
TUESDAY, 23 FEBRUARY 2016

The House met at 10:00

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good morning, †molweni *greetings. I would like to take this opportunity to welcome our guests in the gallery. Please be assured that we appreciate your presence here but we also want to draw your attention to the fact that our guests cannot participate in the proceedings of the House, and that includes clapping of hands, heckling and interjections.

To the honourable members, good morning. We have a full speakers list today. It is a pretty full programme, and I would like to ask upfront that I ensure the members' co-operation in trying to make sure that this sitting goes through as smoothly as possible. Thank you.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

Debate on and reply to Premier's State of the Province Address.

The SPEAKER: I have received a copy of the Premier's State of the Province Address delivered in the House on Friday. The address is printed in the minutes of the proceedings, and I now place it in the House for debate.

I see the Honourable Leader of the Opposition, the Honourable Magaxa.
[Applause.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Honourable Speaker, the Honourable Premier of the Western Cape, honourable Members, distinguished guests and my dear comrades, most importantly, the people of the Western Cape:

Madam Speaker, this debate takes place during a painful time for workers in our country, with three mine workers, of whom two are women, Yvonne Mnisi, Pretty Mabuza and Solomon Nyirenda, painfully trapped underground at Lily Gold Mine. Today marks day 18 of this tragic experience. We stand in solidarity with their loved ones and pray for their successful rescue.

On behalf of the black poor majority of the Western Cape, we rise as the African National Congress to convey their plight, hopes and aspirations for a Western Cape where they are equal citizens.

At our 53rd National Conference in Mangaung we resolved that the main content of the ANC's National Democratic Revolution remains the liberation

of Africans in particular and blacks in general from political and socio-economic bondage. This means uplifting the quality of life of all South Africans, especially the poor, the majority of whom are Africans and female. At the same time it has the effect of liberating the white community from the false ideology of racial supremacy and insecurity attached to oppressing others.

At our annual January the 8th celebration held in Rustenburg earlier this year, we declared 2016 and I quote, “The year of advancing people’s power, placing active citizenry at the centre of our society’s development.” This declaration reaffirms our commitment as a liberation movement to uplifting the lives of our people through active engagement in democratic processes. It is also a clear indicator that the ANC places our people at the centre of governance and the development of a non-racial, non-sexist, truly democratic society.

South Africa remains a unitary state and we envisage a Western Cape which is in line with our national objectives as a country.

The Western Cape is one of our nine provinces. Its success are the successes of South Africa as a whole and its challenges are those of the rest of South Africa. We can only have a united South Africa when we have a united Western Cape. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Therefore the heightened inequality we currently face between racially divided classes, which perpetuates sexism, must be directly attributed to the Democratic Alliance Provincial Government. Our strategic objective of attaining a National Democratic Society will never be realised under the current conditions. The DA Government is politically and ideologically opposed to these ideals of equality ...[Interjection]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ideals that many of our icons died for.

Premier, your painful long speech last Friday unfortunately was uninspiring, petty and filled with untruths and opportunism and quite frankly, lacked leadership, vision and is based on your imagination.

We expected to hear the Premier of the Western Cape speaking about how she and her government plan to uplift the lives of the poor majority of this province. Instead we had a former, or perhaps a leader, of the Democratic Alliance who continues to lead from the grave providing us with petty anecdotes of how great the DA is. In fact, what we received on Friday was not a State of the Province Address but rather The State of DA Address. Madam Premier, as I sat here ... [Interjection.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole! Gooi kole!

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals! Throw coals!

Mr K E MAGAXA ... and listened to your speech, the one thing which became abundantly clear is that the Government you lead and the political party you represent pose a real danger to unity and equality in this province and indeed the country. White privilege and racial prejudice run through every paragraph, sentence, including full stops, of your address. I sat in disgust at the discriminative comments you made, all whilst your colleagues sat laughing. Oddly enough, even those honourable members of the DA who experience racial discrimination in the province joined their colleagues in laughing. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me share one particular disgusting rant you made, and I quote:

“A library in Khayelitsha has the highest book out-take in the country. Can you believe it?”

Madam Premier, you then repeated this comment as if to further prove how racial ideology and discrimination has embedded itself in your outlook.

I would like ask Madam Premier, what exactly is so unbelievable? Is it the fact that black people actually can and do read, or is it the fact that a library

which barely has any resources due to the skewed allocation of funds in this province is actually excelling, or perhaps even both?

In fact, Madam Premier, I think I am being too harsh on you. Surely I am expecting too much from someone who believes that poor black people migrating from other provinces are refugees. [Interjections.]

At the forefront of increasing racial tension, bigotry and the exploitation of the poor in the province is the Government you lead, Madam Premier. In this regard, you cannot put the culpability of increasing racial and class inequality at the doorstep of President Jacob Zuma, the ANC, a mythical “destabilisation campaign”. In fact the instability of this province is a campaign engineered by you ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Stand down!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... and the backward ideologies sitting opposite the ANC benches, those who are howling and ranting now. [Interjections.] This mindset has been developed through ...[Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, take your seat please.

Mr M G E WILEY: Accusing the Premier of a criminal act is not ...

[Interjections.]

.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members

Mr M G E WILEY: ... permissible. Accusing a Premier of being an architect of instability is accusing of her of a criminal act and that is unparliamentary.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your point has been noted. Order, please hon member Ms Davids. You may proceed, hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact, the instability of this province is a campaign engineered by you and the backward ideologies sitting opposite the ANC benches. This mindset has been developed through a Premier who cannot hide her ideological and subjective disposition of poor black people as an “other”, or a racial “other”. An “other” which is not expected to be able to read and have an appreciation for the accumulation of knowledge because this “other” is sub-human and their assimilation to “human status” is something which is unbelievable and worthy of “special recognition”.

The children of Khayelitsha, according to the Premier, must continue to live in conditions of squalor, exclusion, inferiority, economic oppression and exploitation.

The DA, through every utterance, every policy and every action, has come to optimise white patriarchal racism. Do these characteristics not remind you of a certain government of the past that the ANC dislodged? [Interjections.]

We all witnessed the “Baas John” moment, hon member John Steenhuisen, had in the National Assembly ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...last Wednesday when he stood up and told an elderly African male that he is talking rubbish. [Interjections.]

This does not surprise us. The “baas” mentality is very rife in the Democratic Alliance. All one has to do is observe the behaviour of the DA Chief Whip, Hon member Mr Mark Wiley, to witness “baas” mentality at play. [Interjections.]

I do not know if she remembers, but shortly before crossing the floor to the DA, Patricia de Lille accused the DA of the same “baas” mentality. She might have forgotten now that she has assimilated the “baas” status, assuming that she has, of course.

In the recent weeks we have seen a spike in racist attacks. One would have imagined that a Premier of a province which remains as racially segregated as the Western Cape would come out strongly on such issues. However, there

was no mention of any plan for social integration, social cohesion and fighting racism in her address.

Black students at institutions of higher learning in the Western Cape remain targets of racist attacks. Black women are beaten up for just walking the white streets of the Southern Suburbs where our Premier comes from.

The Dianne Kohler Barnards and Penny Sparrows of the DA prove that the Democratic Alliance harbours people that lust over the past and continuously entrench the oppressive *status quo* through any means at their disposal.
[Interjections.]

The Premier said that she dedicates the SOPA and the remaining three years of her Premiership to the youth, which is welcomed. She said that Cape Town has become a magnet for young people. I wonder which young people she is referring to because young black professionals are actually ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... leaving the City of Cape Town due to racism.
[Interjections.] If the City of Cape Town ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... is a magnet for anything, it is a magnet for racism.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, please take your seat. I am sorry, please take your seat. Honourable members, I need to request your co-operation; both sides of the floor; we have a speaker and your ongoing little debate is drowning the speaker out. So, please just tone it down a little bit, please. You may proceed, Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: If the City of Cape Town is a magnet for anything it is a magnet for racism. All you have to do is ask any young black professional of their experience of seeking accommodation in the City of Cape Town, or entering a restaurant on upper Kloof Street. The very same young people she dedicates her state of the DA to, have actually become unemployed under her watch. [Interjections.] Youth jobs under the DA are at the lowest they have ever been in the last ten years. Let's go the statistics ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In 2006 youth jobs were at 934 000. By 2012 this figure fell to 844 000. At the end of the year 2014, there were about 856 000 youth jobs in the Western Cape. This, therefore, means that 78 000 young people were no longer in employment in the Western Cape by the end of 2014 because the Premier selectively quoted employment numbers. Let me provide the real numbers of youth jobs in the Western Cape. In Quarter 2 of 2015,

5 000 more young people became unemployed in the Western Cape. 21 000 young people became employed ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...between 2009 and the end of 2014. Perhaps the Premier should dedicate her last three years of Premiership to those 21 000 young people who have lost their jobs under her watch. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She is not going to get the ... [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Premier has a long history of being anti-youth. Her track record as Mayor in the City of Cape Town proves this. One of the first things she did as the Mayor of the City of Cape Town was to close down the Youth Council.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Office of the Premier of the Western Cape is the only one in the country which does not support the National Youth Development Agency. The question I must ask ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... my dear Premier, is why are you anti-youth or is your

problem with black youth rather, or black female youth in particular? [Interjections.] Perhaps we should ask Lindiwe Mazibuko and Mbali Ntuli whom the Premier pushed out of the DA vehemently and aggressively.

Let us look at the Western Cape's jobs story. The Premier boasted about how the unemployment rate of the Western Cape was down to 20,6% in September 2015 from 24,8% in 2012. However, what the Premier selectively failed to mention is that in 2009 she inherited a province with an unemployment rate of 19,9% which was the lowest in the country when she took over. This therefore means that the unemployment rate went up under the premiership of Helen Zille and her Alliance.

When comparing the unemployment in the Western Cape with that of other provinces, KwaZulu-Natal has decreased their official unemployment rate by 3,6% and their expanded unemployment rate by 5,2% for the year ending September 2015. KwaZulu-Natal had the second highest job gains with 158 000; followed by Gauteng with 191 000 jobs for the year ending September 2015. Nationally, 15,3 million people are now employed, the highest yet in our economic history.

This proves that the notion that the Western Cape under the DA is the best run province remains a myth fuelled by deliberate misinformation on the part of the DA's propaganda.

While jobs have grown in the Western Cape, the racial composition of these jobs are in line with the DA's core mandate of preserving white privilege and entrenching racial and economic inequalities.

Job creation in the Western Cape continues to benefit white people. The latest Employment Equity Report shows that 63,8% of top management positions in the Western Cape are occupied by white males, while only 2% are occupied by African males. White females occupy 14% of the top management positions while African females occupy just 1% of top management positions in the province. When compared to other provinces, the Western Cape has the highest percentage of top and senior management posts occupied by white people, as expected under the DA leadership. [Interjection.]

Now, the Premier states that there are over 200 more jobs in the Western Cape than there were when she came into office, but she, however, selectively failed to tell us who the bulk of those jobs went to. While white South Africans made up to 16% of Western Cape residents of working age in 2014, they benefitted from 57% of total job growth in the province from 2009 to 2014. Africans made 32% of the working population of the province, but just got 16% of jobs. This is but one example of a government hell-bent on entrenching a racialised economy. The DA is a racist party. [Interjections.]

It is also rather interesting that the Premier speaks about 200 000 jobs from 2009 to 2014 because the DA promised South Africans 6 million jobs in their

election manifesto in 2014.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr K E MAGAXA: What then becomes of the other 5,8 million jobs? Surely those only exist †pha kuMnumzana uMaimane, entlokweni kuye. *there in the head of Mr Maimane.

The Premier speaks about the slow growth rate of the economy nationally and blames the slow growth in the Western Cape on the national wage increase. Her attack on the national wage increase of 7,2% proves that the Premier and the DA as a whole are anti-decent wages. Their labour policy which is anti-union and anti-collective bargaining proves that the right of workers to decent wages, collective bargaining and protection, are things the Democratic Alliance are opposed to. This is a bourgeois party.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Premier even has the audacity to propose the capping of wage increases to 5,5% while the current inflation rate for year end 2015 is 5,2%, which means that lower income workers will barely be able to survive and afford basic goods and services such as food and transport. This is yet another example of a provincial administration determined to preserve class divisions and worker exploitation.

The triple crisis of poverty, unemployment and inequality remains a huge challenge for South Africa.

We are pleased that in his State of the Nation Address, President Zuma did not shy away from the fact that South Africa will face economic challenges in the year ahead as South Africa does not exist in a vacuum, but is affected by global economic trends. [Interjections.]

In staying true to her character, the Premier did not fail to remind us that the Western Cape's economic growth rate is higher than the national average because she is consistently competing and not in partnership with our National Government.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr K E MAGAXA: What the Premier failed to mention was that over the past 10 years, the economic growth rate of the Western Cape has always been higher than the national average except for 2012 where the national average was 3% and the provincial average stood at 2,6%. Over the last six years the Western Cape economy has not grown above a 3% average with 2012 and 2013 being the most devastating on the economy of the province.

The reality of the matter is that our economy nationally has been facing difficulties since the financial crisis in 2008 and Government at a national level has done fairly well in stabilising a very volatile situation. We take

note of the nine point plan as presented by President Jacob Zuma which we believe will make a difference.

I am pleased the Premier made mention of the fire season which is currently upon us; as we know that it is the poor black majority who are affected by these fires. It is, however, unfortunate that while congratulating fire fighters, correctly so, for their hard work done, the Premier failed to mention the displaced people of Ward 89 in Khayelitsha who were displaced by fires on 1 January 2013, just imagine, 2013, and remain there till today.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr K E MAGAXA: She failed to mention the people of SST in Site B who had to erect their shacks without any assistance from this Government. While she correctly applauds the fire fighters she conveniently forgets the nine innocent lives lost in December 2015 due to fires. She forgets the people of Masiphumelele, deliberately forgetting Imizamo Yethu, Hangberg, Khayelitsha and countless of other poor communities who continue to reside in complete destitution and hopelessness.

Apart from the obvious misinformation presented by the Premier to this House on Friday, her speech was also filled with glaring broken promises.

In 2012, the Premier promised that by 2014, 70% of Government facilities and every school shall be connected to broadband and ICT access in every ward. We are now in 2016 and this remains to be seen.

The Jooste Hospital which we were promised will be reconstructed in 2013 has since been closed down by this Government. This is in line with the DA believing that poor black people do not deserve quality healthcare. As DA MP, the hon member Mr James Wilmot said in the SONA debate last week, the National Health Insurance is a Rolls Royce, meaning that black people do not deserve a Rolls Royce. [Interjections.]

I was rather taken aback when the Premier announced her plans to conduct a study of moving the Administrative Capital of South Africa to Cape Town. She mentioned a proposal for a public private partnership to locate major Government administration buildings and parliamentary residential accommodation in the proximity of three hectares available for development to our current Parliament.

One wonders why these plans were not explored when we called for inner city migration through making space available for low cost housing for the working class who work in the city. The fact of the matter is that the Premier and her Government simply refuse to provide affordable housing. The Provincial Government has instead chosen to sell public land perfectly suited for housing to investors with no strings attached.

Last week, we learned that Public Works MEC, Donald Grant, has given notice that four prime sites are up for sale in the CBD with a combined development potential of 300 000 square metres or 30 rugby fields, according to that [Inaudible], the first of which, the old Tafelberg Remedial School in Sea Point has already been sold to a wealthy private individual. There the opportunity to build 216 mixed income affordable units has already been lost. [Interjections.]

We also learned that for the other three sites the Province proposes mixed-use development similar to the Old Biscuit Mill in Woodstock ...

An HON MEMBER: It is true.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... with space for exclusive apartments targeting investors and tourists. This is elite land captured for exclusive use by the already privileged of rich who are by and large white. [Interjection.]

The billions of rands invested into the province by private sector should again not be presented as social and economic advances by the Western Cape Government. The poor of the province will never see a cent of the billions of this investment. Most major private sector corporate social investments only comprise of a minuscule amount of profit they reap and only scratch the surface of poor communities where the private sector secure their work place.

The Premier also failed to present a comprehensive plan to support and develop the informal sector economy.

The Provincial Government presents us with a narrative that the private sector alone will resolve all our employment challenges. Again, not realising that many, mainly African, workers are forced to make a living in the informal sector economy due to historical disadvantages that marginalise poor people in a hostile atmosphere. [Interjections.] Further, the billions brought ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... in from the surge in tourism gives little economic benefit to the workers in the industry.

