

---

WEDNESDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2017

---

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon, hon members. Guests in the gallery, feel quite welcome. Thank you for being with us here today. I must though point out that as guests you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings of the House but do feel free to enjoy the sitting with us. Thank you.  
[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] ...you must respect the...

The SPEAKER: Order, please members! I think it might be remiss of me to just go headlong into the first Order of the Day. I hear a word being bandied about and it is called “respect”. I would like to ask that we display that mutual respect today and that we manage ourselves and that we do not bring this House into disrepute; that we in fact maintain the dignity and decorum of the House, and I think with two days to go I can quite honestly say I know who the ones are who hide behind whose back, and who does what behind the

scenes. I have - Oh, Minister Winde, I see that hand, so and hon Olivier, I see you going there too, so shall we? [Laughter.]

On that cautionary, let us say, let us make this is a positive sitting. Let us do this in the spirit that it is intended. We are hon members and the rest of the country is watching us so let us do what we do best. I would like to now recognise - is it the Chief Whip I need to recognise? No? Not at all today?

We go straight to the Orders of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

#### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The SECRETARY: Consideration of principle of *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B6 – 2017].

The SPEAKER: Thank you Secretary. I do have a speakers' list and I would like to start right at the top by acknowledging and recognising the hon, the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you hon Speaker, and welcome to our guests in the gallery.

Madam Speaker, when I tabled the Western Cape Government Medium Term Budget Policy Statement in this House on 23 November, I highlighted that this year and the following three years will be challenging as a result of the political economy and the impact of the sinking fiscal envelope over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework. I further emphasise that there is much uncertainty and the recent developments at the National Treasury, state capture and the position of state-owned entities places Government's fiscal strategy at a further risk.

Madam Speaker, the 2017 National Medium Term Budget Policy Statement highlighted a number of risks in its fiscal statements. These include an underperformance of the economy and revenue projection, more pronounced strain and imbalances within public finances as the Public Sector Wage Bill increasingly crowd out other spending. The total tax that we collect as a nation is about R1 trillion. The current Government Wage Bill is 50% of that. In fact it is going to rise over R608 billion. The rising share of debt service cost on the national fiscus, you will recall that the debt service cost has risen from R147 billion to R166 billion. The build-up of unpaid accounts and fiscal imbalances particularly as it relates to some of these other provinces, particularly in Gauteng where we have a R2 billion in terms of contingent liabilities as a result of the medico legal claims. Also Madam Speaker, the continued financial and operational deterioration of the major state-owned enterprises, one that is currently being run by a member of the ruling Opposition party here, the ruling party in the National Assembly, she is doing an outstanding job in destroying public entities in the National

Parliament.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Ja, hulle is 'n klomp skelms!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, they are a bunch of crooks!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Key risks at the national level include also the growing demand for public services as the population and poverty grows.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: 'n Klomp skelms!

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A bunch of crooks!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Water security, the drought, the medium and long-term impact of avian influenza outbreak, the expected... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The expected increase in the occurrence of fires in the Western Cape during the upcoming fire season, crime and the ageing infrastructure and infrastructure backlogs. Madam Speaker, as understood and underscored in the Western Cape Medium Term Budget Policy Statement that despite these challenges we are determined to navigate through these difficult times. Our principles and our values remain our

guiding framework for action. At the core of our values is the rule of law. Unlike President Zuma, Madam Speaker, this Government believes in the rule of law and the advancement of the constitutional democracy. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, President Zuma's appointment of the Presidential Fiscal Commission to in the words of Mr Zuma himself, "work with the Ministry of Finance to help to prepare for the 2018 Budget and in particular to help find ways of meeting our fiscal targets in a difficult economic climate with high debt levels and lower revenue... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Too much noise, Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please. Members, you can have interjections, but not ongoing interruptions. It has now reached the level where you are drowning out the speaker. May I ask that you respect the speaker on the floor? You can talk quietly but when it gets to a level like now, then I have to call you to order. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Madam Speaker, this House should note that the President has appointed a presidential fiscal commission. It is now fully embedded in South Africa's future financial planning, despite falling outside the constitutional recognised fiscal structures. We have a Constitution that describes the fiscal and fiduciary responsibilities of the National Treasury. We have the Public Finance Management Act that determines that the Minister of Finance is the head of the National Treasury but what do we have now, Madam Speaker, is the President has now bypassed

the Constitution. The President has now bypassed the Public Finance Management Act. He has now established a Presidential Fiscal Commission. Can we be honest - it is another way of looting the state. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The PREMIER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, if hon member Dugmore is not awake in this House... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...he will soon find his pension when he retires in the pocket of the Presidential Fiscal Commission. The Presidential Fiscal Commission in comparison reports, Madam Speaker, all the structures that are created in terms of the Public Finance Management Act reports to a legislature or a parliament but Madam Speaker, the Presidential Fiscal Commission in comparison reports only to the President without any public participation requirements. [Interjections.]

Public participation demands that the nation be afforded a real opportunity to weigh in and meaningfully influence decisions. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: There is no public participation.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms P MAKELENI: What do you know about public participation?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, there is no logical reason as to why a parallel body has been established but we know the speciality of Mr Zuma is to put up parallel states. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You steal [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have the legal state and then we have the Gupta state.

The PREMIER: To steal!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: To steal, absolutely right, Premier. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, at best the Presidential Fiscal Committee creates further policy uncertainty and at worst speaks to a sinister move meant to consolidate what is fast becoming a kleptocratic state or as we know it, state capture. If you would like to see the face of state capture I have a picture for you, some of you have a short memory. This is what the face of state capture looks like. This is the face of state capture. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You run to her [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is when you are asked to account for money that disappear in public entities; this is the face that we put up. The ANC is putting up this face. [Interjections.] This is the leader that wants to be Premier in the Western Cape under the ANC. They are captured. This is the face of state capture.

†Mnr L H MAX: Gooi kole! Gooi kole!

[Mr L H MAX: Throw coals! Throw coals!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Also hon Speaker it is clear that President Zuma has no desire... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order Minister. Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat please.

Ms P MAKELENI: Where are the ballot papers?

The SPEAKER: Colleagues, there are political issues, and there are political issues. Let us not cloud the issue here. [Interjections.] It is a debate. Member Gillion, you will have your turn to sit in the Chair later and then you can do what is required but all I am asking is that you cooperate and at least not drown out the speaker on the floor. I have a duty to protect the person who is speaking.

Ms P MAKELENI: Zuma is not going to take us out of the drought.

The SPEAKER: We are not talking about, hon member Makeleni.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Zuma is useless!

Ms P MAKELENI: You are useless.

Ms M N GILLION: You are useless in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Ladies! [Interjections.] Ministers, members, hon member Magaxa, yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: May I address you, Madam Speaker, on this please?

The SPEAKER: Yes you may.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I think, Madam Speaker, you are also contributing to this mess. You are responding to interjections and you are responding in a very biased manner.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And now you are provoking the people to make noise.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, I take your point, except that interjections are allowed but when it drowns out the speaker I have a duty to

protect the speaker on the floor and that was the reason for my calling the House to order. I am guided by Rule 41 which says I must maintain the order of the House so I am appealing to you all. [Interjections.] Hon member Tyatyam, you can assist me and we can cooperate and work together. You may proceed, Minister Meyer.

Ms P MAKELENI: Show us the ballot papers that you shredded.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you hon Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, because we believe in the rule of law, we are despite these fiscal challenges and growing needs and shrinking budget... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: The rule of law - no they have short legs.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We will not take on any unfunded mandates. As a result of mismanagement by National Departments this Government will not take on any unfunded mandates as caused by the National Government's incompetence. While the Medium Term Budget Policy Statements highlights the challenges it also captures our determination, not only to manage the risk but also to do so within the framework of our legal mandates. There were two priorities highlighted in the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and my colleagues will extensively respond to this.

Firstly, this Cabinet has responded to the issue of the drought and we have responded to the issue of safety. This Government has therefore in respect of

the drought, water and fires made allocations totalling R165.3 million for the 2017/18 financial year and a further R157 million for the 2018/19 financial year which are now included in the adjusted budget. As far as crime is concerned the Department of Community Safety will make further provision through reprioritisation within the Department's baseline for requirements regarding the upcoming festive season, economic crimes and safety issues within the city and dealing with the top ten areas affected by crime in the province.

