
THURSDAY, 22 MARCH 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I see the Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I table the motion in my name on the Order Paper:

That notwithstanding Rule 161, the House considers the principle and finalisation of the Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill (2017/18 Financial Year) [B2-2018] on Thursday 22 March 2018.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to. Chief Whip?

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I table the motion in my name on the Order Paper:

That notwithstanding the provision of Rule 18, the hours of sitting on Tuesday 27 March 2018 and Wednesday 28 March 2018 shall be: 10:00 till adjournment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection? The motion is agreed to. I then ask the Secretary to read the First Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Principle of the Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill (2017/2018 Financial Year) [B2 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Minister of Finance. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and members of this House. As indicated during the tabling of the Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill on 6 March 2018 in this Legislature, an additional R100 million has been reallocated from other provinces experiencing slow spending, to the Western Cape for the purpose of accelerating the delivery of integrated and sustainable human settlements in the province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, while we are certainly grateful for the funds, it does sadly highlight two things. Firstly, while there certainly may be a myriad of reasons why provincial departments in other provinces are unable to spend their allocated funds, their inability to do so does not inspire confidence in their provinces or confidence in their government's ability to work responsibly with public funds. And secondly, allocating additional funding to the Western Cape does signal a vote of confidence in the DA-led administration's ability even at this late stage of the current financial year, to spend government's funds in a responsible and accountable manner.

This view is supported by the 2016/17 Public Finance Management audit outcomes, which I believe are worth repeating. Within the Western Cape Government, 100% public entities and 85% of departments received clean audit outcomes for the 2016/17 financial year, with the remainder of the departments, where the outcomes have been pronounced upon by the AG, receiving unqualified audits.

Mr Deputy Speaker, also allow me to reiterate that the R100 million will be allocated as follows:

- R57 million will be used for bulk infrastructure such as electricity and sewer reticulation in the Forest Village and Belhar CBD catalytic projects;
- R43 million will be used with the assistance of the Housing Development Agency to purchase land critical for the further

development of the Imizamo Yethu project in Hout Bay.

The Adjustment Budget will provide for the alternative use of drought funding previously set aside in the 2017/18 Adjusted Estimates, primarily for drought and water augmentation initiatives. We will now be redirected to municipalities in the province to address the current drought disaster.

This demonstrates that this Government is responsive to the most pressing demands within our areas of jurisdiction. It also provides funding for the safe removal of asbestos in the Eden region. The additional allocation not only confirms the growing confidence in the Western Cape Government's ability to administer public funds efficiently, economically and effectively, but also that the concept of a capable state as envisaged in the National Development Plan, is firmly entrenched in the Western Cape.

I am therefore confident that the Western Cape Government will spend these funds in a responsible and accountable manner. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Davids?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Hear-hear.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ANC welcomes the additional R100 million ... [Interjection.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... our revolutionary ANC guided National Government has allocated for human settlements in the Western Cape, especially the contribution of R43 million in this Additional Amendment Budget for the purchase of land in the Hout Bay area of Imizamo Yethu where people suffered ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Imizamo Yethu.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... for years with all sorts of ills ... [Interjection.]

†UMPHATHISWA WEZOPHULISO LOLUNTU: Haikona!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No man!]

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... including devastating fires and appalling living conditions.

The information is vague on where this land is because according to the committee, parcels of land are identified but they cannot say specifically which land is identified. Seemingly there is still disagreement on which land to decide or negotiate for. The DA is torn apart with factional and power struggles, like MEC of Social Development who wants to be the Mayor of Cape Town. [Interjections.] And one hopes it is not the case here.

I therefore ask the hon MEC Madikizela to tell us here today, and right now, what land has been identified. Give us the reference or even erf numbers in order for us to exercise our oversight work to see to it that the transformation objectives for integration and equality will be adhered to. And also we want to ask the MEC here today, was there any public participation with the community of Hout Bay?

The rest of the new housing allocation amounts to R57 million for the mysteriously named Catalytic Priority Projects. Despite the fancy name for these projects it needs close scrutiny as well as proper oversight.

The two conditional grant projects referred to are firstly, the well-known Belhar CBD that keeps on cropping up in various budgets. It was in the previous Main Budget and also here in this Main Budget. It is clear that this area gets a lot of attention and that developers will make a killing there as the project seeks to unlock even further opportunities and wealth. The grant is for bulk services.

Secondly, is Forest Village in the Kuils River area of Eerste River, where almost 4,300 so-called housing opportunities will be established. Of this just over 2,500 will be for subsidised developments. The ANC will keep a close watch on these projects to ensure that the guidelines and policies are adhered to and will not hesitate to report deviations to the National Government.

This is necessary as the DA cannot be trusted with such big projects. We

have seen the overpayment of about R5 billion on the Cape Town Stadium and Rapid Bus Transport to Blaauwberg. There is also the steamrolled rezoning of the Founders Gardens and another development around it. Not to speak of the Tafelberg school site housing development for the poor and working class people in Sea Point, where an official got too involved in the bargaining of the sale of the strip of land that was awarded to the privileged and also other questionable activities around it.

The DA does not care for the poor and ordinary people of this province. That official was suddenly redeployed to the Conradie Hospital site to look after the DA interest there. This week a newspaper advert went out publicly. It seeks to recruit a property developer for a pilot or test catalytic priority project for the old Conradie Hospital site of 22 hectare and six other unspecified projects. This development must also be closely examined as it is the first step in dealing with that and other catalytic projects like those in Belhar and Forest Village.

The DA is obsessed with the Conradie piece of land. It was raving about it from former MEC Robin Carlisle's time, but nothing much happened in the almost 10 years on the watch of the hon Premier Helen Zille. A lot was said, but too little was actioned. One can only hope that in the cases of Belhar CBD and Forest Village, more movement and service delivery will be seen. It must also be seen with the implementation of the untested, so-called, better living model.

Social housing or affordable homes for working class people to be closer to their jobs and opportunities remain a priority. This province cannot just prepare and partially develop prime pieces of land that will be used for the privileged or benefit a few. There should be closer control over the allocation of large numbers of so-called open market properties for higher end developments. Some serious money is going to be made by the developers.

What is more worrying in this catalytic project model of the Conradie matter is that the developer will be appointed even though the rezoning has not yet been done by the Cape Town Metro. It is still pending on an appeal process. Hopefully the DA by its boy's club cabal has not already made a deal in the backrooms.

Why is a commercial property developer recruited for a social housing development? Such a developer may look after the interests of the big developers and businesses as these are the ones the DA prefers to milk as party donors. This Legislature must ensure that the DA in government stick to best practice, not to wander off the high road again and they must follow the national guidelines precisely.

The ANC welcomes further drought assistance to various municipalities. This is to ensure longer term water security. Not the kind of alarmist so-called "disaster of all disasters" as termed by the hon Premier. That sounded like a tragedy bigger than Noah's flood.

And then there is the matter of the taps running dry or not. Many people already have to stand in a line at communal taps and can only get what they can carry. They have been living with the DA's Day Zero for many years. And now there is even confusion in the DA round Day Zero. The leader is saying one thing and then the leaders in the Metro are saying another. The leader, Mmusi Maimane, said Day Zero has moved to next year, and then you hear this morning that the Deputy Mayor in Cape Town is saying that Day Zero is still here. [Interjection.]

There is also R2 million made available for the removal of asbestos by the Eden District municipality, thanks to the caring ANC Central Government. We therefore, as the ANC, support National Government by supporting this Adjustment. Thank you..

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Davids. Hon Minister Bredell?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie, kollegas, vir die geleentheid. Op 15 Februarie 2018 het Cyril Ramaphosa die nuwe President van Suid-Afrika geword. Wat was een van die eerste besluite wat die nuwe President geneem het? Hy het die Minister van Water en Sanitasie en die Minister van Plaaslike Regering vervang.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[THE MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you hon colleagues for the opportunity. On 15 February 2018 Cyril Ramaphosa became the new President of South Africa. What was one of the first decisions the new President has taken? He replaced the Minister of Water and Sanitation and the Minister of Local Government.]

†n AGB LID: Mooi!

An HON MEMBER: Good!

†n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor.

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Daar was die afgelope nege jaar altesaam ses verskillende Ministers vir Plaaslike Regering.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit is eenvoudig so dat dit uiters moeilik is om stabiliteit in 'n sektor te verkry en langtermyn planne vas te lê en uit te voer tot voltooiing van soveel gesigte.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ten spyte van vele uitdagings is ons Provinsie op elke meetbare vlak van dienslewering, die bes bestuurde in die land. 80% van die departemente en entiteite het skoon oudits ontvang. Die tweede beste provinsie was Gauteng wat net meer as 50% gekry het. Die data gee

versekering aan mense dat hul geld gaan waar dit hoort. Dr Ivan Meyer het sy jongste begrotingsrede beskryf as “die begroting vir die mense”.

Ons DA Regering glo daaraan om waarde aan mense se lewens toe te voeg deur die bou blokke van hulle toekoms te versterk. Daarom kry Onderwys 35% van die totale begroting en ons sien die resultate elke jaar. Ons wil ook vir ons mense sorg wat kwesbaar en siek is, en daarom kry Gesondheid 37% van die begroting. Daar is ook ander departemente wat baie belangrik is. Een hiervan is Plaaslike Regering en dit is waar ons tans in die voorste linie baklei teen die voortslepende droogte.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Over the past nine years there have been in total six different Ministers for Local Government. Mr Deputy Speaker, it is simply so that it is extremely difficult to establish stability in a sector and lay down and execute long term plans to completion, with so many faces.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in spite of the many challenges our province remains the best governed in the country at every measurable level of service delivery. 80% of the departments and entities have received clean audits. The second best province was Gauteng that received just more than 50%. The data provides assurance to people that their money goes where it is intended. Dr Ivan Meyer described his latest Budget speech as “the budget for the people”.

Our DA Government believes in adding value to people's lives by strengthening the building blocks of their future. Therefore Education receives 35% of the total budget and we see the results every year. We also want to look after our people who are vulnerable and sick, and therefore Health receives 37% of the budget. There are also other departments that are very important. One of these is Local Government and that is where we are currently fighting in the front line against the continuing drought.]

†The global population doubles every 70 years. Here in the City of Cape Town, Western Cape, it doubled over the last 20 years. We have seen and managed several droughts before, but never with more than four million people in the city. The city is not an island on its own, and we want to touch on the need to better capacitate and improve the rural towns. We must seek to provide citizens with more opportunities in their communities to better enable them to make a good living where they are.

It is my dream to see more resilient, sustainable and successful towns in this province, that grow into regional hubs of employment and opportunities, towns and cities that are more climate-resilient and shockproof, and places where jobs can be created.

Of course this is not an easy thing. A major constraint remains financing. Many of our municipalities face severe financial challenges that limit their potential to develop into business hubs and become job creators. In this regard we need to have a continued look at the current structure of grant

payments to municipalities, particularly with regard to bulk reticulation and maintenance requirements. Many municipalities are simply not able to generate enough money from their own sources to pay for many of these types of projects.

The tariffs municipalities can charge for services rendered is another concern. Municipalities are not setting cost-reflective tariffs, but the reality is that realistic tariffs will not be affordable to communities that are already under pressure in the current economic environment.

Municipalities in the Western Cape are serious about addressing their developmental challenges, but addressing poverty and underdevelopment requires significant funding. It also requires good financial management. The little we do get needs to go where it is meant to go and in this regard I am proud to state that the DA Provincial Government keeps a tight handle on financial management. Unlike ANC provinces, not a single town in this province is in Eskom's bad books at this moment. That shows the commitment and responsibility this Provincial Government and our local entities have towards public finance.

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, as provinsie vervul ons geen rol in die uitrol van grootmaat waterinfrastruktuur nie. Dit is 'n nasionale regeringsverantwoordelikheid. Ten spyte van die reuse droogte wat ons tans ervaar, is daar bykans geen nuwe werklike projekte aan die gang of in beplanning vir langtermyn watersekerheid vir die Wes-Kaap nie. Die grootste

projek waaraan reeds meer as R2 miljard spandeer is, is ten opsigte van die Clanwilliam Damwal, maar dit is gestaak en gaan nie langer voort nie. Dit was gebou met die doel vir nuwe boere om 5,000 hektaar te kan aanplant, maar ons praat van grondhervorming, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

Daar is internasionale beste praktyke dat water op provinsie- en streeksvlak bestuur moet word met gepaardgaande begrotings. Ek wil hierdie gesprek met ons nuwe nasionale Minister begin. Ons moet meer beheer hê oor ons eie toekoms, ook in hierdie opsig.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, as DA Provinsie het ons in die nuwe finansiële jaar R157 miljoen geprioritiseer vir waterinfrastruktuur projekte. Ons het as Provinsie ook 'n bykomende R100 miljoen vir droogtehelp begroot. Die grootste deel hiervan gaan aan die landbousektor wat in ernstige moeilikheid is. Ons is bekommerd oor ons landbousektor en is verbind daartoe om te doen wat ons kan as Provinsie om hulle te ondersteun.

