
FRIDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2018

The House met at 10:00

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good morning, hon members, to the officials, guests in the gallery. Before we begin our proceedings today I would just like to recognise one of the stalwarts of Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Mr Johannes Titus, who has served this institution with distinction for 34 years. He joined the institution on 27 August 1984 and since then he has worn his official uniform with pride and he has delivered and done his duties diligently.

I am told that Mr Titus was the first unofficial mace bearer back in the day when there was no mace.

So it is only fitting that he leads the procession today.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Mr Titus, on behalf of the members and staff I wish you well as you enter into the next phase of your journey. I wish only the best for you and your family and God's richest blessings for the Festive Season.

Hon members, please rise by joining me in thanking Mr Titus for his loyal service. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, Mr Titus.

May I now call the House to order. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2018].

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon, the hon Minister Fritz. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker, thank you.

Madam Speaker, also allow me and my Department to also wish Mr Titus an absolute great farewell and I hope that he will find the time with his wife and his daughter, who I think need a lot of his attention, that he will be able to give them the attention needed.

Madam Speaker and Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier and Cabinet colleagues, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Western Cape Provincial

Parliament, citizens of the Western Cape, the most important people.

Madam Speaker, as with all other departments, my Department has had to execute its mandate within an increasingly constrained financial and socio-economic environment, which has further been constrained by the recent drought.

I have gone into detail before during my Standing Committee meeting regarding the various shifts and changes made by the Department. These are now a matter of public record.

However, let me once again highlight the key changes and adjustments made, which speak to the sound governance of this Department.

Madam Speaker, the Department had in essence received a net increase of just over R5,128 million. This has had the effect of increasing our allocated budget from R2,242 million to R2,247 million, which will address the increased need for services in the province.

Included in this increases is the allocation of the following:

1. R1,45 million for youth programmes that prioritise job and employment readiness, employment preparation ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just read. Leave your hands and other things. Just focus

on your speech.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can you just keep quiet and just listen? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen, listen, listen.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You need to listen.

The SPEAKER: Good morning, hon member Dyantyi. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: R2,318 million ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: And welcome. Good morning and welcome.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... to provide ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You might want to listen. The Minister is leading into his speech. Thank you. You have just arrived. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: R2,318 million to provide for vehicles specifically adapted for the transport of children [Interjections.]

within intellectual disabilities, between special care centres and their homes; and then R1 million from the drought relief reserved for food aid to Agri farmworkers and their families, and I must say this was a very needed one.

In addition to this I am incredibly pleased that through this adjustment we will be able to expand our services by appointing 47 new social work graduates in addition ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... to the current 37 workers. [Applause.] And this of course through our conditional grant.

A further 10 social workers as well as two social work supervisors will also be appointed to address service delivery gaps, and I must say this is absolutely amazing. [Applause.]

Other major adjustments include increasing the travel and subsistence budget to improve oversight to fund budget shortfalls in security and cleaning services, and this oversight is an important role by our Department.

Madam Speaker, the empowerment of vulnerable persons to become self-reliant is the utmost priority of this Department, and I am pleased to see that this will be achieved through the appointment of more social work practitioners. The Western Cape Government's approach to increase

wellness, safety and tackle social ills is achieved by building inclusive, safe and healthy communities; nurturing resilient and healthy families; ensuring safe and healthy children from 0 to 14 years of age; and promoting an engaged and healthy youth between 15 and 25 years of age, and this we many times do in a traversal way with all our other departments, and they play an incredibly role together.

As I conclude, I want to highlight how this Provincial Government is exceeding in its targets in the face of budget constraints and the necessary austerity measures.

Corruption within our National Government places immense pressure on our service delivery as it limits the funding we are allocated, and I am entitled to. In turn this inhibits our ability to create an open opportunity society for all. The National Government is incapable of handling our country's economy and revenue collections.

Even as the hon members sitting in front of me here, opposite me, will continue to heckle, they too cannot deny the rampant corruption ...
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are not even [Inaudible.] to yourself [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... State capture, patronage networks ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are not even [Inaudible.] to yourself [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... kleptocracies and their national counterparts.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just sit down; you are finished now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It brings me ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... great comfort ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, kindly take your seat, please. Hon member Dyantyi, an interjection is allowed, but that was three in a row and it is now becoming a running commentary ... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It was interjection.