If anything, Madam Premier, your speech was an absolute joke.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...an insult to the people of the Western Cape, including you by the way, if you want to transform this country.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You have proven yet again that instead of working with National Government, you have chosen to fight it.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja, you know that.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: How can you ... [Inaudible]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Instead of meaningfully uplifting the lives of the poor majority, you entrench a racialised economy which benefits white people. Madam hon member Schäfer, one of the most reactionary people I have ever come across in this House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Instead of meaningfully uplifting the lives of the poor majority ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, please take your seat.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can I finish that sentence?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, there is a point of order. Please take your seat. Hon member Mr Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: I would like to rise on a point of order, Madam Speaker. That we do not cast aspersions on hon members sitting in this House and the member is out of order. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mngqasela. Hon member Magaxa, if I can address you: I heard you saying that hon member Schäfer is the most reactionary of the lot. It is casting an aspersion on an individual who is present in the House.

Ms S W DAVIDS: What is wrong with the word?

The SPEAKER: If you could refrain from that I would appreciate it. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can you educate me on what is wrong with the word, reactionary?

Ms S W DAVIDS: What is wrong with the word?

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Magaxa. Just for noting. Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In conclusion I want to mention this again, instead of meaningfully uplifting the lives of the poor majority, you entrench a racialised economy. Instead of fighting racism, you have institutionalised it and some people see it is a culture of the Western Cape.

Mr S W DAVIDS: Yes!

Mr K E MAGAXA: As the African National Congress and the people of the Western Cape, we reject your so-called State of the Province Address which to us is just about demonstrating how weak your governance is. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon member Magaxa.

The PREMIER: Where is Marius? [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Are you missing him?

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, please hon members. I can answer that question. I have received an apology from the Hon member Mr Fransman, so may we proceed. I see the Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I want to start off by saying that the content of - and I am not going to call

anyone a leader, because I think it is the General Secretary of the South African Communist Party, on behalf of the ANC, that has made that speech today.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to say ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is interesting that ..
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Prins, if you could take your seat please. Is it a point order?

Ms M N GILLION: It is a point of order, Madam Speaker. The Leader of the Opposition has been announced to your office.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Ms M N GILLION: And I want to plead that every member in this House please respect our Leader of the Opposition.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed, Hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Then I will call him the acting Leader, because I cannot remember [Inaudible.] been elected as the Leader. [Interjection.] I just want to also echo the acting Leader of the Opposition.

An HON MEMBER: He is not acting!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: When was he elected? Poor Marius Fransman.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I just want to also echo the words and the message of support and strength to the mine workers who are trapped underground. On behalf of this Government, the DA Government in the Western Cape, our sincere concern at this point, we know the difficult time they are going through.

Mr P UYS: Where is your speech?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You know, honourable, and I

know I am a sweeper, but I am so tempted, I cannot help not saying something that ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The hon acting Leader of the Opposition ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...speaks all the time. He is the one who made the point that we are the ones who are dividing people along class lines. He speaks only of the African workers. What about the Coloured workers? What about the White workers? What about Indian workers in this province? [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He racialises the working class.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, we have a far way to go and cannot have members shouting across at the speaker, and similarly both sides of the House. We cannot drown out the speaker on the floor. Hon member Ms Davids, I am not singling you out,

but you were the first one to launch into the speaker. If you do not mind, interjection is allowed, but you cannot give an on-going commentary. †Asseblief mense, kan ons net n bietjie bedaar. *Please people, can we just calm down a little. Let us try and maintain the dignity and decorum of the House and let us try and get through this sitting without all these interruptions. You may proceed, Hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is interesting that the ANC constantly accuses the DA of being racist and they have nothing else. I listened to that speech, it was hollow. He calls the Premier's speech a joke. I think that was the biggest joke. [Interjections]. The acting hon Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

The point I want to make is there was nothing of substance in that speech. There was absolutely no content in the speech and all he could give were vague insinuations and aspersions on people in the House. It leaves me with almost nothing else to say in this speech. In her SOPA speech last week, the Premier clearly spelt out the contribution the Provincial Government is making towards building a capable state.

The issue in this House is about whether we have a capable state or not and let us go through South Africa and let us go and assess other countries and let us see whether we have capable state or not.[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, please address the Chair.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It, of course, greatly pains the ANC that this province has consistently, and we are talking based on evidence, on statistics produced not by us, but by the National Government itself that this is the top province in every aspect of governance. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: In the tired and unimaginative view of the ANC, all the tremendous growth that we have made, based on real evidence and statistics, can only be reduced by them to race, the poor thing of race. I feel so sorry for everyone else who is not African. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Waarom sit ... [Onhoorbaar.] Ons gee net die waarheid terug.

*The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Why sit ... [Inaudible.] We are just giving back the truth.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, please kindly address the Chair. Do not engage Hon member Ms Davids in the debate. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The question is why is it that the ANC is incapable of engaging meaningfully on the key issues as outlined in the Premier's speech? They cannot address it. He did not address one of the issues in the Premier's speech. [Interjections.]

There is a battle of appearances *versus* reality being waged in this Legislature. On the one hand, the ANC is hell-bent on giving the appearance that the province has declined whereas the reality, based on every piece of evidence, is that we have, in fact, increased the performance of this province and service delivery to the poor in this province and I think that calls for an amen. [Interjections.]

Our services, as a government, are overwhelmingly skewed towards serving the poor communities. And you know what? The Provincial Treasury has shown that 76% of our spending goes into the poor through services, jobs and growing the economy. This benefits the poor and the poorest communities. I want to take them by the hand and lead them through the streets of Hanover Park and Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain and take them to some people, some young boys who have been empowered by this province.

To date the ANC has never produced a shred of evidence to dispute this fact, yet they say: they serve only the rich. They continue to say that we only serve the rich. This is an ANC delusion, one which has come to characterise the party at large. This is a party of delusions, such as those of the National General Secretary, Gwede Mantashe, who said that the USA are planning a

regime change in South Africa through a youth exchange programme.

An HON MEMBERS: The voters ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Exactly! It is the voters. I want to remind the honourable House. It is the voters who in this province planned and executed the regime change and they will never be elected into power. Never be elected back! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC really have – we can categorically say, never.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, please take your seat, hon member Ms Davids, I am appealing to you. I know you love to get stuck into the debate, but please allow the speaker to present. I am sure you will have an opportunity, but we cannot allow on-going commentary, if you do not mind. I am going to appeal to the Hon Chief Whip if you could assist, it would be greatly appreciated. Thank you. You may proceed, Hon Minister Mr Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to put it to the House that the contrast could not have been greater. Whilst the Premier of this

Province delivered a speech which inspired confidence, the former leader of the ANC, Marius Fransman, was putting up posts on Facebook questioning why his tenure as leader was rocky and uncertain. The question is will he now join the growing coalition of the wounded of the ANC or ... [Interjections.]

Let me guess, it is a choice of deciding whether he will be a poo thrower or an ambassador somewhere depending on what he decides [Laughter.] or an inmate. That is the third option. It is a very startling thing. So it is an ANC that is in complete disarray.

The State of the Province Address, delivered by Hon Helen Zille, left residents of this province with a great sense of hope. We are building a capable state founded on freedom, fairness and opportunity. Let me repeat a key fact shared by the Premier last week. The 2015 Public Service Awards, a national ceremony held by the Department of Public Service Administration, saw every gold, silver and bronze medal ...

An HON MEMBER: Every!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... come to this Province. Every one of them. I want to repeat; every gold, silver and bronze award, nationally for the departments and heads of departments, came to the Western Cape, and this they cannot run away from. They can run, but they cannot hide and this is the problem with the ANC on the other side. Every one of

our 13 departments received a financially unqualified audit outcome with 12 receiving clean audits. Is that not amazing? Then they call it compliance, compliance.

This is unprecedented because in other provinces the nearest they come, I think, is 50% or 30%. They are useless in capable government anywhere else they govern. [Interjections.] The reality is the DA led Western Cape Government, through good governance and delivery, is addressing the legacy of racism. [Interjection.] One only has to look at the diverse Cabinet, and I am proud today to say I am associated with the diverse caucus sitting behind me. It is the only diverse caucus and I am very proud to say I am part of it. I used to sit there where it was just one group, now it is very nice to be in a very diverse group. [Interjections.]

And this diversity is not based on bean counting. †Ons sê nie hoeveel vrouens ... *We do not say how many women...[Interjection.][Inaudible.] is useless. We talk about the capabilities of people on this side of the House. I am so proud to be part of this House, of this DA Government in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

We are building strong institutions, pockets of excellence which are extending quality services to the most vulnerable segments of our society and we will continue to do this. And I want to, just for the record say, our Government, in this House and our departments, will assist the Premier in her next three years, and she will be here in three years' time. [Interjections.]

We will assist her to promote, we will continue to promote youth unemployment and youth [Inaudible.] They neglected youth [Inaudible.] We will continue to empower young people wherever we find them and we will go look for them and empower them.

And they know, a lot of them know, how many of them phone me late at night to ask to empower them ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...because they cannot do it.

An HON MEMBER: Stop pointing ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, can I ask that you manage your finger, please. I know it is part of your - please do.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: In fact, in testament to this, the Department of Social Development has over the last six years expanded services and brought them closer to communities. My Department has moved from one head office over 16 district offices and one head office overseeing an expanded network of six regional offices and now we have 37 local offices where the people are living and where services are ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, your time has expired. You must finish up. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, can we have some order please. There is too much noise in the Chamber. I see the Hon member Ms Schäfer, you may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, we are here today to debate one of the most important issues affecting our citizens. How we plan to build a resilient, inclusive and a competitive space, unlocking and unblocking the growth potential of this Western Cape Province.

You see, National Government has failed dismally to really tackle the unjust disparities of our past, and in particular the economic exclusion where so many South Africans find themselves today. The small inside group of the ANC *versus* the mass of outsiders, the people of South Africa.

How are we, in the Western Cape, providing solutions to changing the disparity that still exists in our country today? It is through the Western Cape's focussed economic strategy which aims to stimulate specific sectors of our economy where the greatest opportunity for jobs and economic growth can occur.

Madam Speaker, in the face of the national job crisis, I am happy to say that the Western Cape is still able to provide more jobs than the rest of the country. According to Stats SA, hon member Magaxa ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...between 2008 and 2015, 200 000 new jobs have been created and in the same period while we were creating these ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...new jobs, the unemployment in South Africa has risen by almost 1,2 million people. It is absolutely astounding that President Zuma just yesterday publicly stated that David van Rooyen was the most highly qualified Finance Minister he has ever appointed. [Interjections.] I say that the President has absolutely no jobs planned and definitely does not understand the economy, because you know what happened after he said that? The rand reacted and once again tumbled 9/12. The day the rand crashed. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You see, the Western Cape has a jobs plan, a real jobs plan. With Project Khulisa, our focus on tourism, the oil and gas sector and

agri-processing, the Western Cape is well on the track to creating these new jobs. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer, please just take your seat please. Hon members, there is too much noise. We need to just allow the speaker on the floor the opportunity to not be drowned out. I understand heckling and interjection, but we cannot drown out the speaker on the floor. You may proceed, hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: A sign of a province on the right track is when business speaks to the confidence they have in this province. [[Interjection.] The very 654 000 square metres of commercial and residential development that has been approved for construction in the past year ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer, please take your seat. Hon member Ms Davids, may I address you. I provided guidance. Since we started I have asked you to refrain. An interjection is allowed, but then ongoing commentary becomes disruptive and it affects the flow. So can I please ask you, once again, to refrain from ongoing commentary, please. Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. That is nine times more than Gauteng. I say business confidence in this DA led province is at an all-time high; markets react and markets have spoken.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The Western Cape recognises that youth unemployment requires focussed intervention and has developed programmes that speak directly to skills development, entrepreneurship and innovation. Capacity, our special purpose vehicle, is a case in point, acting as a bridge between training and employment, guaranteeing that individuals who qualify with the programmes are ensured employment in the field they studied in. Capacity has placed over 96% of all our graduates at over 150 companies since 2011, trained and placed in excess of 600 unemployed youth to date. In 2015 they trained over 200 previously unemployed youth in scarce tech skills matching them to high value tech jobs and another 300 youth are in the project for this year.

Capacity specifically develops programmes in direct response to industry demand ensuring that the curriculum covers what we call a real world work environment, assisting our youth to access opportunities, bringing them into the economy. This is what an accountable and capable government does.

While we have seen some record numbers moving through our Cape Town International Airport this season, South Africa has seen a decline in tourist arrivals of 6,8% for 2015 from 2014. The great numbers seen at the airport were not sufficient to ensure that South Africa maintained a continued growth in tourism for the first time in its history. [Interjections.]

According to a report by Grant Thornton, because tourism arrivals grew by only 7,5% in 2014, the negative 2015 performance actually has wiped out two years' worth of vital tourism growth. [Interjections.]

That is what the impact of the amended visa regulations have done to a key sector in the Western Cape and South Africa at large. It has taken close to two years now for Minister Gigaba's department to bow down to pressure and begin to implement the concessions decided by his Cabinet to undo the damage of the regulations. And still, we find reluctance from him to so do.

Minister Patel, in his recent economic speech, stated this Government engages with business and stakeholders on every level. Home Affairs failed to engage in the tourism sector, failed to listen or heed calls made by the industry, and failed to take our extensive report of the impact of the visa regulations tabled by this Parliament seriously.

Even the trafficking numbers that Minister Gigaba used were thrown out as grossly overstated. Despite this, we took the visa frustrations through to the Red Tape Reduction Unit and one by one we tried to solve them. Instead, we also focussed on new markets for the launch of the Western Cape's Air Access Strategy to improve our competitiveness and ease of access into targeted African markets.

The proposed upgrade and realignment of the Cape Town International Airport of R3,1 billion will see an increase of new flights by 50% adding

3 000 additional jobs and unlocking massive economic growth in surrounding areas, the aerotropolis. This is where the Western Cape has identified the poorest, the youngest and the most marginalised of communities living. This is where the Western Cape will ensure that the people will benefit from this massive expansion project the most.

While the country faces a severe drought, we await the official confirmation of Central Karoo and the West Coast declared as disaster areas. The Western Cape is financially assisting our emerging grain farmers from risk of failure.

On the one hand the ANC talks about land reform and building an inclusive agricultural sector, and on the other hand they fail on policy implementation and real land reform in South Africa. The Department of Land Reform has a policy to acquire land called the Proactive Land Acquisition Strategy (PLAS) where an emerging farmer can access a piece of land for about a nine year lease. The problem is there is a massive backlog of leases to be issued. The ANC has put people on land with no sustainability, instead acquiring land for itself and no return of land to address the disparities of the past. The land just becomes a liability to the State.

We in the DA are going to watch the 31st of March 2016 like hawks. The Department of Rural Development and Land Reform has been mandated that all PLAS farms must have lease contracts in place by then, not to mention the District Land Committee set up with no budget. This is how serious the ANC is about land reform.

Last, but not least, my colleagues, such as hon member Mr Dugmore, needs to hear this on the other side. No commercial farmer, even if they wanted to, could get involved in land reform as there is no policy that speaks to this in National Government. Yes, they will deny it, but show me the policy and I will make a public apology. No policy exists at all. And finally, Madam Speaker, let the ANC take heed of this quote:

“Failure isn’t fatal, but failure to change just might be.”

I thank you. [Applause]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Hon Minister Madikizela. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me take the opportunity to welcome the new Leader of the Official Opposition and we want to express our gratitude to the ANC for appointing him in his position. We could not have asked for a better ally. [Laughter.]

If his dismal track record as Secretary of the South African Communist Party is anything to go by, then we are sure that he will do a much better job of destroying the ANC than us.

The honourable Leader of the Opposition spoke about the DA posing danger,

but the actual person and the people who are posing the real danger in this province is hon member Mr Magaxa and his racist faction within the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that in your speech?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, it is my speech. The ANC in this province, Mr Deputy Speaker, has decided to throw the Coloured leaders under the bus which further proves the point that I am making about the danger that people like hon member Mr Magaxa are posing in this province. They are now applying double standards by acting as if they are dealing with these people for the transgressions they cause. But how on earth do you justify a situation where some leaders are dealt with [Inaudible.] but a leader like Andile Lile, who has [Interjections.] caused so much suffering and pain in this province still remains a member of the PAC? Now this shows the double standards ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This really shows the double standards of this party and really it must be very, very painful. It must be really painful to be a Coloured or a white member of the ANC. Because what is happening now, while we try to unite South Africans to deal with the serious issues of racism, it suits the ANC's agenda to divide our people along racial lines. Because the question that we need to ask ourselves here is who stands to benefit by dividing South Africans?

