

---

THURSDAY, 21 FEBRUARY 2019

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Order! Good afternoon hon members. Good afternoon to our guests in the gallery. It is indeed a privilege for me to welcome you here today. However, I do need to draw your attention to the rules of the gallery. Kindly ensure that your cell phones are on silent, no flash photography and that you do not interfere with the proceedings of the House. That includes no clapping, no cheering and no interjections. Thank you, but feel free to be with us for this sitting. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

SECRETARY: Reply to the Debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Secretary. I will now afford the hon, the Premier an opportunity to reply to the debate.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: The hon the Premier. [Applause.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Before I begin, will you allow me the opportunity of also adding my word of welcome to the people in the gallery, with you? It was a very great and pleasant surprise for me today to see some of the first people that I recruited to the organisation, the Democratic Alliance, when I was working in the constituency that borders the N2 on both sides.

†AGBARE LEDE: Hoor-hoor! [Applous.]

[Hon MEMBERS: Hear-hear. [Applause.]]

The PREMIER: And it is very heart-warming and moving to me today to see that they have taken the trouble to come and listen to my last reply to a State of the Province Address.

†Namkelekile nonke ndiyanithanda.

[You are all welcome. I love you.]

†UMnu S G TYATYAM: Ngabantu baphi abo?

[Mr S G TYATYAM: Where are those people from?]

The PREMIER: It does make me feel... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, could I get the House to order please. The Premier is on her feet.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you hon Premier. I would also like to thank my colleagues on this side of the House for being the incredible team that they are... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: And on this side!

The PREMIER: I am coming to that side of the House right now. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Beware!

The PREMIER: And for elaborating on various aspects of the SOPA, doing more justice than I could have in the relatively brief time that I had at my disposal to set out all of their extraordinary successes, and I am grateful to

have had copies of all of their speeches because it just shows me what is possible for South Africa if a government focuses, keeps its eyes on the prize of what we can be and does its job properly, and thank you very much, you have been exceptional.

Then I would like to come to the hon the Opposition, and let me start on the bright side, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Are we the honourable?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Stay there.

The PREMIER: There was one point in the hon member Magaxa's speech that I agreed with, and let me start with what that is. He is quite right, I am strongly anti-communist. [Laughter.] And anybody with the slightest understanding of history of the concept of freedom and of the notion of compassion would be anti-communist. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: And only you understand this history; you are the only person who are anti-communist?

Mr S G TYATYAM: You are the owner of... [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: It is a complete contradiction in terms to wage a liberation struggle to achieve communism and I am about to explain why. Communism

is the antithesis of liberation and freedom, the very antithesis, but what communism has done, Madam Speaker, is it has added some very important words to the English language. Words like democide, classicide, politicide, genocide... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: So communism is about words now.

The PREMIER: ...all of those words are used to describe the different forms of mass murder undertaken by communist regimes in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: The English principally.

The PREMIER: I looked up seven different sources on the number of deaths caused by communist systems of ordinary people ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Then tell us about the national genocide.

The PREMIER: The lowest estimate is 65 million... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: The land of genocide of apartheid...

The PREMIER: ...at the very lowest and the highest is 161 million people dead, and whichever way you look at it, it is horrific. The concept of communism and progressivism or freedom are complete contradictions in

terms, but I will continue to defend the hon member Magaxa's right to remain as deluded as he is. Now why has communism caused such misery, Madam Speaker?

It is because communists believe that the great leader of the very small vanguard knows what is good for everybody else and that, through the state that they control entirely, they have a right to control society and they can have a right to force people to do what they want them to do. [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is the DA, that is what you do.

The PREMIER: And that can only result in oppression... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: ...coercion, force and ultimately murder and mass starvation as we have seen throughout history. [Interjection.] Our political philosophy is the exact opposite. We believe that we have to maximise freedom and choice so that individuals can chart their own course in life, that they can learn from their mistakes and their successes and through hard work they can ensure a better life for their children and so we believe the role of the State is to protect people's rights and freedoms; to extend opportunities to them. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, because it is not happening [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And to provide those things to people that they cannot reasonably be expected to provide for themselves. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Premier, kindly just take your seat. Hon member Tyatyam, there was a debate. We had an opportunity to provide input. The Order Paper today says the Premier's Response. Interjections are allowed but no running commentary. Maybe you could listen and then if you have questions pose them through the Chair to the Premier. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. We sum up our political philosophy as a government in our Vision Statement. We want to lead the Western Cape to become a highly skilled innovation driven, resource efficient, connected high opportunity society for all.

Now I am not surprised the hon Dugmore is not here today, because he really dug a big hole for himself by saying that our vision does not include the concept of redress.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Does it?

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, it is premised on the concept of redress.

Ms P Z LEKKER: So a selected few.

The PREMIER: Redress is interwoven into every word of our Vision Statement. [Interjections.] For example, skilled and highly-skilled: “Skills”, President Mandela said, “is the best form of redress because it gives people the opportunity to improve their circumstances.” [Interjections.]

“Innovation” means new ways of doing things that make it easier and more possible for people to advance.

