
THURSDAY, 25 FEBRUARY 2016

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The SPEAKER: Order please, order. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

1. Reply by the Premier to the debate on the State of the Province Address.

The SPEAKER: I will now afford the honourable, the Premier an opportunity to reply to the debate. The honourable, the Premier Zille. Premier.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear, hear! [Applause.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole, gooi kole. Sy is te gou.

*Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals, throw coals. She is too quick.

The PREMIER: Thank you colleagues. Madam Speaker, you have to be very hard-hearted not to take pity on the Opposition in this House.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: But that cannot stop me from giving them the leathering that they really deserve today because they did not debate the State of the Province Address. They clearly did not even listen to it. They failed to present any alternative vision and the only things they could say was what I did not say, but whatever I say today cannot do them nearly as much harm as they are doing to themselves. I have not even begun my address, when they were already fighting with each other.

As I acknowledged the hon member Mr Magaxa as the Leader of the Opposition the hon member Mr Dugmore shouted out, “not for long”. It seems the hon member Mr Dugmore was right - not for long! [Interjections.] [Laughter.] It seems the hon member Mr Dugmore was right, not for long, because the hon member Mr Magaxa lasted a shorter time than Des van Rooyen. He made his first speech two days ago and he is no longer here.

The SPEAKER: Order please. Premier, please take your seat. Hon member Mr Dugmore, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, on a point of order, you know the Premier referred towards the end of her speech to the isiXhosa dictionary. Now I want to say in Xhosa there is a word for someone who lies, you know, it is: †Ulixoki, uyaXoka *you are a liar, you are lying. I want to ask you to ask the Premier to withdraw the statement... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, it is not a point of order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...because let us look at Hansard. She is referring to some interjection. I know that I have never said those words and she is casting aspersions on me. I would like to ask you to ask the Premier... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...to withdraw that statement and I would like you to consult Hansard because she is lying and she is misleading this House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore - sorry, Madam Premier, please take your seat. Hon member Mr Dugmore, that is not a point of order. It is actually a point of debate.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Ja.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: But as you have requested, let us read the Hansard and revert. So Chief Whip Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, but now can we deal with the fact that he has called the honourable Premier a liar.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: Now that is a little bit more important and that does need action.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Ja.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, in your closing point now you said she is lying and I would like to request that you withdraw that statement in the absence of us having reviewed Hansard and come back with a ruling.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker, would you be prepared to accept a withdrawal and for me to say that she was telling an untruth? Is that acceptable parliamentary language?

The SPEAKER: If you can withdraw please hon member Mr Dugmore, thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is not a negotiation.

Mr R T OLIVIER: But it is acceptable.

The SPEAKER: Alright, may we then proceed? Members, can I request your cooperation. If we are rising on a point of order let it not be a spurious frivolous point of order. I cannot entertain points of debate because I cannot talk to the factual, the integrity of a statement that is made. I am merely here as a Presiding Officer to ensure that procedurally we are correct, so if it is a point of debate please consider before you jump up and say it is a point of order. You may proceed, hon Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: May I address you on that, Madam Premier, because when people have points of order they must get up and say under what point in the Rules they are raising a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...is not in the Rules.

The PREMIER: And that is absolutely critical, otherwise by the time you rule somebody out of order... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: ...they have already made a speech. Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I take notice. Madam Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Now whether or not Hansard picked it up, I heard it clearly and wrote it down in my shorthand notes, because Hansard often does not pick up interjections. The hon member Mr Magaxa stood here and I said to him, “the honourable Leader of the Opposition”, and as clear as crystal the hon member Mr Dugmore said: “Not for long...” and now he is not here and the hon member Mr Dugmore is now determined to try and set it right what he said then, because there is such in-fighting in the ranks of the ANC that he will be the next one out because he said that about the hon member Mr Magaxa and I heard it as clear as a bell.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is that the best you can do?

The PREMIER: No wait, it is coming! But the hon member Mr Dugmore was quite right when he said the hon member Mr Magaxa would not be here for long, because he has not been. He may be outside addressing the masses of 35 people... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: ...but he certainly is not in this House today and I would like in his absence to extend my sympathies to the hon member Mr Magaxa because on his very first appearance in this House as Leader of the Opposition he is being stabbed in the back by his own colleagues. The ANC brings new meaning to the well-known phrase in politics that in politics your opponents sit opposite you but your enemies sit next to you or behind you and that is what is going on in those benches.

Mr P UYS: Take note of that!

The PREMIER: I do take note of it.

An HON MEMBER: You wish!

The PREMIER: Now when the ANC made their speeches... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: ...it had absolutely nothing to do with the State of the Province Address. They were reading from their election script and their election script goes like this in a sentence: "Their governance record is so awful everywhere they govern..."

Mr C M DUGMORE: Did you read Gauteng's speech?

The PREMIER: ...and they have so fundamentally failed to build a capable state that the only thing they have left is to divide South Africans on the basis of race and put the majority against minorities. That is all they have left.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] ... your race; that is all.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes, you people do not be [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And more and more people see through this and the more people see through it the louder they shout but it is just like crying wolf, they have no credibility left on this particular issue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members.

The PREMIER: So I was not surprised at all when the hon member Mr Magaxa cried “racism” in response to my speech and listen to what he said, because it was quite extraordinary.

He said: “racial prejudice runs through every paragraph, sentence and full stop of Zille’s speech.”

He obviously forgot to read between the lines as well. He did not listen to a single word I said because everything I said was about how we can redress the legacy of the past and empower all our citizens. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Ms P MAKELENI: You do not know what you are saying.

The PREMIER: He picked as the very worst example of racism from my speech the fact that I expressed my delight and surprise at the high takeout of books in our excellent library facilities in Khayelitsha.

Ms P MAKELENI: What was he... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Now I would like to recommend to the hon member Mr Magaxa - I do not know if he is the ex-Leader of the Opposition but he is certainly not here today.

Mr C M DUGMORE: He is still the Leader. Do not worry.

The PREMIER: The hon member Mr Magaxa - you must be worried because you had a prediction that he would not last long, but there he sits - or not, as the case may be, and I would like to recommend to him that he takes us to the Human Rights Commission... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: ...for providing excellent library facilities in Khayelitsha,

because he obviously sees this as an example of racist white violence. Now let me tell you that I went to look up the comparative statistics of library and library usage in South Africa, and it is this: according to a research report that surveyed all the libraries across South Africa the book takeout per year - and the last year measured was 2013 - the book takeout per year in the Western Cape is over 20-million per year. The next closest is Gauteng with less than half, nine million.

An HON MEMBER: Jo, jo! [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: But you know what the Eastern Cape is, less than one million. It is 817 000.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You celebrate that; celebrate that.

The PREMIER: I do not celebrate that. I celebrate the fact that in Khayelitsha people have libraries to go to. That is what I celebrate and you call that racist. [Applause.]

You call that racist when I am celebrating the fact that people in Khayelitsha have libraries to go to.

The SPEAKER: Order, order please members, Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: It is a national tragedy what is going on in the Eastern Cape.

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier, please take your seat please.

The PREMIER: You see, I knew that the ANC would find a way of calling me racist... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes, yes.

The PREMIER: ...by showing this comparison.

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier, please take your seat.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] ...poor black woman in this... [Inaudible.]

Ms P MAKELENI: There is nothing else... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] ...what you said about refugees.