Now, if we want to be the party in National Government, as the Democratic Alliance, it really doesn't suit us if we divide South Africans along racial lines. We have to rally everyone behind the DA because we want to be the government. But, in order for the ANC to remain in power, they must continue dividing our people along racial lines. [Interjections.]

Now, I am sure, members of other races in the ANC must be feeling like endangered species, and this is very, very serious. We are very much aware that the ANC's strategy, as I said, is to divide South Africans along racial lines in order to retain power, resorting to stances like the march on Friday where we saw the ANC march on themselves. [Laughter.]

This march was, in fact, an admission by the ANC that they have failed to lead this country. How on earth can a ruling party call on masses and play victim when it is supposed to provide leadership and stand up to the challenges facing the country? How do you explain that?

Mr D JOSEPH: No vision.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We also saw the ten remaining members of the ANC in the province, marching during the SOPA by the Premier. It was a sorry state of affairs if you saw the number of people who decided to march here.

Unlike the ANC, we do not deny that racism is one of South Africa's problems that we need to deal with. We do not deny that, and if you have noticed, the party, through our leader, took a stance on this issue. But the truth is, we must not deny this. Racists are found everywhere, including in my own party, and we have said that, but there are also racists in the ANC and many other parts of South Africa.

So, let us not pretend that the problem of racism and racists only exists on this side because if we continue to pretend that it does not exist in the party that is leading this country we will never be able to deal with this problem.

Now, I must also say that sadly racism suits the ANC's agenda. As I said because the ANC has nothing left to offer, they have run out of excuses, so that is why they are now resorting to *wit gevaar* tactics in order to whip up the emotions of vulnerable and poor South Africans. That is why people like hon member Mr Magaxa has been spreading this propaganda about the DA delivering more in white areas. But the irony is that no ANC run province delivers better services in black areas than the DA. [Interjections.]
[Applause]

Now, while he spoke fiction, let me talk about facts because we base our facts on official reports like the Statistics reports. Now, this is from the report coming from Stats SA. Now, let me prove the point that I am making here. The number of consumers receiving water and free basic services from municipalities - the top province out of nine provinces - that province is the

Western Cape with 75,7%. And listen to this. The second province is 41,7%. Now, that is the first indicator which shows that this DA Government delivers better in poor black areas than any ANC run province.

The number of consumer units receiving electricity and basic electricity services from municipalities in all nine provinces, the top province is the Western Cape with 45,45% and the second province a dismal 25.7%.

Mr D JOSEPH: Shame on the ANC.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, these are basic services that are provided to the poor. The third indicator, which is an issue that they normally throw at us; number of consumers receiving sewerage and sanitation and free basic services from municipalities - the Western Cape remains the top with more than 69% and the second province covered a distant 41,9%.

Now, this is a clear indication that people can spread lies, but facts do not lie. This report, the Stats SA Report, shows all the deliveries across the provinces. The ANC has no shame, as we have seen in the recent Amathole region toilet saga. That is a classic example of what we mean when we say these people have no shame. Where money that was meant for the poor was embezzled by elite members of the party and they left the small change to build toilets that pose risks to the poor people. Those toilets broke down in a few months and these members have the audacity to pretend as if they care about poor people.

In many areas, in places like the Eastern Cape, people are still relieving themselves in bushes because of a similar attitude and practices. Now, shame on you.

Mr D JOSEPH: Shame on the ANC.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Contrary to the picture that is painted about this Government, the figures that I talk about do not lie.

In her State of the Province Address, Premier Helen Zille shared the progress made on our game changers. Two of those are the Better Living Model and Sanitation which fall under PSG4. Yesterday, Minister Donald Grant and myself briefed the media on the progress made and future plans for the Better Living Model. The Premier further announced six catalytic projects planned to deliver more than 100 000 houses by 2022.

These projects were recently approved at the MINMEC meeting and planning processes are already under way. They cover areas initially earmarked for N2 Phase Two, like Barcelona, Europe, Gxagxa, Vukuzenzele, Kanana, Lusaka, Kosovo and we also included Tsunami and Thabo Mbeki as part of the south corridor development.

Other areas outside the City of Cape Town include George, Thembalethu, Syferfontein East and West, Wilderness, Transhex in Breede Valley and

Vlakland in Drakenstein. This is about a R10 billion investment in public infrastructure. These projects will be funded mainly by public funds from taxpayers, not hand-outs or favours from National Government.

Allocation to provinces are done in terms of the Division of Revenue Act. I am mentioning this because I am reminding people like the Minister of Water and Sanitation, Nomvula Mokonyane, who seemed to think that by spending money in the Western Cape she is doing us a favour. It is not her money or ANC's money, it is taxpayers' money.

One of the things that members from that side spoke about is transformation. If you look at transformation across the departments, some of those indicators are jobs that we spoke about and the services we deliver that I spoke about. But let me also mention one other very important thing because one of the legacies that we must leave as this Government, is to make sure that we do not only employ people, but we empower SMMEs. In this Department ...[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Talk about employment equity in this province.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, I am talking about something more than that actually. Now, let me talk about the empowerment of SMMEs. When I took over this Department, for example, only 22% in terms of value went to SMMEs, previously disadvantaged people. As I am talking to you now, 46% of the entire budget of this Department goes to

SMMEs, previously disadvantaged individuals.

So, we have moved beyond jobs. We are talking about changing the structure of the economy by empowering previously disadvantaged people, mostly black, so that they become part of the economy ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time is up.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is real transformation.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Christians.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has set the bar very high... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Another DA lie!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...when it comes to clean governance and service delivery. [Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Die DA kry seer. [Interjections.]

*Ms M N GILLION: The DA is hurting. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: This Government must gauge itself against international standards, but it cannot gauge itself against its peers locally.

[Interjections.]

The speech of Premier Zille addresses crucial areas namely business confidence, energy crisis, innovation, investment as a precursor to job creation, e-Learning and broadband, skills development and youth placement.

Mr P UYS: He is repeating.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: And the ACDP welcomes the State of the Province Address. [Interjections.] I would like to appreciate it if the Premier can tell us, about the R534 million, how the young people in the townships who are down and out, are going to benefit, in the Manenberg, in the Hanover Parks, in the Langas, because they have been marginalised from the economic structures. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are marginalised... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: These young men and women that do not have hope. Premier also mentioned about the alcohol abuse. It is a killer. The alcohol abuse is a killer and it destroys our communities. The Premier spoke about reduction and yet we have sub-councils that extended the liquor trading hours and also including Sundays. Premier can just elaborate on that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not be so nice!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Then we come to the Conradie Hospital. Thank you very much that that deal of the R80 million with the previous MEC Marius Fransman fell through the mat.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Because he gave it to one of his cronies and it fell through the mat, so now 3000 households can benefit from the Conradie Hospital project. It is also important to understand that the Bible says: †“*Wat jy saai, gaan jy maai...*” *“*What you sow you will reap...*” He brought impeachment and now he is nowhere to be found. I hope that the ANC at least communicated with him on his status.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Because he does not know. He says he hears everything via the media. So I just hope we will be informed about his status.

Mr R T OLIVIER: That is another Facebook [Inaudible.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The after-school programme is excellent and extensive and that programme is an excellent idea, and we need that in the communities

where parents are working and children are not being looked after, after school, but can we ask the new Leader of the Opposition to get SADTU involved, or does he only have influence over the three members in his own caucus because he does not have the support of the entire caucus? [Interjections.] So I wonder will the Leader will be so bold enough to ask SADTU to help with this programme because it is much needed? [Interjections.]

The other important point mentioned by the Premier is the energy crisis that we have and there were great initiatives via the Premier, innovative statements that she made, but we want to know Premier, will the National Department buy into this, because we know that Eskom has a monopoly and although they fail their bosses get bonus after bonus after bonus. So how is the Premier going to convince National Government, for the best interest of this Province, that we need other ways of energy?

The other area that I just want to touch on is the Youth Cafés. That is working brilliantly. We visit them. It works and youngsters can go to them. [Interjections.] I would like to know are we going to have more roll-outs when it comes to Youth Cafés? We visited four. There is excitement. Youth that do not have access - it is happening. [Interjections.] I wonder if these members... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjection.] Hon member at the back there please, come to order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I wonder if these members even visit those...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just one second.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give this member a Bells! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker, could I draw your attention to the order point in regard to the Order Paper for this Speaker's List. It says here that Speaker number five, F Christians, is from the ACDP, but I am just wondering should it not be DA.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the ACDA. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore. Order, order, order! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dugmore, order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Mr Dugmore that is a frivolous point of order. You know that! Please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker I must respond to that. He must be lucky... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are taking your own time for that, but

continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Ja, he must be lucky if he has got a job tomorrow because the new Leader of the Opposition is going to change some seats here. He is going to get rid... [Interjections.]

You see, when hon member Mr Dugmore was MEC he made a big balls-up so he is going to pay the price and he is one - he does not know. [Interjections.] Because I know what is happening in their caucus. They are getting rid of them. So be careful, be careful, be careful. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Be careful! [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please continue.

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The other thing that is very important is broadband and we know at Scopa we called in the Department and the Premier has said broadband is important; e-Learning is important; and I would like to know, the Premier said by the end of 2016 it will be at all schools and people will have access to that. Do we have programmes that will have youngsters

coming after school and how will those programmes be conducted, because we know in the poorest of the poor areas they do not have computers? They need these things and that is a real tool to help our youngsters to be on track with where they are. [Interjections.]

I was shocked the other day when we visited the school and young people in Matric do not know what they want to become. So these tools that they are going to have and receive is very important if we want to have these people part of the economy of the Western Cape.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in closing I want to say that I know that the speeches today will come and criticise the Premier but I challenge the ANC today to make contributions that will help the Province going forward and not to criticise just for the sake of criticising but really help this Province going forward. I have made a few suggestions and they do not like it, but Premier, I would like you to respond.

Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. †Die agb lid mnr Mackenzie. *The hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am delighted to be part of this debate today and I am mindful of the challenges that we are currently facing. [Interjections.]

2016 is indeed going to be one of the toughest years ahead and these sentiments were shared by the hon Premier last week in her speech and also in her newsletters inside Government, and I certainly hope that the members of that side of the House would have paid attention to her speech last week. Then they would have been able to respond effectively.

The State of the Province response by the hon leader Mr Magaxa was clearly an archived version of one of Marius old speeches, or I am not sure if it is hon Marius; is he still a member of this House, by the way? [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Ha-ha-ha!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: In fact hon member Mr Cameron Dugmore is raising the issue of membership of the ACDP, but the hon member Mr Magaxa made a clearly backdoor entry into Parliament because the SACP, he never ran in the elections. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] We can all remember that President Zuma... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: What is the relevance to the debate?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is relevant to the debate because the hon member is the hon Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We all know the current situation. The economy lost R169 billion on 9/12 ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Mackenzie, order, just one second. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please come to order before I allow the hon member to continue. We cannot have these continuous interjections and comments coming from the one side only. Please continue hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Like I said we all know that the economy lost R170 billion due to one disastrous decision by the hon President. In fact the Premier is operating in that space at the moment because we have to cut budgets in the Western Cape because of a decision that President Jacob Zuma made.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Tell him!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And if the hon members - I see the ANC is having a march today. In fact they are marching to the wrong house. Please turn the members around and march into Parliament and impeach President Zuma!

†An HON MEMBER: Ja, ja.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: You successfully impeached Marius Fransman. Please go do the same to President Zuma. [Applause.]

The Western Cape Government continues to be a shining beacon of hope for this country.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a joke.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: As the President continues to mess about we govern. In fact as members alluded to in yesterday's and today's newspaper, Mr Zuma said there "Van Rooyen is the best man for the job..." Then why did he let him go? In fact Minister Manuel said he served five years as Finance Minister and he has never heard of Minister Van Rooyen. So that is unfortunate. [Interjections.]

The Provincial Government continues to find innovative ways to deal with the red tape of small businesses and to ensure critical support. If hon member Mr Magaxa read the Premier's speech or listened properly, the money that the Premier was allocating was to all youth in the Western Cape. His own members went to the Youth Café and applauded the hard work they are doing. The hon member also raised the issue that the Premier made about the libraries. What the Premier was highlighting was how successful that library is and all of us including the ANC members went to the Khayelitsha Library on an oversight visit and they were over-excited by the hard work the

Provincial Minister of Arts and Culture is doing there. [Interjections.]

In fact a couple of weeks ago we went to the Heritage Western Cape, and the ANC members as well. They were saying “jo”, because it was so great, because that is what the Western Cape does. We deliver where we govern - as finished as that. [Interjections.]

With regards to Cultural Affairs I would like to mention as already alluded to in the Premier’s State of the Province Address... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, can you protect me. I cannot hear myself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order now, I am also battling in front here. May I again appeal to members on both sides of the House to calm down while the member speaks. The Chair is battling to hear the hon member properly. Speak through the Chair please, hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: In SOPA the Premier alluded to the good work that they had done to advance social cohesion. That, hon member Mr Dyantyi, is what you are looking for and hon member Mr Magaxa, what I am going to do, if you just take down this number - it is 021-4001300. This is the City of Cape Town anti-racism line, which sadly you do not know.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And this was launched more than a year ago by the City of Cape Town already. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a *foefie*.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: So that is what you need to do, members. Take down the number, dial it, then you will get what the City of Cape Town's anti-racism policy is.

We look forward to the launch of the new Cape Town Museum as alluded, and that will be open during Heritage Month that is coming. The Province has a rich history and this Museum will be sure to enlighten many of our people about our people's history, similar to the history of District Six and sadly, not one of the ANC members attended the event last year on social inclusion. The event was organised by Minister Nathi Mthethwa, Minister of Arts and Culture. I was the only member of Parliament who was there. Your national MPs were there, but not one of your caucus members were there, so they do not take racism seriously. They should have attended that meeting; that whole-day-workshop. It was held in the Gardens. None of them attended. They all were invited. Shame on you!

An HON MEMBER: Shame on you.

Ms M N GILLION: Shame on you!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier further mentioned that the language unit had developed and launched the official IsiXhosa terminology for chess and cricket. Through helping to develop, helping the language and standardising words we can truly promote the use of this beautiful language of all South Africans. That is social cohesion - work in action, a Government in action; not merely talking about it but actually doing it.

Sport continues to provide opportunities for youth from all walks of life and the MOD Centres have again shown why it is such a success that it is and I would like to welcome here Mr Ibrahim Murat who is sitting with us today - a former teacher of the Good Hope School. He took the school from under 30 rugby players three, four years ago, to currently 180 rugby players from Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, and that is what effective Government is. [Applause.] So well done to you Mr Murat and we are going to continue to try working with you in ensuring that more kids from Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain get into the MOD Centres and into our Youth Cafés.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

*An HON MEMBER: Well done!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Important to the Government of the Western Cape is

creating safe opportunities for our young ones including our youth. The Premier has announced last year the additional allocation of R26 million, all encompassing R120 million for the youth opportunities, and that hon member from the ACDP, Mr Christians, hopefully answers your question. That is where the money goes to - because that money is going into our townships; into Khayelitsha; into Langa, and it has already gone into there.

An HON MEMBER: With the Premier.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: With the Premier, yes. [Interjections.] To further invest in skills development, that support for our youth, it is in the work placement opportunities including the Premier's Advancement of Youth Programme, including the GAP year of which the members in committee have received the information on this committee. [Interjection.]

The Premier announced the game changers as the key priority areas for this meeting and hopefully all the members will pitch up; hon member Mr Magaxa, hon member Mr Fransman hardly came to our meetings. I certainly hope you will come to our Committee meetings, where the Premier will come and present the plans with the MEC as to how they are going to go about youth opportunity creation, all seven game changers will be in this Committees and I am happy hon member Mr Dugmore has confirmed his attendance already, and I certainly hope that you will attend that meeting because in the Committees which is the work of Government, that is where the heart is; something hon member Mr Fransman never understood. That is

why he never came to the meetings.

An HON MEMBER: He was never here.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, in conclusion I would like to welcome the support ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But what have you actually said [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I have highlighted some of the challenges, hon member Mr Dugmore, caused by your President Mr Jacob Zuma. Mr Deputy Speaker I would like to... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker I would like to welcome the State of the Province Address and on behalf of the DA we fully support this address. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

*An HON MEMBER: Well done! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Can we have full order please before we allow the hon member Ms Beerwinkel to start with her speech. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

*An HON MEMBER: Well done, well done!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I actually need to address these confused members on the other side of the House who do not really know where they are because most of their address has been about the SONA and not the Premier's address. So let us then do that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are scared.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Western Cape is not an island, my dear.

