
THURSDAY, 30 AUGUST 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: May I ask all members and guests in the gallery to remain standing? We would like to observe a moment of silence. There has been a tragic bus accident in the early hours of this morning on the way from Beaufort West to Aberdeen, and sadly ten commuters have lost their lives and 20 have been hospitalised. I also would like to ask that we respect all women and children that have passed during this Women's Month; if we could observe a minute's silence, please?

[Moment of silence observed.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may be seated, thank you. Good afternoon hon members. Order! To our guests in the gallery, good afternoon, distinguished guests in the gallery, I see we have a full House today.

I would like to thank each and every guest in the gallery for coming out to Parliament today. It is indeed a People's Parliament. I do though, however, need to draw your attention to the rules of the gallery, you are not allowed to participate in the debate in any way but we are extremely grateful that you have made the time to come here to be part of the Speaker's Debate, which focuses on the legacy of Mama Albertina Sisulu. I thank you. I see the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Good afternoon, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the following order of sequence for today's sitting, which will be the Speaker's Debate, Questions to the Premier without Notice, Questions, Interpellations, Statements, Motions and then the Order of the Day. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections? Agreed to. The next item is the Speaker's Debate and in the spirit of Women's Month this debate will be presided over by the hon Matlhodi Maseko who will act as Chairperson for the debate. Thank you. I call the hon member to the Chair. [Interjections.]

[*Hon member Maseko takes the Chair.*]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Again I just want to welcome all the guests today in the gallery and again in commemoration of Women's Month I will just say that you are saluted, every woman in this country, in this province, is saluted and you are welcome and we appreciate you for spending some time with us today and without wasting any time, I am going to recognise our first contributor to the debate, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

SPEAKERS DEBATE:

(Speaker's debate)

CELEBRATING THE CENTENARY OF THE BIRTH OF ALBERTINA SISULU – LEAVING A LEGACY

The SPEAKER: Chairperson, hon Premier, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, guests in the gallery, fellow South Africans. The debate today is a debate that had been agreed at a legislative sector level because 2018 we celebrate both the 100-year anniversary of Tata Nelson Mandela as well as Ma Albertina Sisulu so the purpose of the debate today is to honour the legacy that has been left behind. So while millions of women have shared in the fight for South Africa's freedom a number of them stand out and are

registered internationally for their role in the struggle. I do, though, also want to highlight that not a single woman leader who works in their communities on a daily basis, some of whom of you are sitting in the gallery here today, around issues of gender-based violence, early childhood development, disability and drug abuse to name just a few examples, should ever feel that the work that they are doing is in any way different.

I also speak to the nurses, teachers, police women and all who are of service in the community. The struggle issues may be different but the contribution that each individual makes and the tireless efforts that you put in should never go unnoticed. I would like to at this stage thank all the women who are in the gallery today for your contribution to eradicate gender based violence. Thank you for being here today. [Applause.]

In celebration of Women's Month we remember a few of these exemplary women. On 9 August 1956, 20 000 South African women from all walks of life broke the apartheid barriers and marched to the Union Buildings to protest the pass laws. This year marks the 62nd anniversary of that historic event.

The 9 August Women's Day is a public holiday in South Africa commemorating the march led by these five remarkable women: Lilian Ngoyi, Sophia Williams De Bruyn, Rahima Moosa, Helen Joseph and the other woman was Albertina Sisulu. I would like to explore and share Albertina Sisulu's story with you today. Another woman whose story I will also

elaborate on very briefly is one Helen Suzman.

This year the country celebrates the centenary of the birth of Albertina Sisulu, born Nontsikelelo Albertina Sisulu in the Eastern Cape on 21 October 1918. She was the second of five children. She was the wife of fellow activist Walter Sisulu. She was a mother to five children as well as a grandmother to 26 grandchildren and three great-grandchildren. Due to having a mother with ill health, it fell upon Albertina, as the eldest girl, to take on a motherly role for her younger siblings. She had to stay out of school for long periods of time but this did not deter her from finishing her primary school. After successfully finishing her schooling she trained as a nurse at the Johannesburg General Hospital.

In January 1940 she met Walter and they married in 1944. At her wedding Nelson Mandela, who was the best man, said: "Albertina, you have married a married man; Walter married politics before he met you." She in turn was marrying the liberation movement. She did not display an interest in politics at first, only attending political meetings with her husband in a supporting capacity. She attended her first conference where she was the only woman present. She eventually got involved in politics when she joined the Women's League in 1948 and in the 1950s began to assume a leadership role. She took part in the launch of the Freedom Charter in that same year.

In organising the historic anti-pass march, many were arrested. She spent three weeks in jail before being acquitted on past charges with Nelson

Mandela as her lawyer. Throughout her marriage Albertina Sisulu scraped and saved for her children to attend good schools in Swaziland, determined to give her children the best education she could. Her home in Orlando West, Soweto was used as a classroom for alternative education. She was arrested after her husband skipped jail to go underground in 1963 and was placed in solitary confinement for almost two months. She was subsequently in and out of jail for her political activities.

In 1983 she had helped found the UDF and was elected one of its three co-presidents from her jail cell. She recruited nurses to go to Tanzania as well. On October 14 1989 came the great turnabout. President De Klerk lifted all restrictions on Albertina Sisulu and the next day her husband and seven others were released after 26 years of confinement.

Consistent with the long struggle, constant and indomitable passion, she expressed her personal happiness but it would not be enough until they brought the Government to a genuine negotiated settlement for a full democratic participatory non-racial South Africa for all.

This was the hallmark of Albertina Sisulu's principled, selfless, and courageous life; the unwavering commitment to the non-racial philosophy of human equality and dignity for all in a common society.

She held, miraculously, no bitterness toward the whites of her country as people, distinguishing carefully between the apartheid regime and the people.

As she stated in 1987:

“The Nationalist Government are the enemies - not the white people. White people are just like you and me. We are all here to stay. All we want is power-sharing; to elect our own government, for a non-racial, democratic united South Africa.”

In 1992 Albertina Sisulu proposed that South African women should participate in shaping a Woman's Charter that would be included on the proposal on gender rights for the new Constitution. In 1986 she received the honorary citizenship of Reggio nell'Emilia in Italy, the world's first town that assigned this important award to Sisulu. In 1989 she also led a UDF delegation overseas, meeting then Prime Minister Margaret Thatcher and United States President George H W Bush. She was honoured for her work when the World Peace Council, based in Basel, Switzerland, elected her President for three years. In 1994, she was elected to the first Democratic Parliament... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] You are disturbing us, Premier.

The SPEAKER: ...which she served under, until retiring four years later. At the first meeting of this Parliament, she had the honour of nominating Nelson Mandela as President of the Republic of South Africa. That year she received an award from then-President Mandela.

The University of Johannesburg conferred an honorary doctoral degree on Albertina Sisulu. For more than 50 years she committed herself to the Albertina Sisulu Foundation, which works to improve the lives of small children and the aged. Sisulu and her family were residents of Orlando West in Soweto when it was established and she and Mandela opened the Walter Sisulu Paediatric Cardiac Centre for Africa in Johannesburg.

On other legacy leaders I would especially like to recognise the contribution that Helen Suzman has made in her lifetime. In 1953 she represented the United Party in Parliament. In 1959 only Helen Suzman retained her seat. As the sole voice of South African opposition Suzman became known for her strong public criticism of the then governing party's policies at a time when this was unheard of. She visited prisons, among them Robben Island, where she inspected the living conditions of prisoners and met Nelson Mandela. Helen never shirked away raising unpopular issues.

Visiting political prisoners was only one example; opposing capital punishment and arguing against the banning of the Communist Party and the banning and other restrictions imposed on individuals and organisations were others. In 1975, she tackled gender discrimination, especially discrimination against black women.

Suzman was a Member of Parliament for 36 years. She can be remembered for saying:

“I stand for simple justice, equal opportunity and human rights, the indispensable elements in a democratic society and well worth fighting for.”

She is also known for her famous quote:

“It is the answers, not the questions that are embarrassing.”

Nelson Mandela had this to say about Helen Suzman:

“Your courage, integrity and principled commitment to justice have marked you as one of the outstanding figures in the history of public life in South Africa.”

As this debate is being held in Women's Month one cannot help but reflect on every woman in South Africa during this time. Looking at the life of Sisulu one is reminded of the triple role that women play in society. A reproductive role, she was a mother to five children. A productive role where her daughter-in-law Eleanor Sisulu wrote “that Albertina took to nursing like a duck to water”, and because of her disciplined upbringing and young life caring for others and her community role, looking at the Albertina Sisulu Multipurpose Centre’s activities. In Albertina Sisulu’s case the quadruple role applies, looking at her political contribution as well.

Addressing women’s rights requires the state to address the structural causes

of unemployment, precarious employment and poverty that destroy women's power, drive, and vulnerability and entrench a patriarchal culture. It requires scrutiny of who or what the State values. Women's unpaid contribution for example whether in subsistence farming, caring for, working care work in the community or running a spaza shop from a train station, is presently not countered as a contribution to economic growth, yet it is that work that keeps families and communities alive. Both men and women play multiple roles and I am pleased to see that some men have joined us on this Women's Day. The major difference, however, is that men typically play their roles sequentially focusing on a single productive role while women must usually play their roles simultaneously, balancing the demands of each within their limited time constraints.

Since men and women play different roles, they often face very different cultural, institutional, physical and economic constraints, many of which are rooted in systematic biases, systemic biases and discrimination. This must never be undermined or underestimated. One woman can play a huge role in society and will always continue to do so, as Albertina Sisulu so capably demonstrated. She also believed that women needed to work together.

Her passing extinguishes another light of a generation that fought one of the great moral battles of the 20th century. She was a humble but forceful woman. She kept her dignity through decades of Government harassment. Try as they might, her spirit could not be broken. She was not bitter and they could not defeat her love. She acted on the ideal of human rights throughout her life.

The leadership characteristics, one is reminded of both hers and Helen Suzman's determination, their compassion, integrity, empathy and their courage. Sisulu's life speaks volumes of how she moved from shock to action. The needs of the most marginalised people of South Africa were her priority and not that of her own. Her leadership qualities and maternal instincts underlined the respect she earned during the struggle when she was referred to as the Mother of the Nation.

I am reminded of those qualities that define a leader. Throughout Albertina's life and while there were many dark moments when her faith in humanity was sorely tested, she did not give in to despair. It was never about grandstanding, personal gain or opportunism. It was of being in service for the greater good.

We need to be reminded of great leaders like Nelson Mandela, Albertina Sisulu and the Helen Suzmans of the world when we consider what it means to leave a legacy. All leave a legacy of selfless leadership.

We need to ask ourselves some serious questions when we talk about leadership and legacy. Questions like who am I doing this work for, who would I like to see benefit from my work, is it myself, is it my family, is it my community, my country or humanity?

Authentic leadership is to create a vision out of purpose. Leaving a legacy is putting a stamp on the future and making a contribution to future generations.

Only until we think about these questions and when we feel in our hearts that actions match words will we be able to identify true leadership and legacy.

Albertina Sisulu died on 2 June 2011 at her home in Linden, Johannesburg, at the age of 92, having lived a purposeful life. As the Speaker during the centenary celebration I say thank you Albertina Sisulu for the legacy you have left us. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I recognise the DA, Minister Mbombo. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA. Oh okay, I wonder how she can sit with the DA. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Premier, Madam Speaker, hon members of the House, uMam in the gallery. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: A DA Woman.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is Women's Month. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, that is what [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is Women's Month. We commemorate the many great female leaders that paved the way for us to stand before you

today. [Interjections.]

Just to echo the previous speaker, I would in particular like to honour the women of 1956 who marched to the Union Buildings on 9 August, despite their political affiliations, race, religion or cultural beliefs, to march against the pass laws - uMam Sisulu, uMam Helen Suzman, as the previous speaker has indicated that organised the march. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I see there you are talking about [Inaudible.] it is just a DA thing.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What is not recorded in history, which I want to draw your attention to, is the role the youth played in that historic march. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: [Inaudible.] You missed something somewhere.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Leader of the Opposition.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What is not recorded in the history, which I want to draw your attention to, is the role the youth had played in the historic march. A particular young girl from Dukathole, Germiston, Andronica Matshiliso Masangane, who was ten years old at that time, the daughter of Samuel Thabo Masangane and Annansatsi Masangane who were marshals in that 1956 march.

On 8 August, which is the day before the march, this 10-year-old girl was giving the task of delivering a letter to the Native Affairs Commissioner of Germiston, who was to give it to the then-Prime Minister J G Strijdom, to inform him about the march. Her role at the tender age of 10 was instrumental in the success of the march.

Today I would like to honour her, because she is 72 years old now, for her bravery and sacrifice along with other young people of the struggle. The struggle was not only about us older women but the emancipation of all because there was a girl child. There were also men who were marshals. So this is exactly what we need to do is to invest in the young women and girls. We are shaping tomorrow's leaders and setting them up for the brilliance, so I cannot stress enough the importance of the education of the girl child that not only liberates them but it empowers them to make informed decisions.

As the part of Provincial Strategic Goal 3 being reminded about what Masangane did, the Western Cape Department of Health has through the Global Fund invested over R80 million rand in young women and girls. We are serious about empowering them so that we become strong and independent.

This initiative is focusing on the girl child between the ages of 10 and 24. We have an in-school programme for those ages 10 to 19 and a Women of Worth programme from 19 to 24 which is in terms of the projects the Soul Buddies, the Keeping Girls in School, and the Women of Worth. These

projects are currently implemented in Philippi, Nyanga, KTC, Lower Crossroads, Crossroads, Gugulethu, Manenberg, Samora Machel, Mitchells Plain. The focus is on economic inclusion and education of young women and girls, which is essentially for creating the agency and for women to be independent.

Hon members, the biggest issue is that it has become harder and harder for women to access the economy and this places women in a fragile state of dependency on an abuser and contributes to poverty. One of the shocking practices in many areas in South Africa is that one needs to pay a bribe in order to get a job or you need to be a family member in order to get employed. The worst of this is the rising phenomenon of the “carpet interviews”. For those who do not know, a carpet interview is when someone demands sex in exchange for a job. It has such become a common occurrence that for example it speaks directly to the desperation of women to put food on the table and subject themselves to be coerced by using their bodies in order to bring food to the table. The mere fact that women have to be subjected to this horrific treatment in order to access a job is a violation of their human rights dignity.

Hon members, what kind of a freedom is it, when women are not included in the economy and are dependent on the abuser? Economic freedom for women has been a long battle. While some strides have been made, we are collectively still far from achieving the full economic independence that women deserve. We as women have proved despite the odds that we are as

capable as anyone else to contribute to the economic level yet there are so many stumbling blocks. If you look at the unemployment among women you will find that it far exceeds that of the unemployment rate amongst the males, 41% of women in South Africa are without work compared to 33% of men, yet women are the majority and actually are the ones who are the most breadwinners. It is the reality that we face. The scourge of unemployment and poverty disproportionately affects women specifically the black women. The face of poverty, the face of unemployment is a black woman. Having access to the economy and access to opportunities are essential to break the cycle of poverty dependency and to restore the dignity of women.

Madam Speaker, 24 years into democracy economic opportunities are still out of reach for millions of South Africans. This is coupled where we have to [Inaudible.] value added tax, the fuel and so forth. It becomes difficult for women. Therefore, women's issues need to be on the forefront and institutionalised in everything we do across all spheres of government. We cannot leave any women behind and we need to enhance our fight as a whole of society to fight inequality.

Hon members, this Women's Month we honour the legacy of Ma Sisulu, the mother of our nation was an activist and a keen fighter for equality for all and Mama happened to be a nurse and a midwife.

At last Mama is recognised and with that I am pleading for the nursing profession to be recognised, more especially since the nursing profession is

made up of the majority of women. Mama Sisulu's career prompts us to reflect and introspect, especially to us within the health sector.

In the Western Cape, 72% of the 32 000 individuals employed in the healthcare are women. Most of them are nurses among the professionals. It is about time that the nursing profession is reviewed and revamped to what it should be in honour of Mama Sisulu, plus Mama Sobukwe was also a nurse. We are losing experienced skilled nurses away from the coalface in pursuit of senior positions that are purely administrative because the nursing profession is not recognised as the skill sector it is supposed to be. Salaries of nurses, I must add, as well as teachers, social workers, which are the majority of women in terms of the profession and they are the breadwinners, need to be adjusted. They have been lowest, for example for nurses from long, long ago, yet the entire country rely on these professions. Nurses we know are the backbone of the health system. Once you start strengthening this bone the whole health system can show improvement.

The National Department of Health needs to step up because they are the ones who are supplying the South African Nursing Council and recognise the profession. Probably now we are commemorating Mama Sisulu and also I want to recognise Mama Sobukwe as the nurses; probably as a signal that we make 2019 as the Year of the Nurse.

In closing, hon members, Mama Sisulu, like many other formidable leaders

from her entire time laid the foundation for us to continue the journey to full emancipation of all women. It is up to us to stand on their shoulders and continue the fight against the struggles women face still this day. It is a fight you cannot fight alone. It needs the whole of society, men, women and we must not leave the girl child behind, just like what had happened in 1956.

†Enkosi. [Thank you.][Applause.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: For the purpose of correction there, a different [Inaudible.] Helen Joseph.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Before I recognise hon member Nkondlo I just want to welcome the students from the University of Stellenbosch and say thanks for honouring us, for being with us today. Hon member Nkondlo, over to you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon member Nkondlo, yes, now you are right.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, not member Tyatyam. [Interjections.] Over to you, hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Speaker of the session. Let me also join by welcoming everybody who is here and honouring us on this Women's Debate of today.

†Diqhubekeke ndibulise kakhulu koomama kwigallery abasuka eKraaifontein

oomama beSiyaqhuba †Women's Project.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Let me carry on and greet and acknowledge the ladies seated in the gallery who are from Kraaifontein. They are from the Siyaqhuba Women's Project.]

†Allow me, Madam Speaker, to just reflect on this particular debate, a debate so important to all of us as women who find ourselves sitting on these chairs and corridors of power, a privilege that we enjoy not because of any intellect from our side but most importantly because giants before us like Mama Sisulu existed.

This is 2018 in which we mark the centenary and the life of Albertina Sisulu, a fearless champion of democracy and human rights, a woman of fortitude in recognition of her courage, discipline, integrity and love for her country. Mama Sisulu was truly a woman of fortitude. Her strength, her resilience and the will to carry on shone like a beacon in the darkest days of apartheid. Albertina Sisulu dedicated her life to her country and its people. She will forever be remembered as a fearless leader in the struggle and a mother to the nation. She worked tirelessly towards creating a better and more equitable South Africa.

Our National Government has initiated these events to lead the centenary of Ma Sisulu under the theme "Be the Legacy". This theme is brought within a

deeper appreciation of the inheritance this country has to draw from the life of this giant, a hero we know for her struggle for freedom, for dignity, freedom to exist in our own land. She was passionately known as the Mother of the Nation whom at her early life took the role of being a woman leader, by providing care and nurturing her siblings to a point of losing school days and being behind in her class by a two-year difference with others, since her mother's state of health was very weak and as an older sister had to step in and play the role of being a mother.

The *WordPress.com* under Black Feminist Thoughts, Kate says:

“Seeing oneself as apolitical is a luxury most people cannot afford because they live the political implications of their identity every day.”

Indeed Ma Sisulu's life is a journey and a tale of such political implications of a young black woman in a rural village of South Africa that a system subjected to poverty, to underdevelopment and worse, deprived her of basic human rights. From primary school to studying as a midwife she had to make choices informed by those circumstances. We are told she chose not to marry but take a professional career that will help her earn a living to support her family back home and at the time nursing as a career provided such practical solution for her.

Ma Sisulu as a young nurse trainee experienced the realities of the system of the day whereas as professionals they were treated differently on the basis of

their skin colour but also their seniors would break their own professional code and standards to black patients, with some made to sleep on floors instead of being taken to hospitals where there were beds, just on the basis of their skin colour. Interestingly we are debating today in 2018 and I would have hoped, honourable MEC of Health, you would have at least indicated to us from that journey and the experience of Ma Sisulu today, what is it that we can say as experience of a black nurse and a black patient in the Western Cape today. [Interjections.]

These experiences shaped the Ma Sisulu who was to become a feisty and dynamic human rights and anti-apartheid activist of her time. She became one of the organisers of the anti-pass women's march in 1956, playing a key role in planning the logistics involved in helping women bypass police that were barring large groups from travelling to Pretoria. Ma Sisulu was detained many times by the system of the time, experiencing serious hardships at times. Her husband would also be jailed and thus leaving her to fend for the family.

This burden was even more as her children joined the struggle and as a mother she had to face being jailed, tortured by the brutal force of the time in their quest to fight against Bantu education. This famous march is celebrated and commemorated through a national public holiday in South Africa, of 9 August every year. Out of this snapshot of history of Ma Sisulu, what should we say is the legacy that we should take up?

The *Longman Dictionary* defines legacy as a situation that exists as a result of things that have happened at an earlier time; money or property that you receive from someone after they die, or inheritance.

Our President Cyril Ramaphosa in the ANC's January 8 statement in East London describes her as a woman of strength, compassion and tireless commitment to the people of this country, epitome of selfless service to the people. Thus Ma Sisulu lived a life to raise the voice of women.

In 1987, referring to a Rand boycott in Soweto and the role of women, she said:

“Women are people who are going to relieve us from all this oppression and depression. The Rand boycott that is happening in Soweto now is alive because of the women. It is the women who are on the street committees, educating the people to stand up and protect each other.”

In 2016, Stats SA reported that in the Western Cape we have about 24% women in leadership positions in municipalities and below than 30% women managers and also just below 15% women directors. Once again, what legacy in as far as the voice of women that Ma Sisulu stood for? Again we know, we have heard and we have seen in the political environment in South Africa today that some of the leaders like Lindiwe Mazibuko, Patricia de Lille, Phumzile van Damme have all lost their positions of power. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No, no.

Ms N D NKONDLO: What legacy then in the political space are we to take? [Interjections.] No government in South Africa could ever claim to represent the will of the people if it failed to address the central task of emancipation of women in all its elements that includes the Government, who are privileged to lead.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, ja, ja.

Ms N D NKONDLO: This was said by Thabo Mbeki in 2004. A life to fight injustice and to stand for human rights was what Ma Sisulu was about. One way in ensuring that women's rights are protected is to play an active role as this House, as this Government in the Western Cape. Therefore we cannot just stand here and want to regurgitate history, rehash what we have learned and we have known about Ma Sisulu, posture our own understanding to ensure that we gain [Inaudible.] but we must be able to reflect how we as this particular House were furthered in as far as this legacy is concerned.

As we speak, honourable or acting Speaker of the session, one wonders what has happened in the case of a staff member of this Legislature who was harassed and insulted by a male supervisor. An independent process that found him guilty and recommended a demotion to our dismay that this fellow manager, the buddy to the Secretary of Parliament cleared him of all charges with no reasons or rationale in law. [Interjections.]

We support the union and female employee to take the matter further to the CCMA and pursue a just result is arrived at. This is what Ma Sisulu would have stood for. [Interjections.]

Amongst others as just examples, just last week we read about a female law enforcement officer in the City of Cape Town who has been harassed by another male supervisor. She has been robbed of an opportunity to work overtime and provide extra income for her family. Such prejudice is the price that a woman must pay in this particular province. These are just examples for us to reflect the situation of women in 2018 today as we talk about the legacy of Ma Sisulu.

