

---

THURSDAY, 23 AUGUST 2018

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Before we start, may I welcome our various guests in the galleries. We have amongst our guests also some fourth-year Social Work students from the University of the Western Cape and also a matriculant from Brackenfell High School. Most welcome here! Enjoy the debate. Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Do not take what they say seriously. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: May I also at this stage then say that visitors in the the gallery... [Interjections.] Order, order! Our visitors in the galleries are most welcome here but they must please refrain from participating in the debate by way of clapping, interjections or anything of that like. [Interjections.]

Order! I have to announce that due to the resignation of Mr H L Max a vacancy had occurred in the representation of the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. This vacancy has since been filled by the nomination of Ms W F Philander with effect from 15 August 2018.

Ms Wendy Philander was sworn in by the Speaker in the Speaker's Office on 15 August 2018. We welcome hon member Ms Philander in our midst and we wish her well in her new role in the Provincial Parliament. Most welcome here! [Applause.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear! Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I see the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. If there is no objection to that, we will start with the Subject for Discussion in the name of the Chief Whip. I then as the first speaker see the Chief Whip.

(Subject for Discussion)

## **POLICING AND SAFETY IN THE WESTERN CAPE**

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Constitution of the Republic, Clause 198 (a) states that National Security must reflect the resolve of South Africans, as individuals and as a nation, to live as equals, to live in peace and harmony and to be free from fear and want and to seek a better life.

The question is has this sense of freedom and peace been achieved in South Africa and has life changed for the better for all?

Many citizens would dispute this and for those living in the Western Cape there is an increasing sense that we have been abandoned to our own devices in the face of rising crime levels and an inability or unwillingness of the State to counter it.

For a number of years now there has been a growing sense of unease that we are being treated differently as far as policing and crime prevention is concerned and to this end a number of steps have been taken to prove this fact.

The Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry of 2014 requested by a range of

community-based NGOs proved beyond a doubt that policing levels in that vast township were poor and that the people lived in fear and terror in the face of rampant crime and abuse.

Just yesterday the Department of Community Safety briefed the relevant Standing Committee on progress regarding the wide-ranging recommendations of that report. Regrettably several of these relating to the SAPS have not yet been achieved; most notably the submission of the Quarterly Crime Statistics to the MEC and the filling of vacancies, especially of the FCS, which is the Family, Children and Sexual Offences Unit.

Just this week a protest led by learners marched from this Legislature as they felt unsafe, not only in school, but going to and from their homes. For this same reason a group of NGOs has approached the Equality Court about the poor resourcing of police services in the province and the apparent reluctance of the responsible National Department to address the matter. Judgement is awaited.

In another landmark step the Public Service Commissioner Dr Luthuli last week presented the findings of the report into an investigation of personal practices and shortages of the Western Cape SAPS. Commendably the Chair of the Standing Committee, hon member Wenger, who is currently on maternity leave, approached the PSC armed with the findings of a series of province-wide public hearings into the matter. These findings have formed the basis of the report and led to a set of recommendations from the PSC.

This is an all important report by a Chapter 10 Institution dealing with public administration, emphasising what most suspected: we have a dire problem that is putting lives at risk on a daily basis - that in the face of increasingly serious and violent crimes in this province the SAPS are woefully under-resourced to the point of disaster.

Just yesterday the Provincial Commissioner sitting in this very bench in front of me told the Community Safety Committee that the situation regarding police resources was very poor. Nobody is totally safe at present.

Last week two police officers were shot dead in separate incidents without provocation simply because the assailants wanted their firearms. Several people including a child have been killed in gang-related violence in the last few days. They all join a long and growing list of victims of extreme and gratuitous violence hurting every citizen and activity of life in this province.

How has this disaster come about? There are a number of factors. The first is the severe neglect by the responsible National Department to address the skewed balance of resources for almost 20 years. Some would say it began when the governing party realised that it would not win this province politically. Delegations to the then President Mandela saw some relief, especially during the urban terror phase. Later President Mbeki and the Police Minister were approached but this produced little, until, by default, the ANC came into power in coalition with the National Party. Statistics will show a sudden spike in police recruitment; a boost for detectives and case

processing and support for specialist units. The murder rate dropped significantly from 3 664 in 2003 to 2 680 in 2005. Police totals shot to 20 072 in 2008 and the police-to-population ratio echoed the national average of around one officer per 345 citizens.

However, upon a fall of that administration in 2009, the incoming DA found the tide was turning against them. Within a short space of time the training of new police recruits dropped dramatically. One year alone there were none trained for the Western Cape.

At this point I wish to quote from the PSC report:

“The determination of police numbers is calculated at national level to determine an allocation of resources in the provinces. The number of detectives is based on the number of reported crimes.”

This was borne out by the landmark occasion when the then National Commissioner appeared before the Provincial Standing Committee on 27 August 2013 in this Chamber where she quoted Section 11 of the SAPS Act. That is Act 68 of 1995, where she states:

“The National Commissioner is responsible to determine the fixed establishment of the SAPS and the number of and grading of posts and to determine the distribution of the numerical strength of SAPS.”

Furthermore, she made the following astounding statement:

“The minimum service level requirements at Vispol - that is the Bobby on the beat station level - is to render a 24-hour service seven days a week. At the Community Service Centre you can expect four members per shift including a Shift Commander and an Operations Commander...”

[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What are you saying? Can you just repeat what you just said? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: “...and a Sector Team at minimum standards is two vehicles...” [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is nothing outstanding about what you said there.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. Can I have protection, please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is nothing outstanding about what I have just heard. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr M G E WILEY: I am quoting directly from the National Commissioner.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is outstanding about it?

Mr M G E WILEY: “In every sector two vehicles with four members per sector, excluding a Sector Commander.” But just two weeks ago General Brand, the Cluster Commander for both Mitchells Plain and Wynberg, stated at a CPF meeting that the best the Provincial Commissioner could do with the resources at his disposal was one vehicle per sector; in other words half of the national minimum standard and yet as any honourable member who has visited a local SAPS Station recently will testify, many stations can only muster a single vehicle for multiple sectors especially the nightshift, and often only one or two members in the charge office. The current SAPS levels are so low that they are just above the 2008 total and are exactly 20 969, yet the population has grown by more than a million.

The numbers peaked in 2013 at 22 633 and have now gone in a planned five to six year decline cycle year-on-year. Police to population figures in the province are now at a shocking - country leading - one person, one officer to 509 population as opposed to the national average of one officer to 369. The desired United Nations Guidelines Standard is a reported one officer to 222 citizens. 128 - that is 85% of the 150 SAPS stations in the province - are seriously understaffed. In 2014 there were 2392 vacancies, including key

posts and the situation today may well be worse. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are really trying to convince yourself with stats. People's lives are more important downstairs... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The PSC has given SAPS six months to fill the vacancies. Case dockets per detective are at an impossible level at most stations... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...which you are doing nothing about.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... and reports that some detectives are carrying 150 or more cases have been received. Under these circumstances low conviction rates can be expected and these are reported in single digits. The worst stations affected by these shortages are frequently the ones most in need of policing with the highest crime rates. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So why are you going silent on [Inaudible.] You are quiet.

Mr M G E WILEY: The murder rate has increased in ten years from 2 836 to 3 311 last year. In every single crime category in the Western Cape it is in the top four places in the country. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the new Chairperson.

Mr M G E WILEY: In six crime categories like drug offences, cash-in-transit, contact crimes and robbery it is either the leading province or second out of the nine provinces. Police reservists, previously a vital source of manpower, have dropped from 2008 at 9 825 to virtually zero today due to bungled policy decisions during Selebi's time; similarly the disbandment of special units also at that time, so gangsters really take hold. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member, order member Wiley, just one second. Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can the member take a question, please?

Mr M G E WILEY: No.

†n AGBARE LID: Ag nee man.

[An HON MEMBER: Ag no man.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not prepared.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please take it.

Mr M G E WILEY: No, I cannot.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The member is not prepared. Please take your seat.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Fine, okay. I am waiting for you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed, hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Current Operation Thunder about which the Standing Committee received an excellent report yesterday is testimony that a focused intelligence driven operation produces results. The problem is that Thunder is a short-term crisis intervention and has to be replaced by dedicated and permanent provincial teams without delay. Very shortly many of the thousands that have been arrested will be released on bail or have cases dropped.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: The Criminal Justice... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley, your time has almost expired. Just finish off.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ag, sorry, sorry, sorry, you can finish now.

Mr M G E WILEY: The situation, Mr Deputy Speaker, cannot continue. The citizens of this province are entitled to feel safe at home in using transport,

going about their lawful business on a daily basis. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Your time has expired, hon member Wiley.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daai is swak, man. Daai is swak.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is poor, man. That is poor.]

†n AGBARE LID: Mmusi Maimane.

[An HON MEMBER: Mmusi Maimane.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the ANC speaker is hon Lekker, please. Allow her the time.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They do not care, that is what wrong. They do not care.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Lekker. [Interjections.]

†UNksz Ms P Z LEKKER: Ubungenothula?

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Can't you just keep quiet?]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja, they do not care.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi jou kole, gooi kole, gooi kole.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw your coals, throw coals, throw coals.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Right next-door to you - he does not care. He is supposed to be a Minister and he is useless.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Let me take this opportunity to express my delight at the opportunity to partake in this important debate on policing and safety in the Western Cape. This debate is not to find solutions to the crime situation in the province. Its purpose is to make clear member Wiley's diatribe against SAPS leadership and the ANC Government. In the quest to politicise the issue of policing which started with the Khayelitsha Commission, the party now had to commission the PSC to investigate police shortages in the Western Cape.

Hon member Wenger exaggerated the situation and motivated strongly for the PSC to investigate policing in the province.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi jou kole, gooi kole, gooi kole.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw your coals, throw coals, throw coals.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: What?

Ms P Z LEKKER: In her e-mail dated 4 May you can clearly see that hon

member Wenger is trying to persuade the PSC to focus mainly on the issue of under-resourcing of police instead and in fact turn a blind eye on the challenges of limited resources police are faced with. The PSC report even noted some of hon member Wenger untruths when she claimed that SAPS will receive an additional R12 billion when in actual fact the budget decreased by 264 for the main appropriation of 87. We must call on hon member Wenger and the DA to desist from politicising the issue of policing. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: People are dying.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And what are you doing? Nothing!

Ms P Z LEKKER: They can learn from MEC Plato... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because he is doing nothing. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell him next to you!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are doing nothing!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: They can learn from MEC Plato who stood in front of this august House a month ago and praised the work that Minister Cele and his adviser, a DA member... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Lennit Max!

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... Lennit Max were doing to combat crime in the Province.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hey listen please, listen!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Today amnesia seems to have taken over. [Interjections.]

DA members forgot everything that MEC Plato said when he praised Operation Thunder and other SAPS operations in the province. There is no denying that the shortage of police is a big problem not only in the Western Cape but in all other provinces.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Only in the Western Cape?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Other Provincial Governments commit resources to support the work of SAPS. In the Western Cape we have a Cabinet that defines itself out of the work of the National Government.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes!

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is busy igniting fires, thus it sabotages all plans of SAPS to combat crime and ensure safety in the province. The DA does not want a safe and free Western Cape. For it the crime situation in the province is a campaigning tool. It benefits them as its gullible voters and [Inaudible.] by

its demand for deployment of the army. They have fond memories of the army's presence in the streets of the province. For us we know that the army's role is to kill the enemy. Who is the enemy? The DA's army march clearly identify... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, just one second.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ag, sit down man.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon Minister. [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: What is wrong with you?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Is the member prepared to take a question?

Ms M N GILLION: No, sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, are you prepared to take a question?

†Me P Z LEKKER: Jy mors my tyd, nè.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: You are wasting my time, hey.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Kom nou, vat die *question!*

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Come on now, take the question!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer seems no. Please continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It means that first and foremost the army must be deployed to target foreign nationals in the country. This message is in line with Herman Mashaba's utterance that foreign nationals are responsible for crime in the country and should be deported.

“They want the army to be responsible for this job and this is incorrect. Hon member Wiley knows this as his family was very close to former Defence Minister Magnus Malan, even going with him on excursions to the Bird Island.”

Mr S G TYATYAM: They still are.

An HON MEMBER: Who?

Ms P Z LEKKER: We do not need the army to do policing work in the province. We would love to see Government deploying more police in the province but as a country we cannot afford it now. SAPS has put in place Operation Thunder. We have heard in this House, we received a report of

SAPS management on the impact of the targeted approach on both gang and murder statistics [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is not responsible for that. He is not responsible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: The impact is felt on the ground... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order! Just one second. Minister Plato, order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Plato!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Behave. Behave yourself!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Shut-up. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Behave! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa, if the Chair speaks the House must come to order. Hon Plato, you must please withdraw that

statement, that utterance of shut-up, it is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, that remark was uncalled for.

Mr K E MAGAXA: What remark?

Ms M N GILLION: What remark?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It was uncalled for to make that link. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: To Mark Wiley what they have done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Plato!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is completely uncalled for Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are the worst one to say that. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I said so.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are the worst person to say that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Who are you, you can say that? [Inaudible.]  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa, order! Hon member Magaxa, for the last time, if the Chair asks for order, it means order. Minister Plato, I will come back to the statement, I did not hear that, but the statement that you made of shutting-up, shut-up, that is unparliamentary. Please withdraw that first.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, I duly withdraw that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is the statement that you referred to?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons kom terug vir jou! [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are coming back for you! [Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You are welcome.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons kom terug vir jou!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are coming back for you!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Plato... [Interjections.] Order!

Hon Plato, you referred to a statement that I must look at. What was that?

An HON MEMBER: Can I raise a point of order?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Bird Island statement and laughing at hon member Wiley. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Honourable, I will look at that. I will go to Hansard and see. I did not hear the direct link there, but I will look at that. Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the speaker said that the hon member Wiley probably went to Bird Island with his father.

An HON MEMBER: Uh-huh.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Ja, ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Something along those lines.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is a clear casting of aspersions on the character of hon member Wiley and I ask that you would look at the Hansard and [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will. [Interjections.] Order! I will most certainly do that, if that was the reference then certainly that would be uncalled for. I will look at Hansard and come back to the House. [Interjections.] Hon member Lekker, you may continue.

An HON MEMBER: Listen to the recording.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to address you on the comment made by hon member Schäfer.

Ms S W DAVIDS: It is the Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have already ruled.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I will read directly from the statement as to what I said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You do not need to do that. I will go back to Hansard and I will come back to the House.

Ms P Z LEKKER: No, Chairperson, I must clear my name, because clearly she misunderstood and she did not want to hear what was written and spoken here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I take your word that there might have been a misunderstanding but the Chair has ruled. The Chair will come back to the House. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Read your statement.

