

---

WEDNESDAY, 28 NOVEMBER 2018

---

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Thank you. Good afternoon hon members. Good afternoon guests. To our special guests in the bay, we have a delegation from Sri Lanka that is visiting South Africa and - Sierra Leone, sorry, my apologies - Sierra Leone, and they have engaged with our Committees and they are I think wrapping up their South African trip tomorrow so we want to thank you for hosting us with your presence and paying us a visit and we wish you well as you sojourn back. Thank you.  
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just to say, Sri Lanka is in Asia, Sierra Leone in Africa.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, I did self-correct, I did say Sierra Leone and I will go for the geography class later. Thank you, hon member Dyantyi.

We have just prayed so let us maintain that order now. I recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I table the motion on the Order Paper in my name, and give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provision of Rule 18, the hours of sitting on Thursday, 29 November 2018 shall be from 10:00 to adjournment.

The SPEAKER: Agreed to.

Mr M G E WILEY: I do think there is meant to be an addition though, that it is meant to be also Friday 30 November as well. Sorry. It is not necessary apparently.

The SPEAKER: I think we just deal with today, Chief Whip and tomorrow we will be here at ten o'clock in the morning, I take it. So can I ask the Secretary to read the first Order of the Day?

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The SECRETARY: Consideration of principle of *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B6 – 2018].

The SPEAKER: Thank you Secretary. I now see the hon, the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Madam Speaker and hon Mr Deputy Speaker; Cabinet colleagues; hon members of the Opposition, leader of the Official Opposition; members of the Western Cape Legislature and our special guests from Sierra Leone. Welcome in this Legislature!

Madam Speaker, when I delivered the Western Cape Government's 2018 MTBPS and 2018 Adjusted Estimates of Expenditure, I did that within a particular context. An important element of that context is that South Africa's economy is underperforming.

The strange thing, Madam Speaker, is that one reads through the National MTBPS and the recent Fiscal Framework of the National Government, one thing is clear. The ruling African National Congress agrees that the national economy is underperforming, but instead of taking steps to bring about a turnaround, the ANC has rather adopted a strategy that "stupidity got us into this mess, and that stupidity will get us out."

Madam Speaker, in Afrikaans we say: "kom ons red wat daar te redde is" and we can do so by focusing on the low hanging fruits, and this is exactly the sentiments expressed by the Governor of the South African Reserve Bank.

He highlights, like so many other sober-minded people that we must choose a path that stabilises and reduces our national debt. We cannot continue to borrow. [Interjections.]

While this view has been expressed by Minister of Finance, Minister Tito Mboweni and his predecessors, South Africa continues to borrow, and lately, from China. [Interjections.]

Terms and conditions of this loan remains a mystery, but one thing is certain, Madam Speaker, is that the ordinary South African citizens will have to carry the can for this indebtedness.

Madam Speaker, we need to reduce our fiscal deficits and we need to ensure that our borrowing is more productive. We must attract investments because it provides an institutional environment that gives investors security and allows for predictability.

One of the primary causes of weak growth has been a severe decline in governance in South Africa - one of the many consequences of a large decline in business and in consumer confidence.

Agbare Speaker, binne die konteks van 'n tegniese resessie moet die rand se vertoning ook beoordeel word teen die prestasie van ander geldeenhede in ontluikende markte.

Die feit is dat ons geldeenheid een van die onderpresteerders in ontluikende markte is, wat op sy beurt suggereer dat die toedrag van sake huishoudelik van aard is.

Packirisamy is een van die ekonome wat ten volle geregtig is om aan te voer dat die krimpende ekonomie en stygende werkloosheid beleggersvertroue ondermyn. Dit lei tot laer investering en dra by tot verbruikersnegatiwiteit. [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sukkel julle nog om vir ons te lees. Dit lyk so; hy lees met 'n lae spoed. [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mnr P UYS: Want hy glo nie wat hy lees nie!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, business confidence in the Western Cape grew by a record number of points in the first quarter of 2018... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...despite the province being in the midst of a drought disaster. [Interjection.] According to the Bureau for Economic Research's Business Confidence Index, business confidence in this province rose by 15 points, reaching the 50-point mark, for the first time since 2016.

Why is this possible, Madam Speaker? The Western Cape is the best run Government in South Africa.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons het daai gehoor ja! [Gelag.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, as highlighted in the MTBPS... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Droom aan! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...despite the economic times, we are seeing the nett effect of a competent Government governing the Western Cape for the past ten years. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: What!

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie, wag 'n bietjie, ons kom!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: A capable state and a clean Government does matter to investors and does impact positively on business and investor confidence. Building investor confidence and consumer confidence is part of this Government's structural reform agenda. [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Waarvan ons hoor is net 'n grap; net 'n grap!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, during the National Extended Cabinet Meeting... [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: En hy weet dit.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...held on 2 October this year, I raised my concern regarding some ANC Provincial Governments considering the establishment of a Provincial State Bank. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Kom terug na die Wes-Kaap toe. Ons is in die Wes-Kaap.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nie orals nie!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The ANC is considering a Provincial State Bank. Madam Speaker, it will merely be a vehicle to shield the leaders of the next chapter of state capture from public scrutiny and accountability.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, what ANC Provincial

Governments are planning is the next chapter in licence to loot in the national landscape and the hon Tito Mboweni - there is nothing to do about this! [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It sounds like a federal idea. [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are such a girl. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The ANC is planning to establish a State Bank. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We can no longer take you seriously!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And the State Bank is the licence to loot. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

We will not allow! We are asking Minister Tito Mboweni to please stop the licence to loot! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You can take your last idea [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Because the Premier of Gauteng said nothing will stop him from opening a State Bank so nothing will stop him from a licence to loot. [Interjections.] We ask the Zondo Commission to zoom into Gauteng's licence to loot. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dankie Ivan.

The SPEAKER: Order please! Minister, kindly take your seat, please. Hon member Dyantyi, there is no Ivan in the House, please. It is the hon Minister Meyer.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie, geagte LUR. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mnr P UYS: Hy is 'n grap.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I think there is a licence to loot...  
[Interjection.]

Die PREMIER: Hy is 'n grap ja.

Mnr P UYS: Hy is 'n grap!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And Pierre Uys is the joke because he does not understand the implications. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Pierre Uys does not understand the implications of State looting. [Interjection.]

Mnr P UYS: 'n Hengse grap!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And so there is a licence to loot.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please. So sorry, who is going first, the hon member Olivier, I see you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, is it parliamentary that the MEC... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He knows it is not parliamentary.

The SPEAKER: Order please, members!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...hon MEC refers to our Chief Whip as Pierre Uys. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He does not have respect [Inaudible.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Is he selective in his "honourable"... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, before you begin...

Mr R T OLIVIER: Can he withdraw and apologise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Withdraw and apologise.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, I have had occasion to just ask the hon member Dyantyi to refer to you as the hon Minister... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: We only have hon members here.

The SPEAKER: So we cannot have anyone casting aspersions and we are all honourable in the House for the duration of the sitting.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker, hon members of this House, to these hon members in this House, I think we must act honourable... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your theme.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and stop the licence to loot in South Africa.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But let me proceed, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, there is too much noise. Can both sides of the House please calm down?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have no understanding. That is the problem.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am happy that the people from Sierra Leone... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, sorry. There is a point of order. You indicated that Pierre Uys is a joke. Did you indeed utter those words?

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay, I withdraw that. Thank you Madam Speaker. Sorry for that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Meyer. You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just get on with the speech.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Let me get on with the speech.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi! Please allow me to Chair the sitting, thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, compose yourselves.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, if we act as honourable members, we must stop every single attempt for people that want a licence to loot. [Interjections.] It is happening right in front of us in Gauteng right now.

Ms P MAKELENI: We will stop at [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And we sit here and make as if nothing is happening. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You have oversight.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We see what is happening in front of the Zondo Commission. There is a licence to loot, but I will proceed, Madam Speaker, because there is a statutory obligation because when all of us here in this House, we took an oath of office... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We took an oath of office... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: That is last year's speech!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...that this we will protect all laws in this Country and Madam Speaker, my concern for this licence to loot is rooted in Section 15.2.2... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: On your face!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...of the National Treasury Regulations, which determines and I quote: "Each Provincial Treasury must have a bank account configuration that consists..." [Interjection.]

Mnr P UYS: Jy het dit laasjaar gesê.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: "...of at least an exchequer bank account and a Paymaster-General bank account, opened with a Commercial Bank."

The notion of a State Bank, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not say that to students (?) Go back to University.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...comes at a time when South Africa is reeling under the revelations of the Zondo Commission and the earlier happenings at VBS Bank. [Interjections.]

South Africa cannot afford further state capture and a Provincial State Bank will certainly create another opportunity for those who are determined to raid the State coffers. I have made an appeal to the National Treasury to intervene in this matter as any attempt to establish a Provincial State Bank will be in contravention of the National Treasury Regulations, as amended.  
[Interjections.]

It is therefore my contention that the National Minister Tito Mboweni...  
[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: What are you doing [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...as the Head of National Treasury, must ensure good financial governance in all spheres of government in South Africa. [Interjections.]

Agbare Speaker, soos wat die Internasionale Monetêre Fonds (IMF) ook na 'n onlangse besoek aan Suid-Afrika uitgelig het, moet ons indringend kyk na die sakemodelle van Staatsondernemings. Besnoeiings en bateverkope is van die opsies om mee te begin, maar volhoubaarheid moet sentraal wees in die nuwe sakeplanne. Daar kan nie voortgegaan word om kontant-inspuitings en staatswaarborgte te gebruik as reddingsboei vir swak presterende entiteite nie. Die arbeidsmark moet ook indringend hersien word. Loonverhogings moet hand-aan-hand gaan met groter produktiwiteit.

Verhogings moet bekostigbaar wees en gesentraliseerde ooreenkomste behoort nie kleiner ondernemings se mededingendheid aan bande te lê nie. Bevorder mededinging oor 'n breë front, Agb Speaker... [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: The same as last year.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: ...van mynbou tot telekommunikasie en die finansiële tegnologie en die banksektor en bevestig ook titel-sekuriteit. Verminder ook beleidsonsekerheid, byvoorbeeld oor grondhervorming, deur te fokus op beter produktiwiteit in die landbousektor. Ook verbeter ons belastingadministrasie, agb Speaker, en oorweeg ook bestedingsplafonne. Hoewel van hierdie beleidsmaatreëls onder die Nasionale Fiskus val, is die Wes-Kaapse Regering en ons Tesourie ernstige vennote om die fiskale raamwerk reg te ruk in die Begrotingsraad.

Madam Speaker, in the words of Max du Preez, we can shout "New Dawn" as hard and as often as we like... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please! Someone's cell phone is causing a disruption.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit moet daai kant wees.

The SPEAKER: I do not know if you are watching a movie or what is happening, but it is interfering. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Dit moet 'n translation wees.

The SPEAKER: Oh okay.