The SPEAKER: Members, hon members, can I call your attention please. We can have interjections. We can even have heckling but you cannot drown out the speaker. Now on this last point there was so much noise that even I had to battle to hear so interjections are allowed but we cannot have a running commentary. Madam Premier, if you do not mind, I would like you to address the Chair. Please speak to me.

The PREMIER: I was addressing you all the time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just try and be dignified [Inaudible.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly! That is what you should do. Just be dignified.

The SPEAKER: Can I ask every member in this House to be honourable and dignified and maintain some sense of dignity and decorum. Hon members, please. Madam Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: So as I predicted sticking to their script, when I expressed delight that our libraries are being so well used in Khayelitsha, I am a racist, and when I point out that the Eastern Cape's library use is less than a million compared to 20 million in the Western Cape, I am also accused of racism. It is heads they win, tails we lose. That is how they work it on this race debate.

Mr S G TYATYAM: We are ready to do that.

The PREMIER: You see, our library facilities in Khayelitsha reflect the very opposite of racism. It reflects how much we care for the poor...
[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Who built the Khayelitsha library?

The PREMIER: ...and their access to facilities. Now I am addressing you, Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: But I hear an interjection like I hear all the interjections from the hon member Mr Dugmore even though he does not think I do, but I listen to them because he says the truth when he is interjecting and thinks that people cannot hear him.

†Me B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

*Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes.

The PREMIER: So he asked here, he said: "Who built those libraries?"

An HON MEMBER: You see, she is no longer... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Now the best used library in Khayelitsha is the one that was built with funds from the Carnegie Corporation that I negotiated while I was Mayor of Cape Town. [Applause.] And it is a magnificent library.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes, but you never even built schools.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: I am coming to him. I am coming to him in a moment. I am coming to him.

An HON MEMBER: Madam Speaker...

The PREMIER: I have not even started, yet he is already wailing. That library project with all of the IT infrastructure and everything else was so successful that Carnegie agreed to fund a second library in Khayelitsha.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: And now Khayelitsha has seven libraries and that is why we have such a wonderful takeout of books in those magnificent facilities ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: Have you been to the library in Site C, the Site C library?

The PREMIER: ... and the ANC calls that racist, Madam Speaker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Go to the library in Site C... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Now Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members.

The PREMIER: If you would like a really racist speech, and if I can refer the ANC to a really racist speech, I would like to remind them of their own President's infamous: "I am not an African-speech." Do you remember that one?

†Me B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

*Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes.

The PREMIER: He said when he was speaking on the ANC's election manifesto, no less ... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: He did not say that. No one has said that.

The PREMIER: ...he said that he was defending E-tolls, because he said we must stop defending... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: We must defend E-tolls and we must stop attacking E-tolls when he... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

An HON MEMBER: No, you are quoting him wrong here.

Ms P MAKELENI: Can we get back to the SOPA... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: I am giving you an example.

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier, please take your seat. Hon members, if I can address you on a point of clarity in case we do not know where we are today. Today is the reply to the Premier's State of the Province Address.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: How the Premier chooses to respond is her right, but I am requesting that if there is a speaker on the floor please manage yourselves so that we do not have to constantly interrupt because interjection is allowed but we are getting far too much heckling coming from the other side. Please members, I am appealing to you to cooperate. Thank you. You may proceed, Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: I was saying, the ANC clearly does not know what racism is and I am going to give them an example of a racist speech and it is their own President's speech, his "I am not an African-speech..." which he gave when

he was defending E-tolls and he said: “We must stop thinking like Africans...” He said: “We cannot think like Africans in Africa...” and then he said: “This is not some national road in Malawi...”

That is racism and it came from their President. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And it is xenophobic.

The PREMIER: It is also xenophobic.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is all you know about.

An HON MEMBER: What is the relevance?

Ms P Z LEKKER: And what about... [Inaudible.]?

The PREMIER: Now may I through you, Madam Speaker, address the members of the House on that side and say †Iqaqa aliziva kunuka. Iqaqa aliziva kunuka, nditsho kuni. *you speak critically of others but do not look at yourselves. *I am saying to you - you speak critically of others but do not look at yourselves.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: The ANC must stop their double standards, because they must sweep before their own door before they call anyone else racist without any shred of evidence. You see, you are racist if you refer to race but you are more racist if you take race out of the analysis and talk about the reading of books. Then you are more racist, but you know, I feel sorry for them because they are a party being torn apart by racism; absolutely torn apart by racism.

An HON MEMBER: This party is better than yours.

The PREMIER: You know, †as jy agter die deur staan soek jy ander ook daar.
*if you stand behind the door you are also looking there for others.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, I would like you to listen to what their own members say about them. This was on *Facebook* just the other day.

Ms P Z LEKKER: She is going on and on and on.

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Ms Lekker, can I please ask you to refrain from constant heckling?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The PREMIER: It came from one of their own City Councillors in the City of Cape Town on Facebook, and it says:

“After the manner in which the ANC has treated our leader Marius Fransman and now the PEC as well as the Youth League PEC’s latest statement, I am terminating my ANC membership. It is over. I have had enough.” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: “If Marius, my leader, starts his own party, which I hope he does, we will join that, but if that does not happen I am taking myself and all my comrades to the DA...”

Mr P UYS: That is their propaganda.

The PREMIER: Then he says... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: That is DA propaganda.

The PREMIER: Then he says: “The ANC is a racist and prejudiced party...”
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: He is quite right. It took him a while to realise that but he is quite right.

“It has something against our leaders...”

And this is what a member of their own caucus in the City of Cape Town is saying:

“I always asked myself will the ANC ever have a coloured leader because a coloured is black in South Africa, but every day I realise it will never happen. I am sorry, friends, enough is enough.”

That is what is going on in the ANC.

†Mnr C M DUGMORE: Hier kom die swart gevaar

*Mr C M DUGMORE: Here comes the *swart gevaar*.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja, die swart gevaar.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes, the *swart gevaar*.

The PREMIER: No, that is what you are doing. That comes straight out of your caucus. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Straight out of your caucus.

†'n AGBARE LID: Swart gevaar!

*An HON MEMBER: *Swart gevaar!*

The PREMIER: In the DA... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: In the DA a white person can be a leader, a black person can be a leader, a coloured person can be a leader, but in the ANC only one race can be a leader. How racist is that?

Mr P UYS: ...it is racist, just for saying that.

The PREMIER: Now you know I have got pages and pages and pages...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, honourable members.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, I have pages of similar things. Another lady says:

“This is an attack on coloured people. You are blatant and oppose openly, discriminating against a coloured man who has not been formally charged whilst others like Andile Lile...”

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

*An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: “...who has a murder case hanging over his head and who is out on bail, is still in the ANC structures...”

That is what he is saying.

Ms P Z LEKKER: What is on *Twitter*? Tell us please.

The PREMIER: And then somebody else says... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, Madam Premier, please take your seat. Members, you are drowning out the speaker. I can understand that you have a need to respond but let us do it in a dignified manner. So that we do not drown out the speaker, please.

Mr P UYS: What is wrong with the speaker?

The SPEAKER: You cannot constantly just keep responding, please members.

An HON MEMBER: They do not agree with you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members.

An HON MEMBER: They do not agree with you.

†Die PREMIER: Hulle kry baie seer, agb Speaker.

*The PREMIER: They are hurting a lot, Madam Speaker.

Another worker from Grabouw... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Please tell her that. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Another worker from Grabouw wrote this... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: It is all fabricated by the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, what is on *WhatsApp*?

The PREMIER: It is not at all. This is an ANC website.

