

---

THURSDAY, 19 JULY 2018

---

## PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sorry, sorry man. †Ons weet die DA val anderkant, daar is baie... [Tussenwerpsels.] [We know the DA falls on the other side, there are many... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Order! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sorry my friend, you know exactly. Sorry my friends. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is rude.

An HON MEMBER: That is low.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sorry friend. We know the DA is falling apart.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, Acting Chief Whip. I see the Chief Whip for the DA. [Interjections.]

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the Speaker's Debate. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. Thank you Chief Whip, I will see the Speaker. The topic for the debate in the Speaker's Debate is "*Be the Legacy, Celebrating the Centenary Commemoration of Nelson Mandela.*" I recognise the Speaker.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

**SPEAKERS DEBATE:**

“Be the legacy”: Celebrating the centenary commemoration  
of Nelson Mandela (1918–2013)

The SPEAKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, fellow South Africans. In 2018 South Africa and the people of the world celebrate the centenary of Nelson Mandela. The theme for the centenary celebrations is “Be the Legacy”, meaning that each person should emulate the true values of Madiba, a great leader who showed the world what selflessness and forgiveness are, who strived for the freedom of all people, and achieved justice and equality for all. By living his values, we can keep the dream of a better South Africa and world alive.

The Western Cape Provincial Parliament has developed a fact sheet where we walk in Mandela’s footsteps from his birth in 1918 until his passing in 2013, pausing at important landmarks along the journey. Today I will talk about what I believe it means to be the legacy.

Preparing the speech was probably my most challenging, to capture in words not just the facts and dates that make a life but the essential truth and essence of Tata Madiba, a man who moved the nation towards justice and in the process moved billions around the world through their speeches on him, including Barack Obama, some text of which I included in my speech.

Born on 18 July 1918 in Mvezo, a village in the district of Qunu in the Eastern Cape Province, far from the corridors of power, a boy raised herding

cattle and tutored by the elders of his Thembu tribe.

Who knew that he would emerge as the last great liberator of the 20<sup>th</sup> century when he died on the 5<sup>th</sup> of December 2013?

In 1941 a 23 year-old young man from a rural village in the then Transkei arrived in the City of Johannesburg, having been expelled from the Fort Hare University for leading a student protest against management practices at the institution. He was offered a job as a night watchman at the Crown Mines with the intention to continue his studies at the University of Wits. Writing in his autobiography, *A Long Walk to Freedom*, Mandela later recalled his first encounter with the apartheid police force when he explained that he was only in Johannesburg temporarily. The temporary stay turned a humble man from a humble village into a dominant force that transformed South Africa and astounded the world.

Tata Madiba was sent to prison for the freedom of people. Not only that, but for a life of harmony for all South Africans regardless of gender, nationality and race. Moreover he accepted the consequence of his actions knowing that standing up to powerful interests and injustice carries a price.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is so true, so true. Well done, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: He said: "I have fought against white domination and I have fought against black domination. I have cherished the ideal of a democratic

and free society in which all persons live together in harmony and with equal opportunities. It is an ideal which I hope to live for and to achieve but if need be it is an ideal for which I am prepared to die.”

Mandela taught us the power of action but he also taught us the power of ideas; the importance of reason and arguments; the need to study not only those you agree with but also those who you do not agree with.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Uitstekend!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Excellent!]

The SPEAKER: He understood that ideas cannot be contained by prison walls or extinguished by a bullet.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek hoop hulle luister.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I hope they are listening.]

The SPEAKER: Mandela believed that action and ideas are not enough. They had to be chiselled into law and institutions. He also showed in painstaking negotiations the will to transfer power and draft new laws. He was not afraid to compromise for the sake of a larger goal. The Constitution that emerged was worthy of this democracy. True to his vision of laws that protect minority as well as majority rights and the precious freedoms of every South African. He did not only change laws. He changed hearts.

How true Mandela's words that day in court have become. He lived his words. His mission as an anti-apartheid revolutionary was equality and freedom for all women, men and children. He stood for what was right and just for every human being. This is the ideal he was jailed for, yet he did not let the harshness of isolation of jail and the motives for his jailers kill the dream he was determined to live for. Since his release from 27 years of imprisonment he has become a symbol of reconciliation in a world divided by an insatiable amount of hate. He became a symbol of love and hope. His positive attitude was forgiveness of those who oppressed a nation; his willingness to embark on a journey of reconciliation to build a South Africa for all. Madiba said that children sleeping and begging in the street is a sign of an unfinished job, that there can be no keener revelation of a society's soul than the way in which it treats its children.

Looking at the extent of women and child abuse, it cannot be what Madiba would want to see in our country. It cannot be what he left behind or what we as public representatives leave behind, to name just one human glaring human rights violation. Madiba was more than a political leader or the President of our country for an all too brief five year period. He nurtured the struggle for our freedom. He inspired a continent, served as the conscience of the globe and eventually through his words and his actions transformed a generation. 27 years as a prisoner of conscience did not dim the light of hope that he ignited in the hearts of freedom loving South Africans, nor did it extinguish the burning passion in his own spirit to continue fighting for a just, equitable and democratic country and society. Those devoted to public service can give

meaning to his words and vision. We will always be able to draw on his words of encouragement and his personal wisdom.

Like no other leader before him, Nelson Mandela transcended definitions of time, race, gender and political philosophy. He was as much at ease in the presence of queens and presidents as when he walked in the rural streets of Wupperthal or Khayelitsha. Individually I was struck by his humility, wisdom and his concern for the issues affecting ordinary people. Mandela also made time to engage on issues that affected those at grassroots level.

A statement was once made by Kofi Annan, the former Secretary-General of the United Nations, who said: “People often ask me what difference can one person make in the face of injustice, conflict, human rights violations, mass poverty and disease.” He answered by citing the courage, tenacity, dignity and magnanimity of Nelson Mandela.

We can never know how much of his character was innate in him, or how much was shaped in a dark and solitary cell, but we remember the gestures large and small, introducing his jailers as honoured guests at his inauguration; taking time, taking to the pitch in a Springbok jersey, turning his family’s heartbreak into a call to come confront HIV/AIDS. That revealed the depth of his empathy and his understanding.

Mandela understood the ties that bind the human spirit. South Africa has a word, *ubuntu*, that captures Mandela’s greatest gift, his recognition that we

are all bound together in ways that are invisible to the eye; that there is a oneness to humanity; that we achieve ourselves by sharing ourselves with others and caring for those around us.

As citizens and public servants we can follow the example of a man who transcended divisions, breached differences and healed a nation that was scarred by a historical legacy of more than three centuries. Mandela himself said: “True reconciliation does not consist of merely forgetting the past; it also requires a commitment to a new and shared future.”

As public representatives irrespective of our political differences, I think this is an opportunity to unite about shared values and a broad commitment about how we want the Western Cape and the broader South Africa to develop in the years to come. Let us build a new legacy of growth, development and social inclusion where we can realise the dreams and aspirations of successive generations where we can truly build a province and a South Africa to our heart’s desire.

Each one of us has an experience where this world icon influenced our lives in personal ways and I see that many members have pictures of them with Madiba on the walls in their offices. Given the sweep of his life, the scope of his accomplishments, the adoration that he so rightly earned, it is tempting to remember Nelson Mandela as an icon, smiling and serene, detached from the tawdry affairs of lesser men, but Madiba himself strongly resisted such a lifeless portrait. Instead, Madiba insisted on sharing with us his doubts and

his fears, his miscalculations along with his victories. He said: "I am not a saint..." he said, "...unless you think of a saint as a sinner who keeps on trying."

It was precisely because he could admit to imperfection because he could be so full of good humour, despite the heavy burdens he carried that we loved him so much. He was not a bust of marble. He was a man of flesh and blood, a son, a husband, a father and a friend. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So good, I just wish the Premier was listening to you as you are speaking.

The SPEAKER: That is why we learned so much from him and that is why we can still learn from him. In the arc of his life we see a man who earned his place in history through struggle and shrewdness, persistence and faith. He also tells us what is possible - not just in the pages of history books, but in our own lives as well.

Madiba showed us the power of action of taking risk on behalf of our ideals but like other early giants of the struggle, the Sisulu's and Tambo's, Madiba disciplined his anger and channelled his desire to fight into organisations and platforms and strategies for action so men and women could stand up for their God-given dignity. As Mandela said shortly after his retirement in an interview, "You have a limited time to stay on earth. You must use this time given to you for the purpose of transforming your country into what you

desire it to be - a democratic, non-racial, non-sexist country.”

Looking at Madiba’s humility and integrity there are no levels to humility and integrity. You either have it and you practice it or you do not have it and you do not practice it. There is no in between.

I encourage all South Africans to align your actions with your beliefs. Let us all try to think of ourselves a little bit less and of others a little bit more.

In closing I would like to share a quote from Madiba on integrity and he says: “As I have said, the first thing is to be honest with yourself. You can never have an impact on society if you have not changed yourself. Great peacemakers are all people of integrity, of honesty, but humility.”

Be the legacy, members. I thank you. [Applause.]

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It gives me great pleasure to participate in this Nelson Mandela: *Be the Legacy* debate. Nelson Mandela is the father of our nation. He could also be seen as a father figure

to the rest of the world.

Nelson Mandela International Day 2018 marks 100 years since the birth of Nelson Mandela. The centenary is an occasion to reflect on his life and his legacy and to follow his call to make of the world a better place. The Nelson Mandela Foundation is dedicating this year's Mandela Day to Action against Poverty, honouring Nelson Mandela's leadership and devotion to fighting poverty and promoting social justice for all.

Nelson Mandela said, and I quote: "What counts in life is not the mere fact that we have lived. It is what difference we have made to the lives of others that will determine the significance of the life we lead."

Mr Deputy Speaker, I was fortunate enough to visit Robben Island this past Monday with the British High Commissioner Nigel Casey, Ed Roman, the Consul-General Cape Town and his team including former Ms Earth, Catherine Constantinides, who is also an environmentalist, social activist and one of South Africa's chief volunteers. The visit to Robben Island was to clean parts of the island and indeed it was a great success.

This visit also served as a reminder of the significant life lived by a great human being. Not only is his name, his legacy and his life a pillar of great hope for this nation but once again it gives one great inspiration to do good and live a life of great service and volunteerism.

Mandela once said, and I quote: "History will judge us by the difference we make in the everyday lives of children."

It was extra special to accompany youth from the disadvantaged community and I want to thank again the British High Commissioner and his team for making this possible, for spearheading this initiative. Tata Madiba helped shape this beautiful country to what it is today. Tata Madiba is remembered to this very day for the dedication and commitment to volunteerism. We need to teach our youth more about volunteerism. Mandela was the volunteering chief who volunteered his time and energy for the life of many people in this world. That is why I was proud to be part of this initiative to accompany these kids from disadvantaged communities for them to experience and learn about the life of Nelson Mandela and to educate them about the value of helping others. Satisfaction from volunteerism and doing good is far better than anything else. These young Mandela's went back in their communities with great excitement and energy to assist and help others.

In the words of one of the kids, and I quote: †"Meneer, ek gaan ander mense help, want Mandela was 'n regte held." [ "Sir, I am going to help other people, because Mandela was a real hero." ]

The late Nelson Mandela was a true statesman. We saw him tackling the HIV/AIDS epidemic as a matter of urgency including revealing to the world that his own son, Makgatho Mandela, died because of AIDS. It was the first time a leader on this continent, and I dare say a leader in the world, has

spoken about the loss of a very close member, a very close family member to AIDS, and in this case his own son. This is a person who led by example.

The late Nelson Mandela said and I quote: “Sport has the power to change the world. It has the power to inspire. It has the power to unite people in a way that very little does. It speaks to youth in a language they understand. Sports can create hope, where there was once only despair. It is more powerful than governments in breaking down racial barriers.”

The late Nelson Mandela was an avid sportsman. Not only was he a great boxer, an athlete who ran two hours every morning as a young man, it was indeed through sport that we were united as a rainbow nation in 1994/5. Who can forget the Springboks led by Francois Pienaar winning the 1995 Rugby World Cup and Bafana Bafana winning the African Cup of Nations led by Neil Tovey in 1996. Through sport the Springboks and Bafana Bafana brought our beautiful nation to joyful tears and a spirit of hope and inspiration and opportunity to the minds of many South Africans.

We have recently seen how the victorious Springboks led by Captain Siyamthanda Kolisi during the England tour to South Africa filled the hearts of South Africans with great hope and inspiration. We also saw the excitement on the face of South Africa where Kevin Anderson beat the legendary Roger Federer and subsequently made the final. Another South African, Raven Klaasen, who successfully made it to the doubles final at Wimbledon and wheelchair tennis sensation Kgothatso Kajee Montjane who

made the first semi-finals and was only beaten by top seed Diederik Groot. These are South African heroes from diverse backgrounds... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Nice, who is going to tell Madiba what you are doing today [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...inspiring us and they flew the South African flag with distinction with their outstanding performances at the All England Club. The spirit of sport as a uniting factor will indeed be acknowledged as one of Nelson Mandela's greatest legacies.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we are the new Mandela's and to strive to live his legacy in all facets of our lives.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you saying you now?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We are the legacy that the late Nelson Mandela left behind. Before the late Nelson Mandela passed on he gave us a baton of hope which we dare not lose. We need to build on this a prosperous non-racial South Africa that will take this country forward... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mandela would never serve the DA, Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...together as the nation we share this beautiful country South Africa and we all need to fight for what is right and just for

the people of South Africa. We can and we will achieve prosperity in this country and it is all up to us as leaders in this Chamber to make this happen.

We are the legacy. We need to be the legacy that Mandela left behind. Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: God is watching you.

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: God seën suid-afrika. [God bless South Africa.]  
[Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! The Leader of the Opposition, Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you the Speaker for the input.

This year the country celebrates the centenary of Nelson Mandela as well as that of Mama Albertina Sisulu. President Ramaphosa in his maiden speech State of the Nation Address declared 2018 the year of Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela and called on all South Africans to play their part to honour and emulate Madiba's values. Let us remember and honour these selfless leaders for the sacrifices they made in the liberation struggle. However, today we are talking about †uMadiba omde uRolihlahla uDalibhunga.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He was one of our best and finest products of what [Inaudible.] the reputable revolution alliance led by the most powerful liberation movement in our lifetime. Let me state from the beginning that Mandela loved the ANC because he strongly believed that it made him, hence every time right-winged and liberal elements attempt to isolate him from his political home he will correct them that he was part and parcel of the ANC leadership collective. He even told them that when he died he will join the ANC branch in heaven and if there is no-one he would establish a branch of the ANC and I believe that he is in an ANC branch as now. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am sure there is an ANC branch. I am sure about that one.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mandela at a young age through his influence in the ANC became the chief volunteer and the leader of the 1952 defiance campaign against the apartheid regime, which called for civil disobedience, boycott and other forms of non-violent resistance. The apartheid regime responded by brutal means to the extent that it pushed people outside the urban areas.

The Sharpeville massacre of 1960 marked a turning point in the history of South Africa's liberation struggle. The ANC and other anti-apartheid formations were banned. The ANC launched its military wing Umkhonto we

Sizwe and Mandela became one of the first cadres to undergo military training.

Frustrated by the manner in which the regime reacted to peaceful projects he declared: “The time comes in the life of any people, when there remain only two choices, to submit or fight. That time has now come to South Africa. We will not submit and we will fight back with all means at our disposal in defence of our rights, our people and our freedom.”

Mandela became the commander-in-chief of Umkhonto we Sizwe. In 1962 Mandela left the country for military training in Algeria and to arrange training for other MK cadres. On his return he was arrested for leaving the country illegally and was sentenced to five years imprisonment in November 1962 and he was later charged in the Rivonia trial and sentenced to life imprisonment with other comrades such as Sisulu, Mbeki, and others.

Hon Speaker, when we celebrate Madiba’s legacy we are not only celebrating the incarcerated political leaders as well as the country’s first democratic elected President. We celebrate all his sacrifices he made to create a better South Africa for all. We celebrate the leader of the national democratic revolution which is directed towards transformation of South Africa from colonialism of a special time; a system that subjected the black majority into slavery in the country of their forefathers. This is a system that Mandela and the ANC fought to destroy and we continue in that particular struggle today.

Hon Speaker, without offending anything on this positive debate on Madiba's legacy I would like to state the fact that our struggle led by this hero and other comrades is an antithesis of what new liberalism stands for, especially the white imperialism in our country which pretends to be interested in our cause while in actual fact determined to protect and defend white privileges accumulated through exploitation, oppression of the black majority and deepening racial inequalities in this particular country. It is in this context that one gets extremely devastated and feel insulted when the DA shouts from the rooftop claiming to be better than the National Party, while they know very well that they directly participated in the putting ANC leaders including Madiba in jail and formed part of that army that killed innocent young people that fought for their freedom.

Lest we forget that during the 1950's the Liberal Party, the Progressive Federal Party which later became the Democratic Party of which now after a fusion with the National Party became the Democratic Alliance, legitimised apartheid through its participation in the apartheid Parliament as represented by our Premier Helen Zille's role model, Ms Helen Suzman, who had no interest whatsoever in black majority attaining freedom. This is why OR Tambo described Helen Suzman as "someone who paid lip services to change during the apartheid years but at the end of the day resisted real change."

Helen Suzman fully participated in a discredited political system which you all have come to accept as crime against humanity. [Interjections.] She put serious conditions as the prerequisite to support the Release Mandela

Campaign which was denouncing the arms struggle including sanctions against the apartheid regime. [Interjections.]

Therefore, hon Speaker, in conclusion, it is important to appreciate the fact that celebrating Mandela should be understood in the context of the continuous struggle against colonialism of a special type to advance, to deepen and consolidate the national democratic revolution led by the African National Congress alliance, which is now led by our current Madiba who is our beloved comrade Cyril Ramaphosa. Together with him we will take our struggle to implement our Freedom Charter to another level... [Interjection.] and by expropriation of our stolen land without compensation to those who work it, together with him, motivated by Mandela's legacy we will clean our governments and deal with any form of state capture, whether it is a monopoly capital or parasitic bourgeois together with him we will reclaim the integrity of our movement, the ANC and supported by masses of our people. I think the IPSOS report has already alluded to that fact that we are moving in a fast way... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...in order to destroy apartheid and rebuild the credibility of the African National Congress.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]  
[Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. The hon Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Minister Marais.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As we celebrate the centenary of Tata Madiba we are reminded of his strong belief that, and I quote: "Our human compassion binds us, the one to the other - not in pity or patronisingly, but as human beings who have learnt how to turn our common suffering into hope for the future."

Through his actions and legacy he taught us of the invaluable role cultural affairs and sport had and continue to have in our reconciliation as we continue to build the once divided nation. At the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport we are in the unique position of being able to continue Madiba's legacy through different areas, through arts and culture, sport, libraries, museums, archives and heritage.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we know that Nelson Mandela had a big heart for the youth and that he believed in creating opportunities for children to become

successful adults. We live in a time where youth are more vulnerable than ever. They face enormous obstacles on a daily basis. Our Department is determined to give children opportunities to flourish, whether it is through expression of their artistic talent, playing sport, spending time at the local library or taking part in a wide range of after-school activities. We strongly feel that each child should have the opportunity to express and grow their talents regardless of their home circumstances. It is not fair that there are children who are scared to walk to school for fear of being caught in gang-crossfire. It is not fair that children go to empty homes after school with no-one to assist with homework.

While it is not fair it is an unfortunate reality and our Department aims to create safe spaces for children to go to after school. These are spaces where they can feel part of a team, play sport, do their homework or do music or drama.

Our Department offers aspiring young actors and script-writers the opportunity to develop their craft through our drama festivals. The MOD Programme also aims at offering children various platforms to practice their various skills. We believe that this is the way to continue Madiba's legacy by fostering social inclusion and empowering youth in order for them to believe in themselves and their dreams. This is one of the reasons why we come to work each day at the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. Our goal is to create an enabling environment for young sportsmen and women as well as all artists, poets, musicians and dancers,

because we know that diversity begins at grassroots. We are committed to pushing for the social inclusion of all.

In budgetary terms Cultural Affairs and Sport portfolios are far from the front of National Treasury's queue. Given the true impact of sport and culture on our society perhaps it is time this changed. Each time sport and culture have shown that it can, as Madiba and member Mackenzie said in his speech and reminded us of.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we are aware of the ongoing protest actions that are happening in Hermanus in the Overstrand. Sadly the public library in Zwelihle was set alight last week and destroyed. This is a loss which affects everyone in the community. A library is a place of learning, of reading and of a community. A library offers children a safe space to do their homework. It offers unemployed youth and adults the opportunity to look for jobs and work on their CVs and it offers the community as a whole the chance to learn more about the whole world through books.

Our Department assists municipalities to supply and maintain these facilities as we believe the value of a library in a community is immeasurable. We simply cannot condone the destruction of such valuable facilities during protest action. When we take away a centre of learning from a community we take away opportunities and we risk letting young people slip through the cracks.

Nelson Mandela lived by example when it came to lifelong learning and reading. We need to be able to give our youth every opportunity to access opportunities for education. As part of Madiba's centenary our Department together with Economic Opportunities and the City of Cape Town will be erecting a statue of Nelson Mandela on the balcony at City Hall, on the same spot where he gave his first speech as a free man in 1990.

This statue will serve as a constant reminder of Madiba's legacy in our daily lives to not take the freedoms we enjoy for granted, to break down racial barriers and to foster the spirit of inclusivity and warmth and as Mr Obama said this week, Madiba teaches us that the most important principle is that we are bound together by a common humanity and that each individual has inherent dignity and warmth, and this statue will serve as a daily reminder for us to respect the vision that Madiba had for our country.. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons kan nie hoor nie want Fritz praat te hard daar naby.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We cannot hear because Fritz is talking too loudly near there.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...to enable all citizens to realise their potential but more to have a government in place that is transparent, accountable and works in the best interest of the communities which it serves. We owe Madiba this much; to put the interest of the communities that we serve over and above everything else. We cannot

continue to look the other way as politicians become richer while service delivery suffers.

We need to live the legacy and be the legacy that Madiba would have been proud of. I thank you.