Vergelyk gou vir 'n oomblik die klein begroting wat ons saamskraap, R250 miljoen, met die Nasionale Departement van Water se totale begroting van R16 miljard. Daardie ANC begroting wat niemand juis kan sê waar die geld heen is nie. Al wat ons hoor is die ANC Departement is bankrot en die ANC Nasionale Regering het nie meer geld nie ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr Deputy Speaker, as Province we fulfil no role in the roll-out of large scale water infrastructure. That is a National Government responsibility. In spite of the enormous drought we are currently experiencing, there are hardly any real new projects going or planned for the long term water security for the Western Cape. The largest project on which already R2 billion has been spent is in regard to the Clanwilliam Dam wall, but it was stopped and is not continuing any further. It was built with the purpose of enabling new farmers to cultivate 5,000 hectares, but we are speaking of land reform, Mr Deputy Speaker.

There are international best practices that water at provincial and regional level should be managed with associated budgets. I want to start this discussion with our new national Minister. We must have more control over our own future, also in this regard.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as DA Province we have prioritised R157 million for water infrastructure projects in our new financial year. We as Province have also budgeted an additional R100 million for drought assistance. The largest part of this goes to the agricultural sector that is in serious trouble. We are concerned about our agricultural sector and is committed thereto to do what we can as Province to support them.

Now compare for just a minute the small budget that we scrape together, R250 million, with the National Department of Water's total budget of R16 billion. That ANC budget that no one can really tell where the money has

gone to. All that we hear is that the ANC Department is bankrupt and the ANC National Government has no more money ... [Interjection.]

†n AGB LID: Ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... want die ekonomie is op sy knieë.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:... because the economy is on its knees.]

†n AGB LID: Ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, as ons resultate wil wys moet ons eenvoudig dinge anders begin doen.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, if we want to show results we will simply have to start doing things differently.]

When it comes to running local councils, no one is doing it better than the DA-run Western Cape, as several independent audit surveys and reports have shown. Still a lot more needs to be done and this Government remains committed to always learn and to apply global best practices in everything we

do. Where we fall short we go and do our homework, always putting the best interests of our community first. There can be no compromise on this DA promise. I thank you. [Applause.]

†n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Hoor-hoor!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am a bit confused, because I thought the Minister spoke on the Main Appropriation and not the Adjustments, so I had to make sure. So we are talking about the Western Cape Appropriation, the Additional Adjustment Appropriation. [Interjections.]

The ACDP supports the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation, especially, Mr Deputy Speaker, for the drought assistance and also the safe removal of the asbestos in Knysna and Bitou. Also, especially for the money that is going to be made available for the Imizamo Yethu settlement land, because I just read this thing that these people that were devastated by the fires had to move to open fields at the school and the matric pass rate dropped from 96 to 72%. So that is a welcome relief and as somebody said,

we just want to know from the Minister where is this land allocated and how soon will this happen? Thanks you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mngasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I must state right from the outset that this DA Government that we have in this province is a well-oiled machine and we take pride in how ... [Interjections.] the Government has been performing. It is a responsive, responsible, efficient and accountable government, whose aim is very clear, and that is to improve the lives of all people in this province ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But when are you [Inaudible].

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and that is a very clear mandate. It is based on this principle that I welcome the Additional Adjustment Appropriation. I welcome it because amidst the fiscal uncertainty in our country and the corruption that the ANC has been perpetuating, the province remains an example of fiscal discipline and we are resolute in ensuring that our people receive the best services that they rightfully deserve.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as the DA-led Government, we are fully aware of the threat that the current drought holds for the province and its people. It is for this reason that we have been proactive in our response by, amongst others, ensuring that funding allocations are made to avert the effects of the drought

which it could have experienced if this intervention was not made.

Mr K E MAGAXA: But you were side-lined.

Mr M MNQASELA: The 2018 Additional Adjustments and Appropriation clearly demonstrates how we have not only considered the drought, but we also took cognisance, by extension of the water crisis, of fire. Just in the Department of Local Government alone the Province allocated over R84,5 million for this financial year and to add to this, we have seen now in the Main Budget, hon member Christians, there is almost R40 million in the Local Government Department alone to address this problem.

Now when someone comes here and speaks, Mr Deputy Speaker, in this forum, in this very august House and says to us the DA is not performing, you wonder where is this person living? On what planet? Where? In which province? [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Right here.

Mr M MNQASELA: So members must not come and dream here, because we do not live with dreamers, we live with doers. We do. We do not dream. [Interjections.] So let me further express my appreciation to the hardworking officials of the Department whose resolve has been to avert any kind of crisis when it comes to drought or water or fire, because we have got one of the best disaster management teams in this province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, when you read *Die Burger* from last Tuesday, an article, by Candice Bezuidenhout, says and I quote:

“Even though the Kouga Dam in the Eastern Cape is currently only 12% full, the provincial leg of the Department of Water and Sanitation, Portia Makhanya, says it is enough water to sustain the province until the next rainy season.”

That tells you people are dreaming on the other side. If you have 12% and you think you have enough for the entire period, then the ANC remains dreamers. We are delivering here and because we know ... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] Day Zero.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that because of Nelson Mandela Bay, people have been saying how the DA is delivering services. [Interjections.] Now we can see the entire province is moving towards the Democratic Alliance.

†Bathi abantu: sonele ngoba sigalela idipu, amakhalana ayaziwela. Qina mhlali, qina.

[People are saying: we are sick and tired of the inaction by this administration. Be strong, people. Be strong.] †Not nonsense. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order! I see Minister Madikizela.

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Please come to order before the Minister starts.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, pressures in Human Settlements are mounting with urban migration increasing rapidly in provinces like Gauteng and Western Cape. Protests and land invasions have escalated since the EFF and the ANC tabled a motion to expropriate land without compensation.

†ILUNGU ELIBEKEKILEYO: Hayi!

[An HON MEMBER: No!]

Mr P UYS: You must [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Which is sadly interpreted, Mr Deputy Speaker, by many ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: That you are interpreting.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... as a licence to invade land

with impunity as we have seen in a number of areas, including Gugulethu. And this is the reality. Let us not joke about this. This is the reality.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are on your way.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Because since that motion people think that we have given them licence to invade land, and that is a reality. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is not true!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now this Additional Budget ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This Additional Budget, Mr Deputy Speaker, came as a result of the failure by the Gauteng Department, in particular, to spend its budget, and we are grateful to the National Department of Human Settlements for giving us some of this money so that we can spend it wisely.

Contrary to the ill-informed letter I saw in the *Daily Maverick* by the

provincial spokesperson of the ANC, who is clearly living in his own world, it is not the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements that is a ticking time bomb, in fact he must just look elsewhere.

Mr Deputy Speaker, while we appreciate the fact that we have benefited from Gauteng's failure to spend its budget, this has a negative impact for the entire Department nationally, and I think that must be noted, because nationally we have suffered the second biggest budget cut, resulting in over R1 billion cut for my own budget in the next three years. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You cannot spend it.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now this will have a huge impact on our plans as a sector, nationally, particularly in our 50 catalytic projects that we have as a sector, nationally. With this R100 million we received from the National Government, we are going to solve the problems of Imizamo Yethu by acquiring land in Hout Bay so that we can formalise that informal settlement, and for your information, hon member Davids, it is Erven 5636, 5637 and 4062. In fact, I share this information with you so that you can go and look for yourself.

But what is important here, as I was listening to you, because even though you support this Adjustment, you made some remarks and you questioned whether this money will be used wisely, and as I was listening I was asking myself whether you have been to Forest Village?

Now Forest Village is a big construction site. This is not the money that is going to be used for plans. We are already working in Forest Village.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Some of the houses have already been handed over. I was asking myself whether you have been to the Belhar CBD. Because Belhar CBD, again, is a huge project where we are building almost 4,200 units, including for military veterans, and we are the very first province to cater for military veterans.

So this is where this money is going. It is going to be a tangible delivery ...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... that is already happening on the ground, hon member Davids. We will use the R47 million, as I said, to acquire four parcels of land in Imizamo Yethu. But I think it must be mentioned that that devastating fire happened when we already started to develop in Imizamo Yethu. [Interjection.]

We are already busy with 1,492 houses in Imizamo Yethu, and the remaining R53 million will be spent to supplement the bulk infrastructure requirements for the Belhar CBD, as I said, which consists of 4,188 housing opportunities

for the entire range of income categories, including social housing, rental units, sectional title deeds for BMG, military veterans, Flisp units, student accommodation. This is what we are doing in the Belhar CBD.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Because there is money paid there.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So we have already completed 630 social housing units and 1,000 private rental units and 102 military veteran units are currently under construction in that particular area, and I think I would urge perhaps the Chairperson to invite hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much.

So this money will also unlock bulk infrastructure challenges for many other projects in the surrounding area, and that is why, Mr Deputy Speaker, we are very grateful. But, I want to state that this Budget cut will affect a number of our catalytic projects in Vlakkeland and again I hope you have been there, which is in your area, because when we talk about catalytic projects as you have been saying, these are not just pipedreams. We are talking about mega projects where contractors are on site, where houses are being built. Some of those houses have already been handed over to some people. If you look at Transhex for example, where we are building more than 8,000 houses, the contractor is already on site. We have started with the construction of those

houses.

So I want to assure you, hon member Davids, that when we talk about catalytic projects these are mega projects that will change the lives of our people where we are busy in the areas that I have mentioned.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Focus on housing. [Inaudible.] Leave them. Just focus on housing.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are very grateful to the national Department and we hope that we will continue to benefit from the failures of other provinces so that we can move with speed in our catalytic projects. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister Meyer to respond. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the participants for this debate. Although we support the principle that you must reward good governance, we are indeed sad that the people of the North West, the people of Limpopo and the people of Gauteng must suffer again because the ANC has failed to spend the money in their provinces on the poor.

R300 million is taken away from the North West. R150 million is taken away from Limpopo. Another R150 million is taken away from Gauteng, and there

are people here from Gauteng. There is a pattern emerging. Bad ANC governance is being punished, but the irony is that the poor are suffering under the ANC bad governance. But, there is hope. It is time for a new beginning in South Africa. I agree with hon member Mnqasela – the Western Cape is a well-oiled machine.

I heard during this debate that hon member Dugmore acknowledges that there are certain individuals in the ANC ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And in the DA.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that are corrupt.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And in every party.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I want to repeat what I heard in this House, is that hon member Dugmore acknowledged that there are certain individuals in the ANC that are corrupt.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do not forget the guy next to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: For the record ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do you know what corruption is?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: For the record, Mr Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Are you saying there is no one corrupt in the DA?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: For the record of Hansard, this is an important acknowledgement of hon member Dugmore. We want to encourage him to submit those names to the Commission of Inquiry into state capture. It is his responsibility as a public representative, since you also, like all of us, undertook an oath of office.

In the context of that oath of office he must now appear before Judge Raymond Zondo, who is chairing the Commission of Inquiry into state capture. We are looking forward to seeing hon member Dugmore appearing before that commission, and we will give him leave of absence in this House.
[Laughter.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, to Minister Bredell for prioritising during Cabinet meetings support to municipalities for this drought, because he realised that the support is also needed outside the Metro and he is working tirelessly with municipalities, because we have a big rural

footprint in the Western Cape.

I would also like to thank the hon Minister of Human Settlements, Minister Madikizela, for your support and influence during the Human Settlements Minmec, because through your convincing, you have now secured additional money for the Western Cape Human Settlement Development grant to the tune of R100 million and we are certainly looking forward to the various oversight committees assisting us. I am particularly happy that Minister Madikizela already has plans in place to spend the money instead of making new plans. There is a process, there is a project, there are outcome indicators and there is already contractual obligations in place.

