied by private co-operations and individuals, of the state...

[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you member, your time has now really expired, with injury time included. Your time has expired.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Can I finish the sentence?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have given you extra time already.

Mr B D JOSEPH: No man, this guy... [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, member Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Can I finish the sentence?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will be lenient. Please continue and finish quickly.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Enkosi kakulu. [Thank you very much.] The people of South Africa and Western Cape in particular want their land back. The DA must stop telling lies about food security, property rights, title deeds, disinvestments to the poor. Rather engage on how best we can expropriate land without compensation, to benefit every single South African. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. That is now finished. The hon member Dyantyi now for his real speech. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker, voor ek vuurwarm kole ingooi... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker, before I throw in hot coals... [Interjection.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am only starting now. †Voor ek warm vuurkole daar in daardie kant gooi, kan ek asseblief iets saggies lees, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. [Before I throw in hot fire coals over there in that side, can I please read something softly, Mr Deputy Speaker.]

Our conference resolution reads:

“The ANC should as a matter of policy pursue expropriation of land without compensation. This should be pursued without destabilising the agricultural sector...”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, just one second. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I know that the hon member thinks he is very important, but the staff do not have to turn on two microphones for him. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: "...without endangering food security in our country and without undermining economic growth and job creation."

Large tracks of land in the Western Cape which is led by the DA are owned by individuals, specifically whites, while black people are crammed into shacks. Now let me give you an example.

In the West Coast there is a farm called Saamstaan. †Ek gee jou die naam, [I give you the name,] Saamstaan Farm, owned by one white man and it stretches from Malmesbury right up near Citrusdal.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek *repeat* daardie:

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I repeat that:] it stretches from Malmesbury right up to Citrusdal, one farm, one white man. This is what the DA does not want us to expropriate without compensation. It is such things. Expropriating this land is non-negotiable. On 21 March on the Human Rights Day the Social Justice Coalition was trying to come to assistance to help you. They marched on Human Rights Day.

They marched for the following things:

- They said you need to prioritise urban land for social housing;
- They also in their memorandum gave you an example that the court

judgment in relation to Marikana, in Philippi had judged that either the City sells that land or expropriate that land and they were recommending to you as JC: let that land be expropriated.

This is what the DA does not want to do because †Marikana se mense kan maar vrek in Philippi. Dis wat hulle sê. Dis wat julle sê. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Marikana's people can die in Philippi. That is what they are saying. That is what you are saying. [Interjections.]]

The DA poses as champion of the Constitution property clause 25 but where was the DA when this constitutional property clause was written? The DA was there protecting the angry white libertarian interest and its representative - and may her soul rest in peace - Dene Smuts was the loudest voice opposing this very same clause.

Ms L M MASEKO: That is nothing...

**(LAND EXPROPRIATION WITHOUT COMPENSATION)**

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The newspaper archives are full of quotes of her opposition in the very same clause the DA professes now to protect. In fact she proclaimed to have voted against it. The old National Party Rep, Sheila Camerer, who later joined the DA, also fought for the provision of that clause. [Interjection.]

Since the DA now wants to preserve the land reform provision of our Constitution, it must know that it wants to retain a variety of requirements that actually allows no compensation when land is expropriated or bought for redistribution, restitution and tenure purposes. [Interjections.] This is what the DA wants to protect and keep untouched. There is no surprise about it.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA was there during the farmworker uprisings in its province, and opposed any increase in minimum wages to these poor and vulnerable people.

Now it again opposes security of tenure of farmworkers and rural development that must come from land reform. The true reason why the, †*die mal DA* [the mad DA] opposes land reform is precisely because it protects the right of mostly white farm owners. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is very clear ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I close, I close.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No-no-no, the hon member is misleading the House. [Interjections.] We are not opposed to land reform. That is what he said. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister – order! You have made your point. It is not a point of order, but you have made your point.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is baie seer. Dis seer.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It hurts very much. It hurts.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is clear the DA does not want to treat all people fairly and justly. It only advances the interest of the [Inaudible.] and big business. The racist DA only mounts this land reform white horse for the sake of right-wing propaganda in order to scare people, and use *swart gevaar* tactics, because traditional white DA supporters are leaving the party in droves. [Interjections.] They are leaving the party in droves as we speak. The DA is a party driven by hate and fear.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And this can be seen in the propaganda it shares on

social media and other media, alarming people about property rights with preposterous and ridiculous views. It does not add value at all. Instead of submitting its argument at the Parliamentary Committee to review the Constitution, this untransformed DA brings hot and verbal salad to this Legislature, as you have been listening.

The DA did not and still does not understand land reform in our context. Perhaps it should invite UWC's †*plaas* [farm] team for a crash course. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So they can understand that. [Interjections.]

The DA prefers gated communities and white reserves across the Metro and other areas. It only sells available prime land to aligned developers. It refuses to confront and change apartheid colonial legacies in our country.

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The liberal DA and many of its so-called libertarian founders were always biased towards land owners, starting with the unqualified suffrage introduced by Helen Suzman and the Liberal Party, knowing that the majority of people in this land were dispossessed and prevented from owning land. How disingenuous can the party be?

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Giving the farms to your friends.

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no-no, do not go there.

An HON MEMBER: Your ANC friends.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA wants to get rid of Cape Town Mayor Patricia de Lille because she is in favour of integrating poor and vulnerable people into leafier areas. Yes, †daardie is die enigste rede waarom, nou sê hulle [that is the only reason why, now they say] “vote of no confidence”, and they are failing. They are going to fail again. She is going to continue, whether you like it or not, she is the man, she decides when she does not want to stay there. [Interjections.]

†Julle is in die sop, man! Julle is in die sop. Julle weet nie wat om te doen omtrent Patricia de Lille nie. Julle weet niks nie! [Applous.] [You are in trouble, man! You are in trouble. You do not know what to do about Patricia de Lille. You know nothing! [Applause.]]

This could break the chain [Interjection.] of apartheid spatial ownership patterns if De Lille succeeds, but they have to get her out because she is

just about to succeed. Viva Patricia, viva! [Interjections.] But the DA does not want that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: All they want is for Patricia to go and we say “Stay, Patricia, stay!” Viva Patricia, viva! †Dankie. [Thank you.] [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please come to order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What was that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mngasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, firstly let us be honest here. You see this document? [Interjections.] It is the DA document on land reform which we took as a resolution in our Federal Congress a few weeks ago. And we are saying in this document ... [Interjections.], we are saying in this document, we need ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we need dignity for black people ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we need growth for the economy, we need more jobs and to sustain the development of all people in this country, and that is what the ANC does not understand. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Now furthermore, hon members speak here and they talk about all fancy things, but let me just tell you that as it was said earlier, only 0,14% was budgeted by the National Government to expedite the programme of land reform. Are you really serious? 0,14% [Interjections.]. We have not started. No-no-no, wait.

Ms M N GILLION: We will see you in court.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now when you talk about well-located private land and you want to expropriate, you must really ask hon member Dugmore, maybe he can answer that. [Interjections.] Hon member Magaxa says here ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: You are already in big trouble.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that the DA of P W Botha and Helen Suzman – I will just take Helen Suzman and [Inaudible.] her.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: But you must ask hon member Uys who P W Botha is. [Interjection.] I thought that as a person who is a trained history teacher you would know better. I am worried about those students you taught history in Luxolo High School. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC talks here, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You think you can rewrite the history?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... about black people, but they are not referring to the Khoisan.

Ms M N GILLION: He said [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: They are not referring to the Korana, they are not

referring to the Cape Khoi, they are not referring to the †Griekwas [Griquas] ... [Interjections.] they are not referring to the Nama, because for the ANC it is about the majority and majoritarianism. [Interjections.] We are talking here about the rights of all people in this country, including the minorities in South Africa. [Applause.]

Now let us come to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... hon member Davids.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon member Davids says ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: It is intolerable, hon member Davids, she carries on like a machine gun. She has had her turn to speak, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can we go ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I take your point and I agree. The hon member Davids, you have had your turn, please contain yourself with interjections. It is becoming a running commentary now.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit maak seer!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It hurts!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela, you may continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me give a lecture to hon member Davids. You know, she was the Mayco member for Rural Development in Drakenstein Municipality. [Interjections.] She can tell this House now if I am not telling the truth. She never gave anyone any rural development kind of a benefit.

HON MEMBERS: Ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: You never gave anyone a house when you were there ... [Interjection.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Mr M MNQASELA: You never gave anyone ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... a farm when you were there. In fact what the ANC did – we have the Val de Vie development that she is referring to and



giving it to the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.] Hon member Uys may have signed that development to the rich because he was here as the Minister and hon member Dyantyi later came in. [Interjections.] Here he was the Minister. They know nothing about poor people. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The Paarl Valley that hon member Davids talks about, it was her own ANC Government that signed that development, removing black people, poor people, Coloured people, because they were poor, working in the fields. [Interjections.] You removed them. You ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... gave it to rich friends of yours. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just come to order before you continue. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member, you may continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now we are talking about all of this private land. We must ask hon member Uys ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... in 1999 ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, we cannot continue like this.

Mr M MNQASELA: We must ask hon member Uys in 1999, when, before the amalgamation of municipalities in Overstrand, that side ...  
[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: He speaks about Uys.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... they have given one, two, three, four, five, six – seven parcels of land to one company. [Interjections.] One developer. And, hon member Uys, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, they allowed this private company to develop all well-located land. [Interjections.] You see, hon member Uys is a person to ask about well-located land. [Interjections.]

Now when the ANC took over in 2002, the DA Government, we kept that relationship, wanting to change it. Before we did it, the ANC came in 2002. What did they do? They continued.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

Mr M MNQASELA: They continued to service only the rich. In 2006 when we came in, then we started to say let us change this nonsense.

An HON MEMBER: Hayi man!

Mr M MNQASELA: We took all this land from one person and only transferred one piece of land to this gentleman. [Interjections.] And that was this Schalk [Inaudible.] that you are talking about. [Interjections.] And we are resolving it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Because only the DA cares about all people, only the DA cares about ... [Interjection.] white people, about black people about Coloured people, because we know that South Africa needs to embrace all people in this country and only we know it better. Nobody else. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Lastly, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... there has been some fabrication of the truth. [Interjections.] And now someone comes here with some economics and says that one person owns the land between Malmesbury and Cederberg.

An HON MEMBER: Uh-huh!

Mr M MNQASELA: I would say that person is not telling the truth. [Interjections.] Because there are multiple farmers that own land there, not

just one person.

Now what we need, they must employ researchers. [Interjections.] You need to employ proper researchers. I am worried about you ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Saam staan!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stand together!]

Mr M MNQASELA: It is disappointing that we have got the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... here that cannot debate anything.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Saam staan!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stand together!]

Mr M MNQASELA: It is embarrassing. It is disappointing. [Interjections.]  
EFF ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: I cannot even start about you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: I cannot even start about you. [Interjections.] It is a joke.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Saam staan [Onhoorbaar.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stand together [Inaudible.]]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order now. [Interjections.] Order! This debate is now concluded. We move on to the next topic.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daardie is baie swak [Onhoorbaar.].

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is very poor [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We move on to Interpellations. Hon member Davids, I am also talking to you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And whoever is busy with you. Minister Winde,

hon member Mnqasela, please attend now. We move on to Interpellations. The first interpellation will not be dealt with by agreement. We move on to the second interpellation. Hon member Maseko to Minister Madikizela. I see Minister Madikizela.

*[Interpellation 1 not dealt with.]*

## **INTERPELLATIONS:**

### *Belhar CBD Project: challenges faced*

#### **1. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

- (a) What are the challenges faced by the Belhar CBD project and (b) how do they impact on the time frames?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. My Department has requested USDG or Urban Settlement Development Grant Funding in the amount of R275 million from the City of Cape Town, and to date the City has approved R127 million, resulting in a substantial financial shortfall.

This has been mitigated in the interim by making changes to the project programme and moving the planned Symphony Way Road dwellings forward until funding becomes available to proceed. Also, in terms of acquiring development rights, the project has and is still experiencing major processing

delays at a municipal level in securing statutory approvals.

The developer is required to obtain approvals, amongst others, for site development plans and building plans before construction can commence. The operating procedure to obtain referred approvals, especially bearing in mind that the magnitude of a project yielding 4,188 units, can be a tedious process that has a major impact on project delivery deadlines.

On average the delay so far is about six months. The extent of the project site covers two municipal wards, for which there are a number of local builders forums, and of course as we know in developments of this nature, there are always conflicts between people who want to be accommodated in the development in terms of labour and in terms of subcontracting, which is a normal type of challenge that we face.

These factors have caused numerous threats on site and tools down and contractor strikes that have gone as far as the site being closed by forums to prevent any activity on the site. These events have called for urgent intervention and engagement between my Department, the developer and subcontractors.

These actions by local forums cause the developer to take strain in meeting interim targets and essential deadlines, contributing to the Departments' overall service delivery. To date these delays have caused a three month delay to the project programme. Amongst other problems that we have there

is a water shortage, because as a result of the restricted use of municipal water the developer was forced to sink boreholes, requiring a water use licence that resulted in a 14 day project delay.

These losses of water also has an impact on the wet works production. On the liquidation of subcontractors, the contractor commissioned to undertake the construction of bulk, civil and [Inaudible.] services was liquidated around 15 December 2017. Although a new contractor was appointed in February 2018, the pump station for sewerage was not timeously completed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired for the first chance. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Belhar CBD programme is a truly ground-breaking project and is a catalytic mixed use, high density and different income level residential project. This clearly demonstrates that the DA-led Western Cape Government is committed to social cohesion, because people from different backgrounds are brought into one community.

It is therefore clear for all to see that not only are we building houses but we are also integrating communities.

What makes this project so unique is that it includes BMG housing opportunities, rental units, student accommodation and there is a police



housing programme and military veterans. To date 630 social housing units have been developed and have been rented out, and approximately 1,000 open market rental units are under construction.

As the Minister mentioned, however, the only challenge that we are currently sitting with is the beneficiary housing list, which must be vetted by the National Department of Military Veterans. Let us be clear, the development is happening, but the issue is the ANC-led National Government, because from this project the military veterans have to benefit. It is failing to vet and to identify who are the beneficiaries. We do have, by the way, a Department that strictly deals with military veterans.

Now as a reminder to my colleagues across the floor, the list of military veterans has to be vetted by the Department to identify the beneficiaries, not by us in the DA-led Western Cape Government or any of our municipalities.