Ms P Z LEKKER: As and when you continue Mr Deputy Speaker, investigating this you must ask for a copy of my statement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, the official record of the House is Hansard and what you have spoken will be reflected on Hansard. So I will do that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, thank you, and not listen to the perception that

she is creating. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, please continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Manenberg, Ravensmead, Steenberg and Worcester have experienced a decrease in both murder and attempted murder. These base camps are enhancing the perception of safety in the identified areas, providing additional policing resources in those areas by deploying more operational ready personnel. The Provincial Government should move away from the opposition stance it has adopted. It must support the efforts and use Section 206 to support the work of the police. The ANC during its government time came up with very good programmes that led to the decrease of crime in the province. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is why you are out of government.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...including the deployment of Bambanani to patrol in all communities. [Interjections.]

†Me S W DAVIDS: Uh-uh, nou praat jy sommer... [Onduidelik.]

[Ms S W DAVIDS: Uh-uh, now you are talking... [Inaudible.]]

An HON MEMBER: Wiley is acknowledging.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Schools, open spaces and buildings were safe and the relationship with communities was improved. The DA came and dismantled all the programmes and as a result crime soared. It has set up set up parallel police offices in the City which destabilises police efforts. The rogue Metro Police is unable to perform its task of supporting SAPS.

We have read how the rogue Metro Police is conducting investigations on matters of a DA councillor including Interpol investigation. Right now the Metro Police is embroiled in a case of sexual harassment of a female officer by senior leadership members of the Metro Police... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, yes.

Ms P Z LEKKER: And this leadership is keeping mum. How can we entrust the DA to protect the citizens of the Western Cape when it cannot even protect its own members of the Metro Police? In this August month I am calling on the DA leader here in this House to investigate the allegations by a female constable who claim to have been harassed at work and the City is very quiet about it. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No they are not...

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are good at that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: There is compelling evidence that the DA is funding gangs

in the province through the payment of protection fees to gangs for its projects in communities. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Fritz, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A point of order, you know, these are outrageous statements... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Is that an order? Is that an order? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A point of order; talking nonsense like that. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Is that an order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I will address that. That is not a point of order. That is a debating point.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And the member refers to the party and not to a specific member so I am happy that she can continue. Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it seems like it is one of those days again. Hon Fritz is totally unparliamentary today and I really want you to...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will control that.

Mr P UYS: Today there is a specific problem again.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja-nee, ons kan daai sien, ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sure, we can see that, yes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable, but similarly there are members on the other side who also... [Interjections.] Order! Order!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons sien vir jou.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: We see you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are also members on the other side who are out of character today.

An HON MEMBER: Character?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So both sides are transgressing the Rules here and I want to ask that we come to order. Hon member Lekker, your time is starting again now, you may continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The DA has used taxis owned by gangsters to transport its

members to DA activities.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We are not Zuma.

Ms P Z LEKKER: MEC Plato befriended gang-bosses instead of prosecuting them.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Where? [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: All the above will be the legacy of the DA in fighting crime. It only committed resources towards the Chrysalis Academy and funded religious communities on a feeding scheme. It also introduced ineffective walking busses and this is against the backdrop of the province being a murder capital.

Having said all of the above the issue of police shortages in the poor communities is a serious challenge. The ANC on its 54<sup>th</sup> Conference resolved on the need to increase the capacity of police officers in line with the realities on the ground. This included reducing the ratio of police to population ratio over the period of five years as well as to increase the number of vehicles and police stations. We fully agree with this and we are calling on National Government to see to it that this resolution is fully implemented with specified timeframes. Equally the ANC resolves that CPF must be strengthened and adequately trained and resourced. We have been fighting the DA administration over the strengthening of CPFs. The DA in

this province is deliberately killing CPFs and opting to prioritise Neighbourhood Watch. This is part of the big political strategy to control over-policing. No wonder JP's unit has operated pseudo-intelligence and police unit, which spied on councillors... [Interjection.]

†Me M N GILLION: Dit is die waarheid.

[Ms M N GILLION: That is the truth.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...carried investigation on serious cases such as murders.

An HON MEMBER: You are exposed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: We must call on the DA to desist politicising crime and safety. Instead they must work towards fostering good relations between police and communities. Under the ANC Government we excelled on this. Community structures and their involvement on safety have a critical role to play. The DA Government in this province and local municipalities must commit resources where they are needed most; their incentives in the Neighbourhood Watch and capacitate the CPF, the resources to the CPF.

The failure to do this has led to the current situation. The failure to regulate shebeens in the townships has contributed immensely to the situation we are faced with. We call for the review of trading hours of liquor outlets in the townships and villages. I want to remind the DA that its responsibility is to support in its efforts the fight against crime. It has a responsibility to foster

the relations between SAPS and the community but instead the DA has been actively instigating people against SAPS.

The Khayelitsha Commission is one of the mechanisms they use to set the people against the police. Millions were spent and these recommendations have not been implemented in full. Clearly it shows that as a political ploy and not as intentions of promoting safety.

Premier Zille continues with her antics as she unilaterally shortlisted, interviewed and made recommendations for the new Police Ombudsman in the province. It is part of the campaign to discredit the work of SAPS.  
[Interjections.]

Given all challenges we are faced with in the province, I want to commend the police for the great work they have done, particularly with the current operation, which is called Operation Thunder, and I want to encourage them to continue doing the good work despite the DA sabotage. I thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi-mooi, mooi! [Applous.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good-good, good! [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Lekker. I see the hon Minister Grant. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is the same faction.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The leader of faction... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: The same faction.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is significant that at the start of the week in which this debate is taking place, one of the daily newspapers in Cape Town published a letter written by the Chairperson of the National Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Police... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a faction of the DA.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...under the heading of “Urgent need for security at police stations to be improved.” [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is a needy faction.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: In the letter the Chairperson Francois Beukman states that the National Commissioner of Police has been requested to brief the Portfolio Committee on measures to

increase security at police stations. [Interjections.] He refers to the attacks on police stations during the parliamentary recess as a clear indication that there are gaps in the plan to address safety at police stations. [Interjections.] Their Chairperson goes on to say that the lack of progress by SAPS with the implementation of a proactive national plan to install CCTV cameras at police stations... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The taxi industry [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...the upgrading of perimeter fencing and the installation of secure entrance gates is a huge concern to the Committee.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You cannot even fix a lift.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: This is then, Mr Deputy Speaker, the backdrop against which this debate is taking place today. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Minister Grant, just one second. Hon member Dyantyi, this is a serious debate. You are giving a running commentary now. That was a good interjection.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Interjection yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But that was the exception. The others were just comments and screaming across the floor. So please contain yourself.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, alright.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant, you may continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please fix the lifts. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...a situation in which even the Government agencies responsible for preventing crime and protecting citizens... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ooh that is a good one, hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...property owners and businesses fall short of being able to protect themselves. It is also the background against which I specifically want to highlight the challenges of policing and safety in the public transport domain.

Mr Deputy Speaker, crime on public transport networks is a worldwide challenge. As such networks, by their nature, result in commuters congregating at a pick-up place being conveyed in a relatively confined space according to a known or predictable schedule. This is the reason for the fact that these networks are often the target of terrorism as maximum harm can be

done in a defined area. Worldwide, a range of measures varying in levels of sophistication has been developed and implemented to counter crime on an around these networks. A key element, however, of all of these measures, is effective law enforcement. Success or failure is dependent upon the extent to which the crime is anticipated and detected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister, just one second. Hon member Tyatyam, is that a question or a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to understand the relevance. We are dealing with the Western Cape in terms of the subject here.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr S G TYATYAM: And the worldwide and all other things...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will listen. I am listening to the member.

Mr S G TYATYAM: This goes to the relevance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I hear your point and I am happy that the Minister can continue so far. Minister Grant, you may continue.

An HON MEMBER: Good for a workshop.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is just designed to actually interpret the flow... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...and the bottom line is to the extent to which crime is anticipated and detected, the perpetrator is apprehended, properly processed through a justice system and then punished, and here, Mr Deputy Speaker, was where the reality of our situation becomes apparent. Detection and apprehension levels are low and where people are identified and arrested, processing through and by the criminal justice system is hopelessly inadequate, resulting in very few successful prosecutions and sanctions. As a result criminals believe that they can commit crime with impunity on and around the public transport system, whether the transport involved is a minibus taxi, other taxis, a bus or a train.

In fact, in our situation this has resulted in a different aspect of crime in relation to transport networks, one which does not generally occur throughout the world. I mean of course crime against the transport network itself. The wanton and irresponsible destruction of transport infrastructure has become an all too common feature of our lives.

Critical infrastructure is simply destroyed with no thought to the impact which the loss of taxis, buses and commuter rail rolling stock has on the lives of decent hardworking and often poor residents of our cities, towns and rural

areas as they go about their legitimate business.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I believe it is important to unpack in this House some of the relevant statistics in relation to a few modes of public transport as follows:

Recent violent crimes in the taxi industry in the Western Cape:

- May this year: 12 murders; four attempted murders; arrests: none.
- June: seven murders; one attempted murder; arrests: none.
- July: eight murders; one attempted murder; arrests: none.

An HON MEMBER: Shocking!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Total: 27 murders; six attempted murders; no arrests. The standard entry for these and other similar crimes, which appear in the various SAPS reports, reads: “the case is under investigation and no arrests have been made.”

Since 2012 there have been 80 murders and only three convictions. The causes of the conflict are generally known. They are route invasions; continual recruitment of members on the payment of large fees despite the none-availability of operating licences; unlawful parallel regulatory and enforced insistence run by the industry; ongoing power struggles; the use of vehicles for criminal activity.

It is significant that in a submission to the Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Police just a week ago both COSATU and POPCRU stated that law enforcement agencies must move with speed to arrest perpetrators and rid the industry of illegal firearms that are being used to commit these crimes.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I submit that three convictions in the Western Cape over a seven year period involving 80 known murders is anything but moving with speed or efficiency by the relevant law enforcement agencies. Then I move to the theft and destruction of commuter rail infrastructure and rolling stock.

Damage to and destruction of rail infrastructure - many would understandably call it sabotage - take many forms and it is disturbingly easy to carry out in what is a seriously undercapitalised and updated system.

Mr K E MAGAXA: What are you doing?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The network is vulnerable in many ways and at many levels; copper wire theft, signal box damage and electrical interruptions. Through the use of smart technology some progress is being made with early detection and even arrest.

Mr K E MAGAXA: What are you doing?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: More than a 100 arrests! Copper wire syndicates have been identified and shut down. Less

vulnerable signalling is being rolled out. This is encouraging and that is what we are doing.

An HON MEMBER: What are you doing?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: However, Mr Deputy Speaker, absolutely no progress has been made with the most obvious and spectacular destruction... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What are you doing, sir?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...the reckless wanton and selfish burning of rolling stock. This is cost well in excess of R500 million since October 2015. [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: What are you doing?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Sadly the public is becoming used to photographs and video clips of trains burning fiercely, producing flames metres high. Trains do not ignite easily, Mr Deputy Speaker. An electrical fault may account for one or two of the fires, but not for the number and the regularity we have experienced in recent months and years. Fires of this order require an accelerant and have to be set and encouraged by people. People leave clues and forensic trails particularly when these fires are started in stations and at staging yards and yet virtually

no-one has been detained.

After a series of such fires on the 27<sup>th</sup> of July, I accompanied the National Minister of Transport and Senior SAPS and crime intelligence officials on a visit to the scene of the most recent fires as well as an inspection of the destroyed coaches.

On this occasion SAPS submitted a report on the 32 incidents of train burning on the greater Cape Town network since May 2015. There have been others since the meeting of the 27<sup>th</sup> of July but the summary of the cases indicate that 30 forensic investigations had been completed but there were no positive forensic results for 21 of the 30 completed investigations. In only four cases are there positive forensic outcomes and the suspects have yet to be traced.

For the six cases of arson in June to July 2018 one arrest was made, but the person arrested had to be released after 10 days because of insufficient evidence and because incorrect processes had been followed in making the arrest.

At the start, Mr Deputy Speaker, I indicated that a key element of all successful measures to combat crime in the public transport system is effective law enforcement. What we have available to us in this province by courtesy of the National Government is woefully short of the mark. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Grant. Your time has also expired. [Applause.]

†n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In the absence... [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: They cannot even cheer for you! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! In the absence of the EFF I see Minister Plato.

†n AGBARE LID: Gooi! [Onduidelik.]

[An HON MEMBER: Throw! [Onduidelik.]]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. The budget for CPFs in this province is well over R5 million per annum. The deployment of the base camps under Operation Thunder has been welcomed as a necessary intervention in some of our most violence-prone areas where gangsters and drug lords are holding our communities ransom with perpetual gun violence and fear. The commanding officers are trying their level best through coordinated interventions, increased intelligence and additional deployments to bring stability back to communities who have been ravaged by the scourge of gangsterism, drugs and guns.

Successes over the last couple of months saw massive ammunition cases confiscated, in particular 150 rounds and 200, and 70 rounds of live brand new ammunition confiscated. We heard how legal traceable weapons were confiscated and how illegal weapons without serial numbers have been confiscated. These operations were able to see not a single murder being recorded in an observed month in one community.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the temporary three months base-camp deployment has allowed kids to walk safely in the streets and is allowing kids and parents alike to walk to nearby shops without having to fear for their lives.

Horrifically, we also heard the communities themselves acknowledging that this might be a temporary sense of safety in the community, pleading with commanding officers and myself that they fear the day the base camps are removed and the additional deployments move out of the community, as this will mean war will return to their streets. The difference the deployment of additional resources, increased cooperation and improved intelligence is making in our communities is literally the difference between life and death.

Mr Deputy Speaker, though not all base camps are operating successfully and though there has been concerns about the effectiveness in the long run, what these cases and camps pointed out is the difference between policing and safety in the Western Cape that the people of the province has become accustomed to under the thugs that have been ruling the streets and that of what all communities deserve when deployment of policing resources are

better aligned with the safety threats people experience on a daily basis.

It is confirmation of the problem which the Western Cape Government and the Provincial Legislature has been vocal about at every opportunity and that is the lack of visible policing and the shortage of police officers within communities. The deployment of only 269 officers stationed at only a few base camps ensures police visibility we need and that is the essence of the problem. Coupled to this is a letting go of some thousands of police reservists which left a void that is hard to be filled by the current police force.

If 269 extra additional officers bring this change, what can 1000 extra officers no do?

This is the reason why the Public Service Commissioner has found that vacant posts that are critical should be filled within a six-month period and that is critical. All of this is a National Police management failure.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is deteriorating conditions between our populace in the province and the police which have allowed the criminals, the gangsters, the drug lords and gun runners in our communities to manifest themselves as the authority in our communities... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You mean your friends.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and not the State. In too many areas in our province the ANC post-democratic government's failure to adequately invest in the police to combat crime, prevent crime and keep all inhabitants safe... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Shame, shame!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...as they are mandated to do by the Constitution, has led to the state failing to change the lived safety experiences or improve their lives. The Public Service Commissioner even mentioned that the current police force might even become smaller and that is one of the recommendations.