Ma Sisulu is known for her dedication to the care for children, the support to young to go to school and raise support for them. She was a grassroots leader who preferred to work with women at local level to help set up community projects. Gender based violence continued to be the biggest threat in the Western Cape, more so prevalent amongst or towards children. By June 2017 more than 30 female children have been murdered in Cape Town with girls who are constantly raped and murdered and we take our hats off for the shutdown activities that have been initiated in particular by the communities in the Cape Flats as we have seen over the past two days. [Interjections.]

Important to note is that in this particular sketch we have a commitment that is still to be realised by the leader of this Government, our honourable Premier, of ensuring that she delivers the Children's Commission. That is an

institutional response that has to deal with the plight of vulnerable children in this particular province, but the reality of the matter here in this province is that only until now with the pressure we are told that there is no money for an inquiry, there is no money for a Children's Commission.

We have to appreciate the resilience of the civil society formations, the activists and the members of this House from Ma Sisulu's party, the ANC, and the support of the ACDP to stand firm on this matter and we are hoping that through the upcoming process the voice of the people shall be heard to ensure that this institutional response that is the Children's Commission becomes a reality in this province. We must as we exit this House recollect the words and more so through our deeds we must remember what Ma Sisulu said in the first anniversary of the UDF:

“Amongst others, appreciating the organisation that UDF as the front was, as an organisation and institution that unite people to speak with one voice; an organisation and institution that unite the people to tell the truth.”

We are women in these corridors of power, not for our own sakes...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The UDM was [Inaudible.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...but to represent the voices especially of those

vulnerable in our society by social circumstances and gender inequality that exist in our societies. What are political circumstances that our women have to experience in this province? What are their economic circumstances? [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: What happened to Vygie?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: And Jonas.

Ms N D NKONDLO: These are some of the questions that we must answer together as a collective as you make the noise, young man. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Chihuahua. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: We must unite to speak with one voice. We must unite to speak the truth, because the truth shall set us free. We are all products of how we grew up where we come from, the media we consume, the friends we make and of course all of the beautiful and intersecting aspects of our identity, to claim to be free but it is also to be ignorant of how every aspect of our lives... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo...

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...frame what we see in the world is a blatant lie. As we sit here and as we are about to exit and celebrate... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, your time is up. You can round off the sentence.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...as we celebrate Ma Sisulu, we must ensure that we become leaders of fortitude and we are leaders of credibility. I thank you, Speaker. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I recognise hon member Botha. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would just like to ask Chairperson, that given that we are debating the celebration of Albertina Sisulu's life and women in general, do you think it is correct... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not a point of order, what rule?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Do you think it is correct - it is a point of order... [Interjections.] Do you think it is correct that male members of the DA were actually interjecting so much that we could hardly hear the previous speaker? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dugmore, that is not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Your member behind you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I think we do have the guests and... [Interjections.] Hon members, we are here to celebrate women and we are going to be given a chance to do that. I recognise hon member Botha. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is Helen Suzman [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Helen, in Joburg.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you Chair. Let me welcome and acknowledge... [Interjections.] Chairperson, can I be protected. †Asseblief! [Please!]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Magaxa, can the women be given a chance and as a man give them a chance to just celebrate with them, by showing them respect. [Interjections.]

Hon members, can we give hon member Botha... [Interjections.] Okay. Hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you Chair, thank you. Let me welcome and acknowledge all our guests in the gallery today. Madam Chair, women are the real governments of society. I say this because many families in South Africa are dependent solely on women, be they grandmothers, mothers, daughters or sisters. According to Stats SA only 33% of children are raised by both parents in South Africa. The majority of households are headed by single

mothers. My question therefore is then given the tremendous strain that the average disenfranchised single mother faces, how can she still contribute within her home, work and community life?

I depict some of her contributions. As the Premier of her household, what she says goes. She legislates and ascends on the house rules or laws. She sets curfews and instils discipline. She sets restrictions on internet use and gaming time. This is why I say women are the real governments of society. [Interjections.]

As the Minister of Economic Development, Tourism and Agriculture, she assists her children with school and university applications. She helps them draft their first CVs. She plans family holidays and helps them to apply for their first IDs. She farms the potential of her children and grows capable resilient and independent young adults. Women are the real governments of society.

An HON MEMBER: Ma Sisulu.

Ms L J BOTHA: As the Minister of Finance she ensures that with a low income there is always enough money set aside each week for food. She also budgets some of her wages for her children's school clothes and shoes. She always sets aside enough to pay bills and rent. Women are the real governments of society.

As the Minister of Education she sees her children off to school every morning. She joins her children's school governing bodies and makes sure their homework is completed before going back the next day. She even invests in her own education by attending a part-time course at a nearby TVET college. She inspires her children to never settle for what they have, but to work hard and achieve great heights. Women are the real governments of society.

As the Minister of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning she rushes around before and after work making sure everything is in the rightful place. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi Lorrainekie ...

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well done, Lorrainekie ...] †you should be the MEC for Education, not Debs. [Laughter.] †Mooi Lorrainekie! [Well done, Lorrainekie!]

Ms L J BOTHA: She tidies on weekends and delegates chores to other family members. She beautifies her home where she can and has even instilled a strict recycling policy at home. Women are the real governments of society. [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Daai is goed, daai is goed [Onduidelik.]

[An HON MEMBER: That is good, that is good [Inaudible.]]

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Chairperson, can you please speak to the men of this House on the opposite side? [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Chairperson.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We appreciate it is very good.

Ms L J BOTHA: As the Minister of Local Government she makes sure that each and every family member is managing their responsibilities and assists and advises where she is able to. She provides disaster relief to teenage daughters, experiencing their first heartbreak and to boisterous sons who injure themselves playing outside. Women are the real governments of society.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is nice thing. It is a nice thing. I like it.

Ms L J BOTHA: As the Minister of Community Safety she opens her home up to the friends of her children who come from unsafe and unloving homes.

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Different from the DA speeches, very different.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Chairperson, can you please speak to the

commentator on the other side?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you sit down for a few seconds. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The commentator? It is an interjection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dyantyi, can I address you. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I was still addressing you member, can you sit down so I can address you... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sure. May I address you?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: And I can recognise you after I am done.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you sit down so I can address you? We are here celebrating Women's Month... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And she is celebrating it.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: And I would expect from every member in the House to really respect our celebration today and also respect that the guests have moved from far, from where they come from, to listen to us as we talk to the topic of the day or the debate of the day. [Interjections.] So that due respect, hon members, I will appreciate if we do not drown the speakers, that the guests here can hear what are we saying. So hon member, please, can we really do that for today?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you, hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, hon member Dyantyi, you can address me.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much. I am doing what we do. As a member, I interject.

Ms L J BOTHA: It is commentary, it is not interjections.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This debate, we never said that we must not interject; unless you are saying we must just sleep on these. I am interjecting as a rule.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She must take it. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Interjection is allowed as long as you do not drown the speakers. I recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Chairperson, may I address you please.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: This is the Speaker's Debate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So what? [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Sjoe! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Phew! [Interjections.]]

Mr M G E WILEY: And for the information of the gallery, Speaker's debates are apolitical debates... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, please! Sit please!

Mr M G E WILEY: The ANC members during our first speech... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Mr M G E WILEY: This is exactly the point I am trying to make.

Mr P UYS: That is not a point of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not a point of order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Deputy Chairperson, the first speaker on this side of the House is the most educated member in this House. She has four degrees, and yet the ANC shouted her down, although it was an apolitical speech.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down! [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The ANC member decided to make a political speech.

HON MEMBERS: Sit down! Sit down! Sit down!

Mr M G E WILEY: The ANC member made a political speech. [Interjections.] Then they wonder why they get a return from this side of the House. [Interjections.] May I say... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, members! Can you really - can you... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Chairperson, this side of the House will continue in the spirit of the debate... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Wiley, can you sit down for a few seconds please. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...to be an apolitical debate. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you sit down. Can we - members, I just spoke to all of us in the House and said that can we respect each other.

HON MEMBERS: So what [Inaudible.] So what? So what?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Makeleni, can we respect the debate for today and just concentrate on debating the celebration of the Women's Month and concentrate on that because this is important to every woman in this country in this province and the other women that are around here. If you are not used to respecting each other, at least the women that are here to listen; respect them. [Interjections.]

Can I recognise again hon member Botha, can you continue.

Ms L J BOTHA: At the same time she shelters them from gang violence on the streets. She participates in Walking Buses and Neighbourhood Watches in her community. She also understands that our justice system often does not

protect women, allowing rapists and murderers to roam freely in her streets hence she helps other women to understand when they are being abused and directs them to nearby women shelters and even offers her own home where she can. Women are the real governments of society!

As the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sports she identifies nearby MOD Centres and sends her children, nieces and nephews to them to develop their natural talents. She ensures that they attend eLearning classes in mathematics so that they can improve their grades and have the best opportunities later in life. She even visits their ballet eisteddfods and soccer matches. Women are the real governments of society!

As the Minister of Health she prays every night that her children will live a long and healthy life. She keeps a personal record of the immunisations and vaccines that her children had and have not had, and makes sure they are vaccinated on time. She nurses them back to health when they have the flu or chicken-pox. She even notices when they are unwell and stays home with them from work to make sure they spend the day in bed, resting. Even before her children are born she makes use of a nearby satellite antenatal clinic. She books her first visit to the clinic at 20 weeks and has her pregnancy monitored, followed by numerous check-up visits. Women are the real governments of society!

As the Minister of Human Settlements she has built a home for them that they are proud of and can enjoy. Owning the title deed of her home means that she

can even take out loans to start her own business and improve the livelihood of her family. Later she can pass the home on to her daughter accruing inter-generational wealth for her previously disadvantaged family. Women are the real governments of society!

As the Minister of Social Development, she offers counselling to family friends whose children exhibit antisocial behaviour. She is able to point them in the direction of nearby Social Development offices and helps them to seek assistance from social workers. She points them in the direction of nearby rehabilitation centres where necessary. Women are the real governments of society!

As the Minister of Transport and Public Works, she accompanies her young children to school on the train each morning and afternoon, ensuring that they arrive and return safely each day. Where possible she chaperones her children to events to ensure that they are not left in dangerous places, unsupervised and alone. I have said it before, and I will say it again, women are the real governments of society!

Each woman in her own right is an Albertina Sisulu and a Helen Suzman. She is the custodian of values, without which the world would be a very cruel and difficult place. While not every woman can be a Sisulu or Suzman, we must not forget that her contribution to our society is immeasurable.

To each and every mother, grandmother, sister and daughter, I call on you to

instil in yourself and others the values of bravery, commitment to change and personal development and excellent work ethic and a commitment to feminism; the belief of gender equality, rather than seeking the validation of men we must affirm one another as women and as women we must preserve and uphold these values as we are raising the next generation of Suzmans and Sisulus. Why? Because women are the real governments of society!

I thank you Chair. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. In absence of the EFF, I recognise Minister Marais.

Ms P MAKELENI: May I address you Madam Speaker?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you Madam Speaker of the session. I would like to address you on a serious matter.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: I feel we have just disturbed member Botha's beautiful statement today because we were very intolerant of what was happening in the House. I felt you did not do justice to member Botha. There was a lot of heckling happening here but your ear is so insensitive when it comes to

members of the DA. You do not have a problem, but when it is people from this side you immediately have to stop everything. You even allowed hon member Wiley to speak and make an argument that was very unnecessary at that point in time because it was not what we were discussing in the House, but you had patience to listen to him. I want to appeal to you, that you at least try and be calm so that we can have peace and be impartial so that we can have peace in this House and so that we can listen properly in this debate because some of us have serious interest in this debate. Thank you.

[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your concern is noted and it is your personal take on everything that happened. I recognise hon Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you Chairperson. Annually commemorated as National Women's Day, 9 August is celebrated not simply as a day of historical significance, but also a day that presents a strategic platform through which a nation can pause and acknowledge the central role women play in advancing the agenda of an inclusive society.

Each year, during the month of August, the nation focuses on particular areas that are of concern to women and the girl child. The most notable and overarching plight to date is the structures perpetuating systematic gender inequalities which are presently, in the year 2018, still accepted, maintained and mainstreamed.

†Voorsitter, ons het te dikwels die rol wat Suid-Afrikaanse vroue in die vryheidstryd gespeel het as minder belangrik bestempel. Dit is belangrik om te beklemtoon dat Suid-Afrikaanse vroue aan die middelpunt gestaan het van die verzet en bevrydingstryd in Suid-Afrika wat tot vandag toe voortduur. Fenomenale vroue soos Krotoa, Ayesha Bibi Dawood, Dulcie September, Helen Suzman, Lilian Ngoyi en vele ander het 'n sleutelrol gespeel in die bereiking van vryheid, regverdigheid en toegang tot geleenthede. Alles aspekte wat 'n demokratiese staat veronderstel is om aan sy burgers te bied. In die Wes-Kaap soos in baie dele van Suid-Afrika het die 1950s 'n keerpunt getoon aangesien vroue leierskaprolle vervul het in die radikalisering van weerstand teen apartheid en sy onregverdige wette. Dit was vroue wat die stryd getransformeer het om 'n ware Suid-Afrikaanse stryd te word in beide stedelike en landelike gebiede.

Vandag word ons gekonfronteer met nuwe uitdagings in Suid-Afrika. Vroue en ons meisies word aangeval. Hulle het teikens van geweldsmisdade geword. Hulle is die slagoffers van verskillende soorte mishandeling. Hulle word geleenthede ontnem as gevolg van geslagsongelykheid. Die ergste van alles is dat hulle die slagoffers van huishoudelike geweld is.

Die Suid-Afrikaanse Mediese Navorsingsraad berig dat 40% van Suid-Afrikaanse mans hul lewensmaats aanrand. Daar is elke dag in ons elektroniese, gedrukte en sosiale media stories van vroue wat verkrag en wreed doodgemaak, aan lyding onderwerp en verwaarloos word.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Chairperson, too often we have regarded the role that South African women have played in the freedom struggle as less important. It is important to stress that South African women stood in the centre of the resistance and struggle movement in South Africa that has continued to this day. Phenomenal women such as Krotoa, Ayesha Bibi Dawood, Dulcie September, Helen Suzman, Lilian Ngoyi and many others played a key role in achieving freedom, justice and access to opportunities. All aspects which a democratic state is supposed to offer his citizens. In die Western Cape, as in many other parts of South Africa, the 1950s showed a turnaround as women fulfilled leadership roles in the radicalisation of resistance to apartheid and its unjust laws. It was women who had transformed the struggle to become a real South African struggle in both urban and rural regions.

Today we are confronted with new challenges in South Africa. Women and girls are attacked. They have become targets of violent crimes. They are the victims of various sorts of abuse. They are denied opportunities as a result of gender inequality. The worst of all is that they are the victims of domestic violence.

The South African Medical Research Council reported that 40% of South African men assault their life partners. Every day there are stories in our electronic, print and social media about women who are raped and cruelly killed, and who are subjected to suffering and neglect.]

†Unfortunately these inequalities are still abundantly common South African sport and the world over. We still find that male sports people are paid more than their female counterparts. We still find that even though Banyana Banyana outperforms Bafana Bafana they receive a fraction of the male national team salaries. We still find that less funding is allocated to sporting codes typically played by women or the girl child; all of which have negative implications for female participation and opportunity in sport. If we consider the top structures, most senior executive decision-making positions in the sport fraternity are held by men. Ask me, I would know.

Their renowned collective label for sport stakeholders fraternity, in itself, implies it is only for men or the boy child. The discrimination based on gender in sport is not a women's issue to be engaged on by women only, but it is a South African problem, which requires us all, especially men to act. As we celebrated our esteemed sports people at our Western Cape Provincial Sport Award Ceremony on Saturday evening I requested guests to take into consideration their sacrifices, self-determination, perseverance and resilience to challenges faced, while still achieving high standards against all odds. Take that consideration a bit further, and acknowledge that those representing our province and country on various sporting platforms would not be able to, if it was not for at least one woman in their lives, be it a coach, administrator, teacher, mother, sister, cousin, daughter or wife. When asked how does she continue to excel amidst all the critique and demeaning, Caster Semenya proudly paid homage to her mother as a support base and number one motivator on the world stage earlier this year. We need to move

away from the accepted idea that you need to coach, run, swim or sport like a man to look good as a woman and with the influence and will from all in society. We have a really good chance to bring about real change in sport, not only in the Western Cape but in the greater South Africa, and who knows, the world round.

I urge all present here today to join me in challenging, dismantling and transforming the systematic, institutional and ideological patriarchy that still legitimately oppress women and the girl child in democratic South Africa today.

A paradigm shift and call to action is much needed to equalise the playing field. I have witnessed firsthand how important sport is to our people especially at club level and in our rural areas. Participation and access to sporting activities go a long way in the upliftment and empowerment of our communities. I have seen rugby, soccer and netball fields solely comprised of gravel, yet leagues are still taking place with the support of community spectators behind the makeshift lines despite the adverse conditions. There is a desire and a defined need to participate, develop skills and hone talent and to dominate in chosen codes.

It is of paramount importance for us as South Africans to recommit ourselves to stand together to protect our women and girls from discrimination, abuse and neglect, regardless of political affiliation, cultural backgrounds, language or creed, we are all here today in commemoration of our women of

strength who have led the way.

The current inequalities and inequities warrant the same solidarity, unity and purpose that the Federation of South African Women espoused in the 1950s. The Federation famously challenged the idea that a woman's place is in the kitchen, declaring it instead to be everywhere. In the march of 1956 the women of South Africa expressed the public message that they would not be intimidated and silenced by unjust laws.

Today we stand united once more as we will not be intimidated, silenced, overlooked and neglected.

†Wathint' abafazi, wathint' imbokodo! [You strike a woman, you strike a rock.] I thank you. [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi, mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Good, good!]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much hon member. I recognise hon member Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Madam Chairperson. In celebrating the centenary of the birth of Ma Sisulu, as the ACDP we want to commend all women present and women in our country and our province. Chairperson, who will ever forget the 20 000 women that walked against the *dompas* led by this

fearless lady called Ma Sisulu with many others.

Chairperson, she opposed the Bantu Education running a mission school from home, and running this mission school from home she started home schooling, like we see home schooling today. She started home schooling and that is why, Chairperson, I am also talking about the BELA Bill, the BELA Bill that wants to limit home schooling. The Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill wants to limit home schooling and the ACDP's position in this Bill is that we must give maximum freedom for parents to make choices for the upbringing when it comes to their schooling and especially education. It is our contention that parents should be presumed competent to do so unless proved otherwise. The home education, the BELA Bill and the problem that we have is that the Bill now wants to define the compliance of home schooling and the Government, the State can decide not to give you and refuse home schooling, and that is disturbing and that is not the legacy of Ma Sisulu. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So Chairperson, an important thing about what Ma Sisulu taught us, even if you are imprisoned, even if you stand alone, even if you put away for three weeks in solitary confinement you will stand because of what you believe in.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Christians, your time is up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis mooi, mooi!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is good, good!]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you Madam Chairperson. In the debate on the legacy of Mama Sisulu I want to greet the women pastors and reverends that are here today and also all our guests and all women that are present here today. Chairperson, I will be doing my debate in Afrikaans.

†Vandag eer ons een van die grootste en sterkste vroue wat ons land in die stryd vir vryheid en geregtigheid opgelewer het. Mama Albertina Sisulu is gebore ses jaar nadat die ANC gestig is en sy is oorlede in 2011 soos die Speaker gesê het, 'n jaar voor die ANC se Eeufees 2012. Haar lewe was deel van die ANC se stryd om vroue en ons land se mense te bevry.

Sy was daar in die stryd teen pasboeke, het gewerk aan die Vryheidsmanifeste, die opmars van vroue, die begin van MK, die ondergrondse tydperk. Mama Sisulu het toegewyd met leierskap die stryd aan die gang gehou. Sy was die rots wat talle staande gehou het. Terwyl haar man Walter in die tronk was, het sy hul kinders asook haar oorlede suster se twee kinders grootgemaak. Dit was ook nie die eerste keer dat sy kinders moet ondersteun nie. Sy was maar nog self 'n kind van elf jaar oud toe sy self ma

moes wees vir haar eie broers en susters, weens die siekte van hul moeder. Ek moes ook self die skool verlaat en inspring om my susters te versorg op 'n baie jong ouderdom van 16 jaar en daarom verstaan ek waardeur Mama Sisulu moes gaan. Boonop het die apartheidstelsel en sy polisie die lewe vir haar moeilik gemaak. Sy was die eerste vrou wat vir 90 dae sonder aanklag aangehou is. Twee maande lank was sy alleen toegesluit. Mama Sisulu is vyf keer met huisarres ingeperk. In een stadium is sy amper ses maande sonder borgtog aangehou. Sy is vier jaar tronk toe gestuur maar dit is opgehef met borgtog hangend op appèl. Sy is later ook met 'n ander leier van die UDF van hoogverraad aangekla en was maande lank in die tronk.

Sy is in 1985 weer nege maande alleen in afsondering opgesluit. Met ander vrouelede soos Winnie Madikizela Mandela, Helen Joseph en Sophie Williams De Bruyn het Mama Sisulu 'n belangrike rol gespeel om die rol en aansien van vroue in Suid-Afrika te verbeter.

Sy is 'n nasiebouer, 'n versorger wat nie van haar mense geskei kon word nie. Sy het saam met hulle pyn verduur in die diens van ons mense en het groot respek verdien. Sy sal altyd onthou word as 'n voorste veteraan van die ANC wat haar lewe aan die stryd gewy het. Ons moet haar lewe en voorbeeld eer deur ander vroue se probleme in die provinsie reg te stel. In die Wes-Kaap is vroue steeds die slagoffers van geweld, diskriminasie, onregverdige en ongelyke behandeling; die meeste onder 'n provinsiale regering wat deur 'n vrou gelei word.

Hoewel ons Mama Sisulu eer, eers moet ons kyk na haar lewe in nalatenskap binne die ANC. Sy het haar werk gedoen ondanks apartheid en onderdrukking. Sy het die hardhandige onwettige regering met moed teengestaan. Sy het tussen die mense gebly en saam met hulle gestry. Sy verdien om as een...

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Today we honour one of the greatest and strongest women our country has produced in the struggle for freedom and justice. Mama Albertina Sisulu was born six years after the ANC was founded and she died in 2011 as the Speaker said, a year before the ANC's 2012 Centenary. Her life was part of the ANC's struggle to liberate the women and people of our country.

She was there in the struggle against pass books, worked on the Freedom Charters, the march of women, the start of MK, the underground period. Mama Sisulu kept up the struggle with leadership. She was the rock that kept many standing. While her husband Walter was in jail, she raised their children as well as her late sister's two children. It was also not the first time that she had to support children. She was still a child of eleven years old when she herself had to be a mother for her own brothers and sisters because of the illness of her mother. I myself also had to leave school and jump in to care for my sisters at the young age of 16 years and therefore I appreciate what Mama Sisulu had to go through. In addition, the apartheid system and its police made her life difficult. She was the first woman who was confined

for ninety days without a charge. For two months she was locked up alone. Mama Sisulu was confined to house arrest five times. At one stage she was under arrest for almost six months without bail. She was sentenced to four years imprisonment but released pending bail on appeal. She was also charged with high treason along with another leader of the UDF and spent months in jail.

