
FRIDAY, 23 MARCH 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 10:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order, before I ask the Secretary to read the first order, I just want to welcome on the galleries this morning Ms Barbara Stone, a former member of the Queensland Parliament, and Ms Janet Sullivan from Perth, Western Australia. They are in the country in Cape Town following the cricket but they took some time this morning to come and say hello to us in Cape Town. You are most welcome here.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

1. Debate on Vote 1 – Premier – Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 3 - 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. Honourable members, the Department of the Premier's Main Budget for 2018/19 is R1,486 billion. The Department has endured repeated budget cuts in recent years. Compared with the indicative budget baseline for 2018 published in the 2017 Budget, the Budget has shrunk by almost 4%. In the final budget round, the Department was required to cut its budget by R201 million over the MTEF period, approximately R63 million, R67 million and R71 million in the respective years. The implementation of these budget cuts has left us with no provision for inflation in the outer years of the MTEF period.

Those hon members who have been serving on the Standing Committee for some time are aware that the Budget has been in "austerity mode" for several years already. Further budget risks include the impact of higher inflation on the current and future public service wage agreements, as well as the impact of the rand / dollar exchange rate on licensing and capital expenditure for the Centre for e-Innovation. Given the budget cuts already suffered, it would not be possible to absorb these or any other future budgetary shocks.

The Department has taken prudent measures against overspending on the compensation of employees' budget by establishing a Compensation of Employees Funding Committee, which ensures effective management of

staffing costs within expenditure ceilings. This Committee makes recommendations on the filling of critical posts, based on criteria agreed by Exco.

This year, the Department instituted a Budget Committee, headed by the Director-General, to make binding budget decisions. This increased focus and control was necessitated by the extent of the budget cuts and the need to safeguard critical service delivery priorities both within the Department and transversally.

Honourable members, Broadband connectivity has been installed in 1875 sites or 100% of the deliverables for Phase 1. The 1875 sites include schools, clinics, hospitals and Government offices. All sites will have a service of at least 10 megabits per second. Later this year the Centre for e-Innovation will begin upgrading the minimum network speed to 100 megabits per second and ultimately each site will have a service of at least one gigabit per second in the third phase of the Broadband Project, which commences in 2022.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it is appropriate for me to say that I do go around on unannounced visits to various sites of service delivery, especially service delivery priorities such as Broadband for example, and while it is very gratifying to see how quickly the Broadband is being taken up, it is also true to say that we are reaching the ceiling of that take-up quite quickly and that we need to move to one gigabit as quickly as possible.

We are finding that in schools people are really taking to the e-Learning project with great enthusiasm but if their connectivity is not sufficient to carry the load or is not fast enough it is a great deterrent to that project, and from what I saw for example on my visits yesterday we are going to have to do something and this is where the shrinking budget has profound implications for our delivery on the ground and the shortfall of R58 billion in the National Tax Revenue and the cut just to our budget of over R200 million over the MTEF, demonstrates what a profound impact this has on every last person in this province, particularly the ones to whom we owe the greatest duty of service, such as disadvantaged children in our schools.

The Free Wi-Fi initiative has been expanded and will be implemented over the medium term. The initial plan was to roll out one Wi-Fi hotspot per municipal ward. Funding has now been made available to roll out Wi-Fi at every Western Cape Government Broadband site and I am sure when we do that the usage will already go so high that we will find that the ceiling may well be reached in excess of the Broadband available. The Department is also exploring the extension of the Broadband initiative to municipalities – at least to bring Broadband to the front door of the head office in every municipality – and we want to do that also over the medium term.

The Broadband installation is often happening under difficult circumstances, with numerous criminal threats to staff on the ground.

I would like to extend my thanks to those technicians once again, just as we

thank all officials and contractors who deliver Western Cape Government services anywhere in this province at the risk of their own personal safety and in some areas where gangs have formed a parallel administration where no-one may go in and deliver services without the express consent of the gangs, usually in return for protection money, it makes the delivery of services to people who need them most extremely difficult and often extremely expensive and police, who have their hands full all over this province, have to accompany people on routine service delivery assignments to ensure that we can deliver those services properly and then what is more, Mr Deputy Speaker, often as soon as we put the fibre in it is dug out even though it has no resale value, leaving the schools in those areas without access and it is a very, very serious problem. [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Another surprise!

The PREMIER: I am extremely surprised that people would sabotage their own infrastructure and their own children's future. I am very surprised at that and I will never stop being surprised at that, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Given an anticipated austere environment into the future, the Centre for e-Innovation will focus on consolidating the ICT gains made through the Western Cape Government's investment in ICTs.

At a strategic level the unit will be focussing on supporting the Broadband and e-Learning Game-Changers, as well as the Service Interface output of

Provincial Strategic Goal 5.

Hon members, I am sure you are aware of the Cape Access Centres in our rural municipalities. 70 centres have been established in the Western Cape to date. At these centres citizens get free access to the internet. They are provided with free accredited ICT training as well as free printing facilities. The Cape Access Programme provided PAY Internship opportunities for 35 interns in the rural areas. This number will increase to 40 in the 2018/19 financial year. Given budget constraints, no new Cape Access e-Centres will be established in the 2018/19 financial year, which is a great pity given the demand for these centres and the extent to which we could roll them out if we had the funds to do so.

You may also have heard about the business process optimisation work done through the Service Interface Programme where the Department of the Premier collaborates with other departments to improve our citizens' service experience at the frontline service facilities. Through joining forces with the Department of Health, the Department significantly improved service delivery at the Mitchells Plain Community Health Centre. This is something of which I am particularly proud. Similarly, we have implemented queuing systems at two facilities of the Department of Transport and Public Works, namely the Vangate Shared Services Centre and their Walk-in Services Centre in the central business district.

This Department will work with key stakeholders to implement a Client

Relationship Management System at strategic pilot sites during the coming financial year, and just basic efficiencies in these offices like queuing systems and e-filing systems make an enormous difference to client experience.

The e-Government for Citizens unit maintains nine contact channels through which the citizens engage Western Cape Government or access information and services. Our new Western Cape Government Intranet, called MyGov, was rolled out during the 2017/18 financial year and during 2018/19 we will be focusing on enhancing the new platform by introducing new functionality.

Hon members, there are three components to BizSystems, namely: BizProjects, an enterprise project management system; BizPerformance and BizBrain, a Business Intelligence or BI System. The investment in these systems is resulting in an efficiency gain as stakeholders have easy access to performance data related to projects, non-financial quarterly performance data and a range of statistical data and evaluation information via this platform.

Now Mr Deputy Speaker, this is another point that I wanted to make and I am going off script obviously to do so. I have realised that data in government is absolutely crucial, not only access to it, which we have, but asking the right questions and ensuring we get the right strategic data to make the important decisions that we have to make and often, when we ask the most strategic and crucial questions, we find that we have not asked the right questions initially

to get the data that we need, so we have a lot thinking to do when we formulate projects to work out right upfront how will we know whether we are on the right track. How will we know before the end of two years whether this policy and the costs that we have incurred in implementing it in practical projects throughout the system is actually producing outcomes and how can we change course if things are not going quite as we would like, and of course that is one of the issues that I interrogate when I go on these unannounced service delivery interface meetings to ask these questions and to find what is not working; what would you like to have done differently. We envisage this, to achieve this. Is it doing it? If not, why not, and it is the kind of data we need that will give us early warning of those systems upfront. So Mr Deputy Speaker, data governance is essential for producing credible Business Intelligence.

Harmonising the data going into the BI system is a major priority as well as asking the right questions and making sure that we have the right measurements to answer those questions, because if data is wrong then it is worse than useless. It can make you take the wrong decisions.

In the interim, limited consolidated information is available on BI dashboards and available to decision-makers on their cell phones. Harmonised data is also essential for the Western Cape Spatial Data Observatory, which presents spatial information visually to guide decision-makers.

A Data Competency Centre has been established consisting of strategic role

players across key departments and I would like to appeal to my colleagues in the Cabinet to make absolutely sure that the right people are dispatched onto this committee, because if we are not asking the right questions and understanding exactly what data we need to measure, whether we are making progress, we are not going to get it, and this investment is going to be in vain. [Interjection.]

The role of the DCC is, amongst others, to collaboratively work towards achieving the benefits such as improved data management; common data quality standards; collaboration with partners; and efficiency gains and it is really important to send people who have a deep understanding of how we measure monitoring and evaluation and exactly how we need to measure performance.

Ms N D NKONDLO: A deep understanding!

The PREMIER: A deep understanding, yes, unlike yours, a deep understanding. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] ...a deep understanding.

The PREMIER: There are lots of people who do not have a deep understanding. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: I have a deep understanding. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: There are some people in this House... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: There are some hon members in this House, Mr Deputy Speaker, who do not have a deep understanding, but I will not mention who they are because you will rule me out of order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ooh, you know yourself. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: This year, the Department will embark on an end-of-year review to reflect on the implementation of the Western Cape Government's Provincial Strategic Plan 2014 to 2019, and determine to what extent we have achieved the outcomes and targets we set for ourselves at the beginning of this term. The review will be an evaluation of the effectiveness of the Provincial Transversal Management System in coordinating the implementation of the Provincial Strategic Plan across the Government as a whole, and one of the most difficult things I think we have all learnt in this term of office, is how difficult it is to govern transversally, especially when our strategic goals require many departments to work together.

The legal framework and the evaluation framework set objectives and measurements within the department but our goals are transversal and can only meet together, and I would like to thank the Ministers very much for taking the transversal meetings that they have chaired for the Provincial Strategic Goals, so seriously and to all their heads of department who have also looked very seriously at transcending the previous silo-mentalities in government and understanding what it means to achieve a Provincial Strategic Plan. It has been a major breakthrough and I hope it is irreversible. I hope that after 2019 when we have had this election and I am not longer here, and you will be very pleased to know that, the hon Opposition... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Are you sure [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Ah, shame, I am not leaving. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Shame, your President will have to call an early election for me to leave. [Interjections.] Well, if your President calls an early election I will leave early, so Mr Deputy Speaker...

An HON MEMBER: After your congress you might leave early. [Laughter.]

Mr P UYS: For higher office. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: For higher office!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please come to order. [Interjection.]

Members on both sides, allow the Premier the opportunity.

The PREMIER: And you might be leaving altogether, honourable.

[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, and I would love it because I have had [Inaudible.]

not like you being [Inaudible.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members, please allow the Premier to continue.

The PREMIER: The hon member must be very, very careful, because the last time she generalised like that she got into serious trouble. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, she had to apologise. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: I am just saying, you... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids!

The PREMIER: The institution of the Children's Commissioner in the province is of utmost importance and we intend to introduce a Bill to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament by the end of April 2018. The

implementation of the Provincial Youth Development Strategy will continue in 2018/19 in partnership with the Department of Social Development, to ensure youth are given priority in the province, but let me stress here and I am coming to that in my speech as well, most of the Game-Changers are directed to expanding the opportunities of the youth in this province, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: But there is no impact. There is no impact.

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Ag nee! Nee! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: Ag no! No! [Interjections.]]

The PREMIER: That hon member only visits one farm repeatedly and she is very welcome to come. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: One farm.

The PREMIER: She is very welcome - yes, even when you are not there.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are not even putting your foot on the farm because you... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, allow the Premier. [Interjections.] Order.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Just stick to the script.

The PREMIER: The Department drives the MOD Centre Year-Beyond Project, located in the After School Game-Changer. The YeBo initiative is the academic leg of the MOD programme, offering technology-assisted, peer-facilitated literacy and numeracy support. The YeBo programme is currently operating in 21 no- and low-fee schools in the Cape Metropolitan region and I invite the hon member to join me if she wants to see impact. [Interjections.]

In partnership with the Universities of Cape Town... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: I say again there is no impact.

The PREMIER: ...Stellenbosch and private sector partner Shoprite and Bridgiot implementing partner, the Department will continue to work in responding to the drought by evaluating a combined smart water meter, which is called Dropula, not Dracula, and behavioural intervention aimed at water-saving in schools in the Western Cape.

Smart water meter technology will be implemented at the top 105 water consuming schools, with behavioural interventions at 20, and with a further 170 schools being targeted for roll-out by the WCED at a later stage. Preliminary results from six schools where the smart meters have been installed indicated that savings of on average 40% can be achieved. This,

however, needs to be rigorously tested at scale.

The Department has also been leading the development of a Food and Nutrition Security Strategic Framework, which we call “Nourish to Flourish”. What is notable about this effort is that it recognises how much of the value chain lies outside the control of the state and that applies to every single domain, a lot falls outside of what the state is capable of doing and that is why we have adopted what we call the whole-of-society approach. But our Nourish to Flourish has enabled organisations from diverse sectors to recognise opportunities for collaboration and a pooling of effort and resources to improve access to healthy food for our residents.

The Department will also play a lead role in coordinating the implementation of the Alcohol Harms Reduction White Paper. This includes the drafting of a new Western Cape Liquor Bill, developing a monitoring and evaluation toolkit and supporting its non-governmental partners in investigating various levers to reduce alcohol harms.

Since its inception, the Premier’s Advancement of Youth internship programme has created work opportunities for thousands of school leavers. I am happy to report that 696 PAY interns will begin their internships next month.

The Department of the Premier will continue to strive to meet the undertakings given in service delivery agreements with other Western Cape

Government departments for the delivery of corporate services. The Department considers itself a strategic partner to other Western Cape Government departments in ensuring good governance geared towards improved service delivery and not merely compliance.

In closing, I would like to thank the senior management members of my Department, the DG and all of his team for preparing a workable Budget despite the severe challenges facing them and the impact of these budget cuts will be profoundly felt, but we have no alternative in an environment of national corruption, economic decline and failure to collect adequate tax revenue. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department of the Premier in the Western Cape functions in accordance with the following mission statement: to embed good governance and to enable integrated service delivery in the Western Cape through partnerships, innovation and people excellence.

When looking at the Budget allocation of this Department it is very clear that it has aligned itself very closely to this mission statement. We know that despite budget cuts in the Western Cape Treasury as a result of continuous

corruption and maladministration by the ANC at national level, our Government will continue to lead in governance, service delivery and economic growth in South Africa.

I am very pleased to see that the head of the Western Cape Provincial Government under the sound leadership of Premier Helen Zille continues to set the benchmark for clean, effective and innovative governance in our country. Despite being in the grips of the worst drought since 1906 and despite an unfavourable economic outlook for the rest of the country the Western Cape still leads with South Africa's lowest unemployment rate and its fastest growing economy. I think we can all agree that as we move into our next financial year it is blatantly obvious that this Department has a history of money well spent.

First and foremost I welcome the reallocated amount of R422 million towards drought alleviation in the 2018/19 Provincial Budget. Considering the budget cuts our provincial finances have had to sustain, it is commendable to see that the sound financial management of our province is able to make provision for the worst drought since 1906. We trust that Premier Zille at the helm of the Provincial Disaster Management will ensure the roll-out of safe and efficient water resources in the event of Day Zero. While I welcome the Declaration of the national disaster by National Government, had this been done sooner, Mr Deputy Speaker, our province would have been able to mitigate the impact of the drought on our province. I trust that the National Government will soon inform us as to the amount of emergency funds our

province will finally be afforded after having rightfully pleaded since 2015. I would like to remind the ANC that national disasters necessitate swift government action, not a decision made 19 months too late. [Interjections.] Nevertheless, in a province where sound and proactive governance is prioritised, we have managed quite well on our own to the ANC's [Inaudible - 00:27:38]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Department of the Premier's Centre for e-Innovation which received a significant portion of the Budget allocation is particularly noteworthy. Having reached the milestone 100% target there are now 1 875 Government sites connected to Broadband across this province, including 415 corporate sites, 1 235 schools, 200 libraries, 70 Cape Access e-Centres in rural areas, where poor communities are afforded internet accessibility and ICT training. The Centre for Innovation has also installed over 24 500 work stations with 28 500 users across this province making use of ICT innovation to connect and empower our people.

Considering that this Department has once again received a clean audit we know that this money is not only well spent, but allocated towards the sole purpose of uplifting the poorest of our communities and modernising service delivery strategies. This certainly reflects the Department's mission for innovation and people excellence. This is absolutely commendable.

Also noteworthy is the reprioritisation of funding to deal effectively with Goods and Services budget over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework in

order to sustain critical programmes in the Department. This ensures that critical posts are filled and remunerated based on the agreed criteria, which guarantees uninterrupted service delivery to our people, despite budget cuts from National Government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to note a commendable increase of 14,3% under the People Management Corporate Services Centre to continue the roll-out of training, empowerment and people-practices within the Department. This increase further demonstrates this Department's commitment to its mission statement.

While Programme 5's Corporate Assurance has received a 3,9% increase this remains worryingly below inflation. Unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker, due to budget cuts to the Department's allocation due to the financial mismanagement of National Treasury, this is the unfortunate reality within our provinces.

We know that the Premier and her Department will still make the most of the money allocated to them despite a smaller budget from the ANC National Government.

I would also like to note a decrease of 2,09% in Programme 2, Provincial Strategic Management 2018/19 Budget allocation, due to the vacancy within the programme and the impact of budget cuts on certain projects.

[Interjections.]

Although this programme has sustained the decrease, I am confident that policy and strategy support will make up for the budget shortfalls. It is also very pleasing to note the Department of the Premier's continued investment in the Premier's Advancement of Youth or PAY project programme. This Department's commitment to partnership and people excellence goes beyond merely investing in innovation to uplift residents. By using the head of our Provincial Government to afford matriculant skills development, professional work experience and a marketable CV in our very own provincial ministries, we expand and diversify our Government with a young and vibrant workforce; all this while we are installing hope in the lost generation, hon member Lekker... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Lost?

Mr D G MITCHELL: I am also very pleased to see that Premier Helen Zille's Department will continue to invest in this project in line with the Department's goals and mission statement.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Wait until she starts [Inaudible.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, in the midst of an increasingly volatile economic climate where the ANC has raised value-added tax to make up for money lost to its own corruption, where the Western Cape has received a budget cut due to the ANC's failure to grow the economy and to generate sufficient revenue, the Department of the Premier continues to succeed in our

province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Indeed this Budget is not only comprehensive, inclusive and thorough; it is also sustainable and tremendously resilient, continuing dedicated and people-focused service delivery in the face of a drought crisis. This is commendable and sets precedent for excellent governance on the African continent.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I am proud to support this Budget Vote. Thank you.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon leader of the Opposition, hon member Magaxa. Hon member Tyatyam is that - do you want to... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Before member Magaxa speaks...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you rising on a point of order or a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, a point of order. The member only spoke six minutes 40 seconds. He is supposed to speak 36 minutes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon Tyatyam.

Mr D G MITCHELL: It is nine minutes actually. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That is not a point of order. Member, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier and colleagues, on behalf of the African National Congress we greet you all this morning. [Interjections.]

The Budget for the Department of Premier Helen Zille is still bloated with an allocation of a massive almost R1,5 billion rand, which is a lot of money. It is not shrinking. What is shrinking is delivery since the DA took over and that has nothing to do with the Budget. It is just the DA is incapable of using the limited resources in our country to assist us to develop this country and deliver services to the poor of our people. Almost half of this Budget - it is understandable - goes towards compensation of employees. This is more than R630 million, excluding the almost R40 million for consultants and professional services as well as almost R800 000 for legal fees by this Department alone. This Government claims to budget on behalf of the poor and vulnerable people, yet it is precisely those poor and vulnerable people who are mostly at the receiving end of her insensitive Twitter rants. She is clearly not meeting the DA's own philosophy of being "fit for purpose". It is further ironic that on page 1 of the blue Budget book dealing with Vote 1, it

is stated that: “Department will coordinate external communication and public participation in order to ensure that the Western Cape Government communicates to the people of the Western Cape.”

Yet, it is extremely confusing to hear the honourable Premier of colonialism and professional blacks explains at great pains why she has either captured or outsourced the very duty to a person who is not elected in this Legislature and even appointed in her Government. The DA deliberately and desperately crossed the lines between the party and state and even allowed the rent-a-black DA leader Mmusi Maimane to come and tell us he is managing the drought... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: A point of order Mr Deputy Speaker. I understood that explicit racism was not allowed in this House and to describe the leader of the Democratic Alliance as a rent-a-black is clear racism and I would like you to rule on it please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I must admit I did not hear that. The hon member, did you say that? [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can you come again, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you actually say the words that the Premier has

now mentioned?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I did not mention the Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am talking about the point of order which the Premier raised, did you actually use those words?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Which words?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa ... (intervention)

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, sorry. Which words Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, let me go back to Hansard. I will study Hansard and come back to, if you in fact said something which is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: To come and tell us he is managing the drought and appointed who and who shall be in his team, while the legally elected Cape Town Executive Mayor Patricia de Lille was sidelined and ignored. The DA in this province under the leadership of hon Premier Helen Zille used the water crisis to settle its internal factional fights and scores and decided to ignore their constitutional obligation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, hon Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yesterday was the political debate on the Budget and I listened to your statement yesterday around the content of the speeches, so I ask you on a point of order whether the hon member is addressing the Budget or a general political debate... [Interjections.] I fear that it is a general political debate. That is the point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! That is indeed correct. Let me at this stage again give the guidance which I intended to give at the beginning which I did not do but let me give it to you now. The debate we had yesterday on the Budget was on the Principle or the Second Reading. That was a wide-ranging political debate. Today until next Wednesday we will debate the individual votes or the ministerial portfolios, as per the estimates of expenditure, the so called Blue Book. [Interjections.]

