
THURSDAY, 23 FEBRUARY 2017

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The SPEAKER: Order. Members, could I ask that your cell phones please be put on silent or vibrate. I will now ask the Secretary to read the Order of the Day.

Reply by the Premier to the debate on the State of the Province Address.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I will now afford the honourable the Premier an opportunity to reply to the debate. The honourable, the Premier Zille.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Thank you very much Madam Speaker and hon members. On Tuesday we saw a painfully shallow empty and vacuous response to the State of the Province Address from the Opposition.

Mr P UYS: We saw something... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: There was no light coming from that side, no light at all, even less than usual, which is saying something, and I think it is because that entire side of the House is covered with a dark blanket of hypocrisy... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: But your anger does not serve us... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Your anger.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...your anger does not serve us all.

The PREMIER: ...that hangs over everything they do. For example... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You must calm down. This is not good for...

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Olivier.

The PREMIER: For example...

Mr R T OLIVIER: Sorry Premier, I am sorry. [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: They claim for example, and I am talking of hypocrisy here,

Madam Speaker, they claim to speak on behalf of the poor and marginalised, yet they refuse to give a moment's silence to the 100 people and more who died in the Esidimeni tragedy. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: That is the hypocrisy that we are talking about.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is not a good start. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The hon the Leader of the Opposition... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: ...scornfully dismissed this side of the House with these words: "They think that they will teach us about our own oppression."

Madam Speaker, the DA does not have to, because stalwarts of the ANC struggle and once proud ANC members are doing a brilliant job of teaching the ANC how low they have sunk. [Interjections.] This is what struggle stalwart Mathews Phosa had to say...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am just reminding you of relevance.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Dyantyi. Excuse me, Madam Premier,

if you could take your seat for just a minute.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please, just the relevance.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, if you wish to raise a point of order I need to recognise you and if I could ask you, there is no “her” or “he” or “she”, it is the “hon member” or the “hon Premier”, if you would like to address me.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes.

The SPEAKER: So you do not - I am not finished. You do not do your point of order from your seat. You stand up and you address me. The Premier is responding to the debate, and so I will monitor the response in terms of relevance as you have requested me to do. Thank you. You may proceed hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you Madam Speaker. The relevance is a point raised by the hon Leader of the Opposition that “they”, namely us, “think that they will teach us about our own oppression”, and I am responding to that exact point by saying we do not need to because it is being done so well by Mathews Phosa, who said:

"During the Struggle, heroes died so that we can govern; now innocent people die in Marikana and in psychiatric wards because

we govern.”

An HON MEMBER: That is powerful.

The PREMIER: And then the hon Leader of the Opposition refuses a moment of silence. [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: Shame!

Ms S W DAVIDS: People die on the Cape Flats.

An HON MEMBER: And people die everywhere else.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Every day [Inaudible.] on the Cape Flats... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: I am coming to the dangers.

The SPEAKER: Order members.

The PREMIER: I will come to the Cape Flats in a moment.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You are very selective with your morality.

The PREMIER: After the “klap” that the ANC got in the election of 3 August last year, they promised to reflect and self-correct.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We are still doing that.

The PREMIER: But then we have this kind of performance here.

Mr M G E WILEY: You are slow learners, hey.

Mr L H MAX: It is a long shot, that one.

The PREMIER: Now the hon Leader of the Opposition comes here and because no-one can tell him about his own oppression...

An HON MEMBER: Communist!

The PREMIER: ...he says: “The most dangerous place for black South Africans to be is in formally white suburbs.” He obviously does not think that black lives matter. If he knew and if he thought that black lives mattered he would take some time to go and to research about where the real risks are, and he just has to look at the crime statistics to see that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is worse in the Western Cape. The DA - black lives do not matter to you. You know that!

The PREMIER: But sadly, the ANC solution to gangsterism and crime...

An HON MEMBER: That is the hypocrites.

The PREMIER: ...is to send President Zuma to the Nyanga Police Station for a photo opportunity... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Where you cannot provide solutions.

The PREMIER: ...and ask questions which clearly show how ignorant he is of the real problems the police face and the real problems of crime.

An HON MEMBER: No, they know that. They know that.

The PREMIER: He is as ignorant about the lives of real people as the hon member Mr Magaxa is. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The President [Inaudible.] You should be ashamed.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] Dan Plato wants to work with us from now, you are speaking... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms P MAKELENI: You should be ashamed.