“It is a great concern this morning when ordinary apple-factory workers, while waiting for their transport to Grabouw, communicated their disgust and disapproval about Fransman’s removal by the ANC.”

“Furthermore I was told in no uncertain terms that if this is the way how the ANC deals with coloured leaders they will not vote.”

An elderly lady said:

†“Hulle het dieselfde met Rasool gedoen. Nou maak hulle dieselfde met Fransman. Hulle ma se...”

*They did the same with Rasool. Now they do the same with Fransman. Their mother’s...”

Comrades, this is serious, the electorate are not stupid. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, Madam Premier...

The PREMIER: And I can go on and on.

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier can you please take your seat. There is a member on a point of order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, on a point of order, we cannot hear anything at the back with those three members out there. They are just unbelievable.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Schäfer. Hon members, can we pause for five seconds and just try and regain our composure.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You are quoting... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, no, hold on. Hon members... Hon members, hon member Mr Dugmore, I am requesting cooperation. Chief Whip Mr Uys, can I please ask that you manage your caucus because we are clearly now getting to be disorderly. Interjections are allowed but we cannot drown out the speaker please.

Mr P UYS: May I address you please Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: You may.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, this side was very calm and really we are here to listen, but the way the Premier behaved, misbehaved, I mean, let us be honest! You do not behave like this.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ah, sorry.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P UYS: Definitely, and that was misbehaving.

The SPEAKER: I hear your point hon member Mr Uys... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: Except the Premier is responding ...

HON MEMBERS: No, no.

The SPEAKER: ...to the issues that were raised... Hold on! It is not my place to interject in what the content is. Members, this is a response. You might not like what you hear but you need to afford the Premier the opportunity to present.

An HON MEMBER: No!

Ms T M DIJANA: She is wasting our time.

The SPEAKER: Now can I please request... Can I please request your cooperation please.

Ms T M DIJANA: She is wasting our time. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, we have been going on now for over twenty minutes, most of which has been based on you ruling from the Chair to try and get order in the House.

I really must appeal to you, that if the members on the other side are not interested they are free to go at any time if they want but we must ask...
[Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What number Rule is that?

Mr M G E WILEY: ...that if they are not prepared to abide by your ruling then we must go over to the next process.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip Mr Wiley. Hon members if I can just - the debate is wide-ranging, the same as the responses were on Tuesday and there is no prescription on how strongly the Premier makes a point and unfortunately that is the nature of the response so can we please cooperate and allow the speaker, the Premier, to continue with the presentation. You may proceed, Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. May I, through you, address the other side of the House by saying when it comes to race and racism †tshayela kwakho kuqala. Tshayela kwakho kuqala. *Sweep your house first. Sweep your house first.

An HON MEMBER: You are going to swear at us now. Asithuka.

The PREMIER: That is what you need to do. †Tshayela kwakho kuqala.

*Sweep your house first. Now I am not thuka-ing at all. I am telling you to sweep before your own door first. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

The PREMIER: Now the ANC comes here with a culturally appropriated phrase taken from the United States of America with the phrase that everybody agrees with, “black lives matter” but when we say “all lives matter” they say that is racist, but in fact the ANC comes here and says that black lives matter, but everywhere they govern they govern as if black lives do not matter at all. At all! I am not only referring to grotesque abuses such as we saw at the massacre of Marikana. I am talking about daily governance under the ANC.

Now teachers are supposed to care and they are supposed to believe that young black lives really matter. In fact teachers are supposed to believe that all lives matter, but there was an oversight visit that was addressed in the National Assembly by our shadow Minister of Education there and they were in an oversight visit of rural schools in KwaZulu Natal where you would think that young black lives really mattered to the teachers, but the Government officials told the MPs how SADTU teachers drop their own

children off at former Model C schools and then go on strike for the day, and one District Director described this as the highest level of cruelty. I suppose black lives matter to the SADTU teachers in that school.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr C M DUGMORE: So they are all bad then?

The PREMIER: And then we heard how in the Ugu district there was no teaching and this is in answer to the hon member Mr Dugmore, in the whole of the Ugu district there was no teaching for seven months over the last two years, because of a dispute between SADTU and the District Director.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So that means the teachers are bad... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Seven months, no teaching.

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande.

*An HON MEMBER: Disgrace.

The PREMIER: But black lives matter, and so I can go on and on and on, it is an absolute disgrace.

Mr P UYS: No, not through ours... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is not favourable if you generalise... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: Now no wonder the only card they have to play is the race card but they should make it apply to them.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Which is still in existence, by the way.

†INKULUMBUSO: Ucula iculo elinye.

*The PREMIER: You sing the same song.

Now the hon member Mr Dugmore as I recall also praised the hon Premier Makhura. He is back. I think he has been addressing the masses outside - of 35 people. Welcome the honourable, the Leader of the Opposition back even though it is going to be short-lived.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You talk about racist [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, can I please address you. You have been constantly going there. Can you please try and retain your composure, please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Did you read what hon Makhura said.

The SPEAKER: I know, but please try and manage that emotion. Unfortunately we cannot dictate that. Please manage yourself, hon member Ms Lekker. You may proceed Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: The hon member Mr Dugmore also praised the hon Makhura for giving a visionary speech and of course I went to look at this visionary speech and indeed it might interest - now that the hon member Mr Magaxa is here, who said I made a very long speech - the hon member Mr Magaxa to know that Premier Makhura's speech was a full 2000 words longer than mine.

An HON MEMBER: That is important.

The PREMIER: And the biggest news reported from Premier Makhura's speech - wait for it - was that the ANC was stopping the further roll-out of E-tolls. That was the biggest news. The biggest news with an ANC office-bearer speech.

The biggest news that is reported when an ANC official speaks that they are trying to fix the mess they created in the first place.

An HON MEMBER: When are you coming to the Western Cape?

The PREMIER: Just like poor Minister Gordhan had to do yesterday, fix the

mess they created in the first place, and that is what Premier Makhura spent his whole speech doing, fixing the mess they created in the first place and I was trying to think of a metaphor for this, Madam Speaker, and I think the best one and I hope this is parliamentary, but I am sure you will allow me a lot of leeway, because I could say this outside the Chamber, so I am sure we must have more freedom of speech inside this Chamber. I think the ANC is like a person who wets his bed every night and then thinks that changing the sheets will solve the problem, but after a while, if you do that every night, the springs start to get rusty. [Laughter.] The springs underneath get rusty and then it does not help to change the sheets any more.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] People love the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: And the mattress is rotten.

The PREMIER: The governing party has done this so often and tried to fix it by changing the sheets that the entire institutional infrastructure of South Africa has now rusted and is falling apart.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: And then they call it visionary to change the sheets again.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

An HON MEMBER: And the [Inaudible.] can listen.

The PREMIER: I think that the hon member Mr Dugmore was alluding to the hon Mr Makhura's references to race when he said it was a visionary speech.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Transformation and equity.

The PREMIER: Transformation and equity. Let me come to that.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: He spent exactly two paragraphs on race of the 12 883-word speech and this is what he said...

Ms T M DIJANA: At least he said something. There is nothing... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: I am coming to economic empowerment in a minute.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms T M DIJANA: There is nothing there.

The PREMIER: This is what he said:

“Let us fight against racism wherever and whenever it manifests itself.”

I agree with that. We all agree with that.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You did not say that though, you did not say that.

The PREMIER: I say it every day of my life and more than that I have lived my entire life like that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do you want to say it here? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...by appointing black women.

