

---

TUESDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2016

---

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon members. Good afternoon to our guests in the gallery. Before we proceed I would just like to remind you about the sensitivity of the mikes. It does pose a problem and it can be quite an interference if there is any additional chirping on the sidelines and if you could please keep your phones on silent it would be appreciated. Even vibrate tends to interfere with the system. So I would like to proceed with the business of the day and I will ask the Secretary to read the first Order of the Day.

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The SECRETARY: Consideration of principle of *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B5 – 2016]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the honourable the Minister, Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Honourable Madam Speaker, Mr Deputy Speaker, honourable Premier and Cabinet colleagues, hon Leader of the Official Opposition, hon members of the WCPP, officials of the Western Cape Government, ladies and gentlemen. Thank you for the opportunity to introduce the second reading of the 2016 Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure in this House. At the outset I would like to congratulate my colleague, Minister Meyer, on his clear, constructive presentation of this matter last Thursday and to thank him for his firm management of the finances of the Western Cape.

As the various provinces have unpacked their own adjusted estimates over the last week or so it has been instructive to read the recurring sober theme of poor economic times, significant cuts to provincial funding by the National Government and consequent threats to service delivery performed by the provinces and their municipalities. By contrast, the media reports that the Premier of the North West Province was investigating the purchase of a jet for his and other Cabinet members' use came as a bit of a shock and was roundly criticised by many observers. Clearly the example set by the Presidency was being taken seriously at least by one Premier!

South Africans as people and as a nation have shown themselves able to survive and build through difficult and dangerous times. Perhaps that is why it has become a requirement for South Africans of all ages and backgrounds

to have tucked away in their survival kit a good sense of humour.

How else do we come close to dealing with the Prophet of Doom and Hlaudi Motsoeneng's claim that as Jesus Christ was sent to save the people, he is here to save South Africa and both in the same week? At one level, it is funny; at another extremely dangerous.

Our economy, too, has shown its resilience over many years. It managed to stumble through the economic fantasies of apartheid including skewed priorities, distorted education and suppressed employment and labour practices.

It has recovered from cycles of drought and other weather induced setbacks as well as the impact of fluctuating commodity prices, including the so-called precious metals upon which the country's economy was too dependent for too many years and the production of which resulted in so many social evils. But even this tough economy and the strength of the South African people who live in it and with it have wavered under the combined impact of the financial crash of 2008, the resultant uncertainty and the loss of trust in traditional financial instruments. The impact of the reduction in world trade and the fall of commodity demand and prices was always going to be severe on an economy such as ours and we have certainly felt its effects.

In his speech of last week Minister Meyer also set out a range of international events which have aggravated the overall economic uncertainty

and have not helped the situation – from David Cameron’s lack of political judgment which resulted in the Brexit vote and a change of leadership in the UK to the emergence of Donald Trump as the President-elect of the United States of America.

However, as resilient as our economy has traditionally been, it has been dealt body blows by a series of local, largely politically driven, events. I will not dwell on these in any detail, but it is necessary that I remind this House of what some of these were, as follows:

- The R500 billion game of musical chairs played by the President with the position of Minister of Finance
- Secondly the ill-conceived changes to visa requirements which significantly damaged the tourist industry [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are still there!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thirdly, the striking of unaffordable remuneration agreements in government service.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Fourth, the threatened prosecution of the Minister of Finance... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I was wondering when they were going to wake up, Madam Speaker. Fifth, the ongoing horror stories about many State owned enterprises and other State entities including SAA, Prasa, Eskom, Transnet and the Post Office. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The mismanagement, fraud, cronyism and leakages of State funds and accusations of fraud have reached farcical proportions. The fact that many of these entities are meant to provide the underpinnings of our economy simply makes the situation more dangerous as instead of bolstering our economy they have simply sucked up large chunks of the fiscus, so large that I wonder if we will ever know how much.

Needless to say, the uncertainty arising from the events of Saturday to Monday at the St George's Hotel near Pretoria are hardly designed to bring confidence to South Africans as a whole... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...the economy and the international community - as much as a constructively managed change in

political leadership would be a step in the right direction.

An HON MEMBER: For whom; for you?

The SPEAKER: Order, please members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: To make matters worse, Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry Minister, if you could take your seat for just a minute. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, that is clearly irrelevant... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi I will rule on relevance, but can I please ask while there is a speaker on the floor, interjections are allowed but you cannot heckle to drown out the speaker so I am requesting your cooperation. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Davids.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: To make matters

worse, these events have dominated the debate and distracted National Government, government departments and government agencies from addressing the underlying problems of jobs, trade and economic growth.

How can the Minister of Finance keep his eye on the ball when he is served with a summons in the midst of finalising a national budget? The naiveté or malice or sheer incompetence is simply breathtaking. [Interjections.]

Some failures pass without a trace and leave no evidence. A failed economy in a developing country leaves many traceable fossils, decaying infrastructure, unemployed citizens, corrupted systems and the loss of faith and confidence. [Interjection.]

Here in the Western Cape under the astute leadership of the Premier, Helen Zille, Cabinet has kept focus and developed solutions to the economic challenges. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We have built schools, hospitals and clinics. We have maintained and expanded our road network.

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Well done!]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: At the entrepreneurial level alone 50 000 jobs have been created. We have tackled the problem of the imbalance created between Government employment and service delivery by introducing cost of employment upper limits and sticking to them. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The impact of the drought in parts of the province remains a concern. Funds have been made available for water security and for related water shortage challenges. Given the importance of agriculture to the economy of the Western Cape and to the lives of many of our citizens we have not limited ourselves to financial support but have ensured that the Western Cape has been proactive in launching the Western Cape Climate Change Response Framework. We want to be in a position to handle all climate change issues better in future years. [Interjections.]

It is a truism that the household or business or government which manages its finances prudently even in the good times will be better able to cope with economically difficult times. The Western Cape is a shining example of this truism. Our audit record speaks for itself about transparent financial management, having workable plans and setting and meeting targets. [Interjections.] This Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure is indeed about hard truths and hard

policy choices.

It was Abraham Lincoln who said: “Be sure you put your feet in the right place; then stand firm.”

The Western Cape Government believes it has its feet in the right place and intends to stand firm.

I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi-mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good! ]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker and hon members... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member Ms Beerwinkel, before you begin, may I just if you could - hon member Mr Olivier, I will take my cue from you, but will you allow your member to speak please. Thank you. You may proceed hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: May I have my time back, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You have your time.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Madam Speaker and hon members of this House, if anybody were to look into the heads of this Cabinet, what will they see? They will see a utopia of their own creation that jobs are created, schools and houses are being built, a health system that works, and that people are happy. In other words, in their heads there is no reason for complaint in the Western Cape, but now, what would you see if you looked in the heads of someone from Khayelitsha or Atlantis or some rural area? That is when the hard truths of the real Western Cape are revealed. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not want to go there.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They would show growing joblessness.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Vreet hulle!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Chew them!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Inhumane sanitation, growing waiting lists for houses and schools. In essence what we will see in their heads is a Grand Canyon of inequality.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, it is commonly known that Cape Town is one of the most unequal world cities and that is a hard truth. What is in the Cabinet's heads are self-created truths away from the harsh realities just down the road. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell them.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: On your doorstep in your own back yard are atrocious living conditions that might not be able to be eradicated in a flash, but own up to it. Accept those hard truths that all is not perfect in the Western Cape.

Now before you compare yourself to other provinces or blame national as the scapegoat for your lack of delivery let us stick to the hard truths in this province. By the way hon Speaker, I hope that when Minister Gordhan addresses Cabinet that some of these MECs will be honest enough to tell him how they discredit national and speak disparagingly in tones and terms of their policies... [Interjections.] ...but still staying right here at home and with more hard truths.

This DA cannot be proud that on your watch the average of 70% of staff upper levels are still white and male. You have three out of fourteen departments with female HODs. The official public face of this province is by no means reflected in this staff complement and people outside have no hope of ever seeing themselves in these positions. The widening gap of

inequality, the unemployment rate of about 20% of six million people in this province, about one million, that are actively seeking but not finding a job; the lack of basic services, simple things like refuse removal, enough facilities for sanitation in a safe environment, transport that is safe and reliable, access to information and where to get it, those are the harsh, hard truths that you cannot just wish away. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Even harsher in the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Another harsh truth is that the poor remain disenfranchised. They still have no prospect of acquiring the financial means to access the opportunities in this province in spite of your supposed open opportunity society policy. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh that is a dream. †Dis 'n nagmerrie. [Tussenwerpsels.]  
[It is a nightmare. [Interjections.]]

An HON MEMBER: Order please hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What are the harsh truths about schools and education in this province and the horror stories that are coming out of late? [Interjections.] And yes, they are still part of the unitary state of South Africa, not a federal state of the Western Cape. [Interjections.] You see, this DA secessionist attitude and their belief that they are able to override national laws and the Constitution as and when it suits them by introducing

amendments to the current Western Cape Provincial Schools Education Act, to sell liquor at schools, instead of amending laws to facilitate multi-stream or career-specific learning. This will give learners an opportunity to gain skills necessary to make this economy grow.

An HON MEMBER: Can you workshop... [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This could very well stem the dropout rate. What are the hard truths on the roads? Safety and traffic management is at an all time low and traffic officials have now become glorified debt collectors or photographers behind trees.

An HON MEMBER: Oh my word! [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yet we experience such atrocious behaviour by taxis and irate motorists and all of them get away with it. Why? Because they can, due to ineffective traffic enforcement and the lack of will to make the necessary traffic personnel appointments. Ask your own Chairperson, hon member Mr Max, he will tell you. [Interjections.]

Let us not forget the hard truths prevailing in our hospitals. Service at some hospitals is just shockingly poor and conditions are sub-human. [Interjections.] Staff have bad attitudes. The elderly and sick are treated without compassion and because they are desperate they grin and bear it.

The SPEAKER: Order, please members! There is too much going on.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The soft truth is that I know that the MEC will deal with these incidents when she is informed of them. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: O hete!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, my goodness!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, let us continue with some hard truths closer to home, right here within Parliament. We are all aware of the need for austerity measures, but what do you do when those very measures take its toll on the already overworked staff who have to take on more responsibilities with not even a small allowance as remuneration. For instance staff in the IT Department have left. Their posts are not being filled under the guise of savings. Systems are down. E-mails disappear, and IT staff are running up and down because they now have to upskill themselves and try to fix a plane while it is in flight. The result is that the quality of support to members to execute our core function, which is oversight and service delivery has suffered dramatically in the last few months.

Yet, despite the supposed austerity measures you still deemed it necessary to plan an oversight trip with support staff, so the uncomfortable truth is where is the austerity measure in that? So at the risk of repeating myself, Parliament will again get a clean audit, because the budget is spent and you have ticked the compliance boxes. That is a soft truth.

