

---

THURSDAY, 29 JUNE 2017

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated. I want to see the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the subject for discussion. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to agree to that one? We will then

proceed with the subject for discussion in the name of the hon member Beverley Schäfer. I see the hon member Schäfer.

**(SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION)**

The Provincial state of disaster as a result of the magnitude and severity of drought affecting the Western Cape.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. This a story that began in 2015, an impact on 34 million people back then and a subsequent million cattle lost. Lowest recorded rainfall between October 2015 and January 2016 with the hottest temperatures recorded in the past ten years. It is a story with an impact on almost 1600 settlements in the Western Cape just 12 months ago and it is a tragic story resulting in the devastation of thousands of hectares of land ravishing people's homes and leading to the subsequent loss of 11 lives a few weeks ago.

This last 24 months of really dry conditions in the Western Cape and adverse weather patterns we have experienced, exasperated the intensity and extent of fires along the Southern Cape, but while there is a definite impact of climate change and a much drier province on the one hand, on the other there is another side to the story that must be told here.

Over the past few weeks the ANC in the Western Cape has made a cheap attempt at peddling a campaign blaming the DA for the current drought and

subsequent disaster status of the province. Articles which seek to besmirch the DA's name and reputation have repeatedly made the headlines, many of which can be found unsurprisingly in publications we already know to be pro-ANC.

The central narrative in each story is the same: the drought crisis is DA's biggest failure in the Western Cape and while I find it fascinating it is the greatest misunderstanding of provincial mandate... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...when it comes to water provision and scarcity [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member, just one second. Hon member Olivier, you are interfering with the member speaking.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Contrary to what the ANC might believe or know to be true is that the Western Cape has tirelessly lobbied for the need for greater water provision infrastructure prior to 2009. Indeed we have long been aware of the projected population growth in this province and the subsequent need for natural resources to sustain it. One only needs to track the performance record of the Department of Water and Sanitation over the past two decades to understand why we currently find ourselves in a crisis.

An article by journalist Willem Steenkamp published in January 2005 details a 10-year delay in water infrastructure projects, which was supposed to be implemented between 1995 and 1996. The then Water Affairs Minister under the pressure of a lobby organisation called the Anti-Dam Lobby, deliberately put on hold the much needed construction of the Skuifraam and Berg River Dams in the Western Cape. The Berg River Dam was subsequently only completed and opened in 2009, more than 10 years after the project was proposed, but national incompetence when it comes to water affairs is by no means a new anomaly. [Interjections.]

After months of pleas from the City of Cape Town the regional head of Water and Sanitation in the Province, Mr Rashid Khan, stated in February this year that it was still too early to declare Cape Town an emergency disaster area. This has been his response in the face of a drastic shortage of water and subsequent calls for intervention since 2015. It was in this House a year ago when we criticised the dismal response of the ANC MPs and National Government in dealing with the agricultural drought and the plea to declare three drought disaster areas in the Western Cape.

What has changed? It seems that the Department of Water and Sanitation is seemingly setting the province up for failure through the pitiful provincial budget the Western Cape receives from this Department. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Oh shame!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: The latest national budget for the Department of Water and Sanitation is some R16 billion of which the Western Cape - the country's fourth most populated province and home to its second-largest city - receives a measly R400 million. That means that the Western Cape receives a dismal 2.5% of the National Department's annual budget, a slap in the face to the more than six million South Africans who call the Western Cape their home.

This is a department that paid a close friend of President Jacob Zuma, Philani Mavundla, an R81 million advance on a R1 billion tender by an entity of the Department. This is a department that overspent by R110 million and accumulated bills totalling R1.5 billion. This is a department that is now bankrupt and spends almost 44% of its budget servicing the debt of its various unfinished water projects in South Africa. It comes as no surprise that the severely mismanaged department has failed the Western Cape and our water needs.

Just yesterday, Water and Sanitation Minister Mokonyane has dissolved the Overberg Water Board's leadership following a forensic investigation to investigate allegations of possible financial irregularities by its Board members. Dam capacity and aging infrastructure has not been adequately addressed since 1994 and is taking on a toll not only on the future of economic growth of this province, but of South Africa at large. Water security must remain front and centre for all of Government, but the story continues elsewhere between the National Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and the Department of Rural Development and Land

Reform.

Preliminary findings by AgriSA reveal that DAFF has allocated R212 million for drought relief measures but only spent R146 million. As stated in the President's SONA, commercial farmers have said that of the R2.5 billion allocated to drought relief, no one had seen any of it. Where is the money, we ask?

Farmers around the country have stated that much more money was allocated to inexperienced distribution companies, overpriced feed and boreholes. Mr Deputy Speaker, this stinks of tender corruption and fraud. The tragedy of drought was a slaughtering of breeding cattle that took decades to build up; farmers going bankrupt and Agri workers being without work.

As the DA we understand with the advent of global warming and the subsequent shifting of climatic patterns, drought is inevitable. Rainfall across the country has changed and traditional predictions have not been as reliable as usual. [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: That sounds better.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: We could not adequately predict the drought in the Western Cape but every effort that the Western Cape has made to combat it at its earliest convenience has been thwarted by the National Government. We could have begun effective drought relief almost a year ago, had National

Government heeded our calls and delivered on their mandate when they governed in this province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. One would have hoped that the purpose of this debate was to connect the dots so as to determine how we got to this water crisis and then help one another to come up with possible solutions... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: ...instead of being complacent.

Ms T M DIJANA: ...to avert the calamities thereof.

An HON MEMBER: Lead!

Ms T M DIJANA: But I was wrong to think like that. The reality has dawned on me that this DA led administration pretends never to be wrong and that anything bad happening here is somehow a consequence of National Government. While we are busy here playing to the gallery the distressed families across the province are looking at us hoping for a way forward.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms T M DIJANA: The water crisis is real and it has placed people's lives and livelihood at risk. This is not a subject matter to play politics with. Clearly there is no time for political grandstanding. Let us work to find amicable solutions and save lives.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly! That is what you should do.

Ms T M DIJANA: In 1994 the ANC and its alliance partners came up with a policy framework known as the Reconstruction and Development Programme. Chapter 2 of the document addressed the importance of meeting the basic needs. It claims that water as a natural resource should be made available in a sustainable manner to all South Africans. The document continues to emphasise the fact that the fundamental principle of our water resources policy is the right to access clean water, water security for all. The RDP recognises the economic value of water and the environment and advocates an economical, environmental and political sustainable approach to the management of our water resources, and the collection... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Tell them.

Ms T M DIJANA: ...treatment and disposal of water. I am deeply hurt, disappointed and very angry at the way the DA mismanaged the situation. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms T M DIJANA: The central argument is that this is a manufactured crisis for this greedy Government to cash in on the drought through emergency procurement measures and other underhand dealings. I also firmly believe that it was exacerbated by this Government's segregationist mentality...  
[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms T M DIJANA: ...while the drought and water shortages affected everyone.  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is by design.

Ms T M DIJANA: The focus of interventions was wholly on the challenges of white farmers, ignoring the rest of the populace. As much as it is true that the less the normal rainfall over the years partly as a result of climate cycle changes, is to blame for this crisis, but I want us to pay attention to the role the Provincial Government played to aggravate the crisis. As a point of departure, I want to point out that warning signs have been there as early as 2015 when rainfall was below winter average, leading to a dropping in dam levels. When many was starting to panic the members on that side urged us not to panic about the issue of water in the province.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms T M DIJANA: Professor Kevin Winter suggests that there are three major contributory factors to our water crisis. They are population growing faster than storage, possibly high consumption preceding the current drought and changes due to human-caused global warming. For every reasoning person it is easy to see that the Provincial Government could have acted sooner to avert the crisis. It becomes more concerning to find that Professor Mike Muller suggested in 2007 that the City should implement the Table Mountain group of aquifers or an augmentation of supply into the Voëlvlei Dam from the Berg River. [Interjections.]

Some of these plans include drilling into aquifers, including the Table Mountain aquifer, recycling water as well as the installation of desalination plants. The DA-led Provincial Government and their Mayor have been found wanting to such an extent that they resort to lying and misleading the country about their efforts. [Interjections.]

They claim that part of their so called emergency water schemes include a small-scale desalination package plant located along Cape Town's north-western coastline with a yield of approximately two million litres per day. This is an untruth. This project was championed by Eskom at Koeberg Power Plant and not the DA-led Government.

Locally and provincially they have nothing to show for four years under them

singing, save water and hope for miracle rains. [Interjections.] This DA-led Government in the province has put every citizen's rights... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell them!

Ms T M DIJANA: ...to health, food and sanitation at risk. They have failed for years to act upon the decline of our dam levels. The Constitution of South Africa in its Bill of Rights, Section 27 provides that everyone has the right to have access to water and that reasonable measures must be taken to realise these rights. Their recklessness will be a basis for pursuing a negligence claim against this administration. They fail to meet the basic standard of a reasonable person who could have foreseen this crisis and should have prevented it. They claim to be brand "good governance", yet their conduct amounts to no care, skill or diligence which is required from an elected government.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja, ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.]

Ms T M DIJANA: R350 million will be spent on drilling in the city and province's groundwater at an unsustainable rate, which will lead us back to 2010 in Beaufort West with empty dams and no rainfall to replenish the [Inaudible.] No wonder Premier Helen Zille waited for four years to implement the disaster state notice so they do not have to answer questions of fruitless expenditure and environmental damage. [Interjections.]

Here the DA-led Government has shown their lack of planning. When they were warned seven years prior to the 2010 Beaufort West water crisis, when dams supplying that town went completely dry, there have been scientists that have argued the validity of extracting groundwater citing that it was completely unsustainable. Their findings were not able to convince others that these aquifers do not get replenished at equal rates as they are sucked dry.

In conclusion, the City of Cape Town warned residents on Monday that even tougher curbs are on the way, level 4B restrictions would reduce the City's collective water-use target to 500 million litres a day, even though residents have not yet achieved the present 600 million litre objective. Dam storage levels rose by 1.3 percentage points to 24.5% in the past week, but consumption average 630 million litres a day. The City has done nothing to force residents to use less water. It is becoming unrealistic to do nothing other than ban people from using water. [Interjections.] I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you member. Hon member Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Just agree with us [Inaudible.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, more than 20 years ago in 1995, 1996, the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry starting researching and

analysing the future needs of water resources in the Cape region and a comprehensive evaluation of options was undertaken followed by extensive environmental and social impact studies in 1996 and 1997.

The City of Cape Town was warned repeatedly and clearly has known since 1998, almost 20 years ago, about the reality of changing rainfall patterns, the growing risk of extreme weather events and floods like floods and droughts and the impact the growing population... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Tell them!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...would have on our scarce water resources. In 1998 the former CMC, the Cape Metropolitan Council appointed a manager to oversee the water demand management. In the same year the CMC developed and adopted a water demand management strategy and policy. Mr Deputy Speaker, the CMC also appointed a consortium to carry out, in 1999, an Integrated Water Resource Planning Study, which was published in 2001.

The study's recommendations were firstly leakage repair. The City is still struggling to meet the customer requests when it comes to leak repairs. [Interjections.] Some take days, some take weeks, and in Mitchells Plain one resident tells us that they waited for seven months recently for a leakage repair. They spoke about the promotion of private boreholes, the introduction of water efficient fittings and also the promotion of grey water usage. Mr Deputy Speaker, the City, if it implemented these recommendations

properly, if they have put a budget to it, we would not have been in this crisis. I thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you. Minister Bredell.

An HON MEMBER: Hey, why do you not clap for him?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, Madam Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature, ladies and gentlemen, thank you for the opportunity.

I would like to start by thanking once again the disaster relief workers in particular and everyone else in general, for their roles in tackling the worst natural disaster in South Africa's history. This was not perhaps the worst disaster in terms of monitoring damage estimates, but the number of people evacuated safely and the scale of resource mobilisation are unprecedented. The fact that we were able to limit fatalities and damage particularly with regards to the Knysna fires was only due to the incredible efforts by people and entities involved.

Tragically, 12 lives were lost. 12 people lost their lives as a result of this disaster, five people in the Cape Metro area and seven in the Knysna area

including one fire-fighter. I would like to add my condolences to those already expressed to their families and friends and colleagues.

†Ons is baie dankbaar om te kan sê dat die situasie in Knysna en elders nou onder beheer is en ons is nou in die proses om Knysna en die groter Eden-distrik te herbou. Van 7 tot 16 Julie is die Knysna Oesterfees en ek wil ieder en elk aanmoedig om die Knysna Oesterfees te ondersteun. Die ekonomie moet herstel en mense moet terugkeer werk toe en toerisme is so 'n belangrike deel van daardie opbouproses.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[We are grateful to say that the situation in Knysna and elsewhere is now under control and we are now in the process of rebuilding Knysna and the greater Eden District. From 7 to 16 July the Knysna Oyster Festival will be held and I want to encourage one and all to support the Knysna Oyster Festival. The economy has to recover and people have to return to work and tourism is such an important part of that rebuilding process.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a shame that the hon member Dijana comes here with a political speech on an issue like water and drought, and comes here ...[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Really!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, and comes here with no solutions.

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: She touched on - you touched on population growth. What is your solution to population growth? What is your solution to population growth? [Interjections.] Do you want to put up borders? [Interjection.]

Ms T M DIJANA: [Inaudible.] You cannot ask me... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Does the ANC want to put up borders? [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: You cannot ask me.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...or can we ask, Mr Deputy Speaker, that the reason why we have a population growth and the expected population growth... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...of nearly two million people in the next 15 to 20 years is maybe because the Western Cape is being governed so well. [Interjections.]

It is maybe because if you look at results like the Auditor-General's report and you look at the results that 80% of the municipalities in this province received a clean audit of 80% ... [Interjections.] Second to us is KZN with 18%... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Third is Eastern Cape with 16%. It is no wonder the people flock to the Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] But we will be ready for them; we will, through good governance, secure the resource. We will, through good governance, protect the rights of the poorest of the poor. [Interjections.]

†Agb Adjunkspeaker, tans is die dam-vlakke op 23% wat skrikwekkend is. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Deputy Speaker, dam levels are currently at 23%, which is frightening. [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: As ons nie die damvlakke teen 75% vol kry teen Oktober nie gaan ons ernstige probleme hê in die somermaande. Ons weet dit deur goeie beplanning... [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: If we do not get our dam levels up to 75% by October, we are going to have serious problems during the summer months. We know that through good planning... [Interjections.]]

Ms P MAKELENI: No water... [Inaudible.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons weet dit deur 'n goeie rampbestuursisteen en daarom sal ons beplan daarvoor. Die provinsie is steeds 'n rampsgebied wat betref die droogte en ons werk hard met alle rolspelers om oplossings op die langtermyn sowel as korttermyn te bewerkstellig. Intussen, Adjunkspeaker, is ons nou in ons winterreënvalseisoen en ons verwag, en daar is, verwagte reënvooruitsigte. Die vraag is hoeveel, wat ons nie kan verseker nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Dit is van kardinale belang dat ons almal besef dat water spreek tot menswaardigheid en dit is krities vir ons ekonomiese groei en die ontwikkeling van enige land en enige provinsie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is my prioriteit om te kyk na die medium- en langtermyn... [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We know it takes a good disaster management system and therefore we will plan for that. The province is still a disaster area with regard to the drought and we are working hard with all role players to effect solutions in the long term as well as short term. In the meantime, Deputy Speaker, we are now in the winter rainfall season and we expect, and there are indeed, prospects of rain. The question is how much, which we cannot ensure. [Interjections.]

It is of the utmost importance that we all realise that water speaks to human dignity and it is critical for our economic growth and the development of any country and any province. [Interjections.] It is my priority to look at the medium and long term ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Order, Minister, Order!!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ...om watersekerheid in die Wes-Kaap

aan te spreek en dit sluit in ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... to address water security in the Western Cape and this includes ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, Minister, just a moment, †net 'n oomblik. [just a moment.] Hon member Dijana you have had your opportunity to speak. You cannot have a running commentary with the Minister now. Please allow the Minister to proceed with his speech. Minister, you may proceed.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie agb Adjunkspeaker. Dit is van kardinale belang dat almal beseft dat water spreek tot menswaardigheid en dat dit krities is vir ons ekonomiese groei en die ontwikkeling van ons land en ons provinsie. Dit is my prioriteit om te verseker op medium- en langtermyn dat daar genoeg water sal wees en dat die hulpbron beskerm word. Of dit beteken ontsouting of grootskaalse herwinning van afvalwater sal ons besluit wanneer ons waterbestuursplan voltooi is, maar dit is duidelik dat ons 'n nuwe era betree waar ernstige besluite geneem sal moet word. Ek wil dit ook hier duidelik stel dat watersekerheid sekere implikasies gaan hê. Een van daardie implikasies is 'n koste-implikasie. Water kan in die toekoms baie duurder raak, agb Adjunkspeaker. Dit sal ook met die Huis gedeel word soos wat die planne vasgestel en vasgemessel word.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, die realiteit is dat klimaatsverandering besig is om teen 'n vinnige pas te versnel en dit gaan oor die komende 20 jaar groot eise aan die leiers van hierdie provinsie stel. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ons gaan moet vooruitbeplan en ons sal moet dinge anders aanpak of daar is min kans dat ons vir ons mense goeie nuus sal hê.