Mr P UYS: Just repeat what you said last please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In the 2018/19 financial year additional money has also been set aside for promoting safety in the Western Cape. The Department of Community Safety also aims to introduce an integrated safe zone and school safety strategy to alleviate the high levels of violence in Lavender Hill through deployment of law enforcement auxiliary services and school safety resource officers at the five high priority schools in the area. [Interjections.] It is, Madam Speaker, yet another example of collaboration between the Departments of Education and Community Safety and community structures such as neighbourhood watches. An amount of R3 million in 2017/18, R3 million in 2018/19, R3.2 million in 2019/20 and R3.2 million in 2020/21 are therefore allocated. The gazetting of allocations to municipalities totals R2.4 billion for the 2017/18 financial year.

Madam Speaker, in summary, the adjusted budgets makes provision for

additional net spending amounting to R284 million bringing the budget of R59.4 billion to R59.7 billion. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Meyer. I now see... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: What happens - all of nonsense... [Inaudible.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Coming from you, unbelievable. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon, Minister Bredell.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, hon Madam Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature, ladies and gentlemen, thank you for the opportunity. I would like to start by thanking the disaster relief workers and other officials involved for their ongoing role in tackling the worst drought the Western Cape has ever seen. [Interjections.]

There are people working non-stop. There are people working non-stop across this province to ensure that no community runs out of water in the coming months. I want to acknowledge them and thank them. I also want to thank the public for their support to heed the call to use less water and urge them to continue to do so. [Interjections.]

I also want to thank the media for their communication on the matter and helping us to drive the message to save water. We are still not out of the woods and we need the continued cooperation of everyone in the private and public sector to get through the next few months together.

Madam Speaker, I want to speak about the three Government spheres and their particular mandates and areas of responsibility when it comes to water. We are sitting with a terrible drought and we have a lot to answer for. In a crisis no-one wants to point a finger to shift the blame. This is not what I am doing. I am simply going to provide the necessary context to our current predicament. When it comes to water in South Africa, the mandates are different between the three spheres of Government, National, Provincial and Local Government.

The National Government is mandated by the Constitution to look at bulk water infrastructure in the country. This includes dams and pipelines and management of the major water supply schemes. In addition we are seeking clarity in terms of the role of National Government when it comes to provide development of bulk infrastructure like desalination plants and we want to understand whether the funding for bulk projects like desalination must come from National Government. It is my understanding that that is indeed the case and the precedent has been set with prior projects like the desalination plants in Sedgefield and Mossel Bay. Accordingly I believe that the City of Cape Town needs the full financial support of the National Government in terms of bulk desalination moving forward.

In addition across the Western Cape there is a number of longer term projects that require urgent attention of the Department of Water and Sanitation. [Interjections.]

These include the extension of the Voëlvlei and Clanwilliam dam wall projects that have been a long time coming and should indeed have been completed already. There are other general water-related infrastructure projects across the Western Cape that need the National Government's urgent attention. These all makes up the Provincial Drought Risk Register which totals R4.8 billion. We look forward to the National Department's urgent intervention to tackle the concerns raised in the Risk Register about bulk water infrastructure in many of our rural areas particularly.

Madam Speaker, the Provincial Government in essence have no direct water mandate. Instead our role in terms of water is one of oversight, monitoring and support. We have been playing this role diligently and consistently since we first called for disaster declaration late in 2015. In addition we coordinate and manage provincial disasters. That is where my Departments currently come in. Despite our limited role when it comes to water, from 2009 to date the Provincial Government has overseen municipal spending of over R680 million in grant-funding for bulk water infrastructure projects. It is also important to think back on conditions in 2014... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, would you kindly take your seat please. There is a member on the floor. Hon member Tyatyam, is it a point of order?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No-no, can the Minister take a question?

The SPEAKER: I will ask the Minister. You can take your seat. Minister, will you take a question?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I only take questions from senior ANC members and he is not a senior member. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: There will be no question, thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Do you know what the Gini coefficient is?

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is also important to think back. It is also important to think back on conditions in 2014, a year when our dams were overflowing. A drought did not look imminent. In fact the weather

services' forecast gave us no indication that the dry 2015 winter would be repeated in 2016.

The winter of 2015 turned out to be a very dry one. Accordingly in November 2015 when the dams were still 75% full and despite the predictions of a wetter than normal winter season for 2016, we applied to the National Government to declare the Western Cape a drought disaster area. This was denied. Instead in January 2016 we got the go-ahead for a disaster declaration only in five Western Cape local municipalities: the West Coast District, Central Karoo, Witzenberg, Oudtshoorn and Prince Albert. Finally, in May 2017 the entire province was declared a disaster area, 19 months after our initial application.

Lastly the role of Local Government like the Beaufort West or City of Cape Town is to supply systems for clean water delivery to households. Madam Speaker, it is basically the role of our municipalities to make sure that the water that is available to the system gets to our consumers' taps. That involves many working parts and complex systems made trickier by the ongoing drought straining our resources. Making the ongoing crisis worse is the current economic conditions in the country with the recent credit rating downgrade making finances risky. For a city like the City of Cape Town to develop bulk water infrastructure on a massive scale we are talking about potentially multiple billions required to fund these projects. A growing concern from our side as a provincial government considering our oversight role is where this money is going to come from. The City seems intent to

accepting an unfunded National Government mandate to build and maintain major water infrastructure including the emergency major water infrastructure. I am very concerned about the effects this will have on the citizens of the City of Cape Town.

The indications from the leadership at the City seems to be that the City aims to collect the money needed to fund these water projects from its ratepayers via special levies and water price increases as well as reallocated catering of other budgetary items. The City cannot in our view afford to pass on the cost of taking on a National Government responsibility to the citizens, especially not in the current economic climate.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We will be meeting with the City. We will be meeting with the City and hopefully clear the air around this issue.

†Agb Speaker, tye is moeilik en ons sien in die begrotingsaanpassing is meer fondse beskikbaar gemaak aan my Departement om te help met noodverligting en rampverligting. Ons werk hard regoor die provinsie en dit kos baie geld. Ons landbousektor trek veral swaar en gaan nog heelwat meer ondersteuning benodig in die komende paar maande en waarskynlik komende paar jare.

Tesame met die droogteramp sit ons ook met die brandseisoen voor die deur. Verlede jaar het ons enige iets van tussen 17 000 en 18 000 brande regoor die Wes-Kaap bestry waarvan 9 000 veldbrande was. Daar was etlike wat groot skade aangerig het en slegs deur ons voortreflike nooddienerswerkers se harde werk en ons strategie om so vinnig moontlik by die brande uit te kom is verdere skade voorkom.

Ons voorsien dat vanjaar ook weereens 'n baie moeilike brandseisoen gaan wees weens die droogte. Ons open Vrydag die brandseisoen en ek wil weereens van hierdie geleentheid gebruik maak om namens die Wes-Kaap Regering ons nooddienerswerkers sterkte toe te wens vir die Kersseisoen. Baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Madam Speaker, times are tough and we see in the Budget Appropriation more funds have been made available to my Department to assist with emergency relief and disaster relief. We are working hard right across the province and it is costing a lot of money. Our agricultural sector, especially, are struggling and will be requiring a lot more support in the forthcoming few months and probably forthcoming few years.

Along with the drought disaster we also have the fire season at the door. Last year we fought something between 17 000 and 18 000 fires right across the Western Cape of which 9 000 were veld fires. There were several that

caused great damage and only through our excellent emergency service workers' hard work and our strategy to get to the fires as quickly as possible further damage was prevented.

We foresee that this year is again going to be a very difficult fire season due to the drought. We are opening the fire season on Friday and I would like to again use this opportunity to on behalf of the Western Cape Government wish our emergency service workers all the best for the Christmas season, thank you very much.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor! [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. On Thursday, 23 November...

[Interjection.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

Mnr K E MAGAXA: ...I was not surprised to notice that the honourable Premier Helen Zille was absent during the sitting where MEC Ivan Meyer

tabled his Medium Term Budget Policy Statement 2017.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It was very powerful.

Mr K E MAGAXA: To me that was a clear signal of her ignorance of the challenges facing the people, more importantly, the poor and working class in this province. The Western Cape sincerely needs a new genuine leader who cares about the plight of the people and is committed to do everything in his/her power to alleviate people from their daily sorrows of poverty, unemployment... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, kindly take your seat. There is a member on the floor.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...root out inequality...