The ANC Government is actually handing over or handing our communities over to gang bosses and drug lords on a silver plate. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You did that when you send us securities... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That shows no respect for safety and for lives.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Do you mean the ones that you met at MacDonald's? I still have the pictures.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: What the recommendations

made by the Commission showed us, what the preamble showed us was the preamble to what the Standing Committee on Community Safety in the Provincial Legislature and the Public Service Commission found.

Ms P Z LEKKER: And pictures do not lie.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Poor policing management and policy decisions has dire consequences for the safety of communities in the province and on the police's ability to stem the tide against crime.

It was a mistake, Mr Deputy Speaker, to do away with the Specialised Drug and Gang Units within the police. The drug floodgates opened the moment the Specialised Drug and Gang Units were disbanded. The statistics speaks for itself.

Between the 2003/04 financial year and the 2012/13 financial year drug-related crime in the Western Cape has increased from 19 940 reported cases to over 82 000 reported cases - an increase of over 311%. This is nothing other than an ANC Government failure. We need the Specialised Gang and Drug Units to be reintroduced. These units possess the necessary resources and expertise to investigate and make arrests and come with a track record of success, yet repeated promises by numerous national policing Ministers recently and former President Zuma has remained just that - empty promises, all while the shootings and killings in our communities continue.

It was a major mistake and let me repeat to let go of a 1000 well trained police reservists, what a void it left. [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Do you mean like you did with the Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The current police force cannot cope without the reservists as a force multiplier. Bring them back.

An HON MEMBER: Bring back Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Department has made an official proposal to SAPS to pay a stipend to those fully trained and equipped police reservists who are under-utilised mostly sitting at home. We must succeed to mobilise these trained men and women to work for safety especially within priority projects such as the safety of train and bus commuters... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You dismantled the Bambananis. You cannot complain now. You cannot complain.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...safety at schools and for the prevention of gangster activities.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Oh yes! There are armed robberies at schools.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I know that our proposal is still under consideration and that we require approval at national SAPS level. I wish to make an urgent appeal to the National Minister... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: No, you must take care of the schools.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to ensure a speedy and positive response to this unique partnership opportunity between the Western Cape Government and SAPS. The extent of the gang problem in the province is worsening with youth as young as eleven years old... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Where is the budget for school safety?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...not only joining gangs...

Ms P Z LEKKER: And you know very well you are not supporting them, hey.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...not only joining gangs but also being responsible for increased violence in our communities. The scourge of gangsterism, drugs and gun-wielding criminals not only affect the safety of our communities but also service delivery in some areas as we have seen happening in so many of our communities. This is why the Western Cape Government has called in the past, and we confirm that call once again, for

the deployment of the army to assist the police... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Bring back Bambanani.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...in peace-keeping to allow the dedicated police to do the necessary investigations and gain convictions on behalf of communities living in fear... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: We do not want that experience of Bird Island. You cannot bring the army... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Lekker please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Bambanani cannot investigate... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Bird Island!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and Bambanani cannot arrest and Bambanani cannot stop any gangster bullet.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Bring the people back again. We do not want the army.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That can only be done, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Plato. Just one second. Just one second. Just one second. Hon member Lekker, you are hiding there, I cannot see you but I can hear you. Please contain yourself. Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: All of those, Mr Deputy Speaker, can only be done by a trained professional force and that force today is not the Bambanani force, it is the police force.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Not the army.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We are talking about a professional and effective police force which is not there currently. Mr Deputy Speaker, the resourcing constraints the police face is rendering them toothless in their reactions; possibly outgunned and with much to be desired in their proactive approach. The continued scourge of gun-wielding gangsters and drug lords in our communities requires all authorities to look at what else can be done to disarm the criminals and stop the bloodshed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato, just finish off, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: In the Western Cape's most gang-ridden communities guns are too readily available and accessible and this cannot be left to continue unabated. Thank you. [Time expired.]

[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, your time has expired. The hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape wants to say to the DA and the ANC today that you have failed the people of the Western Cape when it comes to their safety. [Interjection.]

The ANC nationally has for a long time under-resourced the province and our community's safety is at risk, but the DA has known this for a long time, almost governing for ten years, surely they must have a plan. Surely we will have always too little police personnel. Gauteng also has too little police personnel but we must do with what we have and the ACDP is asking what is the Western Cape Government doing to keep our communities safe?

An HON MEMBER: Protecting our public schools?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Minister Plato will always talk about the safety kiosk, is that reducing crime? [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: No!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Minister Plato will always talk about other interventions like the Walking Busses. Is it reducing crime? [Interjections.]

Now I want to say this, I want to say this: that the DA believes in fit-for-purpose but why do they let go of Lennit Max?

Me S W DAVIDS: Ja.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: A highly qualified Police Commissioner.

Mr K E MAGAXA: They will never answer that.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: An advocate and you let him go.

An HON MEMBER: It was his choice.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So it is a fact that here is a political gain.  
[Interjections.] There is no doubt that the DA has got personal agendas that are more important than the safety of the people of the Western Cape.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, exactly!

An HON MEMBER: No

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The time has come for the people of the Western Cape to see the DA for what it is.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Political hypocrites; only good to criticise, good insulting, but nothing more. I am asking, and the ACDP is asking why are the people in the Western Cape unsafe?

An HON MEMBER: Plato.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Because we have a Minister and I am looking him in the eye, you have failed our people. You have failed our people and they are not safe. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So the ANC and the DA must collectively take responsibility for the safety of our people... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Christians, your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please come to order before I see the hon

member Dijana. Hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is an interesting topic. If you want to address the increase of crime adequately there are certain standards that are critical that should be considered. Number one is political will to make the conditions favourable. Number 2 is planting resources to effectively deal with the evils of crime.

As ANC we are not convinced that the Department of Community Safety is fulfilling its core mandate of eradicating crime and ensuring that our people live in communities that are crime-free. [Interjections.]

For any community to make progress, be it economically or socially, safety and stability are key factors that give confidence and encourages growth. During the State of the Nation Address our President, His Excellency Mr Ramaphosa called for the implementation of a Community Policing Strategy and a Youth Crime Prevention Strategy. Community policing is the foundational pillar towards effective and democratic policing. We cannot achieve excellence in policing without the involvement of family, state, religious institutions, schools, social clubs, work and others.

Community Police Forums have a special task to coordinate the relationship between the communities and the police. There are two major drivers behind the current crime rate in the province - unemployment and the lack of proper planning - in eradicating crime ever since the DA has been in government.

The DA has been abusing state resources to fight their own internal political wars. An example of such abuse is the once disbanded and recently reinstated SIU of cowboy-sheriff J P Smith. This rogue parallel police force according to a recent report, this rogue unit investigated serious crime such as murders and attempted murders, despite not having the authority to do so. Instead of assisting the police the SIU was usurping the work of the police and was unnecessarily looking into the affairs of councillors.

In a letter dated 7 November 2017 Major General Felix Mbeki, the SAPS Provincial Head for Legal and Policy Services, informed the City that the Metro Police Service had not been allocated investigative powers and functions.

The ShotSpotter has cost R32 million in total, detected 3 409 gunshots in 1 140 incidents in which 20 people were injured but only nine people have been arrested. This is the City of Cape Town's ShotSpotter, a system that detects and conveys the location of gunfire. This is a so-called crime prevention tool but it did not even make an impact in Hanover Park. It is an increasingly intolerable fact of life in this province that hardly a day passes without us hearing of yet another murder, rape and burglary. We must strive to take away from potential criminals the opportunity to commit the crimes. The Department needs to be one step ahead of criminals in their crime-fighting techniques.

Our people in Nyanga, Mitchells Plain and other hotspots deserve

interventions that will bring about a change in the material reality and quality of their lives, as enshrined in our Constitution.

Another issue that needs to be tackled urgently is that of drugs that is destroying many lives. The current strategies which are in place have not produced the results desired. The conception of drugs has a negative impact in our province as it destroys the social fabric of communities.

We call for integrated comprehensive and coordinated inter-governmental action to address all aspects of the supply and availability of drugs in our communities. I want to state it clear that the DA has failed to address the root causes of crime in our province.

The socio-economic conditions are the real causes of the high crime rate. The evils of the colour bar, which are poverty, race and class are the evils that continue to haunt the people of Western Cape.

When addressing the crime in the province all the MEC could offer is to shift the blame to National Government and the only solution from the DA is to bring back the army. [Interjection.] We will keep on asking serious questions in this House and outside of it to ensure that the Department of Community Safety and the Provincial Government in general remain accountable to the members of the public who depend on Government for their safety and security.

As leaders in this province we must be seen as known to denounce crime and not just talk about it. We need to join all our efforts to eradicate crime in our province. We owe it to our province to call wrong, wrong and right, right. It is the only way that we can preserve our province and pass it on for prosperity as a stable and prosperous province for all to enjoy.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, we urge the MEC of Community Safety and the Premier to consider a provincial crime summit, where all stakeholders will be invited to canvas views about how to eradicate crime in the Western Cape province. Further we will be waiting for the DA-led Province to implement the employment of more police from the funding of the Bavarian Government. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I see Minister Alan Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the sponsor of this debate.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we are 24 years into our democracy, and 24 years into our democracy the ANC has failed our people. They failed our people with BEE. We have gone from 4 million unemployed people to 10 million unemployed people. They have failed with BEE, they have only succeeded with making a select few, politically connected, wealthy. They have failed with jobs and growth. They have failed with land reform.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You failed with your own [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They spend more money on VIP security than they spend on land reform.

Mr P UYS: Where is your speech? This is irrelevant.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You failed the whole Department.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They have made the people of this country in the last 24 years poorer than ever before.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] clean water.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But, Mr Deputy Speaker, the area that the ANC have failed this nation the most is in safety and security.

Mr P UYS: No, man.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They have failed the people of this country where it is a constitutional right to feel safe in the land in which you live. They have absolutely failed in this space. [Interjection.] Mr Deputy Speaker, this province, where the Constitution says the South African Police Services has to offer that service to the people of this province, in order for them to feel safe, in this province it is the murder capital of the world. [Interjection.]

We had 3,311 people in this province murdered last year. It is the rape capital of the world. Last year in Mfuleni, rape went up by 40,8%.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Under your control.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where were you [Inaudible].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC have failed the people of this country and they failed the people of this province. [Interjections.]

When you hear... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You fail as the MEC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: Now you want to... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You must listen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, please come to order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, when you hear my colleague saying that even the police feel unsafe in their police stations, when you hear how many police officers are murdered, this is totally unacceptable.

Now why does this happen? Now I think, Mr Deputy Speaker, that every one of these members in the Opposition benches, I will also say it to these benches in power, that we should go and read Mandy Wiener's book *The Ministry of Crime*.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have got an investigation at the moment... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Stop reading [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in this country into state capture. The real capture started happening in our safety and security space in this country, when the Scorpions were closed down. When you read this book and you see Crime Intelligence is involved directly with the underworld and the gangsters of this country.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: There you will go and see the cause of why crime is out of hand, why crime is running rampant across not only this province, the whole country, and it is affecting, it is a key driver of driving up that further poverty line that we all experience in our country.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, you started the poverty line.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You will see it across the call for more – the gang units, they closed them down. Anywhere where there were mechanisms within the police service to deal with crime, the top decision makers linked to the ANC, the political party running this country for the last 24 years, you will find all of those linkages if you go and read that book *The Ministry of Crime*. It was

captured and that is why gangs, murder, rape, hijackings are rife in this province.

Now another interesting thing is we have had this debate and we have heard the ANC take part in this debate, and not once did I hear of a plan. Not once did I hear of anybody on those benches bragging ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Not once did I hear one member on that side of the House bragging how they run policing in another province. Not one. Because they cannot. [Interjections.] They cannot brag about one space where they are in a provincial space running policing, because they do not run police in provincial spaces. It is a national competency, and this whole Legislature should be united in making sure that this province, the people of this province, get more policing so we bring down the crime levels, but of course that side of the House would never think of that. They would never dream of it because they are part of the failed ANC that has failed the people of this province. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, then I move on to my portfolio, and in my portfolio it is really difficult to get economic growth.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is the worst portfolio.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is very difficult, and I am going to use the first example, in tourism. A key driver of the economy. Tourism is something that Cyril Ramaphosa, when he took office as the President of this country, said, “Tourism is something that we are going to drive, it is going to create jobs, we are going to grow it.” Let alone the other blockages like visas and red tape. [Interjection.] Crime affects tourism directly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon member. Minister Winde, just one second. Hon member Davids, you are giving running commentary now, please contain yourself.

Mr M G E WILEY: Do you think it is funny?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please contain yourself. Minister Winde, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very, Mr Deputy Speaker. The rest was good for my throat. Mr Deputy Speaker, if you go and have a look in September, in Gauteng, Dutch tourists were robbed on their bus. It featured in mainstream newspapers across Europe, across BBC channels about how unsafe it is coming to visit our country. When a UK couple were attacked on Table Mountain in January we saw it running rampant again across the UK and European newspaper headlines. In Singapore, because some Singapore airline

staff were held up in a Johannesburg hotel this very week, again front pages in a key new market of ours. We are really trying to grow tourism, front page “Very unsafe in South Africa.”

If you go onto the websites of those countries, marketing our country and saying, “Come here for tourism purposes,” the USA reports, this is the first sentence, it says:

“South Africa has a very high level of crime. Violent crime such as armed robbery, rape, carjacking, mugging and smash-and-grab attacks on vehicles affect visitors and residents alike.”

The first sentence.

An HON MEMBER: No, that is false.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: When you open a UK website to travel to South Africa it says:

“There is a very high level of crime, including rape and murder, in South Africa.”

If you open the Canadian website it says:

“South Africa has a very high level of crime. Crime is the primary

security threat to travellers.”

This is totally unacceptable, Mr Deputy Speaker, and of course again, this is where the ANC and the policing of crime in this province and this country rest directly with them, and this is where they have failed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Shifting the blame. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: If we look at what has been happening just of late, and of course we respect absolutely anybody’s right to protest, but when protests in our region start turning criminal and start burning infrastructure, the news headlines again, around the world, have a look at the lawlessness and the unacceptable behaviour of our own people and how it affects our brand in an international market.

We just have to have a look at what happened in the last week while in Hermanus and in Stellenbosch, but what really hit me the hardest is when public order police are called in – not a provincial competency – the public order police come to our municipalities and say, “Can we please lend some rubber bullets because we do not have sufficient, or we have run out.”

Mr P UYS: That is your story, man.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: If you are public order police that is the first briefcase you pick up when you go to work. [Interjections.]

And that goes to the next core problem with the resourcing of our police force. You hear it all the time: vehicles do not work, they run out of fuel, they are not maintained, we do not have sufficient vehicles, our police are now scared inside the police stations, they do not have rubber bullets where they have got to deal with unruly crowds. This is just not acceptable. It comes down to the kind of management we are seeing, and where are police in our country managed from? They are managed, according to the Constitution, via the National Minister who is responsible for making sure our police forces are resourced ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You will never [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and making sure that our people in our provinces are feeling safe in their homes... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Give up.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... are feeling safe at their business, are feeling safe in their everyday lives. [Interjections.] And what is happening again in my Department is we are taking money away from normal economic development

projects and putting them into safety and security projects.