Die Wes-Kaap is in besonder heel kwesbaar vir klimaatsverandering. Daarom sien ons die toename in rampe en brande en droogtes waarmee ons nou sit. Hierdie dinge raak ons ekonomie en sosiale ontwikkelingsprogramme negatief en ons sal al meer die storie vooruit moet loop om voorbereid te kan wees vir die toekoms.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is of the utmost importance that we all realise that water speaks to human dignity and that it is critical for our economic growth and development of any country and any province. It is my priority to ensure that in the medium and long term there will be enough water and that the resource will be protected. Whether it means desalination or large scale recycling of waste water we will decide when our water management plan has been completed, but it is clear that we are entering a new era where serious decisions will have to be made. I also want to state clearly here that water security is going to have certain

implications. One of those implications is a cost implication. Water can become much more expensive in future, Mr Deputy Speaker. As the plans are determined and laid down, it will also be shared with the House.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the reality is that climate change is increasing at a rapid rate and over the next 20 years it is going to make great demands from the leaders of this province. [Interjections.]

We will have to plan in advance and we will have to tackle things differently, or else there is little chance of us having good news for our people.

The Western Cape, in particular, is very vulnerable to climate change. Therefore we see the increase in disasters and fires and droughts that we are now faced with. These things affect our economy and social development programmes negatively and we will plan ahead more to be prepared for the future.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, some of the medium and long-term interventions to address supply in water to the Western Cape, and as also discussed in this House two weeks ago by the hon Minister Meyer, include the Berg River Voëlvlei Augmentation Scheme which will divert surplus winter water into the Voëlvlei Dam. The estimated cost of this project is R500 million. It is extremely important that early and urgent decisions are taken on the next projects to be implemented and that these are seen through to the end. This will be done in cooperation with our National Government who are the

implementing agents in these projects.

The environmental assessment for the Berg River Voëlvlei Augmentation Scheme was already approved a week ago. Western Cape Province will receive below normal rainfall. That is a fact. We need three to four years of good rainfall to return to a normal situation. That is also a fact.

[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Build dams then, build dams.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You say we must build dams, but it was your ANC Minister who said two years ago that the reason why we have water shortages is because we have too big dams. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The City of Cape Town must build... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC is divided even on water. [Interjections.] They do not know where to plan and where they want to take this country to. [Interjections.]

Scientists are not clear and they acknowledge the fact that they do not have tools to predict water and rainfall patterns exactly and that makes it very difficult for our planning. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The scientists are not clear... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is scientific consensus, Mr Deputy Speaker, that the Western Cape will become relatively drier as climate systems adjust with climate change driven by global warming.

Ms P MAKELENI: Then where is the dam?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In the Western Cape we are busy with the response, we have identified the risk areas.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I thought you were going to build next... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We determine what interventions are needed. We are busy with the costing of those interventions. We determine the funding models that need to be in place and then how to roll that out. We are also busy looking at water restrictions and how we can implement emergency restriction measures right through the province so that you do not get one municipality on a 4-level and the other one on a level 1.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that your best? [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Groundwater management, appointment of geohydrologists are already ongoing and the appointment process is being fast-tracked. Emergency measures, the EIA fast-tracking process is in place. We look at the health system, the exploration, the drilling, the equipment of water treatment on site, Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...to see to it that our health system is protected. [Interjections.] The education system determines the status, the tanks on-site currently, close to the groundwater systems and then where we need also to put boreholes so that we can project the education system. We also look at governing buildings and how we can use the water more productively within our Government buildings and also the Government Departments together put up a drought committee that will in the future manage our drought situation. [Interjections.] This was launched in January 2016, the task team, and they will focus on drought and water management.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have also done an assessment in this province; each and every municipality was assessed and what we need to put in place so that we can support them and see to it that they do not run out of water. The total cost of that project will be ± R5 billion. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You do not sound... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It was presented to the Cabinet on the 31<sup>st</sup> of May, based on the Drought Risk Register. We also completed emergency water provision planning. We have 60 000 litres of bottled water immediately available for distribution. We have also put in an application for 20 water-tankers to the Department of Water Affairs that are on standby. We have also got a borehole project which we can roll out within two weeks.

We are also busy and we have finalised the tender of geohydrologists for the drilling and managing of groundwater that is going to be crucial and then the legal framework in which we will be able to enforce drought measurements on our municipalities.

We have then also called for a Water Indaba in this province and the declaration was signed by the Premier, the Provincial Minister as well as all our Mayors across this province. Mr Deputy Speaker, the declaration was the result ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, order, your time has almost expired, Minister, you must just finish off now.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: If I just can highlight - thank you for

that Mr Deputy Speaker, the purpose of the pledge was to enhance water conservation efforts including adopting water-sensitive urban design planning principles to reduce the per capita demand in our water, reducing water leakages, recognising the need to manage groundwater wisely, diversify water supply, protecting the quality and integrity of the source, a legislative overhaul in areas where needed and driving our water innovation.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have a very competent team working on this drought and with the cooperation of the public we will survive. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, your time has expired. Hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Let us celebrate our water heroes.

The PREMIER: Yes.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, today I would like to celebrate our hero, my hero 46-year old Mthuthuzeli Zebukwane from Makhaza Khayelitsha. It is dedicated to him because this man is a living example of what it means to save water.

Section 27(1)(A) of our Constitution says “every person has the right to

access to water...” and during my recent interaction with him he said that he wants to ensure that he does his bit to ensure that he saves water and all other people have access to water. Mr Deputy Speaker, when I heard this and see how sincere he was I immediately became emotional. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Since DA cannot provide us with water.

Mr M MNQASELA: I became emotional because I could see how sincere this man is to what he is doing to save water. This man is a general worker and earns a low wage and he has over the last four years taken the initiative to save water. Allow me to inform this House of how innovative Mr Zebukwane is. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, since 2013 Mthuthuzeli and his household have been using recycled water to flush his toilet. Whenever they take a bath †bahlambela ekomini, abanashower okanye ibath. [they bath themselves in a washing basin, they do not have a shower or bath.][Interjections.] they use the water and the water they use for dishes, they throw into a tank and then manually pour the water into their ablution system to flush the waste. Not only has this led to the household savings litres of water, but it has also helped in reducing the family’s water utility bill and he said that he has been amazed at how much he has been able to save, both in the amount of water and his utility bill.

Mthuthuzeli told me that when he first heard about the possible water crisis a

few years ago he took it upon himself that it will not be that they can continue with business as usual. He then started this exercise of putting his own water-saving mechanism and this father says no person should go without water.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, tell them.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, this gentleman is my hero and an example of what can be done by each and every individual in this province. [Interjections.] One's status should not in any way determine how they should behave, neither their circumstances, nor their background and this is an epitome of what we can do working together to ensure that we are better together in delivering better services to our people.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Just take a peak there, Premier.

Mr M MNQASELA: And this further enforces, this further entrenches the culture of responsibility on the part of residents when we talk about service delivery. Section 36 of the Bill of Rights talks about limitation and the responsibility in the rights that we enjoy and that is exactly what Mr Zebukwane is doing in Makhaza.

Mr Deputy Speaker, my hero, this 46-year old man from Makhaza in Khayelitsha, not in Bishops Court, not in Table View, not in Gordons Bay, in Khayelitsha in Makhaza. He is saying and I am saying this here, he says

Government must help other people to ensure that they learn because he has only limitations. He can only do what he is doing in his home, and I am challenging this House that we go out as constituency leaders, when we go to a constituency period now and ensure that many more Zebukwanes are there and doing the same thing that Mthuthuzeli is doing. Because of this initiative and willingness I have decided hon Mr Deputy Speaker that myself, the Chairman of the Standing Committee on Local Government, I am going to invite the Standing Committee members and say let us go to Mr Zebukwane's home to see how he has come about to do this exercise and I am certain... [Interjections.] I am certain there are many more other Mthuthuzelis out there that we are not aware of. As a House we should be engaging with various communities including organisations, leaders and ordinary members in our communities and as well as ward councillors and identify who are these other Mthuthuzelis that are there who have not come to the party in this kind of an exercise. There is an opportunity here to recognise this man's efforts by helping him to automate his system which he currently manages manually. We need to identify, celebrate and in fact reward our residents for the difference they make in our water-scarce situation.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to say this, the ANC is very disappointing. They are telling us that you must implement some kind of a permitting system if you want to come to the Western Cape.

The PREMIER: Ja.

Mr M MNQASELA: They are saying that you must do that 23 years down democracy. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: We will not do that, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: We will never do that as the Democratic Alliance. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! I want the House to come to order before I see the hon member Beerwinkel.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am not impressed with that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon leader, I am talking to you as well. Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me from the outset acknowledge the member of the public that member Mngqasela has just raised now, but it is nothing new, because we all do it all the time every day.

Mr D JOSEPH: A good story to tell, a good story.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But I would also not like to go all over the show, I want to come home to things more close to us. As we are predominantly all from the Metro area and few others amongst us from outer rural areas, we are all subjected to the punitive measures put in place by the City of Cape Town because they woke up too late to a looming disaster they were warned about ten years ago and here is an article by Professor Mike Miller, “Slaapstad”, not sucked out of our thumbs:

†“Hoekom is Kaapstad eintlik sonder water? Want amptenare wou nie luister nie.”

[“Why is Cape Town actually without water? Because officials did not want to listen.”]

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That article is for your consumption. [Interjections.] and that is why it is called “Slaapstad”. [Sleep City.] In fact experts say we should rather spend our time to learn from the mistakes that were made, in fact Cape Town managed us to the brink of this disaster. While some brag about clean audits may I remind all that that does not bring us better water management.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Councillor Limberg identified high water

consumption, faulty meters and leaking taps as part of the reason for the crisis... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You do not want to fix those.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...of this ensuing water crisis that we are facing. Mr Deputy Speaker, if I did not leave here last night almost at eight p.m. after a disastrous Scopa meeting and had to leave home this morning at 05:15 to avoid adding to pollution on heavy traffic, I would have produced numerous photographs of unattended running taps, car washes that continue unabated, washing of cars with hosepipes and in some cases even watering of gardens to prove that monitoring of abuse of water usage is not happening in our informal settlements. In this very building, I have not seen any measures put in place to seriously curb unnecessary water usage in toilets and at taps. Those of us who travel regularly to our constituencies can attest to garages and shopping centres where faulty toilet systems run continuously, where hosepipes are used to wash cars and water gardens. Where is the seriousness regarding our scarce resource of dwindling water levels?

Only punitive measures are put in place for households who do not comply with Level 4 restrictions. However, no incentive for those who comply. The rich who have rolling gardens have declared that it is cheaper for them to pay the imposed fines than to eventually have to do a new landscape from scratch. When solar heating systems like solar geysers were introduced, an incentive of a percentage reduced price encouraged users to install them.

Here is another opportunity for job creation with water tank manufacturers, maybe supply complying households with a water tank as appreciation for their cooperation or encourage companies who sink boreholes to reduce the price for those who comply. It is all very well now after the horse has bolted, to sign declarations with municipalities but do they have the manpower to implement what is expected of them? How much will be appropriated to assist the furthest flung municipalities in their quest to adhere to these requirements?

There are two things that you can theorise about but never concretely confirm and that is human behaviour and God's will with nature. The R75 million hurriedly sourced from the reserve fund includes a hospital in Swartland but for the rest, most of it was for Knysna. Are there new preventative measures and infrastructure such as fire-trucks being planned for each municipality seeing as how most disaster management facilities are stationed at district level which is normally many kilometres away?

There is a huge education gap that needs to be filled to empower and enlighten people about the dangers facing us and so again a public participation opportunity presents itself in that youth can be trained to do these home visits to inform communities about the crisis but also to incentivise them by paying them a stipend for the work they do. We must remember that the poor do not necessarily read newspapers or concern themselves with environmental issues because their priorities are different. They worry about where their next meal will come from. A simple initiative

like “drop a block” which entails putting a brick into your toilet cistern, in this way reducing the quantity of water it draws back in. Another opportunity for youth to become involved in curbing the looming disaster is not being implemented as an imperative across municipalities. This, as opposed to the unhygienic suggestion of not flushing after a number one, yet, in every toilet in this building there is still a notice behind each door to ask whether you have flushed properly to keep our shared services clean, contradiction, not implemented right here under our noses!

Professor Mike Miller from Wits School says and may I just read what he said because I would never be able to say it better than him.

Mr M G E WILEY: When did he say that Carol?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Excuse me?

Mr M G E WILEY: When did he say it?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: When did he say it? The 19<sup>th</sup> of April 2017.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: “This year’s crisis has been predicted for at least a decade and they failed to act.” [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shame Chief Whip of the leading party!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He also says: “Ten years ago the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry published a reconciliation study to show how Cape Town could get better water needed to meet rising demand...” and we have heard about the Berg River plan that was spoken about.

Twenty options were ranked in order of cost and readiness and the information is on a public website so no-one can claim ignorance. Cape Town seemed determined to live up to its laid-back reputation. Cape Town’s case highlights the need for greater public engagement with the plans discussed that are only discussed in the recesses of the Cape Town City Hall.

The challenges remain so rather engaging in medium or rather that businesses engage in water stewardship activities to pretty up its sustainability reports, business should treat water seriously and put it on its board agendas as a substantive item. The board should ask: how much water do we have? How much will we need? Who is ensuring that it will be available when we need it? If they fail to do this water crisis will appear on agendas and shareholders will hold them to account for its effect on their bottom-lines.

Let me continue. Of course there is a bigger picture, Mr Deputy Speaker, that the economy and business who cannot carry out their core function if it entails the use of copious amounts of water. This declared disaster sees no colour or political affiliation. So no blame game in that regard but where we

can lay the blame squarely is at the complacency displayed by officials over the years in spite of warnings and predictions that by 2015 alternative measures must be in place. It is this retroactive after the fact planning that has put the City of Cape Town in the mess and the rest of the province through complacency of the departments who should have insisted on spending the budgets on what the reports were telling them were imminent? Over the years there have been many meetings and reports compiled but implementation was just not prioritised and the City of Cape Town falsely believed in 2014 that their Water Demand Management Plan had been successful.

In a later report they admit that intervention should have started even before 2014 to mitigate the risk of what we are now facing. It is clear that the rainy seasons as experienced in the past have not repeated itself over the years due to climate change and global warning resulting in dams not filling up as was expected. However, human behaviour was not factored into possible outcomes, neither was the growing population, putting more pressure on scarce water resource factored in. The bottom line, Mr Deputy Speaker, the City of Cape Town and this Province were given fair warning with possible alternatives also presented. All of this fell on deaf ears and today we are all punished with the same restrictions and future generations will judge the DA and their leaderships for the lack of this basic commodity. I thank you.

[Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I see hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. My speech is this pile of paper over here, but I am going to start with these two pieces of paper over here, because I wanted to just perhaps answer one or two of the issues as raised in this debate, because of course it is a debate.

I think the first one, when the ANC stood up initially, they said: “this is not a time for politics and not a time for grandstanding...” but then went straight on to say the DA has mismanaged this situation, so you must decide whether you are coming here and making a political speech or not.

An HON MEMBER: That is a fact, that is a fact.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But that then says let us ask and let us determine what was said in that political speech. Three issues were raised, the Table Mountain Aquifer, recycling and the desalination plant.

Now first of all when we talk about the Table Mountain Aquifer in the hon Dijana’s first speech she speaks about this but then she also says but R300 million has been made available for the drilling of boreholes. We need to have a bit more research on it. It is not just about drilling of boreholes or even the deepwater aquifer. This is much more complicated than all of this.

We have learnt huge lessons on the West Coast with potato farmers that have just extracted groundwater and now that whole aquifer is full of salt water. We cannot just make these rash statements here. We have to have proper plans in place to deal with these kinds of things.

Recycling - I will deal with that just now when I get to my part of the speech and of course the desalination plant we do know that the City's got a tender going out now for a 100 megalitre plant per day and that is for 9 August.

We also know that, and you heard the hon Chairman of the Standing Committee, the hon member Schäfer, who really spoke about where water stands and whose responsibility overall these long-term water plans come from.

We then heard the second speaker of the ANC talking about the 10-year plan but overlaid in that 10-year plan is 100-year drought and of course all of these things have to come together in that partnership but I think nothing is so blatantly clear as when we hear the real numbers, the numbers of the R2.5 billion that has been made available nationally for drought. When we see the measly few million that end up first of all in this province or let alone anywhere else in the country, we hear the reports of the Department of Water and Sanitation - this is not the City or the Province, the Department of Water and Sanitation, we hear that they themselves are bankrupt. We also see the kind of money that they allocate or the kind of points that these head officials are making around whether it is necessary to actually invest these

big numbers into these dams, yes or no.

Do you know that I asked the question around the Clanwilliam Dam. That very Department, I said: “when, how long have we been waiting for these tenders to be awarded and this dam to start being built?” Guess when they are going, they are looking at the first possible chance to build this dam? Next year April. Now why does that date sound strange to you? Because that is the start of next year’s financial year, because they have already spent last year’s money and this year’s money, and where did they spend this money? So I will tell you what, I will give you one space to go and have a look at. When you are doing oversight again and you go up the West Coast, go to Lamberts Bay. There is a desalination plant that was built there three years ago. It has not produced one litre of water.

An HON MEMBER: And George.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Not one! Guess who built the desalination plant? [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Zuma’s son. [Interjections.] He got the contract to build that desalination plant. Now let us go and have some oversight up there and see what happens around building desalination plants and why the National

Department is not able to deliver on these 10-year plans, because the money has gone to other things. If we did not go to National Parliament and write letters from this Government to the National Parliament of Water Affairs the canals feeding the Voëlvlei Dam would have still been full up to the top with sand and those catchment weirs would have still been full. In actual fact they still are fairly full. They managed to clear a little bit of the catchment area in those weirs and then they ran out of money again.

This is the National Department of Water Affairs whose job it is to fill our dams. So do not come here and play politics when you know that your own Department is the biggest failure in this space. [Interjections.] So Mr Deputy Speaker, let me get to what I wanted to talk about. I have two hats here. I have got one hat... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who has the right to tender?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I have one hat... [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Daar is 'n eina daar!