Ms M N GILLION: Oh, you know that!

An HON MEMBER: Oh you know hey! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I want to protect the hon member please. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You know that when it suits you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The member may continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, black lives have always mattered... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is racist.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...not always their votes. In the SOPA of the Premier she painted a utopia that only exists in her head, in the affluent areas and in your desktop reports. The reality is very different, and it is that sort of double speak that is the undoing of the DA image of a non-racial caring party that is exposed again in your SOPA.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is called “spinning”.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The expectation of what you want allowed at National Assembly is exactly the rulings that count against us here in the Legislature from members of the same party. The curtailing or reprimand of those who speak out against your internal racist practices or expose your racist members... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is only of the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...as was emphasised in the weekend papers. [Interjections.] It is a similar kind of double speak that we will today address from the SOPA. Another reality, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Luister asseblief!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Listen please!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...is that the DA Government in this province forgets that their plans will come to nought without the allocation of taxpayers' money from National Treasury. Your very existence is dependent on National Government's allocation.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, on the taxpayers.

An HON MEMBER: 14% of the Western Cape... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Comments like "useless" and "worst" and "hopeless" were heard here as the Premier delivered her address the other day, but in the very next breath she boasts about awards won and accolades given by that very National Government that they were just lambasting.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They need to make up their minds. Do they want them or not?

An HON MEMBER: But they do not recognise.

An HON MEMBER: Preferably not.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: A capable government, a capable state as has been brandished around here, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Banished?

An HON MEMBER: Bandied, bandied.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...admits that it cannot do it alone. Your very existence, I repeat, is dependent on the goodwill of National.

An HON MEMBER: Goodwill?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Black lives have always mattered.

An HON MEMBER: Respect the laws of this country.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And that is why we as the ANC will continue to speak out against the stark differences of quality of life of the citizens of the Western Cape especially in the rural areas, which you said nothing about.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What are you saying? Say what you are saying.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How important is education in its totality to the DA

Government if the Premier finds it necessary to mention, and my leader has very eloquently raised this issue but I want to spin it from a different angle...

An HON MEMBER: Spin it!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...that learners in Khayelitsha flock to a library. That is an indictment on your Government for not providing all the necessary for a culture of learning with all the necessary assistance and what you have deprived those learners of. [Interjections.] Flocking to a library - why do you not talk about learners that flock to a library in Sea Point or Constantia? They do not have to because they got it in their homes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Schools are becoming ganglands. [Interjections.] Schools are becoming gangland territories, yet the SOPA contained nothing about how this DA Government intends to rid institutions of learning of this evil.

Mr M G E WILEY: You need to go to General Veary.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Farmworkers in this province remain the poorest and most abused group of people.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Almost every day the media screams headlines of “Evictions, physical abuse, verbal abuse...”

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: “Poor living conditions; autocratic decisions regarding people’s rights...”

An HON MEMBER: We do not approve.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...all in the face of ESTA Legislation and up here are examples... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order member, just one second. May I again appeal to people on the gallery to refrain from commenting on the debate. The Speaker has ruled about that in the beginning and I want to again ask you not to participate in the debate. Member, you may continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you members of the Grabouw community. We welcome you here but please adhere to the rule. We will defend you. We will fight for you. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: They are most welcome!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The majority of these people have not yet tasted or experienced their freedom.

An HON MEMBER: We will fight for you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ESTA legislation is in place, Mr Deputy Speaker...

An HON MEMBER: Who are these people?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...disregarded by these farmers.

An HON MEMBER: We do not know them.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Education is equally important to a farm-school learner but have you ever seen a farmer sacrifice his personal transport to get the young learner to school who lives outside of the five kilometre range? Have you ever seen a white child...

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...walking to school for those differences?

An HON MEMBER: Never, never!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How then Premier, or the MEC of Education, do you not see the racism in that practice? Instead MEC Schäfer...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is beyond her.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...schemes of how to close down farm-schools and breaking up the hegemony of a community in the process.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Those are our leaders of tomorrow. E-Learning - this great innovation we still need to understand, how those very rural learners who need it the most will be benefiting by this initiative. [Interjections.]

This is an election year, but those very farmworkers who are treated as badly as they are will be driven to the venues and be intimidated to vote DA. [Interjections.] But we will never stop speaking out about these racist injustices because black lives and not only their votes have always mattered to us.

The Premier continues to praise a fish for swimming so when a fire-chief spends inordinate hours at work during a period of huge fire devastation that is par for the course. Speak rather about the poor who lost their lives and possessions in these devastating fires and are no better off than they were then. Black lives also matter when disaster strikes not only those who

succumb during execution of their duties - and our hearts go out to their families - but also those who were left behind.

A manager at CapeNature in the Cederberg Nature Reserve also lost his life in a tragic accident, but no mention of him. His life matters too.

Then when a department gets a clean audit those are instructions from the Auditor General but even the Auditor General admits that a clean audit is no proof of an outcome of service delivery. [Interjections.] It is no proof of an outcome of service delivery. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr M G E WILEY: You are seriously confused!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Overcrowding - Mr Deputy Speaker, is the Chief Whip speaking about himself?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Because I know what an audit opinion means.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sure, sure, it does look like that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Overcrowding in informal areas such as Masiphumelele, Imizamo Yethu and all the areas that were mentioned by my leader, are stark realities of poor service delivery, but the Premier decided to duck that issue of sanitation of service delivery and pass it on to the City of Cape Town. The City of Cape Town is your municipality over which you have oversight. See to it that they do what they are supposed to do for the poor who are generally black.

Premier said most cases landing up in hospitals are from preventable diseases. She might be right, but preventable by who?

An HON MEMBER: She is always right.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: None other than you, the very Western Cape Government... [Interjections.] ...who thinks that it is okay for black families to live in shacks with no proper sanitation; no heating; no privacy. Portapotties and bucket systems still exist, four to five families still share toilets and taps. How can these conditions not affect the quality of life of people who live there?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Are you sure this is happening in the Western Cape?

An HON MEMBER: Are you hearing yourself?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker...

An HON MEMBER: No she is!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Crime is at an all time high. Employment opportunities are few. Youth are disillusioned.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You are such a puppet.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Drug abuse grows worse by the day...

Ms M N GILLION: What did you say? Who is your puppet here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Drug abuse grows worse by the day...

An HON MEMBER: The honourable member.

Ms M N GILLION: No, the honourable puppet is not honourable.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...yet gambling opportunities are being extended

where the poor live by the extension of LPM Machines.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, just one second. Hon member Mr Mngqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask for your ruling on this. The hon member Gillion says to hon Minister Madikizela that “you are a puppet, you are not an honourable.” [Interjections.] Now I am sure, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is the other way around.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am rising on a point of order and I will await your ruling; not their ruling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.] Order, order, all members, order! All members are regarded as honourable members. I did not hear her saying he is not honourable but the word “puppet” in isolation or in that respect is not unparliamentary. So I will allow the member to continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Where was I? The DA continuously blames SAPS in one breath and in the next breath boasts about how innovative they are to deal with the problems together. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She is in control. Do not worry.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And while we were being addressed here, shots rang out in Manenberg and some innocent persons became statistics. During that debate the Premier looks up at the gallery to welcome the new Provincial Police Commissioner. Very strange, why up there? Why was the new Provincial Commissioner not allowed to sit in the box where honoured guests sit? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He was not here.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, we know that. The stark difference between services rendered... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...opportunities afforded...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, your time unfortunately has expired.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: With all of their interruptions, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately it has expired some seconds ago

already. I must see the hon Minister of Education next. Hon member Ms Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On Friday the Premier outlined three crucial requirements for a democracy to succeed, accountability, the rule of law and a capable state.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Essentially she showed what it is like to live under a DA Government where these three requirements are present. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is hell under the DA.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In the Western Cape we are showing that where the DA governs life improves for everybody. Our economy is growing. Unemployment is decreasing. Money is used for the purpose for which it is intended, i.e. delivering services to all and the poor in particular and of course our education system is flourishing.

The fruits of this capable state are that since the DA has come to power in the Western Cape in 2009 we have improved our matric pass rate from 75.6% to 84.7%.

In the 2015 NSC each one of Quintiles 1, 2 and 3, achieved a pass rate of over 70%. Those are the poorest schools. [Applause.] They have improved by 16.5%, 15.8% and 16.6% respectively since the DA came into Government. [Interjections.]

Since 2009 the Bachelors pass rate in each of the poorest Quintiles 1, 2 and 3 has increased by 15.9% [Interjections.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

*An HON MEMBER: Well done!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...10.9% and 12.5% respectively. There is still work to be done but it is a work in progress and it is progressing very nicely. Under a DA Government we keep making progress and under a DA Government the poor gets better services.

Our teachers are in the overwhelming majority in their classrooms teaching every day. They are committed to improving education for the children they teach. Even teachers from other provinces are so desperate to work in a capable state that I have had calls in my office from teachers asking if we have jobs for them. This is life under a DA Government and a capable state.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Unfortunately we do not have jobs for them. The fact that we do not yet govern nationally means that we have not had the power... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And you will never!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...to stop the institutional corruption and blatant mismanagement of Government finances and because of that we are coming under increasing pressure as a Provincial Government even though we manage our finances impeccably. The ANC has simply refused to deal with a corruption that is losing us billions of rands every year that we could use for better service delivery... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: What about the corruption [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...especially more teachers. Several years ago when Willie Hofmeyr was still the head of the then highly efficient SIU he told us that in his estimation corruption was costing this country R30 billion a year. Do you have any idea what we could do with that money? R30 billion could buy us 88 235 teachers; 545 new schools or 300 million textbooks and that is every single year. The minimum amount that is being lost to corruption [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not go to Pretoria. Stay there!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Stay in Cape Town.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Recent reports indicate that since the ANC has been in power... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi - order Minister. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, you cannot comment on each statement made by the Minister, please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please Minister, continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Recent reports indicate that since the ANC has been in power R700 billion could have been lost to corruption. That is my entire budget for 38 years.

†Mnr R B LENTIT: Skande!

*Mr R B LENTIT: Disgrace!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Of course Advocate Hofmeyr was removed from that position soon after he made that comment so the ANC could continue with their programme of loot-*a continua*.

†An HON MEMBER: Dis 'n skande!

*‘n AGBARE LID: It is a disgrace!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Quite frankly it is a national disgrace. Thanks to the ANC’s desperation to cling to power and simple refusal to take decisions in the best interest of our country we are now all suffering and the poor worst of all.

An HON MEMBER: Three ministers.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The Premier mentioned on Friday the crippling wage increases that have been agreed to by National Government in an effort to keep the unions on board in the tripartite alliance. Because of this we are sitting in a situation where we are going to have overcrowded classrooms, insufficient teachers and insufficient money to expand our services to the poor ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Blame national yes, blame national.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is national’s fault so I will. We are doing our utmost to try and keep those services as they are at present but there are severe pressures and it is not by any means solely because of the global economic crisis. It is largely influenced by the ANC’s total disregard of market forces, flip-flopping on crucial policy because they cannot agree amongst themselves, and by the policy of cadre deployment where they have put too many people in too many positions simply because of their loyalty to

the ANC and the alliance; with their ability to do the job factoring into the equation, very little, if at all.

Excuse us for the incapable state that are getting more and more absurd by the day. Planet Zuma now has another inhabitant, Gwede Mantashe. His comments last week really reflect the desperation of an organisation that simply does not know what to do because in order to do the right thing... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Relevance to the SOPA?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...they have to make decisions that will upset one or other faction or alliance partner.

An HON MEMBER: There is nothing to say...

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...which brings me onto accountability. In the National Assembly last week the poor performance of Langa High School... [Interjections.]

... was referred to. Yes, well if they did that in the NA I would have.

Ms M N GILLION: Stay here.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Notwithstanding the fact that even our

poorest quintile schools achieved an average of more than the entire Northern Cape, Limpopo, KwaZulu Natal and the Eastern Cape Provinces, this particular school has been identified as one of our new collaboration schools. We have private funders and operators who wish to help fund and develop schools in poor communities and guess who is opposing it - none other than the ANC's trusty alliance partner SADTU. The very organisation that opposes any measure to try and improve education and accountability including systemic tests and ANAs. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.] in Quintile 1, 2 and 3...

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: So do not go running off to the National Assembly trying to make it look as if we do not care about poor communities. That is the ANC and its allies that do not care about poor communities. We are trying something new. They are trying to stop it. In addition, last week, SADTU aligned teachers at Oranjekloof Primary, another collaboration school where the parents have voted overwhelmingly in favour of this project, marched to the City to protest at the WCED against this model.

Did they do it after school? Oh no! They left at 10 a.m. and closed the school. That shows you how much the ANC's allies care about education. As they say birds of a feather flock together and on the subject of birds there was a lot of chirping last week from the other side of the House about school safety, so let us say something about that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...closed a thousand schools.

An HON MEMBER: How many children have died?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Obviously a lot fewer than under your MEC tenure. Obviously the safety of our learners is of paramount importance to us and it is something to which we give ongoing attention. However, we all know that and I quote:

“The challenge facing our schools cannot be dealt with in education alone and requires an integrated response guided by partnerships at local and provincial level.”

That was a quote from a speech, the Safe School Summit on the 24th of August 2005 by the then MEC Cameron Dugmore. [Interjections.] Of course the ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why did you close Bambanani? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Because they were not as effective. Of course the partnerships also extend to the national sphere of Government...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...which controls the SAPS. Furthermore,

to show the ANC's hypocrisy even when it comes to this crucial aspect at the end of last year Minister Motshekga arranged a School Safety Summit because of the concerns expressed across the board and across the country about safety in schools. Guess who attended it? One MEC from the entire country - one MEC attended the Safety Summit and that was me.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That was you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is true. As they say, actions speak louder than words and the ANC's actions speak volumes. Now the President is also announcing that central procurement will become compulsory. Well perhaps he has not heard of concurrent competences and independent spheres of Government, but we will not sit back and watch the centralised "Guptarisation" of procurement.

We will not allow the gains we have made to descend into the cesspits of ANC corruption and mismanagement and lose control over our ability to deliver, which as we have shown again and again, is infinitely more efficient than National Government.

It is clear that the DA Government in the Western Cape is the epitome of the capable state and accountable fair government. Under the DA people have more opportunities and especially a better education, which is the foundation on which all other opportunities are built and is the key to it achieving

genuine freedom.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Just to deal with a few issues of the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel seems to have forgotten that we owe our existence to the Constitution of South Africa; not to the National Government.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: And National Government itself also in fact owes their existence to the National Constitution. [Interjections.] We agree that people in wealthy areas do not need libraries. That is why we are providing libraries in poor communities because they need them. That is precisely the point and as far as closing schools is concerned, your beloved National Government has the policy of closing schools and rationalising schools across the country. The Eastern Cape is closing about a thousand and we engage them all the time. [Interjections.] So you really are scraping the barrel today, the ANC, in this debate, sorry. Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The hon Bernard Joseph.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Let us look at the statement made by the office of the Western Cape Premier on the 19th of February 2016. What a joke! Open quote:

“Yet in our midst there are hundreds of thousands of young people marginalised from the modern economy and disproportionately damaged by broken families, alcohol, drugs and violence. The positive vibrancy of Cape Town is not their experience...”

Open quote:

“The Origins of Political Order and Political Decay”.

The latter part clearly describes the DA and the problems above pertaining to alcohol and drugs, the DA is a crime-friendly party. Our people - the poorest of the poor - are further marginalised by this failed DA system, a system that caters only for the rich in Camps Bay, Green Point, Bishops Court and many other affluent areas. [Interjections.]

However, nothing is done in Nyanga in terms of the implementation of projects that is the murder capital of South Africa and the province to prevent crime. Good governance †se voet! *my foot!

An HON MEMBER: Ja, ja.

Mr B D JOSEPH: The Premier boasts about the Education Department getting a clean audit. The school in Wallacedene has two functional toilets for 1700 learners, school benches are falling apart and ripping children's clothes in Belhar and Delft. Education funding to poorest schools is lacking. The unequal funding of schools must be properly investigated and adjusted.