The SPEAKER: If I could – I understand interjection is part of your political work, but not a running commentary, thank you. You may proceed, Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank, Madam Speaker. It brings me great comfort to note that while the ANC does not care for the people of this province or country that this caring DA-led Western Cape Government is focussing on creating healthy, inclusive, safe and socially connected communities. [Interjections.]

Furthermore the DA-led Western Cape Government is focused on creating crime centre interventions that protect the most vulnerable and build resilience and social challenges.

Madam Speaker, I call on my hon ANC colleagues to take a page out of this caring Government's book, as our service delivery excellence speaks for itself, and will show in the upcoming 2019 elections. [Interjections.] I thank you.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Fritz. I now see the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the Department of Social Development, under the leadership of Minister Fritz and the HOD, Dr McDonald, has remained committed to creating a self-reliant society by ensuring the provision of a comprehensive network of social development services that enables and empowers the poor, the

vulnerable and those with special needs.

The Department's core functions ensures this by delivering a social welfare service to the poor and vulnerable, in partnership with stakeholders and civil society organisations, and providing a community development service which provide sustainable developmental programmes to empower communities.

Madam Speaker, this is executed through its programmes which prioritise social welfare services, children and families, restorative services, and development and research.

I would like to focus on two of the many areas where the Department has excelled. Firstly, the Department has intervened to protect children from neglect and abuse by increasing bed spaces in shelters, providing training to the parents of teenagers, and providing family preservation and unification services.

The Department has also trained an additional 194 social workers to promote quality services to children and families.

Further quarterly public education programmes were held on reporting maltreatment of children. This increased the reported cases of child maltreatment. 3,666 cases were reported in the first three quarters of the year.

Furthermore, Madam Speaker, I would also like to use this opportunity to thank our unsung heroes, our frontline social workers who in the midst of service, in the midst of several societal issues, continue to fulfil an important role in bringing about stability in our societies.

Madam Speaker, regardless of the time of year or time of day, they continue to provide support services to our most vulnerable children in our province. It is without a doubt that our social workers will continue to be under immense pressure to provide support to our children this festive season.

Therefore, Madam Speaker, I want to urge the parents of our province to be extra vigilant with regards to the safety of their children as they enjoy the holiday season.

Madam Speaker, the Department has had massive success in driving the treatment of substance abuse by providing school based drug-treatment programmes in 10 high risk schools.

The Department further drove the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer to enhance the quality of governmental and non-governmental alcohol and social services, ensuring alignment with the Western Cape Alcohol Harms Reduction Policy White Paper.

Madam Speaker, in light of the work already completed by the Department

of Social Development, it is most welcoming that the Department of Social Development's Adjusted Appropriation for the 2018/19 financial year is R2,246,792,000; an increase of R5,128 million from the Main Appropriation.

Madam Speaker, I must commend the Minister and his Department on their achievements in the face of an increasingly constrained budgetary environment, while also facing escalating levels of poverty and unemployment.

Thank you to all social workers who will render the debriefing and counselling services that will be the aftermath of this silly season in front of us. Where our parents lose guard of their children because of celebrating and consuming lots of alcohol during the Festive Season, and not because of being at a school function.

I therefore call on all parents to not lose sight of taking responsibility of your children; to be conscious and aware of who you allow into your children's lives and especially your families. It can simply not be a case where Government or stakeholders take full responsibility of communities' children.

To my colleagues on the Standing Committee, thank you for your support throughout our session and oversight. Thank to you coordinator, Nomonde Jamce, assistant-coordinator, Mary-Anne Burgess, and my media

researcher, Josh Shigome, for the continued support in the Committee. A special thanks to Tanya Steyn-Dowey for having made my task lighter.

Then I would like to thank Minister Fritz and his Department for their continued hard work, dedication and commitment to empowering and uplifting the people of this province. Thank you HOD, the directors, for always being there to answer my call whenever I call, or to call back in the case where I did not find you the first time. Thank you for your accessibility.

Madam Speaker, the DA supports this Appropriation for Vote 7. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Lorraine, good morning.