The hard truth is public participation as a priority spend and a constitutional obligation is non-existent. Yet this is critical to ensure an involved citizenry.

Another self-created truth that lives in the heads of this Cabinet and those that live in the Camps Bays and the Constantias and the Bishop's Courts is that the rural poor do not exist. Their privilege blinds them from the Western Cape reality.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis baie seer! Repeat!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It hurts a lot! Repeat!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: You speak about integrated service delivery through partnerships and spatial alignment but the hard truth is that farmworkers in this province still like slaves have to bear the brunt of beatings of cruel farmers. How can it be that in a DA-run province with all of your liberal policies and supposed Game-Changers there are still farmers who beat workers to death, bury them in shallow graves, beat them up and pay them R400.00 to shut them up, set dogs on workers and enjoy watching them squirm in fear just for fun. Isolated incidences, you might say, but the hard truth is it happens more than you want to admit.

The majority of people living in the rural Western Cape live a hard life under your watch. That is rural, but closer to home, just here in Bromwell Street fellow Capetonians are threatened with removal all in the name of commercial development. So is this Cabinet on the same page as the DA-led

City Council? [Interjections.]

Where is the social compact and humanity when you decide to uproot people's lives? Then there is this issue of Tafelberg site. A soft truth is that you converted a harsh truth of the lack of integrated spatial development into a reality. [Interjections.] But the hard truth is that the community pressure forced you to capitulate into this decision. [Interjections.]

Another hard truth, the tourism sector remains the pet sector of the rich and the connected. At the same time jobs are only held by the under-skilled or semi-skilled who never become equity owners or have an empowering stake in the industry as a whole. These are but a few of the hard truths out there.

What are some of the half truths? The half truth is that your seven Game-Changers look noble on paper, but without political will to accept that you cannot be everything to everyone and that good governance needs people to implement it, the hard truth is that those Game-Changers will remain rhetoric, a beautiful buzz word, and the hard truth is that they will remain toothless policies. [Interjections.]

The harsh truth and reality is that this Western Cape will remain and unless until there is a political will and honest Government to address these hard truths, if not these Game-Changers will remain stillborn.

I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Christians. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dyantyi, I have the member down for two minutes. You may proceed hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: It does seem as if hon member Mr Dyantyi is practicing to be the Speaker so we will... [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the ACDP supports the adjustment estimates under this political climate and economic pressures; I think the Minister and the Departments did well to shift the adjustment and thank God that we have - we can shift the adjustments to push it where it is needed, so the important thing for me is when I looked at this budget you are looking at a couple of things and for my two minutes I can only say a couple of things, but important thing is that you want job creation and I saw the other day when the Minister spoke and I read it, that 50 000 jobs were created under this entrepreneurship. So that is positive growth. That is what we need in the economy. So that is what we must applaud.

The important thing is e-Learning, broadband and those are the things that we want to give to the most vulnerable, the most poor so that they can better their lives, better their education and contribute to this economy when they grow up. So I am pleased, people know that I like the MOD Centres, the youth cafés, the extension of the youth cafés, we support that, because the community where I come from our youth... [Interjections.] Our youth are also, our youth... [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, can you just speak to this person, speaking to me all the time while I am speaking? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I cannot speak because he speaks to me while I am speaking.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Makeleni, I get a sense you need to face... [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: She is speaking to me while I am presenting my speech.

The SPEAKER: You cannot engage the hon member while he is on the floor speaking. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] ... what is going on there... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Makeleni, hon member Mr Olivier, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr R T OLIVIER: On a point of order, Madam Speaker, is it parliamentary for hon member Mr Christians to refer to honourable as “this person”?

The SPEAKER: Your point is taken, it is important that we recognise and address each other as honourable. However, in this instance it seemed as if the hon member Ms Makeleni was right in his personal space and he needed to alert me to a problem that... [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Makeleni! You may proceed. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, another important thing for me is - and I sit on the committee - the Police Ombudsman that investigates complaints. Now I do not know where these members come from but the communities where I come from we need an Ombudsman. We need people that do not have resources to go to an Ombudsman and report them. So the important thing that I also want to say is in 2015/2016 budget the irregular expenditure came down from R125 million to... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians please finish up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...to R27 million.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So you must applaud people when they do good.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon member Mr Christians, thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But I never speak two minutes, I was interrupted more than two minutes. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Christians, take your seat. Sorry, if I may address you, when there is an interruption, the clock is stopped, so we do not allow the clock to run. Two minutes are short, but thank you.

I now see the following speaker and I see the hon Minister, Minister Mbombo. [Interjections.] Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Listen carefully, hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Madam Speaker, †Mam‘uSpeaker, amalungu abakekileyo asePalamente. [Madam Speaker, hon members of the House], Hon members of the House, media and everybody who is here, †molweni [good morning].

Today is one of the important days in the budgeting process, which is the

second reading, and I get excited as a member of the Executive and also as a public servant to come and account in this Parliament and also to the people who voted for us. It is very crucial that every cent in the public health must be accounted for.

At the beginning of this financial year the Western Cape Government set out to spend prudently and to the benefit of the people of the Western Cape. This is despite the dismal economic outlook which has threatened to bring the country to its knees. Financial constraints particularly in health are a matter of life and death. We certainly do not have the luxury of plundering money at the expense of the millions of people whom we serve. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Like the ANC does.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Auditor-General is here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The AG when she was speaking about the irregular expenditures specifically for the health R7.7 billion of irregular expenditure in health sector for the 2015/16.

Look at who are the biggest contributors: KZN Health Department, R2.5 billion; Mpumalanga Health Department, R1.9 billion; Northern Cape, R1 billion; Free State, R825 million. The Western Cape only 0.0.1% (zero

point zero point one percent) of the total budget.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Which is about R7 million and we are the only province that complied with the legislation... [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The only province! We are the only province that complied. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am not even here, I am not even there yet they are talking about their medical claims related to litigation where we know that the Eastern Cape is the most sued government department in the country; for having been sued this year R4.8 billion. Hon members, the issue of our economic climate... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ...and how this impacts on health, how this matter is not a political football.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mbombo, could you please take your seat. Members, we simply cannot engage in a debate across the floor and I am addressing both parties, whilst we have a speaker on the floor. I am requesting you to please cooperate and afford the Minister an opportunity to complete her presentation, please hon members. You may proceed hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. †Enkosi mam‘uSpeaker [Thank you, Madam Speaker]. Annually the Western Cape population increases while our equitable share reduces in real terms. The challenge of the quadruple burden of disease which has been influenced by the lifestyle choices is one of our challenges. In addition to this inevitable increasing reliance on the public health system due to our ailing economy, people who would normally make use of private healthcare no longer can because the economy is in a downward spiral and is shedding jobs more than we could create any. As if the situation is not dire enough, provinces have been shackled with a Public Wage Bill which has been on us, possibly the toughest fiscal constraints since the dawn of democracy. The country has to spend the money that it does not have. The cost of medical equipment and medical products is way over the South African price index. This means spreading resources which are already way too stretched for any public health system to function.

The fluctuating rand is doing little to mitigate these circumstances and being plunged from one national crisis into another, specifically by the President, is partially the reason we find ourselves in the situation we are in today and

talking about the national crisis, just this past week, we have seen the National Minister Dr Motsoaledi step-dancing in the face of difficult questions about the implementation and roll-out of National Health Insurance. While there are noble ideals being rapidly rolled out at a national level, little is actually done to truly improve the health outcomes and the quality of care in some of these areas.

It is reported for example that 89 out of 1426 health facilities are meeting the requirements needed for the effective implementation of the NHI as confirmed by the Office of the Health Standards. This is besides the concerns raised by the Western Cape about the affordability of the NHI as it is premised on economic growth projection of 3.5%. If you recall, when was the last time we have ever had the growth of more than 10% for example in South Africa, and if you are unable to get the economy growing rapidly and consistently the entire exercise has been nothing more than a dream and an election promise. Universal health coverage is an ideal that we support as the Western Cape Government and that is why we have continuously made inputs to improve not only the funding model but also the interventions, evidence based interventions which you might see are happening in Eden and also in addition to that to make sure that we represent the people of South Africa, South African citizens. It is only the Western Cape Province that serves in the National Task Teams of the NHI that have been set by the National Minister. Each and every task team there is a national, there is a provincial health person that is represented there. That is the only one.

Critical to any emerging economy is effective investment to healthcare and education and without these pillars of a capable state we will continue in this vein and for example if you look at the Western Cape in terms of the story for the twelfth consecutive year the Western Cape Health Department has achieved an unqualified audit, achieving the almost impossible. Not only that, we also became the very first health department in the country to obtain a clean finance audit.

†'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi! [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Well done, well done! [Applause.]]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: While these are impressive accolades, we certainly do not only benchmark the services we render based on audit outcomes. These are coupled with the health outcomes which have an impact.

You should have an impact †kumam'uNozamile, kutani Sara [Mama Nozamile and Aunty Sara] in all our communities. In the 2015/16 reporting for example we have experienced almost 14 patient contacts within our primary healthcare facilities and despite the challenges as hon member Ms Beerwinkel has alluded to in terms of the service pressures, still scored 84.1 % in terms of the client / patient surveys. In spite of that, so I am not sure probably whether it was reflecting on the state of the patients who died in Gauteng as a result of the poor transfers because that is the kind of... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mbombo, your time has expired. If you could

finish up please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So Madam Speaker, we know that we are not there yet but we are trying very hard especially to reduce the waiting times. That is why we have the whole lot of innovation methods. If you go to Mitchells Plain, look at how we have reduced the waiting times, how we have improved, the patient care. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Mbombo. [Applause.] In the absence of the hon Joseph from the EFF I see the hon Makeleni. Hon member Ms Makeleni, you may proceed.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. These adjustment estimates are a threat to the delivery of basic service and do not augur well with what the electorate expects from this Legislature.

However, how can we fight crime when the budget for policing function is reduced from R53 million to R50 million? The most outrageous thing is the shifting of R2 million from civilian oversight and policing functions to the Premier's Department. This is utterly not justifiable. [Interjection.]

The bleeding Education Department rolled over R45 million, which shows the level of incompetency. As if that is not enough, R41 million is shifted to the votes, to the other votes, and again the biggest beneficiary is the Department of the Premier. I wonder why. I am particularly worried about the

R142 million which comes from the National Government as Education Infrastructure Grant. These funds are for the Accelerated School Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, also known as ASIDI, for the purpose of building more schools. Instead these funds will be used to rebuild shoddy schools with structural defects that put our children's lives at risk.

This means many poor communities, who were waiting and expecting schools, will have to wait for another three years. This amounts to wasteful expenditure and poor management or control, which is completely unacceptable. More painful is the shifting of funds to Vote 10 for the leasing of the new office accommodation for the MEC. This is glorified theft of taxpayers' money and should not be allowed.