In 1985 she was again locked up in solitary confinement for nine months. Along with other female members like Winnie Madikizela Mandela, Helen Joseph and Sophie Williams De Bruyn, Mama Sisulu played an important role to improve the role and esteem of women in South Africa.

She is a nation builder, a carer who could not be separated from her people. She suffered pain along with them in her service of our people and deserved great respect. She will always be remembered as a foremost veteran of the ANC who dedicated her life to the struggle. We should honour her life and example by rectifying other women's problems in the province. In the Western Cape, women are still the victims of violence, discrimination, unjust and unequal treatment; the most under a Provincial Government led by a woman.

While we honour Mama Sisulu, we have to look at her life in the legacy within the ANC. She did her work in spite of apartheid and oppression. She withstood the brutal unlawful government with courage. She lived among the people and struggled along with them.]

†Me D GOPIE: Sy verdien om as een van die moeders van ons nasie erken te word. Sy was steeds die moeder vir derduisende selfs toe haar eie kinders uit die land gedryf en in die tronk gegooi is. Mama Sisulu het nooit opgehou om vir haar mense te werk nie.

Sy het die Albertina Sisulu Sentrum in Soweto begin om kinders en oumense by te staan. Die uitdaging is nie om te praat nie, maar om te werk. *MPL* Botha sê in haar *speech* wat die Premier sê, *goes*. Hoe doen ons dit waar die Premier as 'n vrou twee termyne gedien het, en steeds nie iets nagelaat het om vroue en kinders te ontwikkel nie. Sy moet nog vir ons wys wat sy agtergelaat het.

Mama Sisulu was 'n getroue verpleegster, hoe kan ons haar liefde vir hierdie werk uitbou as ons hier in ons provinsie verpleegsters afdank omdat hulle warm onderbaadjies dra? Hoe eer ons Mama Sisulu as honderde vroue en kinders in hierdie provinsie onder die DA doodgaan? Waar is die programme om hulle saak te bepleit? Om sulke kwesbares te beskerm? Geld wat uitgegee is vir programme, vir die Wetgewer se programme van die Speaker, kon beter bestee word op vroue-ontwikkeling, dan het dit Sisulu geëer. Vrouewerkers van die Wetgewer kan ook beskerm word; om te verval in die manier om die vinger na ander te wys in die stryd, help nie ons vroue nie.

Die Wes-Kaap het nou 'n nuwe geslag moeders nodig om oor te neem en die nalatenskap van Mama Sisulu verder te vat. Dit het tyd geword vir sulke vroue om hulself te laat geld.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[She deserves to be acknowledged as one of the mothers of our nation. She was still the mother for thousands even when her own children were driven from the country and thrown in jail. Mama Sisulu never gave up working for her people.

She started the Albertina Sisulu Centre in Soweto to support children and the aged. The challenge is not to talk, but to work. MPL Botha says in her speech that what the Premier says, goes. How do we do it where the Premier, as a woman who had served for two terms, and still did not leave behind anything to develop women and children. She still has to show us what she had left behind.

Mama Sisulu was a dedicated nurse, how can we expand her love for this work when in this province we fire nurses because they wear warm waistcoats? How do we honour Mama Sisulu when hundreds of women and children die in this province under the DA? Where are the programmes to plead for their cause? To protect such vulnerable people? Money that was spent on programmes, for the Legislature's programmes of the Speaker, could have been spent better on women's development, then it would have honoured Sisulu. Female workers of the Legislature can also be protected; to lapse into the manner of pointing fingers at others in the fight, does not help our women.

The Western Cape now needs a new generation of mothers to take over and build on the legacy of Mama Sisulu. The time has come for such women to make their presence felt.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up.

Ms D GOPIE: In conclusion... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You can – another sentence.

Ms D GOPIE: ... Chairperson, I want to say if Mama Sisulu was here she would have comforted the women in our communities that lost their children to gangsterism and killings by consulting them and giving them comfort during this time. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Chairperson. Allow me the opportunity to acknowledge our women in the gallery, women of value, women of strength; I salute you and thank you all for being here today.

Madam Chair, on 9 August 1956, 20 000 women from every racial and ethnic group took to the streets and marched to the Union Buildings. They were protesting the introduction of the apartheid pass laws, in short, against

injustice. These women were a united force to be reckoned with and in song they took to the street singing, “†Wathint' abafazi, wathint' imbokodo. Uza kufa! [You strike a woman, you strike a rock. You will die.] [Interjections.]

Chair, despite the blood, sweat and tears of our mothers and grandmothers, South African women are still held back and not quite equal to their male counterparts. In 2017 Stats SA reported that in the last 62 years we have failed to instil real gender equality. Whilst 51% of our population is female, we remain unrepresented in positions of authority and power.

While the Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill in particular ... [Interjections.] calls for 50% representation in decision-making positions, only 44% of decision makers are women. This includes managers, professionals and technicians.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

Ms W F PHILANDER: This figure has barely changed since 2002.

Although South Africa has made great strides, gender representation is still below the 50% mark for positions of influence. Chair, the struggle that women face in the post-1956 and the post-apartheid era is all the more real for rural women.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

An HON MEMBER: Tell them, sister.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Chair, under customary law, land is generally allocated to men.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mmm.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Most rural women therefore do not have access to land of their own, and often lose their homes due to divorce, desertion or widowhood.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Chair, despite the Government's recognition that past policies have led to unequal gender relations, particularly within the rural sector, its land reform programmes prioritises race as the main factor of inequality.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Poor rural women are not identified as a specific target group. They are forgotten unfortunately.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Luister hoor!

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Listen, you hear!]

Ms W F PHILANDER: You must listen. What is more the rate of gender violence has reached new heights in our province and country, and yet there seems to be limited policing to address this. They just ignore the plight of our people. Every single day I pick up a newspaper and read of yet another girl child or woman who has been sexually harassed, molested, raped or killed. We can no longer settle for a Western Cape and a South Africa which treat women, rural and urban alike, as subhuman.

An HON MEMBER: Ja. [Interjections.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: And we know what, whose competency is the police?

Mr C M DUGMORE: You need a new [Inaudible.].

Ms W F PHILANDER: A further issue that rural women face is housing. Housing is predominantly given to men. Women are rarely given housing outside of their relationship with a male partner.

Chairperson, in the Western Cape various municipalities have developed their policies to accommodate rural applicants, child-headed households and where the husband deserted the wife and children, the wife could claim that home for her family.

As a province, country and global society where women are treated as inferior to men, we must take it upon ourselves to actively challenge the

punishing conditions that our rural and urban women face.

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] DA caucus.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Chairperson, today we are not women of political parties; we are here to celebrate women, irrespective of our political affiliation. We are here to celebrate all women in society. [Interjections.] For this reason the Western Cape assists its mothers, sisters, daughters and *†oumas* [grandmothers] through its superior ante-natal care facilities, including satellite clinics located across the province. We provide transportation to hospitals from rural communities throughout the province.

You will find TVET colleges where our women are acquiring new skills and improving their employability daily. We have numerous ECD and MOD Centres so that single mothers do not have to worry where their children are while they are at work. We further pioneered the delivery of title deeds which any person, male or female, is entitled to.

Lastly, throughout the province the Western Cape has shelters for victims of abuse to protect our women against further violence. We do not point fingers, we actually do.

Rather than speaking to dry statistics alone, I want to conclude by sharing the story of the late Auntie Bokkie Claasen, and, Chairperson, I want to

acknowledge today the daughter of the late Auntie Bokkie Claasen within the gallery, Councillor Miriam Claasen of Drakenstein. Thank you, councillor, for being here today.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

†n AGB LID: Dit is n DA *councillor*.

[An HON MEMBER: It is a DA councillor.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: It is a DA councillor. Auntie Bokkie was a ...
[Interjections.] Auntie Bokkie was a 92-year old activist, campaigning for social change across boundaries. She was a true community activist...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: In your dreams.

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... she gave everything selflessly. On any given day she would spend an entire day, elbows deep in cooking pots, making meals for people who could not afford to do it themselves. A no-nonsense individual with no interest in cheap politics ...

Ms P MAKELENI: We know Auntie Bokkie.

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... but in bettering the lives of our people, an individual whose children were many times shocked as to who she invited

into her house. She invited them in because they were hungry, and she prepared food for them. †*Punt, klaar*. [Fullstop, finished.] [Interjections.] As a rural woman, Auntie Bokkie's opportunities were limited by the circumstances she found herself in, and yet she never let this hold her back from her true calling of helping her community. She continued to be a shoulder to cry on, an ear to listen and a hand to help. We need to ensure that the struggle of 1956 is not relegated to dusty old history books sitting on a shelf, but that its promises materialise so that the Bokkie's of the Western Cape are empowered to further empower others.

What legacy is it that we want to leave behind? For me it is a legacy, a legacy of no woman left behind, and a legacy of no community left behind. I thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] I now recognise the sponsor of the debate, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Chairperson, I wish to thank the hon members for their input to this very important debate today. While much has been done we still have a far way to go. We can and should become the agents of change.

During the debate hon members made reference to an incident involving staff of the WCPP which led to grievances being raised, as well as disciplinary action being taken. At previous sittings hon members also used the opportunity to air their views based on information they had

received from staff driving a particular agenda, in my view, and seeking a particular outcome. Let me make this very clear, as Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, I will not tolerate behaviour inconsistent with the values that we as an organisation stand for, and staff members contravening the rules of the workplace will be decisively dealt with in terms of the policies of the institution and the laws applicable to regulating the relationship between employer and employee.

Equally, as Speaker, I despise the abuse of freedom of speech by members when they use parliamentary platforms to cast aspersions on staff members by using suppositions, half-truths, misrepresentation and outright untruths in vengeful, political grandstanding as was illustrated in this House today.

[Interjections.]

I would like to appeal to all women in this House and the country to not be selective in their outrage of certain matters of abuse against women...

[Interjections.] but rather to be consistent in their condemnation of abuse against women wherever it happens, even if it is within your ranks.

[Interjections.]

The only way... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] never keep quiet.

The SPEAKER: ... to change the world is to change ourselves.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We can provide you evidence.

An HON MEMBER: Not at the expense of women.

The SPEAKER: Please display some respect. We need to move beyond greed, hate... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... fear and corruption... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Madam Speaker, can you sit down for a second for me? Hon members, we agreed that you can interject, but a running commentary is not allowed. Can we allow the Speaker to continue with the debate please?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We need to move beyond greed, hate, fear and corruption, and actually find the possibility of recognising the dignity inherent in each of us. The only way to change the world is to change ourselves, and we should see our lives as constant work in progress. We can change the world one conversation, one room at a time. Each one of us in this beautiful country has the ability to leave a legacy. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

[Debate concluded.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That brings us to the end of this debate from the Speaker's side.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to questions to the Premier without notice, and the first questioner is the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question to the Premier, I just want to check, Premier, given that you and the entire Cabinet gave a heads up to the Western Cape Schools Act Amendment Bill, in contrast to the public hearings where parents, students and members of society, including various organisations in the education space, have rejected the Bill, and I am sure the process in the Committee will confirm, but also the legal advisor to the Western Cape Legislature has also written an opinion, advising that key aspects of this Bill are both unconstitutional and against the provisions of the SA Schools Act.

In light of this and probable legal challenges, as well as the public outcry

against the Bill, can you justify proceeding with this futile exercise?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the process is not over yet, and the public participation did not only comprise public hearings, but written submissions as well, and we are continuing that process. Most certainly, in areas where there is a form of manufactured outrage because of the misrepresentation of what the Bill actually involves, we will be looking objectively at whether the comments relate to the contents of the Bill, objectively and clearly.

The comments of the legal advisor to the Provincial Parliament have been analysed very clearly by our lawyers and the Legal Department, and have been demonstrated, as I understand they were in the Standing Committee this week, that they are without substance, and it is unfortunate that he misunderstood the parameters so blatantly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, a follow-up?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Just on one area of concern on the Bill, the one permitting the sale of alcohol on school premises, can I just understand the rationale and what schools or organisations have lobbied the Provincial Government to allow for this?

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The question is part of the process of the misrepresentation of what the Bill actually says. Mr Deputy Speaker, let us look at the situation that currently exists and the situation we are trying to create.

The current system is one of complete lawlessness. The current system...
[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why do they not enforce [Inaudible].

The PREMIER: ... prevents the serving of alcohol on any school premises. Many schools rent out their halls to make money. They rent out their halls for events and functions; they rent out their halls for weddings; and at many of these functions alcohol is served, obviously outside of school hours, and nothing to do with actual school functions involving learners. [Interjections.] And it makes it very difficult within the law for schools, quite legally and normally, to raise funds.

Secondly, some schools have cheese and wine auctions to raise funds for their schools. [Interjections.] And they serve, at adult functions, outside of school hours, at dinners and events, a glass of wine.

An HON MEMBER: Which schools?

The PREMIER: Now the bottom-line is that we either enforce the law and make that absolutely illegal... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give them wine to [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: ... and spend a lot of time going around on weekends and after school hours, fining schools and charging people for serving a glass of wine; or we say that they may apply to the Department for a permit for a specific event or function, and on the strength of the argument on the application and the purpose, they may be allowed to serve alcohol at a particular function, or for a specific event. [Interjections.]

That is intended to regularise the free-for-all that is being undertaken at the moment. At the moment the ANC runs events at schools, sends out invitations and says, "Please bring your own alcohol," which is totally illegal. [Interjections.] That's what the ANC does. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That's what the ANC does. [Interjections.] And then they try to manufacture outrage when we are trying... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... to stop those practices, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Give one example.

The PREMIER: We have got the documentation on it... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... and we will send you the example.

An HON MEMBER: Now that is a reason bring alcohol into schools? †Haibo!

[No man!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: No one is bringing alcohol into schools, no one. [Interjections.] No one is bringing alcohol into schools. [Interjections.] The way the ANC is carrying on you would have thought that we are going to serve alcohol from school tuckshops.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The PREMIER: That is complete nonsense. Stop manufacturing outrage; stop pretending that things are happening that are not happening, and start looking at what is happening now, and whether we can regularise a process for adults at appropriate places... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... at appropriate times within the rule of law. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order! Order! [Interjections.] Please come to – order! Hon member Makeleni, allow your member to ask the second question. Hon member Nkondlo, you may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can the Premier provide the names of the schools that she has spoken about? Especially the ANC schools that she says are providing alcohol? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Yes, I certainly shall ask the Minister of Education, who drew this to my attention, to provide that name.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is a list behind you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] We move on to the next questioner. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Kivedo is absent. The third one ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon member Christians?

Mr P UYS: Fake news!

The PREMIER: It is fake news.

Mr P UYS: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, you may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, yesterday we saw protest action again in Mitchells Plain, Bonteheuwel, and the people of the Western Cape are sick and tired of being ruled by gangs. There are ongoing killings and people getting shot on a daily basis.

Yesterday in Mitchells Plain, sub-council 18, there was a meeting with all the role players, police, Justice Department and everybody. Minister Plato was on the agenda, but excused himself.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Is the Western Cape Government serious about making a meaningful contribution to stop the killings on the Cape Flats?

†‘n AGB LID: Mooi, mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Good, good! [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi, allow the Premier to proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The PREMIER: Most definitely, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh? Yes, what?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, what?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, do you want to follow up?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the problem is that the MEC of Community Safety was not there and he was on the agenda.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He was sleeping.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I spoke to the councillors there and they said he was given... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why were you not there?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... well in advance time to be there. They were waiting for him to see what the Western Cape Government's role is in combatting crime and killings.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So the absence of Minister Plato tells me that the Western Cape Government is not serious about stopping crime ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... in our areas. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I did not hear the question there. What was the question?

An HON MEMBER: There was not a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just one second.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I said the absence of Minister Plato at that meeting means that the Western Cape Government is not serious about the killings ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... because the Premier said yes... [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Ja!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... and I am saying it is not yes, it is no. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Christians, it is fine to say that, but it must be in the form of a question, so I will put a question mark behind your sentence. [Interjections.] Premier, you may

continue if you want ... [Interjections].

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, what is more important than the lives of our people, with Minister Plato being absent yesterday?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.]

Hon Premier, you may proceed. [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the process of Parliament is not difficult.

An HON MEMBER: No, sit down Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: A question is a question, not a statement. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] I have proceeded beyond that point. Hon Premier, you may respond. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The hon member Christians asked what is the role of the Western Cape Government in dealing with crime and killings.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That was the first question.

An HON MEMBER: No, that is not the question.

An HON MEMBER: No, that is not the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Please come to order.

The PREMIER: Our role is oversight over the police. The people who have the direct role in combatting crime and killings and gangsterism are the police.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, okay?

The PREMIER: And they are under the sole operational control of the National Government.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I knew you were [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is a simple fact.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

An HON MEMBER: Safety!

The PREMIER: That is a simple fact. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: And we also know, and we have exposed the fact, through our oversight, that the police in the Western Cape are severely understaffed in 75% of the police stations in this province.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why Plato was absent. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And it was due to the oversight of this Provincial Government that the Public Service Commission has instructed the National Government to fix the understaffing of the police in the Western Cape. That was the oversight role undertaken by this Provincial Government.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why Plato was absent.

The PREMIER: And we look forward to ensuring that that happens.

We have done an enormous amount, especially in areas that really suffer through gang violence to seek to address the situation within our limited

remit, and one of the things we have done for more than 10 years...

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You demanded an army. That is what you have done.

The PREMIER: ... is to call for the SANDF to come and support the police in these areas. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: The army is not changing.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Jeez, man.

The PREMIER: And we send peacekeeping forces to do just that all over Africa, but we cannot do it in our own country. [Applause.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ag, please. It is two different things, man.

The PREMIER: In key parts... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us turn it into a workshop.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please!

The PREMIER: In key parts of the Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker, the civil authority has completely lost control of the area, and places are run by gangsters that set themselves up as alternative governments. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Under your watch.

The PREMIER: And it is not under our watch... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is under [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: ... because I would love ... [Interjections.] I would love for this Government to be able to have control over the police in this province. [Interjections.] I would love for this Provincial Government to have control over the police in this province and then we would see the transformation of policing. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: What is the role of the [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: The role of the MEC, hon member Magaxa, is oversight, which has got nothing to do with operational control, nothing.

Mr K E MAGAXA: What is oversight?

The PREMIER: Part of the oversight, as I have just explained, is reporting the understaffing in our police stations to the Public Service Commission and getting action on it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And they do not, they are doing nothing about it.

The PREMIER: So the bottom-line is this: we, in this province, are one of the very few provinces in the world which have delegated governments where provinces or cities do not have direct control over their police force. Yes, in this world.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Then you do not know [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: And it is absolutely critical that we should have it, because the criminal justice pipeline is one of the most crucial things to establish the rule of law and a climate for investment and economic growth, and the biggest failure in this province are in those areas over which we currently have no operational control... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Wow!

The PREMIER: ... policing being number one.

So there is no person in this province that cares more about communities than Minister Plato. He is in communities day and night and every day. We do not

know what he had to do as an alternative priority, but the Minister is at meetings every single day, and to pick on one meeting that he was not at for reasons... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... that we do not know, cannot be used to reflect on his interest and commitment in this matter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am willing to answer ... [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon member! [Interjections.] Please take your seat. [Interjections.] We move on to the next [Interjections.] ... You have another one? You have another opportunity, hon member Christians. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please come to order before hon member Christians can speak.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier has now mentioned that they are calling the army. The army is not the solution.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The army is going to kill our people.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The army is going to kill our people. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The Western Cape Government ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Christians, come to the question. [Interjections.] It is a follow-up question.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am asking the Premier – the army, they are trained to kill terrorists. Does the Premier want our people to be killed in the townships by calling for the army? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! The Premier cannot respond if there is a noise in the House. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Please proceed.

The PREMIER: Our ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, allow the Premier the opportunity.

An HON MEMBER: You do not understand.

The PREMIER: Our primary objective is to stop people being killed in the townships. That is our number one objective.

Now I know that the hon member Christians may not know a lot about the SANDF but there are different ... [Interjections.] There are different units in the SANDF, and a peacekeeping unit has a fundamentally different role and training from a military task force, and I would like to emphasise that we are calling for the peacekeeping operations of the SANDF in the worst gang affected areas, to enable the very stretched police service to do their job of investigating killings and crime, gathering evidence and bringing people to court, and securing convictions.

An HON MEMBER: There is a war.

The PREMIER: And if people keep peace in a war ... [Interjections.] – let me tell you, in some communities in Cape Town it is a war zone.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The PREMIER: Where the civil authority has no power, and that is what we need to stop. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] We move on to the next question. Hon member Makeleni, now it is your turn.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA is not asking questions today, huh? Wow!

Ms P MAKELENI: Premier... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot hear you, your own member is making a noise next to you. Please proceed again.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, last year the Imizamo Yethu and Knysna communities were both destroyed by fire, and a high level delegation was sent to assist in Knysna. Yet to date the community of Imizamo Yethu is still displaced, living under inhuman conditions, such that they are still in temporary sites, where a sandstorm blew away their houses last weekend, and no help was given to this community.

My question to you is: what are you going to do to help these poor people?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: First to look at Knysna. The only houses that were rebuilt in Knysna were the houses of the indigent that were destroyed and flattened, and the opportunity was used in Knysna to fix the infrastructure and to ensure that a proper spatial layout was produced to prevent these kinds of tragedies in the future.

We are trying to do exactly the same thing in Imizamo Yethu. We are trying to ensure that the redevelopment of Imizamo Yethu increases formal densities in that area to ensure formalisation without displacing more people than is absolutely critically necessary, and that redevelopment is complex because of the density in that area...

Mr K E MAGAXA: Cheers!

The PREMIER: ... and because of... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Small things, small minds.

The PREMIER: ... local conflicts in that community. So it is very-very difficult to get the development happening at the scale that we would like. It is very unfortunate that some of those temporary houses were destroyed or damaged in the storm, and I do know that the City of Cape Town, which has the responsibility for disaster management at local level, has taken action.

Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are not convincing me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, you may follow-up.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not at all.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, as someone that is deployed in Hout Bay, I know that that infrastructure has not been fixed. There was the promise of thousands of rands for super blocking and electrification in Imizamo Yethu, and this project was set to potentially take 24 months...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Get to the question please.

Ms P MAKELENI: To date not everything has happened in this regard.
[Interjection.] No, I'm trying to help her to put together her response, but what I need to understand is: after all these promises that were made here in this House and to the community, what have they, as a government, done to date, this whole year since the fire?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Beloftes maak skuld.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: What you promise you must do.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

†Die PREMIER: Eerstens wil ek net sê dat ek nooit enige beloftes gemaak het nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The PREMIER: Firstly I want to say that I have never made any promises. [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy het! Baie beloftes.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have! Many promises.]

The PREMIER: But a lot has been done. [Interjections.] But a lot has been done. In the first instance Minister Madikizela has worked very hard to purchase additional land to ensure that residents of Imizamo Yethu in the densification and reblocking of that area can, to the greatest extent possible, remain in that area.

The Mayor, I know, has gone so far as to petition the international body that controls world heritage sites to get an excision of one of those sites to enable us to extend Imizamo Yethu, and that is a very complex and very difficult thing to do. And of course also a very controversial thing to do, because people would argue that we should not be messing around in world heritage sites in order to deal with human density in various settlements.