I will tell you about the first one, the ATM fraud that we have invested in. I have put R1,5 million now of Economic Development money into an ATM fraud project where we, along with Minister Fritz' students coming out of Project Chrysalis, have brought the average of 45 to 50 hits a month in ATM fraud in the bottom part of the City, down to one or two since we have embarked on this expenditure.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It goes to Table Mountain safety and security... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... your time has expired. Just finish off hon Minister, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is evidence, without anything to show from this House, the ANC has totally failed the people of this country and this province. [Applause] [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are the failed MEC.

*[Debate concluded]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That concludes the debate on this subject. We move on to Interpellations. The first interpellation is in the name of Minister Grant. I see Minister Grant.

**INTERPELLATIONS:**

*Stability in the taxi industry*

**1. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

What intervention strategies has his Department used to restore stability in the taxi industry in the wake of (a) the most recent taxi strike and (b) the taxi elective conference of the South African National Taxi Council?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thanks Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to hon member Hinana for this interpellation. What intervention strategies has my Department used to restore stability in the taxi industry in the wake of the most recent taxi strike and the taxi elective conference?

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is necessary to give some background to the dispute referred to between the Western Cape branch of the South African National Taxi Council, SANTACO, and the self-styled Minibus Taxi Industry Task Team. When SANTACO initiated election processes in 2017, in terms of their 2005 Constitution, the newly formed MTITT questioned the processes as well

as the applicability of the SANTACO and Provincial Constitutions. This led to the destructive and violent actions of 18 September 2017. At this point my Department and I undertook to play a facilitative role to intervene, but not to interfere in what are internal processes.

With the agreement of both parties, my Department and I facilitated a mediation process led by retired Supreme Court of Appeals Judge, Ian Farlam, who, after hearings, delivered an opinion that provided the necessary clarity on the issues. Both parties agreed that the mediation process had been conducted freely and fairly.

In November 2017, the following failed attempts by the national offices of SANTACO to get the parties to agree on the implementation of Judge Farlam's recommendations for the holding of elections, my Department briefed senior counsel with the intention of obtaining a declaratory order to bind all parties to a constitutional process for elections. Before the Department could lodge its papers, however, the task team had lodged its own papers, seeking a similar declaratory order, but with the inclusion of additional demands, such as an order for the Department to fund the hosting of a pre-elective conference, and a cost order against the Department.

The High Court handed down an order on 6 June 2018. I, with the approval of both SANTACO and the task team, requested Judge Farlam to advise parties on the correct interpretation of the judgment and its effect on planning for the elections and the taxi industry indaba. On Monday, 30 July 2018, I met

with the national president of SANTACO and members of his national executive, to confirm my joint commitment and support for free and fair elections. I also requested SANTACO national and Judge Farlam to meet with both groups. Meetings were arranged for that same afternoon, 30 July 2018.

Despite the court order, all of the interventions described above and support provided by my Department and SANTACO's national leadership, the task team threatened to withdraw taxi services unless their demands for a pre-elective conference were met. Including the lifting of the suspension of two of their members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister, your first slot has expired. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. The taxi industry is a very integral and important industry in terms of generating the economy, but as I will expose, the violence is curtailing that progress.

In 2015, the minibus taxi industry provided 320 000 passenger journeys per day, or 116,8 million journeys a year. This number has since increased no doubt due to the many failures and instability of Metrorail.

By 2017, minibus taxi journeys increased to 480 000 passenger journeys a day, or 176,9 million journeys a year. In fact, Mr Deputy Speaker, the minibus taxi industry has replaced Metrorail as the leading form of public

transportation in the province.

In 2015, Metrorail provided 575 000 passenger journeys per day, or 209,8 million journeys a year. By 2017, in comparison, minibus taxis overtook Metrorail as the main form of public transport as the number of journeys declined rapidly to only 360,000 passenger journeys per day, or 131,4 million journeys per year. In other words, Mr Deputy Speaker, the minibus taxi industry has had 45,5 million more passenger journeys than Metrorail per year since 2017.

As the primary source of public transport in the Western Cape, it is essential that this industry works efficiently and harmoniously. It is imperative that learners, young professionals, †magogos [grandmothers], who are primary commuters, do not fear losing their lives due to the taxi violence between competing taxi associations.

The question therefore to the Minister is: what affect does this violence have on our economy, and what affect does it have on the lives of the innocent, poor people who are on a daily basis depending on the services of this industry, and what is it that must be done in order to make the industry operate safely?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon member Dugmore.

An HON MEMBER: Whoa!

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. As I think this House is aware, the ANC MPLs on the Standing Committee in this Legislature, myself and comrade Nomi Nkondlo, out of deep concern within the ANC around the withdrawal of services, what others refer to as a taxi strike and the impact that it was having on commuters, decided then to engage with the MEC Grant, to look at getting a full briefing and to basically ask the question as to whether there was a role that we as the ANC could play in actually helping to stabilise the situation.

As a matter of record, that... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The only instability is your [Inaudible.].

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... that the ANC, together with SANCO and our councillors from the City of Cape Town, began a process of engaging both the Minibus Task team as well as SANTACO, and in the process we were successful in achieving an end to the withdrawal of services which took place on the Monday.

I think it is very clear that issues related to the taxi industry are not easy to resolve, they are complex and I think it is important for no party to claim easy victories, but I think what has been achieved and in the further meeting that was held with SANTACO national, as well as SANTACO in the Western Cape, as well as members of the task team, there was then a commitment to look at the roadmap in regard to the convening of all the regional conferences

that are supposed to happen, as well as the provincial conference, which would then elect a new SANTACO leadership.

But I think what is important is for the MEC, as well as the Standing Committee, to reflect... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... honestly on what are those issues which have actually contributed to the divisions and tensions within the taxi industry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time has expired for this slot. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, one the many social ills plaguing taxi industry violence, is intense and unregulated competition. Whilst competition is good and a necessary part of any healthy economy, where it is unregulated it can cause devastating consequences. This is exemplified by the many shootings and murders over the lucrative taxi routes, and this is something that has to be resolved and the allocations of the routes be done following the prescription of the rule of law.

Presently the Standing Committee is reviewing the National Transport Act 5 of 2019, better known as the “Uber Bill”. Amongst others, it attempts to restrict where Uber drivers can conduct their business. However, it does not

do the same for the minibus taxi industry. It is problematic that we are not applying the same regulations to all transportation services in the industry, particularly to the industry which is known for violence.

We cannot, Mr Deputy Speaker, deny the importance of the taxi industry as it provides a vital source of revenue through our informal economy, by providing drivers with employment and skills and driving small-scale business management. However, this industry needs to be regulated so that the drivers are not exploited, the taxis remain drivable, ticket prices are not unfair and passengers also feel safe.

Hon Minister, the question is therefore what scope is there to regulate the taxi industry and for how long should taxis who have applied for permits wait before they are granted their permit so that they can operate without any fear of being the targets of their rivals?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

An HON MEMBER: A good question [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. I think when one looks at the court papers in regard to the entire issue of who approached the High Court in terms of getting a declaratory order around the status of the Farlam Commission which had been appointed to investigate issues, I think we must be very careful to describe the Minibus Taxi Industry Task Team as a

grouping which stands alone, because in fact there were 11 applicants who sought clarity on this. It was CATA; it was CODETA, it was the taxi associations affiliated to CATA; the Park City Taxi Operators; Kenfac; Route 7 Transport Service; Mitchells Plain; Century City; Main Road Taxi Association and Proteaville.

Now I am not in that sense talking up the issue of the task team, but the reality is that some of these problems were a result of concerns around the governance of the taxi industry, but I think the real issues that the Standing Committee and the MEC need to look at... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just finish off.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... is how we actually deal with issues such as permits, the impact of MyCiti on the taxi operators, issues which have been left unattended... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... by this Committee.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am deeply concerned about the media reports in the Western Cape. Since 2014, there has been an increase of

14% in taxi-related killings. This also brings into focus the murder of Mr Dan Khumalo, a respected figure in the minibus taxi industry in Cape Town and a senior leader in the Cape Amalgamated Taxi Association, CATA.

In response to a previous parliamentary question, the MEC, Mr Donald Grant, highlighted that the Department has arranged briefings and information sharing with SAPS Crime Intelligence to assess the disputes surrounding taxi-based violence. Additionally the Department is establishing an integrated task team with SAPS, the National Prosecuting Authority, SARS and others to investigate the root causes and perpetrators of taxi-related crimes and killings.

The question to the Minister is: what has his Department done to contain the strikes, the violence and to stop the murder by intervening in the taxi industry and up to now, what has been the situation after the tense strikes and the killings that have just happened? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a great pity I have only got two minutes to wrap this up because it actually warrants further discussion.

So summarising very quickly, I just want to say that to limit the recurrence of the mayhem and destruction resulting from the Task Team's 2017 strike, and

we must not forget about that, hon member Dugmore, that it was repeated on 6 August, my Department and I publicised widely the process followed and the fact that the Task Team had no further legitimate basis for action.

I also reminded minibus taxi operators and associations of their responsibilities towards commuters and the public, and also warned of consequences should they ignore legislation, the code of conduct for operators and the conditions attached to their operating licences. At this stage support for the Task Team started to decline significantly. That was during the course of the day on 6 August.

The task team called off the strike that Monday night, despite the fact that the Western Cape Government, SANTACO and opposition members had not acceded to their demands. It was also a long weekend which was coming which would hit the pockets of the taxi industry. That little reality is also true, but the Task Team strike action on 6 August coincided with the date that SANTACO's general secretary had communicated as the date on which the pre-elective special conference was to be held.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I can report to the House, however, that following my request for the president of SANTACO to urgently reschedule and condense the programme for regional conferences in order to ensure that the provincial conference can still be held, I can now advise the House that the new timetable will start on 11 September with eight regional elective conferences, and hopefully finish peacefully and productively with the provincial election

scheduled to conclude on 17 October 2018.

Thereafter, Mr Deputy Speaker, I look forward to working with the new democratically elected leadership of SANTACO so that we can give our commuters a better deal in the future. Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister, your time has expired. That brings us to the second interpellation. Hon member Botha to Minister Fritz. Minister Fritz?

*Development and empowerment of women in the province*

**2. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Social Development:**

What successes has his Department had regarding the development and empowerment of women in the province?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The victim empowerment programme of the Department of Social Development funds and supports 20,000 women that provides psychosocial support for women and their children; empowerment of women that access services starts from the point of intake, and I think it is an important point to make.

A social worker provides psychosocial support to empower women to develop personally and make informed decisions with regards to their own future, as well as that of their children. Areas that are focussed on are legal recourse, safety, planning and emotional well-being, parenting skills and strengthening resilience to ensure restoration and healing.

A total of 16 shelters are also funded by the Department to provide access to skills development courses, and I think I want to emphasise the skills development courses, because the whole idea is after a person has been admitted from an abusive husband in a house, because they are dependent economically on him, that you take a person into a programme where they are enabled economically, to then on their own go and work outside. I want to thank the hon Minister Winde who has now joined and we have partnered in relation to those skills development for women in those abusive relationships to come away from it and get into our shelters.

During the period March 2016 to April 2018 the Department funded three shelters for skills development, and 288 women accessed a range of accredited courses that included home-based care, chef assistants, first-aid, computer skills programmes, security guards, etcetera, and the interesting thing with this is again the partnership with some of our corporate partners to be able to absorb some of these women to work within some of those programmes.

For the 2018/19 financial year the Department is funding skills development

at all funded shelters to the amount of R852 000, reaching 800 women.

The Kensington Treatment Centre is an in-patient treatment centre for adult females that is specifically focused on substance abuse rehabilitation. The programme runs for nine weeks per client, the facility has been officially managed by the Department of Social Development as of August 2016 to date. Before that it was outsourced. We found that it was cheaper to run it ourselves. The facility has admitted 315 women since it has been fully managed by the Department of Social Development.

As part of the in-patient treatment programme, the female clients have been involved in the following skills development and empowerment programmes: life skills, and that includes decision-making ability, conflict management and conflict resolution, stress management, anger management, how to write a CV, job seeking skills, interview skills, money management, bead-making and they have the most amazing products from that... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister, you must just finish there, your time for this slot is... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and baking programmes... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... is expired.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and there is nothing about jumping off a roof.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Lorraine Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: You do not get it.

Ms L J BOTHA: Throughout Women's' Month I have found myself asking what is necessary to achieve substantive gender equality within our complex society? As we all know South Africa's society is incredibly unequal and has many social cleavages, including race, gender, religion, to name but a few.

According to the Poverty Trends Report for 2006 to 2015, 30,4 million people, or 55,5% of South Africans are living in poverty. By inference the majority of women in our country are living in poverty. The economic circumstances limit their access to opportunities, housing and access to basic sanitary products, including sanitary towels. Their circumstances make them more vulnerable to crime, disease and various other social ills.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Ms L J BOTHA: Of those women living beneath the poverty line, many are single parents. The South African Institute of Race Relations found the

proportion of South African children without fathers increased between 1996 and 2010 from 42% to 47%.

Our single mothers who live in poverty are struggling to provide financially and simultaneously care for their children. They do not have the luxury of being concerned with climbing the career ladder, saving up for a pension, building a great credit score or getting enough Vitality points. They are simply trying to keep their heads above water. At the same time those women who are lucky enough to earn a living wage, or better struggle for equal recognition in the work place, they struggle to earn equal wages to the male counterparts and they are subjected to oppressive gender norms, which restricts their ability to express themselves as individuals rather than objects. Many aspire to marrying rich rather than believing that they themselves can be successful. It is clear that women in both poor and wealthy societies alike are oppressed by the virtue of their gender.

Hon Minister, how is your Department ensuring that women in our society achieve their greatest potential? In terms of the 16 facilities that you have mentioned, going forward in the targeted number that was addressed, is this targeted number going to increase, and by what number will it increase? And given these figures, firstly of those unemployed women who take refuge in the province's shelters for victims, how satisfied are you that your Department is achieving the targets set for the recruitment and employment of women, and how does your Department follow up on the successes of these women in the shelters that were abused so that they do not go back to their

abuse relationships because of the fact that they are economically dependent on their abusers?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired. Hon Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question we are debating today is what success has his Department had regarding the development and empowerment of women in the province? And hon member Botha tried to give the basis of the question she is asking.

What comes to my mind is how do we measure the success of the Department when women themselves have not been consulted and engaged to understand what they need? The arrogance of this DA to think that they are the only ones who know what women need. We have been calling for a pro-women budget in this Legislature for the past four years. None of these Ministers sitting here today heeds our call. In fact they think that the solutions to women problems are all found in the Ministry of Social Development, which cannot be correct.

The Minister had the decency to increase the budget for victims' empowerment programme by a mere R13 million, when every day we hear how women fall victim. We ask again how you measure the success of the Department when the number of rapes, murder and human trafficking is on the rise; when most women are unable to find jobs because they are not fit

for purpose, and when they finally do get jobs, they are paid less than their male counterparts.