The rollover of more than R74 million in the Department of Health is testimony that the DA-led Government is mismanaging the public healthcare system. Many of our hospitals and clinics are suffering from lack of adequate maintenances, goods and services, like long queues, shortage of chronic medicine and beds. It is unacceptable for the funds not to be spent due to incompetence such as funds not submitted timeously resulting in accruals, delays in the filling of training posts and delays in the appointment of professional services and slow progression on scheduled maintenance projects.

The lack of consequences or remedial action taken against the responsible staff members amounts to a travesty of administrative justice and is

tantamount to corruption. The Alcohol Harms Reduction is the one of the so-called Game-Changers that the Premier brags about. It is now surprising that it was not budgeted for in the main appropriation budget. This confirms our long held view that these Game-Changers were not well thought through or budgeted for, hence the present run-around. More worrying is that the Department of Social Development continues to ignore poor women in its budget. These adjustment estimates are silent on women emancipation and empowerment.

We are mindful and worried of the fact that in municipal districts such as West Coast and Central Karoo, poverty has increased over the period between 2011 and 2016... [Interjections.] ...while nationally the ANC managed to bring down... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: ...poverty levels. The shifting of funds should have responded to the real challenges that would tangibly improve the lives of people. The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports has the smallest budget, yet its budget is reduced by R5.7 million. Sports and Recreation is the hardest hit programme. Many children from poor communities are not adequately supported by this Department and public schools remain under-resourced.

Underspensing is under-delivery and it is bad budgetary practice to

over-provide when the required levels of service delivery cannot be reached. This DA Government should get its act into gear and respond better to the needs of the poor. In the meantime it just underscores the fact that the DA does not really care for the poor.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Makeleni. [Applause.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor, hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear, hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon the Minister, Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Finance people have an interesting way with words. They refer to things like fiscal consolidation when what they actually mean is that they are not going to give us the money we actually need to provide the services that are so desperately needed by our people. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: And that is the reality we are facing in education, not through any fault of the Western Cape Government. A good education is crucial for people to improve their circumstances in life. It is the best chance people have to get out of poverty. Each child has only one chance to be in school and it is incumbent upon us as Government to make that one

opportunity the best possible. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: While there is always room for improvement and we acknowledge that, we are doing that in the Western Cape, which is why we see an average of 18 000 additional children entering our education system every year in search of a decent education, which they are certainly not getting in the Eastern Cape where most of them come from.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Fortunately the voters in the Eastern Cape have started to see the light by voting in a DA Government in Kouga and Nelson Mandela Bay in August this year and people who live there are already telling us that they see the DA difference, so I sincerely hope that they will liberate the entire province of the Eastern Cape in 2019. Now that number one is again been protected by the ANC today the chances of that happening are in fact even higher.

In the WCED we use every cent wisely, which is one of the reasons why we have just received our second clean audit in a row. We have also achieved improved educational outcomes which shows that we are not just spending our money in accordance with procedures, but that we are spending our money on what is making a difference in our education system and yet we sit

now in an extremely difficult financial situation that has been created by the corruption and mismanagement of our country by the ANC over many years.

The situation has been exacerbated under the current leadership of the thief in chief who does not just have his hands in the cookie jar... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: He is actually sitting in the jar with his comrades from the Saxonwold Shebeen, feasting at the expense of the public. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...and laughing as the economy fails, the cost of living increase and unemployment rises. The AG noted in his report released last week that national and provincial government departments across the country have accumulated R46 billion in irregular expenditure. We all know that irregular expenditure cannot necessarily be attributed solely to administrative... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...to maladministration and corruption, but R46 billion. A mere R1 billion of that would allow us to appoint another

2500 much needed teachers or build another 18 schools. With R8 billion we could employ another 20 000 teachers or build 133 schools. Why did I choose R8 billion? Because that is the amount of SAA's losses over the last few years alone.

The PREMIER: A disgrace!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is just state owned entity under the ANC that has been allowed to continue running at a loss year after year with no accountability whatsoever; never mind the SABC, Eskom and all the corruption and wastage in government departments. Because of our good governance we are managing to attract private funding to assist us in improving education. This is through our collaboration with schools as well as a few other offers of people prepared to build those schools, help build classrooms for schools in need and also our longstanding partnership with the Archway Foundation which is assisting us in building school halls.  
[Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, it is very difficult to speak at the same time as the ANC. We are very grateful for all our partnerships and it goes to show that good governance attracts investment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is deeply ironic that when the ANC

National Government cannot provide what we actually need and we manage to find the external partners to assist us, they criticise that as well and get into a state about privatising education. Like most things in life education will not improve without the right skills and accountability. We will not know whether we have improved or what we need to improve unless we measure it. This is why we spend money on annual systemic tests so that we can see where we are doing well and where we need to improve and overall the results are showing that the system is improving.

It is true that the WCED invest millions of rands in these tests, but they are necessary to help us improve. The main beneficiary is our children in our poorest schools. We use the results to design interventions to improve areas that are identified as weak at specific schools. In addition to this we are planning to introduce the School Evaluation Authority which will ensure that what happens in the classroom is properly assessed and will enable us to take action to improve areas that are identified as needing improvement. Its sole purpose is to ensure that our children receive the best possible education and yet... [Interjections.]

Absolutely, and yet, both these measures are opposed by SADTU and some even NGOs you claim to be fighting for equal education. It is ironic that the most disruptions occur in our poorest performing schools that are often in the poorest communities. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Exactly! And then people like to use context as an excuse for poor performance. It is especially ironic that SADTU's unlawful conduct during our recent systemic tests has actually cost us more money than we should have spent which is always unacceptable but is especially so in the current financial climate. [Interjections.]

We will in all likelihood have to spend millions more in redesigning the tests ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As it may have been compromised by their actions. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Whilst we regard all education role-players as important and engage with them regularly it is not acceptable that they dictate to the Department when and what tests we write in the interest of education. [Interjections.]

We will be seeking to recover these costs from SADTU and we will also be taking appropriate action against any individual who we have proof of disregarding an instruction from the Department. In contrast, in the jobs for cash report commissioned by Minister Motshekga and published earlier this

year, it is clear that SADTU in particular has captured the education of our children in South Africa. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: What about the [Inaudible.] They also...

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The report states that where...  
[Interjections.] They are mentioned too, I said not only SADTU.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I said SADTU in particular...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Perhaps if they listen they would hear what I am saying. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Hon Minister Schäfer, may I address you, if you could direct your comments to the Chair please... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I will Madam Chair... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...and not engage the hon member Mr Dugmore directly.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Certainly Madam Speaker, if you could ask the hon member Mr Dugmore to do the same.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The report states that where authority is weak... [Interjections.] When everyone is ready.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The report states that where authority is weak, inefficient and dilatory teacher unions move into the available spaces, unions, and determine policies, priorities and appointments achieving undue influence over matters which primarily should be the responsibility of the Department. This was the case in six provinces, all ANC run. When is the ANC going to grow itself a backbone and do what is right for our children instead of trying to appease organisations that have no interest in anything other than themselves? [Interjections.]

Despite the extreme financial situation we find ourselves in the WCED is doing everything possible to provide the best education and will continue to do so but if it were not for assistance from external parties we would not even be able to design the new school evaluation authority which I really believe will be instrumental in making a real difference in teaching and

learning in the classroom. If the ANC stops wasting money, tolerating and even promoting corruption and started using the billions available for the improvement of the conditions of the poor... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...our country would be on a far better trajectory. Our economy would be growing and more people would be in employment and if accountability was the accepted norm in Government as a whole we would not be losing billions every year.

Where the DA governs everyone benefits especially the poor, but we cannot carry on having to make do with less and less whilst having to provide more and more. I have to address the hon member Ms Beerwinkel and give her a constitutional lesson. [Interjections.]

Section 146 of the Constitution provides specifically for provinces to make their own legislation which supersedes national legislation, except under very specific defined circumstances. So I suggest she goes and has a little lesson and goes and reads Chapter 4 of the Constitution together with Section 146 of the Constitution and she will see there is nothing wrong and nothing unconstitutional about my proposed Amendment Bill. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. These adjustment estimates take place at a time when the South African economy is facing huge pressure from around the globe. The Investor Rating Services recently decided not to downgrade South Africa against the forces of doom who were hoping for the worst and that confirms that South Africa under the ANC-led Government remains in good hands.

An HON MEMBER: Zuma.

An HON MEMBER: Amandla!

Mr K E MAGAXA: I cannot say the same about the DA-led Western Cape Government... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Department of the Premier systematically draws off funds from all other votes under its command. This illustrates that the Premier Zille has no confidence in her own Cabinet colleagues. It is not by accident that adjustment estimates increased by R23.7 million for the Department. In many cases the funds have been taken from other ailing departments. Some of these departments are at the centre of service delivery, namely Community Safety, Education, with a just [Inaudible.] MEC, and Health and collectively they shifted R5.6 million to the Department of the Premier.

The Provincial Treasury that has R6 million unspent for capacity building rolled over R1.8 million funds that were meant for drought relief to three affected municipalities. It was Premier Zille who complained that National Government refused to declare certain areas in the Western Cape as disasters whereas her own Government failed to utilise these funds budgeted for the same purpose. One of the critical challenges facing the poor people in this province is the lack of housing. Since 2009 this Government has failed dismally to provide adequate and decent houses. The adjustment estimates fall short of addressing the pressing need. Many households will remain homeless which will exacerbate poverty. We know why. To the DA, homeless people are just seen as dirt that must be chased out like with the DA Councillor of Sea Point's social media rant about vagrants.

In fact I am surprised that that person has not been removed even today by the DA. I have previously criticised DA-led City of Cape Town...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...for selling off Tafelberg property to private developers at the expense of the working class families who have been staying and working around Sea Point. Today the DA-led Government was forced to abandon ill begotten plans and instituted a feasibility study which shows that 270 affordable house units could be built. These units will be for families earning less than R3 500 per month.

This victory must be celebrated not by the DA because they know nothing about that, but by all those who have been struggling for the accessibility of the South African poor people to housing.

The struggle against the sale of prime public land is not over. There are still many poor communities who have been thrown into temporary relocation areas and incremental areas. These people who were dumped in areas like Wolwerivier, Blikkiesdorp and Fisantekraal, where there are not enough proper basic services like clean water, suitable sanitation or sewerage system or road infrastructure. In some cases they waited up to more than ten years for proper housing. These communities are victims of drug syndicates who exploit their plight and plant them into drug abuse and criminal activities.

In fact the DA's MEC is consistently seen rubbing shoulders with these hardcore criminals and the DA is known to be benefiting in these gang activities through fundraising. The families in Old Biscuit Mill in Woodstock are not spared in the housing crisis. The property was sold to the highest bidder while these poor people stayed there for over three decades. Now they face eviction. The Government cannot claim ignorance. It should take the blame, buy that land on behalf of the residents and offer them affordable housing.