Ms P MAKELENI: Ja, exactly. You are [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: So these are enormously challenging problems, but in the

meantime, given these fires that we have had in Imizamo Yethu, the City has created, on sports fields and other public amenities, a lot of temporary housing and is moving as fast as possible within the law, and a year is a short period of time to purchase property, to reblock, to rebuild and do all of the things that are necessary. You just have to look at District Six, you will see the kind of mess the National Government has made of that.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

The PREMIER: And so our big challenge ... [Interjections.] Our big challenge is to get land, unlike District Six where the land is actually there, our big challenge is to get land, to reblock and to develop and to do it properly, and that is being done day by day, with great commitment, by many people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, the time has expired, but I will allow you to ask a last question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Premier is talking about the plot that we identified, and some of the plots are the [Inaudible] and you know exactly what the ratepayers are saying about that. In fact the City has been promising that... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And your question is?

Ms P MAKELENI: Wait. [Interjections.] Can you have patience?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms P MAKELENI: The City has been promising an environmental assessment impact assessment study to be done in IY, and to date it has not been done, and you know that those ratepayers do not want the houses to be built ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, that introduction is too long.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... at the back of their houses.

Now what we want from you, Premier, what we are asking is will you follow-up on this matter and to ensure that it is fulfilled at least within this year?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Will you do that? That is her question.

Ms P MAKELENI: That is all we need to know from you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have eight months left before the next elections.

The PREMIER: I am not sure what the hon member Makeleni is asking me to do within this year.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have just explained it to you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow you to make... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Let me assist... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... make it more clear.

Ms P MAKELENI: Let me assist – that is why I was trying to explain... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She does not want to do anything.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... so that she understands. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, that is not the point. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Here... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Magaxa – just one second.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... in this Parliament. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, with all due respect. The hon member has had her three opportunities to ask as questions. [Interjections.]. The fact that she is so incompetent that she is not able to ask the questions is her problem. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you have made your point... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: If you could manage your... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: ... [Inaudible.] you would listen better.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have allowed the hon member make it clear... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... ask a clear question.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes. In this House, Mr Deputy Speaker, we agreed that we must avail money that was coming from National to go and buy plots in IY.

An HON MEMBER: This is not your House.

Ms P MAKELENI: We agreed here. And the Premier read a list of money that has been availed to assist in IY. All I am asking the Premier is if she will do a follow-up to ensure that we fulfil all the promises we made ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... to the people of IY, at least this year.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Say yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: This Province's promise has been fulfilled. The land has already been bought. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of Questions to the Premier. We move on to Questions for Oral Reply. The first question is again

to the Premier from hon member Magaxa. Hon Premier, the first question for oral reply.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act, 2003

1. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Premier:

Whether the Provincial Government supports the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act, 2003 (Act 53 of 2003); if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Yes, the Western Cape Government complies with the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you want to follow up?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that all? Really?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the question here is what is the Government's position in the context that the DA has pronounced that they are not going to be implementing or acknowledging any existence of Broad-Based Economic Empowerment? How are they going to deal with that situation in our province because they are a government that must abide by

the policies of this country.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Sorry, there is a nail out here and it catches on me every time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We did not hear that, can you repeat please?

The PREMIER: The point that I made when I was struggling to get up for the third time, is that there is a nail sticking out of the bench that catches me every time. I think the ANC put a nail here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: You are trying to nail me.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA is nailing you.

The PREMIER: If the hon member had listened to my answer in the first place, the Democratic Alliance is a party that believes in the rule of law, and when laws have been passed, that applies to this Government, whether we support them or not, we apply them in practice, because we are a party of the rule of law. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you can follow up, second opportunity.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think you are also ears here, as a person who is in charge of the proceedings. The question here is: we are a government led by the DA and in the context of the transformation of this country is the DA trying to tell us that, under the leadership of Premier Zille, they are not going to make any form of transformation in relation to the previous injustices that affected the black majority in this country?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Magaxa. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: In fact the very opposite is true, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are champions of real transformation.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: The most critical transformation that is required in this country is broad-based economic inclusion. Everybody needs to be brought into the economy and be able to be productive and live a better life, and one of the key components of that is a capable state operating under the rule of law, and because the DA Government in the Western Cape has come closer to this than any other government in any other province, we have seen that this is the only province where the economy is growing and jobs are growing, and so we fundamentally believe in transformation and economic inclusion.

[Interjections.] And broad-based empowerment, and we do it every single day.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Quarterly Labour Force Survey has told us that 50,000 jobs have been lost in the province.

Now I do not know where the bragging about the province creating jobs comes from? What are facts around that? All I am saying is that this province does not exist outside the Republic of South Africa, and this province...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, get to your question. Get to the question part.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am coming to the question, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can you be tolerant with me as [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will, I have been tolerant, but you...

[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... when she is not helping. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... because she has been trying to dive... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! You... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... and not answer the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your introduction is slightly long. Just get to the point.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am trying to make the question easy for her to answer because she seem to be struggling. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: She is struggling to respond to my question. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, can you help me with the... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am helping you by saying you must get to the question. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: My question, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Take shortcuts.

An HON MEMBER: Why? Why shortcuts?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is the problem that we have in all the departments in this province, failing to meet the requirement of equity, because of the DA's non-preparedness... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is two questions.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... to create an equal society in the Western Cape?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier?

An HON MEMBER: You know that is not true.

The PREMIER: There were two questions there. The one is about the annual labour force survey, which measures employment quarter by quarter.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That was not my question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: That was not my question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Premier has just started to speak.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It was a statement responding to the nonsense she just said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, please.

The PREMIER: Year on year we are still up by far more jobs than we lost. The quarter by quarter is the harvest jobs and it is very difficult to harvest food that could not be planted because of the drought.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, order. Mr Deputy Speaker.
[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just allow ... [Interjections.] – order! Is it a point of order? [Interjections.] I am hearing you?

Mr K E MAGAXA: There was never a question about the 50,000 jobs. I was countering... [Interjections.] the statement she was making.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just take your seat. I will explain it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The question is about equity.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Premier has just started to reply and I am sure she will get to the answer to that. [Interjections.] The Chair cannot prescribe in what form the reply must be.

So allow the Premier to please proceed. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I cannot let untrue statements get flung around in the lead-up to a question, and that is why I am going to correct those untrue statements when they are flung around.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: Let us get to what the hon member Magaxa claims is his question. The Provincial Treasury informs me that every single tender in this Government complies with the legal broad-based empowerment requirements.

An HON MEMBER: It is not true.

The PREMIER: And that is regulated by the Provincial Procurement Policy Framework Regulations, and that is true.

However, it must be noted that this legislation is not an exclusionary requirement and hence a bidder, who is a so-called non-contributor in terms of BBBEE, may submit a tender. In the evaluation process the non-contributor would only receive points for price and not preference points. In terms of the 2017/2018 financial year, the majority of procurement spend went to compliant companies. From a procurement perspective the BBBEE compliance for the Province is 100%.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Question 2. Hon Lekker to Minister Plato. Minister Plato?

Visit to Germany: exchange of experiences

2. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Why did his delegation during the visit to Germany to exchange experiences with the Bavarian State's Government not include other political parties of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, to the hon member, thank you very much for the question.

The delegation, during the visit to Germany, did not include any political party.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Except the DA.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The invitation received from the Hanns Seidel Foundation for the visit, as part of the Bavarian State Chancellery funded project and executed by the Hanns Seidel Foundation, requested specific stakeholder representatives to form part of the delegation, both inside and outside of government. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move to the next question, which is Question 3. Again hon member Lekker to Minister Plato.

Special Investigating Unit

3. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) Whether he will be taking action on the reports that the City's Special Investigative Unit (SIU) operated outside its mandate as a parallel police force and investigated serious crimes, such as murder, and even became involved in an Interpol investigation; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what is the relationship between his office and the Metropolitan Police force in the City of Cape Town?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, once again thank you to the hon member for the question.

I am not aware of substantiated reports that the Metropolitan Police of the City of Cape Town are operating outside of their mandate. I invite the hon member to provide such information to me and I will then act in accordance with my powers in this regard.

Both the Department of Community Safety and I enjoy a cordial and

cooperative relationship with the City of Cape Town's municipal police.
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move to the next question, Question 4. Hon member Gillion to Minister Mbombo. Minister Mbombo, Question 4.

Khayelitsha District Hospital

4. Ms M M Gillion asked the Minister of Health:

Whether her Department has a turnaround strategy to address the service pressure challenges at the Khayelitsha District Hospital, where patients sleep on the floor and in chairs for days without receiving care; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Strategy for Khayelitsha – it is not here?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are listening, we are listening. [Interjections.] I am here.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH:

- Opened a new 30 bed surgical ward.
- Commissioned a new CT Scan Suite
- 15 intermediate care beds, which are separate to those at KDH. Noting that KDH is a 300-bed hospital.

- We have reduced waiting period, especially in emergency care, where patients are being triaged to assess which cases are non-life-threatening. Yellow and green, are redirected to the Outpatients Department.
- In the Outpatients Department we have improved the congestion there, where, I think by 1 September 2018 it will be functional.
- Blood Bank, on site. Patients used to wait longer because they had to have their blood results sent elsewhere and then the results take longer.
- Staffing: All vacant clinical, nursing, admin and support posts are in the process of being filled. 11 have already been employed. A surgeon, as well as a second orthopaedic surgeon, has been appointed.
- We have got a Night Nursing Office now, so that we will be able to manage after-hours questions and complaints.

What is crucial is that we are on an ongoing drive to educate the public on the use and the meaning of the Triage scale, and also as well as on promoting the correct use of primary health care facilities in the area.

So this is a work in progress, but at the end this is just part of mopping the floor. The actual closing of the tap is the issue of looking at what the contributory factors are, for example, alcohol abuse and substance abuse, where you find at month-end, over the weekends, people come in with head injuries and other interpersonal injuries.

Also the issue of the quadruple burden of disease where they need a lot of resources, because it is actually a reflection of the health system throughout,

not only in the Western Cape, but in the whole country. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a follow-up, hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes. Thank you very much, hon MEC. The first follow-up. Can you confirm, MEC, now because that is what this question is about: do you have a turnaround strategy? Except the mopping of the floor that you have just told us about.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am sharing the strategy with you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that the strategy? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That is a strategy that we have indicated. Khayelitsha is a 300-bed hospital which is the biggest, a Level 1 hospital. Secondly, in terms of Level 1 hospitals, the services that are being offered in Khayelitsha are more than what Level 1 has to offer. We have got specialists there that you do not get in other Level 1 hospitals, for example, Eerste River, Helderberg, False Bay, Wesfleur, Victoria and so forth. These are the Level 1's. So Khayelitsha is actually probably 1.5.

In terms of the disease profiles you will find interpersonal injuries through violence, stab wounds, stabbed hearts; 72% of the people who present at the EC are under the influence of alcohol, or it is a result of alcohol and

substance abuse. The quadruple burden of disease, which is mental health, you will find that we have seen so many cases around that.

So when I talk about mopping the floor, it is about what you have to focus on, the social determinants of health. What causes people to abuse alcohol? And so forth.

So as the health system we have to respond to such. So what we are saying is, at a social level, the community must take responsibility, it is a whole of society approach. Instead of saying that we have got all these challenges we have done something.

So going from 300 beds to add more beds, which is 300 plus 45, 345. In addition with respect to mental health issues we are building a 72-hour psychiatry unit. I think it is going to be 42-beds.

Mostly, the reason for the waiting period is where blood has to be taken, where the specimen is taken outside the hospital, like to the lab in Tygerberg, and then the patient waits for the results, and then they come back, probably at a time that the doctor who has to interpret the results is not there. That is why the Blood Bank now will be on site.

The CT Scan, again the patients have to be transported to go, let us say, to Tygerberg for that CT scan, or to Karl Bremer. Now it is there on site, so there is no need to wait.

Now the issue of the quadruple burden of disease. You will find that we have got priority one, which are “red” patients, because if you do not respond they might die or they might get complications. We call them... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And they are already [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Exactly.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is fine.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes. Wait-wait, †*wag n bietjie*, [wait a minute,] you ask me, let me respond to you. [Interjections.]

Now what used to happen is that the people who used to wait the longest are the ones who are “green” because your first preference is the “red”. So the “green” are waiting for the same doctors or nurses who are dealing with the “red”.

So what we are saying now is instead of waiting there until those health facility professionals are done, there we now have an outpatient section instead of a small room there. We are now taking them to the outpatient section where we will have a full-time medical officer instead of waiting.

So that is the appointment we are talking about. I am adding, adding, adding.

Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, the second follow-up. Thank you very much for that response. Can you confirm, because what I know is that there is 100% bed occupancy ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: 130.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can you confirm that if I go to the Khayelitsha Hospital this weekend people would not be sleeping on the floor?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I cannot confirm – I just told you... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Cannot confirm? Then you say... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I just told you now what we have done to remedy the situation, but it is beyond our control in terms of stopping people from injuring one another.

I am saying that 130 – actually the international norm for bed occupancy is 80%. 130%, where in some cases even the beds in Maternity... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a crisis. That is what it says.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... Yes, where you have to use them for the people who are not necessarily pregnant.

So in terms of that, when people end up fighting and killing each other, it is beyond our control. [Interjections.]

So it means that we can do as much as we can [Interjections.], and it is a progression... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] to fail. It [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Minister speaks with great authority on the matter. I wonder if the Minister would tell us what her educational qualifications are to speak with such authority? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, are you going to respond? Not? Then the last opportunity will be hon member Makeleni.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What are your qualifications? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I just want to add that what I am describing now is what is happening throughout the country... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sure.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... but what matters is how you keep going. Remember also the budget in terms of the constraints is also being reduced. So as always I say, poverty or health and welfare come together. The poor people become sicker and do not have money. And also we need to acknowledge, in health you need about 10 or 12 categories of health professionals.

So they do as much as they can, and if you go to Khayelitsha you will find that most of the staff are not necessarily staying there. They travel from far in order to go and help, and they do have other options. They could go and work at a Mediclinic and so forth. So they do as much they can.

So that is why when we are wrong we listen, when people complain, we listen and explain, and then, if we are wrong, we say we are sorry, and then we try to make it work, despite the kind of the circumstances.

So what I am trying to highlight – I do not think it is about me because I am just a politician in the sense but what matters... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not worry about that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I think what matters... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I think what matters... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a nonsense question.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: My worry... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: My worry is about those 10 health professionals who underwent probably 10 years of training, and then they are being subjected to us politicians ridiculing them.

So that is why I always say that even when you go to conduct oversight, you do it with respect and dignity, and also take into consideration the privacy of the people, because you cannot just come in there and then cause a lot of chaos. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Nomafrench was in Khayelitsha recently to present the scan and other things that she brought, and she was confronted by all the challenges that were mentioned, and this question seeks to understand: after you went to Khayelitsha and did your assessment, because the bed issue that you are mentioning today arose last year, because that was your response to the question we asked you last year already.

Now we are talking about how you found the situation, and we also agreed with you that that is not the kind of situation we like to see in our hospitals, this is what we seek to understand now: going forward what are you going to do?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am sorry, I am not sure I understand you, because to have a 30-bed ward, you cannot do that within one month or six months.

So when we responded last year, it was about what we were putting in as part of the plan in terms of the resources. So from that time to now we say, "Ah, there is that bed," because you have to add more, you have to create a ward, 30 beds, and then we have to create a CT Scan, it costs about more than R2 million, for example. The same applies to all the other things. To appoint staff, for example the 11 health professionals, two surgeons and so forth

because I did not add many of those. Even the registrars, where we work with the University of Stellenbosch, which are the post-graduates who want specialist training, are being added.

So we are doing something, but I cannot stand here and guarantee that there will not be any people waiting because 130% is abnormal. It is abnormal, but these are things that are happening.

So in terms of whether it will not happen again or not, I do not know, but as long as we are responding promptly to such and then provide communication to the people, because for example where the “green” patients are waiting for their blood results or for their X-rays, they are panicking, they cannot make informed decisions, whether they must go home and then come back and so forth. So that is where we are. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to Question number 5. Hon member Olivier to Minister Schäfer. Minister Schäfer.

Zwelihle: matric students affected by unrest

5. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:

Whether any catch-up programmes have been put in place to assist matric students in Zwelihle who were affected by the unrest in their community; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes, the catch-up plan was devised with the principal and the circuit manager. The principal audited the coverage of the Grade 12 syllabus to date and identified specific areas in each subject to be addressed with the responsible teachers.

The district staff support the teachers as per the needs to cover all the content for the year, and the learners with the tutor programme. The school extended the school day, thus allowing the teachers to also include revision and examination preparation activities with the learners. The learners also participate in the district preparation sessions over weekends that are arranged for specific subjects.

A Spring School for the Khayiha High School learners specifically is being arranged to ensure that learners have been exposed to sufficient consolidation of content exercise, and to sharpen examination writing techniques, as well as revision of past question papers. Study classes up to the day that the learners write a subject will be arranged with the school. The teachers and learners have access to telematics and printed past question papers. The briefing sessions form part of the programme for the entire school to get the learners focused again.

In total the community unrest resulted in the disruption of 18 school days for all the learners in Zwelihle, and all schools are extending their school days to allow teachers to cover the core areas of the curriculum. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we move on to the next question which is – Hon Masizole, do you want to ask a question?

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes. On the Minister, this one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may proceed.

Mr M MNQASELA: Hon Minister, I would like to particularly appreciate that you have agreed the visit the schools.

Now, when you visit the schools what do you intend to see and what do you intend to interrogate in order to see whether the intervention programme does in fact work?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member Mngqasela. I will certainly be visiting within the next two weeks or so, and I will be discussing with the school principals whether they are of the opinion that the interventions are working; make sure that things are happening as I have been told, and if not, to make sure that they do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then move on to the next – hon member Botha, do you want to ask a supplementary? You may proceed.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to ask the Minister, in terms of this catch-up programme, is it a compulsory programme

for these matriculants?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It will have to be. The school day has been extended so it will have to be compulsory, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then we move to Question number 6, which is also to Minister Schäfer from hon member Olivier.

KwaFaku Primary School

Demolition of old school building

6. Mr R T Olivier asked the Minister of Education:

Whether the demolition of the old school building at KwaFaku Primary School has started; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer is that, yes, the demolition of the old structure of the KwaFaku Primary School has started and also finished during the June school holidays.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to Question 7. Hon member Gopie to Minister Marais. Minister Marais?

Rocklands Civic Centre: monument or statue

7. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

- (1) Why is there no mass opportunity and development centre (MOD centre) for learners at the Darling Primary School;
- (2) whether her Department has plans to build an MOD centre at the school in the near future; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

Toe ons die MOD-program destyds geloods het was dit die benadering om twee laerskool MOD-sentrums wat gekoppel is aan een MOD-sentrum by 'n hoërskool per distrik toe te ken, en in ooreenstemming met hierdie benadering is die huidige MOD-sentrums in hierdie kringe by die Laerskool Naphakade in Ilinge Lethu, Malmesbury en Laerskool Riebeeck-Wes toegeken. Daar is tans geen MOD-sentrum by 'n hoërskool in die distrik nie.

En die tweede deel: En binne die konteks van die huidige fiskale klimaat is daar nie enige planne om die MOD-program na meer as die huidige 181 MOD-sentru

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr

Deputy Speaker.

When we launched the MOD programme in the past it was the approach to allocate two primary school MOD Centres that are linked to one MOD Centre at a high school per district, and in line with this approach, the current MOD Centres were allocated in these circles at the Naphakade Primary School in Ilinge Lethu, Malmesbury and Riebeeck West Primary School. There is currently no MOD Centre at a high school in the district.

And the second part: And within the context of the current fiscal climate there are not any plans to expand the MOD programme to more than the current 181 MOD Centres in the Western Cape.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Gopie?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie?]

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, are you aware of the distance between Darling and Malmesbury and that... [Interjections.] the students are from a poor community to travel from Darling to Malmesbury?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Marais?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie. Ek is bewus daarvan. Dankie.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. I am aware of that. Thank you.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni first and then I will come to you. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Minister mentioned that there is no intention to increase the number of MOD Centres from the 181, and this was said three years ago, that there is no intention, and yet last year there was a new MOD Centre in Scottsdene, so where there is a will there is a way.

Now the question is: after assessing the situation in Darling, and we appeal to the Minister, we want to know if she will consider, in fact not just consider, she will open a MOD Centre for that whole community of Darling that has no MOD Centre?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Marais?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. Unfortunately we cannot, because we do not have the budget for it. We can go and fetch the money from the Guptas in Dubai, then we can do it. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ask the Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Gopie, do you want to proceed? [Interjections.]

Ms D GOPIE: Minister, are the rural areas a priority in your Department?

An HON MEMBER: Actually you are friends with the Guptas. You can ask yourself. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon member Gopie, yes, absolutely, it is a priority.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then proceed to the last follow-up. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Can the MEC ask the Premier to assist you to go to the Guptas like she does when she wants money for the DA? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Definitely not. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed to Question number 8. Hon member Davids to Minister Madikizela. Minister Madikizela?

Louisenhof Wines Trust: occupation by backyard dwellers

8. Ms S W Davids asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether his Department visited Stellenbosch where a portion of the land owned by the Louisenhof Wines Trust was occupied by backyard dwellers from Khayamandi and where they erected over 100 structures; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes, my officials did visit the site. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move to Question number 9. Hon member Makeleni to Minister – that question will stand over if I am correct, Chief Whip? In the absence of Minister Fritz, Question 9 will stand over. Question 10, hon member Makeleni to Minister Schäfer, Minister of Education. Minister Schäfer?

[Question 9 stands over.]

Sexual violence in schools in South Africa

10. Ms P Makeleni asked the Minister of Education:

With reference to the Sexual Violence in Schools in South Africa (SeViSSA) Kwanele Study that was conducted by the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC), which proved that sexual violence is commonplace in Khayelitsha schools:

- (1) Whether his Department has taken any steps to address the challenge; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether any assistance has been given to affected learners; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is unfortunate that during Women's Month I am referred to as a "he", "his" Department, I am actually a "she", but the answer to the question is that I would not say that the report refers to sexual violence being commonplace, but it certainly does indicate an unacceptably high level of incidents.

We can, however, only assist and intervene when cases are reported to us. There have been two on-learner cases reported for this year, January to July 2018, for the Khayelitsha area. In addition there was one reported related to educator-on-learner and the other a support staff-on-learner.

There were not sexual abuse cases, incidents for the Khayelitsha area

reported to the Safe Schools Call Centre during 2017 at all, for both learner-on-learner or educator-on learner.

The Department addresses sex and sexuality at appropriate levels as part of the life orientation curriculum. We do this as a preventative measure. In various appropriate grades we address all issues related to gender, sex and sexual abuse, for example, the focus of health promotion in life orientation in the foundation phase, Grades R to 3. It includes personal safety to enable children to avoid situations where they might be sexually abused.

The curriculum for the intermediate phase, Grades 4 to 6, recognises that children are becoming increasingly aware of their sexuality and provides guidance on the associated risks.

In Grade 7 we address changes in boys and girls, puberty and gender constructs. We provide guidance on physical and emotional changes, understanding physical and emotional changes of the body, and how these impact on relationships. We also deal with abuse in different contexts, between adults and children, and between peers.

In Grade 8 we address sexuality, human rights violations, gender equity – here we unpack the concept of gender equity and gender-based violence, we focus on the social impact of rape and gender-based violence, as well as the prevention of violence against women.