An HON MEMBER: I agree with that.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Crowded classrooms is another problem more especially in Khayelitsha. In Khayelitsha there is a school, where matriculants at this stage do not even have educators for certain subjects.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr B D JOSEPH: How do you expect the matric rate to increase at the end of the year? Good governance †se voet! *my foot! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Let us talk about the unemployment. EPWP is like labour broking; cheap temporary labour by the failed DA system. Give people their dignity back by providing our people with meaningful... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Who is your people?

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...and permanent employment.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Who is your people?

An HON MEMBER: Who is your leader?

Mr B D JOSEPH: Do not worry. I will come to you in terms of moral ethics. [Interjections.] It is not easy to agree with you on many occasions, but I have to agree with your statement that our unemployment rate is still much too high, hence the DA employed an official of the Department of Health who was dismissed for fraudulent appointments, now being reappointed in the Helderberg district office of Health. Good governance †se voet! *my foot!

The very high cost of employment should be reduced especially... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Joseph, just one second; just one second. [Interjections.] Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon member must withdraw the words *se voet*. It is unparliamentary. [Laughter.] It is unparliamentary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am quite happy with that. That is a way of saying it in Afrikaans. I have got no problem. You may continue.

[Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: The very high cost of employment should be reduced especially those employment opportunities created for DA party supporters. Cadre deployment just like the ANC. Good governance †se voet! *my foot!

R534 million set aside for TVET colleges, yet another failed attempt to train the poor whereby many students end up working at Shoprite and Spar. Then another R120 million being set aside for work placement. Isn't this precisely what the problem so highly describe as political decay? Good governance †se voet! *my foot!

“Demands for affordable housing closer to the city bowl is an important priority for a functional City and this can be achieved more effectively if the State complements the market mechanism appropriately. We have to create a much more inclusive city at a time of resource scarcity. This requires innovation.”

Blikkiesdorp and Wolwerivier are just a few of the prime innovations of better living by the DA. [Interjections.]

The City of Cape Town and farms in the rural areas are embarking on evicting people from houses but yet they have given away land cheaply to the rich people in Stellenbosch, which clearly illustrates the way minority white farmers are getting preferential treatment in this province under the DA

administration compared to the poor people in the rest of the province.

[Interjections.]

Farm evictions occurs daily and leaves the poor farmworkers with insurmountable problems to find alternative accommodation. Some farmers have ten to fifteen pieces of very expensive agricultural land and which are being rented at less than R10 000. Legislation indicates if a farm is being leased for more than ten years it must be registered with the Deeds Office. In none of these situations these farms were registered with the Deeds Office.

Just yesterday, in terms of good governance, we have seen a situation where a landlord has received a bill of R103 000 for the month of February from the City of Cape Town.

Ms P Z LEKKER: And that is good governance

Mr B D JOSEPH: Good governance †se voet! *my foot! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr B D JOSEPH: Failure to release the audit reports; the Economic Freedom Fighters will continue to grab land because the DA Government has not delivered on its promises.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, your time has now really expired. I

have given you some injury time.

Mr B D JOSEPH: I just want to conclude.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your last sentence, your last sentence.

Mr B D JOSEPH: I just want to conclude: †die vlakte in Stellenbosch - wat op die oomblik 'n verrassing is, is die betrokkenheid van die Universiteit van Stellenbosch om beurse te gee aan afstammeling van die vlakte-gemeenskap. Die vraag is waarom en hoeveel van die afstammeling kry beurse van die Universiteit van Stellenbosch?

*the plain in Stellenbosch – what at the moment is a surprise, is the involvement of the University of Stellenbosch to award bursaries to the descendants of the plain community. The question is why and how many of the descendants receive bursaries from the University of Stellenbosch? The 2016 State of the Province Address...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr B D JOSEPH: ...to highlight the plight of the poor in the Western Cape...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr B D JOSEPH: ... was uninspired. Good governance †se voet! *my foot!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The EFF! That was excellent!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member, †agbare lid mnr Joseph, die stoel buig agteroor om die kleiner partye te beskerm en meer tyd te gee, maar dan moet die tyd nie uitgebuit word nie. Ek het u ruim, ruim tyd gegee. As die Stoel vir orde vra, dan beteken dit orde.

*hon member Joseph, the Chair is leaning over backwards to protect the smaller parties and allow them more time, but then the time must not be exploited. I allowed a lot of time. If the Chair asks for order, then it means order.

‘n AGBARE LID: Se voet! [Gelag.]

An HON MEMBER: My foot! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier of the Western Cape, members of the Provincial Cabinet, hon members, community leaders in the gallery, members of the media and most importantly the people of the Western Cape, good morning!

Allow me to thank the hon Premier for reminding us on Friday that for Government to build a capable state is the great imperative for creating a

decent life for the people of this province. The South African economy is in decline. Those in business have been sounding the warning bells for some time.

However, this decline also impacts on the pockets of the poor and on Government's ability to deliver public services, especially healthcare. It is imperative for Government to create an environment that improves the health of its population by investing in health services.

Quoting United Nations Ban Ki-moon who once said:

“Investment in basic services can bring a six-fold increase in economic return. Healthy populations have higher life expectancy, go to school, are more productive, have lower birth rates and thus invest more in fewer children...”

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Agreed... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Our country has invested in legislative framework policies, strategies, chapters, plans, protocols, guidelines and reforms. Despite these interventions nationally the health outcomes remain low and the poor quality of services is the norm rather than the exception.

Internationally, the country is rated as one of the worst health systems especially for a country that is more economically viable compared to other

African countries that have experienced civil wars. Now the question is why? Let us not mince the words, we have seen in the Provincial Governments that are governed by the ANC that actually they do not care about giving these services to the poor. [Interjections.]

Jooste Hospital for example, is the only hospital that has been in the Cape Flats. They have never built any hospital and the Jooste Hospital was an old-age home where it was found to have occupational hazard problems. Khayelitsha Hospital in 2012, Mitchells Plain Hospital in 2013 - these are the hospitals that were built during the time that the DA was in Government. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister, just one second. I sense the hon member Mr Wiley wants to address me on the interjections from hon member Mr Dugmore and hon member Mr Dyantyi?

Mr M G E WILEY: That is the one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, I agree with you, honourable.

Mr M G E WILEY: Your continuous contribution.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore and hon member Mr Dyantyi, allow the member to continue. Please continue.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Look at the failure of the ANC Government in building a capable health state. Number one is the appointment of a competent workforce; the human resource for health strategy of 2011 is gathering dust and we are still waiting. The Health Leadership and Management Academy that was formed in 2012 was nothing more than an attempt to reverse the damage caused by the appointment of incompetent cadres in the senior management in the health sector and nothing still is being said about it.

Look at the example of the Eastern Cape Province where they had four acting HODs in one year. KwaZulu Natal on the other hand appointed a CFO who was suspected of financial mismanagement in another province.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Come back to the province... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: This is like appointing a fox to look after your chickens. By the end of the previous year it was estimated that there were some 14 000 vacancies for doctors at State hospitals across the country and this is not a new problem. [Interjections.]

According to the Institute of Race Relations in early 2013, Limpopo had the highest public sector doctor vacancy rate in the country at 86%. The Northern Cape was recorded at 57% while the Eastern Cape was set at 48%. The vacancy rate for nurses was no better. Look at Limpopo once again, they had the highest nurse vacancy rate at 68% followed by the Eastern Cape at 67%

and the Free State at 47%. Whilst the slashing of provincial budgets and still no tangible plan from the National Government for effectively filling the vacancies, existing problems are sure to worsen across the country. We have already seen the Government's inability to absorb the new crop of health professionals into the system. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Do not worry, the Cubans will sort it out.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: If we are prioritising redress and service delivery then we cannot have young, especially the black, medical and nursing professionals sitting at home nursing their degrees.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not like the Cubans.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Any person with an understanding of our past, its footprint and our present and the current state of the economy will understand this. In the Western Cape for example the population grows at 2.6%. We are sure to see a rise in the number of people requiring access to public healthcare irrespective of a shrinking public purse. The question we are faced with here is how does Government in pursuit of creating a capable state respond to these kind of conditions?

Near the end of last year the AG found that the wasteful expenditure, for example in Gauteng, had amounted to R160 million. Not wanting to be outdone, the same applies even with their transport department. For example

in the Eastern Cape, my favourite province, one of our least developed provinces, the Health Department lost R74 million to wasteful expenditure. The North West Department of Health amongst other departments in that province found itself under administration and also accrued R263 million in irregular expenditure. So what does effective and capable government look like?

It is clean. It is innovative. It is responsive and it governs with integrity. In the Western Cape we have maintained eleven year track records of sound financial management as evidenced by unqualified audits. On the score of service delivery we have already achieved for example the antiretrovirals which have increased our clients from 75 000 in 2009 to 181 000 in the year 2014/15. If you look at the terms of the prevention of the mother-to-child HIV transmission we have brought it down from 3.6 in 2009 to 1.4% in 2014/15... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the way... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...and if you compare it with Gauteng it has only managed 2.7%. Our maternal mortality ratio is 78 compared to the national norm of 146 per 100 000. The KZN ratio is 160 and Mpumalanga 173 and the worst performer is Limpopo with 185; in this province, it means that being poor and pregnant is a death sentence. It is like opening your own coffin. †Akuyi lubuyayo *you can go but never come back †when you are pregnant.

We have increased the TB cure rate from 79% in 2009 to 80% last year and if you compare again with other provinces, the Eastern Cape battled with a 70.5%. Limpopo at 64%. Finally the responsiveness in innovation are the heart of the Western Cape Government and if you look in terms of the white paper, the National Health Insurance, I cannot miss that, it borrows on best practices that already is the model for hospital management in the Western Cape and if you look in terms of how they have appointed their GPs in other provinces it looks as if now they will be adopting the Western Cape methodology on how to fix the mess that they have already implemented. We have already decentralised decision-making on budget to the managers of healthcare institutions. By empowering healthcare professionals to make decisions about the priorities of their facility the allocation of budgets and the appointment of staff can be tailored to the unique needs of facilities and communities. If you look at other provinces for example the one has to wait for months before a window is fixed; years before the doctor is appointed; and ages before service providers are paid resulting in medically compromising drug stock-outs.

This Government is the one you will find that is quick on its feet and also it knows how to run a capable state and we have seen in the other governments that the health of the poor is being affected and then the question we ask now, who has got the heart of the poor; this Government or the one that allows the people to die? [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister... no-no, hon member Mr Dyantyi...
[Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dyantyi, order. The hon Minister Grant.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Western Cape Parliament, guests, I rise with pleasure to participate in this debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address of last week, an address delivered in the context of a South Africa still reeling from the economic turmoil caused by a President who clearly has at best a tenuous grasp of or at worst a total disregard for the impact of irresponsible political announcements on international and market confidence in this country.

As if this were not enough the world has also had to endure the spectacle of a once-respected Parliament upon which all South Africans optimistically pinned their hopes of a better future, reduced at times to the level of a badly disciplined and mismanaged primary school classroom.

The burden of restoring some of the shattered confidence now falls on the shoulders of Minister Gordhan, who mercifully for South Africa ended up occupying the finance office once President Zuma had finished his game of musical chairs, estimated at R500 billion in lost value, the most expensive Parly game in South African history.

I presume many members of this House read the highly respected weekly publication, *The Economist*, which has appeared continuously since 1843. In this week's edition there is a short article on reforming FIFA which begins as follows:

“Every so often organisations become bywords for something else. Apple means elegance, Berkshire Hathaway loyalty and Blackberry decline. Alas, FIFA, the governing body of world football, spells corruption. Sprucing up this most tarnished of brands will take more than a bit of tinkering with the way FIFA is run. On the 26th of February FIFA's member associations will hold a secret ballot - what else - in Zurich to choose a new President who will replace Sepp Blatter. The omens are not good. Mr Blatter bequeathed his successor an organisation in chaos. His fifth term was cut short after the indictment last year of several of the game's biggest-wigs for alleging money-laundering.”

Fellow members of this House, as serious as the association of corruption is with the name and affairs of FIFA and as enormous are the amounts of money involved, FIFA remains a controlling body of what is at the end of the day a sport - something meant for recreation and a platform on which to display feats of athletic ability, skills and teamwork. The beautiful game is still a game; not life itself. FIFA is certainly not a government charged with caring for its citizens, upholding and respecting a long fought-for constitution, ensuring a functional social environment and understanding and nurturing an

economy which can deliver jobs to people so that they can feed their families with pride and not be dependent on grants and handouts... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...which ensure their continued reliance on favours open to political manipulation... [Interjections.] ...and so Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: If Apple means elegance, Berkshire Hathaway means loyalty, Blackberry means decline, and FIFA spells corruption, what has the ANC Government in 2016 become a byword for?

An HON MEMBER: There you go, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You take too long. You cannot go [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Is it the once admired struggle for freedom from the shackles or apartheid or is it the relentless plundering of State resources through cadre redeployment? The abuse of the many opportunities cynically created through State-owned enterprises and dubious tender allocations and the grotesque enrichment of a

few obedient loyalists at the expense of the hopes, dreams and aspirations, of millions. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie!

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: As we sit here today I think we all know the answer to this rhetorical question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Grant, will you please take your seat for a minute. Hon member Mr Dyantyi you have a speaking term directly after this.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh ja.

The SPEAKER: If you could just contain yourself until then. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is just an interjection.

The SPEAKER: Ja, you will get your chance. You may proceed hon Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And so for reasons entirely different from those of many ordinary people in South Africa the

ANC must be hoping that Minister Gordhan is able to pull a field of rabbits out of the hat tomorrow. Without this the slippery slope looms large. It is against this background that the honourable Premier delivered her address last week, stressing the need for continued service excellence during a time of austerity and a time of central fiscus cutbacks in the face of poor management of the economy and the impact of the drought. Over and above this ongoing need for quality service the Premier highlighted a number of initiatives - game changers aimed at making a demonstrable difference to the lives of many residents in the Western Cape and at ensuring that this Province retains its reputation for working better together with the people who choose to live here.

The combination of capital flight from South Africa and the cutbacks pose particular challenges to my Department as the lead agent in delivering infrastructure requirements, upon which so many of the services highlighted by the Premier depend.

In one way or another the Department of Transport and Public Works is also involved in most of the game changers. Apart from providing the enabling infrastructure itself the Department has a crucial role to play in that its maintenance and construction projects are key sources of job creation and economic empowerment. Every possible opportunity has to be grasped to maximise the economic benefit of this capital expenditure against the background in which across the country since 1994, within both public and private sectors, the ratio of fixed capital investment to GDP has decreased

significantly.

Under these circumstances it is crucial that Government aligns and sequences its efforts so that the correct messages are sent to the private sector to establish partnerships with Government to ensure that the deteriorating fixed capital to GDP investment ratio I have referred to is restored over time. The role which large public works programmes played in the new deal solution to an earlier recession in the United States must not be forgotten. In doing this we have to focus infrastructure spending in such a way as to maximise returns and these returns including enabling our sister departments to deliver on their services and to minimise the negative economic externalities which have brought us to where we are today.

A prime example is the road network in this province. Often the subject of positive comments by our increasing number of visitors to the Western Cape of the 32 000 kilometres of roads making up the Western Cape road network, 20% is surfaced, but this 20% carries 95% of all road traffic. In addition the overwhelming majority of our road network has a fair to very good visual condition index. Although much of our surface roadwork network is over 25 years old our planned and focused maintenance spend has protected our massive investment in ensuring that the economy of this Province is able to keep moving.

The current asset value of the road network is just over 72 billion if you include the gravel roads. The estimated replacement value is in excess of

R90 billion. It would be simply irresponsible not to maintain an asset base of this magnitude and importance to our economy, as irresponsible, as willy-nilly destroying investor confidence by playing musical chairs with key posts in the National Cabinet to satisfy some as yet unconfirmed political agenda.

The PREMIER: Ja.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

*An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: By contrast the route map set out by the Premier of this province last week is clear, responsible and achievable. The commitment of my Department to play its part in the successful implementation in the interest of the residents of this province and the well-being of the country at large. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Grant. I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. For the hon Premier Zille and the DA, the end is beckoning. [Laughter.] She has summed up the end by her so called dedication to youth of her last three years.

An HON MEMBER: Who is going to play the end?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For the ANC the beginning of the end for her and the DA

starts in six months time, now, in 2016. [Interjections.] Local Government 2016 will provide the seeds of exit.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi!