The growing number of informal settlements across the Metro and other municipalities seem to suggest the lack of political will on the part of the DA-led Government and the DA does not care about the plight and welfare of

the working class and the poor people. In this province it is not by accident, nor a surprise that the Western Cape Government under the DA has the highest bucket system in the country... [Interjections.] ...despite huge resources that... [Interjections.] ...but this province, by the richest province above all other provinces in South Africa... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I think they must be feeling ashamed of themselves.  
[Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Thank you. [Applause.] Okay, order please members. This is a debate. I now recognise the final speaker on the speaker's list. I see the honourable the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer.  
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I just wonder what will he say?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, thank you for this opportunity to take part in this debate on the Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill.

During a second reading debate you discuss the principles of the bill. I am afraid to say I have heard none of that on that side of the House.  
[Interjections.] I want to... [Interjections.] I want to... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: A second reading debate is a political debate... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...where you discuss principles. There were no principles discussed, only hot air. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But they cannot spell the word... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So I want to thank you, my colleagues, that followed the rules, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: So the ACDP... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: What they do not know - I am only talking about you, not the ACDP... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He is my friend.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, he is your friend!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He is my good friend. Madam Speaker...  
[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: He is your small DA!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He is my friend. I am prepared to defend my friend in the House.

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Can we allow the Minister to proceed please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, on a more serious note what we are debating here, is the Western Cape Adjustment Appropriate Bill. This is a piece of legislation. This they do not know. We are discussing a law in this House.

An HON MEMBER: Workshop.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: They do not know this is a law, so when you discuss a law you follow the rules of lawmaking. They have an opportunity to influence the Bill so when you discuss a second reading debate you have referred to page so and so and you make alternative lawmaking proposals. That is what we do in the National Assembly. This is a Bill. You are lawmakers. You are not noisemakers, you are lawmakers. Mr Deputy Speaker, instead of lawmakers... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]  
...we do not have lawmakers in this House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You are noisemakers instead of lawmakers. This is a Bill and based on the Bill you should refer to page 19 and you should make alternative proposals as we have done in the National Assembly. So you took part in the wrong debate because this is a debate about legislation. But I have heard no legislative proposals so I cannot even go to my cabinet colleagues and say: "let us consider these proposals..." because none came from their side. So they do not know how to influence a law. You are lawmakers but you are noisemakers. Our Adjustment Budget is based on sound fiscal policies but let us see what the ANC is doing to our public finances in South Africa, because that is why we are in this situation.

As you know I have spoken about it, but more and more people need to understand the severity of this problem. The current total debt in this country, Mr Deputy Speaker, is R2 trillion. So people want to know why we have an adjustment budget? They must understand that under President Zuma from 2009 when he became the President, our debt rose to R2 trillion.

Our debt to GDP ratio, in 2009 when President Zuma became the President,

was about 23%, but now we are at 50% under President Zuma. This is what we must discuss because our debt service cost in this country is now R147 billion. Over the MTEF it will go over R200 billion.

But here is the more shocking news. If you take the total wage bill of the Government, 1.5 million civil servants plus the social grants, plus the debt service cost, it is 69% of total government expenditure. That is the reality. That means there is only 31% left for the people of South Africa, because that is how the ANC is discussing the fiscal policy principles. [Interjection.] The fiscal policy principles of the ANC only leave us with 31% left.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is getting even worse, because we must discuss the principles of the Bill and the principles of the ANC is that we now have a State guarantee. The State guarantee is now R500 billion, R263 billion has already been taken up. What is a State guarantee? It is a future financial commitment to the revenue fund. So, this is not theory, it is money that they put in things that are not meaning anything, like SA Rail. [Interjection]. They are putting money in the South African Post Office, they are putting money in the SABC. State guarantees mean money is going down a fiscal hole, that is the reality of SANRAL, that is the reality of the South African Post Office, that is the reality of the many state owned enterprises. And do not forget Dudu Myeni, another fiscal black hole of money going into SAA.

That is what we are discussing, those are the principles of the Bill. You must bring us new principles and to my colleague who does not understand, this is

fiscal consolidation at its best under the Democratic Alliance. It means there is discipline, there is allocative efficiency, there is fiscal sustainability, because it is principles of the Bill that we are now discussing.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it gets worse. Total revenue collection in South Africa is R1.1 trillion. The total Government expenditure is R1.3 trillion. It is R200 billion short. And then the R4 billion that Minister Grant spoke about. So it is getting worse.

The Eastern Cape irregular expenditure went up with R1.2 billion. The Premier League, Ace Magashule, under his leadership there are 8 departments that regressed. The Free State, hon Premier Zille - in the Free State, your counterpart's office, they have regressed. Education and Health in the Western Cape are well managed as my two colleagues indicated. In the Free State the Health and Education budget are 69% of the total budget of the Free State Province. What happened there? In the Free State the Health and Education Department were qualified by the Auditor-General ... [Interjection.] No, that is your fiscal policy, we discussed the principles, so we look at how you apply the principles where you run . They were unable to report accurate and reliable information.

In the Free State, in supply chain management, irregular expenditure increased by R2 billion. In Gauteng, your principles, irregular expenditure increased to R6.5 billion.

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are making [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Now, I am coming to you. [Interjection.] No. In KwaZuma [sic] Natal, [Laughter.] the new province. We now have another province, it is called KwaZuma Natal. In that province the irregular expenditure increased, in KwaZuma Natal the irregular expenditure increased by 112% to R3.57 billion. That is their fiscal model, that is why I explained our fiscal model. In Mpumalanga irregular expenditure is R4 billion. This is another Premier League province. In North West, where Minister Grant was now, the irregular expenditure is R3 billion. North West is also a Premier League province.

We are adjusting budgets countrywide because of your irregular expenditure that impacts on the expenditure of this Government. So let us see, the total irregular expenditure in the Premier League provinces totals R12 billion. That is why their three provinces want to protect President Zuma, but his time is up †en sy twak is nat, [and he has nothing left] and so that is why they support President Zuma because they support the looting of the coffers.

The legislatures in the rest of the country, as you know yourself, have bigger staff complements, bigger budgets and less citizens than us, and so what they have done – they have fewer citizens because the legislatures in the rest of the country have been mismanaged through public funds, but hon members here do not understand how the budget works, because this is a Bill, in the Bill I said to my colleagues we must support Parliament. I have made

additional money available. I went to the Cabinet, to the Budget Policy Committee. They have agreed that we make additional money available, I have communicated that to the Speaker, now I hear things. It seems they have not read the Bill. A Bill is not only published, it should be read and be studied.

So those members who speak about us not doing justice to the vote of the Legislature, they must read twice because the hard truth is that the ANC has no clue of the political economy or the budget itself. The hard truth is that Zuma and Gupta have stolen billions, forcing adjustment budgets ...  
[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: And Verwoerd?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Are you justifying Zuma's  
[Inaudible.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, I am not justifying [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Zuma's time is running out.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Why are you comparing  
[Inaudible.]?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The ANC culture ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon member Davids.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...of stealing is running out. The Adjustment Budget makes provision for nutrition for the poor. Today the ANC voted against nutrition for the poor. The Adjustment Budget makes provision for educational infrastructure for the poor. Today the ANC voted against infrastructure against the poor. Today we are making money available to strengthen the health information systems in our public health system, the ANC is speaking against investment in health information systems.

Today we are making R60 million available for health infrastructure, the ANC is speaking against an investment of health infrastructure for the poor. Today we are making, through the Adjustment Budget, money available or public funds available for ICT, we made provision for the ICT in education, today the ANC says they do not want ICT in our schools. Today the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr D JOSEPH: This budget make money available for ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, your time has expired, but I will allow you to finish your last sentence.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, a last message to the Leader of the

Official Opposition. He must stop speaking in tongues because he will follow the same route as Marius Fransman. [Interjections.][Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time is expired.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill? No objections? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: The House will deal with the separate votes from now onwards. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Committee Reports on the Annual Reports of Departments, their entities and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for the year ended 31 March 2016, and the Report of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts on the Annual Reports of Departments and their entities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. †Die nasionale toekenning van fondse asook bykomende inkomste wat die Wes-Kaap Regering self invorder, of ander bronne soos bates, word binne die provinsiale begroting prosesse bestuur. Speaker, binne hierdie prosesse moet ons Regering deursigtig wees, verantwoordelik wees teenoor die inwoners van die Wes-Kaap, en ek is seker dat die DA-Minister, huidige Minister wanneer ons die land oorneem, sal die Minister van Finansies word.

Volgens die Wes-Kaapse Grondwet in Hoofstuk 7 artikel 6.4, is dit belangrik dat wanneer die toekenning van fondse bepaal word, dit nodig is dat die wanbalanse en ontwikkelingsbehoefte van die mense in ag geneem word. Deurknede rekenkundige en finansiële praktyke van Tesourie wat die norme en standaarde stel verseker volgehoue dienslewering aan al die mense.

Die Wes-Kaap Regering is bevoorreg om van die beste amptenare in diens te hê, veral in Tesourie. Dit is 'n voorreg om die amptenare se toegewydheid en bevoegdheid te kan ervaar. 'n Duidelike voorbeeld vir ander provinsies hoe skoon oudits bereik kan word. Ons bedank die kantoor van die Ouditeur-generaal asook interne en eksterne oudit komitees vir hulle werk.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The national allocation of funds as well as additional revenue the Western Cape Government collects itself, or other sources such as assets, are managed within the provincial budget processes. Madam Speaker, within these

processes our government has to be transparent, be responsible to the people of the Western Cape, and I am sure that the DA Minister, current Minister, when we take over the country will become the Minister of Finance.

In terms of the Western Cape Constitution in Chapter 7 Section 6.4, it is important that when the allocation of funds are determined, it is necessary that the imbalances and development needs of the people are taken into consideration. Well-tested accounting and financial practices of Treasury setting the norms and standards ensure sustained service delivery to all the people.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government is privileged to have some of the best officials in its service, especially in Treasury. It is a privilege to experience the officials' dedication and competency, a clear example to other provinces as to how clean audits can be achieved. We thank the Office of the Auditor-General as well as internal and external audit committees for their work.]

†The Provincial Treasury has a mandate to control and oversee the Western Cape Government finances. It provides for sustainable financial management to promote economic development and good governance within departments, entities and municipalities. The Committee noted the low percentage of the economic growth base for South Africa and the impact it has on the Western Cape economy. The Committee noted that the Department attained its third consecutive clean audit and the introduction of compulsory saving measures

was successful, and the Committee noted the launch of the Chartered Accountant Academy which was a pilot project.