“Resource efficient” means that we do not steal people’s money so that we can spend 82% of our budget on service delivery to the poor. That is redress. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The PREMIER: A government that does not steal your money but spends it on service delivery to the poor.

Mr S G TYATYAM: But you do not report about the money!

The PREMIER: “Connected” means redress, because a digital economy, the only way to connect to a digital economy is through access to the internet which brings opportunities in which you can live your freedom and using your opportunities as each individual is redress. That is the redress that creates progress and advancement and the DA does real redress by opening opportunities, by spending the money where it needs to be spent, by building



skills, by growing the economy and by linking people with skills to a growing economy. That is sustainable and permanent redress. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr K E MAGAXA: They do not believe a word that you said.

The PREMIER: What is the ANC's - you did not understand what I said.

Mr K E MAGAXA: They do not hear, your own people.

The PREMIER: What is the ANC's version of redress? What is the ANC's version of redress? I will show you Madam Speaker what the ANC's version of redress is. Here it is. This is the summary of ANC style redress that the hon member Dugmore spoke about.

The headline in the *Financial Mail* this week says: "Eskom's lost decade: 12 chief executive officers, 6 chairmen, 60 directors, 30 executives, who were paid R514 million." [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Outrageous! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And then they ask the question: "For what actually, for what actually?" [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We want to help [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And of course Dugmore would answer: "For redress." But what happened, R514 million - that is half a billion rand, went to a handful of people because of their political connections. That is ANC-style redress. They enriched the few to impoverish the many. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: You must go to the Zondo Commission. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: During the ANC's time in office the economy was so undermined that almost ten million people are now unemployed. That is the entire population of a country like Sweden, for example. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: She must go to the Zondo Commission.

The PREMIER: We now have almost ten million people unemployed because of ANC-style redress. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Go to the Zondo Commission. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: And what happened to Eskom does not even touch the Shaiks and the Watsons but it does touch the Guptas, because when we had load-shedding at the end of last year it was because the Optimum Coal Mine

that the Gupta's bought with the help of the then Minister of Minerals...

[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Still your friends.

The PREMIER: ...had gone into business rescue after giving too many kickbacks to politicians.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hey, look who is talking.

The PREMIER: And while we have load-shedding in South Africa and while people are not being paid because mines are going into business rescue, the Guptas are in Dubai holding a R100 million rand wedding on taxpayer's money from South Africa.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Disgusting.

The PREMIER: That is ANC-style redress. [Applause.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Jo! Scandalous! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And then more than that, more than that, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: More than that, Madam Speaker, the Guptas are protected from paying tax and they are protected from prosecution. So I can summarise and we all need to understand ANC redress to what I call the Seven Cs, sailing the Seven Cs is the ANC's version of redress and Madam Speaker, the first C is a political philosophy rooted in communism. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please. Hon member Dyantyi, take your seat please.

The PREMIER: It is called the "National Democratic Revolution."

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, I was listening to the Cs. It is like she is in a class [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: But it is actually communism. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi! Hon Premier, please take your seat. Please take your seat hon Premier. Hon member Dyantyi, you have just arrived. There is no "she" in this House.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am arriving yes [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: The hon Premier is on her feet and you will address her in such a way as an hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Incorrect.

Mr D G MITCHELL: And your Premier.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You have now made a grand entrance. Compose yourself. You may proceed hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. The Seven Cs of ANC transformation, start with communism as embedded in the National Democratic Revolution. Then it has to go to centralisation; central control in a supreme leader and his cronies. That results in crony capitalism instead of the National Democratic Revolution, which immediately is followed by corruption and a criminal state... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is not the truth; you are not supposed to [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...which means the accountability mechanisms like the National Prosecuting Authority and the South African Revenue Services are captured and then there are no consequences and that is why the ANC stands for Absolutely No Consequences for anyone.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: And that is the political philosophy, absolutely no

consequences so by stealing... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Socialism.

The SPEAKER: No finger pointing please.

The PREMIER: ...stealing in the name of redress.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, there is finger pointing happening across the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can continue, Premier.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, so I need to call both sides of the House to order, thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I like a just system. [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: So the connected few have earned a fortune, Madam Speaker, by stealing in the name of what hon member Dugmore calls “redress”.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: By stealing the hard-earned money of a tiny 1% of the population who pay 53% of all personal income tax. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is really getting into the taxpayers now.

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And then they arrest only the whistleblowers.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: O ja!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh yes!]

The PREMIER: But as they say in the advertisements on television, colleagues... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is really spoiling her whole discourse.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: There is more; there is more ANC redress coming.

An HON MEMBER: Beware!

The PREMIER: If we read Eskom's redress plan that the hon member Dugmore was talking about it says that by next year Eskom has to get rid of another 1308 people because they are white.

HON MEMBERS: Yoh! Yoh!

The PREMIER: A third of them... [Interjections.] A full third of them are engineers.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is not a fact Ma'am. Do not tell me you have come here to speak about this... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: A full third of them are engineers.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You speak about [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: And other middle-management technicians whose only sin, and this is a phrase the ANC will understand, whose only sin is the colour of their skin. [Interjections.] We thought we were getting away from that system. [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Another sort of [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: That is racist! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am so disappointed in your last research.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker!