Order! The debates on the individual votes will therefore be more restricted and must in some way directly or indirectly relate to the programmes or the narrative contained in a particular vote.

An HON MEMBER: It is relating to. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will when a point of order is raised in something which the member says I will ask the member to relate it to the reference in the Blue Book or to some programme in the Blue Book. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members, can I just carry on? Members also often refer by way of comparison to situations which it might obtain at national level or in other provinces. That is in order up to a point. It will, however, be beyond the scope of the debate if an entire speech is built on such comparison.

The Chair does not want to unnecessarily curb debate and we also do not want continuous points of order on relevance, and members are therefore requested to keep this guidance in mind. The Chair will always err on the side of allowing more freedom of speech rather than curbing freedom of speech, but I need the assistance of members of this House. I understand that politics and debate are very close together and it is difficult sometimes to

determine whether in fact the reference was to the Blue Book or not. So I want the member to continue but keep in mind the guidance I am giving that somehow you must be able to relate what you say to the Blue Book.

May I also at this stage refer to a different ruling in the House which I gave on the 10th of May 2012 and that still applies, and I am just quoting a specific part of that.

It has further been ruled in the National Assembly and subsequently confirmed by resolution of that House that members may not reflect on their fellow members except upon a substantive motion properly giving notice of. That is the current situation in the National Assembly and it is strictly applied and in 2012 I then said that ruling is now also hereby confirmed in our House and to guide hon members in the application of this ruling, may I indicate that a substantive motion would be required only in instances where such reflection is of a material nature. Casual and brief criticism of fellow members will still be in order, provided the integrity and character of the members are not reflected upon.

Members will realise that the application of this ruling will make it very difficult for the Chair to determine whether a negative reflection, a negative reference or criticism is indeed a material reflection or not. I therefore again want to appeal to all members to carefully weigh their words when criticising fellow members or ideally to refrain from engaging in this type of debating. It certainly does not add anything to the standard of debate or the dignity and

decorum of the House. I want us to continue and keep that in mind. I will from the Chair apply the relevant rule as best as we can, but the onus is on the individual speaker to stick as far as possible to the Blue Book and if he digresses from that certainly the House will point it out or the Chair will point it out.

Hon Member, you may continue. Sorry, hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker, may I just address you. We generally never criticise your rulings or the way that you deal with issues in this House, because you are generally quite fair. However, what I find very strange is how the DA jumps up the minute the ANC veers away from the topic as it is written. Just a minute ago member Mitchell was all over the show and nobody from the DA's side got up to bring him to order. It is unfair. It is unfair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Chair will look at that and rule if necessary. Member, you may continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I will abide by your rule Mr Deputy Speaker, as per my speech and I will always analyse something that I have taken from the Blue Book in this context that I am reading my speech. I said the DA in this province under the leadership of our hon Premier Helen Zille used the water crisis to settle its internal factional fights and scores and decided to ignore their constitutional obligation to manage

and provide solution to this drought quagmire we find ourselves in. They also wanted to use this challenge as an instrument to access money for their election campaign from the ANC-led National Government. Therefore this drought provided an opportunity for them, to this racist party for the few to deal with their internal enemy by the name Patricia de Lille, who, by the way, at least tried to make a serious attempt to confront the water crisis.

In this whole Maimane-noise in both the City and Provincial Government our hon Premier of the Western Cape - who is experiencing extended suspension - remained silent. She sat soundlessly next to Maimane for photo opportunities and abdicated her communication duties in favour of that guy who is fast becoming irrelevant in the new dawn of the real South African political landscape. [Interjections.]

As the Premier of this wannabe English Libertarian island or reserve, she cannot pick when she has a communication duty and when to abandon her duty in a delict way. It is especially an outrage, considering this Department alone gets more than R14 million for advertisements and communication together with almost R2 million for catering; not taking into account how much of the more than R38 million for consultants are also used for this purpose. Then there are millions more spread across the other departments that will be mustered for this task by clamping onto other programmes like the very white party held under the arches of this building on Tuesday night.

Yet, the shadow of Premier Maimane must come to assist this province, its

public representatives and the DA leaders, as they are too weak to do it all on their own. They need God Maimane.

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Overall this Department's Budget is stale with no imagination or anything innovative. In fact, this Budget reads like an end of term budget by a political principal that is coming to the end of the line. It seems as if the political head of this Department just sits her time out for her purposes to amass more pension money and perks before she will go home to play with her granddaughter. In fact, the hon Premier Zille should not waste anybody's time here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: She must go and she must go now in order for her anointed one to take over before the DA is defeated at the ballot box as even internal poll predictions show that the DA is in a freefall and loses support on a daily basis. [Interjections.] Even DA members now say people turned their water campaign into an Avoid-DA slogan.

The DA has used De Lille in order to get its two-third support in this metro. Now she has to be thrown to the dustbin of the history. This is the testimony of what we have been consistently telling the black majority of this country, that DA remains a party of apartheid... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and is not going to change precisely because we are in this democratic dispensation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member Magaxa, I am listening very carefully and you are going straight into straight party politics now. I want you to get closer to the Blue Book. You actually were with the Blue Book but you are digressing slightly now. So just carry on, but do not play, stop playing the person, play the policy.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja, in the context, Mr Deputy Speaker, in the context of this Budget.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He must go. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The fusion of two rightwing old parties of apartheid – the New National Party and the Democratic Party, which is jointly today called DA by the most conservative and racist elements of this epoch, has to preserve and protect privileges and economic interest accumulated through and under the apartheid regime. People like De Lille with a real liberation background and credential... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...not mere journalism, claims that are deliberately...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Magaxa, I am giving you another opportunity to get closer to the topic under discussion. You are going too wide now. Please continue.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Nobody trusts and believes the DA anymore, especially after the water-crisis fiasco where the drought is startlingly described by this Premier as the disaster above all other disasters!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Whose function is that?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Besides her tendency to exaggerate, she also continues in the DA's favourite pastime to instil fear and hate in order to govern. Upon closer scrutiny this Department seems to be in dire trouble. The branch people management continuous with its duplicating functions and on page 10 it is declared that "the austere environment placed some significant challenges on managers that impacts severely on the branch resulting in a reduced ability to meet dire demands of client departments and the branch is then compelled to reprioritise" - which means it is downscaling its duties.

It is further telling when it continues that the structure of the branch will have to be reviewed in order to formalise management arrangements, and that as far as the integrated financial management systems goes, there is no clear

direction from the Treasury. There is also a danger that some service levels to existing clients could be compromised and this places significant strain on the centre for e-Innovation to keep up services.

On page 11 the Branch Corporate Assurance makes this concession that: “It must be acknowledged that the demand for services is higher than what can be supplied with the current resources, and this is what is under threat as it impacts on the level of penetration from a risk management perspective, internal audit coverage and turnaround times of forensic investigations.”

Further to that it says: “The growth in demand for legal services coupled with capacity constraints can cause delays in service delivery and the situation is exacerbated by the fact that the members of the Executive are not bound to service levels and standards. Departments impose deadlines that often deviate from agreed service levels and standards.”

On the other matter of vacancies, a number of posts were not funded due to budget constraints. This is a recurring excuse - this is a recurring excuse in this Department of the absent Premier.

On page 19 it is even more suspicious as more must be done in the prevention of irregular expenditure and strengthening ethics in supply chain management in this so-called model department. Upon reading pages 15 and 16 of this Blue Book about the Budget for the Premier’s Department one gets a clearer picture of the much acclaimed Broadband brag of this Provincial

Government. It states that this project is mostly aimed at delivering this to state and provincial government use with immense savings on amongst others telephone accounts, very little for the poor people in whose name it is put in place. If any, they will only benefit later as very little is done so far to enable public access to this vast improved network. [Interjection.]

Mr D MITCHELL: Go to Merweville.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You can reduce this Department in fact as the Department of Wi-Fi's. On page 22 it is discovered that less than a quarter of the Government buildings offer free public Wi-Fi hotspots and there are plans afoot to expand this, but what about those people staying out of reach of such Wi-Fi supplied at state buildings?

From the Budget book it is clear that the DA in government is not in step with the new trend in South Africa after the 54th ANC Conference and the subsequent election of comrade Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa as the President of the Republic of South Africa. Our President brought a new era of hope, guys, and change for all South Africans, young and old, black and white. The DA is still scrambling around like a headless chicken that does not know where it is going.

This directionless situation is also reflected in her Budget in the blue Budget book. Yes, on page 11 the impression is given that there will be a higher inflation rate and on page 26 it is assumed that the rand to US dollar rate will

not significantly weaken and it is because of the ANC. Both assertions are off the mark, as the opposite happened! The ANC-led National Government works very hard to improve the situation even more. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja right!

Mr K E MAGAXA: This Department will have to review its policy and position as far as the economy is concerned. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In conclusion, since the DA took over in the Western Cape it has been making serious propaganda lies about the corruption of the ANC in the Western Cape Government that was in power before they took over but now we are in the tail end of their second term in this power but they never, they never not once exposed one single case where ANC politicians were involved in corruption but guess what...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ANC officials!

Mr K E MAGAXA: But guess what, instead, instead the Premier of this province including her own MECs or Ministers are directly involved in the direct corruption in this Provincial Government... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: And she knows that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: And we have made those complaints... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member Magaxa, you cannot accuse members of this House of being corrupt. You must withdraw that.

An HON MEMBER: What?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot accuse members of the House of being corrupt. That is unparliamentary. Please withdraw that.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Uh-uh, I said the allegations, they are alleged to be. [Interjections.] The allegations... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear it that way. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am saying - let me, can I? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Read this part again.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay, I am saying both the Premier and the MECs are alleged to be involved in corrupt activities. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Member Magaxa, I did not hear the word “alleged” initially. Is that the point of order? [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: No. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would suggest that the matter be referred to Hansard that it can be cleared out what the member said. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We must be honourable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I would have no choice if the member tells me that he used the word “alleged”. I did not hear it that way but I will give him the advantage to say that... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Punish him if he is liable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and we will then... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Haibo!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will come back to the House if necessary.
[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Uh-uh, do not say shut-up to me!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja. No, I will withdraw the previous part, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! What part?

Mr K E MAGAXA: That - the allegations that they are corrupt.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you withdraw that?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am not saying they are corrupt. I am saying, I am rephrasing it. I am saying: "they are alleged to be corrupt."

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I will come back to you from Hansard. I will report on that the next time around. Please continue. Hon member Lekker, sorry, hon member Lekker. Hon member Magaxa just one second, your member is on the floor.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask whether it is honourable for MEC Madikizela to say to me, "shut up".

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Again! [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, I did not hear that, but that is

unparliamentary. Hon Madikizela, if you did say that you must please withdraw that.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I did not point to any member. I did not say to any member “shut up”, I did not say that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So that was not meant to a member of the House. Are you confirming that? [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, I want to dispose of this one. Please we must continue, hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, member Madikizela said: “You must punish member Magaxa”, and I asked him directly, “Are you the Deputy Speaker?” and then he responded, “shut up”, and he used his finger like this.

An HON MEMBER: He is abusive.

Ms P Z LEKKER: So I find it not honourable for him not to speak the truth here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: In fact I take it as an abuse, the way I see it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I take your point of order. Hon Minister, in the interest of the debate going forward will you withdraw that please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, please you can refer to Hansard because I did not say that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hansard will not assist me, unless you said the words. If you had said the word “shut up” on Hansard it can only...
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, I did not say shut up to any specific persons.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It can only refer to members of the House.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, please, I did not say shut up to any specific member. That is what I am saying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And then the question is hon Minister, who did you address it to then, if it was not meant to somebody in the House then I do not understand the interjection, but I will come back on that one as well. Please continue hon member Magaxa.

Mr P UYS: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, for the record just, the MEC is just ignoring you, he just sat. You asked him to apologise. He just said: "I will not..." and you just moved on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No I did not... [Interjections.] Order!

Mr P UYS: You just moved on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I did not regard it as ignoring. I will refer to Hansard and if indeed that word was said, then certainly I will rule on that. Hon member Magaxa, please finish off, your time has almost expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, Ramaphosa took power only a few weeks but already the people implicated to corruption are being charged already. That is a serious contradiction while the DA making noise for more than almost ten years, but they have done absolutely nothing. We have taken power, Ramaphosa have taken power a few weeks ago but already heads are rolling. What a difference! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! In the absence of the

- when the Chair speaks, I want silence please. [Interjections.] Order! In the absence of the two smaller parties I see the Premier for a reply.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. I do hope that voters realise how much their case is represented in this House when they vote for certain parties. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no difference.

An HON MEMBER: I do not have to listen to... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are running away.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: I would like to end with thanking the hon member Mitchell because I would like to end on a high note. So let me rather begin with the hon member who has fled this House rather than hear my reply.

It is very rare, Mr Deputy Speaker, that you hear a committed Marxist still representing the very worst of colonialism legacy in this country, praising to high heaven the capitalist leader of his party.

An HON MEMBER: What is wrong with that?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: If you do not see something

wrong with that then there is something wrong with you.

The PREMIER: And that shows the sense of direction that he gives his party as the provincial leader. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no such thing.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Of course, once you know [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: But Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, please.

The PREMIER: His final words really gave us an insight into the complete confusion that governs in the Opposition party and their complete failure which will continue into the future to govern properly because praising the leader of his party for enabling heads to roll in the first couple of months after he has taken office begs the question, why do allegedly independent state institutions have to wait till political leadership changes to do what they should have done all along and anyway and how do we know that they are not acting now only because the political leadership has changed and not because they have suddenly found a renewed commitment to the Constitution. In fact in many ways, Mr Deputy Speaker, all of this hurried action against Zuma allies, as corrupt as they may allegedly be, simply indicates the core problem of state capture in the ANC, because what has happened there is the

institutions of state that should be independent are so profoundly captured by the ruling party that they do not act until they have the political go-ahead. The acting head of the Hawks was asked why they had waited for so long and indeed until the Gupta brothers were out of this country, before they issued... [Interjection.]

I am answering the speech that was made and that was allowed to be made... [Interjections.] ...and what is relevant for the goose is relevant for the gander. I am answering the points that the hon member Magaxa made... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I am answering the points that the hon member Magaxa made for the simple reason that they require a response and they were allowed to be made here in this Chamber and what did the acting head of the Hawks say, what did the acting head of the Hawks say when she was asked why she had allowed the Gupta brothers to escape South Africa before issuing a warrant for their arrest? She said, "Because it was not my decision."

Now if it was not her decision, whose was it, and that shows how this state capture continues into the new era and the rolling of heads, I hope, has got something to do with state institutions finding their spine and following the Constitution and the law, but I fear in fact that it is just a swing of the pendulum as always happens with ANC leaders who actually have to give the

go-ahead for state institutions to do what should be their constitutional duty and that is at the heart of the disgrace.

Then apart from being misleading in this House, and I did not say “deliberately misleading”, although when he denied an interjection you will see what Hansard reflects, Mr Deputy Speaker, and then this House will have to take a decision on what to do about it.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: But it was such an empty and hollow and vacuous response that it is very difficult to know what to say in return, because what the hon the Leader of the Opposition did was the only thing that the hon Opposition can do when they are making a speech, which is resort to race because they have no other coherent argument. Now this was not only a model racist speech, it was also a sexist speech and if any member of a minority group in South Africa had given a speech like that there would have been a profound outcry. [Interjection.] But the extent of racism that is embedded in the society, and executed primarily by the ANC is reflected in the double standards about who may say what and who may not say things. [Interjections.]

Now can you imagine - can you imagine if a member of a minority group in South Africa, a minority racial group, because I do not like to label people, but can you imagine if somebody who had identified with a minority racial

group in this House had got up and said a black-leader elected at a congress was a rent-a-black, there would be the most fundamental outcry and rightly so. What gives another black person the right to say that without being racist? Nothing! Yet there is a profound double standard in our society which was reflected absolutely clearly in the speech of the honourable the Leader of the Opposition and I will not tolerate the leader of the Democratic Alliance being slurred like that in this House for his race. That is racism. That is unconstitutional and I will not stand by and allow that to happen. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are quite right.

The PREMIER: Because, Mr Deputy Speaker, every element of fundamental racism exists in the speech that the hon the Leader of the Opposition made.

First of all, the double standard that I have just alluded to; secondly the de-legitimisation; you cannot be black in South Africa and choose not to agree with the ANC without them trying to de-legitimise your right to be different and to have a different view [Interjections.] ...and that is the ultimate racism... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: That is the ultimate racism, Mr Deputy Speaker, to say to a black South African... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The PREMIER: That is the ultimate de-legitimisation, Mr Deputy Speaker, to say to a black South African who does not agree with the ANC that they are a rent-a-black or a garden-boy or that they have lost their way and all the kinds of things that routinely get said. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is your mindset.

The PREMIER: So it is not only racist because of the double standards but it racist because of the de-legitimisation that went right through the right of individuals irrespective of their race to make free political choices in this country and then the third item was demonisation, which was there throughout, and I would like you Mr Deputy Speaker to go back to Hansard and see what a profoundly model racist speech that was in this House and make a ruling on it. It was also a sexist speech.

Ms P MAKELENI: You said that already [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: It was also a sexist speech for many reasons but I will give you one of the main ones. He suggested that I leave politics and go and play with my granddaughter. At what point would any hon member dare to get away with saying that to a man? That would not happen and I am very, very tired of the double standards in this House, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I think it

is time that we did something about it. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So you do not see anything wrong with that statement?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Tyatyam, allow the Premier to continue.

The PREMIER: When he eventually fell over his feet and fell into the Budget he said it was a disgrace that we were saving money on telephone calls because that only benefited us.

How does that logic work that we are saving millions of rands by cutting the costs of telephone calls through Broadband connectivity; we do not put that money into our pockets like members of the hon Opposition who are now in National Government, we put it into frontline service delivery and if the hon Leader of the Opposition has any evidence that there is any corruption in this Government he has a legal and constitutional duty to lay a charge at the police but not to come here and make unsubstantiated statements and then deny that he has made those statements in this House.

It is a complete disgrace that we have an Opposition of this calibre holding this Government to account. But I also am delighted that we have merit-based selection systems in the Democratic Alliance and that young people like the hon member Mitchell get elected. Hon member Mitchell represents the kind

of citizen that will take this country to the heights to which we can go. He has taken personal responsibility. He has used his opportunities, as limited as they initially were in his life, and he has used his opportunities not only to advance his own life but to advance other people's lives and it is a pleasure to have a young pioneering person as Chair of my Portfolio Committee, and I would like thank him very much for the hard and dedicated work that he does and to all the other members of the Portfolio Committee for being there regularly and assisting in holding this Government accountable. But as for the Opposition, I sometimes just wish the public could really see them as the disgrace that they are. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That concludes the debate on this vote. I am going to suspend business just for two minutes to allow for the officials to come in and for a different reason which I will explain to the Whips afterwards, just for two minutes.

[Debate concluded.]

[Business of House paused briefly for clearing of bays.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated. The Secretary will read the Second Order.

The SECRETARY: Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury – Western Cape Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Meyer. [Applause.]

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you, hon Premier, and members of his House, hon Leader of the Opposition, in his absence, colleagues and citizens, ladies and gentlemen, and my staff in the gallery.

The Provincial Treasury's Budget Vote 3 is R325,3 million for the 2018/19 financial year.

Mr Deputy Speaker, key areas of focus on delivery for the 2018/19 financial year entail the continuation of the various key themes as reflected in the main Budget Vote 3.

These themes are located in Provincial Strategic 5, which seeks to embed good governance and integrated service delivery through partnerships and spatial alignment.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we will continue to build on our past successes by strengthening good financial governance brand as this clearly differentiates the Western Cape Government from the rest of the other provinces in South Africa.

Research and analysis will therefore be conducted to inform the development of the provincial local government's fiscal frameworks, the budget policy and sustainability of provincial and municipal budgets.