In Grade 9 we address health and safety issues related to violence. Learners learn about common acts of violence at home, school and in the community. The reasons that violence occur in families and communities and among friends and peers; the impact of violence on individual and community health and safety; and importantly we explore alternatives to violence, problem solving skills and managing conflict. Here it becomes evident that what learners witness at home and in their communities has a massive impact on how they view each other and how they view women.

In addition to addressing sexual abuse, harassment and violence in the curriculum, the WECD Safe Schools directorate also runs a special programme that has been designed for girls and young woman called “Girls in Motion Life Skills Programme”, which addresses gender violence, teenage pregnancy, gender discrimination, conflict resolution, as well as life skills and self-esteem building.

School policies and guidelines for managing gender-based violence are an important first step in the violence prevention process. With the support of the school management team, school governing bodies can take the lead in developing procedures for dealing with gender-based violence in schools. Punitive measures alone, however, will not change the attitudes that support violence. Such changes must occur at the social and cultural level. It is here that curriculum and educational programming can play a major role.

In addition to the preventative measures, all educators at Khayelitsha schools

have been trained on the “Abuse No More” protocol; social workers are currently training parents also on the “Abuse No More” protocol. Abuse awareness programmes at schools are done in collaboration with NGOs and other Government departments to address inappropriate sexual behaviour.

The second part of the question: school social workers provide individual support to victims of sexual violence and alleged perpetrators when referred for support. Groups for alleged perpetrators who have been identified to address their inappropriate sexual behaviour and to change behaviour. This is done in collaboration with NGOs and other stakeholders in the community.

Metro East education district social workers are part of the Thuthuzela implementation forum meetings, where the referral pathway is addressed to support learners, to ensure the correct procedures are followed when an incident of sexual violence is reported, and the necessary support is given to the learners concerned.

We also continue to encourage all learners to report any sexual abuse to our Safe School Call Centre so that we can investigate and act appropriately. Counselling support is provided by trained professionals. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, hon Minister, for your response. However, upon receipt of this report, I want to understand what have you done since,

because clearly all the things that you have mentioned are not working if half of the children that are in primary schools in Khayelitsha are being violated.

So somehow this is not reaching its intended audience, or the plans are not achieving their intended goals, so I need to know after you received this report what have you done?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As I have explained in my answer, we have been doing a lot for quite some time. The numbers that we have been given do not appear to be that high. We cannot force people to report incidents of rape, or sexual abuse.

So we are publicising as much as we can the Safe Schools number; we have interventions at schools on a regular basis, and, you know, I do not know what else you expect. If you have got any other suggestions please let us know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Hon Minister, you mentioned the “No More” when you addressed us earlier. Can you just share more about the “No More” policy?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. The “Abuse No More” policy, hon member Mackenzie, and thank you for that question. It is a policy that has been devised by my Department quite some time ago, intervening effectively in the lives of our children and their families. It is not the sole responsibility of any single agency or professional group, but it is a shared community concern. Teachers of course have a special role to play in this problem, and the policy highlights the responsibility of educators who may suspect or deal with disclosures of child abuse and sexual offences against children, and the educator’s mandatory duty to report such incidents in the prescribed manner.

The policy also highlights the responsibility of the principal to implement, manage and sustain the protocol and procedures described in the document, in such a manner that confidentiality and the best interests of the child are maintained at all times.

Of course in the absence of a functioning criminal justice system, we are facing now, no protocol or policy in the world will be completely successful. Teachers do not want to report sometimes because of the waste of time by the court. Because of the high prevalence, this policy has been developed to help institutions, employees and learners of the WCED to deal with the problem in the most efficient and effective way. All employees have to ensure that they are fully conversant with the reporting procedures, and the content of this protocol and that they have a clear understanding of their roles and in the management of child abuse and sexual offences against children.

This protocol has also been developed in conjunction with the National Prosecuting Authority and the Department of Justice. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister, I would start by evaluating if the interventions that I have listed are working. That is what I would do if I were the Minister, but unfortunately in this case I am not the Minister.

What I am trying to bring to your attention is a serious crisis. If half of the children in Khayelitsha have been violated I think it deserves attention from your office, not the arrogance you are giving me. I have asked you what have you done since you have received this report. That is all I am interested in so that I know that you are taking this thing seriously.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, for that question. Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. As I said it is not true that half the learners at schools have been...
[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: So what is the actual number if it is not half?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... subject to sexual violence. There are some – and as I have mentioned the statistics, there were four incidents the first half of this year, and no incidents reported last year. So, you know, we respond as best we can to any abuse that is reported to us and we take whatever preventative measures we can to prevent it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What are they?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: What are they? I have just read out two pages of them, so if people do not choose to listen to the answers, I am afraid I cannot help them then.. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next [Interjections.] – order! Question 11 and Question 12 I believe will also stand over in the absence of the Minister. We go to Question number 13, hon member Dijana to Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell?

[Questions 11 and 12 stand over.]

Waste-management infrastructure

13. Ms T M Dijana asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether waste-management infrastructure has been increased to deal

with population growth and industrial growth, which are driving up waste production; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for the question.

Waste management infrastructure has increased to try and cope with population growth and developmental growth. However, pressures such as: strict geotechnical requirements for the establishment of sanitary waste disposal facilities; public perception, “not in my backyard” kind of attitude; and risk averse national norms and standards for landfill disposals have resulted in an increase in the cost of establishing waste management infrastructure. This, coupled with limited municipal financial resources, makes it extremely difficult for municipalities to provide waste management services. These factors have resulted in the slower expansion of new landfill airspace in the Western Cape.

My Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning introduced interventions such as the regionalisation of waste management services, aggressive waste diversion targets, recovery and beneficiation of waste material through promotion of alternative waste treatment technologies and stimulating job creation in the waste economy to lessen the pressure on available landfill airspace.

An Integrated Waste Management Infrastructure Study was also conducted to identify and cost the integrated waste management infrastructure needs of the province. This information is being utilised to augment the integrated waste management plans of local government. All the municipalities in the Western Cape already have second generation IDP waste management plans, in which infrastructure planning is addressed.

The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning has also made a concerted effort to convince the national Departments of Environmental Affairs and the Department of Water and Sanitation to change the norms and standards for waste for landfill disposal, from a risk averse approach to a risk-based approach. Certain allowances have already been made by the Department of Water and Sanitation which resulted in the reduction of the cost of construction of certain regional waste disposal facilities.

Furthermore, the pilot study will be done on the risk-based approach in the Western Cape, Gauteng, KwaZulu Natal and Limpopo Provinces. We are hoping that the results of this study will convince the DEA as well as Department of Water Affairs to change the approach in the national norms and standards for waste for landfill disposal to a risk-based approach, which will be more affordable for the country.

Since 2016 there has been an actual 13% reduction in municipal waste generation in the province from 4 million tons to round about 3,6 million tons

in 2017, notwithstanding the increase in population. In our opinion, this can be attributed towards the current state of the economy, but also to the vigorous diversion approaches implemented by the province and municipalities due to limited landfill airspace availability. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My follow-up question is on the landfill sites which are full. Do you have any plans on those landfill sites? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes. It is part of the whole management system. We started off round about 2009 with round about 187 landfill sites. At that stage only 11 were licensed. We then embarked on a process to license the landfill sites, of which currently I think round about 132 are licensed, the others are in various stages of rehabilitation to get them out of the system.

And then what is very important in our strategy is to work towards regional landfill sites because we need to get the recycle economy going and we need to have specific volumes. Part of the difficulty of that strategy is also to get the economy for the waste pickers right through to the end user because we cannot lose sight of job creation within this spectrum, but we think there are huge opportunities and therefore we are starting now with the first regional

landfill site in the Garden Route District Municipality.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dijana first and then I will come back to hon member Simmers.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you. My other question is on the tons, I just want clarity. How are the tons being counted in the municipalities? I know that in other municipalities they do not have those computers. I just know that in Ashton they have that computer to count the tons. And then the other municipalities, which system are they using to count the tons? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

It is a very simple system. There is a weighbridge as you enter the dumping site and there is a person sitting there and making a call if it is garden waste, that they also guide you where to dump it because in most of our dumping sites currently there are small recycling facilities there. So they weigh it and they document it physically.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Simmers?

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Minister, in u antwoord het u genoem dat die nasionale norme en standaardte het 'n massiewe finansiële las bygedra tot die koste van afvalbestuur vir plaaslike owerhede. Kan u miskien vir ons meer hieroor

verduidelik? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Minister, in your reply you mentioned that the national norms and standards have massively added to the financial burden to the cost of waste management for local authorities. Can you perhaps explain some more to us about this? Thank you.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to the hon member. Let us take for example Karweiderskraal; to open one cell before the new norms and standards would have cost R7 million; after the new norms and standards with the first world layering and, and, that was required, would have cost R21 million.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question, Question 14. Hon Botha to Minister Schäfer. Hon Minister Schäfer?

Teenage mothers: support to

14. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:

What programmes does her Department have in place to support the general wellbeing and academic success of teenage mothers on the West Coast?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker and to hon Botha. The answer is that school social workers in the West Coast Education District monitor the implementation of the WCED learner pregnancy policy to ensure that pregnant learners receive appropriate support. The aim of the policy is to ensure that pregnant learners stay at school and complete their schooling.

The WCED employs social workers in every circuit, who work with other departments and agencies to address issues regarding teenage pregnancy. They monitor both the wellbeing and academic support to teenage mothers in the district. This support contributes to ensuring that these learners remain in the school system.

Support to teenage mothers is given individually to address specific needs as well as within small clusters, to hear advice, good practices and address general needs at larger schools. In 2017/18 a total of 3 933 learners were reached with prevention and support programmes in this district.

In some cases teenage pregnancy is as a result of peer pressure or sexual assault. Support and counselling are available for these learners. Any learner who has been subjected to abuse may also report this to the Safe Schools Hotline, 0800454647, or to their school principal. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we proceed, hon Botha? We move on to the next question, Question 15, also hon Botha to hon Minister

Mbombo, Minister of Health.

Patients in rural areas: transport

15. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Health:

What transport is available for patients living in rural areas that gives them access to their nearest hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. Whilst it is not clear exactly what kind of transportation, I need just to indicate that in terms of transportation that we provide for patients we do have Air Mercy, which are the aeroplanes that we have. We call it the Air Ambulance. We have normal ambulances and then we also have HealthNet which is the buses and taxis, but I want to focus now more on HealthNet.

This transportation takes patients not only to the nearest but also for those who are going for check-ups to other levels of hospital. For example, in Beaufort West where patients might be coming from Maraisburg, although there is a Maraisburg Hospital that is there, people can go, they can walk to the hospital but when there is a need to go to another level for special care, like Beaufort West, they need transportation because there is no public transport. In some cases when they are referred, let us say to George which is a Level 2 hospital, there is no transport and then they have to go there.

Previously, for example, a patient might have had to leave Maraisburg in the evening and then wait at Beaufort West and then by the time they got to George Hospital it is another day. And in some instances you find that there was a time where some of the waiting patients, some might be fine, like patients from Prince Albert or patients from the West Coast who are going to New Somerset or to Groote Schuur, where others had to wait for example under the tree and so forth, unsafe.

So we have about 60 pick-up points throughout the province where we invested R90 million because five of our districts are rural and are farming communities. So therefore we do have such transport.

Just to give another example, the Overberg patients are now picked up as early as quarter to three a.m. from small towns like Barrydale, Gans Bay and so forth and then at Suurbraak until they are collected by a big bus in Grabouw when they are going to this side.

You do not get such transportation from homes because they are being picked up along the way to where they are going; others can walk to a clinic where it could be open temporarily and then go there. We find it is not actually part of the responsibility of the health system. Our responsibility is where we can pick up from a facility to another facility. But we have to understand that there are others, where it is too long a walk to go there, and that is where we have to make temporary arrangements. For example, in Matroosfontein there is a hotel, and we have made an arrangement where they can use the

reception to wait instead of waiting across the street.

In Merweville we made an arrangement with a church where the caretaker is able to open it up for them to wait until they are picked up and so forth. We made arrangements with the municipality where a volunteer, or even in the councillors' office the ward councillor, can make his or her office available for the patients to wait there.

Lastly, I just want to stress that the reason that they are being picked up so early – because one might argue, because we know the distances – is because they have to be seen early; if let us say they go to George or go to Paarl or Worcester or here, they have to be seen early, as first patients, because it is their check-up day. Some of them have serious conditions where they have to go and do blood tests, they will have to go to x-rays and so forth, so by let us say 5 p.m., that is when they all get done and then they have to be transported further.

So we have done quite a lot and I know it was not necessarily part of what we were supposed to do but there was no way that we could leave what I call Auntie Sara behind, we have to do something.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister, I just want to know from you, when a patient has missed his transport to go to a referral hospital, does the clinic assist, is

there synergy between the next appointment, when the next appointment comes, with the transport system for them to be picked up? Because on our cluster visit we have picked up one of the challenges was that some patients missed their appointments, so then in their minds they just go to the transport to go to the hospital, to a referral hospital and when they get to transport there is no space in the transport for them to be transported. So is there that assistance to those patients for them to have a space on the transport for next time at a referral hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It depends on the distance. Let us make an example of the West Coast where patients, let us say from Matzikama, starting from there, as far as Nuwerus and Bitterfontein, which is nearer actually to the Northern Cape, picking up patients from there and then up to the whole area of Matzikama, up to Vredendal and then from Vredendal they come down and go to Grootte Schuur. It is about 200 and something kilometres which take about almost a day and a half, sort of.

So noting now, in Matzikama specifically, we have made an arrangement with a private transporter – because there is no public transport – and where we subsidise the private transport. I think also in Langebaan we did the same thing.

Ms L J BOTHA: Wupperthal.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, where we subsidise for patients to be

picked up because they travel so far. Actually the same with the patients in Graafwater and Cederberg, for example where we have made some arrangements. So those patients have been transported privately, that we subsidise, and then to the clinic, they get into a small combi, then pick up the others and go to Vredendal, and then come here.

In some instances they might not be able to, so if it is on that Wednesday the specific doctor – let us say maybe they are going for cardiac or orthopaedic and whatever – is elsewhere, if they miss it then they think that they must come the following day, Thursday. But for that Thursday that specialist is not there. He might probably have to do outreach or he is going elsewhere. So those specific days are meant for those patients and also the same with other arrangements.

In some cases you find, which now we have tried to minimise, they will go with an escort. So if it's a 15-seater, a 22-seater bus, they have different ones – ones where there is a stretcher, others where you can sit, because we know these patients. You will find that now they will come with an escort, maybe mama will come with her escort and they now occupy another space. Now when they go to the next pick-up then it is full. So what we have done now is to communicate that they do not have to go with an escort. When they arrive at the facility there will immediately be porters and whatever who are going to take care of them, to minimise that.

But lastly, also you find some patients have to be picked up from home,

especially with a few like in Merweville where you might get three in the same street and some other places where it is not safe, like in Ashton, for example, where we will find that there was a robber or something like that, but they are fewer. So we make unofficial arrangements where we can pick them up from home. Especially when you pick them up at 2 a.m. from home and it is dark. So that is what we do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question, which is Question 16. Hon Kivedo to hon Minister Plato?

Guns: confiscation of

16. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) Whether guns are confiscated in cases of shootings; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what is the possibility of establishing a gun confiscation unit in the province?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon member for the question.

Yes, firearms are confiscated if a firearm is found in possession of a suspect during the attendance of shooting incidents or in pursuance of a similar investigation where a firearm is linked to a shooting incident or any other

criminal incident.

It is an offence to discharge a firearm in a built-up place or any public place without good reason to do so.

Given the geographical incidents of firearm losses such as robberies, in robberies and, or, maybe stolen, the tracing and confiscation of firearms is a generic visible policing function. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move to the next question, which is Question 17, hon Kivedo to hon Minister Bredell.

Recent fires and floods: cost of damages

1. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) What is the estimated cost of damages caused by the recent fires and floods in the province and (b) how long will the rehabilitation of fauna and flora take?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie aan die agb lid vir die vraag. Die mees onlangse brande en vure het plaasgevind in Knysna en Bitou tydens die 6de tot die 11de Junie 2017, waartydens daar noemenswaardige skade

aangerig is aan die omgewing, munisipale infrastruktuur, die behuising en besighede. Na afloop van hierdie gebeurtenis is die area as plaaslike rampgebied verklaar en 'n mens moet nou onthou dit het nog gepaard gegaan met ons nasionale kollegas by Rampbestuur.

Weens die omvang van die verwoesting het die Premier op 6 Julie 2017 die stigting van die Tuinroete Herbou-inisiatief aangekondig. Hierdie inisiatief is amptelik op 11 Julie tydens 'n vergadering met my kollega, Minister Alan Winde, en die burgemeester van die Eden-distrik, nou die Tuinroete-distrik, Knysna- en Bitou-munisipaliteite geloods. Die bogenoemde inisiatief het werkstrome en werksgroepe daargestel wat gefokus het op spesifieke areas van intervensie.

Die Nasionale Rampbestuursentrum het Focus Project Management aangestel, 'n professionele diensverskaffer wat die skade wat tydens die rampe in die geaffekteerde munisipaliteite berokken is, te bevestig. Hierdie verifikasieproses het plaasgevind 22 Januarie tot 31 Januarie en ook 1 en 2 Februarie. Die bevindings van hierdie verifikasieproses is aan die Nasionale Rampbestuursentrum voorgelê om sodoende addisionele nasionale befondsing te bewillig vir die herstel en die rehabilitasie van die streek. Die koste vir die brandinsident in Knysna en in Bitou is na geraam so R112 miljoen, R112,8 miljoen. Dit moet ons onthou agb Adjunkspeaker, dit is die koste van die natuur, die natuurlike omgewing. As jy gaan na al die eiendomme wat vernietig en beskadig is, gaan hierdie koste baie maklik op in die biljoene in.

Geen noemenswaardige vloede het onlangs in die provinsie plaasgevind nie. Die mees onlangse verklaarde vloede-insidente het in Januarie 2014 plaasgevind. En nou moet ons ook onthou, van daardie stadium af het Rampbestuur in die provinsie - en ek wil graag hê dat ons eintlik ons Staande Komitee weer 'n slag soontoe neem - 'n risiko-analise gedoen oor die hele provinsie. So met ander woorde as hulle vir ons sê, as ons die aanduiding kry met ons kontrak met SAW, dat daar 30mm reën in 'n spesifieke area gaan val, dan kan dit op die skerm kom presies watter strome gaan oorstrom, watter woongebiede gaan oorstrom, watter munisipale infrastruktuur kan moontlik beskadig word, en so kan hulle hom plot. Indien die reën 50mm is, en, en, en dit help ons om pro-aktief in hierdie areas op te tree. Dit gee vir ons 'n geweldige voorsprong.

Ek het verlede Vrydag ons burgemeester soontoe geneem want die stelsel is net so goed as die inligting wat ons ontvang van die burgemeesters. So ons is baie opgewonde dat hoe ons hierdie sisteem uitbou, ons inwoners al veiliger en veiliger sal wees in die provinsie.

In verband met die skade wat aangerig is ten opsigte van die flora en fauna met spesifieke verwysing na die brande in Knysna en Bitou, is daar verskillende projekte in plek gestel vir die rehabilitasie daarvan, wat oor die medium- en langtermyn geïmplementeer sal word. Hierdie projekte sluit in die implementering van 'n omvattende na-brand indringersplant kontroleprogram en hierdie program is ontsettend belangrik mnr die Adjunkspeaker, want indringerplante is die plante wat maklik brand, dit is

die plante wat nie keer as ons vloede kry nie, so daar kan duine skuif en dit is 'n kritieke program. Dit is 'n program wat ons met 'n tipe van 'n EPWP program kan bestuur, maar ons moet dit ook koppel aan sekere kundigheid, want party van hierdie plante en bome is gevaarlik om te saag en te sny. Hierdie is 'n langer termyn program wat tussen vyf tot tien jaar sal neem.

Verdere projekte sluit in die grond-erosieprogram wat die hange en die hellings stabiliseer, wat ook kritiek is, want as ons deur daardie area ry, ek kan onthou met die brande verlede jaar het ek dadelik vir my span gesê as hier nou twee, drie millimeter, vyf millimeter reën sou val, kan hier grondverskuiwings kom wat katastrofies kan wees. So ons het gaan leer by die beste en as jy nou daar ry sal jy sien hoe stabiliseer hulle die hellings. Ingenieurs het bepaal watter hellings het 'n grootmoontlikheid om te kan skuif en sodoende het ons hierdie kundigheid ingekry om te help om daardie areas te stabiliseer.

Die korttermyn projekte is die daarstelling van die brandbane. Hierdie brandbane moet ook elke twee jaar onderhou word, om te verhoed dat gras en bos dit oorgroei. Nou die brandbane is 'n baie sensitiewe een, dit word deur die nasionale Bosbouwet bestuur, en ek is nog altyd in my kop bekommerd dat ons kyk nie genoeg na ons brandbane nie, veral in daardie areas dat grondeienaars sal moet inkoop, en in sekere areas kan dit 'n baie duur proses wees, om hierdie brandbane daar te stel en te onderhou.

Ons is besig met 'n publieke deelname proses want ek dink na die ramp het

mense ook besef dat hulle moet deel wees om hul eie eiendom en lewens te beskerm. Dit is natuurlik 'n baie boomryke area, so dit is moeilik veral as jy dink dat van daardie brande 4,6 km ver gespring het. Jy kan nie so 'n wye brandbaan maak nie, maar dat brandbane belangrik is en deel is van die bestuur van ons program is van kritieke belang. Baie dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to the hon member for the question. The most recent fires and blazes took place in Knysna and Bitou during the 6th tot 11th June 2017, when significant damage was caused to the environment, municipal infrastructure, housing and businesses. Following this event the area was declared a local disaster area and one has to bear in mind that it was managed along with our national colleagues at Disaster Management. Due to the extent of the devastation the Premier announced the establishment of the Garden Route Rebuild Initiative on 6 July 2017. This initiative was officially launched on 11 June during a meeting with my colleague, Minister Alan Winde, and the Mayor of the Eden District, now the Garden Route District, Knysna and Bitou Municipalities.

The above initiative established work streams and work groups that focused on specific areas of intervention. The national Disaster Management Centre appointed Focus Project Management, a professional service provider, to confirm the damage during the disaster in the affected municipalities. This

verification process took place from 22 January to 31 January and also 1 and 2 February. The findings of this verification process was submitted to the National Disaster Management Centre for the allocation of additional national funding for the rebuilding and rehabilitation of the region. The cost of the fire in Knysna and in Bitou was estimated at about R112 million, R112,8 million. That we have to bear in mind, hon Deputy Speaker, was the cost to nature, the natural environment. If one looks at all the properties that were destroyed and damaged, this cost will easily go up into trillions.

No significant floods had occurred recently in the province. The most recent declared flooding incidents took place in January 2014. And we also have to remember, from that stage on Disaster Management in the province – and I would like us to take our Standing Committee there again some time – has been conducting a risk analysis across the whole province. So in other words if they tell us, when we get the indication with our contract with SAW, that there will be 30mm of rain falling in a specific area, then it can show on the screen precisely which streams are going to be flooded, which living areas will be flooded, which municipal infrastructure can possibly be damaged, and so we can plot. If the rain is 50mm, and and, and it helps us to act proactively in these areas. It gives us a huge advantage.

