
TUESDAY, 21 FEBRUARY 2017

The House met at 14:15

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order! Please take your seats, members. Before we start, let me just say something else. Today marks the 100th anniversary of the sinking of the troop ship, the SS Mendi. It also is South Africa's Armed Force's Day today.

The SS Mendi sank while en route to the World War 1 battlefields with resultant serious loss of life. The vast majority of the over 600 who perished in the icy waters were members of the South African Native Labour Corps who volunteered to participate in the war.

Allow me to just read to you one paragraph attributed to the spiritual leader of the troops on that ship, the Reverend Isaac Dyobha. He said to the troops while the ship was going down:

“Be quiet and calm my countrymen, for what is taking place now is what you came here to do. We are all going to die, and that is what we came for. Brothers, we are drilling the death drill. I, a Zulu, say here and now that you are all my brothers - Xhosas, Swazis, Pondos, Basotho and all others. Let us die like warriors. We are the sons of Africa. Raise your war cries my brothers, for though they made us leave our assegais back in the kraals, our voices are left with our bodies...”

I think it is fitting that the House be asked to stand for a moment of silence to commemorate the Mendi tragedy as well as all members of the SANDF that pay the ultimate price in service of their country. Let us stand.

[Moment of silence observed]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you. May I also at the outset welcome all the visitors on the galleries. Just to remind visitors that they are not allowed to participate in the proceedings of the House by making interjections, shouting, clapping, but you are most welcome to enjoy the debate on the floor.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

Debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have received a copy of the Premier's State of the Province Address delivered in the House on Friday. The address is printed in the minutes of proceedings, and I now place it before the House.

Allow me also to say before I see the Premier, that today is International Mother Tongue Day. †Dit is Internasionale Moedertaal Dag so ek wil die agbare lede aanmoedig om in hulle moedertaal te praat, [It is International Mother Language Day so I want to encourage the hon members to speak in their mother tongue] †as long as it is one of the three official languages of the province.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Premier. Ah, sorry, hon member Mr Magaxa. My apologies. [Applause.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What a promotion, Mr Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Leader of the Official Opposition, thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon members, comrades and compatriots, Mr Deputy Speaker, on 17 February 2017 we listened to a water-treading Premier Zille

giving her Provincial Address. For many people this was an extremely painful, torturous process as some listened while the hon Premier misinformed the people of the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: It was painful for you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and the country through alternative facts, false news and excuses. I shall demonstrate that the Premier misinterpreted statistical figures on economic growth and employment in order to sustain her own narrative of economic growth and inclusion and her superior attitude. The Premier's approach reminds me of a phrase: "lies, damned lies and statistics".

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh come-on!

Mr K E MAGAXA: I want to include in that phrase, "blue lies". [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, let me start by challenging the first claim. The Premier claims that the Province created 490 000 jobs from the fourth quarter of 2009 to the fourth quarter of 2016, according to the Quarterly Labour Force Survey. The fact is, in the Western Cape only 342 000 jobs were created during this period. According to the QLFS there were 2 044 000 jobs in the fourth quarter of 2009 and 2 386 000 in the fourth quarter of 2016. We encourage the Premier to use simple arithmetic which shows that 342 000 jobs were created. She claims 148 000 more. Shocking!

The second falsehood, the hon Premier claims that the province has the lowest rate of unemployment.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: True!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Broad-based.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The truth is in December 2016 the lowest unemployment rate was in Limpopo with 19.3% followed by the Western Cape with 20.5%. Those are the actual facts. Yet when the DA came to power in 2009 the Western Cape had the lowest unemployment rate with 18.1%.

This means the Western Cape unemployment rate has increased by 2.4% since the DA came to power and it has dropped from the first position - a status maintained by the ANC when it was in power in the Western Cape. It is now number two. There are now almost 150 000 more unemployed people in the Western Cape than when the DA came to power in 2009; 614 000 unemployed in December 2016 vs 462 000 in March 2009.

The Premier boasts about the economic growth of the province in the context of a negative national economic outlook. This claim is designed to sustain another invention that the Western Cape is better governed than other provinces... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is true.

Mr K E MAGAXA:...and ultimately the country, what a big misinterpretation of the facts. Nothing could be further from the truth. The latest available provincial GDP data shows that the real growth rate in the Western Cape economy from 2009 to 2014 ranks only third out of nine provinces. The Western Cape economy grew by a total of 14.4% at an average of 2.7%, Gauteng grew at 15.4% at an average of 2.9% and KZN grew at a 15.38% also averaged at 2.9%.

Under the ANC from 2004 to 2008 you have to understand this - the Western Cape enjoyed the fastest growth in the country at a real growth rate of 5.5% a year. The ANC record remains unmatched by the DA. They still have to [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Then Zuma came to power. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: They still have to fight for this record. You must be hard at work. So our message to this DA Government is that some cannot be fooled and people are not stupid. Amilcar Cabral is instructive in this regard:

“Tell no lies, claim no easy victories, hide nothing from the masses.”

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Exactly!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, moving to other issues on the dismal legacy of the DA under the Premier. This government will be remembered as a monumental failure in vital indicators like service delivery, economic growth, crime and racial integration. On the service delivery it is well documented that the DA Government failed dismally to meet the expectation of people in housing provision. It has never met its own modest targets, let alone matching the ANC record.

Under this DA the number of shacks in informal settlements has grown exponentially. Worst still the number of people in temporary residential areas, which by the way become permanent, is increasing daily. It is clear from the provincial address that the DA has run out of excuses and now it changes the narrative.

Now the DA views provision of RDP houses as an unsustainable burden, simply because the poor cannot afford to pay the rent. Let us remind this DA government, headed by Premier Zille, an adequate house provides a sense of dignity, security and comfort to the recipient, but we understand this government's refusal to provide houses because the beneficiaries are the poor black majority who are the least of its priorities. Despite the DA's disguised pretence to care for the poor, evidence on the ground exposes its hypocrisy.

It wants the poor and unemployed people to rent and not own a house, because according to the DA this is a luxury they do not deserve as if it is a preserve for its high middle-class constituency.

An HON MEMBER: That is not true.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA failed to deliver basic service to the people of the Western Cape. Mr Deputy Speaker you must note that the person howling most while I am speaking is the Premier herself. [Laughter.]

The 2016 General Household Survey showed that delivery of sanitation actually reversed under the DA-led government with the Western Cape having the highest percentage of households who use bucket toilets in the country. Informal settlements are on the rise in the Western Cape while the DA sells off primary land which is well located and could be used for integrated social housing. Who can forget the Tafelberg land fiasco which led to this DA caught in a web of lies about the sale of the property?

We have learned this week that instead of transferring land and delivering decent social housing to our people, the DA in the Western Cape, in Cape Town actually, sells the land to the highest bidder, even overlooking the Department of Public Works and Transport bid. The DA has no shame. Every day the working class and the poor in the Western Cape face eviction, displacement, drugs, gangs, and all of the negative social and economic effects of the triple crisis of unemployment, poverty and inequality.

This is the same government that spends taxpayers' money to fight the poor, for example, the cases of South Road in Plumstead and Bromwell in Woodstock are typical cases which demonstrate the willingness to fight for

the interest of the business and white capital at the expense of preserving the lives of our people.

This DA government and City have sleepless nights to chase away poor people. In fact we have always said these actions constitute another District Six modern apartheid atrocity. Our people were dumped in informal temporary relocation areas and remain there to this day. The people in Mfuleni and Wolwerivier have been living in concentration camps with no or little basic services while the DA showed no interest... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You dumped them there!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...in their plight. It has now adopted a new hollow story promising to upgrade informal settlements, while our people continue to live in abject conditions, some with no water, sanitation and electricity. Whether the hon Premier chooses to believe it or not, our people live in extremely dangerous conditions as the Cape ranks amongst the top ten most dangerous cities in the world. Crime in the Western Cape stays on a steep constant rise under the Premier's watchful eye. However, instead of dealing with crime the DA leaders make dirty deals with gangsters at the expense of the lives of our people.

The most recent crime statistics shows that seven of the ten highest murder spots in South Africa are in this province, namely Nyanga, Gugulethu,

Harare, Khayelitsha, Kraaifontein, Delft and Mfuleni, because the DA does not care about the lives of the black poor people. The DA has even failed to implement recommendation of its own Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry into policing. Instead of addressing structural issues the DA is obsessed with cosmetic VPUU which is now forced onto other municipalities. For the people of the Western Cape however, 2017 marks the eighth year of perpetuated racial oppressive and exclusionary governance.

There is a sharp increase of racial tension and division in this province, which has even spilled over to young learners at the Sans Souci Wynberg Girls and the Rondebosch Boys High schools.

The DA Provincial Government under Premier Zille became so accustomed to these increasing social divisions and trends that this administration continues to dismiss any criticism with open arrogance. Dangerous divisive societal occurrences since the previous SOPA repeated in 2017. Poor black people still walk in fear through affluent white suburbs as they might be mistaken for criminals and beaten up. The DA simply does not care about poor black people. The poor black African and Coloured people, who are a majority in this province, mostly female, still live in absolute squalor. True to the DA racist and classist nature it accuses the ANC of using the race card when we dare speak out against race problems.

They think that they will teach us about our own oppression. It just shows a complete lack of understanding and acknowledgement of the daily reality of a

poor black person here. But who can fault that as it is known that the DA harbours people who view blacks as monkeys and while their members of Parliament suffer from apartheid nostalgia, missing and praising P W Botha and H F Verwoerd. [Interjections.] Racism is rife in the DA and the recent victim is our own honourable Bonginkosi Madikizela in his quest to be elected as the new Provincial Leader of the DA in this province.

During the State of the Nation Address on 9 February 2017 we saw DA MPs carry a banner about the unfortunate and painful incident which took place in Life Esidimeni. True to their populist nature of making a mockery of black pain they used this tragic incident as a political football because black lives do not matter to the DA.

If the DA cares about black lives it would not arbitrarily close down the G F Jooste Hospital which serviced thousands of poor black people. The DA lied and said the hospital would be reconstructed in 2013 and then altogether closed it down leaving many people without ease of access to public healthcare. While the DA makes a mockery of black lives on television our people are faced with overcrowded primary healthcare facilities, without access to medicine. The trauma unit become one of the places to keep sick people two days.

The primary ANC programme which the DA opposes is the national democratic revolution. Since 1994 the ANC brought about fundamental change to the lives of our people. Unfortunately in the Western Cape, except

for programmes which are driven by the National Government, there is nothing that the DA is doing to improve the quality of the lives of our people. The Expanded Public Works Programme is an ANC programme, the Community Works Programme, Working on Fire, National driven housing programmes like N2 Gateway and massive developments in the Mfuleni and Delft are ANC directed programmes.

The ANC Government intervened in Atlantis to reduce unemployment and the IDZ in Saldanha are part of the programmes which the ANC National Government had to impose on the DA Western Cape Government who is reluctant to do that. Sadly for populous reasons this Provincial Government claims such programmes, let alone abusing the EPWP and CWP as a mechanism to recruit for the DA. What a misuse of our programme. It is criminal actually to do that. This Provincial Government will never tell the people of the Western Cape that these are driven by the ANC Government.

The legacy of this hon Premier remains her Government's failure to improve on the employment equity scorecard. Job creation in the Western Cape continues to benefit white people. The DA Government represents a regression in many respects. A clear example is the Department of Public Works and Transport. Is it not so?

†'n AGBARE LID: O, foeitog!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh, shame!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Grant, under the ANC Government this Department was a prime example of transformation and equity. However, under the DA it has degenerated into an extreme level. In fact the latest employment equity report shows that 63.8% of total management positions in this province are occupied by white males, while only 2% are occupied by African males. White females occupied 14% of top management positions, while African females occupy just one percent of top management positions in the province. When compared to other provinces, the Western Cape has the highest percentage of top and senior management posts occupied by white males. [Interjections.]

The recent matric results once more demonstrated the stagnation of the Western Cape results. Since the DA has taken over this province our matric results have not substantially improved. Hence we must congratulate the ANC led Province of Free State for its improvement as it demonstrated the seriousness of the ANC Government in improving the lives of the people. It is no secret that the MEC of Education in this province spends much more time in trying to persecute SADTU affiliated teachers. Hence, to the schools where the results are bad her point of departure will be to insult SADTU but it is *vice versa* when there is an improvement. SADTU is not existing there. It is a disgrace and shame to this Provincial Government which has been watching schools like Langa High to consistently achieve poor results. Langa is one of the schools where educators were confused by this Provincial Government as one of those earmarked for handing over to a consortium.

The performance of black township schools remains tragic. Schools such as Oscar Mpetha in Nyanga are here to receive their quota of books. In fact it is a norm that black township schools under the DA only receive some of their books after June in this province. Whilst the Provincial Government continues to boast about removing red tape and introducing fairytale Game-Changers for the poor, exploited and oppressed in this province absolutely nothing changed.

They remain living in streets with human waste and they face seasonal disasters. One of the most recent was a fire that killed an entire family in BM-Section in Khayelitsha. They remain marginalised from the workplace, risking to run to work every day, bypassing gangsters and criminals. What are Game-Changers for? Are they for the super rich that this Government colludes with on a daily basis?

Just like 2016 this SOPA neglected the importance of strengthening and supporting the township economy. What we have seen in Joburg with the capitalist crusader Herman Mashaba completely killing the informal and township economy is something that we as the Western Cape ANC have long been accustomed to. On a daily basis this Government oppresses informal traders, confiscates their goods and merchandise, beating and roughing them up and crippling them with massive fines. In essence this government is taking the bread, butter and school fees from these informal traders and entry level entrepreneurs. If the traders were perhaps paler, better dressed and wealthier they would be assisted by these so called Game-Changers.

Another area of dismally failed Game-Changers relates to broadband roll-out. For a few consecutive years the DA promised broadband. For the first two years it blamed SITA for non-implementation but last year we were told that the peace pipe was smoked with the agency. A question has to be asked: has the broadband reached its intended beneficiaries? Surely not like in other provinces.

In the final analysis it is clear that the hon Zille legacy, in totality, represents a regression in all material respects on the lives of residents of this province. The DA is led by illusion, deception, fantasies of economic inclusion. In contrast, the experience of our people points towards heightened socio-economic exclusion and marginalisation and extreme growth of racism in our province; attacks of people being punished and always confused with prostitutes; confused with people who are breaking into cars. The most dangerous place to walk as an African person is in the rich suburbs because you can be attacked at any time. In fact that is where we fear most. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Madikizela.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Madam Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the House, ladies and gentlemen, let me also start by paying

tribute to all the South African native labour corps who perished on this day 100 years ago. As we remember them we are also reminded of the long journey that we have travelled as a country to be where we are today. The important lesson to draw from this is that we must learn from our past but we must not live in it. [Interjections.]

During his State of the Nation Address, President Zuma also spoke about the important milestone in the history of our country. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is too dark... [Inaudible.]

Ms M N GILLION: Is he now debating that... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He spoke about one of... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Maybe it is the wrong House.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...the liberation movement's heroes, Oliver Reginald Tambo, who would have turned 100 years this year. [Interjections.]

Now let me pause here Mr Deputy Speaker, and say that some of you would know that Oliver Reginald Tambo hails from Mbizana, which is where I am from.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Quality, quality.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What is shocking about the statement that was made by the President marking this year as the Year of Oliver Reginald Tambo is that where Tambo comes from in Mbizana, Mbizana is the worst performing municipality or town in South Africa as we speak. [Interjections.] It is the poorest town in South Africa as we speak today. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order member, hon Gillian.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I need to know, Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, where is the relevance? Is the member referring to the SONA or the SOPA? This is the SOPA debate. Where is the relevance?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, thank you, thank you again hon member Ms Gillion. That is a valid point of order. We have traditionally allowed a very wide political debate in this SOPA so I am not going to curb members unnecessarily so Minister, you may continue.

†'n AGB LID: Yes. Luister net moo!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes. Just listen carefully.]

Ms M N GILLION: Where is the relevance, member?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now the irony is that you compare Mbizana and Nkandla. The President marked this year as the Year of Oliver Reginald Tambo, but you look at the contrast where the state coffers have been looted and pumped into Nkandla, compared to eBizana where Oliver Tambo comes from.

An HON MEMBER: Do not go far.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, on Friday the Premier gave a comprehensive report, a report backed on the achievements of this Government since this DA administration has taken office in 2009. She spoke frankly and openly about the challenges faced by our Government giving a very balanced State of the Province [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: She misled the House.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...a stark contrast from what we heard during the State of the Nation Address by President Zuma.

An HON MEMBER: Factual, factual!

An HON MEMBER: You were not there.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The biggest challenges facing our country right now, the sluggish economic growth; joblessness; skills shortage; droughts; weak political leadership nationally; policy uncertainty; a very slow pace on land reform which is now resulting in knee-jerk reactions from the ANC Government; corruption; poverty and inequality.

An HON MEMBER: It is worse in this province, nè.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: During her State of the Province Premier Zille gave action stabs and clear vision to deal with all these challenges. This is the kind of leadership that is needed nationally in order to restore investor confidence that we lost after President Zuma took office.