The R6 million reallocated into the 2016 Adjustment Budget for drought relief was welcomed. The Committee also noted the dependence of municipalities on MIG funding and various grant allocations. Ongoing efforts by SCOF, the Standing Committee on Finance, to find proper accommodation for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board is noted.

The WCGRB operates within the Government's framework which provides for licensing of persons conducting gambling, as well as manufacture and sale of gambling machines. The Committee noted that the Board received a clean audit and achieved all its targets. The Committee further notes that the WCGRB contributes to own income revenue for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in a very responsible manner. Concerns that were highlighted are illegal gambling, in particular on-line illegal gambling.

The process followed to fill the vacancy of the Chief Financial Officer is noted. The socio-economic impact of regulated gambling is noted. The long-term drawn-out costly process relating to the previous CEO is also noted. As far as the Parliament Oversight Committee is concerned, the Western Cape maintained an unqualified audit with no findings on predetermined objectives, and during the 2015/16 financial year the WCPP were able to switch from modified cash standard to the GRAP system. Given our budget constraints our service delivery risks were associated with GRAP. We need to

congratulate our staff in Parliament for this achievement.

The service delivery that our members as well as the public is receiving is of the highest professional standard. It is world class service. A word of thanks to all our staff in the Western Cape Government, as well as the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I move that the House accepts this report of SCOF and the POC. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ANC would obviously welcome the fact that 14 of the provincial departments and 6 of the public entities have achieved unqualified audits with no findings. We know that from our officials this requires hard work and commitment from the HOD and officials, and they deserve our congratulations, just as we as the ANC celebrate the steady improvement in audit outcomes in Gauteng and in Eastern Cape departments. It is something that we should focus on as a country, take out the party politics and welcome those officials who work hard to ensure that we have clean audits. This is something that we support.

But clearly we remain deeply concerned that the Western Cape Housing Development Fund, even though there has been a slight improvement, remains a source of major concern, and the fact is we need to be open and

honest when we reflect that there has been a regression by 3 of the public entities in this province, the Western Cape Liquor Authority, the Western Cape Nature Conservation and Heritage Western Cape.

So sometimes we even, with the active participation of the SCOPA Chair, want to celebrate and instead do not look at the actual risks that we were experiencing in a number of entities and departments, and that is why, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is important that we as a House look very seriously at the risk areas that have been identified by the Auditor-General in the process of the Annual Reports.

One of that issues that he has referred to is the fact that the quality of submitted financial statements leaves a lot to be desired. In fact it has been identified by the Auditor-General that 12% of the departments and entities, in terms of the quality of the financial statements, need serious intervention. If we look at another risk that is the actual quality of submitted performance reports, once again the Auditor-General has indicated that an intervention is required in 22% of the departments and entities, and this clearly is a risk which is not being taken seriously enough by all of these provincial departments.

Thirdly, when one looks at supply chain management, the Auditor-General has indicated that 35% of the departments and entities that were audited were found to have concerning risks in regard to supply chain management, and this is something that all the departments need to take very, very seriously.

So clearly there is room for improvement across the board as much as it is easy to fall into a pattern of pretending that there are no issues and concerns in the Western Cape, whereas in fact there are very serious concerns, and as the ANC we have always taken the view that while clean and unqualified audits should be welcomed and celebrated, that we have to drill down to the actual work of the departments and ask very serious questions:

- Are our people getting value for the money allocated to our provincial departments?
- Are our departments transforming in terms of representivity and the actual ability to deliver services innovatively?
- And are we pursuing those who are responsible for abusing State resources?

And I think on this scorecard it is very clear that the Western Cape Government and its departments are not transforming and are not serious about quality of services to deal with the overall inequality we find in our province.

For example, when we look at a simple audit risk area, HR management, the Auditor-General would report to us that there is a 100% performance in regard to HR management, but that actually hides a very, very important fact and that is that when one looks at the employment equity statistic across our departments, compared to when the ANC was governing, the representation, particularly of so-called Coloured and African public servants has worsened

under the Democratic Alliance since they had taken over.

On page 281, if you look at the Annual Report of the Public Works Department, you will see that there was broad consensus across party political lines that representivity, both in Government Motor Transport as well as in the Department as a whole, is not at all reflective of the people of our province and actually this Department has not made use of the opportunities to advance representivity in the senior management level. But maybe, Mr Deputy Speaker, this has something to do with the fact that the department that should be leading in regard to representivity, the Department of the Premier, has actually regressed and not made use of the opportunities in terms of the vacant posts that were available in terms of their particular appointments.

So it is very encouraging that the proposal of the ANC in regard to the Annual Reports, particularly in regard to the Department of Public Works, has been accepted and this is in regard to representivity. The situation has been identified as so serious that the Department of Transport and Public Works in the Annual Report, and this recommendation was accepted, that the Department needs to set specific targets to achieve representivity in terms of gender and race, and report back to the Committee in this regard, and these specific targets must be included, and this is the first time that a departmental Annual Report has reported in this way. These targets must be included in the next Annual Performance Plan, because each year for the last 3 years the Department of Transport and Public Works, and the Department

of the Premier have been reporting but have not actually included representivity targets in Annual Performance Plans, and we are going to be watching this very carefully, that in the Annual Performance Plans tabled with the budget next year, there will be firm targets to achieve representivity. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What targets do you reach?

Mr C M DUGMORE: So the point that we as the ANC is making, it is one thing to achieve a clean audit, it is another thing to regress when it comes to employment equity, representivity and basic service delivery, and the majority of provincial departments stand accused of reversing employment equity gains compared to the time when the ANC governed this province.

I also want to refer the MEC, through you Mr Deputy Speaker, the MEC for Finance, to a very serious concern contained in 281 of these Annual Reports, and that is that we have an entity at a municipal level, the George Link entity, that has failed to submit annual financial statements for 2 years now, and this is an entity that received hundreds of millions of Rands over the last 3 years from the Provincial Department via the George Municipality.

We have forced in, and you will see it reflected in these Annual Reports, that the deadline is tomorrow for the George Link public entity to provide annual financial statements, and we want to ask the MEC for Finance: Is this acceptable? Are the monies flowing to George Link, given that the annual

financial statements and the adjustment estimates that we will be dealing with tomorrow and the next day, that over R70 million is going to be transferred once again to the George Link? Will the MEC give this House a commitment that in terms of the issues and the concerns raised in the Annual Report, that he will resist and refuse that that transfer goes ahead to the George Link until such time as those annual financial statements have actually been received and considered?

This is a very clear call. The DA is talking about clean government. How can you continue to allocate finances to a public entity at a municipal level which has not reported for 2 years? Will the DA give us this?

Then also the Annual Reports indicate very clearly that in regard to the issue of Tafelberg, and this is again comparing what appears in our Annual Financial Statements and the Auditor-General's report, and when we compare that to actual delivery, in regard to Tafelberg, there was a clear opportunity which the Department of Housing had actually presented, not only to the Department of Public Works but to the Provincial Cabinet as a whole, to use Tafelberg as a site for social housing.

Instead we had a decision by the Cabinet which they are now having to backtrack on in terms of simply alienating that land to the highest bidder. So you might have a clean audit and an unqualified audit, but are you governing when you do not manage to utilise ideally located land to integrate the City and instead you decide to sell it to the highest bidder, and are now faced with

a situation of having to backtrack a great expense to the public?

When we then also look at whether we are pursuing those responsible for abusing the funds of this province, I want to again draw members' attention to the Annual Report and what they actually say about Filcon. The Report indicates that our Department has not yet initiated claims against Filcon for damages suffered as a result of awarding a tender for the construction of schools at a provincial level, even though Saul Loggenberg, the director of this company, was identified in the United Kingdom as someone who would not be able to be appointed as a director, and even though there were 8 liquidation applications against this company.

A minimum of R15 million has been lost because of this appointment, but the Annual Reports reflect that up until today no action has been taken either against Filcon or against Saul Loggenberg as an individual to recover these amounts, yet the DA would tell us that they stand for clean government and they would want to protect the taxpayers' money.

MEC, are you not concerned that a department that reports to you has not taken any steps to recover monies wasted by the allocation of the tender to a company with a very dubious record? Who is responsible for this and who is going to be held responsible for this?

When one looks at the issue of then service delivery compared to a clean audit, we have a situation ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time has expired, but I will allow you one sentence.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We have a situation - I will conclude on this - where fatalities on our roads have increased, funds have been available from Government Motor Transport, yet 132 traffic officers remain unappointed and the carnage continues. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: The Department of Social Development and Health Programmes rest on the Provincial Strategic Goals 2 and 3, which highlight the Western Cape Government's commitment to improving education outcomes and opportunities for youth development and also increasing wellness, safety and tackling social ills.

Guided by the Health Care 2030 Strategy, the Department of Health in the Western Cape remains committed to transforming public health care services in the province. Delivering quality health care to nearly 4 million uninsured citizens is no easy task, but under the leadership of Dr Nomafrench Mbombo, we have seen the Department continue to improve in all sectors, finding innovative solutions to some really challenging issues.

The Department succeeded in integrating communities into the provincial health system through the appointment of 42 new hospital boards for

facilities across the province. The Western Cape Health Facilities Boards and Clinic Committees' Bill was drafted with the intention of enhancing people's involvement in the Government's processes of hospitals and primary health care facilities.

This is an important initiative as it will strengthen community involvement in public health care services. Also pleasing to note is that the Western Cape On Wellness initiative continues to grow. During the 2015/16 financial year the Department focused on increasing wellness in aspects of behavioural and social change, encouraging citizens to take responsibility for their health and wellbeing.

This is extremely important as we continue to try and increase the province's life expectancy which currently stands at an average of 68 years for women and 64 years for men. Too much money is still spent each year on preventable health conditions such as alcohol and drug abuse, risky sexual behaviour and simply unhealthy lifestyles. The WOW initiative seeks to educate and promote healthy societies and we are confident that with its growth so too will healthy living in the province.

During this reporting period the Committee on Community Development has embarked on oversight visits by itself, joined with other committees, by cluster and with the NCOP. The Committee invited both the Departments of Social Development and Health to report on their programmes executed respectively. The Committee also had its meetings in the communities and

with community organisations that serve them. The communities, NPOs and health facilities were heartened that members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament visited them.

Many of our non-profit organisations are doing sterling work within our communities. The funding they receive from Government is well spent and done so in the interest of strengthening our communities. Social workers and community workers in organisations very often have to do with what they have, which can be very little at times and yet they do it with passion and commitment. So too, health workers in our clinics and hospitals are serving their patient clients with passion and making their experience worthwhile.

However, sometimes there are complaints from these sick clients and those seeking assistance in our health facilities, that they have experienced the ugly side of service delivery. We have received some complaints regarding bad attitudes from our staff, both in DSD and health facilities and this has been addressed with the Department of Health when they presented their Complaints/compliments Programme with the Committee.