The Department will continue to provide support initiatives and advice and guidance to departments and municipalities on revenue-related and cash management matters through analysis and reporting on the in-year cash flow, investments and external borrowings for local government, as well as for revenue performance and cash management for the provincial government.

Provincial Treasury will maintain departmental oversight over the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, in support of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board's stated vision to be the leading gambling and racing authority in South Africa. The Department has allocated an amount of R29,3 million to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.

Mr Deputy Speaker, R19,8 million is allocated to support our budget and management initiatives in Vote 3.

The Provincial Government Budget Office will focus on the alignment of policy, planning and budgeting processes with an emphasis on impact evaluations and assessments of budget priorities and spending patterns.

The Provincial Budget Office will also further focus on research and analysis and assessments to:

- Support provincial departments on budget policy matters and;
- To inform the formulation of the provincial budget policy to recommend allocations in line with the Government's strategic priorities as outlined in the Provincial Strategic Plan 2014 to 2019.

The Provincial Budget Office, Mr Deputy Speaker, will also continue to coordinate the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook and the Provincial Medium Term Budget Policy Statement of this Government, to provide the economic, fiscal and policy context within which this Budget is formulated.

Through the overview of provincial revenue and expenditure, the Provincial Budget Office will communicate the budget policy framework and budget priorities that will support the delivery of the Western Cape Government policies, programmes and projects that drive service delivery within the province.

The Local Government Budget Office will provide research, advice and analysis on the regional and local economies to identify issues and trends which impact on local government planning, budgeting and fiscal policy matters. It is also my intention, Mr Deputy Speaker, to further strengthen the Local Government Budget Office.

Research and analysis will also once again culminate in the release of the annual Municipal Economic Review and Outlook and the socio-economic

profiles for local government, also known as the SEP-LG. Guidance and advice is provided through the municipal planning and budgetary processes to promote what we call evidenced-based budgeting.

Mr Deputy speaker, public finance is allocated an amount of R87,8 million. This includes an amount of R38,3 million towards the financial management support grant to municipalities.

Provincial Government Finance assesses provincial budgets to improve the credibility and the sustainability of the budget, and monitors the implementation and financial control of these various budgets.

Local Government Finance will continue to facilitate and co-ordinate the implementation of the Municipal Finance Management Act in Provincial Treasury and in municipalities. The implementation of the Municipal Finance Management Act will be driven through the IGR coordination between municipalities, the Department of the Premier and my colleague, the Minister of Local Government, and various other stakeholders.

Mr Deputy Speaker, key responsibilities in this regard include monitoring, support and intervention, including being responsive to support particularly the most vulnerable municipalities, in respect of the Municipal Finance Management Act implementation, budget implementation, revenue and expenditure management.

Provincial Treasury's infrastructure initiatives will focus on the institutionalisation of the IDMS (Integrated Data Management System), the infrastructure, procurement and delivery management system both in municipalities and also in the various Provincial Government departments.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Provincial Government programme, Financial Governance, is allocated R42,2 million in Vote 3. The Provincial Treasury also provides technical support to departments and municipalities, and ensures that governance and financial management improves through the application of the accounting framework, training programmes and regular corporate governance and review action plans, also known as MGRO (Municipal Governance Review and Outlook) and CGRO (Corporate Governance Review and Outlook). We will continue with our focus on improved financial governance which is driven through the Corporate Governance Review and Outlook and the Municipal Governance Review and Outlook.

Processes are underway to align these strategies with those of the Department of the Premier and the Department of Local Government, to improve efficiencies under the banner of Provincial Strategic Goal 5, imbedding good governance. Municipalities were assisted with the implementation of the new MSCOA (Municipal Standard Chart of Accounts), which became effective 1 July 2017. This, Mr Deputy Speaker, as I have announced last year, is one of the major reform initiatives and naturally came with challenges. We will continue to provide support to municipalities until such time that these

challenges have been addressed.

Provincial Treasury is committed to youth development. For the 2018/19 financial year, the capacity building programme, Graduate Trainee Interns, has an allocated budget of R14,5 million, while a further amount of R3,12 million is set aside for bursaries.

28 interns commenced their internship on 1 March 2018. A further 32 PAY (the Premiers Advancement of Youth) interns will commence their internship on 9 April 2018. Thanks for this programme, Premier Zille.

Our Chartered Accountant Academy which aims to create a pipeline of public sector accounting professionals, is bearing fruit. The Budget for the 2018/19 financial year amounts to R5,7 million. Accountant trainees have increased from the initial seven to 15 members. Three trainee accountants have successfully completed the Certificate in the Theory of Accounting and two trainees are awaiting their results in the initial test of competence.

Mr Deputy Speaker, R27,5 million is allocated towards stepping up our focus on using procurement for economic development. During the 2018/19 financial year, the Department will be seeking to conclude a strategic partnership for the provision of a supplier management and electronic procurement solution. The acquisition is intended to support the Government's overall strategy for improvement in the value of money, competitiveness among suppliers and the provision of a convenient accessible

means to do business with Government.

It is furthermore intended to maintain and build on the levels of policy standardisation and good governance that the Western Cape Government has progressively established since the inception of the SCM Modernisation drive, in 2009 already. At the commodity level, the Department will identify appropriate transversal contract opportunities and adopt the National Treasury's strategic sourcing framework, with a key focus on the areas of demand and contract management.

In addition, the Western Cape Cabinet is monitoring the implementation of the preferential procurement and has instructed that a provincial economic procurement policy be developed to ensure that any target setting is focused and will generate the necessary value as intended by the preferential procurement regulations.

The Economic Procurement Policy lies at the core of the Provincial Treasury's contribution to economic growth and job creation. We can already report to this House that at least 30% of our provincial procurement spend was directed to small black businesses.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Provincial Treasury's vision is good financial governance. In the previous financial year we have signed a good financial governance declaration. I am happy to report to this House today that we are indeed making good progress in the implementation of these good governance

principles across both the departments and in the various municipalities and in the various public entities.

In order to achieve its planned objectives, the Provincial Treasury today has allocated an amount of R325,3 million for the 2018/19 financial year, and it allocated as follows:

- Programme 1 - R61,1 million
- Programme 2 - R159,4 million
- Programme 3 - R62,5 million, and
- Programme 4 - R42,2 million.

I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Denis Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Standing Committee on Finance deliberated on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury with its entity, the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board and reported that it supports the Vote.

The vision of the Department is good financial governance. The vision will be realised through enhancing accountability, creating public value, enabling delivery of quality service and building capacity in the public service.

In the Medium Term Expenditure Framework the Department will spend the R325,390 million in this book year, and this will go up to R359,392 in the 2020/21 book year.

The powers and functions of the Department are captured in the Public Financial Management Act, as well as the Municipal Financial Management Act. The Department provides ministerial support and works closely with the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. The Department also carries out the very important transversal function in that it develops, monitors and advises on norms and standards within the municipalities and the financial legislation within the departments.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Provincial Treasury forms part of the Western Cape Government's Provincial Strategic Plan 5 and will ensure that good governance continues during this next financial year. Coupled to this is the service delivery through partnerships and spatial alignment. Provincial Treasury has the responsibility to ensure that all departments are involved in building a capable and developmental state as prescribed by the National Development Plan.

Mr Deputy Speaker, policy priorities will again be formulated after research:

- Firstly, fiscal policy research is critical,
- secondly, research into the socio-economic conditions is critical,
- thirdly, Provincial Economic Review Outlook, PERO, and the Municipal

Economic Review Outlook, the MERO, is critical, and;

- fourthly, research into the sustainability of the Gambling and Racing Board is critical.

The outcome of the research will assist the Provincial Treasury with fiscal consolidation, as part of the fiscal strategic plan the Cabinet and the Western Cape Government will follow.

The Minister of Finance is in charge of the Ministerial Infrastructure Coordinating Committee. The value of this committee should not be underestimated. The pace of economic growth, job opportunities, skills development and service to the people in the Western Cape is noted in this transversal Cabinet and senior management responsibility.

†Anders as in die ander provinsies waar die Hawks op Ministers en senior amptenare se kantore moet besoek en beslag lê op ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Different from other provinces where the Hawks have to visit Ministers' and senior officials' offices and confiscate ... [Interjections.]]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Blue Book please.

†Mnr D JOSEPH: ... kantoortoerusting en dokumente weens korrupsie en beweerde misdade.

[Mr D JOSEPH: ... office equipment and documents because of corruption and alleged crimes.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Please.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee on Finance notes the dispute between the AG ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee on Finance notes the dispute between the AG (Auditor-General) and the Department of Agriculture as reported in the Annual Report. The independence of the AG must never be compromised. It is however important to note that the dispute has a long history and that the Department has asked the AG to make known its findings on this matter in dispute. [Interjection.]

The incident is not good for our good governance model in the Western Cape. I am sure that it is also not good for the integrity of the AG either. If there is no outcome to this dispute prior to the end of the financial year, the question must be asked what rule applies whilst the current situation is unresolved.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Programme 1 of the Western Cape Government's Finance and Provincial Treasury is truly an example. On the contrary, in the ANC, in National Government, Ministers are just changed like chess pieces and the taxpayers are at the mercy of South African people.

In line with Programme 1 of the Programme Description, Provincial Treasury

governs and oversees the office of the Minister, the management services that are rendered, as well as financial management. These services are to assist the Minister and the Cabinet with functions assigned to it by the legislation. We know that the Western Cape Treasury, under Minister Meyer's management, ensures that these services are rolled out in the management of our provinces.

The Minister is supported by the Head of the Ministry, with staff and members that fulfil their duties assigned by the legislation and/or the Premier. The Minister and his office also have the responsibility to engage with the international diplomatic corps. This gives the Western Cape Government the opportunity to foster relationships in support of economic growth.

The Minister has also the responsibility to engage with the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. The sub-programmes under administration include management services and financial management. The Department will continue to engage with internal audit functions. These functions are rendered by Internal Audit and are centralised in the Department of the Premier Corporate Services.

The Committee notes the effort by the Department to fill the senior vacancies. We request that the senior management do all it can to retain the scarce skills in the Department and to fill the remaining vacancies as soon as possible.

The Gambling and Racing Board is now a very stable board. It is evident that they are working together, they are helping each other to make progress on this board. The organisation has had many changes, but the Committee notes that the vacancies on the board are also ongoing, like with other boards. The Standing Committee of Finance must make the request for a review of amendments relating to the appointment of board members, followed by the vacancies, soon after recommendation to the Minister. We have had discussions in the last Budget Committee meeting and also in previous committee meetings. I hope that we can find a solution with regard to this concern. We congratulate the new Chairperson of the Board, Mr Lakay, and wish him well in his responsibility.

The challenge of illegal gambling, cybercrime, illegal online gambling, pose a risk for continued income and keeping the Board's role for sustainable income. The Committee thanks the staff of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, in particular the law enforcement officials, for their commitment to stem out illegal gambling and note the training programmes to deal with illegal online gambling.

The interaction of the Board and staff with communities for awareness and education for responsible gambling is noted. The Committee further notes the work that is done in giving financial support to programmes and uplifting communities and addressing the needs of disadvantaged schools.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to take the opportunity to thank all staff in

Provincial Treasury, all the leadership in Provincial Treasury, the Gambling and Racing Board members, as well as the staff. The Committee supports Vote 3. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Just before I start, I would really like that when MECs or as my Chairperson reported now, that they report correctly on the report from the Standing Committees. There is a section that says Section 86 was included, meaning the ANC made their own statement regarding the Budget. We did not approve it en masse.

Mr D JOSEPH: The Committee ... [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Committee may have, but the ANC had a minority view. Mr Deputy Speaker, time seldom allows me to get to this point, so I want to start by acknowledging the real recipients of what should be our appreciation, the staff of Treasury, sitting over there, who put so much work into compiling this Budget, inclusive of all other departments and their continuous assistance to us to be able to do our work when we request them to do so, and my gratitude goes to every single one of them, even those that we do not see. They are the backbone of this Vote. Your dedication is commendable.

While this might have been a very difficult time for you to allocate the

Budget, we are always reminded that your political principals and “principal” is spelt p-a, not p-l-e, “can do more with less”, so it probably was a walk in the park for them.

Having had a long history with this Department and being instrumental in influencing some of the changes they have implemented over the years, they also know that it was not and is not always smooth sailing. Today of course is not different.

Now the ironies, Mr Deputy Speaker, of this total Budget and Vote 3 in particular, are that it is purported to be a people’s budget. Just as we hammered you and got you to change your stance on clean audits and what they really mean, we will continue to remind you that a people’s budget can never be sincere if they are not consulted. Treasury is not even a real service delivery department in the true sense, yet their oversight and guidance to both departments and municipalities is of cardinal importance.

Of what significance is our oversight role then on this side of the House if no change can be effected because of it? And there seems to be no haste in getting to a point where legislation to be able to do so is put in place. I will continue to harp on this point until it sinks in. I am tired of coming to this House and watching performances and grandstanding and listening to sarcasm, when what you are presenting to us has no input from us.

Mr D JOSEPH: The sarcasm is from your side.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The first sentence of your overview reads:

“To promote transparency and improved oversight.”

But you do not like oversight and you do not want oversight.

Mr D JOSEPH: We enjoy oversight.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Your chairpersons are generally praise singers as you heard and you will hear for the rest of the day, except maybe two of them who when they did have an oversight role, they were sacked, they were demoted [Interjection.] and – they have been demoted.

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And they have now even lost some of the leadership positions by vote rigging.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You also [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am tired of listening to chairpersons curtailing the bait when it looks like the DA, their masters are being questioned about the principles that drive the allocations. The silo thinking and thieftdoms amongst them who have not yet grasped the principles of transversiality is just unacceptable. They are not Cabinet members, all those members sitting at the

back, all the chairpersons. They are neither members of the National Assembly in opposition. Their attention and role is oversight here in the Western Cape, but you will continue to listen to the praise singing further today.

Both the MEC and officials of Treasury sit in at Minmec, you sit in on the Financial and Fiscal Commission, you make inputs on behalf of the people of this province. So what is it based on? Where do you get the background besides the policies based on studies done by consultants?

Your allocation from national has increased year-on-year and is forecast to continue to grow over the MTEF. I will not repeat all the programmes of the departments, you have heard them, so I will not waste time to do that. This financial year it has grown from R61 billion last year to R63 billion this year, and it will continue to grow over the MTEF to R67 billion in the 2019/2020 year, and R72 billion in the 2020/2021 financial years.

Treasury Vote 3 allocation increases by 13% in the current financial year with Programme 2 and 3 having an 18% increase in both. Of course compensation of employees takes the biggest chunk of this Budget.

In the APP, Mr Deputy Speaker, there are plans for ministerial international engagements. However, of concern is that any lessons to be learned or twinning arrangements, only happened in DA run municipalities, in spite of proposals made for sharing of knowledge and expertise with smaller, poorer

municipalities to help them grow. I speak here in particular about the agreement signed with Bavaria, with not one less-privileged municipal area being a beneficiary. Yet we are told that this Budget, over which you claim oversight, is for the poor or, as you put it, for the people. We ask you again, which people?

Your assertion that your decrease in conditional grants means you will now do less for the poor, you claim to do much more for them, yet when you cannot, you blame national by implication admitting that without the assistance of national, you cannot do anything.

South Africa is a unitary state and as such the fiscus needs to address the needs where it is most prevalent. If this province does not get as much as they expect, it means National Government, National Treasury, in particular, has identified a greater need somewhere else.

You are to promote good governance and integrated service delivery, based on national strategic outcomes through spatial alignment and sustainable budget allocation and spend. You are to provide ministerial support, improve corporate management and provide financial administration services to the Department, but more importantly are your transversal and external responsibilities, and the ones that stand out, and I am mentioning these specifically, Mr Deputy Speaker, to apply them in reality. On the management of the provincial, some of them are:

- To manage the provincial and municipal fiscal resources;
- to improve conformance, sustainability and monitor the efficient implementation of the provincial and the municipal budgets;
- Supply chain and asset management, to strategically drive policy in this regard and give guidance and assistance;
- improve the understanding and application of accounting standards across departments and municipalities, and you have a plethora of Acts, rules and regulations to guide and assist this process.

The most glaring omission though is that though the Auditor-General is very clear that all sectors of government are now moving over to GRAP standards, neither you nor Vote 11, mention this National Treasury important document and guideline called:

“National Treasury Generally Recognised Accounting Practices for National and Provincial Departments of 2016.”

Yet, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is that very guideline document that spells out how accounting by principals and agents should be managed and interpreted, clearly pointing out that your Vote 11 interpretation of transfer payments and goods and services is questionable, and worse, you support the fact that a department without existing avenues, should take the AG to court. How have you guided the rest of the departments if these guidelines were not taken into account or even mentioned in any other department? How have you assessed, reviewed and assisted in the prevention of irregularities and material

misstatements in both the modified cash basis of accounting applied by the Department, and the accrual basis of accounting by public entities, yet a financial misstatement is the very reason why Vote 11 is in dispute with the Auditor-General, and are planning to go to court to decide on the matter.

One of your comments in your review of the 2017/2018 financial year states that you provided training services in respect of transversal financial systems to all provincial departments and where required, to other provincial and national departments. The question is what and why? And here we do not need a grandstand, just a clear understanding of why this was necessary. Another statement says:

“Moving ahead to your outlook.”

Of course the PERO and MERO are of cardinal importance to influence the policy and Budget allocations. The Local Government Budget Office plays a crucial role here by advising on the analysis that effects and has an impact on local government planning budgets and fiscal policy matters.

Experience has taught us that you can analyse and advise, but until you consult, inform and educate the communities that are being budgeted for, the IDP and the following budget is a desktop lie.

An HON MEMBER: True that.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You say that you guide and advise through municipal planning and budgetary processes to promote evidence-based budgeting. Let me give you an example of why I continuously harp on this issue. Speak to the newly appointed municipal manager of Swellendam as an example, and one of the first things he mentioned, and I am going to read it verbatim. Mr Anton Groenewald has been appointed and he says – they asked him:

“What are your challenges and rewards?”

And he very honestly says – they say:

“He does not duck potentially difficult questions. When asked what he considered his greatest challenges to be, he replied ‘that the limitation of resources faced by the municipality and the polarisation within the broader community are important tests. There are strong community emotions towards the Council, negative social ills in the poorer communities and seemingly lack of opportunity for people of colour. The expectation is that the municipality must address these barriers.’”

This is a newly appointed municipal manager, he just walked into the job and like that he identified the needs of this municipality, supposedly the best in the country.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What is your point?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is a good, honest official.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Exactly.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: There is nothing wrong with that.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Exactly, but the point I am making, MEC Fritz, is that all along this municipality has been punted on a big board as the best in South Africa. Why would the municipal manager say that? Based on which standards?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] new in the job.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: By your own admission – do not justify things that are wrong, please do not.

So I dare you to go into any community, Mr Deputy Speaker, and ask how many public participation meetings took place before the municipal budget was approved ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: More than enough.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and I will be vindicated. By your own admission you run most of the municipalities, then why, in spite of your grandstanding, MEC, do we have service delivery protests right here outside this building on a regular basis?

Mr D JOSEPH: ANC organised.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The poor and uninformed of this province are really being taken for granted. A top-down approach and consultants, we do not even live in the area, are allowed to sit in and dictate policy for the people they do not even know.

How come in your oversight municipal budgets you do not foresee or curtail the eminent downgrade of City of Cape Town by rating agencies, one that is based on your DA disastrous handling of the water crisis. [Interjections.] Remember ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Oh please, like [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Economist, Mike Shussler, says, and I quote:

“A downgrade of the City’s credit rating would be dire for the local economy and would have a profound consequence on the whole of South Africa. The DA’s failure to plan and implement water demand management systems earlier has the potential to harm the

Province's credibility. Such negligence.”

In one breath you use the poor rainfall over the years for the problem, and then in the next breath you blame the previous Minister, Mokonyane, for the crisis as if she determines when it should rain. [Interjections.]

The one place, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: She bankrupted the Department.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... in SCOPA that we always spend most of our time on in any department, is on goods and services, and Treasury will not escape that.

The total spend on consultants in Treasury has increased by 29% from R20 million to R26 million, and the reason given is that the Western Cape, with permission from Cabinet, wants to invest in a study for a fuel levy. Why should a province which is part of a unitary state, where such policies are determined by National Government, want to even think about something like this? [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: As you yourselves often say, you are not an island and you add that you are not part of a federal state, but this approval was given by Cabinet. Why?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Under this ANC Government.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is totally unacceptable. This Budget is supposed to be for the people. You grandstand about the implications of a VAT increase, but in the background you plan a fuel levy. Who will pay that?