Ms S W DAVIDS: But they run a racist campaign.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is very clear to me and many South Africans that the only way to sort out our challenges in this country... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is to take over.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...is for the Democratic Alliance to ascend to Union Buildings and become the Government of South Africa. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: It is coming!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am by no means painting a rosy picture about the Western Cape. While we have done and continue to do more than any other province to improve the lives of our people, we are still faced with many challenges, and we do not deny that, that we still have many challenges in this province. Many of our people are still living under unacceptable conditions in informal settlements, backyards and farms. [Interjections.]

During her address on Friday, Premier Zille made some very positive announcements which will go a long way in addressing these challenges. Premier said:

“We are also making progress on a catalytic project to upgrade informal settlements near the airport, known as the Southern Corridor. The project will have huge transformative potential for communities for the informal settlements next to Vukuzenzela, Kanana, Kosovo, Thabo Mbeki, Tsunami, Lusaka and Europe, all of which are in the Gugulethu, Nyanga and Philippi areas. The priority backyard dwellers in these areas will also benefit from this project. The installation of bulk and internal services is underway in Forest Village, with development approvals for Ithemba expected this year, and for the remaining areas in 2018.”

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] We will budget for that later.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We have similar catalytic projects in large informal settlements elsewhere in the province for example in George, where we are going to provide 15 000 families with shelter, covering Thembaletu, Syferfontein and Wilderness Heights.

An HON MEMBER: Good news, good news!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Construction of top structures for Thembaletu Phase 1 is under way. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And Wilderness Heights?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Planning is also well underway on the Trans Hex development in Breede Valley. The development will yield over 8 000 housing opportunities to improve the living conditions of informal settlements and farm workers.

I visited these areas on Thursday last week, a day before the State of the Province Address, to witness a Geotech investigation and to talk to the residents about these projects because this is a government at work.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor, LUR.

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear, MEC.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This is part of our second action step after we conducted a community survey last year in order to profile the communities that will be benefiting. I am pleased with the progress we are making in these areas.

The Premier also spoke about the inner-city development that will cater for people who are earning too much to qualify for free subsidised houses, but too little to get a bond. We have now embarked on a province-wide tour to ensure that municipalities include these programmes in their business plans.

†Me M N GILLION: Baie laat, baie laat.

[Ms M N GILLION: Very late, very late.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: During my budget speech last year I cautioned about the danger of neglecting this market and focusing on BNG only. I even questioned the sustainability of a free house on an economy like ours that is growing at less than 1%. I further spoke about the importance of going back to basics when it comes to housing provision in South Africa. I want to repeat what I said, Mr Deputy Speaker, because it is a wrong perception that the poor people cannot contribute towards building of their houses.

In rural areas for example where poverty is rife people take pride in building their own homes. The mandate of this Department is not the construction of only free houses. It is much broader than that. We are responsible for the

Estate Agency Affairs Board. That is worth almost seven trillion as at the end of last year. We are tasked with the responsibility of implementing 16 programmes within our housing code of which fully subsidised houses is one, not the only one but we have to see the mandate of this Department as an economic lever rather than social intervention. We must create wealth for our poor people. This is unfortunately something very few people understand and one of those people is a so called economist ANC spokesperson, Yonela Diko, who recently wrote a piece in the *Daily Maverick* and he said:

“The first glaring mistake of the DA in the Department of Human Settlements was to deploy Bonginkosi Madikizela as its Member of Executive Council, a black man who believes he built the cabin he was born in. Bonginkosi Madikizela opened his 2016/17 budget vote by saying: ‘I was raised by my poor parents who made sure that they built a home for us and did not depend on Government . I believe that Government should not build houses for people...’ and this is what he said. So here was a Member of the Executive Council...”

An HON MEMBER: That is why you do not want to build houses.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: “...tasked by Government to build houses for our people telling the nation he actually does not believe in the portfolio he has been given.” [Interjections.]

Now this is a clear understanding, Mr Deputy Speaker, that many members of the ANC do not understand the mandate of this Department.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Should you build houses or not? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is no wonder the ANC is dying in this province, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have never seen such poor analysis... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is why you are rejecting...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I have never seen such poor analysis by someone who claims to be an accomplished scholar.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It will really help Mr Diko to read the housing policy and the housing code. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: There is no DA, Patricia.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But more importantly Mr Deputy Speaker, he must familiarise himself with white paper comments and look at the paradigm shift the ANC National Government is taking on housing provision which are informed by the following statements made: the first one was made by the National Minister and the second one was made by the President. Lindiwe Sisulu speaking at the Sixth Africa Planning Conference in Durban on 21 October 2014 said:

“Anybody below the age of 40 will need to understand that they are not our priority unless they are special needs or are heads of child-headed households.”

Ms M N GILLION: It is an old policy, it is a policy.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: “Our intention in giving free houses was to right the wrongs of the past and make sure that we can give our people dignity, and that group of people is not the people below the age of 40...”

An HON MEMBER: Not with Human Settlements budgets.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Zuma, while he was addressing the South African Local Government Association members in Gallagher Estate in Midrand, said:

“People do not want to work because houses are free. Sometimes I wonder when people complain about things they can do themselves. I thought by this time we would have changed the manner we do things and begin to make ourselves participate in our own development. [Interjections.] If I was a dictator I would change a few things but this is democracy...”

Ms S W DAVIDS: Four days before... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And this is what Mr Zuma said. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: You want to lead the DA.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You want to lead the DA in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: If Mr Diko wants to see the evidence of upgrading of informal settlements and Khaya, because this statement was also made by the hon member the Leader of the Opposition when he was addressing the media last week; if they want to see what this Government and this Department is doing to upgrade informal settlements... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister, just one second. Hon member Ms Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to know if the Minister is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

HON MEMBERS: No, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not now.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Okay, about Diko.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No he is not prepared.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I just want to know if that person quoted him incorrectly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! The answer is no. Minister, you may continue.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Okay I just wanted to know if that person misquoted him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, he has already responded.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now if Mr Diko and the hon member of the Opposition, the Leader of the Opposition wants to know what this Department is doing to upgrade informal settlements I want to implore

them to get the Presidency Report. Not even our own report, the Presidency Report.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Because all the Departments nationally under Outcome 8 have to report on what they are doing on the different programmes and you will see that this Department is the only Department nationally that is green on that particular report.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now that is the Presidency Report. Now I also implore him to get the AG's Report for the last financial year and he will see that this Department is the only department in the whole Republic of South Africa that received a clean audit.

An HON MEMBER: That a cooked report.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The AG cooks a report now?

An HON MEMBER: He cooks the report.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This report shows that this Department is the only Department of Human Settlements nationally that received a clean audit. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now these ill-informed comments about my Department being a ticking time-bomb are exposing his lack of understanding and sheer ignorance.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Cape Town does not spend its housing budget. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker...

Mr C M DUGMORE: There is no oversight.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Leader of the Opposition and Mr Diko went further to expose their ignorance by quoting outdated information about inequalities in the Western Cape or Cape Town.

Ms M N GILLION: Haibo, is that outdated? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are in denial!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: According to the UN Habitat World Cities Report of 2016, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

†Mnr C M DUGMORE: Julle gaan verloor as julle die man as julle leier kies.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr C M DUGMORE: You are going to lose if you choose the man as your leader. [Interjections.]]

†Me M N GILLION: Hy sal nooit die leier van die DA wees nie.

[Ms M N GILLION: He will never be the leader of the DA.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The City... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...The City that is performing worst when it comes to inequalities in South Africa is now Nelson Mandela Bay, not Cape Town; Nelson Mandela Bay that we recently took from the ANC.

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The second one is Durban, Mangaung, Buffalo City, Tshwane. In fact Cape Town currently according to

this report is the most equal City in South Africa. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja-ja-ja.

An HON MEMBER: The best, the best!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This diatribe by Mr Diko followed the statement made by his party, the ANC in its two days Lekgotla on 3 and 4 February in Worcester. [Interjections.] The statement read for example on housing:

“We note the DA’s lack of proper housing delivery and consistent underspending of national housing allocations.”

Again Mr Deputy Speaker, another blatant lie by the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Because there has never been any under-expenditure during my nearly eight years... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Cape Town?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, the City of Cape Town! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...as the Minister of this Department, instead Mr Deputy Speaker, I have received more money because of good financial management and expenditure as the Department of Human Settlements. [Interjections.]

Another noise that is constantly made by the ANC is the inner-city development. If you look at the delivery records of the ANC since 2002... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, your time has expired, you must just finish off, the last sentence.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There has never been any project where they did inner-city development. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. [Applause.]
Order, please come to order. The hon member Mr Mnqasela. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

An HON MEMBER: That is a real leader in the House!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, Madam Premier, Ministers and hon members, guests in the gallery, I rise in support of the State of the Province

Address. [Interjections.]

The Premier was very clear. The Premier was bold and made bold commitments about the programme of action of our DA-led Western Cape Government, charting a clear roadmap on how we create an inclusive Government that enables access to opportunities. Indeed together we keep making progress.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I believe that for the province to sustain... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You still think you are in National, hey.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...sound and prudent financial management outcomes, the Department of Local Government must consider implementation of Audit Committees, an ICT programme as part of the shared services programme across district municipalities. [Interjection.]

As part of our mandate the Standing Committee on Local Government Oversight will undertake to visit all district municipalities in the Western Cape to engage on various challenges confronting them and their ability to discharge their responsibility and of course success stories in the respective areas.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: It is unfortunately that the legacy of apartheid has continued to disadvantage many in our communities. Too many South Africans still do not enjoy equal access to economic opportunities and this is the case in our province too. We are not denying that fact.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we are the first one to say.

Mr M MNQASELA: The DA's economic policy recognises the need for job creation as the catalyst for economic growth. For this reason the DA supports measures to redress the legacy of the past... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is the new service now...

Mr M MNQASELA: ...provided we broaden opportunities beyond the elite band that the ANC continues to chart.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Ja, you support them... [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: That our Broad-based Black Economic Empowerment and all other policies are aimed at those in the lowest band of our economy... [Interjections] ...and that they too become beneficiaries and promote growth and jobs. [Interjection.]

High levels of unemployment fuel poverty and inequality. In fact they are the root cause of most of our overlapping economic, social and political problems. [Interjections.]

If we want our economy to grow we have to create jobs. During the 2016 Local Government elections as a party we have put jobs at the apex of our programme. [Interjections.] This was also emphasised by our leader, Mmusi Maimane. We themed 2017 “A Year of Jobs and Skills”.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: That is the only party that puts jobs and skills as a priority in this year as we did last year. [Interjections.]

Much success has been seen in this regard in this province led by uMam'u Helen Zille. We applaud uMam'u Helen Zille and her Government in the initiative that puts people first and only people first. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr M MNQASELA: Jobs and growth and infrastructure-led development are the priorities that uMam'u Zille is putting, and her Government. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Applause.] Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, as much as we encourage participation by the public we do not allow demonstrations in the House and I believe that it is unsuitable here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes. [Interjections.] Order! Before those new four members of the public entered into the gallery I made an announcement from the Chair to say that any disturbances or activities from the galleries will be illegal... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: There is no disturbance.

An HON MEMBER: There is no such. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Be quiet!

An HON MEMBER: It is not illegal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! ...will be illegal and it will not be allowed because it disrupts the proceedings in the House. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We are just hanging up the Premier's dirty laundry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There you are!

Mr C M DUGMORE: The Premier's laundry, the dirty laundry...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Sergeant-at-Arms is requested to remove the persons from the gallery. Hon member Mr Mnqasela, you may continue.

[Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: My time, Mr Deputy Speaker, I hope it recovers in this exercise. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the police; where is the police?

Mr M MNQASELA: As highlighted by the Premier... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh there is the police.

An HON MEMBER: Is the police also here now? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The police is here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Those members on the gallery, may I just... [Interjections.] Order! Members on the gallery, let me address you.

[Interjections.]

I know what you want to do, you want to make a statement from the gallery

but legally in terms of the law that is not allowed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: How does the DA behave nationally?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you the opportunity to leave on your own... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: What is the police doing here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...otherwise I will quote you the relevant provisions from the law, the Powers and Privileges Law, which make your actions unlawful and make you liable to conviction in a court of law. So I allow you the opportunity to leave peacefully, otherwise I will have to ask the Sergeant-at-Arms to do so, to take you out.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why must they leave?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Why is the ANC so desperate?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, Chief Whip?
[Interjections.] Order! Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I suggest that we suspend proceedings so that the House can be brought to order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will do that. [Interjections.] Hon members, please take your seats. Please take your seats.

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is the real issues in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Ja. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will now... [Interjections.] Order! I will now suspend proceedings of the House until order is restored. The bells will be rung when we start again. The House is suspended.

[Business of the House was suspended at 15:00 and resumed at 15:08.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may take your seats. My microphone was just off. I again see the hon member Mnqasela, to continue his speech.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Where should I begin in terms of the minutes? Shall I start from the beginning?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you an opportunity to finish your speech from the point that you were actually interrupted.

Mr B D JOSEPH: One minute.

Mr M MNQASELA: No it was not. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It was

highlighted by the Premier that the latest quarterly Labour Force Survey figures for the fourth quarter 2016, indicated that the Western Cape gained 490 000 new jobs since the fourth quarter of 2009, not that mathematics of the ANC. At just 14%, we have the lowest unemployment rate in the country, and that is laudable.

Mr Deputy Speaker, moving on, the fire season is once again upon us, and we need to applaud the work done by disaster management forces, and of course the fact that at this stage we are sitting at 17 000 fires, and I was in my constituency yesterday. There were three houses that were engulfed by fires in Pringle Bay and the firefighters were able to put out the fires, and I think that is the kind of action we need from them.

What concerns us is that there is no way to establish how these fires are caused. Most of these fires are caused by people who throw cigarette butts out of their windows, and I do believe that new legislation is needed to ensure that we deter those who put us in danger. It is my firm belief that throwing cigarette butts out of a car window should constitute a punishable crime, not just a slap on the wrist.

With our winds, it merely takes a spark to land on a patch of dry grass, and become a raging inferno, and that is how serious it is. For our part, we have massively grown the province's firefighting resources, and the Premier put it very clearly, that since the beginning of the tenure of this Government in 2009, there has been a serious deployment of resources to ensure that the

firefighting and disaster management is empowered. Over the next three years, R37 million in the province has been deployed to ensure that there's capacitation of the firefighting component. I must say that between 2012 to date, the Department of Local Government ensured that from a mere eight firefighting aircraft that were operating on the 31 runways in the province, we are now sitting with 26 of them. I think that is laudable.

These resources have meant that for five years up to now, 97% of fires could be brought under control within the first hour of being reported, and that is something that we appreciate.

Together with the new equipment and the innovative smoke alarm projects that have been put out in informal settlements in the Breede River Valley, that has been a pilot, and of course in Wallacedene that is coming through. In other informal settlements throughout the province, we are waiting to see that these smoke/fire alarm systems are being implemented, so that we protect the lives of the poor who are subjected to these kinds of fires, deadly fires in these areas.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, Madam Premier, Ministers and hon members, on behalf of the citizens of our province, please join me in sending sincere gratitude to these heroes and heroines of the firefighting family, for their selfless and fearless service to the people of our beloved province. To all the firefighters, professionals from all five district municipalities, local municipalities and the City of Cape Town, the staff of CapeNature, Sanparks

and the Working On Fire Programme, they are truly world-class, and deserve their hero status in the mind of the public.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, just finish off.

Mr M MNQASELA: A major role is played by the members of the Fire Protection Association, Volunteer Wildfire Services and private contractor teams, pilots from the South African Air Force and the private sector, also contributed greatly ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you now.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... as did the South African Defence Force Joint Operation Centre, and the National Disaster Management Centre. You guys rock.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Thank you, your time has expired hon member.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Sithi kuni nilibambe lingatshoni, abantu kuqala, kuqala abantu, qina mhlali qina.

[Mr M MNQASELA: We say to you be careful of yourselves. People first, people come first, be strong comrades, be strong.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Christians.

†Mnr F C CHRISTIANS: Agb Adjunkspeaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

†Mnr F C CHRISTIANS: *Die Burger* van 15 Februarie 2017 lees:

“Wes-Kaap vertrou nie polisie. Huishoudings in die Wes Kaap meen dat misdaadvlakke in hul woonbuurt jaarliks erger word.”

Vertroue in die polisie word minder jaar na jaar. Kapenaars vrees al hoe meer vir hul veiligheid en hul kinders, na mate, rooftogte, kapings en moorde toeneem. Die mense van die Wes-Kaap is nie meer veilig nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr F C CHRISTIANS: *Die Burger* of 15 February 2017 reads:

“The Western Cape does not trust the police. Households in the Western Cape believe that crime levels in their neighbourhoods are increasing yearly.”

Trust in the police diminishes year after year. Capetonians increasingly fear for their safety and their children, as robberies, highjacks and murders escalate. The people of the Western Cape are not safe anymore.]

†In an article dated the 20th of February 2017, an Elsie's River girl, 11 years old, was shot in the head, being used as a human shield by a scoundrel. It reads that the 11 year old girl is fighting for her life at this moment, because a ruthless gangster allegedly used her as a human shield.