The PREMIER: Now of course the people who are being fired from Eskom or being retrenched from Eskom or given voluntary severance packages by Eskom because of the colour of their skin are highly skilled and they are being snapped up worldwide especially in middle-eastern countries, who understand that the end of the oil-and-coal era is near. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Tell us what happened to Germany.

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] We want them to go.

The PREMIER: And they have to diversify, they have to diversify their energy economies... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: People must go anyway.

The PREMIER: ...and retrenched South African experts are the best to do that and all over the Middle East the reconstruction and the repurposing of energy economies is being led by ex-Eskom employees, while Eskom falls into complete ruin. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: I will be happy if you can tell us about... [Inaudible.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: And black engineers are not employed also.

The PREMIER: And while Pravin is desperately trying to bring expertise

back into Eskom, Madam Speaker, Eskom Human Resources is trying to get rid of that same expertise. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is that your response to the SOPA debate.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: That is why the ANC can never self-correct. It can never self-correct.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I was also wondering about that.

The PREMIER: And anybody who believes that the ANC can self-correct is going to take South Africa into another ten wasted years.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is that your only response to the debate? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are wasting taxpayer's money.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The sangoma told you this. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Did you really think you can change it today?

The PREMIER: Eskom, Madam Speaker, Eskom is massively overstuffed and massively under-skilled. Now put those two things together... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are childish!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The men are fit; the men are fit for purpose.

The PREMIER: ...and instead of fixing the problem... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are childish.

The PREMIER: So I would like to say to the hon member Dugmore in his absence do not come to this House and lecture us on redress, because ANC style redress is still going to destroy South Africa.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Do not come to preach us on something that you do not even understand [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! Hon Premier, kindly take your seat. Hon member Tyatyam, should you wish to rise on a point of order you do so.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You should address her now.

The SPEAKER: The Premier is replying to the debate. The debate was a political debate and I am allowing the Premier latitude... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just listen!

The SPEAKER: ...to get to the relevance that hon member Dyantyi and hon member Magaxa is calling for. So you may proceed, hon Premier.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may. I am sorry. Take your seat, hon Premier.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, you are not going to get what you want from us.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You are making noise.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We are not going to sit here, be like children taught in a class. [Interjection.] You are wasting the time of this Premier to finish the response.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is her right.

Mr M G E WILEY: Please leave!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact you are disrupting the sitting... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Please leave!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry take your seat, please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can you please stop that thing.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, take your seat.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We understand that you are a speaker from the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, take your seat please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...but it does not matter if you are a DA leader, DA Speaker, please.

The SPEAKER: As the Speaker of this House, if I may address you hon member Magaxa. I have a duty. I have a duty to ensure the dignity and decorum of this House. [Interjections.] You get politics and then you get bad manners.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So to call me out, to call me... [Interjection.] Hon member Magaxa, may I address you?

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Address me.

The SPEAKER: I am speaking to you. You are sitting down and talking to me. You need to rise if you wish to address when I am done. I am not going to, and you might call me the schoolteacher.

An HON MEMBER: Arise, ja.

The SPEAKER: And I might teach you; treat you like a child and send you to the naughty-corner, but I am not going to allow you to be rude and disrespectful in this House. [Interjections.] Should you not want to hear the reply you have the option of leaving but you are not going to be here and be rude and disrespectful. That is the point. So mind your composure. Mind yourself. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker. The relevance is the concept of redress. The hon the Opposition repeatedly accused us of not understanding or applying redress and I am explaining that we are the only party in this House who actually understands and applies redress. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You do not! You obviously do not have a clue!

The PREMIER: And let me add another thing.

†UNksz P MAKELENI: Chosi ngantsomi.

[Ms P MAKELENI: It never happened.]

The PREMIER: The hon member Dugmore should not come to this House and lecture us about tender processes and the use of public money.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: There was one columnist who said... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Just lecture us again.

The PREMIER: ... very insightfully this week: “For any ANC official to stand up in public and breathe even one word about public money is more than bad manners and poor taste. It is abuse.” [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He must be a white racist!

An HON MEMBER: It must be your friend. He must be your friend. That is why.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa!

The PREMIER: "...and it is abuse to have the nerve to come here and talk to us about the use of public money is pure cheek." [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, that is a white racist that said that. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You must check your manners too by the way.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, kindly take your seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Tell us about it. You came to explain us here.

The SPEAKER: I think it is important for the country to see what is actually happening in this House. There is politics and there is sheer bad manners. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Tell us! [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: According to you!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, you are being disrespectful. I am speaking and you are shouting from your seat. The first Rule of Parliament is to wait until someone else - take your seat. I am speaking. Take your seat please. You need to wait to be recognised and then you stand and then you



speak. I am addressing the House and you are launching into your own attack on the Premier. It is unparliamentary, hon Tyatyam, and I am not going to allow this House to degenerate into a circus. So manage yourself otherwise you run the risk of being sent out purely because you cannot maintain the dignity and decorum of this House. I will not have it become a shebeen. Thank you. Yes, hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you Madam Speaker. I think we all want this House to be like any other House that each and every one of us be treated with respect, that there are no insinuation that will tell you, you would be sent to a naughty-corner, and if that is the case, Madam Speaker, I think I want to put it the House that at least we need not to hear you speaking at all times because whilst you are engaging with the rest of the people here, you are also causing chaos. So I am hereby appealing and requesting the Speaker of the House to conduct this House and treat each and every one of us equally... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Equally, that is all we are asking.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...not as if some are blue and some are red. I thank you Madam Speaker.