This Department refuses to understand that the current economic and social challenges affect women the most. Until they realise that women are responsible for looking after this country and this province's children, until Minister Fritz and his Department understand the bigger picture, there will be no success in women development. Until they understand that empowering women is empowering the nation, and until you understand that, 852 is not enough to empower 800 women, until you understand how serious and how big the problems are ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... that women are facing, and that women want to participate in the economic mainstream.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have heard now hon member Makeleni remarking that the Provincial Department of Social Development does not prioritise gender equality because it does not have one single programme dedicated to women.

I feel that it is important to discuss the importance of gender

mainstreaming... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Serious?

Ms L J BOTHA: ... and its role in DSD. Yes, serious.

Gender mainstreaming is the public policy concept of assessing the different implications for women and men of any planned policy action, including legislation and programmes in all areas and levels. Mainstreaming offers a pluralistic approach that values diversity among both women and men.

This concept was born from the 1985 third World Conference of Women in Nairobi, Kenya, and has since been pushed in the United Nations development community. Rather than collating a single piece of legislation or a single programme dedicated to women within DSD, gender mainstreaming would argue that we need to consider the impact of gender in every document, conversation and piece of legislation or programme that we run. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen.

Ms L J BOTHA: My question to the Minister is to what extent has his Department employed gender mainstreaming in DSD to support and address issues pertaining to women in place of creating a single vague policy.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie mooi, Lorraintjie, baie mooi.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Very good, Lorraintjie, very good.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makeleni?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is baie goed.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is very good.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. What hon member Botha is saying is exactly what we have been saying over the years, and today it is clear that women are agreeing, and I call upon women from all walks of life... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Deal with that man.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... to unite and support each other. Women, when we are united we are strong, hon member Botha. Let us ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us hope she keeps that, nè?

Ms P MAKELENI: ... look up to the strong women who live and led before us. The likes of Ma Winnie Mandela and Mama Sisulu. Let us rise and empower ourselves. As we rise let us lend a hand to empower other women

because we are the bond that keeps the country together. We are †imbokodo zoqobo [real rocks]. Women must rise and women must unite.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister, how do you ensure that women in our communities are communicated to by your Department about development of women and the programmes that are ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I do not think he has got the answer.

Ms L J BOTHA: ... ensured to them by your Department, and how does the Department track those women have been in the shelters and have acquired the skills that you spoke about, and their development, to ensure that they are now women that can be attractive to the job market out there so that they, and I reiterate once again, that they do not have to go back to their abusers because of economic reasons, that they are dependent on them to put bread on the table for themselves and for their children?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. I must really thank the two hon members for asking those questions. Those are potent and real, serious substantive questions, and I do not think we must trivialise it. Hon member Dyantyi, it is very serious, those are serious questions.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give the answers, do not go around.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And I really want to start...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to start, Mr Deputy Speaker, with exactly the point I made earlier. The hon member Makeleni makes a very important point... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But answer then.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: She says this – can you shut up and listen to what I am saying? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Dyantyi, I will deal with that. Minister Fritz, you have just gone slightly too far. Just... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please, we had calmness in the House until you came in now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member Makeleni makes a very important statement and in that statement she says that the responsibility of the empowerment of women and acknowledging the importance of women is everyone's responsibility. It is all the departments' responsibility, and it is in that context that we work very closely with Economic Development, I work very closely with Minister Grant – listen to what I am saying. I work closely with Minister Grant, I work closely with Minister Meyer, the Minister of Finance. I took him with me to say let us create an environment first... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is the other man, he is the other man.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and you make a very important point.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jirre!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Lord!]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... to firstly create an environment not only for women, but for girls, girl children who are at high school to understand, as you spoke about. The hon member spoke about gender targeting... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja! [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and gender consciousness, also in terms of health, reproductive health so that people can make decisions as young as 16, 17. And when you go through that programme, you know, and a number of – hon member Botha, you asked the question about when people get jobs. When we get them out of abusive relationships into our shelters to empower and skill them so they – and I made that point – can be placed with corporates. [Interjection.] Exactly, that is the point. Am I getting with you?

So the point... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Do not wait until they turn 18.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You know, either I speak or they speak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, protect me.

An HON MEMBER: They speak nonsense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will protect you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja, they just talk nonsense all

the time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has almost expired. You have another 20 seconds. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to also just finally say that we will continue to work in a transversal way with Department of Health, with Department of Education, with all other departments and not in silos, to continue and not just to talk here and romanticise about women equality... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ooo, jirre.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh Lord.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... like hon member Dyantyi... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down! [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... but to make it a substantive issue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because all they can do is

romanticise... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sit asseblief! Sit asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit please! Sit please!]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... issues. Not you, hon member Makeleni. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Those men next to you. Those abusive men next to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister, your time has expired. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you started too early, your interpellation only comes now. Hon member Dyantyi to Minister Bredell. [Interjections.] Order. Order! Minister Bredell?

*Land grabs and violent service-delivery protests: steps to be taken*

**3. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether his Department will be investigating all the municipalities in the Western Cape for corruption and other irregularities in light of reports that more than six municipalities in the province are hotbeds of tender irregularities, maladministration and the irregular appointment of senior staff?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you for the interpellation.

My Department has always investigated complaints relating... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please give us something better than the previous Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... to allegations of fraud, corruption and maladministration, as well as tender irregularities at municipalities.

The following steps were taken in respect of each of the municipalities:

- In George Municipality, my Department of Local Government

requested the Provincial Forensic Services to scope the allegations of, amongst others, corruption, maladministration at the George Municipality. The outcome of the scoping exercise indicated *prima facie* evidence of alleged fraud, corruption and maladministration. After being briefed on these findings, I instructed that the evidence be made available to the Hawks for investigation.

Premised on the evidence the Hawks conducted a search and seizure operation at the premises of the George Municipality and private homes. The Hawks, together with the Provincial Forensic Services is currently investigating the matter. I am in the process of also implementing Section 106 of the Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000 in the municipality.

- The second one, Bitou Municipality. As per the Council resolution a forensic investigation, in respect of Section 57, managers and procurement related matters, was initiated at the municipality during which further *prima facie* evidence surfaced, which was outside the scope of the initial investigation.

I have since implemented Section 106(1)(b) of the Local Government Municipal System Act, read with Section 7 of the Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Acts Process, in that I have designated two independent persons to investigate the allegations of maladministration, corruption, fraud

and other serious malpractices in the municipality. This investigation is still ongoing.

- Kannaland Municipality: The Provincial Forensic Services were requested to conduct a forensic investigation into several concerns identified by the Kannaland Municipality, with the aim of assisting my Department in its endeavours to strengthen and support the municipality in terms of Section 154 of the Constitution.

This investigation was conducted, subsequent to an intergovernmental agreement entered into between the municipality, the Provincial Forensic Services and my Department. The forensic investigation has since been concluded and the final report was handed over to the Hawks in November 2017 for further investigation. While the Hawks are concluding the investigation they have handed certain cases over to the Director of Public Prosecution for prosecution.

- Oudtshoorn Municipality: My Department received a request from the municipality to investigate certain allegations relating to the tender irregularities in the municipality. The Forensic Services were requested to scope the allegations of tender irregularities. The outcome of... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, I think you must stop there.

Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I was still listening when his time expired because I am wanting him to answer the question completely. Otherwise I could give you my time so that you answer and really account for your failures. Thank you very much for that piece so far, hon MEC.

Mr Deputy Speaker, so that he can answer better – I do not know if you he will mention all of them. The problem that you have is bigger, hon Minister. George, Kannaland and Beaufort West are under investigation by the Hawks for fraud, racketeering and corruption.

George, where a raid by the Hawks took place and you have referred to that, has been investigated for alleged of fraud and corruption, Kannaland for alleged racketeering, while Oudtshoorn and Beaufort West for alleged fraud and corruption. These are serious happenings in these municipalities.

Your Department was investigating improper allegations in the Bitou Municipality regarding the appointment of the head of Corporate Services. The Cederberg Municipality is being probed for alleged tender irregularities

on grant funding, and Stellenbosch Municipality over similar irregularities. The Department has also referred supply chain challenges in the Theewaterskloof Municipality to Provincial Treasury for further investigation and support, and the alleged sale of public land in the Langeberg Municipality has been referred to the Department of the Premier, Legal Services for further investigation. The list, under your watch MEC, is growing.

So far you have mentioned 106 about three times, and you have not completed the answer. I am not sure whether 106 is going to be the cure, or there is something else that you are not doing that you should be doing, because 106 now becomes a reaction kind of thing to it.

Again, you have mentioned, more than twice, Forensic Services. You are likely to do forensic investigations on all 30 municipalities with the trend that you are on now. 106 here, forensic investigation there and then the Hawks there. And then what? Because it takes us back, if I may remind you, to that anti-corruption strategy. Do you think that it is really effective, is it working, that you are forced from one municipality to the other to do 106, to do forensic audits, to take them to the Hawks and so on? [Interjections.]

Remember this is the best run government in the province. This is the best run government. These municipalities that you are mentioning are getting clean audits, sir, clean audits.

Now how do you compare the two things? [Interjections.] Clean audits on the one side ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just finish your sentence.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... and corruption on the other?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired for this slot.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I can finish my time... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, your time has expired. The hon member Mngqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

*[Hon member Maseko takes the Chair as the Temporary Chairperson.]*

Mr M MNQASELA: Chairperson, I think the question that we must ask and perhaps in appreciating what the Minister has said to us, is what did the ANC do when they were in government?

An HON MEMBER: Nothing.

Mr M MNQASELA: The hon member Dyantyi was the Minister of Human

Settlements and Local Government. [Interjection.] What we can remember is all the inefficiencies ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member... [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and corruption and that Local Government ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... is now are sitting here... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... do not drown the speaker.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... with the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am just giving him his [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: We need to be frank, we are sitting here with the Western Cape, hon Chairperson. In the recent release by the AG on the audit outcomes, the AG said that out of 33 municipalities that received clean audits in South Africa, 21 are in the Western Cape, and that represents 64%. The ANC run municipalities received 36%. The ANC loves the 33s and 36s, that is the pass rate for them, and they think that is good performance.

We are doing something that the ANC should learn. I would actually expect

the ANC to stand up and thank the Minister in this province and this Department... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For all these things [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: ... for being a beacon of hope to say to South Africa that it can in fact be done.

†UMnu Q R DYANTYI: Hayi Masizole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: No man, Masizole!]

Mr M MNQASELA: So I would expect, hon Chairperson, because we are sitting with a situation where almost R28 billion, nationally, has been squandered on irregular and fruitless expenditure in this country by the municipalities, that we cannot be happy when politicians and senior public officials in municipalities confuse the public purse with their own private wallets, run governments like spaza shops. But in this province we dealt with Oudtshoorn. Your councillor was the Mayor, he was sentenced to five years in prison last year.

*[The Deputy speaker takes the Chair.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order hon member, your time...  
[Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: So that is what we are doing in this province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. I was just about to let him sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may start.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The findings of the forensic investigation into alleged unlawful activity at the Stellenbosch Municipality, MEC, should be made public immediately, and I would want you to, before you sit down today, to really commit to do that, and the findings in the report were referred to a disciplinary committee in May 2017 for further investigation. The findings of the disciplinary committee were referred to Council on 23 May 2018.

The DA run City of Cape Town has incurred R47 million in irregular spending. The best city, hey? Topping the list, three municipalities in the

province have together spent R173 million in 2016/2017 without following legal prescripts. Very basic. †Die basiese dinge wat hulle nie doen nie. [The basic things they do not do.] The best run municipality †van die Wes-Kaap [of the Western Cape.]

Okay. He raised the Auditor-General. The Auditor-General pointed to the City's weaknesses in consequence management, that people do wrong things, and get off scot-free. Nothing happens to them because they are DA pals, that is the problem that we have. You are not mentioning that and revenue management and political instability in smaller municipalities.

The main contributors to irregular expenditure were the City of Cape Town, MEC, with R47 million; Beaufort West R36 million; Eden District R32 million, and R163 million irregular expenditure related to non-compliance with supply chain management regulations. Again another basic thing that should not be rearing its ugly head again. 98% of the SCM related irregular expenditure involved current year transgressions that can be isolated to unjustifiable deviations.

So they deviate, this contract, they say: "Let us deviate from what is common."

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Again another DA mess up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I again want to stress this, the ANC cannot lecture us on this one.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, we are showing you the way.

Mr M MNQASELA: They have got one of the DDGs...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are showing you the way.

Mr M MNQASELA: They have got one of the DDGs, Mr Sitisho, who was sentenced in 2005. In fact he has been sentenced for issues like fraud, corruption, for embezzling public funds and using credit cards that belong to Government, in an amount of R104 307, and that is one of the amounts. The other one is where he took loans, Government loans because he needed to buy a car using money that did not exist in the municipality, and took in the excess of R163 000. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: We are talking about now [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: We are talking about Bitou now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: I am going to Bitou. Bitou is a problem that was caused by the ANC and we are fixing that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, you cannot go there, the time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: The problem, Mr Deputy Speaker, when I sum up...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... our problem is that... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we must deal with the supply chain management issues. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member!

Mr M MNQASELA: They are real.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.] the Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please adhere to the Speaker's call. I asked for

you to complete your speech. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is very clear, you can see by that kind of conduct, †die DA is diep, diep, diep in die ding. Is diep in die ding. [The DA is deep, deep, deep in this thing.] They are in trouble. [Interjections.] They cannot even respond to basic things. †Ek voel baie jammer vir julle, foeitog julle. [I feel very sorry for you, shame you.] You are in trouble.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Wilma Brady.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, do not even go there because it brings Helen Zille, the Premier into that. Mr Deputy Speaker, in summing up this issue before the Minister comes and responds, I want to call on you, hon Minister, I want to call on you – put that what you are reading aside – now I want you to rise, as Anton Wilhelm Bredell, the MEC, and say with all of these problems that we have outlined to you, can you turn over a new leaf?

You have at least eight months left. How can you use the last eight months because we are going to make them the last eight months for the DA. How can you use the last eight months to at least ensure that you attend to the mess of the DA because you are bringing factional stuff into Government?

You see that in Knysna, you see that in George, it is worse in the City of Cape Town. I mean today we just had three factions speaking in this crime

thing: Grant, Winde, Wiley. It is so clear, the DA just lost it. They have just lost it, and that which you have lost is affecting how we run municipalities, how things are done. Give us some plan at least for the last eight months.

†Dis julle laaste agt maande. [It is your last eight months.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb lid. Minister Bredell?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Minister Bredell?]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is a bit shocking because it is actually a very important topic and if we do not get rid of corruption we will never solve the service delivery issues within the country. [Interjection.]

Now a clean audit – let me state it again, a clean audit is not a forensic audit, so audits do not look at that. We are busy with the Auditor-General, but remember it is also not our institution.