Mr B D JOSEPH: (?) It is the translation. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No-no, it is the translation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, in the words of Max Du Preez, we can shout “New Dawn” as hard as an often as we like, but if we cannot significantly increase the levels of productivity and honesty of our administrators and bureaucrats, the sun will struggle to rise.

Madam Speaker, the Western Cape Government however, remains committed to changing the South African landscape.

An HON MEMBER: The South African landscape?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We do so confident in our ability to bring meaningful benefits to the citizens of the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

Mnr P UYS: Kry zero persent man.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Did you read your speech before you came here?

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dyantyi!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are so out of touch!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you are entitled to an opinion. If you want to pose a question you do it through the Chair, please. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: You can get your debate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is just a question.

The SPEAKER: Well ask me the question and I will ask the Minister.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I do want to ask the Minister. Please pass the DA interviews for him to come back please... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, that is not a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I really just want to ask that.

The SPEAKER: That is a frivolous... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is why he is the Minister.

The SPEAKER: That is a frivolous... [Interjections.] Hon member Dyantyi that is a frivolous point of order.

An HON MEMBER: I believe you are going to the National Assembly!

An HON MEMBER: Yes, and he is going to make it there. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, and he is going to make it there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members on both sides of the House. [Interjections.] Hon member Dyantyi, that is a frivolous point of order. If you continue in that vein... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may continue.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons is klaar gepraat nou.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker. We have seen that the ANC has created an environment in the rest of South Africa where everyone has to rise to their level of incompetence. Today we heard the shocking revelation from a Senior Minister in the Zuma Cabinet...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What has that to do with this?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...that he warned the former President...  
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please, again Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...he warned. [Interjections.] Today, Madam  
Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please members! I am going to allow the Minister to  
continue. Minister Meyer.

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible.] a donation he received.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, today we heard the shocking  
revelation of a senior Minister in the Zuma Cabinet that he warned the former  
President that he has auctioned off executive authority to third parties - a  
shocking state. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So why are you attacking Zuma? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He warned the President... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms P MAKELENI: That is what happens when you let ideas... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, sorry Minister, kindly take your seat.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Start a Zuma Commission.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, you choose to be in this Chamber. If you do not like what you are hearing you can exercise an option, but please do not be disruptive and to say that it is a waste of time, if it is your time that is being wasted then you have the choice to leave, but please do not be belligerent in your comments. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, today we have heard the shocking revelation of a senior Minister in the Zuma Cabinet that he warned the former President that he has auctioned off the executive authority to third parties.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Who was saying that?

Mr P UYS: It was a Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He warned the then President that his

successor would inherit... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...an empty office with the Guptas around and running his office. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Really!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, this may explain the snail pace at which President Zuma's successor is addressing the obvious things that he has to do to assist in the recovery of our economy. According to this witness, and the Gupta Ministers' virtually camped at the Gupta compound in Saxonwold and were boastful of their association with this family. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Is that your speech? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This alliance led to the diary... [Interjections.] The diary of the President was set at Saxonwold. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Serious!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This, Madam Speaker, the diary of the

President was determined at Saxonwold. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are actually boring now. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

An HON MEMBER: But we know who is doing this [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is why this country is collapsing under the ANC. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, this will not happen in the Western Cape. That is why the ANC will never get back to this Western Cape. We will win the 2019 elections. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is all over.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We will retain the Western Cape because the people of the Western Cape have confidence in this Government... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: That is all you can say!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...in our pursuit of clean governance. Madam Speaker, in our engagements with the citizens... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Your time is up, shame!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...they gave us a clear message for 2019. [Interjections.] We have clearly listened to the people and crafted a careful manifesto. That is why a DA National Government will:

- Fight corruption;
- Fix the police force so that it protects and serves South Africans including people like you, hon member;
- It will create fair access to real and long-term sustainable jobs;
- We will secure our borders, hon member.
- We will also speed up delivery of services [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Come back, MEC, now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Tyatyam, we need change in South Africa that builds one South Africa for all. [Interjections.] Hon members, the change we want in South Africa has already started in the Western Cape. Ten million people in South Africa are unemployed, but we are driving the jobs agenda in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, scare tactics.

The PREMIER: The following are selected companies that have already invested in the Western Cape: Amazon... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please. There is too much noise on both sides of the House. I do not know who is engaging with who but at the cost of pointing out the hon member Olivier, who will say I am picking on him. I do not understand who it is you are talking to, but I sense Minister Winde, you might have a hand in it. So ja, and then hon Makeleni, if you could also tone down just a little bit, we could get on with the business of the day. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Getting on with the business, Madam Speaker, is exactly what the Western Cape has been doing. The new companies have invested in the Western Cape. As you know, Amazon, HiSense, Kimberly-Clark, IBM, Harvard University, Airbus, Oracle, JUWI, Wind Prospect and Panasonic.

During 2017, international arrivals in the Western Cape have increased by 10.2%. Madam Speaker, foreign spending in the Western Cape increased from R18,1 billion in 2016 to R23,1 billion in last year, 2017. Three new international routes have been introduced during the 2018/19 financial year.

Madam Speaker, the Apprenticeship Game Changer aims to introduce at least 11 300 qualified apprentices into the labour market by 2019. Hon Members, the Western Cape is pro-business.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you still far? Just give us an indication?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We will invest almost R30 billion in infrastructure over the next three years. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you still far in your speech?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Western Cape has already attracted R1,2 billion rand (USD?) investments in the green economy. South Africa has the fastest growing green economy and 70% of all renewable energy manufacturing takes place in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, and hon members, Cape Town is the business meeting capital of Africa... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And that has absolutely nothing to do with this...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and hosted the largest number of international associations on the continent. 34 000 international delegates attended conferences in the Western Cape in 2017. Hon members, one million bottles of South African wine are sold every single day. 21 out of the 23 South African Wine Routes are located in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: The Minister is so obsessed with alcohol!

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms P MAKELENI: What is the obsession with alcohol?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, the Western Cape is focussing on doing the basic things right. This government believes in:

- A Constitutional Democracy;
- The rule of law;
- The protection of property rights;
- The free market based economy;
- The Bill of Rights;
- And in establishing a democratic political culture.

These principals are fundamental and these are the things that are monitored by investors. Gross fixed capital formation is largely driven through investor confidence.

The Western Cape through the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement creates business and investor confidence by investing, Madam Speaker:

- In jobs;
- In safety;
- In infrastructure;
- In the youth;

- And large investments are taking place now in the drought.

I am proud of the team on this side of the House for driving the growth agenda, the jobs agenda and the safety agenda... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But they are not even taking you seriously, on that side of the House. Hulle is besig met hulle phones.

An HON MEMBER: They are not listening.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, beyond the political noise on that side of the House, we have evidence from various statutory bodies across South Africa that the Western Cape is the best-run Government in South Africa.

Ms P MAKELENI: And beyond the idea of [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon, the Minister, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, before I start my speech I notice the hon member Dyantyi asked a question across the floor... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us hear the pretender!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...about whether the hon Minister of Finance had been through his interview process... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us hear the pretender. He is supposed to be brilliant.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and I can assure you, those processes, interviews are all completed. We are very organised, but in case the hon member Dyantyi is not in the loop from his faction, a letter sent to his province on 26 November by the African National Congress Secretary-General, which says “notice of extensions of the BGM, Branch General Meeting... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are so outdated.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...for list processes has been extended, so you have more time in which to work and if you want the rest of this letter, if you do not get it, I am happy to give it to you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

[Members speaking simultaneously.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Are you going to make a speech now?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I ask the MEC a question?

The SPEAKER: No-no, you can ask me if the MEC will take a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes please.

The SPEAKER: So you can take your seat and then I shall ask the Minister. Minister Winde, will you take a question? Yes, the Minister will take a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your interview with the DA, were you able to share with them the embarrassment you caused them when you led the Agriculture and Economic Opportunities Department that you even had to drag the AG to Court because of your failure?

AGBARE LEDE: Ja, ja.

The PREMIER: Well that is a stupid question.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much for that question and I have actually prepared because I have got all of that answer here and I will answer it in my speech.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You know it is a serious embarrassment. You must know.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you got your answer now.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So first of all, Madam Speaker, I happily follow on our Minister of Finance.

An HON MEMBER: No answer?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And he brought to the debate our economic failure as a country.

Mr P UYS: Looking at the [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: What I want to do within that space as to how this country is viewed by the world... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen to the speech!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: How this country is viewed by the world, and how leadership in the country has failed... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And how have you failed.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And we at the moment in this country are judged, our economic failure, but not only our economic failure. The brand of this country at the moment is one of crime and corruption.

An HON MEMBER: Uh-huh, answer.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You just have to monitor the Zondo Commission to see what State capture is like and that State capture is dealing with a very peripheral stock top crème; at the moment it is embedded in our systems in our country and of course the world is not stupid because you just have to look at the World Economic Forum rating of this country at the moment. And the top rating of most problematic [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ag, are we not speaking about the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...of doing business in South Africa is one of corruption.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where are we?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: If you look at that bar chart it is the biggest problem in our country. The noise at the moment... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr P UYS: And you are so happy!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The noise at the moment is the space that we have which is a corrupt country.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh come-on!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And if we really want to change this we have to change the tone at the top and everyone will agree that that tone at the top of over the last while has been led over the last ten years by Zuma and Gupta... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Blame the ANC for everything that they do.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Zuma and Gupta and they have

led that tone at the top. We now have opportunity, Madam Speaker. We now have an opportunity to change that, to change the tone at the top.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Blame the ANC. Ons weet die probleem is [Onduidelik.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We need to make sure that we bring into our legislatures [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your biggest winning. [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Anything with legislatures said in this House.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We need to make sure that we bring in ethics, truth, values, into our system. [Interjections.] If we are to really fix this and my portfolio that I now head up which is one of crime...

Ms N D NKONDLO: Aikona!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: One of corruption, one of dealing with this cancer that is rotting our country...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The one with the slush fund. The one with the slush fund; is that what you are talking about?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am just asking.

The SPEAKER: Sorry! Hon member Dyantyi, we have been through this before. An interjection cannot become a running commentary but you cannot pose a direct question to the Minister without going through the chair. So kindly manage yourself. [Interjections.] It is becoming disruptive so please. Thank you, you may proceed, Minister. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As long as you answer when I ask you questions.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, who are you for the Minister to report to, please now. You are trying to usurp my role here. Just manage yourself please. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much. So if we bring it back to the province... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Finally!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...about getting the tone right, making sure that we have values and ethics in how we do things as the leadership in this province, in this democracy of ours, whether it is the ruling

party or the opposition, we need to make sure that values and ethics become what we stand for so that we can send that message out. Now quite frankly let us talk about how ethics are carried out within the opposition at the moment.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, tell me, okay.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: There was a press conference held, if you look at the photograph of the press conference, it is actually the ANC leadership in this province, of course one of the members sitting in this photograph is the Chief Whip of the Opposition sitting in this House and in this press conference... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that part of your speech now? Please now, that is another mistake!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: In this press conference the campaign Chairperson of the ANC blatantly lies in a press conference to the press. He blatantly lies... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Jo!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And I will tell you what, I think we should actually say to him if he has proof that the DA was involved...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is dit! He knows what he has done.