†Tragies dat ons gemeenskappe in absolute vrees lewe.

[It is tragic that our communities have to live in absolute fear.]

Although the Premier, Helen Zille, very successfully mapped out in her State of the Province Address, but in spite of the enormous strides the Western Cape Government is making when it comes to addressing unemployment, economic growth and many good advances that her Government is making, our communities are living in fear.

Stats SA says 52.2% of our people are living in absolute fear, not even wanting to go to a park, not even wanting to go to the shop, because are they scared of being killed.

Although the province only has an oversight responsibility, more must be done. Day in and day out, our people in the townships are butchered and gunned down. Every day on my phone I get messages, in Mitchells Plain, wherever, our youngsters are being gunned down on a daily basis, and illegal guns are entering this province on a daily basis.

I wonder, has the Premier already engaged the President to say, "listen, give

us the control of police, we will do a better job". I wonder, did the Premier – I want to urge Premier to speak to the President and say, “give us the functions over police”, because that I think is an absolute problem solver.

President Zuma was at Nyanga Police Station the other day and we visit police stations all the time. Now he is shocked to see the under resourced police station, but I want to just say, Mr Deputy Speaker, that the former ANC President, Matthews Phosa, said the following. He said:

“It will be a miracle if the ANC gets close to 40% in the 2019 national elections.”

[Applause.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: He further said that President Zuma must leave his office, because he will be known as the chief architect of breaking up the ANC.

Now I want to say it will be a miracle if this Western Cape ANC gets more than 30% at the 2019 provincial elections under the hon Magaxa. [Interjections.]. That is what I want to say. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ANC is busy slipping down a slippery slide, and

they will not stop. That is why they have tricks like this in the gallery that they do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member Christians, just one second. Order. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, if member hon Christians will just calm down and get back to the SOPA and refer to that, because the relevance of what he is talking about has nothing to do ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, thank you. I have already ruled on the point of relevance. The hon member may continue. [Interjections.] I cannot control his voice, but – order. Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But, Mr Deputy Speaker, let me get back to this, let me get back ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Christians, the second part of the request maybe is something that you can control. [Laughter.] Thank you, you may continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I will try. The ACDP welcomes the appointment of the five liquor inspectors but we are saddened by the fact that illegal outlets will become legal, according to the Premier. We cannot allow illegal liquor outlets to become legal because those liquor

outlets are smack bang in the middle of our communities. It is smack bang in the middle. I mean, what happens to a girl or boy in a township that has got a neighbour as an outlet, a liquor outlet?

I also want to ask the Premier, how can we, in the province, say one thing, and the municipalities are doing another? Alcohol trading hours are extended. It is open on Sundays, it is open until eight o'clock on weekdays, and we need to address this, Premier, try to, because alcohol in the communities that I come from is the killer. It is the abuse of alcohol every Friday night, you can ask SAPS. Go into a police station on a Friday night, domestic violence is number one, keeping police busy with domestic violence, and we know that alcohol and drugs are the cause.

Mr Deputy Speaker, there are big strides in education, there are big strides, huge strides. I mean we know that Education got a clean audit and the ANC do not like that word "clean", because they do not understand that [Interjections.] but, the Education Department is doing well. I read just the other day in the paper, that traffic cops pulled over a bus, and the headline says "Death Trap". A bus being kept together with nuts and bolts. Our school children are in those buses, and something needs to be done.

Just the other day I phoned the school and I phoned the Education Department to ask, and I spoke to the region and they did not even know about this bus that was pulled off.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has unfortunately has expired. Is that right, Table?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Six, is that six minutes?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, thank you. [Time expired.][Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please come to order before I see the hon Minister. Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, Minister Schäfer, before you start. Hon member Joseph?

Mr B D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to clarify the time allocation to especially the ACDP and EFF. I am concerned, in terms of my time judgment, it was three minutes 56 seconds, and this paper that you have distributed, indicates it is six minutes. I just want us to be fair. Fair play is

very important.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can rest assured that the Chair reacts upon what the Table tells us. It will in all cases be fair for all parties and I am informed six minutes was used in this case.

Mr C M DUGMORE: But how many minutes ...[Interjection.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: But I can clearly state, it is three minutes and 56 seconds, thank you.

†'n AGB LID: Koop 'n ander *watch*.

[An HON MEMBER: Buy another watch.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately I cannot argue with that. Our record shows six minutes. I see the Minister, Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On Friday the Premier made it clear that, as a government, our overriding goal is the economic inclusion of all. The only sustainable way to ensure that everyone is included in the economy, is to create opportunities for economic growth, and ensure that people are educated to be able to participate in the economy, especially in areas in which scarce skills are required.

Growing the economy is crucial. Without it we will never be able to address

the vast inequalities that still exist in our country, and the unacceptably high rate of unemployment. Unlike the President, who thinks that the solution is radical economic transformation, that involves taking away from some to give to a few Zupta aligned cronies, the Premier understands that economic growth is the only way we will be able to reduce unemployment, and provide safety nets for those who need them.

The Premier gave some very impressive figures on Friday, regarding our economic growth in the Western Cape, as well as our improved unemployment rate, but judging from the comments of the Opposition parties afterwards, they do not understand the link between economic growth and how it trickles down to the poor.

Logic 101 tells us that if there is no economic growth, it trickles down to the poor, because they cannot get jobs, taxes are more difficult to collect, because people are not making so much money, and then there's also less money available for the poor for services and social grants. Logic 101. But no country can achieve sustainable [Interjection.] economic growth without substantial investment in quality education. Through being educated, people are better placed to secure a job or start a business, earn an income and ultimately lead lives they value. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is very difficult to speak when there is ongoing commentary.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is because you are [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please. Please continue, I will have a look at it.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: DA leader ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Just believe it yourself.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: DA leader, Mmusi Maimane, recently highlighted that those who many people may call our “born frees”, are in fact the lost generation.

The lost generation is our learners who have not had access to adequate education, that has enabled them to stay in school, complete their matric and possibly go on to study further after school.

These are the people the ANC has neglected for the last 20 years. This failure has consigned many of these young people to a lifetime of poverty, and has certainly inhibited their chances of improving their socio-economic circumstances.

We need to ensure that we do not lose our young people, and that we

implement policies and initiatives that will remedy the ANC's neglect of education in our country. Provincially we are unfortunately confined to basic education in terms of the Constitution, but we are looking creatively at ways to improve the opportunities for our youth, which include liaising with tertiary education institutions.

In the Western Cape, after eight years in office, we are beginning to reap the benefits of investing in quality education. The Premier spoke about the huge improvements in our matric pass and retention rates, systemic tests and the great improvements in the results in poor communities.

In addition to that, we are ensuring as best as we can, under extremely difficult circumstances, that our young people are educated in a way that enables them to meaningfully contribute to society, by either taking up employment in areas where we need skills, or creating their own employment. There is no use in creating a whole generation of people who are not skilled in the things that are needed in the economy. They too will become part of the lost generation.

This will simply exacerbate the unemployment crisis, will inhibit economic growth and lead to a lack of dignity for those affected. In order to address key gaps and provide our youth with opportunities, the Western Cape Government has identified several Game-changers, three of which are directly relevant to the youth, and in which the WCED is involved. We will also continue with other programmes which are part of our youth

development strategy, including the very successful Youth Cafes.

We believe that these interventions will accelerate economic growth, job creation and social inclusion if successful. Our apprenticeship Game-changer's aim is to achieve sufficient, appropriately qualified, technically and vocationally skilled people to meet the needs of prioritised economic growth areas in the Western Cape, by 2019.

Maths, particularly, is crucial to this Game-changer, and we are implementing interventions to increase the number of learners who passed pure maths and technical maths at 50% or more. In so doing, we will create a pipeline of young people who will be qualified to study for professions that are needed in the economy, and for which jobs will be available. This is how we create opportunities for our youth.

We have made good progress in the After School Game-changer over the last year. We have entered many partnerships with organisations that are assisting us in delivering after school programmes to the youth. In the current financial crunch we are faced with, these partnerships are invaluable. Scouts are now active at 12 schools.

We also have programmes such as robotics, life skills and awareness programmes, academic support and sports and cultural activities, that will be strengthened at our After School facilities, which include MOD Centres and DSD's Partial Care Centres.

We are piloting a model of incentivising attendance, introducing awards for the leadership and coaches, and also introducing a qualification for After School coaches, in order to professionalise this offering. Two of our districts are very involved in developing this model, and 234 schools have chosen greater involvement in After School programmes, as part of their school improvement plans for this year.

In addition, under this Game-changer, a Safety Round Table will be convened on the 23rd of March, in order to try and better coordinate a response to the safety issues around schools, that impact on schools, both during and after school, involving all role-players. This Game-changer is already making a difference in the lives of our youth.

I would like to quote some of the beneficiaries. Chantelle from Capricorn Primary says the following:

“I want to say thank you for bringing drama into my life. When I first joined the After School programme, it was the first time doing drama. After my first play, a lady from Germany came and she told me, ‘You have got potential, why did you not use it?’ Nobody had told me that before.

Others are doing drugs, gangsters, but [Inaudible.] took me in and made a new person of me.”

Kelly, a girl from Western Cape Sport School, who plays softball and

athletics. She says:

“I come from Lavender Hill where I feared for life, surrounded by gangsters, and where I was pressurised into doing drugs. Thanks to talent in softball, identified in the MOD programme, I was kept off the streets and drugs. The girls I met were not just my team, but my family. Sport got me out of the environment I was living in and boosted me physically and mentally.”

Siva from Gugulethu Comprehensive, joined the Yebo Programme. He said:

“It has helped a lot with subjects that I thought be hard, especially maths which I hated. The way it was taught I did not understand.”

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION:

“I hated maths and now I love it with a passion. I could not pass beyond a code 4, now I can get code 5 and code 6. Why? Because people take time to help me understand.”

This is the role of Government, to create an enabling environment for people to improve their life chances.

The Premier has also outlined the immense progress we have made in the e-

Learning Game-changer. This Game-changer is designed to make a major contribution towards improving the quality of teaching and learning in the province, and entrenching the skills people need to participate in our technology driven economy. Again this shows the responsiveness of this Government to the needs of the youth and the needs of the economy. By ensuring that our young people have the requisite skills, we will enable them to be able to fill the skills gaps in the economy, thus providing them with opportunities to fill the gaps that would otherwise need to be imported. In this way, we will also reduce the unemployment in our province even further.

As the Premier said, the increasing numbers of people coming to the Western Cape, in search of a better education, is putting immense strain on our system. We simply are not getting the required resources from National Government to cover the needs we have. Despite the fact that we have spent our entire infrastructure budget for the last five years, and in fact have received additional funding from the incentive grant for each of the last three years, we are struggling to keep up with maintaining existing schools, and building sufficient new schools, let alone staffing them.

This is exacerbated when all role-players do not act accountably with what they have been entrusted. We saw this recently with the protest around KwaFaku Primary School.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mmm. It is a disaster.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Last week parents from KwaFaku Primary School protested regarding the condition of the school.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Speak about other schools [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The school was reportedly in a shocking condition. Officials from the WCED visited the school the very next day, and found that the school was a health hazard. They reported that there were numerous toilets that were without doors, and most of the toilets do not flush, and that the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon member Olivier in the front bench there. You cannot have a running commentary, and the members at the back there. I am looking again at Makeleni, Lekker, I am not sure about Dijana this time around. Will those three please contain yourselves.

Hon member Olivier, although it is your vote, so to speak, it does not mean to say that you can speak on the vote. So please allow the member to continue. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. They reported there were numerous toilets that were without doors, that most of the toilets did not flush, and that the floor drains are blocked due to waste being pushed back into the building, when manual flushing isn't done regularly.

These are all matters that are the responsibility of the school principal, school management team and school governing body. It is a disgrace. Over the last two financial years, the school has received almost R600 000 for day-to-day maintenance, and yet the school does not even have decent functioning toilets. In addition, there was not one single request for emergency maintenance submitted to the Department. This is quite frankly a dereliction of duty, and shows the result of each and every role-player in the education system not acting accountably. I have requested an investigation into the school's finances and further action will be taken.

The same applies at Oscar Mpetha. It is true, they have not got their full allocation of text books because they did not order them. The principal ordered them in December last year, because they did not plan properly at the school.

Of course the ANC would not know accountability if it bit them in the face. I noted with interest that their Acting Leader in the Western Cape wants to call on us to focus on eradicating corruption. What a joke! Corruption is so infused in the ANC's collective make-up, that they do not even recognise it anymore, and they seek to highlight corruption in the one province that achieves clean and unqualified audits year after year.

The closest any ANC run province comes to the 83% of Western Cape Government auditees that received clean audits, is Gauteng with 54%. Nearly 30% less.

Show us one example of corruption in the Western Cape, and we will act. Fortunately the DA governs here, so we will address it appropriately, not just redeploy it to Parliament.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It's about time.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The DA has been in government in Nelson Mandela Bay for just six months, and we have managed to save R200 million. In Gauteng we have uncovered corruption in Johannesburg and Tshwane Metro, and the ANC wants to focus on corruption here?

Mr Deputy Speaker, when the ANC has no cards left to play, racism claims become the order of the day. As we have seen again here this afternoon. The ANC is hell-bent on branding the Western Cape as a racist province. Of course this is simply not true, but why let the fact stand in the way of a good story? Every province can have incidents of racism and they do, including the Western Cape, but if such issues arise here, they are appropriately dealt with.

Last year we had allegations in some of our schools. In the case of Sans Souci High School, we investigated the claims thoroughly. Racism was not proved, but there certainly was insensitivity towards cultures of black learners. This was dealt with by my Department sensitively, and changes have been and are continuing to be made.

A racist Whatsapp message at Rondebosch Boys' High School was swiftly dealt with by the school principal, with the clear message that it will not be tolerated. Then we had a complete abuse of racism allegations at Wynberg Girls' High School, where statements were in fact fabricated in order to sensationalise the incident to achieve an outcome that some girls and the hostel staff wanted at the expense of the reputation of the superintendent.

Racism will not be tolerated in the Western Cape, no matter where it comes from, and we have shown that. So the ongoing repetition of allegations to the contrary, in the hope that people will believe them, are simply futile.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government is a leading example of a capable state, and an accountable and responsive government. Our successes to date show our commitment to the people of this province, and our youth in particular, and we remain committed to working to bring about the kind of change we need in the province and South Africa as a whole. Change that will grow the economy, support social progress and create jobs.

In 2019 the rest of South Africa will have the choice to vote for this kind of government also. I really hope they take that chance. [Applause.]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Hoor, hoor!

[Mr D JOSEPH: Hear-Hear!] †They will.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Die agb Beerwinkel.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Beerwinkel.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Doen vir my 'n guns asseblief. Gooi harde kole. Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do me a favour, please. Throw hard coals. Please.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker and hon members, and Premier, I do not really think that we need to say very much more after the demonstration that we just saw now, highlighting the real truth about what the people of this province think about what happens in this province.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And as if that is not enough for the DA to deal with, with their internal politics of division for positions of leadership happening now, and what is happening with Patricia de Lille and Shaun August, at the moment they are not really listening to us here. Their attention is more on the leadership battle a few days from now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Especially Zille.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Ja. Mr Deputy Speaker, what the Premier presented to us the other day, was the state of her dream province, but definitely not that of what the majority of citizens, who live in squalid conditions, far removed from work and opportunities, experience.

Mr R T OLIVIER : Zille [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: A drone picture would show up the stark differences immediately, because you would see the abject poverty and that the poverty is black. That their lives are still governed as if by their race. If you listen to the MECs and the DA members as they speak, especially what you have just heard from the Education MEC, you have to ask yourself which province are they referring to?

Ms M N GILLION: Exactly.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you explain why 69% of top managerial positions in this province are still occupied by white males, quite contrary to the demographic picture of the Western Cape, with the excuse most times being that “suitably qualified persons cannot be found”? How else do you explain the exodus of younger generations who do not see themselves carving out a career at this Government, as there is no growth opportunity while the status still exists?

We see this at every annual report presented. The affluent areas around the coast and the Atlantic Sea Board, are white, and where most only come for holidays and are mostly foreigners, but they are not considered refugees, and live in the best located, pristine areas.

A lack of basic services, transport congestion, bad spatial planning,

proliferation of shacks, and intense poverty in the rest of the province – how could you not acknowledge this in your SOPA, Premier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The skewed allocation of housing opportunities, a proliferation of backyard dwellers, waiting for years to get a home. These people did not even get a mention in your speech. Job creation, social inputs on how these will be addressed in your budget, were absent.

The one aspect that can unite communities, sport and recreation, has the smallest budget. Social services that should have many more social workers to work in the areas, to alleviate the social problems, their budget, if you compare it to the rest of the other departments, just shows that the DA doesn't care about correcting the socio-economic problems of the poor communities.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is how you [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am not in governance.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Where you are [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Place names like Barcelona, Los Angeles, Europe, are names that conjure up ideas of affluence and grandeur and wealth, but a visit there will show you squalor, overcrowding, joblessness, hopelessness, children not in school, occasional flooding, lack of basic services, poor sanitation, unsafely placed and refuse hardly ever removed. [Interjection.]