Ms P MAKELENI: That is all we are asking.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, your point is sustained. However, let

me bring the attention of the House and the gallery to the fact that your howling necessitates me to call the House to order and since you arrived you have been instrumental in that backbench of chirping and howling. So it is my duty, if the interjections become too loud and they drown out the speaker and if you do not follow the simple rules, wait to be recognised, stand on your feet. These are basic principles, after 57 months you should know. What example are we setting as an institution to the electorate out there? We should be the example. We should be the example and the reference to schoolchildren is relevant, because you know that schoolchildren behave better sometimes, I think, than the members of this House do, and that is why I am saying we need to be the example to the electorate. All I am asking you, you can do your politics, but do it with dignity and respect please. Thank you. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

Sorry hon member Wenger. Premier, kindly take your seat, there is a member on the floor. Hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, on a point of order, my recollection of the Rules states that the ruling of the Speaker may not be questioned.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely!

Ms M M WENGER: And therefore I would like to raise a point of order on the hon member's point earlier. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Wenger. Your point is sustained. Hon member Magaxa. You see, again here we have it, two members on their feet without being recognised. [Interjections.] Hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: While we all know that the Speaker has powers and the ruling of the Speaker is superior to all of us here, however...

The SPEAKER: The minute you get to “however”, hon member Magaxa, you are then... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is also you. It is also you, Madam Chair, you see where you reiterate; I am using the same words. It is a conjunction in English, however.

The SPEAKER: A conjunction!

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am using the same conjunction that you used, you know.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ja, ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Here we are supposed to be behaving as members who are representing our own constituency.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Not you!

Mr K E MAGAXA: We have to act according to the same rules. We have to hurdle according to the same rules, you know, each and everything that is said and affecting us, we have a form of responding, just like any House in the world, okay. Therefore, we are not going to be told you to shut up right through as if we are schoolchildren.

The SPEAKER: I never said that.

An HON MEMBER: But it is obvious you did [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact you even related and referring to us as “worse than schoolchildren”. It is an abuse of that position. As a result, Chair, if you do not want us here, just chase us away, so I can talk alone quietly.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you have every right, it is your democratic right to act and represent your constituency. The point I am trying to make as the Speaker is do it with dignity and respect. We do not need this House to spiral into something that becomes the talk of the town. We have taxpayers and the electorate watching the leaders in this province and the behaviour is appalling to say the least. That is all I am asking you. You are allowed to interject. You are allowed to protect and represent your electorate but do it with dignity please.

Thank you. You may proceed, hon Premier. [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes, you are being too sensitive. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. To pick up where I left off about the ANC's nerve in even daring to raise... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Your nerves!

The PREMIER: ...our use of public money in this House, I do not have to speak for the hon Winde, although it was interesting for me to see that he was the target of most of the attack of the speech on my SOPA address and I can see that what is already happening is the hon member Dugmore is going to be leading the pack... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a sangoma [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...in trying to toothcomb every aspect of his life to manufacture scandals and outrage starting with the hon member Dugmore's speech in this House. The hon Winde is very capable of defending himself and he will do so.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Ja, the hon Winde, †diyabathethelela umama. [I defend mothers.]

The PREMIER: Around the question of the McKinsey contract, let me say what I recall. I recall three attempts for us to draw up a proper strategic

intervention to grow jobs in the economy as a matter of priority and I remember on each of those three occasions our analysis was that we were falling short of a really impactful plan and that we needed outside assistance and that we needed it fast. We had very painful memories of what happened in Cape Town when we tried to do the same, went out on a general tender, took the lowest quote and ended up with a group of Marxists drawing up Cape Town's strategic and economic plan that we had to put in the dustbin and which was fruitless and wasteful expenditure deluxe because it was unusable by any government with our political philosophy.

Here we had a situation where McKinsey's had just finished Round 1 Phakisa for the National Government and when we studied it that was the kind of plan we wanted but we did not only want a plan, in this Government we actually implement our plans, but we wanted a Western Cape specific job driving growth plan that would enable us to implement something that will have real impact and so we did and we went through the right process... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So hopeless.

The PREMIER: ...and it was audited by the Auditor-General who found no problem with it, and you know what?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No I do not.

The PREMIER: Do you know what, Madam Speaker, the results of the

implementation of that plan is the statistics that you read here.

An HON MEMBER: The same audit that we are going to be taking to court.

The PREMIER: This is the result of it. Employment in the Western Cape grew by 24%, well ahead of Gauteng at 16,6% and KwaZulu Natal at 8,3%. The Western Cape has the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa, 14% percentage points lower than the national average on the broad definition.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: We have cut red tape to the tune of actually getting investment of R1 billion more than we otherwise would have.

Green economy: We have 70% and are leading in making South Africa the greenest economy in the world.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are so hopeless!