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to check if it is parliamentary for a member of this House to say another member of this House lies. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I do not think that is what was said. Minister Winde said “the campaign manager.” I do not know who that is. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where is your Chairperson?

Ms P MAKELENI: He said “he lied...”

The SPEAKER: No that is not what I heard, sorry, hon member Makeleni. I think you have that one wrong.

An HON MEMBER: Who is the campaign manager?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will correct that, Mr Ebrahim

Rasool blatantly lied in this press conference. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] That is the reason. Julle het baie seergekry; julle het baie seergekry!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And I actually probably put the question to the Chief Whip of the Opposition that within the next 24 hours if you want me to withdraw, apologise, or you want to confirm that he is a blatant liar, bring the proof of how the DA was involved in trying to block the Anti-Gang Unit. He blatantly tells lies.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay you have said that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And of course this is the first lie.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please say something else now!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is the first lie.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We have heard that one.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Where is your statement on the Anti-Gang Unit?

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr C M DUGMORE: You have said nothing about [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Welcome hon member Dugmore, good afternoon. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. So let us go to the second one, and now of course hon members in this House we cannot accuse each other of lying so I am not going to do that, but I am going to talk about a speech that was delivered on the 15<sup>th</sup> of November in this House. Hon member Lekker made the speech and this is the Hansard of her speech and in this speech she says:

“The Department...”

Now she is referring to the Department of Agriculture. This is your question:

“Your Department failed and is still failing to submit two years of annual reports.”

This is on 15 November. On 30 October, 15 days earlier, the Department submitted both the 2016/17 and 2017/18 annual reports. They were submitted in this House [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you on... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And this is the report of this House. So of course I am not going to say that the hon member was lying but what she said in her speech and the Hansard was exactly the opposite to what the truth was... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is following you. The problem is following you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...of how this was tabled in this House 15 days earlier. In addition... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why are you [Inaudible.] for yourself?

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Why? Because nobody else will do it.

Mr S G TYATYAM: (?) You have refused!

The SPEAKER: Hon members there is a conversation and I have been listening and it talks to - it was a South African context, a Western Cape context... [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is hy!

The SPEAKER: A culture of integrity and ethical leadership amongst others and examples are now being quoted so allow the Minister to get to his speech, which I am sure he is working towards.

An HON MEMBER: He is taking too long!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, but please practice some patience. Thank you. The Minister will now proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He just goes to HR before he goes to [Inaudible.]

Mr P UYS: Get to your speech.

The SPEAKER: Okay, but let us all stay in Cape Town. Thank you.

Mr P UYS: Get to your speech, the Speaker said.

The SPEAKER: No, that is not what I said, hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Of course you said that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, I will get to my speech, if the opposition would allow me to, but obviously this pains them too much. So we need leadership to start being ethical and honest and truthful. So here is an example [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: So that is your manifesto now!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and one wonders what this member will do with this information that I have just given because of course this was misleading the House because the evidence which is of this House, and a Hansard and a report of the committee say two opposite things.

The next line which goes to the question that I was asked by the hon member Dyantyi... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Auditor-General has made findings against you and your department.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And that is correct.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Alan.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is correct. The Auditor-General did make findings against the Department.

Mr P UYS: Where do you want the discussion?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Auditor-General made findings against the Department and this is the Department. The Department that in 2011 received the highest score in the Annual Public Sector Reporting Awards for the year ended 31 March 2010 [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I am waiting for you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: All Provincial Departments in the Western Cape in 2011, overall winner of the 2011 Annual Public Sector Reporting Awards category all National and Provincial Departments. [Interjections.]

The highest score in the Annual Public Sector Reporting Awards for the year ended 31 March 2011, category all Provincial Departments in the Western Cape. In 2012 overall winner of the 2012 Annual Public Sector Reporting Awards category all National and Provincial Departments.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that your affidavit now [Inaudible.] Wow! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: In 2015, the highest score in the Annual Public Sector Reporting Awards for the year ended 31 March 2014... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, excuse me, Minister Winde, excuse me. Hon member Dyantyi, you asked a question. I take it this is the response to the question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not the affidavit. He should answer the [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No, so the Minister is now answering your question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, do not give me an affidavit.

The SPEAKER: So please be patient and listen. Thank you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you Madam Speaker. I am prepared for any question that comes my way. So in 2015 the highest score in the Annual Public Sector Reporting Awards for the year 31 March 2014 all Provincial Departments in the Western Cape. In 2015 the most consistent highest scores for 2013, 2014 and 2015 and then of course, let us get to the Auditor-General because that was not the Auditor-General. That was the South African Institute for Government Auditors who gave those Awards. Then the Auditor-General gave the PFMA Clean Audit Awards for the Department for 2010/11.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No that is not what I was asking. You must come to that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: For 2012/13, for 2013/14, for 2014/15 and for 2015/16 and of course... [Interjection.] And of course then the Auditor-General changed the rules and that is why we are challenging this in Court.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes. You change the rules for your own party.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And of course I can assure you that if we get this right... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: You change the rules for everything.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...it will actually make it easier to create jobs. A lot of that stuff that has been tackled in the Auditor-General's report is how we make funding available for small black farmers, this Government, but of course I cannot go into the merits of this case because it is in court at the moment but if I got asked the question I give the answer. He obviously does not like the answer and he is walking out. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is walking out!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is walking out. So let us

move to the same discussion in this House where the hon member Lekker, still on the floor and still in the Hansard, Madam Speaker...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Where is she?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do not know where she is but still in the Hansard, she then goes on to say things like:

“The charges that are relating to Knysna tourism. How can a person involved in misuse of millions of public funds or illegal tourism companies be appointed as MEC of Community Safety? The Hawks are coming for you, my friend.”

So of course she is totally within her rights to make this kind of allegation within this House. I asked her when we went out for tea whether she will be prepared to make those allegations outside the House. I still have not heard them made outside the House, but I put that challenge to her publicly in this House to say come and make those statements outside the House and we will see what will happen with that. Or even better, why does she not make the statement in the House, bring the proof, and go and lay the charge at the police station if she has proof, in order to back up this statement that she made, because my point is, we need honour and ethics, the truth. We need to come to this House if we are to change South Africa. We need to come to this House as hon members, with ethics, with values, with truth that back up what we talk about here in this very House because we have to set the tone going forward.

So then the next thing, Madam Speaker, that I would like to speak about in this debate is a question that was asked to me across the floor by the hon member Dugmore and I am very glad that he is here, because we were talking about a safer Western Cape and the hon member Dugmore said to me “but you do not invite the Standing Committee or the opposition members to this specific event.” [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: But you answered to that already so why must we hear it again?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So of course, I said, I could not answer it directly. I said I would go and get the facts and I have now gone and got the facts of who was invited to that specific event. Every single member of the Standing Committee was invited to the event but guess what, that invitation was sent out on 25 October [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: To who?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: To every single member of the Standing Committee.

The SPEAKER: Honourable...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Then on 1 November a reminder

was sent out and of course what I am going to deal with now is who replied and of course one of the members, T Dijana replied at 18:15:38 on 1 November. She replied to that mail and her reply says: “Yes, I will be there on both days.” Unfortunately the hon member said that, but did not come to the meeting.

An HON MEMBER: What is new!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So I said to the hon member that I would bring the truth to this space, which I have brought now again.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you. Thank you. Nkosi. [Applause.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Is that your speech?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We need to make sure that in everything that we do even when we RSVP, we RSVP with truth and honour.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Was that your speech?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And now I would like to finish off with Bambanani. So I went to a meeting on Monday night. I went to a meeting on Monday night with the Police Board and guess who was briefing the CPFs on Bambanani?

An HON MEMBER: Lennit Max.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Lennit Max on behalf of the Minister and that is fine, because he is the adviser...

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde...

Mr C M DUGMORE: Is there something wrong with that?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But I will tell you was the second brief... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, sorry, if you can finish your sentence, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The hon Ramatlakane was briefing the CPFs... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are you coming to this meeting with [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...on how a government project was going to be rolled out in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The member of an oversight committee briefing how Government was going to roll something out, and again I put the challenge to them there and I put it here now. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: If this is a truly Government and not an ANC, it will come via us and come via this Government.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You stopped it, you!

[Hon members speaking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, who wants to go first?  
[Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Perhaps hon Olivier, name them Madam Speaker.  
[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, you are... Hon members, please kindly compose yourselves. We now get the next speaker, the hon Magaxa.

Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Praat mooi!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Let us get the speech.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The misconception must be dispelled of a budget that is committed to service delivery and citizen impact, as well as the claim that this is for jobs, infrastructure, youth and safety.

I draw attention to the commemoration of the life of the late Fidel Castro the Cuban communist revolutionary and a Marxist-Leninist who passed away on 25 November 2016.

An HON MEMBER: We salute!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Under his administration as Cuban President, there was a successful programme of nationalisation, including executing state socialism reforms throughout society, which were based on providing access to basic needs of survival to all. We celebrate him in the South Africa for many reasons; most importantly because he opened up opportunities for the poor students from historically disadvantaged backgrounds to access to higher education and training as medical doctors in Cuba, which today are benefiting the whole world. [Interjections.]

For years Premier Zille and her party have been a stumbling block for those

poor children from the Western Cape to access this once in a lifetime opportunity to free themselves from the bondages of poverty, inequality and unemployment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Therefore this DA will go down... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It has been stopped.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...with that blood on their hands of refusing innocent poor children an access to education - free education. This is not surprising, because the DA exists to ensure that black people remain chained by a triple yoke of oppression, while racial inequalities widens. The South Africa's triple challenge of poverty, inequality and unemployment is racial in character because of the colonialism of a special type. The DA has to understand that, if they do not want to end up ignorant for life.

Colonialism deprived us a lot. It has oppressed us as a nation, as a class, as a gender. Therefore we cannot resolve that crisis without acknowledging every day policies that talk to those contradictions; in an interrelated manner [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: There is a speech.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...not disturbed by stir. [Interjections.] He resolved those problems at the same time. The ANC Government's responsibility is to actually do that and we were doing that in this Province. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Well done the ANC.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA, instead of being occupied by spending the budget to address these challenges, it is mired in deep racial infighting. At first it was De Lille and now the fight is against a group of uneducated white people occupying senior positions in the party like John Steenhuisen and Alan Winde.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr K E MAGAXA: If MEC Meyer and the DA were serious about the budget for service delivery and citizen impact, then they must create space in the budget for the returning medical students from Cuba who are ready to save the healthcare system in the province or in the public health system that is collapsing in the province.

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible.] he is a first-aider. (?)