Those are exotic names, but harsh conditions of poverty in the supposed best province of this country. [Interjection.] Under your watch, Premier, in your province, and the people who live there are black and Coloured.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Or [Inaudible.]

Ms C BEERWINKEL: Let us not get forget the TRAs, or should I say PRAs, meaning permanent relocation areas, as my leader said. Like Blikkiesdorp and Wolwerivier, where the people living there tell you that they come there to die.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No recreation, no work opportunities and far from amenities. Drug and alcohol abuse are the answers to their frustrations.

Ms M N GILLION: Listen Bongi.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Wolwerivier, by the way, Mr Deputy Speaker, is

incidentally also the place where the seven families from Bromwell Street are being sent as an alternative place to stay. All in the names of gentrification, for business.

†Me P Z LEKKER: Sies!

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Sis!]

†Me M N GILLION: Skande!

[Ms M N GILLION: Disgrace!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Now these stats come from the Housing Development Agency, and they were taken from the 2011 Census. In the Metro there are 378 informal settlements, with 141 765 dwellings. In the Western Cape there are 230 informal settlements, with 51 224 dwellings. That is in the other five regions. There are 191 668 households in shacks, not in backyards.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Jô.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And this is the real state of your province, Premier. The MEC of Human Settlements, however, spends most of his time analysing Yonela Diko's post instead of concentrating on the SOPA and his responsibility here in the province. [Interjection.]

You, the DA, continuously blame National Government for the lack of police stations and policing [Interjections.] yet your own responsibilities of social –

please listen. Your own responsibilities of social services are not carried out.

According to a survey done in the Western Cape, in the murder capital of Nyanga, in the murder ...[Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Where is that place?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: According to a survey, the Western Cape is the murder capital, and Nyanga tops the list. Premier, this is in your province of good governance and clean audits. [Interjections.]

You have appointed community police forums, then maybe you should listen to what the secretary of the Nyanga Police Forum, Mr Gwebe, says.

“Overcrowding and poverty are serious problems that need to be dealt with first.”

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... so that the numbers can decrease, and I agree. Police stations and policing are not the answer. Hon member Christians should get his facts right. More police is not the answer. Stop shouting about the plaster, deal with the origin of the wound. Deal with the root cause. There are other social issues like health, that need urgent attention

and mention.

In these overcrowded areas, primary healthcare can never be doing well, and we have heard the story of G F Jooste, that was closed down and that has now become a gang hotspot, where the new hospital site is on hold.

Premier, you have misled the community of Manenberg when you told them that an alternative site would be sourced ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why is she leaving now?

Ms M N GILLION: Run!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: now reports that the hospital construction is on hold. While this derelict building, as I just said, and I repeat, is being used as a drug addict stronghold.

This area, Mr Deputy Speaker, is in this Premier's province, and this hospital derelict site is also in the area where predominantly poor Coloured people live. That is almost racist in its practice of depriving that community of health service close-by.

By your own admission, Khayelitsha Hospital is a state of the art hospital. Yet families often go there and find their family members lying on the floor due to lack of beds, yet the Department claims to know nothing about it. Just

generally services at hospitals are really lacking and shocking.

Ms M N GILLION: They want to give lectures.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Education, my favourite topic.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Ja, nê?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The education in your province ...

Mr R T OLIVIER: She is not here.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... *In absentia*, MEC and Premier, rattles on from one crisis to another. About a month ago 700 learners in five districts had not yet been placed, and in Cape Town almost 4 500 were not in school. The Premier did not mention anything about any progress on that issue.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Why were they not placed?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But there were no prizes for guessing in which areas those learners come from. In your province, Premier ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Coloured lives do not matter to the DA.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You spoke about the laying of the foundation for

quality education. Then first we want a firm commitment from you, Premier, that you will stop this amendment to the Western Cape Education Schools' Act, that intends to open the door for sale of liquor at schools. We know the reason and the frivolous excuses made by the MEC to justify this amendment, and we tell you that it will not fly.

What do you say then if your quality education speaks about the state of affairs, where a school's source of water is a stream with a makeshift filter system to get water to the school for years? There you see it.

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is a disgrace.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That is the makeshift – at school children need to get water. Really, can you sleep at night, Premier and MEC of Education?

The other case in point the MEC referred to, but look at what the building looks like. You cannot blame the SGB for conditions, you have oversight. Stop shifting the blame. Just pumping money into a school and an SGB is not enough. You need to monitor what happens to the money you have given, and how they spend it. So after the fact, blaming the SGB, will not work. One wonders, one needs to really take your hat off to those teachers and children, who in spite of those conditions, still decide to come back to school.

Yet your MEC's main focus is how to get private sector involved with

schools, making the road, to complete private schooling easier for the rich and less accessible to the poorer learner, but more so, because feeder areas remain a hampering criteria for parents to send their children to schools of their choice, and so your drop-out rate be increased, bringing along more socio-economic problems to deal with. Private schools are a proliferation in affluent areas, because parents have no confidence in your Education Department.

Your SOPA spoke only about the academic achievements, with emphasis on your sausage machine approach of academics at all costs, forgetting that learners are not all wired that way.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But on academics, Premier, I hope you told Sipelele and his father that you actually refer to people coming from other provinces as “refugees”, who are utilising funds meant for the children of the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: You said that.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...and that your MEC is forever moaning about the influx from the Eastern Cape. Imagine if this was the federal state that you so wish for, then, like Donald Trump, you would probably would have built a wall or signed an executive order to deny them access.

Yet now you find it okay to score cheap political points and conveniently forget that that young boy's foundation was laid in the Eastern Cape, and that he came here intelligent. Premier, you signed the [Inaudible.,] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... that good governance is your success recipe, but then how democratic is your Democratic Alliance? If in your DA run municipalities, councillors are not allowed to exercise their democratic, constitutional rights to speak, debate or question, because a mayor single handedly runs the show?

Appointments are made without following due process, council items are never for debate, just cognisance, the inexperienced Speaker is controlled and in so doing abuses power, delegations are changed to suit personal gain further down the line. That is corrupt. Will you promise to investigate that, Premier?

Absolute power, with some of your DA mayors certainly corrupt, and in the case of one, where your own member would speak out in playing her oversight role, was some summarily removed, and posted to the furthest point on the West Coast ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes, they do not like oversight.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... for doing her oversight work. Same as you are doing with the only chairperson here amongst you, who understands his oversight role. He gets removed to a smaller portfolio. [Interjections.]

How credible do you want the citizens to believe you are? Good governance is not only about following policy and clean audits. It is also about allowing yourself to be questioned, interrogated as is expected where oversight is done correctly. The same as you at National Assembly.

Premier, does it not bother you, that on a regular basis children are being hit and killed by stray bullets in gang ridden areas? 7 year old Aliswa, an 11 year old girl in Elsie's River, a 5 year old, Ashlita Markus (?). In Hanover Park Sweet Home, a mom and a 6 month old baby are caught, the mom is killed, a 13 year old boy stabs a fellow schoolmate to death. These are the victims, Premier, that you should be asking for a minute's silence. Right here, in your province, under your nose, just up the road.

Further on, we still hear the same complaints of abuse, deprivation, unfair dismissals and evictions without alternatives. So even though you have a Farmworker Development Department, you best investigate why staff there are leaving one after the other. It does not help to cover up unfair labour practices, victimisation and stifling of growth opportunities.

This DA needs to wake up, Speaker – sorry, I addressed you as Deputy Speaker, I did not realise that you had changed.

An HON MEMBER: Welcome, welcome.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, this DA-led Government in this province needs to wake up. It is not anywhere as near as great as they think it is, because you continue to compare yourself from a privileged position. Your legacy, Premier, will remain one of a cold, angry, uncaring and autocratic leader. [Applause.]

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Kivedo.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agb Speaker, kollegas en eregaste op die galery, ek maak maar gebruik van die uitnodiging van die Adjunkspeaker om ter wille van die Moedertaal Dag-viering, nou dele van my toespraak te vertaal het terwyl ek hier sit, en ek gaan op die trant voort.

Dankie vir die geleentheid om repliek te lewer op die SOPA van ons Premier op 17 Februarie. Die goue draad wat regdeur die toespraak loop, myns insiens is verandering in die regte rigting, ontwikkeling wat volhoubaar is, en ook groei wat ekspansionisties is. Alles hierdie ondervang deur die beginsel van integrasie, sinergie en inklusiwiteit, alles in lyn met die grondwetlike

beginsels en die imperatiewe van die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan. Wat ons gehoor het is die goeie Wes-Kaap storie, maar ook hoe dit moet oorspoel na die res van Suid Afrika. Ons is almal Suid Afrikaners.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mnr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, colleagues and honorary guests in the gallery, I am taking advantage of the invitation of the Deputy Speaker with regard to the Mother Tongue Day celebration, and I have translated parts of my speech while I am sitting here, and I will continue in this way.

Thank you for the opportunity to reply to the SOPA of our Premier on 17 February. The golden thread running all the way through the speech in my view is change in the right direction, sustainable development, as well as growth that is expansionist. All of this is based on the principle of integration, synergy and inclusivity, all in line with the constitutional principles and the imperatives of the National Development Plan. What we have heard is the good Western Cape story, but also how it it should spill over to the rest of South Africa. We are all South Africans.]

†Madam Speaker, it is only through education that we will empower our young people to lead the charge in economic growth, that creates jobs. Providing a good learning environment that prepares young individuals not only to enrich and improve their own lives, but to one day make meaningful contributions to society, is a key focus for the Western Cape Government.

Madam Speaker, the matric class of 2016 did remarkably well, although the Western Cape WCED suffered budget limitations, they did exceptionally well to manage their resources to the best of their ability. The WCED increased our provinces' pass rate by 1.3%, from 84.7 to 86, and on a qualitative level, 40.9 of learners who wrote their matric exams last year, achieved Bachelors passes. This is the highest percentage of Bachelors passes in the country.

The country's top three positions in Quintile 5 schools, all went to learners from the Western Cape. I am also exceptionally pleased to mention that the WCED has delivered the top three learners in the country in maths, and the top two in maths and science combined.

†Al agt distrikte in die provinsie het hier meer as 80% slaagsyfer bereik. Ons is veral verheug oor die progressiewe vordering wat oor die afgelope sewe jaar sedert die bewindsoorname van die DA-geleide Regering gemaak is, veral in sover dit die prestasieverandering, vordering en opwaartse [Onhoorbaar.] van leerders uit arm, geteisterde gebiede betref.

Agb Speaker, Mfuleni in die Wes-Kaap, dien in die geval as 'n uitstaande voorbeeld van skole wat bo hulle omstandighede uitgestyg het. Vanaf 2014 het die Mfuleni-gemeenskap skouer aan skouer gewerk, en teen alle verwagtinge in sukses behaal.

Hulle was aangespoor deur die wete dat onderwys die mag, die meganisme is om uit die armoede-siklus te breek en te ontsnap. In 2014 het hierdie area 'n

matrikulasie-slaagsyfer van 50.6% behaal, maar waarna die syfer tot hoër as 80% in 2016 verbeter het.

Agb Speaker, dit is eweneens belangrik om te vermeld dat die skoolleerder slaagsyfers in arm, geteisterde gebiede meer as verdubbel het, vandat die DA die Wes-Kaap Regering in 2009 oorgeneem het.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[All eight districts in the province have achieved more than the 80% pass rate here. We are especially pleased about the progressive improvement of the past seven years since the DA Government had come to power, especially with regard to performance change, progress and upward [Inaudible.] of learners from poor, affected areas.

Madam Speaker, Mfuleni in the Western Cape in this instance serves as an outstanding example of schools that have risen above their circumstances. From 2014, the Mfuleni community worked shoulder to shoulder and achieved success against all expectations.

They were inspired by the knowledge that education is the force, the mechanism to break the poverty cycle and escape from it. In 2014, this area achieved a matric pass rate of 50.6%, after which the figure has improved to more than 80% in 2016.

Madam Speaker, it is equally important to mention that the learner pass rate in poor, affected areas has more than doubled, since the DA has taken over the Western Cape Government in 2009.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

Mr B D KIVEDO: Educational success in the province was also reflected in the province's retention rate, which is the highest in the country. The WCED has yet again retained the highest percentage of learners in the country, from grade 10 to 12, namely 64.13%.

Ensuring that we limit the number of learners dropping out of our schools system, remains a top priority. We have established 181 Mass Participation, Opportunity and Access, Development and Growth – that is MOD Centres across the province, to over 40 000 people from disadvantaged communities and under-served schools.

The MOD Centres in our province have provided structured sport, recreation, arts and cultural development curriculums after school. This has been a positive initiative led by our Government in areas where drugs and crime are barriers to our learners' ability to achieve success.

Building on the previous years successes, I have no doubt that the Department will ensure that this year's matriculants perform even better. I also want to commend them on finding placement for almost 20 000 unplaced

learners this year. Providing opportunities for those from disadvantaged backgrounds remains a primary focus of the DA led Western Cape Government.

†Ons laat leer dan deur middel van die aanvaarding van 'n holistiese benadering, wat onder andere vennootskappe tussen alle lede van ons gemeenskappe insluit, ons bied die geleentheid om die lewens van diegene in arm, geteisterde gebiede te verryk, as gevolg van juis 'n holistiese en globale benadering. Gegewe dan die langtermyn uitwerking van armoede en ongelykheid, lei dit juis daartoe dat die DA die uitdagings waarmee vele van ons openbare skole in die arm, geteisterde gebiede gekonfronteer word, begryp. Ons begryp dit. Ons het ten volle begrip daarvoor.

Dit is derhalwe verblydend dat die WKOD verskeie programme bied, gemik op die uitbreiding van opvoedkundige geleenthede aan ons arm gemeenskappe. Pro-arm inisiatiewe vorm 'n kern, kritieke element van ons Premier se e-Learning Game-changer – ek het nie die Afrikaanse benaming daarvoor nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[We then learn through the acceptance of a holistic approach, which amongst others include partnerships between all members of our communities, we offer the opportunity to enrich the lives of those in poor, affected areas, especially as a result of a holistic and global approach. Given then the long

term effect of poverty and inequality, it leads to the DA understanding the challenges confronting many of our public schools in the poor, affected areas. We understand that. We understand fully.

It is therefore encouraging that the WCED offer several programmes aimed at the expansion of educational opportunities to our poor communities. Pro-poor initiatives constitute a core, critical element of our Premier's e-Learning Game-changer – I do not have the Afrikaans term for that. [Interjections.]

Over the last year, the DA led Government set-up 676 schools across the province, with [Inaudible.] and wireless connections. In addition, the WCED has installed 4 267 technology smart classrooms across 309 schools. This has been closely linked with the Western Cape Government's focus on maths and languages. Several teaching programmes have been initiated to incorporate e-Teaching and e-Learning into learning. This has been proven to help learners, especially in the environments with large classes.

Madam Speaker, we believe that no person in this province should fail to have the opportunity to attend school because of their financial circumstances. Thus it must be noted that 98.5% of the schools in our province are either no-fee schools or schools that have been compensated and assisted by the WCED in one way or another.

Our Government has enabled over 600 000 learners the opportunity to be

schooled, irrespective of their financial status. This has provided opportunity for nearly half the number of learners in schools around the province, to attend schooling. It remains a priority that children of a school going age receive quality education, that will in hindsight provide opportunities to these learners in the future, and contribute to us building a functional society.

In 2016 we allocated nearly up to R50 million to fee paying schools. This equated to us providing assistance to 97% of all provincial, fee paying schools.

†In konklusie dan ...[Tussenwerpsels.] [In conclusion, then...[Interjections.]]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In conclusion. †Is daai Afrikaans? [Gelag.] [Is that Afrikaans? [Laughter.]]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: In die lig van al hierdie, lieve kollegas, is dit belangrik, en agb Speaker, dat ons 'n dringende beroep, 'n vriendelike dog ferm beroep op ouers rig in hierdie Wes-Kaap, om aansoek te doen vir die kwytskelding van skoolfooie, om die deur van geleerdheid en kultuur oop te maak vir almal om – dit is 'n algemene, universele stelling, deur die Stoel, agb lid Dyantyi, wat ons altwee kan deel met mekaar. [Gelag.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: In the light of all this, dear colleagues, it is important, and Madam Speaker, that we make an urgent plea, a friendly though firm plea to our parents in this Western Cape, to apply for exemption of school fees, to open the door of knowledge and culture, for all to – through the Chair, it is a general, universal statement, hon member Dyantyi, that we can both share with each other. [Laughter.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo, your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Yes, just in conclusion ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo ...

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie. [Tyd verstreke.] [Applous.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you very much for this opportunity. The Department of Community Safety in the Western Cape remains committed to assisting the police in the province in

their task of maintaining the rule of law, vigorously and continuously hold the police accountable to the people of this province through our oversight mandate, and expand on what we have [Inaudible.] are capable of doing to help create the safer communities we all want to live in.