An HON MEMBER: Good morning to you too.

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon member Makeleni.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Beautiful in blue.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Morning, Madam Speaker. Greetings to the Department and everyone listening to this debate today. As we are getting nearer to the end of the year, I would like to wish you well during the holidays until we meet again in 2019.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You speak like an MEC, just as a start.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I rise today ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is six months before that.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... to welcome the contribution made the ANC administration to the people of the Western Cape. It is welcome relief to the budgetary constraints of this province. Today, Madam Speaker, we are debating Adjustment Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure under the theme “Unlocking economic and social opportunities for maximum citizen impact.”

It is in this Vote that the clear impact of the way this province is governed is felt; it is this Vote where we see how this Government responds to the plight of the people. We can all attest to how many people of this province go to bed hungry; how full the jails of this province are, and how children are dying of malnutrition. Also how young people are killed by alcohol,

drugs and gang-related crimes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Under their watch.

Ms P MAKELENI: How women continue to suffer ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Under their watch.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... at the hands of their abusers.

An HON MEMBER: Why do you say that? [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Today as we mark 16 Days of Activism against gender-based violence ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: 10 years of [Inaudible.].

Mr D G MITCHELL: We cannot hear.

Ms P MAKELENI: ... we must remember how much of the Department's effort can help to prevent and reduce the above.

As this Government continues [Inaudible.] social development budgets, it indicates how little they are committed to improving the quality of lives of the people of this province.

This Department was allocated R2,2 billion and the Adjustment allocation is R5,1 million, which brings the Adjustments balance to R2,2 billion. We would like to welcome the R5,1 million ordinarily as every rand makes a difference to those who have nothing. What concern us though is how this funds will be used. In our Standing Committee MEC Fritz was given an opportunity to explain how this allocation will be used for maximum citizen impact. He missed that opportunity and opted to respond to questions only.

The Blue Book indicates on how and amount of R300,000 will go towards youth outreach. This is part of Ministerial outreach programme to enable the Minister to run his own projects. We cannot help but to wonder if this is the Minister's kitty box which can be used without accountability. We have seen funds given to NGO like Thula Thula who never provided reports that was requested on Imizamo Yethu fires last year. We have been asking for these reports through committees and return questions to the Minister, and we have never received it.

It is important to note that employees of this organisation all wear DA T-shirts at work. When we go to the election we see the same NGOs delivering bread to voters, to DA voters only, especially in VDs where Minister Fritz is deployed like in De Doorns. [Interjections.]

Others have been seen handing out [Interjections.] foods with DA stickers ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! [Interjections.]

†UNksz P MAKELENI: Kudlaliwe ngathi kweli phondo.

[Ms P MAKELENI: They played with us in this province.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Ms P MAKELENI: The Department seems to select ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, sorry, if you could take your seat.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a speaker on the floor and I have a duty to respect ... [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: The speaker was talking nonsense.

The SPEAKER: ... the speaker. If we could just tone down a little. You may proceed, hon member Makeleni.

†Me M N GILLION: Dan haal hulle die brood sonder 'n sakkie uit. Net so met die hand.

[Ms M N GILLION: Then they take the bread out without a bag. Just like that, with their hands.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.] The Department seems to select ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, you have a speaker on the floor, thank you.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms P MAKELENI: The Department seems to select when it comes to accountability. DA NGOs are funded with no reports, whereas organisations in black townships have budgets taken away; like the Adelaide Tambo Centre in Gugulethu which had R90,000 in its ECD Grant taken away. [Interjections.] Organisations in Langa where mainly affected by those reductions.

An amount of R38,893 was given to ECDs Grant from the National Government for early Childhood Development. These funds are for subsidy and maintenance components. We are disappointed to note that in the midst of all these challenges the ECDs in the West Coast and Karoo are not getting any from this budget. Yes, hon member Mitchell, nothing for your constituency and nothing for yours either, hon member Botha.

ECD Centres who are named after the biggest stalwarts whom we celebrate

in this Legislature, like †Isitwalandwe [honourable.] Mama Adelaide Tambo, which lost money, was allocated to simply because Mama Tambo is associated with the ANC. The biggest losers in this [Inaudible.] ECDs are from Langa townships.