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.] [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Good! [Interjections.] [Applause.]]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must be very lonely without Lennit Max.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I dedicate this speech to Lekisha Wilschut, a 14 year-old girl from Nelspoort in Beaufort West who was tragically murdered, raped and dumped just last month. May her soul rest in peace and may God be with her loved ones during this very difficult time.

Mr Deputy Speaker, at the National Men's March on 22 November 1997 Nelson Mandela famously said and I quote: "Our children are our greatest treasures. They are our future. Those who abuse them tear at the fabric of our society and weaken our nation."

We have to ask ourselves, how have we ensured that our children are not abused? [Interjections.] How have we kept our promise to Tata Madiba to

promote the development of South Africa's youth. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is so true. That is why I want a Children's Commissioner. That is so true.

Mr D G MITCHELL: The unfortunate reality is that the National Government has done everything to disenfranchise young people in South Africa and rob our youth of opportunity at every turn, in a country where 78% of Grade 4 learners are functionally illiterate, how are we ensuring youth development? In a country where a matric certificate no longer equips school-leaving South Africans with an adequate education for the workplace, how are we giving opportunity to our young people? In a country where the Government wants to deny young people ownership of land how are we ensuring that young people from previous disadvantaged communities... [Interjection.]

†Me M N GILLION: Waar val jy uit?

[Ms M N GILLION: Where are you coming from?]

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...are ensured a chance for generational wealth for their families. If we look at the ANC's track record of governance Mr Deputy Speaker, in South Africa, Government has done more to undermine young people than develop their potential. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Maybe in this province.

Mr D G MITCHELL: This is the reality of Nelson Mandela's legacy under a party who are too preoccupied with themselves than with the pressing issues our young people are facing. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will just show you just now. †Wag net 'n bietjie. [Just wait a minute.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: You cannot put a price on a child's education, Mr Deputy Speaker, but you can pay the price for failing to educate the child.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Help die kind tog. Help hom asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Help the child. Please help him.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: When we provide a low quality of education to our young people, we abuse them. We set them up for failure and a life of further poverty. Just last year *The Economist* reported...

†Me M N GILLION: Praat van Madiba [Onhoorbaar.]

[Ms M N GILLION: Speak about Madiba [Inaudible.]]

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...that according to the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development South Africa has one of the world's worst education systems. Is this truly the legacy Nelson Mandela would have wanted to leave for young South Africans?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Help vir hom asseblief man, help daar. Help vir hom.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Help him please man, help there. Help him.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: How are we ensuring that we sustain development of our people when we continue to fail our youth?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Vra vir die DA. Vra vir hulle.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ask the DA. Ask them.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Today I stand here and I know that Madiba would have been bursting with pride to know that the Western Cape is honouring his legacy, to know that in the Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker, South Africans live longer. [Interjections.] South Africans have more jobs. Youth have better access to education and citizens have access to meaningful land reform.

Of course, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is more to be done, more to be done for the young people of Merweville who want to work but get neglected by a selfish municipal coalition government founded on the basis of personal interests and not to people... [Interjections.] More to the matriculant from Piketberg who got eight distinctions but cannot go to university because

NSFAS system failed her and condemned her to poverty; more for the young mother from Mitchells Plain who has to choose between paying her rent and buying groceries with a minimum wage even though she has a job...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Do not interfere with [Inaudible.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: On the contrary it saddens me to acknowledge that Tata Madiba must be turning in his grave knowing the organisation he has dedicated his life to is destroying the country he fought for, to know that the National Government provides better policing for the Presidency than the people of Nyanga. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, order. Minister Winde, order, order. Minister Winde and hon member Dugmore, you are interfering with the speaker there. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, Winde does not care what he says.

Mr D G MITCHELL: To know that the National Government spends more money on policing in the Presidency than on land reform; to know that the ANC commits billions of rands to corruption... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order member. Just one second. Hon Olivier.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Help tog vir hom!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Help him!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Die waarheid maak seer!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The truth hurts!]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, just on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I am listening.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is this supposed to be a political debate?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, the truth hurts.

[Laughter.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is this a political debate, I am just asking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, yes, you... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Are you are asking your leader there who is not here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will respond to that.

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, I am asking the Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! You may take your seat hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: He is out of order - your MEC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Rules make provision for a Speaker's Debate on a topic which is not political, but it is difficult to always keep to that point, so I am having a slight difficulty in the Chair to link it to the topic under the heading of the Speaker's Debate but I will allow the member to continue, but keep in mind this is not a party-political debate.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the hon member Mitchell through you whether he is prepared to take a

question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mitchell, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr D G MITCHELL: No he can ask me downstairs. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay the answer is no, but you may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Yes, yes, yes. Today I stand here and I know that Tata Madiba would have been proud and would be bursting for the gains made in the Western Cape.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief man, in jou drome!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please man, in your dreams!]

Mr D G MITCHELL: It is clear that the Democratic Alliance is the only political party that honours his legacy and the vision of Nelson Mandela... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai is 'n nagmerrie, daai.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a nightmare, that.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: And his hope for South Africa. It is the fundamental

belief Mr Deputy Speaker that Tata Madiba reminds all of us that I am my brother's keeper, I am my sister's keeper and that is why the Western Cape works. [Interjections.] If there is a child in De Doorns who cannot read or write, that matters to me, even though it is not my child. [Interjection.]

If a youth in Murraysburg must choose between university and work to ensure their grandmother has medication that makes me poorer, even though it is not my sibling. If there is a farmworker in Breede Valley who is being discriminated against because of race, creed and gender, that threatens my human rights, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms M N GILLION: Oh my word!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, the only way to ensure the development and upliftment of our young people is through a sound education skills development and access to an opportunity for employment. When young people can access the formal economy, provide for their families and become contributing members of a growing economy, we will be able to ensure a prosperous country Nelson Mandela envisaged for South Africa. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai is swak. Dit is swak.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is poor. It is poor.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: It must be our priority to provide the best possible

standard of education to each and every South African while growing a strong and diversified economy to give them a job. If we cannot fulfil this basic need in our country then we will continue to fail our young people.

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stop there, do not go into the country itself.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Exactly! Well done.

Mr D G MITCHELL: If we want to continue the legacy of Nelson Mandela we must remember his commitment to South Africa's children. Despite the ANC's talk of a new dawn many young South Africans remain in the shadow of government, siphoning money into their own pockets. Mr Deputy Speaker in conclusion... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, your time is almost done.

Mr D G MITCHELL: We are not free until the last one is free. I thank you.  
[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. [Applause.]

The hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think today uNelson Rolihlahla Mandela is referred to by so many as uTata but do not know the meaning of

uTata. Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela was one of the greatest to have ever lived on South African soil, if not the world. He was the first black South African President and even a psalm was made of my black President by a young woman of this Western Cape.

He was an icon of peace and justice. The spark uTata Madiba ignited in fighting aids, poverty, hunger and even supporting more than 50 charities in his lifetime will continue to live on. As community activist and social justice advocates we remember what uMadiba stood for and will strive to live up to his values.

Mandela was a champion for public health. Unfortunately in the Western Cape we are faced with a TB problem where there are large numbers of infected people spreading the disease for months before they are diagnosed and to start with treatment. In places like this Cape Flats and the townships...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I hope she will answer that when she speaks. She is next.

Ms M N GILLION: ...people get infected multiple times. People living in these communities inhabit a veritable soup of TB because they are exposed to hundreds of different strains of this disease. The Provincial Department of Health has not given an explanation to the TB crisis Cape Town is experiencing. They have no plan in place to reduce the spread of TB and win this war... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I hope she is listening.

Ms M N GILLION: I wonder what uMandela would expect of this Provincial Health Department since he was an advocate for universal healthcare as HIV/AIDS was spreading like wildfire in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Mandela encouraged South Africa to take strong action. In 1992 he spoke about how the spread of HIV is related to poverty, overcrowding, the poor treatment of women and migratory slave labour. Later he promoted the use of condoms... [Interjection.] ...to prevent the disease and he discouraged the stigmatisation of people with AIDS.

During the 2000 International AIDS Conference he stated that the world should move away from minor disputes and political issues; that the world should move away from the distraction and give attention to serious life and death issues such as HIV/AIDS. He noted that South Africa should spend major resources to stop the spread of AIDS. Madiba's son Thembu died in a car accident at the age of 24 in 1969, when he was on Robben Island. Mandela's work for children continues, despite his retirement from public life and subsequent passing on.

Through the Nelson Mandela Children's Fund, funds are raised and programmes are initiated to ensure a better future for children. The focus of these efforts is on creating a beneficial environment for the welfare of children. The fund raises money for organisations that work with the country's children and youth from birth to 22 years of age from

underprivileged surroundings. Mandela today would be very upset with the rate of child murders in this Western Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, yes.

Ms M N GILLION: In 2017 alone more than 80 girl children were killed in Cape Town. The DA has been deflecting blame and violating the Provincial and National Constitution by failing to appoint a Children's Commissioner as required by the Provincial Constitution.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, goo, goo, goo, goo, goo!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, throw, throw, throw, throw, throw!]

Ms M N GILLION: After numerous programmes and campaigning by the ANC and progressive NGOs the Provincial Government finally published a Bill for the establishment of the Children's Commissioner in October 2017. It took 17 months after the comments of this Bill closed and the ANC introduced an interpellation on the failure of the Premier and Legislature to give effect to the Constitution; that the Premier introduced the Bill to the Legislature.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thought you said 67 minutes.

Ms M N GILLION: Mandela was a constitutionalist. He would be very upset with this DA Government. They decide when they want to do things legally

and constitutionally. They have been undermining their own Provincial Constitution for many years... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Member, just finish your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: And only after the Public Protector made negative findings against Premier Zille did they respond by introducing the Children's Commissioner Bill into the Legislature.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. Your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: We salute you for your efforts uTata Mandela. [Time expired.] [Applause.] [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, good!]

An HON MEMBER: They are just confused.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo.

Ms M N GILLION: There is no confusion here; no confusion here.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us hear. I think she has just reformed [Inaudible.] I am listening.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Premier in absentia, Mr Deputy Speaker, the members of the House, good afternoon. This is indeed a huge honour to celebrate one of our nation's greatest freedom fighters, uTata Nelson Mandela... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry the millions watching on TV.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...and on this special commemoration we ought to take this opportunity for South Africa to take stock. It is an occasion that warrants some of us to have introspection. It is an occasion that also warrants the individual introspection and to look in terms of that how far have we come and where we are headed.

As the president of South Africa, Nelson Mandela's unwavering moral compass ensured that the country moved forward. Three life rules that he stood on was “free yourself, free others, and serve every day.”

I cannot agree more about these for example as a proponent of women's rights, as I always say freedom is when the last one is also free!

Mr Deputy Speaker, allow me to zoom in on Tata Madiba's role in healthcare reform in this country. Post-apartheid, he was one of the people who put such a task when he introduced the RDP. The testimonies shared through the TRC, for example, show how the apartheid government colluded with the clinicians, doctors and nurses and health professional bodies intentionally to

destroy health services in the Bantustans.

Madiba introduced the RDP, and I want to mention a few of the priorities. One, free public healthcare for pregnant women, breastfeeding mothers and children under the age of six. This was the first time any form of free healthcare had been provided to South Africans. Prior to that we were one of the twelve countries in the world with the worst child health outcomes. For maternal deaths, nobody knew exact figures as maternal mortality was not notifiable as then it was the international norm and the evidence, the anecdotal evidence show that indeed giving birth in the then health system was equated to opening your own coffin, but sadly in almost all other provinces the status quo of the maternal death is still worse. It is only in the Western Cape where we have seen the reduction in the maternal mortality.

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because we started that ourselves in 1994. That is what you do not know.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In 2006, Mandela's legacy was extended to offer primary healthcare services to all users of public facilities and he also made the point that would develop a district health system so that services can be at the doorstep of the people, with families, community involvement and inter-sectoral collaboration as partners in taking ownership of their health.

As other colleagues have alluded to, Madiba was the first known leader to break the stigma and remove the sting of HIV/AIDS when he disclosed his son's cause of death. About TB he was the one also who disclosed that he suffered from TB whilst he was in prison and about taking ownership of his own health, his lifestyle, promoting daily physical activity by taking early morning walks. He was a trendsetter for people to take ownership of their health.

In terms of the training of the medical doctors everybody knows about Madiba's Cuban doctor training programme. He realised a need for training of more doctors so that every person especially those in remote areas have access to medical interventions. The services then were more hospicentric and curative hence the choice of primary healthcare focus.

We salute him for identifying such a need. Last month, we saw the end of this programme because it could not achieve what it was supposed to achieve. That is access and coverage and equitable health services.

Honour Madiba's legacy as a compassionate leader, more than his leadership skills; he was full of compassion particularly for the weak and vulnerable as we have seen. Mr Deputy Speaker, the question is...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For some reason they... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Let us honour his legacy of compassion

because the question is how do we ensure we leave the Madiba legacy as Health Departments in South Africa?

Whilst we have an overburdened and distressed health system and we understand the frustration from our health workers, we are appealing to all health workers to *Be the Legacy* and work together to provide the best quality care. No matter the burden and stress, there is no justification to ill treat patients. Bring your Mandela moment to work. Bring compassion to health services. Let us care for our vulnerable: the patients.

About the medical training of doctors, we are leaving a living legacy because we have increased our doctor training. Almost 30% of all doctors in South African are coming from the Western Cape. In recent weeks it was confirmed by the national Minister, that the Western Cape has the highest doctor-patient ratio of any provinces in the country. Indeed we are living the legacy by planting more doctors within our health system.

The other issue or intervention Madiba was passionate about, was the universal health coverage, which is guaranteed actually in the Constitution where everyone has got the right to access health services. The Western Cape is committed to universal health coverage. That is the need to ensure access to quality health services and financial risk protection.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You say that to try [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We welcome UHC, universal healthcare coverage, as a vision for addressing equity, quality of care and access to care and already the Western Cape is the only province that is already exploring the piloting of universal health coverage in some areas.

In closing, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to share with this House what a remarkable contribution we made in honouring Madiba on Mandela Day. For the second year running the Western Cape Government Health gave life to making a difference to people's lives, especially the vulnerable ones. Operation 100, where we ensured treatment to more than 100 vulnerable patients, actually to be exact, 195, for this year. Last year it was 67 who received life-changing surgeries and operations. Yes, it is our task, it is our main job to do such but the fact of the waiting lines we have to do something about, hence we have explored that with the private and all other people, the individuals and business and corporate to make sure that people do not have to wait longer. They must get these operations. I would never have imagined that this initiative would reach even more than what was targeted. I pledge to my colleagues especially in Health, let us move forward and continue to keep the spirit of Madiba alive by the way we serve: patients first. Enkosi.  
[Applause.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next speaker, the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, hon members, when I think about Nelson Mandela I think about the first time I saw his stencilled face spray-painted on walls in Cape Town. I think about reading about him in books which were illegal then. I think about marching with thousands of others to demand his release. I think about being at the Grand Parade when he was released. I think about listening to him address ANC members in the Western Cape and the West Coast region about the difficult task facing our movement as we suspended the arms struggle and prepared for negotiations.

I think about being part of a meeting with him and the leadership of the province as we discussed racism, evictions, and brutality against farmworkers by some farmers in what was then known as the North West Coast. I think about his role as our ANC President and the President of the Republic.

We are here today to talk about the theme *Be the Legacy*, but we should never forget that his legacy is based on what and who he was. He was a revolutionary. He was a soldier. He was an organiser. He was a strategist, he was a unifier. He was a human being. He was a disciplined and loyal member of the African National Congress. There are some today, a vocal minority who want to trash this legacy by describing him as a sell-out and these same people then attempt to create divisions by saying that his former wife, comrade Winnie Madikizela Mandela actually fought the struggle. This populous and opportunistic rhetoric will not succeed because it is not true.

As the ANC and I believe the majority of South Africans do, we know the

role played by both these icons and thousands of other leaders in the struggle. We know about the ANC's approach to defeating the evil of apartheid. It rested on four pillars: mass mobilisation, underground work, international isolation and the armed struggle.

We know exactly what role our leaders and our cadres played at different levels and at different phases of our struggle, and comrade Mandela was always part of that leadership collective. It is critical that we defend this legacy and we will.

Then as the hon Leader of the Opposition said there are others who want to paint him as separate from the ANC, portray him as a Bambi in the midst of some ANC wolves. That narrative will also never work. Comrades Mandela, Tambo, Hani, Mbeki, Sisulu and the leadership collective, in exile, on Robben Island and in the underground, collectively, conceptualised the strategy and tactics to liberate our country, working with other liberation movements and the masses of our people.

They have left us with a democratic constitution to guide the fundamental transformation that still needs to happen in our society. A loadstar to lead us from the legacy left by apartheid, colonialism and a brutal system of economic exploitation which made a misery of the lives of the majority of our people who are black, working class and poor, and by "black" we mean those who were classified as African, Coloured and Indian.

Being the legacy means dedicating ourselves to the national democratic revolution; a truly united, democratic, non-sexist, non-racial and prosperous society; to be relentless in calling out those who would defend colonialism and to be relentless in calling out those who destroyed public and private property in the name of a certain struggle, those who failed to call out racism and exploitation and to call out those who refuse to confront the root causes of poverty, unemployment and inequality; those who steal from the fiscus and commit corrupt acts in the private sector. This is how we can be the legacy.

Albertina Sisulu was the member of the National Assembly who nominated Nelson Mandela to be the first democratically elected President. The person who seconded that nomination was none other than our current President, Matamela Cyril Ramaphosa, then the secretary-general of the ANC. Our President Ramaphosa is carrying out that legacy as part of the leadership collective of the African National Congress.

We are called to be Thuma Mina volunteers and we are rising to that call every day, but President Ramaphosa and Madiba, should he have been alive today, would have wanted that all South Africans rise to that call, black and white, wealthy, working class and poor, and this is how we can be the legacy. We can get our hands dirty and serve the people unconditionally.

Nelson Mandela would expect us to not only work for transformation in our country, but to join global struggles on our continent and the world, for one in which people feel safe, people have food to eat and people have houses to live in and jobs.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in rising to the challenge set by the Speaker in her organising this debate, we need to honour Madiba's legacy and heed the call of the African National Congress and our President. It is very easy to stand up here today in what is essentially a non-political debate and to try and score cheap points, but the reality is that those speakers who actually crossed the line to reveal the desperation ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Get on with the debate, man!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The desperation... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Get on with the debate!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... of the Democratic Alliance that is eating... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Keep quiet!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... itself up, whose former black leaders are beginning to talk very openly about the direct racism that they experienced within the ranks of the Democratic Alliance, but we are not concerned about that. We are concerned today about committing ourselves to be that legacy. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. The hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Our ultimate latecomer.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I dedicate this speech to the over 20,000 Zwelihle residents who are locked in Hermanus in a very desperate situation by a relentless few individuals who are hell-bent to undermine every rule under the law ... [Interjection.], but I must thank the stakeholders in Zwelihle... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who is behind the violence now? Who is behind the violence now?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... who have been working together to ensure that we are able to relieve that situation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who is behind the violence now?

Mr M MNQASELA: In debating this theme *Be the Legacy*, the question is what kind of response would Mandela have expected us to give to the situation in Zwelihle.

When thinking back on the legacy of Tata Madiba, I ask myself what kind of

South Africa would he want. Immediately the following words from *A Long Walk to Freedom* come to mind:

“To be free is not merely to cast off one’s chains, but to live in a way that respects and enhances the freedom of others.”

His wise words tell us that he would have wanted a South Africa where all could be free, uTata, like the DA does, understood... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not mess it up [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that to achieve real freedom... [Interjections.]

†UMnu Q R DYANTYI: Uzakakuhle mntaka Mnqasela. Sukufaka lamasela eDA.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come right child of Mnqasela. Do not involve these DA thieves.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... for South Africans we must prioritise... [Interjection.] number one, jobs, education, safety, security, transportation and housing for all South Africans.

Mr C M DUGMORE: How much are you getting [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: And following his legacy in this province we have

ensured that we create 75% of all jobs created in South Africa. That is 123,000 jobs. This province is doing something about the legacy of Mandela.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: Education – this province had an 82,7% matric pass rate for 2017, with the highest scores in the country on mathematics and science. This is what Mandela wanted, that education be the key to freedom. That is what Mandela wanted us to do, but the ANC continues to drop it and says people must pass at 33%, and what kind of freedom and what kind of legacy would you have given to Mandela?

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr M MNQASELA: And this Mandela that you are talking about and the Mandela, Mr Deputy Speaker, we are talking about, is definitely not the same Mandela. [Interjections.] Because the Mandela that you are talking about is one that would not vote for the ANC in 2019. [Interjections.] He would not have voted for this ANC because he would not have believed that this ANC still represents... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Like Patricia de Lille [Inaudible.] vote for you.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... the people. [Interjections.]

On safety and transport, we have ensured that continuously we invest towards

the safety and security of commuters in our rail infrastructure because every day National Government fails to protect our people when they travel by train. Guess what? That is this ANC and Mandela would not have been proud of this ANC. [Interjections.]

Housing – we have achieved a 64% success rate in land reform whilst the ANC has a 90% failure rate, and this is the ANC that Mandela would not vote for next year.

Let me say, Mr Deputy Speaker, when you listen to the Leader of the Opposition you wonder... [Interjections.] whether his very much loved theorist, Karl Marx – because he a Marxist, but he sounds like a [Inaudible.] proletariat masquerading as a revolutionist.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Marxist, *nè*?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... as if he has failed to understand his own belief systems because Mandela, when he lived, he said about Helen Suzman that this is a woman who believed that if others are not free she too is not free. Now why would he say that Helen Suzman represented the few and represented apartheid? That is the worst thing to come from the ANC.

Mr D JOSEPH: She fought for their freedom.

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC, when Helen Suzman passed on, said this in

2009, and this is the ANC that hon member Khaya Magaxa should be representing and it is clear he is representing the SACP when you have put him here on the card of the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just one second.