[An HON MEMBER: It is hurting there!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: I have one hat - the Guptas and the Zumas have got the right to tender, yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Though they are not in the same fashion. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Ay-yay-yay! Anyway! Mr Deputy Speaker, I have two hats here. The first hat is the agricultural hat and the first declaration of disaster was in February 2016 in this province. That means the work done in 2015 led us to declare a disaster in February 2016. From that date to this date in the agricultural space where you heard about the R2.5 billion that has been available we have received a measly R12 million as a disaster recovery plan for agriculture in this province ... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: This is disgusting, absolutely shocking!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The province that produces 60% of South Africa's agricultural export, a measly R12 million! [Interjections.] And guess what, when we got allocated that money we got told by the National Department: "You cannot spend the money, we will spend it and we will put the tenders out, we will decide who gets that money and how it will be spent in your province." It had zero impact. It really was a waste of time, and so at the end of the day we have put the R96 million already... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.]  
Order! Order! Hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do understand that they are  
experiencing a provincial disaster of their own on the other side there...  
[Laughter.]

Ms P MAKELENI: But yours is worse!

Mr M G E WILEY: But I really ask that despite their drought of members  
over there... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Is that a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: ...would they please give our members a chance to state  
their case? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I take your point.

Ms P MAKELENI: Is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is a valid point of order and I agree with the  
point of order hon member Makeleni.

An HON MEMBER: There is a drought there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please refrain from making comments all the time. It is one thing to do an interjection but when it becomes running commentary it is totally different. Member, you may continue, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. We have put the R96 million already. We have budgeted the next R73 million for this financial year and spent R60 million of it so far. We are the ones that have procured in this financial year the 105 tonnes of feed already for this latest round and we are the ones that are already preparing for the other implications of drought in agriculture and that is the disease that follows.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: When you have drought, no rain etcetera, there are other implications in the system. We are the ones that are doing that. We are putting it in place. It is about management.

Ms P MAKELENI: You must do it.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is about management.

Ms P MAKELENI: You are not doing... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So then let us come to the next part which is about water management across the province so we have heard a lot of stuff to be said about the City of Cape Town and wastage of water and of course every single drop of water that gets wasted is a drop of water that should not be wasted. We need to have serious plans in place. We did a study through GreenCape, this is the document, it is called the “Market Intelligence Report 2017”. It looks at the analysis of the existing water scenario that we find ourselves in across the country and where the business opportunities lie. But when it comes to water wastage do you know that the City of Cape Town’s water wastage or the non-revenue water and the leakages sit generally between 14% and 17% which sit on a global average norm of best run cities. When you have a look at the province and at the country, of course generally across the country we are sitting at over 30% with wastage in water. When you have a look at the GIS-mapping of how water is managed across South Africa and you notice on this map there is a section that is quite green and a whole lot that is very red, that shows you the best management and the worst management. You can overlay who runs those municipalities and those towns politically, where it is green and where it is red.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In the Western Cape there is one red, Kannaland. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] One red, but Mr Deputy Speaker I urge everyone in this

House to perhaps go and have a look at this Market Intelligence Report, because it does a few things, it shows us where we are going wrong, and where we need to fix things, but more importantly it shows us...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Olivier.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: More importantly it shows us where some of the opportunities lie. At the moment in the Western Cape economy industrial water for reuse, in other words the opportunity in businesses for recycling the value is about R600 million worth of business but in potable water reuse which is in our households the opportunity is a R4.5 billion economy.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Sure.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: A R4.5 billion economy and so that is a massive opportunity for our SMME sector to really get involved in finding ways and solutions for us to reuse water. If the City is using 600 million litres or 800 million litres a day how do we reuse 400 million litres of that and those are opportunities for the SMME sector for the private sector to find solutions for us and people are prepared to spend that money.

The hon member Beerwinkel asked that businesses need to put it on their

boards. Our study in 2016 showed that 94% of companies in the province reported water has a direct risk to their operations. It is the highest in the world and it features in all of their reporting and risk management systems in those businesses, 94%.

South Africa's average annual rainfall is about half of the global average rainfall so we know already that water is a big issue and when issues about supply and demand or risk sit in systems, that is when economies can be built and just as through the Energy Game-Changer and through the work that has been done in this province around energy there is massive, massive opportunity around water for economic solutions, for innovation and ways in which we can start to create a new economy in this region. We can build businesses, SMMEs and entrepreneurs can find solutions not only for us right here in South Africa but for Africa and the world and I am pretty certain that that is going to come out of what is happening at the moment.

The latest statistic on grey-water systems, and we can measure it through the number of water tanks that are being sold, the business growth rate in the last four months has been just under 1500%, a massive growth, so that shows you the opportunity in that R4.5 billion market space which is obviously where we all need to find the best enabling environment.

And then lastly Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to say that I want to use this opportunity to thank those individuals like hon member Mnqasela who spoke about thanking those businesses that are finding the opportunities but also

those businesses and people that are doing the right thing, that are putting those buckets in their showers, that are really, really saving water wherever possible, that are putting in those grey water systems, our hotels. There is a hotel group in this City that started giving me a hard time around water and what are we doing around the messaging and you will see as you walk through the airport, it hits you in the face because they have banners and posters everywhere about “remember this is a water-scarce space.”

[Interjections.]

We are really trying to get that message out as strongly as possible but these hotels for months now have removed the plugs from their baths, you cannot bath in our hotels at the moment, you can only shower and there is a big sign in every one of those showers that is laminated that says “remember this is water-scarce space, do not waste our water.” And I want to say thank you very much to these businesses and then of course to those households across our whole province that do the right thing, that use less and less water, that are being water-wise. I want to thank every single one of them for helping us make the difference and save the water especially through winter so we can start to build as much reserve as possible for next season. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. that concludes the debate on this subject.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Interpellations. The first interpellation has been withdrawn.

## **INTERPELLATIONS**

[Interpellation 1 withdrawn.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We go to Interpellation 2 and I see again the hon Minister Winde.

### *Economy of the Western Cape*

#### *Inclusive growth and employment equity*

**1. Mr S G Tyatyam asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

What steps is he taking to make sure that the economy of the Western Cape produces and promotes inclusive growth, and specifically to ensure that employment equity in top management is achieved?

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker, and of course to the hon member Tyatyam for the question. I know that this is not the first time you have asked this question this year, but I am happy to again reply to this question for debate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: An improved answer. [Laughter.]

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: An improved answer? Yes, we hope.

First of all, from the Department of Economic Development and Tourism:

(a) To promote inclusivity, through the Project Khulisa growth strategy, we have targeted specific initiatives to grow these sectors of our economy which demand lower and mid-tier skills. In tourism, entry level skills are in great demand. In oil and gas, as well as agri-processing, low-skills, as well as semi-skills and fully-skilled jobs are required.

And of course that already speaks to the Skills Game-Changer, and the 32 500 artisanal and apprenticeship skills that we have put in place, and of course perhaps to say that we are already 7 500 jobs into that 32 500 target, and I think going really, really well.

(b) The achievement of Employment Equity is outlined in the Employment Equity Plan of the Department, and that is 1 April 2015 until 31 March 2020. The EE Plan identifies annual targets that would be incrementally achieved through this 5-year goal that is set.

I have got a very detailed answer to you in this, and I think I am going to have to give you this document when I am finished, because if I spend all my

time reading these answers, I have got four pages still to go just on this first part of the question, I am going to run out of time.

But what I do want to say is that during the 2016/17 financial year, the following results were achieved in senior management staff:

- (a) Five internal promotions, of which four were from designated groups;  
and
- (b) The appointment of two SMS members, both from designated groups.

The Department continues to strive towards a demographically representative and equitable workforce, but of course at the same time as we are doing that, it is a merit-based workforce, and you can see this in the results that this Department achieves in this province.

Then Department of Agriculture:

During 2014, the Cabinet of the Western Cape Province adopted five Provincial Strategic Goals, and of course within these goals, again Project Khulisa, three sectors, and in those sectors: agri processing, tourism and oil and gas, we then took the next step and went through a further analytical consultation process to develop interventions in these three sectors. We wanted to:

- Capture a larger share of the global Halal market;

- Increase exports in wine and brandy to China and Angola, and
- Improve local production capacity in domestic and key strategic markets.

Again, this talks to skills and intervention in skills and training. This talks to us making sure that we are intervening directly in the job space, because if we have a look at the jobs growth numbers, and if we look by 2016, 4th Quarter Labour Force Statistics South Africa, we find that there are 253 293 jobs in primary Agricultural Sector in the Western Cape, 27.1% of South Africa, and a further 135 942 in the agri-processing sector ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister ...

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and over that period, we put another 127 jobs into the economy in those two spaces in the Western Cape. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was expecting that answer, because the Minister focuses on jobs only. When we talk of inclusive growth, it does not only talk to jobs, but it also talks to how we change the economic landscape created by apartheid. How do we make sure that we share the economic space, and make sure that people become

involved in the mainstream of creating jobs themselves? Not only jobseekers, hon Minister.

Historically, the Western Cape benefited from the apartheid policies of investing more in non-African communities. Since it is a province with a minority African population, and no homeland areas at all, as a result, since the transition to democracy, it has high employment levels in terms of national standards, you know it. It is not because of the DA. You also know that in terms of the infrastructure that you mentioned about the water, the leakages, the Western Cape has always been higher than all other provinces, because of the legacy of apartheid that we were in. Not because of the DA.

The overall growth in the Western Cape has generally been slightly above the rest of South Africa, but the economy of the Western Cape continues to widen the gap between the poor and the rich, continues to widen. You have not been able to close it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And the rich whites. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The Eastern Cape and the Northern Cape are part of the Western Cape.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, no, no, no.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is the same province.

Mr S G TYATYAM: But the Government under the DA, Mr Deputy Speaker, they will howl, they will do all other things, but in the main, they are unable to deal with the issue of simply making sure that black people do create a space and participate in creating the economy. You know that, you can even mention the industries, the hotels that are being built here, just here in town.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Tsogo Sun.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ja, and then you must ask, how many ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is black owned.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, Tsogo Sun is not black owned. They have shares. How many people, black in particular, are participating in the space of the property development market?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is very few.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... your time has expired in this slot. You get another slot later on.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ai, I wanted to finish.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. You know, I think the most important thing is how do you create an enabling environment for natural inclusion of growth to happen in an economy, and I found this document – I am not quite sure why I had it. It is called:

“Enterprising Cape: Building an inclusive and vibrant economy”

It is part of the Premier’s policy brief. It was done by Future Cape, and it really specifically speaks to how the Western Cape has being advised to build this inclusive economy, and I would like to quote something. It says that:

“It is a story of how the Western Cape, by strengthening its human capital, improving its business environment, and creating conditions conducive to greater innovation and entrepreneurship, can help foster inclusive growth, while simultaneously becoming a vibrant economic hub for Africa, as it escapes the middle income trap and achieves higher income status.”

And, you know, it says what you should do here, and I would really like to speak a little bit more to this, because at the end of the day you have got to make and create an enabling environment through policy, and if you do not

create that space, you are never going to achieve what you are setting out here in this debate, and it says the potential policy targets, and let me quote. It talks about the economy, it says:

“You must look at agri-processing”

We do it.

“You must shore up the manufacturing sector.”

We are doing that, with places like the Atlantis IDZ, etcetera.

“Support the tourism sector.”

We are doing that. Education, it talks about:

“Establishing early childhood development programmes.”

We are doing that. It talks about health:

“Lowering barriers to accessing health care.”

We are on target to doing that. It says:

“In terms of the vibrant economy, lowering barriers to formalising

informal businesses.”

We are removing red tape. It talks about:

“Greater access to ICT broadband, and quality and capacity and efficiency of economic development infrastructure, like roads, rail, seaports, airports.”

We are talking to that, and in terms of governance, it talks about:

“Reducing red tape for business and undertaking reforms to increase Government effectiveness and regulatory quality.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: This is the basis of building an inclusive economy. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam?

An HON MEMBER: Well done.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. There is nothing new.

An HON MEMBER: Talk is cheap.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The doctrine of the DA is to make sure that it creates conducive - it does not want to intervene in the economy. It only creates conducive platforms ... [Interjection.] for the free market economy to flourish. That is what the DA stands for, but it does not intervene and make sure people benefit, because people who are not in your favour, people who are not actually siding with your policies in terms of making sure that they create an enabling environment for all others, because you only create an enabling environment for your industries, not ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: [Inaudible.] ... all the people, that is our policy.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Of the *bourgeois*.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ja, of the *bourgeois* of course. And the second part. When you create these industries ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You need to make sure that when you create the conducive grounds, you also need to make sure that the private sector plays their role. [Interjection.]

What the Minister has not told us here, for quite some time, is what the private sector is doing in making sure that they are part of this partnership? Because what we do not have in the Western Cape is an inclusive culture of

sharing in the economic benefits of this province.

We are still placed in the structural economic deficiencies of the past. This is what we want the Minister to talk to. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, to hon member Tyatyam - really, the point of the matter is that we cannot go around clinically creating or pushing and moulding an economy in the way that you think it is going to grow, in the way ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja, because you are incapable ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... you think you want it to grow.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Because you are incapable.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: It does not work like that. It is like putting these agri-parks ... [Interjection.] spending billions on agri-parks ... [Interjection.] creating false markets. You cannot do that. You have to create an environment ... [Interjection.] that is open and will naturally progress into transformation and inclusive economy. We know that. [Interjection.] And hon member Tyatyam ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... actually does know that. We have seen time and time again that the private sector is truly committed to economic transformation. [Interjection.] It is truly committed to inclusivity, because we know that we cannot ever go back, and we would never want to go back. We want everybody to be a part of the future of the economy of this country. That is it. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon member Tyatyam, your last opportunity.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon member Schäfer knows very well that the neo-liberal agenda of the open markets actually does create impoverishment. It does create poor communities. It does create hunger. Because the agenda of the neo-liberals and the capitalists, is to exploit.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Like the Guptas.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is to exploit and make sure that ... [Interjection.] they create the most profits out of the impoverished people. That is what the DA stands for. That is why the DA is unable to intervene in the private markets and tell them what to do. That is why the top management of almost all of

these private institutions are still lily white and males in particular. The taxpayers' money is being used by the DA to create these conducive grounds for them. [Interjection.]

Look at our textile industry, here in this province. It is gone. [Interjection.]

Ja, you do not listen, that is my problem.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Textiles? Gone.

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is the problem. It has gone down.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You are supposed to [Inaudible.] on the economy? [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: It has gone down, and the problem. [Interjections.] What we have now, through our National Minister, in Atlantis. We have never seen what our Government in the province has done to make sure that we improve the conditions of the textile industry in our ... [Interjections.] So we need to make sure ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hisense.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Hisense was Rob Davies, you know that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. The hon Minister Winde.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was actually just going to relook at what this interpellation's question was actually about, but it does not matter, we do not mind, we will not call it a new question. We will react to it.

I mean, the hon member Tyatyam stands up and he says this province – his words were, “You have got the highest unemployment levels”, and then he says, “You have got a widening gap between rich and poor.”

Now I am not going to say that we do not ... [Interjections.] have a gap between rich and poor, because we do have a gap, and it is too wide, we need to narrow it. But we have told him in this House before, the gini coefficient, he needs to go and have a look at it, because it is in this province that it is the lowest. It is actually widening where the ANC governs. [Interjection.]

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The unemployment rate, broad and narrow ... [Interjection.] the lowest in this province ... [Interjection.] and sometimes they brag about the unemployment rate in Limpopo as being the lowest in South Africa, but that is because it has got the highest number of people that have given up looking for work. [Interjections.] I do not know who runs that province but let us get back to some of these answers that talk about inclusive projects that we are

busy with. Because he says we do not intervene at all.

So what about the 303 agricultural products that we have been involved in through the CAS programme, where we allocate money through a process, which is only this province, where we use the commodity approach ... [Interjection.] and now National is saying, “We need to come and have a look at how you do it.”

What about the 104 mentors that we have put in place through the same programme? What about the 20 black fruit farmers that we have just put in place through the Jobs Fund? And of course we also produced the Jobs Fund for black-owned farms in the Eastern Cape, because their government was not able to do it.

What about the 60% target, that we set ourselves, for these farms, of the 246 agricultural black-owned farms that we measured, and we got a 62% success rate through that process, again where the National Department wants to come and see what we do.

And then the hon member comes and talks about inclusivity. He should be standing here, telling us about some of the projects that he is busy with within the ANC in other provinces, where the exclusivity is really making a big difference. Because I do not see where Gigaba creates exclusivity where he gives visas to the Guptas. I do not see where Molefe creates inclusivity, where ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... where he gives coal contracts to the Guptas. I do not see that, I see the BEE policies ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... creating big, mega, singularly owned, black companies and not inclusive in the economy. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has now expired. Order. We move on to the next interpellation. Interpellation 3. Hon Minister Bredell?

*Misconduct by municipal employees*

**3. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

How does his Department restrict or prevent municipal employees who are under investigation for misconduct from seeking employment at a different municipality?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you for the interpellation.

All appointments made by municipalities must undergo a screening process during the appointment procedures, whether it be a policy provision, or in terms of the regulations on appointment and conditions of staff, of senior management. As published in *Government Gazette* 37245 on 1 January 2014, the onus is on the current employer to disclose the details of the investigation for any charges against the official. It is then the relevant municipality's prerogative whether or not to consider such a candidate.

Currently there are no legislative provisions that allows me to prevent a senior manager's reappointment at a different municipality, on the basis that he or she has resigned before disciplinary proceedings against such individuals could be finalised at his or her previous employer.