The sad situation is that the military veterans seem to be unknown to this Department. Identifying beneficiaries and providing veterans with homes has become a prolonged process ... [Interjection.] and this is the Government that says they can champion land reform.

This underscores how badly the ANC-led National Government is performing. After nearly 24 years they have no idea who should be benefitting, as a military veteran, from housing. However, as much as this has been a challenge for the Department, this programme has managed to build 102 units

for military veterans.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this particular development will lead to the establishment of social and gap housing, which the City really needs at this stage.

Now my question to the Minister is regarding the abovementioned and to date, does the Department have a clear indication of how many veterans will be beneficiaries within the Western Cape? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC, hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, but, Mr Deputy Speaker, just a point of order. If you look at the question on the Paper:

“What are the challenges faced by the Belhar CBD project and how they impact on the timeframes.”

The last point from hon member Maseko I think is a new question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, it is part of the debate, so I cannot rule on that one.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Ms S W DAVIDS: But I do not understand the Chair of the Standing Committee bringing this question here today. [Interjections.] because we recently awarded vast additional amounts ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: You will never understand.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... in the Adjustment Budget and the Annual Budget to the Belhar CBD project. The Chair should know that, and also should know that National Government, in fact, brought real funding. But one knows why she is anxious about that project. It is because the DA is very bad at spending budgets and especially sticking to timeframes.

We see clearly in the media reports that Cape Town, under DA management, failed the people of the Metro dismally. According to those reports, Mayor Patricia de Lille is in trouble with the DA caucus, because she wrote a letter to her Mayoral Committee members and told them to work harder.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: They fell behind in spending more than ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... R4 billion ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] You raised a point about what the hon member said, but you are now totally off the point as well.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is on the point, because it is the money that was supposed to be spent on the CBD that was not spent.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, carry on.

Ms S W DAVIDS: They fell behind in spending more than R4 billion on the Capital Budget and with only two months to go, they have already spent or committed to less than half of the total Budget. It is a disgrace and shows the DA does not care to bring services and relief to the poorest residents. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Maseko.

Mr M G E WILEY: That was it.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think for the past two sittings I have been talking about the Belhar CBD programme, because it is one of the benchmarking integrated developments that we have really championed in Human Settlements. Hon member Davids definitely knows that. In the Belhar CBD you have all the programmes that are really

showcasing integrated development and taking communities, whether poor or rich, allowing them to live together, to have co-dependency on each other.

On the issue of the money that she mentions is being spent, she is also part of the Standing Committee that is doing oversight. We have never seen an underspending there. She knows if there is one project that the Department of Human Settlements, with the City, has championed, besides the challenges that are there, it is the Belhar CBD.

Ms M N GILLION: Huh? It seems like it is about you.

Ms L M MASEKO: Okay. So building with mortar and brick only forms a structure, hon member Davids, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, but the Provincial Department of Human Settlements is about building communities, and that is being showcased in the Belhar CBD. This project, the Belhar CBD project, is the epitome of integrated development. It is about creating a co-dependent, interactive community who helps and supports one another.

Ms M N GILLION: That is why the community is in the street.

Ms L M MASEKO: My question therefore is how do we make our communities understand the value of ownership of their homes and how long will it take for the beneficiaries of this project to receive their title deeds so that they can also be included in the economic mainstream of the

Province of the Western Cape?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired. Hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Minister spoke about the challenges of that project – the municipal level development site plan, building plans that are not approved. In regard to funding he said they are working together with the municipality, but there is a shortage of funding. He said that the deadline is delayed by six months and then he also had a problem with the local forums that are posing a challenge.

So I am saying, Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA can only blame itself for the problems, because the local municipality is DA governed. The DA should not come and tell us what problems or challenges it has. It should bring and implement solutions. The DA does not volunteer to govern. DA people, in all positions, are paid to do the job. The DA is handsomely rewarded to bring solutions to the table. That is your job, DA. But the DA complains so much ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member ...

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is more interested in helping big developers ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Your time has expired.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... make more money.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA is building houses for communities in the Western Cape. The DA is improving the living conditions of the people of the Western Cape. [Interjection.] What the Department needs to do, is continue to prioritise the need for all stakeholders to understand their partnership expectations and requirements in relation to Government functions. [Interjections.] This is the responsibility not of the Department or the DA, the ANC also. [Interjections.]

This ensures mutual beneficial outcomes which form the basis of the partnership agreements. When you build houses you create partnerships with the communities.

I commend Minister Madikizela for exceedingly creative, liveable, accessible, safe, resilient and multi-opportunity settlements. [Interjections.] This is a good indication of when good governance makes a huge difference under the ... (intervention)

An HON MEMBER: No [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: All of a sudden now you praise the MEC. It is almost

like [Inaudible.].

Ms L M MASEKO: Again you did not ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... hear that. This is a good indication of when good governance makes a huge difference under the DA Government. That is exactly what we are implementing.

Ms M N GILLION: That is what you are trying [Inaudible.].

Ms L M MASEKO: The Belhar CBD is an example of good governance ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You do not [Inaudible.].

Ms L M MASEKO: ... and getting value for our money. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now this question was directed to Minister Madikizela, the Minister of Human Settlements in the Province.



Now Minister Madikizela, since 2009, has never sent a single cent back to the Treasury. I need to correct that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now when you talk about failure to ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: All the DA [Inaudible.] to spend.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... spend, I think that comment is misdirected.

Now the reason why we are responding to these challenges is because they are there, but we are not responding in the manner in which I did because we want to complain. The questions were asked and I am responding, but we are always faced with these challenges, and we put measures in place to make sure that ultimately houses are built, ultimately the budget is spent.

If you look at the current expenditure of this Department as I am speaking to you now, it is 100%. In fact it is more than 100%, because we received an additional R100 million from the National Department and we have spent it.

So let us not then give the impression that this Department is sending

money back.

Ms M N GILLION: And let us not [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Not a single cent since I took over this Department, was sent back to the National Treasury.

Now some of the issues that were raised here; hon member Davids, the letter that you are speaking about, if my CFO failed to spend the money, I cannot go out there and grandstand and lambast my CFO in the media. I must take responsibility, as the leader of this Department. [Interjection.]

You cannot then praise ... [Interjection.] – yes. You cannot then praise someone who publicly lambasts the people who are reporting to her. You must take responsibility if the people who are reporting to you are not doing their work. Let us not grandstand.

That is why if there is something wrong in my Department, I will never come here and say: “No, it is not me. It is my HOD or my CFO.” Ultimately I am responsible for what is happening in this Department. If things are good I must take credit for it, if things are bad I must take responsibility for it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is the end of this interpellation. We move on to the next one. Hon member Max to Minister Marais. I see Minister Marais.

*The Rural Library Connectivity Project: challenges and benefits*

**2. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

(b) What are the (a) challenges and (b) benefits of the Rural Library Connectivity Project?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, agb lid Max, vir die interpellasie.

Die uitdagings kan 'n kombinasie van 'n wye spektrum van faktore wees, insluitende die volgende:

- Die beskikbaarheid van 'n internetvoetspoor in afgeleë landelike gebiede.
- Geen internettoegang as gevolg van tegnologie-verwante probleme aan die kant van die diensverskaffer.
- Gebrek aan hulpbronne en/of vertraagde tegniese ondersteuning.

- Vertraagde installering van meubels en elektriese kables aan die kant van die munisipaliteit wat die installering van die toerusting vertraag.
- Gebrek aan gemeenskapsbetrokkenheid en ondersteuning wat lei tot inbrake en/of skade aan toerusting. Dit is die misdadefaktor wat altyd in ag geneem moet word.
- Kabeldiefstal.
- Veilige bewaring en versekering van toerusting by biblioteke.
- Langtermynvertraging as gevolg van die afhanklikheid van breëband konnektiwiteit in gevalle van biblioteekopgraderings en waar nuwe biblioteke gebou is.

Die voordele is:

- Die verskaffing van inligting- en kommunikasietegnologie aan landelike Wes-Kaapse openbare biblioteke.
- Werkskepping.
- Die gemeenskap kan die hulpbronne by die biblioteek gebruik om aansoek te doen vir werk wat die totale aantal werklose jeugdige tot 'n minimum beperk.
- Geregistreeerde universiteitstudeute kan die hulpbronne by biblioteke gebruik om navorsing te doen, werkopdragte in te handig en aanlyn toetse te doen.
- En dit verbind die biblioteek met die wêreld.

Baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Max, for the interpellation.

The challenges can be a combination of a wide spectrum of factors, including the following:

- The availability of an internet footprint in remote rural areas.
- No internet access as a result of technology related problems on the side of the service provider.
- Lack of resources and/or delayed technical support.
- Delayed installation of furniture and electrical cables on the side of the municipality that delays the installation of the equipment.
- Lack of community involvement and support leading to break-ins and/or damage to equipment. It is the crime factor that always has to be taken into account.
- Cable theft.
- Safekeeping and insurance of equipment by libraries.
- Long term delays as a result of the dependence on broadband connectivity in cases of library upgrades and where new libraries have been erected.

The benefits are:

- The provision of information and communication technology to rural Western Cape public libraries.
- Job creation.
- The community can use the resources at the library to apply for jobs which limits the total number of jobless youth to a minimum.
- Registered university students can use the resources at libraries to do research, submit assignments and do tests online.
- And it connects the library with the world.

Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie. Die agb lid Max.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Max.]

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On the basis of what the Minister just told this House, I must say I must compliment the Minister for the outstanding effort to provide rural communities in the Western Cape with libraries equipped with broadband and Wi-Fi.

Now this commitment is underpinned by the DA's aim to uplift the poorest of the society and provide an open opportunity society for all. I am of the view, hon Minister, that you will ensure that the outstanding 41 libraries will be upscaled, because your commitment to the development and upliftment of

rural communities is demonstrated by this project so far.

I am further of the view that providing internet connection to the Western Cape rural libraries will:

- Ensure improved literacy rates, as beneficiaries will have access to internet and e-Books.
- Enhance job opportunities as beneficiaries will be able to search and apply for jobs online – as you indicated.
- Improve classroom performance as students from poorer households use the internet in school assignments.
- Stronger small business as entrepreneurs with limited internet access can research their market better and engage in online market sales.

Now in the light of what you have said, hon Minister, and the DA's commitment and efforts to ensure that rural communities have access to connected libraries, I want to ask you, hon Minister, how many people per community have accessed their local library's internet? It is one thing to have it there, on the other hand you have to ensure that people are aware of this benefit and make use of it. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. †Die agb lid Gopie. [The hon member Gopie.]

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The libraries in rural

communities are the only sources that there are for unemployed youth and for students that need to use the facilities. There are insufficient computers in those libraries to be used by both unemployed youth and students.

Also, the time that is allotted per person, especially for the youth who must do their assignments and research, is insufficient. Then on top of it there is a fee that is charged for printing, a fee of R1.20 per page.

So we are not really assisting the rural community if a child that is being supported by a grant or sometimes a child that is being supported by a grandmother, that must still be fed, also has to do an assignment at R1.20 per page.

I do not know if the Minister knows how many computers there are per rural library, and how many – like now, the Chairperson was asking how many people are being serviced by those? So how many computers are servicing the amount that the Minister is now going to answer?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has also expired. †Die agb lid Max. [The hon member Max.]

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, what the Minister actually said is very reassuring, that our communities have access to libraries and internet facilities, and as I mentioned before, having access to internet ensures a higher literacy rate, a higher employment rate, improves students'



performance in classrooms, and the development of small-scale entrepreneurs.

Now I must also, as Chairperson of the Committee, then assist the Department in requesting both rural and non-rural areas to engage their communities through proper communication, for example posters, school bulletins, local papers and advertising boards to inform residents of the benefits of libraries and internet access.

I also call on local libraries and their communities to host ICT seminars where possible, so that residents can truly reap the benefits of these facilities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, when I studied Advanced Customary Law, they said in literacy, before Customary Law was codified – when an old man died it was like a library burning down.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr L H MAX: Because it was a nodal point of knowledge. Now these libraries are our nodal point of knowledge for our communities.

Nonetheless I am pleased to hear that there has been a positive response from our people, as the Minister indicated, but I would also like to ask the Minister how are these libraries informing their communities of their services

as I indicated before? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Gopie again.

Ms D GOPIE: The Chair is speaking about more people being serviced. That will not solve the challenges that we are facing... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Ja.

Ms D GOPIE: ... in the rural communities.

An HON MEMBER: What are the challenges at this point?

Ms D GOPIE: Because there are challenges at the moment. We have a lot of unemployed youth, we have a lot of students who need the only library that is in that community. The time is insufficient for those students and unemployed youth that are already using that library. To get more people to come to the library will not solve the problem.

We need to have more computers, we need to have more time for those students, we need to have no fees especially for the students that are poor. A student that is poor, that needs to get to that library, to do research, to print an assignment, if that grandma says: "I do not have R10," then that child cannot hand in his assignment, and that child can fail.

So we need to work on a mechanism to get rid of this challenge ...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms D GOPIE: ... of charging a fee.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. †Agb lid Max. [Hon member Max.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not [Inaudible.].

Mr L H MAX:.. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. You know, if I can recall during the Appropriation Debate, the Minister also alluded to this, as well as her input now on this question. The only inference I can get to, from the Minister's response, is that the DA-led Government and this Department are moving towards making the Western Cape the sports and cultural centre of South Africa, and are creating conditions for access and mass participation, talent identification and skills development.

Now for this I must commend the Minister and the Department. But I have to ask, although I am satisfied with the performance of the Department and the leadership of the Minister, it is important that the Minister informs us, as part of your evaluation, hon Minister, on the libraries connected so far; what has the feedback been from our communities?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Did you hear what hon member Gopie said?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Marais.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you.]

†'n AGB LID: Jou tjank is afgetrap.

[An HON MEMBER: You were put in your place.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: The Rural Library Connectivity Project received a cash injection from broadband funds during the 2013/14 financial year, and managed to procure equipment for 83 new sites, and reflects equipment for a further 40 existing sites, and during the remaining four years, the project continues to expand their services to 16, 15, five and three sites respectively. In total 223 libraries have benefited from this project.

Our funding comes from conditional grants, the library service equitable share ring-fenced funding, and then the Western Cape Government Broadband Project.

†Wat betref die gebruik van die biblioteke, ek het nie die presiese getal nie, agb lid Max, maar ek kan vir u uitvind, maar met my besoeke, en ek doen dit gewoonlik onaangekondig, is ons biblioteke vol, en dit laat my kom by die

probleem dat wat gebeur is dat die kinders dan, of dan die studente, beperk word tot 'n sekere tyd om te werk op die rekenaar om almal kans te gee. Maar daar is toegewyde personeel wat dit baie goed bestuur, en ek weet ook dat daar waar daar probleme is met van ons kinders wat werklikwaar nie die papier kan betaal nie, help die personeel wel vir hulle, en as daar gevalle is wat u spesifiek van weet, kan u asseblief vir my daarvoor laat weet dan kan ons kyk wat ons in daardie gevalle kan doen.