I therefore want to thank hon members who took part in this debate and thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This concludes the Second Reading for the Additional Adjustments Appropriation. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That, as Minister Meyer says, concludes the debate on the consideration of the principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the principle? No objections? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill. (2017/2018 Financial Year).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will now deal with the separate votes in

the Bill. The Secretary will read the Second Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedule – Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill (2017/2018 Financial Year) [B2 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I first put Vote 8: Human Settlements. No objections? Agreed to. I put Vote 14: Local Government. No objections? Agreed to.

That concludes the decision on the votes. I will now put the Schedule to the Bill. Any objection to the Schedule? No objections? Agreed to. I put Clauses 1 to 3. No objections? Agreed to. I put the Short Title. Similarly, no objections, agreed to. The Secretary will read the Third Order.

The SECRETARY: Finalisation of the Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill (2017/2018 Financial Year) [B2 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I came to this House on 6 March 2018 to table the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriations Bill 2017/18, and the associated *Provincial Government Gazette* of allocations to municipalities.

Mr Deputy Speaker and hon members of this House, in summary the Adjusted

Budget makes provision for additional net spending amounting to R100 million, bringing the Budget of R59,716 billion to R59,816 billion. The Adjusted Estimates of Expenditure was tabled at the Parliamentary Budget Committee for approval, and the Budget Vote was also extensively discussed in the two relevant Standing Committees.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I now move that the Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill be finalised and submitted to the Premier to be assented to. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the Bill being finalised? No objections? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments, Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill (2017/2018 Financial Year).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will now be sent to the Premier for assent. Before I ask the Secretary to read the next order, may I take the opportunity to welcome, in the galleries, staff from the procedural section of the Provincial Legislature in Gauteng. You are most welcome in our midst here.

The Secretary will read the Fourth Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Principle of the Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister Meyer again.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and welcome to the colleagues from Gauteng. That is the next province we are targeting.
[Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, on 6 March 2018 – do not worry, good governance will come to Gauteng. It is a matter of time. 2019 is around the corner and we welcome you to this particular session in this House.

Mr Deputy Speaker, on 6 March 2018, I tabled the Main Budget for the Western Cape Government. That Budget was tabled under the theme “A Budget for the People”. The total budget, Mr Deputy Speaker, was under the discussion. The budget theme reflects the main mandate of this Government, and that is to serve the people. This is in stark contrast to what is happening in ANC run provinces.

The ANC provinces’ budgets are used to milk the people. And talking about milk, we have got a milk case study. In point is the dairy project, business, at Vrede Farm in the Free State. Instead of budgeting for the poor people, the ANC budgeted for the Guptas and here are the facts.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] point of order. I just want to ask whether the hon MC would take a question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I only take questions ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wow!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... from people who are running for the ANC provincial leadership, and if he is running I am happy to take a question. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, it is an open-ended reply. [Interjections.] Order! Minister Meyer ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, just one second. Is it in terms of the Rules, yes or no?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure about that side of the politic.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I want to ask you a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are not prepared?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have confirmation on my left that he is not running. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, unfortunately not.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So he is too scared to take a question? Okay.

Mr P UYS: Big joke!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think members of this House should know that the court papers filed by the NPA, as a forfeiture unit, has shown that the dairy farm project was nothing more than a looting ground for the Gupta family. The AFU found that 200 of the R220 million meant for the poor people, through that particular Vrede Farm project, only R2 million was spent on the farm.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is wrong.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The rest of the money from the Free State Budget was stolen by those members [Interjections.] whose names hon member Dugmore will submit to the Inquiry into State Capture. This, hon

members, happened after the National Treasury exposed serious financial misconduct in that particular province. The people of the Free State never benefited from this project. The DA's Budget is pro-poor, the DA's Budget ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Premier [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... is for the poor. For the record, the ANC steals from the poor. The ANC also promotes thieves like Ace Magashule, the current Secretary General of the African National Congress. I agree with Dr Roy Jenkinson that the Vrede Dairy project is a textbook example of ANC corruption and the ANC makes poor people poorer.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Jy praat so mooi.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are speaking so nicely.]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dis reg, Minister Fritz.

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That is right, Minister Fritz.]

†Hon members, this state theft under the ANC comes at a price. At the end of December 2017, and I have looked today at those figures, the Western Cape Government had a positive cash balance, but the Free State had an aggregate overdraft of R390 million, Mr Chief Whip, in the Free State.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Now how can you run a government like this?

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is not true, man.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: On 31 December, third quarter, Free State had an overdraft of R390 million. I do not know how they manage that place ...

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... if there is management at all. Maybe mismanagement. If you do not have management, you have damagement and we see it in that particular province. In the absence of management it is damagement.

In the Western Cape we have a completely a different narrative. We have before us a budget for the people. 79,4% of the Budget is exclusively for the poor, the vulnerable and the marginalised. R23 billion goes to the Department of Health, R22 billion goes to the Department of Education, R2,4 billion goes to the Department of Human Settlements, R2,3 billion goes to Social Development and R7,7 billion goes to the Department of Transport and Public Works, looking at the infrastructure in those particular areas. But if you analyse this Budget, almost 80% goes exactly to where it is needed, to those poor people.

Our Budget focuses on children, the youth, women, victim empowerment support and child care, and Minister Fritz will further elaborate on that during his Main Budget. Because this is a caring budget, Minister Fritz has made substantive provision for persons with disabilities in his budget. He will later brief this House about the plans in this particular regard.

Mr Deputy Speaker, on the order paper it reads:

“Consideration of the Principle of the Western Cape Appropriation Bill.”

We have defined those principles when we tabled this Main Budget. We called it the Western Cape Fiscal Strategy. Firstly, allocated efficiency, which aims to achieve a balanced allocation of resources that reflects the priorities of this Government and programmes’ effectiveness, based on evidence, with a greater focus on reprioritisation and trade-offs.

Secondly, since we are dealing with the principle, the second principle here is what we call fiscal sustainability. Now if you have a R390 million overdraft, there is clearly no fiscal sustainability in the Free State. In this province, we maintain stability in key Government programmes while managing and responding to key risks, particularly in a constrained economic and fiscal environment.

And the third principle, since we are discussing the Principle of this Bill, is

fiscal consolidation, reducing Government expenditure in a responsible manner, whilst managing the risk and increasing revenue. Now this is an important matter. While this ANC speaks about fiscal consolidation in their documentation, what is happening in practice is that you have fiscal expansion.

Last year the total Government debt in South Africa was R2,2 trillion. This new budget of the ANC takes the total debt to R3,4 trillion, so you cannot speak about fiscal consolidation under the ANC, because the debt, hon Premier, has risen from R2,2 trillion to R3,4 trillion. There is no space for fiscal consolidation. It is a myth.

So whenever the new Minister, my friend, Minister Nene – I have a good working relationship with him, but I will tell him: you cannot speak about fiscal consolidation if you continue appointing more staff and if you increase the debt because if you increase your debt from R2,2 trillion to R3,4 trillion, it will have an impact on your debt service cost. And the debt service cost has risen from R147 billion to R166 billion and then in this financial year coming – R180 billion – over the MTEF R200 billion. You cannot speak about fiscal consolidation. The principle in this Budget is fiscal consolidation.

Lastly, is fiscal discipline. Yesterday I attended a meeting of the Waste Bill negotiations. There is no fiscal discipline. The Minister that was responsible to produce the Waste Bill increased her own staff. As a Minister,

you must have eight or six members in your ministry. Here, Faith Muthambi – no wonder they have no faith in her – has 20 people in her office. You cannot speak about fiscal discipline. You must lead fiscal discipline in your own office.

So, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have no faith in Faith Muthambi and that is why she is gone. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As we expected, the DA went all over the country, blaming everyone and everything ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Who is responsible for that [Inaudible.]?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... except themselves for the failures in the Western Cape where they govern. The MEC speaks about principles in the Western Cape, yet he jumps all over the place. We are talking about the Western Cape.

To be able to budget for the people you need to know the people, you need to speak to them, you need to meet with them, you need to understand their needs and conditions under which they live, so that you treat them better and accordingly budget for where the needs are most.

Just one example, go to any TRA in this province and you will see the conditions under which people live and then ask yourself whether this Budget is for the people. The regional budget, if you look at that, you would then also take the poverty factor into account and understand how equitable share allocations are not done to take into account the poverty of those areas.

The DA should stop boasting about where they are spending, when they are actually spending money that has been allocated to National, the very sphere that they continue to bash. You fail dismally, even though you grandstand. [Interjections.] Follow the President's example; walk with the people, both literally and figuratively. You were allocated ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You were allocated R47,5 billion in equitable share and R12 billion for conditional grants. Let me address these conditional grants, Mr Deputy Speaker. National allocations come with specific instructions for projects. You had no right to go into communities and grandstand as if these projects were funded by the DA and then not even have the decency to acknowledge the councillor or the MPL deployed in that area. These allocations were made for all the people. [Interjection.] Use your DA party allocations for your DA campaigns.

There are some repeat offenders amongst them. Human Settlements is one, Sports and Recreation is the other one. Safety and Security is always on their

own, they never contact anybody. Some of these MECs sitting here are not even contactable, Mr Deputy Speaker. The records are there ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: [Inaudible.] cell phone.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I do not have your cell phone, MEC. The records are there to prove how many times we have hammered you ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: My number is 083 ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: [Inaudible.] cell phone number.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister, not now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, but she wants it!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... which in itself makes a mockery... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. [Interjection.]
Order! Order! I want silence before the member proceeds.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: [Inaudible.] of my time. The records are there to

prove how many times we have hammered you on your lack of public participation which, in itself, makes a mockery of this Budget anyway. During every vote in this Budget there is an aspect of public participation. It is a shocking shame in the way you avoid public participation and just tick boxes.

Patricia de Lille's fight at this moment is for exactly that.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: For the public to know what she is being accused of and hear her version. [Interjections.] Yet you fight that. Ironically, Human Rights Day was yesterday and the rights of the people of the Western Cape have not been addressed in this Budget.

A people's budget, you say, yet you play political games to avoid giving those who keep your homes clean, ensure your safety, care for your health in facilities, to live closer to their employment by giving them social housing in the centre of town. Tafelberg site is an example, a constitutional violation. You never create real opportunities for people's voices to be heard.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is a disgrace.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It only works if the colour and the area is right. Just this morning an ex-principal and parents were speaking about a dangerous

section on the N2 where learners need to cross and a child was knocked down last week, after numerous requests for safety measures. Speak to Education, they reflect full attendance in the classroom but how the children get to the school and back is a buck that they will pass. Blame Sanral.

Mr C M DUGMORE: They said there must be a walking bus. How ...
[Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Until all are equal and treated fairly, the race debate of this Budget allocation will continue because you entrench it and entice it by your actions. One life lost is one life too many and our sincere condolences to the loved ones of the cyclist who was killed.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, is it not just strange how quickly the DA rallies together and rocked up to listen to the people in Fish Hoek, yet we, on a regular basis, repeatedly ask for your intensified presence in areas such as Scottsville, Scottsdene, Nyanga and all these areas where young lives are snuffed out daily. [Interjections.]

We here speak for those people because they cannot, neither can they tweet you to attend at the drop of a hat. What is not racist about that? How does the Budget address their and other such areas' needs?

Then we have an uninformed Australian racist announcing that white farmers should be welcomed into a civilised Australia. How civilised was the verbal

altercation that took place, first between Quinton de Kock and then lately Rabada, the best bowler in the world, who would have been suspended for an entire series because of provocation from a civilised Australian? So what colour were the alleged killers of their wives in Constantia, twice? What race was the girlfriend and the killer of the Stellenbosch University student? A whole family wiped out in a gated community. Who murdered and gruesomely cut up a young girl's body in Kraaifontein? Your silence as the DA was, and is, deafening against the insinuation that only uncivilised black people murder white people.

The DA white supremacist attitude which says everything that is white is right is just unacceptable ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member, just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon member prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: She is not prepared, apparently, no.

Mr M G E WILEY: We were not aware that an Australian Minister was a DA supporter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Magaxa.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What is right about your Premier continuously tweeting relentlessly without retribution or punitive action? Everything in this province is about race, everything. What is right about her always questioning a ruling in this House and being treated differently?

You are accusing Patricia de Lille of bringing the party into disrepute and being a bully. When will you deal with the Premier? The double standards you apply are openly racist.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Zackie Achmat, in today's *Die Burger*, has vowed to lay a charge against the Premier at the Human Rights Commission for her tweets on Life Esidimeni. Your leader, Mmusi Maimane, has also condemned the outburst. Josh Budlender says, and I quote:

†“Jy weet, Helen Zille, afgesien van hoe bizarre jou tweets is, wat dit sê oor jou politieke onkunde, eiegeregtigheid, arrogansie en mees basiese vlak is walglik. Die oorweldigende gevoel by die lees van jou tweets is net walglik, dis net afstootlik.”