Having said this, municipalities are required to submit a schedule once a quarter, which reflects all cases of misconduct and disciplinary cases in the respective municipalities, regardless of the outcome. This schedule is monitored by my Department, and forwarded to the National Minister to be placed on a database. All appointments, when sent to the National Minister, are verified against this list.

Compliance of section 57(a)(7) of the Systems Act: Municipalities are required to maintain a record that contains the prescribed information

regarding the disciplinary proceedings of staff members dismissed for misconduct.

As per Act Sub-section 7, municipalities are required to submit a record of the abovementioned, on a quarterly basis, to the Provincial MEC of Local Government.

In terms of Section 18(7) of the Regulations on appointment of conditions of employment of senior managers, municipalities are also required to submit a record.

Contemplating sub-section Regulation 6: Must be submitted within 14 days of such a dismissal or resignation, to the MEC of Local Government, and the Minister. It should also be noted that there are categories of misconduct and time periods that must expire before a person may be re-employed in a municipality in terms of Schedule 2 of the said Regulations.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Bredell. Hon member Mngasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I appreciate the responses and the participation by the hon Minister in this interpellation.

The challenge that we are confronted with is that the poorer the municipalities are, they are linked mainly - especially in terms of the character – to the behaviour of the administration. They are linked mainly to how the administration behaves, especially those who are charged with misconduct, and then, before they start serving, they start facing disciplinary processes, then they begin to move to other municipalities.

We have seen this in municipalities in Cederberg. We have seen it in the Greater Karoo. We have seen it in Oudtshoorn and we have seen it in Kannaland.

Those are the kind of challenges that, when you look at what has happened in those municipalities and the charges that have been levelled against those administrators. It is gross misconduct and a violation of the Municipal Systems Act, and the Municipal Finance Management Act. But when you look at whether or not you are able to act, you see the Minister is correct in saying that there is no legislation that is in place to enable him and his Department to ensure that they act against those violations.

When a councillor is found guilty by the municipality, and subsequently a recommendation is sent for the Minister to act, we have seen that the Minister has been acting. We have seen a number of ANC councillors that have been removed because they have been found to be corrupt in the province, but we have not seen municipal employees that have been found guilty being barred from seeking employment elsewhere.

Hence you see these helicopters moving from this municipality, flying to another municipality, and successfully getting employed and that is an area that is a serious concern for us as the Standing Committee. I would like this to be investigated in order to look at the legislation, hon Minister, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we can bar municipal employees from moving around, whilst facing possible disciplinary action, and in fact, that action should be taken and successful litigation should be seen, and those who have been found guilty, should be prosecuted and go to prison. Not this thing of corrupt people moving around and not going to prison ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... where thieves belong. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. †Die agb Olivier. [The hon Olivier.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I welcome the response from the MEC, confirming that there is no legislation in place that allows him, as directed by the interpellation, to restrict or prevent municipal employees under investigation for misconduct, from seeking employment at different municipalities.

We acknowledge that, and when you consult the Basic Conditions of Employment Act, there is no provision for that in the Act, and therefore it

allows an employee, who is under investigation, to apply elsewhere and leave that service before actions or disciplinary actions proceed. Obviously, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is no legislation that allows the Minister to prevent that movement of employees from one municipality to the other.

But the other side as well, which we must not lose sight of, is the fact that that employee is innocent until proven guilty, and therefore an investigation does not necessarily mean that that employee is guilty of any misconduct, and therefore you cannot prohibit such an employee, or any Minister or MEC cannot restrict or prevent that employee from moving to another municipality.

I think the issue here that needs to be investigated, is the period, or the length of the investigation. I think some of the investigations that take place take years and years to be finalised, and I think that is where maybe the MEC should investigate as to how, and his counterparts can see to it that such investigations are fast-tracked, so that if an employee is found guilty that that employee is therefore, in that manner, prohibited from ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... moving to another municipality, but obviously ... [Interjection.][Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, time of your first slot has

expired. You will get another opportunity. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The seriousness of this matter here is that when there is corruption or elements of corruption, it contributes to poverty. It further creates disinvestment into the municipal area, and it exacerbates the lack of service delivery that is the primary responsibility of municipalities, in terms of Section 152 and Section 153 of the Constitution.

Now when you hear the ANC's response, that, "No, do not touch them, do not bar them", the question is we need to agree here, as this Parliament, do we want to really deal with corruption in this country? Are we really serious about dealing with those who are flouting the rules of public office?

Mr D JOSEPH: Public money ... [Inaudible.].

Mr M MNQASELA: And we have got to really value the public purse, and in doing so, we have got to put stringent measures in place that will enforce behaviour, that will enforce the manner in which public officials are being held to account, because the public purse is the primary responsibility of Government. If you cannot manage your money, as Government, you cannot display that confidence in the public sector.

That is why you see downgrades now in this country and you are seeing all of this negativity, and the technical recession. It is because there is this

character, that we are not acting enough when we see corruption. And I am not surprised, Mr Deputy Speaker, because the ANC has failed to deal with Jacob Zuma and his shenanigans, where we found him and his cohorts being corrupt ... [Interjections.] and they come here and say he is corrupt but they do not act to show that it is seriously enough for the ANC. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the interpellation - maybe we should remind the member. His own interpellation is asking whether the MEC here, or his Department, can restrict or prevent an employee under investigation.

Now I am not sure what the ANC is supporting here. His question is whether if you are under investigation, an employee, are there any measures to prevent you from moving from this municipality to the next one. You are not found guilty, it is not saying here if you are found guilty, and I am sure the ANC would not support that issue. But what we are saying, which the MEC is confirming, there are no powers vested in him to do that.

But let us then see, because it seems that the ANC here is a problem. Let us look at Mossel Bay, where they are governing ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... where an official who was at the Liquor Authority as chief, is now currently appointed in Mossel Bay as ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member. Unfortunately your one minute has expired. That is a long story, but you just had one minute.

Mr R T OLIVIER: But, can I ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your one minute ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... just finish the line?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just quickly. I will give you another sentence.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the CFO, the same, and this is in his own municipality, where they are saying they are curbing corruption, but here, the other one is found guilty ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: The CFO has been found guilty in a court of law ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... but he is appointed as a CFO.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has now really expired.

Mr R T OLIVIER: So if they then ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... [Inaudible.] corruption, this is what needs to happen and ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... and the DA ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... is the one that must deal with corruption.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Olivier, I gave you some latitude there, but you abused that. When I say finish your sentence, I mean one sentence.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hon member you are fired. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mnqasela.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I apologise, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ja, you are fired.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, we know that in many cases where there is smoke, there is fire. [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] nice jacket.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you very much. [Laughter.] Mr Deputy Speaker, we have also seen ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talk about the CFO.

Ms P MAKELENI: And it suits you.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... how the courts have come to recognise this very issue that we are dealing with. When we go to the courts and we approach the courts we have seen that in fact, regarding those who have been flouting rules, where there is smoke, there is really serious fire. We have recently seen in Oudtshoorn, the Mayor and the officials that were working under his leadership, were found guilty in the court of law and they have been sentenced. And those are not any other Mayors. They are ANC Mayors and

they are corrupt ANC officials. Now the Minister has said here to us that there is no legislation ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are actually misleading the House.

Mr M MNQASELA: Now we need him to assist us, as this Parliament ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: This must be documented.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and find a way to legislate in this area, in order to ensure that we are able to manage these kind of matters ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] must withdraw.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... in a manner that will enhance confidence in Government.

Ms P MAKELENI: You must withdraw. You are [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: We cannot have a situation where in Kannaland – oh, please, hon member, do not do that. Through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, protect me, please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You do not make sense.

Mr M MNQASELA: I will not make sense to you because Zuma has not made sense to all of us in this country. [Laughter.] We have seen in Kannaland, we have seen in Cederberg, officials employed by the ANC, when the DA takes over, they run because we are going to start shaking, and start dealing with the investigations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: When we find them guilty ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... they are long gone ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... employed by another ANC municipality. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, your time has expired. I see hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is pity that the hon member Olivier started off by saying that you are innocent

until proven guilty, and then he quoted certain examples in Mossel Bay and, and.

Those members are willing to go through the trial, and they are busy with the process, and I think that is exactly the point of the hon Chairperson, and that is that when you enter the discipline domain, you must not be able to run away from being found guilty, and we will need to, if we want and if we are seriously clamping down on corruption, because we have seen it in so many cases ... [Interjection.] that the officials play the system. When they are guilty, they play the system until the day before the hearing, and then they resign and then they walk off. So nothing happens, and all that he is asking is that we must seriously, if we are serious about clamping down on corruption, need to look at legislation where, when you enter the disciplinary domain, there is no choice to go to trial or not.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You cannot just run away. The municipality must then have the trial in your absence, but if you are found guilty, you will not be able to work within the domain.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And I think that is a very reasonable request. I think it is a very serious request, if we are all serious about clamping down on corruption.

There is a couple of other things that we can implement if we are serious about clamping down on corruption, and that is, for instance, getting the internal audit unit independent within municipalities. Then we will see how corruption disappears within municipalities.

The fact is that our smaller municipalities do struggle with certain competencies, engineering, CFOs, MMs, because of the comparison towards the scaling of the municipalities. Again, National made huge mistakes for not investigating it early enough and coming up with a system that we can compare with the private system. They just ignore all our inputs and hopefully we will, in the second round now, get some sense of the system, because if we are not going to do that, we will not get quality officials going to rural areas. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Bredell, your time has expired. That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We move on to the Question Paper.

Questions for Oral Reply. The question standing over from 4 May 2017. Hon member Botha to the Premier first. I see the hon Premier.

## QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

*Question standing over from Thursday, 4 May 2017, as agreed to by the House:*

*Disabled children of schoolgoing age, support given to*

### **2. Ms L J Botha to ask Ms H Zille, Premier:**

- (1) What support is the Western Cape Government giving to disabled children of the province who are of schoolgoing age but who are not attending school and who are being left to their own devices;
- (2) whether the support is being monitored; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Departments of Social Development and Education play a major role in providing services to disabled children of schoolgoing age, and who are not in formal schooling.

The Department of Social Development provides funding to non-profit organisations:

- (a) To provide support to children of schoolgoing age with severe to profound intellectual disabilities. This support is based in centres

operated by NPOs relating to:

1. The operational cost of subsidy. That is a per capita subsidy, which includes overheads, administration, nutrition and other programmes.
  2. Post-funding subsidy for programme implementers of the stimulation programmes, and carers.
  3. A transport subsidy to assist with transport costs to and from the centres, as well as visits to hospitals and clinics, and other priority visits which impact on the child's wellbeing.
  4. Subsidies for therapeutic outreach services for children who are on the waiting list at centres or schools, or are unable to attend a daily programme due to the severity of their disabilities. This occurs at grassroots level in the community or the client's home.
- (b) For support and capacity building of parents, primary caregivers and siblings of the children in the communities.
- (c) For social work services, including own services to follow up on children at home, and those not attending centres.

The Department has also developed a uniform referral pathway to assist

professionals and community level workers to be able to assess appropriately, as well as develop appropriate intervention plans. These include all relevant stakeholders, as well as engaging with the Western Cape Education Department for further interventions and applications to special need schools, or NPO facilities.

Monitoring of the children is done at social worker level, as part of the overall intervention plan, and this monitoring is done over the lifespan of the disabled person.

The Western Cape Education Department prioritises children with disabilities who have high support needs, and who are of schoolgoing age, for placement in special schools.

Two new special schools are scheduled for completion in July 2017, to cope with the ever-increasing demand for places due to various factors, such as the increased incidence of certain disabilities, and migration into the province due to the lack of support options elsewhere.

Children with disabilities, of schoolgoing age, who are out of school, are usually children with severe and profound intellectual disabilities, which may be co morbid with other disabilities, often autism spectrum disorders.

These children were the subject of a court order in 2010. The Provincial Government's response to the order was to provide an intergovernmental

programme of support. The Western Cape Education Department established four multidisciplinary teams which support the children at special care centres. The NGO managed special care centres have been funded by the Department of Health, and incrementally, the Department of Social Development is taking over the funding.

There are many out of school children in this category who may be recipients of social grants as well.

2. The Department of Social Development works closely with the Departments of Health and Education, for the monitoring of the children, to ensure that the children are provided with appropriate services while at home, whether through a clinic or an outreach service. In addition, the Western Cape Education Department monitors support to learners in special care centres. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There is no follow-up there. Then we move on to the next – is there a follow-up? Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to know how often is this monitoring done by the Department.

The PREMIER: I have not got an answer to that question that I can be confident of saying in this House. So I wonder whether the hon member

Makeleni would pose a question to the relevant Minister, who is Minister Fritz of Social Development?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, like the Premier is just saying, that the questions must be posed to Minister Fritz. I have done that in a Standing Committee twice with regards to Milnerton. There are people that can attest to that in our committee. I have done that ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And your question is?

Ms D GOPIE: ... twice, and nothing has been done. There are children in Milnerton that are mixed, they are sitting in a hall ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms D GOPIE: ... and they are not cared for by the Department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Member, that is a statement. Just turn it down to a question if you want to ask a question. That is a statement.

Ms D GOPIE: Was the Premier informed about the case that I have raised twice with the Minister?

The PREMIER: I would very much like the hon member Gopie to submit the information to me, or submit a written question to this House, and we can look into it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We will then move onto the next question, which is also a question standing over from 15 June 2017. Hon member Botha to the Premier. I again see the Premier.

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 15 June 2017, as agreed to by the House:*

*Cyberattacks*

**1. Ms L J Botha asked the Premier:**

- (1) Whether the Western Cape Government is in a position to safeguard itself against any cyberattacks; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether the Western Cape Government, during her tenure as Premier, has ever been threatened by a cyberattack; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) how was the attack address?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Deputy Speaker.

1. I am informed that the Centre for e-Innovation in the Western Cape

Government is in a position to safeguard itself against cyberattacks. I will just call it the CEI, that stands for the Centre for e-Innovation, it has an information technology security component which has been established under the leadership of the Chief Information Security Officer.

The unit is responsible for ensuring that the Western Cape Government puts the necessary processes and technologies in place, in order to safeguard its information and ICT infrastructure assets.

CEI works in partnership with the State Information Technology Agency, which is SITA, as well as external service providers, to ensure that cybersecurity is adequately addressed.

2. During my tenure as Premier, there have been numerous cyberattacks, albeit that they have been general in nature and have not specifically targeted the Western Cape Government.

There has, so far, been limited negative impact on the services that we provide, but we remain vigilant and continue to improve our security position.

The most recent cyberattack occurred from 12 May 2017, and relates to the *WannaCry* ransomware attack. Through numerous proactive and reactive measures, the Western Cape Government was able to isolate

potentially vulnerable areas of the Western Cape Government ICT landscape which were most at risk, and was able to put in place and action the required remediating steps.

The Western Cape Government was therefore not impacted by the *WannaCry* ransomware attack, which is apparently a cryptoworm, which ends up trying to extort money out of people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just a quick follow-up, hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I want to ask the Premier, what communication measures her Department is using to communicate to staff about the threats and potential threats?

The PREMIER: What I have seen so far are the notices around the lift wells, which I have read, but I understand that the Centre for e-Innovation is very quick to identify where the particular threat is happening, or is likely to happen, and they identify and inform the relevant people without trying to create panic across the system.

So I think the general information is out there, and as far as I understand it, the Centre for e-Innovation is very quick to target any places specifically at risk.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Botha, another follow-

up?

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Premier, is there an integrated approach that the Department has in assisting municipalities?

The PREMIER: I am afraid I cannot answer that question with any accuracy, but I do know that our Disaster Risk Management system has looked at the risk of cyberattacks very seriously, and if that question is put to me, I will be able to get the full information, but I do not have the full information with me now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question. New questions to the Premier. Again hon member Uys to the Premier. Premier, Question 1.

*New questions to the Premier*

*Working relationship with Mmusi Maimane*

**\*1. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

How Mr Mmusi Maimane's recent behaviour towards her influences her work as Premier?

The PREMIER: The answer is it has no impact on my work as Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, do you want to follow-up?

Mr P UYS: Yes, Sir, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, Premier, for responding.

Hon Premier, as the person who occupies the most senior Government position in the DA, but cannot serve in any decision-making structure within the DA, has this ever happened to anybody in South Africa or in the world? And if it did not happen, there must be an influence on you as the Premier?  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Premier, you may answer the question, but I want to say – order! The question must relate to the Premier's executive role. I am not sure whether that relates to it, but the Premier can answer if she wants to.

The PREMIER: The answer to the question is I have no idea, and I would like to in fact refer you to rule 195(1).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the Premier if she would offer to advise the Leader of the Opposition, hon member Magaxa, on how to manage factional disputes in the Western Cape ANC ... [Interjections.] in a mature and responsible manner and if so, what

advice would the Premier give the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... hon member Magaxa.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Premier, do you want to respond?

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do think the hon Opposition is beyond help in any shape or form. [Laughter.]. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Maybe to get a bit closer and hopefully the Premier will try to answer this. Hon Premier, the Leader of the DA said:

“It is quite evident that Helen Zille and I hold fundamentally different attitudes about the mission the DA needs to accomplish in 2019 ...”

An HON MEMBER: What is wrong with that?

Mr P UYS:

“ ... and the goals and priorities that flow from this.”

Mr M G E WILEY: What is the question?

Mr P UYS: Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is very clear, the Leader gives direction to the DA. What is your mission and goals, hon Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: My mission and goal is to help support good governance, through the DA, throughout South Africa, and watch that with some satisfaction when I am retired.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Magaxa. The last opportunity.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes. Thank you. I just want to ask the Premier how is she going to execute her responsibilities as a person who has been appointed by the DA, and form part of the proportional representation of the DA in this Legislature in the light that she cannot now sit in on any of the DA constitutional structures? How is she going to get the information so that she can execute DA's policies in this Provincial Government.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is the worst question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I need to remind the hon, the Leader of the Opposition that our party operates very differently from the way his party operates.