Also the spend on business and advisory services increased by 100%, from R3,9 million to R8 million in Programme 2. While we will never support gambling, we also understand that this is part of your own revenue source.

An HON MEMBER: We will never support it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But you also, year-on-year, make the commitment to enhance this income by different or more innovative ways yet, because LPMs, (Lower Pay-out Machines) did not bring in as much revenue as expected, the allocation to the Western Cape Gambling Board is increased. That is a contradiction. The ANC is happy that the LPMs are not making much money, which proves our stance that people, mostly the poor, have less disposable income because of loss of work opportunities. Remember these are the machines that only pay out just over R500 at the most, so it is not the rich that gamble at those machines, it is the poor.

We will carefully monitor the unspent revenue set aside to assist vulnerable municipalities later in the year when they submit their business plans. Again

we will question who was consulted and how the requests are justified. For too long we have watched staged performances here, but the people who should be consulted are never here in this House or when public participation exercises are taken outside of this House, from area to area across the province, it is a concurrent fruitless and wasteful expenditure over which you have oversight, but never mention. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Finance MEC, Dr Ivan Meyer, and his Department should once again be commended that the Western Cape remains financially sound.

Whilst we are grappling with our worst drought in over a century and enduring the fact of a sluggish economic growth, the 52% fuel levy and the 1% VAT increase, under these circumstances, Minister Meyer and the Treasury have managed to keep the machine well-oiled and ready to deliver.

The Western Cape Treasury has prioritised sustainable financial resource management with the strategic focus on effective and efficient management of provincial and municipal resources. The tabling of this Provincial Budget will ensure financial stability not only to assist the Provincial Government, but municipalities in the preparation and adjustments of their budgets.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is noteworthy and pleasing to see that although the

Department has increased the Budget to R325 million, that during this difficult fiscal period, that they are leading from the front in also cutting where it is much needed.

Our jobs are to ensure that we hold the Executive to account and for Treasury to ensure that they monitor and also hold the Department to account when it comes to their spending. In this regard, if you look at Programmes 2 and 3, it was fitting to see when we visited Beaufort West, and we have highlighted this in the Committee, that the Department's officials were busy working there and ensuring and assisting the municipality with local government assistance.

When the Finance Committee recently met, some of the programmes that we went through with the Department were bursary funding, municipal funding and the co-funding programme, and the Department acknowledged and commended the Treasury departments for ensuring that there is funding available for these programmes. At the same time we want to implore the Department to ensure municipalities are actually implementing these programmes and ensuring that students that go from their municipalities partake in these bursaries programmes.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as the Oversight Committee, we will monitor the Generally Recognised Accounting Practices (GRAP) of Kannaland Municipality and ask that the Department keeps the committee informed of their progress to ensure that there are no accounting irregularities that

negatively impact on the services for our people.

It was also highlighted by several members earlier – we were very pleased to see that the Auditor-General met with the Department of Agriculture and we were happy to see that the Minister has made an undertaking to write to the national Minister of Finance to ensure that this matter, where it relates to the Department of Agriculture, is resolved speedily.

The Committee is also aware there are currently possible legislative amendments when it comes to the Western Cape Racing and Gambling Board, with specific reference to appointing the candidates next on the list when it comes to shortlisting of candidates, so that our Committee do not have to re-interview candidates every time there is a vacancy on this board.

We are also aware of the affect that the 1% increase in VAT will have on the Provincial Treasury and we know that they have taken measures to ensure that services in Treasury are not affected.

The financial soundness of this Department has continuously translated into unparalleled effective and sufficient service delivery to other departments and to the Western Cape Government, and we did ask the Department of Treasury, where they implement best practices in their departments, that they also duplicate that in other departments. One of the items that they did do was the extension of their asset management programme, to ensure that where there is no urgent need when it comes to desks and [Inaudible.] and moveable

assets, that they extend it by another year or two and that should be duplicated in other departments.

Deputy President – ag, sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Laughter.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... speaking from my mouth to God's ears! We will see you there. We are going there in 2019. [Laughter.] Mr Deputy Speaker, when it comes to the Local Government Office, under Programme 2, where they have done extensive research and analysis on the regional and local economies – during our Budget Committee meetings, we asked them to make sure that that information is not only passed on to other departments, but also to various committees, so that those can be used when we interrogate the budget departments of all the departments.

We therefore welcome the service-centre-led approach from the Department and want to thank the officials, the Minister and the Western Cape Racing and Gambling Board for ensuring that during this tough period that they had a people centred focus on this budget.

So we thank the Minister and all his officials and, Mr Deputy Speaker, in the Committee we fully supported this Budget, even the ANC's minority view, was saying that they note the deliberations and they did not object to this Budget. So for that we want to say thank you, hon member Beerwinkel, that

implicit support for this Vote. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Simmers.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape transparent, accountable and good governance has become the expected norm for all the people we serve.

Whereas, on the other hand, South Africans in other provinces are unfortunately subjected to experiencing the ongoing effects of the National Government's wasteful expenditure and maladministration ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... continuous corruption – yes, corruption †is aanhoudend, [is continuous,] †continuous corruption ... [Interjection.]. along with being plagued by state capture for almost a full decade and its impact they are only starting to feel now, with an increase of 1% in VAT that ultimately will reduce the spending capacity of the poorest people of our country the most.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes!

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: En dis die hartseer van wat hier gebeur het.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: And that is the sad part of what has happened here.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, as this point in time this province has remained a bastion of hope for South Africans since 2009, as this Provincial Government and administration have remained resilient and focused, year-on-year, on the sole objective of improving the lives of all our residents in this province.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hear-hear!

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, a major focal point of the Western Cape Government remains ensuring that all departments are embedded in good governance, with the sole aim of ensuring enhanced service delivery for all our people. †Ongelukkig is dit iets wat die ANC nie raaksien nie lyk dit my. [Unfortunately it is something the ANC does not see, it seems to me.]

†n AGB LID: Hulle kan nie.

[An HON MEMBER: They cannot.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Ja, hulle kan nie, hulle is 'n bietjie blind.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Yes, they cannot, they are a bit blind.]

†That the Provincial Treasury received an allocation of R1 billion over the MTEF period, solidifies this Government's commitment, Mr Deputy Speaker. I welcome this allocation as it will provide the necessary support to all our

provincial departments, entities and municipalities, in improving supply chain management processes and increase access to Government services.

Mr Deputy Speaker, under the trusted political leadership and administrative leadership of our Finance Minister, Ivan Meyer, the Western Cape Provincial Treasury has done remarkably well in performing its functions. We are fortunate in this province, unlike many other provincial treasuries, to experience the true nature of how effective provincial treasury leadership in financial management reform is in ensuring that provincial line departments obtain the financial management maturity and capability to achieve the objectives of the PFMA which I would actually advise my colleagues on this side to go and read. [Interjections.]

The commitment to fiscal policy during these truly difficult financial times will continue to test the robustness of our provincial inter-governmental fiscal relation systems and budget coordination mechanisms.

Mr Deputy Speaker, now more than ever it is important for the Western Cape Government to squeeze inefficiencies and venal tendencies out, and increase value for money and the development impact of public spending. But, this can only be accomplished through the capacity of the public service sector focused on service delivery and therefore, the fact that the Provincial Treasury has dedicated up to almost R3 million to the training and development of 330 out of its 425 employees, is important for ensuring that service delivery continues to improve.

I therefore welcome that our Provincial Treasury remains committed to building its capacity in light of the poor economic growth and several budget cuts being experienced throughout this country.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this increase in capacity building will enable that we have the team needed to ensure our province is successful in the managing of a tight financial budget and that our Western Cape Government can continue to provide support and additional training for officials at municipal level. This will inevitably contribute to ensuring that the sound financial performance across all our municipalities in this province is improved upon, as it has for the last few years as well.

Mr Deputy Speaker, and really it is sad when I listen to our Opposition here, but they need to realise that the governing party in this province shows that it remains committed to the investment of the people of this province.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr T A SIMMERS: We are transparently advancing opportunities for all in this province ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh-uh.

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... and ensuring that every resident enjoys a quality of life with higher prospects to succeed in all that they aspire to attain. I think

the other eight provinces will actually prove that we are better at that. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister Meyer to respond, to reply.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Dankie ook aan ons Voorsitter van die Begrotingskomitee, mnr Denis Joseph. Dankie vir u leierskap en ook ondersteuning vir hierdie Begroting.

Die Voorsitter van die Staande Komitee oor Finansies neem aktief deel in die oorsigrol van die Provinsiale Tesourie en ek wil hulle graag hiermee bedank. Ook dankie aan die Staande Komitee vir die erkenning van die rol van die Inter-ministeriële Komitee oor Infrastruktuur. Aan die Voorsitter ook dankie vir u insette ten opsigte van die Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.

Agb lid Joseph, ek het onlangs vergader met die National Gambling Council, ek het dit bygewoon saam met die Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, saam met Minister Rob Davies in Gauteng, en ons is nog steeds in gesprekke met DTI in die verband.

Dankie ook agb lede vir die erkenning van die rol van my amptenare in die Provinsiale Tesourie, hulle is uitstekend, bekwaam, bevoegd, *fit for purpose*.

Agb lid Beerwinkel, u het die opmerking gemaak dat ons sit op die Minmec, ons sit op die Begrotingsraad.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you also to our Chairperson of the Budget Committee, Mr Denis Joseph. Thank you for your leadership and also support for this Budget.

The Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Finance actively participates in the oversight role of the Provincial Treasury and I would like to thank them. Also thank you to the Standing Committee for acknowledging the role of the Inter-ministerial Committee on Infrastructure. To the Chairperson, thank you also for your input with regard to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.

Hon member Joseph, I have recently met with the National Gambling Council, I attended it with the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board along with Minister Rob Davies in Gauteng, and we are still having discussions with DTI in this regard.

Thank you also hon members for acknowledging the role of my officials in the Provincial Treasury, they are excellent, capable, competent, *fit for purpose.*]

†Hon member Beerwinkel, you made the remark that we sit on Minmec, we sit on the Budgeting Board. In the Democratic Alliance we do not sit on the Minmec, we do not sit on the Budget Council, in this Government we serve

on these councils. It is a big difference. In the National Assembly they sit on committees, †en hulle sit en hulle raak vet.[and they sit and become fat.] Here we serve.

An HON MEMBER: Hayi, no-no-no.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You sit and Tweet.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon members, I think it is important for the record that the hon member has referred to our international partnerships. In this Cabinet I am responsible for the management of the Regional Leaders Summit and I want to report that in terms of the specific benefits that were achieved through the interaction with the Free State of Bavaria, we have made a substantive contribution, through international relations, with the development of the multi-purpose centre in Khayelitsha when it was opened by my friend, Minister Siegfried, from Bavaria. So there was a direct benefit in a poor area.

There was also earlier a specific benefit from a multi-purpose centre that was built in Nyanga, as a result of the Free State of Bavaria's financial commitment and involvement. We also have that in a poor area, and all of you have been there. They have benefited from Amandla Football, a Bavarian-German NGO.

We have also assisted the Regional Socio-economic Programme and the

Violence Protection through Urban Upgrade Programme, and in that particular regard the German Development Bank has given us, in this province 5,3 million euros. So I think the record speaks for itself, that they supported these various poor areas.

We would like to assist ANC run municipalities. [Interjections.] Show me where it is? [Interjections.] Show me any ANC run municipality and we will support them. [Interjections.] We are – there is none. But ... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Just take a seat.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... our international relations ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Our international relations support every single municipality in the Western Cape.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Allow your [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Also, Mr Deputy Speaker, I heard during this debate that the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, hon member Joseph, reported in this House, that the MEC for Finance in the Northern Cape has been criminally charged for financial misconduct and fraud. For the record, it is an ANC MEC in that particular province.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yôh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have, also for the record, supported Swellendam Municipality with the Local Government Financial Support Grant and there is now an intern supported by this Provincial Treasury.

When the ANC loses an argument or they lose an election, they do not have a democratic culture. That is why every week they organise marches ...
[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: That is you, that is the DA.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... right here at Parliament, and we say it is fine, because we believe in participatory democracy. We say it is fine because we believe in the Constitution. We say people can march, they can demonstrate ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We believe it is their democratic right to.

An HON MEMBER: No man.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We say you can come and march. It is part of your constitutional right.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Davids.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You can march, but in a democracy you must win an election. You can march, but you must win votes. [Interjections.]

So we believe ... [Interjection.] continue to march. It is in your democratic right, we support it. [Interjections.] But you must win elections.

Mr D JOSEPH: You must win elections.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: When the ANC loses an argument, when they lose an election ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: They turn to racism.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... they organise marches. That is your style [Interjections.], that is your style of politics. [Interjections.] Our style of politics ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Your style of politics is to march. [Interjection.] Our style of politics is to win elections. That is why there is a government here in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] So march on. [Interjections.] We – our style of politics is to win elections. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Order, there is too much – order! There is too much dialogue going on next to the Minister and across the floor. Hon Minister Meyer, continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I repeat, when the ANC loses an argument and an election, they organise marches. [Interjections.] That is their style of politics. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister Meyer, just – order. Order! Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it was here a couple of minutes ago ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... you cautioned all of us here about relevance and sticking to the Blue Book. I am not sure whether you are listening ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you are right.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... to the MEC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I was hoping the Minister would end with that. He

is – in a way he was responding to the hon member Beerwinkel, but I think he is going a little bit wide now. Minister Meyer, you may continue.

Ms N D NKONDLO: No, we are not in a comedy show here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister Meyer, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon member Nkondlo, I think that point is noted. We win elections. I move on.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I think the hon members will know that the Provincial Treasury has been accredited by the National Treasury to provide financial systems training on behalf of the National Treasury, all over to the provinces as well as to the National Government departments, and we will continue to do so.

Mr Deputy Speaker, there is an irony in this debate, and thank you, Minister Winde, for pointing out the irony during this debate. One hon member complained about us. I have been mandated by this Government to do a study to investigate the feasibility of a fuel levy. I am now being criticised in this House for this study, but when the ANC was in power in this government ...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They are still [Inaudible.]

Ms P MAKELENI: There he goes again.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... when Minister Lynne Brown, when she was the MEC [Interjections.], luckily I have read the files ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Lynne Brown was the MEC of Finance ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and when I became the Minister of Finance, I went to the file and I read the communications between Lynne Brown, at the time, and Trevor Manuel ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the Minister of Finance, and in those communications Minister Brown asked on behalf of this government, that we must implement a fuel levy.

Mr D JOSEPH: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: She wrote as the ANC MEC for Finance to Minister Manuel. Minister Manuel wrote back to her and said yes, I agree, there must be a fuel levy. [Interjections.] So there is the irony. [Applause.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Grandstand!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is not grandstanding. This is reading the files, which you open when you become MEC. We opened those files. We read this documentation. Thank you, Minister Winde, I like what you did now. It is called collegiality. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where is Lynne Brown now?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I do not know where Lynne Brown is now. [Interjections.] I cannot say.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I know she is in Napier. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: If the hon member says she does not know what happens in the Cabinet ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ah ha!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... before you go to a Cabinet you brief your caucus.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I briefed this caucus about the fuel levy, then I went to the Cabinet. So if they do not do this, it shows there is a breakdown between the Executive and the Legislature. That breakdown between the Legislature and the Executive is precisely the reason why they kicked out ...
[Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... Ebrahim Rasool. So in your caucus, you must ask your Chief Whip to put items on your caucus agenda, then you discuss it and then you process it. I do not take anything to the Cabinet before I inform the caucus. It is called caucus management. In the absence of your caucus management, you have damagement. [Interjections.]

And so I think the issue of the fuel levy is now exhausted. The ANC supported it, we are now supporting it. We are doing the study to finalise OT and we are updating the research, and we think in this regard Lynne Brown did outstanding work, and in this regard we think Minister Manuel did

outstanding work. But the time has moved on, so this Cabinet has asked me to update the research and also take into context the economic situation and the Cabinet has given me that mandate. That mandate is currently now being instituted.

Hon members, in the National Assembly my colleagues take part in the debate of the DoRA, they make submissions and those submissions are taken into the national geopolitical budget space. Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to announce in this House, that today I have signed the letter, with concrete and substantive proposals on this National Budget, and I am sending the letter off today to Minister Nene. Not hot air, not shouting in the House, I have written a clear, professional letter to him with things which I ask him to consider, and knowing him and having worked with him, I think he is a reasonable man, and I am certainly looking forward to further engagements with him in the National Treasury. So I have written to him and I am very thankful for that discussion.

Also, hon members have spoken now about the rating agencies ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Olivier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am almost concluding, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon members have spoken about the rating agencies and the downgrade. I want to report to this House that thanks to Minister Winde, we have met with

the Premier and the rating agencies precisely about this particular matter. We have briefed them, they have offered some assistance, because the rating agency also has a foundation, because they said they cannot just simply declare something or make a statement, they also want to help. And so this Moody's Foundation and Minister Winde and the Premier are now in consultation to assist all of us ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... all of our clients in the Western Cape, in this specific situation. So we have now decided ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is crisis management.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... to step up to the plate and I think, hon member, you will appreciate, thank you for that input that you made, we have now successfully engaged with the Moody's rating agency, and we will continue to do so, because a capable state, hon member Nkondlo, one of the principles of the National Development Plan, is to build a capable state.

One of the requirements of a capable state is to engage with international rating agencies and we do so not only in the interest of the Western Cape, but in the interest of South Africa, because in the National Budget ... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: We appreciate it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the National Treasury speaks about the implications of the drought for the country and the economy of the whole country.

So in that context we are helping the National Treasury, through the conversation which Minister Winde has started, so that we can also assist in that geopolitical macro environment. So I am particularly pleased that these discussions are continuing and will certainly continue.

Also, lastly, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to thank all the members of the Standing Committee on Finance and particularly members that serve on Vote 3.

I want to thank also the HOD, Mr Zakariya Hoosain, together with the senior staff in the Department, and all the members that are seated there at the back, they have done an outstanding job in putting this Budget together. Thank you, Zak, and thank you all the colleagues that are sitting there. And, also special thanks and deep appreciation also to Paul Pienaar. He and his team put all these technical documents and the tables and the annexures together. I really think it is a remarkable piece of work that they have done, and I really want to put on record not only my, but the Cabinet's and this whole Parliament's and the people of the Western Cape's thanks and appreciation for the work and the long hours that you have done. And that also includes

my staff up there in the gallery. Thank you, Nona, you are doing a great job also in communication. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on this Vote. We will now suspend business and we will resume again when the bells will be rung. We will try and save some time and come back any time between quarter past one and two o'clock. Maximum two o'clock, and we might even start earlier, but the bells will be rung to indicate when we start. It all depends on the availability of the next department. Thank you. The House is suspended.

[Business of the House suspended at 12:11 and resumed at 13:31]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seats. The Secretary will read the Third Order.

3. Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism – Western Cape Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of this Legislature, heads of departments, the staff of Economic Development and Tourism, citizens of the Western Cape, business leaders, entrepreneurs and job seekers:

Mr Deputy Speaker, in 2014 the people of the Western Cape entrusted us with the task of creating a vibrant economy in which they can participate to meaningfully improve their lives. And whether this participation is in the form of getting up every morning to go to work or learning a new skill, or building a business that creates a livelihood for themselves and others, our task has been to ensure that these endeavours are possible.

In the past year our economy has encountered considerable challenges ranging from the impact of the drought to Avian influenza and it has felt the knock on effect of the instability of our national politics, both the rand and the South African brand have taken a knock. But, I am proud to stand here today and say that because of our concerted efforts at building an economy that is diverse and resilient, more people in our province are able to get up and go to work each day. This is due to the enabling environment that we have created in our region which has given the private sector the confidence they need to invest and also to the programmes we have put in place to help grow start-up businesses, cut red-tape and to nurture the young. Technical minds that will help build our future.

The drought has forced us to think about resilience. Mr Deputy Speaker, Cape Town has become the model for international best practice in water saving as we more than halved our water consumption when we implemented the 50 litres per person per day limit. Perhaps what I must also say to the members of this House and those that are listening to us out there, that of course, we have to continue doing this way into the rains of this winter

because if we do not do that we are going to have a similar problem next year again, and hence of course, the 3-day T-shirt, although it is a blue one today, a new one, so you are all lucky it is Day 1.

Businesses have also played their part. Yesterday, Sea Harvest in Saldanha Bay opened their desalination plant. Also in Saldanha, Oceana is developing their own desalination plants. In tourism, Tsogo Sun and the V&A Waterfront and many others have also made investments into the water economy or into their own resilience with regards to their own water supplies. These companies are investing in their own resilience and at the same time relieving stress on our water system. They are also at the forefront of kick-starting our new water economy.