MEC Meyer was grandstanding here last week, telling us about R86 billion for youth and social development, it was mentioned as one of the four departments to benefit. We ask MEC Fritz about this. To my disappointment once again MEC Fritz was not aware of this and he said Cabinet must first meet to discuss this.

However – how will this young people benefit if the Minister who is responsible for youth development is not aware? I hope the Finance Minister was not grandstanding as he usually does, because youth in this province need all the help they can get. [Interjections.]

I am happy to note that the National Government has given R52 million [Inaudible.] for the MOD Centre Programme, which enables youth development. However, Madam Speaker, what pains me about this adjustment is the fact that it continues to take money away from workers. The hardworking workers across this province are overworked because this Province does not want to fill vacancies. People are exploited to act on jobs they are not paid for. People are working overtime, kept away from their children and robbed of quality time with their families; yet the Compensation of Employees budget is reduced. Due to absence of parents,

who are overworked, children are exposed to social ills like drugs and alcohol abuse.

Firstly the province has the highest number of drug and alcohol abuse and this Ministry is supposed to help curb the scourge; they are contributing to it. This DA Government must know when you are not filling the vacancies you are taking money away from families and every time you shift funds around that are intended for a working class family, there is a poor child who goes to bed hungry, that could die of malnutrition.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: What about the money you have taken away from the poor with state capture?

Ms P MAKELENI: This DA Government must know when you are not filling vacancies, that means this Budget is taking money from the poor and vulnerable. I am disappointed that funds will be taken away from critical programmes like social welfare services and restorative services to fund MEC Fritz Youth Cafés and Youth Awards in particular.

The Adjusted Appropriation for Programme 2 Social Welfare Services is decreased by R888,000; for Programme 4 Restorative Services it is decreased by R1,1 million. You surrender this money, you must know there is a child dropping out of school because school fees are not paid. We cannot support this budget that takes money from the people.

In respect of the above the ANC rejects how this Budget Appropriation is used. Thank you Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence - it was just delivered. In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP I see the hon, the Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to firstly say also thank you hon member Botha as the Chair and to the Committee; I want to say thanks you for the work that you guys have been doing and for keeping us accountable, and I think that is the point about governance: you definitely have not been a sweetheart. [Interjections.] Chairperson, you asked critical questions when you had to ask critical questions, and that is the point. Unlike some of our ANC colleagues who ask more sweetheart questions to me – they look like they understand ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, yes. Hon member Botha, I also need to say that we will continue with the training of our social workers. Many a time our social workers come straight from university and specifically around competencies around the Children's Act, and how to implement it and to understand and interpret it. We found those [Inaudible.]

some of the challenges, and I want to say the management and staff work very hard at trying to get training to our social workers and to our child and youth care workers. To all our staff.

So thanks for also recognising the sacrifice of the social workers; that they go into those townships where no one else wants to go, to remove a child from a gangster and get attacked on many occasions. I really want to also today echo your salutation to our social workers for the hard work, instead of the kind of ungratefulness of society to the work that social workers are doing.

So thank you very much for that, and I want to also echo your point about the safety of our children over the festive season. To just ask our families each, no, not a whole lot of people, just the family. We are not asking masses, we just ask that one household to check where their child is any given time, because it is during this time that children disappear, and by the way in the house, the boarder, the mother's lover, they are many times the perpetrators of our child murders, and I think we as parents, and families and aunties and uncles must just all be vigilant around the safety of our children. In that regard I really want to thank all our members, our Education Department, our Health Services, our Sports and Culture; all our colleagues who have been working on all the spaces that we have created in the After-School space for the safety of children and families.

Hon member Makeleni, I really want to say ... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank her first.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... that you ... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank her first.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... that – I thank the Committee as a whole, so do not, I do not individualise people. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do not be rude.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I do not individualise.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member Makeleni, if you can pay attention now, I want to echo your issue around social evils in our community, and those are the responsibility of all of us ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Which you are doing nothing about. Do not just echo.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... you know, all of us. You know ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not just echo.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and we, the problem with some of our colleagues and not you ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are sitting there.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... but the problem with some of our colleagues [Interjections.] on the other side is that they like to point fingers and not take up the responsibility to go and do stuff, and change the stuff. [Interjections.]