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. There is a member on the floor. Chief Whip, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, the relevance. Could the hon Leader of the Opposition mention the word "budget" every now and again please?  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: That is a statement Chief Whip. You may proceed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. We have been observing this trend of regularly being absent in the province and touring the world. It was after one of those world tours ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, sorry, I just need to address the naughty-corner there.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...that we were misled that Singapore owes her development from the gains earned during their so-called glorious colonial oppression. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Ah rubbish!

Mr K E MAGAXA: However, our own findings show that this was not the case. Singapore gained independence as the Republic of Singapore on 9 August 1965, as a broken country. Prime Minister Lee Kuan Yew's emphasis was on rapid economic growth, stability and sustainability which propelled to a successful economy and it was never attributed to the colonial rule of her past.

The PREMIER: There is no... [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Singapore by the way... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, kindly take your seat please. There is a member on the floor. Minister Fritz, are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, I want to know - what is the relevance of the history lesson here. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down, sit down!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We are busy with appropriation, and surely the hon member can look at some of the points. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Minister Fritz... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Do not tell me, you are useless also, all of you. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are useless! [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: You are useless!

The SPEAKER: Order, please members, order. [Interjections.] Order please.

An HON MEMBER: You are useless!

The SPEAKER: There have been two points of order raised on relevance. Hon member Magaxa, I will ask you to get to the point. I know you are going somewhere, if you can get there.

Ms P MAKELENI: It is political. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: It is political, Madam Speaker.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Clearly her interest have changed and the people of the Western Cape are bearing the bitter fruits and suffer the most and she must stop thinking that we are ignorant and stupid. You do not understand the history of this world. [Interjections.] It is work unusual in the Western Cape, whilst there have been a call to tighten our belts for a while now. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because you steal the money!  
[Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: In this Department there are a number of senior qualified staff members who were inherited from the previous ANC administration. Some of these staff members are left idle with no responsibilities for almost three years now. They are not utilised... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Magaxa, kindly take your seat. Hon member Beerwinkel, are you rising on a point of order?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes Madam Speaker. It is not parliamentary for another member of this House to cast aspersions on a speaker. MEC Fritz yet again is misbehaving and alluded to a comment that my colleague was making saying “because you steal the money”, so when he was referring to “you” he obviously... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, you point...

Ms M N GILLION: No, do not lie! Do not lie!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That was the speaker on the floor...

Ms M N GILLION: Exactly!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So when you say “you” you are referring to the speaker that was on the floor.

†Me M N GILLION: Sit hom weer uit.

[Ms M N GILLION: Put him out again.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He must withdraw that statement.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Beerwinkel. [Interjections.] Minister

Fritz, the statement that was made may I ask who were you referring to?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC. The ANC, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ANC, because all the Ministers steal the money, everyone and every department they steal, steal and steal.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They steal us empty, empty. There is no more money. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, hon member Magaxa, you may proceed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I think my time is not going to be stolen in the process.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No-no the time is stalled when there is a point of order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is work unusual in the Western Cape, whilst there has

been a call to tighten our belts for a while now. In this Department, particularly the Premier's Department, there are a number of senior qualified staff members who were inherited from the previous ANC administration. Some of these staff members are left idle with no responsibilities for almost three years now. They are not utilised optimally, efficiently and productively with the skills they possess and requisite experience acquired over time.

Mr M G E WILEY: You are confusing the [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Does that not qualify as fruitless and wasteful expenditure? I argue, yes, it does. Not only does the DA suppress non-political civil servants, but is similarly found to be pursuing this unorthodox way within their own party structures. Advocate Lennit Max is one such victim. He is one of the most learned members in this Provincial Legislature and yet he is shifted from pillar to post because he is independent and assertive. The DA is anti-black people who are assertive. [Interjections.]

The very same honourable Premier employed former COPE people, initially denying that they were from the DA and put in the Premier's Department...

[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Sit down!

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down, sit down.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...but the same individual today, Malusi Booi is a DA Councillor... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and Mbulelo Bara is a DA member of Parliament in the National Assembly.

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat. There is a member on the floor. Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Madam Speaker, I must appeal to you on the grounds of relevance. [Interjections.] Really, I would like your ruling on the matter. You have already admonished the member and I would like your ruling on the matter please.

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip.

Ms M N GILLION: You are wasting time.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, there was no relevance whatsoever in the speech of MEC Meyer.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr P UYS: So please just be consistent. That is all I am asking.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Speaker called it politics. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Colleagues, it is my duty to ensure fairness procedurally. I cannot talk to the content of what is being delivered by a speaker, but I am asking that the topic we are busy with, it is the Second Reading Debate. Let us try and be relevant and stay as close to the topic as possible. Name calling and screaming and shouting at each other are certainly not going to help improve the situation, so may we allow the hon member Magaxa to proceed. Thank you. You may proceed, hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I am convinced that it was due to her lack of leadership and absence that one of the key departments, the Department of Agriculture, failed to submit an annual report for 2016/17.

It is the very same department that is heavily affected by drought, yet the leadership took their eyes off the ball.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Shame on the DA and its leadership. National Finance Minister Gigaba stated in his Medium Term Budget speech that:

“The Medium Term Budget Policy Statement is an important opportunity to reflect on the country’s finances and economic outlook, and to what extent this outlook supports our national development objectives as articulated in Vision 2030.”

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He further remarked... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Gillion’s placard is distracting me, I must admit. Hon member Magaxa, thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: He further remarked that:

“The biggest challenge facing South Africa is the creation of jobs and how we dramatically reduce unemployment. In order to overcome this challenge, all social partners, namely “business, organised labour and civil society must come together and forge unity of purpose, and find common solutions to growing the economy inclusively, and on a more radical and sustainable basis.”

How does the Western Cape statement meet these requirements? How does it? I do not think so, because the DA's house is not in order. The Premier is suspended from her party. Both Patricia De Lille and JP Smith are under investigation.

The PREMIER: I am not!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Honourable MEC Bonginkosi Madikizela is facing probes as he failed to declare gifts in terms of law. MEC Madikizela was also elected the new leader in the Western Cape under a cloud of vote rigging and corruption.

An HON MEMBER: Corruption, ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Lennit Max is challenging the stolen election in his Congress. [Laughter.] DA senior officials in the City of Cape Town, Achmat Ebrahim, Melissa Whitehead and Craig Kesson face suspension following alleged corruption worth millions that that Minister must also take into consideration. Hon MP Mark Wiley is now facing a civil claim of nearly R2 million for undue termination of a contract with a certain Mr Joe Juries of Busy Boy Technology. [Interjections.]

This amount to fruitless and wasteful expenditure and the DA still brags about audits and good governance while money is stolen in your face

increasingly. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Lousy and corrupt!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No corruption.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA is commonly found in scandalous corruptive activities instead of prioritising service delivery to the people of this province. When you corrupt your own province how far do you corrupt our money? Have the Ministry of Local Government and more importantly the Premier acted on these embarrassing developments both in Cape Town and the Provincial Government on their watch? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You do not understand...

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Western Cape is facing a catastrophic drought due to the lack of rain and victims of the recent fires are yet to be assisted. The intergovernmental Drought Task Team is found wanting. The Adjustments Estimates of R74 million in the Department of Agriculture do not talk to the recovery projects to the areas affected by drought and fires.

Notwithstanding these challenges, the Department of Agriculture is still experiences roll-over of funds to the tune of more than R2 million in

administration. [Interjections.] This is money shifted - you are laughing - within programmes to fund severance packages of a retired Chief Director. This is clearly unacceptable. You are not even ashamed of yourself. [Interjections.]

It is no wonder some say it is a shame on the MEC and their cronies. Just last week it was reported that there is no progress in re-blocking Imizamo Yethu after the severe fires in March this year. No agreement has been reached between Cape Town and the community. The City is accused of causing divisions between the residents. This is a DNA that is found everywhere in the DA-led administration. It is a cancer that must be rid from our communities in order to bring about better lives for all - not rhetoric. The whole budget is much of the same old false tune songs without substance.

I thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon the Minister, Minister Grant.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hon Madam Speaker, Madam Premier, Cabinet colleagues, hon Leader of the Official Opposition, hon members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, officials of the Western Cape Government, ladies and gentlemen. Thank you for the opportunity to speak to the Second Reading of the 2017 Adjusted

Estimates of Provincial Expenditure in this House. At the outset I should like to congratulate my colleague, Minister Meyer, on his constructive... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, it was not constructive.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...but realistic presentation of this matter last Thursday and to thank him for his continued mature management of the finances of the Western Cape during a very challenging period.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You did not write that speech. Somebody wrote that speech... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Minister Meyer set out very clearly the limitations inherent... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...in the current fiscal envelope and the huge threat posed to the overall economic well-being of the country by the continued mismanagement of a raft of state owned enterprises and other state entities. One can only hope that once the by now tedious litany of accusations of half-truths and outright lies has been resolved, some sort of financial and management sanity can be restored.

The people of South Africa are tired of seeing telephone number sized amounts of money being wasted, unaccounted for, and - I must name it for what it is - stolen while levels of service provision remain at best stagnant.

[Interjection.]

It comes as no surprise that Minister Gigaba has been asked to pull a fat rabbit out of a lean hat to deal with the enormous fiscal hole in the national budget. It is widely rumoured, of course, that the hat in question will turn out to have been manufactured in a Gupta-owned factory.

The PREMIER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, this time last year I made the observation that South Africans as people and as a nation have shown themselves able to survive and build through difficult and dangerous times. Our economy, too, has shown its resilience over many years. It managed to stumble through the economic fantasies of apartheid including skewed priorities, distorted education and suppressed employment and labour practices. In more recent years it also had to deal with some dangerous economic radicalism and appalling decision-making.

Who ever thought that the words “looting” and “captured” would become part of the language of economics!

Ms P MAKELENI: Are you serious?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The calm waters of the National Development Plan are but a distant dream. Madam Speaker, in the time available to me I would like to expand on comments made by Minister Meyer last week in relation to aspects of infrastructure provision, a major responsibility of my Department. While this is a far-ranging and complex issue, for the purposes of this Second Reading Debate I want to focus on two specific things.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You still have not [Inaudible.] Where is the looting?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The first of these is illustrated in a quote from a report issued by the Brookings Institute as recently as 9 November. The extract reads as follows:

“Infrastructure policy discussions regularly highlight the need for new projects like wider highways and new transit lines. This makes sense: voters and the media cannot ignore the infrastructure they see and ribbon-cutting ceremonies are visible successes for politicians. But by focusing on NEW infrastructure projects, policymakers overlook the more economically significant challenge facing most of the country - maintenance.”

Yet another report highlights the rough rule of thumb that every one unit of expenditure on preventative maintenance saves between four and ten units on future repairs.

My Department has argued for some time in favour of providing adequately for maintenance even within tight infrastructure budgets. In this regard, the road maintenance policies practised by our Roads Branch have paid handsome dividends for the Western Cape, but even these are under pressure to keep up with the rate of wear and tear with the increasing number of vehicles and trucks on our roads. The same scenario exists beyond the road network onto our broader built environment i.e. our general Government buildings, our health facilities as well as our schools.

Under these circumstances, even in the most restrictive of economic times, maintenance must be a funding priority and maintenance budgets must be respected.

Madam Speaker, in this regard, we all have an obligation to face up to the following questions:

1. What is the price to current and future generations for decisions we do and do not take today?
2. What will we place at risk tomorrow if we do not make the right decisions today?

A recent article about South Africa pointed out that we have lost our sense of history. We have become a ten minute nation which conveniently forgets what happened yesterday. The nature and track records of some of the world would-be players in South Africa suggest that there is more than a degree of

truth in this assertion.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We have not forgotten Tafelberg [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, we cannot afford to become a nation of 10-minute thinkers when we develop plans and make decisions about the road ahead. The price future generations will have to pay cannot be ignored.

This brings me to the second of the challenges which I referred to earlier. Last year in this debate I referred to the impact of the drought in parts of the province and said that we want to be in a position to handle all climate change issues better in future years. In this regard I have left a discussion about water provision to better qualified colleagues. I must, however, point out that much of the construction of the Department of Transport and Public Works over the MTEF period is water intensive and that infrastructure is climate sensitive. So, Madam Speaker, in my portfolio we are cognisant of the fact that the World Economic Forum has identified that the greatest threat to the global economy is increasingly the environment. Various environmental factors now outweigh economic, geopolitical, societal and technological considerations.

The Western Cape Government climate change response strategy identified the following predictive impacts of environmental change:

- Decrease in rainfall
- Increased severity of droughts
- Higher average temperatures
- Increased intensity of extreme events
- Increase in flooding and storm surges
- Decreased viability of ecosystems
- Increased coastal impacts
- Fewer cold and frost days
- Increased fire risk

These predictive risks now need to be factored into our built environment and infrastructural plans so that we do not locate facilities appropriately. We also need to:

- Invest, firstly, in research into alternative smart technology around delivery;
- Secondly, focus on non-infrastructure solutions to service demands;
- Thirdly, review service delivery models and norms and standards;
- And finally, investigate and consider serious alternative methodologies for the delivery of infrastructure.

Madam Speaker, it is often pointed out by political commentators that a government is not known only by its policies and by its ability to implement them. It is also known by how it deals with situations as they arise, particularly extreme situations and even more such situations which arise

from outside sources. The Western Cape Government is determined to be such a government.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of member... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Words, it is only words!

The SPEAKER: Have you finished your interjection, hon member Dugmore?

An HON MEMBER: It is not walk and talk?

The SPEAKER: Walk and talk. In the absence of the hon Bernard Joseph of the EFF I now see member D Joseph. I see you, you may proceed.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker. The completion of the annual reports as well as the Adjustments Appropriation processes with the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement including our entities bears testimony that the Western Cape has a well functioning government, lead by and I want to say to the hon member Magaxa, lead by our Premier, who is a respected South African leader and the Premier of the Western Cape voted in by the majority of the voters in the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And a friend of the Guptas... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: And a friend of the Guptas also...

Mr D JOSEPH: The political leadership supported by quality leadership and staff within the departments and entities formed the basis of the success story of the Western Cape. Members of all political parties in this House are allowed to carry out their oversight role over the Executive in the interest of the residents in the Western Cape.

Mr S G TYATYAM: They do not do that.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC in the Western Cape, the party that participates here in the Western Cape Government is allowed to do oversight while the ANC in other provinces is not allowed to do oversight under the ANC rule.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! That is not... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, “the ANC versus the ANC” as quoted in the *Cape Times* today is not new.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr D JOSEPH: The trust that voters have placed in the DA since 2006, including the 2014 elections and moving towards 2019 is the new discussion in the hands of the voters.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr D JOSEPH: The absence of leadership in the ruling party the ANC as well as the absence of the ANC Executive at the state capture debate last night is no coincidence. Madam Speaker, the ANC is the sinking ship called the Titanic as the ACDP President has always called it. [Interjections.]

†Op hierdie punt wil ek baie geluk sê aan die ACDP Provinsiale Leier, die agbare lid Ferlon Christians, wat weer verkies is as leier van die Wes-Kaap by die naweek se konferensie... [Applous.] ...alhoewel daar ook 'n teenveldtog binne die ACDP was oor leierskap, wat ook sê daar is ook probleme in die ACDP. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[On this point I wish to congratulate the ACDP Provincial Leader, the hon member Ferlon Christians, who was elected again as leader of the Western Cape during the weekend's conference... [Applause.] ...although there has also been a counter campaign within the ACDP about leadership, which shows there is also problems within the ACDP. [Interjections.]]

†All parties are given the opportunity to participate in the Adjustments Budget process and Provincial Treasury is guiding us under very difficult circumstances to make sure that fiscal consolidation is maintained. Madam

Speaker, according to the Reserve Bank research shows that the economic growth will increase by 10% if the leadership and fiscal consolidation challenge facing South Africa is addressed. The global economy recovery growth is predicted at 6.3% towards 2019. The question we must ask: why is South Africa not part of the global growth and the ANC is clear. It is an abuse of power by the ANC. It is abuse of state resources and taxpayers money that should be intended and intended for a better life.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC's refusal to listen to constructive criticism from within their own ranks has created their own Titanic. Self-evaluation includes listening to all stakeholders, which will strengthen the link between good governance and better performance in government. The Western Cape built up a record of continuous improvement due to self-evaluation and organisational performance.