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[“You know, Helen Zille, apart from how bizarre your tweets are, what it says about your political ignorance, selfrighteousness, arrogance and

most basic level is revolting. The overwhelming feeling in reading your tweets is simply revolting, it is simply revolting.”]

†This is the very person you want us to believe is capable of looking after the interests of all the people of this Western Cape when compiling a so-called people’s budget. How do you know that all psychiatric patients here in the Western Cape are treated well? When last did the Premier go into a hospital to see how staff violate the very principles their seniors instil in them? [Interjections.]

Do you know how long terminally ill patients lie for hours waiting for transport to take them back to where they come from because there is not enough allocated from equitable share for ambulances – the budget supposedly for the people.

We speak, Mr Deputy Speaker, from a lived experience, not the people’s budget on paper and in meetings with consultants. We represent the people you are budgeting for.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: O! Help net!
[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Oh! Please help!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Start by looking right here at your front door. An example of your racist budget: one black woman on your budget for Cabinet. The back row, all positions of power as chairpersons. Look at your race and

your women representation.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are obsessed with race!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes. When questioned about specific programmes for women in different votes, the general response is: we are training more women in our department. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Totally missing the point. This is a people's budget. I, in particular, Mr Deputy Speaker, am humbled by my party to be afforded the opportunity to attend study tours out of the country. The tragedy though is, these initiatives and instructions are never implemented. Is that not fruitless and wasteful expenditure? Why is this Budget not reflecting specific women's programmes in different votes?

Yet fiscal dumping is happening at the Speaker's rooms where security measures are being installed. What is the person appointed to be dealing with women's programmes doing? Because you have no respect for women. Your leader right here and some of your unmanageable MECs have played their patriarchal hand in showing their verbal abuse against women on this side of the House often. It is disgusting. This is the calibre of a person or man that the Premier feels is fit for purpose to sit in on the planning of the people's budget. [Interjection.]

Consult the Hansard for Rodney Lentit's shouts at us across the floor about his DA. He even did that on an international tour. Today all of you have the most disparaging insults to fling at him, even threatening him with legal action because, like Patricia de Lille who is your latest victim, he threatens to expose your racist double standards.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We are enjoying the unravelling of the squeaky clean DA image of upholders of the law. [Interjections.]

So let us look at how this people's budget upholds the law. Our annual reports process, Mr Deputy Speaker, is not complete because the DA feels that they would rather take the AG to court as opposed to adhering to laws and regulations for Vote 11. Remember, these are the clean audit masters.

Regulations with regard to accounting by principals and agents from page 133 to 142 of that document is very clear; you can read it. Add to that, page 595 of the Budget Book which spells out the role that Casidra has to play on behalf of the Department and that is the crux of the matter. Page 117 of the DoRA is also equally clear and if you want I can read it; if my time allows, I will, Mr Deputy Speaker.

You have not exhausted all the avenues, yet you want to take the AG to court. I hope you get your lesson there.

Now let us move to the other upholder of law, this move of the Environmental Commissioner which, on page 87 of your own Constitution, compels you to do it. Yet you went to public participation because it suited your agenda to amend and make something which is considered compulsory into a discretionary clause when you do not even have the manpower to deal with your current load.

Section 24 of the Constitution addresses the environmental rights of these very people that you say you are supposedly budgeting for. Why are you so afraid of the independence that this Commissioner will bring?

Mr Deputy Speaker, the lived experience of the people of the Western Cape will tell you that they do not agree that this Budget speaks to their needs. Do I still have time? Can I read page 117?

Page 117 of DoRA, Mr Deputy Speaker, says, and it is the CASP programme of Agriculture, it says:

“To create a favourable and supportive agricultural service environment for the farming community, in particular subsistence, smallholder and black commercial farmers within strategically identified grain, livestock and horticulture production areas;

To provide effective agricultural support services, promote and facilitate agricultural development by targeting beneficiaries of land reform,

restitution and redistribution and other black producers who have acquired land through private means and are engaged in value-adding enterprises domestically, or involved in exports;

To address damage to infrastructure caused by floods.”

That exactly is what Casidra is doing on behalf of the Department. So where is your argument that it should be a transfer payment as opposed to goods and services, which the AG says is what it should be? What do they stand to lose to follow the laws and regulations of accounting principles of 2016? I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Fritz? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, my Cabinet colleague, Dr Ivan Meyer, has quite aptly set out a clear path of Government expenditure for this upcoming financial year. But I think this House actually needs to – the way you have conceptualised, with your team at the back - I really think we need to applaud your efforts in this regard, Dr Meyer. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Stick to your speech!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: In fact, in an incredibly constrained fiscal environment, the Finance Minister has admirably ensured

that the DA Government continues to maintain investment into those programmes and priorities that focus on the poor and you know that, you know that. [Interjections.] Contrary to the overused and hollow ANC narrative of this Budget being designed for the rich – †nou ek weet nie waar die *rich* is nie – [now I do not know where the rich are] – you must show me the rich. I would really like to go see my money go to the rich ... [Interjections.]. Come we go, yes. [Interjections.] I believe Minister Meyer deserves applause for a job well done in protecting the poor. [Applause.] Thank you. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Mawonga Performance and Expenditure Review, completed for the National Government is a very interesting report. Through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, to hon member Beerwinkel, this review, commissioned by the National Government, shows that the DA Government spends the greatest portion of its budget on transfer funding to NGOs and it spends the most on poor people than any other province when we look per capita at poor persons in the province.

And according to the report, Mr Deputy Speaker, to hon member Beerwinkel, the Western Cape spends 82% per poor person above the national average. The closest province in comparison to us was the Northern Cape at 62% above the national average and the lowest was Limpopo Province, which spent 35% below the national average, below.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Not only that, the report also uses the Western Cape as a benchmark of how NGOs should be funded. Now we hear a whole lot of noise from you but this is your own government saying this stuff.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Your history ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Government is decidedly and proactively pro-poor in this province. This Budget was formulated under extremely trying economic conditions of low economic growth and vastly diminished tax, †met 'n klomp skelms in die tax, [with a bunch of cheats in the tax,] †revenue service and collections, and high unemployment in our country.

All these factors and others can be laid right at the door of the ANC, like many of my colleagues have pointed out. The ANC has failed to build this economy, full stop, nothing else, period. It is the ANC which has almost destroyed SARS, you have destroyed SARS, you have destroyed PRASA and you have destroyed Eskom and you are busy destroying SASSA, you are busy destroying SASSA. You are a disgrace. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is why you will not be elected in the province again, ever. I promise you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Fritz, just one second. Hon member Magaxa. Order!

†UMnu K E MAGAXA: No, into endiyikhalelayo ngula mnwe utyebileyo omfutshane, uGabha, osikhomba ngayo la ndoda. Kukusihlukumeza okuya, ukukhonjwa yindoda emfutshana, etyebiliyo ngomnwe omfutshane otyebileyo. You know? Now iyasihlukumeza. Asizokuba sikhonjwe yila ndoda apha. Makathethe kak'hle, sive. Angasikhombi. Usiqhela kakubi. Asizoontanga zakho maan!

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

†Mr K E MAGAXA: No, what I want to complain about is that he is pointing at us with that fat finger of his. We will not be pointed at by a short, chubby man, pointing his chubby finger at us. You know? That is abuse. We won't be pointed at by that man. He must speak respectfully and not point at us. He is really disrespecting us. We are not his equals.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa, the gist of what you said I just got at the end, that is that they must - you must speak to the other side, not point at them. Hon Minister Fritz, you may continue but refrain from pointing to the other side. Hon Minister Fritz, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja, they are even talking about fingers. So they are so petty and so useless, that is why they can talk

about fingers. Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC must explain why things are so bad economically in this country. It has become really difficult to fund projects in our province and programmes that are most needed by the poor and the sad thing is that it is the poor that are suffering due to their corruption.

What should really disgust all of us is that even if the ANC shouts and howls from the benches on that side, the ANC has never even once in this House acknowledged their culpability in the economic crisis of our people. They have never said that they are culpable. They have milked this country's coffers dry, through a complex network of corrupt senior ANC politicians, cronies and cadres. It is estimated that the Guptas alone managed to shift more than R100 billion to offshore accounts over the last 10 years and they all sat here in this House, keeping quiet about how the country was being milked and they denied it all the time until it came out. [Interjections.] They denied it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: In state-owned enterprises (SOEs), the ANC-controlled municipalities, government departments and provinces like Free State and Mpumalanga, the amount of money lost to the fiscus literally runs into hundreds of billions. And they all sat here, Mr Deputy Speaker, and they said nothing about it. [Interjections.] They are as guilty as all those other ANC people. It is the looting and theft that the

ANC – and that is the ANC’s way, this is what makes their criticism of us in this House ring rather hollow and empty. [Interjection.]

That brings me to the one factor that, almost more than anything else, has contributed to the mess we are in. Why is it that almost without exception, in all cases where there have been cases of corruption, maladministration, fraud and looting of SOEs, governmental entities, the common denominator has been ANC-deployed cadres. They must ask me about SASSA ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second, there is an hon member standing up. I am listening.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Relevance?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, there is no relevance ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: He has been allowed a long time for the political ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, yes, your point of order is valid but

relevance ... [Interjections.] Order! When the Chair speaks you usually take your seat, please. This is a wide-ranging political debate. The limited debates start tomorrow when we do the individual votes, so the hon Minister may continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to show through this debate how corrupt and how the thievery is continuing in the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister, just one second.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, through you, however haywire we can go we must consider the agenda for today, which is the Western Cape Appropriation Bill and the hon member here is not dealing with that. So I am saying we agree that you can, as the Deputy Speaker - but he must go and consider.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Tyatyam, we have always allowed wide scope in this debate, so I am not going to curb the hon Minister unnecessarily. Hon Minister, you are almost done, your time is running out.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I just want to quickly talk about the water crisis. They accuse us and say we have done nothing but the same ANC, Mr Deputy Speaker, for three years, were the Opposition. [Interjections.] They sat in those benches. So they are a weak, weak Opposition. They were a useless government and they are even a worse

Opposition. [Interjections.]

Let me talk about their national Minister, Minister Mokonyane. Let me speak about her. She is the cause of the water crisis in the province What happens? She gets promoted by the new President, she gets promoted by him. She is now the Communications Minister. This is what the ANC is – you see, you are rotten to the core. Your whole existence is rotten and the problem with you is in time you ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... will all disintegrate and what will happen to you? You will need EMS. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just one second. Order! Order! Order! Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is not funny anymore. It is really not funny anymore. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The MEC for Finance made the point that we are discussing the principles of the Western Cape Appropriation Bill. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Allow the hon member to take her point. Hon member, I am listening. Please continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We are considering, he made the point repeatedly what principles we are discussing. Now that MEC is going all over the show talking about – as if Minister Mokonyane is responsible for bringing rain to this province. What absolute nonsense. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, that touches the same point as your colleague next to you raised and I have allowed the hon Minister to speak widely. Although the hon Minister introduced certain principles, this is in fact the Second Reading Debate, which is a wide debate.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: There is a very important simple principle.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, there is a simple principle: you cannot have money, the money gets stolen by this ANC. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: How can you use money when

the money is constantly stolen at a national level. We just heard earlier from the Housing MEC, that in another province they did not spend their money. Then, it comes to us because they are not only corrupt, they are incapable, they are incompetent and the reason why I know, I come from the ANC. I know how corrupt they are. They are very, very corrupt. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Order, before we see the hon member Christians. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo, I have asked for order, please. Order! Hon member Christians, you may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the 2017/18 Western Cape Appropriation Bill. Minister Meyer mentioned a couple of things and the one thing that he said, several fiscal and service delivery risks remain and, amongst others, he mentioned the VAT increase. I believe the VAT increase is an assault against the poor and the vulnerable.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: And we reject that. Another point that leads to volatility and puts our economy at risk is the expropriation of land without compensation.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It is foolish, irresponsible and I believe that the EFF will be swallowed by the ANC because of this move.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I wonder how long will this romance last between the EFF and the ANC. [Interjections.] We know that the EFF is a socialist movement and they want everything to belong to the state. [Interjections.] Everything must belong to the state and we cannot agree with that.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You want us to [Inaudible.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Because two wrongs do not make a right. [Interjections.]

But Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to say the following. I read an article today in the paper about education. Pupils are our biggest investment, David Harrison writes in the *Cape Times*, and he says:

“As South Africa seeks a new path to economic growth and development, we must face up to the reality that our public education system is too big to keep on failing.”

He says and we know, we have debated this over and over again, that only 50% of our pupils entering Grade 1 get to Grade 12 and that is concerning.

And he says the following, he says there are three factors for the poor performance of education. He says the one is teachers who cannot teach or will not teach. Now that is saying: I will not work. The bulk of our money goes to human resources; teachers are saying: we will not work. Is this putting more money and resources to teachers that do not want to work? We must get rid of them.

School governing bodies and principals that cannot lead properly. We must get rid of them. Those are immediate things that we can do to rectify our education in this province.

He further says that learners who cannot learn at a pace and level at which they are being taught – surely, Mr Deputy Speaker, if you put – and we spoke about this in the Standing Committee, about teacher and learner ratios, classes are too large. There are fundamental problems in our system that need to be rectified and we cannot see, year in and year out – he even said we do not know the amount of money we pay for learners repeating standards over and over. It is a huge amount of money that goes into that.

So I would want the Minister – that they have some sort of evaluation system to see if these people are producing. If they are not, they must be fired because our pupils are our future. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.][Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Beverley Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Over the past 10 years the Western Cape has gone through a series of monumental changes. No longer can we look at this province through the same lens. Today we face, like so many other places, a growing range of adversities and challenges in the 21st century. From the effects of climate change and the subsequent impact of drought in the economy, from listeriosis to a jump in the Fourth Industrial Revolution, all will have effect, all will have impact.

Yet it is resilience in the face of all adversity that assists cities, towns or provinces to adapt and transform in the face of these challenges in preparing for both the expected and unintended consequences. Resilience will shape the future of cities and provinces alike and resilience will shape South Africa going forward.

If governments want to become sustainable then resilience must be taken into account. A well-run government will not ignore this important factor when putting together its budgets.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I commend this well-run Government of the Western Cape for a budget that is exactly that. It is a budget that has been stable over the past nine years, a budget that is sustainable going forward and a budget that focuses on addressing the mitigating risks, such as drought and the water crisis. This is a budget for the people. This is a resilient and sustainable budget for the province.

The Employment Outlook Survey Quarter 2 of 2018, released by Manpower Group South Africa, has found that, despite the economy still weighed down by economic uncertainty and factors such as the drought in the Cape, business and consumer confidence has improved.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Do you support the Environmental Commissioner?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Employers reported that the strongest hiring prospects were in the Western Cape with an outlook of above 11%, the highest in the country. This is a budget for the people, a resilient and sustainable budget for the province.

In stark contrast, after close to nine years of gross negligence and financial mismanagement under Jacob Zuma, the ANC has left the economy on a flat line. Billions of rands have been systematically siphoned from the public purse to a select few under the ANC's watch, with the mismanagement of public funds plunging South Africa further into debt.

And what do they do, Mr Deputy Speaker? They deliver an anti-poor budget. The ANC-run National Government slaps an extra per cent on Value Added Tax, making the people of South Africa pay for their Zupta sins. The very poorest of poor will take the brunt of that impact. [Interjections.] If this is not one of the most anti-poor national budgets I have ever seen, then look again because raising of that by one percentage point could mean, inclusive of the value-added additions along the value chain, we could at times pay up

to 2% more tax on specific daily items. It is estimated that the increase in VAT could cost the poor in the region of R2 billion.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC National Government's anti-poor budget could not be better illustrated than that of Luke Jordan's media statement in the *Daily Maverick* this year when he said, and I quote:

“Almost R3 billion a year taken out of schools. When children cannot read. R10 billion taken out of homes. When the housing backlog is vast. R12 billion taken out of roads and rail and water, and R5 billion taken out of municipal infrastructure, when service delivery is perpetually behind. R3 billion taken out of building jails and courts. When those are overcrowded and crime is rampant. And R200 million taken out of the NPA's Budget, the equivalent of hundreds of lawyers and investigators.”

and the list goes on.

The anti-poor budget of the ANC speaks even louder when R3 billion will be spent just on VIP services and security for 2018. When President Ramaphosa's salary hike means that he earns R700 000 more than Jacob Zuma and can you believe this, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Land Reform Budget at national level has been cut again, sitting at half of what it was in 2007 and 2008 at the end of Mbeki's presidency. What a †skande! [disgrace!] Yes, this is most definitely the ANC Government's anti-poor budget.

And so while R45 billion of state funds were lost in 2017 on irregular and unauthorised expenditure by organs of state and state-owned enterprises, while the national Department of Water and Sanitation is under forensic audit on an overdraft of close to R3 billion, while the Western Cape still waits for the money from 2009 and while municipalities in the North-West, the Eastern and the Northern Cape are mere weeks away from reaching Day Zero, no plan, no resilience or sustainable solutions. [Interjections.]

The ANC goes even so far as to refer to the Western Cape's drought as a myth even though the drought has been declared a national disaster. Indeed, the only myth to the ANC is sound and effective governance. If our drought is fabricated for kickbacks, as hon member Davids claims, please do tell us what your explanation is for the severe droughts in other ANC-run provinces.

While the National Budget is clearly anti-poor, the Western Cape is undoubtedly a budget for the people, a resilient and sustainable budget for the province. [Interjections.] Ours is a budget that has continued to drive economic growth and jobs across the province, producing 106 000 more jobs than anywhere else in the economy. Ours is a budget that, through Wesgro, has brought in R17,5 billion into the Western Cape through trade, investment and destination marketing. Ours is a budget that, by combining economic promotion with tourism, has added 13 new flight routes, contributing R4,8 billion to the economy. Ours is a budget that, through partnerships, has successfully driven water-wise tourism and significantly driven down the water footprint of this sector.

Through this Government and this Budget the Western Cape is still the only province to launch a drought portal for the agricultural sector, the only province to have conducted a household census for agri workers, the only province with land support advisory desks and, as a result, the only province with a 62% land reform success rate, in stark contrast of the ANC's embarrassing 2%.

Adopting land expropriation without compensation is the ANC's move to divert attention away from its complete and utter incompetence. So while Minister Nkoana-Mashabane has been quoted as saying that she has a hole in her head, let us just leave that for another debate, Mr Deputy Speaker.

But finally, let me say this, you can tell a lot about a government by the way in which it spends its money. Where the ANC has lost billions in corruption and wasteful expenditure, it creates a budget to tax the poor. Where the DA Western Cape has put its money, our economy grows and our province creates the jobs. This Budget speaks for itself. The Western Cape's Budget is undoubtedly a budget for the people, a resilient and sustainable budget for the province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Premier, Mr Deputy Speaker, the members of the House, guests from the Provincial Legislature, Gauteng, good afternoon. Thank you, Minister Meyer and your team for a budget allocation

that seems to be responsive to the service needs of the people.

Again, Health received the biggest slice which is about 37% of the total Provincial Budget allocation. It is worth mentioning that throughout the years the Western Cape health allocation has always been bigger, even in other provinces. In the 2017/2018 Budget year our share was about 36% of the total Provincial Budget. For 2018/19 it has grown by 1%.

We need also to applaud Gauteng who have just increased their provincial allocation to 37%, which means we are now equal. Of course they have to meet the challenges related to the Esidimeni litigation.

Just to understand, to compare apples with apples, the national average in terms of the Health Budget allocation from the total provincial allocation is about 33%. It is worrying that the Eastern Cape Budget allocation has been 3% less compared to the national average. As for KZN, Mpumalanga, Free State and North West, one could interpret that they do not prioritise health because the budget allocation remains unchanged, despite their health challenges.

The demand for healthcare continues to grow and is unlikely to change in the short-term given the trends in social requirements, health and wellbeing and a worrying trend is the increase in people that are presenting with multiple interacting and compounding health problems. This situation places the provincial systems under enormous strain and in the context of significant

budgetary constraints and with the drought, 2018/19 is likely to be a very challenging year.

Certainly, the excitement of us getting a bigger slice of the pie, I guess, is dampened by the fact that the Budget is not increasing in real terms, let alone responding to the escalating burden of disease.

Healthcare costs are unsustainable and health spending is higher than economic growth. If you look at the prices of medicine, for example, it means we have to swim against the tide. It means an urgency in health reforms that needs to be done immediately.

For example, our shortfall which is about R459 million, and if you could translate loosely, we are talking about 900 health professionals that could be lost if we convert that. The health sector is facing a budget shortfall actually in most of the six provinces, except for Gauteng which has received an additional boost, as I indicated, of about R2.8 billion for the litigation.

Western Cape Health has begun to make bigger moves from marginal efforts at cost-cutting and efficiencies to fundamental transformation in the way we do business. So that we ensure a strong, coherent and resilient health system, we have embarked upon the implementation of a transformation strategy. However, space and time is required for the re-engineering of structures and processes necessary for the impact of the health system transformation so that we can see its fruition.

Initiatives such as MEAP, the Management Efficiency and Alignment Project, we have already begun with such. This has been undertaken with the aim of improving the efficiencies in administrative structures, functions and processes across the various levels and offices in the Department. Top management has endorsed the purpose, functions and architecture of this at the various levels. The intention is to achieve a 10% saving in the managerial administrative support services in order to protect the clinical services.

Mr Deputy Speaker, notwithstanding the Western Cape population that has increased actually by 3% from the previous figures, the allocation in equitable share remains the same. For example, the Eastern Cape has lost almost 8% of its population through emigration to other provinces but unfortunately money does not follow the patient when it comes to the Western Cape like it does in other provinces. For example, Gauteng invoices Mpumalanga and Limpopo for their tertiary services they render and again these two provinces also get an allocation of a tertiary grant, yet they do not render those services.

So, now Gauteng can bill other provinces for these patients, yet if Western Cape were to copy and paste this initiative to cover the cost of that 8% of patients coming from the Eastern Cape, just imagine how that would be interpreted. It would be a political war, yet it is happening throughout, in all other provinces. [Interjection.] I would not expect any person from the Opposition to comment about health because we are saving other provinces,

for example, the issue of the oncology in KZN, all the registrars are being sent to us. We send our EMS people to the Eastern Cape. Now we will be accommodating the Free State for some of their services. [Interjections.]

So when you come to the Western Cape, if it comes to health, no politician can politicise health. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No politician can, because we are doing a lot for the all other provinces. For us, health is too important to reduce to a political football.

The other challenges facing the health system as a whole is the growth in the elderly population. Of course we rejoice that people now have a longer life expectancy that has increased with an average male living up to 61 years and the average female about 67 years. However, we do know this means an increase in people living with chronic conditions, needing constant clinic visits and thus it means that there is a need for additional resources.

South Africa also has an influx of foreign nationals who are uninsured and put more burden on public health services. For example, in the area of Cederberg we have identified some children who are even born out of the health system because their mothers are afraid to go for ante-natal care because they are foreign nationals and all of those things. So in my Budget

speech I will elaborate more on some of our responses to these challenges.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in Health, no-one is turned away. No-one is turned away. It is unlike when you say a school is full, therefore you cannot take any more. In Health we cannot turn any person away. [Interjections.] We cannot close hospitals; even if we are full, one on top of each other, we cannot close. We cannot close hospitals, we cannot close clinics, even if they are full. Remember, people have got the freedom to move around anywhere. It is their constitutional right. [Interjections.]

We also face unforeseen circumstances. For example, issues such as where you end up with a hospital catching fire, the issue of storms, the issue of the drought, now we are in the middle of listeriosis. Nobody planned for this but yet we have to respond. We cannot say the Budget was R21 billion, therefore we cannot respond. We respond to issues outside the health system, like listeriosis. We have to go to the taxi ranks and all of those sort of things, yet it is not even our core function. Therefore we have to think on our feet when an outbreak or disaster ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, just finish off, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Therefore, in response to the health system pressures, the Department uses multi-pronged approaches in order to respond to such. In my Budget speech I will elaborate more.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time has now really expired. I see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, this debate comes when there is a great sense of uncertainty and growing disunity in the province as a result of the DA's 'swart gevaar' tactics in response to the successful adoption of a motion on land expropriation without compensation in the National Assembly.

This message of fear has reached as far as Australia where Home Affairs and Immigration Minister, Peter Dutton, was quoted to have said:

“White South African farmers deserve special attention because of the horrific circumstances of land seizures and violence in the country.”