Mr M MNQASELA: Because the ANC said... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, hon member! Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, can you kindly ask the Deputy Chief Whip of the majority party not to make interjections when he is not sitting in his seat. At the back there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I will look at that. Yes, if the hon member is not in the Chamber as part of the seats for members then he should not make comments from where he sits. I did not pick it up, but that is true. Hon member Mnqasela, you may continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: The ANC had this to say on the death of mam Helen Suzman:

†“Iqhawekazi, isithwalandwe intyatyambo, uMama wesiziwe.”

[Heroine, highly honoured, flower, mother of the nation.”]

All of this was said by the ANC... [Interjection.] because the ANC believed everything that hon member Khaya Magaxa does not believe in, yet he sits here on the card of the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: Because they said Helen Suzman became a thorn in the flesh of apartheid by openly criticising segregation of blacks by a white only minority government [Interjection.]. Let me just say I understand, I understand ... [Interjection.] because this ANC is not the ANC of Mandela. This ANC is the one that promises us the glory and freedom, but guess what we see? We were promised by your Thuma Mina campaign that Cyril would arrest people for corruption. Guess the numbers?

Mr D JOSEPH: Zero!

Mr M MNQASELA: Guess the numbers.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: One.

Mr M MNQASELA: How many did Cyril Ramaphosa arrest? [Interjections.] No, zero. [Interjections.] Yesterday he was praising Zuma when they were commemorating Mandela. Praising Zuma at eQunu iMvezo. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Saying Zuma is the hero. We have one hero and that is not their Mandela, our Mandela, the Mandela of the nation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and the father of the nation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Order! Order! The Speaker to respond.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Please close it as you started it. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank all the members for their contribution to the Mandela *Be the Legacy* debate. I must say while I was sitting in my bench listening to the inputs, I was seized with quite a few questions. What can we do to emulate this giant? How can we carry on this legacy that so many are drawn to?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Join the ANC. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Or who am I to believe that I can change the world? I think the question is... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: They do not deserve you, the DA does not deserve you.

The SPEAKER: I think the question is who are you not to be? Madiba's thoughts were never about failure, self-doubt, but forged in a quote from Marion Williamson who said:

“Our deepest fear is not that we are inadequate, our deepest fear is that we are powerful beyond.”

I believe a small portion of Madiba's mammoth legacy is believing in the talents we have been given, never ever forgetting to dream and having the tenacity to accomplish those dreams.

His death was not just a time for mourning, it prompted many of us to do introspection with honesty, regardless of our positions or circumstances.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Introspect about your membership of the DA.

The SPEAKER: We must ask how well have I applied his lessons in my own life? It is a question I ask myself as a woman, a mother, grandmother and friend and more importantly as the Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Hon members, ladies and gentlemen, fellow South Africans, as we proceed from here as people and representatives of this great country called South Africa, as the heirs to the Mandela generation, we have to ask ourselves the question: What can we do to contribute to make this a lasting legacy? As his

long-time personal assistant said recently:

“Never should the lessons that characterised former President Nelson Mandela be forgotten as they hold the key to unlocking the solutions to South Africa’s current problems.”

Those lessons were of kindness, discipline, integrity and respect, values I hold dear. The world has come to know him as not only a great statesman, but a brilliant orator as well, so I will close with one of his quotes:

“What counts in life is not the mere fact that we have lived, it is what difference we have made in the lives of others that will determine the significance of the life that we lead. May we move forward, each and every one of us, and may we be the legacy.”

I thank you. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Uitstekend! Uitstekend!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Excellent! Excellent!] Keep up the [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, allow the Chair a chance to speak as well. That concludes the Speaker’s debate. We move on to Interpellations. The first interpellation has been withdrawn. Second

interpellation, hon Minister Marais.

## **INTERPELLATIONS:**

*[Interpellation 1 withdrawn.]*

*Cultural rights of passage*

### **2. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

What assistance does her Department give Xhosas and other cultural groups to ensure that the dignity of the cultures prevails when they perform their rites of passage, like those rites that young boys undergo at initiation schools?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie en baie dankie vir die interpellasie, agb lid Gopie.

Die Departement van Kultuursake en Sport beskou die wetgewende mandaat wat die beskerming, bevordering en bewaring van kuns, kultuur en erfenis in die provinsie behels as bindend. Dit is teen hierdie agtergrond dat die Departement alle kultuurpraktyke ondersteun, insluitende inisiasiedeurgangsrite wat die oorgang van 'n seun na 'n man behels.

Die Grondwet van die Republiek van Suid-Afrika van 1996 erken die reg op

lewe, die regte van individue om hulle kultuur te geniet, die regte van individue om kultuurverenigings te vorm, by hulle aan te sluit en hulle in stand te hou, en die regte van kinders om beskerm te word teen mishandeling en verwaarloosing, en die inisiasie-ritueel is dus onderworpe aan die Grondwet en die Departement, in samewerking met sy venote in die Regering en burgerlike samelewing, tradisionele leierskap wat die bewaarders is, gemeenskappe en gesinne van inisiate is gefokus op 'n poging om te verseker dat die praktyk voldoen aan die tersaaklike beginsels vervat in die Handves van Regte in die Grondwet.

Die inisiasieprogram word deur die departementele inisiasie-raamwerk en protokol gehelp en geleid en poog om die nodige ondersteuning te verskaf om 'n veilige en 'n bemagtigende omgewing vir die geïnisieerde in die Wes-Kaap te verseker.

Die Nasionale Departement van Samewerkende Regering en Tradisionele Sake het navorsing wat gedoen is gebruik om 'n inisiasie-beleid te ontwikkel en die Wes-Kaap se inisiasie-raamwerk en protokol wat deur die Departement ontwikkel is was een van die bronne waarop hierdie navorsing gebaseer is. Hierdie beleid is onderworpe aan verdere navorsing, uitgebreide konsultasie en verfyning totdat dit in April 2016 deur die Nasionale Kabinet goedgekeur is.

Nasionale Kabinet het ook goedgekeur dat nasionale wetgewing opgestel word, gebaseer op die beginsels vervat in die goedgekeurde beleid. Hierdie

nasionale wetgewing gaan tans deur die parlementêre prosesse.

In die Wes-Kaap word inisiasie hoofsaaklik deur die Amahlubi-, Basutu- en die amaXhosa gemeenskappe beoefen. Dit is belangrik om daarop te let dat sommige Khoi-Khoi leiers ook die deurgangsrte in die provinsie beoefen en dat dit dieselfde mate van ondersteuning van die Departement ontvang. Die tradisionele leierskap wat deel uitmaak van die Inisiasieforums is die bewaarders van die praktyk en is verantwoordelik vir die implementering daarvan. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, and thank you for the interpellation, hon member Gopie.

The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport regards the legislative mandate involving the protection, promotion and conservation of art, culture and heritage in the province as binding. It is against this background that the Department supports all cultural practices, including initiation rites involving the transition of a boy to a man.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996 acknowledges the right to life, the rights of the individual to enjoy their culture, the rights of individuals to form cultural societies and maintain it, and the rights of children to be protected against abuse and neglect, and the initiation ritual is

therefore subject to the Constitution, and the Department, in cooperation with its partners in Government and civil society, traditional leadership that are the conservators, communities and families of initiates, is focused on an effort to ensure that the practice adheres to the relevant principles contained in the Human Rights Charter in the Constitution.

The initiation programme is assisted and led by the departmental initiation framework and protocol in an effort to provide the necessary support to ensure a safe and empowering environment for the initiate in the Western Cape.

The National Department of Cooperative Government and Traditional Affairs used research that has been done to develop an initiation policy and the Western Cape's initiation framework and protocol developed by the Department was one of the sources on which this research had been based. This policy was subject to further research, broad consultation and refinement until it was approved by the National Cabinet in April 2016.

National Cabinet also agreed that national legislation be drawn up based upon the principles contained in the approved policy. This national legislation is currently going through the parliamentary processes.

In the Western Cape, initiation is practiced mainly by the Amahlubi, Basuto and the amaXhosa communities. It is important to note that some Khoi-Khoi leaders also practice initiation rites in the province and receives the same

amount of support from the Department. The traditional leadership that forms part of the Initiation Forums are the conservators of the practice and are responsible for its implementation. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Gopie.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie.]

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Traditional leaders in the province have been complaining for years about the lack of suitable land for initiation, especially in the city. They have been complaining that there are inadequate spaces for initiation and no space for segregation.

In the past the Department said there were 20 registered initiation sites in the province. This number has since decreased as suitable land is being targeted for development in the province. Other sites have been invaded by people to create their homes.

One example is the land in Khayelitsha where the City cleared the bushes to make way for a MyCiti bus depot. This is the only remaining spot where initiation takes place. It means now that the City is developing it. There will be no other suitable land in the area. This happened when there were already initiations underway in the rite of passage. This can only mean that the DA and the MEC do not care about people's tradition.

The MEC must tell us what is she doing to ensure that there is suitable land

and ensure dignity of the culture is respected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mackenzie?

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Minister Marais, u het gepraat van 'n raamwerk en natuurlik verwys ons na klousule 8.1.9 in terme van u rol as provinsiale Minister en ons weet in die verlede was daar die *Initiation* forums waar u natuurlik baie insette gelewer het.

So my vraag aan u as LUR van die Departement van Kultuur en Sport, watter rol speel u saam met die munisipaliteite, behalwe nou Stad Kaapstad, as ons nou praat van die buitegedeelte in George, Oudtshoorn, in die Weskus, Vredendal en so aan; watter rol speel u om die munisipaliteite saam met die tradisionele leiers te laat vergader, sodat hulle die gesprek kan saamvat, want dis natuurlik u verantwoordelikheid oor [Onhoorbaar.]

So ek wil net weet watter rol speel u en u Departement, en sit u op daai fora om die twee partye saam met mekaar te kry? Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Marais, you spoke about a framework and of course we refer to clause 8.1.9 in terms of your role as provincial Minister, and we know that in the past there were Initiation forums where you have obviously had great input.

So my question to you as MEC of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, what role do you play along with the municipalities, apart from the City of Cape Town, and now we speak of the outer part of George, Oudtshoorn, in the West Coast, Vredendal en so on, what role do you play to convene the municipalities together with the traditional leaders, so that they can consult, because it is your responsibility of course on [Inaudible].

So I just want to know what role you and your Department play, and do you sit on those forums to get the two parties together? Thank you.]

Ms D GOPIE: Um, ja.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Gopie, u mag voortgaan.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, you may continue.]

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I also want to ask the MEC what the MEC is doing to assist Khayelitsha residents who feel helpless as all the sites that were used for initiation have been taken. How many sites did the Minister defend since the Minister took over? Why did the Minister not object to the planned development in Khayelitsha when she knew that the land was being used for this important passage?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mackenzie again.

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek wil ook vir die Minister miskien weer vra, in terme van die kapasiteit... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to also ask the Minister, in terms of the capacity... [Interjection.]]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But she did not even answer the first question. You just say something.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Wait, relax.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, please.

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: In terme van die kapasiteit in terme van die...  
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: In terms of the capacity in terms of the ...  
[Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chill!

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: ... inisiëringforums, watter *support* gee die Minister vir die verskillende forums, en ons weet baie van die forums in Khayelitsha en Philippi en so aan is nie geformaliseer nie, so watter hulp gee u in terme van die kapasiteitsbou en so aan, watter hulp gee die Departement vir daai forums? Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... initiation forums, what support does the Minister give the various forums, and we know many of the forums in Khayelitsha and Philippi en so on are not formalised, so what support to you give in terms of capacity building and so on, what support does the Department give to those forums? Thank you.]

†n AGB LID: Watter help gee hulle?

[An HON MEMBER: What support do they give?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie again.

Ms D GOPIE: It must be said that this MEC does not care about the people's culture and does not respect their tradition. I also want to know when last did the Minister meet with the traditional leaders to hear their complaints, particularly about the inadequate pockets of land for this rite of passage and how many pockets of land in the province are secured for this practice?

Also, knowing that most of the parents are single parents and that there are some people that are registered to practice and there are some that are not registered to practice, how are these single women assisted to know who is registered and who is not registered?

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister Marais.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Marais.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie. Dankie vir al die vrae. Ek gaan nou probeer om almal mooi te beantwoord.

Eerstens as Minister werk ek en die Departement en die amptenare toegewys tot inisiasie slegs deur die forums van die gemeenskappe. Ek gaan slegs op uitnodiging na hulle toe en my laaste vergadering met van die tradisionele leiers was, ek wil nou sê min of meer twee maande terug, en die situasie ten opsigte van die grond is met daai gesprek aangespreek en opgevolg, en daar is op hierdie stadium 20 inisiasie *sites* of inisiasieplekke wat in die stad gebruik word, en deur die res van die provinsie moet ek nou eerlik sê is ek nie 100% seker nie, maar in elke munisipaliteit is ongeallokeerde plekke waar ons inisiate toe na gaan, en wat ons dan ook doen is om slegs op uitnodiging te gaan, omdat dit 'n baie – hoe wil ek sê? - dit is 'n *secret passage*. Dit is 'n heilige rite wat gedoen word.

So ek word slegs genooi en hulle kom na my toe wanneer daar 'n probleem is. Dis nie ek wat na hulle toe kan gaan sommer uit eie uit nie. Ek werk deur die inisiasieforum soos wat ek genoem het, en ons gee dan ook ondersteuning, die Departement verleen ondersteuning aan gesinne wat wissel van die versekering dat seuns mediese ondersoeke ontvang en so ver strek as beroepsvoortligting en emosionele ondersteuning.

So enkelouers word gehelp en ondersteun deur die Departement amptenare

wat geallokeer word, en die Departement fasiliteer die voorsiening van drinkwater vir inwoners deur die munisipaliteite, en ons het gereelde vergaderings ook met die munisipaliteite, en geen nie-samewerking deur munisipaliteite word ondervind nie. Alle munisipaliteite werk saam en ons het geen probleme wat dit betref nie.

En dan het ons 40 mense wat die inisiasiepraktyke toepas, en ons het 'n noodhulpkursus wat hulle moes doen, en in hierdie Augustusmaand word 'n spesiale inisiasiepraktyk-kursus aan hulle aangebied en ons amptenare is baie op die grond om te weet of hierdie persone geregistreer is en of hulle nie geregistreer nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. Thank you for all the questions. I will now try to answer all of them properly.

Firstly, I as Minister and the Department and the officials allocated to initiation only work through the forums of the communities. I only go to them on invitation and my last meeting with some of the traditional leaders was, I want to say, more or less two months ago, and the situation with regard to the land was addressed and followed up with that discussion, and there are at this stage 20 initiation sites that are used in the city, and through the rest of the province, and I have to honestly say I am not 100% sure, but every municipality has allocated places where our initiates go to, and what

we then do is to only go on invitation, because it is a very – how can I say? – it is a secret passage. It is a holy ritual that is performed.

So I am only invited and they come to me when there is a problem. It is not I who simply go to them on my own. I work through the initiation forum as I have said, and we then give support, the Department gives support to families that varies from ensuring that boys receive medical tests to going as far as career guidance and emotional support.

So single parents are assisted and supported by the Department's officials who are allocated, and the Department facilitates the provision of drinking water to inhabitants through the municipalities, and no non-cooperation by the municipalities is experienced. All municipalities cooperate and we have no problems in this regard.

And then we have 40 people who apply the initiation practices, and we have a first aid course they have to do, and during this month of August a special initiation practice course is offered to them, and our officials are very much on the ground to know whether these people are registered or not registered.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Minister Marais, die tyd is ongelukkig verstreke.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Marais, the time has unfortunately expired.] †That's the end of that interpellation. We move on to Interpellation Three, hon member Lekker to Minister Plato. †Ek sien Minister Plato. [I see Minister Plato.]

*Operation thunder: impact of*

**3. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (a) What has been the impact of Operation Thunder on crime-fighting in the province and (b) what supporting role has his Department played in this operation?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and also to the hon member.

The impact of Operation Thunder on crime fighting in the province has been positive. The police informed me they have made 669 arrests. They have also had:

- 424 disruptive operations
- 253 drug operations
- Search warrants executed: 309
- Tracing Operations: 379

- Persons searched: 14,793
- Drug premises searched: 835
- Vehicles stopped and searched: 1,711.

The Department of Community Safety is supportive of the Operation Thunder initiative by SAPS. The Department will monitor and does monitor the progress made by Operation Thunder in relation to the reduction of gang related activities during the ProvJoints Anti-Gang Priority Committee that is chaired by the Department.

The Department is also engaging with SAPS to provide support to reservists in the province with a view to increasing the number of active reservists and contributing to the law enforcement capacity of the police. The Department has weekly community based safety workshops in various communities to address crime. We host parent and youth evening events in communities and host various safety walkabouts to address crime within volatile communities.

The SAPS is part of our community based outreach programmes and in doing so the Department and SAPS complement one another. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. While we commend the role of SAPS we must acknowledge that the Provincial Government is not

rising in its full strength to the task, which is why gangsterism in the province is still out of hand.

We need to know from the office of the MEC what other programmes are being put in place, particularly in the areas of Uitzig, Lavender Hill, Mitchells Plain and Elsies, which at the moment seem to be the areas where incidents of gang violence are on the rise?

So can we get programmes from the Office of the Premier, particularly in those communities which are at the moment being hit very hard?

**The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT:** Where is Max, Lennit Max?

†Me M N GILLION: Haai! Hoekom praat jy nou van [Onhoorbaar.]

[Ms M N GILLION: Hey! Why are you now speaking of [Inaudible.]]

**The DEPUTY SPEAKER:** Order! Hon Chief Whip, hon member Wiley?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] should be asking that question actually.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

“City losing the battle against gangs”

said the *Argus* on the 17th. Then they waste time and energy misleading the

public into thinking policing is a provincial or municipal function. For the totally uninformed after 20 years of our Constitution, here are the facts...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr M G E WILEY: Clause 205... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... of the Constitution says:

“1. The National Police Service must be structured to function on a national, provincial and where appropriate, local government sphere.”

An HON MEMBER: We know that.

Mr M G E WILEY:

“2. National legislation must determine...”... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: “... the powers and functions.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, just one second. Hon...  
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are trying to follow that, Mr Deputy Speaker. He is just too fast for us.

Ms M N GILLION: He is too fast for us.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please, please... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: 3... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ...

“The objects are to prevent, combat and investigate crime, to maintain public order, to protect and secure inhabitants of the Republic and their property, and uphold and enforce the rule of law.”

Section, Clause 206 ... [Interjections.]:

“Each province is entitled to monitor police conduct, oversee effectiveness ...” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY:

“... and efficiency and to promote access and liaise with the National Cabinet Minister.”

That is Bheki Cele, the National Minister. Secondly Clause 207 says:

“The National Commissioner must exercise control and manage the police service.”

National Minister. Which part of this simple text... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What are you talking about?

Mr M G E WILEY: ... does the ANC not get?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What are you talking about?

Mr M G E WILEY:

“Since intelligence gathering, justice...”

That is the courts:

“... correctional services and defence are national commodities only.”

So why harp on the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town for not doing national work?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

Mr M G E WILEY: In the province... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: What are you saying?

Mr M G E WILEY: In the province we are already suffering a 40% reduction of the national police to population ratio despite its very high crime statistics and flood of those... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... seeking a better life. Can you blame them? Every other – wherever else the ANC governs the people have to flee because they have nothing, only poverty and despair.

Now they have another showman who thinks they can talk crime away and get compliance with bluster. Yesterday I visited Operation Thunder based in Lavender Hill to see what is meant by “declaring war on crime”. [Interjection.] I was somewhat amused by the name given to the skewly

erected 16 by 16 tent. It's called the Steenberg – listen – Steenberg Military Base.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Serious! Military Base, manned by police officers...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired for this slot.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can continue later. Hon member Lekker?

An HON MEMBER: Well done.

Ms M N GILLION: Is that well done? †Jy kan [Onhoorbaar.] seker nie gehoor het nie. [You could probably not have heard [Inaudible.]]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, I really get confused when hon member – what is your name by the way?

An HON MEMBER: Address the Speaker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: When hon member Mark Wiley blames the ANC Government for issues of policing. Crime knows no political party.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Ms P Z LEKKER: And I want to say today that the City of Cape Town wasted R32 million on the shot spotter ... [Interjection.] and only nine arrests were made based on the evidence from the shot spotter, and that indeed shows that they have wasted money which could have been channelled through policing, and today we are faced with issues of crime because of the Democratic Alliance Government that does not care.

The majority of the crime that is very, very brutal is committed in the predominantly black townships and not in the leafy suburbs, but this DA-led Government is not at all willing to come to the pie. Instead they are busy making people fight against one another.

The MEC and myself were in Nyanga today and I must say I was very disappointed to hear the Democratic Alliance members politicking about crime. They are in a war, they want to make sure that our communities are fighting with one another. We cannot afford to make a weir between Coloured people and African people. This Legislature, particularly that side of the row, is responsible for all the killings that are taking place in our communities.

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us hear.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yesterday the Standing Committee approved a report on the shot spotter. The ANC members were not even there to witness it.

[Interjections.]

The nearest this tent that I witnessed came to the military, was the tent itself.

[Interjections.] Then the Minister said that 269 SAPS members of this operation would come from other provinces.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You are disingenuous.

Mr M G E WILEY: But of the four people I spoke to yesterday two come from local stations ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Slow down!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... depleting our stressed stations even more.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: No wonder the Ocean View suburb, a designated gang station, is now experiencing daily shootings... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Slow down.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... every day. What a shame. Does the military have a role to play in this operation? Undoubtedly!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No!

HON MEMBERS: No!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It does not.

Mr M G E WILEY: Military intelligence could immediately give a fresh...  
[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Slow down.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... perspective to a crime scene. A transport unit could fix the broken Casspir at the base there, which I saw, which was broken yesterday. A signals unit would establish a radio coms network to replace the personal cellphones having to be used for operational purposes. A sergeant-major and half a section of interventions would fix the tent into something approximating an orderly and guarded ops centre with tables, chairs, proper defensive sandbagging, entry and exit lanes, lights and generator ... [Interjection.] none of which exist there with the exception of one table.

An ops officer would equip the ops room with essential maps of local areas, roads, pathways, institutions... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: ... including infrastructure and the like.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your last sentence please.