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am talking to the one that killed my brother-in-law yesterday, who waited in KD Hospital for five days without access to a bed; nor being transferred while was terminally ill.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Exactly, tell them.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The second development is the Steenhuisen phenomenon... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The least you can do is to listen.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...which exposed an entrenched white privilege in the DA; black members must have post-graduate qualifications to be considered for positions... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Exactly!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...while for their white counterparts and anointed matric and less is enough to get a senior position like that one of the Chief Whip. Lest we forget that in this Legislature we once had an astute lawyer and a sharp thinker by the name of Lennit Max, with a vast experience in the safety. He had brilliant ideas to fight crime but all were ignored by the DA. That is because the party does not care about the safety of people in the province. This was affirmed by Premier Zille in this House when she told us she would only fund safety initiatives in communities when her party wins national elections.

We then had to ask the Premier what caused the change of heart now that

they created a Winde slush fund of R26,8 million? This slush fund is not intended for citizen impact; instead it is to make the failed premier candidate to look good who failed to get clean audits for two consecutive years. This was just to clean the scenes he has created.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Under the previous MEC the Department was under-funded, which is the Safety, and reduced to some oversight desk. Under a black MEC the Department was under-funded to create conditions for him to fail and he obviously failed dismally. That the party's Premier candidate is assigned to this Department, and he has put a huge red mat of R26,8 million, and he is supported with more funding, as clearly shows that this is the budget for campaigning, and to clean the foot of the queen / king, hon Winde.

An HON MEMBER: Queen-king!

Mr K E MAGAXA: In this regard, travelling costs for the MEC as well as budget for the Youth Religious Safety Programme... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and the militia called Neighbourhood Watches are increased.

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The blockage of Community Policing Forums by the DA is said to continue as their budget is not increased. Instead the focus now is on Neighbourhood Watches.

For a maximum citizen impact, more funding should be made available to community crime fighting structures like the Bambanani programme, launched by the ANC government in the province. The hon Winde slush fund will remain ineffective for as long as it is invested in things like Wi-Fi instead of community structures. With the Winde slush fund, sadly we witnessed drastic reduction in Compensation of Employees across all departments. This was influenced by resignations and failure to fill vacant posts.

The Health Department is one of the most affected departments and it is obvious under this Government. This is a serious concern for me for the reasons known to all of us. Health in this province is in a state of paralysis.

This is not by accident. It is not by accident. It is precisely because none of this middle elite white people are going to those public hospitals. That is why it is not an issue.

It is because none of them belong to those hospitals. It is the black majority

that go to those hospitals. This elite do not care about that.

Mr M G E WILEY: The hospitals in the Eastern Cape? They do not go there.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is not, one would have expected a budget. That one would have expected a budget for citizen impact to cater more to address the self-orchestrated chaos in Khayelitsha District Hospital and Mitchells Plain and it should have made provision for the rebuilding of the G F Jooste hospital. [Interjections.]

Instead conditions at these hospitals will deteriorate as the adjusted budget for the District Health Services has been reduced. That shows the DA does not care about the lives of the poor and marginalised people.

As the ANC we welcome the National Government Department of Health's intervention to reprioritise R350 million to recruit in excess of 2 000 health professionals into the public health system. This was a commitment made at the Presidential Health Summit. What are you doing in the province, *Niyateketa*.

The 16 Days of Activism against violence against women and children from 25 November and 10 December unites people in one voice to call for an end to the Western Cape's most persistent violation of human rights where the highest number of deaths of women and children occur.

This budget is silent on ways to improve safety for women and children, but it is called a budget of service delivery and citizen impact. My foot!

Surely this budget will lead to more cases of child murders such as that of Courtney Peters and Stacey Adams as the Department of Social Development decided to reduce the budget for critical programmes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa...

Mr K E MAGAXA: This shows the DA attitude towards women and children. It is not surprising that a DA youth leader, Fikile Mbewu, appeared at Wynberg Magistrate Court yesterday for allegedly raping and impregnating a 13 year old relative - a relative!

ʼn AGBARE LID: Sies, ʼn skande!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, your time has expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: A DA leader!

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: My God! [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr D JOSEPH: The people of the Western Cape has since 2009 experienced a stable Government in the Western Cape. Under the leadership of Premier Helen Zille and a stable Cabinet the voters in this province gave the DA a mandate to govern. This mandate to govern increased from 51,9% to 59% in 2014.

Agb Speaker, ek is van mening dat die mense van die Wes-Kaap die mandaat vir die DA nog sterker gaan maak. Toe hulle die korrupsie in die ANC Regering waargeneem het, het die mense begin verstaan waarom gaan demokrasie.

Terwyl die DA goeie regering in die Wes-Kaap handhaaf, is die ANC besig om te steel. Die korrupsie het so erg geraak dat die ANC Regering 'n kommissie moes aanstel om die ANC te ondersoek. Hoekom het die ANC so lank geneem om van mnr Zuma ontslae te raak? Hoekom het die ANC toegelaat dat miljoene gesteel word en dat die armes nog armer word? Die ongekende armoede van miljoene Suid-Afrikaners onder die ANC Regering kan mens niks anders noem as 'n skande nie. Dit is 'n skande!

'n AGBARE LID: 'n Skreiende skande!

Mnr D JOSEPH: Agb Speaker, ons kan nie die ANC Government vertrou met 'n begroting en geld in die Wes-Kaap nie. Ons sal dit nooit doen nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Wat dan van Bambanani [Onduidelik.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Whilst the Western Cape Government is busy implementing the Provincial Strategic Plan embedded in good governance the ANC is at war with itself, to the extent that the ANC in the Western Cape is without a leader. The caretaker leader, the hon leader of the opposition does not even know who to support for the leadership race in the ANC.

Ms P MAKELENI: They are such gossipers.

Mnr D JOSEPH: Agb Speaker, die ANC en die EFF, en die ANC is besig om hierdie land in die grond in te bestuur.

'n AGBARE LID: Ag, nee, jy weet dis nie waar nie.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, if we reflect on the National Medium Term Budget Policy Statement we will see that South Africa is in financial trouble. We are on a financial fiscal cliff. Our economic growth has come down from 5% in 2008 to 0,7% in 2018.

Binnegevegte en staatskaping by SARS het veroorsaak dat R50 biljoen te kort ingevorder is. Waarom moet die belastingbetalers en gewone verbruikers en arm mense die SA Lugdiens aan die gang hou met 'n R5 biljoen begroting per jaar? Mense wat in vliegtuie sit en vliegtuie vlieg het geld, en baie mense spaar om te vlieg en ons gun hulle dit, maar ons kan nie die ANC toelaat om die geld so te mors nie.

State entities like SAA must be placed under public private partnership. Government will then have more money to spend on the poor.

The Western Cape Government's decision not to introduce a fuel levy is based on research and evidence on our economic status. The main driver for the consumer price inflation is the monthly fuel price that impacts on transport.

In 2005 while the Province was governed by the ANC a fuel levy of between 10 cents and 50 cents was proposed by the then Minister Trevor Manuel. The Western Cape is a responsible Government and is very aware that the poor conditions, economic conditions like unemployment, poverty levels and inequalities does not favour a fuel levy for the Western Cape; thus the announcement by the Minister to drop it.

Mr P UYS: We stopped you.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, the inflation we note has rose to 5,1% and

according to SA Stats placing further pressure on consumer spending, which will impact negatively on the economic growth.

Senior citizens are mostly affected by the cost of living and the National Government must seriously investigate and review the situation of senior citizens.

Madam Speaker, South Africa is connected around the world and very well known for its collective intelligence. Our Universities receive students from various backgrounds thus proving the opportunity to generate and transmit knowledge for societal changes created by technology. This will impact on how we will manage on the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

Mr P UYS: We stopped you.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, the inflation we note has risen to 5.1%, and according to SA Stats, placing further pressure on consumer spending, which will impact negatively on the economic growth.

Senior citizens are mostly affected by the cost of living and the National Government must seriously investigate and review the situation of senior citizens.

Madam Speaker, South Africa is connected around the world and very well-known for its collective intelligence. Our universities receive students from

various backgrounds, thus proving the opportunity to generate and transmit knowledge for societal changes created by technology. This will impact on how we will manage on the fourth industrial revolution.

Technology influence our perception; it changes our behaviour and affect the daily lives of human beings. The shift from reliance on animals early in the 20<sup>th</sup> century has now shifted to electricity distribution followed by wired and wireless communication, placing pressure on human labour. Whilst the world has experienced the third industrial revolution with develop digital systems and global communication systems, the fourth industrial revolution is here; meaning the future is on our doorstep.

Industrial revolutions are ultimately driven by individual and collective choices. Madam Speaker, it is very important to note that governments, investors, consumers and regulators who adopt and implement these technologies will be associated with influence and power.

Madam Speaker, the impact on the fourth industrial revolution may point out to how unequal societies have become and how people who can afford the benefits of technology and innovation enjoy a better life.

Government must invest in the foundational phase; government must invest and place stronger emphasis on early childhood development. This investment will support lower income families, unemployed parents, the poor, the marginalised, preparing the youth for the future and to deal with the

technological challenges.

I need to make this point about the R2 million donation that the ANC received from VBS Mutual Bank to fund their 2016 elections campaign. That is the truth and the money was invested [Interjections.] on behalf of municipalities, on behalf of the poor, under false pretences.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is wrong.

Mr D JOSEPH: The Reserve Bank and other regulators were misled, hence the call for the provisional liquidation of VBS Bank.

The ANC only admitted receiving R250,000 for its birthday celebrations in January this year. According to the newspaper report ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey, you are talking about birthday, hey?

Mr D JOSEPH: ... the Sunday Times of 28 October 2018. 10 Limpopo municipalities, two in Gauteng, one in Mpumalanga invested a combined R1,5 billion in the VBS Bank, and that was the only reason as to **challenge** the money back to the ANC.

Madam Speaker, the ANC – vir die ANC om net te sê ons gaan hierdie geld, gesteelde geld terugbetaal is onaanvaarbaar. Die ANC in die Wes-Kaap en die ANC in die ander provinsies moet die land, en veral al die arme mense om

verskoning vra. Die ANC is 'n korrupte politieke partye en dan wil hulle nogal die Wes-Kaap regeer.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Sies.

Mnr D JOSEPH: Die mense van die Wes-Kaap sal ook nooit toelaat dat die ANC of die EFF hierdie Provinsie regeer nie.

To influence National Treasury as well as private sector for investing in VBS Bank is against the Municipal Financial Management Act, and is nothing less than fraud and corruption.

Madam Speaker, our economic outlook, we can say from that we are in a technical recession. What we need is leadership; we need policy certainty; we need a safe environment to correct business confidence and we need fiscal discipline. Whilst we note the efforts by President Ramaphosa to draw investors to South Africa, we need to remind the ruling party it cannot be business as usual in the Government and the State-owned entities.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just vote for the ANC [Indistinct.].

Mr D JOSEPH: I commend the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer and the Cabinet Ministers for their continuous interaction with international role-players, promoting trade and economic opportunities, marketing our country and marketing the Western Cape as the best Regional Government in South

Africa.