I was nominated by the DA, I was elected by the electorate of the Western Cape into this position, and elected by this Parliament into this position. So the bottom-line is that that is how the DA understands the constitutional situation of a Premier. We are not deployed into positions, we are nominated and elected.

Mr P UYS: You are deployed.

The PREMIER: Secondly ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: Secondly, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have a very good system of report backs. So, for example, without speaking out of caucus this morning, we had a full and comprehensive report back from all the decision bodies in the Democratic Alliance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move to the next question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] the last one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, the four questions have been exhausted. Second question, the hon member Uys to the Premier. Again the Premier. Question 2.

*Investigation: Minister Madikizela's birthday party*

**\*2. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

Whether she has started an investigation into the payment for the birthday party of the Minister of Human Settlements by contractors of the Department of Human Settlements; if not, why not; if so, (a) who conducted the investigation and (b) what were the findings?

The PREMIER: Thank you. The answer is yes. I did, with the assistance of the Western Cape Government officials, and I published the findings in a column that was published online. Which I can read into the record if you would like me to.

Mr P UYS: Yes, let us do it.

The PREMIER: Shall I read it into the record?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, please.

The PREMIER: Alright, good, I will do that.

“In the parasitic relationship between social and conventional media, fake news is often used to generate outrage, and fake outrage, in turn, to generate news. Things that should generate outrage often pass unnoticed.

Outrage manufacturing becomes particularly marked the months before political parties hold elective conferences for new leadership. During this period, internal jockeying for positions includes candidates raking as much muck on their opponents as possible.

Healthy scepticism is therefore a useful attitude with which to approach the many revelations that make their way into the media, as South Africa’s major political parties approach their congress season.

It is fascinating to watch the links between some politicians and those journalists who are prepared to provide a public platform for their schemes. A few journalists even become proactive agents in a party’s internal battles and vendettas.

It was in this frame of mind that I read an article in last week’s *Sunday Times*, headlined ‘Contractors paid for DA MEC’s bash.’ The opening paragraph read:

‘Acting DA provincial leader, Bonginkosi Madikizela, is facing allegations of impropriety, after a swanky birthday

bash, in his honour, was apparently partially funded by construction companies that benefit from projects financed by his Department.’

Despite the inclusion of a denial from Mr Madikizela himself, who is the Provincial Minister of Human Settlements, the overwhelming impression left by the headline and the article is that contractors funded a party for the political head of a department that awards contracts and tenders worth billions annually.

If that were true, it would, at the very least, be improper. At worst, it might indicate corruption. So confident was the journalist of the latter, that he publicly predicted the unfolding scandal would end Madikizela’s career. Before long, the lines were buzzing. Journalists wanted comment. The party hierarchy advised me to take urgent and immediate action.

The next day the story escalated, with a breathless front page headline in the *Cape Times*, screaming:

‘Madikizela’s birthday party sleaze.’

Followed by an article dripping in insinuations. Experience, life’s best teacher, cautioned me to proceed carefully, gather as many facts as possible and speak to the individuals involved before determining a

course of action, or making a public statement.

I knew at least two things:

1. Bonginkosi's candidature for the provincial leadership at September's Western Cape Congress meant that his opponents would be looking for every reason to publicly discredit him; and;
2. Whatever may have happened in relation to his birthday celebration, the provincial procurement system would not have been influenced by it, because we have built a firewall between politicians and the supply chain management system.

So if it turned out that there were contractors who thought they could buy favours by sponsoring an event, they would end up sorely disappointed. Nevertheless, if there had been such an attempt, it would have been wrong, and action would be required. It was obviously important to establish the facts.

My first discussion was with Bonginkosi himself. I told him I was going to investigate the issue in as much detail as possible, so that I could determine an appropriate course of action. He welcomed my approach. He told me the party had been organised as a surprise for him. He thought he was going out to a birthday dinner

with a group of friends, only to walk into a room full of guests, shouting, ‘Surprise’.”

Mr K E MAGAXA: Wearing a white suit.

The PREMIER: “What he knew ...” - well, he goes to everywhere wearing a smart suit.

An HON MEMBER: And a bowtie!

The PREMIER: He goes to everywhere wearing a smart suit.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Why has he never come here with that suit? [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: Because he was going to a birthday dinner.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER:

“What he knew about the background was as follows ...” ...

[Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: We are not children.

The PREMIER: He is the best dressed man in South Africa by a long shot. Mr Magaxa is only second.

“What he knew about the background was as follows: He has for years been part of a 20 strong network of friends, who support each other, specifically in times of celebration and bereavement helping to raise money for events ranging from parties to funerals. This group, loosely based on the traditional stokvel saving model, meets on a regular basis.

When Bonginkosi was elected the DA’s interim Western Cape leader, they wanted to throw a celebration party for him. Bonginkosi vetoed the idea. He said it was not appropriate in the circumstances and could potentially be interpreted as lauding it over other candidates. They accepted his reservations and later hatched a plan to give him a surprise birthday party instead.

It was a closely guarded secret. After the event, when he inquired who had paid for it, they told him that a fundraising sub-committee had called on people to make donations. He accepted their word, and thought nothing further of it. This was normal in his friendship circle, he told me.

He confirmed the newspaper’s claim that it was Phumla Zantsi, a partner in a construction firm doing business with the province, that had contributed a multi-layered, multi-coloured cake, worth R3 000.00.

That was the only contractor involved as far as he was aware.

Bonginkosi told me that he and Phumla were part of a mutually supporting friendship circle. They had been friends for 20 years, from the time they were both activists in Khayelitsha, and long before he had even thought of joining the DA. For her part, Phumla had been a contractor to the province long before Bonginkosi became Provincial Minister of Human Settlements. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER:

“She had never used her presence in their stokvel network to seek a business advantage or political favour.

‘In any event’, said Bonginkosi, ‘Do you think that I can be bought for a birthday cake?’”

Mr K E MAGAXA: I know this guy is a boy.

The PREMIER:

“I thought about our conversation. A longstanding friend buys you an admittedly expensive cake, from her own pocket, and it turns into a scandal, because her company does work for the province, and has done for years prior to your arrival on the scene. This puts a completely

different spin on a story that had been touted as a career ending scandal.

But of course there could conceivably be more to the story than that, so I investigated further. A party at the One & Only Hotel does not come cheap. I started by making contact with Phumla Zantsi. She immediately agreed to meet, and was entirely forthcoming. She explained that the group of friends had met over many weeks to organise the party. They had nominated a fundraising committee who had approached prospective donors.”

Mr K E MAGAXA: Who are ... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER:

“She gave me the full donor list, ranging from people who had contributed to the incidentals ... [Interjections.] such as tea and coffee at their planning meetings, to those who had paid for a big ticket item, such as the hotel’s bar tab.

I then submitted the donors’ names and the companies with which they were associated to the Chief Financial Officer of the Department of Human Settlements, to determine if any of them are contractors to the Department or the Province. ‘None’, he responded.

I managed to get the telephone number of the major donor, a Mr G, who is based in Durban, where Bonginkosi's sisters live, and where he once lived himself. He still has a large friendship network there. Mr G confirmed that he had covered the lion's share of the costs ... [Interjection.] and that he has no business interest in the Western Cape, and none in construction, and that he had elicited further donations from his network in Durban. None did work for the Western Cape either, he assured me.

Next I had to check whether the people who said they were donors were the ones that actually paid for the party. So I contacted the relevant hotel manager, and asked to see copies of the invoices and receipts. He was unable to give them to me, due to client confidentiality, so I asked the party organisers to source the documents for me. They promptly did and my office undertook a reconciliation, which showed the accuracy of the information we had been given.

Next I scoured some of the photographs from the party, and with the help of the Department of Human Settlements, identified two contractors who attended as guests - Mr P and Mr M. Neither had been on the donor list, but I called them nevertheless, to find out whether they had been asked to contribute, and whether they had done so. [Interjection.]

'I wasn't asked for a cent and I didn't pay a cent.' [Interjection.]

replied Mr M.

He had been invited to the party because he had known Bonginkosi through political circles from the time he was still a member of the ANC. Mr P told a similar story. He was a subcontractor to Mr M, who had phoned him during the festivities to encourage him to pop in to the party and Mr P then did.

By then I had followed all the leads open to me, and I am confident that on the information available, there is no more to the story than that.

Meanwhile the impression has been indelibly created in the minds of the newspaper reading public that the Minister has been involved in shady dealings, involving contractors to his Department, paying for a lavish birthday party.

The ineluctable deduction is that he is corrupt. The ANC has reported the allegations to the Public Protector, who has powers to probe the matter even more deeply than I did. I will pass on everything I have to assist her, if she asks me, and if anything further emerges, I will study it very carefully.

The one question I have not answered to my satisfaction is, where, from inside the DA, this allegation came from in the first place? The

newspaper has kept its sources anonymous. I have said it before and I say so again: When it is established that informants have leaked fake news to the media they and their motives should become the focus of the story because they have not acted in the public interest, only in their own. It is time that this becomes standard practice in the media. Too much damage is done by anonymous sources spreading fake news, aided and abetted by journalists who know if they are honest that their revelations have nothing to do with speaking truth to power.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Uys your follow up?

Mr P UYS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Premier, you started off and you ended off with internal leaks and internal fake news and it seems like you want to almost give that as the reason for this information coming out. Now could you determine where is this fake news coming from?

The PREMIER: I have already answered that question if you were listening. I said that is the next thing I would like to investigate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys your second chance.

Mr P UYS: Hon Premier, the MEC said that the person who organised this party for him was MEC Mbombo. Did you actually call her in as part of the investigation?

The PREMIER: Yes I did speak to Minister Mbombo. She was only asked to do one task which was to invite certain people to the party.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, is it morally and legally correct to have a spouse, two spouses serving on your Executive and in your Cabinet. We could see there could be a conflict of interest especially with the arrangement that we see now.

The PREMIER: They are not spouses, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. They are spouses in terms of your own Handbook for Ministers, your own one. Please check it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you another, a last opportunity. Is there a question there? Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In light of the Deputy Police Minister allowing his Chief of Staff to use taxpayers money to hold an ANC press conference, has she perhaps heard of hon member Uys condemning this blatant corruption by the ANC before looking for corruption elsewhere?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Premier, just one second. Hon

member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: To you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Are we allowed to entertain fake news in this House because we know and she knows that is not true?

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No I am saying why must we entertain ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I will address that.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Why [inaudible.] allow it here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order! It is not for the Chair to determine whether something is fake news or genuine news. The question was asked. If the Premier wants to respond the Premier is free to respond.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, one cannot open a newspaper in South Africa without reading of a criminal state under the control of the ANC. The dossier that has been put forward by Outa, for example, on President Zuma is so compelling and so damning and I have not heard a word from the hon the Opposition. The issue that the hon Wenger raises is a very important one with the Police Minister using the cover of his office to pay for an ANC event at a

swanky hotel but in the ANC's league of corruption, that is small beer. It is quite unbelievable when one reads the dossier of how the Minister who is now the Minister of Finance allowed the capture of state enterprises when he was the Minister in that Department and allowed people to get certain favours for citizenship when he was the Minister of another department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier just one second.

The PREMIER: I have never heard from the honourable, the Opposition one word of condemnation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Order, the irrelevance of this thing now. Where are we going with this?

The DEPTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Order, the irrelevance of this thing now. Where are we going with this?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, the ... [Interjection.] Order. Before we all jump up on points of order, the question was asked by the member at the back there and the Premier is responding to that so I cannot interfere with that answer. The Premier is free to answer the way she wants to. Hon member

Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: I need to ask that you rule on these fake points of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier you may continue.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Oh, she is not finished?

The PREMIER: I am not finished. So, given the fact that the ANC has turned a corrupt state into an actual criminal state captured by international syndicates, it is quite extraordinary that they come here and try and make a scandal out of a birthday cake.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto the next question. We have exhausted the four opportunities on that one. Hon ...

Mr S G TYATYAM: Can I really, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, no I just want to say, on Rule 43. When we get irrelevance is it not upon you as our Deputy Speaker to raise that with a member? You cannot allow things, want to go throughout the world and speak to something that is not relevant to what we are dealing with.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No we all agree with that hon member.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Rule 43 is very clear and it gives you the power to tell a speaker where to get off.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree totally and I accept that but also when a question is asked then the answer to that question becomes relevant.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Can I ask you ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Is the question not supposed to be relevant on the question that was initially asked?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is not supposed to be a follow-up on that question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, relevant to the original question ...  
[Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because I was ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... asked a couple of times to sit down on the basis that the question I am asking has nothing to do with the question that was initially asked.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Relevance relates to the original question and to the response given, so if the response goes in a certain direction ... Hon Tyatyam I am talking. If the response goes in a certain direction then it becomes relevant for a follow-up to be asked on that response. That is what happened here. But you are free to raise a point of order when you feel that relevance is at stake here and I accept that.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Then, Mr Deputy Speaker, what was the relationship between the initial question that was asked by hon P Uys with the question that was asked there by the member of the DA?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Which was answered by the DA.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Premier responded in a certain way and that led to the following question.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, can she stand why you are still ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat then. Thank you. Hon Premier do you want to address me on this one?

The PREMIER: Yes I do. I do want to address you on that because the hon member Uys asked me about an allegation relating to a birthday cake and tried to present it as corruption ...[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: I never said that.

The PREMIER: ... so it is entirely relevant to ask the question as to whether he has ever condemned any other form of corruption on his side of the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is exactly what happened. We move onto the next question. Question 9. [Interjections.] Hon Kivedo to Minister Plato?

*Question standing over from Thursday, 15 June 2017, as agreed to by the House:*

*Illegal firearms*

**9. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (1) How many firearms, used in gang activity on the Cape Flats were given in during the amnesty period;
- (2) whether the establishment of a dedicated special task force,

operating under a distinct code name and with the sole responsibility of confiscating illegal firearms, is possible; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. Two parts of the question, part one: An amnesty period was announced by the former Minister of Police but was never implemented because there was no firearm amnesty period, no firearms could be handed in. I am however still hopeful that such an amnesty period will indeed be implemented and I will raise this issue at my next MINMEC meeting with the new Minister of Police.

Part two of the question, operation COMBAT and the SAPS stability unit focus on confiscation of guns and drugs and focus on the issue of gangs. These units with the help of crime intelligence are regarded as special task forces. The President announced the creation of specialised units to focus primarily on guns and drugs. To date, however, there is no indication regarding the implementation of these.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I thank the hon Minister for answering the question but as I detected he combined the two so I have follow-up questions on both and may I then continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may ask your questions yes. One question at a

time.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Hon Minister, can any success be ascribed to this so-called amnesty period and process?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do not know what you mean by a so-called amnesty period. I am of the opinion that the police leadership is still looking at the creation of an amnesty period, actually they did the announcement. I think it must just be implemented and I do not know what is wrong there. That is a question one will need to ask the National Minister. But there are successes, drug successes, guns successes in the province.

Looking at what happened last week, drugs to the tune of R498 million confiscated. It is a major success and reports have it that it was the biggest amount of drugs confiscated in South Africa and also over the weekend drugs to the tune of R2 million were also confiscated. And the issue is that crime intelligence, with these units mentioned, was involved in the confiscation of those drugs. So those are successes. Despite the amnesty period the normal police investigative work will continue and it is continuing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo, your second opportunity.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reason for why I say I called it a “so-called” will lead from my second question. Hon Minister, were there any considered and vigorous attempts by law enforcement officers

to confiscate outstanding illegal firearms?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The amount of guns confiscated on a week to week basis is in the region of 35 so it is happening and we are pleased with the amount of guns confiscated, but I need to caution by stating it is a tall order because every week that amount confiscated, every week that amount of guns is available and that is a big worry for us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Final question on this Question 1. Hon Minister, are these the firearms stolen by ex-colonel Christiaan Prinsloo, who is currently on holiday in Pollsmoor, to be sold to gangsters on the Cape Flats?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Part of it, Mr Deputy Speaker, you must realise that there was a break-in at the Simons Town Naval Base as well. There was also a break-ins at the base here, the former S.A.K.K. Base near Khayelitsha next to Spine Road and there were also break-ins at some police stations where guns were stolen. So, one must not be fooled that all the guns doing the rounds on the Cape Flats are only linked to Prinsloo. Many of the guns are linked to these institutions I have mentioned as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your last opportunity.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie. Wat die tweede vraag betref het ek ook ...

[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. With regard to the second question I also ...

[Interjection.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Van watter tweede vraag praat jy?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Which second question are you referring to?]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Daar was twee vrae.

[Mr B D KIVEDO: There were two questions.]

† 'n AGBARE LID: Maak nie saak nie, man, jy [Onhoorbaar.]

[An HON MEMBER: It does not matter, man, you [Inaudible.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ja, jy kan maar aangaan. Jy kan maar voortgaan.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you can go ahead. You may continue.]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Daar is twee vrae, definitief vraag een en twee.

[Mr B D KIVEDO: There are two questions, definitely question one and two.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Goed so.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Very well.]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Daar was drie vrae op vraag een, en dan vraag twee.

Agbare Minister, in die geval van gewapende roof asook die afvuur van wapens, en ook in die geval van moord met wapens, waarom word die

perpetreerders van hierdie misdade gewoonlik gearresteer maar die vuurwapen word weining maal gekonfiskeer?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: There were three questions on question one, and then question two. Hon Minister, in the event of armed robbery as well as the firing of firearms, and also in the event of murder with firearms, why are the perpetrators usually arrested but the firearms are seldom confiscated?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Minister?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?]