All of this reinforces our belief that saving water will help to safeguard jobs. Our number one aim has always been to create jobs and the latest jobs numbers reflect our efforts. The most recent job statistics released by Stats SA show that the Western Cape has the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa which at 19,5% is 7,2 percentage points lower than the national average.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Great stuff!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: This is because in everything we do, we have not allowed ourselves to lose sight of why we do it. [Interjections.] Giving the hard

working people of the Western Cape the opportunity they deserve to live better lives. Since we came into office in the Western Cape in 2009, 598 000 more people have jobs in this province. The number of people employed in the province increased by 106 000 on a year-on-year basis between the fourth quarter of 2016 and the fourth quarter of 2017.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the latest Bureau of Economic Research data, released last week, shows that business confidence in the province has improved dramatically, moving from 35 index points in December to 50 index points in March. This level of confidence has not been seen in our economy since 2016. This despite a once-in-four-hundred-year drought which has cost our agricultural sector R5,9 billion and which has challenged our tourism establishments to rally together with a strong message to maintain our visitor numbers.

The Western Cape remains open for business and there is a lot to be confident about in our economy. Tourism GVA grew by R2 billion or 11% year-on-year. That is 11% when South Africa has really been battling to find one per cent growth in our economy. This between the third quarter of 2016 and the third quarter of 2017 and we have created more than 26 000 jobs in the sector since the inception of Project Khulisa.

International, regional and domestic arrivals at Cape Town International have all shown growth between December 2016 and December 2017 despite fears of a decline. These numbers are boosted by the sterling work of the Air

Access team which has managed to grow the number of inbound seats into Cape Town Airport by 700 000 since their inception in 2015. This year alone Air Access has secured new routes with three airlines, six route expansions and connected Cape Town with four new destinations, all of which are said to add an additional 106 000 inbound seats. It is estimated that these new routes introduced this year alone will create an additional direct tourism spend of R620 million and it is only March.

I must thank the partners who have been involved in this initiative, it could not happen without partnership and specifically the funders, the City, tourism, both in the City and at Wesgro housing this, National Tourism joining us as well. But of course the other partner is ACSA, our airport and two nights ago our airport, for the third year in a row, won the best airport in Africa award once again. And this despite these increased numbers. So they deserve massive congratulations. [Interjections.] Yes, I do. Yes, I do and we work very well with them [Interjections.] And in this programme so is South African Tourism a national entity [Interjections.] and we work very well with them as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They are the one entity that has not been soured by Zuma for the last ten years. We are delighted, Mr Deputy Speaker, that President Cyril Ramaphosa ...

Ms P MAKELENI: Your President.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes, he is our President.

An HON MEMBER: Our President.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: President Rhamaposa highlighted the importance of growing tourism in the country ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order members.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will start again. You can carry on, I have got lots of pages here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order allow the Minister to speak.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are delighted that President Cyril Ramaphosa highlighted the importance of growing tourism in the country as a path towards creating more jobs. This has been at the heart of our Project Khulisa economic strategy for years and we are eager to share our insights and lessons with him. We are also pleased to have Minister Derek Hanekom

back in the driving seat of this crucial portfolio. Minister Hanekom has expressed an interest in improving safety at our key tourism safety sights and we look forward to collaborating with him in making improvements in this space.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Partnerships between all spheres of government and the private sector are crucial in driving growth. One of our plans to grow tourism in the province is by focusing culture and heritage tourism. To this end we have launched our Madiba Legacy Project. This project will trace former President Nelson Mandela's footsteps in the province and encourage tourists to follow them. In 1997 when he received the Freedom of the City of Cape Town, Nelson Mandela said:

“Cape Town's greatness not only lies in its contribution to our economy but in its involvement in our country's history.”

It is time that we share this history with the world. In the coming year we will honour former president Mandela through the creation of a public showcase of his life and the struggle against apartheid. We have chosen Cape Town City Hall specifically as it is where Madiba made his iconic first speech after his release.

†Die PREMIER: Mooi!

[The PREMIER: Good!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, and I am just trying to see if our artists are here. Excellent. Artists Xhanti Mpakama and Barry Jackson have been commissioned by the heritage experts of Koketso Growth to create a celebratory artwork of his image which will be unveiled this year as part of the Nelson Mandela Centenary Celebrations.

This work is being undertaken in collaboration with the City of Cape Town and The Nelson Mandela Foundation. Thank you very much for what you are doing in creating this iconic piece that is going to be the anchor or the centre-piece of this new route celebrating and honouring Nelson Mandela.

[Applause.]

It is no secret that I am an avid cyclist, Mr Deputy Speaker, but my passion extends beyond just being in the saddle because cycling has the ability to contribute sustainably to tourism and our economy, especially if you look at a study in Oregon in 2012 that showed that cycle tourism generated \$400 million for the state. It is estimated that in Germany, 10% of tourism revenues come from cycling tourism, which is why last year we launched the Cross Cape Cycle Route which takes riders on a journey through many of our special small towns between Plettenberg Bay and Stellenbosch.

This year we will be launching two new routes taking cyclists on multi-day rides in other parts of our province, growing their economies through tourism and hospitality. But it is not just tourism that is impacted. There is a real need for new skills in the industry ranging from bicycle mechanics to guides. In the new financial year, six young people from Kayamandi will receive training to become adventure guides. And, Mr Deputy Speaker, cycle events in our province add up to R1 billion in this month alone.

Another important part of growing tourism in our region is ensuring that travellers to our destination feel safe. Tourism in our province employs over 200 000 people and it is our responsibility to build our city and province's reputation. We must face this important fact head-on to protect and grow employment in this crucial sector of our economy. We share the concerns of our residents and visitors about safety in the Table Mountain National Park, which is managed by a national entity. We are focusing on safety with renewed energy. We have budgeted a R1 million for safety and security initiatives which include pro-active communications campaigns. We have identified Table Mountain National Park as a hotspot and we are building partnerships with SAPS, the NPA, the rangers in the park, docks, the communities that surround the mountain, the users and we are doing this all to build that partnership to ensure safety.

Mr Deputy Speaker, recently it emerged that a sophisticated syndicate of criminals was targeting tourists using ATMs in the Cape Town CBD. The information emerged via a task-force created by Provincial Government

specifically to investigate the issue after it was raised by concerned hospitality establishments. The task-force includes the Cape Town Central Improvement District, the police, the City of Cape Town's law enforcement, the Provincial Department of Community Safety, Cape Town Tourism and the representatives of the hospitality industry, banking and fraud investigators and the National Prosecuting Authority.

We put this partnership together and the Department of Community Safety deployed 14 officers to seven ATM sites in the city between 15 December and 15 January. DEDAT supplied funding to keep them operational from January through to the end of February. During this three-month period members of the unit were able to stop 17 such incidences from occurring. The Department will once again be rolling out the ATM Fraud Prevention Project in the coming year in collaboration with docks and the CCID and the partners that I have mentioned. 50 trained students from the Chrysalis Academy will now be helping with this project as well. Thank you very much Minister Fritz.

DEDAT has committed an annual amount of R1,26 million towards this initiative ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will monitor that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I am glad you will monitor it. It is already showing massive

success. The people who work in our tourism and service industries have an important role because they are our marketers and the front-desk of the province [Interjections.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sorry, MEC. Continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you. Last year we rolled out our Journey to Service Excellence programme in Saldanha Bay and Langebaan, after piloting it in Clanwilliam in 2016. Through the J2SE as it is called, we offered hospitality training to locals from all sectors and we awarded businesses for service excellence. The overall winner for this year's intake, Mike Killian, is a true tourism ambassador. From his post at a Total service station in Saldanha Bay, he provides a warm †Weskus [West Coast] welcome that our tourists deserve and we are extremely proud of the example he is setting for the region.

Mr Deputy Speaker, tourism is just one of the legs that our Project Khulisa initiative aimed at growing the economy and creating jobs. In 2014 we set ourselves a target of growing jobs in agri-processing by 100 000. We met that target in 2016. However, this sector has been exposed to both Avian influenza and the drought and has subsequently seen the shedding of some of these gains.

Despite this we are still showing a net gain of 37 370 jobs in agri-processing and 60 000 primary agricultural jobs. Through Project Khulisa we have

managed to mitigate some of these negative effects of the recent natural and disease-born disasters on this sector although there is much more to be done. The impact of the drought on agriculture is currently estimated at R5,9 billion. Its devastation is undeniable.

In my Agricultural Department Budget speech next week, I will discuss the programmes that we have put in place to alleviate pressure in the short-term and safe-guard ourselves against the threat of climate change in the long run. But, the drought also presents us with a unique opportunity to stimulate a new economy in our province, driven by the private sector which is centred around preserving this important resource. The growth we have seen in private sector water saving services and technology has been nothing short of incredible and has shown the innovative, adaptive and responsive nature of our economy and its entrepreneurs. These new services and technology are backed up by the services offered by our Drought Economic Workstream which is supporting businesses to understand their consumption patterns, recognise potential saving opportunities and finally to augment their own water supply.

Our partnership with GreenCape in offering these services has been instrumental. They have directly assisted 563 businesses with advice on water-related matters. In the next few weeks they will be launching their 2018 Market Intelligence Report for water and energy services and renewable energy and waste. Dedat contributed R5,85 million towards this work which was supplemented by an additional R2,55 million for the further work in the

water sector in January. This support has helped leverage more funding and has allowed the facilitation of R1,2 billion in green economy investments for the financial year.

Mr Deputy Speaker, despite the massive shift in focus brought about by the unprecedented water crises we are facing, GreenCape has continued its other important work, most notably the Green Economy and waste sectors. As a result of their hard work, the National Minister of Trade and Industry has announced that the designation of the Atlantis Special Economic Zone will take place in this financial year. So far R680 million in private sector investments have already been made and there are at least five potential investor applications to hand which we are currently busy processing.

We are especially proud of this team for being announced as the runner up in the Circular Awards which were held in Davos this year at the World Economic Forum. The award was for their work in the waste economy for an industrial symbiosis project through which the waste materials of one business are recycled for the use in the manufacturing process of another and for this, to both Dedat, who links through to GreenCape, and the GreenCape team, my heartily congratulations, well done. A silver recognition globally is outstanding. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Well done!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, in addition to the strong role it has played in bringing more tourists to our shores, our partner, Wesgro, which is the Western Cape's official investment trade and tourism promotion agency, has also done sterling work in securing investment and landing trade deals.

In the past year they have secured a total of 20 investments with an estimated value of R3,3 billion resulting in the facilitation of 1 346 jobs.

The PREMIER: [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Thank you, hon Premier. In collaboration with a host of partners they also launched the Cape Investor Centre, midway through last financial year which has already landed R40 million worth of investment into the province. On the trade promotion front they have facilitated the signing of 80 business agreements with a combined export value of R11,5 billion resulting in the facilitation of a further 1 278 jobs. Wesgro has also played an important role during this drought ensuring that travellers, investors and businesses know that the Western Cape remains open for business.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in our other Khulisa priority areas like oil and gas, we together with the Department of Trade and Industry have invested over R500 million in the development of a core industrial infrastructure at the Saldanha Bay IDZ. The oil and gas and marine sector supported 8 320 jobs in 2016 and contributed R1,3 billion to the province's gross value add. The

Saldanha Bay IDZ has signed a lease agreement with Transnet National Ports Authority in the last month and this is the first step in making the IDZ a reality. [Interjection.].

We are currently focused on providing up-skilling opportunities to meet the needs of investors and we are looking at ways of cutting red tape for businesses in this space. This includes the exploration of a customs control area. Mr Deputy Speaker, our Red-tape Reduction Unit continues to do excellent work ensuring that we are the easiest province to do business in South Africa.

When we established this unit we set ourselves the bold goal of realising R1 billion in savings by 2019 and current estimates show that we are not only on track to meet this target but we will surely exceed it. The unit has now managed over 8 000 cases with a resolution rate of over 85%. Our on-going tracking tool shows that we have already saved businesses R600 million.

They have helped businesses that import eggs and businesses that export boats and businesses all in between. Each and every query resolved helps a business to grow and create jobs or to retain the jobs that they are so vitally important to our residents.

Mr Deputy Speaker, then moving on, globally there is increasing evidence that an apprenticeship-based teaching and learning system is the best way to improve employment opportunities for young people, while growing the

competitiveness of the economy at the same time. In Switzerland, which is number one on the in-set global talent competitiveness index, 70% of young people are involved in an apprenticeship-based learning system.

That is why in 2016 the Western Cape Government introduced the Apprenticeship Game-Changer. By identifying the specific needs of an industry in our province and training young people to meet that demand, we can deal with two of the most pressing problems in our economy, unemployment amongst our young people and skills shortages. Our data at the end of December shows that a total of 6 782 learners registered on the work-based programmes such as apprenticeships since we set our targets in April. Even more importantly these learners are taking part in 62 of the 91 specific occupations linked to the five priority sectors of the Western Cape. We aim to put at least 13 221 young people in similar programmes by March next year and to do this we are focusing on making it easier for business to take on apprentices. Our red-tape call centre is on hand to take queries from interested businesses. Any employer that receives a learner grant from a SETA in 2018 should contact the unit to see how best to get these apprentices on board.

Our Work Readiness Programme will be receiving a R3million boost as we implement the new approach that links employers, SETA's and our funding for a customised work readiness programme which can accommodate 300 young people over the next year. I would like to congratulate some of the really inspiring young people who are all doing our province proud.

ABCD Concepts won the Ikasi Bright Ideas competition. Thirteen year-old, Zintle Masoko, has won a full Tedx Scholarship and Thula Myandi has been accepted into the Spier Arts Academy Mosaic Apprenticeship Programme. [Applause.]

All of these young people are linked to the Khayelitsha Bandwidth Barn, a township tech-incubator that the Department supports. It boasts 70 tenants, with six hot-desk spaces and over the past year has hosted numerous public events and offered ITC skills training programmes that have reached about 5 000 people. In addition to 142 grade 10 and 12 girls who were trained in the Code4CT Web Development Programme. The Western Cape has set itself a goal of becoming a leading global digital hub. Last year the Savills World Research Survey on tech-cities identified 22 cities that have the potential to lead the world in the global tech-industry and I am proud to say that Cape Town was on this list.

The Fourth Industrial Revolution is upon us, Mr Deputy Speaker, and we need to be ready to respond to this game changing hyper-connectedness. Last year we supported EdTech to set up their first business incubator in Africa, based here in Cape Town. We are partnered with the Department of Education, teachers, the business sector and local start-ups which can be taken through the incubation process with the opportunity to prototype and commercialise their products. We have set aside R2,6 million to drive this initiative in the coming year.

In a similar vein, we have partnered with the Department of Community Safety to address safety concerns through the Securitech Project which aims to bolster safety issues through technology. In 2015, the Western Cape undertook a digital readiness assessment which found that businesses lag in their uptake of technology. In response, the Department is developing a digital online platform to assist SMMEs to access digital tools and resources to boost their tech readiness.

Best of all, when the tool kit launches in the second half of 2018, business owners will be able to do all of this from their cell phones, as we have found that 93,8% of residents in the province access the internet primarily by phone. They will also be able to access the tool kit and the site by using one of our broadband Wi-Fi hotspots.

The cost of internet access in South Africa is still exorbitantly high which is why we are continuing to grow our public access Wi-Fi offering. With Liquid Telecom, the former Neotel, over 300 000 residents have made use of a monthly free allocation of the 250mb of data available at our 178 hotspots across the province over the past two years.

This month we completed the final phase of our Internet Champions Project which trained 332 mostly young unemployed people, who deliver basic mobile literacy courses and assist citizens to locate the use of these public hotspots. In total the project has registered 410 000 people over the two years and a number of champions have moved into formal jobs as a result of their

involvement in this project. And this actually goes quite contrary to the previous debate that we heard from the honourable Opposition saying that the only connection is Government sites for Government. It shows you that this enabling for the population of our city and our region.

According to the Director General of UNESCO, Irina Bokova, analysis has shown that in developed economies 90% of the jobs will require some level of digital skills. Our focus in 2018 will be on providing access to digital skills for our citizens and the project will kick-start in selected libraries and youth cafés. Thank you again, Minister.

In 2015, we established the I-CAN Centre in Elsie's River as a proof of concept for the community based approach in teaching digital skills. So far we can report that there have been over 34 000 visits to this centre, 835 people have completed Dedat funded courses and 34 337 have participated in free courses there, and 1 695 have registered for the Wi-Fi in that I-CAN Centre. [Applause.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, we are looking to roll out this project in other municipalities and so far, I am pleased to say, that Mayor Paul Swart from the Agulhas Municipality has shown real interest. He visited the I-CAN Centre not too long ago and hopefully we will find other Mayors who are keen on partnering with us that we can actually put these kind of access centres across all of our towns, across the province.

Last year we started an exciting new project called I-CAN Play which aims to teach young people new skills through digital gaming. The aim is to establish entrepreneur driven gaming sites in poor communities and at the same time to constructively engage young people in learning new skills. The first I-CAN Play site opened in January at the Khayelitsha Bandwidth Barn and we have secured partnerships with VS Gaming and Lenovo's device sponsors. A second test site will be opened in the coming financial year.

Mr Deputy Speaker, entrepreneurship is one of our key focus areas because of its ability to create jobs and stimulate growth in our economy. The Real State of Entrepreneurship study done last year found that more than half of entrepreneurs in South Africa are young people. Tech entrepreneurs and founder of LinkedIn, Reid Hoffman, once said:

“An entrepreneur is someone who jumps off a cliff and builds a plane on the way down.”

In the past year Dedat has helped over 2 000 small businesses in this province to build their planes by providing financial and non-financial support.

An HON MEMBER: They did not create it.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And they did not create it. One of our projects in partnership with

Pick 'n Pay is helping to turn township spaza shops into independently owned supermarkets. So far we have converted two stores and plan to roll out more in the coming year. At Nozinga Market in Gugulethu 15 new jobs were created upon their opening. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Annual Western Cape Funding Fair in collaboration with Deloitte attracted over 1 000 existing and potential entrepreneurs who were able to engage with about 20 funders.

Our ongoing Investment Readiness Workshop has to date resulted in more than R20 million being raised for entrepreneurial ventures. Our Agri-Processing Supply Development Programme is aimed at increasing business skills and growing the scale and efficiency of businesses. With an investment of R2,5 million we are able to assist 21 businesses. Of these 14 have managed to improve their turnover by a total of R18,9 million, creating an additional 87 jobs.

One of these businesses is Darling Sweets which was started as a side venture with some old fashioned toffee recipes. It has grown to a 500 square metre production facility which employs 21 full-time and 11 part-time staff. The toffee factory which uses butter as one of its main ingredients has also become one of Darling's favourite tourist attractions and I see that some of you were given toffees on your desks [Interjections.]. Those who are speaking after me make sure you put a toffee in your mouth just before you speak. [Laughter.]

But I could go on and on about the projects and programmes that we have

been involved in as a Department and of course, going forward. Some of those, looking back, like the CTICC expansion and helping out the Cango Caves. Looking forward at Palio tourism, innovation specifically, and if any of you are interested in innovation, come to the first Thursday of the month. Innovation will be a focus in the Ministry, right to energy or health tech. There are so many projects and programmes that we are involved in. Mr Deputy Speaker, for the 2018/19 year, Dedat has been allocated a total budget of R433,46 million:

Programme 1 - Administration receives R65,22 million

Programme 2 – Integrated Economic Development Services is allocated R44,5 million

Programme 3 – which is Trade and Sector Development will receive R48,76 million

Programme 4 – Business Regulation and Governance gets R10,8 million and

Programme 5 – Economic Planning will receive R140,85 million

Programme 6 – Tourism, Arts and Entertainment is allocated R54,78 million and;

Programme 7 – Skills Development and Innovation will receive R68,98 million.

This Budget will help create opportunities for residents of the Western Cape to thrive through the development of new skills, the creation of new jobs and the opening of new entrepreneurship ventures. We will open these opportunities by focusing intensively on Project Khulisa and game-changer

goals that we have set ourselves, by partnering with the private sector and other spheres of government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in ending I would like to thank the HOD, Solly Fourie and his team at the Department for their hard work and dedication in making all these programmes possible. They have been a nimble and dedicated team and the outcome of their efforts is definitely evident in our economy.

I would also like to take this opportunity to congratulate Solly, myself, in this forum, for receiving the Gold Award for HOD at the Batho Pele Awards in South Africa. [Applause.] And, Mr Fourie, your whole team and Department receiving a bronze reward as the top department in the country. [Applause.] Thank you very much and very well done. And then, lastly, to my office, who continually support me from early, early in the morning to late, late at night, unrelenting. I want to really thank you very, very much for that dedication that you give to me but also that you give to the people of this province. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer.

†Mnr L H MAX: Gooi kole!