Unfortunately a critical period such as this needs a cool-headed approach. Such an approach is well captured in the words of the famous Xhosa musician Stompie Mavi:

“Khanibeke phantsi intonga,
Kusekude phambi kwenu,
Khaniyekeni ingqumbo, ixesha liyabaleka,
Masixesheni umanyano.”

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

“Put your weapons down,
We still have a long journey ahead of us,
You must stop the hatred because time is moving on
We must be united.”

†We have to use the song today to call on the DA to stop beating war drums and join in the work to foster unity amongst the people and accelerate land reform in the country. The likes of Masizole Mnqasela and Basil Kivedo should lend a hand in assisting us in debunking this ‘swart gevaar’ instilled in the people by DA leaders. [Interjection.] This is not the time to instil fear in the people; this is the year for renewal, unity and jobs. Unfortunately, that is not something we can achieve through this Budget.

In contrast to what is claimed by the MEC, this Budget does not place people at the centre and certainly does not create public value.

It is high time the DA learns the principle of nothing about us without us. Communities for which this Budget is intended to serve had no say on how it was structured. This Budget is also not doing anything to address community challenges. The Western Cape is the leading province in terms of women and child murders. Last year alone the province experienced a crisis of more than 30 young children and women who were killed brutally in this province. Yet there is no allocation to address this challenge. This Government continues its failure to protect women and children’s rights.

The only money that is there for gender-based violence comes through the conditional grants from National Government. The majority of the population are women in this province, yet there are no programmes to support women empowerment ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Says who?

Ms P MAKELENI: ... that are funded through this Budget. In fact, we have been calling for a pro-women budget. [Interjections.]

This Budget will further entrench difficulties for the poor in the province, as the retrenchment of employees in the Department of Health that is currently underway and the vacancy rate that is ever-increasing in all provincial government departments will have a direct impact on the people.

All this is happening when we were told the economic growth will contract and lead to more job losses. This is a direct contradiction to what the MEC said last year, that the economy would grow at 1,3% in 2017 and 2% in 2018, which could lead to job creation. He failed to grow the economy, and this province reported 31 000 job losses.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Who destroyed the economy?

Ms P MAKELENI: Life in the Western Cape is becoming more difficult under his watch.

All this is happening when we were told by the honourable MEC Meyer that this Budget will continue to protect frontline services through investment in education, health and social development. All MECs said the Budget increase does not take into account population growth, and therefore affects the net value of the Budget.

People are growing tired of DA lies. This is evident in the people's boycott of the nomination process for clinic committees and hospital boards, on which only DA Members of Parliament were appointed to serve.

We thank the people who raised their concerns about the application forms used in this process which are designated to create space for DA cronies. As a result of their efforts, this Government was forced to extend the process by a further two months. People see through the DA lies. †Sizozijik' izinto. [Things will turn.]

The MEC mentioned that six Youth Cafés have been established across the province, in fact let me correct you, hon Minister: The number is eight. He went further to announce that an additional four Youth Cafés are planned, while MEC Fritz said that they are planning to only have three. Last year it was the honourable MEC Debbie Schäfer and the Premier talking about seven Youth Cafés. How can they all get confused with what is supposed to be a Game-changer? This is clear indication that there is no communication between Cabinet ministers. We can only conclude that the divisions that have brought the Cape Town City Council to its knees are slowly coming to the

Legislature.

Other critical indicators of youth development are set for failure. When the entire country is abuzz about the importance of building and maintaining school infrastructure, including addressing sanitation issues, this province does the opposite through cutting its infrastructure spending. This is despite an audit report by the Equal Education highlighting the issue of poor sanitation and safety in schools.

Enrolment of learners in public schools in the province is over 1,1 million in 2018, yet the Government is lowering the number of new schools from 16 to 14 and closing down more schools. More disappointing is that only 36 000 learners can attend MOD Centres, which have been standing at 181 since the inception of the programme. This is while hundreds of school children are lured into drugs and many others die at the hands of gangs on a daily basis in the Cape Flats. What is shocking is that the budget for MOD centres is cut from R152 million to a mere R127 million.

The Western Cape is embarking on a strategy to reduce alcohol harms, with almost all departments injecting funds into it. How do you achieve this, when the DA leader Mmusi Maimane has no shame drinking in public? This is while the DA is putting on the table the Bill to allow alcohol to be sold in schools.

This is a budget of more rhetoric and empty promises by the DA. The same

promises they sold to the people when they tricked them into believing that GF Jooste would be renovated and later relocated and to date there is no budget to rebuild GF Jooste. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Well done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In the absence of hon member Joseph I see the hon member Mackenzie .

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, before I start let me welcome Mr Samuel Matamane, a PhD student from UWC. He is from the DRC. He is with us today, he is doing his PhD in Public Law, so welcome to this Parliament.

Mr Deputy Speaker, on the 6th of March the Western Cape Finance Minister, Dr Ivan Meyer, delivered what can only be described as ‘the people's budget’. The Minister’s pro-poor and infrastructure-led Budget will contribute significantly to job creation and the Western Cape economy. Minister Meyer’s Budget not only ensures the financial stability of the Western Cape but also complements our Provincial Strategic Plan. Having gone through the Annual Performance Plan to see where and how the money will be allocated, I was pleased to see that the Minister prioritised the poor people of this beautiful province by ensuring that this Budget is not only an

economic Game-changer but specifically has a pro-poor focus.

However, it would be remiss of me to ignore the fact that this Budget is negatively affected by the irresponsible and corrupt ANC National Government. In an attempt to recover the billions of rands lost through corruption and state capture, the then Minister of Finance Malusi Gigaba, announced a 1% increase in VAT and a 52% increase in the fuel levy. This, coupled with the consistent year-on-year imposed Budget cuts on the Western Cape Government, means that we will have to often seek ways to ensure that our poor mandate is not compromised. The VAT and the fuel levy increase should not be understated. A 1% VAT increase on the Western Cape Budget of R59 billion is roughly R300 million on goods and services. That means the Western Cape Government now has to go and cut services by R300 million to accommodate the Zupta tax.

Mr Deputy Speaker this imposed Budget cut and adjustments that have been made is not necessarily a VAT increase, we can actually call it an ANC sponsored corruption tax. It is corruption added VAT. The DA prioritises the poor where the ANC takes money from the poor and spends it lavishly on their cronies. In fact the current Minister of Public Enterprises, Mr Pravin Gordhan, revealed recently that the ANC-led National Government – of which he is a Cabinet Minister by the way – he recently revealed that corruption has conservatively cost the taxpayers R100 billion. The tragic consequence of this unabated corruption is that the poor will continually be punished. One such example is the ANC-led Eastern Cape Government which

established itself as the ‘corruption capital’ of this country under the ANC. Despite the fact that they are currently spending R253 million on management and financial consultants, they still received an unqualified audit and also lost R2,4 billion through irregular expenditure.

Compare this to where the DA governs. The DA brand offers unparalleled good governance standards. Where we govern the best services and game-changing initiatives are the rule rather than the exception. Take the water crises for example, despite facing the worst drought in over a century, despite the fact that the ANC-led national Department of Water and Sanitation bankrupted the department, the DA changed this disaster into an opportunity for hope. The building of new infrastructure, coupled with the maintenance of the existing infrastructure, which by the way is not budgeted for and is not the mandate of the Western Cape Government, we still used that disaster and turned it around into opportunities and created jobs and opened up a new water economy with incentives for market exploration for small and medium scale entrepreneurs. That is what the DA does with disasters.

We have now set an international standard for reducing water consumption from 1 billion litres a day to 520 million litres a day. That is what the DA does when disaster strikes. We have implemented sustainable water solutions including various augmentation programmes which, again, was not funded by National Government. The City of Cape Town had to use money that was meant for service delivery to do this. [Interjection.]

Take a quick glance at what is happening in the other provinces. The North-West, Limpopo and the Eastern Cape are currently facing a similar crises and they are likely to reach 'Day Zero' very soon, Mr Deputy Speaker. Sadly so. Instead they are using those opportunities for more corruption and unabated looting. Under the leadership of Dr Ivan Meyer and the Premier Helen Zille, this Government pulled a rabbit out of a hat and produced a pro-poor, stable Budget that will give effect to important services such as health, education and social development. Where currently in Gauteng, based on their Budget, they have put a freeze on infrastructure when it comes to health maintenance.

This DA-led Government has strategically prioritised funds to ensure this province remains the leader in effective and clean governance. The billions allocated for infrastructure from Transport and Public Works will create sustainable water augmentation and resource management in the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape.

The Apprenticeship Game-Changer and the Premier's Youth Advancement Programme will further combine and create opportunities for 12 000 young people, producing 11 300 qualified apprentices for the labour market. With this Budget, the Youth Development Programme will receive an additional – hon member Makaleni – four Youth Cafés, expanding the capacity to 22 [Inaudible.] This is another example of the DA's commitment to youth development.

This DA-led Government has placed significant emphasis on economic

development opportunities. With this Budget, the Provincial Treasury allocated R1,3 billion for the promotion of economic development and tourism which will grow the Western Cape economy and create more job opportunities and investment opportunities. It is clear that where the DA governs, unlike the ANC, there is a difference. We put the people first, we prioritise our funding and we ensure no money gets corrupted, unlike where the ANC governs.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we also know that SAA has recently received another R19 billion in State funding. This money-sucking entity continuously pours billions of rands down the drain, whereas the Western Cape Government uses money allocated it. That R19 billion, including the R50 million, very conservatively estimated ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: The R50 million that is being used for President Zuma's legal fees, is money that should go to the poor ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... and this Government will make sure we recover that money when we get to ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... National Government in 2019. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Time has expired. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, a key priority for the Western Cape Government is the development of sustainable integrated human settlements that will allow its residents access to social and economic opportunities close to where they live. Section 26 of the Constitution says that “everyone has the right to adequate housing within the available resources”. Unlike the ANC, the DA with its available resources goes beyond just delivering houses because we constantly exceed our delivery targets. Despite a R1 billion Budget cut in the next three years, the Budget for the 2018/19 financial year of just over R2,3 billion will provide 20 000 housing opportunities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, again, I want to congratulate Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela and his Department for winning the 2017 National Govan Mbeki Award. I am extremely proud of this Department’s effort in fulfilling the mandate to deliver housing opportunities to qualifying and deserving residents.

I say this because during the 2017/18 financial year with a budget of just over R2,5 billion, again the Department has exceeded its housing targets of 18 000. The Department’s housing policies offer a range of support options for different segments of the housing market. The approach is to encourage

market based solutions for housing provisions in gap markets and for self-help initiatives in an attempt to free up resources to service the poorest and most vulnerable that cannot meet their own housing needs.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the previous year, the Department embarked on the Informal Settlement Support Plan. This plan forms part of the Living Cape Framework and moves to improve the living conditions of the communities of the Western Cape. For the 2018/19 financial year, the programme will benefit 60 informal settlements, 25 021 plots will be upgraded. Beneficiaries of this programme will also receive title deeds for their property. To mention a few, Kayamandi with 3 011 households, Grabouw with 5 270 households and Mossel Bay with 3 493 households. This is the Budget, under the DA Government, for the poor, creating public value.

On the other hand, the ANC's track record on housing delivery under-delivers and over-promises. Normally the ANC complains if I compare the Western Cape to another province so let us look at District Six which is a national Land Reform Project, which includes housing. After 24 years of waiting District Six claimants are nowhere closer to receiving the homes they were promised in 2014 by the National Government. Only 245 units were built in the 2017/18 financial year and over one thousand claims remain unprocessed.

If this was a Western Province Cape project, these claimants would be settled because we deliver better. Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA delivers. The implementation of 60 land release projects will yield close to 10 000 housing

opportunities, the biggest projects being Dal Josaphat and Belhar with a total of 6 266 housing opportunities. This Department is particularly proud of its innovative and forward thinking Belhar CBD Development, so listen on this one.

A different level income residential project, it provides 4 188 units that cater for the bonded subsidy market, social housing, open-market rental units, student accommodation and free-standing open-market units. This initiative goes further and brings an essential 550-bed regional hospital, day clinic and ambulance services to the heart of the community. Mr Deputy Speaker, our successes do not ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Tyatyam.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... stop here. As a part of the Better Living Model, the former Conradie Hospital will be developed to provide a mix of social and open-market units and – hon member Dugmore you will love this one – this project will provide over 3 600 housing opportunities. Its success as a private, public partnership is demonstrated as the City of Cape Town has allocated R223 million and developers have allocated R174 million to the project.