Last Friday I took our Mayors there because the system is just as good as the information that we receive from the Mayors. So we are very excited that the more we expand this system, the safer and safer our citizens will be in this province.

In connection with the damage that was caused with regard to the flora and fauna with specific reference to the fires in Knysna and Bitou, various projects have been put in place for its rehabilitation that will be implemented over the medium and long term. These projects include the implementation of a post-fire foreign vegetation control programme and this programme is extremely important, Mr Deputy Speaker, because foreign vegetation is that which burns easily, these are the plants that do not prevent slides when we get floods, so dunes can shift and it is a critical programme. It is a programme that we manage with a type of EPWP programme, but we have to link it to certain expertise, because some of these plants and trees are dangerous to saw and cut. This is a longer term programme that will take between five to ten years.

Further projects include the soil erosion programme that stabilises the slopes and hillsides, which is also critical, because when we drive through that area, I recall with the fires last year I immediately said to my team, if there were to fall two, three millimetres, five millimetres of rain now, mud slides can occur that can be catastrophic. So we say we go and learn from the best, and if you drive there now you will see how they are stabilising the slopes. Engineers had determined which slopes have a large possibility of shifting and thus we acquired this expertise to help to stabilise those areas.

The short term projects are the establishment of the fire breaks. These fire breaks have to be maintained every two years, to prevent it from being overgrown by grass and bushes. Now the fire breaks is a very sensitive one, it

is managed by the national Forestry Act, and in the back of my head I have always been concerned that we do not look after our fire breaks properly, especially in those areas where land owners will have to buy in, and in some areas it can be a very expensive process to establish and maintain these fire breaks.

We are busy with a public participation process because I think after the disaster people have realised that they have to be part of protecting their property and their lives. It is of course an area very rich in trees, so it is difficult especially if one thinks that some of those fires had jumped a distance of 4,6 km. You cannot construct such a wide fire break, but that fire breaks are important and are part of the management of our programme, is of critical importance. Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hob member Dyantyi?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit was a lang antwoord, ‘n baie lang antwoord.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It was a long reply, a very long reply.] [Interjection.]

†Ja, now my follow-up. Besides the R112 million, which is answering the question, the cost of damages, it seems that the R112 †het net te doen met natuur, soos u gesê het. [only has to do with nature, as you have said.] †Nou beteken dit dat u R1 biljoen is net ‘n duimsuig, dat u weet nie wat die koste van die ander dinge behalwe die natuur is nie? [Now does it mean that your R1 trillion is just a thumbsuck, that you do not know what the costs of the other things are, apart from nature?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Buiten die natuur, dit is en die agbare lid sal weet dit is baie moeilik om te bepaal, want mense het mos hul private versekerings, en, en, ek, ek. My syfer dit is 'n duimsuig, ek suig duim uit wat ek lees en wat ons gedoen het, so die duimsuig is baie groot, dit is soos R4,iets biljoen, maar ek is meer bekommerd oor die mense wat nie versekering het nie. Dit klink dalk verkeerd, maar dit is die mense waarop ons moes gefokus het, daar is informele areas waarop ons gefokus het, en dan is daar ook 'n paar ander mense wat nie verseker was nie of nie reg verseker is nie. so die eintlike vraag ook, die skade, van daardie mark, die skade aan besighede, dit het die nodige aandag gekry en ons werk baie nou saam met die munisipaliteit sodat die herbou van Knysna suksesvol afgehandel sal word. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Apart from nature, it is and the hon member will know, very difficult to determine, because people after all have their own private insurance, and, and, me, me. My figure, it is thumbsuck, I suck thumb from what I read and from what we have done, so the thumbsuck is very large, it is something like R4,something trillion, but I am more concerned about the people who do not have insurance. It may sound wrong,

but these are the people we should have focused upon; there are informal areas we focused upon, and then there are also a few people who were not insured or not insured properly. So the actual question also, the damage, of that market, the damage to businesses, it received a lot of necessary attention and we are working very closely with the Municipality so that the rebuilding of Knysna will be completed successfully. I thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb Minister, dit is ook die einde van tyd vir vrae toegelaat.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, that is also the end of the time allowed for questions.]

†Question 18 and Question 20's replies will be printed in Hansard. Question 19 will stand over, as well as the question in terms of Rule 206 in the name of hon Mitchell, that will also stand over till next time. It will be printed on the Order Paper next time to make it absolutely clear.

[Question 19 stands over]

We then move on to Interpellations.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Stellenbosch Municipality: corruption

1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What has been done regarding corruption at the Stellenbosch Municipality since the release of the forensic audit report?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The first interpellation, hon Dyantyi to hon Minister Bredell. I see hon Minister Bredell.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hou kop.

[Mr Q R DYANTI: Be calm.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie aan die agb lid vir die vraag. My Departement het die nultoleransie-beleid teenoor korrupsie en sal nie huiwer om dit pro-aktief te hanteer nie. 'n Klag is deur my kantoor ontvang met betrekking tot die bewering van bedrog, korrupsie, wanadministrasie in die Stellenbosch Munisipaliteit en besonderhede is soos volg:

Die bewerings van onwettige TASK terugbetalings by Stellenbosch Munisipaliteit:

Gedurende Augustus 2017 het 'n politieke party in die provinsie 'n klag by my kantoor ingedien wat my Departement van Plaaslike Bestuur aan die munisipale bestuurder van die Stellenbosch Munisipaliteit gestuur het vir 'n

antwoord. Die munisipale bestuurder het in 'n antwoord van 1 Desember aangedui dat die Munisipaliteit 'n forensiese ondersoek ingestel het na die implementering van die TASK-proses asook die daaropvolgende betaling aan die munisipale amptenaar wat gemaak is.

Die forensiese verslag het in Mei 2017 voor die Raad gedien en 'n besluit is geneem om 'n dissiplinêre komitee aan te stel om vas te stel of daar gronde bestaan vir dissiplinêre optrede gebaseer op finansiële wangedrag. Die dissiplinêre komitee se verslag het op 31 Mei 2017 voor die Raad gedien en die Raad het daarna besluit om 'n volledige ondersoek soos vereis deur die Munisipale Regulasies na Finansiële Wangedrag MFMA te onderneem.

Die verslag oor die volledige ondersoek het in Julie en Augustus 2017 voor die Raad gedien, waarna die volgende besluite geneem is:

- a. Die aanbevelings en inhoud van die dissiplinêre komitee word kennis van geneem en dat dissiplinêre stappe oorweeg word nadat 'n standaard *benchmarking* oefening gevolg is.
- b. Die dissiplinêre komitee word gemagtig om 'n onafhanklike ondersoek van die Distrik en Provinsiale TASK-evalueringskomitee aan te stel om die bestaande TASK-gradering te verifieer asook om die konsekwensies, teenstrydighede teen die goedgekeurde uitgangspunt te evalueer;
- c. Die dissiplinêre komitee, in die lig van (a) hierbo van die aanbevelings

in hul verslag, die bevindings hersien van die standarde/die *benchmarking* proses, met finale aanbevelings wat aan die Raad voorgelê word nadat die inligting in (b) beskikbaar is.

Die inligting in (b) moes in Januarie 2018 aan die Raad voorgelê word. Al die bogenoemde verslae is vertroulik en is gedurende die onderskeie raadsvergaderings aan raadslede beskikbaar gestel.

My Departement van Plaaslike Regering het op 9 Maart 2018 met die munisipale bestuurders vergader waar die bogenoemde inligting weer mondelings aan hulle oorgedra is en die akkuraatheid daarvan bevestig is.

Ek is dus oortuig dat hierdie saak deur die Munisipaliteit bestuur word en dat die Raad behoorlike administratiewe prosesse volg in die toepassing daarvan.

Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to the hon member for the question. My Department has a zero tolerance policy with regard to corruption and will not hesitate to handle it pro-actively. A complaint was received by my office with regard to the allegation of fraud, corruption, maladministration in the Stellenbosch Municipality and the details are as follows:

The allegations of unlawful TASK paybacks at Stellenbosch Municipality:

During August 2017 a political party in the province submitted a complaint at my office that my Department of Local Government sent to the municipal manager of the Stellenbosch Municipality for a reply. The municipal manager indicated in a reply of 1 December that the Municipality had conducted a forensic investigation into the implementation of the TASK process as well as the following payment made to the municipal official.

The forensic report served before the Council in May 2017 and a decision was taken to appoint a disciplinary committee to determine whether grounds existed for disciplinary action based on financial misconduct. The disciplinary committee's report served before the Council on 31 May 2017 and the Council then decided to undertake a full investigation as required by the Municipal Regulations on Financial Misconduct Procedures (MFMA).

The report on the full investigation served before the Council in July and August 2017, after which the following decisions were taken:

- a. The recommendations and contents of the disciplinary committee were noted and that disciplinary steps be considered after a standard benchmarking exercise had been followed;
- c. The disciplinary committee are authorised to conduct an independent investigation of the District and Provincial TASK evaluation committee

to verify the existing TASK grading as well as to evaluate the consequences, inconsistencies, against the approved point of approach;

- c. The disciplinary committee, in the light of (a) above of the recommendations in their report, to review the findings of the standards/the benchmarking process, with final recommendations that are to be submitted to the Council after the information in (b) had become available.

The information in (b) had to be submitted to the Council in January 2018. All of the above reports are confidential and were made available to councillors during the various meetings of the Council.

My Department of Local Government met with the municipal managers on 9 March 2018 where the above information was verbally conveyed to them and its accuracy confirmed. I am therefore convinced that this matter is managed by the Municipality and that the Council is following proper administrative processes in the application thereof. I thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Dyantyi?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi?]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker, LUR.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, MEC.] †The question is quite straightforward. What has been done regarding the corruption of the

Stellenbosch Municipality since the release of the forensic audit report?

I really appreciate the background that you have given but my attention, my interest is on what happened since then because all of these fraudulent activities involving these senior employees were only initiated in 2017. Just to remind yourself and everybody else, part of this the involved upgrading of posts, 575 posts that were upgraded, 373 of those incumbents received backpay of more than R2 million, back to 2014. The HR manager – because here we are not all over the place – Mr Van Rooyen, instead of backdating for six months as stipulated, did it for a year and could not explain that.

So you have a situation where the backpay was incorrectly calculated to include benefits and not the salary issues as indicated.

Now there was a DC that was recommended; that disciplinary process which was submitted on the 23 May 2018 that served on Council. My interest now is: what has happened since then? Do we have anybody who has been asked to pay back that money? Is there anybody who has been charged with criminal activity or whatever has been wrong?

Now what you are telling us today is that nowadays there are more investigations beyond the forensic audit. You are not even saying there is a legal process to understand this. You are saying the Municipality is now prepared to pay for more investigation. Basically, in rugby terms, kicking for touch instead of acting on the issue.

I want to hear from you, MEC, because all of this is happening under your watch. In 2014 you were the same MEC when all of this was happening and again, as we said last week, you say you have got an anti-corruption strategy and every week we come into this House and we demonstrate to you that your anti-corruption strategy does not work, it is just talk.

You need to tell us today with regard to that DC. We are only interested in what action has been taken against Mr Van Rooyen, Liebenberg, who was your former municipal manager in Stellenbosch and everybody else implicated in that, and what is your office doing? You cannot come here and tell us ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... the Municipality is going to do this. You were the MEC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am not finished yet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You will get another slot afterwards.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister? I am sorry, hon Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I appreciate the question, the interpellation put forward by hon member Dyantyi. It is a very serious matter. I think these are the issues that we flag in the committee, that officials must always be above reproach. They must act in a way that promotes ethical values and I think the response by the Minister in ensuring that that happens, we would like to see how far it goes in order to clear any ugly air that seemed to exist out there.

Mr Deputy Speaker, nationally we have got a problem of more than R2 billion of prohibited awards to state officials – which is, you have got officials who sit and deal with bid adjudications and award contracts to their friends and we cannot have a situation where ethical values do not get promoted. We have over 1 440 suppliers who have gone to do business with the State and never gave correct declarations and this resulted in 67% of municipalities in South Africa having awarded contracts irregularly in this country.

So in this province we do not want any of that. We need to promote quality municipal officials, especially at executive level. So the sooner this gets dealt with properly, the better for us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, †my voorsitter van die komitee. [my Chairman of the committee.] Let us deal with him, I am going to him. I see you are going national, let us come back. We are going to Bredell, he is the MEC in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Thank you very much for that because the issue here, hon Mngasela is very correct, we want to professionalise local government. We want to deal with issues of corruption and you need to commit here. I have a sense that the lack of action against these officials had a lot to do perhaps with the fact that maybe †hulle is julle pelle, [they are your pals,] they are either members of the DA or protected by the party. For as long as you do not do that, that is the perception that it is going to leave.

Why, up until today has there been no action? You paid so much for the forensic audit. The issue that member Mngasela raised of the 67% in national, if we break it down in the province a lot of that also goes to Stellenbosch as a municipality.

And may I remind you, here again we are talking about a municipality that, before we raised these issues, you were bragging about as a capacitated municipality, that brings certain audit reports and so on. But underneath that, now we know †daar is baie gemors in Stellenbosch [there was a lot wasted in Stellenbosch] under the DA in 2014 and still now nothing is happening. All you do is to change mayors and you do not deal with the problem.

We want you to stand up today and commit as the MEC to say: this is what I

will do, one, two, three. Or, alternatively, to tell us that you have tried your best, therefore maybe somebody else needs to take it up, maybe hon Winde when he is the Premier, to reshuffle that Cabinet. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mngasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. What is important here is to ensure that we encourage, as I said earlier, quality performance by Section 57 and 66 and 56 of our executive officers. And that will then allow us to ensure that nationally the R66,9 billion of irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure which is mainly in ANC municipalities, does not happen. Because in this province we still have R173 million that we still have to deal with. [Interjections.]

I think that is what we need to deal with at the Standing Committee. [Interjections.] And the issue here is that nationally, I mean in this province 21 municipalities have clean audits but how do we get to the 30 so that all of them are clean? And that is only 9% of all the municipalities in the country. [Interjections.] And the AG is telling us – you must listen – the AG is telling us, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we need to focus in the Central Karoo because there is a problem. And this is a problem that we are dealing with because it is the hangover from the ANC-run governments there. [Interjections.]

Now I want to ask, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... that the hon Minister must help us to fast-track the mess in Beaufort West on the forensic audit, Kannaland as well as the other remaining municipalities, because we want to fix anything that smells, what we are questioning in the Stellenbosch situation. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: But we need to deal with it, as well as Bitou – your hangover again. [Interjections.] †La masela. [These thieves.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Firstly, hon member Mngqasela took a flight to Pretoria.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I brought him back, now he is in the province, he is driving four hours to Beaufort West. Now we must ask him ... [Laughter.] It is just 40 minutes to Stellenbosch, that is where we are. Do not go to Beaufort West because if you go to Beaufort West, it is a pity because we did not get to that point, there was an embarrassing question that was coming to the hon MEC Madikizela about the mess in Beaufort West – in fact, embarrassing because he could not even respond to this question.

[Interjection.] Because the DA during that time was in control of that municipality. So do not go to Beaufort West, you are going to open more problems. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So let us come back to Stellenbosch. Hon MEC, in all of the actions you seem to be able to act in all other municipalities, even without success, but you try, you demonstrate. There is something with you and Stellenbosch. When it comes to Stellenbosch we do not see action. There are huge problems in Stellenbosch. The inequalities are huge in Stellenbosch because you have got a rich municipality, richer than Drakenstein for that matter, and yet the kind of poverty issues, unemployment, inequality, I mean there are even land grabs and protests in Stellenbosch. You have a municipality, they are not concerned about those things, they are busy with corruption in the DA.

We want you to tell us: what are you doing as the DA in Stellenbosch?

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, I spelt out the steps that we are busy doing, †en ek het dit gesê dat die verslag was voor die Raad en die Raad het die volgende stappe in plek gesit. [and I said that the report had been before the Council and the Council had put the following steps in place.]

As the hon Richard Dyantyi will know, we have three spheres of government, three equal spheres of government, not levels of government. So if the Municipality and their forensic unit is dealing with the matter we will monitor it and we are quite happy that they are busy dealing with the matter. [Interjection.] There is no use for us to also start a forensic investigation on the whole issue, because it is the second time he is mentioning our anti-corruption policy. I will state that it works. That is why we have managed to pull out these ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is not working.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No, that is why it works because that is how we know about these issues. The TASK evaluation process was a very difficult process to implement and obviously we will need and we need to get to the bottom of this. There is no merit in, that any DA – we do not employ DA officials. I do not know the officials that ... [Interjection.] but you must also remember they have also got a right to defend themselves. So there are

two unions involved, the officials have a right to defend themselves and these things will end up in court and we will monitor that process.

I think it is unfair to state that inequality is only an issue in Stellenbosch. Throughout this province there are inequalities; throughout the country there are inequalities. [Interjection.] There is poverty and inequality everywhere, so it is not only in Stellenbosch. So with that, I thank you.

[The Speaker takes the Chair]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. That concludes Interpellation 1.

[Debate concluded.]

Violent protests: impact of

2. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What is the impact of violent protests on (a) councillors and their families and (b) the economy?

The SPEAKER: We now go to Interpellation 2, which is from the hon Mnqasela to the hon Minister of Local Government. I see the hon Minister

Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker. Municipalities have indicated that violent protests affect councillors and their families negatively as their lives and property are at risk. In these instances, the following measures had to be implemented by municipalities, the provision of alternative office space to councillors, increased security measures and hiring of private security services to safeguard the homes of councillors and councillors themselves; the use of law enforcement as protection to councillors, guarding of municipal buildings and availing alternative accommodation to councillors outside their areas of residence due to the resultant threats to their lives and that of their families.

Two shooting incidents have been reported, one in Knysna Municipality, where we tragically lost a councillor and one in Mossel Bay, where a councillor was shot at. In the Mossel Bay incident, the investigation is still underway and it cannot be determined yet whether the shooting was as a result of protests, or if it was politically motivated.

The impact of violent protests has also led to councillors' houses facing threats of destruction or damage. However, the provision of security in safeguarding these assets mitigate these threats. There have, however, been municipal reports where councillors suffered damages to their personal property as a result of the violent protests. For example, the City of Cape

Town has reported receiving six claims totalling a value of round about R1 million, R968 423 calculated since May 2015 and Saldanha Bay had furthermore reported on damages being incurred in a councillor's property, however the value had not been quantified.

In addition, the threats on councillors and their families and the fear as a result thereof, have left emotional scars on them. The relocation of the councillors and their families to alternative locations has led to their displacement and isolation from extended families and relatives. It has furthermore disrupted the family's daily routine of reaching work, going to school, etcetera.

The common responses by municipalities as to the impact of the violent protests on the economy have been that these protests have directly affected the workforce to the extent that workers have been unable to report for work. We know the tourism industry has taken a huge knock, especially in places like Overstrand, etcetera. In Overstrand the Municipality is of the opinion and reported that up to 13 businesses could have closed as a result of the violent protests and obviously that has a huge impact on the economy. [Interjections.]

These protests have had a direct impact on tourism, as I stated, and a loss can work out round about R40 to R50 million.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I see the hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker and thank you hon Minister. I must say that we do not give much recognition to the pain and suffering of councillors in our communities. And I often see when we talk at times as Members of Parliament and then we talk about councillors, we often say you know these councillors should do this, these councillors are not doing that and so forth and so forth.

But I think in terms of the support that we are able to give to these councillors and the emotional pain, trauma and suffering by their families and obviously, in a case like Hermanus, the total loss to the economy which is in the excess of a billion Rands, over the protracted period of the strike. 13 businesses have closed down and many jobs lost as a result.

So there is very serious work that needs to be done here and I would like to really urge the Minister to come up with ways to encourage, to provide visible and tangible support to councillors especially in the townships and in the rural towns in our province because that is where it hits hard. It comes very close to home to all of us as Members of Parliament. The home of one of the councillors in Hermanus was torched and we had to evacuate all of them. The Municipality had to evacuate all councillors and their only cardinal sin was to represent their communities and be elected into public office and stand when things are going wrong, but some in the communities do not seem to accept that.

Yes, there is a lot that needs to be done in ensuring that services and voices

in the communities are heard but we cannot accept that this is done violently. In Cape Town, a councillor was held hostage and her car was burnt in full view of the community and we saw recently in Beaufort West a councillor was almost torched and the only problem was, he is a councillor. So there is a lot of support and I do not know how much is being done to provide counselling and other support services to them.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much. Welcome back, Madam Speaker. It is indeed true that the pain and suffering of councillors and their families through these violent community protests is immeasurable. It is not only councillors but other public reps like MPLs and MPs. One example is the constituency office of our MPL hon Makeleni in Hout Bay which was vandalised and torched.

In most of these protests councillors are targeted for things they do not have anything to do with. I think the example member Mnqasela used, in terms of Zwelihle, is a very good one. There is another example, in Ward 89 here in the Metro, councillor Nqulwana had his property damaged and torched for things that he has no control over [Interjection].

You have fires that have taken place there in 2013, five years later nothing has happened and he has to pay the price for that. So it is not his failure, it is the failure of the best run Government in the province. So now that we know,

MEC, the impact as you have raised it, you need to, as you rise, tell us what measures you are going to take to provide security for councillors and their families during these protests but also more importantly, what you plan to do to assist municipalities, to address service delivery issues in communities so as to minimise the rate of service delivery protests. Because all of these things are linked to service delivery, things that are not happening, so communities have decided that this is the only way. How do we address the root causes and not just react to the symptoms?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think the question really that we should ask ourselves is what are the underlying factors that lead to some of these protests? There is still a matter that is before the court because hon Dugmore was promoting illegal occupation and land grabs in this province. [Interjections.] That matter is before the court and we still have to hear what the court has got to say about that. [Interjections.]. Now we are hearing that the issues that affect councillors have to do ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... with politics because hon member Dyantyi is saying that. It will be interesting to see how involved the ANC is in all of these that are happening in this province and that is a very serious matter and we need to ask these questions. So I am interested to hear what the findings are. Once

these activities have taken place what then happens in uncovering the fundamental causes and I must take full responsibility that I will investigate this matter with the law enforcement agencies that hon Dugmore has instigated... [Interjections.] through the SMS that he sent.

But, the issue here, is that if we politicise the pain of councillors, which I know for sure for instance here, the ANC gave no support to councillors in Overstrand. [Interjections.] They gave no support whatsoever and then you come here and say the DA this, the DA that. So the issue here is that we must take seriously the pain suffered by councillors during these incidents and the businesses and the loss of jobs as a result, [Interjections.] Now, hon Minister ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... do you think there is anything that could have been done differently by our committees ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mngqasela. Your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and their CDWs where we live and whether we need to change certain laws? [Interjections.] Thank you very much Madam Speaker. †Masiqhubeni, masiyeni. [Let us move on, let us go.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members we have a speaker on the floor. Hon member Nkondlo, your speaker is waiting to speak. You may proceed hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here are a few facts. [Interjections.]. Every municipality in the Western Cape that is engulfed by service delivery protests is run by the DA including Overstrand in Zwelihle. It is a [Inaudible.] protest, it is under your watch as the DA. [Interjections.] Basically you are failing to deliver services to these communities. That is fact number one. The second one, hon member Mngasela, councillors of Overstrand and Zwelihle cannot be treated along party lines. You have got a DA municipality in Overstrand which must protect everybody in that municipality so you cannot invoke that the ANC did not do this. There is taxpayers money in Overstrand that must take care of those councillors. The last fact hon MEC, in response to hon Mngasela, he is asking what has the ANC done? The ANC took it upon itself, once it saw the DA ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... had failed, we asked the Minister of Police to intervene ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... and he stabilised it and now they are able to go in

there. That is what we have done.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Kindly take your seat. [Interjections.]. Order please members. I see the hon member Mngqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. It has become evident, I think in many of these, and I do not want to belabour the facts that I have put forward here, the issues are and that still remain very key, what is it that we need to do differently because we cannot continue under the current paradigm? [Interjections.]