The PREMIER: You see, Madam Speaker, year after year the President promises to bring back the Specialised Gang and Drug Units and the other Specialised Units and he never does. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier, please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: Bring back the Presidential... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you Madam Speaker, I assume that this is a response to the Provincial State of the Province Address.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi will you please address the Chair?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am on the same point of relevance.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is. It is.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is getting too long.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Relevance, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: It is. Let us talk about your... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your comment is noted. I will allow the Premier to proceed. She is responding to a comment that was made so let us see where this goes. Thank you. You may proceed, Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The relevance is the extent to “we have been attacked” are not looking at crime and that in fact the most dangerous places for black South Africans to be... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: So julle kry baie seer.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: So you are hurting a lot.]

The PREMIER: ...are in formally white suburbs and I am answering that point.

An HON MEMBER: Sir, your complaining... [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are rattling.

The PREMIER: The President has promised year after year to bring back the Specialist Units. We have even asked him to help us in the worst areas with support from the SANDF.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because you do not do your work.

The PREMIER: He has refused to do that again and again [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You chose to be an enemy of the SANDF.

The PREMIER: Yet, he is quite prepared to bring in the SANDF to protect him as he goes to make a speech in Parliament.

An HON MEMBER: You are not in the country... [Inaudible.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande, skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace, disgrace!]

The PREMIER: And in fact there in Parliament Street... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My point exactly, relevance.

The PREMIER: Here in Parliament Street... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Relevance, there is no relevance.

Ms M N GILLION: What is the relevance? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, if you could take your seat please.
[Interjections.] Hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, please, can we get back to the SOPA? What is the relevance of the hon Premier with the SOPA?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, the point of order in terms of relevance, the Premier's presentation was wide-ranging. The responses that were received on Tuesday was all-encompassing and I would like to believe that the Premier is now picking up on statements that were made, hence her response, which in my opinion is relevant so I will allow the Premier the proceed. [Interjections.] Sorry Premier, if you could take your seat. Chief Whip, Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. Thank you for the ruling, the repeated ruling, Madam Speaker. Now I raise on another point of order and that is the Rules are clear about frivolous points of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please! [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And I ask you to start ruling on frivolous points of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip. I have noted that. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, sorry, it is not your place to tell someone else to sit or stay. Please speak to me if you wish to make a point of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, yes, ja. There is a point I want to make, which I

was hoping you would address, that the hon member Mr Wiley stands up whilst the Premier is standing. I think you need to act on those things. He is even more frivolous. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, both you and hon member Ms Gillion were standing at the same time for a point of order, but can we get... [Interjections.] Hon members, let us settle down. Let us settle down. Let us manage ourselves. Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela, can I get your attention please?

An HON MEMBER: Come now, please man.

The SPEAKER: Let us restore the dignity and decorum and let us get - this is a serious topic we are busy with. It is no laughing matter so I would like to request your cooperation and if you do rise on a point of order please nothing vexatious, spurious or scurrilous, whatever else you might want to call it. Madam Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The point that I am making is that while the people on the Cape Flats go unprotected and while the President refuses to deploy the SANDF to help the under-resourced police at our request, he closes down the City Centre, closes down the highway, militarises the entire area, has heavily armed soldiers in camouflage fatigues marching up and down outside of Parliament to protect him as he goes to speak to the people... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: To protect Parliament. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: The institution of democracy, Parliament. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: This is Parliament.

The PREMIER: This is quite outrageous.

Ms P MAKELENI: ...which you seem to undermine, Parliament.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: It is also with ... Parliament does not need protecting.

Ms P MAKELENI: It does. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, Parliament needs...

An HON MEMBER: It needs protection from the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It needs protection.

The PREMIER: Parliament needs protection from the ANC. [Interjections.]

Parliament needs protection from a rogue President.

An HON MEMBER: From the anarchy.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It needs protection from you!

The PREMIER: If the honourable the ANC was committed to protecting Parliament they would support a vote of no confidence in a President whom the Constitutional Court has found violated his oath of office. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: What about Tuesday when the youngsters were here? What about Tuesday... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Ms Davids. [Interjections.]

Interjections are allowed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You leave your own guys.

The PREMIER: If the ANC cared about Parliament one little bit...

Ms P MAKELENI: You are worse, you are worse... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...they would support a vote of no confidence to get rid of a President who had violated his oath of office... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

The PREMIER: They care nothing. They care nothing about Parliament. They just care about protecting an individual and those troops and those policemen were there to protect an individual from the people, with the ANC... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: De Lille is coming! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Premier, could you please take your seat. Hon member Mr Olivier, may I address you, if you could stand up please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There seems to be a running diatribe with you and someone else who I cannot pick up but you are mumbling and you are busy there...

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is honourable Winde.