Mr M G E WILEY: To conclude, at no stage can the military be used for crowd control and riot suppression. That is the SAPS responsibility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well, you should tell that to the Premier.

Ms M N GILLION: You must tell that to the Premier and Mmusi.  
[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell them it is contradicting the DA now.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You know, Mr Deputy Speaker, I will tell no lies.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Today there is a police camp in the area of Philippi East, Marikana and the disruptive operations by the SAPS and thanks to Operation Thunder are slowly bearing fruits, and I want to say today as a resident and regular person in the area of Philippi, I see the fruits.

I find it very disingenuous for the Chief Whip of the Democratic Alliance to speak on issues that he does not know of. To speak on issues that he does not have any experience of. We live in these townships and we know that currently Nyanga crime stats have decreased. If you go to the crime stats that was released, Nyanga was low on the list.

MEC Plato knows that and Mmusi Maimane knows that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Ms P Z LEKKER: We need police presence and we want this Department of DOCS to come to the plate and make sure that they assist our people. We can all strategize around this operation and find amicable solutions for our people, but if we continue to politicise crime because it does not affect certain people, then we are going to have a problem and my worry is the DA voters in the township do not know that this DA does not care about crime because it does not affect them. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon – order! [Interjections.] Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I need to at least thank the hon member for her confirmation that our programmes are also bearing some fruit and for her asking ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is not your programmes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... to do better and to improve...  
[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is not your programmes at all.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is my Department's projects and programmes. Programmes and projects I started in this Department.

Ms P Z LEKKER: By dividing the communities.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And let me say to you, Operation Thunder, I have said, it is a success. That was in my very first sentence.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Unfortunately [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I did not say... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: I cannot hear you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... anything else about Operation Thunder.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well done! [Interjections.] Please tell Wiley.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I also do assist many communities with programmes and projects and I have to admit, hon member, it is just a fact that we do not have enough personnel in our outreach teams... [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Alweer? Alweer?

[Ms M N GILLION: Again? Again?]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We must actually improve ...

[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Enough to get more people to Manenberg [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... getting more people to do more and more in the communities on a day to day basis.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry, do not worry. Lennit Max will help you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But I need to say what is a fact, it is not the duty of the Department to go and catch the criminals.

Ms M N GILLION: Nobody said that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is unfortunately – you imply that, you imply that.

Ms M N GILLION: Nobody said that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is the duty of SAPS...

[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Do your part.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is the duty of...

[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Well, you do not understand... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... the police to rid our communities of the gang bosses and the drug lords... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You refuse to understand, that is your problem.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... which is not happening. But, I also need to say the police officers talking to me on a day to day basis confirm they do not have the capacity, that is why we assist them, not to destabilise communities. Our call this afternoon was a just call, it is a call at the right time to say to National Government... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell that to your Chief Whip.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... come and assist the police on the ground because they are tired, that is their clear message. That is why they cannot get and do what they need to do. We are not saying the army

must come and shoot and kill people... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: That is a [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... we are saying the army must come and be a force ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... multiplier in our communities. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is what we are calling for.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Plato, your time unfortunately has expired.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Mooi.

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is also the end of Interpellations.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: A DA contradiction.

Ms P Z LEKKER: They do not talk to each other.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Questions on the Question Paper.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, I was answering your question.

Ms M N GILLION: No, but... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ... you are contradicting your Chief Whip.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You must let him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The first question has been withdrawn. We move to the second, to Question Number Three. Hon Minister Bredell.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 21 June 2018, as agreed to by the House:*

*[Question 1 withdrawn]*

*Witsand Desalination Plant*

**\*3. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) What are the costs involved in the building and operating of the Witsand desalination plant, (b) who is paying for it, (c) what is the life expectancy of the plant and (d) how much will the consumer have to pay for it?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: O, is jy terug? Is jy terug?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, are you back? Are you back?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie vir die vraag van die agterliggende lid Uys wat nie teenwoordig is nie, maar nieteenstaande.

Die koste vir die oprigting van die... [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you for the question from the hon member Uys who is not present, but nonetheless.

The cost for the erection of the ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy het die vraag lankal gevra, moenie sê hy is nie teenwoordig nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: He asked the question long ago, do not say he is not present.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi, asseblief dit raak nou bietjie erg.

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please, it is becoming a bit unbearable now. [Interjections.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die koste vir die oprigting – ons aanvaar dit. Die koste vir die oprigting van die Witsand-ontsoutingsaanleg beloop R9 miljoen en die bedryfskoste word op R19,000 per maand geraam.

Die Franse Regering dra R4.5 miljoen by en die res, die R4.5 miljoen, word van die Provinciale Regering se Droogteverligtingsfonds gefinansier.

Die lewensduur van die membrane word beraam op so plus-minus 10 jaar. Daar is natuurlik afwykings daarop, maar die gemiddeld is 10 jaar. Die ander dele soos die pype, pompe en die solartoerusting se lewe word geskat op 25 jaar.

Die verbruiker betaal nie vir die kapitaalkoste nie. Die bedryfskoste wat sowat R6.50 per kiloliter beloop is minder as wat die huidige koste van water in Hessequa en in die Witsand-area is vir die hoë verbruikers en ons is baie seker dat hierdie projek die Witsand-gemeenskap baie sal help. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The cost of the erection – we accept it. The cost of the erection of the Witsand desalination plant is R9 million and the operating cost is estimated at R19,000 per month.

The French Government contributes R4.5 million and the rest, the R4.5 million, is funded by the Provincial Government's Drought Relief Fund.

The life span of the membranes is estimated at plus-minus 10 years. There are of course deviations but the average is 10 years. The life span of other

parts such as the pipes, pumps and the solar equipment is estimated at 25 years.

The consumer does not pay for the capital cost. The operating cost of about R6.50 per kilolitre is less than the current cost of water in Hessequa and in the Witsand area for the high consumers and we are very sure that this project will help the Witsand community a lot. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Dyantyi.

[The DEPUTY ADJUNKSPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am interested in section (b) that you did not answer, who is paying for it?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Why are you so aggressive?

†n AGB LID: Is jy klaar?

[An HON MEMBER: Are you finished?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister Bredell?

[The DDPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie, baie... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Very, very ... [Interjections.]]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a valid question.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... baie aggressief, maar ek het dit klaar gelees, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek sal dit nog 'n keer lees.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... very aggressive, but I have read it already, Mr Deputy Speaker, I will read it one more time.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: [Inaudible.] stupid.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die Franse Regering gee R4,5 miljoen...

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The French Government contributes R4,5 million ...]

Ms M N GILLION: What are you saying?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die Franse Regering gee R4,5 miljoen by

en die Provinciale Regering R4,5 miljoen.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The French Government gives R4,5 million and the Provincial Government R4,5 million.]

An HON MEMBER: He said you were stupid.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die Franse Regering.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The French Government.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a further follow-up?

Mr D JOSEPH: Do not tell him [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am rising on a point of order. I heard hon member Dan Plato pointing at this side saying: "You are stupid." Can...  
[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: You did.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... you rule on this matter, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I did not hear or see it. Minister Plato, if you did refer to any member of the House that would be unparliamentary.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They are terribly wrong, Mr Deputy Speaker. I heard in his volatile kind of an attitude, I said: "But you are saying the Minister is stupid."

Ms M N GILLION: No, he did not say that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So that... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Okay, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I did not say you are stupid.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am not going to argue that further. I take the Minister's word as an hon member. If it is in Hansard... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I provide – I am going to provide clarity... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... on this matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please allow me to speak, to finish off. If Hansard proves otherwise I will certainly come back to the House. You want to say something further?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to provide clarity.

Ms M N GILLION: He was repeating himself.

Ms P Z LEKKER: When the MEC was responding hon member Richard Dyantyi said: "It is right there on the question, you skipped it." That is what he said.

Ms M N GILLION: Then he said "stupid".

Ms P Z LEKKER: Then he responded from that side saying: "You are stupid." I just want to put this into perspective, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, that will assist and I will refer to Hansard and if necessary I will come to the House. Hon member Dyantyi, do you want to follow-up further?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I rise again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your second opportunity.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I rise again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, there is a follow-up question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I get attention of the MEC? I am on the floor, MEC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Bredell, there is a second follow-up question.

An HON MEMBER: A DA caucus there.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not take advice there. My second follow-up, MEC, thank you for your first response that you skipped initially, thank you for that. A follow-up on that response, would you be able to just share with us, between the R5 million if I heard you correctly and the R4,5 million from the French, what are the binding arrangements between those two entities on that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Kom terug.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come back.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, is a twinning arrangement where people invest in different spheres of government, for them it is also an investment and they wanted to help Hessequa Municipality, so it is through their twinning arrangement when they made contact with the French that they offered them, like we sit with Bavaria or the Hanns Seidel Foundation who help us with a lot of projects. It is not a counter or an obligation or – the Hessequa Municipality, we know they are a poor municipality. They asked us for help and it is part of our longer-term water strategy to get our coastal towns off the grid.

And remember the big cost of desalination is actually the energy, so this is the first where solar is driving the plant, and if we can make this a success I think we can roll it out to all our coastal towns.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer first.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek is op pad.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am on my way.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: So with this idea, that we attach solar to desalination,

what in the Minister's opinion is the kind of savings that we see in energy which will benefit the town?

**THE MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:** There is a lot of literature around this, but this is part of this project, kind of a research project so that we can get the facts. We all know that desalination water, if you do a normal desalination plant without solar, it varies – and why it varies is because the period in which you pay back your capital makes a huge impact on the price. So it can be anything from R18 a kilolitre to R55 a kilolitre, but bringing solar in we are back to R6.50 where we really want to be.

There is another thing that we need to keep our eye on solar for, is because you get certain times of the year when the dams will be full and there will be water or there will not be tourism and then you might not run the desalination plant, but because you have got solar now you can push that in the grid and that can also help you to offset the cost.

So we are really excited to get this solar plant to drive this desalination plant.

**THE DEPUTY SPEAKER:** Hon member Dyantyi, the last opportunity.

**MR Q R DYANTYI:** Thank you very much. Thank you, hon MEC. Are there any private role-players in this?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The short answer, no.

†n AGB LID: Is jy seker?

[An HON MEMBER: Are you sure?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question. Question Four, Minister Madikizela.

*Power Town site at Mossel Bay: upgrading of*

**\*4. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether there are any plans to upgrade the Power Town site at Mossel Bay in order to make it suitable for human settlement; if not, why not; if so, what are the plans?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I wish hon member Uys a speedy recovery, I am told that he is not well.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you hon member. Please come back, all is forgiven. It was your deputies.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Mossel Bay Municipality

and my Department are currently busy relocating people from Power Town to Sonskyn Vallei because the land currently is not suitable for habitation, and that is why we are currently doing that. Already 105 people from Power Town have been relocated to Sonskyn Vallei and the rest of the people will be relocated in the third phase of that particular project, and only after that we will then start the process of rehabilitating the land because currently it is not suitable for human habitation.

So that is the situation with regard to the Power Town land. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you for that answer, MEC. Through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I wonder if the MEC can answer how long these people stayed in Power Town before discovering that this land is not suitable?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, they have been staying there for over 20 years. You will remember, hon member, that this process of planning a development started way back. A number of studies were done. The intention initially, or the impression that was given was that those people could be settled there, but all the studies that were done prove that the land is not suitable for that, and then ultimately Mossel Bay Municipality took a

decision to find alternative land.

Between the time that it was discovered that those people could not be settled there and the time to get new land, I think there were a lot of engagements between the Municipality and the people.

There were people from Power Town who felt very strongly that they need to be settled there, but unfortunately we could not go against the evidence that was produced by the study that was done by the competent Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier first.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, through you. Just an understanding from the MEC. “Suitable” can mean anything under the sun. What are those studies specifically indicating is not suitable? If they have been there for 20 years, there is a study and it says it is not suitable, what are those indicators which the competent Department of Environmental Affairs is telling us, so that we all know? Because they have been there for 20 years as you indicate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much for that question, hon member. The current condition of the particular land is that it is below the flood line and also forms part of the Klein Brak River estuary,

and that is why people cannot be settled there. So that is the situation of it currently.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion and then the last opportunity will be to be hon member Simmers.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. MEC, according to my understanding and also in your answers, these people have been there for more than 20 years and you are taking them out of that area to Sonskyn Vallei. Why can these people not be relocated to an area nearer to Power Town? Is it because they are low-income, they do not fit into your plans? Or what is the reason? Because for more than 20 years these people have been living there, now after – I experienced the same in Bot River.

†Mense het daar gebly vir meer as 20 jaar. [People have lived there for more than 20 years.] Then you say it is not suitable, but then it is just one portion of the land that is not suitable. Give us the whole truth about what is happening there with the community of Power Town.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is actually not true that it is just one portion. For your information, hon member ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: It is not the same [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Okay, no, okay. Now for your information, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member, is that in fact again there was an understanding that perhaps part of Power Town could be developed. The study that was done was done to four portions of the entire Power Town, because we wanted to separate the environmental impact assessment that was done to see whether there was no part there that could be developed and believe you me a decision to relocate those people was the last resort. All the studies that were done came back saying the same thing. That the land cannot be developed unless of course you can spend a lot of money trying to rehabilitate it.

But also if you look at the distance between Power Town and Sonskyn Village, it is between 5 and 7%, so actually that is the only piece of land close to Power Town that we could find to accommodate them, and that is the reality of the situation, because there were other parcels of land not far from Power Town that were also surveyed, and we discovered that the only place where the people of Power Town could be accommodated is in Sonskyn Valley. [Interjection.] No-no, it has nothing to with that.

Ms M N GILLION: It has got everything to do with that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon member Simmers.

Mnr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Madikizela, thank you for that answer. Minister, but is it also not true that the Municipality in conjunction with your Department, once they identified the suitable portion of land they actually consulted with the community on the way forward and the give them specific timelines. Hence there was limited rejection of the new piece of land that was identified for the specific project?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, it is true. The Municipality went to Power Town. I went there twice myself as well, engaging the community, but it is so unfortunate because I did not want to get there. It is so unfortunate that there are a few people who try to politicise this by saying exactly what hon member Gillion is saying. It has nothing to do what she was just saying now.

The reality is that people cannot live on the land there. I mean you cannot develop that land for people to live there because there will be long-term implications, but public participation was done – just to respond through you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It was done on numerous occasions. I was there twice as the MEC and we engaged people, and the majority of people understood that we had to relocate them.

Ms M N GILLION: Not everybody.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move to the next question.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I said the majority.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question Seven. Hon member Lekker to Minister Plato. Minister Plato.

*Schools: improvement of safety*

**7. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (1) Whether he and his Department intend taking steps to improve the safety of learners and teachers at schools in the province in the light of the increase in incidents of robbery and gang attacks at schools; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether his Department has taken any steps to improve the safety at the Ummangaliso Primary School, the Intshayelelo Primary School, the Lwandle Primary School and the Vukukhanye Primary School following the incidents of armed robbery on these schools' premises in May; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon member for the question.

Yes, I had talks with Khayelitsha SAPS to increase its visibility in and around schools, specifically in the mornings, in the afternoon, but also during

school hours.

SAPS did arrest alleged perpetrators. I also had talks with Minister Schäfer and her officials to see what other measures they put in place to increase safety in and around schools.

The Department has made good progress in partnership with the Education Department, City Law Enforcement, Metro Police and SAPS in the establishment of SAFE-Zones in 16 priority schools which will see the deployment of a further 26 fully trained school safety officers augmented by partnerships with neighbourhood watch structures, EMS Safety and the SAPS.

And yes, the Department of Community Safety Western Cape, the Education Department and SAPS met with the schools on 7 June this year. It was agreed that the Integrated School Safety and Security Resilience Scorecard would be utilised at the schools to ascertain the type of risk, threats and vulnerability the schools are facing. SAPS is to review the operational plan for the area and distribute it to the role-players.

On 5 July 2018 DOCS hosted a neighbourhood watch consultative engagement to discuss school safety with its partners, the neighbourhood watch and CPFs, it is our capable partner, in the Khayelitsha area with 10 accredited neighbourhood watch structures.

The Western Cape Education Department is hosting a School Safety meeting

with the schools in Khayelitsha on 26 July 2018 and DOCS will brief the principals and school safety officers on how to complete the Safety and Security Resilience Scorecard.

Further meetings were held by DOCS and the Western Cape Education Department in relation to the attacks and safety at the schools. The Western Cape Education Department and my Ministry have held numerous engagements around school safety and for more detail the hon member is welcome to submit a question in this regard to the honourable Minister of Education as well, but some of these meetings just include:

- 8 June 2018
- 14 June 2018
- 15 June 2018
- 26 June 2018
- 27 June 2018
- 9 July 2018
- and 12 July 2018

with the role-players in Khayelitsha. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Enkosi. [Thank you.] Mr Deputy Speaker, through you, can

the MEC confirm that the schools that were affected and the others that are also in the same area are going to have permanently deployed Neighbourhood Watch members going forward?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think I said that in my answer. Neighbourhood Watch members, but also other trained staff. We must remember Neighbourhood Watch members are not fully trained security personnel, but the plan, the idea is to give them further training to fulfil that function and to enable them to earn a stipend at least, ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we move on to the next question which is New Questions, Number One? Hon member Mackenzie again to Minister Plato.

*New Questions*

*Strandfontein Coast: attacks – plans to combat*

**1. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether a plan of the South African Police Service to combat the attacks on fishermen and women on the Strandfontein coast has been brought to his attention; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and also to the hon member for the question.

Yes, it was brought to my attention and I met with a fishing delegation in my office as well to listen to their concerns. In November 2016 an initiative called “Fishing in numbers” was established by the fishing men and women to address their safety concerns.

This led to a collective approach to addressing crime and improved co-operation between Metro Police, DAFF, Muizenberg and Mitchells Plain SAPS, the Department of Community Safety, the local CPF members and the councillors obviously, and the fishing men and women as well.

Because of this approach and vigilance amongst the Strandfontein fishing community, we have seen a significant drop in attacks. It means that the new approach is working.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Minister, thank you for the response. Minister, it is obviously great that you have met with the relevant forums, etcetera. Is there perhaps a structure, a coordinated forum where the people can generally feed in, because you are absolutely right, that the people have said there has been a drop in attacks, but obviously it does occur and the police are not patrolling on the outer areas given what is happening on the

inside of Mitchells Plain, particularly recently. So are there a structured forums where these matters can be raised? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, I think “Fishing in numbers”, that is what they call themselves. They are a fully structured body and they are working on a WhatsApp process as well if anything happens, if one or two are at the beachfront fishing and something happens they can press the necessary buttons and some of the members could come and assist, but the Neighbourhood Watches in that vicinity are part of those Whatsapp pages and they also respond if there is problems, and currently it is working exceptionally well in that manner.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, can we move on to the next question? Question Two, hon member Mackenzie again to Minister Plato.

*Lentegeur Police Station: corruption*

**2. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

With reference to the high-profile arrests of two Lentegeur police officials:

- (a) How many officials have been implicated in corruption at the Lentegeur Police Station and (b) what are the details of these cases?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Once again thank you for the question.

Three police officers are implicated and two cases have been opened, one in Kuils River SAPS and one with Lentegleur SAPS.

There are case numbers. The Kuils River case number 115/04/2018 for corruption – the members induced the complainant to pay them to declare the complainant fit to possess a firearm and to return the firearm. The suspects were arrested and the case is remanded to 7 September 2018 to appear in court.

And then the Lentegleur case, CAS 457/07/2017, also for corruption – the member released the complainant on a SAPS 496, but induced the complainant to pay him R400 for “bail”. The suspect, a police officer, was arrested and the case is remanded to 17 July 2018 to appear in court.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Mackenzie?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie?]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, can you share with us, were there any other police officers involved in this particular matter or only those three that were caught on camera? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Currently only the three. If the

hon member is aware of more police officers involved we would love their names and the issues, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We will then move on. Hon Chief Whip, are we correct that Question Number Three to Education stands over?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: The hon Minister away at a Minmec meeting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So Three and Seven will stand over. We move to Question number 4, hon member Maseko to Minister Madikizela. Minister Madikizela.

*[Question 3 stands over.]*

*Municipality housing databases*

**4. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

What mechanisms have been put in place by his Department to ensure that municipalities' housing databases are up to date at all the times?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

My Department has entered into agreements with all the municipalities where we agreed that we will provide the following support:

- Train municipal officials on the use of the Provincial Housing Demand Database and related programmes such as MS Excel;
- Conduct quarterly screenings of persons on the Housing Subsidy System against the National Needs Register to obtain data from the deeds website, Unemployment Insurance Fund, Government Employment Pension Fund as well as Persal and the Population Register which will assist in updating the Housing Demand Database;
- Host information sessions with relevant municipal officials; and
- Manage the development of the system enhancements in partnership with the Centre of e-Innovation.

So these are some of the things that we are doing to assist the municipalities to make sure that their Housing Demand Databases are credible.

*[The Speaker takes the Chair.]*

The SPEAKER: I see hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Through you the question to the Minister, as he has just replied that they are already busy. I want to know when did it start after all the in-fighting, especially in Drakenstein Municipality where the officials were chased out their offices and do not have offices to work from now?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, I was not aware of that information, hon member. I would appreciate it if perhaps I can get more details, but just to answer your question on when we started. We started as early as 2012. We rolled out what we called “Housing Demand Database Improvement Programme”, which we rolled out to all the municipalities because this is one of the biggest concerns that I have in municipalities and I must be honest, hon member Davids, that some municipalities are still not getting it right.