Madam Speaker, that is why more people have voted for the DA since 2006 and after the 2014 elections including Gauteng and the Eastern Cape Metros where the voters have said: "Enough, ANC, enough is enough."

The scope of government in the Western Cape is once again hindered by gross maladministration and corruption at national level under the leadership of President Jacob Zuma. We have allowed the economy to be mismanaged and state-owned entities are on the brink of collapse.

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] Joburg, tomorrow.

*[Hon member Ms Gillion takes the Chair.]*

Mr D JOSEPH: As a result budgets have been cut. Our economy has been stagnated and the DA-led Government also feels the brunt of a tighter budget allocation. Furthermore, the President and his Committee and the Presidential Committee now oversee each and every decision made by the National Minister including National Treasury.

Madam Speaker, acting Speaker, the National Treasury is no longer a safe place for our economy. This - when the Western Cape Government is in the grip of the most severe drought in 100 years, and faces a widespread outbreak of avian flu and thankfully there is improvement in that situation. Over the next three years the Western Cape Government will have to adjust to a R5 billion budget due to the collapse of the National Government Budget Fiscal Strategy under the ANC. Less money means our capacity to deliver to our residents is once again threatened by the ANC's incompetence. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: You have to reserve [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, this is the Western Cape Government's response to an economic failure at national level. This is what the Adjustments Budget and the Appropriation is bringing to the table. We will

not be threatened or stagnated by ANC. We will use our leadership in this Western Cape, well-qualified leaders in the departments, to go beyond what we need to deliver to the people in the Western Cape. Under the leadership of our hon Minister Dr Ivan Meyer, Minister of Finance in the Western Cape who will lead us so that we can face this storm of the gross negligence of the ANC until the DA takes over at National Government. [Interjections.]

†Die hoop vir Suid-Afrika is 'n alternatiewe regering wat die belange van al die mense eerste stel. Die hoop om Suid-Afrika te red vir 'n beter toekoms lê lank nie meer in die hande van die ANC nie. Dit lê by 'n alternatiewe regering in samewerking met ander partye waar die DA sal regeer na 2019. Ek dank u. [Applous.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The hope for South Africa is an alternative government that puts the interests of all the people first. The hope to save South Africa for a better future has for a long time not been in the hands of the ANC. It lies with an alternative government in cooperation with other parties where the DA will govern after 2019. I thank you. [Applause.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Mooi, mooi!  
[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good, good!]

The CHAIRPERSON: I see the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Chairperson, yes, we need more money for drought and yes, we need more money for safer schools and more money for crimes in communities, but we cannot speak about Adjustments Estimates in isolation without state capture. We cannot speak about Adjustments Estimates without the downgrading of South Africa, and also the Wage Bill. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, with the shrinking national fiscus there is severe pressure on this province so I want to as the ACDP thank the Minister of Finance, Minister Ivan Meyer and his Department for excellent work done, and Chairperson, the important thing is I believe he is a capable Minister and doing a good job... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But Madam Speaker, talking about Adjustments estimates I also want to thank the hon member Magaxa for supporting Cyril Ramaphosa to be President of South Africa and down with Nkosazana Zuma; down! So I want to congratulate him for supporting Cyril Ramaphosa, because Cyril Ramaphosa will bring back Pravin Gordhan. [Interjections.]

He will bring back Pravin Gordhan and fire Jacob Zuma. [Interjections.] So Chairperson, you see the problem is that experts are predicting the downgrade will trigger more volatility. It will trigger more volatility so we must remember Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Order!

The CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Christians, can you take your seat please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The relevance, where is the relevance here?

The CHAIRPERSON: I am going to rule on that now.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Please man, because he is just abusing our ears.

The CHAIRPERSON: Ja, hon member Christians, please stick to the relevance of the debate.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: But this was all mentioned in the other debates. I am just adding. I am just adding, so Chairperson, the important thing is with downgrades, with state capture and all that, and just the other day we heard that the Minister of State Security gave a blank cheque to the evidence leader, Mr Vanara, in an affidavit, to make a way with Eskom - the inquiry in Eskom. More state cancer is taking us backwards. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON: Your time has expired, hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It cannot be. [Time expired.]

The CHAIRPERSON: I see the hon member Beerwinkel.

An HON MEMBER: This man is angry, Chair, yoh! [Laughter.]  
[Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sorry. House Chair, I just need to calm down first. Thank you. Anyway, Chairperson, when compiling the budget, be it the Main Appropriation or the Adjustments, you have to take your policy priorities and strategies into account and that is exactly where the loopholes were discovered as we concentrated on the specific PSGs and one very glaring gap in these policies as you will even notice today, that there is nothing specifically in any of these PSGs that specifically refers to the empowerment of women especially that we are in this time of the month but even more so it is very glaring, the value that the DA adds to women input... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is mainstream.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And that there are absolutely no women - there are no women on the speakers' list today to add to the value of what they think of women-input. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is your contribution, yes. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Chairperson, adjustments from national are not a right. They are a privilege based on the needs that are submitted and then allocations are made. However, this adjusted amount of R285 million made up of allocations of R95 million from National, 384 from province and 195

subtracted because of committed, it singles out housing development even though housing development is lowest on its spending to date, so we hope that they will put to good use the R43 million that has been allocated for infrastructure projects in non-Metro areas, and also utilise the allocation for water tanks where it is needed most and also that an education process happens during this very strangely [Inaudible.] title deed campaign for political expediency because more homeowners mean more rates and taxes for municipalities. However, most of these new homeowners end up with sky-high water bills even before they can enjoy their newly allocated home so together with those allocations of title deeds there must be an education process to explain to people that with their new responsibility comes an added financial burden.

Let me also say it is quite obvious how the MEC of Finance's language has changed over time, as we play our oversight role more effectively because you have noticed he does not shout at us anymore about putting an alternative budget on the table. Why? Because we have simply alerted him to the fact, and all of you, alerted you to the fact that we have rights to amendments.

Ms P MAKELENI: Are you listening?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: However, I also have to state with concern, MEC, that in spite of the work that you did to go and find the information and tell us what to do, the implementation of this is not happening in the way that we would have liked it to happen [Interjections.], so whichever body or forum it

is stuck, Speaker's or Deputy Speaker's forum, it is not coming to this House so that we can ... [Interjection.] work on it.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Why do you not just pay back the money?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And so [Interjections.] while it may be ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The taxpayers are [Inaudible.] to this province.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Chairperson, and so it may seem today that we are just going through a tick-box exercise again just accept what has been put down in front of us, that we will just go through the motions. There is a little secret that none of these MECs have ever told us and that is that after this Adjustments Budget, they are still allowed to move money around, shift funds around within the departments. We have never been told that. It has never been brought to our attention, it has never been singled out and it happened because the Premier went to Singapore ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Because of [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... gave Wesgro R500 000,00, which is in her right to do, but we were not informed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Why must you be [Inaudible.]?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and when asking the question of how this could happen, we then discovered that this can happen after Adjustments period.

So obviously you want to know but what justifies that? [Interjections.] Then – if the Chairperson of Finance will just listen [Inaudible.] he would have done in his time already. Not expect us to do it.

Let me read to you what it says, Chairperson, and I am reading from a National Treasury ... [Interjection.] directive. It is about viraments. Now originally I was sent to Section 43 of the PFMA, which speaks to viraments and that is all it does. It just speaks to ordinary viraments which tells you you can move from one programme to another programme within 8%, but it does not tell you that after the Adjustments Budget you can do it again ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So what?!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... to the 8%.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So what? What is the matter [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: MEC Fritz, MEC Fritz, your running comments, please. MEC Fritz ...

An HON MEMBER: Ja, tell her.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: After the finalisation of the Adjustments Budget Appropriation process, the accounting officer can again shift 8% of savings under the programme to defray excess expenditure under another programme.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That is in the law.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The shifting of funds – yes, MEC, you are right, it is in the law. That is why I am reading it. The shifting of funds by the accounting officer after the Adjustments Budget must be reflected in the Annual Financial Statements.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Now, Chairperson, how many of us sitting here as oversight, or even those chairpersons at the back there, have ever picked up in an annual report when finances have been shifted around after the Adjustments Budget? We are not told that. [Interjection.] So what is the implication of that, Chairperson? If the Chief Whip will just listen he would also learn something.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

Mr M G E WILEY: Why do you not just [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: While 8% may be shifted from one programme to another, this 8% should not exceed 8% of the receiving programme.