Madam Speaker, the reason why the Western Cape is the best in South Africa is for the following reasons:

- The Western Cape honour our Constitution and our constitutional democracy where we are equal citizens. Our constitutional democracy replaced the apartheid system that we called was a crime against humanity.
- In the Western Cape we respect the rule of law, we respect the judicial system, we respect the independence of the court.
- In the Western Cape we respect the contribution [Interjections.] of our senior citizens, our leaders, who contributed to building this country, placing South Africa on the international stage.
- In the Western Cape we respect the contribution of ordinary citizens, creating public value and working with Government for the whole of society approach.
- In the Western Cape we value our public / private partnerships and improve the maintenance and infrastructure.
- In the Western Cape we believe in separation of party and State departments.
- In the Western Cape Parliament we allow a member of the opposition to chair the Public Accounts Committee, and that speaks for itself. [Interjections.] It does not happen in the other provinces. [Interjections.] It does not happen in the other provinces.

[Interjections.]

- In the Western Cape the senior management and all staff are not appointed on political affiliation. Freedom of association, freedom of religion, freedom of cultural practice is respected.

The Western Cape Government under the DA is the best run government in South Africa. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] In the absence of the EFF I see the [Interjections.] Minister, Minister Bredell. Thank you.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, Agb Speaker, en baie dankie vir die geleentheid.

Agb Speaker, daar is vandag slegs een Provinsiale Regering in Suid-Afrika wat met reg kan sê dat mense in die Provinsie kan verseker wees van 'n beter lewe vir almal. Daardie Provinsie is die Wes-Kaap.

Mnr D JOSEPH: Hoor-hoor!

'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

*[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]*

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Hierdie Provinsie word byna daaglik gekritiseer deur die ANC oor so te sê probleme in verskeie dele van die Provinsie, in vergelyking met wat? In comparison to what? To Cuba? Ja, the ANC is a joke [Interjections.], Mr Deputy Speaker.

Die ANC wil voorgee dat daar geweldige behuisings, riool, veiligheidkwessies in die Wes-Kaap bestaan, maar weet u dat die feite toon 'n ander prentjie? In die tyd waar die feite moet tel lig ek 'n paar uit.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die ANC het altyd dubbele standaarde wanneer dit kom tot die Wes-Kaap. The ANC, with their cadre benefit policy, always wants to point a finger to the Western Cape, instead of telling the people about the facts. Die Wes-Kaap is vandag op elke meetbare vlak van dienslewering die beste presteerder in die land. Gaan vergelyk hierdie Provinsie met elke ander provinsie daar buite en u sal self vir u die vraag kan antwoord.

Dit is nie ek wat so sê nie, dis nie ek wat dit proklameer nie. Dis die Ouditeur-Generaal, dis Stats South Africa, dis die EMPAT wat opgestel word in die President se kantoor; almal, al hierdie onafhanklike verslae wys dat waar die Wes-Kaap, die DA regeer, regeer ons beter as die ANC.

Die armste in die Wes-Kaap het byvoorbeeld by verre die meeste en die beste toegang tot basiese dienste. The best access to basic services for the poor is

in the Western Cape.

in AGB LID: Hoor-hoor.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die gehalte van dienste is meetbaar beter as enige ander provinsie. If the ANC with their cadre national benefit programme will just stop looting the State [Interjections.] there will be more money so that we can do even more, because everybody in this House must recognise [Interjections.] that we need to do more to benefit the poorest of the poor. The ANC acknowledge and closes its eyes for the fact [Interjections.] that if they steel on that National level there is less to spend on poverty at the end of the cycle.

Die Ouditeur-Generaal het hierdie week of twee gelede sy jongste audit resultate bekend gemaak vir die Provinsie. Vermorste en onreëlmatige uitgawes is die ANC beheerde provinsies is op 200%. 200% increase. Dit is altesaam meer as R3 miljard; R3 billion.

In the Western Cape – die totale syfer van onreëlmatige besteding is 0,01%; R200,000, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, en ons vra ernstige vrae daarvoor want dit moet nul wees. Dieselfde Ouditeur-Generaal het ons 83% skoon audits in die Wes-Kaap gegee. Die tweede provinsie naaste aan ons is Gauteng met 50%. Die ander ANC ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN SOSIALE ONTWIKKELING: Oe, dis 'n skande!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die ander ANC beheerde provinsies ...  
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN SOSIALE ONTWIKKELING: Skande!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... is almal op 30% en laer.  
[Tussenwerpsels.] Dan wil hulle 'n vinger wys, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker [Tussenwerpsels.], ons departemente en ons munisipaliteite is trots op ons rekord van skoon en ongekwalifiseerde oudits.  
[Tussenwerpsels.] Belastingbetalers se geld in die Wes-Kaap eindig nie in verskiesingsveldtogte en in bankrekenings van broers en seuns van politieke leiers nie [Tussenwerpsels.], ons spandeer ons geld op ons armste van ons armste; ons spandeer ons geld om die lewens van mense in die Wes-Kaap te verbeter.

Geld in hierdie Provinsie word bestee om mense se lewens te verbeter. Yes, we need more to do more, but only the DA Government can do that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ons bestee [Tussenwerpsels.] sowat 90% van ons provinsiale begroting [Tussenwerpsels.] aan twee items: skole, education, of gesondheid, health. The reasons are very obvious: because a healthy society is a happy society. A society with a good education will enter our markets and will get jobs at the end of the day.

Dit is waar ons as DA Regering glo ons grootste prioriteite lê. The ANC wants to keep people dependent on grants, and that is the big difference between the two parties.

Ms P MAKELENI: And you have a problem with grants.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En ons sien die resultate. Ons gesondheidsdienste het nie dieselfde krisis as die ANC-beheerde provinsies nie. Oorweeg die skandalige Life Esidimeni saak in Gauteng waar die ANC regering se aksie bygedra het tot die dood van 143 weerlose mense. Wat was die ANC se reaksie? Sy cadre is vroeër vanjaar weer verkies tot die ANC Gauteng se Provinsiale Raad waar sy steeds dien. Dis 'n skande, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

The trend, you can follow this trend. You can see the previous Premier of this province, Ebrahim Rasool, is now in charge of leading the ANC campaign.

[Interjections.] They keep on recycling [Interjections.] people with criminal records, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die ANC onder die President Cyril Ramaphosa praat van Thumani-ma [Tussenwerpsels.] Thuma Mina. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die ANC [Tussenwerpsels.] – dit beteken, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit beteken [Tussenwerpsels.] ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit beteken “stuur my”. [Tussenwerpsels.] Stuur my, mnr die Adjunkspeaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: You cannot even read.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit beteken “stuur my”. Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, het President Ramaphosa al ooit Marikana gaan besoek in die Noord-Wes, waar die polisie 34 mynwerkers afgemaai het? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Dieselfde myn waar die President destyds op die direksie gesit het.

An HON MEMBER: He is scare [Indistinct.].

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die antwoord is nee, hy het nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Hy weier om te gaan. Hoeveel van hierdie mynwerkers se gesinne is vergoed vir hulle lyding [Tussenwerpsels.] soos wat die ANC Regering belooft het? Nie een nie. Hoeveel mense wat betrokke was is al in die tronk? Nie een nie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Intendeel sommige van die, sommige soos die destydse Minister van Polisie, is steeds in die President se Kabinet.

An HON MEMBER: [1.12.52]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, in die Wes-Kaap draai ons die pennies om en ons werk hard om ons mense se lewens te verander. Dit ten spyte van die enorme ekonomiese krisis waar binne die ANC Regering hierdie land ingesleep het. Ons is steeds in 'n resessie en die ANC Regering het ongetwyfeld daartoe bygedra dat ons meer as R16 per liter vir petrol betaal, en dat die inflasie die hoogste ingeskiet het.

In die Wes-Kaap is die tendens egter anders en ten spyte van die enorme finansiële uitdaging kan ons spog daarmee dat tot 75% van die nuwe

werksgeleenthede verlede jaar in die Wes-Kaap geskep is.

’n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nader aan die huis is my Departement van Plaaslike Regering se totale begroting sowat R250 miljoen. Daarmee moet ons omsien na 30 munisipaliteite en ons moet die rampe en die brande wat elke jaar ons tref bestuur. Wat kry ons in ruil?

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die beste dienste aan die arm mense; funksionele rade en dorpe; ons het onlangs weer met die brande in die Suid-Kaap gesien hoe effektief die spanne is. Hoe vinnig hulle ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, Minister, u tyd is verstreke.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... reageer en watter uitstekende werk ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Maak net klaar.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... hulle doen.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: No, your time ...

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... die inwoners van die Wes-Kaap sal die DA vergoed vir goeie regering. Dankie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.] The hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape is up for grabs come elections 2019. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And you are taking it.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The facts are **IPSOS** gives the DA 28% and the ANC 26%. [Interjections.] Afrobarometer gives the DA 31% and the ANC 21%. [Interjections.] Telling us that the Western Cape is up for grabs.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It also tells us that the ANC is a non-starter, but that the DA has failed the people of the Western Cape for almost 10 years. [Interjections.] We are contesting a bi-election in Graafwater where the

previous DA mayor is our candidate, because he is sick and tired of the DA; Jimmy Barnard ward 4, on 12 December. [Interjections.]

The people in the Western Cape is unhappy because we had more than 200 protests in this province. We had more than 200 protests in this province. People is looking for servant leaders and we know how to serve. We know how to address the crime; we know how to address unemployment [Interjections.] and the ACDP is that alternative [Interjections.]. The ACDP is ready to govern 2019. [Interjections.] Because we are enrolling thousands and thousands of members of the DA and the ANC. [Interjections.]

The people ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... is looking for an alternative, and we are that alternative. We, the ACDP is this alternative for this province. [Interjections.] After 10 years in government the DA still do not have answers for this province, and the ACDP is coming and saying, "We are the servant leaders to sort out the problems in this province."

An HON MEMBER: How do you know?

Mr B S MADIKIZELA: Dream on!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: See 2019, the DA and the ANC will not get the majority; the people has said no to them and they are looking for the alternative. The alternative for 2019 is the ACDP. I thank you.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Spoken like a dreamer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy Speaker, this elitist DA Government is really in a crisis, both in its policies, its internal divisions, its race debate and its general reasoning. [Interjections.]

You cannot stand here and grandstand with some fancy worded budget, but your internal processes in its implementation makes no sense and it is far removed from the **reteric**. We cannot stand by and let everything that MEC Meyer said about this province fly in the face of reality and leave it unchallenged.

This supposedly best run province is like Henry Ford who said you can have any colour car as long as it is black. Here you can say anything as long it is singing your praises; their praises.

An HON MEMBER: Oh my word.

An HON MEMBER: Tell them!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: People's lived experiences are very different to what you have just heard here. Money spent ... [Interjections.]