The SPEAKER: No, and whoever the Minister is busy with, I am requesting, if it is the honourable Winde, as you say, hon member Mr Magaxa, I am requesting that you refrain. You refrain from a running commentary because

we have a speaker on the floor and you are drowning out the speaker. Hon member Mr Olivier, I must say, since you moved from that seat to over there you have become quite disruptive in your behaviour with your engagement with the Ministers there. [Interjections.] If I could request your cooperation and if the Ministers are guilty you must tell me who they are, because I cannot see who it is you are talking to.

Ms M N GILLION: But then you must look that side of the floor, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I am looking that side. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, can I address you on that?

The SPEAKER: There is no Donald Trump in this House.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may, hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I am mindful that I am your favourite member in the House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Laughter.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: And I have been quiet now. The Minister is continuously commenting on the other side. I did not comment to anyone now.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you hon member Mr Olivier. I think that settles the debate. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: A ventriloquist. He is a ventriloquist.

The SPEAKER: There will be no discussion between individual members one-on-one. Madam Premier, you may proceed. I trust you will now get the ear of the House, thank you. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, I trust so too, Madam Speaker. While we are talking about the under-resourcing of the police in the Western Cape, it is also worth noting that in his budget speech yesterday, Minister Gordhan announced that there would be an increase in VIP protection services of R131.8 million. Now think about that when we are worrying about resources... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And gangsters.

The PREMIER: ...on the Cape Flats and when we think about this Government nationally and this Opposition in this House that do not believe that black lives matter. The perception that the ANC does not care about fighting gangsterism in this province has come a long way, and you have to

ask why. You have to ask why.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ask Mr Big and Patricia De Lille why.

The PREMIER: Ja, we will ask him why. I will ask.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ask Mr Big and Patricia De Lille why...

The PREMIER: I will ask Mr Big, I will ask Mr Big, because listen to this.

I will ask Mr Big... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ask Mr Big.

The PREMIER: I am asking Mr Big and here is Mr Big's answer. Listen to this. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: "Two independent sources have confirmed that President Zuma met alleged crime bosses, including Quinton 'Mr Big' Marinus and the Americans gang leader, Igshaan Davids, known as 'Sanie American'..." [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Ask Dan Plato. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members, you are drowning out the speaker.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Do not trust your spies.

The SPEAKER: You are allowed to interject but that was a major catcall and it does not allow the Premier to continue with the speech.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just a point of order, Madam Speaker, just for the dignity of the House and the good order. The Premier before she started quoting said that this is the words of Mr Big. Can she please for the sake of the House clarify from which document she is quoting and the author of that document.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can she do that please for the sake, so that we can...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, you rose on a point of order. You should have asked me if the Premier would have taken a question to satisfy your request, so you cannot ask me as the Speaker to ask the Premier to clarify something. [Interjections.] I think appropriately it should have been

will the hon Premier take a question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can I just clarify that, the issue is that the Premier, the number one citizen of this Province is responding to her State of the Province Address. She has referred to a nickname of someone as Mr Big.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mr Big yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And she is quoting a document in this House. For the purposes of getting the full information I believe that we have the right. That is my point of order that if any speaker is quoting, they cannot quote a nickname of someone. They need to say: "I am quoting from the Institute of Racial Relations"... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Quinton Marinus.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...or this, and I would like you to make a ruling on whether members can stand up in this House and quote nicknames of people who they allegedly are quoting. That is all I am saying.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, you must state the name.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, with respect...

An HON MEMBER: Uh-uh, you are not recognised.

The SPEAKER: I have recognised you Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: ...vaguely in the Rule Book... [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No but why must he speak if he is not recognised?

Mr M G E WILEY: He is just engaging in conversation. That is the first thing and Mr Big was raised by the other side. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, okay.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You must not say Mr Big.

An HON MEMBER: But you wait to be recognised.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, sorry, I have noted your comments. Please manage your finger, if you do not mind, in response... [Interjections.] Thank you, and I am certain the Premier, would you respond?

The PREMIER: Yes certainly.

The SPEAKER: The Premier will respond, thank you.

The PREMIER: Certainly Madam Speaker. This is a comprehensive report by

the famed investigative reporting team, AmaBhungane, and they are engaged here in a major exposé of President Zuma's links with gangsters in an article that has never been credibly refuted, and indeed, Mr Big was raised on the side of the honourable the Opposition, and when I responded I quoted his full name and his nickname. I read here that:

“Two independent sources have confirmed that the President met alleged crime bosses, including Quinton “Mr Big” Marinus...”

Ms P MAKELENI: Oh, we are just friends with that one.

The PREMIER: “...and Americans gang leader, Igshaan Davids, known as “Sanie American...” [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Why, are you jealous now?