What we also do not get, hon member Tyatyam, what we do not get, Madam Speaker, is that it is a whole of society that must do it ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a nice excuse.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... they can – no, stop calling it an excuse!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The whole of society is a nice excuse from the DA.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You know, and then you have the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, please ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... Police Commissioner coming to communities and say, “Oh, it is this one’s responsibility and that.” [Interjections.] And they all wear little mafia hats and they come and talk about whose responsibility it is. It is our responsibility, all of us. And all of us must take responsibility for it. [Interjections.]

So ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... luckily if I was now mad as you I would have taken you seriously.

I really also want to say to Minister of Treasury, Minister Meyer, thank you for giving us more money, and they can say what they want, because they always distort whatever they – and the way they understand committees, they completely misunderstand when they talk in committees. [Interjections.]

In fact some of the stuff is completely logical, and then they expect us to make sense of the nonsense that they talk.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I think you are done now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So thank you for giving us more money ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I think you are done now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... thank you for also capacitating our young people. [Interjections.] We will create more than 100 positions now for young people to be job ready and we do not apologise for ... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Because young lives make it here.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We are not like them, where the money gets stolen. Our money will go to our young people who are unemployed, who are now in matric, who is next year going to be unemployed; we will give them opportunities ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, kindly ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and we do not apologise for it.

The SPEAKER: ... kindly take your seat, please. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I would like

to make a request through you that MEC Fritz withdraw his finger that he continues to point at us. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, your point is sustained, but once the finger has been pointed I cannot do that. I can caution the Minister to put your hand in your pocket, Minister, if that is a solution. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Hon member Magaxa ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Premier. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Then the ANC continues and I do not think, Madam Speaker, this is for hon member Makeleni, because I think she is quite a sensible and reasonable person. [Interjections.] ... but then she talks about some ECDs ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: At least there is one.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... getting only certain funding, given to certain people, and again playing the race card. Let me tell you there was not one of you stood who up for that one NGO, for the Amy Foundation. [Interjections.] Not one of you stood up when we stopped that funding.

Ms M N GILLION: There is no race card played.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because that man was white. If it was anyone else you would have jumped on the wagon and go mad. Stop using the race card.

Ms M N GILLION: Assist the NGOs ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We deal with all NGOs in the same way.

Ms M N GILLION: Assist all NGOs, not [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So please. [Interjections.]
And also the distribution of the ECD.

Ms M N GILLION: Assist all NGOs.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The ECD condition ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... grant. You know, hon member Makeleni, the ECD – you now genuinely know the whole distribution

procedure, as Minister I do not get near and tell people, instruct people who they must fund and who they must not.

So what they found, they went to do an assessment of the infrastructure needs and conditional grants went to those where the need was biggest.

Ms M N GILLION: And you do not assist the others. [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And they – but that cake is so big you – †ek gooi sommer die glas. [Tussenwerpsels.] – [I feel like throwing this glass. [Interjections.]]

So the point we are making ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Can we get some order, please?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... the point, do you listen? [Interjections.] Listen. The point is ... [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is why you are breaking things.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... we have X amount of money, you cannot give to everyone, so we have to prioritise. [Interjections.] But do not pull the race card [Interjections.]; do not pull the race card.

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is what I am
[Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, please speak to the Chair.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And again, you know, again
the issue of vacancies – hon, we are at pains when we sit in a Committee to
explain what happened in our Department with the filling of vacancies.

Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It does not change.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... people within our
Department get promotion; they are asking that we keep our people ...
[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And they are resigning.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... at the same level forever. We are promoting our own staff instead of bringing people from outside. [Interjections.]

Now when you promote that there is a vacancy it takes a long time. Now they cannot get that logic into their heads. Basic logic [Interjections.]. I want to really create a workshop of Saturday mornings [Interjections.] for Parliament to understand some of the Budget.

An HON MEMBER: Your finger, Sir.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And all members will be free to attend.

An HON MEMBER: Your finger.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because really it cannot go on like this.