Key to the efforts of these departments has been the whole of society approach adopted by the Minister which involves building partnerships with the private sector, NPOs and individuals in our committees. NPOs are but one sector that have a unique role to fulfil in addressing the challenges facing our communities, and it is precisely for this reason that DSD has partnered with various NPOs and afforded them various capacity building

programmes to help them in the execution of their duties.

However, we are aware that there are organisations that do not comply, but assistance is being afforded to these organisations and we are optimistic that they will successfully comply soon. Furthermore, the Department is committed to increasing opportunities for the youth through the introduction of a successful Youth Café Programme. Currently there are 6 Cafés providing services to youth in the Western Cape, and we look forward to engaging the Minister on opening another one in the northern parts of the West Coast.

The Department has been successful in a number of programmes, but there are a number of challenges. We acknowledge that they will need to be resolved in order for greater services to be afforded to the people of the Western Cape. Much still needs to be done in implementing and executing programmes for people living with disabilities. The commitment of the Western Cape Government is to deliver an open society with opportunities for all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired, just finish off, last sentence.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, to the people of this province: it is best summed up by the late Maya Angelou who said:

“I’ve learned that people will forget what you said, people will forget what you did, but people will never forget how you made them feel”.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I move that the House adopts the Standing Committee Community Development Report. I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has now really expired. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, firstly I want to thank the members the Standing Committee on Public Accounts for the excellent work they have done. The ANC and the DA assisted and I think we were a good team working together.

I also want to extend my thanks to the AG and the Audit Committee for their briefing and assistance, and many thanks to the Committee Coordinator, Mr Dustin Davids, who assisted me greatly. Mr Deputy Speaker, there were a lot of resolutions we made, but one of the major resolutions we made was we were concerned about the burnout of staff.

Provincial Treasury has put a hold on the employment of new employees and we as a Committee felt that because employees tell us that they are at the office early in the morning, leave late at night, that may lead to service delivery problems because of burnout, and we want the departments and MECs and Premier to listen to this, that our employees in the Western Cape

Government are working hard and they are commended for that, but they are there early in the mornings and late at night, and that may lead to enormous pressure that they live under.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the important thing for us is that we know about the three entities that regressed and we as SCOPA have taken a resolution that they will appear in SCOPA. The three entities that will appear are the Western Cape Liquor Authority, Western Cape Nature Conversation Board and also the Heritage Western Cape that regressed, and we want to meet with them and hear what are the plans they have to improve the audit outcome.

That is our job. Our job is to call them and ask them how are you going to rectify this? That is our job, and we will do that. We must also compliment Wesgro and the Western Cape Housing Development Fund for improved audit outcomes. I can remember when, and the Minister of Human Settlements will say that when the Housing Board came, they gave us an undertaking, next year we will have a different outcome and they did that, and we want to compliment you Minister and your staff, for work well done. They have done that, they told us that and now we are going to take the hands of the other three entities and ask them how are you going to improve your audit outcomes for the next financial year? Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, your time has expired. Thank you. Hon member Mr Mitchell?

Mr D M MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department of the Premier spent 94.3% of its appropriated funds. Although there was an underspending, this has had no impact on the Department's ability of attaining their objectives as close monitoring took place throughout the year in order to improve spending effectiveness and efficiency. The performance against predetermined objectives has improved from year to year, especially with the 96.2% delivery of the performance targets compared to 93.6% last year.

Mr Deputy Speaker, like other Western Cape Government departments that have had to work with the shrinking fiscal purse, a 132 crucial posts have not been filled in order to remain within the allocated budgetary amounts. In some instances this meant that managers had to maintain service delivery standards with fewer resources than before.

I am pleased that the Department remains committed to achieve its strategic goals and the goals are aligned to the Provincial Strategic Plan and continue to guide the direction and decisions of the Department.

The Department has made significant progress with regards to the rollout of its flagship programme, Broadband. At the end of the 2015/2016 financial year a total of 1 022 sites were connected to Broadband. More than 1 300 new WiFi hotspots and Broadband sites will be completed by March 2017. Access to information is critical in these modern times and through the Broadband programme the Department has enabled the citizens of the

Western Cape access to Government services at nearly no cost to them and much quicker than it would normally take.

Alcohol abuse has continued to be major problem in the Western Cape ...  
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [indistinct] alcohol abuse.

Mr D M MITCHELL: ... as cases of Foetal Alcohol Syndrome Spectrum Disorder, are amongst the highest in South Africa. Other social problems like crime in our communities have been worsened by alcohol abuse. In September this year I was pleased with the announcement of the Provincial Government Alcohol Related Harms Reductions Policy Green Paper that was gazetted and made

This further illustrates our commitment to ensuring that alcohol and substance abuse is reduced in order to ensure that we have a healthy and safe society.

In conclusion, thank you to the member of the Committee and I ask that the House adopts the report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Our Committee had the

Department of Community Safety before us and the Department was examined on general information, departmental performance information and human resources management for the Annual Report year 2015/16.

Members of the public were also given an opportunity to pose questions and give input during the discussions, and we are grateful for the contributions from members of development fora, neighbourhood watches and CPF structures that participated.

In the year under review the Department has done some very good work. For example, almost 1 000 youth went through the Chrysalis Academy Programme, which had a diverse graduate group with learners from across the province enrolled in this programme. Similarly the Northlink Partnership continues with care for a rural, urban intake of learners and the Department has now allocated staff members to monitor the learners' progress.

The Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer is being rolled out and in three pilot study areas, namely Paarl East, Nyanga and Khayelitsha. In these areas the Department in conjunction with its partners are establishing neighbourhood watches, facilitating youth training via the Chrysalis and Wolwekloof Academies, coordinating the Youth Safety and Religion Programme, setting up Safety Kiosks and conducting detailed audits of legal and illegal shebeens.

The Department also commissioned a research study on alcohol use and abuse

in Khayelitsha with the assistance of Western Cape Universities. While the neighbourhood watch regulations were promulgated recently and were not part of the year under review, the Department prepared itself for these new processes that accompany the regulations and shifted the accreditation process responsibilities to the Security Risk Management Programme in Programme 4.

The Department has also worked on improving their on-line templates of the Expanded Partnership Programme to assist community police forums with a more user friendly electronic submission.

We also noted that the employee leave system is still operated on a paper based system which is at odds with a modern government. We heard that this is in the process of being modernised and we trust it will be implemented in the near future.

The Department must be commended for its 7 consecutive clean audits and its continued prudent financial management. The Department spent R220.2 million of its R223.8 million budget.

I also take the opportunity to congratulate the Minister and Head of Department and their teams for winning the bronze award for Best Functioning Provincial Department in this year's Batho Pele Awards.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank the members of the

Committee from across the political divide for their constructive contributions, and ask that the House adopts this Report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity. Hon members, the Department performed very well in the year under review and we accept the fact that on its key responsibilities it came under it and that is to monitor, coordinate and support municipalities to be effective in fulfilling their developmental mandate and facilitate service delivery and disaster resilience through engagement with government spheres and social partners.

Noteworthy is the determination by the Department to remain resolute in the implementation of its objectives and predetermined programmes. What has become clear is that whilst there are engagements throughout the year, the Department did not close its ears and eyes. It actually listened to us as the Standing Committee in ensuring that the Municipal Public Accounts Committees do in fact operate, in ensuring that committees are in place in the municipality so that there is a voice that links the community, who are governed by those who govern them, so that the municipality does not do as they wish.

IDP programmes are informed by the voices of the people and that became very clear that through the Annual Report that in fact did take place

throughout the Western Cape municipalities, and for that we commend the Department and all officials of the Department through their commitment in ensuring that they serve the people.

The Department presided over 24 clean audits in municipalities in this province. That gave us the best province in terms of how municipalities are governed and of the 10 best municipalities, 8 come from this province because of the work done by this Department.

Noteworthy is the progress made in Oudtshoorn. We all know the fiasco that presided in Oudtshoorn through the malicious and ill-intent government in Oudtshoorn under the ANC, but we have seen that when the DA took over we changed things around. [Interjections.]

We need to now look at Kannaland, because Kannaland is the next step where we need to now assist and ensure that with the willing government that is in place there now, we are able to work together to say Kannaland, how can we help you and provide an intervention through Section 139?

Lastly, we have a responsibility in the Western Cape, through the Department of Local Government, to ensure that not only do we achieve clean audits, but that clean audits have an impact in the manner in which people live.

Ms P MAKELENI: Really?

Mr M MNQASELA: So that in the end when we talk about clean audits, a person that is sitting in the West Coast, a person that is sitting in the Central Karoo, a person that is sitting in the Eden District Municipality, can say in fact that the clean audit that they are talking about in Parliament, has made a difference in my life. We know that we are on track, we know that this Government under Premier Zille is on track to deliver that and for that I say thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Department of Human Settlements under the leadership of Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela spent 99.9% of their budget. The Committee noted the Auditor-General's audit opinion regarding the Department's 2015/2016 financial year, having obtained a clean audit and I want to put on record, hon member Dugmore, the Housing Development Fund obtained an unqualified audit.

The 2015/2016 Annual Report indicates that the Department managed to create 18 745 housing opportunities, and these range from the provision of free housing to subsidised housing for various categories of citizens based on income.

Also, Chairperson, I acknowledge the strides that the Housing Entity Tribunal has made. The entity received a merit award for work excellence

from the National Department of Human Settlements at the Govan Mbeki Awards Ceremony.

A major challenge for the Western Cape and other provinces is allocating housing opportunities to people living in informal settlements, as well as backyard dwellers. This is why Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela has set three priority areas on which to focus. These are:

- The upgrading of informal settlements programming.
- Increase affordable GAP housing.
- And prioritise the most deserving people in relation to the allocation of Breaking New Ground free houses.

The number of households living in informal settlements has increased and continues to increase. It is thus pivotal for the Department to find innovative ways to ensure that informal settlements are afforded basic services too.

In this regard the Department remains committed to the upgrade and development of informal settlements. The aim is to shift resources towards upgrading of informal settlements to deal with the poor living standard and lack of basic services to the community. The main concern of the Standing Committee of Human Settlements was the new informal settlements, that they be prioritised from the old informal settlements that were there.

It is pleasing to know that a study has already been conducted on 120

informal settlements in the Western Cape to provide them with the support they need. The Department has revealed that the Informal Settlements Support Plan will be finalised by March 2017. We look forward to the implementation of this plan so we can see our communities living with improved standards through this initiative.

I am particularly pleased that the Department has developed a Deed Acceleration Programme that is aimed at reducing the time taken for the transfer of title deeds. We are pleased with the Department's commitment to returning dignity to our beneficiaries by providing housing opportunities to people who would otherwise have no hope. The whole of government and whole of society approach ensures that we shift away from merely building houses, but we create communities that we can be proud of.