The PREMIER: “...at his official Cape residence on May, 2...”

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is how you won elections.

The PREMIER: And then the meeting... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

The PREMIER: “... was facilitated by Lloyd Hill...” [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Sorry you were not invited.

The PREMIER: "...a notorious Durban underworld figure and long-time Zuma family associate who is also said to be Davids' cousin."

Ms B A SCHÄFER: (?) There we go.

The PREMIER: Now there you have it, because that is why police are being under-resourced and that is why... [Interjections.] ... we are having no action on bringing back the Gang and Drug Units.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is how you got the ID of Quinton Marinus.

The PREMIER: That is why we are having no action on the Drug and Gang Units. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is why you got the ID.

The PREMIER: Then we read that Duduzane Zuma... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Quinton Marinus gave the money.

The PREMIER: "... allegedly met the delegation of gangsters at the gates of the presidential estate and ensured that security guards did not record the identities of the visitors..."

You could imagine that. [Interjections.] Now do you think that Duduzane Zuma went there without his father knowing and said: "please do not write here that Mr Quinton Marinus aka Mr Big..." [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Gossip.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: There is nothing gossip about this.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are bringing gossip to the House.

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, if this was gossip, many people would have sued this newspaper and these reporters. There is no way that anybody could get away with writing the stuff if it was not true. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The truth hurts.

The PREMIER: They would have been in court ages ago and they in fact

would have got slapped into jail for this kind of libel and defamation.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They have got Zuma's... [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: The fact that no-one has ever been sued because of this article speaks volumes, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is not everyone that reads this nonsense.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids. [Interjections.] Hon members, please, can I... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: And what was the purpose of this meeting with all the gang leaders, Madam Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Mr Quinton Marinus, aka Mr Big, said at one point:

“Mr President, we will mobilise our members and work hard in the election for you.”

Ms S W DAVIDS: Oh, so you were at the meeting! So you were in the meeting, Premier?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, may I request, interjections and heckling, but it is becoming an ongoing commentary. If you could, thank you.

The PREMIER: And then having promised the President that the gangs will work very hard for the ANC in the election, then comes the *quid pro quo*, Madam Speaker, and the *quid pro quo* is this. Listen:

“Sir”, addressing the President, says Mr Marinus, Mr Big: “Sir, we are having problems with the South African Revenue Service.”

And President Zuma replies:

“We will look into that.”

Now you understand! [Interjections.] Now you understand why the President had to capture SARS, because he had promised the gangsters that he is now going to look into their problems with SARS. [Interjections.] That is what happened! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: This is a meeting for you to reply, not to bring gossip.

The PREMIER: The gangsters before they went...” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. There is too much noise in the House, both sides.

The PREMIER: Before they met President Zuma, Madam Speaker, the

gangsters had a preparatory session, like a caucus - probably an ANC caucus, at a boardroom in Salt River, and at this preparatory meeting Hill addressed the group and told them, allegedly “that political support for the ANC to win back the province would be rewarded with business opportunities”, and no doubt SARS tax exemption. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: This is for the [Inaudible.] today, report the people of this province. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Hill said: “Everyone is going to eat, are you all in?”

†'n AGBARE LID: Eina!

[An HON MEMBER: Ouch!]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are taking people of this province for granted. Give us the... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And I can continue. This whole thing is full of these quotes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Premier, could you take your seat please.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Dis baie seer!

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It hurts a lot!]

The SPEAKER: Members, I am repeatedly calling order and we cannot as much as we want to contest what is being said, it is my duty to maintain order in the House. Now there is too much noise and it is drowning out the Premier, so if I could request your cooperation please. You may proceed, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] I can carry on. I have about 20 pages of that, but I have made the point, which is simply this. [Interjections.] The fact that President Zuma has links with gangsters and drug dealers... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The Auditor-General made the call there.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...is the reason that we are not seeing the return of the Drug and Gang Units and is the reason that the police are so under-resourced in the places where we need them most. The most terrible thing about the opening of Parliament was that President Zuma had more police deployed to protect him... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: When you moved... [Inaudible.] that was the terrible part, and there was nobody representing us.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...than are deployed at any one time in the six most violent areas of the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Six put together, that is what the hon member Ms Wenger said.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Dis die waarheid.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is the truth.]

The PREMIER: Now the hon Christians, in his absence, Madam Speaker, was the only Opposition member who seems to have read the Constitution and understands where the competence for policing lies, which is with the National Government and that is why he called on the National Government to do something about it, because the hon member Mr Christians seems to be the only Opposition member in this House who believes that facts matter... [Interjection.] ... who believes that facts matter. You do not care about facts.