The PREMIER: And then I also agree with his next sentence:

“Those who call black people baboons are as wrong as those who threaten to drive white students out of university campuses.”

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is what I quoted.

The PREMIER: “There must be no room for racists in the South Africa of our dreams...”

Of course, again fine words! The ANC’s problem is not with words. It is translating words into deeds. That is what they cannot do.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly, no action.

The PREMIER: Because what does the honourable Mr Makhura propose after making that fine-sounding statement? What did he actually propose to do? His visionary solution to racism is to appoint an eminent person's group of unknown people to work with various unspecified civil society initiatives to open honest and constructive conversations on how we can build a society free from racism and xenophobia.

Mr S G TYATYAM: He does not call them refugees like you.

The PREMIER: Now at least here... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, at least here learners can draw books from a library in Khayelitsha unlike anywhere in the Eastern Cape.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Unlike anywhere, that is another generalisation.

The PREMIER: 800 000 books drawn in a year in the Eastern Cape.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is 800 000.

The PREMIER: Yes, that is 800 000, which how many of those were drawn by black children?

An HON MEMBER: Not true.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: Right! I suggest that this eminent person's group start by looking at Gauteng because that is the province that most needs to combat racism.

Ms P MAKELENI: Jo! You will not [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: The Human Rights Commission report from last year has been quoted in *Business Tech*, in the list of South Africa's most racist provinces, and guess what, Gauteng tops the list with 121 complaints of racism just last year.

Ms P MAKELENI: Were you there?

The PREMIER: And the whole of the Western Cape was way behind with 29. 121 complaints to the Human Rights Commission of racism from Gauteng, 29 from the Western Cape.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is because they... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Even KwaZulu Natal is almost double the number of complaints that the Western Cape had. Now if there were 29 in the Western Cape it is still 29 too many.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: It is still, but I will also very much like to know how many of those 29 complaints from the Western Cape were actually found to be valid and upheld?

Mr C M DUGMORE: The point is you said nothing about this in your speech.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

†INKULUMBUSO: Iqaqa aliziva kunuka.

*The PREMIER: You speak critically of others but do not look at yourselves.

†We do not talk so much. We do.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: If he really wants to do something... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: And the rest of the figures are... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...about racism... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Start with yourself.

The PREMIER: If he really wants to do something about racism he can start doing what we have done in the Western Cape and in Cape Town. You see, Madam Speaker, the ANC hates the Western Cape because they do not govern it and that is why they try to smear it every single day.

Mr D JOSEPH: You will never govern here.

The PREMIER: And when the social media campaign to smear the Western Cape as a racist province and Cape Town as a racist City was at its height, the Mayor and I discussed it and we agreed and she initiated... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

The PREMIER: ... a campaign with the slogan: “Do not let racists speak for you...” We did something long before the Premier of Gauteng started speaking about it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: She does not speak for us.

The PREMIER: And now there is a dedicated helpline. I will give the ANC the number if they would like it. 021-4001300.

And this is - yes absolutely, I read numbers rather more quickly than their President, but I will do it again, 021-4001300. That is the dedicated hotline to complain about racism.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: And that is more than anyone in Johannesburg has done. And if there is a matter of serious racism we refer it ourselves to the Human Rights Commission.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And outside... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: So those 29 cases included cases that we referred ourselves.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Right here is your desktop... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And then the Mayor's campaign included a major outreach campaign, a social media campaign, a stakeholder campaign and a range of other community engagements and interactions and now although they have a much worse race problem in Gauteng according to the statistics of the Human Rights Commission, all Makhura does in what the hon member Mr Dugmore calls a visionary speech, is to put together an anonymous eminent person's

group, whose brief is completely unclear and that is visionary to the hon the Opposition.

Mr C M DUGMORE: What about... [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The Human Rights Commission is a Chapter 9 Institution.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The PREMIER: Almost every year... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Do not sleep!

The PREMIER: ...we hear a great deal about racism and it is usually about racism in upmarket restaurants, the top restaurants and they are restaurants that I very rarely go to because I do not believe in spending so much money on a meal when you can cook it for a tenth of the price at home, but the rumours reached such fever pitch that *City Press* published a survey by a black couple who went out actually looking for racism in Western Cape restaurants. They went looking for it. Their antennae were out. They wanted to find proof of racism in Western Cape restaurants and they went to fourteen. That must have been a bloody nice assignment. They went to fourteen upmarket restaurants looking for proof of racism in the Western Cape and they could not find a single fault in twelve out of the fourteen - not one. They were looking for it, remember, and the write-up of the remaining

two indicates that perhaps one at a stretch might be construed as racist and even if it was only one out of fourteen, one incident of racism is one too many, but to make a broad generalisation about the Western Cape on a random sample of one is entirely unacceptable. We welcome such surveys because we do not want racism in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The PREMIER: But why do these surveys only target the Western Cape, why do they not do the same in Gauteng or KwaZulu Natal which according to the Human Rights Commission has a far worse problem than we do.

An HON MEMBER: There are more complaints.

The PREMIER: You see they just †‘tokkel’ *strum on their †‘een snaar kitaar’ *one-string guitar.

We support the Constitution and we reject racism. [Interjections.] But the interesting thing is that we heard the honourable Khaya Magaxa reverting back to the National Democratic Revolution.

†Mnr M G E WILEY: Daar is hy.

*Mr M G E WILEY: There it is.

The PREMIER: Now let us unpack this NDR, it sounds good but you can

capture it in two words, “state capture, state capture.” It is the abuse of cadre deployment to seize all levers of state power including in the ANC’s own words, to seize the Legislatures. They are howling here because they cannot seize this one. Seize the Legislatures. The executives... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are exploiting the [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: You heard what the Constitutional Court said about the executive at national level, failing to fulfil its duty of oversight. It is because they have been captured. And then you have the public service. That has also been captured. That is why we cannot build a capable state. The security forces; the judiciary. Fortunately they haven’t yet succeeded in capturing the judiciary. The parastatals - look what a mess they are with various close friends of various prominent people in positions and the Gupta-isation of all of our state owned entities; the Public Broadcaster and so on, and you know... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: So go to your friends... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: You know Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Go to your friends.

The PREMIER: Not only is it good enough to stop at the capture of all these state institutions in the NDR. Now we have the Gupta-isation of very specific

portfolios to turn our state into a criminal state.

It was a total outrage that the Zupta friend, Mr Zwane, was made the Minister of Minerals and responsible for mines, and then he went and helped facilitate the sale of one of the biggest coal mines to the Gupta family. That is a disgrace. That is Zupta-capture of the state.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] your Zupta.

The PREMIER: And when we had the Des van Rooyen debacle...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Zupta!

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...what laid just beneath that surface was the Gupta confidants who entered the Treasury with Mr Van Rooyen to try and capture the Treasury. Zupta sought to capture the Treasury and that is what the Des van Rooyen debacle was about.

An HON MEMBER: Zupta!

The PREMIER: So this is... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the mine... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: This is the logical conclusion of the National Democratic Revolution. It is the criminal state and this party will make sure that South Africa is saved. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The PREMIER: ...from the criminal state. Now Madam Speaker, I was amazed, the ANC issued a statement after the State of the Province Address where they slammed the three concepts that I drew from in my speech. They slammed the rule of law. They slammed accountability and they slammed the capable state.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because they do not believe in it.