*An HON MEMBER: Good, good!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Three years is too far and too long. †Amasi abekwe-Langeni! *The puppets will dance! †Die blou poppe sal dans! *The blue puppets will dance! I was hoping that the MEC for Health was going to talk about the Poly-Clinic in Hout Bay but she was certainly asked to talk about the Eastern Cape and other provinces because she might upset the applecart in that constituency.

When the sun sets, what will the Premier and the DA be remembered for?

The blue brigade will proclaim all manner of glossy titles. I want to assert that many who voted for her party and many more who did not vote for the DA, will nod and share the following amongst others, that hon Helen Zille and the DA will be remembered for positioning the Western Cape Government as opposition to key national imperatives and the National Government; each page of their contributions is punctuated by a contrast and comparison with National Government. It is a DA template. You have listened to them, from hon Minister Madikizela and all of them.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Tell us about how

you measured that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She will be remembered for entrenching and deepening inequalities amongst the communities of this province. For under the DA, the situation has worsened. The allocation of resources remains and continues to be skewed.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Tell us what you measured it on?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She will be remembered too for catchy concepts and sound bites, with a disconnect with people's real life situation in Grabouw, in Mitchells Plain, in Manenberg, in Nyanga, in Dunoon.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Those areas are better than they were under the ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She will also be remembered for claiming credit out of a success of a privileged province, which has been so since the dawn of democracy, as I will show later. Allow me to borrow, Madam Speaker, from Premier Zille's inspiration. Concluding the 2015 SOPA, she said:

“Finally, Strategic Goal 5 seeks to embed good governance and integrated service delivery through partnerships and spatial alignment. None of our other plans can be realised without a

capable state and strong partnerships with all stakeholders in our society.”

That then is the plan, in broad outline. Drill deeper, and there will be an enormous amount of detail in the plans we are crafting to turn vision into action and outcome.

Fast forward to 2016. Premier, where is the detail in the plans? We could not get it on Friday, something you promised twelve months ago.

An HON MEMBER: You will understand.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Of the many intentions you shared with us on Friday it is your conclusion of SOPA 2015, and your emphasis on the capable state, that I want to pay attention to.

It is one’s submission that a capable state embodies the following features, amongst others:

- The promotion of active citizenry, to ensure that they are the masters of their own destiny;
- The building of the capacity of the state itself and related institutions;
- The nurturing of genuine partnerships, through leadership in society.

In your State of the Province Address you claimed that your Government is

committed to achieving a capable state. You further claim that you are committed to creating opportunities for growth and jobs.

In our view, embedding good governance, integrated service delivery and achieving a capable state requires that the capacity of the state be prioritised.

I put it to you, Premier, that your very own department cannot be regarded as a department in a government that pursues the noble goal of a capable state.

The Department of the Premier is utilising consultants on a daily basis, including giving those consultants state assets, such as laptops, offices and telephones!

This is a Premier that says I want a capable state. [Interjections.] How is it possible to advocate for back office rationalisation and austerity measures, whereas you have a consultancy based department?

Skilled personnel, at senior levels are regarded redundant and not “fit for purpose” according to them, yet they are highly paid. I go to the next one.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi just manage your finger please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Provincial Treasury Department experienced significant under-expenditure, as a result of non-filling of vacancies - talk about job creation. The entity of the Department itself, the Gambling Board,

spends millions of rands in courts and legal processes against its own staff and members.

The Local Government Department - the third one - continues to experience abnormally high turnover of staff. Municipalities and councillors across the province are on a weekly basis entangled in corrupt activities.

The DA's story in local government reads like a horror story: Cape Town is under corruptive clouds of paying R5 billion more than the tender prices for the stadium - found by the High Court to have a corrupt tender given to the value of R113,5 million.

The Hawks have recently brought to court official Paul Hattingh and two women who siphoned tenders of R70 million in a fraudulent way to their own businesses; and a scandalous wastage of R30 million with the Cape Town Soccer Cup continues.

This so-called good story of Cape Town – the DA's flagship project is debunked by the many problems with councillors like Pieter van Dalen shooting at small boys playing with a ball in Khayelitsha at night while the shooters laugh and the children who scream for life.

Cheval Arendse taking workers money from subcontractors to pay them themselves. [Interjections.]

Willie Japhta asking the High Court for a lesser sentence of a convicted murderer. Sam Pienaar is given a senior position... [Interjection.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Dit stink!

*An HON MEMBER: It stinks!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...despite him not disclosing the fact that he was part of the Trojan Horse plan that saw the random killing of three children. [Interjections.]

Chris Jordaan was given a senior position despite being fired from the city for selling two cars for his own gain without permission. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis baie seer, ek weet dit! [Gelag.]

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: It hurts a lot, I know that! [Laughter.]

In the Eden District there are still unresolved issues with mayor Wessie van der Westhuizen that should have been removed on recommendation of the DA caucus and one Tertius Simmers that cannot stay out of trouble. In George Municipality there is Mayor Charles Stander who stands accused of domestic / gender violence - that is all in the DA. The list is long. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Take action [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I can go on. Nomonde Dlephu admitted to stealing council electricity, and yet they get to just a slap on the wrist in the same way Diana Kohler Barnard got it. [Interjections.]

With the assistance of National Government, we are now beginning to see stability and signs of recovery in Oudtshoorn.

With fanfare, we are told of amazing work done by the Red Tape Reduction initiative. We now have 700 new ideas and suggestions from employees of this province. This is supposed to be ground-breaking and a first. This initiative dates back to 2013. Three years on, we are yet to be furnished with real progress. What happened to the thousands of previous suggestions reported in the 2013/14 annual report, hon Minister Winde? We here have a Government that spends money on suggestions, on consultants, and concepts.

Let me now deal with the misrepresentation of delivery stats by DA hacks. The DA is now notorious for claiming historical reality of a privileged province and appropriates it as a DA creation and success. Let me bring the facts delivered by our own Deputy Minister Buti Manamela in his response to the State of Nation Address, with the heading that the “Western Cape has always been the place of milk and honey.”

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In 1996 - help them. †Hulle kry seer. *They are hurting. In 1996, 85% of electricity and lighting was in the Western Cape and in 2011 we have 93%.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What was the population then [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am coming to that. In 1994... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In your mind is it better or worse?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In 1994 Limpopo had 39% in 1994, and in 2011 Limpopo is on 87%. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And Kannaland? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: She had the essence here, the essence here is that between Limpopo and the Western Cape who changes the lives of people better?

An HON MEMBER: Limpopo.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is Limpopo.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Western Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is Limpopo, because even if you are to go back when the DA took over and assessed the rate between what it inherited and what it did I want you to go and do that homework. You did very little.
[Interjections.]

In terms of access to piped water... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am mindful of my time. In terms of access to piped water, in 1996 the Western Cape was on 89% and in 2011 - listen to this - the Western Cape was on 88%. It regressed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No-no, it is not a regression, the population growth...

†Me M N GILLION: O die kole maak seer.

*Ms M N GILLION: Oh the coals are hurting.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Free State - I am contrasting now.

†Me M N GILLION: Gooi daai kole.

*Ms M N GILLION: Throw those coals.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Free State in 1996 was on 70%.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Resources [Inaudible.] Look at that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Free State in 2011 is on 89% above the Western Cape. Who is changing the lives of people better in here? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dyantyi please just take your seat. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is baie seer. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: It hurts a lot. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there will be an opportunity to respond. Please allow the speaker on the floor. You are drowning out the speaker and I cannot hear him. So can I please... [Interjections.]

†Die SPEAKER: Mense, luister asseblief! *People, listen please!

†Hon member Mr Dyantyi you may take the floor. Thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie agb Speaker.

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Madam Speaker.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Ek sal vir jou die

inligting stuur.

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I will send you the information.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie.

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can go back to your 2011 Census and Stats SA exactly what you are reading. You are very selective.

The SPEAKER: Please manage your finger.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My apologies, Madam Speaker. In fact what you are witnessing and this is the issue about the DA, in the DA nothing else matters. The problems of a lack of service delivery, rising poverty, deepening inequality, joblessness, crime, homelessness are less important in the DA.

An HON MEMBER: That is not true.

†UMnu Q R DYANTYI: Into ebalulekileyo kwiDA, yigolide yisilivere nebronze. neGomora. Abanasixaka-xaka sokungabikho kweenkonzo. *What is important to the DA is gold, silver and bronze. I will also add Gomora. They don't have any problem with the absence of service delivery.

Mitchells Plain, Manenberg, Khayelitsha, Elsie's River. †Into abayifunayo yi
 *The only thing they want is a clean audit. [Interjections.] That is the DA.
 Because for them it is about ticking those boxes. What the DA is interested
 in... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is to tick the box.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... is black votes.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not their black lives.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is what the DA is interested in... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi your time has expired. Please take
 your seat. Thank you. Your time has expired.

†'n AGBARE LID: Sit, sit, sit, se voet.

*An HON MEMBER: Sit, sit, sit, my foot.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Totsiens Helen en die blou poppe. [Applous.]

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: Goodbye Helen and the blue puppets. [Applause.]

† ‘n AGBARE LID: Hooi, die blou poppe! Die blou poppe gaan val.

*An HON MEMBER: Hey, the blue puppets! The blue puppets are going to fall.

The SPEAKER: Members can we get a semblance of order please. There is too much noise. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon member Ms Wenger. You may proceed.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Premier Helen Zille spoke about the importance of the capable state. The capable state is the great moral imperative of our time because it is through a capable state that we can turn plans into reality and a capable state also means a safe state. But policing is a National Government competency. The state at a national level has been run exclusively by the ANC for the past two decades. It is clear that the ANC has been unable to address the historical unequal police service provision because the majority of crime victims are poor, black and coloured people. Indeed those areas that are most affected by crime are areas where poor people live and it is in these areas that the police have deployed the fewest resources.

The ANC says that they are tackling racial and economic inequality, but the

one area that the ANC controls exclusively, which is policing, has seen a deliberate under-resourcing in the poor areas which need it the most. It is clear that the lives and safety of the poor do not matter to the ANC. They come to this House and continually make the juxtaposition of Khayelitsha and Camps Bay and the so-called leafy suburbs. But in the case of policing it's absolutely true.

Nyanga has a police to population ratio of 1:878; Delft 1:693; Mfuleni 1:671 and Khayelitsha 1:556, while Camps Bay has one of the best police to population ratios in the province. When the DA takes the keys to the Union Building in 2019, we will create a South Africa in which children are safe and citizens are able to walk in our cities and townships without fear. Victims of crime will receive appropriate support and will be treated with compassion. We will start by increasing the number of operational SAPS members to 250 000. This will give us a ratio of one SAPS member to 202 citizens, a ratio that will put us above the international median but is more appropriate for the level of crime experienced in South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger, please take your seat. Hon members there is too much noise. We have a speaker on the floor and you are drowning the speaker out. I am appealing to both sides of the House, please allow the honourable member to present. You may proceed hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. We will further boost

these numbers with a strong volunteer corps. The DA will provide the opportunity for South Africans to do volunteer service in the SAPS. Upon completion of the program, volunteers would have the option of being considered for permanent police service or to qualify for an opportunity voucher to further their studies or to start a small business. This is a far cry from the zero number of police reservists recruited in the Western Cape in the last three years. A DA National Government would ensure that new SAPS members are appropriately trained. We would not sacrifice quality in an attempt to achieve higher quantities of police members. We will maintain high standards for recruitment and allocate sufficient funds for training. We will ensure shift management systems to ensure minimum service level standards and ensure that adequate staff accommodation is offered to police members in their initial years of service.

These are just some of the tangible policy proposals we are putting forward to increase the safety of the citizens of South Africa. By contrast, the only retort from the ANC is on Bambanani's. Bambanani's were however so poorly managed under the ANC that in 2007 their own MPL Patrick McKenzie expressed disappointment that they got funding under Leonard Ramatlakane. He said that Bambanani's were no longer what they were intended to be and the concept needed to be revisited. A year later the community said the project was a complete failure and should be revisited. So why now come and make as if Bambanani's are the silver bullet that is going to solve our crime troubles.

In fact, the ANC discredits all independent research that does not fit their narrative. For example, the ANC keeps saying that Cape Town is the most unequal city in our country ...

An HON MEMBER: It is!

Ms M M WENGER: ...yet the United Nations reveals that Cape Town is the most equal city in South Africa and it is three ANC municipalities that are the most unequal in our country. This is a case of Orwellian doublethink - the act of simultaneously accepting two contradictory beliefs as correct - to tell deliberate lies while genuinely believing them and to forget any fact that is inconvenient.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip Mr Wiley.

†Mnr M G E WILEY: Agb Speaker, dis daardie lekker klomp daar anderkant.

*Madam Speaker, it is that merry lot there on the other side. Please.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May I ask the hon members of the back bench of the ANC please if you can please tone it down. I can understand interjection but you cannot drown out a speaker.

The SPEAKER: You can proceed hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: This is a case of Orwellian doublethink - the act of simultaneously accepting two contradictory beliefs as correct - to tell deliberate lies while genuinely believing them and to forget any fact that is inconvenient. They question Stats SA on jobs because the facts are inconvenient. They discredit the Auditor General's reports saying that clean audits mean nothing because the facts are inconvenient. This is probably because ANC municipalities cannot come close to the same level of audit proficiency. Their provinces are not exactly a shining example of clean audits. As *The Daily Maverick* notes, the ANC bumbles their way through the business of governance, but that's because their business is not governance, it is the capture and exercise of power. For them it is state capture, not the capable state. Where are the outcomes, they asked. The outcomes are in the fact that clean audits mean prudent and efficient use of taxpayers' money for the purpose they were intended, service delivery. And if that is meaningless then that just goes to show the extent of rot within the ANC. Premier Helen Zille spoke about the importance of the capable state, that it is the great moral imperative of our time. Because it is through this capable state that we can turn plans into reality.

Clean audits are a barometer, a green light on the capable state and that is why they are important. That means money is not being spent on fire pools, on jets and fruitless and wasteful expenditure. The ANC's Cyril Ramaphosa recognises this. He said that South Africa is facing significant challenges in the area of governance and that too many departments on a provincial and national level continue to receive qualified audits and that is why there is the

need for a capable state. To quote award winning singer/song writer Alanis Morissette “isn’t it ironic, don’t you think”.

The Premier delivered an address to make citizens proud. Despite challenging economic times, the Western Cape is progressing on jobs. The Western Cape is progressing on the economy. The Western Cape is progressing in education and in infrastructure. This must be a bitter pill to swallow for the ANC. The only province where the ANC does not govern is the best performing province of them all. We however still have much work to do and will continue to make progress because we have a great moral imperative to deliver a capable state for the inhabitants of our dear province. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members. Order please. I see the Hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, hon Premier: President Nelson Mandela said 21 years ago, and I quote:

“As long as the unfortunate conditions created by the old order remain, the people will remain restless. The discomfort will give rise to waves of instability. The challenge before all of us is to create conditions which begin to transform their conditions of living and give them new hope of a better future”.

President Nelson Mandela went on to say:

“Freedom should not be understood to mean leadership positions or even appointments to top positions. It must be understood as the transformation of the lives of ordinary people in the hostels and in the ghettos, in the squatter camps and on the farms and in the mine compounds”.

Madam Speaker, 22 years into a democratic South Africa we have had 22 years of ANC rule, 22 years of unemployment, 22 years of ANC corruption and 22 years under a National ANC Government with no vision. 22 years of a National ANC Government set to enrich themselves and neglect the poor. Shame on the ANC. The honest question we must ask ourselves is the following: have the lives of ordinary people improved over the past 22 years under the ANC government and is the ANC government providing a capable state? The answer is no.

Madam Speaker, †vir dié wat van my verskil - *for those who differ from me – the hon Dyantyi still looks at the stats of 2011, not telling the people that this province has grown by 28,7%. But while the hon Dyantyi looks at 2011 we look at 2015. He compares the Western Cape to Limpopo, where you get a township, Modimolle, which for the last 3 months has been without water. That is what the ANC thinks about black people.

†Hoekom is daar verskeie skole in die Oos-Kaap wat verlede jaar nie 'n enkele leerling deur matriek kon sit nie? Hoe moet hierdie kinders in gemeenskappe hoop hê vir 'n beter toekoms? Die ontledingsgroep, *Africa Check*, het bevind dat vandat die ANC vir President Zuma aangestel het as Staatspresident is 1,6 miljoen meer Suid-Afrikaners werkloos. In totaal is daar vandag 8,3 miljoen mense werkloos in Suid-Afrika. Dit is ten spyte van 'n Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan, ten spyte van 'n Kabinet van 35 ministers en 37 adjunk-ministers.