Anti-corruption strategy, I think it works, that is why we are only busy with investigations in seven municipalities out of the 30. Corruption does not have a colour, does not have a party, but this party, the Democratic Alliance, is very serious of getting to the bottom of any corruption... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief! Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please! Please!]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and that is why, in a place like George... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oor my dooie liggaam.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Over my dead body.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Just listen. That is why in a place... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... like George, Mr Deputy Speaker, we allowed the Hawks to enter that space within two days before by-elections, because it is not about winning a municipality, it is about getting to the bottom of corruption. The problem we have got is the national institutions like the Hawks. We do not get an answer. We wait now for four months, give months. If we can get the charge sheet, we can get rid of the people. [Interjection.]

We cannot, and the hon member Dyantyi is supposed to know it, that the MEC does not have any authority over the Hawks. If we hand it over it is

independent. They must do it, and I can show him that in two municipalities, in Cederberg they found nothing, so all the allegations were rumours. The forensics have come up with no transgressions in Cederberg. In Theewaterskloof... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, is that a cover up now?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is no cover up. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In Theewaterskloof... [Interjections.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Luister, man!

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Listen, man!]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... it is being done by independent institutions. It is the same institutions that do George, that are busy doing the others... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Koebaai.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Goodbye.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In Theewaterskloof it is not about fraud or irregularities, it is about the supply chain and Provincial Treasury will support the municipality.

The other part of his interpellation was about the appointments of Article 57. You have not even touched on your own question. I do not even think you have read it. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Listen!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... in this province... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Your time has expired!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi, you are making a nuisance of yourself now. Unfortunately, Minister Bredell, your time has

expired, you cannot go into that topic.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Aw! Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.  
[Laughter.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of interpellations. We move onto Questions on the Question Paper. The first one is hon Uys to Minister Schäfer. Minister Schäfer the first question, Question number 3.

*Questions standing over from 19 July 2018*

*School transport collection points: Power Town*

**\*3. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Education:**

Why was the new school-transport collection point of the Power Town learners moved to a point which is much further away than the previous one and to a point that also exposes learners to greater danger?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and to hon Uys. The answer is that the so-called new transport collection point was not a part of the approved contract route, therefore it has not been moved.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is not correct. It was implemented, it happened there. Did you actually visit it or who informed you hon MEC?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is correct. The person was collecting people there but it was done on his own initiative, it was not approved by the Department and it was not approved as part of the contract route so he did do it for a while and then my Department found out about it and told him that he was not complying with the contract.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. How can a person working for your Department MEC, do it on his or her own initiative, not knowing where to pick up the learners, pick them up at a completely different area where they need to walk through a bush and your Department not knowing it?

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We contract with service providers who travel to pick up learners. The person who was doing it, wanted to go and fetch the children, because he knew they were there. My Department had not authorised it. When we found out about it we told him to stop. It is quite simple.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: It is not that simple hon, Mr Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will get back to you. Hon member Botha has the fourth opportunity otherwise [Inaudible.] this is your last one.

Mr P UYS: I mean when you sign a contract with a person delivering a service there is at least a couple of things in it, the first thing must be, and help me hon MEC, the pick-up point, the drop-off point, the time and you tell me that was not specified in your contract and then the learners had to go through all this trauma, and now you just say well the service provider is at fault.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The service provider is at fault, yes. There has been an application by the school to extend the route and to put on additional learners and it is busy being adjudicated on at the moment. The school will be informed, hopefully within the next week. But that is what happened yes, we do not see every single individual bus picking up every child every day.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon member Botha, do you want to ask a question. It is a last opportunity on this question?

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes. I just wanted to know were there any reports to the Minister that the learners had undergone this great danger?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon member Botha, we have a policy in place, which is actually a national policy on learner transport where learners who live five kilometres or more from the school can get access to learner transport. These learners are walking 1,1 kilometres so they do not fall within that policy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we move onto the next question, Question 7. Hon Joseph to Minister Schäfer again.

*Slangrivier Primary School : Governing Body*

**\*7. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) Why did the Department declare invalid the school governing body of the Slangrivier Primary School that was elected on 8 March 2018;
- (2) whether any complaints were brought against or disputes lodged against the members of the governing board who were elected on 30 May 2018; if so;

- (3) whether such complaints or disputes were investigated and acted on according to the procedure of the Schools Act; if not, why not; if so, what was the outcome?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer to part (1) is: the election process was declared invalid after a parent lodged a dispute. The district investigation showed that the school did not use a valid voter's roll to guide the nomination and election meeting. Part (2), yes, a second election took place on 31 May, not 30 May. A dispute was declared against the eligibility of some elected members. These claims are currently being investigated and (3), the complaints are still being investigated in respect of the second meeting in terms of the regulations governing the elections of school governing bodies.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister can you advise on the number of first elections that were successful as well as the number of second elections that were successful?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, I can. Thank you, hon member Botha. The total number of elections completed was 1 507 altogether, 712 of which were successful the first time around; 799 on the second.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Schäfer, how many disputes did you receive from schools in this year's school governing body elections?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you hon member. We received, in total, 71 disputes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move to the next question? Hon member Botha are you finished? You may ask your question.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. I just want to ask the Minister what has the Department spent on the 2018 SGB elections?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. We spent R1,57 million in total.

*New Questions*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then move onto the next question which is New Questions, number 1. Hon Lekker to Minister Plato. Minister Plato?

*New Questions*

**1. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether he has conducted an investigation into how the Democratic Alliance obtained the official database of all the CPF structures in the province, which was used to invite the people to join the DA's march for safer communities in Nyanga; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and also to the hon member for the question.

No, I did not conduct any such investigation and that is a question to be forwarded to the Democratic Alliance due to the fact that my understanding is that CPF's information is not classified information, they operate in the communities and their information is readily available for anyone that wants the information. It is public knowledge and it is open in the public domain and it is easy to get hold of that information. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to get an understanding from the MEC, in terms of the Democratic Alliance receiving email addresses, because that was a specific question, and following a letter that I sent to him asking him to investigate how the Democratic Alliance, as a

political party, received e-mail addresses of CPFs which is the property of the Department. Now I want to check with him, is that normal practice that his Department will give information to anyone that is requesting it or did they follow a process of requesting those documents through the PPI Act?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is a question the hon member must forward to the Democratic Alliance.

[Interjections.]

The fact of the matter is I can walk into any police station and get the EXCO members of the CPFs information, it is as easy as that. And that is not only the property of the Department, it is also the property of the South African Police Services.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker?

†UNKsz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you.] †Mr Deputy Speaker ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: [Inaudible].

Ms P Z LEKKER: I think it is about time you take your retirement.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think we must agree here that the office of the MEC has got no interest in the protection of information in terms of the PPI Act, instead is taking this opportunity to create an impression that anyone is entitled to information ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, this is an opportunity for a question ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... and my question to him would be when is his office going to refrain from involving itself in party political issues?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: If you have any proof hon member that my office has provided my party with CPF information, please bring that proof. I am not aware of it. I was not involved, my office was not involved. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We can then move onto the next question which is Question 2. Again hon member Lekker to Minister Plato.

*School Holiday Programmes : safety of children*

**2. Ms P Z Lekker to ask Mr D Plato, Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether his Department has put any programmes in place to ensure the safety of children during the school holidays; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and also to the hon member for the question.

The Department of Community Safety conducts its Youth Safety and Religion Partnership Programme (YSRP) in conjunction with faith based organisations during the June/July and December/January school holiday period. This initiative of the Department was established to create a safe environment for children and youth during school holidays.

The YSRP school holiday programme is part of the Department of Community Safety's Improvement Partnership Strategy and is conducted throughout the Western Cape Province in conjunction with faith-based organisations. Priority is given to areas with a high prevalence of gang activity and violence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In light of the Department's involvement with the public with these kind of programmes

during school holidays, is his Department considering enrolling this kind of programme throughout the year?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No. Mr Deputy Speaker, we just do not currently have the budget for all-year-long programmes of this nature and that is definitely something we can investigate. It is subject currently to available budget.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER. Thank you. Hon member Lekker, your second ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. If that is something that his Department can have a look at, can we at least get time-frames, as the African National Congress, in relation to these engagements that he is willing to undertake?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have got no problem with that request, it is a fair request from the hon member. As I have said before, definitely it is a new perspective that would be brought to our programmes and I will definitely take it back to the administration and consider that and keep the hon member in the loop. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank You, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, can you tell us how many children have accessed, over the last three years, this programme and how is the success or how was the success of this programme measured?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Just for the current December/January holiday period, it is in the region of 9 500 youth and the aim is to keep the youngsters off the streets, to keep them occupied at a centre like a church or a community town hall or whatever, wherever they find the necessary space. They have people working with the children; teaching them whatever; developmental projects programmes; sporting codes and things. It is really aimed to keep them away from the yard; to sit in the yard and to drink and to smoke and that sort of thing and it is currently quite successful. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Botha, the last opportunity.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister, within the province, is it more focused on the Metro children and if not, in the rural areas, how many sorts of the programmes are there on the West Coast?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is not aimed at the Metro alone. It is throughout the Western Cape Province: Beaufort West, Saldanha, Vredenburg, Lutzville, Vredendal, as far as I can recall but I am willing to

give you a full spec of the necessary rolling out programme pertaining to the rural areas. But, in saying that, seeing that you asked the question, it could be advisable for members of this House as well to engage their religious institutions to come and take part in the programme. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto Question number 3. Hon Makeleni to Minister Fritz. Minister Fritz?

*School Holiday Programmes: safety of children*

**3. Ms P Makeleni asked the Minister of Social Development:**

Whether his Department has put any programmes in place to ensure the safety of children during the school holidays; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you for the question, hon Makeleni. I see you sat next to each other when you wrote all these questions down because it is an identical question. So we have various programmes within the ECD Programme alone. Remember we have ECDs who also focus on a number of holiday programmes for other children, not only for their own residents and then we have the Parcel-Care Programme. The Parcel-Care Programme is an after-school programme that also operates during the school holidays to specifically keep children safe during school holidays. So that is the one programme and the Department of Social

Development is also funding a community based prevention and early intervention programme called the Isibindi Programme. Isibindi is implemented by community based organisations that employ child and youth care workers to support vulnerable children in their own communities. The primary goal is to provide daily practical and therapeutic assistance to children and their families. Among the other programmes that are provided through Isibindi is a programme called the Safe Park Programme. The Western Cape ESD has created 24 safe parks for children where they can play, do homework, receive meals, access counselling and specifically during holiday periods, this programme is operative.

The Western Cape Department of Social Development is also funding 11 drop-in centres. Drop-in centres have programmes designed to meet the developmental needs of children; physical, emotional, social development needs and providing basic services focusing on the provision of food; programmes to keep them busy during the school holidays; hygiene; personal hygiene even up to laundry in line with the Children's Act as you know is amended. This is an important point that I just want to make because you will notice in every single programme of social development there is a nutritional component so that the children get something into their tummies so that we do not have hungry children around. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to check with

the Minister how are the children and parents informed about these programmes?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Our children are encouraged to take part.

Ms P MAKELENI: And parents are informed about these programmes?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The Parcel-Care Programme is extensive. We have the best run programme and it is called Parcel-Care because it is an after-school programme and you can ask the Minister of Education, I do not see her here, but the After-School Programme is a very well audited programme, in other words: †jy sê dit bestaan nie, dit bestaan [you say it does not exist, it exists] and may I translate that into isiXhosa? Okay, and so the point we are making is that during school holidays that programme also absorbs a whole lot of those children that are part of that and parents are then informed via the normal structures that we inform them.

In fact in one of those programmes, an ECD programme, there is the app that also informs parents. But we have seen that the app is just being used during certain times and that is why we stopped it because it was too expensive.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, who are some

of the stakeholders with the Department of Social Development that make this programme successful?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Some of the stakeholders. I can mention, I can get you the list if you had asked me before the time because it is our MPOs. No, it is our MPOs who run it so if you ask me the question in that question then we will answer it like that. Thank you.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What do you want!?

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon Botha your second opportunity.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister, please focus. [Laughter.]. Are parents obliged to fill out indemnity forms for their children to participate in programmes like these within your Department?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I think that is a very important question, in all our programmes, indemnity ... [Interjection.] Are you going to protect me against the hon member Davids?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member Botha, the indemnity part is really important because part of the holiday programme,

hon members, is also to take our children outside the boundaries of where they grow up. Our children have been designated to townships and they live in townships, they grow up there. We want to broaden their boundaries, to expand their minds. We take them to Cape Town, to Table Mountain, to all those places so that their boundaries broaden, hon member Makeleni and they do not have that narrow-minded thing. So, yes it does.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Last opportunity hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. If the hon Minister can just speak to this House on some of the feed-back from parents whose children were involved in these programmes of the Department?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me just make one point. I said that the Parcel-Care and Isibindi programmes have now very specifically been subjected to audits and part of that audit was to get feed-back from parents. You see we must stop doing programmes for the sake of doing programmes. We must do programmes so that we have an impact in our communities and see the change in behaviour within those communities.

I want to just make the point, Mr Deputy Speaker, that in all our programmes, specifically in the transversal provincial strategic goals, we have very specific methodologies in assessing the impact and it is not just by the way, it is actually structured and ... [Interjection.] and yes, part of it all, is to get feed-back from the parents The feed-back is very positive, very positive.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question, Question 4, hon Mngasela to Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell.

*Contribution to Red Ants: municipalities*

**4. Mr M Mngasela asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (a) How much did municipalities in the province contribute to the Red Ants and (b) what services did they deliver?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you and thank you to the hon member for the question.

Out of the 30 municipalities, five municipalities utilise the services of the Red Ants. The details of the five municipalities are as follows:

City of Cape Town - the City paid for a duration of six months an amount of R1,2 million for the demolition of illegal structures at various relocations. Drakenstein Municipality utilised the services of the Red Ants during the 2016/17 financial year to the amount of R40 000 and for R21 000 to clear some erven in Stellenbosch.

The Stellenbosch Municipality utilised the services of the Red Ants from

May 2017 until July 2018. An amount of R1,6 million was paid for its services. The municipality appointed the Red Ants to render the following services: monitoring; patrolling and prevention of illegal land invasions; demolition of illegal structures.

Overstrand Municipality, which I think the hon member will be more interested in, because it is his constituency and the Overstrand Municipality utilised the Red Ants for the 2017/18 financial year. An amount of R4,6 million was paid for its services.

An amount of R2,8 million was spent in respect of tender awards which comprises of the following: R474 000 was spent on the disconnection and reconnection of electricity and water meters; R490 000 was spent on meter readings services in Gansbaai area. R1,8 million was spent on the management of informal settlements in the Overstrand area.