The issue of prioritising the most deserving people who registered years ago against those who are not even on the Housing Demand Database getting houses before those people and it is a constant conversation that I am having with municipalities so that we eventually get it right.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Hinana and then you, hon member Davids.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon Minister, in our communities we have vulnerable people who are the aged, the disabled, and child headed families. In this training for municipalities and the officials that must accurately and correctly capture information on the database, are these vulnerable people being considered for priority when the opportunity arises?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, absolutely, hon member Hinana. You know in every rule there is an exception because it is true as well that while we emphasise the importance of prioritising people on the Housing Demand Database, there are instances in our communities, for example, where you find that umakhulu [grandfather] is 70, he is not on the Housing Demand Database because what used to happen before, and it is still happening now to a certain extent, there are unscrupulous politicians who go around when they campaign and say to people: "Write your name here, we will give you a house." And in those people's minds unfortunately they think that they have registered on the Housing Demand Database.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] one of the DA councillors.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now it is then our responsibility – well, that is more common in the ANC areas. Now...  
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] the DA councillors.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Okay, what we need to do and I always say this to officials and to councillors in particular, I say to councillors if there are old people that are known, that have been living in that community for years, they cannot be ignored because they do not appear on the waiting list, which means we need to get our systems right because as I said, yes, we prioritise people on the waiting list. There are exceptions in those circumstances where people are not in the waiting list, but they were born there. I mean you cannot take a 22-year old just because that person is on the waiting list and ignore an 80-year old who was born in that area just because he or she is not on the waiting list.

So that is again the conversation that I keep on having with officials and councillors.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see hon member Davids and then hon member Mackenzie for the last follow-up.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Just to the Minister, if you said you started in 2012 why did we have this serious discussion in the Standing Committee on farmworkers that are evicted, but then they get a house without being on the waiting list? And it is happening in all the rural municipalities? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, I think – this is a very

good question. You see the biggest... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The biggest problem that I encounter Madam Speaker, when I – sorry colleagues.

The SPEAKER: There is too much noise, hon members. There is a speaker on the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sorry, may I address you, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please, Minister Madikizela.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sorry, sorry, hon MEC. There are three incidents today. The first one was hon member Grant just walking in whilst [Inaudible.] was speaking here, as you saw him. Secondly, the Deputy Chief Whip was interjecting whilst not sitting in his seat. Now hon member Fritz, who just moved now, was doing the same.

So there are people who are getting out of hand. I would like you to attend to that from the blue side.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, I shall in terms of Rule 41 manage the House accordingly, thank you. Your point is noted. You may proceed, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Very observant. Madam Speaker, the reality here is that, yes, when I took over this Department the sad reality, hon member Davids, is that farmworkers were treated as if they were aliens. They were not registered on the Housing Demand Database of any municipality for that matter. And I instructed all municipalities – well, I mean I learnt to instruct from my colleague. I instructed all municipalities – because farmworkers are not people who are living in a vacuum.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not learn much from them. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: They are citizens – no-no-no. I instructed all municipalities to make sure that farmworkers are registered on the Housing Demand Database, and notify us if there are areas where you believe that farmworkers are not on the list – because we made that call from 2012 as I said, that each and every municipality must register them on the Housing Demand Database, but also there are instances, if I can just say, where we partner with farmers because farmers would come to us and say: “Look we have land. We want to make this land available to municipality [Inaudible.] on condition that my employees would be accommodated here.”

So we make those kinds of partnerships. If it is not land they say: “Look we will contribute with our top structure for our workers on condition that they will be prioritised.” If those farmworkers were born there or have been living there for years we also partner with farmers in those conditions.

But I do take the point that you are making because it is true, I am not going to stand here and deny that there is a problem in some municipalities because this issue of registering people is still a challenge.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon Minister, we have seen with the recent riots in Mitchells Plain about housing and people complaining they were not on the database, yet when we brought the City of Cape Town out to come and register them, those who claim to be on the database were never actually on the database and we could not find those. They were 30 years or 40 years on the database, they never existed except when it came to violence.

Now that kombi or the bus that the City uses to come and register individuals, if I listen to some of the questions obviously around this, is it possible for the Department of Human Settlements to consider getting those vehicles or registering kombis or buses, if you want to call them, to take them around the province to perform a similar function? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Mackenzie, the reason why we ask municipalities to do it is because we do not register people. It is the responsibility of the municipalities to do it. We have a different role.

Because our role is to make sure... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He does not know, please help him, he does not know.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Our role is to make sure that when there is a project – because it is us who keep the Housing Subsidy System, we screen people and make sure that it is only people who qualify who end up in houses. I mean, even though it is not always the case because of unscrupulous people, but we have a different role, but if, for example, there is a need – let me just make this point. If there is a need for us, maybe there is an invitation in that particular area for us to talk about this, I would not decline an invitation of that nature, hon member Mackenzie, but that is the primary responsibility of municipalities to make sure that they register people on the Housing Demand Database. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. That concludes Question Four. I have been informed that Question Five has been withdrawn. So we will now move to Question Six. I see the Minister of Local Government, Minister Bredell.

*[Question 5 withdrawn]*

**6. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

With reference to the report released by C40 Cities entitled *The future we don't want*, according to which Cape Town and Paarl are at risk of flooding by 2050: What steps are being taken to mitigate this risk in the province?

**The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:** Thank you, Madam Speaker, thank you hon member for the question. If the hon member allows me I am going to give her a short summary and then hand it in because otherwise we will get to stand the whole day. It is a very complex and a very important discussion.

The question is welcomed, so thank you very much. The City of Cape Town is part of the C40 group but I would like to bring to your attention the similar membership of the Western Cape Government to The Climate Change Group – States and Regions Alliance, and the similar leadership role that is envisioned. So we also partner within that grouping, and we obviously start, or obviously work with anybody who can support us to find solutions towards climate change and the impact of climate change.

The Department of Environmental Affairs has developed a comprehensive climate change response strategy to address the climate risks and obviously flooding is part of that.

Under the umbrella of this framework strategy numerous sector response strategies are developed, so it is the Department working with various sectors within the private sector as well.

Then the Department of Local Government, the Provincial Disaster Management Centre, has a number of risk vulnerability tools that they have developed for the municipalities and you will see we work with them. We work towards the municipalities because at the end of the day we need to land our message in the municipalities and especially with the planning legislation a lot of issues have actually to do with planning. If you pull it down to the ground you will see a lot of our problems are because of wrong planning or bad planning.

Then the Department of Environmental Affairs, the Climate Change Directorate, in addition to the coordinating and the increased capacity across the departments to understand climate change risk, like flooding, are currently also engaged in a specific project, the Municipal Risk Pooling Feasibility Project, so getting all the departments together to work with our municipalities.

Then we have got the Biodiversity and Coastal Management plan that we have developed and are busy rolling out to municipalities, and I can just think of the many hours we spent to get this on the table because we sit with a given and you cannot pick up a town and move them from the coast. You need to work with the current towns and the current planning environment,

and also to land our message for future planning. There were very difficult discussions because obviously there were developers who had land close to the sea that have been in the pool that they in future wanted to develop and now all of a sudden you cut that out.

So that is an ongoing process, but it is very important that we do get our setback lines right on our coastal areas.

Then also the Eco-Invest project. It is a biodiversity economy strategy and programme which falls under the Provincial Biodiversity Strategy Plan for 2015 to 2025.

Then the Department of Housing. The Western Cape Informal Settlements Strategic Framework prescribes development settlements that are responsive to climate change, and this is especially very important for our housing development in the lower income market because they are at risk.

And then one that is very important for all of us, I think, is the study by the Climate Systems Analysis Group in the University of Cape Town, modelling the impact of expected climate change to the Western Cape for 2030 to 2045, and working closely with them and I have got more information on each of them for you, and obviously the documentation is also available and we can come and brief your Standing Committee. Complex studies have been done behind this and it will be interesting to debate it with the Standing Committee and roll it out.

Then, also from the risk profile, because this also speaks to our risk profile in our province and what are we doing towards this from a disaster management perspective. The Provincial Mitigation Strategy, we have developed that. The Early Warning Strategy, that is developed and discussed with our stakeholders to get them on board and to understand our messaging and I think technology in the future will also play a huge part in the early warning systems to get to our people quicker so that they understand, and I think we have got a couple of successes also that we can brag about.

That windstorm two years ago where we interacted with the Premier's Office and asked to close the schools for a day. It was a very difficult decision, but afterwards it was proven worthwhile because we have saved a lot of lives through that decision. It is because of the early warning mechanisms that we have got.

Then Disaster Management Integrated Development Plans with all our municipalities, the flood contingency plans that we have put on the table and the flood awareness campaign; every year we have got a fire and flood awareness campaign that we place in communities outside school hours, getting school children to a place and discussing the risk of flood and fires with them. Last year, I think, in the 2017/18 financial year, we reached 48,000 people through that programme.

So that is what we are currently busy with, so thank you for the question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Bredell. I see hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think you mentioned the yearly and the annual public awareness programmes, but I think what is so important, hon Minister, is that the public does not see the proactivity planning 20 years before, and we have seen that obviously with the water crisis that we have had. They can be quite unforgiving when suddenly it hits their doorsteps, because all of a sudden they think that we have not really done any planning.

So if this is what, according to this research document, going to be a huge risk for the Western Cape should we not or are we not going to perhaps launch a long-term awareness campaign that prepares cities and people for quite a major flood that this report is heading towards?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, I agree and that is why we belong to all these different forums with all their intellect and bringing it together so that we can also get a better understanding, but it is still a very complex environment. It is a complex environment, any disaster management.

I always say it is very difficult to sell something that might happen in the

future while we sit with current disasters actually. We need to overcome poverty and job creation and all these things, but is a long-term investment and even through this drought we were very tempted, but we always stick to the long-term plan. All our investments we throw into our 30-year plan so that we do not build white elephants.

So we do not have the luxury but we are hands on, we work with the communities, we work with our universities and there are some other disasters that we need to prepare for – building collapse, all those kind of things. Therefore we do invest in that as well and from disaster perspective we have got a whole risk profile of the province, 10 disasters that can hit us and obviously we try to be prepared as much as possible.

Building our communication systems to interact with communities when there is a disaster, it is crucial to get that right and I am the first to admit that social media, we struggle to get ahead of it currently, we are still struggling with it, but I will also invite this House to come and visit the Disaster Management Centre to just look at the work that we have done during the drought and the systems that we have put in place to, on a weekly basis, be able now to monitor our dams, the rainfall patterns, all those kind of things. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You cannot struggle with social media.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Your champion is the Premier.

The SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is good at that.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We learn from the best.

The SPEAKER: There are no follow-up questions. I believe Question Seven is standing over. We now move to... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I cannot [Inaudible.] why you struggle.

*[Question 7 stands over.]*

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, we now move to Question Number Eight and the question is to the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer, from hon member Joseph.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is quick, yes or no.

**\*8. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Finance:**

- (1) Whether any provincial department or municipality invested money at or borrowed money from the VBS Mutual Bank; if so, what is the financial impact;
- (2) (a) what regulations were introduced by the Provincial Treasury to prevent such practices and (b) what lessons can be learnt from the recently revealed involvement with the VBS Mutual Bank?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you hon member Joseph for the question whether any Provincial Government department or municipality has invested money or borrowed money from the VBS Mutual Bank.

In respect of the Provincial Government departments, none of the Western Cape Provincial Government departments have invested money or borrowed money from VBS Mutual Bank. In respect of municipalities, based on the assessment by the Provincial Treasury on this information supplied by the municipalities in terms of Section 71 of the Municipal Finance Management Act, Provincial Treasury could not detect any municipality in the Western Cape that has invested money at or borrowed money from VBS Mutual Bank.

May I just add, Madam Speaker, in relation to the question from the Deputy Chief Whip, the Western Cape Government, as you know, our bank account is held by Nedbank, but we are also investing in all the four major banks here in

South Africa because it is important that you also spread your investment risk across the four major banks.

And also, Madam Speaker, in relation specifically to municipalities, the municipal investments and borrowings are governed by the Provincial Regulations issued by the National Minister of Finance in terms of the Municipal Finance Management Act and the Provincial Treasury, as part of our oversight responsibilities, to assess the conformance and compliance to these regulations, and specifically Regulation 6 of the Municipal Investment Regulations prohibits investments with banks or other banks and institutions that are not registered in terms of the Banks Act. And in this case it does exclude VBS Bank and other banks similar to that.

Furthermore, in terms of Regulation 3 of the Municipal Investment Regulations, municipalities must also adopt cash management and investment policies that are aligned to the Municipal Finance Management Act regulations, and municipal borrowing is also regulated in terms of Sections 45 and 46 of the Municipal Finance Management Act and Regulation 7 of the Municipal Budget and Reporting Regulations.

The authority to develop and adopt borrowing policies, which should be committed with the legislative and regulatory requirements of the MFMA, vests with the respective municipal councils, and it is the responsibility of the Provincial Treasury to perform an oversight role and monitor municipal

investments and borrowing through the monthly and quarterly in-Year-Monitoring report, the so-called 71 and 70 reports.

Madam Speaker, with respect to provincial departments, Provincial Treasury invests the surplus cash in the province in terms of the Western Cape Banking, Cash Management and Investment Policy. This policy is in line with the Public Finance Management Act, and in line with the regulations of the Public Finance Management Act. The Western Cape Government will thus only place investments in accordance with the Public Finance Management Act and National Treasury Regulations and its own policy prescripts which exclude investments in the VBS Bank and other mutual banks. [Interjection.]

Provincial borrowing is regulated in terms of Chapter 8 of the Public Finance Management Act – and I am going in detail, Madam Speaker, because there are some provincial governments... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that want to invest money in State Bank. The VBS is a precursor of a State Bank, so I will be in-depth explaining this ...

The PREMIER: That is right.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... so that we prevent using all the other

[Interjections.]...

The SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Let him continue, man!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I have already asked hon members on this side of the House to raise their hand if we can pay their salaries into a State Bank. They refused. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, you can.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So they – we would like to see it. [Interjections.] Whose money can we pay into a State Bank? [Interjections.] Okay. Right, Madam Speaker, you pay his money into a State Bank, VBS. [Interjections.]

Right. Madam Speaker, it is important to understand what is happening... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! There is a speaker on the floor.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... with taxpayers' money and we are the custodians – also you in terms of your oversight role – are the custodians of the taxpayers' money and we have to respect tax payers' money. And so the

Western Cape Government, hon Deputy Chief Whip, has not incurred long-term debt and therefore has no exposure to VBS Bank.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and thank you hon Minister for the response. I think it is a financial lesson that we are getting, it is very important that financial governance is adhered to.

Hon Minister, it is clear that the individual spheres of government, namely also the municipalities, have their own right and authority to decide ... [Interjection.], It is clear that municipalities in other provinces have made these decisions.

So, Minister, my question is what are the consequences and the risk management in these municipalities from a national perspective and abusing taxpayers' money that is lost now?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Is it a point of order, hon member Oliver?

Mr R T OLIVIER: On a point of order... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... Madam Speaker. I am not sure whether I understand the

question correctly.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: And the answer was no, and it went a long explanation that we are not investing in this.

Now I am not sure why do we venture now into national too? What is the relevance? [Interjections.] Because we are not in the province and it was explained why.

Ms M N GILLION: You are not in the National Assembly.

Mr R T OLIVIER: And he is not the National Minister to respond to it. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, kindly take your seat. [Interjections.] The hon member is entitled – hon member Oliver...

Ms M N GILLION: That is a new question.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, the question needs to be linked, hon member Joseph... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: It is a new question.

Mr D JOSEPH: No, just a correction. The hon member missed Question Two, the (b) part of the question, he did not read that, the hon member did not read that other part at the back, that is why he is making that statement. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. So that is the first follow-up question. [Interjections.]

Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay. For the purposes of the House to facilitate the second part of the question, hon members, is what regulations were introduced by the Provincial Treasury to prevent such practices and the (b) part is what lessons can be learned from the recently revealed involvement with the VBS Bank?

So the hon member Joseph asked what lessons have we learned. Let me now come to that. [Interjections.] What are the lessons... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that we have learned.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is it going to be long?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Olivier... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: But you already [Inaudible].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the correct application of the investment regulations and policies would mitigate against exposure to institutions such as the VBS Bank.

Furthermore the VBS event reiterates the importance of investing in commercial banks which have more onerous regulatory frameworks than mutual banks which have a more relaxed regulatory framework. Moreover, in South Africa, mutual banks tend to be substantially smaller than commercial banks. This supports the requirement that government institutions should only invest with commercial banks.

When placing investments, government institutions must... [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Dit is algemene kennis, ons almal ken dit.

[Ms M N GILLION: That is general knowledge, we all know it.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... preferably invest – hon members, this is why Minister Winde and I always speak about the investment grading because before you invest as a municipality you look at the investment grading...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... because that tells you the risk so you have

to mitigate against the risk. [Interjections.] High risk are institutions that you should avoid, but VBS is the highest category of risk, but yet ANC municipalities invest in such institutions. [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Antwoord jou vraag.

[Ms M N GILLION: Answer your question.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am answering the second part, what lessons can be learned. When placing investments, government institutions [Interjections.]...

†Me M N GILLION: [Onhoorbaar.] Antwoord daai vraag.

[Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] Answer that question.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... must also diversify... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Daar hardloop julle weg van die vraag af.

[Ms M N GILLION: There you are running away from the question.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Municipalities and government institutions must diversify their investment portfolios to reduce their exposure to any

single financial institution or instrument.

It must also prohibit – and this is important, Madam Speaker and to the members - it is clear in the regulatory framework that you must prohibit payments of commission to draw business from a municipality to a financial institution and continuously monitor the performance and status of institutions where they hold their deposits and investments.

And also, Madam Speaker, the VBS curator applied to the court to recover some of the money back through civil claims against VBS shareholders and corrupt officials that work there. In court papers the bank's records show that a shelf company, in other words a dormant company, something that does not exist was used as a conduit to make fraudulent payments to an ANC gala dinner earlier this year. [Interjections.] This year.

Now the VBS, Madam Speaker, through this fraudulent company has sponsored the ANC gala dinner at the ANC 106th birthday party in East London [Interjections.]. Some of the honourable members on that side of the House also attended this 106th day birthday celebration [Interjections.]. They were part of the celebrations of the ANC that happened in East London.

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It was money that was stolen through VBS bank and they attended that celebration. This is money from a shelf company

of fraudulent ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

An HON MEMBER: Why are you checking on [Inaudible].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No. This is a company ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: 106 years old. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Even [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi your comment is inappropriate.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No it was not, I heard it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the records of this House can show which members attended it. I know my friend did not attend it because we were together. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, the same fraudulent shelf company was used to pay third parties commission to raise money from municipalities to invest with VBS in clear conflict with the Municipal Finance Management

Act because it is says, if you invest you may not use a third party. They have used a third party and here is the shocking revelation of VBS Bank.

Some of these third parties receiving a commission for illegal investment in VBS include an ANC Youth League leader in Limpopo. [Interjections.]. This is the state of governance in the ANC but this is more shocking, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] I am now answering the lessons. The question is what are the lessons? The lessons.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer there is a member on the floor could you take your seat please. There is a member on the floor. Sorry hon Beerwinkel is it a point of order? [Interjection.] Order please members, you have a speaker on the floor who wishes to rise on a point of order. Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am really beginning to wonder what the purpose is to put a question on this paper if when the response is given it is all over the place except what the question is. Lessons learnt, if you can explain to me the lessons you learnt, not what the ANC did. Learnt from that. Answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, I cannot interpret the questions the Minister has chosen to respond to part (b) so I will allow him to continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the total tax that we collect in South Africa is R1,4 trillion. It is an important matter to reveal and

examine what happens to R1,4 trillion in tax because through the DORA you make conditional grants, you make earmark allocations, you have money in your National Revenue Fund, in the Provincial Revenue Fund but you cannot simply just keep the money there, you must also invest the money.

So this has to do with the interest on the investment and then, Madam Speaker, every year in this House, the hon Chief Whip that is not here today, he is the one that asks the questions about the investment account, he is the one that asks about the Provincial Revenue Fund ... [Interjections.] so we are answering those questions because it originated from that side of the House.

So I will continue because the question is what are the lessons and we must learn these lessons after 25 years of democracy. If we fail to learn these lessons we are going to repeat them. [Interjections.] So we are going to ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Order please!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Well, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Sorry, Minister Meyer, take your seat please. Chief Whip Wiley?

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is rubbish what you are doing.

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Dyantyi! [Interjections.] Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Madam Speaker, it would appear that the ANC is bringing their street politics into the House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members! This has gone too far. Chief Whip your point of order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. Madam Speaker, when the Minister was trying to answer the hon member on the other side, member Gillion said “you are rubbishing this House”. Now with all due respect if a Minister is doing his duty, as he is entitled to do ... [Interjections.] he cannot be rubbishing this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip.

Ms M N GILLION: What is the point of order?

The SPEAKER: The point of order, sorry hold on. Order please members! Hon Magaxa, kindly take your seat. Hon member Dyantyi, compose yourself please. [Interjections.]. Now hold on. The Chief Whip rose on a point of order that member Gillion said this is rubbish and a waste of time or

something. I would need to rule on that but I would need to go to Hansard.

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] is rubbish.

The SPEAKER: So you are actually saying that the proceedings of this House are rubbish today?

Ms M N GILLION: No, I did not say that [Inaudible].

The SPEAKER: So what are you saying hon Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: That is rubbish?

The SPEAKER: What is rubbish?

Ms M N GILLION: The MEC is taking us for a joke here.

The SPEAKER: Can I ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It has been ruled before [Inaudible].

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, is it proper, can a person just stand and not even follow the procedure of a point of order and just address the sitting

without even getting the right from you as the presiding officer of this meeting? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The Chief Whip was on his feet while the Minister was standing. The Minister then took his seat and I recognised the Chief Whip. Hon members let us just be very clear, as the Presiding Officer I cannot talk to the content of a question or the response. I do not have sight of responses.

There is a question posed, there is a part (b) that talks to what lessons can we learn from the recently revealed involvement with the VBS Mutual Bank? How the Minister chooses to respond is his prerogative. I cannot tell him what to say. There are four follow-up questions to a question that is posed. Hon member Joseph posed the first follow-up question which addressed part (b). The Minister deems it important enough to respond to part (b).

Unfortunately I cannot control what he is saying to you so that is the reality of the sitting but to go about and say this is rubbish and we do not need a lesson, the Minister is entitled to a response to a question and that is what the Minister is doing.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is a free flow. Does he have the right to speak anything that comes to mind even ignoring the question?