Mr B S MADIKIZELA: Even worse than the ANC provinces.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Money spent – I live here in the Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] I address the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Western Cape is in South Africa.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and its realities. [Interjections.] I am very aware of the Western Cape being part of South Africa ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but I live here. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which the DA does not know. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You cannot boast here about how you spend the

money, yet R304 million of your budget that is meant to employ people is handed back.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Jô! What?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Education hands back R130 million of their equitable share, which is meant to employ teachers, and you boast [Interjections.] – please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The best province.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The notion of this best run province obviously stems from a comment made by the Auditor-General regarding audit outcomes, which we all know are but snapshots of every department ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Skande! Sies, man!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and is mostly about compliance. It has nothing to do with your core business, which is providing services ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It has everything to do.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and changes the lives of all citizens for the better. [Interjections.] Or for the entrenched right to oversight. [Interjections.]

The Auditor-General does not express an opinion on that. We hold you to account for that in our oversight role.

Mr B S MADIKIZELA: And you are failing dismally to do that.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Conveniently nothing is said about the specific department who did not submit – and I want to correct untruths that are being spread here now by MEC ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: By your hopeful Premier.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... hopeful Premier, yes, I am coming there.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: New MEC of [Interjections.] Community Safety. For two consecutive years they did not submit and they are taking that very AG whom they are boasting about, tells them that they are the best, that very AG they are taking to court, because he did not sing their praises. [Interjections.]

The result, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that as SCOPA we have had a protracted battle with the DA who is hell-bent on not having that department come to account for [Interjections.] the work of the past two years [Interjections.] and

our right to hold them to account has been stalled by numerous shenanigans. They have not presented the report to SCOPE.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I give up.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They have not.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The best run province.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Firstly trying to hide behind a *sub judice* rule that is not applicable or relevant, and now trying to further curtail our right to oversight ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And now you are a lawyer.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... by determining which pages we have a right to question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This last issue, Mr Deputy Speaker, was taken in a backroom here in the Kaap where we hidden to cover up so that the rest of the press and the rest of this building [Interjections.] could not listen to the debate that we were having.

STILPA has degenerated into a party political ... (intervention)

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Open society [Indistinct.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... playing field using votes to bully opposition. This is the DA of the best run province that purports to run an open society province.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go! It is all rubbish.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Facts to remember ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now we know.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... background to that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now we know.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Speaker was informed on 28 September by MEC Winde that he is about to serve papers on the AG. On 30 October we are stopped in our tracks by a letter sent to that Committee by the Speaker. This action prompted by some official who felt the need to stop us using Rule 61.

For four ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: To hide all their Nkandlas.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... consecutive meetings, Mr Deputy Speaker, four consecutive meetings we were bullied by votes and absolute party political cover up for either their refusal to accept a clear and concise legal opinion about the *sub judice* rule, which then and now still is not applicable.

They will not accept responsibility for the fact that the Speaker, who had been informed on 28 September already and her letter to us, is the reason that we have not yet dealt with Agriculture's two years of annual reports.

We reject the final arrogant response to a request from the Committee for the reason which gave rise to these delays. You will not bully us into silent submission to accept a response which clearly is both contradictory and false.

At some point you need to pay attention to this prayer that is read here every time we come in here. Listen to the words that are uttered. The lengths to which this DA Government will go to cover up what is wrong is just mindboggling, and this morning SCOPA's meeting is a proof of exactly that. This is the same practice in municipalities where the opposition is bullied by votes for them to get their way.

But wait, why were their voices so deafening in their silence when Patricia de Lille was fighting for her rights within the DA? Fighting for what was right.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Nou kom die ding, nou kom die ding!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Silent. Remember the public investors and the world ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Nou kom die ding.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... watched your unravelling on a daily basis as it confirmed to them what they always knew. They had ring seats to this circus. [Interjections.]

If you recognise stupidity, as the MEC Meyer said, then recognise it across the board, amongst your own as well.

Today the lobbying of a position that they clearly knew was wrong, standing in the way of our right to access for information, all in the name of party political cover-up by the head puppeteer, the Chief Whip, continued. This will not end our fight for justice or our right to play our oversight role. We will continue that without fear or favour.

You are well-known for bashing National Government. Maybe you should take a page out of their book and see how they deal with their own in SCOPA.

But back to the reality here. Ironically, Mr Deputy Speaker, the MEC whose

department we were trying to debate, is the person who is now your Premier candidate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, in his dreams. In his dreams.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He speaks about ethics and truth and [Interjections.] values and we need to deal from the top. Apply that to your own.

But let us backtrack a bit. First ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Alan Winde, the Premier.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... how did he get there?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In his dreams.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: First MEC Bongi Madikizela is elected as the leader ... [Interjections.]

Mr B S MADIKIZELA: Bonginkosi.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... the poster boy [Interjections.], the imagine, the future of how the DA wants to portray itself ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... the one, he is to who the black vote.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Indistinct.] very badly.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Come the elective conference ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: By a white liberal [Indistinct.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... the white elite cabal ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... chooses [Interjections.] white again, because to them white is right.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why else would you remove the person with a legitimate expectation to follow up the steps to Leeuwenhof [Interjections.] in favour of a white candidate?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They just need black votes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Back to the Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is all.

Mr D JOSEPH: Choose your leader [Indistinct].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It is under this very Premier candidate, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is under his very watch that their flagship entity, Wesgro, is the only entity that has regressed this year. After so many years for the first time. It is the same MEC under whose watch farmworkers do not yet enjoy freedom that has been hard-fought for them. They still live in the worst conditions imaginable as was recently witnessed during a bi-election in De Doorns, and again now in Ceres where the farmers refused the workers their right to information. Yet they are masters at intimidating their workers in a direction that they should vote.

They are continuously evicted, treated badly, worse than animals ...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Take them to court.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and in a recent newspaper article on a farm, not

far from here, in Simondium, were without water for days. Their basic right.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In Simondium, ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Under his watch SMMEs were finding it so difficult to survive because of all the hoops they have to jump to make an honest living; also the cost of getting assistance from institutions set up for that very purpose.

That same MEC now realises that for the economy to grow you need to address crime, and hence chose to take over Community Safety again; trying to show up white is right and show up Dan Plato as useless. [Interjections.]

Funds are now syphoned off from other departments to fund this campaign trail.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why is it that shifts in environments can now so easily happen [Interjections.]? In actual fact to duplicate a national initiative of the Anti-Gang Unit, which you now have to backtrack on and support. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is the same MEC [Interjections.] who tells coloured voters on his campaign trail that the police alone cannot solve the problem. We have always said that.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We need all hands on deck. Why now suddenly you realise that it is not only the police? We have often been telling you that until you deal with the societal degradation and moral decay, crime will flourish. Police are the plaster. You need to find the root cause of the problem, and again this is the MEC under whose watch the economy of the province were supposed to turn around and jobs created, but more especially the entry ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... level micro-enterprises were supposed to flourish.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No wonder you are quiet. This is it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The reality ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... is the unemployment rate is sky rocketing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired. I will allow you the last sentence to finish off.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She has done it. She has done it.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Can I find that last sentence?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just finish that.

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: An inordinate amount of wasteful – but let me just say this, Mr Deputy Speaker, this DA Parliament needs to learn to communicate, learn to listen and respond to communities, but how can we expect any better when it is in this very Parliament where ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... a notion that public hearing is not public participation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Mngqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker ... (intervention)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... I would have appreciated [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... at least to hear from the opposition, just like the President has done [Interjections.], his Excellency, hon Cyril Ramaphosa [1.28.07] last week on Thursday. Thank you, Western Cape, for achieving clean audits, because all provinces must get clean audits. But you have nothing to say about that? [Interjections.] You have nothing to say about that. [Interjections.] I am going to implore you [Interjections.] – I am going to implore you to go to your offices and, or go to the library and read these two books; read these books. The AG does not hold political office and has no intention ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But he is appointed [Indistinct.].

Mr M MNQASELA: ... the AG reports on facts ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that why the AG [Indistinct.].

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and you must read facts. [Interjections.] Alright.  
[Interjections.]

Now point number one, [Interjections.] in ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... every bi-election ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please – order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we have made ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, address the Chair please. Maybe it will assist with the calmness in the House. You may continue, but speak through the Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Every bi-election the Democratic Alliance, without fail, has been reaffirmed [Interjections.], re consolidated as the [Interjections.]

only political party in this province where voters have confidence. [Interjections.] And I can tell you now, I heard hon member Christians [Interjections.] saying all sorts of things about the Democratic Alliance. He is serving there as the chair of the Committee at our behest. [Interjections.] Because we believe that in fact it is good to have a multiplicity of ideas and ensure that there is a festival of ideas when we deal with Parliamentary matters [Interjections.], and it cannot be correct when you have got a political party – by the way this hon member, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, who came here and said those who have, who are from the LGBDI communities do not belong in our communities.

That is the kind of political party we can go to voters and tell, “Do not vote for the people who hate you; do not vote for people who want to divide our communities.” [Interjections.]

Now the City of Cape Town, Mr Deputy Speaker, was the only municipality [Interjections.] that received clean audit in 2009.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Go to the issue.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... because the mayor was Helen Zille through that multi-party government that we had. [Interjections.] And I can tell you since then when we had zero clean audits out of all other 29 municipalities, but to date in this province the majority of clean audits are under the DA [Interjections.] when the ANC fail to do so. We have done that over the past nine years. That

is the DA different [Interjections.], that is how the DA proves that where we govern, we govern well. Not this nonsense under the ANC Government.

Ms P MAKELENI: You mean black like me?

Mr M MNQASELA: Let me go further. In Limpopo ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Start with the Overstrand.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... Mr Deputy Speaker – I am coming to Overstrand. [Interjections.] In Limpopo, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... more than 90% of the budget is spent on salaries. We are saying in this province that will never happen under a DA Government because we believe in spending money on the people not in our stomachs.

Ms P MAKELENI: And you are taking away from [Indistinct.].

Mr M MNQASELA: And that is what we have done, and that is what we are doing in this province.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You need Patricia de Lille.

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon member Magaxa, it will be a disservice if I do not respond to you, Sir. Out of respect. [Interjections.] This is a budget for the people; this is a budget for a good governance, a good DA story. [Interjections.] That is the budget.

An HON MEMBER: You are even towing the line.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now unemployment under your Government, hon member Magaxa, in this country, has risen [Interjections.] to almost 10 million people. More than 500,000 graduates under your Government, hon member Magaxa, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, more than 500,000 are unemployed in South Africa. Where are you taking this country? That is why next year we need a total change; we need a new dawn, a DA dawn, not this nonsense of Ramaphoria. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, under the ANC Government in this country, because we have to contrast here. We have got to put facts. [Interjections.] Hon member Magaxa made the mistake [Interjections.], chose Cuba as an example. Cuba. Let me tell you something about Cuba. Cuba has the lowest salaries in the global index [Interjections.] and Cuba pays its employees [Interjections.] just about 20 US dollars a month, a meagre salary.

An HON MEMBER: So what?

Mr M MNQASELA: And then you are saying it must be an example. You are an embarrassment as the ANC in this country, to think that you must be, you must feed yourself [Interjections.] and your big tummies; even [1.33.13] and be the only one [1.33.17] and the rest must go to bed without eating.