An amount of R1,8 million was spent in respect of deviation of security services for the civil unrest in Overstrand which comprises of the following: R134 000 was spent on Kleinmond riots for the period 15 to 18 September; R1,7 million was spent on the Hermanus riots for the period 26 March to 2 April and then Knysna Municipality, also utilised the services of the Red Ants. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, the figures that you have quoted, are these funds that the municipalities plan from their own budgets and there is no recourse, in terms of claiming from any source of funding from the Department or emergency funding? I am asking this because for instance, there is more than four, five million Rands from Overstrand alone and if you look at Stellenbosch and other municipalities, if it continues as it does, it will become a serious problem and I do not think it is something ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that we can leave unabated.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are limited to a question. You have asked your question. Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to the hon member. No, it must come from their own budget, the municipality enters into the contract with that and obviously it is the taxpayer that is paying for it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we proceed? We move onto the next question which is Question number 5. Again the hon Mmqasela to Minister Grant. Minister Grant?

*Fernkloof bypass Hermanus : plans*

**5. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

How does he and his Department intend to address the concerns regarding the plans for the Fernkloof bypass at Hermanus?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the member for the question.

In response, the concerns regarding the Department's proposed plan to relocate the existing R43 to bypass the central business district of Hermanus from Mountain Drive to Fairways Avenue will be dealt with in terms of the environmental impact assessment process in compliance with the National Environmental Management Act, Act 107 of 1998 as amended.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask hon Minister, in terms of this project, what do you have in mind? Will it continue in its current form, what are the views and feelings from the ground?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the process is now not in my hands, it is in my colleague Minister Bredell's, in terms of the EIA process, and following the outcomes of that

process, any of the concerns raised will obviously be dealt with thereafter.  
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Second question, hon Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: I am happy, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question which is Question 6, hon Beverley Schäfer to Minister Winde. Minister Winde?

*Agricultural Land: lease agreements*

**6. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

- (a) What is the current status of lease agreements for agricultural land owned by the National Government in the Western Cape and (b) how much unproductive agricultural land is there in the Western Cape as a result of lease uncertainty?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker and thanks to the hon member for the question. We have learnt from the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform that a total of 60 farms had been

acquired by the Government through the Pro-Active Land Acquisition Strategy. The idea with PLAS is that once the land is acquired it will be leased to farmers for agricultural development. However, of the 60 PLAS farms acquired, less than half, 23, have received long-term leases, i.e. 30 year leases from the Land Reform Department, whilst a large percentage is sitting with three year leases and in some cases expired leases or no leases. The implication of the current scenario is that the tenant farmers are discouraged from investing own resources for the development of the said farms. In addition, no private funder or banker is prepared to invest on the land whose security of tenure is questionable. Consequently PLAS tenants are forced to rely on conditional grants for their farming operations and grant funding is generally not sustainable. More so given the prevailing economic climate in South Africa.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the other reality is that delays in finalising lease contracts do lead to discouragement of the affected farmers which in our view goes against everything that the NPD seeks to achieve and then (b), as stated above, only 23 of the 60 PLAS farms have long-term leases and are thus enabled to invest their own resources.

This is not the case for the majority of the PLAS farms given the lack of tenure security albeit most farmers would continue farming even after their leases had lapsed and as a Department we continue to provide much needed extension and advisory support services to those tenants. This does undoubtedly affect productivity on these farms and remains risky for anyone

to invest on Government property without security. More so at the moment with the on-going land reform debate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, do you think that that poses any risk to primary agriculture as a whole? If think there is so little land available in the Western Cape you have got 37 farms that actually really have no leases, you cannot farm on a three year lease. So, does the Department at all get involved in any of these farms and is there any production happening on the farms and of the 37 are they operating perhaps with really very little income?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: First of all, with regard to the leases, we write regularly to try and encourage finalisation of leases; some of the farms, I actually have meetings on those farms and then invite the Department of Rural Development to come to the farm to try and really put pressure on them to get the leases finalised but I think maybe we need to go a bit further than that.

Right now with the talk on land, of course this Department does not actually talk about ownership, it only talks about leases. That is the EFF model. I think we must actually say how do we get these 23 farms with the long terms

leases into ownership and we need to have policies that determine how that happens and then the others, let us put a medium term lease in place so that you can get some confidence in a system and also what we should do, is be encouraging them on ownership as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question, Question number 7. Hon Maseko to Minister Madikizela. Minister Madikizela?

*Section 25 of the Constitution : effect on completion of housing projects*

**7. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

How will amending Section 25 of the Constitution to permit the expropriation of land without compensation affect the completion of housing projects in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The amendment will not have an impact, hon member, to the current projects because all those projects are built on Government owned land. But what it is already happening, the unintended consequences of how people interpret it, they are now starting to invade land all over the show and that puts into jeopardy the planned future developments in many of our municipalities. Those are the unintended consequences that we are starting to see. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko?

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Leader of the Opposition, if you can practice the skill of listening. Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, as a Minister and I know you interact in Minmec and you share ideas and you hear what is happening, is it necessary to amend Section 25 of the Constitution to ensure effective land reform knowing what is happening in other provinces? [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, hon member Maseko. Well it is not only me who does not believe that it is not necessary to amend Section 25. It is 59% of South Africans, who participated in public hearings, who also believe that it is not necessary to amend Section 25 of our Constitution. Already after public hearings in all nine provinces, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is a flip-flopping that we are starting to see between the two parties that supported this amendment as to what needs to ultimately be done.

You heard the President yesterday saying something else and the EFF is already saying something else. So this is a clear indication as we have always said that this is an election *foefie*. There is no need to amend Section 25 of

our Constitution. We can speed up land reform under the current Constitution [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Maseko, another opportunity?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. With that answer there is no other question I can ask.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of questions. We move onto Statements by Members. I see the DA first, hon member Botha.

#### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

“I am a product of my mother’s womb.

My purpose and future is what I strived for **BUT** you ripped me. You Hit me. You tied me down, **forcefully entering** the doors between my thighs **not because** of the way I dressed or combed my hair and not because I was out late but because of your **cold heart, greed and lust. NO MEANS NO!**

**NOT** maybe, or perhaps, but **NO!**

Yet you satisfy yourself despite my cries.

The pain I bore while you continue all the more.

**Brutally**, beating me, **Ripping** my body apart.

**I cry. I scream. I plea.**

**NO! NO! Means NO.**

Helpless. I lay there.

The rhythm, of my heart, slowly dissipating, until I feel the pain no more.

Powerless, teary eyed, while you continue, ripping me apart.

**NO! Means NO.**

My **dignity**, my **pride**, my **self-esteem**, my **womanhood**.

Away. Away. Away.”

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sorry, Mr Speaker, just a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just one second.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Will you please ask your two MECs, Grant and Winde to respect that woman speaking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I will look at them. [Interjections.]. Order, the member is on the floor. You may continue hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA):

“Away. Away. Away.

I am no more.

While you were watching, where you stood!

I, I was in pain. **My tears uncontrollably flowing.**

Helpless, I lay there. Cold, just waiting, waiting for someone, to rescue me.

**I did not, deserve,** to die in this way.”

This poem was written by Miss Nerine Schilder. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC?

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Everything the DA alleged against its Cape Town Mayor, Patricia de Lille, came to null and void. [Interjection.]. In fact the DA was wrong all along and its lies are now uncovered as the DA ran away from its many false reports and charges that could not produce a shred of evidence against De Lille.

DA mayoral hopeful, J P Smith, and his cohorts have egg on their faces, together with those that compiled reports at the expense of the overburdened Cape Town ratepayers. All those DA people with ulterior agendas to boot De Lille were wrong all the way, even the DA Chief Whip in the National Assembly, John Steenhuisen

The DA lost credibility and support, funders and other backers also withdrew. The DA risked all as it entered the 2019 election race flogging a dead horse. The DA only tried to save itself by running away from its fight with De Lille in which she gave the DA a few bloody noses in and out of court.

All that remains for the DA is to pay the lavish legal costs it fruitlessly incurred. But, the anti-black DA and its overlords must pay this from their own pockets and not leave it to the taxpayers of the Cape to foot the bills!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are so boring.  
[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA, hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Introducing safety procedures at school alone is not enough to ensure that every child is safe in school. While safety procedures demand a decent amount of accountability from educational environments and institutions, it should be underpinned by a whole of society approach on tackling this issue.

Taking into account the history of violence against children in the last few years especially, parents should not assume that their children are safe from abuse once they step inside the school gates. When one is vigilant untoward incidents ring alarm bells and start the possibility of confrontation and action.

†Wisselwerkende gesprekke tussen onderwyskundiges en ouers kan hierdie brandpunte en probleme belig. Dit benadruk gedeelde eienaarskap, dit gaan verder as slegs 'n bespreking van grade en onderrig, dit vereis 'n proaktiewe samewerking ten einde die daarstelling sowel as die monitering van veiligheidsprosedures, veral daardie gerig op infrastruktuur, hulpbronne, vervoer, sowel as die emosionele en fisiese welstand van die leerders. Sodoende kan 'n veilige, beheerde omgewing geskep word. Op groter skaal bestaan daar 'n nypende behoefte dat die regering van die dag 'n veiligheidsbeleid ten opsigte van stedelike en landelike leerdomeine moet afdwing.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Interactive discussions between educational experts and parents can highlight these issues and problems. It stresses shared ownership, it goes further than merely a discussion of grades and teaching, it requires a proactive cooperation in order to establish as well as monitor safety procedures, especially those aimed at infrastructure, resources, transport, as well as the emotional and physical wellbeing of the learners. Thus a safe, controlled environment can be created. On a larger scale an urgent need exists for the government of the day to enforce a safety policy with regard to urban and rural learning domains.]

†And Mr Deputy Speaker I think this is exactly what the DA does, creating quality education, safe school environments and positive outcomes for all learners. Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the EFF it is again the DA, hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. South African women are not a single baton but a dynamic force of numerous cultures who together define and shape our country, South Africa. Today I want to commend all women, young and old for simply being who they are. †Imbokodo [rocks] and I salute you. I salute women before us, women like Helen Suzman. Suzman who single-handedly, as a woman representing

women, challenged the apartheid government for all of us to have our freedom. A testament to this is her famous response to a National Party Minister and I quote:

“It is not my questions that embarrass South Africa, it is your answers.”

Mr Deputy Speaker, the baton that Helen Suzman had is passed onto us. We have a responsibility of being involved as decision makers. Let women speak for women. South Africa currently ranks in second place out of our fellow G20 members with 42% of our seats in Parliament occupied by women.

While this is admirable, women constitute 51% of our population. This means that 9% of our five million people are not being politically represented. Empowering women to become policy and decision makers needs to be at the forefront of the conversation of women empowerment. This picture is far bleaker for women in corporate leadership. Bain & Company found that in 2017, 31% of South African companies had no female representation in senior leadership roles. Only 22% of board directors were women and only 7% were executive directors. Only 10% of South African CEOs and only 2,2% of JSE listed companies CEOs were women.

This is not what Helen Suzman fought for. The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape is committed to the empowerment of women ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... and will continue to fight for an open opportunity society for all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has also expired.

Ms L M MASEKO: I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC. Hon member Davids?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA alienates itself even more from Western Cape voters as it relentlessly pursues unreasonable high tariff hikes on water, sewerage and electricity.

The DA has proven that it is now taxes people from their homes and punishes residents with punitive high prices on water and electricity; looting private people's purses in order to pay for the DA's ill-considered and failed planning ahead of the present crises with the drought and other problems.

The DA has forever pushed the prices up for service delivery and has now crossed the line of affordability for many poor and working or middle-class residents. People are waking up to sharp increases in rates and taxes with especially the shocking water and electricity tariffs, and even their own DA people are speaking out about it in the media.

Reports are coming in of municipal accounts that doubled and even went up three or four hundred per cent without any sign of improved service delivery to match the higher costs. Cape Town's people are not only the ones suffering under the DA's high handed dealings. Other DA municipalities follow suit.

The DA philosophy, as voiced by the Cape Town Deputy Mayor, Ian Nielson, says: "If you do not like the prices move away." Move away where? DA, where must the people of South Africa, especially the people of the Western Cape move under your government? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA, hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Evaluation and Network Analysis of the Cape Town–Stellenbosch Tech Sector, a report commissioned by global research firm Endeavour Insight, found that Cape Town's entrepreneurial tech sector now employs more than double the people employed in the same sector in Lagos and Nairobi combined.

Cape Town's Tech sector employs between 40 000 to 50 000 people making the city Africa's leading tech hub creating the most tech jobs on the continent. This is a fantastic achievement from the DA-led Western Cape which prioritises cutting red tape for business development, mentoring emerging entrepreneurs and stimulating investment in key economic sectors.

I must commend the Cape Innovation and Technology Initiative, Wesgro, the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government for this outstanding work. Cape Town authorities have been pushing to establish the city as an innovation hub and the silicon valley of Africa. The city has produced multiple firms such as Naspers, GetSmarter and Clickatell which have stood out for their innovative breakthrough and have had a strong global presence as a result.

The report states that while Cape Town has just over 500 tech companies, the city has generated an objectively higher level of productivity than Lagos and Nairobi combined if employment is used as a measure. Cape Town's tech sector has generated over 40 000 employees compared to the 9 000 in Lagos and the 7 000 in Nairobi. This means that the Cape Town's tech sector is booming in jobs and productivity under a sound-led DA Government. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ACDP, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, for the first time in a long time Knysna is united under the mayorship of Mr Mark Willemse. [Interjections.]. My question that I want to ask Minister Anton Bredell today and Minister Bonginkozi Madikizela: why do you want to get rid of Mayor Willemse? Are you putting a political agenda ahead of the residents of Knysna? [Interjections.]

For many years, for many years there have been serious allegations of corruption, ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... maladministration and poor leadership. Mayor Willemse has united the town politically around one common goal and that is putting the residents of Knysna first ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order member. Just one second. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I wanted to request that member Christians be protected. It is not fair how he is being treated.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree totally with you. Hon member Christians will be protected. Order, order all members. Order! Please allow the member the opportunity to proceed. [Interjections.]. Order, order! Minister I am also including you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mayor Willemse has united the town politically around a common goal and that is putting the residents of Knysna first by exposing alleged maladministration and corruption. Mr Deputy Speaker, when he was elected as Mayor, the question I asked myself was, what are his achievements?

In a short space of time he reintroduced the fraud hotline, he reviewed the process of the Draft Integrity Framework. He reviewed the process of the Knysna Municipality Whistle Blower. In conjunction with internal audit and risk management a few areas of concern were raised in respect of irregularities in overtime and critical areas of risk in housing.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the question remains – and this is the question the ACDP is asking: What is the DA hiding? [Interjections.] What is the DA hiding? [Interjections.] This makes the DA no better than the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...when it comes up to covering up corruption. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member your time has almost done. Please finish off.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP in the Western Cape is calling “Hands off Mayor Willemse!”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order. [Interjections.] Order. Order. Please come to order before we proceed. The ANC is next. Hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, amidst the celebration of our national Women's Month, shocking revelations of the abuse and ill-treatment of a female employee of this Western Cape Legislature came to the fore.

The direct and personal verbal attack by a senior white male manager ...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yoh! *Verkrampies!*

Ms P MAKELENI: ...on his subordinate is not a flash in the pan event. It is common knowledge that the said manager is a repeat offender and every time his outbursts of insults contain racist undertones. [Interjections.]