The PREMIER: Or the fastest growing green economy in the world. We are the finance hub of Sub-Saharan Africa having overtaken Johannesburg and I can go on. That was the consequence of implementing the Khulisa Plan.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!

The PREMIER: And we will defend it because it was money well spent because it was a plan well implemented. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are explaining something that does not necessarily talk to this.

The PREMIER: And you know, Madam Speaker, somebody... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What can people make with that?

The PREMIER: Many, many hundreds of people, we have created over 500 000 jobs since this administration came into office, created the conditions through Project Khulisa to do that and you know what, one of the people... [Interjections.] ... who have benefitted... [Interjection.] ... is a lady called Nosipho that the hon Beerwinkel spoke about. The hon member Beerwinkel selected her facts very carefully when talking about Nosipho and she only told a fraction of the story that led to a completely distorted picture. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The PREMIER: Today I will tell you the full and true story of Nosipho and her daughter Thandi. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.



Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, Premier. Talk about the true story.

The PREMIER: Nosipho, Madam Speaker, was born in Dyarha.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Nosipho, Madam Speaker, was born in Dyarha outside Cofimvaba in the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell us the true story. †Die hele storie. [Tussenwerpsels.]  
[The whole story. [Interjections.]]

The PREMIER: Once, long ago, this remote community was visited by a mobile clinic, but this service stopped. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I give up, I really do.

The PREMIER: And Nosipho never understood why. [Interjections.]  
Nosipho's father, Vumile, worked on the mines in Johannesburg and he wanted his family, his wife, Nosipho and her three brothers to move to Johannesburg so that they could be with their father, but they could not. The reason they could not was primarily that if they left their land they would lose it because they had no secure title. [Interjection.]

It was beautiful land and it produced no food or jobs, but in old age it would mean some chickens and some mealies for them [Interjections.]

†UNksz P MAKELENI: † *Hayi hayi hayi.*

[Ms P MAKELENI: No, no, no.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ... and they lived under a chief that was completely unaccountable and Nosipho and her mother Bathandwa had no protection from this thing that they had heard about on Umhlobo Wenene called a constitution, †*umgaqo siseko.*

They knew nothing about their rights. They continued to live rightless subservient lives on land to which they had no title. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: They did not understand this concept of land reform that they kept on hearing about over the radio. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Premier. Hon members, your conversation is drowning out the Speaker. Hon member Makeleni and the hon member Olivier! Thank you. You may proceed, Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Once a year their father Vumile came home to visit and eventually Nosipho's mother, Bathandwa, got sick. Eventually the family saved R500.00 that they needed to hire transport to get their mother to the hospital but by then her HIV had developed into full blown AIDS and it was too late and she could not take ARVs regularly because there were always medicine stock-outs at the local hospital. Eventually tragically Bathandwa died and Nosipho, now a teenager, had to parent her younger brothers... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Fictional story!

The PREMIER: ...keep them in school; keep herself in school while their father was working in Gauteng. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: But then the next tragedy struck! When Nosipho managed to get to the clinic in Cofimvaba... [Interjection.]

†UMnu S G TYATYAM: Ngomphi lo Nosipho?

[Mr S G TYATYAM: Which Nosipho?]

The PREMIER: ...they had no Depo-Provera because there was another stock-out. [Interjection.]

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Ngowaku Qumbu. [She is from Qumbu.] Cofimvaba.

The PREMIER: And so because she had no control over her body and her sexuality she got pregnant and she dropped out of school in Grade 10, but at the end of that year half her class left as well, because they were going to the Western Cape to have a better chance of passing Matric. In their school they did not have any chance at all because the teachers were often absent and unprepared. They were often at meetings during school hours. There were no textbooks, there were no computers. There was no internet. There were no flush toilets and the feeding scheme had stopped working long ago.

An HON MEMBER: They came to the school in the Western Cape.

The PREMIER: That was in Cofimvaba. [Interjections.] She desperately... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat, please hon Premier. Do you wish to rise on a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No-no. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No-no, it is not a point of order. I want to know if the Premier can take a question.

The SPEAKER: Okay, can you take your seat please?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ask her.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, will you take a question? No, the Premier is not prepared. You may proceed.

The PREMIER: I no doubt will answer his question because I have a lot more to say about Nosipho. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! Your request is not being acceded to. Thank you.

The PREMIER: Nosipho desperately wanted to go with her school mates so that she would also have a chance of passing matric but she could not because she was pregnant and had to look after her younger siblings, and then another tragedy struck.