That is a very serious matter and my interest over anything else is that we need to protect councillors and their families. We can no longer afford the loss of income, both for the workers and for the employers so it is very important because the economy suffers and jobs get lost, We will never be able to catch up because the economy dropped by 2% in the first quarter of this year and it has been struggling to recover because we have a terrible government in this country.

So the DA needs to rescue South Africans because we are the only hope that can save South Africans and South Africans are looking to us and they are saying please come, not tomorrow but yesterday. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: We promise that the DA is coming, we are ready.

†Safika, 2019, seskhona. Siyabulela. [We have arrived, 2019, we are here.

We thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mngqasela. I now see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Madam Speaker ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, just a couple of things because this is actually a very, very important interpellation and we need with your Standing Committee to work out the programme how we can support more and even enter the space quicker to support our municipalities.

We need to distinguish between the criminals within this domain and people with real issues because sometimes we blame the criminals within but behind that there are people with real issues and we must never forget that. One of the issues is that if we are honest with one another, I have said it more than once in this House, that we play catch-up with service delivery. Although we are the best in the country we are still far from where we should be and just

for example, Madam Speaker, from 2013 to 2018, 640 000 people moved to the Western Cape, 640 000.

Now if you contextualise that you will see that, in other words, today we need 50 million litres of water extra, to accommodate these people, per day. If half of those people are children, it is 300 000 children. They must get access to schools, hospitals, everything. So maybe part of our big problem is our success, a lot of people move to the province, they want to share in the success ... [Interjections.] and we must keep on building and building and Madam Speaker, we will not show them the door because we appreciate families who want better lives ... [Interjection.] for the members of their families.

The worrying aspect is that the National Minister of Local Government announced R6 billion for disaster management that we can apply for but I can tell the hon Chairperson that personally, I think that that R6 billion will go to bail out the Department of Water Affairs and we will not see a cent of that and that is why we cannot address poverty and that is why we struggle to get ahead of service delivery. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes Interpellation 2. We now move to Number 3 which is from the hon Mackenzie to the hon Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport. I see the Minister.

3. Mr R Mackenzie asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

- (1) Whether her Department made any contributions to the National Museums Policy;
- (2) what can her Department do to fast-track the completion of the National Museums Policy?

†The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Madam Speaker Die Departement is bewus daarvan dat die nasionale Departement Kuns en Kultuur besig is om 'n Nasionale Museumbeleid te formuleer. Die nasionale Departement van Kuns en Kultuur het die konsep nasionale museumbeleid ontwikkel om onder meer die gebrek aan duidelike riglyne rakende museums in Suid-Afrika aan te spreek. Die idee is dat die beleid 'n sleutel sal wees om die potensiaal van Suid-Afrikaanse museums te ontsluit deur die bestuur en bedrywighede te verander in terme van toegang, regstelling, billikheid, maatskaplike samehorigheid en nasiebou, ten einde die sektor in staat te stel om ons nasionale erfenis doeltreffend te behou, terwyl dit terselfdertyd effektief bydra tot nasionale ontwikkeling.

Uitgebreide navorsing om die konsepbeleid te ontwikkel is deur 'n komitee gedoen wat deur die Departement opgestel is en uit onafhanklike persone met kennis van die sektor bestaan. Verteenwoordigers van die Departement het ook deelgeneem aan vergaderings met die nasionale Departement om die

beleid te bespreek. In Augustus 2014 het die nasionale Departement van Kuns en Kultuur die konsepbeleid vrygestel en 'n openbare konsultatiewe werkswinkel vanaf 14 tot 15 Augustus in Kaapstad aangebied.

Ander regeringsfere is nog nie geraadpleeg nie aangesien 'n konsepbeleid nog in die *Staatskoerant* gepubliseer moet word. Die Departement sal aan hierdie formele konsultasieproses deelneem na die uitvaardiging van die konsepbeleid deur die *Staatskoerant*.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The Department is aware that the national Department of Art and Culture are busy formulating a National Museum Policy. The national Department of Art and Culture developed the draft national museum policy to amongst other things address the lack of clear guidelines regarding museums in South Africa. The idea is that the policy should be a key to unlock the potential of South African museums through changing the management and activities in terms of access, affirmation, equality, social cohesion and nation building, in order to enable the sector to efficiently preserve our national heritage, while at the same time contributing effectively to national development.

Extensive research to develop the draft policy was conducted by a committee established by the Department and consists of independent persons with knowledge of the sector. Representatives of the Department also participated in meetings with the national Department to discuss the policy. In August

2014 the national Department of Art and Culture released the draft policy and offered a public consultative workshop from 14 to 15 August in Cape Town.

Other spheres of government have not yet been consulted as a draft policy still has to be published in the *Government Gazette*. The Department will participate in this formal consultation process following the proclamation of the draft policy by the *Government Gazette*.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see the hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker and thank you hon Minister for the response. Hon Minister, I actually attended that workshop facilitated by Minister Nathi Mthethwa on the National Museum Policy which was hosted here in Cape Town. Unfortunately our colleagues on the other side did not attend, so I am keen to hear what they are going to say in this debate. [Interjections.].

We discussed that policy and we deliberated on the reasons behind taking so long to implement and find solutions. It is disappointing that nearly four years later and twenty-four years since the policy was first mooted in 1994, that we are still discussing a National Museum Policy. It is extremely saddening to see the state in which some of our valued national heritage legacies are housed at in museums. The Western Cape's intervention through Oral History Month and Minister Marais visiting the speaker of one of the last Khoi languages, Katrina Esau, in the Northern Cape shows how serious

we are as a government in looking after our culture and our heritage.

One expects that the National Museum Policy will provide directions for storage and management of historical artefacts including statues. And would the Minister agree that events like “Rhodes Must Fall”, which led to destruction of property in historical artefacts, have happened if we did have a National Museum Policy and that it should be signed off and implemented without delay? A lot of our cultural heritage and some of our national artefacts, particularly in the Western Cape – we have a lot of it country-wide going from the Cape to Kimberley, from the Khoisan writings - would be covered in this policy and how we store them and how we take care of our heritage. So would the Minister agree, that because of the failure of National Government, who twenty-four years later mooted policy workshops I attended more than four years ago, still to this day there is no National Museum Policy.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker we must commend the National Government for initiating and leading the process of having a National Museum Policy [Interjections.]. The aim of the National Museum Policy framework is to transform the management and operation of the South African museums in terms of accessing redress, equality, social cohesion and nation building to establish the sector of effectively preserving our national heritage while contributing effectively to the National Development [Interjection.].

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

Ms D GOPIE: The objective will be achieved through proposed new structures which include the following: clustering of museums; in this regard we call for the fast-tracking of the feasibility study to determine the appropriate model of the implementation for clustering, having a single national council for all museums in which all clusters would be managed by a chief executive and each museum in a cluster managed at a programme level by a director through the rating of museums. We call for escalation of the process to develop criteria for the categorisation of grading of museums.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think by the time that happens I will be a grandfather by then. [Interjections.] And hopefully we will govern the country by then.

Madam Speaker, you know it is nice what hon member Gopie was saying but it can only happen if you start implementing it. We attended a workshop four years ago and we are sitting now four years later on a framework. The policy was started twenty-four years ago and we are still at point zero. So all that member Gopie is talking about are 'nice to have's' which given the current slow progress of the National Museum Policy, will really take us another two generations and I will probably come back in my next lifetime and I will come and debate here about the National Museum Policy. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Minister I am going to ask you ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, interjections.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... questions on that framework and on the directive and does the Minister think that the National Museum Policy will explicitly provide us with a clear guideline as to how we should preserve all our histories and our collective history as a country and I am also referring to indigenous languages. Again, I want to highlight this point that it needs to make provision and we should make sure that we preserve all our history, our collective history because knowing the ANC we will come up with history books that will only talk about one side of the history. Thank you. [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: What are you doing ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Makeleni, interjections are allowed but it is becoming a running commentary. I recognise the hon member Gopie. You may proceed member.

Ms D GOPIE: I have read the problems stated in the draft policy which highlighted the challenges in the museum space and also gave a direction that the country's museums have to align with Government implementation in the

context of including the development of national identity and social cohesion, equitable distribution of resources, improved access to the resource and opportunities including knowledge and job redress in terms of inclusive multiple narrative and ownership of the programme.

I therefore want to ask the Minister whether she fully supports the draft policy and its objectives? What role will she play in ensuring that the objectives are fully implemented?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think therein lies the problem. There are no challenges in history, you just document it. It is documented already and how does it take you twenty-four years to document history because it is already now twenty-four more years of history. So member Gopie there is no challenge in it. The only thing that needs to be done is to document it and that is what the problem with this is. And also because the ANC seems to want to rewrite history and that is why they are taking so long. They probably will find looking for another way of conniving and writing everybody else out of history and that is the reason why it is taking so long. And also, Madam Speaker, in the museum policy, what we are seeing now for example ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... what happened to uMama Winnie Mandela's house in Brandfort. That house should have been a proper museum long ago, that grandchildren and children in school and varsity students could visit the house and see how she lived. But because of the corruption the ANC committed, R20 million given by the – now the SG has been promoted, Ace Magashule has been promoted - is gone, disappeared. †Die huis is stukkend, die mure val van mekaar af ... [The house is dilapidated, the walls are falling down] ... because of the failure to implement a museum policy because that would have properly guided how do you preserve Mama Winnie Mandela's former house ... [Interjections.] and if the members were not playing politics, they would write to their National Minister and say please implement that policy so we can preserve history, all our history. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie. Soos die agbare Mackenzie tereg genoem het, van hierdie beleid word verwag om leiding te gee oor kwessies soos museumdefinisies, spesifiek oor museums in die huidige Afrika-konteks, koördinerings van museumdienste, museumklassifikasie, gradering en akkreditasie, die rolle en verantwoordelikhede van verklaarde kultuurinstellings as nasionale instellings, openbare en private sektors, en gemeenskapsgebaseerde museums; die vertolkende terreine, of die uitstallingsentrums, die natuurgeskiedenis versamelings, ons tasbare kulturele erfenis en inheemse kennisstelsels, die intellektuele kapitaal, museums en transformasie, die openbare toegang tot

museums, befondsing van nasionale museums en die bestuur van museums.

Die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Kultuursake en Sport is bereid om by te dra tot die ontwikkeling van die nasionale museumbeleid ten einde sy kundigheid en ervaring te deel, maar ek wil net noem, die Wes-Kaap Regering is die enigste provinsie met 'n museumbeleid, en hy implementeer voldoende stappe om die Skedule 5-aangeleenthede aan te spreek, d.w.s. dit is die museums wat nie nasionale museums is nie. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. As the hon member Mackenzie rightly mentioned, this policy is expected to provide guidance on issues such as museum definitions, specifically on museums in the present African context, coordination of museum services, museum classification, grading and accreditation, the roles and responsibilities of declared cultural institutions as national institutions, public and private sectors, and community based museums; the interpretative sites, or the exhibitions centres, the natural history collections, our tangible cultural heritage and indigeneous knowledge systems, the intellectual capital, museums and transformation, the public access to museums, funding of national museums and the management of museums.

The Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport is prepared to contribute to the development of the National Museum Policy in order to

share its own expertise and experience but I just want to mention, the Western Cape Government is the only province with a museum policy, and it is implementing proper steps to address the Schedule 5 matters, that is the museums that are not national museums. I thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the Interpellations [Interjections.]. Hon members we now move to Member's Statements. I see the DA, I see the hon member Mitchell.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D G MITCHELL (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. As we come to the end of Women's Month I want to focus on the impact of raising the boy child in a fatherless society. South Africa is a country where so many, including myself, are and were raised by mothers who had to fulfil both the roles of fathers and mothers. Leading gender theorists explain that both the cause and consequence of this is a toxic masculinity.

Toxic masculinity seeks to legitimise a man's dominance and the subordination of women through physical, verbal and emotional violence. It teaches the boy child, who does not have a positive male influence, that to be a man you cannot cry or you cannot be weak. That to be a man means that you must objectify women, watch and play sport, smoke and drink.

Madam Speaker, the negative consequences on the boy child does not stop

there. Studies show that boys who are raised without a positive male influence, are more likely to commit sexual violence, to become homophobic, to have a limited sense of personal responsibility, to commit crime, to become addicts, to be unemployed and to be aggressive and to bully others.

Madam Speaker, we cannot and we can no longer live in a world where our boys are alienated from their own sense of individuality because they are oppressed by toxic norms. It must be, and I want to repeat that, it must be our personal mission to challenge toxic masculinity where it rears its ugly head. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr C M DUGMORE (ANC): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. It has become increasingly clear that the DA's internal fights are not only limited to the numerous municipalities where councillors clash with each other over who should be Mayor and who should be not, but right here at the provincial level, it is very clear that the DA is racked by divisions in regard to who should succeed the outgoing Premier Helen Zille. [Interjections.]

It is very clear that on the one hand MEC Madikizela who is the duly elected leader of the DA, even if that victory was secured by a dubious margin of only 12 votes, that he believes that he as the Chair of the DA, the leader should also be the Premier candidate and we know that there has been a serious attempt by others within the DA to spread a rumour that he is not

actually standing, whereas it is very clear that he has indicated that he is available for this position.

On the other hand, it is clear that Helen Zille, with the support of the liberal cabal wants, at all costs to ensure that Alan Winde, who does not appear in the leadership structures of the DA, should be the Premier. So once again we are seeing that the DA is finding itself racked apart by divisions, not only here at the provincial level, not only here at the national level but also, we all know very well, Mr Deputy Speaker, that last year many of the MPLs across that side of the road expressed concern that if the ANC elected Cyril Ramaphosa as the leader they would be in deep, deep trouble. That is in fact what is happening now because the ideal logical clash in the DA ... [Interjection.] is evident to everyone because many of the black DA members ...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr CM DUGMORE: ... many of the black DA members see .. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... many of the black DA members see that the economic control of many small towns is controlled by a small white DA elite and that is why the divisions are emerging. So once again DA divisions are impacting on service delivery in our province. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish!

[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: That rubbish is true.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. [Interjections.] Order please members.

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Members there is a speaker on the floor. Both sides of the House.

Ms L M MASEKO: Madam Speaker, four years ago when I joined the Legislature the ANC Leader of the Opposition, Khaya Magaxa, referred to me as a 'peasant'. Implied in this is that because I am black woman who comes from a previously disadvantaged background, that I am a 'village idiot'. This Madam Speaker is racist and an attack on a woman. [Interjections].

The ANC does not care about the Western Cape's ...

The SPEAKER: Order please [Interjections.] Order members there is a speaker on the floor [Interjections.]. Hon member Makeleni you can make interjections but not on-going. You are protected. You may ... [Interjections.] Order please!

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The ANC's very own members sitting before me are cowering behind and even defending the member's patriarchal tendencies. [Interjections.] It is clear that as the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape, we are the only party brave enough ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M MASEKO: ... to stand up to racial bigotry and patriarchy. The ANC does not care about the Western Cape's coloured communities in the slightest. [Interjections.] If they did, it would not have taken over twenty years for the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform to deliver housing to the predominantly coloured claimants of District Six [Interjections.]. The ANC's track of thinking is quite literally, and I quote, said by the member, "why would they build houses for the coloured communities", we know what they call them. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon members Nkondlo and Dijana, please. You may proceed.

Ms M MASEKO: Why does member Magaxa's racist remark that coloured people are dogs does not surprise me? [Interjections.]. Again the same member, four years ago was labelling me, as a black woman, now he is labelling the coloured community. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the EFF, I see the DA. Follow the process.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Last week ... Can I start?

The SPEAKER: Members can we get some order here please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, last week I had the pleasure of attending the Commonwealth Parliament Association Conference in Gaborone in Botswana. The conference was attended by parliamentarians from the Commonwealth area and we had thorough engagements with them. I learnt a lot about the challenges and successes in politics, economics, securities and several other matters. The conversations that left me with indelible thoughts were those on the economic and job creation sector.

I had intense conversations with MPs, MPLs from Rwanda, Namibia, Seychelles and Botswana to an extent that member Beerwinkel told me that I am interrogating the people. [Laughter.] But it left me wondering what in their countries are they doing wrong and what we are doing right. According to the World Bank, Ethiopia will become a middle-class economy by 2025

with the services, agricultural and manufacturing sectors, the leading growth drivers. Of course Ethiopia is not the only one, Ghana, Rwanda, Botswana etc are also growing.

The conversation soon became about how. I began to follow with keen interest the discussion that what led to the successes of these fellow African countries. I was both enlightened and amused by the responses I received. Particularity amused because here in South Africa, the ANC-led Government works against the growth antidote that is rapidly salvaging the poorer African countries out of the wretches of poverty.

There are no shortcuts in growing an economy and the African countries have shown us how it is done. Cutting red tape, protecting individual and property rights, cutting anti-business laws and taxes. For example in Botswana your maximum tax is 25%, in South Africa we get taxed to death at 45%, plus extra with fuel levies, e-tolls and other middle-class killing taxes.

It is important that we learn from our fellow African nations. Like the Western Cape, the rest of South Africa must heed the call of making business easier to do. We must learn what is right and earn our right to be the top position as the leader of the continent by learning from our fellow African countries. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC. Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM (ANC): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Inequalities have increased in the Western Cape over the past decade with no hope for inclusive development.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Really?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Economic growth, human settlements and education continue to be extra-ordinarily skewed. Racial, class, income, gender, rural and urban disparities seem to be at the historic centre of the inequalities and continue to expand unabated as planned by apartheid and the DA regime, and as reported last year in the Oxfam Inequality Report in South Africa. We are talking about the Western Cape.

Under the ANC in 2009 the Gini Coefficient was 0,598 ... [Interjection.] but under the DA when they ...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... usurped governance of the province ...

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... a turn of events started. The Gini Coefficient is now 0,609 according to Statistics South Africa.

Thabo Mbeki maintained in his analysis that the landing of the Dutch East India Company at the Cape of Good Hope in 1652 represented in embryo the emergence of class society in our country.

But race came to dominate, for African people were ultimately not allowed in the province unless they produced a work permit or changed their names and surnames. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You had better loosen your tie, it is strangling you.
[Laughter.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: So it is not surprising that the ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... Premier in 2012 referred to people coming from the Eastern Cape as refugees because human settlements, education, social and health services ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam ...

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... and economic integration ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... are always skewed in planning.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA, hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA (DA): Yes, Madam Speaker, thank you very much. Earlier this week I wrote to the Public Protector to ask her to investigate Metrorail in the Western Cape under the management of PRASA and to recommend remedial actions to rescue the ailing railway industry. I am horror-struck by the lack of accountability and mismanagement of funds, deterioration of infrastructure and the lack of security for the commuters.

Madam Speaker, Metrorail in the Western Cape does not have enough trains to function at minimum capacity. The Western Cape requires a minimum of 88 train sets to function. In 2017 the Western Cape had just 61 train sets, however by July 2018, 32 coaches were damaged as a result of arson. As I speak Madam Speaker, trains are arriving at the station horrendously late, if they do at all.

Metrorail is expecting to launch its new trains for the network by 2019 and has budgeted R172 billion to deliver trains over a period of 20 years. This will be for nothing if we cannot address the severe safety issues on the

railway. *Eyewitness News* reports that the cost of the damages to trains amounts to R69 million over the past four months. It is further estimated that at least R210 million in damages has been accrued over the past five years, hence the request that the Public Protector must take responsibility in protecting both the infrastructure and the people who are involved in the industry who are the commuters.

The mismanagement of PRASA by the ANC-led National Government is further seen in the purchase of 4000 Spanish trains which were 4,264 meters high, despite a national limit of 3,965 meters.

The SPEAKER: Hon member your time has expired. [Interjections.]

Mr N E HINANA: The DA in the Western Cape is committed to ensuring that our residents ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr N HINANA: ... are safe and have reliable rail service.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ACDP, hon member Christians. Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Madam Speaker, with all the service delivery protests in several communities in the Western Cape and with the DA

replacing mayors adding to the tension we are facing in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.] and with the imminent appointment of the new Mayor in Cape Town, it is rumoured on social media, that the former Mayor of Nelson Mandela Metro, Athol Trollip, is heading for Cape Town to take up the post as Mayor of Cape Town. [Interjections.]. What a cat fight! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: What a cat fight with Minister Plato and Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela also having their eye on the Mayorship. [Interjections.] If this is the case and if Athol Trollip gets the nod, the question must be asked if the leadership in the Western Cape of the DA is so shallow that no one can fill the position as the Mayor of Cape Town. Madam Speaker, Athol Trollip must stay in Nelson Mandela Bay.

An HON MEMBER: He will stay.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The bus is full in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC, hon member Dijana. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, please members.

Ms T M DIJANA: The desperate DA fabricates lies and fake news in an attempt to make itself relevant.

The latest is the tall story that the National Department of Rural Development has given up its function and about R127 million to the Provincial Department of Human Settlements to complete or implement the construction of 108 housing units in District Six.

DA MPL, Matlhodi Maseko, must now come clean by telling the Legislature why she as Chairperson ... [Interjections.] claimed in a newspaper report that a resolution of support to this effect was passed by and or reported to her Standing Committee. [Interjections.]

The ANC says there was never a resolution like that and the DA openly stoops to fabricating untruths. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms T DIYANA: This is done to spread false news and sow division in communities.

What is more disconcerting is that the honourable Western Cape Premier, Helen Zille, in her paid radio advert, even attempted to defend hon Maseko

and the DA untruth.

Premier Zille even postulated to listen to the audio of the committee meeting in order to establish the facts and give credence to the untruth. [Interjections.]

What is more, the ANC will not and has not supported a bogus resolution that the Legislature Committee supports the transfer of this money to the Province. Shame on the DA and shame on you hon member Maseko. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is not there. You know it is not there!

The SPEAKER: Order please, order please members. We have one last statement. I see the DA.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape condemns in the strongest possible terms the blatant racism the ANC continues to exhibit in our province. [Interjections.]. It was reported in *Die Son* this week that ANC member Sammy Claasen is taking the acting ANC Provincial Leader, member Khaya Magaxa, to the South African Human Rights Commission for referring to coloured individuals as ‘dogs’.

This vitriolic and divisive language is a clear violation of South Africa's Constitution. [Interjections.] It constitutes hate speech, it has no place in South Africa or in our province. [Interjections.] The acting ANC Provincial Leader, member Khaya Magaxa, continues to sow disunity and pit South Africans against each other for electoral gain... [Interjections.] while showing the party's true colours as a racist organisation. [Interjections.]

This is not the first time that member Khaya Magaxa has attacked individuals in such a demeaning and humiliating way ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: He has allegedly referred to black DA MPs as "peasants".