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Magaxa. [Interjections.] I have been listening intently. I do not think it is a free flow. The part (b) of the question

said what lessons can be learnt from the recent - if you turn the page you will see it – from the recently revealed involvement with the VBS bank. That is what the Minister is addressing. He is talking to a lesson. I cannot talk to the Minister's response. Minister Meyer, member Beerwinkel, I am not going to entertain anything more on this matter.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, Madam Speaker, I have to [Inaudible.] if you do not mind. You have just said that you cannot determine what the MEC is going to respond, that is common knowledge. It is obvious, you cannot, neither can we but ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Then why are you standing again?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down, you must keep quiet.

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What gives you the right to just get up and say what you want to say?

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please! We cannot operate this way. Hon member Beerwinkel, continue with your point of order.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baas Wiley.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: *Baas Wiley.*]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You have just said that you cannot determine what the speaker will respond. You are correct but so can we also not determine what the person is going to respond. Our duty is to react to that response because in our oversight role we have to respond to what we are being told.

If what we are being told is not relevant to the question and it veers right over the country – this is the Western Cape. We are talking about the effects and lessons from VBS, learnt somewhere else but how do you in the Western Cape learn that? Not what did the ANC do with the VBS money and [Inaudible].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel. Minister Meyer, I will sustain the point. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, we have a National Revenue Fund. The National Revenue Fund makes allocations to the local government ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please, hon member Dyantyi. I am sorry the Minister is responding and he is trying to create the linkages so please I am going to afford him the time to continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, I am sorry. I am sorry I really need to address you. We cannot be patronised in this fashion as if we do not know anything about how the budget system works and how financial systems and

transfers work. We do know that. We are asking what are the lessons that you learnt? That is the question.

The SPEAKER: I am certain the Minister is going to give the lessons. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I now accept that they understand the full financial landscape so I now proceed on the lessons from this case study. I accept you know everything and so I will not go there. [Interjections.] No, but you said you know everything. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms M N GILLION: Can I please address you? The manner in which the MEC addresses us and refers to us is patronising ... [Interjections.] and as the ANC, Madam Speaker, we are not going to tolerate this. We are not going to be taken for children. Under your leadership, Madam Speaker, you are allowing this every time. We are not children, we are not [Inaudible.], we are not all those patronising words and expressions that has been uttered to us every time in this House by MECs who are supposed to know better and then expect the ANC to sit here quietly.

Mr M G E WILEY: You expect us ... [Inaudible.]

Ms M N GILLION: No, no and the Chief Whip ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M N GILLION: ... must give me a chance now. [Interjections.]. I am addressing you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You may.

Ms M N GILLION: Because you are also our Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I am.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Go back to the army!

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M N GILLION: ... and you must also protect the members of the ANC in this House.

The SPEAKER: I do.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Go back to the army.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just take your seat. There are two issues here.

[Interjections.] You see, now hold on, but you see †“hou jou mond”, [shut your mouth,] “rubbish”, that brings down the dignity and decorum of this House. So both sides, whether it is patronising or whether it is demeaning it stops. I am not going to allow you to even demean each other. You are all considered to be honourable members and you are behaving like kids in a school yard now.

I mean there is no respect, there is nothing here. You are the leaders in this province, be that example, be honourable and act in a manner that is honourable. You cannot continue in this way members. You may proceed, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: With the lesson.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will now answer the second part of the question, what are the lessons that we have learnt from this experience because history taught us if we fail to learn these lessons, we are about to repeat those lessons. [Interjections.] So lesson number one from this case study is that the VBS curator applied to the court to recover some of the money back through civil claims against VBS shareholders and corrupt officials.

Lesson number two, in court papers bank records showed that the shelf

company was used as a conduit to make fraudulent payments to an ANC gala dinner earlier this year.

Lesson number three, VBS through this fraudulent company has sponsored the ANC gala dinner at their 106<sup>th</sup> birthday celebration in East London.

Lesson number four, Madam Speaker, some of the honourable members in this House attended it.

Lesson number five, the same fraudulent shelf company was used to pay third parties commission to raise money from municipalities to invest in VBS in clear conflict of the Municipal Finance Management Act and none of the municipalities in the Western Cape was part of this process.

Lesson number six, some of these third parties received commission for illegal investment in VBS and it includes the former ANC Youth League leader in Limpopo.

Lesson number seven, from this case study, is according to the curator, this ANC Youth League leader received R8,4 million commission for working only for six months. [Interjections.]. This is an illegal act ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please. Is it a point of order hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, Madam Speaker, can I just ask the Minister just to start at lesson one. I could not hear.

The SPEAKER: You want him to start from the beginning?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, I want lesson one and [Inaudible].

The SPEAKER: Alright. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Lesson number one, the VBS curator applied to the court to recover some of the money back through civil claims against VBS shareholders and corrupt officials. Lesson two, in court papers bank records showed that a shelf company, in other words a dormant company, was used as a conduit to make fraudulent payments to an ANC gala dinner earlier this year. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please. Hon Minister Winde is on the floor. Is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: On a point of order, Madam Speaker, and I apologise to my colleague but the hon member Olivier says please repeat because I never heard a thing and then he proceeds to talk to a back bencher behind him without listening. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, can I address you on that issue [Interjections.]. I have asked on lesson ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you have your own member on the floor, please allow him to speak.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I did not hear lesson one but I have heard what the MEC said about lesson one and that is not a lesson in my view. That is why I have been talking to Pat after that because that is not a lesson for me [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Okay. But perhaps you should not have asked him to repeat it if it was not a lesson. Thank you. [Interjections.]. Hon member, order please. Hon Minister Meyer, will you deal with the lesson?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes, I will repeat every time that they want because I am an educator. If people do not get the message I repeat it. [Interjections.] So I will repeat it. I have all the time. Repetition is the art of learning. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Dyantyi!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Repetition is the art of learning.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please do not talk loud enough to disrupt the proceedings [Interjections.]. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay. Okay. Madam Speaker, the commission that the ANC Youth League member took from this VBS fraudulent activity was R8,4 million over a six month period. And he acknowledged that he has received this commission to facilitate municipal deposits into VBS bank. No wonder that VBS bank ran into a severe liquidity crisis and was placed under curatorship.

There are other allegations of fake transactions and looting the resources of taxpayers. I am therefore glad, Madam Speaker, that the brand of good governance and good financial governance in the Western Cape municipalities are not affected by these corrupt practices of ANC-run municipalities. I want to assure the citizens of the Western Cape that the DA and the Western Cape Government will not tolerate the abuse of taxpayers money as is the case by the ANC, particularly ANC-run municipalities.

If you vote for the ANC you vote for VBS corruption to continue and also Madam Speaker, the VBS rock in PIC is under fire and I think we must understand what is happening here. This is R500 billion, the salary bill of all the civil servants in South Africa. All of us, as we sit here, have family members, or neighbours, or colleagues, who are members of the civil service whose pension funds are invested by the Public Investment Corporation.

They have invested R350 million of civil servants' pension money in VBS bank. Now this is the reality and this is the lesson. You have to look after the pension fund not only for yourself but also of the million civil servants. The ANC is stealing the pension money and we have one million civil servants and the ANC is stealing that money and they do it through the VBS bank.

That is the real story that we must really think about. It is really corruption and this is the same bank that gave Mr Zuma a R10 million loan for Nkandla and we can forget about Mr Zuma ever paying back that particular loan because the bank is now under curatorship, so this is the story.

The investment account there is R1,4 trillion. This is why because of the mismanagement of the investment account, the debt is increasing and South Africa's debt in this fiscal framework increased from R2,2 trillion to R3,4 trillion, The debt is increasing because the investment account is being looted by the ANC Government. So thank you hon member Davids, you asked a brilliant question. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a follow-up question? Hon members I am told the time for questions has expired. That is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. [Interjections.]. Hon members, can we get some level of composure here. [Interjections.].

Hon members, please allow me, in terms of Rule 41, to call this House to order. Yes, we do have Rules. I am going to reiterate the right of response

resides with a member or a Minister, I do not determine the response. Hon members, I am very sorry, the Minister chose to respond so we will now ... Hon member Dyantyi, can you please manage yourself. There are Rules in this House and if you do not manage yourself I am going to ask you to leave the Chamber. [Interjections.]

Hon members, two wrongs do not make a right. No, no. [Interjections.]. Two wrongs do not make a right. [Interjection.] No, there are Rules for both sides of the House unfortunately.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us hear your [Inaudible.] what are you saying?

The SPEAKER: No, no. I am saying in terms of Rule 41 let us restore the dignity and decorum of this House. [Interjections.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: After all that rubbish.

The SPEAKER: How can you say it is rubbish? It was a response. [Interjections.]. Hon member Dyantyi, that is out of order. Which rubbish?

Ms M N GILLION: But you said ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What who said? What who said? I shall revert to Hansard and I will come back to the House with a ruling on “rubbish”. What I do need to talk to though is the behaviour. Your behaviour is completely unacceptable.

An HON MEMBER: That side.

The SPEAKER: You cannot say that side. The Chief Whip is on his feet, hon member Olivier is on his feet.

An HON MEMBER: They can sit down.

The SPEAKER: Why? The Chief Whip was on his feet before you, you are being dishonourable hon member Olivier. [Interjections.] The man has not opened his mouth. [Interjection.] No, no. I am not entertaining you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.] just stand up and talk.

The SPEAKER: The Chief Whip was on his feet ...

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.] allow him to just stand up and talk.

The SPEAKER: ... and then you jumped up.

Mr R T OLIVIER: But you allow him to just stand and talk.

The SPEAKER: He was the first person. I must recognise him first.

Mr R T OLIVIER: You allow him to just stand and talk.

The SPEAKER: He has not said a word!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Ja, but ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: He has not said a word. Hon member Olivier, compose yourself and take your seat please. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, we are now in the terrain of grave disorder.

The SPEAKER: Yes!

Mr M G E WILEY: I would like to suggest that unless the ANC comes to order and it respects the Rules of this House, that we suspend proceedings and you call the Whips into your office ... [Interjections.] and we get an agreement to honour the Rules of this House. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members we cannot proceed with this level of disrespect. Irrespective of everything else, the level of disrespect being displayed is unacceptable. That is the bottom line. I am speaking to the House at large. Everyone has a duty to manage him or herself with dignity and in a manner that is honourable. What just transpired here was nothing but, it was, I have never seen anything like it. So we need to manage ourselves.

We do have Rules and we need to get this thing back on track so we are now going to proceed. I am finished with this debate, we are going to proceed with questions to the Premier and I am going to appeal to every single member to manage him or herself with dignity and decorum please. Thank you. Questions to the Premier. Yes, hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, you did recognise me. So can I continue to address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I just want to indicate to you this House has already made a ruling on the word “rubbish” which was used by the Premier, the leader of the governing party. And it was ruled by the Deputy Speaker that maybe I would advise that you look at that ruling when you look at the word “rubbish” in the House.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier your point is taken however the context in which the word is used ... [Interjections.] No, no, the context. You can say it is rubbish. Hon member Olivier there is no he or she here, we are honourable members, let us just get back to that starting point. That is our basic point of departure. We are all honourable in this House. So let us start behaving in a manner that is honourable.

Ms M N GILLION: Do not just look at one.

The SPEAKER: I am addressing hon member Olivier, I am not even looking at you, excuse me hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] you cannot do your job.

The SPEAKER: If the shoe fits you wear it people. I am very sorry.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You people now?

The SPEAKER: No, no I am very sorry. I was addressing hon Olivier . . .  
[Interjections.] You, honourable members, I was addressing hon member Olivier when you said I must not look at you, excuse me. [Interjections.].  
Hon members of the Opposition.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Magaxa. I am done. I am sorry I am not entertaining this.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We have got rights here. While you also have a right too

...

The SPEAKER: You do have a right but I have just discussed this issue ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... to preside over this?

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes. Madam Speaker, I need you to explain this. You are referring to this side of the House as ‘you people’ and you are saying, you are talking to hon member Olivier. I think you need to explain to us.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, at the cost of delaying proceedings I will apologise and I will say hon members on this side of the House. However, it is incumbent on both parties, not only the Speaker but the members to come to the party too. You cannot carry on regardless and expect that there will not be a fall-out.

Now may we proceed? What happened here was unacceptable behaviour. The whole world is watching this on You-Tube and we sit here. [Interjections]. Hon members, it is about dignity and decorum. Hon member Gillion, that is what the word is, it is called dignity and decorum. That is what we need to maintain. The hon member Dijana is not here, the second question to the Premier is from hon Mnqasela.

**QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:**

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. Hon Premier what impact have the riots in Zwelihle in Hermanus had on the ordinary people of this town? [Interjections].

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: Firstly, ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, please. You may proceed Premier.

The PREMIER: Firstly, I would like ... [Interjection.] to address you Madam Speaker on the interjection of the hon Dugmore who said that the hon Mnqasela and I are working together ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: ... to destabilise Hermanus.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The PREMIER: Now that is an outrageous allegation.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is a lie.

The PREMIER: I would like to begin ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Is it a point of order?

The PREMIER: I am answering a question. I would like to begin ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: ... by saying that some of the people in the greater Hermanus area most detrimentally affected are the ANC councillors from Zwelihle. It is disgraceful how the ANC has completely abandoned them and those councillors were in tears.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, could you take your seat please. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can you ask the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA to confirm if he said that the hon Dugmore is lying. If so he must apologise and withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, I never heard that but since you pose the question, I need to ask the hon Joseph, if in fact what the member said is true?

Mr D JOSEPH: I did not comment directly to what member Dugmore said. I made a comment on what the Premier was saying but in terms of progress, I will apologise. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: To say that the hon member Mnqasela and I are destabilising Zwelihle or any part of Hermanus is fundamentally untrue. The opposite is true, Madam Speaker. The truth is ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, take your seat please, hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: With due respect, Deputy Speaker, we have Rules in this House.

An HON MEMBER: Speaker:

Mr C M DUGMORE: If this is a point of order then the hon Premier has the duty to raise that but she is going on into ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What is the point of order?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... a justification around, which is unnecessary as I understand the Rules and I would appeal to you that if she makes a point of order that my statement ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: It is not a point of order you stand on.

Mr C DUGMORE: ... was misleading then you make a ruling on that and she

is going to start making a speech.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, the Premier indicated that she is responding to the question. So there are follow-up questions to the Premier. If you have your hand up then you may proceed. Hon Premier, you may proceed but I see you hon Mnqasela.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. The hon Mnqasela asked me how people had been affected there and people have been dramatically negatively affected across the board, not least of all, the ANC's own councillors.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Under a DA municipality. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The DA ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You don't [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ... [Interjections.] The Premier is on the floor your interjections are allowed but now it has become a running commentary should I comment?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must ask why [Inaudible.]?

The SPEAKER: The Premier is responding to a question posed by the hon Mnqasela. Please allow the Premier to continue. You may proceed, hon

Premier. [Interjections.] Hon member Magaxa, if you wish to ask a follow-up question to the Premier you indicate that. You cannot ask a question across the floor. It needs to be directed through the Chair. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The ANC councillors in Zwelihle were given ... [Interjections.] supper and support by the DA-run municipality. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Who else must ...[Inaudible.]?

The PREMIER: ... that put them up in proper accommodation outside ....[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Order please, allow the Premier to respond.

The PREMIER: The DA municipality ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, please manage yourself.

The PREMIER: The DA municipality has supported and helped all the councillors in Zwelihle when they were being attacked and what happened was that one of their councillors had her house almost burnt to the ground and her dog burnt alive in her house.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh no!

The PREMIER: That is what happened and if we can go through what is happening to other councillors, both ward councillors and PR councillors in Zwelihle, it would make the hair on the back of your neck stand up. It is incredible to hear what is going on ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Hon members if you have questions you can pose them and interjections are allowed but a running commentary certainly is not. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: There is a group and one can only call it, of marauding thugs who are going around Zwelihle and they are recruiting people under force of the gravest intimidation to join them to walk around the streets. They are blocking every exit to Zwelihle so that the people cannot go to work. They have burnt down the library, they have destroyed the swimming pool, they have destroyed the recycling establishment and they have made sure that anyone who does not join them has their clothes burnt in the street so people are massively intimidated. They do not allow any service delivery in that area. They do not allow sewerage systems to be cleaned, they do not allow refuse removal, they not even allow doctors and other people to come into the clinic so the town has come to a complete standstill. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: The economy is collapsing and people are going to lose their jobs in large numbers.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Speak to the employers.

The PREMIER: I would like to say ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: ... to hon Mnqasela, thank you very much for the work he has been doing supporting everybody ... [Interjection.] irrespective of their political affiliation or their position. The hon Dugmore interjects and says well speak to the employers. You cannot speak to an employer to keep a business going that is bankrupt because the economy has closed down because people have stopped coming to the town. [Interjection.]. That is a tourism town and if nobody comes – the whales come in August. People have cancelled their bookings ... [Interjection.] Yes, the whales come naturally but tourists have to make bookings. Now the hon Dugmore says ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dugmore! The Premier is addressing an Overstrand issue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, the relevance of your question. Hon member Dugmore, the Premier has the right of response.

An HON MEMBER: And we are just [Inaudible] interjecting.

The SPEAKER: No. One interjection, two or even three but you cannot carry on indefinitely with interjections then it becomes a diatribe. [Interjection.] I am not. You may proceed, hon Premier.

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry. Madam Speaker, you have asked member Dugmore to come to order on numerous occasions so I must ask you that you take the next step. If they constantly want to ignore the Rules ... [Interjections.], they constantly want to ignore the Rules then I really must ask that you defend this side of the House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon members. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] We are members of the Legislature.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We want respect from you [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you are going to get very close to having to apologise or withdraw. You made a statement earlier which I am going to check on Hansard but you, about nonsense, so you need to manage yourself please. Thank you. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon Premier.

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The hon Dugmore makes the entirely spurious and baseless claim that we are defending privilege ...[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thought you were answering Mnqasela.

The PREMIER: To defend the economy of a town is not to defend privilege. People invest and grow businesses and create jobs that are the reason that many other people want to be in Hermanus and by destroying the economy of Hermanus you are thrusting people into extreme poverty.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question.

The PREMIER: It does not help to speak to employers to keep tourism destinations open when the tourists are not coming. [Interjection.]. The first thing we have to do is defend the base on which people come to Hermanus and want to spend time and money there. That is the basis. If the hon Opposition would help us try and restore order in Hermanus it might help matters. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you must pose your questions through the Chair please, sorry. [Interjections.].

The PREMIER: So, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, you cannot engage in a dialogue with the Premier while she is on the floor, please. [Interjection.] Hon member Davids, if you want to pose a question, you stick up your hand and then identify and recognise the next speaker. This is the response to the very first question please.

The PREMIER: So the hon Mnqasela and I spent much of the weekend in Hermanus trying to help everybody – everybody – and the hon Olivier, who was himself the target of a lot of vitriol in Hermanus, then sought to try and block the ANC councillors from attending our sessions at which we were helping people across the board – across the board – in all communities. So in fact when we want to try and assist people the ANC intervenes to try and stop us.

The SPEAKER: There is a point of order, kindly take your seat please. [Interjection.] Hon member Magaxa, I know the land issue is a very emotive one but you have to manage yourself. [Interjections.]. No, hon member Magaxa, I am not going to get involved in the debate. I cannot get involved in the debate, I am here to maintain order and you are making it extremely difficult for me. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I think the Premier, through you, is making one of the biggest mistakes in the House by saying I block councillors. I do not have authority over councillors, what they do. I do not deploy councillors, they do not report to me and she must give me evidence where I blocked councillors not to attend any meetings because what she is saying is totally not correct,

Her own Member of Parliament, MPL that serves there, can confirm that I never stopped any meeting. In fact, councillors do not report to me. I do not have to give them any instructions so what she is saying is totally not correct. I do not want to say the Premier is lying but I feel strongly to say that, whether it is out of order, because I have never stopped councillors from attending meetings. And if you want me to say what I said, I can do that for her information, so that it is clear. I said you cannot invite ANC people on a DA letterhead, we are not DA. If member Mnqasela invites people, he must ask on a parliamentary letterhead. That is all I said. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, I will maintain your point. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: What rule has the hon member just stood [Inaudible.]? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, again I have to say I am not, I cannot determine the content of responses. Hon member Olivier, you have raised a point, you have put it to the Premier so I am now going to ask ... Hon Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: On a point of order, Madam Speaker, I think it is important to note that hon Olivier was not invited on a DA letterhead but he ducked and dived, he was playing hide and seek throughout the weekend. [Interjections.] But he was invited respectfully, he was invited and he knows what I am talking about.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mnqasela, I do not think as the Speaker I must ...  
[Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and member Gillion was not part of these meetings. They caused these problems. She never attends ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mnqasela ... Member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Can I ... ?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may address me but before you begin can I just say I cannot be asked ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, please we also need protection.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely.

Ms M N GILLION: The member that was asking the question is casting aspersions on us. Please, please protect us this side as members.

The SPEAKER: My point of departure after the - I cannot engage in the merits of the statement and hon member Olivier stood up and he responded to the statement. I cannot say this is right or that is wrong. I can only rely on the fact that everyone who says anything in this House is honourable and that it is true and that they have the protection of the House.

If we do want to bring serious allegations or issues it must come through a substantive motion so I go back to what the Premier has said and hon Olivier is questioning it but hon Dugmore's question was around the Premier and the member is destabilising the area, that too is a serious statement to make.

So one needs to be - I try and weigh everything up - and I am trying to be as fair and as impartial as possible but I cannot get involved in deliberations around the merits of a statement.

Ms M N GILLION: But then Masi must not make accusations. [Interjections.] Are you attacking me now?

The SPEAKER: Hon members, that is of no consequence, we cannot ask each other where we live or what we do and how we do it. As leaders we all have a duty in terms of oversight. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I must address you. It is ironic that today in this House the very same member there who knew the conditions in Zwelihle as he claimed to know, how could I duck and dive and I am in a

situation where I cannot even get out which he and the Premier explained. I was in Zwelihle. I did not make calls outside. He could attend it because he was running all around where he was free. I could not attend a meeting outside Zwelihle so I do not understand this ducking and diving he speaks about. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Oliver I cannot, that is not the point of order. I am going to ask the Premier to continue.