And then finally, Madam Speaker, I want to echo what David Maynier said in Parliament yesterday or the day before yesterday. They have gone to the Budget Committee at national level ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is that?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... they have begged – this is the DA; begged the Budget Committee and the ANC to please give our pensioners a R450 increase for Christmas. [Interjections.]. The ANC and the EFF voted against it. They are a disgrace. That is what they are. And we wish that budget can come to us. [Interjections.] We wish we can have a competency to give the money. [Interjections.] Because it is not in our competency. SASSA belongs to you. That is the problem we have in this country. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Fritz. That concludes the debate. Hon members, it is still early in the day, it is only 10:30. We have the EMS Services on the sixth floor, let us not get our blood pressure up too early in the day.

I am now going to ask – and I am talking to both sides of the House. The Secretary will now read the second Order – sorry, I think I need to just suspend for three minutes to allow the officials to leave and we will resume in two to three minutes, thank you. Thank you very much.

[Business of the House was suspended at 10:35 and resumed at 10:39]

The SPEAKER: Thank you; you may be seated.

The Secretary will now read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 6 – Health – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2018].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon, the Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Premier, in absentia, Madam Speaker, members of this House, anyone from the gallery; I just want to say good morning.

Today, I present to this House the Adjustment Budget of the Department of Health for this financial year, but, Madam Speaker, allow me first, before I do the presentation to apologise on behalf of the Department that they are unable to be here, because of urgent matters ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: I did not hear.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... and then secondly [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo, kindly just take your seat please quickly, if you do not mind. There is too much noise, too much private conversations.

So if we could just afford the Minister the respect.

†Me M N GILLION: Hulle luister nie eers vir die Speaker nie. Hulle gaan ...

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms M N GILLION: They do not even listen to the Speaker. They are going to ... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz and Minister Schäfer ... hon members Fritz and Schäfer, thank you. Minister Mbombo, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you also, first of all before I present the Adjustment Budget I want to acknowledge that tomorrow is World Aids Day. Let us all remember those who are living with HIV, AIDS and also those who have died from HIV, AIDS, and those who are infected and all those who are affected.

Secondly I just also want to acknowledge that we are part of the United Nation's 16 Days of Activism where the focus is on workplace, violence in workplace, workplace inclusive of the home. Let us all remember those who are suffering under the hands of the perpetrators.

Also for those who died from gender-based violence and those who are still

living with that.

And then thirdly, Madam Speaker, also allow me before I go to Vote 6; during the period that we are appropriating, it was the Treasury, member hon Meyer; some of the responses included half from what we said from the Opposition. I just want to send condolences to hon member Magaxa; when he indicated that he lost a family member, and I just want to state that we did write, hon member Magaxa, to get more information.

We do not dismiss the people's truth. We have to journey in terms of what the people have felt, but we need also for the people to get closure, hence we are open for getting more information.

And then the other issue that was mentioned during the Appropriation; it may not necessarily be applicable now, but it was also mentioned. It was the issue of Khayelitsha. I just want to acknowledge the letter we received from the hon members, the ANC caucus who want to visit the hospital, and we have acknowledged that it is part of the oversight; they have been welcomed, we have agreed to that.

And then lastly the other issue that was mentioned was the Cuban doctors, to which I will respond during the conclusion. Thank, Madam Speaker, for allowing me for such response.

Now going to the Adjustment Budget. There has been an increase of

R36 million from the Main Appropriation, which is meant for service pressure.

As people probably always hear me saying, for us we render services 365 days, 24 hours, throughout; servicing from the unborn to the oldest person, also inclusive of the dead. We have a population that has increased, not only is there the increase of the population, but our disease profile is completely different from across the country, because we have got a high rate of injury and personal violence because of gangsterism. Hence for us it is not only about the numbers but also the kind of disease that we see. And then secondly the roll-overs. We have roll-overs of R106,6 million.

Programme 2, there is a R30,2 million that has been rolled over because of the Global Fund. We are the only province that received funds in this period for young women and girls, but as always is the case for the international funders, they will never give it to you on time according to our budget here. We receive it late, hence we will find that it is always going to be the roll-over due to the late signing of the new grant, given the delays in the filling of R1,3 million that is being rolled over for WoW, the Western Cape Wellness Initiative, where we are promoting health activities; non-communicable disease.