The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has over the next three years committed R160 million to title deeds. This is the land reform – listen hon member Dijana. During the 2018/19 financial year, 7 000 new title deeds

will be provided ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just finish your sentence, your time has expired.

Ms L M MASEKO: Okay. Thank you very much. In conclusion, it is quite clear that this DA-led Western Cape Government's Budget is for the people as it redresses the past injustices while creating public value.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired.

Ms L M MASEKO: I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I see the hon Minister Grant, Minister of Transport.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: Mr Deputy Speaker, leaders of Opposition parties, honourable members; it is my pleasure to participate in this important debate about the 2018 Western Cape Budget. A budget, which in the foreword to the Budget review by my colleague, Minister Meyer, is described as being responsive to the key priorities of the province and one in which emphasis is placed on creating public value for the people of the province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I have referred to this description of this Budget for

good reason. We need to remind ourselves that the formulation, tabling and adoption of a state Budget is about much more than a listing of amounts of money. It is also a public commitment that the money voted will in fact be available and spent on that for which its allocation has been approved.

In this regard, Jacob Lew, the 76th US Secretary of the Treasury, is on record as saying:

“The Budget is not just a collection of numbers but an expression of our values and aspirations.”

So, Mr Deputy Speaker, any government, at any level, which adopts a budget, is by implication making a series of commitments, including having the legislation, policies, structures and human resources in place to deliver on these commitments, by spending the money transparently on the purposes for which it was voted. This is always challenging. It is particularly challenging when a government, such as is the case nationally in South Africa, chooses to place huge amounts of public funds under the control of various arms-length entities responsible for services which are significant drivers of economic development.

Badly handled, this situation slides quickly into nothing more than an illusion of accountability and an illusion of the ability to deliver on Budget objectives. One of the sad truths about South African public life and the life of too many South African public institutions in recent years, and I include

particularly the destructive period during which Jacob Zuma headed the National Government, is the way in which ceremonial illusion replaced substance.

Too often the essential building blocks of our constitutional democracy became mere theatrical performances devoid of all responsibility to build a cohesive nation based on our agreed and codified values, devoid of their responsibility to service the needs of a population still crippled by poverty and income inequality and in order to afford to turn these responsibilities into realities, their obligation to take the nation forward economically.

Examples are many and varied. But let us start at the top of the institutions. Parliament, defined as including both the National Assembly and the National Council of Provinces. In recent years we have witnessed behaviour more aligned with bar-room brawls than the elevated actions envisaged in Section 42 of the Constitution. The ceremonial trappings largely survived and continued. The important work did not. In the end Parliament was unable to do what it is enjoined to do in Section 42, to scrutinise and oversee executive action. The then president made a mockery of this crucial constitutional requirement. Even when he was finally removed, the country had to enjoy the travesty of having a critical Budget tabled by a Minister who was clearly not going to be responsible for delivering on the objectives ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: ... and commitments of the Budget he was required to address. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] with Lennit Max? [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dugmore. You have made your point. [Laughter.] Please continue hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: A host of state-owned enterprises suffered from the same shortcomings. Boards were appointed, dismissed, reorganised and appointed again. Chief Executive Officers and Chief Finance Officers came and went, often at huge expense to the public purse and in one spectacular case, to a pension fund. Acting appointments became the order of the day and so, in many of our state-owned enterprises, as with Parliament, the trappings remained but the work was simply not done.

There was little or no corporate governance. There was equally little or no effort to take the enterprise forward whether it was energy production, rail transport or the national air carrier. The irony of this happening in the land of various excellent King reports is surely not lost on the members of this House.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, what the SOE's lacked in corporate governance and the responsible Ministers lacked in either concern or any sense of oversight responsibility, there was certainly no shortage of public money for the

dubious contracts and convoluted supply chain management practices. If this type of activity were an Olympic sport we would have had been record breakers and could have displayed cabinets full of gold medals. Hopefully the medals would have been the originals. [Interjection.]

Is it not any wonder, Mr Deputy Speaker, against the brief background that I have sketched, that President Ramaphosa's SONA and his first session of responding to questions were praised. The actions related to the Eskom Board and Eskom management have also given hope to a battered and bruised country, our significantly damaged economy and a disillusioned world. What a breath of fresh air was provided by the Chief Justice in his mature, dignified, yet humorous handling of his responsibilities during the change of political leadership.

It is often said of South Africans that we have 10 minutes historical memory about too many critical events, too much dubious leadership in public life, private enterprise and broad society encourages us to set the bar disturbingly low when we endorse, as potential holders of office, people whose track record cannot survive the full light of day. It is painfully true, Mr Deputy Speaker, that sunlight remains the best disinfectant.

In this regard, a budget once tabled and adopted should serve as a check-list whereby we hold governments, SOE's and other institutions to account. [Interjection.] An obvious mechanism through which this is done is through the formal state audit process. The ongoing positive performance of the

Western Cape Government as reported by the Auditor-General and the merit awards received by various departments within the Western Cape Government, are testament to the fact that the Budget we are addressing today is carefully compiled and a firm commitment to delivering to the poor people of this province. My congratulations to Minister Meyer and his staff as well as the staff of Provincial Treasury. I thank you.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Denis Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the Budget Committee and in particular, as Chairperson of the Budget Committee, I support the Budget Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure as tabled in this House on 6 March by our Minister of Finance, Dr Meyer.

†Dit is 'n DA begroting vir al die mense. Dis 'n oop proses vir die publiek wat in die koerante geadverteer was. [It is a DA budget for all the people. It is an open process for the public that has been advertised in the newspapers.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, I also want to take this opportunity to thank the Budget Council, our Premier, our Cabinet Ministers, our CFO's and HOD's and all their staff in all the departments, including Provincial Treasury staff, all the municipal staff, all the leaders in the municipalities who gave leadership and assistance over the months allowing our Minister of Finance to table the

Budget.

Mr Deputy Speaker, let me give a word of thanks to all the members of the Budget Committee representing their respective political parties, as well as the staff in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Why was the national Minister of Finance fired after he delivered his Budget speech? It was a vote-of-no-confidence in the Minister. This Western Cape Government is the most stable government in the last nine years.

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, gister was ook Menseregte Dag in Suid Afrika, ons vier hierdie dag sedert 21 Maart 1995 en dit is gebaseer op die Sharpeville Dag van 21 Maart 1960, toe 69 mense doodgeskiet is en 180 gewond is terwyl hulle teen die paswette betoog het. Die Departement van Kultuur en Sport het 'n begroting wat museums insluit, 'n begroting van R760 miljoen. In ons eie land gaan menseregte geskiedenis so ver terug, soos die Khoi en die San, wie se lewenswyse en kultuur uitgewis is, gevegte onder verskillende volke ontstaan het, as ook gevegte onder Afrikaners en Engelse wat tot groot konsentrasiekampe gelei het waar vroue en kinders se regte erg geskend was.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, in ons onlangse geskiedenis, veral ná 1948 toe apartheid wetgewing ons land se mense op grond van kleur en groepsgebiede verdeel het, het die bruin mense, die swart mense, die wit mense, die Indiër mense, wat hulle grond verloor het, dit verloor vir 'n minderheidsgroep. Hierdie misdaad teen die mensdom mag nooit weer gebeur nie. In die DA glo ons in regverdigheid, gelykheid asook die vryheid van assosiasie en

geleenthede vir almal.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr Deputy Speaker, yesterday was also Human Rights Day, we have celebrated this day since 21 March 1995 and it is based on Sharpeville Day of 21 March 1960 when 69 people were shot dead and 180 wounded while they were protesting against the pass laws. The Department of Culture and Sport has a budget that includes museums, a budget of R760 million. In our own country human rights go back so far as the Khoi and the San, whose lifestyles and cultures were wiped out, fights broke out amongst different nations, also between Afrikaners and English that led to large concentration camps where women's and childrens' rights were grossly violated.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in our recent history, especially after 1948 when apartheid legislation divided our country's people on the basis of colour and group areas, the brown people, the black people, the white people, the Indian people, who lost their land, lost it to a minority group. This crime against humanity may never happen again. In the DA we believe in justice, equality, as well as freedom of association and opportunities for all.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, let me recognise the role of the media in all its forms. Through their investigative work, they have produced many stories to civil society. Under difficult circumstances the media is driving a free and transparent press. It is disappointing to note that in yesterday's *Die Burger*

on Human Right's Day, the *Die Burger* did not reflect Human Right's Day as important, given their front page did not cover Human Rights as a national day, with a small story on page four.

†Anders as die ANC en die EFF laat die DA toe, self in die geval van Patricia de Lille teen die Federale Raad, dat die media onversteurd hulle werk doen.
[Unlike the ANC and the EFF the DA, even in the case of Patricia de Lille against the Federal Council, allows the media to do their work unhindered.]

Stories that the media reported on like Nkandla, the Marikana tragedy, SASSA scandal, Life Esidimeni and state capture bring South Africans to one question, why are some of the Ministers still serving in the Cabinet of President Ramaphosa? Many of these stories border on denying people their human rights, costing the taxpayers billions of rands. The ANC just simply ignored the media and questioned race by the DA and other Opposition parties.

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die ANC en Jacob Zuma en die ANC se belange is bo die land se belange gestel en in sekere gevalle ook bo die Konstitusie Grondwet.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC and Jacob Zuma and the ANC's interests were placed above the country's interests and in some instances also above that of

the Constitution.]

†The ANC is the ruling party and South Africa must first acknowledge their failure to deliver on the Government mandate in addressing land restitution according to Section 25 of the Constitution. The DA supports land transformation in a responsible manner. The ANC and the EFF want to change the Constitution, taking land without compensation. Firstly if this becomes a reality, it will be no different from when land under apartheid was taken away from people without compensation.

Secondly, the land that the ANC and the EFF wants does not even belong to them in the first place. Historically, according to the United Nations, the land belongs to the indigenous people and they are willing to share this land with all South Africans. So the best investment we can make is to allow title deeds to all people including the land on communal land. [Interjection.] Mr Deputy Speaker, the Budget for 2018/19 is once again directed to deal with the previously disadvantaged and the poor. The Budget is also ensuring that service delivery to all citizens in the Western Cape continues. It is only right that we thank those who faithfully pay their taxes to SARS and all the people who participate in the economy, directly or indirectly.

The Western Cape Government, with a staff of plus-minus 80 000, with their extended families, as well as the private sector, play a significant role in the economy together with Government who supports the pensioners, the SASSA beneficiaries and the non-governmental organisations. They all play an equal

part.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the total expenditure of over R62 billion for the 2018/19 financial year for the Western Cape will be used in all departments and all entities to stimulate an inclusive economy despite the experience currently of a flat economic growth rate due to the water crises and drought in the Western Cape. The continued reduction of water demand will avoid Day Zero. Saving water is very important and this will avoid an uncomfortable lifestyle for all citizens including ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... our visitors.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time has expired, do you just want to finish with your last sentence.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, in closing I would like to say that the ANC knows very well that the people rejects them. The people in this province know that under the DA Government they are in good hands and the future of SA, the hope of SA is in the hands of the DA.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired. The hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This Budget takes place a day after our country's Human Right's Day that serves as a reflection we have travelled together in South Africa to rid ourselves of the ugly past of segregation, exclusion and degradation caused by the apartheid structured socio economic political order.

It is in this context one is intrigued by statement of the Minister's Budget – the Budget for the people. Who are the people he refers to? [Interjections.] In addressing the disparities, South Africa had to infuse in its system a huge number of the majority that were deliberately excluded from the economy and as such, that reflects the project of South African democracy that is inclusive. The South African people remain a diverse group, diverse in their social standing, their political and economic standing. As such, hon Minister, who are the people you dedicate this Budget to? And I want to address once again, this issue of race here in this House, Mr Deputy Speaker. Race like gender and others remain measures of vulnerability to measure changes in society. It is also acknowledged as an assessment tool to realise and measure equality. So I am very worried when the colleagues on the other side, seek to silence everybody when they try to use one of these measures which is race and gender and others to understand [Interjection.] the decisions made by this particular Government.

If we believe that in this Government and in this province under the DA leadership that social economic rights are human rights which represent and must confer justice, equality, transformation for the betterment of all across

social and economic standing, if so, how do we measure and understand the message of this Budget to mirror what the DA chooses to do or not do for the people of the Western Cape?