Dan wil ek net vir u sê ons is verbind om dit uit te rol na die meeste van ons biblioteke toe, so ver as wat ons befondsing dit toelaat, en die internet, ek dink ek het dit genoem, die internet verseker dat dit gebruik word. Ek weet byvoorbeeld in Beaufort-Wes is daar van die kinders wat tot vyf kilometer ver kom net in die middag om by die biblioteek te kan wees, en ons biblioteke is gewoonlik heeltemal vol, en ek wil u nooit om van ons biblioteke te gaan besoek. Ek weet in Avian Park, waar daar nou geweldig probleme is, is die biblioteek die veilige hawe vir ons kinders en vir ons ouer mense om te besoek, en dan ook in Abbotsdale en Malmesbury is daar 'n pragtige biblioteek. Dis maar net twee van die 223, en ek het die lys as u dit graag wil hê. Baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Regarding the use of the libraries, I do not have the exact number, hon member Max, but I can enquire for you, but during my visits, and I usually do it unannounced, our libraries are full, and that brings me to the problem

that what happens then is that the children or the students are restricted to work on the computer for a certain time to allow everyone a chance. But there are dedicated staff who manage it very well, and I know that where there are problems with some of our children who honestly cannot pay for the paper, the staff assist them indeed, and if there are cases that you specifically know of, you can please inform me then we can see what we can do in those cases.

Then I just want to tell you that we are committed to roll it out to most of our libraries, as far as our funding allows it, and the internet, I think I have mentioned it. The internet ensures that it is being used. I know for instance in Beaufort West there are children who come from as far as five kilometres away to be at the library only in the afternoons, and our libraries are usually completely full, and I would like to invite you to visit some of our libraries. I know in Avian Park, where there are serious problems at the moment, the library is a safe harbour for our children and for our older people to visit, and then there is also a lovely library in Abbotsdale and Malmesbury. These are only two of the 223, and I have the list if you would like to have it. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, Minister Marais, u tyd is nou ook verstreke.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Marais, your time has now also expired.]

That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We move on to Questions on the Question Paper. The first one, hon member Joseph again to Minister Marais. I see Minister Marais.

## QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

### *Malay choirs, Christmas choirs and Cape Minstrels*

#### **\*1. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

Whether the (a) Malay choirs, (b) Christmas choirs and the (c) Cape Minstrels receive money for their cultural programmes directly from her Department; if not, why not; if so, (i) what criteria must these organisations comply with to receive funding and (ii) what feedback does her Department receive?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, agb lid Joseph.

Die Departement ondersteun jaarliks die Maleierkore, Kerskoorrade en Kaapse Klopse-rade met 'n finansiële bydrae tot die geleentheid van die Tweede Nuwejaar, sowel as die kompetisies waaraan hulle deelneem.

Wat betref die organisasies, dit is die tweede deel van die vraag. Die organisasies moet voldoen aan die vereistes vir nie-regeringsorganisasies, sowel as die finansiële voorvereistes soos bepaal, ten einde toegang tot befondsing te verkry. Dit sluit onder andere in dat die organisasie

geregistreer moet wees, 'n bankrekening in die naam van die organisasie moet hê, bewys moet lewer van effektiewe, doeltreffende en deursigtige finansiële bestuur en die Departement van 'n sakeplan en verwante dokumentasie moet voorsien. Hulle moes ook voldoen het aan alle voorwaardes vir toelaes wat in die verlede ontvang is en die finansiële en narratiewe verslae, soos vereis, ingedien het, en die organisasies wat finansiering ontvang moet die nodige terugvoeringsverslae indien en waar moontlik moet personeel die geleenthede bywoon.

Verdere terugvoering kom van mediadekking en persoonlike besoeke. Baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Joseph.

The Department annually supports the Malay choirs, Christmas choir councils and Cape Minstrels councils with a financial contribution to the Second New Year event, as well as the competitions they participate in.

With regard to the organisations, that is the second part of the question. The organisations have to adhere to the requirements for non-governmental organisations, as well as the financial prerequisites as determined to gain access to funding. That includes inter alia that the organisation must be



registered, have a bank account in the name of the organisation, show proof of efficient, effective, and transparent financial management and provide the Department with a business plan and related documentation. They also should have adhered to all conditions for grants received in the past and have submitted the financial and narrative reports as required, and the organisations receiving financing must submit the necessary feedback reports and staff should, where possible, attend the events.

Further feedback comes from media coverage and personal visits. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Die agb lid Joseph.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Joseph.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Baie dankie aan die Minister vir die antwoord op hierdie vraag. Ek wil net by die Minister weet of daar inter-regeringsverhoudinge bestaan tussen die Provinsie en die Stad Kaapstad, en of daar ook gepraat word oor die verskillende behoeftes van hierdie organisasie? Want elkeen se behoeftes is natuurlik verskillend, en natuurlik is daar ook 'n verskillende finansiële model wat ook bepaal hoe hulle hulle besigheidsplanne saamstel.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the Minister

for the reply to this question. I just want to know from the Minister if inter-governmental relations exist between the Province and the City of Cape Town, and if the various needs of this organisation are being discussed? Because everyone's needs are of course different, and of course there is also a different financial model that determines how they draw up their business plans.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Minister Marais?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Marais?]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb lid Joseph. Die verhouding tussen die Provinsiale Departement van Kultuursake en Sport, in hierdie geval nou Kultuur, is professioneel tussen ons en die Stad, en die kwessies wat probleme sou wees word bespreek en ons het dan ook gereelde vergaderings met die Maleierkore, die Kerskoorrade en die Kaapse Klopse-rade om die verhouding glad te laat verloop sodat hierdie gebeurtenisse kan plaasvind sonder enige haakplekke.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Joseph. The relationship between the Provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, now in this instance Culture, is professional between us and the City, and the issues that could be problems are discussed, and we then have regular meetings with the Malay choirs, the Christmas choir

councils and the Cape Minstrels councils to smoothen the relationship so that these events can occur without any hitches.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Joseph.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Net die laaste punt op hierdie vraag, ek wil graag weet, net verder gaan op die finansiële model. Die Minister het wel al die kriteria wat nagevolg moet word aangedui, maar ek wil net weer daarna verwys dat elke organisasie ook 'n verskillende behoefte het, byvoorbeeld sommige van hierdie kulturele aktiwiteite gebeur in die stad, en sommige gebeur op die platteland, met ander woorde hulle moet verafstande ry, en daar is uniforms, daar is ander administratiewe koste, daar is instrumente wat baie duur is wat hierdie organisasies gebruik. Ek wil weet of dit ook in ag geneem word as deel van die kriteria? Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Just the last point on this question, I would like to know, going further on the financial model. The Minister did indicate all the criteria that have to be followed, but I just want to point out that every organisation has a different need, for example some of these cultural activities occur in the city, and some occur on the platteland, in other words they have to travel far distances, and there are uniforms, there are other administrative costs, there are instruments that are very expensive

that these organisations are using. I would like to know if that is also considered as part of the criteria? Thank you.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, agb lid Joseph. Ja, dit word in ag geneem. Gewoonlik is die besigheidsplanne of die versoeke wat ons kry van die verskillende rade afgebreek in presies wat hulle nodig het, so ons kyk daarna, want elkeen, soos ek sê, het sy eie behoeftes en ons befonds na aanleiding van ons befondsing wat ons beskikbaar het, en volgens hulle behoefte.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Joseph. Yes, it is taken into account. Usually the business plans or the requests we receive have been broken down into precisely what they need, so we look at that, because everyone, as I have said, has his own needs and we fund according to our funding we have available, and according to their needs.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Gopie, is dit 'n opvolgvraag?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, is it a follow-up question?]

†Me D GOPIE: Ja.

[Ms D GOPIE: Yes.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Jy kan voortgaan.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.]

†Me D GOPIE: Ek wil net weet van die Minister, behalwe hierdie organisasies wat hier gelys is, is daar ander organisasies wat nuwe organisasies is wat aansoek doen, en is daar enige hulp aan hulle verskaf, en as hulle afgewys is, gaan die Departement terug na daardie mense toe en sê wat die redes is dat hulle afgewys is? Waaraan moet hulle werk? Wat moet hulle *correct* en so aan?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Ms D GOPIE: I just want to know from the Minister, apart from these organisations listed here, are there other organisations that are new organisations applying, and was there any assistance provided to them, and if they have been turned down, does the Department go back to those people and tell them what the reasons are why they have been turned down. What do they have to work on? What do they have to correct and so on?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Minister Marais.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Marais.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, agb lid Gopie. Ja, daar is van hierdie, ek wil amper sê kleiner organisasies wat aansoek doen op 'n gereelde basis. Ons kry byna daaglik versoeke, en ons gaan terug na

hulle toe. Van dié wat byvoorbeeld met die jaarprogram aansoek gedoen het en nie befondsing gekry het nie, gaan ons na terug en sê ons ook waarom kon ons nie vir hulle geld gee nie, en indien ons, die Departement, die vorms ontvang en daar is sekere vorms of inligting nie beskikbaar nie, dan vra ons vir hulle om dit te stuur voordat die Departement daaroor besluit, ja.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you hon member Gopie. Yes, there are some of these, I almost want to say smaller organisations applying on a regular basis. We almost daily receive requests, and we go back to them. To some of those who for instance have applied with the yearly programme and did not receive funding, we go back to and tell them why we could not give them money, and if we, the Department, receive it and there are certain forms or information not available, then we ask them to send it before the Department decides on it, yes.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Die laaste vraag, agb lid Gopie.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last question, hon member Gopie.]

†Me D GOPIE: Na hoe 'n lang tydperk gaan die Departement terug na die organisasie wat aansoek gedoen het?

[Ms D GOPIE: After how long a period does the Department go back to the organisation that has applied?]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Die ideale tyd sê ons is sewe dae dat hulle moet teruggaan. Ek weet daar is gevalle waar dit nie gebeur het nie, waarvoor ons persoonlik om verskoning gevra het, want sekere aspekte het langer geneem om op antwoord te gee, maar ons gaan terug na almal toe. Maar die ideale tyd is sewe dae om te sê ons erken ontvangs, en of daar probleme is wat reggestel moet word.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: The ideal time we say is seven days to go back. I now there were instances where it did not happen, for which we have personally apologised, because certain aspects took longer to reply to, but we go back to them all. But the ideal time is seven days for us to acknowledge receipt and to say that there are problems that have to be rectified.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the second question. Hon Joseph to Minister Meyer, the Minister of Finance. Minister Meyer.

*VAT increase: impact of*

**2. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Finance:**

What is the impact of the 1% VAT increase on (a) the economy, (b) the poor and (c) the Western Cape Government's Budget for the 2018/19 financial year?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The question of the Chair of the Standing Committee on Finance has a specific context. The 1% VAT increase is therefore a context which we need to unpack in this House. The ANC has looted taxpayers' money. The ANC has mismanaged SARS with a R48 billion less tax collection. The ANC has caused an additional R48 billion fruitless and wasteful expenditure as reported by the Auditor-General. The ANC has also created a bloated civil service that now cost us R580 billion. As a result of the ANC mismanagement, the ANC Government is now punishing the poor with a 1% VAT increase.

Mr Deputy Speaker and members, the National Treasury has confirmed that they are implementing these tax measures in response to the ANC unsustainable debt, and I am quite shocked that they are so open about it. It is in this document that was tabled in the National Assembly, but more so, it also confirms that your ANC National Government confirmed that increasing taxes in a low-growth context, when South Africans are struggling, is not desirable. This is again an indication and confirmation of the ANC National Government that the 1% VAT increase is not desirable, it is in this book.

Your ANC Government has also confirmed that corruption and wasteful expenditure under the ANC has eroded the taxpayers' morality. It is all here in this book.



Mr Deputy Speaker, VAT is therefore a type of consumption tax ...  
[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Double standards.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that is charged ... [Interjections].

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay. I will lecture you. You ask for a  
lecture.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] from that 1%.

An HON MEMBER: Not from you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon member.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I cannot be lectured by [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You asked for a lecture, it is free.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Not by you [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Continue please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, VAT ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: If you were not an opportunist, I would allow it.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Lekker ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a workshop, listen.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... you have asked for a free lecture, it is coming.

An HON MEMBER: A workshop.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I do not need that lecture.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Lekker, VAT is a type of consumption tax ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: People who are living in the informal settlements ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Lekker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, speak through the Chair please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, VAT is a consumption tax that is charged at the gross margin, and what this means, when you charge a tax at the gross margin, it means that you collect tax at every stage in the production–manufacturing-distribution-sales process of an item. For example, hon member – what is your surname again?

An HON MEMBER: Hayi, man!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Davids. [Interjections.] Hon member Davids, that jacket that you wear it comes, it was first ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: An expensive jacket.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: A very expensive jacket. It is taxed at a gross margin. [Interjections.] Now that jacket, at every stage of production it was taxed, because it is a value-added tax at a gross margin.

So what this means every time tax is added in the value chain. Value-added tax is essentially an additional cost levied on businesses, calculated every step of the value chain with refunds and claim backs, therefore a VAT increase means not just an increased cost burden for everyone in the process

of bringing goods and services to the market, but also an increase in the fiscal and economic burden.

Secondly, the added costs are often multiplied and passed on to the consumers' shoulders. In particular, poor households, who have a higher consumption budget proportionate to the necessities than any other households, will be disproportionately impacted by the VAT increase. Hence, a VAT increase is bad for the poor.

The impact of the VAT increase on the economy is dependent on how responsive purchasers, that is Government, business and consumers, are to the increase in the price of goods and services. If purchasers are responsive to the price increase, it would likely result in a decrease in consumption impacting negatively on the economy. The impact on consumption of goods and services – the demand – may then also have an impact on the production of goods and services, in other words also on the supply side of the economy.

Hence sales tax, Mr Deputy Speaker, is regressive, and VAT is a sales tax. Sales taxes are regressive in nature, meaning that although the tax rate is the same on all consumer items, a greater burden will be placed on lower income groups since the absolute tax increase is a larger portion of the lower income groups.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Davis Tax Commission highlighted that:

“An increase in VAT would have a greater negative impact on inequality than an increase in personal income tax or corporate income tax.”