Ms S W DAVIDS: He is DA. He is not Opposition.

The PREMIER: And I want to thank the hon member Ms Wenger and the hon Plato and the other colleagues for answering all the misplaced allegations on gangsterism and crime from the ANC benches.

The truth is, the one area of failure in the Western Cape is gangs, drugs and crime and that is the responsibility of the criminal justice system...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is the responsibility of all the parties... [Inaudible.]

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...which is 100% in the hands of the ANC. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: 100% in the hands of the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is how you work with the [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: No-one needs to tell the residents that are suffering...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No apartheid spatial planning.

The PREMIER: ...about their own oppression at the hands of the ANC, this is why more and more people are voting DA. Now we have the hon member Ms Beerwinkel... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: That is why you are using all the municipal elections now.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Then we have the hon member Ms Beerwinkel, who failed to convince that she actually believes anything she says. †Sy praat met lang tande, [she speaks without conviction] Madam Speaker, and she loves referring to the struggle. Oh, she loves referring to the struggle... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She was never in the struggle.

The PREMIER: ...as if she was a part of it.

An HON MEMBER: She was never in the struggle.

The SPEAKER: Order, please members, Minister Fritz.

The PREMIER: As if she was a part of it, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Part of my speech was about the struggle. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: But the only struggle she has ever had is the energy that she expended moving from the National Party to the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Do you not want to hear what she said? [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Racial nationalism on steroids - the only card the ANC can play, and then we had the hon member Mr Dugmore. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier!

The PREMIER: Hon member Mr Dugmore... [Interjections.] Then we had the hon member Mr Dugmore, Madam Speaker, who outsourced the research for his speech on Facebook.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Ja, you outsourced your research on Facebook. [Interjection.] I am telling you, if I had researchers like they have in the hon the Opposition's office, I would also do my research through Facebook.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Who told you that the NDF is better than the national [Inaudible.]

Ms P MAKELENI: She is very personal, really, and that is a problem.

The PREMIER: His Facebook friends... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Respond to the issues.

The PREMIER: The fascinating thing was that the hon member Mr Dugmore went onto Facebook... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Premier, if you could take your seat. Hon Hinana.

Mr R T OLIVIER: (?) He comes from the ANC.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, may I address you, please.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr N E HINANA: We are here in this House... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: What is your point of order?

Mr N E HINANA: ...waiting to hear what the Premier is saying. We are struggling to hear a word and you have been repeatedly saying that, “order, order, order”, and that does not help us because we do not hear what the Premier is saying. Can you please assist us. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you hon member Mr Hinana. Hon members, if I could address the House. [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You did not miss anything.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, please! [Laughter.] This is a wide-ranging political debate so the issue of relevance is a very narrow one. One needs to understand where the debate is going, but more importantly, I cannot sit here and keep calling order, so I want to draw your attention to Rule 44 where if there is a consistent display of being disruptive I would need to go to Rule 44 as a Presiding Officer. So heckling interjection is allowed, but we simply cannot continue in this way. So Madam Premier, I would like to ask you to proceed and I would want to request the cooperation from the House, please. I thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, hon member Mr Hinana, †Baas Wiley het gepraat!
[Boss Wiley has spoken!]

The PREMIER: Thank you. I was dealing on the research methodology that the hon the Opposition uses.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baas Wiley het gepraat! [Gelag.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Boss Wiley has spoken! [Laughter.]]

The PREMIER: And I was intrigued to see that the hon member Mr Dugmore went onto his Facebook page and said he has been mandated by the ANC to speak about the Philippi Horticultural Area in his speech... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: So what is wrong with that?

The PREMIER: ...and has anybody got anything to say. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: I did not say that!

Mr R T OLIVIER: What is wrong with that?

The PREMIER: And then he got a couple of comments etcetera.

Mr C M DUGMORE: A hundred.

The PREMIER: And then the hon member Mr Dugmore sent me after the debate two documents, and I have read them, and I have asked for a progress update on this matter and the progress update is simply this, that there are appeals lodged for the honourable the Minister of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, DEADP as I call that Department. DEADP I think has got a new name now, and he is contemplating those appeals, and there is no way that I can say anything or do anything that would in any way pre-empt or influence this process.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Ooh, well that is a cop out. That is a cop out.

The PREMIER: Now the hon member Mr Magaxa tried to challenge the unemployment statistics in my speech. He used the narrow unemployment

figures to do so but as I said in my speech I used the real figures, which is broad unemployment, because broad unemployment exposes the harsh reality of South Africa's unemployment crisis; not the sanitised figures the ANC likes to present.