In conclusion I would like to commend the Department for the important role they play in delivering not only housing opportunities to the people in the Western Cape, but for also restoring the dignity of our people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired, just finish off.

Ms L M MASEKO: And the DA supports the outcome of the 2015/2016 Annual Report. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Beverley Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, today we consider the Annual Reports of the Department of Agriculture and the Department of Economic Opportunities and Tourism, and the relevant entities namely Casidra, Wesgro, the Western Cape Liquor Authority and Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone Licencing Company Limited.

The Economic Development, Tourism and Agriculture refers to the entire economy of the Western Cape and sits within that strategic goal of creating opportunities for jobs and growth. While we look at the agricultural sector, three key challenges lie front and centre for this Department.

I will speak more to them tomorrow, but land reform, drought and water challenges will become an ongoing discussion for us all. The Committee took on the issue of drought and engaged in a joint Committee meeting with the Standing Committee of Environmental Planning with the National Department of Water Affairs on water licences and red tape. The Committee also met with key stakeholders, VinPro, Agri West, Western Cape and Tru-Cape South Africa to discuss the damage caused by droughts and recent fires, and how these natural disasters have impacted on the industry resulting in possible job losses.

The availability of water remains a challenge and as water is a natural resource it cannot be generated. Even though farms will not have the same determinations as a metro region for water restrictions in cities, farmers will still have to manage their own dam levels.

We do note however, while engaging with the Department, that it has a major challenge to service the demands of all its smallholder, subsistence and commercial farmers due to a lack of human resource capacity, as well as financial constraints, and that drought support was being dealt with with no additional technical capacity.

We welcome the completion of the Climate Change Framework Implementation Plan for the agricultural sector. This framework will take the province forward in building climate change resilient farming practices and encourage more innovative farming practices going forward.

We welcome the completion of Casidra's Casper computer software, a project management tool utilised within Casidra to roll out, monitor and report on projects to ensure smoother and more effective service delivery.

Looking at the Department of Economic Development, Tourism and its entities, the 2015/2016 financial year has experienced tough economic conditions, including difficulties created by changed global environment and the Brexit exit from the European Union, both of which create uncertainty in the tourism and trade sectors. Despite this, Wesgro has delivered on three core mandates, namely trade promotion, investment promotion and tourism promotion.

We welcome the fact that most of Wesgro's investment deals were created

outside the Cape Town Metro. We note that Wesgro achieved R2 billion of investment deals that it targeted in the year despite the overall global decline in foreign direct investment which affected this province. We also welcome Wesgro's new and informative website that produces a real-time data dashboard for stakeholders to access.

The Committee engaged with the Western Cape Liquor Authority on its Annual Report. The entity has however, been transferred to reside over the oversight responsibility of the Department of Community Safety and therefore will report to the Standing Committee on Community Safety for the next financial year.

We welcome the fact that the Western Cape Liquor Authority has processed all the outstanding liquor license applications that were considered defective in terms of being incomplete or lacking relevant documentation. There are 119 applications currently with the presiding officer and once these applications are dealt with, the backlog will be clear. However, the Committee is concerned about the turnaround time for the process of liquor applications. As per the Act, the turnaround time is 4 months. The entity however, indicated that a liquor license application took between 4 and 7 months to process and whether the application is complete or not complete.

The Committee noted that 4 to 7 months was too long a process to process an application and urged the entity to reduce this turnaround time as this might be an indication of unnecessary red tape and a lack of ease of doing business to assist in the economic growth for the province.

In February this year the Committee received briefings from ACSA on the expansion plans for the Cape International Airport and the liquor licensing for airports. The Committee commissioned a research report, identifying which airports, globally and domestically, had been granted full liquor license capabilities. We asked Minister Plato and the Committee Chair to look at the complexity of liquor license based on the report for airports, and grant the dispensations needed to be able to compete as a world-class airport.

We welcome the work that has also been done by the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone Licencing Company and look forward to its opening for business in the course of 2017. The SBIDZ has experienced challenges with regard to enterprise development and skills development. It has been good to hear that it has secured funding for training and the next phase is to take learners into the workplace to complete their training.

Whilst skills development is a Game-Changer we note the Artisan Development Programme is on track in terms of its implementation phase. The challenge however, is whether the suitable candidates will be able to match the entry requirements to qualify to enrol for the programme. Skills programmes have been introduced for those candidates that did not meet the required entry requirements with the idea that the skills acquired in the Skills Programme will be transferred into a successful completion of the Artisan Development Programme.

The entity has initiated a coaching and mentoring programme with the

Department of Social Development to young students as a means of addressing substance abuse problems within the Saldanha Bay community. It has also developed a supply development data base for small, medium and micro enterprises that have been interested in working with the oil and gas industry. Companies have been encouraged to register on the database.

Mr Deputy Speaker, both the departments are well on track with project Khulisa and working soundly to create the right environment for job creation to occur. I ask that this House supports the outcome of the Annual Reports of both these departments. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Die agb Basil Kivedo. [Applous.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Basil Kivedo. [Applause.]]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is always exciting to talk on a project that excels.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You need 6 minutes [Inaudible.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Attention, the ANC. I am going to send you home with a good message. The Western Cape Government believes that education serves as one of the most useful mechanisms for eliminating inequality and promoting job creation for the people of the province.

The Department of Education's vision is built on improving our education outcomes, thus in the past financial year the Department has dedicated themselves to spending on projects, resources and people that provide quality education to all the learners in the province. The Department can be proud of what they have achieved over the last year. We not only saw an increase in the number and quality of passes in the 2015 NSC, with the province achieving the highest pass rate in the Country, 84.7%, but the province also saw a record number of learners achieving the Bachelors pass. Up 2.9% from 38.8% in 2014, to 41.7% in 2015.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] take your time.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I will take my time. †Ek salueer die Departement vir die voortdurende fokus op die uitbreiding van onderwysgeleenthede met spesifieke teikening van diegene in die gedeperifeerde gebiede in die Wes-Kaap.

Ek is trots op die Departement se prysenswaardige pogings met betrekking tot die verskeie inisiatiewe wat hulle onderneem ten einde die minderbevoorregte leerders en skole te onderskraag.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[I salute the Department for the continuous focus on the expansion of educational opportunities with specific targeting of those in the neglected

areas in the Western Cape.

I am proud of the Department's praiseworthy efforts with regard to the various initiatives they undertook to support the underprivileged learners and schools.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ten spyte van [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: In spite of [Inaudible.]]

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Desnieteenstaande akute begrotingsbesnoeiings weens die moeilike nasionale ekonomiese toestande gedurende die afgelope jaar, het ons Departement ten spyte van vermeldde struikelblokke 'n verbete poging aangewend om nie begrotingsbesnoeiings veral in kwesbare gebiede toe te pas nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: In spite of acute budget cuts as a result of the difficult national economic conditions during the past year, our Department has, in spite of the above handicaps, put in a determined effort not to apply budget cuts in especially the vulnerable areas.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: U praat soos [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr O R DYANTYI: You speak like [Inaudible.]]

Mr B D KIVEDO: In 2015 the WCED paid out almost up to R44 million to fee paying schools serving less affluent communities in addition. The WCED transports over 55 000 learners from our poor rural areas to get to and from school every day. I would like to commend the Department for once again being awarded a clean audit for the past financial year. This is exceptionally impressive considering the size and complexity of the Department. Eish, eish! [Laughter.][Applause]

I would like to thank Minister Debbie Schäfer, the Ministry, the WCED, the Standing Committee on Education and all relevant and last but not least, our captain, princess, I mean Premier Helen Zille. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Who keeps the boat afloat.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you. [Applause][Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me first congratulate the Provincial Government of KwaZulu-Natal [Laughter.] for being voted the best government in South Africa by the Top Companies'

Reputation Index, not me. [Applause.]

Premier Willies Mchunu had this to say in acknowledging the honour:

“Freedom that co-exists with under development and deep poverty, is not freedom. Freedom is indivisible. There can be no freedom for some, and not for all. As we celebrate this achievement, we need to join hands and strengthen our programmes in order to add meaning to freedom and democracy.”

This is what the Premier said, and he addresses the issues exactly. Many in this government claim that we must only focus on clean audits. Service delivery is also important. [Interjections.] This testimony is in sharp contrast to how the DA led government seeks to achieve something in this province. This government continues to perpetuate the social divide between rich and poor, increasingly, the taxpayers’ money is channelled towards certifying the interest of rich white minorities to the detriment of poor and marginalised communities.

We have seen in almost all these 14 votes, taxpayers’ money is not fully spent for intended programmes and hence we have roll-overs time and again. There are no remedial actions taken against affected senior officials or even MECs who actually oversee these Ministries. The common unacceptable excuse nowadays that we get is that savings are due to instruction from Treasury, whilst the Department under-expenditure affects infrastructure, it

affects goods and services, thereby negatively affecting their service delivery mandate.

So it is important that we must not only look at clean audits, but let us make sure that service delivery is the core of our business. This is compounded Mr Deputy Speaker, by the fact that in a department such as Social Development there is no strategy for early childhood development. [Interjection.] Pity that she is gone. They depend mostly on NGOs without providing clear or well thought out guidelines.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Is it a question? Do you want to ask him a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening. A point of order? Order. Is it a point of order?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Yes, it is a point of order. That the member is interjecting when he is not sitting in his place.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at that. If the member is doing that he is ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, no. Deal with it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... transgressing the conventions. Please. Thank you. Please continue, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, let me say, this is a cause of concern because the major problems that affect our youth today, if we miss them there, in early childhood - the challenges that we are having today is because of that.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where are the parents?

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is why it is so important that when we use finance from the taxpayers, we need to make sure that we oversee that. [Interjection.] What is that? You ask the Department whether those trainers have been trained, who are supposed to look after early childhood. Most of them are not trained. This Government puts the future of our children at risk, but wants the votes of their impoverished parents. We are only concerned about their votes but not about their development. †Kodwa nathi asiva. Asiva nyhani, asifundi. [But we also don't listen, we really don't listen, we don't learn.]

We are mindful of the historical exploitation and repression of black workers in this part of the world. You know, when Jan Van Riebeeck came and built the harbour here, he was using our people, the indigenous people of the Cape and most of them worked without getting paid [Interjections.] or even getting

the economic spin-off [Interjections.]. To talk about this in this day and age, whilst we talk so much about the ocean economy which is seen as the instrument towards socio-economic development ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. There is too much comment from the [Inaudible.] side and across the floor as well.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You know, what is currently happening ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member, just one second.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are too many members having discussions and interfering with the hon member's speech and it is very clear on the microphone that there is other feed coming into his mic as well. Hon member, you may continue.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just take your time.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is quite important to look at what is currently happening. We look at 1650 or 1660, but now let us look at the present day. The same thing is currently happening. What is happening in the Saldanha

Bay IDZ? You can look and ask yourself how many black industrialists are involved there? None.