The PREMIER: Can you believe it? The ANC went on record as rejecting these three critical concepts by calling them and rejecting the notion of and I quote “the universalisation of Western liberal democracy.” And then the ANC referred to two models, various models around the world, but their models included Middle-East and North-Africa.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Ja.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: And now I know that the hon member Mr Magaxa and hon member Mr Dugmore would much prefer the systems that have caused the decimation of societies in Syria and Libya and other countries drawn from their role model areas.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Why not Germany?

The PREMIER: But I hate to break the news to them. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Premier, Madam Premier, please take your seat. Members, hon members, I am appealing to your judgment, your better judgment to manage yourselves in a way that lends dignity and decorum to this House. You know an interjection is one thing but laughing crassly at the back there and especially to the three back-benchers of the Opposition, it is inappropriate. We have viewers watching this and what do ordinary South Africans think when they see this happening? I think we owe it to ourselves and our constituents to manage ourselves in a better way, in a more dignified and appropriate fashion please. I can understand you have concerns and debate and issue points but we really just need to compose ourselves here. Please people. You may proceed, Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. So I was at the point of describing the statement that the ANC released rejecting accountability, the rule of law and the capable state, but I hate to be the one to break it to

them, our own Constitution is firmly rooted in these three concepts and they were not a colonial imposition. We defined and created that Constitution ourselves as South Africans. But here they come and reject the Constitution in favour of the NDR that favours state capture and the criminal state, which is why the National Prosecuting Authority is in the state it is in, and indeed the hon member Ms Beerwinkel picked up the hon member Mr Magaxa's theme, when she said that this Government's existence in this House depends on the goodwill of the National Government and the ANC. That is what she said. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, you see, that is how much they understand the Constitution. They say it is true. Let me tell the hon member Mr Magaxa. It has nothing to do with the goodwill of the National Government.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We have got good policies.

The PREMIER: It has everything to do with the will of the voters. The fact that we are the Government here has nothing to do with the ANC and everything to do with the Constitution and the will of the voters.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

*An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Actually the ANC helps us by being so useless, but nevertheless it is in fact due to the Constitution. You know it is a great

contradiction that the ANC often likes to claim credit for the Constitution but they keep on undermining it at every turn and in fact it is contrary to our oath of office. When we come to this House we swear to uphold the Constitution.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You cherry-pick, you do not have to redress. You cherry-pick... [Inaudible.]

†Me C F BEERWINKEL: Ja.

*Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

The PREMIER: I will come to redress in a moment and then you will get a real fright, my friend.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You forgot to talk about it in your speech.

The PREMIER: I did not forget to talk about it in my speech, but let me say quite frankly when I come to redress he is going to have egg all over his face. Let me warn him in advance and this is where I agree with the hon member Mr Dugmore. Premier Makhura is streets ahead of the hon Opposition in this House because at least he said that he supported the Constitution, unlike any of the Opposition here.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We all support the Constitution.

The PREMIER: But one thing that the hon Premier Makhura left out of his

speech was the economic crisis and the need for austerity measures. He did not mention that anywhere, as Minister Gordhan emphasised so strongly in his budget speech yesterday. Now of course hon Makhura could not go there because according to preliminary estimates Gauteng spent at least R4 million on their SOPA event and the headline in the newspapers on Gauteng's SOPA event - may I read it to you - was this. The headline was this:

“Satin, silk and shanks...”

†'n AGBARE LID: O hene!

*An HON MEMBER: Oh dear!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Bourgeoisie! That is the problem.

The PREMIER: “Gauteng SOPA menu fit for a king...” That was the headline and listen to that. “Panko prawns...” I have never even heard of them.

“Panko prawns, lamb shank, and a decadent duo of chocolate mousse will be served as part of the lavish menu for the Gauteng State of the Province Address on Monday.”

An HON MEMBER: And we had sandwiches.

The PREMIER: “The venue alone leaves nothing to be desired as guests are

seated at a luxuriously decorated marquee. The tables that seat twenty people each were lavishly decorated with satin and silk tablecloths and green and white fresh flowers. A feast fit for a king...”

An HON MEMBER: ...that was not part of the debate.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You would never go to [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: “A feast fit for a king, of zesty tian-smoked chicken layered with creamy avocado...” etcetera, etcetera, etcetera. Then they go on and on and on about all this luxury and they end up, “the trio desserts include decadent chocolate mousse and deconstructed lemon meringue...”

†'n AGBARE LID: O hene!

*An HON MEMBER: Oh dear!

The PREMIER: Decadent and deconstructed - it sounds like a definition of the ANC. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Corruption.

The PREMIER: And at a very minimum...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: ...that cost R4 million.

An HON MEMBER: That was for the poor.

The PREMIER: That cost at least R4 million.

Mr D JOSEPH: Where is the poor?

The PREMIER: This is their austerity budget.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Gauteng.

The PREMIER: And it was probably half of what they spent last SOPA, who knows, maybe that was their austerity budget.

An HON MEMBER: Just reply to something else.

The PREMIER: But this was after Minister Gordhan had said that all these extravagances have to stop, but they still carried on and when questioned about this a spokesman for the Gauteng Government said: “Who can put a price on taking SOPA to the people?”

Now I can tell you that even though they had the SOPA in Sebokeng I am sure the good people of Sebokeng were not eating sushi, steak, shanks and decadent chocolate duo.

Ms M N GILLION: Go to Parliament... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that a reply on the Premier's speech?

The PREMIER: No, they were not eating that. In contrast we heard the National Government's request for austerity measures and what you spent on everything in this SOPA - everything was under R50 000. Compare that to R4 million. [Applause.] We did not have sushi and steak and shanks. We had sandwiches.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The PREMIER: We had sandwiches and I am just waiting for the ANC to find a racist angle in that. They are going to. They are going to say you ask black people to come to the SOPA and then you only serve them sandwiches. That is racist. I am waiting for that.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The bread was white!

The PREMIER: Because that is the only argument they have left.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: For serving white bread, brown bread for myself.

The SPEAKER: Order please members. There is too much noise in the

Chamber, both sides of the House.

An HON MEMBER: Serve them white bread. That is racist. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Brown bread... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. I am appealing to both sides of the House. Can we have some calm.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is not [Inaudible.] Madam Speaker, that side.

The SPEAKER: No I am talking to them. I am talking to that side.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must say also that side.

The SPEAKER: I said both sides of the House, honourable.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, it was not both. It was that side. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa I said both sides.

An HON MEMBER: Hey, Leader of the Opposition.

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] speak to all of us, please, that side as well.

The SPEAKER: I am, I am well aware of that and I have requested both sides of the House to maintain calm so if we may proceed.

Mr R T OLIVIER: We cannot get calm [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: But they find the bread racist, it was white... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] of Khayelitsha, that is a reply.

An HON MEMBER: Let me address the speaker [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Can I just alert the Leader of the Opposition, this is not the time to tender.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, do not alert us.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Premier, members.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You do not even have a new [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Are you tendering to leave early.

The SPEAKER: Can we just have five seconds of silence please.

[Interjections.] Ja, chill!

Mr R T OLIVIER: I am sure that she has a right of replying so [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, you do have a choice. If you do not like what you hear you can actually leave the Chamber. You do have a choice, so you do not have to... Thank you. I am not telling you what to do, but if your behaviour is inappropriate I will have to ask that you leave. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: Do not be shy now, please.

The SPEAKER: Madam Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: I am being told that I should stick to the debate on the State of the Province. Well in fact they were the ones who raised Makhura and his speech and his State of the Province Address. I am simply replying to it.