It further recommended that:

“Should it be necessary to increase the standard rate of VAT, it will be important for the fiscal authorities to think carefully about compensation mechanisms for the poor who will be adversely affected by the increase.”

The poor suffer because the ANC steals.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Minister Meyer, for the response. I just want to say to the Minister that this ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Good workshop.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... this question was also placed in front of the Budget

Committee, when National Treasury visited this Committee and the question was asked how will this 1% VAT increase impact on service delivery within Government, because Government is the creator of jobs, particularly the Education and Health Departments, and the biggest department, Public Works. How would this then impact service delivery? Is there 1% added from National Government to this Province, or will the money come from ...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ag please [Inaudible.].

Mr D JOSEPH: ... the current budget? Thank you.

†‘n AGB LID: Gee vir hom ‘n *lecture*.

[An HON MEMBER: Give him a lecture.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Finance.

[Interjections.]

The Western Cape Government Budget is R62,7 billion for the 2018/19 financial year. The Provincial Treasury is currently in the process in determining the exact quantum of the VAT increase on the budget, and will provide further detail later on. But the preliminary rough estimates that we have done in the Treasury, based on the goods and services, indicate that the 1% VAT increase in this Government will be between R170 million to R200 million. I have to mention, Mr Deputy Speaker, National Government has

made no provision, Chairperson of the Standing Committee, no provision in this budget for that.

What is also concerning is that the Department of Transport and Public Works, with a budget of R7 billion, 60% of that budget of Transport and Public Works is going exclusively on contracts and procurement, and 60% of that budget will be subjected to a 1% increase.

So, in short, there will be service delivery implications as a result of this reckless, irresponsible behaviour of the National Government to increase the VAT with 1% from 14 to 15%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Minister Meyer. I would just like to ask then, in the light of this real situation that the Government has to look at the same budget and include the 1% VAT increase, what alternative measures or savings will the Department of Treasury propose to manage the issue of the 1% increase?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are on record during the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement in our discussions last year. We are also on record, because that is an indication of the three year Budget priorities of this Government. We are determined and we believe that it was unnecessary to increase VAT by 1% because you can reduce the size of the

bloated National Executive. Some of you will know that Premier Zille and I meet three times a year with the President in the Union Buildings. When we go to that meeting we see a bloated Cabinet of almost 60, 70 people sitting in that meeting.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: 74.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: 74, thank you, hon Leader of Government Business. We believe that we can save money to the tune of R13,8 billion over the medium-term by cutting the size, because you do not need the whole National Executive of the ANC in the Cabinet, but it was necessary ... [Interjections.] because – no ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, not yet.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You asked for it.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You asked for it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, no – you asked for it. It is on record in Hansard. [Interjections.] And so what we want ... [Interjection.]



The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But there is nothing wrong with that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There is nothing wrong. It is better you present that to your voters. But we can save R13,8 billion by reducing Zuma's Cabinet. The hon President has indicated he wants to reduce the size of the National Cabinet, but with that big *skelm*, David Mabuza, he cannot do that.

So the first thing, you must cut the Budget by R13,8 billion. The second matter ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do not act as if you like him now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The second matter ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You do not like him.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... where we can save money, hon member Joseph, is by reducing the number of foreign missions by 69, which could save an estimated R3,9 billion over the medium-term. We do not need many of these foreign missions, because we are second to the United States in terms of foreign missions. We certainly can save R3,9 billion or ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: [Inaudible.] Israeli one.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am not so sure ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The ANC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The ANC must answer that, I am not the ANC Minister. [Laughter.] I am from the DA. If you have not noted that.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we can also save R17,2 billion by withdrawing from the National Development Bank. If we reduce the size of the National Cabinet, we reduce the size of foreign missions, we reduce our impact on the New Development Bank, we can certainly bring enough money and R112 billion could be saved. We only get R22,9 billion as a result of the 1% VAT increase. The VAT increase is therefore not necessary. We can save money by having these cost-cutting measures in place. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question, Question 3. To the Minister of Economic Opportunities, Minister Winde. I see Minister Winde.

*Fourth Industrial Revolution: implementation of*

**3. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic**

**Development and Tourism:**

What are his plans and programmes for the implementation of the Fourth Industrial Revolution?

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the absence of the questioner, the reply:

The Fourth Industrial Revolution is not something which can be “implemented”, but rather a revolution which will irrevocably change the way we do things. Our only option is to maximise the positive trends and minimize the negative impacts. Indeed, the question companies and industries need to face is no longer: “Will I be disrupted?”, but rather: “When will my business be disrupted, how will the disruption take place and how will it affect me and my business?”

It will probably be those businesses who most effectively succeed in combining the digital, physical and biological worlds that will be most resilient against disruptive change.

To indicate the potential impact we face, it may be a good idea to compare some key elements of the 2nd and 3rd Industrial Revolutions.

In 1990 ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, allow the Minister time.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In 1990 the three biggest companies globally were in Detroit, USA, a prime example of 2nd Revolution manufacturing, and had a combined market capitalisation of \$36 billion with 1,2 million employees. The three biggest companies in Silicon Valley, USA in 2014, had a market capitalisation of \$1,09 trillion, 33 times higher, and 137,000 employees, nine times lower.

Given South Africa's realities and governance objectives, it is clear that the Fourth Industrial Revolution may have a devastating effect on our society. To develop a strategy we need to understand the underlying drivers of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, its potential impacts on the world as well as on the Western Cape agriculture sector and we have developed a strategy to face this impact.

For this reason the University of Stellenbosch Business School was commissioned to conduct a diagnostic evaluation on the future of the Western Cape agricultural sector in the context of the Fourth Industrial Revolution and it was found that some of its current drivers include autonomous vehicles, 3-D printing, advanced robotics, new materials and digital as well as biological developments.

While there is a risk that the culmination of these drivers could lead to job

losses and failing enterprises, by preparing adequately and embracing the Fourth Industrial Revolution, we could see an agri-renaissance. In this case the latter, the accelerated adoption of technology, offers exciting new markets and products, new and efficient ways of farming, leading to increased competition amongst producers. The draft report makes a very specific recommendation for Government, producers, small-holder and commercial industrial association's processes, consumers as well as scientists.

We intend to use this report to inform our work going forward so as to ensure we minimise any risk and capitalise on any advantage for the new trend. This report which is nearing completion will be released to the general public within the next couple of months. Mr Deputy Speaker, in addition to this, from the agricultural side there is also obviously the side driven by my other Department, Economic Development and Tourism. And in this space we have been investing now for quite a long time from broadband investment to the two Bandwidth Barns; to the I-CAN Centre; to even embracing innovation as a core basic within everything that we do as government, but also at the same time, passing that on to the eco-system and the private sector so that we mitigate these risks and identify how the eco-system can be taken advantage of in this southern tip of Africa.

I believe that we are stepping up to the plate in this space because of those new tech companies starting in this region, really showcasing what can be done out of this region. I am fairly confident that we are at least in the game,

if not ahead of the game.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question, Question 4, hon member Hinana to Minister Fritz. Hon Minister Fritz?

*Philippi: programmes for young people*

**4. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Social Development:**

(a) What programmes does his Department have to reduce the involvement of young people in criminal activities and (b) how many young people have successfully graduated from these programmes in Philippi?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to thank hon member Hinana for the question and I want to start off by saying that the Crime Prevention Unit must be read with other units and with other programmes within the Department, specifically the Youth Programme.

In order to ensure the delivery of crime prevention services to children and youth, the Department of Social Development is, in addition to its own services, currently funding NPOs in the province to render crime prevention services. We have CASE, a very interesting organisation, working specifically on the psycho-social aspects of young learners in Hanover Park and Manenberg, crime prevention programmes at 11 schools with a target of

1 226 learners. Services include an holistic approach in terms of psycho-social services to children in conflict with the law and youth at risk.

Then we have Nicro in the Delft area, targeting 120 learners and crime prevention to learners and parents and teachers in those areas. Realistic is in Guguletu, Nyanga and Philippi and targets 120 learners at five schools. Life-skills and crime prevention programmes are used as interventions. Then Iliso Care Society in Khayelitsha, four schools target 330 learners and 220 with interventions of life-skills, coaching and mentoring programmes. Khulisa Reintegration Services in Worcester and Paarl, target 100 children and parents. A life-skills programme, mentoring, coaching and after-care services are all provided and then Youth Impact and Sustainable Solutions is an organisation providing reintegration services in Hanover Park which targets 40 learners and 20 parents, skills-development and mentoring and after-care.

In terms of crime prevention strategies and services to children and youth in the Philippi area, the Department has embarked on a stakeholder collaboration with the CPF cluster and Philippi SAPS to keep them informed of services in this area and ensure that intervention services are rendered to all beneficiaries in need. This also ensures that any child-related matters, which would include child protection and children in conflict with the law, receive the necessary attention.

In terms of strategy, services to children and adults in conflict with the law

for the period of 2017/18, the Department successfully diverted 40 children to the diversion programmes. In terms of adults there are 313 successfully completely diversion programmes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. Hon Minister, youth play a very significant role in contributing to the crime in our country and my question is whether there is any relationship that the Department of Social Development in the Western Cape have with the City of Cape Town in order to rehabilitate those youth that are involved in the crime in the area?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you hon member Hinana for that question. We have a monthly meeting with the City of Cape Town and their Social Development Unit and let me just speak to two specific programmes.

Last weekend we had 120 youth at a camp at Blue Waters in Strandfontein and those are all preventative programmes before young people become involved in crime, to prevent them or tell them about the opportunities that are available. And I want to say thank you to councillor Elton Jansen who facilitated that programme. We had full-time social workers at the camp for the whole duration of the weekend to immediately assist with psycho-social interventions.



The other programme is a very interesting programme in the Delft area with the City of Cape Town. The minute a youngster is caught and I am talking about serious crime, we are talking about 'shooters', Mr Deputy Speaker. Those are youngsters who are used now by adults to do the shooting for these gangs in our gang areas. The minute we get them and they are caught by Metro Police they come to a diverse and a transversal panel including some of our social workers that immediately try and see whether we can save this youngster from a life of crime.

That programme we hope to also roll out to the hotspots of Philippi and Hanover Park but we are operating in the Delft area at the moment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Through you, to the MEC. I was listening very attentively. MEC does your province end just over the mountain in Worcester and Paarl from the City of Cape Town? †Misdad is nie net gebonde aan die Stad Kaapstad en die Boland nie. [Crime is not just linked to the City of Cape Town and the Boland.] What about the other areas, the rural areas? You do not even mention any programme in the rural areas and I want to know specifically about rural areas where crime is high.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. Hon Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is a very good question.

The hon member always asks good questions and she is not as impatient as the so-called Leader of the Opposition. Mr Deputy Speaker and hon member Gillion, just last week – and unfortunately when people read papers, perhaps this stuff actually gets into the newspapers...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell the truth.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The newspapers wrote extensively about the intervention programme we ran for unemployed youth in the Robertson area. For 30 young people who were on this programme who would normally just go into the kind of diversions of society, you know the †afwykings van ons samelewing. [deviations of our society.] I was so amazed at the brilliance of those young people that we had for a whole long week and we are now doing the follow-up to it. We are not like the ANC who comes and does courses and then they disappear ... [Interjections.], then they run away, they give little pieces of paper that mean nothing. We do follow-ups ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... so we can get those people into work and I want to say, that is very, very important. [Interjection.] Also, Mr Deputy Speaker, unlike the ANC we also believe in the sustainable stuff, not hit and run stuff, not hit and runs. [Interjections.] They are so used to hit and runs because they tick boxes all the time. In regard to rural areas I want to take the hon member Gillion with me ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... to Vredendal, to go to all those areas where we have young people on our programme working on farms ... [Interjections.] farm people. That is throughout the year hon member and that keeps them out of crime unlike your hit and run so-called programmes that are a joke.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Sit down [Inaudible.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Groot [Onhoorbaar.].

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Great [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Olivier, is it a follow-up question? I will give you an opportunity.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, MEC †van die jong mense wat op jou program is, hoeveel van hulle is nog van skoolgaande ouderdom? [of the young people on your programme, how many of them are still of school-going age?] †And when the diversion takes place, †hoeveel van hulle gaan terug skool toe, en meer spesifiek, in die landelike gebied waarvan lid Gillion praat, nie in die Metro-gebied nie, in die landelike gebiede, daar by Kaap Agulhas, die verste punt van die program van ons af [Onhoorbaar.]. Dankie. [how many of them go back to school, and more

specifically, in the rural area member Gillion is talking about, not in the Metro area, there in Cape Agulhas, the furthest point of the programme from us [Inaudible.] Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Dit is die maklikste vraag. Een belangrike punt [Onhoorbaar.]

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is the easiest question. One important point [Inaudible.]]

I am going to speak in English so that everyone understands. I think the important question ... [Interjections.], mister land grabber, to understand is that when you talk about diversion programmes we talk about a particular category of young people [Interjections.].

A diversion programme is a programme – if we talk about crime specifically in the rural areas – for when young people commit crimes and they are arrested, for them then to be diverted out of the criminal justice system. So we have a child programme and the court approves that kind of alternative sentencing. So that is one area. But I am talking before the child commits the crime and that to me is an important part. We are passionate about our young people. In areas like Vredendal where young children from farms break into homes, they have learnt, they have heard it is better in our child and youth care centres in Clanwilliam. But that we must stop and we must really

empower our young people and so we roll out a whole lot of those programmes focusing on, targeting children, hon member Olivier, in primary schools and high schools, just to give them hope and a future.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Last opportunity hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you hon Minister for the response. I just want to know, after the youth have undergone the rehabilitation programmes, is there a mechanism to monitor their progress after the programmes because we need to provide programmes that will break the syndrome. What are the available opportunities and assistance after they have been through the programmes?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. That is in fact a very interesting and important question that I referred to earlier. One of the things we do, when people are on our programme, is to try and align them with the private sector, with job opportunities or within Government. It is no use we talk about opportunities and we do not create opportunities within Government. I am working closely with the hon Alan Winde's office and his Department of Economic Development and Economic Opportunities to assist us in placing young people when we have seen that they have the possibility to go into these areas. But when young people are too young they must go back to school and we also work with the Department of Education, hon member Olivier, to get them back into school and to finish schooling so that they have a future. So it is an important point ... [Interjection.]

Ja, because it is †3 000 van die Oos-Kaap. [Tussenwerpsels.] [is 3 000 from the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.]] It is important that we actually do that and we focus on our children here in the province to give them an opportunity and a life and a future. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question, Question 5. Hon member Makeleni again to Minister Fritz. Hon Minister Fritz, Question 5.