*Why are there are several schools in the Eastern Cape that last year could not put a single learner through matric? How are these children in these communities supposed to have hope for a better future? The analysis group, *Africa Check*, found that since the ANC appointed President Zuma as State President, 1.6 million more South Africans are unemployed. In total there are 8.3 million people unemployed today in South Africa. This is despite a National Development Plan, despite a Cabinet of 35 ministers and 37 deputy ministers.

†Werkloosheid, armoede en ongelykheid, dit is die realiteit van 22 jaar van demokrasie onder ANC-regering. Ons moet as Suid-Afrikaners onself afvra of die vryheid van die demokrasie 'n werklikheid is vir die gemeenskappe onder die ANC-regering? Ons moet vra of mense in Diepsloot, Bushbuck Ridge en Sebokeng vandag werklik vry is. Het die lewe onder die ANC-regering vir hulle verbeter? Die antwoord is nee. Die vraag is, is daar 'n alternatief? Die antwoord is ja. Die alternatief is die Wes-Kaap onder die DA-regering.

*Unemployment, poverty and inequality are the reality of 22 years of democracy under ANC rule. We must ask ourselves as South Africans if the freedom of democracy is a reality for communities under ANC rule? We should ask whether people in Diepsloot, Bushbuck Ridge and Sebokeng are today truly free? Did life under an ANC government improve for them? The answer is no. The question is, is there an alternative? The answer is yes. The alternative is the Western Cape under a DA Government.

†Ek doen vandag 'n beroep op mense om te kyk na die DA-regering. Vir my is die ou leuse "aksie spreek harder as woorde". Met die oog op die komende verkiesing vra ek, kyk na die DA-regering en vergelyk ons met enige ANC-regering. Doen die vergelykings in die armste van die armste gedeeltes.

*I today urge people to look at the DA Government. For me, it is about the saying "actions speak louder than words". Looking ahead to the upcoming elections, I ask, look at the DA Government and compare us with any ANC Government. Do the comparisons in the poorest of the poorest areas.

I challenge the hon Dyantyi, I challenge the ANC, I challenge the people, to compare the DA run province with every ANC run province because there can be no doubt that the Western Cape today provides the poorest amongst us with the highest access to water, to flush toilets and to electricity in the country.

Consider good governance and accountability which are key to a democracy as stated by the Premier last week. In 2009, the last year the ANC governed

in the Western Cape, the Auditor General reported that not a single provincial government department received a clean audit. This year 12 out of the 13 departments got clean audits and 13 departments got unqualified audits.

†Die ANC probeer vandag sê daar is nie waarde in 'n skoon oudit nie. Wat 'n skande.

*The ANC is trying to say today that there is no value in a clean audit. What a shame.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister please take your seat. Agb Dyantyi, †jy het jou kans gehad om kole te gooi en die Minister het geluister. Asseblief, jy het 'n spreekbeurt gehad. Hon Dyantyi, *you had your chance to throw coals and the Minister listened. Please, you had a chance to speak. †Interjections are allowed but not a running commentary please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The ANC when they governed in 2009 ran into the streets with brown envelopes trying to bribe the reporters, trying to bribe the newspapers. But let me tell them what a clean audit does tell the people out there. A clean audit tells the people out there that the DA does not steal their money. A clean audit tells the people out there that we spend their money according to the rule of law. Their money is in save hands.

†Die werklikheid is dat die ANC het die Wes-Kaap regeer en het misluk. Die

ANC regeer Suid-Afrika en hulle is besig om te misluk. Die DA is die enigste party wat 'n kans gegun is deur die kiesers om te regeer en dit is gedoen omdat die DA gewys het dat ons 'n party is wat omgee vir die mense. 'n DA wat kwesbare mense eerste stel. 'n DA wat verstaan dat ons mense moet hoop gee. 'n DA wat verstaan om hoop vir mense te gee moet ons 'n volhoubare werk vir hulle gee, nie 'n *job opportunity* nie. 'n DA wat weet dit is belangrik vir pa's en ma's om in arm gemeenskappe te kan hoop gee vir hulle kinders se toekoms.

*The reality is that the ANC has governed the Western Cape and failed. The ANC governs South Africa and they are failing. The DA is the only party that has been given a chance to rule by the voters and it was done because it showed that the DA was a party that cares for the people. A DA that puts vulnerable people first. A DA who understands that it needs to give people hope. A DA that understands that it can give people hope by giving them sustainable work, not a job opportunity. A DA who knows it is important for fathers and mothers in poor communities to give hope for their children's future.

†Op elke meetbare vlak is die Wes-Kaap 'n beter alternatief vir Suid-Afrikaners. Dit is die provinsie waar ons mense die grootste kans het op 'n beter lewe. Ons verwelkom die mense in die Wes-Kaap.

*On every measurable level the Western Cape is a better alternative for South Africans. This is the province where our people have the best chance at a better life. We welcome the people in the Western Cape.

They are welcome in the Western Cape, but we need to also get the funding so that we can provide and build the infrastructure.

†In die Wes-Kaap werk ons elke dag om die gemeenskappe se lewens te verbeter. Dit is die DA se missie om aan elke persoon in hierdie provinsie ‘n menswaardige lewe te gee. In die Wes-Kaap droom ons namens ons inwoners en ons droom is dat elke familie volledige gedienste erwe moet hê ...[tussenwerpsels]

*In the Western Cape we work every day to improve the lives in our communities. It is the party's mission to provide a decent life to every person in this province. In the Western Cape we dream on behalf of our residents and our dream is that each family should have fully serviced properties... [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. There is just too much noise coming from the left here. Hon members please tone it down so that we can hear the speaker. You are drowning out the speaker. Hon Minister, I just asked for silence. Can we please have silence? You may proceed.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: In die Wes-Kaap droom ons namens ons inwoners en ons droom is dat elke familie volledige gedienste erwe moet hê. Dat elke familie ‘n werk moet hê. In die Wes-Kaap het ons 23 van ons 30 munisipaliteite gehelp tot skoon oudits. Ons sit met probleem-munisipaliteite. Ek vra julle wat het hierdie munisipaliteite in gemeen

behalwe dat hulle die sleg bestuurste munisipaliteite in die provinsie is? Kan julle raai? Nie een van hulle word deur die DA bestuur nie en almal word deur ANC en ANC-koalisies bestuur.

*The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In the Western Cape we dream on behalf of our people and our dream is that every family should have fully serviced properties. Every family should have a job. In the Western Cape we have helped 23 of our 30 municipalities to obtain clean audits. We sit with problem municipalities. I ask you what these municipalities have in common except that they are badly managed municipalities in the province? Can you guess? None of them are managed by the DA, but they are all managed by the ANC and ANC coalitions.

†Dinge het in Oudtshoorn so sleg gegaan ons moes hulle onder administrasie gesit het. Ons skraap vandag nog die gemors uit wat die ANC daar in Oudtshoorn aangevang het. Hierdie provinsie gee meer steun aan ANC- en koalisieregerings as aan DA-regeerde munisipaliteite want ons gee om vir die mense wat daar is. Maar ten spyte van hierdie swak ANC-regering daar, gee ons om vir die mense. Dink aan die KKNK wat nie sou plaasgevind het was dit nie vir die DA se ingryping nie. Wat het gebeur in Eden-distrik? Buurmunisipaliteite het hande gevat, geld gegee, ondersteuning gegee sodat die KKNK kan plaasvind. Dis ongehoord. Jy sal dit nie kry waar die ANC regeer nie.

*Things went so badly in Oudtshoorn that we had to place them under administration. Today we are still scraping away the mess left by the ANC in

Oudtshoorn. This province gives more support to the ANC and coalition governments than to DA ruled municipalities because we care about the people. But despite this weak ANC government, we care about the people there. Think of the KKNAF which would not have taken place were it not for the DA's intervention. What happened in the Eden District? Neighbouring municipalities joined hands, gave money, gave support to enable the KKNAF to take place. It's unheard of. You will not find that where the ANC governs.

†Die agb Dyantyi noem raadslede wat oortree het. Almal het stout kinders. Almal het mense wat oortree. Vir die agb Dyantyi wil ek sê dat ek sal nie toelaat dat daar op politieke vlak op enige mense se lewens getrap word nie, ongeag of die raadslid ANC, EFF of DA is. Hulle sal 'n regverdigte verhoor kry. Hulle sal 'n regverdigte kans kry om hulle saak te stel. Die verskil is die DA sal optree teen sy eie mense.

The hon Dyantyi mentions councillors who have transgressed. Everyone has naughty children. Everyone has people who transgress. To the hon Dyantyi I want to say that I will not allow at any political level for a person to be stepped on, regardless of whether the councillor is ANC, EFF or DA. They will get a fair trial. They will be given a fair chance to state their case. The difference is the DA will act against its own people.

†Agb Speaker, ek wil vinnig raak aan brande. Elke brand is hartseer. Elke lewe wat ons verloor is 'n tragedie. In my span, onder Rampbestuur, kyk ons elke dag en ons werk elke dag om brande te verminder. Deur ons opleidingsprogramme en ons bewusmakingsveldtogte, veral onder kinders, is

ons besig om geweldige vrugte af te werp. Ons is baie trots op initiatiewe soos *Gerry the Giraffe* om die bewusmakingsveldtog te lei en dit is besig om vrugte af te werp.

*Madam Speaker, I want to quickly touch on fires. Every fire is sad. Every life we lose is a tragedy. In my team, Disaster Management, we look every day to reducing fires. Through our training programs and our awareness campaigns, particularly among children, our work is proving very fruitful. We are very proud of initiatives such as *Gerry the Giraffe* to lead the awareness campaign and it is bearing fruit.

†Maar agb Speaker ek sluit af deur u te herhinner dat vanjaar 'n plaaslike verkiesingsjaar is en ek wil graag aan die inwoners van die Wes-Kaap die volgende gedagte los wat ek onlangs op 'n plakaat gelees het: "Bad politicians are elected by good people who do not vote". U stem kan Suid-Afrika red. Dankie.

*But Madam Speaker, I conclude by reminding you that this year there are local elections and I would like to leave the people of the Western Cape with the following thought that I read on a poster: "Bad politicians are elected by good people who do not vote". Your vote can save South Africa. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order please members. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon Speaker, the hon Premier, uMama Helen Zille, hon Ministers, hon members, guests, ladies and gentlemen. Indeed success begets further success when you hear of the DA story that team success comes into

light. The DA is now the new phrase in the dictionary for success. In her State of the Province Address the hon Premier made a number of commitments and indeed exciting pronouncements.

Madam Premier, you mentioned in this House last Friday that in the Western Cape we intend to have other means of alternative energy production, thereby ensuring that 120 extra megawatts is put back into the grid and that is a good story that nobody else can tell in this country. Madam Premier, you have given hope, we have given leadership. We have given vision to the people of this province and for that we are saying it is indeed possible that South Africa will be governed under the DA values in our lifetime. When we go to the 2019 elections we have no doubt that South Africa will indeed have a President Mmusi Maimane.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela please take a seat, there is a member on the floor. Is it a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker I honestly did not hear that can the member just repeat that?

The SPEAKER: That is a frivolous point of order hon member Mackenzie. You may proceed hon member Mngasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Indeed South Africa would be governed by our values. The DA story is here to haunt the ANC and we will see in 2019 a new

President and that President is Mmusi Maimane. It has become even more a reality today than ever. In this country the ANC wants to fire President Zuma more than we think we do. So even those who are sitting on the other side, you don't even believe that Zuma is the correct person to lead us in this country. So that we know.

Let me just say that when I heard hon member Dyantyi speaking about good provinces I think I was sitting in another forum and I can tell you that truth and figures do not lie. We are sitting here with the Free State owing Eskom R842 million. We are sitting with Northern Cape owing R2 billion and I can say that is #ANCgoodgovernance. R5.6 billion is owed to Eskom nationally #ANCgoodgovernance. When we speak about corruption you are sitting here with John Block who is languishing in dire strain of desperation because the ANC has a good story #goodgovernance.

Humphrey Mmemezi is sitting in the national assembly being promoted by you after spending lot of money of the poor people #ANCgoodgovernance. Beki Cele was speaking in the National Assembly rubbishing everything good we have done in this province, even lying, saying that we have not spent our money. Yet they transferred the budget to us one month before the end of the financial year. We have spent 95% to date and that is a good story. Beki Cele is sitting in the National Assembly having been removed as the Police Commissioner and promoted for stealing to become a Deputy Minister of what? Agriculture. I wonder if he is not going to steal potatoes and bananas #goodgovernanceoftheANC.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mngasela, your time is not up, I just needed you to redirect your conversation to the Chair please. You may continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now we are sitting here in this province where at least 23 municipalities had clean audits. But look where they did not have clean audits where the ANC did not think it is important. Maybe you must tell your ANC National Executive there in the Cabinet that they must remove [Inaudible - 33:46] because it is a South African thing which we bought into and we are mastering it, because we are the masters of good governance. Go to Cederberg #ANCgoodgovernance. Go to Kannaland #ANCgoodgovernance. Go to Oudtshoorn #ANCgoodgovernance. Go to Beaufort West where the Mayor says I must give you a tender, you must give me money because it is the right thing for the ANC #ANCgoodgovernance.

When Baleka Mbete steals money through the corrupted deal with Goldfields what did she get? Promotion to the Speaker #ANCgoodgovernance. I must just clap for you #ANCgoodgovernance. I am saying indeed South Africa will be governed under the DA values and it is a real story that we are an unstoppable tsunami, the blue tsunami, the real story, the real deal for South Africa #ANCgoodgovernance.

In 2015, Madam Speaker, the Speaker of Cape Town asked all parties and all those who represent society to come and sign a pledge. Listen what this read like. It said:

“We invite all these political parties to sign and endorse the following objectives on fighting racism. To condemn racism wherever it occurs in Cape Town in all its form. To amplify the voices of the majority to reject racism. To build an inclusive Cape Town where human rights are respected....”

I will stop there. Look who was there. It was all the parties including the PAC, the DA, the Cape Muslim Party, and UDM. I don't see the name of the ANC, it is missing here. The ANC is the architect of racism in this country #ANCgoodgovernance. When you had your leader here speaking Madam Speaker, the leader of the ANC ran away because he could not stand the reality. When he was finished they did not want to stay, they were embarrassed. The Chief Whip did not stand. Others also did not stand.

That is the problem we are facing here, there is no leadership in the ANC. They are boring because this is not a competition with meat. We want them to become an effective opposition. We want them to become a party that believes in inclusive society and they must be able to fight racism in this country and they failed to unite the people of this country and we will not stand back #goodgovernanceofthewest. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Can we have some quiet please members. We have two more speakers to go and then we would have gotten through the session. I now recognise the hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. It is really with a profound sense of disappointment that one listened to the content of the Premier's State of the Province Address. What the speaker said and what she did not say explain very clearly why the majority of South Africans, especially black South Africans, and I mean coloured, African and Indian South Africans, working people and the rural poor and women, will never support the Democratic Alliance.

This may take a little more time in the Western Cape because of a deliberate strategy to divide coloured and African from white, but the reality is that what is sad about the perspective of the Premier is that one expects the first citizen of the province to give leadership to all in the Western Cape. But given the triple challenges facing our country of inequality, of poverty and unemployment, and the fact that the black majority African and coloured people in particular bear this burden in the main, it is shocking that the Premier's speech did not mention a single word about the following things.

Firstly, black economic empowerment. Absolutely nothing. Silence. Secondly, employment equity. Absolutely nothing and employment equity for the record says that historically disadvantaged individuals are coloured, are African, are Indian, are women and the disabled. Not a single word about employment equity. Thirdly, absolutely nothing about preferential procurement. Fourthly, absolutely nothing about changing the patterns of ownership of our economy in this province. Absolutely nothing. Fifthly,

nothing about the empowerment of women. Absolutely nothing about practical steps to advance and promote economic participation for the jobs and disabled and absolutely nothing about the demon of racism.

Now this is a Premier that is supposed to give leadership to our province and I want to appeal to every member of this House, and this is very serious, to read the Premier's speech again and then to read the speech of hon Premier David Makhura who delivered his speech yesterday and then you will begin to understand the fundamental differences between those in South Africa who understand the need to deal with inequality by actually changing the economic inequality in this country. But the Premier in her speech would give the impression, and all of us support the need for job creation, but to argue that simply creating jobs but not dealing with the deep inequalities in our economy, reveals exactly the contradictions in the DA.