On the basis of his sanitised figures the hon member Mr Magaxa tried to argue that Limpopo has the lowest unemployment rate in the country. All the figures actually show is just how many people in Limpopo have given up looking for work in absolute despair because they know there is no point in looking for a job there. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So it is right here, so people are still looking...

The PREMIER: It is very different here. [Interjections.] It is very different here because here the difference between the narrow definition and the broad definition of unemployment is very small because most people have not given up looking for work because they know there is a point in looking for work in the Western Cape, and in Limpopo there is a massive difference because more and more people know there is no point and they know... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: And there is no point looking for jobs in Limpopo and the broad-based unemployment rate is going up, even though more and more people are leaving Limpopo, and our figures are going down even though

more and more people are coming to the Western Cape and that is the difference. You know, Madam Speaker, the use of the narrow definition of unemployment is a classic example of alternative facts as used by the ANC.

Ms P MAKELENI: They go to Johannesburg for lay work.

The PREMIER: They tried to claim that because people are no longer looking for work and have given up looking for work they are not unemployed. That is what the ANC tries to claim by using that figure.

Mr M G E WILEY: Or they do not exist.

The PREMIER: Or they do not exist, because black lives do not matter to them. That is the problem. [Interjections.] And then we have the tired claims about the provision of housing, and all the claims of false delivery under the ANC. We know about that. We have been through that a hundred times. Repetition of a falsehood does not make it true. The hon Minister Madikizela addressed the issue of housing.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That was the narrow employment rate.

The PREMIER: And it bears repetition that social housing is being provided and developed in Woodstock, Wetton, Ottery, Salt River, Goodwood and Parow and there are potential social housing projects in the pipeline worth R3.2 billion. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: But Patricia said, “the Premier said no, no.”

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: These are alternative facts that are being invented on the other side of the House, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: She said “no, no”.

The PREMIER: As are the false accusations about sanitation. They are also based on a lie.

An HON MEMBER: That is in the pipeline too.

The PREMIER: The Stats SA General Household Survey is based on a completely outdated definition of what access to sanitation means and about what an appropriate standard is. You cannot look at sanitation and say that everything that is not a full flush toilet is a bucket toilet. There are many, many, many options in between... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: A porta potty is a bucket toilet.

The PREMIER: And according to the definition of access to sanitation they look at many options, not just full flush or bucket. [Interjections.] Let us get that right. [Interjections.] And then, we get the tired old trump card and it is

a trump card, and I use that advisedly with the pun that is entirely intended.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me Madam Premier, I need to address hon member Mr Magaxa and hon Minister Madikizela. You are in close proximity to the Premier and your conversation is inappropriate. If I could call you to order please.

An HON MEMBER: Take it to Khayelitsha.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed Premier.

The PREMIER: And then we have the trump card of the ANC, which is always the race card. If ever they get argued into a corner they cry “racism”, but we do not have to point out... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Even your speech it was [Inaudible.]. Between the two of us it was a bad speech. Let us just... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: We do not have to point out the hypocrisy of that any more because Mathews Phosa has done very well.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That was your worst speech.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: Now let me quote Mathews Phosa. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Even for your standards.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: And I quote, Madam Speaker.

“I have come to a point where I refuse to be part of the intellectual funeral of the ANC, that I refuse to be associated with so called leaders who trample on the people who voted them into office...”

Ms P MAKELENI: As you are doing right now.

The PREMIER: “...who disrespect the Constitution, whose only predictable response to all challenges is "racism" and who are willing to sacrifice the future of our children before the throne of a man who knows no shame and shows no character.”

And that is what this ANC in this House does every time as well, and so of course it was predictable that they would do exactly what Mathews Phosa complains about, and play the race card and firstly it came with the BEE stats and the employment equity stats.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Uh-huh, so you say the racism, Premier... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids, direct the Chair please.

The PREMIER: We heard all of their false claims about employment equity. We heard all of their false claims...

Ms P MAKELENI: But you know you have a serious problem with that.

The PREMIER: ...about employment equity in the Western Cape. It is worth noting, Madam Speaker, that 84.7% of all Western Cape public servants are people of colour... [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What?

The PREMIER: And let me use my own department as an illustration. The Department of the Premier has a staff component where 88% constitute designated groups in terms of the relevant legislation at senior management level, and I heard an interjection to that effect... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Even those you want to fire.

The PREMIER: At senior management level 72.7% are from designated groups.

Mr C M DUGMORE: How does that compare to the provincial demographic?

The PREMIER: Our recruitment includes 88.6% from designated groups and in addition 91% of promotions are from designated groups and 94.6% of those benefiting from skills development are from designated groups. This is a process of transformation and quality improvement.