The money stopped coming from their father, Vumile, and they could not make contact with him to find out why, because Eskom's load-shedding had destroyed the transmission line so they could not reach their father, and they did not know why the money had stopped coming and eventually after months Vumile came back to Dyarha. They were thrilled to see him, but he told them a really sad story. He told them how the mine where he was working, the Aurora mine, had closed down after being bought by Khulubuse Zuma and

Zondwa Mandela who had bought the mine and while they gave a donation to the ANC of R1 million they did not pay their 5000 workers anything for months and months and months and the reason that they paid R1 million to the ANC was to be able to be sure that they would be beneficiaries again in the ANC's model of redress, which is just legalised corruption.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We are going to invite Nosipho here so that we can hear from her. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Now, Madam Speaker, Nosipho had to get work. She is pregnant. She has no skills. She has not even got Grade 10 but she needs to go out and work, and Vumile told her that she had a distant uncle in Khayelitsha and Vumile knew that this uncle had been allocated an RDP house with free basic services and he was sure that this uncle would take Nosipho in so that she could live with him and look for a job in Cape Town... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And so they combined all the child grants they were getting to buy Nosipho a taxi fare to come to Cape Town and she arrived heavily pregnant and managed to find her uncle, Abongile. [Interjections.] And when she found Abongile she found there were three other relatives from the

Eastern Cape already living with him all in backyard shacks and Abongile, who looked after his family, built another shack in his backyard for Nosipho. Life was very difficult. They were over-crowded, there was only one toilet and many people using it.

An HON MEMBER: That is not funny.

The PREMIER: But her aunt, Abongile's wife, advised her to go to the clinic for the first time in her entire pregnancy, which she did. She went to the local clinic in Khayelitsha and she had to wait a long time to see a doctor.

An HON MEMBER: And she got the wrong medication.

The PREMIER: She stood in the queue. She sat in the queue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Finally she could not see [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, never saw a doctor [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: But she did see the doctor and she was really pleased that for the very first time she was able to see a doctor in her pregnancy.

Ms P MAKELENI: At least she did not die.

Ms P Z LEKKER: By the time she gave birth *nè*, people were closed inside...

The PREMIER: The doctor was kind and friendly and examined her but then said he would have to refer her to the New Khayelitsha Hospital because he was worried that her placenta might be in the wrong place.

An HON MEMBER: And that is where she died.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Her placenta was in the wrong place.

The PREMIER: He was worried about that so she went home to tell her uncle and aunt about this thing that she had heard about that the placenta might be in the wrong place and that she had to go to the hospital in Khayelitsha.

Ms N D NKONDLO: And she slept on the floor.

The PREMIER: And her uncle said: “This is amazing because we have just finished the hospital being built in Khayelitsha. It costs R650 million rand...”

[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: The baby went missing [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And Nosipho remembered ... [Interjections.] ... reports about how the SIU, the Hawks, had reported that health officials in the Eastern Cape had stolen R800 million more than it cost to build the Khayelitsha Hospital.



The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes.

The PREMIER: And then she saw an article in the newspaper saying: “R631 million tender toilets collapse.” And this is another scandal from the Eastern Cape where ANC politicians getting toilets tenders for R631 million found that it was down the drain literally and that was the cost of an entire hospital to which Nosipho could now go. [Interjections.] And she went to the hospital and they put some cream on her tummy and they took something that looked like a brush, a hairdryer, and they put it around her tummy and she could see inside her uterus the baby and that was an ultrasound. She had never heard of an ultrasound. She had never seen an ultrasound but the doctor gave her an ultrasound and the doctor said to her: “I am very pleased to tell you that you are going to be the mother of a healthy baby girl, but there is a problem.” [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It was a boy actually.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr M G E WILEY: Do you think it is funny?

The PREMIER: “There is a problem. You have...” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Premier, take your seat please.  
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is racist to do that actually.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is the truth.

The SPEAKER: Members! [Interjections.] Order please. [Interjections.]

Hon member Magaxa! [Interjections - speaking simultaneously.]

Mr P UYS: Copy Carol. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The true story of Carol!

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. [Interjections - speaking simultaneously.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: You do not know what you are saying.

An HON MEMBER: And even I was challenging the laughing matter.”

Mr K E MAGAXA: The problem of this system in the Eastern Cape is because of the “affrontage”. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Can the Premier take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, will you take a question?

The PREMIER: Yes, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P UYS: Of course.

HON MEMBERS: Of course!

Mr M G E WILEY: Hon Premier, can you confirm that this Chamber was the Chamber of the Cape Province Administration which had the same budget for the Eastern Cape, the Northern Cape and the Western Cape in the Cape administration?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Hayi, that is not true, that is not true and you know it.

Mr M G E WILEY: They got no differentiation in budget.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is not true.

Ms P MAKELENI: That is not true.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is not true!

The PREMIER: I do not know any of the details of the budget but I do want to say that apartheid did not steal the R800 million rand in the Eastern Cape that were stolen by ANC officials in recent years. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is why you are rich... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, compose yourself please. You cannot sit and howl from your bench hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You talk nonsense here.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, I am going to have to ask you to leave the Chamber for the rest of the day please.

An HON MEMBER: Your nonsense is another problem [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In terms of Rule 44 please go. [Interjections - simultaneous shouting.] Hon member Magaxa, leave, thank you!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The reason you are preaching... [Interjections and simultaneous shouting.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, leave the Chamber, please. Thank you. [Interjections and simultaneous shouting.]

Hon member Magaxa! Thank you. [Interjections and simultaneous shouting.]

[Hon member Magaxa leaves the House in terms of Rule 44.]

[The ANC leave the chamber at 15:05.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, the House has now come to order. You may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

Mr D JOSEPH: A good story to tell!