In a sense I have to thank the Premier for having done that because if she had not done it we would not have asked the questions and we would not have got to the bottom of how it can be done and why it can be done.

So what is the implication of that, Chairperson? That when we would do our oversight correctly, go back to our Standing Committees now, we have a right to request amendments to budgets that have been placed in front of us, as long as it stays within the 8% of movement for viraments.

We will be coming for you in terms of those changes that we want because we have a right. And the reason why I am lifting it out, Chairperson, we have never been made aware of this right that we have to, after the Adjustments Budget, ask for amendments and adjustments as long as it is less than 8%, and the shift from the one programme to the other must also not be more than 8% of that programme.

We have never heard that. We have never implemented it. We have never been told that we can do it. We have never been shown when it does happen that it has happened. [Interjection.]

Unless, Chairperson, you come to the Main Appropriation or when annual reports are presented, you come with your Adjustments Budget book, you come with your Main Appropriation book and you sit there with all those books and compare. Only then will you pick it up.

So I am saying ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: But that is your work.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... we have a right to do this, and we have a right to ask for amendments where we think monies can be shifted around. I am just making that point. [Inaudible.]

Let me also just say, Chairperson, on the day when I put the question the DG, Brent Gerber, was honest enough to say he did not even know that that was allowed. He was honest enough to say it. He did not know. The AG could not answer the question when we put it. It was one of the members in the Premier's Office who explained it in the way that it happened after first sending me to Section 43, which I found did not answer the question. Then I laid hands on this document. So I am just saying as oversight members we will be playing that oversight role to request more from where we see it is

necessary. [Pause.] Quiet now.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi dit, gooi dit!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw it, throw it!]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So in that regard I just wanted to say that again the ANC has woken up to benefits of processes that you are hiding from us.

An HON MEMBER: Eventually. [Interjections.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And when MEC Bredell speaks about oversight and the oversight role that they have over water and all of that, the fact that you have oversight and you did not exercise it in the way you have done, allows things to get out of hand. Why do you think this DA run province gets and boasts about their supposed clean audits? Because the Opposition is playing their oversight role in an effective way. [Interjections.] We keep you on your toes. [Interjections.] We keep you on your toes. [Interjections.] Why else? Their chairpersons also do not even know. Some of them do not even know that they are supposed to play an oversight role. They have a sweetheart attitude towards their MECs.

Mr D JOSEPH: It does not happen in other [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Which is also the reason, Chairperson ... [Interjection.] why they are forever needing to speak about other provinces as

if they are sitting in the National Assembly. They are not. They speak about other provinces because they have no confidence in their own members who are in the opposition in those other provinces to do their work. That is why you do it here. We do not talk about other provinces, we talk about the Western Cape. We do not talk about National Assembly, we leave them to do what they are supposed to do.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Because you know they are not doing [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Repeatedly we have been told how long ago the City was warned about this imminent drought, but now that it is basically upon us the only real solutions we are hearing are boreholes, but nothing which will address the problem in a real sense. Desalination is expensive and it is far ...  
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Mackenzie, hon member Mackenzie.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why are experts from the drought stricken countries who have mastered the art of water resource maintenance, not been invited to visit and assist.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You can finish your sentence, hon member.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Where – let me go now.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: [Inaudible.] add value to this debate?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I have taught you something which you did not know.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: At least [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I have taught you something which you did not know. Let me just say, Chairperson, it is a shock to discover how much importance is attached to safety from this budget that has just been reallocated. Children's safety to get to school ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: That is a long sentence.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... to get from school is – all kinds of excuses are made about the safety that should be attributed to kids. [Interaction.] Actually the root cause lies in that Social Development programme. Not with MEC Fritz ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... I mean not with MEC Dan Plato [Interjections.] with MEC Fritz. It lies there.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel. [Applause.] I see the hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very, very much, Chairperson.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I think before I get on to what I was going to speak about, I just wanted to react to one thing that the hon member Carol Beerwinkel spoke to. I have asked a question and I was quickly trying to do some research on her statement around a special adjustment, but if my memory serves me correctly, we have done it twice in my term in this House, and in actual fact we did it once last year, and the hon member actually spoke in that special Adjustments vote, which was outside of the normal Adjustments process, but I will check on that before tomorrow.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Chairperson, may I address you?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: MEC Winde ... [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: It is the same, the same.

An HON MEMBER: The same, ja.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, they are not the same, they are not the same, they are not the same. MEC Bredell is not MEC ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not a point of order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... they are not the same. Chairperson, MEC Winde is attributing facts that I did not state . [Interjections.].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip, please. Hon member Beerwinkel, continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please.

An HON MEMBER: Sit down. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Beerwinkel, continue.  
[Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Chairperson, at no stage did I say that there was never an extra Adjustments Budget. The only time [Interjections.] ...  
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... the only time you get that ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel.  
[Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Please, quiet, sit down. [Interjections.] Just admit you learnt something.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Beerwinkel, take your seat. Continue hon Minister Winde. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Chairperson. I am not too sure what that was about.

So obviously we are standing here today to talk about the Adjustments

Budget. This is the political discussion on the Adjustments and of course this is where we put all of it into context - where you have to make an adjustment according to the rules and in the ecosystem, the environment, the space we find ourselves in. And I think the hon Minister of Finance started off by saying this is an adjustment in an expensive political economy, and that is exactly right. We are doing adjustments in very, very difficult times. So if we think about the context we find ourselves in that political economy, I think that is where we need to start.

So if we look at the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement from the National Minister of Finance, we know going forward we have to cut probably R5 billion out of our budget going forward as this government. We need to understand that going forward because we need to understand what the current pressures are. It is not only just about fixing your existing budget, but it is understanding that future in which we operate in. We have got to build that in the context of ongoing downgrades by the rating agencies of seriously bad government at a national level.

The PREMIER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: A government at a national level that is not capable of offering us that ecosystem and that environment in which to operate, and of course this massive problem that we have in our country of serious corruption. Stealing, looting, you have heard it a number of times today, and of course

this bad government that I am referring to comes from a political party and of course if the political party themselves cannot even get their 54<sup>th</sup> conference going ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Who said [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Only yesterday and this was not advertised by the party, this came out of the Presidency ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is that a point of order?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No, Chair, can I address you? Can I address you on the issue? Chair, just to remind the House that the National Conference of the African National Congress starts on 16 of December.

An HON MEMBER: That is not a point of order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: So I am not sure where that comes from. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Please, please hon members. Continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Chairperson. That is exactly the conference that I

am talking about. The one on 16<sup>th</sup> to the 20<sup>th</sup>, that the Presidency had to give clarity yesterday that it was actually in Gauteng and not Kimberley.

[Interjections.]

18 days before a conference of a party that is supposed to run a country [Interjections.] that do not even know where the conference is going to be and then when they advertise it, not from the party [Interjections.], not from the party ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you take your seat. [Interjections.]  
Can you take your seat, Minister Winde. Hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Chairperson, may I address you? Can you call the House into the order of the debate? We are not discussing the ANC's 54<sup>th</sup> conference here. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]. Order!  
[Interjections.]. Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Chair, as I said in the beginning, this is the context that we have to do an Adjustments Budget in. When 18 days before a conference, the ruling party in the country does not even know whether it is in Kimberley or Gauteng ... [Interjections.] and then they correct it and say, "No-no-no-no-no, it is in Gauteng," [Interjections.] but they still do not know where in

Gauteng because they are busy looking for a conference facility where the chairs are bolted to the ground. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! [Interjections.] Can we have order! [Interjections.] Can we have order from both sides of the House please? Hon MEC Winde, continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Chair. Also, obviously the lead up to this conference - I saw one hour and 26 minutes ago, the courts in the Free State said that the Free State cannot even hold their conference in the lead up to this big one on the 16<sup>th</sup>. [Interjections.]