Programme 3, R18,6 million is being rolled over for the Computer Aided Electronic System for the EMS, as I presented previously here in this House in terms of what we do to try to avoid issues related to the assault of our staff

members using the electronic system as well.

Programme 6, R3,3 million is being rolled over because of the bursaries from Nursing Students. When the students are failing we have to hold the money, although the money is still committed, but you cannot give to the student who has failed. You have to wait until that student passes. Hence we will find that there is a roll-over.

Programme 8, R 14,6 million is part of the Equitable Share Rate of the Infrastructure; the delays related to the procurement and lengthy implementation period, for example now I have been to one of the clinics in the Witzenberg where there has been delays in terms of the infrastructure.

Now other adjustments which equates to R70,3 million includes a shift to Vote 1: Department of the Premier, related to the co-funded Provincial Employee AIDS Programme, where all departments put together the money and then for us to render the services for the staff related to HIV, AIDS for all staff in the Western Cape Government.

R1 million shifted from Vote 5 to Education also related to AIDS Programme.

R500,000 to Vote 12: Economic Development and Tourism related to the expansion of the WOSA, which is the Whole of Society Approach, which is we are doing together with them and other departments in Saldanha. It is also

inclusive of the pilot project for the Universal Health Coverage.

R2,2 million has been shifted to Vote 1. Again Department of the Premier for the ICT requirements for all the health facilities. I think she has already mentioned it in terms of the broadband and so forth.

R54 million, that is related to the delay, as I mentioned, the Global Fund now that is being also rolled-over.

And then lastly the Employees' Compensation that is rendered to the Provincial Treasury in order to take consideration of issues related the Compensation of Employees. I present the Budget. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Mbombo. I now see the hon member Botha. [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Government, under the leadership of Minister Mbombo, is committed to creating access to person-centred quality care. It has undertaken to provide equitable access to quality services, in partnership with the relevant stakeholders within a balanced and well-managed health system for the people of the Western Cape and beyond.

Madam Speaker, the Western Cape Department of Health continues to cater for the people of this province through district health services, emergency

medical services, provincial hospital services, central hospital services, health sciences and training, health care support services and health facilities management.

In the midst of an increasing demand for health services the Department has further consolidated its objective of reducing service pressures by building the New District Community Day Centre in Cape Town, the Hillside Clinic in Beaufort West, the Bulk Store at Karl Bremer Hospital, the Emergency Care at Stellenbosch Hospital and the Computer Tomography CT Scanner and Ward Completion project at Khayelitsha Hospital.

It further replaced the Napier Clinic and Prince Alfred Hamlet Clinic while upgrading the Emergency Centre at Tygerberg Hospital.

Madam Speaker, I want to bring heroism to all medical staff, especially to our province's nurses who will be on the receiving end of people suffering from injuries due to carnage on our roads and other injuries that will happen as a consequence of the upcoming silly season, drunkenness over the upcoming holiday period.

While many of us will celebrate the holiday season with our loved ones and families, a special thanks must go to the EMS personnel who have had a tough year as it is, and who will most likely be the first point of receiving with regards to addressing Festive Season casualties, and I again call upon our communities to be on the lookout for these EMS personnel in keeping

them safe while they are executing their duties.

The demand for healthcare services continue to grow as disease places enormous strain on the health system. This reality couples with natural disasters and preparations for additional budget reductions made the past financial year a particularly challenging year for this Department. Despite this there were no unauthorised expenditures recorded and no fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

In light of the above, Madam Speaker, it is most welcoming that the Department of Health's Adjusted Appropriation for the 2018 / 2019 financial year is R23,099,979,000 [Interjections.], an increase of R36 million from the Main Appropriation to assist with addressing the increasing demand for quality healthcare that our Government provides.

The Minister has given the breakdown within programmes where this money will be used, and I am not going to go in that programme by programme.

A special mention must go out to all those respective award winners at the Western Cape Government's Health Cecilia Makiwane Awards evening that took place on Friday, 9 November, at Kirstenbosch. The awards honour, celebrate and value nurses for their selfless dedication to the nursing profession and exceptional work done in their field through making a lasting difference to their patients' lives, and contributing to the improvement of their communities' well-being.