Ms M N GILLION: Where did it start?

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please.

The PREMIER: I am delighted at the hon member Olivier's so called points of order because they proved my point. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, excuse me Premier. I have to address this. I have heard it. Hon member Olivier, may I address you please. Hon member Olivier, did I just hear you say to the hon Mnqasela that I will make your life difficult? Did you threaten him?

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: I do believe that that is unparliamentary, I am sorry hon member Olivier, you need to apologise to and withdraw, failing which, you

will need to leave the House.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, before I do that can I ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No I am not. I have raised an issue.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Can I address you?

The SPEAKER: You threatened the member, you said to him, I heard it, you said to him “I will make your life difficult”. I am asking you, I heard you say it, you need to apologise and withdraw.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, I am not entertaining, if you do not apologise and withdraw I am going to ask you to leave the Chamber please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am not – you need to apologise and withdraw. It was a blatant threat. I heard it.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I withdraw and I apologise but member Mnqasela must not lie in this House. I am asking you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That too, you cannot accuse a member of lying unless – I am really sorry hon Olivier, we cannot go around threatening each other. That is gangster behaviour, it does not raise the dignity and decorum of this House. [Interjections.]. Please let us all be honourable.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can I ask if it is parliamentary for a member to say “dammit” to another member? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Whoever said “dammit” will you please just apologise. Who said dammit?

Mr K E MAGAXA: But why are you [Inaudible.] ...

The SPEAKER: No, I am sorry hon member Magaxa ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] when I was sincerely ...

The SPEAKER: You know I am trying very hard to maintain my composure.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... reflecting on the experience we are subjected to as an ANC by the DA MPLs in this Legislature. The hon Masizole Mnqasela said to hon Gillion “do not point at me dammit.” In this Legislature, in this honourable place.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Magaxa. Now I need to ask the hon, you see we have lost sight of the purpose of why we are here. Hon Mnqasela did you indeed say what ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Chief Whip sit down! Chief Whip sit down!

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon Mnqasela, may I address you? Did you indeed utter those words?

Mr M MNQASELA: I responded to hon Olivier. I simply said to hon Gillion, do not point at me and then I responded to hon Olivier. I withdraw the statement that appeared to be directed at hon Gillion but I was responding to a member here who says he will deal with me.

An HON MEMBER: You are lying.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and he says he will make my life difficult. He is threatening my life. Yesterday in a public meeting the community reps, his friends said I am enemy number one. I would rather be the enemy of criminals and be friends with the people of Zwelihle.  
[Applause.][Interjections.].

Ms S W DAVIDS: Haibo!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, sorry. Hon Mnqasela, you were asked to

withdraw and withdraw was what you had to do. You went beyond withdraw and you tried to validate and clarify which is inappropriate and you took advantage there so I need to caution you. Thank you. [Interjections.] Yes.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker you can see what the atmosphere in Zwelihle is like when a resident from Zwelihle says to someone in this Parliament "I will deal with you, I will make your life difficult."

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, on a point of order, a point of order.

The PREMIER: That is ... [Interjection.] Madam Speaker may I ask you to ask ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, you already made a ruling on that [Inaudible].

The PREMIER: What is the Rule on which the hon member is rising?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Davids. [Interjections.] Sorry just hold on. Yes?

Ms S W DAVIDS: You already made a ruling on that and hon member Olivier did what you asked. Why is the hon Premier now digging up a new [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, Madam Speaker, we are not children here.

The SPEAKER: Now hold on. When the Premier rose to her feet she said may I answer the question? [Interjections.] So the Premier is [Interjections.] I cannot tell the Premier to leave anything. The Premier has the right of response. [Interjections] I cannot tell her how to answer. When the Premier stood up she said I want to answer the question. Sorry, the Chief Whip was on his feet.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I need to protect my member this side.

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Ms M N GILLION: I need to protect my member. First it was the hon Masi, now it is the hon Premier, casting aspersions on a member of the ANC this side of the House. The situation in Zwelihle is tense but I do not think we need to make as if any member in this House is acting as a thug because this is the aspersion that has been created here, Madam Speaker. Our members also need to be protected. [Interjections].

The SPEAKER: Yes, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: This is not a point of order. I have a legitimate point of

order and it is ... [Interjections.] and it is Rule 204(2). [Interjections.] and that is that twenty minutes is allowed for Questions to the Premier without Notice. That is long past. This period is now over. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: That was your plan remember. We know your [Inaudible].

The PREMIER: I would like to answer my question because the convention is that ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You are in the middle of a question.

The PREMIER: ... the Premier may finish answering a question. The truth is, Madam Speaker, that the ANC does not want me to answer this question because the answer is too painful for them. [Interjections.] So they have to *tjank* and whine and interrupt and make a noise so that I do not answer the question and say things like the hon Davids has just said “shut up” so that you will stop it and make her withdraw it and that ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, take your seat please.

The PREMIER: You see, now we stop again. That is their strategy.

The SPEAKER: Sorry. [Inaudible.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: I needed to ask you to withdraw. "Shut up" is unparliamentary. Thank you. Member Davids has withdrawn hon Premier. You may continue.

The PREMIER: Now I have to start again because they do not want me to put the facts on the table and please may I ask you, Madam Speaker, if when people rise on a point of order you will ask what Rule they are addressing? Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: I was very grateful, Madam Speaker, for the hon Olivier's intervention because he absolutely confirmed my point. Firstly, he said he was under lock down, he was under siege in his house, he could not leave. Pointing out what is going on there, even to the ANC's own members. Secondly, he confirmed that he had said to councillors do not go to a DA meeting. He alleges that an invitation was sent on a DA letterhead. My colleague, the hon Mnqasela denies that it was a DA letterhead and my choice is to believe my colleague the hon Mnqasela. [Interjections.] I was there ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: I was there over the weekend ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Hon member Davids, I am going to have to ask you to leave. I am sorry. That is it. Will you please leave the Chamber? Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The PREMIER: Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] is the Premier of the Western Cape not of the DA.

The SPEAKER: Member Davids, thank you.

The PREMIER: And it was precisely in my role, Madam Speaker, as the Premier of the Western Cape, that I went to Hermanus – Zwelihle, Mount Pleasant and Hawston and I went there because I was asked by all stakeholders in my capacity as Premier to come and deal with the crisis there. And I went there and there were members of all political parties, public representatives of all political parties, business people, NGOs, a range of stakeholders and even some people there speaking out for Zwelihle Renewal which is this group that is sowing mayhem in Zwelihle.

An HON MEMBER: ANC councillors.

The PREMIER: We had two long meetings that included the South African Police Services and there is no way the South African Police Services would have come to a meeting to which they were invited on a DA letterhead. That would not have happened, Madam Speaker, and nor would any of the others.

Certainly Zwelihle Renewal or people who were speaking up for them would not have pitched up at a meeting that had been convened on a DA letterhead. So the other implication I would like to say to my colleague, the hon Mnqasela, is that it is causing unbearable polarisation, not only between the law abiding citizens of Zwelihle and the thugs in Zwelihle, it is causing deep racial polarisation between ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

The PREMIER: ... Zwelihle and the people in Mount Pleasant.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, there is a point of order, if you can take your seat please. Member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would just like to ask whether the Premier would accept a question?

The PREMIER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Would you accept a question Premier?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. It is a very simple question, Madam Speaker, I would just like to ask the Premier whether she believes that the ANC could be of assistance in solving this problem and if she does believe it, would she invite the ANC to participate in solving this problem?

The SPEAKER: Thank you member Dugmore. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Absolutely we do and that is why we did invite the ANC to the meeting and we asked the ANC councillors to the meeting and the hon Olivier tried to stop them from coming. So I really like the idea that is emanating from the hon Dugmore that everybody will participate. We did not have a DA meeting there, not at all. We did not have a DA meeting ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Premier, I need to ask you to take your seat. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Unfortunately, Madam Speaker, I have asked that the Premier provide me with evidence that I stopped councillors because she is repeating it. I have explained exactly how ANC processes work. I do not have authority over councillors. I want to repeat ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: She continues on the same – I want her to indicate which councillors did I stop?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... and maybe she should then answer whether ANC councillors were there at that meeting?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, you cannot expect me to talk to the merits of the statement.

Mr R T OLIVIER: She continues on it.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, the evidence is what the hon Olivier said in this House now. He said he said to the councillors do not go to DA meeting. That is exactly what he did and it was not a DA meeting. [Interjections.] So the evidence is right here and it emanated from the hon Olivier himself and you cannot tell me that the South African Police Services would have come to a meeting convened on a DA letterhead. That just would not have happened.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May I? Premier, take your seat, hon Olivier take your seat. The question to the Premier was posed by the hon Mnqasela and then he is allowed a follow-up question. The hon Dugmore rose, I asked him

if it was a point of order, he then said he would like to ask if the Premier would take a question so the Premier has answered hon Dugmore's question. She is now proceeding with her response to hon Mnqasela's first question which he posed. I just want to make sure we are on the right track and then hon Mnqasela gets one more follow-up question and the time then is up, we are going to be done because we are in the middle of a question. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, under what rule is this ruling? The Rules are fairly clear, and the 20 minutes is over.

The SPEAKER: Yes, but the Table staff alerted me that there was still time for the Premier to respond ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You must apply for litigation.

The SPEAKER: ... and she was in the middle of a question and that is why we allowed the question to continue. So there will not be a second, because the Premier is still answering the first question.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy kan nie met die *follow-up* wen nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You cannot win with the follow-up.]

The SPEAKER: There is no follow-up now, unfortunately.

The PREMIER: The key thing about the Rules is that you cannot stand up on

a question to the answer to a question.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

The PREMIER: But I was not going to explain to the hon Dugmore ... [Interjections.] because I knew his question would help me, as it really did, as you could all see that. [Interjection.] Now the bottom line here is that racial polarisation in this town ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yoh! That is a serious allegation. I would be worried about [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ... is increasing dramatically. The economy is probably going to come close to destruction in that town. People are leaving. Property prices have obviously dropped like anything. This whale season is probably going to be a catastrophe unless this problem stops immediately now, and if you could see the thugs that are involved behind this and are terrorising people – there is no other word for it, and stopping basic service delivery, it really does give some substance to the word “thug-ocracy” which is, I am afraid, what some parts of South Africa are degenerating into.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Just for clarity, Chief Whip, I was alerted, the Table staff have indicated that every time there is a point of order, they stop the clock. So there were still two minutes left of 20 minutes in response to your point of order. Hon member? Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Given the complexity of the situation and the fact that rioters have been going on constantly, what do you think, hon Premier, is the reason behind all of this? What is causing this? And lastly, why are the police struggling to contain the situation and what can be done about it?

The PREMIER: Well, from all of the discussions we have had, including with the ANC councillors and the DA councillors from Zwelihle, we have understood that the real cause behind this is that this gentleman, Mr Gcobani Ndzungana, wants to stand as a councillor in the election next year and he is trying to mobilise a support base ... [Interjection.] and he would like to put himself up as a candidate and get his name well-known and thump the tub as much as he can.

And it will be absolutely tragic if those kinds of strategies worked. The polarisation, the animosity, the anger, the hatred that is coming out of the entire Overstrand region belies every single heart of Madiba's legacy that we spoke about today, and we really need to do everything we can to restore it, which is the reason that the hon Mnqasela has been there non-stop and that I have been there repeatedly and indeed the hon Dugmore suggested in an interjection earlier, that it was the first time I had been this weekend. That is not correct. That is absolutely not correct.

Mr C M DUGMORE: About this issue.

The PREMIER: And the bottom line, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] about this issue.

The PREMIER: I went about all of the land issues and other issues about four, five weeks ago. So, Madam Speaker, what is going on there ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: In fact, I have been there four times, Madam Speaker. Once was about four or five weeks ago, the last time was today, and the next time will be tomorrow.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, you cannot ask questions like that.

The PREMIER: ... and it would be nice to see the ANC trying to help us. Their councillors are, and I must pay tribute to the ANC councillors. They understand the critical nature of the situation and if the hon Olivier would stop trying to prevent them from coming to the meetings and if he will come to the meetings as well, as now the hon Dugmore has opened the door to happen, let us try and solve this problem together. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of Questions to the Premier. The

20 minutes that was allocated has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please stay away from Hermanus. You are polarising it.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is an interjection.

The SPEAKER: It is not an interjection. You might wish to comment, but we now move to Statements by Members. I see the hon, the DA. I see member Joseph.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr D JOSEPH (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. The challenge of the South African Police Services to adequately address gang-related crime and violence on the Cape Flats and other parts of the Western Cape is of key concern to the DA in the Western Cape, where ordinary citizens are held ransom by gang mobs and where children die every day in the cross-fire of gang turf wars.

We cannot provide the safe and secure living environment to each and every one of our residents, who deserve it. With the worst police-to-population ratio in the country, at just one police officer for every 628 people, Nyanga has now become the murder capital of South Africa, and we cannot go on like

this.

I support the march by the Democratic Alliance from the Manenberg Police Station to the Nyanga Police Station today, where we call on National Government to deploy the South African National Defence Force to assist the police ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, in your dreams!

Mr D JOSEPH: ... in combatting crime in these affected communities. [Interjections.] If Government cannot protect our people, as per the Constitution, by effectively allocating police resources, then the army needs to intervene.

The scale of violence and the guerrilla tactics employed by gangs on the Cape Flats and other areas, must be dealt with harshly if we want to protect these communities from violence, which affects their daily lives. Furthermore, we must also protect our children from falling into a life of crime and continuing this cycle of gang-related criminality.

The South African Bill of Rights clearly lists the freedom and security of the person as a cornerstone of a free and just society. We must uphold this right on the Cape Flats and other areas and make sure that our residents are shielded from violence and ensured justice should they be subjected to it.

This is a commitment the DA continues to uphold in the best interests of the people we serve. We must send the army now to assist the police in creating a safe environment for all our people. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION (ANC): Madam Speaker, the DA-led Local and Provincial Government must answer for service delivery failures and the housing crisis in Hermanus, where poor people are scandalously neglected and ignored.

The DA must answer for the abuse of the Neighbourhood Watch that posts its forces to racially divide that community. The DA must answer for the fact that Zwelihle and other areas are on fire and DA operatives fan the flames with seditious actions and acts.

The DA must answer why people now suffer under intimidation while essential services cannot be delivered. The DA turned a blind eye to many legitimate protests and now tries to shift the blame. It should instead take responsibility and through proper delivery relieve the governance pressures.

It is also ironic every time the DA messes up, the National Government and the defence force is called to bail the DA out.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As they have just done now.

Ms M N GILLION: We saw this with wild DA expectations ...

[Interjections.] that soldiers must come to guard taps, fight crime, put out fires ... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, julle is uitgevang!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, you have been caught out!]

Ms M N GILLION: ... put one in bed between all couples to prevent domestic violence and save the DA from self-inflicted protests from Hangberg to Zwelihle. The DA must do introspection and make changes to its own attitude to poor people. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

†‘n AGB LID: Knyp hulle!

[An HON MEMBER: Pinch them!]

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, over the past four months hundreds of protesters have taken to the streets, torching Government infrastructure and private property which supports and uplifts communities and families in their endeavours. Police have arrested dozens of protesters in Hermanus, Zwelihle, George, Riebeeck-Kasteel and many other areas.

These sort of actions are regrettable and unfortunate. Focusing in particular on Zwelihle, unrests that we have seen by rioters that have left not only the community hamstrung and kept hostage, but it has seen many more people

falling behind in terms of their own economic activities.

I call Minister Bheki Cele and his advisor, General Lennit Max, to ensure the following resolutions are taken seriously:

1. That the army be deployed with immediate effect in Zwelihle to stabilise that community and ensure that there is law and order;
2. that they work on food and protect innocent civilians from discrimination;
3. that law and order be restored with immediate effect and;
4. that those individuals who have pending crimes on their names be put behind bars;
5. that an environment that is conducive is created for those who want to come forward in order for them to be able to report these crimes and the witness protection be established;
6. that none of those who have charges against them should be released; they should be remanded in custody like the police did this morning with Gcobani Ndzingana.

I call upon all of us here to work together to protect the weak, the vulnerable and downtrodden in Zwelihle. More than 20 000 people are expecting us here, as parliamentarians to rise up, stand up and protect them and defend their right to life ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and their ability to move freely and enjoy ...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...freedom under the sun.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the EFF I see the DA.

Mr N E HINANA (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. Since the beginning of 2018, there have been 263 land invasions in the Western Cape. These invasions have mostly taken place in Cape Town, Hermanus, George, Thembalethu, Phillipi, Khayelitsha, Riebeeck-Kasteel, etcetera. We have had 87 land invasions outside the Metro and 176 land invasions in the City. The number increases as we speak.

These illegal land invasions must unreservedly be condemned as they lead to the destruction of property, like what has just happened in Fezeka Council where the fire department was burnt.

Many land invaders are searching for a home and a way out of homelessness; a point which the DA in the Western Cape wholeheartedly understands and sympathises with. Whilst I, like many other residing in the Western Cape, welcome the rain; it understandably takes a massive toll as flash floods drown our children and wash away families' homes and possessions living in

informal settlements.

Devastating fires are frequently uncontrollable because of inaccessibility in these illegal land invaded constructed settlements. However, the establishment of homes on private lands can be equally condemned and cannot be tolerated.

I therefore call on residents to register their names instead on their municipalities' housing database list so that they can have their houses and their names registered so that when these fires and rains occur, they are known where they are, because they are registered.

I further commend the City of Cape Town Disaster Risk Management Centre for coordinating the vital services they continue to provide to residents in the Western Cape during the emergency and wet season, as a result of the rains. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member. Your time has also expired.  
The ANC, hon Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The problems of the Western Cape DA grow daily and in the latest blow the DA lost the only credible crime fighting expert it had in this Legislature, namely Lieutenant-General, Advocate Lennit Max, who left.

It is an open secret that the DA's backroom boys club hates Max and he is part of the DA's purge of people of coloured origin, like Cape Town Mayor, Patricia de Lille.

This bias and discrimination is also noted in the DA's choice to favour the hon MEC Alan Winde as its Premier candidate for the upcoming elections to succeed the hon Helen Zille. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are not going to get those [Inaudible]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The fear-driven DA has chosen Winde above DA Provincial Leader, Bonginkosi Madikizela. It is interesting to also note the hon Madikizela was used earlier to cheat Max out of the leader position and that Madikizela is now sour, after losing Max that he makes all kinds of statements to further discredit him.

The truth is, those very pale male DA puppeteers cry in their hands that they lost Max. It is any wonder then that the latest Ipsos figures shows the DA is in a tailspin of decline and still sheds support due to such stupid actions and decisions? I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As we commemorate what would have been Nelson Mandela's hundredth birthday this week, I

want to point out a vital point made in former US President, Barack Obama's speech that he had made in commemoration of this day.

In a rousing and emotive address, Obama warned against embracing the politics of fear and resentment ... [Interjections.] and I wonder if the ANC and the EFF will heed this warning as both parties employ divisive and racially polarising tactics to stir up nationalism in a desperate attempt to secure votes.

We see that in the land debate both the President and Julius Malema have pitted races against each other. The ANC continues to remain deafeningly silent on the populist and violent political rhetoric gaining ground in our country. When the leader of an opposition party openly calls for the killing of whites, and when the leader of our country himself does not condemn it, we know that South Africa is in the grips of the very threats Obama warned us against.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: How can the ruling party ... [Interjections.] sit idle while death threats are being made by politicians against minority groups in our country? When will the President heed Obama's call to resist and rebuke such politics of fear and resentment? [Interjections.] Where is the leadership needed in this worrying time for South Africa?

If the politics of fear and resentment as pointed out by Barack Obama, are on the rise, it is our duty as political leaders to combat such beliefs in the interests of South Africa's Constitution. If the legacy of Nelson Mandela is a united, tolerant and peaceful country, then our leaders must stand up against fear and resentment in our society. This is what we owe Tata Madiba, and what we owe the people of a free South Africa.

When we cave in to fear and resentment, we lose sight of the dream Nelson Mandela had for our country. When we lose sight of the values of reason, tolerance, and peace, we risk being completely consumed by our own hate and ignorance. We cannot let this happen. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC, hon Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, for the first time ever this Legislature was dragged to court by hon Premier Helen Zille.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Hon DA Premier Helen Zille ... Interjections.] got an interdict against hon Speaker Sharna Fernandez.

This gagging order stopped the Speaker from tabling the report of the Public Protector against the Premier for her tweets that praised some aspects of the apartheid-colonialism legacy.

It is interesting that the Speaker held back the tabling to give the Premier time to first bring an application to court, instead of immediately giving effect to the binding instructions from the Public Protector.

Mr M G E WILEY: She has not received the report yet! [Inaudible.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is even more disconcerting ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... that the Speaker did not oppose the Premier's application. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, ja, you must quote her now!

Mr R T OLIVIER: This undermines the authority and task of this Legislature as the Premier is accountable to the Legislature and is not subjected to the powers of the Premier.

By not opposing the Premier's application to the court, the hon Speaker as an executive authority abandoned her duty to protect the interests of this Legislature.

Further to that, the hon Speaker did not communicate to the Legislature or consult on this matter. Instead, she handed over her communication duty to

the DA's hon Chief Whip, Mark Wiley, who regularly tries to rule the Speaker from that bench he sits in. Shame on him. Shame on the DA.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA.

Mr D G MITCHELL (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The South African justice system is failing our young people. The rate of child abuse, rape and murder is on the rise in South Africa, often with no real consequences for the perpetrators.

In many communities, mob justice is the only way parents of children at the mercy of violent crime feel they can get justice. This resorts to increased tension and unlawful activity in our country and sidelines the criminal justice system.

We must have a swift and effective means to investigate and convict those responsible for harming our children. This includes investigating a child's closest confidantes. According to a UNICEF report on violence against children in South Africa, some of the reasons for the abuse experienced by children are families living in overcrowded houses, alcohol abuse by parents and drug abuse.

When a child has to run away from an abusive household, it is often because the parents are under the influence of drugs and alcohol, like a 4 year-old boy

in Prince Albert had to do. The criminal justice system must be aware of this and the SAPS must ensure that investigations take this possibility into account. This is particularly important in our poorer and rural communities in the Western Cape.