An HON MEMBER: The Premier replies to [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: I am simply replying to it and I will come to another point now. Madam Speaker, the hon member Mr Magaxa... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are supposed to be ashamed of yourself.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Give your Premier [Inaudible.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Ja.

*An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: The hon member Mr Magaxa also lambasted me for suggesting that the Government should stick to the public sector wage increases for which we were told to budget. Instead of the outrageously above inflation amount of 10% in the increases, if one includes housing and medical aid benefits as well. Then he said here that it is obvious that I do not care about the workers and that I am anti-trade unions.

Now he knows that this is absolute nonsense but he should listen to his own Secretary General Gwede Mantashe who gave a very important interview after the President’s State of the Nation Address in which he said this. He said:

“COSATU cannot claim to represent the poor.”

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: That is what Gwede Mantashe said. He said:

“They cannot claim to represent the poor because they do not represent the genuinely poor who are the unemployed.”

Then Gwede said that “it is time for Government to start worrying about the unemployed first” and we say hallelujah.

He said:

“Unions represent people who have jobs and the numbers of jobs are falling and that is South Africa’s biggest problem.”

So he said:

“Economic decline and the loss of jobs is what Government has to turn to...”

And we are very, very glad, that Gwede Mantashe has got to the point that he agrees with the Democratic Alliance, but let me also say something else. There was very important research recently done by the Development Policy Research Unit of the University of Cape Town where they were comparing

wage levels, both of the median and mean wages of the public sector, and they concluded that in both instances, median and mean wages in the public sector are significantly higher than the private sectors and that is quite an extraordinary conclusion to reach in a country that is in an economic crisis. The article reaches the following conclusion and I would like the hon member Mr Magaxa to listen to this. This is the conclusion.

“The post 2000 period has generated a new labour elite in the labour market namely the unionised public sector employee.”

And these are the people who often, not always - there are excellent public servants - but these are many of the people who govern as if black lives do not matter. They are protected, new unionised public sector elite.

That is what they are called in this survey. And so, that is the big issue that we face and they are precisely represented, *precisely represented*, by the South African Democratic Teachers Union or many of their teachers, who are by the way also trying to prevent poor learners in this province getting the benefit of the collaboration schools. But that is another story for another day.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Do you mean like another ... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Now, we agree with the hon member Mantashe that in fact our first priority has to be to people who do not have jobs. And that is why we are doing everything we can in this province, to create a climate through

accountability and a capable state and the rule of law, to grow jobs. And I have some statistics. You see I am sure the hon member Dugmore had to run away because he is terrified that I am going to come to the employment equity statistics, and I understand why he needs an excuse to run away, because that is what he has done.

But hot off the press, right today, are the statistics of the Quarterly Labour Force Survey. They were handed to me just before I came to this House. Listen to this. This is the Quarterly Labour Force Survey. It tells us that in the past year, between the fourth quarter of 2014 and the fourth quarter of 2015, by far the highest job gains in the whole country were in the Western Cape.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Just during the past year alone - now I could not believe these statistics but I have double-checked them - we created, in this province and the economy in this province, 210 000 jobs in the year.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Luister mooi, luister mooi.

*The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Listen carefully, listen carefully.

The PREMIER: And Madam Speaker, this means that employment in this

province grew by 9.7% over the year. Can you believe it? These sound like Chinese and Indian rates of employment creation. [Applause.]

The PREMIER: 9.7% over the year!

Mr M G E WILEY: It is better than China.

The PREMIER: It is better than China. Greatly outperforming the national growth rate.

Mr D JOSEPH: That is †mooi! *good!

The PREMIER: And now listen to this which I am really thrilled about. The Western Cape, now, also has the lowest narrow unemployment rate and we are now below 20% at 19.4% which is absolutely, significantly, lower than any place in the country. [Applause.]

It is also lower than the point at which we took office and we are now in the deepest economic crisis. And the Western Cape, compared to the rest of South Africa, is growing jobs 9.7% in one year. [Applause.]

You know, I have to revise the statistics that I gave in my SOPA. In the SOPA I said that the economy in the Western Cape has added 200 000 jobs since 2009. Since today's Labour Force Survey came out we have added 337 000 jobs since 2009. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

The PREMIER: That is how much the poor matter to us on this side. And no statistic could give me greater joy than that and I am sure the ANC will find a way of hanging a racist label onto my expression of joy about those employment results. But congratulations to everyone who is responsible for creating a climate for economic growth and job creation. So that was really extraordinary and thank you very much indeed.

Now, the ANC is always telling the world how unequal the City of Cape Town is. It is unequal and it is far too unequal and a narrow unemployment rate of 19.4% is still far too high and we have to continue to bring it down. But indeed, when *Africa Check* heard that I had said that Cape Town was the least unequal city in South Africa they did not believe it, so they went to check it themselves. This is their conclusion and they quote from the most reliable source in the world.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Which is that?

The PREMIER: This is the 2011 United Nations Agency For Human Settlement, UN-Habitat State of the World's Cities 2010/2011:

Presenting its conclusions, the report declares that three South African cities top the list of the most unequal cities in the world, when measured on income

based data gathered in a UN-Habitat survey of cities in 109 countries from all regions. It names the three most unequal cities in the world as: Buffalo City, East London – I wonder who governs that city?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC.

The PREMIER: Then Johannesburg. I wonder who governs that city?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC.

The PREMIER: And then Ekurhuleni. I wonder who governs that city? The three most unequal cities in the world. Then *Africa Check* concludes: Cape Town, according to the statistics, is the least unequal city in the country. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Who governs? The DA!

The PREMIER: If it was measured today we would be further out in front because the more jobs you create and the more people who are working and earning a salary, the less unequal the city becomes. But this is some bit of logic that seems to elude the honourable members on the other side of the House.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

*An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!

The PREMIER: Now, I would like to thank the honourable colleagues that I have, on the DA side, for their excellent inputs in rebutting all of the allegations that came from the other side of the House.

But I am going to address one of them because more disingenuous you cannot get. That was the hon member Magaxa saying that we are doing nothing about affordable housing. He could not have listened to a word I said because one of our major game-changers in the province is precisely a huge project to develop thousands of affordable housing opportunities. But it is interesting that the National Government disagrees with the ANC in this province because just yesterday – and I do not suppose, if he did not listen to my speech and he was in this House, he would have listened to the budget speech – but the hon Minister Pravin Gordhan actually used the Western Cape’s Affordable Inner City Housing Programme as an example for the rest of the country. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: What did he say? He singled out the Western Cape, for commendation, for actually making progress on the inner city development. And this is what he said:

“Cities are already taking steps to encourage higher land use density

and inner city redevelopment under the authority of the new Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act. This will unlock significant further private sector development potential across our cities, focused on strategic corridors. In Cape Town the N2 Gateway Housing Programme is continuing, together with redevelopment of the Voortrekker Road Corridor, Conradie Hospital, the Athlone Power Station and other sites”.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Carry on, what does he say about [Inaudible.] Carry on. Be honest and read.

The PREMIER: I have read the statement that I have got here. Now, we have sold one property... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: She does not mention all the others.

The PREMIER:which is a heritage building and a former school, which is the Tafelberg school, and we have sold that to the highest bidder on the understanding that it cannot be knocked down and redeveloped. It cannot be because it is a heritage building and that is the constraint on the land. As I understand it, after my enquiries to Public Works, the buyer wants to keep it as a school. So it is absolutely misleading to suggest that it could be redeveloped by a wealthy investor for personal profit. It will not be. And that, alternatively, there could be 260 affordable housing opportunities that we could have developed there. Neither of these was ever an option.