The PREMIER: The doctor said to her there was worrying news that she had placenta previa and explained to Nosipho that with placenta previa the placenta of the baby gets born before the baby which means the baby gets starved of oxygen which means it is likely to have brain damage if she has a normal birth. So the doctor said before she goes into labour she has to have an emergency caesarean section but that they would prefer to send her to a

specialised maternity hospital to do that and so she was taken by ambulance to the Mowbray Maternity Hospital where she was operated the next day.

Her baby was born. She decided to call her Bathandwa after her late mother; Thandi for short. She had an Apgar score of nine, which is fantastic, so it shows that everything is working with the baby. Nosipho was sore, very sore after the caesar but very, very happy because she realised that her baby was safe and would otherwise have not been born healthy with huge implications for her and her child. So when she recovered she started looking for a job and because her uncle Abongile had political links with the ANC he knew about an ANC MP who is looking for someone to work for him because that person's previous domestic helper had left and so through these connections Nosipho got the job but found that her employer was really abusive and then she learnt that this top ANC official whose name appeared in the newspaper, and who always claimed to stand up for the poor, had actually assaulted his previous housekeeper and then tried to bribe her to withdraw charges of assault, so she left his employ. Life was very, very hard. She could not get even from her old school outside Cofimvaba - she could not even get her school report, Madam Speaker, to show that at least she passed Grade 9.

Eventually she got temporary work at a cleaning contracting company who sent her all out to different jobs all over the Cape Peninsula for different clients. One of them was Isaac, who had a very nice house in Camps Bay, although she worked in many other houses as well, sometimes for people who were not rich, and she could get there easily because the train system was

working. The bus and taxi linked to the trains, but after the agency had taken some of her money for commission and she paid her transport and then sent money back to Vumile and her brothers she often had very little left. So she wanted to find a stable job in one place.

She liked working for Isaac and his wife Joy, and when their son Simon came home from the pre-school where he was, she liked to play with him too. So Nosipho was completely delighted when Joy offered her a full-time position. She learnt more about the family. She learnt that Isaac and Joy had moved from Johannesburg because Isaac moved his factory to Cape Town because of load-shedding by Eskom and he knew that because of the DA-run City Council and Province there was no more Stage 1 load-shedding in the Western Cape and that enabled him to run his business profitably from this province and so he packed up his family and his business and moved. Joy started teaching Nosipho how to cook and Nosipho showed real talent.

Joy also heard about the child Thandi and said: “Bring her with you to work so that your baby is not left alone or with relatives...” and Simon also loved playing with Thandi when he got home from school and reading her books and doing other things, and eventually Joy sponsored cooking classes for Nosipho and when she passed out of that course graduated at the top of her class and she wanted to move on. She wanted to advance her career and get a better job and because - as a result of the Project Khulisa, tourism was growing and more hotels were opening, she applied to one of the new hotels to be a chef. She got a really good reference from Joy. She had her cookery

course certificate with distinction and she got the job, but there was a problem because the hours were irregular and she used to be able to catch the train. Now the train service was so unreliable that she had to catch three taxis and eventually Metrorail got so bad that the hotel had to arrange its own transport service for its workers for which Thandi was very grateful.

Thandi learnt that Metrorail, like Eskom, is run by the National Government and it collapsed through corruption and mismanagement, which is the ANC's version of redress and transformation.

Thandi wants to advance in her job so she knows she must avoid falling pregnant until she is in a position to afford her own place. It is too crowded where her uncle is. She puts her name on the waiting list for a house but then she learnt she earns too much money to qualify. So she says she is going to have to earn enough to rent a place and she is very pleased at the social housing projects that are going up that will enable her to do that.

She is able to go to a clinic near to where she lives. There is never a medicine stock-out and she never has to do without contraception.

The hotel is thriving. There is no longer just a summer season there used to be. There are conferences all year round. The hotel is of high occupancy and Nosipho works hard to get promoted and she becomes the head sous-chef. Now she can get her own place. She rents a flat in a new social housing project and she can live there and rent and afford to send Thandi to school



but as soon as she is there two of her three brothers come and join her because they are also looking for better opportunities than they have in Dyarha and Cofimvaba.

One is looking for a job, the other for a school to finish his Matric. Just when Nosipho thought she had some space for herself, her space is filled up again, but family is family and her uncle Abongile had looked after her and she will look after her family. Her younger brother has a learning disability which is why he could never pass his exams but the disability had never been diagnosed. He needed a special school. He was admitted to one in the Western Cape and passed Grade 12 so Nosipho knew exactly why 64% of all special needs matriculants in South Africa come from the Western Cape. Where she came from his disability would never have been diagnosed.

Her other brother gets a low-paying job in a security company in Airport Industria. Nosipho advises him to follow her example. She said this is a low-paying job but take it very seriously because if you do your best new opportunities will come for you to advance.

He is one of the thousands of security guards employed by the private sector because of the failing police. Nosipho learns that the national police population ratio is one to 369 but in Cape Town it is one to 560 and her brother is doing something to help because he is one of the 2.36 million security guards employed in South Africa because of the police failure. In fact there are 23 privately employed security guards for every policeman.