Ensuring the well-being of our children also means ensuring a safe, supportive and a peaceful start in life. Our criminal justice system, the South African Police Service and our social workers must ensure that the perpetrators of violence against children in our communities are brought to bar.

We owe it to our children to ensure that they always feel safe and secure in the most vulnerable stages of their lives. This is a commitment I will continue to uphold. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, member. That's the end of Members' Statements. We move on to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Joseph?

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the cost of coal power stations and the

alternative energy models for South Africa. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA-run City of Cape Town's new parking management plan which is set to increase parking rates disproportionately.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Hon member Lekker first.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Enkosi, [Thank you,] Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the flare-up of gang violence in the Cape Flats and Western Cape on the DA's watch.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the possibility of deploying soldiers in areas ravaged by crime.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that motion. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the state of safety in health care facilities in the DA-run Western Cape Province as a man was shot dead in Mitchells Plain Day Hospital in broad daylight.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the latest and probably future brutal violent attacks, the planting of devices and bomb scares in shopping malls and other commercial and business complexes in the Western Cape. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that. Are there any further? Hon member Joseph?

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis debat voer oor die negatiewe impak van die aanhoudende verhoging in die petrol-, diesel- en paraffien-pryse wat alle Suid-Afrikaners affekteer, veral die armes. Ek stel so voor.

*[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kennis word geneem daarvan. Is daar verdere? Agb lid Dyantyi?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the negative impact of the continuous increase in the petrol, diesel and paraffin prices that affects all South Africans, especially the poor. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Are there further? Hon member Dyantyi?]

Mr Q R DYANTI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA mismanagement of the water crisis in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that one. Are there any further? Hon member Kivedo?

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis sy diepe dank en waardering uitspreek teenoor mnr Quinton Adams, dosent in Opvoedkundige Sielkunde aan die Universiteit van Stellenbosch, wie al die afgelope 15 jaar hutte in die Freedom Park informele nedersetting naby die Kaapstad Internasionale Lughawe in samewerking met die plaaslike gemeenskap herbou. Mnr Adams finansier hierdie projek uit sy eie sak asook met behulp van donasies van familie en vriende. ‘n Barmhartige Samaritaan, soos mnr Adams, wie hierdie diepe humanitaire empatie veral vir ons afvlerkmensies toon, verdien om gesalueer te word. Ons het beslis meer brugbouers van sy kaliber in die provinsie en in die land nodig. Verder moedig ons hom aan om sy onbaatsugtige liefdesdiens voort te sit. Ek stel so voor.

*[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kennis word geneem van die voorstel wat in ‘n toespraak ontaard het, maar ons neem kennis van hom. Is daar enige iets verder op hierdie onderwerp?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House expresses its deepest thanks and appreciation to Mr

Quinton Adams, lecturer in Educational Psychology at the University of Stellenbosch, who for the past 15 years has been rebuilding huts in the Freedom Park informal settlement near the Cape Town International Airport in cooperation with the local community. Mr Adams finances this project out of his own pocket as well as with the aid of donations from family and friends. A good Samaritan, like Mr Adams, who shows this deep humanitarian empathy for especially our broken-winged people, deserves to be saluted. We definitely need more bridge builders of his calibre in this province and the country. Further we encourage him to continue with his unselfish service of love. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of the motion that developed into a speech, but we do take notice of it. Is there anything further on this subject?] †Then we move on to the next one where motions is without notice. Hon member Mitchell first.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye oordra aan die familie, vriende, skoolmaats en die breë gemeenskap van Nelspoort met die heengaan van Lekisha Aliza

Wilschut. 14-jarige Lekisha se lewelose liggaam is op 14 Junie in 'n verlate gebou gevind, nadat sy wreedaardig verkrag en vermoor is; verder dat die Huis die oortreding ten sterkste sal veroordeel en die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisiediens daadwerklik sal aanspoor om so spoedig moontlik die oortreder of oortreders in hegtenis te neem. Mag haar siel in vrede rus.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie? Goedgekeur. Agb lid Beerwinkel?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, friends, school mates and the broad community of Nelspoort with the passing of Aliza Wilschut. 14 year-old Lekisha's was found dead on 14 June in a dilapidated building after she had been brutally raped and murdered; further that the House condemns the violation in the strongest terms and actively urge the South African Police Service to arrest te perpetrator or perpetrators as soon as possible. May her soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that both Cape Town Mayor Patricia de Lille and Speaker Dirk Smit are to face a no-confidence motion ... [Interjections.] on 26 July; notes further that the motion against Smit was submitted by the ANC due to his failure to properly handle Council matters in an impartial manner. We wish the ANC well ahead of this debate.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved – there are objections. [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends and congratulates Durbanville Junior School Choir who took the Championship Gold medal in the C1 – Young Children's Choir Division at the World Choir Games held in Tshwane from 4 to 14 July, led by choir conductor Annemarie Dippenaar. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates member Mireille Wenger on the birth of her son; both mother and child are doing well, and we look forward to having member Wenger back in our ranks after an appropriate maternity leave.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the battle between Cape Town Mayor De Lille and the DA is set to continue as the party's Fedex decided to appeal the Western Cape High Court ruling; notes further ... [Interjection.]

†Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh! Hulle gaan nou weer diep, diep onder. [They are now going deep, deep under again.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL:

... this decision to appeal the ruling shows the determination of the so-called liberal DA's hard-core white boys club ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL:

... to rid the party of black and coloured voices; and calls on the party to end the turmoil at the City as a result of plans to oust Mayor De Lille.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection [Interjections.] There is an

objection. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates 11 year-old Jayden Molander from the farm, Lentegeur, Mitchells Plain who recently achieved his South African Springbok colours in karate and furthermore thank his parents Ivan and Maxine Molander for giving Jayden the opportunities to excel.

Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes, commends and congratulates Minister Nomafrench Mbombo, the HOD, Dr Beth Engelbrecht and the entire Western Cape Department of Health for exceeding their target of performing 100 procedures, as part of their Operation 100 Mandela Day Project. Further notes that 195 procedures were performed at various health facilities across the Western Cape. This project is in its second year and once

again clearly demonstrates the Department's commitment to not only deliver person-centred quality care, but to also improve the lives of residents across the province. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends and congratulates Cape Town International Airport for winning Best Airport in Africa in the 4-20 million passenger category at the Routes Africa 2018 Conference in Ghana. I here so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Simmers

first and then I will come to hon member Olivier.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the sad passing of councillor Sifiso Malgas from Langeberg. May his soul rest in peace. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the violence and destruction of property during Zwelihle protests that continue for months; notes further that the protest which started off as a genuine demand for land, have now been joined by rogue elements who are only concerned with causing mayhem and anarchy; calls on the Democratic Alliance-led Municipality and Provincial Government to resolve the community's service delivery protest problems and not only rely on the police and soldiers to silence communities; and appeals for calm in that community.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

An HON MEMBER: Object. Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Objection. Yes, object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. Sorry, it will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the comment by the former speaker, hon member Theo Olivier, in light of the fact that the House also notes with alarm the comment of the Luthuli House employee who stated, “The ANC is my second home and its members are my family” and is currently under arrest for at least three cash-in-transit heists. It took some two weeks for the ANC to act against this individual and only after the media cast a spotlight on this. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There seems to be an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates six Cape Town learners on their successful 59<sup>th</sup> International Mathematics Olympiad. The South African team that participated in the 59<sup>th</sup> International Maths Olympiad in Romania from 3 to 14 July 2018 are:

- Adri Wessels (Curro Durbanville);
- Emil van der Walt (Jan van Riebeeck High School);
- Emile Tredoux (Parklands College);
- Ralph McDougall (Curro Durbanville);
- Taariq Mowzer (Fairbairn College);
- Tim Schlesinger (Rondebosch Boys High School).

All six members of the team attend schools in the Western Cape. Special mention must go to Emile Tredoux of Parklands College on winning a bronze medal and special congratulations to Ralph, Taariq, Tim and Adri who all won honourable mentions. Ralph and Taariq missed a bronze by one point. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Gillion first.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes a Facebook post by Lungiswa Nazo, which showed the treatment of patients at Khayelitsha District Hospital with hundreds of seriously sick and injured people sleeping on the floor and in chairs for days; and notes further the refusal to improve services in this hospital as it gets worse instead of better. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family of 16 year-old Berodine Boyce, whose lifeless body was found on 12 July 2018 in a shallow grave behind the sports ground in Laingville, the small fishing village on the West Coast; furthermore that this House condemns the continued and brutal killing of our young people and calls on the South

African Police Services to swiftly make an arrest so that justice can be served. May her soul rest in peace. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed – is there an objection? Not?

Ms P Z LEKKER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. I will then see hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Enkosi, [Thank you.] Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the latest cheap political ploy by the DA of using the CPF database to invite CPF Members to a DA-led march; notes further that the Department of Community Safety is suspected of sharing it with the DA; notes it is a problem when state resources are used to achieve narrow and selfish party political interests; condemns the DA's use of the official CPF database to mobilise for a political march; and calls for an urgent investigation into how the DA got hold of this CPF database and whether MEC Plato or anyone in his Department leaked the information to the DA. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon – there is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie first.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates and commend SA Wheelchair tennis sensation Kgothatso “KG” Montjane who made it to the semi-finals at the Wimbledon tournament [Interjections.] I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Joseph first.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Government and the Hessequa Municipality ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Objection to [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH:

...on the first solar-powered desalination plant which will be launched in Witsand in November 2018. This project is a result of the partnership between the DA-led Western Cape Government and the French Government [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Objection.

Mr D JOSEPH:

... as well as the University of Stellenbosch. This is a fantastic initiative to ensure water security in these communities by means of clean, green energy. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Ms P Z LEKKER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I sense there is an objection to the motion being moved without notice. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Botha first.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern SASSA's failure to, on Tuesday 17 July 2018, appear before the Standing Committee on Community Development after the Agency confirmed to do so on 2 July 2018. Further notes SASSA was to address the mountain of concerns at various pay points across the province ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L J BOTHA:

...how far they are in meeting their September migration deadline and the progress that is being made in reimbursing grant beneficiaries who were affected by unlawful deductions [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Objection.

Ms L J BOTHA:

...I call on this House to remind SASSA that it should adhere to its own values of transparency, equity, integrity and care. I so move. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Ms P Z LEKKER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates SA tennis star Kevin Anderson for becoming the first South African to make it to the final of the Wimbledon Tennis Tournament in 97 years; further notes his sterling performance in which he beat the legendary Roger Federer en route to the final. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai was mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That was good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I take it there is no objection to that motion without notice? Agreed to. The motion is agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that a new poll by market research firm Ipsos has the ANC polling at 60% support nationwide as at June 2018, while the DA and EFF are at 13% and 7% respectively; notes further that the 60% is a massive improvement when compared to the 54% the party received in the 2016 local government election, while it decreased the gap between the ANC and DA in the Western Cape to only 2% [Interjections.] and commends President Ramaphosa's hard work, which has pushed the ANC in the right direction, as all people in the country want to join in and assist in the Thuma Mina Campaign. Amandla!

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Are there objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates SA tennis star Raven Klaasen, who made it to the Doubles Final at the Wimbledon Tournament. Thank you. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern a more than 500% increase in the price of graves in the DA-run Mossel Bay Municipality, [Interjections.] which increased from under R900 per site to more than R5 000; further notes the Municipality is punishing and milking the poor to build a new cemetery and we condemn this increase and we call on the Municipality to scrap it.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Lekker?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are taxing them to death! You are going to pay for that I can assure you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am telling you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that former DA MPL Lennit Max ... [Interjections.] appointed as special advisor to National Police Minister Bheki Cele; notes further Lieutenant-General Max is relieved that he resigned from the Legislature where he was side-lined, frustrated and undermined as Chairperson for Arts, Culture and Sport; the DA punishing him for asking uncomfortable and insistent questions when he was Chairperson for the Public Works portfolio committee; and congratulates General Max on his appointment. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being [Interjections.] Is there an objection? [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Schäfer?

MR Q R DYANTYI: You want to object!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Wesgro's Cape Town Air Access team for winning Best Destination Marketing Award as well as Overall Routes Africa Award in the Routes Africa 2018 Conference in Ghana. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa first.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the DA-led municipalities across the province continue to sell land earmarked to build houses. Notes that this obsession of selling public land to their friends, which is tantamount to corruption, is responsible for violent protests that dominate the Western Cape currently. The DA should own this crisis.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

An HON MEMBER: One! One example! One! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without

notice:

That the House congratulates the French national team for winning the FIFA World Cup in Russia; further notes that France won the World Cup for the second time by ending Croatia's dream of a first title with a 4-2 victory on Sunday in one of the most entertaining and action-packed finals for decades. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to that motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Hinana first.

An HON MEMBER: Do you have a problem with that?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja! Ek *like* haar. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes! I like her. [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Maitland Crime Prevention Unit for the arrest of two suspects in possession of stolen PRASA property; the value of the property is estimated at R30 000; further commends the provincial Department of Transport and Public Works for having signed a

Memorandum of Understanding with PRASA, allocating R16 million towards the safety of commuters which has resulted in numerous arrests. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the outright condemnation of the City's plans to increase street parking fees in the Cape Town CBD to as much as R400 a day ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just a minute. I think, what I did, Deputy Speaker, was to actually move a motion with notice that we should debate this matter. So, this is now a motion without notice. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow the member to continue. We will sort it out later. [Interjections.] Please continue, member.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay, so as I was saying ... [Interjections.]

That the House notes the outright condemnation, not by the ANC ... [Interjections.] only, but all of us, including Outa, because these street parking fees in the Cape Town CBD are to be set at as much as R400 per day. [Interjections.] That is why organisations like Outa and others are saying that the planned hikes are unaffordable given all other increases that have hit the consumers' wallets and also that the Cape Town Chamber of Commerce has said that we have a right to expect better solutions to problems which are not just knee-jerk tariff increases, given that this DA-led executive directors earn millions a year; and therefore this House rejects those planned increases and calls on the City to scrap it and we hope Deputy Speaker, that ... [InterjectionS.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE:

...the DA will also support us on this one.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the provincial Department of Human Settlements led by MEC Bonginkosi Madikizela for handing over four homes on Wednesday 18 July 2018, in Forest Hill as a part of Nelson Mandela 67 Minutes Project; the project will yield over 800 units. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the allegations of mismanagement, allegations of corruption in the Councillors Pension Fund and ask councillors to stand up and fight to protect their hard-earned pension savings.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

†UNkzs P Z LEKKER: Uqalile ke. [You are starting now.] Objection!  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to that? [Interjections.] There is an objection. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Dugmore?

†Me P Z LEKKER: [Onhoorbaar.] Jy kan maar vergeet! [Tussenwerpsels.] Jy kan maar vergeet!

[Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.] You may as well forget it! [Interjections.] You may as well forget it!]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the internal City of Cape Town Audit and Performance Committee has recently identified reputation vulnerability on firstly the water crisis; secondly the downgraded AG audit; thirdly gangs, crimes, arson; fourthly controversial property development and sewage leakages and therefore this House notes further that it is also highlighted that the City's low economic growth rate with pressures to upgrade informal settlements, as well as MyCiti and control of the transport systems and also the embezzlement of money, as other key challenges facing the City; and therefore this House welcomes this report which shows that the City is in a terrible state of despair, despondency, poor governance, lack of decisiveness, infighting [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you talking about the National Government?

Mr C M DUGMORE:

...cronyism and many other ills which beset the governance of the City.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to that motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the about turn by the Zwelihle Renewal and their willingness to engage and become part of the broader Stakeholders Forum in Zwelihle; further notes the admission that their riot is based on nothing else but a demand for the release of their ring-leader Gcobani Ndzongana as per their deputy chairperson, Sicelo Gxamesi's statement on SABC. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mnqasela?

Ms M N GILLION: Objection.

Mr M MNQASELA: Object before I speak?

Ms M N GILLION: Temptation.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great appreciation the selflessness, fortitude and unity of purpose, an approach adopted by the people of the greater Hermanus and Zwelihle community in particular, in finding ways to ameliorate the desperate situation of Zwelihle community and further notes that the Stakeholders Forum was established, consisting of all political formations across all political persuasions [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is nothing new.

Mr M MNQASELA:

... councillors of the ANC ... [Interjections.] the Democratic Alliance and the civil society organisations such as churches, rate payers association, NGO's and business community and others. That this Parliament wishes them well in their endeavours to find a lasting solution in the Zwelihle impasse. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ridiculous water bills for Cape Town residents due to what is termed incorrect water readings, which are coupled with unaffordable water tariff hikes; notes further that the big increases are all part of the DA's plans to punish the poorest which started with their Day Zero messages, which was targeted at forcing the residents' fear of a future without water in the city and calls on the City to stop the tariff hikes and scrap all incorrect and unjustifiable water bills.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear there are objections to that. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends and congratulates the following schools for

winning and flying the South African flag high at the World Choir Games:

- Tygerberg Childrens Choir,
- Hoërskool Durbanville,
- Western Cape Classical Voices,
- Eversdal Primary School,
- La Rochelle Girls High School
- De Kuilen High School Girls' Choir,
- Bellville High School,
- DF Malan High School,
- The Winelands Chamber Choirs,
- University of the Western Cape Arts Choir and
- Durbanville Primary School.

I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Objection! Because there is one school left out.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to that?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Which school?

Ms P Z LEKKER: You must include all ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]. Hon member Lekker, it is your opportunity now.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, I am objecting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have the opportunity now.

†UNKzs P Z LEKKER: Ushiya iVuselela ngaphandle ubala ezi zenu. [You left Vuselela out. You only count your schools.] †Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 9 July marked the 31<sup>st</sup> anniversary of Ashley Kriel's murder by the apartheid security police for his convictions and commitment to fight for a non-racial, non-sexist, just and equal society; calls for a broader investigation into the killing of Ashley Kriel, restarted earlier in 2016; and makes a further call for the house in which he was killed to be turned into a heritage site in his honour. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Interjections.] Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls on the immediate return of serenity and tranquillity in communities plagued by violent protests, including Zwelihle; that this House further commends the South African Police Services for the arrest and detention of Gcobani Ndzongana and his co-conspirators; furthermore congratulates volunteers and businesses who on a daily basis have been feeding policemen on duty. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Motion is agreed to. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the arrest of suspect John Williams for murders of women in Wellington; commends the police who responded swiftly after the disappearance of his last victim, Chantel Mathyssen (21) from Sarepta, Kuils River and was later found dead on Arben Rude

Farm; notes further that the other victims may include Maria Isaacs (24) from Malmesbury as well as Natalie Jonkers, who disappeared six years ago and conveys condolences to the families and friend of the deceased persons. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Lekker, I think there is nobody else. You can go ahead.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the sentence handed down by the Western Cape High Court to Thembile aka “Morris” Vokozela (52), a prominent Gugulethu Tavern owner for murdering his wife by shooting her 11 times into her body and 5 times into the back of her head. Notes further that he was handed a life sentence and commends Judge Deidre Kusevitsky for this proper sentence.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Motion is agreed to. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the conviction of former DA councillor Wilma Brady of Cape Town for fraud and contravening the Municipal Finance Management Act; notes further that Brady under the then Mayor Helen Zille acted outside the scope of her duties and purported to illegally bind the Provincial Housing Department in a contract; commends the then ANC provincial secretary Mcebisi Skwatsha and the then Housing MEC, who ensured that criminal charges were laid against Brady, who released provincial land to a housing developer without authorisation and condemns the DA efforts over the years to protect and hide Brady's corruption, including a slap on the wrist by the then City of Cape Town under the Mayor in their DC.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The objection is against the motion being moved without notice, not the content. Any further? Hon member Dyantyi again.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Stellenbosch Municipality exposed MEC Bredell's denial that the forensic reporting to alleged wasteful and

irregular expenditure of millions of rands of the public purse was brought to his attention; notes further the report showed gross misconduct, including the HR manager having suggested in a council memo that employees be paid a year's back pay instead of the usual six months, as well as being untruthful about the Provincial Audit Committee, claiming it had reviewed job grades to be implemented, when it had not; and welcomes the observation of the concerned employees in the municipality that MEC Bredell turned a blind eye to allegations of wasteful and irregular expenditure at the municipality.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I sense there is an objection to the fact that it is being moved without notice. Objection will be recorded, and it will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the hon DA MEC Anton Bredell is nowhere to be found where there are real local government problems; further notes he is not trusted by the DA to speak on the water shortage crisis, as his media officer James-Brent Styan has become the face for the drought and other issues in the Western Cape; and calls on this DA administration to instead of promoting his book on every corner, immediately dispatch DA hack Styan to Hermanus to sort out the

problems that hon Bredell seems to ignore.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections there? There is an objection to the fact that it has been moved without notice. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great concern that Mr Present Velile who was deployed to the Western Cape as part of the National Audit Committee to fight corruption, yet ironically was caught with his whole body in the cookie jar; further note that he unduly benefited of a R97 million land project of which the farm is now completely derelict [Interjections.] and R30 million in the bank meant for salaries, is now gone; condemning the ANC for employing this gangster and cash-in-transit heist king and furthermore, condemning the ANC in the Western Cape for not condemning this gangster.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you! Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to the fact that it ...  
[Interjections.] Order, order. There is an objection to the motion being moved without notice and it will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Israel passed a contentious basic law on Thursday that anchors itself as the nation state of the Jewish people, promotes the development of Jewish communities and downgrades the status of Arabic from an official language to one with a “special status”; notes further that this law is discriminatory, racist and a blow to democracy as it harms the relationship between the country’s Jewish majority and its Arab minority and calls on the hon Premier Zille to take a stand on behalf of the people of the province against the unilateral deviation from the two-nation solution to that of bringing about a unilateral Jewish state of Israel.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? For the last time. There are no further motions.

Then we have reached the end, almost.

Before we then adjourn, let me just remind members to remain behind in their seats. The CPA AGM will take place immediately after the adjournment and that will not take us very long, so please remain in your seats. That brings us to the end of the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:41.