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Dit is 'n probleem, die feit dat die *hot bodies* gearresteer word, maar baie keer is die wapen nie te vinde nie, maar dit is waarom ons 'n intelligensie-eenheid het en speurders het om dit na te speur. Baie keer is daar suksesse, baie keer is daar nie suksesse met die ondersoeke nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is a problem, the fact that the hot bodies are arrested, but often the firearm cannot be found, but that is why we have an intelligence unit and detectives to follow it up. Often there are successes, but then often there are no successes with the investigations.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, ons gaan voort. Die volgende vraag. Agbare lid, die vier geleenthede is ongelukkig klaar uitgeput. Die twee vrae word saam hanteer as een vraag, dan kry jy net vier kanse.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we continue. The next question. Hon member, the four opportunities have unfortunately been exhausted. The two questions are treated together as one question, then you get only four chances.]

We move on to Question number 3, the hon Beerwinkel to Dr Meyer. Minister of Finance, the question is to you.

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 22 June 2017, as agreed to by the House:*

*Western Cape Financial Management Capacity Building Grant*

**3. Ms C F Beerwinkel asked the Minister of Finance:**

- (1) Whether any youths of Swellendam are included in the Western Cape Financial Management Capacity Building Grant; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

- (2) what is the Provincial Treasury doing to encourage and assist the Swellendam Municipality to implement this important empowerment programme?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker it is Minister Grant, as usual. [Laughter.] Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and for the question by hon member Beerwinkel. An opportunity was provided to all 30 municipalities within the province to participate in the Financial Management Capacity Grant. Swellendam Municipality indicated that it would not participate for the 2016/17 year. Albeit attempts were made by Provincial Treasury to persuade the Municipality to reconsider their position given all the related benefits of the Municipal Financial Capacity Grant.

The reason provided by the Municipality for not participating was that given their current financial reality they did not have the financial resources to cover the shortfall or said portion as expressed in the Memorandum of Agreement. Provincial Treasury in response highlighted the following that the Financial Management Capacity Grant commitments have now been extended to the 2020 financial year and it was also proclaimed in the *Provincial Government Gazette*.

The grant, the framework is not prescribed on the form and the quantum of co-funding, however, would not be inconsequential as it aims to further entrench this support initiative. The 2017/18 Grant Framework was amended

to take into account rural areas in that the limit has been reduced from 3 to 2 students per year to accommodate the additional costs requirements. So the question also asked what have we done subsequent, I have subsequently, Mr Deputy Speaker, written to the Mayor of Swellendam requesting further engagements towards securing the participation of the Municipality in this support initiative and my Department will also engage with the Overberg District municipality to also initiate some discussions in the region and also with the Swellendam Municipality with the implementation of this initiative.

Mr Deputy Speaker, given the fact that many of these rural municipalities do not have the capacity to attract young people in this particular field, this particular Financial Capacity Grant is specifically targeting the youth in those particular municipalities and also to facilitate retention of those particular financial capacity building skills within the municipality. So this is a golden opportunity for the areas but obviously one cannot force a municipality to take part in this, obviously it has to be a voluntary agreement.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Beerwinkel?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Beerwinkel?]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you MEC. Mr Deputy Speaker, most of what the MEC has now explained is what we knew and is what the Department explained to us. I basically wanted to know, because the municipalities biggest problem was they did not have the counter funding that is needed for

embarking on this initiative to empower these youth. So my basic question now is, what measures are put in place to assist the Municipality with their financial constraints to be able to take on youth although I now hear the MEC's saying that they have reduced it from 3 to 2, and yes we know that the rural opportunities are few but these rural youth need these opportunities. We want the Department to do everything in their power to assist Swellendam to be able to do this. Are they assisting in a financial capacity?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Financial Capacity Grant is a grant to assist these youth, building skills within the Municipality so that that skill can assist the Municipality in maintaining the clean financial audits within the budget and treasury offices. We have now gone further to say we will also now look broader than just the Swellendam Municipality, to look within the context of the Overberg Municipality.

Absolutely it cannot be our responsibility to go beyond that because then we will have to do that for all 30 municipalities. This is certainly not the objective of this particular grant and as the hon member knows one of the things that we have done is, in the beginning of the year, we have introduced a Revenue Master Class to assist the municipalities to increase their own revenue. For example, through tariff structuring because that is one of the tools and instruments that you can increase your local revenue but the responsibility and the mandate and the separation of powers, that is certainly

within the jurisdiction of Swellendam Municipality.

I do not think we can do much more but I am willing, as I have already answered, to make provision to transfer this, for more students for next year without necessarily any co-funding associated with this and I think that is a fair arrangement between the Western Cape Provincial Treasury and the Municipality. There are 28 municipalities that understand that type of fiscal arrangement and they have agreed with such arrangements.

But I gather from the hon member that we must not just accept this and we will further continue to negotiate with the Municipality to see what we can do, but without any further additional financial impacting on the budget of this particular programme because we have to cater for 30 municipalities. I have now written to the Mayor and I will certainly report back to this House about the outcome of that conversation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel do you want to follow-up further?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. The MEC is now repeating what he first said about what the grant is about. I know what the grant is about, I know what the purpose of the grant is. I am saying Swellendam needs to be - maybe I should change it and say Swellendam needs to be investigated ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Change it into a question.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why does the Department not investigate why Swellendam cannot afford to add 3 students to this programme because I know that they can. There is money that they waste on other things, Mr Deputy Speaker so I am sure that they can - it is an honourable programme for youth, why are they not doing it? There has to be a reason why. 28 municipalities can do it, why can't they?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your question is clear to the Minister. He is ready.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon member. I have written to the Mayor, precisely to ask that that particular question and as soon as I get an answer from the Municipality I will come back to House and give that answer to the House.

The Municipality has not yet written back to me and given the fact that we respect the principle of the separation of powers, I have, after writing to the Mayor, asked my staff to give the Mayor a phone call on this particular matter. But I am happy to come back to this House in the spirit of accountability, to report back to the House about the outcome of my questions and the telephonic conversations with the Mayor.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can we just get to the numbers. What was the amount that was expected from Swellendam Municipality because as you drive through Swellendam Municipality you see the best town in South Africa. And, just to understand, what did you ask them to co-contribute towards these 3 youth students per annum?

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, as I indicated in my answer, there is no co-creation in terms of the funding for the 17/18 financial year. The target was for 3 people reduced now to 2 for R120 000. We will now in the new financial year going forward make provision for R240 000 without co-funding and in 18/19 R360 000 without co-funding.

There is however an obligation for municipalities who have a shortage of these financial management capacity skills. Once these persons have completed their studies they must be taken up in the budget treasury office as the National Treasury has now requested all the MECs to make sure that we assist with the budgetary and treasury offices of the various municipalities. Part of that assistance is that the graduates of this particular programme be taken up in the staff establishment of the Municipality, so that we have properly staffed budget and treasury offices within the Municipality, so that we can maintain our status of clean audits within municipalities. So, there is no co-funding, there is an obligation to take these people up in the staff establishment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there further follow-up? No, we

move onto the next question, Question 4. Hon member Joseph, again to Minister Meyer.

*New National Minister of Finance*

*Link with Government's nuclear energy policy*

**\*4. Mr D Joseph asked the Minister of Finance:**

Whether there is a link between the new National Minister of Finance and the Government's nuclear energy policy; if so, how will it affect the Western Cape?

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. According to recent media reports, Finance Minister Malusi Gigaba officially told Parliament that no nuclear deal has been signed. He further indicated that the Minister of Finance does not have the authority to conclude country agreements for the Nuclear Build Programme on behalf of the Government, neither does the Minister have the mandate to determine policy or implementation frameworks for the energy sector.

Well, Mr Deputy Speaker, in terms of Section 66 and Section 70 of the Public Finance Management Act, it outlines that the Minister of Finance's role in this regard requires concurrence for any guarantee, indemnity or security that binds the National Revenue Fund to further financial commitments. I sign many of these on a regular basis. The Finance Minister in addition said that if

any agreements have been concluded regarding project management and the construction of specified nuclear power plants it would have been between the relevant accounting authority and the service provider.

The Nuclear Procurement Programme was reset in May 2017 after a High Court ruled that the process had been illegal. Energy Minister Kubayi thereafter announced that she was restarting the process by signing new agreements with United States, China, South Korea, Russia and France in June 2017 and the procurement programme would only begin officially when Eskom releases its request for proposals.

Any increased burden of national debt service cost caused by the proposed nuclear deal estimated at least a cost of R1 trillion will have a negative impact on the transfers from the National Government to provinces including the Western Cape.

We also know that the current debt service cost is the highest single expenditure item on the budget and has also now increased from last year, from R147 billion to this year to R162 billion. We also know Eskom has the highest state guarantees. They have already taken up R477 billion in state guarantees. Eskom, who has the responsibility to manage this, has already taken up the biggest chunk of that R477 billion state guarantee, namely R350 billion state guarantees.

So, in short Mr Deputy Speaker, this nuclear deal has a minimum cost of

R1 trillion but I am also happy to inform the hon member Joseph from starting the nuclear contract to actually switching on the lights of nuclear will take 17 years. I am glad that the ANC will no longer be in power so we can cancel that in the Union Buildings.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph?

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and thank you to the Minister for the response. I just would like to ask the Minister: Has the new Minister of Finance, since he has taken office, ever made an attempt and now that they want to pursue this course after the court case, has the Minister ever taken the opportunity at MINMEC to ask how, if the ruling party wants to start, they are going to fund these trillions, where the money is going to come from?

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon member Joseph. Mr Deputy Speaker, soon I will have to undergo my performance evaluation with the Premier. One of the targets is meeting with your National Minister. I will have to fail in my assessment in this particular regard because Minister Malusi Gigaba has not yet called a Budget Council since he has been appointed ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Because he is meeting the Guptas.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Because he is meeting the Guptas.

[Interjections.] Hon members, the Budget Council is like the Education Council and the Health Council, it is a statutory council. So, it is important that, as the MEC of Finance in this province, I regularly meet with him in this particular regard but because of his non-commitment to meet with the MECs of Finance, I must now suffer in my performance agreement, hon member Skwatsha. [Laughter.]

So, it is really sad that I am not able to meet with the National Minister but what I have done, is I have submitted budget items because he is not meeting with us. One of the items is the nuclear because, hon member Joseph, there is a dynamic at play in the National Treasury. We have seen that Minister Gigaba was asked to sign the nuclear deal but Minister Nhlanhla Nene was not prepared to sign this nuclear deal and Mr Des van Rooyen, who was only available for a weekend, did not get a chance in the National Treasury to sign this nuclear deal.

Within days of taking power, Minister Pravin Gordhan said, and he is on record: "We will only spend money we have." - meaning he will not sign the nuclear deal. But we have also seen that President Zuma's determination has never wavered and neither has Mr Gordhan's. Mr Gordhan said insufficient work was done by the Department of Energy nationally and so we now know why Minister Pravin Gordhan was later removed from his position.

But, hon member Joseph, in November 2016 during the debate in Parliament, on a vote of no confidence in Mr Zuma, Gigaba said South Africa was being

subjected to a regime change offensive in part because of its plan to build a nuclear power station. That was the response of Minister Gigaba. Opposing this agenda was necessary he said, in other words, he was in support of these plans for the - and he said for the nuclear, and he said, he used these words “to the very death.”

In other words he was prepared to die for the Guptas but this nuclear deal must proceed. I think this was one of the real reasons for Mr Gordhan’s replacement and not the security considerations as pointed out. Hon member Joseph, why this matter is so important for me is because R1 trillion is almost what we totally collect in a year, the total revenue from tax, difference sources of tax dispensation.

Here this Government is committed and the world and South Africa are moving in the direction of renewable energy and as the Premier reported earlier in her State of Province Address, significant progress is being made in terms of the cost and research in the direction of renewable energy. So I think what we are now seeing is that the evidence is becoming more clear. In 2010 Mr Gupta bought a uranium mine. Three years later in 2013, Mr Gupta went to Mr Zuma and he said my mine is not making money. So Minister Gordhan asked us to join the dots. The dots are: in 2010 Mr Gupta bought a mine, in 2013 he said my mine is not making money and Mr Zuma said do not worry I will take care of it for you. So, what we are now seeing here is that Mr Nene was not prepared to sign this thing, Minister Gordhan was not prepared to sign. We know now from the Gupta leaks that Minister Gigaba

has given the Gupta family, through the Department of Home Affairs, citizenship, illegally, and so I think hon member Joseph your question is very relevant. But the text of your question tells us that we have a Minister of Finance here in South Africa whose integrity is in tatters. And so I understand if he does not want to call meetings with the MECs of Finance because we are going to confront him with the realities as they are at the moment.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Thank you, we move onto the next question, Question 6, Minister Mbombo.

*Minister of Health: birthday party contribution*

**6. Ms M N Gillion asked the Minister of Health:**

- (a) Which consultants and contractors of the Western Cape Government made a direct or indirect contribution to the celebration of her birthday last year at the Radisson Blue Hotel and (b) who paid for the event?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In terms of the powers vested upon me, according to the Chapter 13 of the Constitution and also the Public Finance Management Act, Chapter 5 and Chapter 7, I would not know who the consultants and contractors in my Department are because that function is vested with the Accounting Officer, the HOD.

However, *however*, because the question was posed I had to go back to last year to find out if there were any Western Cape Government consultants and contractors that were part of that and the answer is no. And then the ‘b’, no taxpayers’ money was used and no contractors paid for the birthday party so that is the answer. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Order. Is there a follow-up. Hon member Gopie? [Interjections.] Order hon member Tyatyam I cannot hear your colleague next to you.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, would the MEC agree to refer the matter to an independent forensic investigation?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am not aware of any matter that has ever been raised other than now in this question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto new questions. Order. Question 3 to minister Plato. [Interjections.]

*New questions*

*Abuse by law enforcement officials, incident*

**3. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

(1) Whether the incident where law enforcement officers allegedly

pelted suspects with apples has been brought to his attention; if so,

- (2) whether any disciplinary actions have been instituted; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. Two parts of the question. Yes, the incident was brought under my attention and the second part yes, disciplinary actions have been instituted and are currently underway.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger.

Ms M WENGER: I would like to ask the Minister who is undertaking or which entity is undertaking the disciplinary action?

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker that is an internal municipal matter, it is not for any provincial government entity to investigate. I had the discussion with the local Mayor, Mayor Vosloo and they do have their own disciplinary codes and stuff dealing with investigations in regard to these matters.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, given that this is an internal municipal investigation, are you kept informed or do you take a view that you would

like to follow up on this issue seeing that it is in the public domain and it is in the province?

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would believe it is more for the Minister of Local Government to be on top of that situation but it does not matter. The fact of the matter is, if there is a sense in this House that I need to stay close to the investigation I will do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move onto the following, the next question, Question 4 again to Minister Plato.

*Children and young women, killing of: measures to prevent*

**4. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether his Department has measures in place to prevent the killing of children and young women in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker this question is a very, very important one looking at what has happened over the last couple of weeks and days in the Western Cape, specifically on the Cape Flats. The abduction, the raping, the killing and the dumping of children, specifically young girls and even babies, in the province is of major concern for the Department, for the police, for the many NGOs and the general

public. Courtney was just three years old, the Strand girl, just five years old, the Khayelitsha girl also five years old, the Atlantis boy, only one and a half years old and the Kensington boy of ten days ago, only 18 months old and there are many more.

Something is wrong with the men in our society raping and killing our young girls. We have to talk about this. We cannot address the problem without talking about it. Another big problem, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that in 95% of all of these cases the perpetrator and victim knew each other. A friend, a neighbour, a boyfriend or even a family member. The problem for the police is how do you police what is happening inside people's houses?

The Department of Community Safety partners with many institutions and organisations: our own institution - that is Social Development, NGOs, the police, religious fora, neighborhood watches and CPFs, are in continued attempts to address this. Safety is everyone's responsibility and we realise that if we want to be successful in our mission then we all have to work together. The Department's Reaching Out Team and myself constantly address communities to talk about these issues. Educating the public, empowering them with knowledge and correct information is key to addressing the problem holistically. That is why we strengthen our neighbourhood watches and structure Walking Buses for them to be our ears and eyes in the communities, to alert us to what is wrong.

However, we need community members to work with us, we need our mothers

and this is very important, we need our mothers to speak out. Many times a mother knows but keeps quiet. Many times other family members know but keep quiet. Within the context of our formalised programmes, the Department, in executing its oversight mandate in terms of the Constitution, monitors the implementation of the Domestic Violence Act at police stations, thereby ensuring that victims receive the required services and protection as determined by the Act.

The Department also monitors identified child murder and rape cases through its Watching Brief Unit so as to identify possible systematic investigative shortcomings and to report thereon. Various other programmes are our youth safety and religious partnership, our Chrysalis Academy, our alcohol harms reduction and deployment of Safety Kiosks to name a few that are initiated during school holidays.