Nosipho's brother aims to do well enough to be employed by the Cape Town partnership because they train you as well to be a tourism ambassador and to get more skills and so he wanted to study security and he enrolls for a course to study further. And to help Nosipho and to say thank you for the shelter that she is offering him, he participates in Ghandi's school's Walking Bus Programme to ensure that Thandi can get to and from school safely, and he does his bit for the community.

Thandi has a very overcrowded classroom because there are not enough teachers because the money does not follow children to the places that they go to school. But the teachers are in school every day and they are prepared and she does have textbooks and she does have access to computers and she does have access to the internet, and there is a wonderful after-school programme where she learns to dance and becomes a very good dancer and ends up also playing volleyball for the province. And there she gets two meals a day so that Nosipho does not have to worry about whether her child is eating and Nosipho's brothers realise that they, if they want to have families one day, have to advance at work before they decide to have children.

Nosipho attends parent meetings and make contributions to the school and Thandi does so well that she applies for a Maths and Science School and gets into it where she is going to be a boarder in Constantia, a beautiful suburb, so that she can go to the specialised Maths and Science School. But a big event is about to happen, Madam Speaker.

That event is an election. Thandi's family and Nosipho's family and Vumile's family have always been ANC and now Nosipho wonders. If the ANC comes to government here in the Western Cape, will the billions not all be stolen again, like for example the R800 million that could have built a nice hospital in our district in the Eastern Cape? Will the employers leave like they have left the Eastern Cape? Will the health services, schools and transport collapse?

Those are the questions she wants the election candidates to answer, Madam Speaker, and one day she is on a taxi on the way home from work and she hears an ANC candidate called Carol Beerwinkel being interviewed on the radio, and the interviewer asks her:

“Why should people vote for the ANC when it has made millions more people unemployed; when it has stolen at least R700 billion; when it has destroyed public transport and state-owned enterprises and the criminal justice system?”

And Ms Beerwinkel replies:

“The ANC is the oldest liberation movement in Africa and we have zero tolerance to corruption and most of all the DA is, together with the National Party, the party of apartheid. We do not want to bring back apartheid...” says Carol Beerwinkel.

The interviewer pauses and he sounds puzzled. He says:

“But were you not a member and public representative of the National Party for many, many years? Are you not like the rest of the National Party now in the ANC?”

“Oh!” replies Ms Beerwinkel. “Do not keep talking about the past. Look to the future.”

And the interviewer asks:

“What do you promise in the future?”

And Ms Beerwinkel answers:

“The ANC will self-correct by arresting only the whistleblowers who expose corruption and by intensifying their redress plan in Eskom and PRASA and Metrorail and forcing the same policies onto the economy in every sphere. We have to get rid of more whites to ensure transformation.”

Nosipho shakes her head. She understands that in order to keep making progress if Thandi is to have a better life than she has had, she has to ensure that the DA wins the election in the Western Cape again.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! Ja. [Applause.]

The PREMIER: She writes to her father, Vumile, but because the postal service broke down long ago she has to send the letter back with a family member. She told him that since she left home life had been very, very hard, but she only found one thing in the Western Cape. She found opportunity. She searched for it. She battled to find it but she did; first a small opportunity, then a bigger opportunity. Then a bigger opportunity and she used every one.

She said: “My baby was born healthy, I could advance at work. Thandi will now become an engineer because she is good at maths and science and has had real opportunities to learn maths and science...” and she wrote to him: “I now understand why opportunities for people to improve their lives are linked to good honest government that does not steal our money.”

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: She says: “This time, Tata, I must tell you, I am voting blue and if you want to bring the same opportunities to the Eastern Cape, I urge you to turn blue too...”

This is the real story of Nosipho and Thandi and then at Christmas time she goes back to visit her father and she sees that instead of the picturesque mud-huts that had been there when she left there were just tin-shacks

everywhere, still no security of tenure, still no agricultural production, very few men because they were all working in town leaving their wives to hold onto their land. The school was now in ruins and she looked at a picture on her cell phone of her daughter Thandi graduating with honours from the Maths and Science School in Constantia and she said to her father:

“Tata, iDyarha iyakuhlala ilikhaya lam ngoba kulapho inkaba yam ikhona. Kodwa intombi yam uThandi wazalelwa eKapa, eNtshona Koloni. Likhaya lethu ngoku, ngenxa yamathuba angcono.”

She said to her father:

“Dad, Dyarha will always be my home because my umbilical cord is buried there, but my daughter, Thandi, was born in the Western Cape in Cape Town. That is now our home because it has offered us better opportunities.” [Applause.]

That, Madam Speaker, is the story of progress. Progress is unbelievably difficult. It only becomes through massive human effort and part of that effort is a government that creates a context for the growth of opportunity. It cannot take away everybody's problems but it can least be sure that your babies are born in safety, that they have the right inoculations and they have a start in life without which you cannot make use of your opportunities. And while this Government has been in office and I really hope for many years to come, we will continue understanding that the role of the State is to preserve

people's rights and freedoms to extend their opportunities and to do those things for people that they cannot be expected to do for themselves while they make every effort to use those opportunities to improve their own lives and leave a better legacy for their children.

I thank you Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you hon Premier. That then concludes the Debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address.

That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 15:20.