*Youth Cafés: roll out of*

**5. Ms P Makeleni asked the Minister of Social Development:**

(b) (a) How many Youth Cafés will be rolled out in the current financial year, (b) in which areas in the province, (c) how many young people will benefit and (d) where is the money coming from?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you honourable. In the absence of the hon Makeleni I just want to start off by saying that during the current financial year, this is the 2018/19 financial year, the Department will roll out three Youth Cafés and expand the services of the George Youth Café to include Uniondale, hon member Simmers.

*[The Temporary Chairperson takes the Chair.]*

The (b) part of the question, the three new Youth Cafés will be in

Villiersdorp, Saldanha Bay and Bredasdorp and next week I am going to Bredasdorp. I think someone asked me about that. The Youth Café in George will expand their services to youth in the Uniondale area and Seapark has requested a number of young people who will benefit from these Youth Development Services as follows:

Villiersdorp will target 900 young people; Saldanha will target 900 young people, Bredasdorp 950 and in the Uniondale area, an additional 300 linked to George. Just interesting about Bredasdorp, hon Chairperson, is that there is a centre standing opened by Blade Nzimande. It is standing there and it is not being used. It is a skills centre.

You know when we want to respond to the death of Anene Booysen, then we – oh, and the centre is called Anene Booysen Centre – are going to speak ... [Interjection.] – no the Mayor has no jurisdiction over it. We are going to speak to the National Department to go into partnership with them to activate that centre as a centre of opportunity and life, not a beautiful monument that means nothing to the young people. So those are the kind of targets.

The (d) part of the question: the funding for the Youth Cafés will come from the Department's allocation for Youth Development but we are also now moving far more to private sector assistance.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Member Gopie?.

Ms D GOPIE: I just want to ask the Minister, what do you take into consideration in an area when you decide you are going to open a Youth Club Café? What do you look for and then take a decision that in this area we must open a Youth Café?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is again a very good question. Normally we have an MOU with the local municipality. When we have an MOU with the local municipality it is far easier to open a centre ... [Interjection.]. No, no everywhere, but we are in control everywhere, There is no ANC government in the province anymore. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order please, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: There is none that I know of. No, I am serious. I do not know of any ANC government in the province. So one of the things we do is to get a building from them and then we try and revamp the building and make it possible for access, but it is an important point and we only have so much money, so one will have to prioritise. But when they come up with a building we run for it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie. My apologies. I saw the hon member Mackenzie at the back there first and then I will give you a chance.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Minister, can you share with us what programmes are being shared in these Youth Cafés and also is there consultation with the



youth in drawing up these programmes?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. The one important point about Youth Cafés is each one has its own character. The one in Nyanga Junction has got a football, sport kind of flavour. The one in Vrygrond has a very specific job skills type of programme where people train for that. The one in Oudtshoorn is a very media and IT type of approach because they have a radio station there. The one in George also focuses a lot on IT, but they also focus in George on after-school programmes in the surrounding schools so it is very interesting. The one in Mitchells Plain, IT and we are now looking at new contracts in those areas. The same at Vangate. So each Youth Café has its own character and the type of programmes differ from Youth Café to Youth Café. Normal leadership courses and all those things are presented and I think that makes it very interesting.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Take it offline.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Minister, does this now mean that in Elsie's River you did not have an MOU with the municipality, that that is why in Elsie's River we have an I-CAN Centre where youth have to pay to do their copies and things like that? Does that mean you did not have an MIU with the municipality in Elsie's River?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We had an MIU with the municipality but there is an I-CAN Centre.

An HON MEMBER: MOU, you mean.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry. What did I say?

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: MOU. Oh, sorry. Thanks mister land grabber for reminding me. We have one with the City.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: In fact the City is also assisting us more and more because that is the problem with buildings, to get the infrastructure but as I said there is an I-CAN Centre and we are not going to make – because it is very similar, right next to I-CAN Centre. We must address the issue of payment. We must go and look at ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My question to the Minister, through you, is, as he said the objective of the Youth Cafés is to keep the youngsters out of trouble; so my question to you MEC is, are you

working closely with the Justice Department, with the data of the youngsters that are in trouble, and with the police?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member Davids, I want to make a very important point. We must also look at good young people. Not just young people who cause trouble in our society, we must give everyone an opportunity. And if we get a guy who is trouble, let us deal with him but do not forget about the good young people in our society. Let me give you a practical example of an introvert who sat in his room and then someone told him about a Youth Café and he went. Today he is in Spain. He went to Spain. He is a good boy, he did not bother people.

I also want to say to the former Mayor Davids that we work very closely with the Department of Justice. We work very closely with the police around some of those issues. In fact just last week the Metro Police did a camp with us, so I am just making that point. I think it is an important question you are asking but we need to work with all young people, not only troubled young people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Last opportunity, hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I want to find out from you what is the relationship or is there a relationship between you and the private sector with regards to offering some of these services to the youth at Youth Cafés?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, there is some interesting stuff that we are busy working on, specifically with Sun International. I know some people have a problem with big capital but they all live in these hotels.

So, we for instance are slowly guiding and channelling some of our people into the industry in a broader kind of hospitality sense coming from these Youth Cafés and we have a very, very good relationship with that one. We are also nurturing relationships with Old Mutual, with Nedbank, with Sanlam and a number of big companies to see how can we create more work for our young people.

†Ek is siek en sat, [I am sick and tired,] Mr Deputy Speaker, of having people on a course and you give nice certificates, they all take photos and then they are unemployed the next week again. Let us create work for our young people and it seems the ANC is against us creating work for the young people. [Interjections.] Hon member Dugmore is supporting. Thank you. Good support, good support.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. We move on to the next question, Question 6. Hon Gillion to the Minister of Health, hon Minister Mbombo.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, she is here. [Inaudible.]

*Karl Bremer Hospital: dismissal of nurses*

**6. Ms M N Gillion asked the Minister of Health:**

(a) What circumstances led to the dismissal of enrolled nurses and registered nurses, whose names have been furnished to her Department for the purpose of her reply, from Karl Bremer Hospital in 2016 and (b) what steps has she taken to resolve the matter that is now heading for the Labour Court?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question and as the member has indicated, the case has been referred to the Labour Court so it becomes *sub judice* in terms of getting to the merits of it. However, what I can share are the phases that led us to where we are because this is a case of an event that happened in 2015 and the dismissal happened around 2016, I think in August. The case was referred to arbitration which was upheld. So everything happened around 2016 and for the whole of 2017 there was nothing, dead quiet until now in March. It was brought to my attention that the union representative has filed the case in the Labour Court, hence I cannot go deeper in terms of the merits of the case.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie? Sorry, hon member Gillion. My apologies.

Ms M N GILLION: Please, please!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I just said to the MEC Madikizela when he spoke about “let us take responsibility for what is happening in our Departments” and I made a joke and said “please teach your colleague next to you about taking responsibility for what is happening ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member just get to your question please.

Ms M N GILLION: I am going there. This matter of the nurses came to my attention during our Budget debate this year.

An HON MEMBER: When?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She just told you now. Budget debate. Keep quiet.  
[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: The Budget debate this year. I raised a question during the Budget debate to the MEC. The MEC answered me while she already knew there is a Labour Court case ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, Gillion ...

Ms M N GILLION: I am going there. What is the MEC trying to tell me today in this House, that she cannot answer because it is *sub judice*, it was *sub judice* already during that time but let me go to my question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I just say this ... [Inaudible.]. Order, order.

Ms M N GILLION: What is the MEC going to do ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. This is not an example of a supplementary question, a supplementary question must be concise and to the point.

Ms M N GILLION: It is to the point, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is coming to the point now.

Ms M N GILLION: I am getting there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am giving you a last chance.

Ms M N GILLION: Now my question to the MEC is: this is a classic case of an unfair dismissal because it was procedurally not fair. What will you do to assist these affected nurses MEC, taking into consideration that you as the MEC must take responsibility for what is happening in your Department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You are saying that it was unfair and one might interpret that as you undermining the structures that have been there according to the Labour Relations Act of 1995, Public Service Act and also the Disciplinary Code and Procedures, because if the Bargaining Council and also the arbitration found that the processes actually were fair then you cannot say they were unfair.

After the arbitration you have got about six weeks, in terms of appealing the recommendations or the findings of the arbitration, before you would even be able to go to court. So you cannot say it was unfair when it was the arbitrators that were appointed, according to the Acts, as well as the Bargaining Council. So you cannot say it was unfair, because you will be undermining the other spheres according to the legislation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, your second question.

Ms M N GILLION: Hon member Gillion, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies.

Ms M N GILLION: Please, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Gillion, your second question.

Ms M N GILLION: I have been wearing this surname for 52 years.



[Laughter.] Please do not change it now. A husband can change that for me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, get to the point please.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, no let me go to this, as a woman. As a woman MEC ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Excuse me, on a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

Ms M N GILLION: This is a follow-up question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon member. Just one second.

Mr M G E WILEY: Can the hon member just apply herself to the Rules of the House and just ask a question ...

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down man.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... without going on a long meandering trip about her gender, about her personality and everything else. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Point taken.

†Ms M N GILLION: Jy is bang vir die waarheid.

[Ms M N GILLION: You are afraid of the truth.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I want the member now to ask the question please.

Ms M N GILLION: I am going there. [Interjections.].

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Get on with it!

Ms M N GILLION: You know, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.] †Wat baie betreurenswaardig is, is wanneer ons dié kant van die Huis ... [What is very regrettable, is when we on this side of the House ...]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Me M N GILLION: ... ons se werk wil doen en dit word so vir 'n *joke* gevat. ... [want to do our job, and it is treated as a joke.] My question to the MEC is, as a woman who is responsible for this Department, when women are being discriminated against, for wearing a jalay and it is not only now that the MEC †het bewus geword hiervan. [has become aware of this.] What did she do as a woman about the discrimination towards other women?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The question is clear, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The law does not recognise whether you are a woman, you are a human being on that basis as I indicated. The processes have been followed according to the Labour Relations Act and according to

the Public Service Act.

By the way the Department of Health has 32 000 staff members and almost 80% are women, so I do not think in terms of the gender – but what I am trying to highlight is the processes have been followed and once they kick in you have to stick to such. It is the same thing when some people might want to see you and then you say because I am the [Inaudible.] authority, the law does not allow, so as I am explaining to you, the disciplinary things happen and fortunately the two nurses have got union representatives, so they are not alone. The disciplinary procedures were followed, also the counselling procedures and up to the time of the Bargaining Council and then up to the time of the arbitration and then it went dead, that was 2016. Dead, for the whole of 2017 nothing, not even a small letter that said “do you remember ...”. Nothing. It came up now early this year, when one of them filed in the Labour Court which is where it is now. Hence I am saying I cannot go into the merits of the case because that is how things are. I have to follow the law, unfortunately.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you for that answer respecting the labour processes of this country MEC but still, the answer that the MEC gave me during the Budget was that these two nurses were not suspended because they were wearing a jalay but for other reasons. I have got information, MEC, that your Department is misleading you and I

want to ask you for the fairness in this process. Please keep your finger on the pulse because the other issue is, when it comes to discrimination ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member you are going too far. I want a question.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes the question is, you know ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please ask your question.

Ms M N GILLION: I will ask the question. My question to the MEC is, in fairness towards these two women that are being discriminated against, are you going to keep your finger on the pulse?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Sorry, I have already responded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on then to the following question. Questions number 7 and 8 will stand over by arrangement. We come to Question number 9, Mr Olivier to Minister Schäfer. Hon Minister Schäfer?

*[Questions 7 and 8 standing over.]*

*Sanitation crisis in schools*

**9. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) How many schools in the province meet the minimum learner to toilet ratio;
- (2) whether she and her Department have measures in place to address the sanitation crisis in schools in the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Part 1 of the question, according to our Infrastructure Department, all schools in the province are regarded as having sufficient ablution facilities, based on the regulations related to the the Minimum Norms and Standards for public school infrastructure. [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.] We want specifics, MEC.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The second part, I am not sure what crisis the member is alluding to. There is no sanitation crisis in the Western Cape as all schools in the province meet the minimum learner to toilet ratio based on the regulations related to the Minimum Norms and Standards for public school infrastructure.

We do however experience a high growth rate of learners enrolling at Western Cape schools which can at times cause a short term backlog. These backlogs, if any, are then addressed through the placement of additional

ablutions at the school. For the 2018/19 financial year four abluion projects are being implemented owing to an increase in enrolments, namely Bridgeville Primary, Elandsfontein Primary, Naasdrift NGK Primary and New Eisleben Senior Secondary.

Further to this, all new and replacement schools comply with WCED Norms and Standards for ablutions as well as National Building Regulations for ablutions. Any Grade R classrooms constructed at existing schools include abluion facilities. In terms of maintenance, the WCED plans to do maintenance at 54 schools during the 2018/19 financial year. All maintenance projects include the renovation of abluion facilities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier first then I will come to hon member Mackenzie. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, am I correct to assume that the minimum required for abluion facilities is 1 to 35 learners? Is that the minimum that you also have, that it is a 1 to 35, then we rate that as the required number of toilets for learners?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr R T OLIVIER: One toilet to 35, is that also your understanding or that of the Department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do not have that figure with me but I am sure that whatever the figure is, we comply [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Order, order. Hon member Mackenzie first then I will come back to you hon member Olivier.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can the Minister please share with us ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Can the hon Minister please share with us, are there any pit toilets in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. No, there are no pit toilets in the Western Cape despite the fact the DBE reported that there were four. We checked up on the four that were referred to by the DBE, all four of those are brand new schools and there are no pit toilets in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Olivier, gooi warm kole daar! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Olivier, throw hot coals there! [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, taking into account the large numbers of additional learners that came into schools this year and the ratio of 1 to 35, and I can confirm that it is 1 to 35; are you still confirming that that is enough, you do not have a problem with those? Are you still confirming that we are within the minimum required number of ablutions, if you take that into account?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This is a repetition of the first question which I have already answered, hon member Olivier. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order, the last opportunity hon member Olivier. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANYI: He did not say. The answer ...[Inaudible.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC do you agree that almost 42% of the samples of schools that we have looked at by both by the Department and two other institutions, that about just between 38% and 42% of our schools do have a problem with not enough ablution facilities for their schools?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is too difficult.



The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question, Question number 10 which will also stand over. We move onto Question number 11, hon Simmers to Minister Bredell, Minister of Local Government. Minister.