Why, when member Mazibuko, the Leader of the DA in the Opposition, began to talk about the need for employment she was packed away. And now you have a situation where a Premier of this province comes into this House and mentions absolutely nothing about employment equity. And this is actually the tragedy that we face, because that then gives a license to managers in the Provincial Government not to transform their departments so that the Employment Equity Commission has labelled the Western Cape as the worst performing province when it comes to employment equity in the Provincial Government because it has got worse since the ANC no longer governs this province.

Senior coloured, senior women and senior African managers have actually been marginalised and their representivity in the senior [Inaudible - 25:57] has actually worsened under the DA and the facts will speak for themselves. Now, for instance Premier Makhura did not shy away from talking about racism, and I want to quote him. He said:

“Those who call black people baboons are as wrong as those who threaten to drive white students out of university campuses. There must be no room for racists in the South Africa of our dreams”.

But this Premier says absolutely nothing about a very serious issue which actually threatens stability in our province. And I think that is the tragedy. We have a situation where this Democratic Alliance is split on the issue of transformation and the need to implement equity because you hear one thing from Helen Zille, you hear another thing from Mmusi Maimane, you hear another thing from Herman Mashaba and the reality is that the only way this party survives in South Africa in the Western Cape is to stoke coloured fears against African people. *'n Swart gevaar* is in the interest of the Democratic Alliance and that is the only way they are surviving in this province.

The tragedy is that all of these issues that I am talking about of advancement of equity of redress are required by our Constitution. But they are completely ignored by the Premier. The tragedy is that when the first citizen delivers an address which fails to deal with inequality redress and

transformation, the lead is then followed by many. Our Premier is not leading. In fact she is making it acceptable for key sectors in our society, in the business community, the agricultural sector, to actually ignore the imperatives of transformation and employment equity.

She is ignoring employment equity, she is ignoring the empowerment of women and she is actually belittling the massive inequality in our province in regard to land ownership because she is silent on these matters. And while I welcome, and all of us welcome, the need to grow the economy and create jobs and there is consensus about that, we as the ANC are saying that it is not only possible to grow jobs, but it is possible to both grow jobs and transform the ownership patterns of our economy and that is essential to the stability of our country to ensure economic ownership is shared and transformed. Without that, we create a recipe for deepened inequality and depend conflict.

And that's the tragedy because her speech talks to jobs alone, but does not talk to the fundamental inequality that we need to address. And the Premier's economic plans are in fact a recipe or a blueprint to maintain the patterns of economic privilege in the Western Cape. This is dangerous. Because when for instance you, MEC Madikizela and MEC Grant announce the better-living model and you put it in the newspaper, nowhere in this advert is any of the criteria around broad based economic empowerment. Absolutely nothing.

It's about maintaining and preserving privileges in regard to land ownership

because you do not actually insist and then if we for instance need to compare that to David Makhura our Premier in Gauteng, he says to us that nothing is such a permanent reminder of our apartheid and colonial past than the persistent racial exclusion of blacks from the mainstream of the economy. This is not language the Premier uses. Why? Because she represents the maintenance of privilege. You go onto Premier Makhura and he for instance says very clearly that as the pioneers... [interjections]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore kindly take your seat please. Members we cannot throw insults across the floor while there is a speaker addressing us. Can I please ask that both sides of the House contain yourselves and allow hon member Dugmore to proceed?

Mr C M DUGMORE: The stark contrast between essentially ANC policy and leadership and DA maintenance of white privileges is the following. David Makhura says:

“I truly believe we can use procurement policy to achieve genuine black economic empowerment in all sectors without bribery and corruption. We must get rid of the perception that any black person who gets a tender has bribed his or her way into the corridors of power”.

And this is important. Let us empower black people, contractors, construction companies, law firms, accounting and auditing firms, engineering, consulting firms, emerging farmers and manufacturers of food

products, industrial entrepreneurs, unashamedly, transparently and ethically. And this is simply what you do not get from this DA Government and why they are so divided.

What we have then is a Premier who undermines the very redress and equity and equality that our Constitution demands of us. And what is even more scandalous is that in this province we have a Premier who actually ignores the provisions of the Provincial Constitution which has been certified whatever the debates were. This Constitution which is the law in this province requires the Western Cape to set up a Children's Commissioner and to set up an Environmental Commissioner. And what we had, and the honourable members of that side of the House will tell you, that throughout the province there was support for setting up a Children's Commissioner and an Environmental Commissioner and despite a promise made by the Premier in 2009. Nothing has been done.

In fact what the Premier tried to do last year was that she tried to get an amendment to the Constitution to actually make it not compulsory to appoint these. And what it is, they want to avoid the focus on our children who are suffering from tik, on our children who are being abused on the farms. They don't want a Commissioner to highlight those things. They don't want an Environmental Commissioner to expose the deals of the Mayor and others who are involved in property deals. They don't want that truth where they are riding roughshod and they don't want an Environmental Commissioner to investigate where the DA, through people like MEC Bredell, collect their

money from developers in this province. That is the reality which they don't want.

The other thing that we have seen very clearly is this attempt to try and paint, as the Premier did through distortions and deliberate untruths, a picture that this province is penalised when it comes to the provision of South African police service. Let me inform this House of official statistics, that when one looks at the ratio of a police person to the general population, the Western Cape is in the third best position in the country.

Yes, the Northern Cape has 1:184. The Free State has 1:241. The Western Cape has 1:304 and the worst of which is in fact Limpopo at 1:481. But the Premier will come to this House using figures selectively and saying in a certain police station you have 1:600. The reality is the Western Cape is that it is third best provided when it comes to police persons in the country. It is! The challenge, however, is that we need to focus on those inequalities that hon member Wenger referred to of Nyanga versus Camps Bay. Yes, but instead of focusing and working with the police to deal with those inequalities, the Premier has decided to fight the National Government. But don't come to this House and create an impression that the Western Cape is being penalised when it comes to the provision of police. It is simply not consistent with the facts and member Wenger can go to Parliament and get the official response to a parliamentary question to get this particular information.

MEC Mbombo and the Premier want to come and boast about health provision in this province. Do you know that the Auditor General has investigated and we want to see the results of that investigation. The Department of Health in the Western Cape is paying private practitioners R60 000 to spend 1 hour a week at a clinic in Slangrivier. 1 hour a week! That is a complete abuse of public resources actually subsidising the private sector and I challenge the MEC to come and reveal the truth about what was the procurement process followed to appoint those two general practitioners, how much were they paid each month and how many hours they spent in the community.

And here we want this side of the House rubbishing the National Health Insurance System whereas public funds are being used. And I think this is what we need to focus on. So we have a Premier who talks about focusing on the youth for the next 3 years, but simply in a particular style of preserving privilege and patronage actually does not talk to transformation and that is why the African National Congress, despite our challenges, will continue to be the hope for the majority of black, African and coloured and those people in the white community who are serious about changing inequality. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Members can we please just all calm down. I will allow those members to be seated. I now recognise the hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker. We are in a debate here

in this province following the State of the Province Address as given by the Premier last week. That also followed on the State of the Nation Address as given by the President. And what are we dealing with here? We are dealing with a State of the Nation Address that was given by the President to a State where people are disillusioned, people are hungry, there is no plan, our economy is going down the toilet. That's the State of the Nation that the President had to give. And in this province the address given by the Premier on Friday was a State of a Province Address by a leader who gave hope. Exactly correct. You gave hope to the people of this province.

And here we are today. Today is actually that day in this province where the Opposition gets to open the debate. This is the day when the alternative government in this province has the opportunity to talk about this province. The state of this province. This is when the newly elected Magaxa, as the Leader of the Opposition in this province, has his opportunity to make his mark. Guess what he does? He walks out. But you know where he has gone to Madam Speaker? He has gone outside to address the masses. I apologise if I laughed too loudly when I saw this photograph, I wish I could put it on the screens. This is the photograph of the masses outside this very Legislature that the hon member Mgaxa has gone to go and address. There are more spectators than ANC people standing outside there. It's a blooming pathetic show.

This is the new Leader of the Opposition. This is your day in the opposition to come with the alternative. You know that this debate is the debate where

we are going to an election in a few months in this province. This is the debate where the ANC in this province will stand up and brag about all of their accomplishments where they govern so that they can convince the people, like those who are standing outside there, that they need to vote for the ANC because they are so good at governing in this province. They are the alternative.

I never heard one word from one member in these benches saying one thing or brag about one time of where they govern #badANCgovernment in this province. Not one show case. Nothing. And then of course one by one people stand up and they start to use statistics. And it's actually amazing – and they fall into the trap because they do mention the year of the statistics every now and again, that's why I was asking the hon member Dugmore if the statistics he was using was 2011 – because it was one of the common statistics that we heard in the room today. And perhaps while he is answering me on that I hope he has actually read the Khayelitsha Commission Report. Because if you go and read that report hon member Dugmore, you will see exactly where the disproportion of allocation is by the police that you are talking about in this part.

You will see that it is skewed and you have done nothing, zero. And it is your ANC government that runs this portfolio on a national level, you have done zero about trying to fix it. You were the one that said that you are interested in the people of this province. Zero, nothing, naught, nada.
[interjections]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister can I caution you please speak to the Chair and manage that finger please. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I'll try, thank you Madam Speaker. I'll hold these documents then in my hand.

So we heard many statistics and I am going to start with the statistics as used by the hon member Magaxa, who is now the Leader of the Opposition in this province. And he very cleverly followed on all of the previous people that have spoken before him. You remember hon member Fransman? He used to be the Leader of the Opposition. You remember him, don't you? [Laughter.]

He used to be here, he is now no longer. But exactly the same thing, hon member Tyatyam not so long ago was talking about statistics and specifically something called the Gini coefficient. And of course you heard the hon member Dyantyi, now also left, saying †“wag vir Dinsdag, dis die dag” *“wait for Tuesday, that is the day”. I mean I have never heard such a pathetic speech in my life.

We were all waiting in anticipation for this absolutely powerful speech coming from him and he's left. I mean there was nothing to it. But he did mention some statistics. Okay, so they have gone up to 31 people outside now. But each and every person starts mentioning statistics. When we

govern we have to use mechanism of measurement to govern by and you heard the Premier mention a whole lot of them and you've heard many speakers speak about the impact. You have spoken about the audit outcomes. Here the audit outcomes are for the country. Have a look at all the red marks in the rest of the country and then look at the green marks in this province.

But I am not going to speak about it because many speakers have spoken about it. But the main thing that the Auditor General speaks about over and above this is a number R30 billion. R30 billion that disappears or can't be accounted for in this country, just in the last financial year. If you add that all together you are looking at about R750 billion over the last year, 20 years that cannot be accounted for. Is that a government looking after the interests of the poor in this country? It's not a thumbsuck, even if we add that to the R500 billion that the hon member Grant was speaking about in his speech after some musical chairs with the President on what is leaked out of this country.

We are facing budget cuts because there is no tax income. There is no confidence in the system in South Africa and is that good governance? Is that making governing this country and leading this country according to a good plan and good strong political leadership in the interest of the poor people of this country. I say it does not #badANCgovernment. So let's talk about that and I know the hon member Wenger spoke about these measurements, but I brought this to the House specifically because the hon member Fransman spoke about it and the hon member Tyatyam spoke about

it and the hon member Dyantyi spoke about it – the unequal place in South Africa. Absolutely wrong, it's been double-checked. The first time by following hon member Fransman's statement – and it actually says here Fransman said on the 16th of June 2012:

“How does Zille claim to be the best Premier when it's the most unequal city in the world?”

They came back and said absolutely wrong and there the numbers are. You know the Gini coefficient measured from 0 - 1 and of course we must always say that in this city and in this province we will continually work to bring that number down because it is too high, and that is why we do what we do and that's why we apportion the budgets that we do - but the lowest in South Africa.

It goes on to say that hon member Fransman did not know what he was talking about. They then did a further study and the hon member Wenger spoke about that. The United Nations said that East London, Johannesburg and the East Rand are the most unequal cities, not in South Africa, in the world. In the world! This is where #badANCgovernment governs. This is totally unacceptable. Then let's have a look at the other statistics that are used in this debate and we come to the job numbers.

It is actually quite interesting because I heard often from two speakers of the ANC today where they would speak about this quarter, they would speak

about 2011, they would mix up the numbers. We must not mix up the numbers, we must have a look in 5 year terms of when governments were in power because that is how the voters have to then vote according to your plans and how you delivered on your plans. If you have got a plan. Because quite frankly we don't see the National Development Plan featuring anywhere in these processes. It just gets spoken about every couple of years.

But if you look at the stats of the job numbers and we measure 2009 to 2015 and we have a look at South Africa; in South Africa over that period, not 2011 – 2015, there were 1,251 million extra jobs created in this country. Way too low. We need more growth so that we can create many many more jobs because the scary thing is that the unemployed in South Africa is sitting at 5,418 million, not economically active 14,68 million and discouraged workers a further 2,26 million. That's 22 million people who are not participating in the economy of this country. That's at a national level.

If we look at the 1,2 million jobs that were created in South Africa, in this part of the country which is 13, its now 14, its going better, we are actually becoming a bigger part of South Africa's economy – we were 13%, we are now 14.7% of South Africa's economy, we brought in 27% of the jobs in this province. It has the highest labour force participation rate of 68%. Gauteng at 52% and declining. That is the capital of the economy in South Africa and declining. So what happens? Do you want to move to Gauteng? Sounds like you do.

But the Premier mentioned the business confidence index. Look at what is happening. The Johannesburg Stock Exchange is opening an office in Cape Town, why? Because their customers are in Cape Town. This is where the economy is moving to. I spoke last year about if Gauteng was going to lose the economy capital of South Africa, as by *Moneyweb*. And so what happens is these things are changing in this province, why? Because the Premier puts an address out that creates hope. That shows the report card of what this Province did over the last year while we have been in government. It's the state of the province that creates hope.

An HON MEMBER: Hear hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So then let's have a look at something else and now if you allow me, because we are talking about the State of the Nation and the State of the Province, I found it quite interesting when the President spoke in the State of the Nation Address and he said:

“...South Africa to focus on financial service skills development”.

We need to become the financial hub of Africa and quite frankly we do. I've spoken about it in this House before and we have seen what's happening in Mauritius, how they really are doing amazing things. But it's quite interesting, He announces a program in the State of the Nation Address and its almost word for word – the financial skills shortage is critical, Province

intervenes to meet demand on the 26th of March 2014. It was a project that was launched by me in Gauteng in partnership with UCT, Barclays Africa Group, Firststrand, Liberty and we launched the Africa Institute of Financial Markets and Risk Management.

So again this province is taking the lead but we will give the President the opportunity to announce it again and we will definitely work with him because I do believe that that is what we got to do.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You still said nothing about empowerment.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I'm getting there. Just relax. So now let's also talk about something else that's come up in the debate and that is this constant talk about National Government and Provincial Government and national money and provincial money and we need to respect our national colleagues etc. We commit permanently to work with our national colleagues. But it has to work both ways.

So what happens? Last Friday while we were all sitting here, there was a little thing that happened in Knysna where the Human Settlements Minister Lindiwe Sisulu goes and does a big land handover. And it says Knysna land deal not an election ploy. And you just heard the hon member Dugmore say

together with your Mayor. The Mayor was here. This was full of ANC T-shirts but it says not an election ploy. [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please can you take your seat for just a minute. I'm sorry to stop you in your tracks. There is too much noise members, from both sides of the House. Can I please appeal for silence so that we can afford the Minister an opportunity to present. You may proceed hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The Minister Beki Cele also made a whole lot of statements in Parliament last week. I have written a letter to him and let's see what he replies, but for one where he spoke about his visit to Swartland Municipality where there were 157 participants in a project and now there's only 14. We have actually searched through the whole space, we cannot find this project.

He spoke about the flood money which the Premier spoke about where he says that we only spent 5%. I cannot even go back to any of the reporting that says 5%. You go to the different reporting, the lowest number I can find is 25%, but you must understand that when you get given the money you cannot just spend it. You have got to go through processes. This Government talks about good government and processes. When you understand those processes the environmental authorisation and water license approvals had still not been handed to us. So Madam Speaker... [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Your closing sentence?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Last closing sentence Madam Speaker, I would like to follow on the hon member Mngasela to say #badANCgoverning.

The SPEAKER: That hon members concludes the debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address. The hon Premier will reply to the debate on Thursday the 25th of February 2016 in this House at 14:15. I thank you.

The House adjourned at 13:18.