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, sorry there is a member on the floor.
Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms P MAKELENI: There are two things that I want to bring to your attention.
[Interjections.]. When we lift postcards from this side ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me? Yes.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... you stop us and today we see the DA doing the same and they are not being stopped. [Interjections.] The second thing that I would like to bring to your attention, is the fact that Minister Grant just crossed the line while a member was speaking and in terms of Parliament Rules that is wrong and you did not stop him from doing that. So I want to bring that to your attention that when that side does wrong things you do not act timeously like you do with us and I appeal to you to try and sort these things out immediately.

The SPEAKER: I shall do so. It was very difficult whilst the Minister was crossing the floor. I was ... [Interjections.] No hold on. Hon members, I was calling member Schäfer to take a seat and hon member Makeleni you observed that and then the Minister crossed the floor but I have taken cognisance. [Interjections.] Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, the hon Schäfer is casting aspersions on the hon Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]. He did not say that ... [Interjections.]. Listen, he did not say that. He is an honourable member and they are not allowed to say it in this House. I want you to rule on that.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, thank you. Hon members, let us ... [Interjections.] Hon members, the use of pamphlets cannot disrupt the proceedings of the House. That is a ruling that we have had in the past, so yes whilst you have your pamphlets up, the minute it interferes with the smooth running of the House I do need to take control. Secondly, Minister Grant on the apparent

floor crossing, I would need to address that. You were keen to pass something along which should have waited. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Madam Speaker, I must apologise but you know I sincerely saw the look on the hon member Dugmore's face and he could not read it, so I thought I would just give him a copy. [Interjections.] So, I apologise, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Grant. All you had to do was apologise. Hon members we are still on Members' Statements. As has happened in the past statements get made. There is no provision in the Rules to refute or dispute a statement in that two minutes. So, the matter will be addressed, but I am going to take the hon member Uys' point and I will refer to Hansard and I will certainly come back to this House with a ruling in need. Thank you. You may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. I am just quoting what ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Schäfer, hon Makeleni is on the floor.

Ms P MAKELENI: I would like to thank you, Madam Speaker for making that ruling, for reminding members of the House. However, while you were giving the ruling, member Botha was still holding that placard up. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please do not ... [Interjection.] Thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: I understand she is new. Maybe she does not understand, and this thing continues to disrupt the House and you are not doing anything about it.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can I ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: ... and they continue even though you have ruled on it.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, may I request on your pamphlets please, if it is going to be disruptive to the proceedings of the House, then I am going to have to request that you do not display them. Please. And then at the same time, we do not point fingers at each other in this House, hon Makeleni. I see the hon – I never get it right, but I will say, Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: It is okay, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I would like to seek your protection. I am being abused here by hon Makeleni. [Interjections.] I am just holding a paper. I did not disrupt the speaker. [Interjections.] So they are disrupting the speaker. It is not fair. This is not their House. This is our House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.] Sorry, hon member Uys, if I may? In terms of being fair and unbiased, the Rules and we have rulings to guide us, must prevail. We have allowed posters and pamphlets, I recall, and

the minute it became disruptive, members were asked to kindly put their posters down. We are at the last statement now. May I request your cooperation, because we need to get through the business of the day. You may proceed, hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. This is not the first time ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, sorry, hon member Schäfer ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ... member Uys is on the floor.

Mr P UYS: While you were addressing the DA, hon Botha still had it up. No respect for you whatsoever. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Botha, may I request that you please put your poster on your desk? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: We do not want your objections. I thought we ... [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. This is not the first time that member Khaya Magaxa has attacked individuals in such a demeaning and humiliating way ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer, kindly ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: I am going to continue.

The SPEAKER: ... take your seat, please.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: The member ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Makeleni was on the floor, member Uys.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, it pains me that at this stage of our sitting, you make a ruling and members continue to disregard your ruling and there is nothing that is being done about those members. [Interjections.] They continue even though you have asked several times and we have been sent out of this Chamber several times and these members are still here.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. First member Uys and then the Chief Whip.
First member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition is an hon member. Nobody in this House is allowed to cast aspersions on the Leader of the

Opposition as an hon member. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I hear your point. Chief Whip Wiley?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: He has allegedly referred ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Schäfer. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, if memory serves me, last week there was liberal quoting from the written word, hear-say stated as fact. [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: It is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: But it is interesting that the member Makeleni on the one hand criticises you for your impartiality. On the other hand she is trying to protect you. She must make up her mind what she wants to do. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Hon members, the ruling ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is doing both! You ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Please respect the ruling. Let us not display ... [Interjections.] Let us get through this last statement before we move to Motions of Notice. You may proceed.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Sammy said so! Sammy said so! This is not the first time, and I am going to repeat ... [Interjections.] that he has said something that is demeaning and humiliating. [Interjections.] He has allegedly referred to DA Black MPs as “peasants” ... [Interjections.] and last year called White South Africans “animals”. [Interjections.] These utterances show not only that member Magaxa is a racist, but an inept and ill-informed politician who is not fit to serve the people of a free, fair and democratic South Africa. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, the Democratic Alliance will not sit idle while the ANC tries to dismantle South Africa’s multiracial ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...and multicultural society ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...your time has ... [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... in a desperate attempt ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...to gain and cling to power.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are you finished?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: No.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The future MEC!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Is it allowed in this House to call people “racist”? You once told us that it is wrong.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is unparliamentary and yet we have a member here who says that, and you do not intervene. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, I will have to take this one on review and come back to the House. There are merits to and for which I will need to deal with. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] You may proceed,

member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: As South Africa's only political party which represents and embraces individuals of all races, cultures, creeds, and religions, the DA will continue to fight for a unified, peaceful, and inclusive South Africa for all who live in it. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, I am quoting from the press of which Mr Sammy Claassen himself has said it, about his own colleague. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: May we get some ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] was racist, not hear-say.

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Let us not allow the dignity and decorum of the House ... [Interjections.] Please. Thank you. Hon member Tyatyam, you have a microphone that you can use, thank you. You have not stood ... [Interjection.] Hon member Tyatyam, you have not stood on a point of order, but you do not ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: There is no decorum here!

The SPEAKER: You do not have to scream and shout in the House. Thank you [Interjection.] We now move Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Hinana.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mr N E HINANA: Motions with notice?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr N E HINANA: That the House – a motion with notice of the – I am sorry!
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. So, we are at notices of motion in terms of Rule 147. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the crisis of Eskom and the impact on the Western Cape economy. I here so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the dire plight of junior doctors in the province under DA rule.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry?

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Hinana after which I see member Beerwinkel.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, in its condemnation, debates the implication of hon Khaya Magaxa's racist statement, referring to coloured people as "dogs"; that the House further notes that these remarks are racially intolerant in the highest order. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order [Interjections.] Order! Notice taken.

Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House urgently debates the continued victimisation of an education official in Suurbraak where the presiding officer dismissed the case brought against him using numerous examples of unfair labour practices used in the Department's case. The Education Department now intends bringing fresh charges against the said official.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice that the House notes the passing of Rashid Domingo, a Cape Town-born scientist and independent thinker ... [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: It is supposed to be with notice.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... who died ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: With notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Excuse me. Are you giving notice? It will stand over. Hon – anybody else? We then proceed to the next heading. I see the hon member Dugmore. You may now proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Now motions without notice?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Without notice?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Without notice.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr C M DUGMORE: Apologies for that Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] I would like to move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Rashid Domingo, a Cape Town-born scientist and an independent thinker who died in London last week at the age of 81; notes further that Mr Domingo was fascinated by chemistry in Standard 9 at Trafalgar High and converted the family's outside bathroom in District Six into his first laboratory; he then went on to study chemistry and graduated from UCT in 1959, emigrated in 1967 because of the apartheid laws, which thwarted his progress and we hereby as this House convey our sincerest condolences to his family.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Botha?

†Me L J BOTHA: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die uitlatings gemaak deur die LPP Magaxa, dat alle bruin en Khoisan mense “honde” is, verwerp ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House rejects the remarks made by the MLP Magaxa, that all coloured and Khoisan people are “honde” (dogs) ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr P UYS: Hy het nie [Onhoorbaar]

[Mr P UYS: He did not [Inaudible.]]

†Me L J BOTHA:

...met die afgryse wat dit verdien. Sy uitspraak is ‘n sterk graad van haatspraak en rassisme. Ek stel so voor. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Ms L J BOTHA:

...with the abhorrence it deserves. His statement shows a strong degree of hate speech and racism. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ek verstaan daar is 'n teenstem daarteen. Dit sal op die Ordelys gedruk word.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand there is a vote against it. I will be printed on the Order Paper.] Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns in the strongest terms the ANC's failure to reprimand or take disciplinary action against its leader, Mr Khaya Magaxa, for calling coloured and Khoisan people "dogs" and further notes that the ANC's deafening silence on the matter clearly indicates their racist-nationalist convictions. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjection.]

†Mnr P UYS: Is dit - Ag nee ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr P UYS: Is it - Ag no ... [Interjection.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

†Mnr P UYS: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek maak beswaar en ek wil hê u moet reël hierop, dat die waardigheid van 'n lid aangetas word deur die mosies wat deur beide die vorige twee lede voorgehou is.

[Mr P UYS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I object and I would like you to rule on this, that the dignity of a member is attacked by the motions that were both moved previously by the two members.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is starting to hurt.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ek neem kennis daarvan. Ek dink dis ook geopper by die Speakers vantevore.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have noted that. I think it had also been

mentioned by the Speakers previously.

†Mnr P UYS: Ja.

[Mr P UYS: Yes.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: So, dit is onder beheer, daardie een. Agb Maseko?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, it is under control, that one. Hon Maseko?]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the very irresponsible and non-exemplary example set by the former teacher, former member of SADTU, the communist sitting here in this House ...

An HON MEMBER: It is not funny at all! It is not funny!

Ms L M MASEKO:

... member Magaxa. That the House notes his spreading of hatred ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO:

...and inciting of racial tensions in this province; the ANC's failure to deal decisively ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order member [Interjections.] Just – order, just come [Interjections.] Order! Order. Just come to order. Hon member Uys?

†Mnr P UYS: Agb Adjunkspeaker, dieselfde mosie word aanmekaar deur verskillende lede herhaal. [Tussenwerpsels.] U sal moet reël daarop. As dit die geval is, sal hierdie Huis in chaos verval en dit kan nie so wees nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P UYS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the same motion is repeated all the time by different members. [Interjections.] You will have to rule on that. If that is the case, this House will become chaotic and it cannot be like that.]

†'n AGB LID: Nee!

[An HON MEMBER: No!]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Ek sal beslis daarna kyk. Voorstelle mag nie presies dieselfde wees nie. As dit verskil van mekaar kan dit aanvaar word, maar ek sal dit goed bestudeer na die tyd. Agb Philander?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I will definitely look at that. Motions may not be precisely the same. If it differs from each other it can be accepted, but I will study it properly afterwards. Hon Philander?]

Ms L M MASEKO: I was not done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, you are not done? Sorry, sorry, you may continue.

Ms L M MASEKO: No, I was not done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

An HON MEMBER: It is a statement!

Ms L M MASEKO: I am sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker – †Afrikaans, ek het niks gehoor nie. [Afrikaans, I did not hear anything.] So, let me continue. Again, I move without notice:

That the House notes his spreading of hatred and inciting of racial tensions in this province; the ANC's failure to deal decisively with Mr Magaxa shows how much ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, just one second.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, are we dealing with statements or motions here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have called for motions.

Ms S G TYATYAM: You called, besides that, it is the same thing which has been voted ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Why are we raising the same thing?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Tyatyam. I have just ruled on that ... [Interjection.] I said ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Your rulings are not for us!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Please come to order! I ruled on that to say that statements may not or cannot be exactly the same. If there are differences in the statements, obviously that is acceptable.[Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No these are the same.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I will study ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: The narration is the same here!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I am busy talking. If the statements are not the same, then it is acceptable. If it is the same, obviously they will be thrown out.

Mr S G TYATYAM: But these ones are the same.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will study them afterwards and come back to the House, if necessary.

Ms P MAKELENI: They are the same! You cannot ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you may continue.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the very irresponsible and non-exemplary example set by the former teacher, former member of SADTU, the communist sitting here in this House, member Magaxa; that the House notes his spreading of hatred, inciting of racial tensions in this province. The ANC's [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO:

...failure to deal decisively with Mr Magaxa shows how much the ANC hates coloured people and how much the ANC will invest in ensuring that they destroy the fabric of social cohesion and trust amongst our communities; I move that this House further condemns this sort of behaviour with the contempt it deserves. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to that? [Interjections.] There are objections. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move that the House ...
[Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Your integrity has gone down the drain!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: Whose integrity?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Tyatyam, I cannot see you but I can hear you. Please calm down, come to order. Hon member Mngqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think we have generally had a very good sitting. I would like to get your ruling on the casting of aspersions by hon member Tyatyam, that the integrity of a member he says, has gone down the drain. [Interjections.] That must be ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will revert ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! [Interjections.] Can I please appeal to the House, we cannot continue in this vein. When the Chair speaks, the Chair wants order and it applies to the hon member Tyatyam as well. [Interjections.] Hon member Tyatyam, I am talking to you specifically.

An HON MEMBER: He is saying that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I do not know what you said. I will study Hansard and come back to the House, but please ... [Interjections.] Before I see you, just take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo at the back and hon member Dijana, while I am speaking and asking for order, you are constantly making comments. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She is saying he never ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] I will control the House. Hon member Makeleni you may proceed. And I appeal to the whole House now to come to order. We cannot go on like this.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the DA is behaving childishly and spreading lies about member Magaxa; that the House must condemn this in the strongest terms ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We object in advance.

Ms P MAKELENI:

...as it cast aspersions on a member in this House.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to that?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Philander?

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes with great disappointment that member Khaya

Magaxa refers to me, particularly, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F PHILANDER:

...as I am a coloured female ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: We will have to leave, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: This cannot carry on like this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: May I assist? [Interjections.] Order! Order. I have said before that if the ... [Interjections.] Just take your seat. If the statements are materially the same, that will not be allowed. It is difficult for the Chair to ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not listen!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is difficult for the Chair to determine while a member is speaking whether in fact it is exactly the same or not.

[Interjections.] If it is not the same, certainly we have allowed it in the past and we will do so but if there is a concerted effort on the side of the governing party to abuse ... [Interjection.]

Hon member Nkondlo, this is the last time that I am talking to you now. If the governing party is deliberately running on the edge of the Rules all the time, then certainly I will ask them not to continue that, but my sense so far was that there is a nuance – *verskil* – nuance difference in the various motions, but I could be wrong, and I will study the motions afterwards and come back to the House and take those off the Order Paper that are justified to be taken off. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, may I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker. If as reported in the newspaper the comments made by the Leader of the Opposition, who has conveniently absented himself ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I cannot ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ... then every ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let me first hear the member.

Mr M G E WILEY: Then every single person should be deeply aggrieved and insulted, and they should be allowed to voice their opinion on the matter. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is a rule!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I agree. It is not a point of order. We will proceed now in an orderly fashion. I see the hon member Beerwinkel. [Interjections.]
Is the member still busy?

Ms W F PHILANDER: No, I am not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Philander was still busy.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

That this House notes with great disappointment that member Khaya Magaxa refers to me ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ooh! [Interjections.]

Ms W F PHILANDER:

... particularly, Mr Deputy Speaker, in the month of Women's Month [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F PHILANDER:

... particularly as I am a coloured female ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F PHILANDER:

...in the Western Cape [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member. [Interjections.] Just one second.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, you have just ruled ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot hear you. Your own members are shouting at the back.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay. Mr Deputy Speaker, you have just ruled that if there is a motion of substantially similar content that you will not allow it. It is very clear that once again this is a motion launched, attacking member Magaxa. It is very clear. [Interjections.] So we ask you to make a ruling now. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I have ruled on that and I said it is difficult for me to judge from the Chair, immediately when a member starts speaking,

whether he is saying exactly the same thing, whether the content is the same or not. And if the content is different, totally different it is acceptable.

[Interjection.]

If there are overwhelming similarities those motions will be taken off the Order Paper. It will not be printed. [Interjections.] Please continue ...

[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a lie!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and do not start from fresh. Start where you stopped.

Ms W F PHILANDER: I move without notice:

That this House notes with great disappointment ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a lie!

Ms W F PHILANDER:

...that member Khaya Magaxa refers to me, especially in the ...

[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a lie! Lie, lie, lie.

Ms W F PHILANDER:

... Month of Women, particularly as I am a coloured female in the Western Cape, as a “dog”; [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Lie, lie, lie, lie, lie!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F PHILANDER:

That this House further notes ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a lie!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F PHILANDER:

...that the member is dividing people on the basis of our skin colour
[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a lie!

Ms W F PHILANDER:

...and is degrading human beings, referring to us as “dogs”.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Mr Deputy Speaker,

That this House further notes that we will punish the ANC where it hurts them the most ... [Interjections.] and that is at the ballot box!

[Applause.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there objections to that motion?

[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Yes, of course.

Ms P MAKELENI: It is a lie!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, it can never be that you can allow hon members casting aspersions on another hon member and just say you will refer to Hansard. It is a continuing process that is happening, and you cannot allow that! You can hear what is happening. You can see it is orchestrated from one to another one and it is exactly the same. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: ...you are allowing this sitting to fall apart and maybe that is what you want. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.] Order. I have not seen any of the motions beforehand and may I appeal to the governing party if you know upfront the motions are exactly the same .. [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...do not move them.

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] leaving you out!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges the immense role played by Cape Town Professor Phillip Lloyd, eminent scientist who passed away earlier this month; his role as an engineer was acknowledged the world over; his discoveries regarding the recovery of uranium are still used as the standard in the industry today.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I sense there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

[Hon members of the ANC leave the Chamber.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Singing.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Singing.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: [Continues singing.]

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: [Continues singing.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Makeleni ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Continues singing.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Makeleni! Hon Makeleni! Hon Makeleni. For the last time. Hon Makeleni, please take your seat. Please take your seat.

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you for that. I asked so many times for order and when you stand up, deliberately ignoring the Chair, and starting to sing, that is not acceptable. I want you not to do that in future. You may leave the House. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House expresses its ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Starts singing.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Let us go.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, please take your seat.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] seat please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: The ANC found that extra vote. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, you are probably the most seasoned politician in this House and I do not expect that from you. You want to make a political point, do it in a different way. Do not degrade the decorum and order of the House. You may proceed. You may leave.
[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker? Members on that side of the House have repeatedly shown flyers, which is clearly not in line with the Rules. You have done absolutely nothing again. So, if I sing on my way out you must call me back. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, I have not seen one poster

when I was on the Chair. So, please do not make that accusation.

[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Well, your predecessor has failed. I withdraw that if it was not you in the Chair, but there is just clearly a biasness going on in this House. You have been able to hear that every single motion is the same content and you have done nothing. So if I sing when I leave, you can call me back and I will help you to [Inaudible – off mic.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I want you to leave in a dignified way because you are a dignified Member of Parliament.

Mr C M DUGMORE: *Wena DA, wena.* [Singing.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Hinana.

Mr M G E WILEY: You will make a great .. [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Singing.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Hinana?

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Singing continues.]

[*Hon member Dugmore leaves the Chamber.*]

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its heartfelt condolences to the families of the ten deceased bus passengers today in Aberdeen, in the Karoo early this morning. Further, that the House wishes a speedy recovery to those who were injured. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following 2018 Western Cape Sports Awards nominees from the Central Karoo: Vergil Grope, André Louw, Tommie Meiring, Central Karoo Netball, Royal Blues Netball, Arina Steyn, Waldo Kaptein, Newlynne Appies and Parsley Fillies.

Further congratulates the following winners, Wilfred van Niekerk for Volunteer of the Year, Willem Esbach for Community Builder of the Year and Mark Ward for Journalist of the Year at the 2018 Western Cape Sports Awards. Notes that their hard work and commitment to sports in the Central Karoo play a significant role in the development and

participation of youth in sport. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls on the ANC to reprimand and distance itself from the racial insults by their MPL and Opposition leader, Khaya Magaxa, for calling our fellow human beings “dogs”; further that the House calls on hon Khaya Magaxa to retract his racist statement and that both the ANC and hon Magaxa immediately issue an unconditional public apology. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further? Hon member Mnqasela?

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Somlomo Ndiphakama ngokukhulu ukuzithoba:

Ukuba le Ndlu yoWiso-mthetho iwugxeke ngakumbi lo mkhuba, umoya

wobugqwirha nobukhova okhoyo wokubukula ngebala abantu bebala kweli phondo leNtshona Koloni. Umhlonipheki lo uMnumzana Khaya Magaxa kufanele ukuba arhoxise iintetho zakhe ezingokhiyo ndikwatsho ukuba le Ndlu mayiwukhalimele lo mkhuba ungcole kangaka wocalucalulo kweli phondo.

[Isiphakamiso njengoko siphakanyiswe liLungu.]

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. Speaker. I rise with so much humbleness:

That this House, being the Provincial Legislature, condemns in all possible ways this bad attitude, evil spirit of discriminating against coloured people in this province of the Western Cape. Here the honourable Mr Khaya Magaxa has to withdraw his unconstructive statement he made and on top of that I plead with this House to condemn this evil attitude of discrimination in this province.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends endurance swimmer Lewis Pugh for completing his 560 kilometre swim along the English Channel from Land's End to Dover. Further notes that the 48-year-old is estimated to have completed more than 500 000 strokes across 49 days to raise awareness on the health of our oceans. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates GreenCape as the top Gender Empowerment Company for Energy and Utilities in the Standard Bank Top Women Awards of 2018, as an organisation that has stepped up and shaped women's roles within the public and private sector. I here so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the three life sentences handed down by the Western Cape High Court on Tuesday to convicted child murderer and rapist, Odwa Nkololo. May the family and community of the four year old Iyapha Yamile, take solace from this verdict. At last we can now say †Lala ngoxolo. Iyapha. [Rest in peace Iyapha.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the alarmingly high rate of abductions of young girls on their way to and returning from school. This follows a recent spate of abductions in the Zonneblom area; that this House further notes that the protection of the girl child must be the utmost priority. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Elma Davis and Chad le Clos for winning Sports Woman and Sportsman respectively, at the 2018 Western Cape Sports Awards. Further commends the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports, led by Minister Anroux Marais, for a fantastic awards evening. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? It is agreed to. Are there any further? Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends Street Talk, a Non-Profit Organisation which uses films for social activism, for their latest project called “Soccer Gogo’s”, a film on an elderly Women’s Football Club called Vukani Ma

Afrika in Khayelitsha. Further notes that the film was screened on Cape Town TV, raising awareness and encouraging the elderly to participate in sports to tackle many social issues. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Are there any further? Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates all the winners of the 2018 Western Cape Sports Awards. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? That motion is agreed to. Are there further motions? If not, then that concludes the Motions without Notice. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Premier and Constitutional Matters on the *Public Service Commission Amendment Bill* [B 21D-2015] (NCOP).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Premier and Constitutional Matters on the Public Service Commission Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation and the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP.

If parties wish to make a declaration of vote they can do so, otherwise I put the question, that there are no objections to the Ratifications of the Confirmative Authority on the Western Cape Delegation and the NCOP to support the Bill. No objections?

An HON MEMBER: None.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is agreed to. That then brings us to the end of Business for the Day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:42.