But of course you can hear there is a lot of emotion in this House [Interjections.]. If I can give this House one message, that side of the House, just get rid of Zuma and Gupta, please, on the 16<sup>th</sup>. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But of course, Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Chair, is the MEC prepared to take a question?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, he is.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Can the MEC take this House ... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: On a point of order, Chair. He is going to ask where the conference is. That is what he is going to ask.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Okay, I will explain ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Joseph, I did not give you a ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You think are important.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please. Can we have order in the House if there is someone on the floor. Thank you. Continue.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Chair, seeing that the MEC is in a conference mood and he agreed to take a question, can he just explain to us what happened to the votes of their provincial conference which is disputed? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The votes were dealt with, the delegates voted, a leader was chosen [Interjections.], we advertised the conference way in advance, delegates came from across the province [Interjections.] and it was an orderly

conference with a great outcome. [Interjections.].

*[The Speaker takes the Chair.]*

HON MEMBERS: Bring back the ballots, bring back the ballots. [Chanting and clapping.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Hon members. Minister Winde, take your seat. Let us get back to our business of the day. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Where are the ballots? Just [Inaudible.] [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, Minister Winde, thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. So this is the context, the political context.

Now let us look at the political context influence on the economic context. So the hon Minister of Finance spoke about the downgrades and the effect that has on our economy. They cannot even find 1% growth in our economy, and of course the political shenanigans, thievery that goes on in the ANC, the impact can be spelled out perfectly when you see the World Economic Forum risk ratings, Madam Speaker, and I will just take you through one or two of these indicators:

- Irregular payments and bribes.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We were rated as number 53 in the world, we are now 91.

- Judicial independence, we were rated as 16 quite proudly, we are now 36.
- Strength of investor protection. We were rated at 14 in the world, not too bad. We are now 21. That is of course because of the Guptas.
- Ease of access to loans. You can understand loans, specifically if you want to get access to finance, to grow an economy, we were number 12, we are now at 62.

But let us look at the real ones that made a big difference.

- Availability of financial services. We were number 2 in the world. The ANC have very happily taken us to 32.
- Financing through local equity markets. We were number 1 in the world. The ANC have taken us to 25.
- Soundness of banks. Number 2. The ANC have taken us to 37.  
[Interjections.]
- Regulation of security exchanges. Number 3, they have taken us to

46.

An HON MEMBER: Wow!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

- Efficiency of corporate boards. Number 3, they have taken us to 34.

Ms M M WENGER: Shocking!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

- And strength of auditing standards. We were 1 in the world, and they have happily taken us to number 30.

These are these ... [Interjections.]. This is this government ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in which we have to do an Adjustments Budget where we have got one of the worst droughts in living memory, Madam Speaker. [Interjection.].

Now, the hon Minister Bredell spoke about ... [Interjection.] the different roles ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon member Makeleni ... [Interjection.] If you wish to pose a question to the Minister, then kindly direct it through the Chair, but that finger just was not on right now. Please? Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The hon Minister Bredell spoke about the different roles of the different spheres of government with regards to this drought. I want to bring to this House's attention ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You can submit the [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... the National Department of Water Affairs and Sanitation whose job it is, and I heard the hon member Makeleni say earlier in this debate, "So tell us about what is going on at the National Department." I am going to tell you what is going on at the National Department. [Interjections.] They have got 900 posts ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your seat. [Interjections.] Are you rising on a point of order, hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes, Madam Speaker, can my name not be used in vain also? [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: That is not exactly a point of order, but please, take your seat.

Ms P MAKELENI: No, did not raise that.

The SPEAKER: I cannot ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You must just say he cannot use my name.

The SPEAKER: I cannot talk to the context of the debate ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Not in my name, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I will have to go to Hansard, but I am going to allow the Minister to proceed, thank you. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In the context of the worst drought in living memory, the impact that it is going to have on the poorest of the poor in this province, the National Department ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] you are Tweeting about.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... who is supposed to be this Department who offers that bulk servicing, has at the moment, and since 2013, had 900 posts unfilled, they have had seven Heads of Department in the last 10 years. In March this year they had R1,5 billion that they owe to contractors. Six months later they had only paid half of that out to contractors. These are businesses who need to make ends meet.

They have got R2,6 billion that they owe to the Reserve Bank, they have got R9,8 billion that they have not collected on water fees and charges on water that is being delivered. They have got a department that have not put out a Blue Drop [Interjections.] or a Green Drop Report since 2013. This is the Department that is supposed to be arranging bulk water supply for the residents, agriculture, the economy of this province.

They have put back the Clanwilliam Dam because they cannot afford to do it, they are not maintaining their canals, they are not able to offer the bulk water service, and on top of that, until March, they were still denying that we had a problem. [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And this is the Department whom now we have to step in and start to put mechanisms in place, and what the hon Minister Bredell said was

absolutely correct. This Department, this bankrupt, very badly run Department, who is supposed to be stepping in, we are going to have to make plans, we are going to have to use water wisely, more wisely than ever before, but what we are going to do, is we are going to send the account for their failure to National Treasury. [Applause.]

We are going to send them the account, we will step in where we need to. We will send them that account because they cannot get away ... [Interjections.] with this really badly run National Government that puts the economy of this province under such dire pressure.

Now let me tell you about what is going to happen with this economy, specifically in the agricultural sector because of this Department's failure. Do you know that in the deciduous fruit sector, the pressure that we are going to be put under, the Cape has around 68 000 households that produce fruit. I am not talking about the big agricultural sectors. In the big agricultural sectors we already know we are going to lose R4,96 billion in GVA, 35 634 jobs are under pressure just in the fruit sector, but the households, these are families, households in our provinces ... [Interjection.] 30 000 of these households use municipal drinking water to produce food, which they are not able to do at all anymore. [Interjections.] Disappeared, gone out of the system ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And you knew about this ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... lost. In Ceres R40 million from the Wage Bill is going to be missing. If we only have 30% available water and we have a 50% reduction in the fruit producing arena, we lose R547 million in the Wage Bill. That is going to impact families, the poorest of the poor, and the knock-on is going to knock-on onto health services, education, every single facet of society because this is a very serious drought, and have a look at how much money in this Adjustments is coming to deal with the drought in South Africa via National Adjustments. Very, very little because there is no responsibility, there is no action, there is a shockingly run department, there is a shockingly run government, and it is this political party's fault. [Interjections]. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Winde. Order, please. Hon member Makeleni, you are particularly agitated today. Can I just ask you to ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please compose yourself. We are almost at the end. I now see the hon the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor! [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! [Applause.]]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I want to firstly thank the members taking part in this debate, but more specifically I want to thank the Cabinet for recommitting themselves during these Medium-term Budget Policy Statements to the five strategic goals of this Government, namely:

- To create opportunities for growth and jobs. That is the number one strategic objective as outlined in our most recent Medium-term Budget Policy Statement.
- I would also like to thank this Cabinet for recommitting itself to improve education outcomes and opportunities for youth development. I think this commitment and recommitment to these strategic goals is to give effect to one of the principles of good governance, namely predictability.
- I also want to thank this Cabinet for recommitting itself in this Medium-term Budget Policy Statement and the Adjustments Budget to increase wellness, safety and tackling the social ills, and therefore this budget indicates our commitment to deal with safety and tackling of the social ills.
- Also in the Adjustments Budget, Madam Speaker, we have recommitted ourselves in this Medium-term Budget Policy Statement to strategic goal four: To enable a resilient sustainable quality and inclusive living environment and so in this Adjustments Budget again we have made such commitments also in terms of the MTEF, new additional grants going forward in terms of the

context of human settlements.

- Also this Government in the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement has recommitted itself to imbed good governance and integrated service delivery through partnerships and spatial alignment, and hence the budget, as we go forward over the next three years, will continue on this trajectory because we believe these are the sound policy architectures of this Government.

Madam Speaker, I see the hon member of the Official Opposition is in the House. He referred and praised the hon national Minister of Finance, hon Minister Gigaba, with the tabling of his national Medium-term Budget Policy Statement. I was with the national Minister this week on Monday in Pretoria.

I was with the national Minister, we had a budget *lekgotla*, but while we were having a budget *lekgotla*, the President orders a dramatic 2018 budget rethink. While we are sitting there, discussing the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement. The budget, MTBPS, is being captured by the President.

We did not know what we were doing there because while we are sitting there and discussing the budget, President Zuma is busy with his own budget process, and this is the problem, and this is why I just mentioned that we are committed to the things that we have said in our Medium-term Budget Policy Statement, and I want to thank this Cabinet for political stability, but also for rationality because what you have in the national space is irrationality and no commitment to the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement. [Interjection.]