Youth Month, Women's Month and 60 Days of Activism indirectly prevent the killing of children and women through awareness and empowerment. The one programme that is focused on the safety of children is the Walking Bus Project. The initiative has members of the broader community, specifically parents, to walk groups of children to school and back home in the afternoon and at the same time keeping an eye on the perimeters of the respective schools. The project involves the participation of schools, governing bodies, the municipalities, SAPS, Metro Police, Provincial Traffic, community police forums, neighbourhood watches and state departments. The visibility of Walking Bus members in the community can act as a deterrent for potential

criminal activity and create a safe zone for school-going children and the community at large.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, we must begin to focus on the men in our society. It is the men that are raping the young girls, it is the older men in our communities, in our society that have an appetite for young girls and they do not care if the girl is a baby of one and a half years old or five years old or if it is a granny of 80 years old. This issue, we cannot and I want to repeat myself, we cannot sweep it under the carpet. That will be our focus during the upcoming Women's Month period during August. We focus too much on the role of the woman what she must wear, her dress, how she must conduct herself. There is not enough focus on the man and we need a Men's Week or a Men's Month as well so that like we focus on women's issues we begin to equally focus on men's issues. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The murder and rape of women and children continues unabated, although you are saying there are interventions that are in place by different stakeholders. I want to understand, MEC, what is your view in relation to the Commission of Inquiry as our Premier refuses to implement it. [Interjections.] I think that this Commission would be able, like the Commission that was done for Khayelitsha, to deal and assist us to resolve some of the problems here. What is your view in implementing this or are you with the Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member are you done with your question? Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon member is asking the Minister to express an opinion. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Tyatyam, that is correct but I will leave it to the Minister to respond in the way he wants to respond but technically he cannot ask the member what his opinion is about a matter.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is a question for the Premier because the Premier and her office are dealing with this commission issue. I do not want to do things on that level. But, let me say, we have the police focusing on this issue, we have crime intelligence focusing on this issue, we have many NGOs – NGOs are paid millions of rands, collectively, by the Social Development Department and still the problem is carrying on in our communities. So the current entities struggle to contain it, struggle to deal with it. We can add three, four more whatever issues and inquiries, the question is will they, as a collective, be able to contain this problem?

SAPS message is clear, how do you deal with this issue if it is happening in the house? Courtney – the perpetrator was renting a room in the house. The Khayelitsha problem was a friend of the family. In the Strand it was the boyfriend of the grandmother. How are the police going to police that and

how will a Commission of Inquiry police that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, given the interventions and measures and also the fact that many of these incidents are committed by well-known and in the main, males, would you agree that a dedicated office would assist in investigations which focus mainly on dealing with those issues? Hence, I think the issue of the Children's Commission is an issue because you have got a Human Rights Commission so that will really focus on assisting and strengthening what we are raising. So, don't you think that that commissioner or that office would be an added or a plus to resolve most of the other issues or an avenue for those affected ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Get to your question please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... to run to that office for help?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Get to your question please. Hon Minister Plato?

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Dedicated police units already exist and dedicated specialised police units like the FCS unit. The Family Violence Child Protection Services Unit is focusing on this and let me say they monitor all the cases at the various police stations. They also conduct talks, meetings with community entities and they go out with my Reaching

Out team to address various community fora on this issue. It is a debatable issue if another dedicated entity will assist that, we can talk about that.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON:

Mr R T OLIVIER: MEC, I hear your response. Do you think that the police having listened to numerous occasions when we raise issues that they are understaffed, you need special units and so on, do you think that they are resourced enough to be able to deal with these issues? Do you think that dedicated office is enough and do you or don't you think that this Children's Commission would also assist?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: A very important question, Chair. I will take it up with SAPS. I called a very high level meeting with the prosecuting authority, with the courts management and also with other important interested parties, including the police and Correctional Services as well. These entities did confirm that they will be at a meeting that my office has organised and I will definitely pose ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, please. Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that question to that important meeting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order. Order, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No more follow-up questions? We move on to question - okay sorry ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are two minutes left according to my calculation. Which question are we now on? The next question would be Question number 5. Hon Madikizela.

*Heinz Park: houses built by the Nial Millon Foundation*

**5. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

With reference to houses built by the Nial Millon Foundation in Heinz Park:

- (1) Whether he has been in contact with the foundation to secure title deeds; if so, when can the people of Heinz Park expect to receive their title deeds;
- (2) whether his Department will be installing ramps to the houses to provide easy access for disabled residents; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (3) how long is the housing list in Mitchells Plain and what criteria are

used to prioritise the provision of housing to residents?

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. After the inception of the housing subsidy regime the Department serviced large tracts of land in Heinz Park via the Integrated Serviced Land Project or ISLP. In an attempt to empower emerging contractors, the Department made small parcels of land available to emerging contractors to construct the housing subsidy beneficiary approved units. However there are no records because the question is asking about Nial Millon. There are no records that exist that the Nial Millon Foundation was involved in a subsidised housing project in Heinz Park.

The second part of the question with regard to the issuing of title deeds: Phase 1 was undertaken by the Department and is 100% complete. Phases 2 and 3 were undertaken by the City of Cape Town and are 85% complete in terms of title deeds issued. The ones that have not been issued are problem cases where you find that beneficiaries are deceased and houses are occupied by illegal occupants, etc. Now in an attempt to resolve these matters the Department is in the process of formulating guidelines that would assist municipalities to resolve them.

In the second part of the question, in general practice, a developer, if it is brought to their attention at the time of construction, will construct a dwelling with disability friendly furnishings, according to the relevant needs of the beneficiary prior to them taking occupation. But, the policy also makes

provision for dwellings to be adapted should the beneficiary or a member of his or her family become disabled subsequent to them having taken occupation. Now in such cases we expect the people to come forward and tell us so that can make necessary changes.

In terms of Mitchells Plain, which is the third part of the question, there are currently 17 940 applicants residing in Mitchells Plain on the Housing Demand Database. Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there no follow-up questions? Then it brings us to the end of Questions. The questions not dealt with will be printed in Hansard. We move to the next on the Order Paper, Questions to the Premier Without Notice and I see the hon member Christians first.

#### **QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:**

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Shockingly this morning I heard that young children, as young as six years old are consuming drugs and alcohol. I want to know from the Premier: the Western Cape Government's Green Paper on reducing Alcohol Harms is basically there to reduce the negative impact of alcohol in our society. Is this bearing fruit?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. It is a very important question, Mr Deputy Speaker. That is the one Game-Changer that we are really battling with. It is incredibly difficult for governments to change public behavior as

we all know from the history of our various attempts to do so in this country.

We have had to rethink the Alcohol Harms Reduction strategy very, very carefully. It hinges upon managing availability, enforcing the rule of law and creating alternative recreational activities for people other than consuming alcohol. But when it comes to six and seven year olds, again there is no way a government can police what is happening in people's homes. Parents have a responsibility and there is no way that a government can make sure that children are going to school in a proper condition at every point.

Yes, we must pick it up in the school and we do pick it up in the school and there have been cases that have come to me which I have been completely shocked about where children have to be put outside until they sober up before the start of school lessons. It is a very, very serious issue, the systemic abuse of alcohol and the extent to which it is, in some homes, considered a normal thing even for children to do.

So I am afraid that this is one of the Game-Changers that we have had to fundamentally rethink. We analysed some parts of that rethink at the Cabinet meeting this week but it is a very serious problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up? Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government is doing that but that there are municipalities in the Western Cape that are busy

extending trading hours and also typically on Sundays. So, it seems to me, there is a conflict between the municipalities and the Province. Is the Premier doing anything to resolve this contradiction?

The PREMIER: Trading hours are a constitutional power of municipalities and our framework can obviously guide people but we cannot infringe upon the powers of municipalities as I understand it. It is a very tricky issue, Mr Deputy Speaker, and hours of trade and availability are two major factors.

Ironically we cannot do that by banning access to alcohol. In fact, ironically, we have to have more legalised compliant outlets rather than the illegal and non-compliant outlets where we cannot enforce licenced conditions. So these are major challenges and I would very much like the hon member to give me details of municipalities that are moving in the opposite direction and perhaps through the inter-governmental relations framework mechanisms we can work that out.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Premier, the City of Cape Town has got 24 sub-councils. I just checked and 10 to 20 applications are received for extending of trading hours per sub-council meeting and there are 24 sub-councils and that is not even outside the Metropolitan. So, it is a major problem and 90% of those extended trading hours and Sunday trading hours are granted. I cannot see how that can help and something needs to be done. It even impacts

on going to work on Monday because people can now freely access alcohol on Sundays.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it that is a question? Thank you.

The PREMIER: I would like to thank the hon member Christians for drawing that to my attention and I will certainly follow it up. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. We move on to the next one. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Gary Fisher used to be the HOD. He was involved with Public Works dealing with properties, whatever [Inaudible.]. From there he also has an interest as a property developer because we know that he was a board member for the Capital Group, a private company, which was also involved with the Tafelberg sale, in terms of the school and other properties around.

HON MEMBERS: What is your question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: My question - I know you are all interested ... [Interjections.] My question is: looking at the revolving door that we have seen, a person moving from Public Works then goes and advises the Department of the Premier ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second, hon member Tyatyam. 1Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker with respect, we are really tolerant with regard to this. I mean the Rules are quite clear that a sentence or two to lead up and then ask the question is fine but he is going to half a page of motivation and meanderings and all that sort of stuff. Can we be a little bit more disciplined in this regard please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will certainly. Hon member Tyatyam you were on the point of getting to your question. The introduction was a little bit too long.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, I was getting there just ... [Interjections.] The question that one would want to understand, Mr Deputy Speaker, is: has the Department or our Provincial Government conducted an investigation to [Inaudible.] of conflict of interest in relation to allegations of him being involved in how the decision of selling the property of Tafelberg ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Is that a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure whether you phrased it as a question.

It sounds like a statement to me. Just ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No-no, it is a question. Has the Department conducted an investigation ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. That is clear.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is very clear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier, if you want to respond to that?

The PREMIER: Sorry. After all of that I still did not quite get the question. Has which Department instituted an investigation into what?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Tyatyam, do you want to give some clarity there? Very briefly.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No. Mr Deputy Speaker, we are asking the Department of the Premier, we are asking her as the Premier, so we would expect whatever the questions are, we are asking her, she must respond on her responsibility, what did she do?

An HON MEMBER: About what?

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I take it that that was the first follow-up question, because I answered the first question with a question. What I did do was, when Mr Gary Fisher came to work for me, I sought legal advice in terms of his job description and the parameters of the work he was doing and I am satisfied that it was in order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, your follow-up question, if you want to ask a follow-up?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. In light of the fact that Mr Fisher, who is your advisor, continued to be involved in other property development programs, what did you actually do to curtail him from getting involved in those, particularly Tafelberg? What did you do?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I think that is ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...because his company is involved there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Tyatyam. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Okay. I think the hon member Tyatyam is a little confused. Firstly, Mr Fisher is not my advisor. Secondly, when he was my advisor his role was ring-fenced only to the Conradie Better Living model.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we move onto the next one? Hon

... [Interjection.] I will allow you the opportunity to ask a second and a half question. The first one was ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, Chair ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... slightly confusing.

Mr S G TYATYAM: We know that he was involved only in the other projects, but Mr Deputy Speaker, there is no ways that a person who is involved in properties ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, get to your question? I have allowed you an opportunity to ask another question. [Interjection.] Order. Come to the question please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, the question is, what has the Premier done to make sure that his property company is not involved with the Tafelberg site?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... because he had all the information in any case.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier, if you want to respond to that?

The PREMIER: The answer is that I ring-fenced his role only to the Conradie

Hospital or that site in any event, and the Better Living Model and my information also is that he has no interest directly in the Tafelberg site at all. So, I am not quite sure what the hon member Tyatyam is getting at.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Premier. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. About a month ago the Premier announced the diversion of R3 million from a Western Cape Government Project towards the stabilisation units for gang affected Lavender Hill. What are the respective details of this funding and what are the expected outcomes?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. We were facing a very serious crisis in Lavender Hill. Some of the schools had closed and some teachers had been hospitalised for stress and there was continuous gang shooting in the streets outside and children were being put at very serious risk.

In fact, one of the few places they were safe in Lavender Hill was on the school premises, but coming to school and leaving school was a very serious risk for them and of course teachers feel personally responsible for the children while they are at school. So, it creates a very, very tense situation for teachers who battle to teach under those circumstances, understandably. So, it constituted a crisis for us.

We also know that last year we gave R2.5 million to R3 million to train stabilisation unit members, so that they would help us deal with the significant instability caused by gangs, particularly at that time in Manenberg. The stabilisation unit had a very good effect and a good impact and the problem diminished substantially.

We had a large number of people actively trained, as I understood it, to perform the stabilisation duties, but there was no budget in the City's Community Safety Department to actually put them on active duty. So, it seemed to us that if you we have trained people to do the work, but they are not doing the work, and they need the funds to be able to pay them to do the work, it felt worth taking money from an emergency contingency fund to make sure that would happen so that we could get schools functional, children back in safe conditions to schools and teachers out of that stress situation. So, that is what we did.

We also had a number of meetings with the community in Lavender Hill and with principals in Lavender Hill and from the messages that Minister Plato and I are getting, the interventions seem to be working well to calm the situation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Given that this is not the first time the Province has assisted to fund the stabilisation unit, going

forward, will this funding to the City Government be recurring?

The PREMIER: It is a very complex question, Mr Deputy Speaker. Our mandate is oversight of the national SAPS, the South African Police Services, but our function is also Education, and if we are in a situation where children are not getting educated, we have to do something about it.

I would obviously prefer it if the City's budget were used to deploy the Metro Police, but if for whatever reason that is not happening or that cannot happen, and children in a large area are not getting any schooling, we cannot allow that to continue in that way.

So, obviously this is not replicable over the long term and in all places and I think we also need to use the inter-governmental relations framework process to resolve it. We have had very, very good relations, both with the Metro Police on this matter and with the South African Police Services on this particular issue.

So, General Goss was mandated by the South African Police Services to help us with that and Director Roberts was mandated by the Metro Police to help us and they have worked very-very well under the oversight of Minister Plato and his Head of Department and General Jula to stabilise the situation and to get those children back in school. That was the first port of call, but hopefully we will be able to resolve adequate funding from the South African Police Service, because that is their primary job.

The City, actually, does not have this role as a core function, but the Western Cape Police are so understaffed that it is impossible for them to do that job adequately and so, if we want our other services to run, such as clinics and schools the City and ourselves sometimes have to step in.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question. Hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My question to the Premier is, who else besides her son, Paul Marais, is related to the hon Premier and is involved in the business known as Paper Video SA?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier.

The PREMIER: I do not know what that has got to do with my portfolio, but in fact as far as I know, my son is the only one. I know that his wife, who is an accounting teacher has made many videos for them, but she does not work for them. So there is only one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: And what assistance did Gretel Marais, wife of Paul Marais get from the hon Premier, her Department or Government to advance this business or her career?

The PREMIER: None that I know of, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie you have another opportunity. Your last chance.

Ms D GOPIE: Does the hon Premier have a brother or relative who directly or indirectly also works or has worked for the Provincial Government as a consultant for the so-called Job Fund?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier, if you want to respond to that?

The PREMIER: You know, Mr Deputy Speaker, family members of politicians are allowed to be involved in the economy, as long as they do it complying with all the rules and all the regulations and all the processes. My brother has worked for national government departments, very often. He has worked internationally, very often. He has never broken any rules. He is an expert economist and he works according to due process and the rule of law.

I have never ever interfered in any single process of this Government in terms of procurement and I never will. To try and paint my family as something like Duduzane Zuma is completely, completely incorrect.

Mr M G E WILEY: Bizarre.

The PREMIER: If people who are honourable and very good economists get

contracts or tenders or consultancies in a legal and compliant way, there is absolutely nothing wrong with it, especially if I have no role, which I never would, in influencing a tender process or a consultancy process.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on. The hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As we commemorate youth month over the June period and in light of Stats SA's recent revelation of a shocking national youth unemployment rate of 38.6%, can the Premier please advise how many youth benefit annually from the PAY Project?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, the PAY Project, it is called the Premier's Advancement of Youth Project, has been one of the great success stories of this Government. We take in about 700 young people per year, most of whom are unbelievably keen to do a good job of work and to get something on their CV that they have worked for a government department.

Over the years, since we have started this, I think just over 4 000 young people have been taken into this project in various ways. About 200 proved to be so good that we retained their services. They are working their way up through Government.

Another large number went on to tertiary studies in various ways or found

jobs elsewhere. So, this PAY Project has turned out to be a fantastic platform to launch the careers of young people with talents, who really want to make something of their lives.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon Premier. And in light of your response hon Premier, what would you say are the main benefits of the PAY Project and how does it contribute to youth employment in the Western Cape?

The PREMIER: Well, you know the big problem is when young people, for example, do not have money to go to university and do not have any experience ... [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: I cannot hear, sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Olivier, give the member a chance to speak so that Mr Mitchell can also pick up what the Premier says.

The PREMIER: So, Mr Deputy Speaker, when young people leave school and do not have the money or the means to go to university and do not have any job experience, this is a wonderful opportunity for them to get some job

experience; to learn what it is like to be in a work place; to learn the discipline of coming to work every morning and what it takes to work collegially with other people in an office environment and many of them save, even though they only get a stipend, quite a lot of money that enables them to study the following year or at least take a student loan with some collateral.

So, it has been a fantastic launching pad for these youngsters and I would love to be able to expand it, but hopefully the major job initiative by the private sector will be able to do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are we then done with that? Then we move on to Statements by Members. I see the hon member Schäfer.

#### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It has been nearly 10 years since the Democratic Alliance came into government in the Western Cape. We won an outright majority with just under 52% of the votes in 2009, increasing this share to just under 60% in 2014. Judging from the voice of the people in our province, it is clear that more and more voters are turning to the DA for clean, effective and corruption-free governance. One would think that the ANC, when faced with such dwindling numbers in the Western Cape, would make much more of an effort as our Province's official Opposition.

Instead, we see that the ANC's Western Cape branches are falling into shambles, with the dissolution of the party's formal structures in the City on the weekend and the internal bickering surrounding leadership, it is no wonder why the party has now had to call for an intervention by its national counterparts. But the infighting and political erosion of the ANC in our province is but merely a small-scale representation of what is taking place in the party as a whole – crony-led factions and greedy tenderpreneurs have long hijacked the ANC for their own personal gain.