*[Question 10 standing over.]*

*Sustainable development at local government level*

**11. Mr T A Simmers asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

How will the need for sustainable development planning at local government level be ensured by his Department?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question.

During the 2016/17 financial year the Provincial Strategic Goal 5 Working Group 4 focusing on Integrated Management, of which the key roleplayers are the Departments of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, Provincial Treasury and the Economic Development Partnership, developed and adopted a Provincial Top Management and the Western Cape Municipal Managers Forum, an integrated work plan. This Plan

mapped an approach to integrated provincial and municipal planning, budgeting and governance for sustainable local government and sustainable development planning.

There are three main annual engagements identified in the work plan, the first being the strategic conversation followed by the technical engagement, focusing on performance and governance and the last focusing on sustainable planning and budgeting, traditionally known as the Local Government Medium Term Expenditure Committees Process.

Subsequent to the assessment of the draft Annual Budget, the Municipal Integrated Development Plans and Spatial Development Frameworks afford the provincial sphere of government an opportunity to strengthen sustainable planning within municipalities.

The first of these engagements took place in October 2016, which were strategic in nature to feed into the development of the Fourth Generation of Integrated Development Plans for 2017 to 2022 and focused on the sustainability of local government within and across districts in an integrated manner. The agenda focused on partnering for economic development, economic and spatial intelligence to inform a sustainable local government and provincial and local government interface.

Key lessons and themes emanating from the engagements included inter alia the role of political leadership, getting the basics right, the necessity for

sustainable planning and budgeting, partnering with importance of data and intelligence and governance.

While these are the main points of engagement there are various other strategic and technical engagements where the theme of sustainable local government is re-enforced such as the Provincial Top Management Municipal Managers Retreat, Premiers Coordinating Forum, Ministers and Mayors Meeting and technical meetings. On a technical level there are also a quarterly Chief Financial Officers and IDP Managers Fora, amongst others. The agendas of the fora are crafted to support and further develop and implement the theme of the sustainable local government. By reinforcing the message of sustainable local government at these engagements, the outputs and impact of sustainable development planning are being realised. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No questions? Hon Simmers do you want ask. [Interjection.] Order, order, hon member Dyantyi. [Interjection.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Lid, bedaar man. Hou jou op jou plek. [Gelag.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Member, calm down man. Behave yourself. [Laughter.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Simmers if you want to ask a supplementary question you must stand up so that I can see you.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Om verskoning ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Apologise ... [Interjection.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: ... mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: ... Mr Deputy Speaker.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is still going there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed. You may ask the question.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Oukei. Minister Bredell, weereens dankie vir u volledige terugvoering met die antwoord op my oorspronklike vraag. Minister, net gekoppel aan die tema van volhoubare ontwikkeling, en u het nou die verskillende forums gelys waarvolgens u werk; hierdie fasette, daar gaan nou [Onhoorbaar.] deur Plaaslike Regering, maar een faset, en ons het nou in hierdie afgelope paar dae distrikmunisipaliteite besoek, en een van die kern-elemente wat die Staande Komitee van Plaaslike Regering opgemerk het, en ons het hierdie vraag ook aan die distrikte gestel, is die tekort aan tegniese vaardighede, onder andere distriks-, dorpsbeplanners en munisipale dorpsbeplanners.

Hoe gaan ons dit aanspreek? Want volhoubare ontwikkelingsbeplanning benodig bekwame individue, en hierdie is 'n veld veral in plaaslike regering waar daar werklikwaar nasionaal en provinsiaal 'n massiewe tekort aan tegnisi

is wat die ondervinding het ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Okay. Minister Bredell, again thank you for your thorough feedback with the reply to my original question. Minister, just linked to the theme of sustainable development, and you have now listed the various forums according to which you operate; these facets, is there going to be ... [Inaudible.] by local government, but one facet, and we have visited district municipalities over the past few days, and one of the key elements the Standing Committee on Local Government has picked up, and we have also put this question to the districts, is the shortage of technical skills, amongst others district, town and municipal planners.

How are we going to address this? Because sustainable development planning requires capable individuals, and this is a field especially in local government where there really is a massive shortage of technicians nationally and provincially who have the experience ... [Interjection.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: ... om dit te kan doen.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: ... to do that.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid, jou vraag is duidelik. Minister Bredell kan antwoord.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your question is clear. Minister Bredell can reply.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ja, mnr die Adjunkspeaker en agb lid Tertius, en die agb lid weet dat ek 'n passie het vir hierdie volhoubare ontwikkeling, want dis al hoe ons uit ons armoede gaan kom, en dis al hoe ons met ons hulpbronne voor gaan kom, en eintlik wil ek nog 'n woord daaraan koppel want ons praat baie hieroor, en ek soek nog 'n lekker term, maar dis eintlik *resilience and sustainability*, en hoe ons ons munisipaliteite daar gaan kry, want distriksmunisipaliteite is in 'n slegte spasie weens hulle *equitable share* toedeling. Alles begin half daar, en op 'n nasionale vlak is ons indringend besig om te kyk na 'n taakgroep wat die finansiële model waarop distrikte moet fungeer moet uitsorteer.

Nou dis jammer dat ons dit nog nie gedoen het nie, want dit, die probleme waarmee distrikte tans sit, kan regtig nie net op hulle afgeskuif word nie. Hulle trek aan die kortste end. Ons het in Plaaslike Regering 'n groot dryfbeweging gekry om gedeelde dienste in distrikte te begin vestig, en ons het 'n paar goeie voorbeelde, ek dink dis veral in jou gebied in die Sentrale Karoo en daardie gebiede waar ons *expertise* deel met die munisipaliteite, regsadviseurs, ensovoorts.

Een ding wat na vore gekom het met die water en die waterkrisis, was dat die Regering rondom 2000 na 2004 toe, 250 ingenieurs in die Departement gehad het, maar ons sit vandag met 80 ingenieurs, en as Regering, en ek praat van alle regeringsfere, sal ons moet besef as ons nie gaan terugploeg en herbelê in tegniese vaardighede nie, gaan ons nie ons armoede uit die weg ruim nie, en as ek dit bedoel sal ons rêrig 'n ander tipe denke moet kry oor ons beursskemas, ons sal rêrig beurse daar moet stel om plattelandse kinders te kry wat die vermoë het om 'n tegniese ingenieur te word of 'n finansiële HFB. Dit sit daardie kind op universiteit, want hy sal teruggaan huis toe en hy ken sy omstandighede of haar omstandighede, en jy moet eintlik 'n siklus begin ontwikkel waar jy dit elke tweede jaar doen sodat as daardie kind goed doen, weet ons almal die privaatsektor gaan die kind opneem, en ek is 'n groot voorstander dat ons werklik sal moet terugploeg en belê in ons beursskemas, want dit is al hoe ons daardie kapasiteit daar gaan bou.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker and hon member Tertius, and the hon member knows that I have a passion for this sustainable development, because it is the only way we are going to escape poverty, and it is the only way how we will get ahead with our resources, and actually I want to link a word to that because we talk about this a lot, and I am still searching for a nice term, but it is actually *resilience and sustainability*, and how we are going to get municipalities

there, because district municipalities are in a bad space because of their equitable share allocation. Everything sort of begins there, and at national level we are seriously looking at a task group who has to sort out the financial model on which districts have to function.

Now it is a pity that we have not done it yet, because that, the problems the districts are faced with, can really not be blamed upon them. They have the short end of the stick. In Local Government we have started a big drive to establish shared services in districts, and we have a few good examples, and I think it is especially in your area in the Central Karoo and those areas where we share expertise with the municipalities, legal advisers, etc.

One thing that has emerged with the water and the water crisis was that the Government from around 2000 to 2004 had 250 engineers in the Department, but today we have 80 engineers, and as Government, and I am speaking of all spheres of government, we will have to realise that if we are not going to plough back and re-invest in technical skills, we are not going to eradicate poverty, and by that I mean we will really have to adopt a different type of thought about our bursary schemes, we will really have to establish bursaries to find rural children who have the ability to become a technical or a financial CFO. It places that child at university, because he will go back home and he knows his circumstances or her circumstances, and you actually have to start developing a cycle where you do it every two years, so that when that child achieves, we all know that the private sector is going to employ that child, and I am a great believer that we will really have to



plough back and re-invest in our bursary schemes, because it is the only way we are going to build that capacity there.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. †Baie dankie, LUR, vir daardie eerste poging van u. Dit was baie goed. [Thank you, MEC, for that first effort of yours. It was very good.]

Now here is the question on the sustainability: Can any municipality be sustainable, and I am going back to Central Karoo, like Beaufort West, †waar daar drie in een is? [where there is three in one?] In other words, I am saying there is three in one. You have somebody who is acting as an MM, one person who is acting as a CFO, same person, who is acting as a Head Technical in the same municipality. †Drie in een. [Three in one.] Can you hope for any sustainability in that municipality when you have that situation? And it is a specific one, it is not just a thumb suck.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, let me try. I do not know what the hon member is talking about.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I know you [Inaudible.]. †Jy weet nie daarvan nie. [You do not know about that.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I do not understand the ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I told you, I told you. He is not even aware. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chairperson, if you want to enter into a political discussion, we can enter into a political discussion. You must be very careful when you start throwing mud if you are in the mud pool yourselves. It is very simple, we all know it. Stability within a municipality leads to success. We all know it. Where the ANC governs, it is only an unstable environment [Interjections.] The ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Allow the Minister to respond please. [Interjections.] Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I cannot answer if they, I mean you asked the question, let me answer.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Have you run out of ideas?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is no such thing as running out of ideas. That is why you have got an organogram in the municipality, one person cannot do it all.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is as simple as that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But you allow it to happen.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But the ANC is in the middle of that problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The first part of the question, can small municipalities be successful? Yes, they can. It has nothing to do with the size of the municipality. That you must have a specialist within each directorate, obviously you need that. Obviously it is an unhealthy situation what is going

on in some of our municipalities, we are not ideal. But that instability is caused by the ANC. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC as much as you are trying to explain that without the technical expertise, a municipality cannot be sustainable, however for a municipality to be sustainable what are you doing to ensure that those officials that you are putting in place are seeing to it that the IDP processes, which influence the sustainable development of a municipality, are real meetings with the community to influence the IDP – that the sustainable development plan comes from IDP?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What are you doing to ensure that?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC must really also touch base with their national colleagues because they come and see me and ask me to explain our IDP process because they use it as a best practice, because we pull anything in and obviously that is the call, that is where it must start. Obviously there is a bigger problem that hon Beerwinkel is pointing towards. I do not have a problem with our processes and the systems in place.

The problem starts off with our Ward Committees not getting the community out to come and participate within the IDP.

Ms M N GILLION: No man. No, no!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I think that is a bigger issue currently and we need to address that and we are busy addressing that. Through various media we are busy with DVDs, the role of the Ward Committees. We are busy with all sorts of training and you know, Mr Deputy Speaker, if you look at the independent ratings like Ratings Africa - and I want to ask these members, go and read it - the Western Cape stands out head and shoulders above all other provinces. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And it speaks to our equality. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, it would be a lie to stand here and say everything is hunky dory and fine. [Interjection.]. We are head and shoulders above all the rest but there is still a lot of work that needs to be done. We acknowledge that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto the next question which is Question 12. Hon member Maseko to Minister Madikizela. Hon Minister?

*Belhar CBD Projects: business opportunities*

**12. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Of the open market rental opportunities made available by the Belhar CBD project, (a) how many units will be used for retail and other business opportunities and (b) how many new jobs is the CBD project expected to yield, (c) how much has been allocated for the Belhar CBD project by (i) his Department and (ii) public-private partnerships?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. There are no open market rental opportunities for retail, commercial and business purposes. The retail commercial component that formed part of the initial Belhar CBD has been excluded as a result of unmet contractual obligations by the previous contractor. My Department made the portion of the site that was designated for that purpose available to the Department of Health for the development of the 550 bed Tygerberg Regional Hospital that will include a community day care centre and emergency medical services.

A retail component including Spar and various other chain stores has been developed on privately owned land closer to that project site. The development of commercial activity is in close proximity of the Belhar CBD and addresses not only the need for access to job opportunities, but also access within minimal travelling distance.

The appointed developer, through the City of Cape Town's employment database and engagements with the community has provided employment to a number of members of the local community. More employment will be made available to various artisans for which preference will be given to the local community as the project progresses and various development phases are unlocked.

The planned hospital site will provide 1 085 employment opportunities to qualified medical professionals. In terms of the Belhar funding which is part of the question, the Human Settlements Development Grant of R300 million has been allocated to subsidies for the following programmes:

- R120 million is for 600 BMG
- R77 million is for 630 social housing units
- R50 million is for 1000 finance-linked individual subsidy programmes, and
- R18,4 million is for 102 military veteran units.

The Urban Settlement Development Grant: The City of Cape Town, as I said in the previous question, has approved R127 million of the R275 million that we requested. So we do have some funding shortfall there. And in addition the City also approved R58 million for electrification of the area to cover the shortfall of the R126 million total requirement of which the Department of Energy was only able to give us R68 million.

The Social Housing Regulatory Authority or SHRA: R79 million for 630 Social Housing units was made available by SHRA and the Department of Energy made R68 million for the electrification of the wider Belhar area and the developer made available R969 million on internal infrastructure and top structure funding. I thank you Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Davids first and then I will see hon member Maseko.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, as you said, when you were answering the previous question, you also touched on this question, so my question to you hon Minister is, if we are saying that the City has given R58 million ...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: 127.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, I am speaking about the electricity, they gave R58 million for the electricity but I will come back hon Minister to the report of the City where they said they did not spend that money. What influence does it have on this project?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well it is critical for a project, especially of that magnitude to be considered complete, in fact the



AG is very strict on that, as you know hon member. We can play our role as Department and do everything that we need to do. In fact I have a situation now where some of the houses, because water connections from the City took a very long time, could not be signed off as completed even though we did our work. So, to answer your question, it has a major impact because unfortunately they cannot be signed off as completed houses if electrification is not done. So that is a direct response to your question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, it is really reassuring to hear that there are partnerships that are happening in this project that include small businesses but what I want to find out is are there any HDIs in those construction companies or their sub-contractors and is there youth representation or women representation in those SMMEs that are there?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: If you remember the response that I gave during the interpellation hon member Maseko, one of the reasons why we have experienced delays in that project is because the forums that struggled, both wards fought for that. In fact it is also one of the things that we are fighting for as a Department, and that is why – as you might be aware – we pride ourselves that out of our total Budget of R2,5 billion currently in this financial year, more than 50% of that budget – because we are not just talking about the number of HDIs who are working with us, we are talking

about the total allocation of the budget – went to HDIs, and in fact in the last financial year it was 52% and we are striving to increase it therefore in each and every project that we do. It is a pre-requisite from our side that HDI contractors must be involved in those sites.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Through you, to the Minister. Hon Minister, you said in your previous response that retail were excluded because of contractual issues by the previous contractor and that there is a space for them but it is on privately owned land. I want to know how it is going to affect the local retail people and businesses within that community?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are very happy about that particular development hon member Davids because it fits in perfectly with our concept of integrated human settlement development. That is why, even though we excluded it from our own development which was part of it before, the fact that it is happening adjacent to that development is also assisting because what we are seeing in Belhar CBD is truly a development that ticks every box in terms of integrated human settlement development.