In fact the Head of the Budget Office resigned also as a result of the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement tabled by the National Minister. So I think we have a problem, we have got a crisis, and I think it is important ...  
[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly, you have a problem, you have a crisis.

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms P MAKELENI: Shame.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, is the Minister prepared to take a question?

Mr P MAKELENI: No.

The SPEAKER: Minister – I will ask. Minister Meyer, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am happy to take a question.

The SPEAKER: Happy to take a question. You may pose your question.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, is the Minister aware of the concept of a reverse *coup d'état*?

An HON MEMBER: Woah!

The SPEAKER: Minister Marais, I do not know that you wish to respond?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Chief Minister.

An HON MEMBER: Chief.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I know there is a concept of reverse auction, but I also know there is a concept of a reverse *coup d'état*. A reverse *coup d'état* is when you have a government that is not satisfied with the powers that they constitutionally received and therefore they create instability in the systems through state capture so that they can get actually more power, and that is this concept of a reverse *coup d'état*. They are not happy with the systems provided in the Constitution so they create havoc and collapse the systems ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... so that they have more power.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: I am satisfied now.

The SPEAKER: Are you done, Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, I am not done.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, you may ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But also ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you for the explanation. You may continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you for that [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... you have seen absolute chaos in this side of the House because people live on a different planet. In fact, they live in a different republic. It is called the Republic of the Guptas.

Ms P MAKELENI: Ja, led by ... [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Now when you live in the Republic of the

Guptas ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... there is no rationality ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... in our story.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And this is a sad state of affairs.

Ms P MAKELENI: Oh yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But we are seeing the cronies have now taken ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Oh yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... over the National Treasury, and I am ... [Interjections.] This Government, while they are in the business of the Republic of Gupta, in the Adjustments Budget ... [Interjection.] Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... in the Adjustments Budget ...  
[Interjection.] this Cabinet has recommitted itself to focus on the poor ...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... to focus also on the issues of support in terms of the drought, focus on the issues of crime. This Government will protect the citizens, especially to make sure that we do not have tariff settings as a result of the incompetence of the National Government ...  
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon member Makeleni, your poster is now becoming *†iets in my oog, asseblief*. [something in my eye, please.] We allow the use of posters, but the minute it becomes disruptive to the proceedings of the House, I think the point has been made and you can continue to make your point, but please do it in a way that it does not disrupt proceedings. You may proceed, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I am so happy that I know that members of that House are looking ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, I need to ask you to sit down, and I need to correct the hon member Uys. The posters were up before the Minister came to the podium with his book.

Ms P MAKELENI: Uh uh.

The SPEAKER: So – no-no, I am sorry, hon member Uys, that was indeed not exactly the truth. [Interjection.] Thank you. You may proceed.

Ms P MAKELENI: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I am happy that there is consensus on that side of the House, and there is consensus on this side of the House that we are looking forward to this day.

HON MEMBERS: Ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That side of the House are looking forward to when Zuma goes, this side of the House is looking forward to Zuma going and there is a reason why we want that. They agree with us, Madam Speaker, they know that ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We are looking forward [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the Guptas have already, according to

Pravin Gordhan ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: But they are your friends now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... have already taken R150 billion out of our economy.

Now that is the conservative version of Pravin Gordhan. We know it is much more. Hon member Beerwinkel wants us to adjust the budget. The best way that they could help us to adjust the budget is to bring back the R150 billion stolen by the Guptas, because it is three times the size of our annual budget. So if they want to adjust the budget, bring back the money from the Guptas [Interjections.] and we can adjust the budget with R150 billion. That is the way to adjust the budget. [Interjections.]

But the hon member Beerwinkel also knows ... [Interjection.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Ask your neighbour.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that there is a procedure to make amendments to the budget.

Ms T M DIJANA: Ask your [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And hon member Beerwinkel knows exactly

... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... what that process entails.

Ms T M DIJANA: At your left-hand side.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That process entails legislation being initiated in the legislative arm of government. I am on the Executive and I would very much like the legislative arm of government to do their duties.

So please submit that to your committee, table it there, discuss it there and as an executive I will certainly be taking part in that process, advise the Cabinet about that particular process, but start the process because we in the Western Cape are preparing for the time when Zuma goes. And it is important, Madam Speaker, and these members of this side of the House must know one thing: the more things fall apart, the more they fall into place of a new government coming. It is a new beginning and it is coming. [Interjections.]

So when Zuma goes a new government is coming. Then we do not need to struggle with the budget because we will cut the R47 billion fruitless, wasteful expenditure that is annually being reported by the Auditor-General, and we will save billions. R500 billion of contingent liabilities in the form of State guarantees. We will wipe that out. That can only happen when Zuma

goes. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer. [Applause.] [Interjections.]  
Order hon members. That concludes the debate on the consideration of the  
Principle of the Bill. [Interjections.] Do I have your attention please?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of  
the Bill?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: So are there no objections? No objections. Agreed to. The  
Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. The House will now deal with separate  
votes as of now onwards. I am going to ask the Secretary to read the second  
Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Budget Committee on the

Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 24 – 2017] (NCOP), Ratification of Final Mandate.

The SPEAKER: The House received the report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish, and it is limited to three minutes each. Any party – I see the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Even though the Western Cape did not receive much of the adjusted national allocation, we cannot fail our National Treasury by not thanking them for including the Western Cape at least in the Adjustments for Health, the National Health Insurance indirect grant to the tune of R10,3 million for the Health Professionals Contracting Component. We trust that the rural areas will be the most prominent beneficiaries in this regard.

For the rest, the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill remained unchanged, and we accept Treasury's motivation to utilise funds where it is most needed. Even though this province knows that they are but the post office and always wanting to portray themselves as the best, National Treasury, in their wisdom has decided to reallocate as they saw fit and we support their rationale in making the decision that they did.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You support it, you support them.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel. Hon Minister Fritz, order please. I see the ACDP. You do not wish to? Will the DA – I see the DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the Western Cape Government would like to thank the National Treasury and Provincial Treasury for their guidance in this process. The Western Cape Government has made an appeal for more equitable share in the division of revenue.

This is because the changing population and demographics of the Western Cape is changing and is not taken into account when funds are allocated to provinces and municipalities.

As a result, the Western Cape received a skewed budget in relation to the province's actual needs. An example of this would be in the education sector where National Government does not cater for the migration of learners to the Western Cape and also to other cities on an annual basis, to gain access to education.

There is no adjustments to our provincial budget to accommodate this population change, and so the Western Cape Provincial Government struggles to meet the needs of the province's residents.

We must have a more equitable share of the division of revenue, and we appeal to National Government to take realistic and accountable actions to support the provincial budgeting needs.

Furthermore, National Government must place increased focus on the fiscal discipline and consolidation to secure a sustainable budget moving forward. Uncontrolled spending and the increase in national debt does not bode well for all provinces.

The Western Cape has implemented sound government expenditure, strategic discipline measures, and has spending budgets to make sure that the money will be best used in the province. This continued sound and efficient service delivery is for our people.

All provinces have asked for more money. Limpopo have asked for drought relief strategies. The Free State is experiencing a severe crippling drought, the Chairperson of the Select Committee, hon member De Beer, from the Northern Cape, has asked for more money in Education, and the Western Cape Government has requested equitable share and fairness in this process. As the Western Cape Government we still call for more revenue so that we can accommodate our needs in our province.

Madam Speaker, the Western Cape Government does not support this Bill. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Joseph. I need to put the question. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape's delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. I put the question: Those in favour of the report being adopted and that the mandate conferred to the Western Cape provincial delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill be ratified, will say aye, and those against will say no.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the aye's have it. [Interjections.] I put the question, I will read it again. Those in favour of the report being adopted and the mandate conferred to the Western Cape not to support the Bill to be ratified, will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: Aye. Those against say no.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the aye's have it. [Interjections.] Okay. So, is there no division you wish to call? Okay. So if there is no division that is to be called, I need to say, hon members, that concludes the business of the day, but before we go I would just like to draw your attention to the fact that proceedings of the House starts tomorrow at 10am.

I must apologise, the Deputy has a bad bout of the flu, which is why he was not here today, and I had to call on one of our Chairs to assist me. Thank you, hon member Gillion, for your support during the sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 15:09.