In a recent analysis of the ANC's policy discussion this past weekend, the policy document is said to, and I quote: "point to a party in panic about losing power".

As the DA continues to grow in our province, and in the country, the ANC continues to decline. Soon, the colours of green, black and gold will be nothing more than a fading flicker on the backbench of our Legislature. The ANC always brands itself as a political organisation and a revolutionary movement, but the party has become far too accustomed to power, so much so that it still lives in apartheid era delusions of grandeur. We see this each and every day in Zuma's ANC, and we continue to see it in the ANC's continual failure as an opposition party in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. This Legislature must

note that Western Cape Premier Helen Zille ...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hey, you are very obsessed with her.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... is now a free agent as the DA cut her loose from serious decision making bodies. This is a hot air balloon drifting into the sunset.

It all went wrong with her tweets that not all things under colonialism were bad. In fact, the Premier is no longer welcome in the top of her party or in the Western Cape. She is merely kept like a bird in a cage. She is now seen by many as a lame duck Premier. She must just hang on for the rest of her term to get the perks, payment, pension and personnel, something she loves dearly and lives for. Hence she refused to lead the DA Caucus at the National Assembly and came here for better remuneration and power and for patronage.

Cape Town has a clean audit, but not enough water due to bad management. Just recently we saw the no-show Cape Town Mayor, Patricia De Lille and Premier Helen Zille, when South Africa's Public Protector, Busisiwe Mkhwebane called them to Masiphumelele to look into the filth people live in.

Both institutions brag about clean audits, but cannot provide an acceptable

clean living environment for people who stay in Masiphumelele. The DA does not care about the poor and ordinary people's lives and living conditions, hence their artificial growth is going to go down and they will lose even this Western Cape. The DA is a party of contradictions and double standards. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA. Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I wonder whether the members on the other side do not have some sort of an effigy complex with regard to the Premier. They just go on and on and on. And so let us rather ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And so let us rather talk about something really serious. The continuous destruction of the public transport system is getting out of hand. Since January 2017 no less than 28 coaches have been set alight by angry commuters in our province. Metrorail unfortunately only has 58 train sets. In order for the service to run efficiently without train delays requires 84 train sets all in all.

As violent protests continue to target key infrastructure in our country and province, this suggests that many people clearly do not feel like they are being listened to. This has inevitably played out in people being violent and

destructive and behaving in an unacceptable manner, because they feel they have nothing to lose, but they do. They have both their jobs and their family lives to lose.

Another concern is the very nature of these violent protests. Just the other day a MyCiti bus was torched while passengers were left to scramble for their lives. This is clearly an indicator that these protestors have a total disregard for other people's lives. This must be stopped and those guilty must be caught and prosecuted for their actions.

Ultimately torching trains and buses only makes our public transport system worse than before. We urge all those who have information with regard to the destruction of public transport infrastructure to speak out, as those who randomly destroy our public transport infrastructure are depriving law-abiding residents of their right to affordable, accessible and safe public transport to get to work and back home again.

Unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker, as you know people are having to wait. Earlier this week they cancelled over 20 trains on one line in one morning. That is no way for an economy to grow, nor people to be able to get to their legitimate work. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The EFF is absent. I see the DA again.  
Hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. 16 June, Youth Day, was widely celebrated by all South Africans as the Youth's praises were sung. However, at the end of Youth Month, I fear that after this month business will simply continue as usual.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we continue to hear vivid stories and incidents of crime in the media on a day to day basis; substance abuse amongst the youth remains a major area of concern and we sit with a youth unemployment rate of well over 50%.

It breaks my heart that after two decades of democracy and ANC rule, the future continues to look bleak. The reality for young South Africans is that they will continue to be marginalised from being active participants in South Africa's economy and let me dare to say, the youth are the invisibles. They exist, but they do not live.

Mr Deputy Speaker, over more recent years, National Government has been shouting the importance of entrepreneurial development and has urged the youth to become job creators and not job seekers.

It is becoming more and more evident that this has been highlighted by the ANC Government as a means to completely push the responsibility of job creation onto the youth instead of National Government, seeking to create an environment more conducive to more employment opportunities for young people.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, how does National Government simply expect the youth to create something out of nothing? Consequently the National Government is creating its own future monsters. We are sitting on a time bomb – waiting to explode. Eish! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: I think it is “ys”. Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA Government is quick to tell us it wants evidence of arbitrary farm evictions, but the DA is very quiet on the latest such evil deed. Is it because the owner of that Kruisrivier farm is one Jacobus Marthinus Geyser Bekker. He is also known as Jac Bekker in the Little Karoo and Southern Cape where he is a prominent DA leader and public representative.

†Me P MAKELENI: Skande!

[Ms P MAKELENI: Disgrace!]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, the DA leaders are actively involved in kicking vulnerable people off farms. The DA does not care for poor farm workers and ordinary workers. It only side with the bosses. In this case of Calitzdorp pensioner, Martha Pretorius, 66 years old, was told to go, after she had lived on that farm for 55 years and spent most of it in service of the land owner. Her parents also worked for the Bekker family and are buried on that farm.

She started a damages and illegal eviction claims process for compensation in

the Magistrate's Court under the Extension of Security of Tenure Act. She has also laid a charge against the land owners with the South African Human Rights Commission.

Just last week another cruel eviction started in the Drakenstein area. Where will all this madness end?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, let us be clear. The fact that 80% of our municipalities, or 24 out of the 30, for those who might be mathematically challenged, received clean audits is certainly not by default. Since 2009 when the DA under the leadership of our Premier Helen Zille came into power, this Province has gone from strength to strength.

Mr Deputy Speaker, to think in 2009 when we took over from the ANC, the Western Cape did not have a single clean audit. This is just indicative of the ANC's inability to govern. As the DA, we know how to govern and not only govern, but do it without any corruption.

What we are seeing here is that we have a government in place that has been working extremely hard and smart to achieve all of these successes. What pleases me most however is that the DA-led Government is still pursuing more success, because it seeks to ensure that each resident receives a fair opportunity to improve their lives.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it also highlights the importance of having capable, qualified and experienced politicians and staff ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order.

Mr L H MAX: ... visionary and people orientated politicians ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Max, just one second. Hon member Olivier, you have just had your opportunity. You cannot continue. Please continue hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, it also highlights the importance of having capable, qualified and experienced staff and visionary politicians, who are people orientated to be at the forefront of taking this province, and soon the country, forward.

I must pay homage to our Premier Helen Zille, because she laid the foundation, set the path, navigated the Western Cape DA-led Government and this is why we are rapidly moving in the right direction. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr L H MAX: The saying goes, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Just finish off.

Mr L H MAX: The saying goes, Mr Deputy Speaker: An army of deer led by a lion is more to be feared than an army of lions led by a deer. Our Premier Helen Zille, our lioness, lead the Western Cape! [Applause.]

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Before we – order! Order! I want order! Please come to order before the hon member Christians starts. The ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, sadly again just two days ago a foetus was found in a dustbin by a cleaner in Voortrekker Road, Bellville. Yet again, yesterday a foetus was found in Emfuleni.

The question today is, which programs are in place by the Health Department to educate and assist our young girls when it comes to abortions and illegal abortions?

News24 reported approximately 300 illegal abortions take place annually in our back streets. It is also reported the equipment some of these abortionists

use are knitting needles, spoons and dish washing liquid.

Mr Deputy Speaker, many of those who do not use accurate equipment do not survive. So, my plea is that our Health Department and our Minister will look at what are the programs in place to educate our young girls. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. It is now the ANC's opportunity to talk.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. What happened yesterday at SCOPA during the continued political witch hunt and vindictive agenda by Chief Whip Mark Wiley and the DA caucus against two members of the ANC, cannot be left uncontested.

As is the norm, the AG gave a clear and concise explanation of the reason for the Performance Audit conducted for the period June 2010 to September 2012, and the report was tabled between October 2013 and February 2014.

Having just completed a national audit on infrastructure, they chose two departments that use mostly consultants to implement infrastructure projects namely Health and Transport and Public Works. They also explained the difference between a performance audit and the scope of the audit and that of a regular annual financial audit, but most importantly whether value for money was realised after the use of the consultants over the period in question.

In spite of the Department of Transport and Public Works, also Health officials giving clear and concise responses as to their corrective measures put in place, explaining financial terms and convincingly explaining that there was nothing untoward committed by the ANC MEC's at the time, or the consultants used, the DA still continued to push for a summoning of the two ANC MEC's.

The DA even went as far as putting out a press statement with ludicrous allegations to summons the two members before the Committee had even deliberated on the issue and/or taken a final decision. This is totally unheard of that a party can summons an MEC to appear before it, especially if no proof exists of any corrupt activities implemented by the two members as they were not audited.

Even though the performance audit which addresses management issues clearly proved that no MEC at any stage approved, condoned or signed off on consultants, the DA persists in wanting to punish only two ex-ANC MEC's with trumped up offences.

As the ANC we strongly condemn these vindictive actions of the DA and the continued personal vendetta of the Chief Whip, which just sours the work of this Legislature instead of playing ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... their oversight role over the own MEC's and departments who are not performing. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. The DA. Hon Matlhodi.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The continued handing over of title deeds to qualifying residents of the Western Cape must be a priority. The Department has prioritised R47 million for title deeds, so that 56 000 houses can be transferred in the current financial year.

My question however, Mr Deputy Speaker, is how do we expect to redress the past if the handing over of the title deeds is not fast tracked? This is not impossible to achieve. In fact, when the Department hands a house or land over to a resident, it should be accompanied by the title deed. Our residents should not have to wait for the title deed, because it represents the direct transfer of land and wealth.

By handing over the title deed we are giving our people a sense of belonging. We are restoring their dignity. It also allows them to enter the economic mainstream. Furthermore, it serves as a reminder that they now own something that no-one can take away from them.

We cannot talk about redress if the handing over of title deeds is not a priority. The long wait for residents to get their title deeds must be

addressed.

I therefore call on the hon Minister Madikizela to ensure that the municipalities immediately and urgently fast track the handover processes. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of member statements. We now move to Motions. Are there any Motions where Notice is given? I see the hon Schäfer again.

#### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the Fourth Industrial Revolution on job creation in the Western Cape

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any more? Hon member Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the risk of gentrification on the heritage of

historic sites in the province, like the coveted Bo-Kaap.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the need for a commission of inquiry into child killings in the province.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the damage caused by the recent storms and fires to 172 schools in the Western Cape and the Reconstruction Plan of the WCED, while taking cognisance of budget constraints.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the equitable share of the national budget not being distributed equitably to South Africa's provinces.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the sanitation crisis in schools around the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Are there any more? Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of early childhood development organisations on our communities as funded by the Government.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of meritocracy in the public sector and its benefit on good governance.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Gopie do you want to move? Not? Hon member Olivier? I saw somebody there. Hon member Olivier? Not? Okay, Hon member Mackenzie, I see you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of corruption on job creation.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? Again hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the measures the Western Cape Government has introduced to curb unemployment versus the National Government. I thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any further? Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of unfunded mandates on provinces and municipalities.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there anymore? If not, we then proceed to Motions Without Notice. Hon member Gopie?

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the initiation season has kicked in; wishes the boys who will be going through this rite of passage well; and calls on

the Western Cape Government to stop undermining this important tradition of the AmaXhosa. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself – is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the criminal attacks on truck drivers passing through Beaufort West. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? Is there an objection?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Skwa – Tyatyam. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I stopped in time. [Laughter.] You may proceed.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the regrettable involvement of Wesgro in cheap politics; reminds the entity that it is only an investment arm of the Government and therefore does not need to be involved in petty party politics in newspapers; and calls on the relevant authorities to ensure that this is not repeated.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Olivier first.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern that violent protests broke out in Joe Slovo near Milnerton which were partly perpetuated by Provincial Government's unwillingness to consult meaningfully with residents in poor townships; and notes further that the protest that started on Sunday after the Western Cape Education Department removed the mobile classrooms that were used by Khozi Primary School and evicted protesting residents who occupied the land; condemns the torching and vandalism of property and calls on the Western Cape Government to

come up with meaningful strategies to engage with communities to prevent the recurrence of such violent protests.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Simmers?

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Griqua National Conference that will be celebrating their 113th year of establishment on 2 July. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Cape Town-born, South African trail runner, Ryan Sandes, on coming first in the Western States 100 mile race, that took place in California last weekend, in a time of 16 hours

and 19 minutes. This is an outstanding achievement as the race is considered one of the most challenging trail races in the world. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Dijana?

Mr T M DIJANA: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the police for their brilliant work in fighting crime in the province, after the arrest of three men in the biggest drug haul in which 253 boxes of cocaine worth an estimated value of R500 million were confiscated in the Overberg village of Villiersdorp. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Mitchell?

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Dankie. Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder

kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betuig met die familie, vriende, oudleerders en breë gemeenskap van Beaufort-Wes met die heengaan van mnr Nikolaas Roman. Mnr Roman het 'n lewenslange bydrae tot Bastiaanse Hoërskool gemaak, eers as leerder, toe as onderwyser en gedurende 1995 tot 2010 het hy as skoolhoof gedien. Mnr Roman sal onthou word vir sy onbaatsugtige diens aan die breë gemeenskap van Beaufort-Wes asook elke leerder wat deur sy hande gegaan het. Mag sy siel in vrede rus.

*[Voorstel soos deur Lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie? Goedgekeur. Agb Max.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences with the family, friends, ex-learners and wider community of Beaufort West on the death of Mr Nikolaas Roman. Mr Roman had made a life-long contribution to Bastiaanse High School, first as a learner, then as teacher and during 1995 to 2010 he served as school principal. Mr Roman will be

remembered for his unselfish service to the wider community of Beaufort West, as well as every learner that had passed through his tutorship. May his soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? Any objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Max?]

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Wayde van Niekerk for breaking the world 300 m record at the recent Golden Spike meeting in Ostrava in the Czech Republic. This 17-year old record belonged to the legendary American athlete Michael Johnson; Van Niekerk, who also broke Johnson's 400 m world record with a time of 43.3 seconds at last year's Rio Olympics, shaved four hundredths of a second off Johnson's mark as he stopped the clock at 30.81 seconds. He is the first man to run a sub-10 second 100 m, a sub-20 second 200 m, a sub-44 second 400 m and now a sub-31 second 300 m. Wayde should be continually hailed for his phenomenal achievements.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates soccer player, Chad Block, aged 14 years old, from Hanover Park who has been selected by the South African Schools' Football Association and they will later this year go to Thailand to participate in the 2017 Thailand International Competition. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that about 400 learners at the Khozi Primary School did not receive formal education this year as the Western Cape Education Department declared their school illegal; notes that further while the Department could have placed them at another school in the area, it waited until late this week to place them and calls on the South African Human Rights Commission to investigate whether

the rights of these learners were not infringed upon. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Was the school legal?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection to that motion being moved without notice. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the principal and the whole community of the newly established collaboration school, Zwelethemba High School in Worcester; who after visiting the school was highly commended by Education Minister Debbie Schäfer for showing a vast improvement and a good performance after only a few months of being in existence. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the scare of swine flu and the adenovirus in the City; and calls on the Provincial Government to take steps urgently to ensure that all the necessary measures are in place to prevent its spread.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Are there any further? Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and wishes all the best to the Under 13, Under 16 and Under 18 Academy and Under 18 senior Craven Week teams that will be participating in the annual Craven Week Tournament during the July School holidays. Much is expected from the Under 18 senior Craven Week team seeing that they are the defending champions of the 23rd edition of this tournament that will be taking place at St Stithians College in Johannesburg from 17 to 22 July. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon

member Dijana?

Mr T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes Minister Nomvula Mokonyane's decision to end the term of office of the Overberg Water Board with immediate effect following a probe which found alleged financial irregularities. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the principal of Silverstream Primary School in Manenberg, Ms V I Ward, as well as the whole school community who, despite being located in an area that is rife with social pathologies and ills, still managed through good management to excel beyond expectations. This has been evident to the Standing Committee on Education oversight visit to the school on Tuesday 27 June 2017. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Makeleni first.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the suspension of Ronelle Prins (30) from Strandfontein, a dispatch clerk at Pinnacle, because her bosses thought her shoulder-length curls were not professional enough; and notes further that racism in the Western Cape will never end and calls on relevant authorities to intervene urgently.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the acts of criminality and the burning of a MyCiti bus on Tuesday in Du Noon and a community hall in Phoenix, Milnerton; further calls on the City of Cape Town and all available stakeholders and law enforcement agencies to stop at nothing to bring the perpetrators to account.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Ms P MAKELENI: Stop at nothing? [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved – is there an objection?

HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? For the last time, are there any further? Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the ANC yesterday, for the second time in a few days, was victorious in the West Rand local municipality of Mogale City which beat the DA and EFF coalition which were yesterday rejected; further notes that the ANC warned the municipality leadership election and congratulates the ANC for its continuous victory.  
[Applause.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there – order. Are there any objections to the

motion? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Order.  
Are there any further? Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the R22,2 million that will be spent over the next four years on the construction of the new Metro South-East Cemetery in Mfuleni and extending existing cemeteries. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. You have another one, hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: This is the last one, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes, acknowledges and celebrates the water-saving efforts of the 46-year-old Khayelitsha resident, Mthuthuzeli Zebukwane. and his household, have since 2013 used grey water from their baths and dish washing to manually flush their toilet system. This man and his family are the epitome of active citizenry and an example to all of us, and one that we ought to follow and appreciate. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. For the last time, are there any more? If not, then that brings us to the end of Motions Without Notice.

Before we adjourn, can I just remind members that the CPA AGM will not take place now, as we indicated initially, it will be rescheduled at a future date. That brings us to the adjournment. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:02.