It is only feasible to do cross-subsidised, well located low cost housing, if you have economies of scale. That is why we are doing our best to get crucial pieces of land that are currently in the possession of the national departments and various parastatals and also the National Department of Public Works like Culemborg, like Wingfield, like Ysterplaat, like Youngsfield - then we can really do massively cross-subsidised, affordable housing, at scale.

If the honourable members of the Opposition are serious about affordable housing in the city, they will help us lobby their national counterparts to release that land so that we can build the houses that we need. But they are not serious about it because when they had the opportunity to do something they did absolutely nothing. In fact, when the hon member Marius Fransman was the Minister of Public Works what did he do? He sold the Conradie site to Iliza Elitsha Investments and he sold it for R80 million although there were other bids that were much higher, one as high as R140 million. But he told an untruth and said that R80 million was the highest bid when there was a bid for nearly double that amount.

By 2011, that was five years later, the consortium, the pals, had only paid R8 million of the R80 million they owed. And despite the fact that they still owed R72 million, 6 years after the contract was signed, no interest was charged on the outstanding amount.

An HON MEMBER: Hmph!

The PREMIER: Yes. The interest clause had been deliberately left out of the deed of sale and the sale was made to a consortium that was certainly not the highest bidder by any means. The land lay and rotted there. The houses were vandalised and now all those years later it is left to us to redevelop that land for affordable housing. That is how disingenuous and disgraceful the ANC is.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC.

The PREMIER: Now I will get to my next point which is about the youth. It is almost laughable that the ANC says we do not care about the youth. We are on the only province that does care.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear!

The PREMIER: Almost all our game-changers, from alcohol harms reduction to e-learning, to after-schools, to special skills development are specifically targeted at our youth. And the attempts to grow the economy shows...
[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: DA youth.

The PREMIER: ... the result is outstanding because the number of

discouraged workseekers is so low in this province. Now you see I wish the honourable Opposition had the slightest clue about the Constitution and the separation of party and State. I am speaking here today as the Premier. When I say our youth, I mean every single young person in this province. I am not talking about the DA youth. I am not like the ANC who sees the National Youth Development Agency as an employment bureau for ANC youth leaders.

An HON MEMBER: Why don't you?

The PREMIER: We do not run government like this. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

The PREMIER: I will come to why we do not fund the NYDA in a moment and you will be embarrassed that you ever asked me to.

Mr C M DUGMORE: But you want to work with them.

The PREMIER: When do I want to work with them?

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT : Useless!

The PREMIER: I was absolutely fascinated by this latest 2015 National and

Provincial Youth Labour Market statistical release and it said: discouraged work seekers per province, in terms of the youth - in the Western Cape 1.2%. 1.2% significantly lower than any other province. That is from the National Statistics South Africa.

Now the ANC's definition about caring for the youth, and the honourable Opposition keeps plugging at it in this House, is to pour money down the bottomless cesspit of the National Youth Development Agency. Let me say this about the National Youth Development Agency. It has actively undermined youth development. That is what it has done. I could not believe the summary of its wasteful expenditure.

In 2015/16, the National Youth Development Agency was allocated a budget of R409 million, consuming 57% of the entire Presidency's budget. It prioritised lavish parties and personal enrichment over the actual development of the youth. More than a quarter of this went to paying salaries. In fact, over 45% of it went to paying salaries, and the Chief Executive Officer of the National Youth Development Agency, a one Yershen Pillay, earns R1.8 million a year.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Skande!

*The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Disgrace!

The PREMIER: Almost what the President earns, despite no tangible outputs from the agency. Now I could not believe the amount that they spent on

travel and accommodation in one year. R28 million on travel and accommodation for the National Youth Development Agency.

†Mnr M G E Wiley: Laat sak jou dak en bloos.

*Mr M G E Wiley: Drop your head in shame.

The PREMIER: Who can forget the kissing festival. Remember that? R106 million on a kissing festival? And the NYDA also made headlines last year after an independent probe uncovered that at least two senior managers, both earning over R1 million a year, had misrepresented their qualifications. And what did they do? They were not disciplined. One of them was just neatly transferred to the Presidency and kept his R1.2 million a year salary.

I could go on and on and on, but I presume that the hon member Magaxa is so worried about the NYDA because it is a site of struggle between control of the ANC Youth League and the Young Communists League. At the moment the Young Communists League have seized control of the NYDA and I am sure that the hon member Magaxa - who never stood for election as a communist but it is nevertheless the primary hat that he wears - is desperate to prevent the ANC Youth League from trying to reconstitute the board and take over the NYDA again. But that is what is going down over there. You see it's the State capture again. It is the National Democratic Revolution.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear.

The PREMIER: Now, let us get to farm workers. We have the hon member Beerwinkel saying that this Government and the Western Cape does not care about farm workers. [Interjection.] This is about farm workers now. I have moved on.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You have finished with the youth?

The PREMIER: I said every one of our game-changers and almost everything I said in my SOPA is targeted at the youth. I can read my SOPA again if you would like to hear what we are doing for the youth.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: You were outside most of the time.

The PREMIER: You were outside most of the time talking to 35 people. Your mass rally outside. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The PREMIER: I am now talking about farm workers and the hon member Beerwinkel said that farm workers in the Western Cape are worse off etc., etc. Now listen to this. This is a report in *The Sowetan* from the 28th of January 2016 and they reported on a study that was done in the UCT Labour and Enterprise Working Group, who briefed Parliament's Portfolio Committee on rural development. And this is where the statistics come from.

A briefing to the National Parliament:

The study found that farm workers in the Western Cape were by far the best paid in the country.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: Farm workers in the Free State are paid 24% less than their Western Cape counterparts. Workers in Mpumalanga, 25% less. Eastern Cape farm working wages are 30% less. Kwazulu-Natal is 31% under Western Cape levels and in Limpopo they are fully 51% below Western Cape farm worker levels.

Ms T M DIJANA: And in Germany?

The PREMIER: So sweep before your own door before you come and make false allegations here.

Ms P Z LEKKER: How much are they?

†INKULUMBUSO: Tshayela kwakho.

*The PREMIER: Sweep your house.

I do not know what Germany has to do with South Africa. But Germany actually has a capable state accountability and the rule of law and that is why

their economy is booming. And that is the lesson they can learn on the honourable opposite side of this House.

The SPEAKER: Order, please members! There is too much noise.

The PREMIER: Now the hon member Dugmore is back just in time for me to be able to speak about employment equity ...

An HON MEMBER: Good speech.

The PREMIER: ... because we all know that the hon member Dugmore is more Catholic than the Pope on employment equity and he came here and said that I allegedly do not take employment equity seriously. I do not take it seriously he said, which therefore gives this entire province, private and public sector, leeway to not take it seriously. Now I asked them to draw the statistics for my office because he was basically saying a fish rots from the head. If I in my office don't take it seriously no-one else will.

Well these are the statistics, Madam Speaker. The hon member Dugmore made a big thing of the designated groups. Here you have them: employment equity - the designated groups in my office are 92%.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is this your office?

The PREMIER: My office is 92%. You said because I do not take it

seriously, and the only place that I have control over is my office. 92% and indeed if comparing black to any other race it is 76%. So we have got the most incredibly diverse office.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You only have one black advisor.

The PREMIER: Now, Madam Speaker, let me come to the hon member Dugmore. Because he is the one who is still howling and I want to come to the hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You only have one black advisor in your office.