Allegations are that in the latest instance sexual innuendo is also at play. Due process followed after a complaint was lodged against the same manager and punitive resolutions were passed by the disciplinary process.

Yet, on appeal, the manager was victorious and it seems as if all is forgiven by the Legislature management and he will be returned to his position. Initially, the manager was not moved away as was suggested, but the black woman was moved. [Interjections.]

Upon further pressure on management it is now intimated that the errant manager may even be elevated to an office closer to the Speaker's parlour.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yoh! Promotion!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order.

Ms P MAKELENI: The Speaker is now challenged to take control of this situation, show the Legislature is serious and bring justice to a woman who has been seriously hurt, her integrity affected, and reputation put in the balance.

Ms P Z LEKKER: A white man is never wrong!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. The last opportunity is the DA. [Interjections.] Hon member Philander. This is her maiden contribution.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. We must uplift the most vulnerable in society. In 1993, I was in Grade 11, when my dad became a single dad, working both as a general worker and security officer at the Paarl Hospital.

Coming from a close-knit community in Paarl East, I know what it means to be dependent on family members and neighbours for moral and financial support.

Mr Deputy Speaker, today our support systems are increasingly falling flat. How many of our indigent households have had to survive these past few months without their social safety net?

On grant pay-out days, Auntie Antjie from Jansen Street in New York, Paarl East, gets up at 5am in the morning. After she makes her way to the municipality to pay her rates and taxes, she goes off to Shoprite to buy the necessities, pay her funeral policy and then with what she has in her bag – there is an envelope that she needs to give to the church on Sunday.

Heartbreakingly, many in our society are more vulnerable than Auntie Antjie. It must be our mission to uplift the “Auntie Antjies” in our communities. Today, I reiterate my own oath of office and commitment to delivering to our communities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I stand tall today, as that woman-child of Paarl East. I stand tall today as a woman-child that knows what it is to have very little. I stand tall today, proud to empower and deliver to the people of the Western Cape. Let us not forget why we are here today. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On that high note, it brings us to the end of Members Statements. We move on to the Order Paper again. Motions, on the Order Paper and I see the Chief Whip.

## **BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

(Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall

move:

That in terms of Section 3 of the Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Code of Conduct Act 202, Act 3 of 2002, that Adv P Burgess be appointed as the Registrar of Members' Interests with effect from 1 September 2018.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to that? No objections? Agreed to. Chief Whip?

(Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes for the purposes of maternity absence Rules 29 and 30 shall not apply.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to that? No objections? Agreed to. We move on to motions where notice is given. I see the hon member Schäfer waving there. Hon member Schäfer?

**MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates BEE and its failure on the Western Cape economy. I here so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the criminal elements as well as other external turmoil that hold our schools and specifically our learners, at ransom. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing sexual violence and molestation at schools under the auspices of the Western Cape Education Department.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the implication of 59% submissions to the Constitutional Review Committee against the expropriation of land without compensation. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the punitive water and electricity tariffs under DA municipalities in the province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House condemns the EFF's attempts to nationalise the Reserve Bank and the ANC's failure to unequivocally reject it.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the growing unemployment in the DA-run province. [Laughter.][Interjections.]

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Have you read your stats! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the regression in the audit outcomes of DA-run municipalities in the province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of policies, and particularly the Protection and Investment Act and the impact of foreign direct investment on the Western Cape economy.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing violence in the taxi industry and the progress towards the establishment of a representative and inclusive taxi board of control in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Are there any further? For the last time. Not? Then we move on to the next section. Hon member Botha, I see you.

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House express its sincere and deep condolences to the family of Mrs Brenda Arendse, a community activist, who passed away on Wednesday, 15 August 2018 and who will be solemnly missed by the community of Mitchells Plain. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there's no objection to the motion being moved without notice and no objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam first.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of Mawlana Ihsaan Hendricks Al-Nadwi after a long illness; notes further that Hendricks served as the President of the Muslim Judicial Council and was a scholar and an activist in the Palestine Solidarity Movement, who dedicated his

life to the fight for the liberation of the people of Palestine; and conveys sincerest condolences to his family and friends.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Maseko first.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Standing Committee on Human Settlements for its commitment to the people of District Six, that made it possible for the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform to agree to conclude a Memorandum of Understanding with the Provincial Department of Human Settlements, allowing the Provincial Department to complete Phase 3 of the land restitution program of District Six. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of Mam Zondeni Sobukwe, at the age of 91, the wife of Robert Sobukwe, late President of the Pan African Congress, at her Eastern Cape home; notes further that Mam Zondeni was a struggle icon in her own right, who endured pain and suffering at the hands of the apartheid regime as she fought for the liberation of our people; and conveys sincere condolences to her family and her political party and friends. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Kivedo first.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dankie, mnr die agb Adjunkspeaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy diepe dank en waardering uitspreek teenoor die twee boeties, Peter (14 jaar) en Gerry (8) Cedras, woonagtig op 'n groenteplaas in Philippi. Hierdie twee het vir etlike kilometers te voet hul siek hond gedra sodat die dier behandeling by die Dierebeskermingsvereniging kon ondergaan. Hul optrede is prysenswaardig en verdien lof.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie? Goedgekeur.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, hon Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deep thanks and appreciation to the two brothers, Peter (14 years) and Gerry (8) Cedras, living on a vegetable farm in Philippi. These two carried their sick dog on foot for several kilometres so that the animal could receive treatment at the Animal Welfare Society. Their action is commendable and deserves praise.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

†Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the killing of two police officers in two separate incidents on Friday last week; notes further that both officers, who were off duty were murdered and robbed of their firearms; conveys condolences to the families and friends of Constable Lonwabo Kili and Siyamcela Ncipa; and calls on the police to speed up the investigation to bring the perpetrators to book.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the award-winning Vredendal Hospital for its commitment to rural and poor communities as it continues to provide a state-of-the-art and first-world eye care centre to its patients. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the Mayosi family following the untimely death of leading UCT cardiologist, Professor Bongani Mayosi; notes his death is a great loss not only to his family, but also to the nation, as he was a great family man, an intellectual and a meticulous scholar; and conveys condolences to his wife, children, the entire family and friends.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys condolences to the family, friends and comrades of the murdered ANC councillor and Southern Cape leader, comrade Victor "Freeze" Molosi, who was gunned down outside his house after a governing body meeting at Concordia High School in July; and commends the SAPS for the arrests of five suspects. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Schäfer first.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the EFF wanting to capture the Reserve Bank of South Africa and the ANC for not coming out and protecting the independence of it. I here so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the continued arson attacks on Metrorail trains in the city after yet another attack this week at Koeberg, and calls on the National Government and State Security to intervene to end these acts.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to that motion being moved without notice? Nor against the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that punitive water charges have led to the City raking in close to R1 billion more than what it budgeted for; notes further that service charges for water revenue amounted to R938 million over recovery, while sanitation revenue stood at R188 million over its planned budget; accepts that this is daylight robbery by the City, which has been harassing struggling residents for years with exorbitant water bills; condemns this and calls for the scrapping of the erroneous and massive water bills.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Hon member Maseko, are you objecting? No? There is no objection to the motion itself, therefore it is agreed to. I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town Mayor, Patricia De Lille, leaves that office on 31 October 2018, following a protracted battle between her and her party; notes further that De Lille, who faced a litany of charges from the party, won her battle; notes the deal between De Lille and the DA is an agreement to avoid further exposing the levels of corruption in the City under the DA Government and condemns the DA for sweeping corruption under the carpet. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I sense there is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the preliminary committee report that 59% of South Africans are against amending Section 25 of the Constitution. Of the 149 000 written submissions already reviewed, 89 000 South Africans are not in favour of expropriation without compensation.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: I object.

An HON MEMBER: We object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P Z LEKKER: You must go to public meetings ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. You may proceed.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the City fails to maintain the Cape Town Stadium which is costing ratepayers millions of rands; notes further that Capetonians already forked out more than R105 million to pay for the upkeep of the stadium, and will pay an additional R89 million to the Cape Town Stadium SOC Agency for the current financial year alone; and calls on the City to achieve financial stability for the loss-making stadium.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further?

Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that gang violence in the province is worsening, and gangs don't have respect for the hon MEC Plato, as a man was shot dead and three others wounded in Lavender Hill, while MEC Plato was addressing a public meeting about gang violence in the area; condemns ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Must I repeat again?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I am going to read it again. Relax!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker. I will deal with that. Please continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER:

Condemns the senseless killing and calls on the ... [Interjections.]

†Uyangxola lamkhulu. [that old man is making a noise.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: These stations are there ...  
[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: Sit in your seat!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Just because you are not sleeping, you choose to make a  
noise!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms P Z LEKKER:

...condemns the senseless killing and calls on the Provincial Government  
[Interjection.] to put in more resources in the fight ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Plato, allow the member to continue.  
Are you done?

Ms P Z LEKKER: No matter how often ... [Inaudible.] sleeping. Do you know  
that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, are you done?

Ms P Z LEKKER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Ms P Z LEKKER:

That the House notes that gang violence in the province is worsening and gangs do not have respect for the hon MEC Plato, as a man was shot dead and three others wounded in Lavender Hill while MEC Plato was addressing a public meeting ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, what is the moral of the story?

Ms P Z LEKKER:

... about gang violence in the area; condemns the senseless killing and calls on the Provincial Government to put in more resources ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a statement!

Ms P Z LEKKER:

...in the fight against drug and gang violence. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Ms P Z LEKKER: The point was made, *mos!*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any more from this side?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes! I have got more.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the universal and widespread rejection of DA plans to in effect privatise public education and to allow for the sale of alcohol in the schools in the province; and notes further that in all the public hearings – Caledon, Riversdale, Oudtshoorn, Klawer, Paarl and finally in this Chamber ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You were not there!

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Mr C M DUGMORE: In four of them.

An HON MEMBER: You were not there! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE:

...notes further that in all these public hearings the proposed amendments were rejected outright; applauds the parents, teachers and activists in the province for taking a stand against this Bill which the DA, led by the Premier and MEC Schäfer wanted to introduce, but refused to come to the Standing Committee.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I sense, I hear objections. That will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Lekker?

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Umamele hle.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Listen now.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the police for the sterling job they have done in combating crime in the province since the launch of Operation Thunder, which has resulted in a number of arrests for serious crimes including murder and possession of illegal firearms and ammunition; and

calls on the DA-run Provincial Government to give all its support to the police as the operation continues.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Order! Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the continued praise of the apartheid colonialism legacy by Premier Helen Zille who shows signs of an irredeemable, arrogant and conservative person; notes further despite the Public Protector's findings against her, the Premier continues embarrassing the Province and herself, by the way, and sowing division amongst the people; condemns this unbecoming conduct by the Premier and calls on the Speaker to initiate a process to take remedial action against the Premier. I so move. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections to that motion. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the release of the Quarterly Labour Force Survey, Quarter 2-2018, which shows that the largest employment decrease was recorded in the Western Cape with 50 000 job losses between Quarter 1 and Quarter 2 of 2018 ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM:

...increasing the official unemployment rate in the province; notes the majority of job losses under DA rule, particularly in the agricultural sector, where not by accident, but due to structural problems which were created by the DA Government, particularly poverty ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM:

...and inequality under the DA. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Any objections to the motion being moved?

[Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern Cape Town incurred R47 million in irregular spending, topping the list of the three municipalities in the province that together spent R173 million in 2016/17 without following legal prescripts; notes the Auditor-General blamed this on the City's weaknesses including political instability; and condemns the DA for non-compliance which resulted in Cape Town, Bitou and Eden losing their clean audits.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Tyatyam again.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing away of Daliwonga "Loti" Damane, a long-time comrade and a member of the ANC, member of MKMVA. "Loti" as he was affectionately known, served diligently as a member of NEHAWU Regional Executive Committee and a member of the Anti-Poaching Fishing Unit of Delft, We convey sincere

condolences to his family and friend and in particular the children.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to that motion being moved without notice, nor against the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Lekker?

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Waqale apha.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Start here.]

†Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the release of a shocking book titled *The Lost Boys of Bird Island*, an exposé by journalist Chris Steyn and former police officer Mark Minnie; notes further the book laid bare a paedophile ring in Port Elizabeth, where young boys were abused and denigrated by National Party Ministers; and calls on the relevant authorities to uncover the full extent of statutory rape and crooked contracts to members of the ring. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself. Agreed to. Any further? Hon

member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the “blue” untruths that were waived by the Human Settlement MEC in the public meeting in Nyanga last night, when the MEC could not respond to the Nyanga upgrade of almost seven years behind; hostel to homes units’ development and that here in the House on 14 June 2018, the MEC indicated that the contractor was moving in to finish the seven houses at Freedom Square. Yesterday he did not know about seven unfinished houses, which are havens for criminals involved in rapes, murders, etcetera. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without [Interjections.] Are there objections? No? No objections.

An HON MEMBER: There is!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection? Sorry. [Interjections.] We hear the objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Order. For the last time, are there any further? There are none. Do we move on to the Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do not involve yourself ...  
[Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is a “blue” ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Just one second, Secretary.  
[Interjections.] Order! Please read the Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and constitutional matters on the Protection, Promotion, Development and Management of Indigenous Knowledge Bill [B-6D 2016] NCOP, ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Protection, Promotion, Development and Management of Indigenous Knowledge Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill.

This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. If parties wish to make declarations, we can do so, otherwise I am going to put the question. Any objections to the report being – is there a declaration?

An HON MEMBER: There is a declaration.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie, I will see you.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Indigenous Knowledge System Bill has four driving agendas, which are protection, promotion, development and management. To a large extent, the historical content which the Indigenous Knowledge System Bill addresses, is that of redress and transformation within the nation.

The indigenous knowledge system can be used as a very powerful tool for national dignity and social cohesion. The mainstreaming of indigenous knowledge is being addressed by the Indigenous Knowledge System Bill to deal with the marginalisation of indigenous knowledge.

It also recognises indigenous knowledge in the face of globalisation. The Indigenous Knowledge System Bill provides a mechanism for alignment of Government policies, streamlining of legislation, the coordination and facilitation of access to indigenous knowledge.

The Indigenous Knowledge System legislation seeks to create a balance between various interests in promoting economic and moral rights and creating a balance between the public interest and the individual right.

It also seeks constitutional rights, giving effect to the human rights in the Bill of Rights. The protection and [Inaudible] of genetic resources, additional indigenous knowledge and traditional indigenous culture expropriation has come to the fore internationally, during the last 20 or so years.

The realisation on the one hand that genetic resources and indigenous knowledge can yield valuable drugs and treatment for the world's diseases and on the other hand the adoption of music or songs, for example of the indigenous community without their consent or acknowledgement, has led to concerns in recent years, that protection of some kind is required to prevent abuse.

The ANC supports the Bill, which addresses the protection, promotion, development and management of the indigenous knowledge system. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I sense there are no further declarations of vote on this. If not, then I will put the question. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill? No objections? Then it is agreed to.

That then brings us to the end of Order Paper for today and the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:30.