[Mr L H MAX: Throw coals!]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. To the Minister and his Department, good afternoon. I cannot help but mirror the sentiments of

Minister Winde here today because although our job as a committee is one of oversight, I really have to say that this is a good news story.

Let me start with the most recent news that the Minister has announced which was the Cape Town International Airport having received that award for the third consecutive year as Africa's best airport. Now, to put that into context you really have to understand the competition that this airport faces in the whole of the world. [Interjection.] The Skytrax World Airport .. [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Will you be patient?

Mr C M DUGMORE: But you accept that its national.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The Skytrax World Airport Awards, Mr Deputy Speaker, looks at 13 million airport survey questionnaires completed by over 100 different ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... nationalities of airline customers and it covers 550 airports worldwide. It evaluates travel experiences across different criteria including check-in, transfers, shopping, security, departures at the gate amongst others. And I shall reiterate what the Minister has said, is to commend Mr Deon Cloete and ACSA, with their amazing team, for setting a

world-class bench-mark and for maintaining it for so long. And I will explain to you why, hon member. I will explain to you why I have raised this particularly in this speech.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] know him.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I know Mr Cloete quite well, thank you very much. And, then, may we also commend Wesgro, through the Department, for the past years of vigorously driving the Air Access Programme to bring direct flights to Cape Town and in turn drive up the tourism numbers. The numbers speak for themselves, with the 13 new routes and 14 expansion routes and R1,5 million two-way seats since 2015. You have to commend where it needs to be acknowledged and we must do so.

This has resulted in a new record for Cape Town Airport's numbers, resulting in a 20% year-on-year increase in international passengers. So you need to understand the link and the partnership between ACSA and that of Wesgro and that of the Department and the focus of this sector.

In 2016, Mr Deputy Speaker, approximately 1,990,000 international passengers were recorded at Cape Town International Airport. In 2017, this figure increased to a record of R2,3 million international passengers, an increase of nearly half a million. It is incredible stats, and we are only at the starting point and I cannot wait to see the airport's expansion project being completed to really see what the potential for tourism can be in this province.

So tourism as we know is all about visitor experience and convenience of travel. Both ACSA and Wesgro's Air Access work hand-in-hand and that is important to stress here, to deliver on the very two important factors when it comes to travellers and as you can see the results are quite clear to everyone. So the money that this Department puts into Wesgro and tourism as a strategic sector speaks for itself.

You see, Mr Deputy Speaker, with a focused approach and the placing of economic promotion with tourism you do not only see a marked increase in the tourism numbers but you also see a marked increase in economic growth and jobs for the province. And as Minister Winde has previously reported, there has been a remarkable growth in the belly of the aircraft by 38%, I really like those words, Minister Winde, 'belly of the aircraft'. Because in other words, cargo has increased, which shows more opportunities for exports to be made available and this is the knock-on effect.

I must also commend Wesgro for their water-wise portal and the organisers of annual tourist events for completely reducing their water footprint and ensuring complete, almost water neutrality in the Western Cape this year. The Cape Town Cycle Tour, the ABSA Cape Epic, the Cape Town Carnival, the South African Cheese Festival, the Cape Town International Jazz Festival bring close to about R2 billion combined into the Western Cape economy, creating tens of thousands of jobs and they need to be commended here.

Aside from adhering to water restrictions these events actually committed to bringing thousands of litres of water into our province so as not to strain our provincial supply. They have now set an international bench-mark for water-wise tourism in South Africa, a truly remarkable feat of water resilience to sustain economic security.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank Minister Winde for taking up the issue of safety on tourism and tourists. From the spate of the ATM frauds to the safety of tourists along our scenic walks, we must continue to ensure that tourists leave South Africa with a fantastic memory of their journey. Tourism is our rock star. It is a sector that can bring in many low-level skilled opportunities and for the Minister, we must continue to grow this sector, particularly for the youth.

In terms of investment, we welcome the announcement of the Atlantis Special Economic Zone. We have already seen the economic impact in jobs that have been created thus far and so the R1,8 billion secured investment going forward and the work that GreenCape is doing, which will also provide that much needed growth in jobs to an area where a few years ago, was riddled with unemployment.

The recently opened Investment Centre shows clearly the collaboration when it comes to investment which has a positive outcome not only on this province but also on South Africa at large. We, as a committee, have taken the National Council of Province delegates to visit the centre, to engage with

stakeholders housed there and I know that any business can walk into the centre and engage with the most professional staff, who are highly skilled to helping businesses on all levels.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the positioning of the province to becoming the gateway to Africa must remain a key focus. It is right on track with the latest announcement by the President around the African Continental Free Trade Agreement. The agreement by 44 African states reached in Kigali on Wednesday is an opportunity, I believe, good news for the whole of South Africa, which has significantly grown its exports to the continent but it has the potential to do a whole lot more. And we know that this Department, in partnership with Wesgro, has been doing a great deal of work in this space and we look forward to engaging, as a committee, on that African growth story.

We welcome the work that has already been done by the City, by the I-CAN Centre and Bandwidth Barn regarding youth opportunities. The partnership programme that Minister Winde mentioned, the Red Tape Reduction Unit, which takes up calls and answers any questions that employers may have so that they can connect or be connected with young people looking to get on-the-job training, that is really a great idea.

Minister Winde, this Committee has taken a decision to engage far more vigorously on projects and programmes for youth opportunities and so we look forward to really delving more into this space and I think to my

Committee, we have to get out a whole lot more and really see what is going on the ground, because really it is the best way to assess real economic growth.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the agri-processing space is still in its infancy in this province. It can only grow from here on as more opportunities arise. Wesgro have committed, I see, to growing this sector to over a billion in the next five years and we welcome their objective in doing so. They have also identified these key markets that can make the investment numbers a reality of which agriculture, horticulture and aquaculture are some of them. But, it also talks to concept of the Halal Park, where the objective to almost double the Western Cape's Halal market share is being aimed for. So we welcome engaging more in that space.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I always say every year, it is quite amazing to see that such a small budgeted department really can leverage their funds and produce the jobs and growth that they do. And of course it is because of their partnerships with key sectors of the economy, with other spheres of government and particularly with our private sector. Because without them this Department would not be able to achieve on its objectives.

So I am pleased to say that President Ramaphosa is not private sector adverse. And, Mr Deputy Speaker, I cannot fault this Department on the work they do. Under the current economic climate and the latest growth of 106 000 jobs, although it is an upward battle with water and drought posing severe

risk to the growth in this province, we have to commend the work they do.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: So, Minister Winde, I would like to commend that work, the work that your Department is doing for the Western Cape. I must note and commend, in particular as you have mentioned, and re-acknowledge Mr Solly Fourie for his Gold as HOD because I think it speaks directly to the achievements that this Department has received and has attained. His work by National Government does not go unnoticed. To our entities in Wesgro and Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone and your teams of dedicated staff, we also thank you because you are always open to engaging with us. In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA supports Vote 12, the Western Cape Appropriation Bill for the Department of Economic Opportunities and Tourism. I thank you. [Applause]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the absence of our colleagues on the left, I would hope you would be generous and donate those minutes to this side, as you consider it. It is unfortunate the Minister of Finance is not here. I think it is important that we do not allow colleagues to mislead this House or mislead the people of the province as far as the issue of the levy is concerned.

It is not true that the ANC implemented the fuel levy. Yes, there were discussions about it and unfortunately those were different economic conditions and the conditions of the economy of the Western Cape to date are far different, constrained with drought and water challenges which actually are affecting farmers, food security and it is this DA Government that is actually pursuing at this point the discussion to implement the fuel levy.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Mahatma Gandhi said:

“A nation’s greatness is measured by how it treats its weakest members”.

This remains true for the SA economy, especially given its project of democracy to realise prosperity for all. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member?

Mr S G TYATYAM: We have another meeting inside the Chamber. We are busy listening here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. I will keep my eye on that, that the member does not cause a disturbance. Hon member you may continue. Hon member Nkondlo, you may continue. Your precious time is running out.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Okay. What we are committed to raise, as the ANC,

with this DA-led Government, until convincing answers with results can state otherwise, is the lack of deliberate redistributive policies to raise income and welfare of the poor and the most vulnerable in our economy, which is women, youth and people with disabilities who are black and mainly reside in rural and peri-urban areas.

The fixation of economic growth on its own is a reflection of dead thinking in these modern days of economic environment where sufficient evidence abounds to show the weakness of such an approach.

What is extremely disappointing is the regurgitation of the failed [Inaudible.] market fundamentalism that was boldly shouted here in this House by the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, that when one asks if local stakeholders have been engaged on the concept of the Pick ‘n Pay partnership as a mechanism to support local retail sectors, which the Minister was proudly reporting about here, the answer was a loud and bold “this is a free market”.

Interestingly evidence is there in Gugulethu for all to see in the recent attacks and damage to that Pick ‘n Pay shop, when it was caught in the cross-fire of angry local protestors, given the competing interest and demand for housing service delivery. I am sure if this Government could have heeded the call to engage with local stakeholders such could have been avoided, when people understand the logic of certain interventions.

But I must again rebut the Minister for misleading this House in terms of the job opportunities at the Nozinga Shop at NY15, which is exactly what you were talking about, of 15 jobs created there. There are three new jobs, two are cleaners, one is a security guard and the others are people that have been moved from other Pick 'n Pay stores to work there. So, there is nothing like 15 new jobs that have been created there. So you must not mislead this House.

Economic growth must not be viewed as an end to itself but as a means for increasing incomes and well-being of people. Growth patterns matter too, as such growth sees structural transformation within and across sectors of the economy.

We seek to see such leadership from this Department as it relates with identified priority sectors as defined by Project Khulisa. One then asks questions regarding the role played by this Government in its revenue allocation to enable and facilitate economic development once again for those vulnerable in the economy. There is an old known fact that markets cannot provide everything. There is nothing like an invisible hand and as such Government's role in the economy cannot be down-played, especially in developing economies like ours.

We await the study mentioned by the Minister for the 2018/19 financial year to focus on understanding the townships, the small town economy, as they refer to it, the informal economy.

The Chairperson of the Western Cape African Farmers Association, also a fruit farmer, in response to the hon Premier in her SOPA blames this Provincial Legislature as he argues that agri-processing in this province reflects the apartheid economy where there are no black-owned wine sellers, no black-owned dried fruit processors, no black-owned dairy processors, no black-owned fruit processors as the agri-processing is still white-owned.

Hopefully, Minister Winde, you can provide this House with answers to these claims and take responsibility as both the Minister of Economic Development and Agriculture. A recent visit to an [Inaudible.] organisation called Western Cape Caterers also indicated a constraint of small and black caterers experience in the procurement of some departments such as Health and Social Development, amongst others, where a new requirement of strictly Halal has been placed on all specifications for catering RFQs.

One wonders how public procurement can be used to deliberately exclude others let alone the lack of sensitivity in appreciating religious impositions this requirement brings. Whilst exploring Halal market opportunities, both locally and internationally, is welcome, one assumes that market intelligence should exist in this Department to guide the Provincial Department's approach as far as the readiness to roll out, whilst allowing officials of supply chain to unilaterally impose things as policy where they are not.

We await the report that Provincial Treasury and the Premier's Office will share with this Parliament through the Standing Committees on this matter

and action taken since it has been elevated to them.

State procurement is one way to help trigger economic development and realise the social economic objectives of redistributing policies of the state. Whilst this Department does not implement EPWP, the R29 million of integrated grants and the R47 million in the social sector EPWP, how is this used to derive more than the short-term jobs such projects in the EPWP provide?

Also to consider linking those entrepreneurs or potential entrepreneurs in those programmes through enterprising the skills that they acquire. This goes for the plus R106 million of this Department's Goods and Services to help support, in a meaningful way, and create new enterprises through supply development where relevant, as we await the Provincial Treasury Procurement Framework reported here earlier on.

Beyond the red tape information session, hon Minister, how is this Department driving business linkages and also the Skills Game-Changer, which is welcomed with the numbers that you are giving? The training for jobs: have these jobs already been identified or are young people just being placed to be trained and we are awaiting the goodwill of companies to then absorb them? And again are these programmes also trying to nudge and ensure that these young people where interested can once again enterprise their own skills and actually be job creators, than merely looking for jobs themselves?

More than two million in the City of Cape Town are still employing the services of a company found guilty of collusion, even as the Provincial Government approaches the National Treasury to have the cleaning company black-listed as a result of the Competition Commission ruling.

The cleaning company, which is Top n Nos, was found guilty along with Zara Cleaning Services, of price-fixing in a tender submitted to the Department.

This Department is far from optimising its mandate and strategic positioning as a cross-cutting department to help pioneer cutting-edge entrepreneurial strategies and programmes to optimise value from other departments for economic development.

This is done in other provinces and case studies of success abound. As you bask in la la land, do yourself a favour and visit the Provincial Government in Gauteng and they can actually show and demonstrate to you how they have created real value for the local economy.

The contrast between Kayamandi and the town of Stellenbosch is too much. It is really a dream deferred, as Thabo Mbeki indicated in his Two Nations Speech in 1996. This is the same contrast you would find between the Southern Suburbs and Cape Town's Cape Flats and townships. The poverty, unemployment and inequality that defines everyday life in Kayamandi are a legacy of apartheid and present-day deliberate exclusion in Stellenbosch.

The Tourism BEE Act indicates that there is a need to transform the tourism economy by integrating the previously disadvantaged as product owners and customers. Yet, you will still find blacks excluded from meaningful participation in the Western Cape tourism sector. How many wine estates, where you can have your wedding reception, are black-owned? How many shops are black-owned at the V&A Waterfront and how many establishments in Camps Bay are black-owned?

The lodges and hunting industries are one of the most lucrative, a R1 billion industry in the country, yet you do not find any black-owned lodges with conference facilities in the province, nor do you see black-owned hunting outfitters bringing tourists from Texas and Europe who intend spending millions in wildlife resources. [Interjection.]

All these profits are not redistributed amongst the people because they do not own land to conduct these hunting operations and that is why we actually welcome the discussion on the land expropriation which has been proposed by the Chairperson of the Standing Committee. We will be ready, as the ANC, in that debate. [Interjection.]

The SA economy created over 2,5 million jobs between quarter 3 of 2010 and quarter 4 of 2017. Of the net new jobs created, Gauteng contributed 27% while the Western Cape contributed just 19%. The Western Cape economy contributes approximately 13% of SA's national GDP. Consequently, any slowing of economic growth in the province will have a significant impact on

the SA GDP.

The biggest impact thus far has been the effect on employment in the agricultural sector, with the Western Cape having already shed about 84 000 jobs in 2017. Given that many of these jobs are semi-skilled, this will have a significant impact on poor households which also typically experience more difficulty in finding new jobs, even when economic conditions do improve.

A credit downgrade looms for Cape Town and we appreciate the update that the Minister of Finance provided here, but it is very interesting and always presents the double standards of the Democratic Alliance, because when there was an issue of the economic downgrade of South Africa here, instead of considering that approach and actually a mature understanding to engage the credit agencies, all the DA was doing was to go to the papers and create petty politicking so that they could outsmart the ANC.

Economist, Mike Schussler, said a downgrade of the City's credit rating would be dire for the local economy and it would have profound consequences for the whole of South Africa.

The DA's failure to plan and implement a water demand management system earlier has the potential to harm the province's credibility – such negligence.

Any real conversation, Mr Deputy Speaker, with those affected on how such jobs can be saved, but mainly alternative ways to redirect such capabilities,

we are all aware here of a myriad of conversations with commercial farmers on how to rescue, support them financially and otherwise. So what is important is also to engage with the agri-workers to find ways for those jobs to be saved and how they could be redirected in terms of new skills required using the digital economy, as you were mentioning, hon Minister.

Political will remains the bridge between the SMMEs in the province and their ability to meaningfully participate in the economy. This Budget remains a reflection of who the DA is and what the DA is about, a petty party that has no real agenda to change the past, to actually use the blame game to resist and delay any real transformation of the apartheid structure. Shared prosperity and growth must be at the centre of this Department and must reach those that are not well-off.

We cannot speak about equal opportunities for individuals without efforts to alter the circumstances, such as family origins, race, gender, place of birth or social group a person is born into. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, reply?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to thank the participants in this debate, also the work that the Standing Committee has done in interrogating the Budget. Obviously that is part of the process of getting it here to us for this debate, but then of course to finally vote on this

before we start our new financial year.

Again, the Minister of Finance, this is the only province that does that, finalises our debates, our Budget Votes and signs off on our new Budget before the new year starts.

Thank you very much to the Chair of the committee for the role that you play, the points that you have raised. Again, obviously that is what I said but in the Budget speech it was about safety and an Economic Development Department getting more involved in safety; it is because safety is becoming more of an issue for us.

We are seeing it with regard to trying to attract investment into the region and I perhaps also want to use this opportunity, it is something that we do not normally talk about in public, around the safety support that we give and we have actually got a team there, not only just in the Department but we have got, and I must recognise, Cynthia, Neo and Ilse. These are people that are out there day and night, Sunday afternoon, visiting people in hospital, going there, really going the extra mile to give support to our tourists that, you know, either lose a passport or, heaven forbid, end up in some kind of accident or some kind of criminal activity that puts them into a very difficult space. These are the people that go out there and really make a huge difference for our brand and I must thank them. And obviously this is one of those things, through partnership, that we need to look at rolling out.

You spoke about the Free Trade Agreement and, yes, we are the only country that is still left to sign this agreement and, quite frankly, we use this platform again and alongside what you have just said, to call on the President to please, let us sign this thing, let us get some of this free trade going in our region.

If you have a look at the numbers, the trade numbers, we have always focused historically as a core market being Europe but now our biggest trade market of our export products is Africa and this kind of free trade zone or free trade agreement will really, I think, start to boost that economy again, really take it to new numbers.

I think that you also spent some time talking about ACSA, a really good partner, hon member Dugmore, a national entity, in actual fact a global entity. They operate globally in airports around the world. I was lucky enough to be with them in Brazil when they got that contract to run the airports in Brazil. They really are an outstanding company and specifically to the people at the airport, they really go the extra mile and to win these awards that they win, they get voted by the passengers. That is the crux, these are passengers travelling all over the world, 122 countries that take part in this competition and in Africa we come out tops year after year.

But, of course when you mention ACSA and the airport, there is still one issue at the airport and I said that I take my hat off to them in achieving what they do with the growth that we have seen. You know when you have got

extra growth, 20% growth on international arrivals, all these new aircraft coming in, that puts pressure on the system at the airport and we have got investment coming but right now the pressure is on the system.

The weak link at the moment is still our visas and our Home Affairs dealing with it and I am really glad to see that Minister Hanekom has already set the date for the meeting with Minister Gigaba and, interestingly, he says he thinks it is going to be a bit easier in the disclosure this time around because the Minister took a little bit of a sabbatical to go and probably understand some other things in our economy and I am sure it is going to be an easier discussion. I also think that that Minister of Home Affairs does not have the air cover that he used to have before. [Interjections.] He has got a different cover above him, who thinks differently, so hopefully we do sort that out because that is the one area that I think we do have a weak point, but I must again say that ACSA has done amazingly well.

And then of course Wesgro, I saw some more Wesgro people up there but now there are a few left, but to Wesgro again, really great. We spoke about the 38% increase in the underbelly trade. You know we always end up talking about the seats and the tourism side but that trade underneath is growing faster than the tourism seat side and that is very, very important because those are our new companies that we talk about, those entrepreneurs starting those businesses. They are getting their product out to market, the high value product, the Halal focus, getting that good, high quality product to market across the world. It is that underbelly stuff that really is making a very big

difference.

Then with regard to whether the fuel levy was implemented or not; it was a study and of course this Minister in the previous debate spoke about the study and then he was attacked about the study and why on earth are we doing a study and then he pointed out that the first study was done under the then Minister of Finance, Minister Brown.

It was just a study and in actual fact when I came into the Finance post, the study was put on the table but in actual fact in that very financial year the then Minister of Finance, Minister Manuel, actually then implemented that fuel levy, that very fuel levy that we wanted to implement in the province, nationally, and of course then it would not have been a good idea to implement it at the same time. And of course now it is just asking to do that study again just for some clarity. [Interjection.]

Then, you said, economic growth on its own, and I can assure you, if you look through all of these documents, we never talk about economic growth on its own. We always link growth and jobs together because I promise you we cannot just do jobs growth without economic growth. It does not work, it has never worked.

I do understand the risk, and we always talk about it, of jobless growth. And obviously you do not want jobless growth, that is definitely not what we want in our region and that is why you will see that what we choose, the sectors

that we choose to really boost and support, why? Because they have the highest potential for jobs growth, because that is the most important. And we are very proud then of the numbers that we seem to get. And of course the growth does equal jobs because when you see that growth of the airlifts and what that does, the 20% or the 11% local growth, you know, these are all contributing factors to those 598 000 new jobs. Those jobs would not be there if there wasn't growth.