This is what I believe Premier Zille referred to in her address on Friday as the rule of law, a culture of accountability, and a capable state. We work tirelessly to ensure that through targeted interventions and effective partnerships we foster a “whole of society approach” to safety in the province.

The [Inaudible.] realities of too many people in the province, however, require all of us to do more. We cannot use the safety of people in this province, as a political plaything to score points in this House.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As she did.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We do not have the luxury of time and unlimited resources to keep accusing one another in this House of things we have no control over. We have to put the safety of the people in this province first, and it starts in this House. [Interjection.] The recent Victims of Crime Survey released by Stats SA, shows that almost half of households in the Western Cape, avoid going to open spaces or parks. That is 48.4%, according to the report. Less than half of households allow children to play in the area, 42.9%, and only a third of households allow their

children to walk to school ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: It has got worse since the DA took over.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...34.7%.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why is that?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is the harsh reality of far too many people in this province. How dare anyone in this House play politics, while an 11 year old girl has been shot by gangsters and ended up in hospital, in intensive care, and a 5 year old girl has been shot in the back, and left paralysed for life.

As we read on a daily basis, how thugs, gangsters, druglords and gunrunners, are still able to hold our communities hostage. The prevalence of crime, especially violent crime committed between people, is wreaking havoc in our communities, and the cold reality is that these gangsters and shooters of our people are none other than our neighbours, even our brothers, even the son of one of our mothers and fathers within our very own communities.

The cards are stacked against us in our task of helping to create safer communities, and we do not shy away from the responsibility we have to the people living in the Western Cape. What we have done, is to rectify the broken systems we have inherited and attack the lacklustre, rubberstamp

attitude previously towards oversight, or the change of people's lives for the better.

The Provincial Community Safety Act, the first of its kind in the country, has solidified our oversight mandate in law. It enables us to establish the Provincial Police Ombudsman who investigates when people are not satisfied with service delivery of the police in the province, and that includes Metro Police Law Enforcement, etcetera.

Since its establishment, the Ombudsman has investigated more than 670 cases in the province. This administration went as far as the High Court to allow the voices of the people in this province to be heard in order to change their lives, or to change their [Inaudible.] safety realities. The Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry was objected to, and fought against by the Opposition, even by the National Minister of Police, to prevent us from helping to improve of the safety of our people by whichever means we can. [Interjections.] I am confident that our combined ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... focus from the Western Cape Government and the police, will see all of the recommendations made by the Commission [Inaudible]... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... in realising we have to do more in service of our communities.

Madam Speaker, we have focused on targeted interventions and strategic partnerships to reach deeper into our communities, to help improve safety conditions. The safety of our youth in the province has consistently been prioritised by my Department.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is it?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: A generation that is often forgotten about. Since 2015, the Department of Community Safety has assisted more than 2 500 plus graduates from the Chrysalis and Wolwekloof Academies with internships, where they ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Plato, will you take your seat, please? There is too much conversing. Hon Minister Winde, I am looking directly at you, and hon member Olivier, I am looking directly – there is a conversation going on whilst the Minister is speaking. So if I may call both sides of the House to order. There is a speaker on the floor, let us respect the speaker with silence. You may proceed, hon Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, where they are given valuable work experience and paid a stipend via the Expanded Public Works Programme. Our partnerships with FPD Colleges, see hundreds of

vulnerable youth enter the colleges to further their studies. We will continue to encourage more youth from disadvantaged backgrounds to do exactly the same.

We piloted the youth safety and religious partnership programme in 2012, and partnered with 44 institutions in selected communities, to create safer alternatives for the youth during school holiday periods. Over the December 2016/2017 holiday period, the YSOP has, in partnerships with the religious fraternity in the province, managing 107 youth projects, reaching more than 10 000 youth during the school holidays.

Safety is not only a concern during holiday periods, and Premier Zille mentioned the uptake of our Walking Buses in 28 communities already. As a Department, we will continue rollout more Walking Buses in partnerships with parents and neighbourhood watches in the year ahead.

School safety, in particular, remains a concern, and this Government is actively addressing the changing realities and safety concerns in communities, which spills into our schoolyards. The Opposition's obsession with their Bambanani system is case in point. [Interjections.]

The current Bambanani system was widely discussed with our safety partners. All agreed that the system in its current form is not working anymore. [Interjections.] Their current focus is only access control and does not adequately address the violence or criminality affecting our schools. In some

cases they will continue, but we are in talks with both the police and the Department of Education to deploy Safety Kiosks to identified high risk schools, to be staffed by trained security personnel.

To date, we have deployed 50 Safety Kiosks as a visible point of safety, and access point for related service delivery across the province. Under the new neighbourhood watch model, we have seen neighbourhood watches trained as first aid responders, to expand the safety services available. [Interjection].

This was done as part of the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-changer, empowering our neighbourhood watches with the necessary skills, equipment and support to provide holistic safety services in their communities, and we also support the structuring of street committees as well.

Our Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-changer is tackling the scourge of alcohol abuse in the province head-on. With as much as 70% of crimes in our communities linked to substance abuse and 67% of the domestic violence in our communities being alcohol related we have to do more, we have to do better and do differently to help keep our communities safe. But, Madam Speaker households do have a responsibility as well.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: As I have said earlier...[Interjections.] these youngsters that are wreaking havoc in our

communities are coming from families [Interjection.] and those families are staying right within our communities and the parents cannot control their youngsters and they allow their youngsters to run around with guns, to keep guns in the house and to keep drugs in the house. They do not report their children to the police and that is an issue we as a collective, the Democratic Alliance and all other political parties, have to tackle as a collective. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, the additional five liquor inspectors for the Western Cape Liquor Authority, together with the amendments to the regulations, will go a long way in ensuring an efficient and effective regulated environment of alcohol in the province to reduce the harms associated with its abuse, to limit the amount of liquor licences and we are busy with that process. We talked to the municipalities to impose by-laws to control operating hours of liquor outlets within our communities. [Interjection.]

As the Government we remain responsive to the needs of the people who live in the Western Cape. We work with the police in the province, supporting them and fostering the necessary relationships between the police and communities in our realisation that safety is indeed everyone's responsibility.

I have commended Provincial Police Commissioner General Jula in his

efforts to address the historical backlog of police shortages in the province. His predecessor admitted to being close to 3 000 police officers short in the province. General Jula's willingness to serve the people of the province has been instrumental in seeing an additional 1 324 new police recruits deployed to the Western Cape. We avail the resources we have to help address the safety threats, too many people in the province face. Last year we provided funding of R3 million to the City of Cape Town to capacitate their stabilisation unit which has experienced tangible success in reducing gang violence. We will continue to hold National Government accountable for a quality safety service delivery in the province which the people in the Western Cape deserve. We will not stand by in silence or inaction at the lack of resource deployment and the lack of reintroducing the long awaited specialised unit. Madam Speaker, I thank you.

†'n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I see the hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you. Madam Speaker it is indeed a great privilege for me to take part in this debate today. Today I rise as a voice for the lost generation, the many young people in South Africa, mainly vulnerable, young people ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... that are on the brink of giving up hope on the future, a national lost generation ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... who are riddled with limited access to opportunities and national ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mitchell, please take your seat. Hon member Olivier, if I may address you, I notice since you have moved to the front bench there, you have taken on the role of constantly interjecting. It is allowed but it cannot be a running commentary, if I could ask you to compose yourself please. Thank you. Order, hon members. Let us call the House back to order. You may proceed hon Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. A national lost generation who are riddled with limited access to opportunities, a national lost generation that is trapped in the scourge of drug and alcohol abuse, a national ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mitchell, I am going to have to call you to order again if you do not mind taking your seat. This time it is the hon Minister Grant and the hon member Beerwinkel who choose to have a debate. So can I, members, request your support and co-operation? If we could allow the sitting to proceed and you can engage with each other after the House has

adjourned. I thank you kindly. You may proceed hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker for the third time. A national lost generation that is not able to find jobs because they lack skills, a lost generation that is not really free because we are only free during election times to cast a vote.

Let us consider this: according to the National Census there are at least 2.2 million youth between the ages of 15 and 34, 13% of which can be classified as not in employment, education or training. Furthermore 60% of the unemployed have no matric qualifications. These stats put in context the challenge faced by Government and directly the youth of the Western Cape. This is how we, the lost generation feel, under the current ANC ruled Government and the Western Cape [Interjections.] and the Western Cape is no island and we are directly affected by the National Government's nonchalance to the plight of the people of South Africa. But, Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... all is not lost because the many young people in the Western Cape have heard on Friday in the Premier's State of the Province Address, just how important this Government sees the youth, youth development and creating opportunities to ensure our youth live the lives they so value.

In fact the Premier recommitted this DA-led Government's second term, to the young people of this province. I welcome the many opportunities that this Government continues to create for the youth in the Western Cape. From Wi-Fi hot spots, where people will receive 250Mb free data per month to even being able to purchase an additional 5 Gigs at the ridiculous rate of R45.00 when you have run out of data. This no ANC led government is able to do or even remotely interested in doing as they do not fully ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mitchell, please take your seat. Hon members you are allowed to comment but I see all the finger pointing going on, if we could. A point of order is allowed, interjection is allowed but drowning out the speaker is inappropriate. There was a point when I could not hear what the hon member Mitchell was saying. You may proceed hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. From Wi-Fi hot spots where people will receive 250Mb free data per month to even being able to purchase an additional 5 Gigs at the ridiculous rate of R45.00 when you run out of data. This no ANC led government is able to do or even remotely interested in doing as they do not fully understand the importance of being connected to the digital world in order to advance one's circumstances.

This is a fact. Because this DA-led Government does not just pay lip service to opportunities for the youth in this province, schools have been prioritised for Broadband connection as part of the e-Learning Game-Changer. Madam

Speaker, still on creating opportunities through Broadband connectivity, 70 e-Centres across this province would have been established by the end of March 2017, e-Centres to as far as the remote rural town of Merweville. As the constituency head of Merweville, I want to give my constituents, especially the youth of Merweville, the assurance that regardless of how remote we are this DA-led Government will bring services to you. This DA-led Government will provide the opportunities for you and this DA-led Government will ensure that you live a life you can value.

As the Standing Committee Chair for the Premier, I take heed of the Premier's call to visit the many e-Centres across this province because we cannot stand up here and speak in this House if we have not seen it or experienced it.

The shortage of skills and the lack of work place experience among our young people play a major a role in fuelling youth unemployment in the country and the Western Cape. The Apprentice Game-changer was added to the already existing Game-changer with an objective to achieve sufficient, appropriately qualified technical and vocational skilled young people to meet the needs of the economic growth areas in the Western Cape. Because youth lives matter in the Western Cape, we applaud this initiative as together with the other programmes it will assist in dealing with the serious challenges of unemployment among the youth in this province.

3 009 young people completed their work-based programmes in fields linked

to the tourism, oil and gas and agri processing sectors between April and September 2016. If this was achieved in just five months, the year that lies ahead promises to yield a sustainable impact on youth unemployment and youth readiness to enter the job market.

Through a commitment to providing opportunities of this nature, the DA-led Western Cape Government is ensuring that we continue to build societies that will make a positive contribution to the communities and the economy of the Western Cape.

We are committed to breaking the cycle of poverty that many of our communities are trapped in. We need to continue creating opportunities for the youth in order to ensure they become active citizens who can contribute meaningfully to our society. One of the greatest challenges facing our youth is the scourge of drug and other forms of substance abuse. Every day we read about how our young people fall into this trap often with disastrous consequences. It is a challenge that requires a “whole of society approach” where both Government and our communities have to come together and find lasting solutions to the problems facing our youth.

New and dangerous drugs are introduced to our kids with disastrous consequences and what is sad is that they get the drugs from the very people they look up to. The people that are meant to have their best interests at heart continue to be the ones that condemn them to a world riddled with drugs, crime and violence.

Madam Speaker, in Minister Ivan Meyer's budget vote he revealed that the Western Cape Government will spend R9.4 billion in the 2016/2017 financial year on the development of youth in the Western Cape. This is in line with the Western Cape Government's stated intent to improve opportunities for youth development in this province. It is important to acknowledge the significant strides made by the DA-led Western Cape Government in fostering positive youth development.

It is our mandate to advocate for the improvement and offer opportunities for youth development. The current National ANC Government has long forgotten about creating an enabling environment for our youth but the Western Cape Government continues to lead by example and unleashing opportunities for growth and jobs.

Soon the youth of Nelson Mandela Bay, Johannesburg and Tshwane, under a DA-led Government, will also thrive in the same way [Applause.] and eventually no child, Madam Speaker, no child, will be left behind nationally. I thank you. [Applause.]

†AGB LEDE: Mooi!

[HON MEMBERS: Well done!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Joseph, if you could just give me a second, there is quite a bit of movement. Thank you. I now see the hon B Joseph. You may proceed.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Firstly, I would like to welcome in the House the EFF's small delegation that is here but led by one of our provincial leaders ...

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

Mr B D JOSEPH: ... as well as the son of Hamilton Naki. I will speak to him later. From the onset, the EFF wants to emphasise that Premier Zille's SOPA was full of rhetoric, generalisation and statistical data that is difficult for their own voters, of whom the majority are either brainwashed or ill informed, to understand and comprehend the economic and social dominance of the minority in the Democratic Alliance. The DA was entrusted with the Western Cape vote. Its [Inaudible.] from employment, non-payment of pension funds, evictions on farms and evictions by DA controlled municipalities, assaults on workers and in extreme cases, the blatant murder of human beings continued unabatedly by the white [Inaudible.] of Premier Zille. The EFF, on a daily basis, is assisting the very same people who voted for the DA of the hon Premier.

While I am on the path, we must not forget that the slave wages by the DA members to farmworkers, domestic workers, security guards and other low paid employment, cannot be called equal opportunity for all. The slogan which the DA is so proud about, but definitely does not implement over the whole spectrum of the province population, and it is a pity it is a quote from the Constitution of the country.

Where is the black owned companies to upgrade the provincial national roads in the province? Where is the black owned companies to build bridges in the province? In fact, where is the black owned companies to become involved in the multi-million rand development projects in the province? Madam Speaker, one will only find them as window dressers as fronting for million rand white conglomerates [Interjections.]. †Ek wil nie graag die woorde van die Oposisieleier gebruik nie, maar liever verwys hier na Kolossense 3, vers 9 van die Bybel, om dit te gaan lees. [I do not really want to use the words of the leader of the Opposition, but rather refer here to Colossians 3, verse 9, to go and read it.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Therefore to set the record straight I would like to introduce the son of Hamilton Naki. Can you please stand. [Applause.] You can sit. Hamilton Naki was the first person responsible for a heart transplant and here in this record of the South African Medical Journal, as well as an exhibition of Netcare is a clear indication. That is our reference, there are more references.

Who was responsible for this heart transplant? It was definitely not Professor Chris Barnard. He was a stand-by. You mentioned in your address of dedicating your second term ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr B D JOSEPH: ... to the young people of the province. Hon Premier are you still planning on how to implement your so-called education to the upliftment of young people of the province? Are you still planning while tens of thousands of young people are roaming the streets of this province? Are you still planning while children must evade bullets on their way to school? Are you still planning while women and children, including men, are raped on a daily basis.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Are you still planning while 8 to 12 year olds are running havoc in Mitchells Plain, ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She doesn't care!

Mr B D JOSPEH: ... Manenberg and in Chicago in Paarl, assaulting and killing people and being killed on a daily basis.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle gee nie om nie!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They do not care!]

Mr B D JOSPEH: Are you still planning while girls as young as thirteen years old are getting pregnant. Madam Speaker, it is crystal clear that as long as these atrocities are happening the white minority will be "secure in their comfort" to lend a phrase from Advocate Thuli Madonzela. That is the reason

why the term of young people is still in its planning phase and with two years left of your second term as the Premier, it is obvious that dedicating this term to the young people in the province will stay in that planning phase and will die in that planning phase. Good governance, hon Premier, includes satisfaction of the population on all levels of public service, not only on clean audits.

It is the easiest task in government to fill in forms, executing tasks as prescribed by policies, spending State funds as prescribed by the PFMA or the MFMA as it directs you step by step what to do and how to do it. Therefore to look for accolades for receiving clean audits is disingenuous. It is only public servants doing the work are getting paid for. †Jy kan nie ‘n vis leer swem of betaal om te swem en dan van hom verwag om te swem nie. [You cannot teach a fish to swim or pay it to swim and then expect it to swim.] The daunting task - hon Premier, you are boasting about matric results 86%, 86% against what? The challenge is the following: we do not have proper education systems in place in this province. Looking at ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr B D JOSPEH: Yes indeed, looking at the ECD Centres in this province, where are the ECD Centres located?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph ... [Interjection.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: However, MEC Fritz wants to close down ECD Centres in the areas of Manenberg where gangsterism is rife. These are the types ...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph, your time has expired. You may finish your sentence.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Okay. These are the challenges: looking at the ECD Centres, the school system and decreasing school drop-outs rate. This package will assist us in increasing the total pass rate. I thank you.

[Applause.]

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Joseph.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is one of your best speeches!