The SPEAKER: Order please, honourable members!

The PREMIER: I want to talk a little about the hon member Dugmore because he was once the Education MEC. Wasn't he? He was once the Education MEC. And he is always talking about how visionary his party is on employment equity. Well I thought I would draw the statistics of the hon member Schäfer's statistics in top management and his own. And I looked at Education MEC Dugmore's final year when he had had time to do something about it in office in 2008 and our latest Department of Education equity stats as at the 29th of January 2016.

In short, I have summarised all the statistics here; top management in the Western Cape from designated groups today is at 92% compared to 66%

under the hon member Dugmore. Compared to 66% under the hon member Dugmore. And if you combine top and senior management, levels 13 – 16, we come in at 83% now compared to hon member Dugmore's 77%. He has been howling now about removing any whites from the equation. Even if we remove white females from our top management ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why would we want to do that?

The PREMIER: Well, you want to do that because you talk about blacks now and you are saying ...

The SPEAKER: Order please, order! Premier please ...

The PREMIER: I am quite happy to stick with the statistic of 92% versus 66% under him if he wants me to. But even if we control for white females, we still come out ahead in terms of top management. So before they come and wail here they must check that their statistics ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] you are talking nonsense, that you are lying.

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

An HON MEMBER: Lying? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I heard the lying [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: You see, the hon member Dugmore is going to deny that he said I am lying – again ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: No I am not.

The PREMIER: ... because Hansard may well not pick it up because his microphone is not on. But I heard it as clearly as I did the first time that he said it.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: If that can be referred to Hansard please? Unfortunately I never heard it.

The SPEAKER: If you can take your seat?

Mr M G E WILEY: Well if he did then he – Madam Speaker, I must ask. This is the second time then today that they have admitted it but they do not apologise and withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, thank you. I heard hon member Dugmore. I heard the hon member Dugmore say that he said it and it is only appropriate

for me to ask: hon member Dugmore, will you withdraw that statement please?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I will withdraw it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: You are not the Speaker man! Stop [Inaudible.] You act like you are the Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, please members!

The PREMIER: You see Madam Speaker, lots of people do not hear the interjections. You often do not hear, the Chief Whip does not hear, I hear them. Often they do not get captured in Hansard because his microphone is not on but I hear very carefully what he says.

The hon Dugmore says the National Government is very good at employment equity and black economic empowerment and various other things but he forgets to mention what details those are. I have got a whole list, I could read them out the whole afternoon.

†Me P Z LEKKER: Gaan aan!

*Ms P Z LEKKER: Carry on!

The PREMIER: But one of the famous ones was when there had to be a R25 million bribe by Goldfields to secure a mining licence and that R25 million had to be handed over to a top network in the ANC for Goldfields to get a mining licence. That is BEE, ANC style. Corruption and the criminal state covered by the fig leaf of BEE and if that is the kind of BEE ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is that an allegation?

The PREMIER: It is a fact. It was all over the newspapers if you have forgotten?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Oh, so it is a fact then because it was in the newspapers?

The PREMIER: No no, let me tell you this. A New York law firm, Paul Weiss, drew that conclusion because Goldfields appointed them.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Where has it been tested?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Nowhere!

The SPEAKER: Order, please members!

The PREMIER: I can tell you that if it had not been true he would have been

sued. If people make defamatory statements and you do not sue them then you accept that they are correct.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No.

The PREMIER: New York law firm, Paul Weiss, reviewed the deal. The firm found the mining company had increased Mbete's stake in the deal in response to a threat by her representative. According to the report, Mbete's representative, Brian Mosehla, had threatened to scuttle the deal unless Mbete was given a bigger stake. That is a R25 million bribe to secure the mining licence.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is that the truth? [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: BEE, ANC style, and if he is expecting us to do that we are not going to do that. The biggest empowerment that you can do for anyone is give them a good education and ensure that they can get a job. ANC/NDR empowerment is corrupt. It is based on corruption.

Ms P Z LEKKER: And what is the DA [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Now, coming to the hon member Ferlon Christians. The hon Ferlon Christians makes some very important points.

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members. There is too much noise.

The PREMIER: He asked if broadband will be linked to after-school programmes? Yes, they will. E-learning is one of the four pillars of our MOD's Programme operating from schools and they will all hopefully be connected by the end of 2016. Many of the libraries are already connected in our MOD Centres. We will capitalise on existing interest from learners. Statistics at libraries to date show 70 million hits, 59 million page views and over 2.5 terabytes of information. So definitely, hon member Christians, that is part of the MOD Centres.

What you are saying about SADTU and working in the after-school programme instead of dropping their children off at model-C schools where there is an after-school programme run by teachers that belong to other unions; in fact then they do not help us make the after-school programme work in schools where other children go to school. I could not agree with hon member Christians more.

Youth Café's, yes, there will be more. We are looking to launch two more Youth Café's by the Department of Social Development in the next couple of months in Oudtshoorn – that is in April – and at Nyanga Junction at the end of March. Then we will also launch a Youth Café in Vrygrond in partnership with an NGO.

I agree with alcohol harms reduction as a focus and that there is a contradiction with the extension of liquor trading hours. I have to agree very

much with him and that is why we are working closely with the neighbourhood watches to closely monitor the violations of trading hours that happen there.

Now, I come to the hon member Bernard Joseph who is not here. He is probably with his comrades in the North West who are at the moment cheering on the burning down of campuses. But in his absence - I suppose that is also transformation, EFF style - I would like to say to the hon member Joseph that he chose the worst example.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just skip it.

The PREMIER: He chose the very worst example and I am using it here because the ANC also used an example that we were neglecting Nyanga. Well, I cannot tell you how much money we have pumped into Nyanga to ensure that young people have alternatives to crime, drugs and alcohol. In fact, not only have we pumped enormous amounts into it and I was amazed to see that – and now this will probably be racist as well – our alternative entertainment programmes over weekends have been drawing up to 1700 youth on a weekend, which is quite extraordinary.

They started off with 300 youth per weekend, they are now pushing up to 1700 youth per weekend. It is movies, it is games, it is bingo, it is open mikes, it is all of these wonderful activities so that our youth do not have to go and sit in shebeens and drink - and basketball and boxing and a whole

range of other things.

17 Young Adult Service Co-ordinators are role models in Nyanga and we pay them through EPWP Programme. The hon Minister Plato has also got another very important project which is that 250 youths, from Nyanga alone, having been selected at Northlink to continue their further technical studies which is absolutely amazing. Then we have one, two, three, four church groups in Nyanga who do the Holiday Support and Youth Safety Programmes and they get lots of money and support from us. [Interjection.]

Then, 62 pairs of safety boots, 12 rechargeable torches - 62 people have been trained in the Neighbourhood Watch Training Programme in Nyanga. So this is just one example of what we are doing to empower communities to fight crime.

Madam Speaker, I was very disturbed at the quality of the ANC's inputs to this debate. They did not engage in any way with our State of the Province Address. They drew out old statements that could have been made 15 years ago. Their *†een snaar kitaar* *one string guitar †plays on only one theme, race and they find it everywhere.

But on every single point they made, Madam Speaker, if you just look up their own statistics from the National Government, it is usually the exact opposite of what the ANC claims the truth is. They are a disgrace for an opposition and that is why the rest of the country is also turning against them

now. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members that concludes the debate on the Premier's State of the Province Address. That concludes the business for the day and the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 15:40.