That is why South Africa today under the ANC Government are by the World Bank – not me, the World Bank – go and read the report [Interjections.]. It says it is the most unequal country in the world and people live with a salary of less than R992 a month. [Interjections.]

And now – no, I do not need water. [Interjections.] I have got water, thank you, mmm. [Interjections.] I do not need your water. Your water will run out.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! More than 30 million South Africans in this country under the ANC Government live below poverty line [Interjections.] at R992, and this is the problem we are having, because in this province things are moving, hey. [1.34.13] The DA difference in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Khayelitsha?

Mr M MNQASELA: And this is the ANC, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon member, just one second. Hon member Dyantyi, do you want to ask a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I just want to check if [Indistinct.] talking rubbish.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that the reason?

An HON MEMBER: Ag man, sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I did not hear what you are saying, say again?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Sierra Leone guests have just left. I am just checking if they have left because they can no longer listen to the rubbish that is being presented here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. That is frivolous point of order. Please do not waste the time of the House. Hon member, you may continue.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. No, they are leaving because they can sense that [Interjections.] there is nothing there next to you.

They want to sit this side. [Interjections.] They want to sit this side. They cannot sit next to an embarrassment there.

31% of the municipalities, Mr Deputy Speaker, that is 66 municipalities in this country under the ANC are bankrupt. That is the DA story that you are telling, [Interjections.] because where we are government it is clean [Interjections.], where the ANC is in government it is dirty; it smells [1.35.21]. [Interjections.] It is bankrupt.

Irregular expenditure has risen from R16 billion [Interjections.] to R28 billion, that is 75% increase since last year under this ANC, and [1.35.39], it is smelling. [1.35.42]. And it takes more than 90 days to pay service providers. More than 90 days. That is the ANC story.

In the DA province it takes less than 30 days to pay suppliers. That is the DA story. A story that we are bringing in the rest of the country [Interjections.] in this whole South Africa ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we are bringing that story.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, just take your seat. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I ask, can you ask the hon member if he will take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr M MNQASELA: When I am done, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no ... (intervention)

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You are scared.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... for the moment. You may continue.  
[Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it will be a disservice if I do not respond to hon member Beerwinkel. I respect, I love her so much.  
[Interjections.] She is saying here – and you could see she tried, you know, she tried to engage us; raising some pertinent issues, but you could see she is under extreme pressure, because she is not getting her job back.

An HON MEMBER: Are you aware your time is up?

Mr M MNQASELA: And because we would like to welcome her, but it is difficult [Interjections.] because the ANC is not bringing her back to Parliament. In fact the ANC has not taken seriously diversity in South Africa.

Social cohesion has meant nothing for the ANC. They do not see South Africans as a whole.

In Overstrand, hon member Dugmore, there is a not single councillor of a different race, except [1.37.12] [Interjections.]. Only black councillors in Overstrand; nobody else.

So, hon member Beerwinkel, there is no future for you there. There is no future, because all those sitting with you, they do not see you as being part of them; even hon member Dugmore, it is tough, because the [Interjections.] ANC Conference that is coming [1.37.33]. You are not going to get it. [1.37.36] Will get it.

So those are the problems that you are dealing with, but I can tell you this budget is bringing hope, this budget is bringing the sense of ownership [Interjections.], and the sense of responsibility and people are realising that under the DA ... (intervention)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... only the DA will save South Africa. [1.37.59]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired. [Applause] [Interjections.] Order. The hon Minister of Finance to respond. [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: From one [Indistinct.] to another. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please come to order. The Minister wants to start his reply. [Interjections.] Hon member Makeleni, I am also referring to you. Minister Meyer, you may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just say something better now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you for the colleagues who took part in this debate. I want to reply to hon member the Leader of the Official Opposition.

I noted that when you spoke [Interjections.] – sorry, the acting Leader, I noted that the Minister of Health laughed when he referred to those doctors of Cuba. [Interjections.] And I am particularly ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am not surprised, Dr Nomafrench [Indistinct.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... because that project has been cancelled. It shows that the hon Leader of the Official Opposition does not work with the latest facts when he debates in this House.

But hon member ...

An HON MEMBER: Bad researching.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Their research capacity is nowhere, [Interjections.] but the hon member is the only member in this House that is a member of the Communist Party.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So what is your problem?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And the problem is this ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is your problem [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is the problem ... (intervention)

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the problem?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... it is the second Secretary-General [Interjections.] Mr Solly ... (intervention)

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is your problem?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... Mapaila ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please, please, please. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay, the Secretary-General, your friends in the [Interjections.], your senior leadership [Interjections.] in the SA Communist Party replied [Interjections.] recently when he heard that President Zuma wants to campaign in the election, the SACP, his party, said they will refuse to campaign for the ANC.

So this is one hon member that is not going to campaign for the ANC because his party has [Interjections.] indicated they must not campaign for the ANC election. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: [Indistinct.] happened to you guys. We tolerated you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But [Interjections.] there is a serious matter. [Interjections.]

So there is going to be another party.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P MAKELENI: Gossip. Really.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So this hon acting member will not campaign [Interjections.] for the African National Congress, because his leadership has indicated when Zuma campaign they are not on the streets to campaign for

the ANC.

Mr Deputy Speaker, but there is a serious matter here [Interjections.]. There is a serious matter and I know that the Minister of Health is a [Interjections.] ... Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister [Interjections.] ... Order please! Come – order! Please come to order. I want the Minister to proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Dugmore, I know the Minister of Health is a very caring Minister, she is a compassionate Minister [Interjections.] and I know that if somebody [Interjections.] – I know that if there is a serious matter [Interjections.] that the hon Leader of the Official Opposition [Interjections.] brought to this House, I know she will investigate this matter that was raised by the hon Leader of the Official Opposition. [Interjections.]

Hon Leader of the Official Opposition ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Madikizela and hon member Magaxa, please, contain yourself. We only have one speaker at a time and I want to hear the Minister.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, but the speaker does not make sense.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Indistinct.] listen to the interjections.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... if the hon member Dyantyi say there is not sense from his leader ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, you do not make sense now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... refer to the matter that is of serious nature ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I said you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that cause his family pain and hon member Dyantyi does not regard that as a serious matter ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are making a joke.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... I want to differ with him; it is a serious matter [Interjections.] and I think the Minister ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Show us.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... of Health will take that matter up, because we are a caring government; we are a government that is compassionate when people are in pain. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Selectively.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... but there is an issue here. When I tabled the main budget I indicated a fiscal risk statement. One of those risks that I have identified during the tabling of the main budget was the issue of safety. That risk has now materialised and because the risk has materialised, both in the medium-term budget policy statement as well as in the adjustment budget, we have prioritised as this Cabinet ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Slush fund.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... we have prioritised ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We [Indistinct.] slush fund.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that we give impact in terms [Interjections.] of those risks.

So there were two main risks: the one of the drought and this Cabinet has responded R1,2 billion to the drought.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have also responded, Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] to the issue of safety in the adjustment budget, because the ANC cadres are burning the province all over the show [Interjections.]. We are not going to sit back. We are going to deal with it and we have dealt with in the adjustment budget.

So there is a risk; the risk have materialised and this Cabinet has responded to the risk [Interjections.] in terms of the budget.

So, Mr Deputy Speaker, a capable state is now responding to prioritise safety, but I also noticed [Interjections.], Mr Deputy Speaker, many of them there have not read what is in front of them. They have not read what is in front of them.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, listen to Dr Ivan.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Right in front of them is the ATC. In the ATC they have now opposed ... that ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you losing your [Indistinct].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... this Cabinet [Interjections.] – no, I am not losing anything. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come to the point.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: They ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come to the point.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And I will come to your objection. [Interjections.] You have now, we have noticed now your objection that we prioritise the safety of the citizens of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Hon member Joseph, the chair of the Standing Committee on Finance and the chair of the Budget Committee, he is correct when he say we cannot and will not allow, the voters will not allow the ANC to touch the taxpayers' or the public money because we have seen what has happened in the rest of the country. [Interjections.]

The hon member the Minister of Community Safety [Interjections.] has a clear vision ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the first responsibility [Interjections.] of a State is to provide for the safety of its citizens.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which you could not internalise.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And so, my hon Cabinet colleague, the Minister Winde, has outlined a clear vision to make the Western Cape the safest place on the African continent. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, my Cabinet colleague, Minister Bredell, he is also right, because the Western Cape is on record, as he pointed out, the best run government in terms of the basic service delivery indicators.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Daai is net 'n nagmerrie daai.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Bredell also outlined clearly, supported with evidence, that the Western Cape is doing the most for the poor in South Africa.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Agb Minister Bredell het ook aangedui hoe die ANC regerings die Staatskas leeg steel. My colleagues argued rightfully that this is the only government in South Africa that does not steal

[Interjections.] Everywhere the ANC touches institutions, public funds are looted. The ANC leadership in this debate [Interjections.], the ANC leadership gave the ANC a licence to loot. [Interjections.]

I think Minister Bredell is right. There is a crisis in the ANC. [Interjections.] When you bring back a former discredited premier, former ambassador to the United States ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hy maak julle seer!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and you recycle him in [Indistinct.] politic, there is something missing in your space [Interjections.] because you are – there is a motion of no confidence ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Dis seer!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... in the leadership of the ANC in the Western Cape, that is why the recycling is taking place. We know what Rasool is up to; we know how he is going to recycle Dyantyi out of this House. [Interjections.] This is the plan of Rasool to recycle Dyantyi out into the NCOP. [Interjections.]

And so [Interjections.] we have intercepted the intelligence from Rasool that he needs to go to the NCOP, but I think, Mr Deputy Speaker, Minister Bredell [Interjections.] is right when he speak about Thuma Mina, because

Thuma Mina is translated in Afrikaans in die platteland “Toemaar steel meer”. That is what it is translated to [Interjections.] in the platteland.

[Indistinct.] that the Western Cape [Interjections.] the Western Cape is not up for grabs. [Interjections.] The ANC is a non-starter, I agree.

[Indistinct.] shows that the protest are more linked [Interjections.] to the non-delivery of ANC National Government departments in the Western Cape. The coastal economy is a National Government competency. They fail to do that ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, you do say that now?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and many of these things in that space.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thought it is a DA competency.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This government is delivering a new, Mr Deputy Speaker, they cannot complain about the track record of this government ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, really?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... because they have approved in this House the annual report which states the delivery record of this government.

So they have approved the annual report in this House [Interjections.], the delivery record of this government. When this House approved the annual report, you gave a blessing to say, “This is indeed the best government in South Africa.” [Interjections.]