Ms S W DAVIDS: None!

Mr S G TYATYAM: None. Because black people are not good enough to be involved in economic development, they are good to be voters. Cow voters of the DA. What is important for the DA is that our people must not be involved ... [Interjection.] ... in strategic and key ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... levels of strategic development. Our people must not be involved in economic transformation. Our people must not be hands-on in their development, because the DA does not want people to be involved because they only want people to vote for the DA. You know, it pains me, that 22 years [Interjections.] after the breakthrough of ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! The noise level in the House is too high.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dijana! Order! I have asked for order please. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon member prepared to take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr M G E WILEY: Who runs the Black Industrialist Program?

Mr S G TYATYAM: He can e-mail me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is the answer no?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. He can e-mail me. I will answer him. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no, hon Chief Whip. Please continue.

An HON MEMBER: You are not important.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The history of black townships, go to many of them. Go to Netreg, go to Bonteheuwel, go to Mbekweni, Thembalethu, Langa, Nyanga, Gugulethu – there is absolutely nothing happening and there is no township economic development, which this Government under Winde is actually busy

with ... [Interjections.] Honourable, MEC Winde.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. One second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Can the member wind his rhetoric in and refer to members as honourable?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Point is taken. All members are honourable. Please refer to members as honourable members.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I think it is also important that when the DA does its induction, it must make sure that it does not leave anything, particularly post 1994 and it must also say that when ANC took over the governancy in this country, our economic situation, we were bankrupt.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is only the ANC that worked and changed the conditions that we have, that we are in today. [Interjections.] Not the DA. They were nothing! [Interjections.] In fact, we were running a closed economy that was not communicating with any other regions or provinces or nationals. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. Order. Hon Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. Is there nothing within your powers that you could do to prevent us from having to listen to this nonsense? [Laughter.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Listen to your history, listen to your history!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No I cannot do it except ... [Interjection.] Order!  
Hon member Davids, please come to order. No, I cannot do anything except –  
Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: We have been listening to your nonsense all along.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, I was on the point of asking you, and I am not responding to that now, this debate is about the Annual Reports.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is difficult for me to judge whether what you are saying is contained somewhere in Annual Reports.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you the benefit of the doubt.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But you are making ... [Interjections.] Order!  
Order!

Ms T M DIJANA: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana, please stand up. Please stand  
up.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You cannot ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the Chair asks for order and you shout to the  
Chair, "No!" that is unparliamentary. Please withdraw that.

Ms T M DIJANA: I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, the previous debate was on  
the Principle of the Bill, that was the wide political debate. You are making  
a typical political speech now on the second reading, but you are almost done  
and I will allow you. I have given you all the latitude.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No-no, I am raising it ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So you can continue.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... because we must not allow lies here in this Chamber. When people are saying that today this country is in economic woes because of the ANC. We were in woes when the ANC took over here. We had problems. In fact, the pension funds were in trouble, because 60% of the loans of Government was internal. So most of our pension funds were [Inaudible.] by the DA's friends, the NP. [Interjections.] So we must not choose here. Therefore, it is quite important. The second last thing that I want to raise ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The second last thing that I want to raise, when we were at the Committee there was a member from Nyanga who raised issues with the MEC and the Department and they promised in that meeting that they would respond within two weeks. They have not responded to that person, to Mr Mbiko. They have not responded and it is not the first time, because in the last Annual Reports the same thing happened. Mr Mbiko was there and raise issues about a tourism route in Nyanga. It was not raised. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Please finish off your sentence, your time has expired. Are you done?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much for allowing me to participate in this important debate. The Provincial Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is the foundation for high economic growth. For the financial year under review, the Standing Committee concentrated on the key focus areas that Minister Bredell committed to during his budget vote in 2015. I am pleased to announce that as a Standing Committee, we have exercised strong oversight over the Department and its entity, Cape Nature. It must be noted that the 2015/6 business plan is now the last annual report that measures the outcome of the Department's 5-year strategic plan, which began in 2011. This is while they operated in a fiscally challenging environment. Mr Deputy Speaker, this debate allows me to give an oversight account on set targets and performances which were also reviewed on a quarterly basis, in addition to the Committee's oversight engagement with the Department for the 2015/6 financial year.

For Programme 1 – that is Administration - the Minister committed to three planned targets, of which all three targets were achieved and their objectives were met.

For Programme 2 - Environmental Policy Planning and Coordination - the program had 15 planned indicators of which all 15 were achieved.

For Programme 3 - Compliance and Enforcement - the program had 11 planned targets of which 9 were achieved and two partially achieved.

For Programme 4 - Environment Quality Management - the program had 21 planned targets of which 19 were met and two partially achieved. As far as the number of planning applications finalised is concerned, although the annual report states “partially completed” and thus an under-achievement, the unit has exceeded its annual target.

For Programme 5 - Bio-Diversity Management, which falls under CapeNature, The programme had nine planned targets of which eight were achieved and two partially achieved. The DA supports the removal of the two indicators concerning visitor numbers, which was approved by the Department of the Premier and supported by Treasury and tabled at the last Standing Committee meeting, which we accepted.

For Programme 6 - Environmental Empowerment Services - the Department had 7 planned targets of which 6 were achieved and one partially achieved.

And lastly, Programme 7 - Development Planning - all nine planned targets were achieved. I thank you.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the Department for their continued dedication to the people of the Western Cape. Also to the Committee members and my Committee colleagues and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament’s support for their active role in capacitating us in

ensuring that the people of the Western Cape are afforded the services they deserve. On behalf of the members of my Standing Committee, I want to express our sincere gratitude towards our Committee Coordinator, Ms Shareen Niekerk, for always going the extra mile when we needed procedural guidance most. The DA supports the outcome of the 2015/6 Annual Report and I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Lennit Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is very difficult to listen to a confused man. Now, the hon member Tyatyam is totally confused for the following reasons. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why?

Mr L H MAX: He started off in the wrong province. Secondly, according to the information at my disposal, there are 12 black industrialists and the Black Industrialists Programme is managed by DTI. It is mindboggling that the hon member Tyatyam doesn't even know that. [Interjections.] The very ANC wants money from the Government Pension Fund. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX: From the Government Pension Fund and this DA-led Government, since 2009 when it came into power is still struggling to find

out what happened in the portfolio's of hon member Fransman, who has quit now and hon member Uys and those departments with regards to consultants and leadership. So, what I want to say is, never did this DA-led Government claim that this Government is perfect. No, we didn't claim that. We have got our challenges and we are honest with our challenges but what is indisputable ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

Mr L H MAX: ... what is crystal clear, what is irrefutable is that the DA Government is the best. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Just one second. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have a question to the Chairperson of Transport and Public Works.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you may not ask him now. You can ask him at a different time. Are you talking to hon member Max? Are you prepared to take a question?

Mr L H MAX: I will consider it after I speak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no. Thank you. You may continue.

Mr L H MAX: Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, to turn to the Department in this report, it is so that the Department of Transport and Public Works plays a significant role in all aspects of service delivery to the people of the Western Cape. The Department was required to generate a savings of R25 million in its Compensation of Employees' budget as its contribution to the overall compensation of employees savings in the Provincial Government. If these compulsory savings is excluded, the Department spends 99.6% on its final appropriated budget.

So, I must say, once again the Department achieved a clean audit for its fourth consecutive year. That is plausible. However, there are challenges like any other department has. For instance, representivity was mentioned.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Mention it again.

Mr L H MAX: ... and equality needs to be addressed and there was progress made in the senior management team from 20% women in 2014/5 financial year, increased to 31%. But, there is a challenge with regards to the race balance as well, but I don't want to go into detail because tomorrow we are going to talk about more or less the same things. I just want to mention that the Department offered bursaries to deserving students in Transport Engineering and the Building of Environment [Inaudible.] through the Masakh'iSizwe Bursary Program. The maintenance of Leeuwenhof residency, which the ANC claims is equal to Nkandla. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Max, just finish off your time has already expired.

Mr L H MAX: Oh. There is still a lot. I just want to say, this Committee focuses on three issues. The one is road safety, the second is school infrastructure and the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr L H MAX: ... biggest problem is community safety. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has really expired now, really. Order. That concludes the ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] they are pretending.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Order! Only one person can speak at a time and it is quite important that we give attention now. That concludes the debate on the different reports. I will now put the reports individually.

[Debates concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I put the report on the Annual Report of the

Department of the Premier. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? There is an objection. Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against no.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The aye's have it. The objection will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Provincial Parliament. Are there any objections? Is there an objection? Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against no.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The aye's have it. The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report of the Annual Report of the Provincial Treasury and its entity, the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. Are there any objections? Is there an objection? Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against no.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The aye's have it and I will record the objection. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Community Safety. Are there any objections? Is there an objection? Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against no.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the aye's have it. The objection will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Education. Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against no.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The aye's have it. The objection will be recorded. To save time I will not put it the same way. I will simply offer the opportunity for the parties to object if they so wish for the following reports. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Health. Is that an objection?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Social Development. Is there any objection?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Human Settlements and its entity, the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal. Any objection there?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and its entity, CapeNature. Any objection there?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Transport and Public Works and its trading entity, Government Motor Transport. Any objection there?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture and its entity Cape Agency for Sustainable Integrated Development in Rural Areas, CASIDRA. Any objection there?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and its reporting entities, the Western Cape Tourism Trade and Investment Promotion Agency and the Western Cape Liquor Authority. Are there any objections to that report?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. The objection of the ANC will be recorded. I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, the Western Cape Cultural Commission, the

Heritage Western Cape and the Western Cape Language Committee. Are there any objections to that report?

HON MEMBER: Yes.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no objection. That report is agreed to.

HON MEMBERS: No. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry? Order. Is there an objection? I see the hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you object?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, I did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, I did not see you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You should have listened to the audio, because I said, no. I was the only one who said no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, please do not argue with the Chair. I was asking for objections and I did not hear you. If I made a mistake, then sorry for that, but I will record the objection of the ANC.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you. Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible.] withdraw your comment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I put the report of the Annual Report of the Department of Local Government ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Shut up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did I hear shut up?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please withdraw that.

An HON MEMBER: She was not referring to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker. Please stand up. Please stand up. Did you refer to that member and say “shut up”?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, I did, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please withdraw that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order! Order! I put the report on the Annual Report of the Department of Local Government. Any objections to that report?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. That objection will be recorded. I put the Report of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts on the Annual Reports of the departments and their entities. Are there any objections to that report?

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. That objection from the ANC will also be recorded. Before we get to the adjournment, may I just indicate to members that the Speaker has asked me to tell you that this year there will not be a formal farewell lunch because of the logistical challenges we have, but we will arrange something as a welcome back when we come back in the New Year in our old facility. That brings us to the end of business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:35.