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Dyantyi you may wish to compliment hon member Joseph outside of the House. Order, please hon members. I now see the hon Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo. Hon member Olivier I am going to have to appeal to you and your little finger across the floor there. Please co-operate. Thank you. Minister Winde, I am watching you to. Thank you.

†UMPHATHISWA WEMICIMBI YEZENKCUBEKO NEZEMIDLALO:
Somlomo obekekileyo Nkulumbuso ebekekileyo yePhondo leNtshona Koloni,
amalungu abekekileyo ePalamente yeNtshona Koloni kunye nabaphathiswa,
need wend we iezizee kuzimasa le ndibano abamajelo eendaba ...

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Madam Speaker, hon Premier of the Western Cape, hon members of the Parliament of the Western Cape, Ministers, visitors and guests who came to attend this sitting ...] †members of the media and most importantly †goeie middag mense van die Wes-Kaap [good afternoon people of the Western Cape.] On Friday 18 February the Premier tabled in this House the State of the Province Address. It gave a snapshot of the work this administration has managed to deliver from 2009 to date and noting the emphasis on accountability, the respect of the rule of law and the capable state. We thank the Premier for that and indeed we are glad. Hon members, South Africa is at a crossroad. The economy has been crippled and slowed down to a 0.5% growth rate which has shed jobs instead of creating them.

The SPEAKER: Order, order please. Hon Minister, if you could take your seat, I would like to address the members. Hon member Lekker and hon member Dijana you can converse quietly but when it becomes disruptive I would need to request your co-operation and support. If you could, there is a speaker on the floor. You may proceed hon Minister.

†Mnr L H MAX: Gooi hulle uit.

[Mr L H MAX: Throw them out.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Max, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: While we suffer the same fate as other provinces during this tough financial climate, in this province we never allow this to get in the way of delivering critical services to those we serve. We have never been complacent about what we have been entrusted to do by the people of the Western Cape, that is service delivery. People voted and put us into power to render corrupt free, clean, efficient and effective government. [Interjection.] That is why health, the department with the biggest budget allocation continues achieving unqualified audits for the 12th consecutive year.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: For the first time in South African history we are the only health department to achieve a clean financial audit. [Applause.]

†AGB LEDE: Hoor-hoor!

[HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Over the past years, the Western Cape has been allocating the biggest slice of the budget to health. It just shows how

serious the Premier and this Government is about the health of the people of this province and if we check the allocation, the percentage that goes to health in other provinces, you will find that it is a drop in the ocean compared to the health allocation in this province. Thank you, hon Premier. We salute you. Your actions speak louder than words.

Only a healthy population can be productive and contribute towards the economy. Only a healthy person can make healthy decisions and choices about their individual self. Hon members, whilst Tanie Sara, uMama [Inaudible.] will never truly grasp the impact of clean governance it is crucial for improved patient experience in our facilities because that is where an ordinary person in the Western Cape feels the pinch.

Delivering quality health care services is our core. With an increase in population, the burden of disease, increasing patients presenting more than one disease, budget shortages – I am just naming a few service pressures – are inevitable. Hon members, our facilities are congested and waiting times for elective patients are becoming longer. The increase in psychiatry patients fuelled by substance [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Can you take your seat please hon Minister. Hon member Gillion and hon Minister Fritz, if I could address you please? I think it is unparliamentary for two members to engage in a one-on-one whilst there is a speaker on the floor. It is completely inappropriate and I do not think I am going to condone it. We need to manage our emotions and we

need to maintain our composure. There is a speaker on the floor. It is a contentious debate but please manage yourselves in an honourable way. So, if I could ask you to co-operate? You may proceed hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: Good, Speaker, good!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. The increase in psychiatry patients fuelled by substance abuse epidemic is of concern at our [Inaudible.] hospitals. It is for this reason that I dedicate this year to patient centred care but today, Madam Speaker, I would like to dedicate this speech to mental health services and to people living with mental illness.

Mr M G WILEY: Hear-hear!

Mr L H MAX: Well done!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mental health, as a discipline within the system, is often the neglected step child. Mental health care in South Africa will go down in the *Guinness Book of Records* of how the South African Government, including myself, by association as a member of the National Health Council, have failed the people living with mental illness.

You and I, not only Gauteng, but all of us who are in positions of authority will be judged harshly by history for allowing the most vulnerable members of our society to suffer this way. It is inexcusable and it is inhumane.

Let me bring it home. The Western Cape Health Government for this year admitted 6 733 people living with mental illness and attended to 43 121 people living with mental illness at our patient departments. This is no small feat but it takes a highly effective system, governed by ethical leadership, to get the basics right. Due to the very nature of the illness the people who suffer from these diseases are often alienated from society and rely on Government to provide them with the necessary care they need.

I would like to highlight that mental health is a third contributor to the quadruple burden of disease in South Africa. That is why a failure by Government is a massive blemish on democratic South Africa. Members of Parliament also exercise the right over the Executive around the rendering of these services. While the National Government is responsible for norms and standards and policy formulation, the ones responsible for mental health and Esidimeni contracts, the provinces took over mental health services and initiated the process of deinstitutionalisation.

Back in the day, people living with mental illnesses were locked up, restrained and placed in dungeons, away from society. Through pieces of legislation, like the Mental Health Act, we have seen a shift in the way that we treat our patients but this has not been enough. In the Western Cape we have created systems which will assist us with mitigating tragedies of this nature from occurring. Do not get me wrong, Madam Speaker, we too feel the pinch of the lack of resources where we too often have to make difficult

choices and prioritise. However, those decisions are always understood by patient centred care.

We have strengthened the District Mental Health Services provision. This is crucial so that the quality of care is at the level of all our services. We have got the skills mix where we have mental health care nurses, trained nurses together with the advancement of health nurses who visit all these services, including primary health care services. The Mental Health Act of 2002 established the Mental Health Review Board to ensure good governance and effective oversight. The relationship needs to be managed exceptionally well. In order to be effective this body needs to retain its independence and be able to hold the Department accountable. So, most of the failures in mental health are a result of the Board that is not independent or that is not necessarily useful in terms of the rendering of health services. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, would you care to take your seat? Hon member Makeleni, do you wish to rise on a point of order because I see you trying to engage me here.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, †ndizama ukufumana i-attention yakho ngoba ndicinga ukuba uminister irelevancy uyibhudile, ngoku sithetha nge state of the province address, bendicinga ukuba ke uzawuzama ukumcaller into relevance.

[Translations of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Madam Speaker, I am trying to get your attention, because I think the Minister has lost the relevance. We are speaking now on the State of the Province Address. I thought you would try to call her to relevance.]

The SPEAKER: I note your point of order. I think and without having to pass any comment, health formed part of the SOPA discussion and the Minister is obviously speaking to the health debate so I will allow the Minister to proceed. You may proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Premier mentioned the quadruple burden of disease and then within there mentioned the psychiatry units that have been opened in the Paarl and mentioned Valkenberg as part of the psychiatry health services. That is the relevance.

Mr M G E WILEY: She wouldn't know. [Inaudible.] speech.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me! [Inaudible.] Excuse me.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillian. I am sorry I heard what the Chief Whip said. I called order and now you and he are getting into a debate. Please address your point of order through the Chair. We simply cannot do what is happening here today. You may proceed, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: You were actually sleeping when the Premier [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: I do not know who was sleeping but there are no sleepers right now so let us continue with the business of the day. You may proceed, hon Minister. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The move to transfer these facilities had to be carefully managed. The National Department of Health started the process until the passing of the Mental Health Act which brought mental health care under the ambit of the provinces. The move was to ensure the effective continuation of care and to offer a comprehensive package of services to our services.

Due to decentralisation and the lack of capacity in our hospitals service level agreements were signed with the registered NPOs to look after the less critical patients while hospitals continue to look after critical patients. Each funded NPO is legally obligated to meet the standards which have been set out. Accountability measures are the key to all of these. We have seen what results have been yielded by the lack of accountability. As a caring Government we understand that our NPO partners are an extension of who we are and the service that we have undertaken to provide. Madam Speaker, what happened in Esidimeni is an indictment to all of us. Transfer of patients from a certain level of care facility to another, without the requisite step down approach, can be seen as a death sentence. As a result over 100 people died

because of this grave error. May this be a lesson to all of us. It will take the whole society to ensure that people living with mental illnesses are no longer treated as if they are second class citizens.

A few weeks ago, for example, I was touched by a report of a retired social worker who opened and converted her home as a place for people living with mental illnesses, disabled and elderly persons. Unfortunately it had to be closed down but it is people like Mrs X that really understand the importance of putting others first and giving a helping hand. So the closing down of her home is due to our cleaving to our promise of good governance and accountability.

When we preach clean governance and effective accountability mechanisms, not merely our self-righteousness, it is because in health, issues like these are often life and death situations. We dare not fail the people that voted us into this office. In conclusion, Madam Speaker, I am not asking the House to observe a moment of silence for Esidimeni but I am requesting us to remember one thing, people living with mental illnesses matter and they are humans too. [Applause.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Last week we heard Premier

Zille in her State of Province Address refer to three principals, the rule of law, a culture of accountability and a capable state. Policing and crime prevention speaks directly to the heart of the rule of law and policing oversight is responsible for creating a culture of accountability and doing these things well is the essence of a capable state. Safety underpins almost everything that we do and it is therefore in this arena that much of our efforts must lie.

Criminology theory tells us that in order for a crime to occur there are three factors necessary: an opportunity to commit a crime, a motivated offender and the absence of the capable guardian. The Department of Community Safety is focusing on all three of these. It is addressing motivations for crime with a strong youth development and safety focus by programmes such as Chrysalis, it's youth and religion partnership and Walking Buses.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

Ms M M WENGER: Motivations are being addressed through the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-changer, removing opportunities for crime and supplementing guardians when there are too few police officers. The Department has developed the safety kiosks and is working hard to develop neighbourhood watches and community police fora. For example through the Department's innovative Expanded Partnership Programme CPFs have been funded to the value of R3.3 million in the last two years. 141 CPFs from right across the province have benefited from this project. While 94% of CPFs

have received funding, the funding has largely benefited high crime areas and rural areas of our province where resources are often scarce. For example, the CPFs of Nyanga, Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, Harare and Worcester, which contribute almost 20% to all contact crimes, have received over R300 000 towards crime prevention.

This is a prime example of Better Together initiatives being driven by the DA Government in order to strengthen the necessary relationships between citizens and Government in order to improve safety in our province. And what are the safety proposals that the Opposition has put forward today? None. What are the bold plans of the ANC run provinces? None. What is their better plan? They do not have one. [Interjections.]

The ANC's big plan for community safety and sole policy intervention is the Bambanani Programme which was essentially asking elderly women to be security guards for a stipend, without adequate training and without CERO accreditation in dangerous areas. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: In 2007 their own MPLs criticised the programme and their own Premier wanted to shut it down. So, Madam Speaker, the Premier also mentioned police under resourcing. We know that 75% of police stations in this city have less officers than the national norm. The average police to population ratio is one officer for every 358 people but the average for Cape

Town is only one for every 439 and 21 of our stations have only one officer for every five hundred residents. It is sad that the most crime-affected areas have the least officers.

.
It was then surprising that according to media reports the President had an excess of 5000 police officers for the SONA.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we know!

Ms M M WENGER: In 2015 we know that 1,277 Western Cape police officers were deployed to the SONA. That is more than the entire staff complement of Nyanga, Manenberg, Steenberg, Mitchells Plain and Grassy Park combined. [Applause.] The President dispatched more Western Cape police officers to protect himself than to protect the Cape Flats gang affected areas.

It is an insult to communities who suffer the consequences of crime on a daily basis and it is an injustice to all South Africans who deserve better. [Interjections.] It seems rather difficult to comprehend that at a time when there is an urgent need for the deployment of ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order

Ms M WENGER: ... more officers to serve the people of this province, the President instead opted to put his own interests above the interests of ordinary South Africans. But the securitisation of Parliament is a symptom of

a far greater schizophrenia in our police service ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Wenger, if you could take your seat. Hon members there is too much conversing, you are drowning out the speaker. Both sides of the House are contributing towards the noise. If I could ask you to please allow the member to present without drowning out the speaker. Thank you. You may proceed hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The securitisation of Parliament is a symptom of a far greater schizophrenia in our policing, where policing is either forced upon citizens or simply is random. Now is the time for us to debate and to reflect upon the kind of police that we really want for our country.

The SAPS itself is in a reform effort through the Back to Basics Programme but I would argue that instead of going back to basics we should go back to first principles. A good place to start could be Sir Robert Peels principles of law enforcement and the principle of policing by consent. Many of these principles may never have been achieved but certainly are worth striving for and should be the ideal that we uphold. These are:

- To remember that the basic mission for which police exist is to prevent crime and disorder as an alternative to the repression of crime and disorder by military force and the severity of legal punishment.
- The ability of police to perform their duties is dependent upon the

approval of police actions and the ability of the police to maintain public respect.

- The police must secure the willing cooperation of the public in voluntary observance of the law and be able to secure and maintain the respect of the public. The degree of cooperation of the public that can be secured diminishes proportionately to the necessity of the use of physical force.
- Police see and preserve public favour, not by catering to public opinion but by constantly demonstrating absolute impartial service to the law and by offering of individual service and friendship to all members of society and by ready offering of individual sacrifice in protecting and preserving life.
- Police use physical force to the extent necessary to secure observance of the law or to restore order, only when the exercise of persuasion, advice and warning is found to be insufficient.
- Police should only use the minimum degree of physical force necessary.
- Police at all times should maintain a relationship with the public so that the police are the public and the public are the police.
[Interjection.]
- Police should always direct their actions strictly towards their functions and never [Interjection.] appear to usurp the powers of the judiciary by avenging individuals or the State or authoritatively judging guilt or punishing the guilty.
- And finally, the test of police efficiency is the absence of crime and

disorder, not the visible evidence of police action in dealing with it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Deal with the [Inaudible.]

Ms M M WENGER: These principles should be the test for police work and the standard we should hold our officers to. In addition, we need to look at how to prevent crime. If safety is everyone's responsibility, each individual has a responsibility to prevent crime. If we put individual action together, into collective action, the results can be remarkable.

Just look at what Neighbourhood Watch has managed to achieve. Look at what SIDS managed to achieve. We need to enable the whole of society to make our province safer. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Wenger. Hon member Olivier, sorry, I see hon member Christians trying really hard not to respond to the comments that are being thrown to him.

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.] he wants to pray for.

The SPEAKER: Yes, but the two of you need to pray for each other at a different time, not here today. So, if I could call you to order please. We cannot have these little one-on-one's. I see the next member, the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Listening to the Premier delivering the State of the Province Address reminded me just of how much the Democratic Alliance is seriously needed in the rest of the country. Our ability to stimulate the economy as we have so far done to create the almost half a million jobs since 2009 and reduce the current broad base unemployment rate to the lowest in the country should be hailed as a recipe for success. [Interjection.]

At least the ANC should be looking at the Western Cape, taking the recipe and implementing it across the country, even if they called it their own. That at least would be a clever ANC move. After all, would people care that it came from the DA? I hardly think so. Only that it would make a difference in their lives and the lives of their children. At least we know that our recipe of good governance and policies centred on economic inclusion and private sector driven growth works. [Interjection.]

We know. It will without doubt free our people from the ANC's corruption, their ineffectiveness and inability to transform the lives of our people and instead deliver on what every South African outside the Western Cape deserves.

While the DA speaks about Khulisa, a focused approach on growing the economy, the ANC talks about radical economic transformation and pays lip service for the past two years on a so-called Nine Point Plan. Let us compare the Western Cape's 70 000 new jobs in the fourth quarter to the latest jobs

numbers released by Stats SA for the rest of South Africa. Let us talk about the ANC's January the 8th statement predicting a 2.9% GDP growth for the year. A month later the President is stating that the economy was doing quite well at a revised 1.3% growth. A few weeks later the International Monetary Fund predicted a mere 0.8% growth for the same period. That is what the ANC calls radical economic transformation.

I say someone should go back to Economics 101. South Africa remains on a knife edge of being downgraded to junk status and the President states we are doing quite well. Last year, while the DA held a march about job creation in Johannesburg, the ANC's General Secretary, Gwede Mantashe, was quoted in *Fin24* saying "the DA is not serious about job creation."

An HON MEMBER: You know [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I do wonder if his opinion has at all changed just a little bit? Maybe it hasn't because the ANC as a whole doesn't have the ability to recognise a recipe of success or the good story we have to tell of the DA-run Western Cape. Actually, whether they do or whether they do not it is like water off a duck's back because wherever we are, we continue to serve all the people of South Africa. These members across from me, who will never ever admit it, also enjoy the benefit of the DA's effective service delivery that has been delivered in this province.