You have approved our excellent service delivery record when the House approved the various annual reports. That is a free workshop for you.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I see in the report [Interjections.] that the ANC – right in front of us here now ... (intervention)

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Jou laaste punt? Jou laaste punt?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... in the documents, this ANC has now rejected the following: they have rejected ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The DA.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the proposal that we invest R30 billion infrastructure investment. They have rejected proposals [Interjections.] to build new schools. [Interjections.] They have now rejected the building of new clinics and hospitals and ambulance [Interjections.] and EMS. They have now rejected, in the documentation in front of them, the fiscal framework, they have rejected a R2 billion investment in Tygerberg Hospital. That is

what they have rejected. They have not read the minutes. I have seen the minutes; it is right in front of them.

They have also rejected here, when you reject this fiscal framework you reject the injection into the economy in Atlantis. They have rejected the investment in the IDZ; they have rejected a R9 billion investment.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, while they rejected this investment in Atlantis, the President ... (intervention)

Mr C M DUGMORE: We will be there next week [Indistinct.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... their President is coming next week ...  
[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And we will be with him.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But you rejected it and you come to the President. You have rejected it; read the documents in front of you, the ATC.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We will be there with the President.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You rejected the Atlantis SEZ  
[Interjections.], now you want to be seen.

Mr P UYS: You rejected the [Indistinct.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But I will tell the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... President [Indistinct.] that you, the ANC, [Interjections.] have rejected it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell the President about the rubbish [Indistinct.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The budget ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Confused.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: They have rejected. We gave millions for the drought, for agriculture and for education. They have now rejected this money ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: That is national money.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... they voted ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: It is the taxpayers' money.

An HON MEMBER: It is the taxpayers' money.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... against [Interjections.] hon member Minister Fritz, we note that they have now voted against a R2,3 billion to help the poor. We note that in the case of Transport and Public Works the ANC voted now against R7,7 billion. We note that they have voted against a R23 billion in health. We note that you have voted against a R22 billion in Education. We note that you have just voted against informal settlement upgrade of [Interjections.] R2,4 billion. You have now voted against R3,5 billion for road infrastructure maintenance.

So, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... we have now seen ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have no story.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... what has happened in this House. They voted against our plans to support the youth. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: They have voted against us creating jobs.

[Interjections.] The ANC has voted against good plans of this government. You voted against the creation of jobs; you voted against investment in infrastructure. The ANC voted against creating safety; you voted against investment in the youth. [Interjections.] But the point of hon member Mngqasela is absolutely right.

The AG confirmed that the Western Cape received the best audit outcomes.

Mr P UYS: [Indistinct.] you take the AG to court.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And so hon member Mngqasela point out that the ANC only spend money on their stomachs, but I am concerned [Interjections.] that the hon member of the official opposition ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But your stomach is bigger than mine.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... use Cuba and Venezuela as examples. We have met members of parliament of Cuba; they came to South Africa. They told us what happen in Venezuela. In Venezuela in 2000, or rather in 1999 they changed the Constitution. In 2011 they amended the legislation to expropriate land without compensation. What subsequently happened, Mr Deputy Speaker, the politicians in Venezuela they got land. There was food, the food security were compromised [Interjections.]. They had to import more food. Food riots happened. People were told, "Plant vegetables on your roof

and on your balcony, on your stoep.” There was a crisis in Venezuela.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, when there was food riots, it, there was compromise as a result of the food distribution network, and the Venezuela Government brought in the army to assist with the food distribution. The economy collapsed and inflation has went through the roof.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in this debate there is only two things that has happened here. There is the packaging of two different political philosophies, and that political philosophies and that political philosophies can be captured in one, where they loot, has a licence to loot. That is the first philosophy. [Interjections.] But there is a second philosophy, and this debate is about this licence to loot and the second debate was about building a capable State.

This part of the House is building a capable State; that side of the House has a licence to loot. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order, please pay attention. Order! [Interjections.] That concludes the debate on the – hon member Makeleni ... [Interjections.] That concludes the debate on the consideration of the principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the principle? There is an objection. Are you asking for a division or simply recording? The ANC, the Opposition dissent will be recorded.

The Secretary will read the Bill.

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The SECRETARY: Consideration of principle of Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will deal with the separate votes from tomorrow onwards, the following two days. May I just at this point remind members that the scope of the debate on the votes will be limited to the adjustments in the blue book? The – either the new amounts given to the various programmes or the moving, shifting of [Indistinct.] in the votes.

So if hon members – members must be aware not to build their whole speech on comparisons with other provinces; that is an order to a point, but the substance of the speech must be limited to the contents of the blue book.

The Secretary will read the second order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That side.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 34 – 2018] (NCOP) Ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The House received the report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to not support the Bill. That mandate has been sent to the NCOP.

I will now give opportunities to parties that want to make a declaration of the vote. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is an honour for me to support this DoRA sent to this province to do what they purport to be their work, but I would like them also to tell the National Government how they now have voted against the very money that has been given to them about what they stand and boast in front of us now. [Interjections.] Exactly the same thing you have just told us now. You rubbish. Everything has just been sent back to you. We support, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Tell the President, take all your speeches to the President; tell him how you have rubbished them, but you accept their DoRA money and now vote against it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP I see the DA. The DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: [Indistinct.] must object.

Mr D JOSEPH: The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape reject the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [Interjections.] as the legislation calls for a province, provinces to tighten their belts in the face of severe budget cuts while National Government [Interjections.] continues to waste billions of public funds [Interjections.] on costly bail-out schemes instead of addressing the gross mismanagement of the National Fiscus.

The Western Cape is the only province in South Africa which has complied with National Government calls to be financially prudent in the face of year-on-year of stagnant economic growth for which the ANC at National Government is solely responsible.

As it stands the National Fiscal deficit has seen a R22 billion [Interjections.] increase in the 2018 / 19 financial year; increasing to R33 billion in the

19 / 20 financial year, and R41 billion in the 20 / 21 financial year.

Police resources to continue to be cut in the Western Cape while crime is on the rise and 30 municipalities in the province are struggling to provide basic services due to limited resources and the ratio of the conditional grants which remains unchanged. And I just need to say to the ANC members, hon members on the other side: the call for the specialised units is a call that the DA has made for many years, and National Government is only responding now. [Interjections.] That is true.

Furthermore during the medium-term budget policy statement this year [Interjections.] there were no clear strategies to improve oversight on underperforming State-owned entities, enterprises and municipalities.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Indistinct.] You are running away from oversight.

Mr D JOSEPH: The existing turn-around strategies for National State-owned Government enterprises has failed dismally, with South African Airways and Eskom receiving R5 billion bail-out each year.

It is inconceivable that the ANC can spend public funds so recklessly and drive economies, the country's economy into the ground only to instruct the provinces to spend more wisely. [Interjections.]

The 1% VAT increase earlier this year is because of ANC corruption, nothing

else. The Western Cape is expected to sustain the best quality government in the country in the face of severe budget cuts [Interjections.]. While our province is placed under further strain by the migration of residence from neighbouring provinces that seeks a better service delivery and a better life for all.

Each year more than 20,000 learners come from other provinces to seek a better education in the Western Cape. Our province has not budgeted for this increase [Interjections.] and yet we manage to go beyond ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... service delivery to accommodate these learners with their families. [Interjections.]

Furthermore the equitable share is not aligned to the estimated 600,000 population growth in the Western Cape since 2011. We cannot continue to be expected to serve the growing population while National Government continues to cut out budget allocation and expect us to adjust our spending. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, we do however note and welcome the much needed additional revenue for drought relief and fire disasters and [Interjections.] as our province grapples with the effects of climate change [Interjections.] and our natural resources.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D JOSEPH: The DA in the Western Cape [Interjections.] rejects the DoRA and shifts the responsibility to effectively management the National Fiscus onto the ailing provincial budgets. We will not allow the ANC to bulldoze through legislation [Interjections.] which erodes financial accountability at national level.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member, your time has expired.

Mr D JOSEPH: And does not adequately ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just finish off.

Mr D JOSEPH: ... allocate funds to the provinces. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I sense there are objections to the ratification of this. The objection of the ANC be recorded.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Indistinct.] just on a point of order. Mr Deputy Speaker, I listened to hon member Joseph, but could he just clarify whether the DA supports this or not, because from what he said it was not actually clear. Are they actually against the DoRA or they are in favour?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: They will have an opportunity now to say.

[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: My first sentence said I [Indistinct].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to the ratification; the ANC's objection will be recorded.

An HON MEMBER: That is the line we wanted to hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move to the next one. The Secretary will read the third order. [Interjections.]

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill [B 23D – 2015] (NCOP), ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. [Interjections.] This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will again allow opportunity for declaration of vote.

Is there somebody from the ANC? Not? Then the DA?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Standing Committee resolved not to support the Bill.

An HON MEMBER: Not to support?

Mr M MNQASELA: And the issue here [Interjections.] is really on the basis of fairness. On the basis of equality. [Interjections.] And on the basis of justice. [Interjections.] We are an organisation – and this Parliament, by the way, Mr Deputy Speaker, is premised and built on the foundations of democracy ... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What?

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that recognises [Interjections.] justice as the pillar of that democracy, and that recognises equality as the pillar of that democracy.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

Mr M MNQASELA: And when you look at this Bill in its current form, Section 6 and Section 7 of this Bill puts it clear that it does not recognise equality of the Khoi-San leaders [Interjections.] compared to the other traditional leaders. [Interjections.]

Now where are we going if we going to have other traditional leaders treated

so differently from others? As if others are less important [Interjections.] than others. Because this is the reincarnation of the apartheid's style of doing things in this country, and we cannot accept it and certainly not this Parliament. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, are you – why are you raising now? [Interjections.] On?

An HON MEMBER: For the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have asked whether the ANC had somebody, and nobody stood up. [Interjections.] I will allow you, but this is not in terms of the normal order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The normal order is the ANC first and then the governing party last.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Indistinct.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay. Let us hear what the ANC says. The ANC supports the Bill which is aimed at making provision for the recognition of the Khoi

and the San traditional leadership.

The Bill also aims to address the current limitations of existing legislation pertaining to the sections of the National House of Traditional Leaders Act of 2009; the Local Government Municipal Structures Act of 1998; the Remuneration of Public Office Act of 1998; and the Independent Commissioner for the Remuneration of Public Officers Bearers Act of 1997.

The ANC encourage the leadership of the Khoi and San communities to actively participate in the traditional government structures of the State. The ANC supports the plight of the Khoi and the San. We recognise the contribution of the Khoi and the San people in the Western Cape and South Africa. [Interjections.].

The ANC commits [Interjections.] to further support the heritage declaration request of the Khoi and the San on land which has significant cultural and heritage value for them. The ANC will never pursue the gentrification of sacred land of the Khoi and the San, unlike what the DA is doing at Liesbeek Two Rivers Urban Park at the River Club.

Strong Khoi and San leadership structures are required to resist the so-called mixed development on sacred land, and where ancestors of the Khoi and the San lived, people lived for hundreds of years. We support the Bill. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I then put [Interjections.] – order! I put the question: are there any objections to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. The ANC dissent will be recorded.

That then brings us to the conclusion of the [Interjections] business for the day. The House – before the House adjourns, let me remind hon members the House starts at 10 o'clock tomorrow morning and the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:19.