An HON MEMBER: Public Works.

The PREMIER: Let us also look at some of the facts concerning transformation and the developmental state... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Public Works.

The PREMIER: This mantra of the hon member Mr Dugmore. Madam Speaker, you cannot have a developmental state unless it is a capable state. So every ANC Government in the country fails at the first hurdle. They mouth off about a developmental state but they are an incapable state and they are incapable because cadre deployment destroys the prospect of being a capable state. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are marginalising. [Interjections.] You are the master of lies.

The PREMIER: And the ANC pretends that cadre deployment is transformation. It is not. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: It is regression. It is playing the race card once more, which is the only thing the ANC knows how to do. [Interjection.] Now I was fascinated by a news report that I read while I was preparing for this reply. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are the master of that one. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Can we get order please.

The PREMIER: The example I am going to use speaks to the capable and the incapable state or capable and incapable organisations.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] It is a constant reminder.

The PREMIER: I could not believe it when I read in the newspaper that the poverty stricken people of Nkandla have given up on the incapable state that Jacob Zuma leads and that governs KwaZulu-Natal. President Zuma has made so many promises on his home visits that they have now abandoned any chance of having them realised and the people of Nkandla have turned to AfriForum to follow up their cases.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who won the ward in Nkandla?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Who won the ward in Nkandla? Who won the ward?

The PREMIER: AfriForum did not stand in an election.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No-no-no-no, the IFP.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Uh-uh. MEC go and check. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, AfriForum did not stand in the election and they certainly did not stand in Nkandla.

An HON MEMBER: That is true. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

An HON MEMBER: That was last year.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

The PREMIER: So the people... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry Madam Premier, please take your seat. Minister Madikizela, somehow you are... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is Nkandla.

The SPEAKER: Let us not, hon member Ms Davids, hon member Ms Makeleni, can we please just. Ja, at this point it is not - no-no, I am appealing to both sides of the House. There is a speaker on the floor. The least we can do is afford the Premier the opportunity to speak without having your own private conversations at the same time. Please members. You may proceed Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: So while the hon the Opposition in this House mouths off about equity and transformation and black employment equity and all of these things, they do the exact opposite. They govern as if black lives of the poorest people do not matter at all and the people of Nkandla have to turn to AfriForum. That spoke volumes.

An HON MEMBER: Tell us something.

The PREMIER: They do not have to be told about their oppression from the hon member Mr Magaxa who clearly knows nothing about it.

An HON MEMBER: AfriForum will tell you [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: They know about it and they want to change it and so they go to AfriForum.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Not the DA.

An HON MEMBER: And this will never be.

The PREMIER: But let us turn to genuine B-BBEE, the way the DA does it in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Ooh!

The PREMIER: Ja, let us take one look at a few things here. It may be of interest to members to note that 75% of active suppliers on our Supplier Database are small businesses, and 77% of all our suppliers are BEE Level 4 and above, 77%. In the 2015/2016 financial year 96% of our contracts were awarded to suppliers with a BEE Level of four and up, amounting to a spend of R6.5 billion. This figure excludes nationally negotiated contracts in which we participate, which would raise that figure even more. Altogether in that year the Western Cape Government spent R6.75 billion rand on BEE suppliers and only R1.1 billion on non-BEE suppliers and we got excellent service and we had excellent outcomes because we were not doing cadre deployment and I would very much like you to look at this designation of the R6.75 billion and the R1.17 billion.

An HON MEMBER: And they do not cadre deployment?

The PREMIER: The bright blue is the B-BBEE contracts... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Cadre deployment is in your office up here.

[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...and the dark blue is the non-BEE contracts that we entered into. [Interjections.] So take a look at this, these are the facts, they are not your alternative facts.

Ms P MAKELENI: That is propaganda. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, painful.

Ms P MAKELENI: Propaganda!

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: And then we get to the hon member Mr Dugmore who just like the hon member Mr Magaxa took out an old speech, dusted it off, and came and delivered it here again. He raised the issue of the Children's Commissioner and still did not answer the question as to why the ANC was in government for seven years and did nothing about either the Children's Commissioner or the Environmental Commissioner.

Ms S W DAVIDS: But now you are for nine years already.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is not true. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: But we have done things, Madam Speaker.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You broke your promises.

The PREMIER: And the last time I came here and I explained exactly what we are doing. We first tried to change the Constitution to change “must” to “may”. We did not get that right. We have now done a research in depth in our Policy Unit on the kind of issues that the Children’s Commissioner could cover because the Constitution is very specific on this. That research is now done and it is about to come to the Provincial Cabinet for consideration.
[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Eight years. After eight years.