We thus believe that if a budget is to be for the people, the guidelines provided by some of the institutes, in particular their studies on poverty and inequality which reflects three elements of focus, the revenue collection, the allocation and spending in budgets is what we must consider.

This Budget informs us of available revenue of R63,6 billion that is at the disposal of this Government against the mirrored and competing interest of the citizens of the Western Cape with about 93% thereof as transfers from national as both equitable share and conditional grants. We must appreciate through this, the concept of our constitutional democracy and adherence of our National Government to budget allocations to enable provinces to function and deliver services. That remains the role of the National Government. Whilst we celebrate an economic growth of the Western Cape, we must hasten the reality presented by the drought to continue this positive yield and growth trend.

Economists have told us of the possible risk exposure of the South African economy to harsh drought conditions as it presents serious water shortages for agricultural activities and production. The Western Cape accounts for 20% of the country's total agricultural labour force and rating agencies such as Moody have recently raised concerns of possible job losses in agriculture

that they correctly emphasise will result in the loss of tax income.

These are serious considerations that this Parliament and the whole of Government must be pre-occupied with. We cannot continue to largely deposit a rosy narrative of the Western Cape economy, an upward spiral where all is cosy, without also appreciating the warning signals of our current provincial realities.

Such must be questioned against the ability to respond to today's drought conditions that were raised in the USSD conference here on the shores of South Africa in September 2002 and concluded as part of Agenda 21. Are we only waking up to this reality now? If so, how are we to be measured? Are we a responsible government for the people, a government who failed to plan and planned to fail? It is from this world dialogue that citizens of the world and Government are already alive to this reality. As such, in the State of Environment Report of 2004, it identified the province, especially the Western Cape increasingly having rapid pressure on the already stressed Western Cape's water resources.

It further stated that the challenge for the province's water managers is extremely daunting. Not only do they have to supply water to a huge and rapidly growing population but they must also design reservoirs or utilise other, that is ground water resources, to contend with droughts of unpredictable magnitude at unpredictable times.

Interestingly, in 2017 we found ourselves back here talking about support for the PHA to preserve that land as such, to protect the aquifer against the DA-led Provincial Government, its Minister of Local Government who is also the Minister of Environmental Affairs, working with the DA-led City of Cape Town and their decisions to enable high end property development on this land where underneath sits a critical under-water resource.

On the other hand, the Minister of Economic Development and Tourism and also the Minister of Agriculture were caught between a rock and a hard place to make arguments or succumb to pressure over preserving this critical resource of national importance, that already was identified in 2004 State of the Environment Report, that the ground water resources of the Western Cape province are generally under-utilised.

Today is International Water Day as declared by the UN General Assembly in March 1993 and the Western Cape economy and the City of Cape Town in particular remains a serious risk to the security of water supply. We ask what happened to the DA Day Zero? Where is Mayor Patricia de Lille? There is a leadership tussle whilst we are grappling with this reality. We are told through the Moody's Investor Services that the water crises poses a credit risk to Cape Town's debt rating which is currently at the lowest level of investment grade, BWA3, which is the lowest investment grade and as such, added that the City was on review for a downgrade.

Why are these not elevated into serious economic risks of this economy? Are

we led by a responsible government in this province? Are these being swept under the carpet? We must welcome the President of the ANC and the State President, Cyril Ramaphosa, on his announcement in the SONA to heighten efforts of dealing with the impact of the drought by elevating the drought as a national state of disaster ... [Interjections.] mentioning three provinces including the Western Cape.

Drought remains a huge challenge and we join all efforts to save the current water resources and call for the speedy implementation of water saving and augmentation initiatives. This Government must visit and share notes with its counterparts in KZN where in December 2014, the KZN Provincial Government declared a drought in the province. In May 2017, the Richard's Bay Desalination Plant was launched and has improved water security and reliability for that province and especially local communities that have access through their water schemes.

Section 24 of the Constitution states that everyone has a right to an environment that is not harmful to their health or well-being and further have the environment protected for the benefit of present and future generations, through reasonable legislative and other measures, and as such we support the case lodged by our ANC Youth League Activist, Advocate Winston Erasmus, against this DA Government to answer on the delay in establishing the Environmental Commission.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon member. Your time has expired.

Please finish your last sentence.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The features of a robust drive for inclusive growth in this province remains to be seen. This is an all known fact that ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... the market cannot provide everything. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has now expired. I see hon Minister Meyer to respond.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you hon members for taking part in this debate. I have listened carefully and thank you for acknowledging that this is a budget for the people. Hon Minister Mbombo is correct, we also need the application of fairness in the fiscal framework. Hon members this Budget also makes provision for R25 billion, over the next three years specifically, to deal with the issues of infrastructure and this Cabinet has adopted an infrastructure-led growth strategy.

But, also more importantly, Mr Deputy Speaker and members of this House, I am particularly happy that through the work of the various Ministers; the Minister of Human Settlements, the Minister of Education, the Minister of Health and specifically also the Minister of Social Development, we will now

focus more heavily on maintenance and repairs and R5,2 billion has been set aside for repairs and maintenance. In this province we have prioritised repairs and maintenance and so I want to thank hon member Mackenzie for also speaking about support for the infrastructure-led growth strategy.

Minister Fritz is correct, this is a budget for the poor because this is a government that cares for people. This was not, hon members, an easy Budget. We had long hours with the Treasury and with the Premier and with the Budget Committee, thinking about how we could put this Budget together because firstly, we had a Budget cut of R1,4 billion nationally, implications for all the provinces, a R1,6 billion cut nationally and a R1,7 billion budget in the outer year. How does that impact on your budget?

We understand that R1,4 billion translates into a R144 million budget cut and that is what this Budget is for this year, R166 million for next year and R177 million for the outer year. Those were the budget cuts in respect of the provincial equitable share. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, members of this House must know and it will affect all of you, since all of us are also members of various constituencies; for this year there is a R3,4 billion cut in the conditional grants that will impact severely on your members that you represent in this House, in the context of infrastructure grants.

It is sad because hon member Schäfer and hon member Mackenzie are correct that this Zuma added tax is now coming at a price and that price is a R3,4 billion cut nationally through the conditional grants. R1,4 billion for this

year, on the equitable share. It will certainly hit the poor.

But, what we have done in this particular Budget, Mr Deputy Speaker, is to protect the vulnerable people, to protect the poor, specifically if you look at the Budget and most of you have been there, in fact all of you were there when we tabled the Budget of R22 billion for Education, R23 billion for Health and also R2,2 billion for Social Development. What we were able to do was to protect those particular budgets through the provincial equitable share. This Cabinet has resolved that there shall be no cuts in the provincial equitable share in respect of those three departments – precisely Denis. I think the *Die Burger* understands the topic, a budget for the poor, †‘n begroting vir die armes, juis omdat ons beskerming gebied het binne daardie breë benadering. [a budget for the poor, especially because we offered protection within that broad approach].

But, what is more tragic, Mr Deputy Speaker, what is clear, we had a R48 billion under collection in tax.

The PREMIER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: How did that happen? Here is the answer Premier. The answer is very clear. There has been a complete mismanagement at the South African Revenue Services. The South African Revenue Services is the supreme tax collecting authority but what do they do? The core business of the tax office is to collect tax. What are they doing with their

core responsibility?

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] Temporary responsibility.

The PREMIER: Listen.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Listen, hon member Dugmore. An under-collection of R48 billion in tax. The core business of the tax office is tax collection. If you outsource your core business, you have no more mandate or control over it and that is what has happened. They have outsourced their core function to eight agencies. This is the national democratic revolution that wants to insource everything but they have outsourced tax collection. This is absolute madness. R48 billion outsourced because they could not collect tax. Eight agencies.

But, this is the real story. What they have done, is that they have appointed a new integrated credit solution. This is what they have done. When you outsource your core business, you are moving into the space of complacency but one of the members, the staff members of SARS, that worked in SARS, that must collect domestic resource mobilisation, what is he doing? He first organised a new integrated credit solution, one of these companies, what does this company do? They pay R600,000 into his bank account. One of the service providers of SARS, that is outsourced, he received R600,000 in his bank account. This is what you are doing. His name is Jonas Makwakwa. He eventually had to quit but this is the situation.

So, when people, when we face these budget cuts of R48 billion it is a result of the mismanagement of the tax office and we are glad, but we are more happy ...

The PREMIER: And the collapse of the economy.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and the collapse of the economy – because there are deeper things happening. [Interjections.] But also when people mismanage the tax office, people automatically do not want to further pay tax and so hon members this is definitely something to really worry about. Hon members, I think this is a tragedy but there is good news, temporary good news for now.

I am very happy that the Commissioner of SARS has been suspended. He is absolutely no good. [Interjections.] The hon minister Grant mentioned that a budget is a reflection of your values and what are the values of this Government? This Budget gives effect to competence, caring, accountability, integrity, innovation and this Budget is definitely in the space of responsiveness. [Interjections.] Hon members ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] values.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Your values will now come in the next few

lines. Hon members, I am glad to see on the Order Paper today in this House, a Notice of Motion that the House debates land expropriation without compensation, in the name of hon Member Schäfer. Hon members must all deeply think about this debate as the EFF and ANC are now smelling losing the election in 2019. [Interjections.]

That is what is happening because when you lose an election you make popular statements and this land grab is nothing but trying to steal the election through the back-door. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: [Inaudible.] farms.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I know you have got farms ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... because you have got some farms through land reform and I am looking after your farm now specifically in Drakenstein. So the EFF is coming for your farm hon member. We, Mr Deputy Speaker, on a more serious note, are prepared for this debate. We will not allow the ANC and the EFF to ruin this beautiful country. We will not allow you to turn South Africa into a Zimbabwe. Hon member Olivier we will not allow you and your absent EFF colleague to turn this country into a Zimbabwe because we believe ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, we are ready MEC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Olivier, we believe in the constitutional democracy. We will debate it and we are looking forward to that debate. We are going to fill this gallery for the people to see, because we want that debate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would also like to thank all the members and the Ministers for their various inputs. During this debate, the Chair of the Budget Committee, Denis Joseph, †hy is amper [he is almost] a judge, sorry I almost declared you a judge. Hon Denis Joseph, the Chair of the Budget Committee said this is the best run government in South Africa and hon member Olivier said ... [Interjection.]. No, there is a correction. He said this is the best run government in the whole world! I put it for the record of Hansard. [Laughter.][Applause.]

Hon member Olivier must note that we are not sleeping like in the National Assembly, so when you speak it goes on the record. It is now on the record that this is the best run government in the whole world. That is your version.

It is on the record of this Parliament. Also, hon member Olivier, right in front of you, Mr Deputy Speaker, right in front of all of us, is also the minutes of the Budget Committee. I have read the minutes and the minutes says the Budget Committee has adopted and approved this Budget.

I want to thank you for that support from the Budget Committee. I want to thank the Premier, I want to thank the Leader of Government Business, the members of the Cabinet. I want to thank Zak Hoosain, the Head of the Provincial Treasury; the Director-General, Advocate Gerber; the whole team in the Provincial Budget Office and; Julinda Cantana, the Chief Director, Provincial Governance - thank you for the work that you are doing in that Budget Office. I want to thank all the accounting officers of the various departments, but also the accounting officers of the various public entities.

For the record – hon member Olivier and hon member Nkondlo – 100% of all the public entities got a clean audit, unlike in the National Parliament where Eskom, took R350 billion out of R500 billion state guarantees. That madness must stop and I yesterday met with Minister Mninawa Ntloko and I mentioned to her that Eskom refused to give their staff budget to the Treasury. Where in the world would you see something like this? We are now going to ask for the staff and compensation budget of Eskom. For now, they refuse but we are going to subpoena them because we want to see what is happening there.

In this Government all the public entities, when we practice fiscal consolidation, when we issue Budget circulars to the various accounting

officers and to the various Ministers, we also issue that Budget circular to all the public entities because they are in part of the Budget fiscal space, unlike in the National Assembly you have a budget and Eskom is on another planet. We will bring them back to planet earth where we belong in terms of our Budget.

Mr Deputy Speaker I thank everybody for this work and I want to thank the Budget Office, they have produced an outstanding Budget and if there is any applause, it must be for the Budget Office. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER. Thank you, hon Minister that concludes the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the principle? No objections. Agreed to.

The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: From tomorrow onwards we will debate the individual Votes as per the Estimates of Expenditure, the Blue Book and the debate will be more confined to the individual portfolios and Votes. That brings us to the end of the Business for the Day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:48