That is why we are also very happy to partner with another sister department like Department of Health. We are now in conversation with the University of the Western Cape because they need student accommodation within the

development. So you have all the components that tick all the boxes in terms of making sure that that development is truly an integrated development. Those people who will be living there will be walking to work because of the development of Spar and other retail components that are happening, a stone's throw away from that particular development.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Maseko, the last opportunity then we have exhausted this.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, I just want to find out lastly if the recent monitoring of the transfer of skills from the already developed construction companies to the emerging construction companies within the project needs totality.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me just tell you what we are doing as a Department because the truth is you cannot just rely on the captains of industry to transfer skills to people who must in turn compete with them. I mean you cannot rely on that. What we are doing as a Department is to make sure that we truly empower the HDIs.

We have developed what is currently known as a Framework Contract where we invite all the emerging contractors to register in that Framework. They get allocated †umsebenzi [work] based on their levels, in terms of the CIDB grading and the more work you give to them the more their level increases in terms of their grading. Now as I am talking to you, there are people that we took from Level 2, they are now on Level 7 because if you give a Level 2, 50

units and that person does †umsebenzi ngendlela *eright*. [the job properly] the next time you are able to increase the amount of work [Inaudible.] up to a point now where we have HDIs that can compete with the captains of industry and that is what we are doing in that Department.

Without necessarily casting aspersions on the captains of industry, if you look at the best performers now for that particular department, they are HDIs. So we are very proud of that particular process that we have followed. We are truly empowering them, not necessarily just relying on the captains of industry to sub-contract under them so that the skills are transferred, we also give them umsebenzi [work]. We appoint our own service providers that can monitor and make sure that the issues of building regulations must be adhered to and in that way you are able to grow your own timber consistently and gradually.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of question time. Your time has expired. The outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard. We move on to Statements by Members. I see the DA. Hon member Joseph.

#### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The National Energy Regulator of South Africa (NERSA) is currently conducting public hearings as part of Eskom's proposed tariff increase to make up for a R66,6 billion

deficit. This proposed tariff increase is a slap in the face of the poor and the municipalities who have to foot the bill for the rampant corruption that has plagued Eskom over the past years. The effects of Jacob Zuma's legacy [Interjection.] of corruption and the severe mismanagement of South African state owned entities ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... are only now coming to the surface, with the public, rather than the politicians being held accountable.

Energy experts have also said that corruption at Eskom, including the state owned entities dealing with the Guptas, is the reason behind the current coal shortage which threatens further load-shedding for the coming winter. The Gupta-owned business, Tegeta, which received tenders for coal supply, has now been declared bankrupt. Once again, we see that the state corruption through tenderpreneurs has driven the state owned entities to the brink of collapse.

Once again, the people are paying more for electricity ... [Interjection.] when it is routinely cut through load-shedding. The South African public are once again forced to pay the cost of the corruption the ANC continues to abet. [Interjection.] So desperate is Eskom to make back its losses that it has finally ordered ex-CEO, Brian Molefe, to pay back R11 million of his undue R30 million pension pay out. [Interjections.] He should be paying back the

full amount with interest.

We see that the legacy of rampant state corruption under the ANC continues to plague the lives of South African taxpayers, but the damage they have caused to our country will take yet another decade to fix. We need to remove the ANC, the very government responsible for this damage to our country, out of power once and for all. The ANC must go. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order. I see the ANC. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As the ANC we welcome the proposals contained in the report into the Philippi Horticultural Area which was presented to the Standing Committee on Agriculture yesterday. We look forward to receiving the full report on Monday 23 April as promised by the Department.

From what we have seen, the study is technically excellent, and it is good to see the value of the PHA captured in an up to date document. The call for full protection of the PHA is welcomed. However, it is very clear to us that the struggle to preserve the full PHA and all the land zoned for agriculture as well as the invaluable aquifer is far from over.

As the ANC, we salute all the activists in the PHA campaign who have led a

10-year campaign, not only to safeguard the PHA, but for making clear proposals for the empowerment of small black farmers, African and Coloured men and women, by placing them on this land which would result in sustainable livelihoods and job creation.

There are red lights that are flashing which could once again wreck an excellent report. The main threat is the ongoing chronic factional and ideological differences that plague the DA and impact negatively on service delivery in general and in this case the preservation of the PHA as the food basket of Cape Town.

While the report is clear that policy certainty and a common vision amongst all spheres of government is critical, there are stark differences and conflict within the DA. As of today, neither the Provincial Cabinet nor Mayco have formally endorsed this report.

While the MEC for Agriculture's public statement of support is welcome, it means nothing when we consider that MEC Bredell – along with the City of Cape Town – is opposing the PHA Campaign's High Court case to review development permissions to save the PHA. These development applications threaten at least one third of the PHA.

We would have expected the report to make a clear recommendation that MEC Bredell withdraws his opposition to the PHA campaign in the High Court application.

Crucial to the existence of the PHA is the aquifer. Its primary recharge zone is the southern third of the PHA, and it is this specific area which the City has given up for developments. The Province and the City of Cape Town have granted full development rights to both Oaklands City and Uvest – which will pave over the primary recharge zone of the Cape Flats Aquifer.

The DA was told about this. Yet, they added to the water crisis by ignoring proposals.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... to preserve the aquifer. The DA's internal divisions and propensity to support development at all costs, has added to the crisis precipitated by the drought.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. Hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The social ills of society begin when we do not give underprivileged young people an opportunity to escape their circumstances. In the Western Cape, young people continue to be at risk of drugs, gangsterism and a life of crime. It is only through dedicated social development initiatives, and an opportunity-rich society through sound governance, that young people are afforded a chance at a life they value.



The DA-led Western Cape Government is fully aware of the realities in which our young people live. This is why our Government is fully committed to youth development. The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport's After School Game-Changer gives children an opportunity to capitalise on their artistic and sporting talent after school, instead of spending time on the streets.

Our Department of Social Development has Youth Cafés in underprivileged communities in our province. Here, underprivileged and rural teens are provided with counselling and mentoring, skills development, and internet access for greater learning.

Our Department of Community Safety's Chrysalis Academy provides rehabilitation for youth, vulnerable to the effects of crime and poverty, the opportunity to participate in a programme which focuses on the individual's physical, psychological and spiritual development, resulting in realistic, sustainable and life changing results.

Furthermore, the Department of the Premier's Advancement of Youth project provides qualifying matriculants an opportunity to intern within the public sector, gaining marketable skills for their CV's, work experience, networking, and a chance to the fine-tune their career prospects.

It is very clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this DA-led Western Cape Government has taken an inter-ministerial and committed approach to

advancing and catering for our youth at risk. I thank you. [Applause.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the EFF, I see the DA again.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I welcome that the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration (CCMA) is acting as an intermediary for the bus strikes which began Wednesday 18 April 2018 - yesterday.

It is deeply concerning that the South African Transport and Allied Workers Union (SATAWU) and the South African Road Passenger Bargaining Council (SARPBAC) announced an indefinite strike as it has a direct effect on commuters throughout the province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as the DA we urge all stakeholders to find the middle ground in this negotiation process in order to bring about the normal resumption of services as soon as possible.

The unions have proposed a one-year, 12% across the board wage increase agreement with a minimum basic wage of R8 000, while the employers have offered a three-year agreement with 7% for the first year, 7,25% for 2019 and

7,5% for 2020.

The strike costs the province an estimated R10 million a day and puts financial strain on commuters who must resort to more inconvenient and expensive forms of alternative transport. I therefore call on all unions, employers and relevant stakeholders to immediately reach an agreement and avoid any prolonging of this strike action.

Buses must as soon as possible resume their services, as commuters can no longer rely on Metrorail's services. In the City of Cape Town, Mr Deputy Speaker, Metrorail's passengers have dropped by roughly 50% from over 675 000 passengers in 2000 to an estimated 360 000 passengers in 2017. Train cancellations in the Western Cape have also increased from 3% in 2015 to 15% in 2017.

The DA in the Western Cape is committed to ensuring that residents have safe and reliable transport services; enabling employment, educational and economic opportunities. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, member. Your time has also expired. I see the ANC, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the stream of complaints against the DA-run Government's secrecy on health care failures grows and yet the DA keeps its ostrich head in the sand.

The present spat between the Provincial Department of Health and oversight by the National Council of Provinces, led by Western Cape Legislature permanent delegate, Dumisane Ximbi, showed up the DA.

What does the DA have to hide? Everyday newspapers splash horrific stories of bad service at provincial health facilities. [Interjection.] Yet the DA hides the facts and figures from proper constitutional oversight. Not even the so-called complaints mechanisms' reports are shared with the Legislature for scrutiny to assess whether the budget is adequate to address challenges. It is hidden in the backrooms.

But, the DA manipulation does not stop there. Community members tell us the DA is busy with election trickery as it loads health facility forums with DA MPL's and members. This is to silence community inputs and to hide the truth and real picture.

This DA culture of secrecy is not conducive for good and transparent democracy. In the case of the Moorreesburg Hospital a question was raised in the budget period to the MEC and HOD. They gave us the assurance that Moorreesburg Hospital is not closing. Yet, today community members of Moorreesburg are telling us that the hospital is indeed closing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: ...and that the community of Moorreesburg must from

now on use the hospital in Beaufort West.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, but the secrecy of this Department ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ...is not conducive for this democracy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the DA. Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Infrastructure investment and the maintenance of existing infrastructure is critical for promoting job creation, broadening the economic base and raising growth potential, unlocking economic opportunities and addressing socio-economic needs and challenges.

Tata Madiba once said, and I quote him: "Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world." These words, although spoken years ago, remain true to this very day. Therefore, Mr Deputy Speaker, in order to provide quality education, one would logically assume that this requires appropriate infrastructure that contributes to a dynamic learning environment.

†Agb Adjunkspeaker, die DA-geleide Wes-Kaapse Regering erken dat deur op 'n pragmatiese wyse uitvoering hieraan te gee, onder andere infrastruktuurverbeterings by skole, dit op sigself doeltreffender toegang tot skole fasiliteer, sowel as verbeterde leeruitkomst.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Government acknowledges that through applying this pragmatically, amongst others infrastructure improvements at schools, it in itself facilitates more efficient access to schools, as well as improved learning outcomes.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, this year we saw an additional 25 000 learners enter the province without additional funding from the National Treasury. This has resulted in the WCED having less funding available to allocate to the building of new schools, as well as maintenance of existing schools.

However, this has not stopped the DA-led Western Cape Government to continue its efforts in ensuring that the learners of this province receive not only a quality education, but an environment conducive to learning.

†Ter opsomming, as gevolg van tyd, R531 miljoenn word toebedeel aan die DA vir hierdie boekjaar om infrastruktuurverbeteringe aan te bring by skole in terme van die bou van nuwe skole. Daar gaan 7 hierdie jaar kom en ook in terme van die vervanging van uitgediende skole, gaan 3 verweselik word

hierdie jaar. Dit sal bydra tot 'n gehalteverbetering, ook in terme van leeruitkomste en sal ook die leerders die geleentheid gee om in 'n lewensvatbare leeromgewing te leer.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[To summarise, because of time, R531 million is allocated to the DA for this financial year to effect infrastructure improvements at schools in terms of the building of new schools. There will be 7 coming this year and also in terms of the replacement of outdated schools, 3 will be realised this year. It will also contribute to quality improvement, also in terms of learning outcomes and providing the learners the opportunity to study in a viable learning environment.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Member, your time has expired.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Ek wil net sê ten slotte,

[Mr B D KIVEDO: I just want to finally say,] the proof of the pudding lies in the eating! And where the DA is in government ... [Interjection.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: ... no child is left behind. Eish! Thank you. [Applause.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Tyd is verstreke.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time has expired.] In the absence of the ACDP, I see the ANC. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC Winde earlier referred to a song by Michael Jackson which said, "They don't care about us". The DA as usual has selectively quoted. I suggest that they read that poem or rather the words or that song and be educated.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is hy!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I also want to tell you who really cares about the people. It certainly is not the DA. If the municipality is unstable, we have just heard, there will be no success. Let me tell you, what a tangled web we weave is so true of the DA mess hogging the newspapers every day.

It is Patricia de Lille pitted against her very own leaders, against FedEx, against her caucus and the lengths you are going to, to get rid of a strong woman who dared to speak up against injustice in the ranks of the DA. The latest on the list of her sins is her letter addressed to the Mayco members, not the press, the Mayco members, asking for urgent intervention. Raising the fact that it is the worst capital project underspend in the City of Cape Town in years, yet the City hikes service charges by almost 30% to enhance the Capital Budget in the next financial year while the finance available is not



spent.

†‘n AGB LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: As the Mayor, she is raising concerns over the huge underspend in the City on Capital Budget, the greatest being the unallocated amounts on water related services such as desalination and tapping into aquifers. Also, the electrification programme for backyarders has a 71% underspend.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who cares about who?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Right. There are more than 50 examples of underspending almost to the amount of R2 billion. We are often subjected here to grandstanding by the DA, on how they are allocated additional funding due to underspending elsewhere, but now because of their double standards, their silence on the City of Cape Town's capital underspend screams in its silence.

Mr C M DUGMORE: J P Smith [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The DA Finance MEC has reneged on his oversight role over municipal spending to allow such shocking underspend especially on water-related projects ... [Interjections.] while people are queuing

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...on a daily basis for their basic right. A last sentence?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The DA wanted a disaster declared. The real disaster is the DA uncoordinated planning and spending to alleviate the drought.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, member. Your time has expired. The last one is for the DA again. Hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I commend the Provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for their commitment to ensuring that indigenous games are not lost, so that current and future generations of children can enjoy playing them too. Such games include Dibeke, Kho-kho, Ntimo, Diketo, Jukskei, Ncuvu, Morabaraba and Intonga.