An HON MEMBER: You need to wake up.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: It is what the newspaper, the *Sowetan* wrote as an article a few days ago titled ‘Ten amazing stats that will make you wish you lived in the fairest Cape’.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Once again, the numbers do not lie. We have a clear applied plan from the start because in 2015 the Premier highlighted ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER:: ... the provinces strategic plan with five goals which would be achieved through eight focus interventions called Game-changers. So while the DA led Western Cape set out a course of infrastructure led economic growth the ANC made us believe that major events such as Eskom’s load shedding, followed by project Keep the Light’s On, was a legitimate crisis we were all facing. Instead, Madam Speaker, it was a get rich scheme for the benefit of a few companies. I ask at what cost to the economy? At what cost to the thousands of businesses and essential services such as hospitals that had to spend money purchasing back-up generators? At what cost to the future of South Africa’s growth? The black-outs cost South Africa’s economy an estimated R300 billion. Let us put that in perspective. Minister Pravin Gordhan is wanting to raise R43 billion for the Treasury over the next few years and the economy lost R300 billion to a get rich scheme for the elite few. .

Let me say this whether you are rich or whether you are poor, the ANC is going to take some of your money to pay for the incompetent wasteful expenditure of Government money and scams such as the Eskom black-out. And that is a fact. [Interjections.] .The people of this country are feeling it.

The ANC's Leader of the Opposition, member Magaxa, sitting across this House was reportedly complaining in a recent press statement that the Premier did not say how she was going to address farm worker issues and economic transformation, that she just reported on what they were doing over the past year and that the ANC was planning to press for major changes so that these issues and others like housing could be addressed. But member Magaxa clearly did not take note of Stats SA numbers, released by his Government last week, stating that rural unemployment in the Western Cape had fallen to 14%, the lowest ever recorded.

That Stats SA reported that employment in farming and agri-processing had increased by 40% in the last two years. [Interjections.] Surely, through you, Madam Speaker, member Magaxa must know that Harry Potter is a fictional character and the Western Cape does not have a magic wand to produce a magic result. Somewhere it must have been evident that the work that the DA-led Western Cape has been doing in this sector is producing the results.

Moreover the disingenuous comments made by the President around land is quite remarkable when we hear him say that the ANC will do all in its power to ensure that land is returned to the people [Interjections.] Well maybe the

ANC-led National Government should stop buying up the farm land and instead return the land by issuing title deeds to the recipients that rightly deserve it.

The Western Cape's approach to the economy is clearly in stark contrast to that of the ANC. While the Western Cape produces real jobs and real growth and makes a real difference to the people in this province the ANC feeds a personal, State captured, family interest approach propagated in the name of radical economic transformation.

Now let me end by quoting this very hard hitting headline that caught my eye in the *Mail and Guardian* by Jason Musyoka. He called this article, and I quote "The State is sick and while it's ill it can't fix the economy". Madam Speaker, the Democratic Alliance is seriously needed in the rest of South Africa. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. The hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to suggest that hon Schäfer attends an ANC study group on the economy - where she will, first of all, understand why it is that the DA wants growth without transformation. That the DA wants growth without redistribution, that the DA wants profits without fairness and that the DA wants only share schemes and not the transfer of land and sharing of land by the black majority, African, Coloured and Indian.

Member Schäfer will be told that we as the ANC not only believe that transformation needs to take place whether there is growth or not but that the ANC believes that real growth will only happen through transformation. Please come to a workshop.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I want to say, Premier, through the Deputy Speaker, that Premier Zille made much of the fact that her speech on Friday was her tenth State of the Province Address. What she did not mention was that in her first SOPA in 2009, over eight years ago, she promised to establish the Children's Commissioner. The Constitution of the Western Cape, which has been certified by the Constitutional Court, obliges that the Premier establishes both a Children's Commissioner as well as a Commissioner for the Environment.

There is not a choice in this matter. It is now 2017 and this province still has no Children's Commissioner, we have no Environment Commissioner. This makes a complete mockery of the DA's commitment to uphold ...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Why didn't you do it when you were in power? [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE ... defend the Constitution of the Western Cape and the Republic. Alongside ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, just one second. Hon Minister Winde, is it a question?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, is the hon member prepared to take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore? He is not prepared. [Interjections.] Please continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I trust that the time is being watched here. I have 20 minutes. Alongside her broken promises we witness the worsening position of children and youth in the Western Cape. Hon Mitchell, we should remember that you cannot do anything for the youth without the youth. The fact that this Premier has closed down youth participation, that there are no youth structures at the mayoral level is an indication that this DA wants to do things for youth and not with youth. [Interjections.]

Now when we look at the position of children and we are discussing the Children's Commissioner, a study conducted by UCT's Child Institute, as a follow up to the Medical Research Council, looked at two mortuaries, Salt River in the Western Cape and Phoenix in Durban. The teams reviewed 110 child murders with the most prevalent relating to teenage boys killed in conflict with peers or in gang violence. The second highest cause of child

murder was abuse with children under five years old particularly at risk.

The stats have already been quoted in this House today that in the latest Victims of Crime Survey it was found that households in our province had the highest percentage of households who indicated that they do not allow their children to play on their own in the area because of fear of crime, as well as not allowing their children to walk to school on their own, 34%.
[Interjection.]

This is in the context where for eight years the Premier has broken her promise to deliver a Children's Commissioner. I am not glorifying the role of the Children's Commissioner but I am convinced that the constant focus on the issue of children would have and still will assist and yet, Mr Deputy Speaker, it was Premier Zille who told the Standing Committee on the Department of Premier five years after making a promise that she had broken, that to appoint the Children's Commissioner and to quote her words "probably was not necessary and would cost a lot of money". Those were her exact words.

Now despite the people of the Western Cape having overwhelmingly rejected Premier Zille's attempt to amend the Constitution, which would have made the appointment of these commissions discretionary in 2015, we still have no Children's or Environmental Commissioner, and yet this is a so-called capable state, this is a so-called state that represents the rule of law.

This conduct, Mr Deputy Speaker, is unlawful and a breach of the Provincial and National Constitution. It is a disgrace. What really, hon members, lies behind the cynical breach of promise, and the conscious delaying tactics, is a very simple truth - Premier Zille and the DA are terrified at the public and media scrutiny which will flow once these commissions have been appointed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: All the time you did not do it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The cosy relationship the DA enjoys with certain unscrupulous developers, would be disturbed by the prying eyes of an Environmental Commissioner. We know, Madam Speaker, that the Premier is known as a good fund raiser for the DA. She has refused, over many years, to say how many of the hundreds of millions collected by the DA since she became Premier in 2009, have been donated by property developers, who have received favourable treatment from the DA provincial and local municipalities, and we are not holding our breaths, Mr Deputy Speaker, that she will tell us tomorrow when she responds.

How does the Premier, for example, explain that her government has failed to recover any, not a cent, of the millions lost due to the corrupt appointment of Filcon to build schools in our province? Filcon, when appointed, had numerous High Court liquidations pending, and was being run by Saul Loggenberg, who had been banned from doing business in the UK.

Once again the Premier has refused to answer a simple question, whether the

DA has received donations from Loggenberg and companies associated with him.

It is criminal that the lives of small black contractors in the City have been ruined by the City's appointment of Filcon. The City has also failed to institute proceedings to recover the money. It is fine for the filthy rich to get away ...[Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Name one!

Mr C M DUGMORE: I will name five – corruption under the DA and Helen Zille, and yet, we see, Madam Speaker, that the Premier apparently, with the active encouragement of the Chief Whip in this House and the MEC for Public Works and Transport, agreeing to the summary dismissal of the only DA MPL who took his oversight role seriously.

I am of course referring to hon Lennit Max. Is it not shocking that when I, as a member of the Transport Committee, propose that we visit Tafelberg for an *in loco* inspection, and a detailed committee discussion about this blatant attempt to prevent much needed housing in the inner City, the DA majority refused. [Interjections.] It is now becoming clearer to me, Mr Deputy Speaker, that with the knowledge ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order. Allow the member to continue please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is now becoming even clearer to me, Mr Deputy Speaker, that with the knowledge and acquiescence of the Premier, this committee was literally muzzled. Please assure me, hon Premier, that you were not in any way aware of the motivation to remove hon Max, but more about Trafalgar later.

The truth has a way of coming out and I predict so too will the truth emerge about which property developers have funded the DA over these years of so-called "good governance". Yes, the Auditor-General would not have picked this up, because he does not audit the DA's books, but watch this space.

The cynical game of stopping the Children's Commissioner and the Environmental Commissioner must stop, and that is why we as the ANC will, tomorrow morning in terms of Section 6 of the Public Protector Act 23 of 1994, report this matter to the Public Protector, that is the failure to appoint these commissioners, and request an urgent investigation. We will make the case, Mr Deputy Speaker, for a finding against the Premier and the DA in this province, and ask that they be obliged to take remedial action and appoint these commissioners without delay.

We know and are confident that such a finding will have to be implemented, unless of course they delay that further by taking that action on review. It is clear that since the first speech made by the Premier in 2009, when she inherited this province, governed by the ANC, that the material conditions facing the majority of our people, especially from the Coloured and African

communities, have worsened.

The stats on crime are there for all to see, the stats on the economy are there for all too see. A higher growth rate and less unemployment when the ANC governed, and the stats on housing delivery, where the housing delivery pace has slowed down since MEC Dyantyi from the ANC was the MEC for Housing. The facts speak for themselves. You look at the local governments, they will tell you.

Mr Deputy Speaker, my point about the interests which call the tune in the life of the DA, is also relevant in the next two issues I want to address. They are the Philippi Horticulture Association, and Tafelberg.

In regard to the Philippi Horticultural Association, which is essentially the food basket within Cape Town, we have a very serious problem, and I believe that that serious problem is the mayor of Cape Town. She has clearly gone completely rogue. The mayor of Cape Town has gone rogue, she is out of control. I will ask the messenger to give you, Premier, two documents just now, in case you have not seen them.

The first is a letter from the then Minister of Agriculture, to the City of Cape Town. It was formally received by the City on the 24th of July 2009. This letter explains the refusal of the application by the City to change the land use designation of certain erwen in Philippi Skaapkraal, from horticultural to urban development. It concludes, that letter, with the following words:

“It would jeopardise agriculture stand of protecting agriculture land for agricultural purposes, when similar developments are being applied for on adjacent or nearby properties. This will lead to a serious loss of agricultural land where economic agricultural practice is still being protected.”

2009 - National Department. Secondly, the legal opinion, and I will provide that to you, Premier, from the City’s own legal advisors. It concludes saying:

“It is clear from the comments of National Agriculture, that it does not support the application to change the land use, regardless of the City’s recommendation in this regard. Therefore it is unlikely that this development will be sanctioned. Even if the more accommodating approach of Provincial Agriculture is adopted, it is clear the National Agriculture wants to retain the integrity of the Philippi horticulture area as it currently exists.”

Now despite this, it is clear that the DA mayor and the former leader of the DA, we do not know if she will still be a member tomorrow, Patricia de Lille, has tried to stretch every single rule in the book to see that developers, Wentzel Oaker from Rapicorp and Johan Coetzee, be given the keys to the Philippi Horticultural area. – if the rogue mayor gets her way, 1 000 hectares of agricultural land will literally be paved over. The very area which is the primary recharge area for the Cape Flats aquifer.

The rogue mayor wants to allow the building of 30 000 houses for the wealthy, two shopping centres, a private school, a private prison. All of which will ultimately delete the 200 000 tons of vegetables produced every year.

We face a very serious human tragedy as well. There are over 15 informal settlements in the Philippi horticultural area, all on private land. We have hundreds of families, third generation families, Mr Deputy Speaker, who have been living and working on these farms. They have vested rights, but now we see the landowners are being tempted to sell their land, renting this land out to other tenants, who are in turn cutting off water and electricity to these families. They sit without services. Over 7 000 people work in the PHA, over 3 000 people, the poorest of the poor, are living there.

This cannot continue. I sincerely believe that the PHA campaign has huge support from across Cape Town, and there are very many reasons why we must retain this unique horticultural area, producing 150 000 tons a year.

Hon Premier, it is time to do the right thing for Cape Town and the province. As the ANC, we are participating in this debate to raise our critique, but also to make proposals. We are not disrupting procedures here, we are not walking out.

Firstly, Premier, you need to rein in the rogue mayor, that's number one. Invite her to Leeuwenhof for a fire side chat.

Secondly, convene, with our help, a meeting with all spheres of government, the relevant provincial and national departments, and the stakeholders involved. Let us find a solution to this.

Thirdly, as a sign of good faith, place a moratorium on all developing in the PHA.

Fourthly, appoint a team, and we as the ANC will help with this, to address the immediate humanitarian plight, of those living in shocking conditions there. The ANC Jean Davids branch in ward 43, will take you there and show you the human suffering which is happening on your doorstep. They are actively supporting the PHA as part of their branch programme of action, but I also want to make it very clear, Madam Speaker, to both the mayor and these developers, and the Premier, and any other developers who want to develop bricks and mortar in the PHA, that once the new Expropriation Bill is enacted into law, after the consultation process, we, as the ANC in this province, will make the case for expropriation.

In the end, if you do not demonstrate leadership on this matter, Premier, this may well be the only option. You are well aware of the provisions of our National Constitution, upon which the new Bill is based. These are that the public interest should be considered, and that not only market price should be considered, and other factors, including the history of acquisition, will also be considered.

Of course the developers need to be engaged. Let us really put the future of our City and province first, all of us, across party political lines on this matter. All of us have to identify well located public land for integrated human settlements belonging to national, provincial, local government, and also parastatals outside of the PHA.

I would also like to use this opportunity to pay tribute to the brave men and women from the PHA campaign. They are the real deal, warriors for justice. Do not lose hope, comrades, thank you for all your efforts. †Qina maqabane. [Be strong comrades.] [Interjections.] They are comrades, they are comrades, it is true.

Hon members, I turn now to Tafelberg. I want to strongly urge every member of this House to read the 115 page submission made by Ndifuna Ukwazi in response to the feasibility study released by the Department of Public Works. I want the National Minister of Housing to read it, and the MEC sitting here. I want the Minister of Public Works to read it, and the MEC sitting here.

It is the most shocking indictment of this DA Provincial Government. It exposes clear conflicts with addenda and back-up proof, of conflicts of interest, deliberate lies and distortions by MECs past and present. It points to the DA in this province kowtowing to the interests of rich developers and rich interests, and ignoring the poor.

Unless, hon Premier, you and your fellow MECs admit that you were wrong,

and now take a decision in support of affordable housing on Tafelberg, as part of a sustainable development in Sea Point, you will not only stand to be judged by history, but may also face prosecution for failing to implement the oath of office that you have attested to.

Not only will you lose an application to have your decision overturned if you do not reverse the sale, but members of your executive sitting here, may well find themselves liable for costs personally. Anyone who will take the time to read this, will understand, Mr Deputy Speaker, why I'm saying so.

This provincial government does not have a leg to stand on. The sale was illegal, the duplicity started with former MEC Carlisle, it continued with MEC Grant, who has tried to give the impression that any proceeds would go towards affordable housing, whereas it is clear from his own statements, that they want to use the proceeds to fund inner City developments to provide accommodation for provincial departments. He knows that.

Hon Premier, you know of and you are personally aware of the lawful and legitimate request by this province's own Department of Human Settlements.

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member

Mr C M DUGMORE: Seth Maqetuka has spoken to it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Hon Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: It is a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr M MNQASELA: The member is saying the Minister is deliberately lying, without using a substantive motion. I would like you to rule on that. [Interjections.] There is only one Deputy Speaker here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mngqasela, thank you for raising that. I will rule on that at the end of his speech. I will allow him to finish his speech, and I will rule about that. Hon member Dugmore, you may continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am saying that the hon Premier is aware of the request of their own provincial Department of Human Settlements, of her discussions with many people in the housing fraternity, and I can name the names of people who have spoken to her.

You know that the province has not complied with GIAMA, you know that the Department of Transport and Public Works failed to appoint a functional provincial property committee under the Western Cape Land Administration Act. Speak to the people on that committee.

Do you know, hon Premier, that when they received a proposal to consider this, they were not even informed that the Department of Human Settlements wanted to use this land. Is that not completely misleading? Is that not distortion? Is that not lying? By keeping information away from the very committee that you want to make a decision about this? Speak to those members of the committee, and ask them were they given that information?

Like with the Philippi Horticultural Association land, we need to resolve this matter. Those who attempted to purchase this land under false pretences, should be engaged. All of us, once again, need to do the right thing. We need social housing as part of a sustainable development on that site. This will pave the way for many more. For example, there is vacant land along South Road, which can accommodate further housing, without destroying the existing houses there.

Let us come to our senses and route the MyCiti phase 2 down the Landsdowne Corridor, which was always the intention. There is no need to build a new, expensive and disruptive road in South Road.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I must also express my sincere disappointment that the Premier did nothing to condemn the statements by certain individuals in regard to Tafelberg, to speak on behalf of the Jewish community. Calling on Jewish people not to attend a public meeting to discuss Tafelberg. How can such people attempt to speak on behalf of all Jewish people? And in fact, in reality, try and intimidate Jewish citizens into not showing solidarity with the

domestic workers seeking accommodation close to their place of work.

I know many Jewish people who felt that others should not speak in their name. To imply that no Jewish people support social housing at Tafelberg is an insult, and you, Premier, were, as far as I know, completely silent on this matter. The Western Cape, after eight years of DA rule and Helen Zille as Premier, is a worse place to live [Laughter.] for the majority of citizens – it is, for the majority of citizens who are African and Coloured, and working class.