The PREMIER: It is not after eight years, Madam Speaker.

Ms P MAKELENI: Another white lie.

The PREMIER: We went through a number of years trying to change the Constitution... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...which we could not do. So they must not come with their †hoog-heilige nonsens hierso. [hypocritical nonsense here.]

An HON MEMBER: They did not do it, the ANC did not do that.

Ms P MAKELENI: Another white lie!

Mr C M DUGMORE: And nothing about the Environmental Commissioner, of course.

The PREMIER: Let us look at land reform.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Tell us about the Environmental Commissioner.
[Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You spoke about the challenge... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Tell us!

The SPEAKER: Can we listen and we might get the answer.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, the issue of the Environmental Commissioner was not raised in the debate so I am not going to reply to issues that were not raised. [Interjections.] Let us speak on land reform, which was raised.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, take your seat please, Madam Premier. Hon member

Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] ...the Premier is lying to this House or she is deaf. Can we just clarify whether she is misleading the House in terms of the fact that I mentioned the Environmental Commissioner and the Children's Commissioner. She is saying I did not mention it. That is misleading the House. I ask her to withdraw that. Hansard will show I referred to the Environmental Commissioner. She must withdraw that remark.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

The PREMIER: I withdraw. I take the hon member Mr Dugmore at his word.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, please.

The PREMIER: I take the hon member Mr Dugmore at his word that he raised it. That just were not in my notes, but I would never... [Interjections.] I would never deliberately mislead the House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: I would never deliberately mislead the House, but I think it is true that the hon member Mr Dugmore spent a very large amount of his speech on the Children's Commissioner and certainly not on the Environmental Commissioner. [Interjections.]

Furthermore, furthermore, I take grave exception on the part of hearing-impaired people to speak about them in that way.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: It is entirely outrageous and the hon member Mr Dugmore might recall that we had a sign language interpreter here when I was making my speech and that most people who could not follow the sound would have been able to follow our sign language interpreter, because we do not get fake sign language interpreters to interpret when we make speeches, and we do not have contempt towards the hearing impaired like they do on that side of the House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier, if you could take your seat please. I heard the hon member Mr Dugmore say either the Premier is misleading this House or she is lying. There was a request for you to withdraw and then the Chief Whip I see he is trying to get my attention, so I was going to say I would revert to Hansard, but I will take the Chief Whip's point of order, because what is happening is not points of order; it is questions that is being directed through the Chair to the Premier. Your point of order, Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: If in your consideration, Madam Speaker, if you could also include the words "or she is deaf", which is an imputation on the Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!

The SPEAKER: I will revert to Hansard and I will come back to the House in need. Thank you.

The PREMIER: Well, Madam Speaker, I would like to say that that contemptuous statement was not an imputation on me. It was an imputation against deaf people and that is why I think it was outrageous. [Interjections.] Now, I get that from your tone. You are contemptuous of people with disabilities, through you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] Now let us come to land reform. Why is it that after over a decade of trying to get an audit into restituted land and land ownership in South Africa the Department nationally has still been unable to do it. We have not given up on them and last year we launched our own audit. It started last year in the Langeberg Municipality and it is expected to cover the entire province and be completed in 2018. This work is managed by the Land Reform Directorate, a newly created directorate to give effect to our commitment to land reform and we have had exceptional success as I outlined in my State of the Province speech.

Lastly, Madam Speaker, the hon member Mr Dugmore sought to give me some advice on how I should interact with other spheres of Government. Let me say to the hon member Mr Dugmore: when the party that he represents has the integrity to rein in the rogue President he can start giving us advice on this side of the House.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The Premier is new with that [Inaudible.] Patricia de Lille.

The PREMIER: But let me refer the hon member Mr Dugmore to Section 151(4) of the Constitution, which says:

“The National or Provincial Government may not compromise or impede a municipality’s ability or right to exercise its powers or perform its functions...”

And if the hon member Mr Dugmore wants to hold the City of Cape Town or any one in it accountable he should arrange with his party to be deployed there and to do that job where it should be.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] that you have got rights in screwing with the Spatial Development Framework, having the [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I do not have any rights there.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You do.

The PREMIER: If the hon member Mr Dugmore wants to hold the Mayor accountable he knows what to do. [Interjections.] Finally I want to thank my colleagues on this side of the House for a series of quite excellent speeches from beginning to end... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Patricia said, “the Premier said no, no.”

The PREMIER: ...that had you all silent on that side of the House and by stating this Government's case in the face of the outrageous fake news generated by the Opposition. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. That concludes the debate on the Premier's State of the Province address. [Interjections.]

That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 15:09.