The games are practised at the community level through Indigenous Games structures in the different Western Cape districts. In 2017 there were 1 723 district participants. This total includes the Cape Winelands with 301

participants, the Central Karoo with 223 participants, Eden with 303 participants, Metropole with 397 participants, Overberg with 234 participants, and the West Coast with 265 participants. The Department further ensures that indigenous games are promoted at its 20 recreation centres across the province.

Last year trials were held to select participants to perform on behalf of the province; and over 300 players were invited from the various districts. This year on 21 July 2018, each district will have a full team per game, totalling 700 participants.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, this DA in the Western Cape's commitment to the revival and sustenance of indigenous culture and heritage is further demonstrated by the public hearings underway; allowing public participation on the Traditional and Khoisan Leadership Bill 2015. The Bill makes provision for the recognition of the Khoisan and their leaders. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of Statements. We move further down the Order Paper, the Draft Resolution on the Order Paper, standing in the name of hon Wenger. I see the hon member.

### **DRAFT RESOLUTION**

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move the motion in my name on the Order Paper.

That the Rules Committee be tasked with drafting a policy for Members of the House relating to maternity, paternity, adoption and surrogacy leave, and that the Committee report such draft policy to the House for consideration.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being agreed to? No objection. Agreed to. [Applause.] I see the Chief Whip.

#### Motion

(In terms of Standing Rule 147 (1)(b))

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I hope I also get a round of applause. I move the motion in my name on the Order Paper. Thank you. [Applause.]

That the Standing Committee on the Premier in future be called the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection. I sense there is no objection to that one. No objection. Agreed to. Hon member Dyantyi? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTI: [Inaudible.] cosmetic change. I mean they cannot even ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...have a Children's Commissioner and Environmental Commissioner ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...too busy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are off target now. [Interjections.] We will continue with Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Botha.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the successes of the Public Health system in the Western Cape versus the failures in other provinces, I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Any further? [Interjections.] Any further? Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the inadequacy of the provincial equitable share formula to respond to the needs of education and the unfairness of the national quintile policy.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Lekker.

*[Interjections.]*

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi Sekela Somlomo.

*[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.]* †I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the poor state and shortage of CCTV cameras in the Cape Flats under the DA, to assist in the fight against crime. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Gillion.

[Interjections.] Hon member Gillion, you may proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the challenges experienced at Khayelitsha District Hospital under the DA administration and the unacceptable level of services delivered to this community.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Any further? Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the urgent need for the appointment of a Children's Commissioner. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Lekker, just pull the microphone closer.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I give notice that I shall move

That the House debates the escalation of gang violence in the province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that. Are there any further? For the last time? Hon member Joseph are you standing up to move?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speake. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the housing needs in the Western Cape relating to budget allocations, housing waiting lists and backyard dwellers. I so move. Thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. If there are no further, we then move to the next one where motions are given without notice. Hon member Simmers.



**MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Sydney Michaels, 7 years old, a Grade 2 pupil from Pacaltsdorp in George, who was awarded her SA colours in chess these past school holidays. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Motion with notice, that the House ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Without notice.

Ms D GOPIE: Sorry. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing on of Bishop V V Mtini, one of the longest serving ministers of the National Baptist Church of Southern Africa, who was ordained in 1981 at Mbekweni, Paarl, in the Western Cape; notes further that Bishop Mtini was the first chaplain of the ANC in the Western Cape; and conveys our condolences to his

family, friends and comrades. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the opening of the Western Cape Social Development Department's 45th local office in Beaufort West yesterday; further that we congratulate the Western Cape Social Development Minister Albert Fritz for his persistent efforts to grow a network of local offices which bring social work services and innovative services such as the Child Play Therapy Rooms closer to poor communities. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? There is an objection. [Interjections.] Order. It will be printed on the Order Paper and we stay in the Karoo. We stay in Beaufort West. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms M T DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness that longstanding Western Cape ANC members passed on during the month of April; and conveys condolences to the families of comrades Yengwayo Kutta and Christine Julies. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Wayne Naidoo, our Serjeant-at-Arms at the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for being elected as Chairperson of the School Governing Body of Bernardino Heights High School in Kraaifontein. May he deliver the same high standards in his new incumbency as he does at Parliament. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice nor objection to the motion itself. Motion is agreed to. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 25 unemployed young people from Robertson and surrounding communities who completed the Youth Entrepreneurship Workshop. This Workshop was hosted by the Department of Social Development, in conjunction with the Langeberg Municipality; further notes that we congratulate the Western Cape Social Development Minister Albert Fritz for his unwavering commitment to youth development. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved? Is there an objection? [Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the matter of police officer constable Ncedo Katoyi after he and his partner were ambushed by a gang of armed men when they were responding to a call to deal with an alleged assault incident in Site C last week; further notes and condemns the DA-led administration in the City and the province for the poor state of CCTV cameras, which makes it difficult for the police to identify the culprits;

calls on SAPS to speed up investigations so that they can bring the perpetrators to book; and conveys condolences to his family, friends and colleagues. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved? Are there objections? [Interjections.] Hon member Joseph, is that an objection?

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Objection recorded. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Simmers.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the delay in the signing of the IPP's by the National Minister Jeff Radebe, which would have been an opportunity to save the public from the looming electricity crisis, further notes that this House condemns the mismanagement and irresponsible process management by the National Government. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? [Interjections.] There is an

objection. It will be recorded. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 8 community workers who will graduate next week Monday from the UWC Substance Abuse Graduation Programme; further notes that we congratulate the Western Cape Social Development Department under the leadership of Minister Albert Fritz which has shown a real commitment to expanding the resources available to poor communities, to tackle drug and alcohol addiction; since 2009 services for treating substance abuse have risen from 7 drug treatment centres, under the previous ANC Government, to this DA Government funding 36 NGO's working at 51 drug and alcohol treatment sites across the province. This is progress and we thank Minister Fritz for his leadership in this regard. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I object. We object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. There is an objection. Can I just point out, hon member Botha, that your wording, the format is a little bit problematic, but I will accept it for this opportunity. Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry. I have already objected. Mr Deputy

Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the move by Capetonians who asked the Public Protector to investigate the DA-run City Council's proposed 27% water and sanitation tariff hikes; and condemns the unreasonable increase on basic services in the City of Cape Town, under the DA.

You can object.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Are there any objections to that?

[Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sends condolences to the Van Lingen family due to the passing on of Elza van Lingen, Mayor of Kouga Municipality in the Eastern Cape Province. Elza van Lingen served as DA leader in the NCOP from 2009 to 2016. Her contribution in various positions, building a democratic and accountable state will surely be missed. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I take it there is no objection to the moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Olivier first.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the WCED continues to ignore the crisis of safety in schools while incidents of violent attacks on teachers and learners are increasing; notes further that last week two incidents occurred where a Saldanha teacher was shot dead and a boy at a Manenberg School was stabbed on school grounds; and calls on the National Government to come and assist the Provincial Government. I so move. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections? I sense there is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Order. Hon member Mackenzie first.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I move without notice:



That the House congratulates the residents of Mitchells Plain, the British Consul General in Cape Town, Edward Roman, and his team as well as Miss Earth, Irini Moutzouris, for participating in a beach clean-up at Monwabisi Beach on Saturday 14 April 2018 in preparation for World Clean-up Day on 15 September 2018 and urge the residents of Mitchells Plain to continue to work with Government to keep our communities and the environment clean. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that families who fear for their lives in the Marikana Informal Settlement in Philippi have started to move out of the area following the spike in violence which resulted in the death of a man who was shot last weekend; notes further that the patrolling equipment which was promised to the community members last year, has not yet been delivered by the office of MEC Plato and his Department; and calls for swift action from all relevant authorities to combat violence in that area. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved? Is there an objection? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Anwille Barends, our administrative clerk at the Western Cape Provincial Parliament ... [Interjection.]

†Me P Z LEKKER: Jy bly nie daar nie!

[Ms P Z LEKKER: You do not live there!]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Nee-nee-nee, ek is besig.

[Mr B D KIVEDO: No-no-no, I am busy.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I will start from the beginning. [Interjection.] Good. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Anwille Barends, our administrative clerk at the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, for being elected as Chairperson of the School Governing Body of Norwood Primary School in Mitchells Plain. May he deliver the same high standards in his new incumbency as he does at Parliament. I so move. Thank you. [Applause.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Gillion. Correct name, you may now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good Kivedo. Those are your comrades. Oom Kivedo, those are your comrades. †Goed. Goed. [Good. Good.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the DA's support of racists in the province as confirmed by the Education MEC, who refused to cancel a Steve Hofmeyr concert at Overberg Primary School, despite a public outcry; notes further that the MEC said she supports the right to freedom of speech; that the House condemns the DA for its support of racists. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the report by the City which shows that between January last year and February this year, its anti-land invasion unit officers demolished more than 6600 informal dwellings; notes further that a high number of illegal land grabs and increasing numbers of people in informal settlements in the province shows the inability of the DA Government to build houses for people and exposes the failures of the backyarder programmes, and further calls on the DA Government to prioritise building proper homes for the poor.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? Are there objections? [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends FedEx South Africa and its Managing Director, Mr André Bresler, in conjunction with the Oasis Reach for a Dream Foundation in Mitchells Plain for their launch of the “Field in a Box” soccer field that caters for the communities of Philippi and Mitchells Plain; furthermore urges more corporates, through their corporate social responsibility, to follow the example set by FedEx South Africa and invest in the social development of underprivileged communities in the Cape Flats. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved? Is there an objection? That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Dijana. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms T M DIJANA: I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that collective water consumption in Cape Town remains way above the required daily target of 450 million litres; notes further that the average dam levels across the province continue to drop; and calls on the National Government to further intervene to prevent a greater crisis. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Fish Hoek Surf Lifesaving Club for winning the Overall National Club Championship title at the recent national championships held in Port Elizabeth.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Lekker.

Mr D JOSEPH: I object.

†Me P Z LEKKER: Ek *worry* nie.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: I am not worried.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Me P Z LEKKER: Julle kan maar so maak, ek *worry* nie. [Gelag.]

[Ms P Z LEKKER: You can do that, I am not worried. [Laughter.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the launch of a probe by Ipid after a

Metro Police officer allegedly shot dead a man and wounded two others at Mfuleni police station at the weekend after the officer was allegedly stabbed; and call on Ipid to speed up its investigation. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the confirmed cases of listeriosis, nationally, have risen to over 1 000 and the death toll has increased to 193; notes further that the Western Cape accounts for the second highest number of confirmed cases; and calls on the Provincial Health Department to coordinate the containment of the outbreak and run more intense awareness programmes. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? Is there an objection? It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Magaxa. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. [Interjections.] Hon Magaxa, you may proceed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends UCT for its decision to rename the New Science Lecture Theatre the Chris Hani Lecture Theatre in honour of the late ANC stalwart, SACP General Secretary and uMkhonto weSizwe Chief of Staff who was assassinated 25 years ago. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Gopie.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Speak to him Chief Whip. Ask him why he objected? Please ask him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Rivonia trialist, Dennis Goldberg, turned 85 on 11 April; notes further that for this year's birthday he held a concert to raise funds for a multi-million-rand House ...[Interjections.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. You are interfering with your own member.

Ms D GOPIE:

Further notes that for this year's birthday he held a concert to raise funds for a multi-million-rand House of Hope Centre, which will provide music lessons, performing arts, life and language skills; congratulates him and wishes him well raising funds for this noble cause.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends Computa Centre South Africa and Mr Paul Norris for their continued contribution to social development through their donation of computers to OASIS Reach for a Dream in Mitchells Plain and Philippi, ensuring that the youth have access; further notes that these computers will serve as a tool to bring education and recreation together for the greater benefit of underprivileged communities and the youth in particular; I move so.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Ms P Z LEKKER: Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. That will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Chief Whip first.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes of the almost total lack of absence of the ANC representation at Dennis Goldberg's birthday. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. [Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Order. I see the hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. DA caucus, you may object in advance. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the announcement that there will be no cuts to the number of police officers in the Western Cape, despite the DA going wild last year, confusing people about so-called plans to reduce the police service in the Western Cape. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the ... [Interjections.] There is an objection. [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the announcement by the Airports Company of South Africa that Cape Town International Airport will be renamed; notes further that the renaming process was initiated after Transport Minister, Mr Blade Nzimande, had directed ACSA to facilitate the process; and commends the Minister for providing leadership in this regard and calls on communities to submit their proposals.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House thanks the National Minister of Water and Sanitation, uGugile Nkwinti, who intervened to save Saldanha and other West Coast towns from having taps run dry due to the empty Misverstand Dam, by facilitating the release of water from other dams like Berg River and also for his assistance in the Province of the Western Cape, where the DA failed to properly and efficiently manage this resource prudently; and furthermore notes that the average water usage in Cape Town still grows and exceeds the limit set to overcome the present drought spell. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the DA's conference for amending its Constitution to remove its Mayor in the City of Cape Town, Patricia de Lille, from office after she has helped it to get a two third majority in the 2016 local government elections. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I sense there are objections there. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Dyantyi. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is a good motion to listen to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. Hon member Dyantyi, you may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: A very good motion to listen to. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the continued collapse in governance in Cape Town due to DA infighting, which resulted in the failure to spend more than 40% of its Capital Budget; notes too that the City wants to increase tariffs for water by almost 30%; further welcomes the Cape Chamber of

Commerce's public condemnation of this, due to what it termed "the crisis in the City leadership"; and condemns the DA's administration in the City for compromising service delivery to the people. I so move. Please object.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being move? [Interjections.] There is an objection. [Interjections.] Order. Order. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with great concern, media reports that Eskom is owed R13,5 million by municipalities on default payments throughout the country; all of these are ANC municipalities; further notes that none of the Western Cape municipalities owe any monies to Eskom and wishes to applaud and encourage them to continue on that trajectory and keep a clean bill of service to their creditors. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Are there any ...[Interjections.] Order. There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the disruption and chaotic management of water supply in Cape Town and the entire Western Cape by the former Minister of Water and Sanitation, Nomvula Mokonyane; and further notes ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA:

...that the distinct style of leadership, competence and respect for inter-governmental relations by the new Minister, Gugile Nkwinti, is encouraging, and that this Parliament applauds this form of action and approach by Minister Nkwinti as progressive in embracing good governance and a sustainable supply of water to all affected municipalities in the Western Cape. I so move. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] I sense there is an objection. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Olivier, are you wanting to move?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. Any further? Hon member Mnqasela? Are you done? [Interjections.] If there is no further, that will then bring us to the end of the business for today. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:59.