We are very happy with the clean audits, that's how – hold on, that's how it should be, but when the truth emerges about funding to the DA from unscrupulous developers, it will become clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this provincial leadership has been captured. That this provincial leadership has been captured by ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...the elite, the privileged ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon Premier?

Mr MNQASELA: Name those [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: This is a direct insinuation that members of this House are

corrupt, and have raised money from developers, who then had their plans approved, with a direct link between the donation and the approval of plans. That is completely unacceptable, and a direct inference ... [Interjection.] that Members on this side of the House have been involved ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I hear the point of order. Hon member Dugmore, on that specific point by the Premier, are you referring to members of this House as being corrupt?

An HON MEMBER: It is very painful.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry, can I address you Mr Deputy Speaker? I would like to quote what I said exactly:

“But when the truth emerges about funding to the DA from unscrupulous developers, it will become clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this provincial leadership ...”

I am referring to the leadership of the DA.

An HON MEMBER: That is us.

Ms P Z LEKKER: There!

Mr C M DUGMORE:

“...has been captured, captured by the elite, captured by the privileged and the wealthy.”

That is what I said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, yes, we have the convention that a member may refer to the party in general, and I am going to ask you now also, are you referring to members sitting across the floor here as being corrupt? Just a yes or no.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I am referring to the DA as a political organisation, that is who I am referring to.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then you can proceed. Hon member Dugmore, while I am busy speaking, let me then – order – let me then deal with the question ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker. Let me refer to the point raised by the hon Mnqasela. The words that the member used, and I jotted it down when you said it, was:

“Deliberate lies told by MECs past and present.”

HON MEMBERS: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now that clearly refers to MECs not here anymore, and I do not have a big issue with that, they are not protected here, but when you refer to:

“Deliberate lies of MECs present.”

Which implies, without question, they are sitting across the floor of the House. That is unparliamentary. You may tone it down to say, to use the word “untruths”, then it is acceptable, but to say “deliberate lies” or “lies” on its own is also unparliamentary. So please withdraw that.

Mr C M DUGMORE: If I can just address you on that quickly, just to get some clarity? I am specifically referring to a 115 page document, submitted by Ndifuna Ukwazi in response to the development proposals for ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore ...[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: In this document, there are specific allegations raised at least about untruths ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...at least about untruths, perpetrators ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, just one second. I am not talking about the political points, what is in the document or not. I am talking about the words uttered in the House, and in our debates, any reference to a member across the floor as “deliberately telling lies” is clear-cut case unparliamentary and you must withdraw that. Please withdraw that.

An HON MEMBER: Please withdraw.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, if I then indicate to you that I am accusing these hon MECs of telling untruths, is that acceptable?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is acceptable. [Interjection.] Are you finished with your speech?

Mr C M DUGMORE: No. So, Chairperson, out of respect for your ruling ... [Interjection.] I will withdraw the comments that you asked me to withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed if your speech is not done. Are you done?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would just like to ask if I could be told, after all these disruptions, how much time I have left, because ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have one and a half minutes left.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay, thank you. As I was saying, that we will see from this funding to the DA, that it will become clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this provincial DA has been captured by the elite, the privileged and the wealthy ...

†'n AGBARE LID: Dit maak seer nê.

[An HON MEMBER: It is hurting, hey.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: because we know that the DA wants growth without transformation. We know that the DA wants growth without redistribution. We know that the DA wants profits without fairness. We know that the DA wants only share schemes and not the transfer and sharing of land by the black majority, African, Coloured and Indian, and when the majority of people see the truth, the DA's days will be numbered.

We as the ANC not only believe that transformation has to take place, whether there is growth or not, but we as the ANC believe that real growth

will only happen through transformation. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, I have headed my speech, I started by writing down two reasons why, I ended up by saying one reason why, and I am going to get to that in a moment, but I think before I do that, and I might run out of time, so I am actually going to first of all deal with Mr Dugmore, the hon member Dugmore.

You know, the hon member Dugmore comes here, the first part of his speech, if you go and have a look at Hansard, is actually just a rehash of stuff that he has brought here before, which is absolute, and I am going to go a whole lot of untruths ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But the promises are broken. That is why we have to deal with it.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So I think that the hon member Dugmore, when he comes here, he must have the guts to come here with detail and go outside with the facts, and not the untruths that he brings here to this House.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Say it outside!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But, Mr Deputy Speaker, let me say to you that the hon member Dugmore made one massive mistake, because when he decided, or when the ANC decided to put him in as a speaker today, he decided to ask social media for help with regards to the detail of his speech ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, just one second. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, the MEC ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. The MEC is threatening another member here, and he is even using the “f” word. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Using the “f” word?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Which MEC?

Mr S G TYATYAM: That member. Donald. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I did not ...[Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: He even said “let us meet outside now.” You did not say that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, please take your seat. Hon Minister Grant, I did not hear anything, did you say that?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I invited the hon member Dugmore to repeat what he sees in that paper, to me outside this House. [Laughter.][Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. That definitely was not a point of order, and I did see the Minister wanting to roll up his sleeves, but we will not go there. [Laughter.]

The hon member Dugmore made a big mistake by going to social media, to say I have got to speak in this debate, please give me some detail on what to speak about, specifically around the PHA.

Now that was a massive mistake, because if you follow the line, and I actually ask most members to go and have a look at this line, the ANC got klapped from one side to the other, because hon member Dugmore went out there to say he wants to come out and then they started asking him about

expropriation, and they asked him a whole lot of things, but I will just quote, and I quote some of the words of member Dugmore in one of his replies. He said, and I quote:

“So, yes, our movement and some of its leaders have made and continue to make mistakes, and act in ways that deeply concerns me.”

This was in reply to one of the questions. [Interjections.] Of course, the hon member Dugmore also talks about land policy, and I am going to get to land ownership just now in my speech, but one of the areas, and actually I have put the challenge already in this House ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, yes? Order, order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask a very serious question. I would like to ask whether the MEC will accept a serious question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you accept a question? The answer is yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Will the MEC be prepared to publish, for all of this House, the full transcript of every discussion that happened, because you obviously have a spy on my Facebook page [Laughter.] but would you be prepared to publish the full Facebook discussion about this matter? Would you be prepared to do that?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is a busy man.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not need to publish it. All of you can go onto his Facebook page and have a look at it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] not my friends on Facebook.

An HON MEMBER: It is a public document.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is a public document, it is out there and he answered it. In actual fact, if you want to scroll down, because there was about 500 comments altogether, if you want to scroll down, it is actually a lady by the name of Moira Edmonds, and the discussion is – I do not know, I think she is an EFF member now, anyway, but quite frankly, the hon member Dugmore also talks about the land policy.

I am in this House and I will talk about it again just now, but I put a challenge, because the hon member Dugmore speaks about land ownership. Now in this House I have 31 lease-hold questions that the National Minister of, Minister Nkwinti, has for some black farmers for five years, not given them a lease.

I want to know if the hon member Dugmore will join me in a court case

against that Minister, about getting land ownership for those specific members. [Applause.] The hon member also comes and talks to this House about expropriation, “And you just wait until the expropriation.” I want to warn the members of the PHA that that will be really disastrous, because the next thing you will find is the PHA will be owned by the Guptas.

HON MEMBERS: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But quite frankly, Mr Dugmore needs to come to this House with facts and not untruths, and he must be bold enough to take these outside of the House.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is that the best you can do?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, let me come to my speech. [Interjection.] My speech was headed, first of all, “Two Reasons”, “Two Reasons Why”. What were the two reasons that gave the Premier the opportunity to put some of these amazing numbers on the table, and there were two reasons.

The first reason was good governance, and good governance that has been put in place over time in this province. That is the first reason, that gave the Premier the opportunity to go through all these points.

The PREMIER: Absolutely!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The second reason was the ANC. The second reason that all these numbers are outstanding in this province, is because of the ANC. Why? Because the ANC is in opposition. They are not in government in this province, the ANC is opposition.

So why is the unemployment rate 13.8% lower than in any other ANC, or the national average run by the ANC? Why is that? Because they are in opposition, they are not in government. Why 56% of mortgage bonds for repeat buyers, who are semigrating to the Western Cape, come from Gauteng? 56.2%, why?

An HON MEMBER: Because they are in opposition.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Because they are in opposition, exactly. Why 75% of SA's venture capital deals are in the Western Cape? Because the ANC in this province is in opposition.

Why are the tourist numbers the way that they are in this province? The arrivals, the growth, 16%, because the ANC is in opposition. Why in this province is the backlog in title deeds only 28% and not 59%, in the backlog, in handing out title deeds for the land that the hon member Dugmore was

talking about? That very same land, why? 59% in ANC run provinces.

Mr C M DUGMORE: One percent [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is because the ANC is in opposition in this province. 234 new Wi-Fi hotspots coming, R45 for 5 Gigs, it has been mentioned by other members on this side of the House in this debate. Why is that happening? Because the ANC is not in government, they are in opposition in this province.

Why are we seeing the education hits on the, that the Premier spoke about in her address. The education hits on the internet pages moving in 2015 from 375 million, to 3.8 billion hits in education on our systems and on the internet platforms, why is that? Because the ANC does not govern this province.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly, they are failing.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: 27% of building plans increase in this province, and a 6% decline in all the other provinces put together. Jobs up 40% in agriculture, 97% of the fires put out within one hour.

These are the points that I have just raised, were the points that the hon member Schäfer spoke about, that was written about the Premier's speech

in the Sowetan. Those ten points, why so many people want to come to the Western Cape. Why do they want to come to the Western Cape? Because the ANC is in opposition. That is why they want to come here.

Jobs growth is two times faster in this province than in Gauteng, two times faster. This province is 14% of South Africa's economy, Gauteng is 34% of South Africa's economy, and we grow twice the speed of Gauteng. Why? Because the ANC sits on that side in this House.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is not going to be long, it is not going to be long before you are going to sit this side.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Business confidence, why is business confidence so much higher in this province than any other province in this country? [Interjection.] You know why. Why? It is because of those two reasons: good governance on this side, and the ANC is in opposition on the other side.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Why is it that MoneyWeb, and I have mentioned this before, "could Cape Town challenge Johannesburg as South Africa's economic hub?" Why do people write that? It is because a different party governs in this province.

What we have been quoting and the numbers, it is about South Africa having found an alternative to leaving the country, move to Cape Town. This study, go and read the study, go and read it and see why at 17.4% of its repeat home buying, no other province's net inflow of repeat homebuyers comes close the Western Cape, according to the banks' repeat homebuyer study of 2017. Go and read this.

Go and read these things. Why is it that 654 000 square meters of commercial and residential developments were approved for construction in the Western Cape, almost nine times the 75 000 square meters approved in Gauteng for the same period?

Mr C M DUGMORE: And what about Durban?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Why is it? Gauteng was the next, not Durban. Why is that? It is because wherever the ANC governs at the moment, they fail. They fail dismally.

And why is it that the Premier spoke about the economy, about PSG 1? About growth and jobs, to which, when you have a look at the answers in the newspapers, post the State of the Province address, the kind of complaints coming from the opposition in this province, say the Premier should not have spoken about the economy. Well, of course she needs to speak about the economy, because through the economy, through growth, through jobs, guess

what happens? There is more tax into the system, so we can actually spend more money in our schools and our hospitals, we reduce poverty, the Gini coefficient changes.

All of these things change because we are getting the growth and jobs, because we are creating the confidence, and because the economy is growing. They are all changing because the ANC does not govern this province.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Do you know that I have said it before in this House that when the ANC stand up in debate, they never ever use examples of how they excel in any topic, in any subject, on any department, in any other province, or at national level.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, I talked about Gauteng.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Not one answer was given, not one bragging statement was given. Why? Because in those provinces they govern.

If we want to make a difference in those provinces, the people in those provinces, the voters in those provinces, should put them in opposition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, just one second. Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you ask the MEC to stop pointing fingers?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, you have heard the request.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I will try, Mr Deputy Speaker. So, let us have a look at the hon Leader of the Opposition and his speech, and what he had to say, and, you know, he started off with coming with the jobs numbers, but either somebody wrote his speech, because he definitely did not look at Stats SA details. Now I also have some issues with Stats SA, and I will put it straight out here, because I actually think that the numbers that we have got in the Western Cape are slightly different. I think they are actually more, but we will accept the Stats SA numbers, because those are the numbers that we have at the moment. He spoke about the province with the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa, and that is Limpopo with 19.3%. This is the narrow unemployment rate.

Now that study group that the hon member Dugmore spoke about, obviously that member, the Leader of the Opposition, never attends that study group, because that study group obviously does not have mechanisms to discuss economics 101.

An HON MEMBER: A lower population.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: There is a massive difference between narrow and broad unemployment, and not only in the percentage which is the massive difference in South Africa, between the South African narrow and broad, it is a massive percentage that the ANC should all hang their heads in shame, because of it, but let us have a look at the narrow.

19.3% in Limpopo, 20.5% in the Western Cape, but the Western Cape's broad unemployment rate is 23.6%, in Limpopo it is 36.3% There is only one province in South Africa whose unemployment rate – and it is too high, is in the 20's, only one province, broad unemployment. It is this province, where the ANC is in opposition.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hear-hear.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In the other provinces where the ANC is in government, the lowest provinces are Gauteng with 32.8% and Limpopo with 36.3% They are the only two provinces with a 30%, or in the 30s in unemployment.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And every single other province, also governed by the ANC, are in the 40% unemployment rate. Absolutely embarrassing, and the reason that those unemployment rates are so high, is because the ANC is in government in those provinces, and it does not know what it is doing in government.

Then let us get to broadband. He decides to attack broadband, and he obviously does not know that there is a roll-out in broadband, he is still stuck three years ago, or four years ago, when we were getting the roll-out happening. Now I want to help the hon member, and perhaps if he cannot do it directly ...

An HON MEMBER: On social media.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... he can probably – yes, on social media, the same place that I saw member Dugmore. Go to your App Store and download an app called “WiFinder”. WiFinder, and when you get there you just tap the app, and the app will load. You can do this in your study group as well [Laughter.][Applause.] and when you open this app, you have got a choice. You can go to a list and you can list – you see these lists here? These lists are all the free Wi-Fi hotspots in this province.

You can also, if you want to, go to a map of the province, because you might be travelling in the province, and you can go to a map, you can zoom in. If

you see, when I zoom into this map, you can zoom in, and when you go in, wherever you are, you hit the button, you see all the Wi-Fi hotspots there, you hit the hotspot, it will tell you exactly where it is, and if you do not know exactly where it is, then you go to “go there”, and when you say “go there”, it links into your GPS, and look, it shows you exactly how to get there from where you are.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, workshop!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Now this is technology, I know ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: This is technology, I know, and probably a bit confusing ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms M N GILLION: No, you are now in the circus. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please, calm down, afford the – order. Hon Minister, you can continue once everything has calmed down.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I heard the question, “We need data.” These are the free Wi-Fi hotspots. If you don’t have data, you can download that onto your system without the data, and it will still show you how to get there or where that free Wi-Fi hotspot is, and then, guess what when you get there? You will find some of the cheapest data in the country once you have used your free data.

So you get free data when you get there, and then you will get some of the cheapest free data in South Africa. R45 for 5 Gigabytes, and I heard them talking about Gauteng. Go to Gauteng and try. I promise you, four times more expensive. Four times more expensive, but perhaps what we will do, and I know my time is probably starting to run out. So ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to talk now to the point that was raised about land. I know that the hon member Dugmore spoke about it in his speech, specifically referencing the PHA and some state owned land, but I want to also start with where the President started off with this speech. He purposefully racially categorises things, and then talks about total untruths in his speech, and he says in South Africa less than 10% of land is transferred into black hands, implying that 90% of land – and I am not going to go through the whole, you know, report of the 122 081 300 hectares

of land in South Africa, or the 18 million hectares of communal, or the 12 million of – and so you go through 8 million, the R6 billion that has been paid out and 3 million hectares that have already been handed over. The 38 million that is already transferred.

What I really want to talk about is, in any principle, if you want to reach a result, you need, and you want to manage something, you need data. You need to be able to manage something with data. Now 23 years in government, land a big issue for South Africans, a massive issue, that this government on this side, at a national level and in the other provinces, do not hand over title deeds. It is a big issue, it is an emotive issue, and if you really want to manage it, you should measure it. The old adage, “If you can’t measure it, you can’t manage it”, and still today in this country, we do not really know for sure, because we do not measure it.

So I want to enlist the members of this House, I want to enlist if they are really serious about transfer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Then help me ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Come to the study group.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Just finish off the sentence.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Then help me convince Minister Nkwinti to at least give those 32 members their land. On the 15th of March, on the 19th of April, on the 17th of August, on the 31st of June and on the 7th of February, I officially wrote to Minister Nkwinti, and to date not one answer. Not one. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You do not care about land ownership in this country. [Interjections.][Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Please come to order. That concludes the debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address. The hon Premier will reply to the debate on Thursday at 14:15. That concludes the business of the House. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:42