Then, of course you spoke about one of the Pick n Pay stores and of course it was really, really unfortunate that some people decided in their protest to burn down Mzoli's and I mean that is totally unacceptable. Quite frankly, we cannot be doing things like that because the impact that it has on jobs and on businesses. The store right next-door did not burn down but in the midst of all this the door was forced open and of course all the stock stolen and taken out. That is also just totally unacceptable to do that to someone's business. We cannot have that in our system.

I am going to end with the inclusive stuff and specifically what you spoke about; you spent a bit of time on agriculture and I am going to probably answer that next week as well, but I will answer that last on the agricultural companies.

Jobs and demand-led, on the focus areas that we work with, they have definitely got to be demand-led because I think that is one of our biggest problems in South Africa, we have too many skills being produced through

the skills pipeline, whether they be FET Colleges, whether it be universities, whatever skills we are producing, they are not always demand-led. That is why we have these huge numbers of 250 or 300 000 graduates who cannot find work, 800 000 posts that cannot be filled because there is no alignment between the skill and the post. And so everything that we do, we are not focusing on that tertiary space, we are focusing on the artisanal, we are focusing on apprenticeships, we are focusing on those pipelines. That is where we are focusing as a province but it is definitely on demand-led.

Our engagement with business: the Department engages with those businesses, we find out, we need block men, we need chefs, we need – whatever those, then we make sure that we are focusing our support because it does not help going through all of that work and not being able to find a job. That really is soul-destroying and that is why we have to be demand-led.

You mentioned about the cleaning company and the blacklisting; I remember that. The interesting thing for me is that both those companies had substantial fines given to them because what they did was wrong, but I kept on getting pressure from the ANC to say: blacklist, blacklist, blacklist these guys. And I seriously felt, I looked at it and I thought, you know, here are two black-owned companies and they have done something wrong and they got a substantial fine through the legal process and I thought that that fine was sufficient punishment, but why put them out of business totally? Why blacklist them and put them out of business?

Anyway, the process obviously was dealt with through National Treasury way and they were blacklisted, but still I did not feel that that was necessary with having a fine as well. [Interjection.] Yes, but they were fined for doing something wrong and I thought that was sufficient punishment because obviously those businesses are now put out of business. If they employed staff, they were put out of business and, of course, what is more is that they were black-owned businesses. And I would have rather seen support for them post their fine to get them to work. [Interjections.]

Then of course you spoke about the credit downgrade and what happened last time. I am meeting with Moody's and I will let Minister Meyer speak about that but you know at the last downgrade we did two things. One is Minister Meyer and his team pulled in Wesgro, myself and other players and we met with the Reserve Bank because the Reserve Bank Governor said: hang on a second, we need to see what is happening in the Western Cape. And that was very interesting for me, how a Reserve Bank Governor wanted to engage in that way because we had just received a downgrade. The reason that we proactively engaged with Moody's was because they wrote about our risk, the drought, affecting the two main sectors, agriculture and tourism, and it was a proactive engagement.

But when you talk about Cape Town's Moody's report, in actual fact the day that we met Moody's was the day after they put their report out on Cape Town. They had already put it out and it was actually showing the kind of management and leadership that Cape Town had put in place around the

drought and actually commended the City for doing that. So that report is already out.

Then, if we get to the agricultural businesses and jobs, it is difficult, you have got to be careful when you make sweeping statements about black-owned businesses, processing plants, etcetera, etcetera. So I thought what I would like to do, we take black-owned brands to market because we specifically want to see the redress in the system. We want to create an inclusive economy. The work that we do as a department is to change the face of our economy. We need to make sure it is inclusive.

So let me just go through a list of the black-owned wine companies and wine labels that we take to market in China, that we take to market across Africa and they are: Adama, Aslina, Bayede, Blaauwvlei Wines, Cape Dreams, Carmen Steven Wines, Compagniesdrift – and that is not only wine-producing, that is actually an agri-processing plant. The CEO used to be a farm worker, now she is the CEO of that agri-processing plant. De Bos Hand-picked Vineyards, Dorrance, Earthbound, Enaleni Wines, Epicurean Wines, Fairview, Five Reserve, House of Mandela, Isivuno Wines, Jan Harmgat, Cab Wines and Mountain Breeze, Koopmanskloof, La RicMal, Land of Hope, Lathitha Wines, Libby's Pride, M'hudi Wines, Milk Wines, Paardekloof, Poker Hill Vineyards, Remongo Wines, Ses'fikile, Seven Sisters, Sizani Wines, Stella Winery, Stellenrust, Tesselaarsdal Wines, Thandi Wines, Bridge of Hope Wines, Thembi & Co Wines, Township Winery ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thokozani, Bonani Wines and Women in Wine. [Interjections.]
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: So, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are misleading the House. [Inaudible.] the label.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, whether it is wine or whether it is labels, the hon Minister will respond to that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: So, Mr Deputy Speaker, not all of these wine labels own their own farms. [Interjections.] And not all of these wine labels own their own processing plants, not all of them own ... [Interjections.] but, more and more are owning their own farms and their own processing plants as it gets reversed back to the economy. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Because the one thing specifically in agriculture ... [Interjection.] Do you want to hear the list again? Okay. [Interjections.] Because the one problem in agriculture is that barriers to entry are very high because to plant vineyards takes a long time and a lot of investment and the real work the Department does, the team in agriculture, and we will talk about this in agriculture further, is that they help with getting market access to start bringing the brand ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member Nkondlo, you have had your turn.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: And that brand, over time, reverses back. If we go to a company like Compagnesdrift who now reverses back, they are actually buying other farms other than wine farms. They are starting to invest into cattle farming, into cattle ranching. They are starting to invest into other agricultural products, but of course what happens is they were helped initially and they have reversed back and now they are starting to expand because it is much easier from an investment point of view through that process.

And so we will continue to work and support these businesses in making sure that they grow so that we can redress the space in which we find ourselves. We can create a shared and an equitable economy. We will work very hard at doing that and I want to thank everyone that has been part of this debate and

again to the Department for spending their time here. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote. We will suspend for a few minutes to allow the bays to be vacated and the officials to exchange.

[Debate concluded.]

[Business of House paused briefly for clearing of bays.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order.

†UNOBHALA: Ngxoxo-mpikiswano ngeVoti 10 – ezoThutho neMisebenzi yoLuntu – yoMthetho oSayilwayo woLwabiwo-mali weNtshona Koloni.

[The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works – Western Cape Appropriation Bill.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy

Speaker, Chairperson and other members of the Standing Committee, Honourable Members, Head of Department, Ms Jacqui Gooch, and senior officials, visitors:

In addressing this House yesterday, I emphasized that a budget is not simply a random collection of numbers, but is an instrument designed to ensure that a government at any level is able to deliver on its values, aspirations and commitments. As such, the Budget is shaped by these commitments on one hand – but also by emerging realities and emerging needs. One such emerging reality in the Western Cape in recent time has been the change in the availability of water and the impact of this reality on virtually all sections of the economy and across all communities. I will return to aspects of this reality during the course of this speech.

Another such reality is, of course, the existing overall economic context within which the country as a whole is located at the moment. This reality we are less able to lay at the door of environmental and weather considerations and more at the feet of a national government under the leadership of the former President, whose grasp of economic realities was at best, sketchy. His parting gift to the country of having it fund a promise of partial free higher education will have a fiscal impact for many years to come – and not necessarily only the sort of impact he may have had in mind when he took the decision.

Perhaps the macro-economic context to which I am referring is best described

in an extract from the Budget Speech of the then Minister of Finance, Malusi Gigaba, just a month ago on 21 February. In describing the economic circumstances leading up to the tabling of the National Budget he said:

“It would be remiss of me not to acknowledge that last year was particularly difficult for our economy. The year was characterized by slow economic growth, recession, ratings downgrades and heightened concerns regarding the governance and sustainability of key state-owned companies. It goes without saying that the consequences of these economic realities have had to be absorbed by budgets at both national and provincial levels.”

In his Western Cape Budget speech on 6 March, Minister Meyer went to considerable lengths to set out the measures which the Province has been able to take to protect the frontline services mandate, particularly in health, education and social development. These measures are obviously necessary, commendable and right, once again giving the lie to the Official Opposition’s constant denials of the focus of the overall Provincial Budget on the poor. Let me now turn to the overall Vote 10 Budget for 2018/19.

The total amount to be appropriated for Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works – is R7,7 billion. The increase of R180,8 million on the previous Budget is below inflation and of the total Budget R1,7 billion consists of own revenue. Approximately a quarter of the Budget amount is linked to conditional grants. However, as these national conditional grants were

almost without exception cut at source, the Department of Transport and Public Works (DTPW) has augmented these amounts from own revenue.

The Department of Transport and Public Works – in line with other Provincial Departments – operates on the basis of various programmes. The allocations to the 6 programmes within the Department are as follows for the 2018/19 financial year:

- Administration – R197,45 million
- Public Works Infrastructure – R1,808 billion
- Transport Infrastructure – R3,588 billion
- Transport Operations – R1,303 billion
- Transport Regulation – R776,10 million
- Community Based Programmes – R55,79 million

As the DTPW is the implementing agent for both education and health infrastructure in the Western Cape, the Department is scheduled in the financial year under discussion to spend on behalf of these crucial delivery departments the following amounts:

- Education – R1,2 billion
- Health – R478,64 million

These amounts for education and health include funds for capital works and scheduled maintenance. The strategic decisions about these education and

health infrastructure projects remain with those departments and the three departments cooperate, to ensure that their Rands go as far as possible without sacrificing quality and safety standards. In healthy economic times, this would simply be good housekeeping. In the existing tough times, co-operation is essential to service delivery.

It is one of the great challenges facing any government that as budgets shrink and resources are reduced, more and more people are put under financial and employment pressure and demand for government services increases. To meet this increased demand for services and support, any responsible government has to minimise wastage and ensure that every cent is well spent.

Mr Deputy Speaker, having unpacked in broad terms the quantum of Vote 10, it would be remiss of me not to alert this House to two factors, which can and will reduce the real purchasing power of this Budget.

Firstly, the recently announced 1% change to VAT has significant implications for the DTPW - a department which devotes a considerable amount of its budget to supply chain transactions – transactions which attract VAT. The estimated impact of the 1% change is in the order of R51 million – not an inconsiderable amount, seen against the needs of the population of the Western Cape.

Secondly, the widespread water limitations will further reduce in real terms the disposable Budget of the Department as reduced water consumption and

water sales begin to have a negative impact on the income of many municipalities. In cases where these municipalities have to increase property rates and service charges to compensate for the loss of income, there will be implications for the DTPW as the Department responsible for rates and charges on provincial properties. Water is also an essential component in construction and road building.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Minister Meyer has correctly stressed the importance of investment in public infrastructure for the provision of services, as well as for underpinning economic growth and providing jobs. The Budget amounts I have already referred to for Public Works and Transport infrastructure as well as education and health speak for themselves. The proper development and maintenance of infrastructure needs to be understood as critical in leveraging the potential of a country and in securing effective, efficient and fit for purpose service delivery. While new assets are obviously required to support growth, considerable resources must be invested in maintaining the existing infrastructure portfolio and renewing it where necessary. A Brookings Institute report puts the overwhelming logic of proper maintenance simply in three rules, as follows:

1. Poorly maintained infrastructure increases costs.
2. Maintenance is an investment with a very high rate of return.
3. Deferred maintenance makes fixing later more expensive and is a genuine debt burden on future generations.

In this regard it is instructive to look at the total replacement costs of two classes of assets for which the DTPW is responsible, as follows:

1. Road network – replacement cost of R102,8 billion.
2. 8.3 million square metres of property portfolio – replacement cost of R105,8 billion.

Together just under R250 billion.

My Department has over a number of years applied the principle of the importance of maintenance to our road network and more particularly to that part of the network which carries the overwhelming flow of traffic. This approach has paid dividends time and again. The cost of having to replace any infrastructure instead of maintaining it to lengthen its useful life, is simply short-sighted economics. Where new investment is made in the road network, it is usually where it best supports economic growth.

A full list of planned road and other infrastructure projects over the MTEF is, as members will know, available in the Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure – the so-called Blue Book.

Mr Deputy Speaker, while on the subject of the sensible use and preservation of our assets, it is also encouraging that the findings of our latest Property Efficiency Report show continued improvement in our utilisation of both owned and leased-in property used by the Western Cape Government. The

performance matrix analysis, analyses efficiency, quality and the environment in which the building operates by concentrating on cost, consumption of natural resources and space utilisation.

While time does not allow me to unpack the significant data in this report, it is informative to table a few trends as follows:

1. Workspace use efficiency has increased by a further 7.6%
2. Energy consumption is down by a further 6%. Overall consumption in our Government used buildings, is 158 kWh per square metre per annum as opposed to a private sector average of 246 kWh per square metre per annum. This is indeed significant.
3. Water consumption is down by a further 20%. Here I must stress that this decline in consumption predates the introduction of further reduction measures associated directly with the current water situation, which other budget debaters have alluded to in this House.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as Minister of Transport in this Province, it would be remiss of me not to refer to the continued abysmal and dangerous rail commuter service provided to the residents of the Western Cape – and particularly of Cape Town – by the National Government through its state-owned entity, PRASA. Members will be aware of the ongoing governance challenges, which have developed over time. Hardly a week goes by without media reports of further dubious procurement deals, board-level clashes and management instability. I will now be working with the third National

Cabinet Minister of Transport in a space of 6 months.

PRASA continues to be governed by an Interim Board and although there has been a call for nominations to a new PRASA Board, the closing date for such nominations is such that this new board will be appointed only after yet another interim board is put into place for a further period. This does not bode well for the 600 000 commuters reliant on a safe, dependable service. I must emphasise that my Department has assisted Metrorail Western Cape and PRASA in every way legally possible over the last few years to stabilize and improve services.

In this regard, members will find in Vote 10 a provision of R16 million to be transferred to the City of Cape Town in the new financial year, as the Province's share of the costs of an agreed-to rail safety security initiative involving the Province, the City of Cape Town, PRASA and the Cape Town Chamber of Commerce. As Minister of Transport, I will be chairing a working group of these various entities with the intention of supporting a PRASA turn-around strategy aimed at improving the safety, reliability and cost of the rail commuter service – a service that is essential to the wellbeing of hard working and often poor residents of this province.

Given the technical and practical nature of much of the work of the DTPW it is entirely appropriate that it continues to implement the National Youth Service (NYS) Programme, aimed at unemployed youth across all regions of the Western Cape. The Department has invested significant resources in

addressing shortages in critical and scarce skills in construction related trades. The Department continues to train and to test Red Seal Artisans in electrical and welding trades. This strategic intervention forms part of the Western Cape Apprenticeship Game-Changer.

In addition, during the 2017/18 financial year the Department trained 216 unemployed youth over a 12-month period in various learnerships, such as:

- Plumbing
- Carpentry
- Electrical wiring
- Masonry
- Welding
- Road Works

In 2018/19 financial year the National Youth Service Programme will be in its 10th year of implementing skills interventions in the Western Cape. The NYS Phase 10 commenced in February 2018 with 210 learners across the Western Cape in the following trades:

- Air-conditioning and Refrigeration (Eden)
- Plant Operator (Eden)
- Welding (Cape Winelands/Metro)
- Masonry (Cape Winelands /West Coast/Overberg/Metro)
- Carpentry (West Coast/Overberg)

- Electrical (Central Karoo/Metro)
- Plumbing (Central Karoo/Metro)

The Western Cape DTPW Skills Development Programme was recognised by a runner-up award at the National Achievers' Awards in the category Best Public Service Programme. Well done to the Department.

Then, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is the Masakh'iSizwe Bursary and Professional Development Programme working together to address skills shortages to drive economic growth through infrastructure development, whilst creating a conducive environment for training and development of youth. The underpinning concept of these programmes is empowerment of financially disadvantaged youth through access to tertiary education and providing a coherent package of support that puts bursars in an advantaged position to perform academically and to obtain experience, employment, and attain professional registration with the respective statutory councils. The DTPW is proud to report that in this way 16 graduates have been placed within the Department for professional development. It is an outstanding achievement. Well done.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we are approaching a number of public holidays and long weekends. These are well-deserved breaks for many hardworking people – but they are also times of risk and danger for road users. These risks are often aggravated by the irresponsible actions of some who choose to drive at excessive speeds, when tired and after having consumed alcohol.

The Western Cape Provincial Traffic officers will implement an Easter and Freedom Day long weekend traffic operational plan, aimed at reducing fatalities, crashes and injuries and improving the safety of road users and pedestrians.

The Western Cape remains the only province in which this operational programme is implemented on a 24/7 basis. While details of the operation will be announced at a media event on 29 March, aspects have already been implemented and I want to appeal to all road users over this period to exercise restraint and to act responsibly within the law. I also want to thank our officers for the additional time sacrifices they will make during this period.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in closing I should like to thank my Cabinet colleagues and the members of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works and the leadership of the Premier. And thanking also our excellent HOD of my Department, Ms Jacqui Gooch, and her staff, some of whom are present here this afternoon. I want to add my congratulations on the various high-level awards, which she individually, with the Silver medal, and the Department, collectively with a Bronze, have received as a Department truly in the service of the people.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Yes, thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is with great pleasure that I stand in this august House in support of the Appropriation Budget Vote 10. This financial year the Department has been allocated R7,7 billion to lead in the delivery of Government infrastructure and related services.

I have no doubt that, with the history of the Department's previous successes in mind, this will be the sixth consecutive year that this Department celebrates clean audits. Mr Deputy Speaker, the first programme is Administration and just over R22,3 million has been allocated for 2018/9 Financial Year. The Administration programme ensures that this Department implements a number of programmes to service delivery and infrastructure that improves the socio-economic outcomes and creates a safe empowerment and empowered connected communities.

The Standing Committee conducted an oversight visit to Atlantis and we saw the number of schools that have been delivered for the benefit of accessible and quality education to the kids around the area, a school like Parkview. The Standing Committee on its oversight visit was pleased. Wesfleur Primary was also visited by this Standing Committee to check that a quality service delivery is being implemented, is enjoyed by the communities. The Standing Committee was pleased by the work well done by the Department

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, what was not considered by the Standing Committee is that there are a number of infrastructure developments that need to be done

by the Department at other schools. We also visited a school in Philippi called Kwa-Faku. The Standing Committee was not pleased by what it witnessed there, with kids exposed to asbestos, TB and the quality of the environment at the school was not conducive to quality education.

This is one of the issues that the Standing Committee raised with the Department, and we believe that something is going to be done with the infrastructure deliverance programme. The DA in the Western Cape, shows, with its programmes, that where it governs, it governs better. Administration is only one contributing factor to how the DA governs. When driving around South Africa, it is clear that the provincial governments in other areas are left far behind compared to what is being done in the Western Cape.

The DA-led Government recognises and takes the necessary precautions to ensure that our roads are continuously resurfaced and preserved and where necessary, builds new bridges to prevent traffic congestion. This year, R3,2 billion has been allocated to this infrastructure. Various initiatives such as the upgrading of roads from gravel to surface standard and the improvement of dangerous locations are also important in decreasing road fatalities and improving the road safety.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I commend the Department as well for increasing its spending on provincial roads by almost R200 million over the next three years. This Department infrastructure is supported through the annual Road Asset Management Plan (RAMP), which maintains provincial roads and

outlines plans and current investments for the road network. Our commitment to improving our roads, through our proper Budget, underlies why the Western Cape Government roads outshine all other provinces.

This is made possible by the third programme, Transport Infrastructure, which has been allocated over R3,6 billion this year. Deputy Speaker, the Department [Inaudible.] Programme, Public Works Infrastructure, has an allocated Budget of almost R2 billion. With this programme the Department is committed to accessible and inclusive infrastructure and that is welcomed. This is demonstrated by the Department setting aside over R6,6 million for infrastructure related to the persons with disabilities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, allow me to focus particularly on the next two programmes. There is a public outcry against the current Metrorail crisis, which affects the majority of Western Cape residents who commute to and fro, using the services. If it is not yet clear why the DA governs better, and why our Budget is proper, then let me put this to you. The fourth programme, Transport Operations is allocated over R1,3 billion. Through it, the Provincial Sustainable Transport programme will be implemented to maintain and sustain public transport and improve public access. This will aid the poor majority who rely on public transport in the province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, just compare the DA-led Western Cape MyCiti Bus services with the state asset entity Metrorail under PRASA: whilst Metrorail can barely keep its central line open, MyCiti, with two express routes

between Cape Town Central, Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain have nearly doubled in the past two years, with more than 200 journeys recorded in November 2017.

Whilst the ANC is failing its residents in keeping its promises, the DA delivers. We also need to inform our communities that these MyCiti buses and infrastructure are being provided and should be used. It is not reasonable and rational, because any so-called poor service delivery, that communities ventilate their anger by destroying assets that are meant for them. That is very irrational. You cannot burn your house because you are having a problem with rats in your house.

This DA-led Province has championed the Western Cape Provincial Road Traffic Administration Amendment Bill, which aims among others to improve road safety. This constitutes the fifth programme, Transport and Regulation, that has been allocated over R810 million. We cannot rely on the National Government alone to make our roads safe as that government is inept and unable to even manage to find back logs. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, these two programmes demonstrate how well the DA-led Western Cape Government manages its own transport programme. This Government prioritises transport maintenance and road safety. That the [Inaudible.] is managing the province's transport is reason enough for why Metrorail should be put under the province's mandate and then taken out of the ANC maladministration and poor service delivery, because where the DA

is in government it governs well.

If Metrorail was under the Department's mandate in the Western Cape, residents in the Western Cape would not dread their commuting to work, but rather feel safe and assured that they would reach their destination on time. Not to mention that Metrorail's failure has congested our roads as its passengers have dropped by 50% from over 675 000 passengers in 2002 and [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr N E HINANA: ...an estimated 260 000 in 2017, as they are now forced to use taxi's and their own vehicles to get to work. Mr Deputy Speaker, I need to emphasise as well that the responsibility for the failure of Metrorail is that Metrorail cannot rely on the police to provide them with safety. They need to have their own police enforcement so that they guard their asset, they guard their commuters, so that vandalism, theft and damage of property is secured. But, it cannot be solely and exclusively the responsibility of SAPS. Seeing that we are having a problem with SAPS too maybe they should fall under the Western Cape Administration. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA in the Western Cape strives to empower and all of its communities. The final programme is the Community Based Programme and it is allocated over R62,7 million. Not only does this Department promote inclusivity by recruiting female contractors for construction, but the

construction industry itself supports sustainable economic and employment growth by encouraging skills and training programmes.

Last year alone, the DA in the Western Cape provided over 37 000 work opportunities. This year we will top that number and provide over more than 40 000 opportunities. This is testament to the DA's ability to deliver infrastructure and services that are proper, as they improve socio-economic outcomes and safety. Where the DA governs, it governs better.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA governs better, reprioritising the Department's Budget in this programme where it has helped respond to the current drought and economic climate. This approach is necessary as there have been budget cuts by the ineffective National Government to reduce the sustainability of the above DA-led programmes that are successful.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, I fully support this Budget and would like to thank the Department, the MEC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order. Hon member Lekker. Hon member Lekker, please. Contain yourself.

Mr N E HINANA: I fully support this Budget, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I would like to thank the Department, the MEC, HOD and the staff for their hard work, which has delivered a transport system inclusive of the provincial and road [Inaudible.] network and necessary social and economic

infrastructure needed to improve the lives of all those living in the province. As I said, we support this Budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. You may continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, one would notice from the report on the deliberations of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works, on the Budget for the 2018/9 year, that the ANC has recorded its objection to this Vote. This was not done because we believe that the Department has been prejudiced in the allocation of just over R7,729 billion to Vote 10. It is clear that the Western Cape allocations from National Treasury for infrastructure were not punitive, but they were consistent with cuts in all other provinces.

Mr Deputy Speaker, our objection in fact, is based on the fact that we could not find, either in the Annual Performance Plan or in the Budget itself, examples of a genuine commitment to use the resources allocated to this Department to advance the transformation redress and inclusive growth agenda that our province actually needs.

This Department is not only about Transport and Public Works. It is also about property management. This portfolio is about how the province utilises the property portfolio, both land and buildings, to advance redistribution and redress.

If one wants to find an example of how the Democratic Alliance is unwilling to advance transformation and redress where they govern, one needs to look no further than the 2018/9 Annual Performance Plan of this Department. You will not find a coherent plan to use provincial assets, to effect redress. Instead we have the cherry picking of a view sites, like the former Conradie Hospital as an example of a so-called “Better Living Model”. So many announcements have been made as to the commencement of this project and just as many deadlines have been broken in regard to the commencement of this project.

Mr Deputy Speaker, ever since the resolution of the ANC’s National Conference at NASREC, which called for the expropriation without compensation of land to be used as one of the mechanisms to implement land redistribution in a manner which does not impact negatively on food security and the agricultural sector, the DA has tried its best to resist and undermine this resolution of the African National Congress. [Interjections.]

One of the arguments they have used and it relates to this Budget, is that they support the South African Constitution and that all initiatives regarding land redistribution should be implemented in terms of the South African

Constitution and this, Mr Deputy Speaker, is where the DA hypocrisy stands exposed, because our Constitution and this also impacts on the Annual Performance Plan, calls for a law of general application to govern the expropriation of property in South Africa, which affects properties in the Western Cape as well. And the National Department of Public Works initiated a process as far back as 2015 to pass a Bill which would guide expropriation in our country and as a Standing Committee we were part of conducting public hearings in our province.

Now just as the majority of those at the public hearings on the Children's and Environmental Commissioner supported setting up these commissions, both of them, the Environmental and the Children's Commissioner,, also, those that attended the public hearings on the Expropriation Bill, which impacts on our province, supported the need for an expropriation bill at that time. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, it was the MEC's party, the DA, that objected to the Expropriation Bill then, when the issue of expropriation without compensation was not even on the agenda.

So, it is clear that the DA was then and is still now opposed to any attempts to implement the redress provisions of our Constitution. They made every effort to oppose and delay the passing of the Expropriation Bill, which would have assisted us in the province even when the principle of expropriation without compensation was not on the agenda. It is this fight back and resistance to transformation which actually exacerbates land hunger and frustration in our country.

Now we see that the DA has resorted to typical “*Swart Gevaar*” tactics in its attempt to instil fear and anger against our ANC Government’s attempts to advance and deepen the transformation agenda through land redistribution. Just before the registration weekend, the DA sent out millions of SMS’s which we did not ask for, which said, “ANC and EFF working together ...” and these are the words – “ ... to take all private homes and land. You can only stop this if you are registered.”

Just like Tony Leon’s Fight Back Campaign, essentially code for Fight Blacks, [Interjections.] this campaign was a blunder by the DA, because as in our province, when we look at this particular Annual Performance Plan, the majority of South Africans understand the need to implement the redistribution of land and attempts to whip up fear and anger will work for a while in the short term, but they will fail to stop the renewal and transformation project of the ANC.

When voters vote in 2019, they will have a clear choice. Either to vote for the ANC and ensure transformation of our society, which will ensure less inequality, greater ownership of the economy by the black majority, and greater prosperity, or vote for the DA and reverse transformation and to protect apartheid acquired privileges. That is what the choice is about and unfortunately this Annual Performance Plan does not indicate to us, in any way, that there is a move to seriously redress and to use the property portfolio of this Provincial Government to advance transformation.

Now we as the ANC are committed to accelerating and consolidating the processes of economic transformation and land reform and wasn't it ironic, Mr Deputy Speaker, that when our colleague, comrade Nomi Nkondlo raised the issue of ownership of wine farms, which also applies to this portfolio, obviously the MEC for Agriculture was prompted with a series of SMS's about all these wine labels and that is essentially the difference between the transformation agenda which the ANC talks about, ownership of land and property whereas what the MEC of the DA espouses, is one where it is sufficient for black people to own labels, but not actually to own the means of production themselves and that has come out very, very clearly. [Interjections.]

So, the Expropriation Bill which impacts on our province and on this Vote, and that particular Bill happened at a time when the expropriation without compensation was not yet on the agenda. They are not about punishing white South Africans. This is about the best way to effect land redistribution and correct the injustices of the past and we would expect our province to begin to be proactive in this Department to use our portfolio to effect redress.

The basic narrative is that land reform is a national imperative. We need as a province to unite in seeking solutions to this original sin, the dispossession by colonialism of those who owned the land. Instead of assisting this Provincial Government and indirectly this Department, is actually promoting fear and racism.

The ANC has a historic mission to effect redress and the Freedom Charter remains our guide to this and we will do this responsibly. We are firm in our support for the clause of the Freedom Charter which says:

“South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white, and the land shall be shared amongst those who work it.”

In his SONA address of 2018, President Ramaphosa clearly stated that we are determined that expropriation without compensation should be implemented in a way that increases agricultural production, improves food security, and ensures that the land is returned to those from whom it was taken under colonialism and apartheid. He continued to say that Government will undertake a process of consultation to determine the modalities of the implementation of this resolution. This clearly shows that this will be done in a responsible and a participatory manner.

The DA’s fightback which is clear to see in this Budget and its lack of commitment to using our properties in this province to advance transformation, is to maintain the apartheid spatial development patterns and to spread a message of fear.

The majority of South Africans and I would argue the majority of black and white South Africans, want redress. The majority of South Africans want justice. We need to isolate those who resist transformation and want to pressure, preserve in fact, apartheid’s legacy of spatial planning. We need to

condemn the fear mongers.

The National Development Plan seeks to build a capable and a developmental state as well as to unite all South Africans around the common programme, but this Department and we must acknowledge has identified some of the impediments to achieving the objectives of the NDP and they are outlined in page 6 of the Department's Annual Performance Plan.

They include the lack of growth and jobs, infrastructure development as well as what they refer to as the impact of apartheid spatial development, but by referring to those impediments, Mr Deputy Speaker, and not doing anything in your Budget and in your Annual Performance Plan to deal with that, you are simply entrenching apartheid privileges as a result of the skewed spatial planning.

We expected that at least this Budget would commit to redress some of these critical challenges. Instead we are experiencing the direct opposite, but we are not surprised because it appears to us that the DA is determined to try and resist and chart a course different to that of the need to transform our country.

The sale of land to private developers in our province needs to be investigated, as essentially it amounts to what could be described as another form of state capture. [Interjections.] Here in the Western Cape we have provincial property which could help to redress but the DA has no plan and

political will, but is actually trying to sell our crown jewels, like Tafelberg, to private interests and we have never heard the truth about the DA's relationship with Saul Loggenberg and with Filcon. The Premier and this MEC had never investigated allegations of a conflict of interest regarding the sale of Tafelberg and the role of certain consultants and the private interests which they actually have and how those have impacted on these matters.

It is clear that this Budget continues in fact, in terms of its property mandate to actually preserve the spatial development patterns and preserve the tale of what is essentially two cities: one unequal and poor and one privileged and mainly white. This Budget clearly shows that the DA is against the transformation agenda which the National Government is trying to drive, and it has been made clear to us, through the disposal of prime pockets of land, instead of using those to advance integrated human settlements close to the city which is what one would expect from a developmental state and a Provincial Government in the Western Cape.

It is clear to us that the uncaring attitude of the DA and the attempt to sabotage a genuine attempt to redress dispossession and to implement land redistribution can be seen in the ineffectiveness of the Provincial Property Committee established in 1998.

We heard in our discussions during the Budget Vote and before, that the regulations promulgated in 1998, which guide the work of the Provincial Property Committee have not been updated since 2009. The Western Cape

Land Administration Law requires that this House receives a report annually about provincial properties, their disposal, the plans.

This House, and you would confirm this, Mr Deputy Speaker, has not once since 2009 ever received a report from the Provincial Property Committee. So, what is actually happening here? It appears that there is an attempt to effectively manipulate and control the disposal of provincial property and not be transparent so that the people of the Western Cape can actually participate in how those assets should be used to advance the Redistribution Programme.

We were informed that there is a draft annual report and it is now being edited. The reality is, like the Environmental Commissioner, like the Children's Commissioner, since 2009 there has been a basic defiance of the Constitution and of the Provincial Land Administration Act which guides this particular province. And essentially this is an attempt to undermine national legislation which governs the approach to property where one has to offer property to sister departments, where one has to make sure that in disposing of assets you advance Black Economic Empowerment and effect redress.

So essentially, they have not amended this Land Administration Bill because they are actually resisting the provisions of national law in regard to how property should be disposed of. I think it is shocking that in a budget which is supposed to advance a transformative agenda and to provide, in the words of the DA's so-called equal opportunities, that in effect, one of the prime ways that we could be using in this Budget and in the Annual Performance

Plan to advance redress, is to actually redress the properties by giving ownership to historically disadvantaged people through lease-hold and through development of integrated settlements.

This is not here in this Budget and its very clear that for those reasons, Mr Deputy Speaker, we can never be part of a budget where this state instead of being developmental, in fact, is using property to uphold and preserve privileges inherited by an unjust system of colonialism and apartheid in the past and the fact that we have a Premier who speaks up colonialism, effectively means that it is no issue for the Democratic Alliance to sell-off a property like Tafelberg, which actually kicks sand and treads on the victims of colonialism, who could have actually benefited from using a public resource for integrated housing close to their places of work in Sea Point.

This is essentially the agenda and that agenda was exposed by the way MEC Winde responded to hon member Nkondlo and this content also exposes the actual agenda of the Democratic Alliance as implemented by this MEC for Transport and Public Works. One would talk the language of empowerment, but when it comes to an essential component of economic transformation, which is transforming the ownership patterns of the economy and the land, they would give you a list of labels as opposed to a list of farms actually owned by, sorry to disadvantaged South Africans, who actually were the possessors of this land.

So, for the Democratic Alliance to try and instil fear instead of actually

acknowledging what damage the past has actually caused and being prepared to walk this journey to actually advance genuine redistribution, I think exposes their hypocrisy. So, what we would expect, MEC, is for you to actually announce a clear agenda of using all of our provincial assets to advance the Redistribution Programme.

There are no issues of expropriation if it is a word that you are scared of. Those are properties that belong to this province. There is nothing stopping those particular properties being used to advance this agenda and that is what we actually expect to see from this Department. And up to now, in this Annual Performance Plan we are not seeing such an agenda at all.

What we have also witnessed is that the leadership of MEC Grant is actually very critical when it comes to stabilising the taxi industry. I am sitting here with court papers which have been brought by, in fact the majority of organisations representing the organised taxi industry have had to go to court to try and make sure that the recommendations of the Farlam Commission, which have explained very clearly how the existing taxi structures are not democratic, have been supposed to be constituted in a certain way, and this MEC has failed, in essence, to ensure that the recommendations of the commission that he appointed is actually implemented, and this is contributing to the ongoing violence in the taxi industry.

So, we have the MEC and he is raising a legitimate point which all of us agree round Metrorail and PRASA, but he is failing in the mandate that he

has, to actually stabilise the transport industry. It is clear what the judge said that the way that the current SANTACO in this province is constituted, is not democratic. It has ignored certain basic provisions of the Constitution and the fact that we are sitting here now, and that was September when the violence flared up. We are now sitting almost in April and this issue has not been resolved.

We have seen the emergence of increasing levels of taxi violence over the last couple of weeks and the MEC has failed to actually deal with this particular problem in a proactive way and it is unnecessary that this matter has ended up in court. We expect leadership from the MEC to resolve these issues, working with the associations and those who have been effectively excluded from taxi governance in this province.

I really want to appeal and to say in this House that if the MEC and the Department do not deal with this matter, it is clear that more people are going to die; more commuters are going to be affected by the failure to resolve the governance issues in the taxi industry.

So, the MEC needs to give this House, on the property issue which I have raised, a clear commitment, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we will receive a report on the workings of the Provincial Property Committee. This House will receive a report about what is the plan of this Department, in this financial year, to ensure that provincial properties, both land and buildings, are used to correct the injustices of the past and to effect redress, which is what our

Constitution in its current form says, we actually need to do.

What we are also concerned about, Mr Deputy Speaker, is the ongoing road carnage. It is clear that our province faces a serious crisis in regard to deaths on our roads, pedestrians and road accidents. Often the MEC makes mention of the fact that drivers are not abiding by the rules of the road and sure, everyone would agree that that is where it starts. One has to be responsible and one has to ensure that drivers follow the rules of the road, but we are seeing that there is an insufficient programmatic response to road carnage.

Families are robbed of bread winners due to this problem and yet we see that when we look at this Budget, there is no clear commitment to increasing the allocation and we have previously made arguments as the ANC, that we can find that money in the reserves which has been generated by Government Motor Transport held by the Treasury, to put in more visible law enforcement.

We agree with the MEC that driver behaviour is where it starts. There is no debate about that and we would support those efforts, but what we do not agree with is that this notion that it does not really help us so much to have more visible policing on our roads – there is almost this notion: no, you know, we can do this with electronic surveillance, we can do this by focusing on driver behaviour. That is important but there is nothing that actually helps getting driver behaviour to where it should be, than the visible presence of traffic officers across the province and this Budget clearly does not indicate a

commitment to that pillar which we believe would contribute towards actually helping reducing the number of fatalities on our roads.

For these reasons, Mr Deputy Speaker, we are not able to support this Budget as much as we would like to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired. Hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A point of order?

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr D JOSEPH: Member Dugmore made an unparliamentary statement, Mr Deputy Speaker, by saying that the Premier and the Minister have not declared their interests in Filcon and other private companies. I would like you to check that in the Hansard. It is an unparliamentary statement [Interjections.] It is a false, misleading statement and if he has the facts then he must come forward with that information [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I hear what the member is saying but this

Chair cannot justify and say that is true or not true. So, some other processes must be followed to follow that up.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is why I made the request to refer to Hansard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja. [Interjections.] I do not want a discussion on this thing. This is not for the Chair to decide. You have made a statement and it is a political statement which must be followed up differently.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Could I just ask you ...?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I just want to, for your information and for the sake of the House, I referred to the fact that they had not investigated these allegations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is very clear what I said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.. We dispose of that issue. Minister Minister Grant to respond to the debate.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am critically aware that I stand between this House and the weekend ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Jazz Festival.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Jazz and various other things, so I will be as brief as I possibly can, whilst not abrogating my responsibility in replying to this debate. Let me start off by thanking everyone who participated in it and I am also sad that our friends from the EFF and ACDP are not here today and they have been conspicuous by their absence.

I really want to thank member Hinana and the members of the Standing Committee for their robust oversight over the past year and I am sure that it will continue in the year to come. I also want to say that in looking at the numbers, hon member Hinana, about Rail, whenever I talk at a National or even a City of Cape Town level, I prefer to look at potential in life. And, actually, if we had 120 trainsets we could have up to 1,4 million passengers on Rail and we could substantially reduce the congestion and the economic wastage of people's time and money on congested roads, but we will continue to do whatever we can through our Transport and Rail Safety Task Team to do and look for solutions. Even though that it is a national mandate in the interests of our commuters, particularly our poor commuters.

We simply have to fix Rail by all means possible, including a contribution from the private sector. Then, it was remiss of me not to also thank the Department for their sixth clean audit and in listening to the criticism from the Opposition benches generally, I wish they had been party when we met in the last quarter of last year, to look strategically at our Budget and the year ahead, to see how we can really address and do within our means of providing for what the state needs, particularly in the infrastructure and in health and in social development, where we spend more than 80% of our infrastructure budget on those, which are frontline delivery services.

So, I cannot understand the cacophony of sound from the Opposition benches in the southern part of this House about the criticism of the DA Government, that we are not interested in redressing or basically giving opportunities to the people of the Western Cape. I reject it with contempt.

Then, let me talk about the one thing that I think I should address, the comment that the hon member Dugmore made about the Land Administration Property Act, which actually was promulgated in 1998, not in 2009. So, the big question is, what happened between 2002 and 2009 when they were in charge? And let me also tell you, Mr Deputy Speaker, what we are doing.

We are bringing new legislation to book and we are also looking at the policy in terms of the disposal of our property and when we are good and ready, and it has been properly researched through the normal channels – Cabinet, our caucus, the DA policy – they have not won the election, they cannot tell us

how to govern. [Applause.]

†‘n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And I am sick and tired of their nonsense, and I will always be receptive to new ideas and good ideas, but if things are fundamentally different to our values as a political party and things must not stand in the way of the economic and social development of this province and my Department realises and it is not me, it is our team sitting in that box. They know what the priorities are [Interjections.] and I commend them for the work that they do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: So, Mr Deputy Speaker, in closing I have already thanked my Department in the main part of my speech and in closing I must also thank my Ministry members who are here, sitting up in the gallery, because their contribution is absolutely vital in ensuring high quality team work between the Ministry, the Department of Transport and Public Works and transversally across the entire Government of the Western Cape. So, I want to thank my Ministry and I want to thank the Department and my colleagues and basically recommend this Budget to this House. Thank you. [Applause.]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That concludes the debate on this Vote.

That also concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 15:55.