Madam Speaker, I would like to thank all my colleagues on the Standing Committee. Thank you for your support throughout our sessions and when we did our oversight.

Thank to you coordinator, Nomonde Jamce, and assistant-coordinator, Mary-Anne Burgess.

Madam Speaker, I would like to thank Minister Mbombo, the Head of the Department, Dr Beth Engelbrecht and all the personnel that steer this Department, but most specifically the nurses for their continued hard work, dedication and commitment to making health care accessible to all residents of the Western Cape.

With all this said, Madam Speaker, I hereby support this Appropriation. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the hon member Gillion.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Another beautiful in blue.

Ms M N GILLION: [Laughs.] I will never join the blue crane.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Never say never.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! [No ways!]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, allow me to greet the Department in absentia, and the community at large listening today as we are at the end of a very difficult year, and as we prepare for the Festive Season and all its challenges faced by this Department in the province.

Madam Speaker, in the last round of the EFF's Steenhuisen fiasco, John Steenhuisen told Parliament that if that is what a university education gets you, you can keep it, and if you think that is ... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: No, you ignore the first part.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: And if you think that it is higher logic, then I am afraid you are deluded. Unfortunately in this House we have fallen victim of that delusion.

We thought by getting a professor to run the Health Department things would turn for the better. Instead, Madam Speaker, our hospitals in the Western Cape have turned into places where people go to die.

An HON MEMBER: Because she is the best in the country.

Ms M N GILLION: I am afraid [Interjections.] that through this Budget ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... our public hospitals will move from being death centres to mortuaries.

I say this because of the various programmes decreased appropriations. Programmes 1 to 6 and Programme 8 have all been affected by the cuts in adjusted appropriations.

The reality is that whereas the Adjustment Appropriation for this Department increased by 36,2%, it is not enough to change terrible state of our public healthcare systems in this province. The decreased appropriation will make things worse.

The Adjusted Appropriation for Programme 1 is reduced by R34,8 million, which is shifted to other programmes. R21 million is shifted away from programme 6. For Programme 2 the Adjusted Appropriation is reduced by R2,5 million, with a roll-over of R31,6 million. The Adjusted Appropriation for Programme 2 still decreased. This is unacceptable.

For the MEC and her Department cannot gamble with people's lives like this. The decrease on the Adjusted Appropriations for these programmes

are just unacceptable.

In explaining what the impact of the decrease will be let us take the Khayelitsha District Hospital as the case study. The state of the art hospital in Cape Town's biggest and fastest growing township is a branch out of the ANC. It was opened six years ago to relieve service pressure at GF Jooste Hospital ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: By the DA.

Ms M N GILLION: ... which services Cape Flats' communities.

Mr M G E WILEY: It was opened by the DA.

Ms M N GILLION: With the closure ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Ms M N GILLION: ... of Jooste [Interjections.] ... With the closure of Jooste the challenges at this hospital worsened. The hospital is now overcrowded with staff shortages ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Because the people are flooding here from the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

An HON MEMBER: What? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Haibo. [No man!]

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

Ms M N GILLION: The worst care and worsening mortality rates. [Interjections.] Patients die in this hospital while waiting for beds and chairs and on the floor, and they go for days without receiving care. [Interjections.]

Staff members are exhausted and burned out due to heavy workload. Staff simply ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: ... cannot cope with the workload. Part of the reason for this is the many frozen posts at this hospital.

Madam Speaker, the MEC, her Department and the Hospital Board ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Gillion, kindly take your seat. The

debate between hon member Nkondlo and I suspect I it is ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Ja, please.

The SPEAKER: ... Minster Winde, the Chief Whip has also picked that up, it is unacceptable people, we need to respect the speaker on the floor. Thank you.

Mr P UYS: Ja, please.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The MEC, her Department and the Hospital Board are aware that parts of this building are not compliant with fire and safety standards.

Some emergency evacuation routes are ineffective, yet nothing is done to address the challenge. There is corruption and [Inaudible.] – †o, die mooi woord – [oh, the nice word] - in HR processes like nepotism, hiring unqualified staff and manipulation of performance reports in this hospital.

There is a high turnover at the hospital due to resignation and firing of staff, that seem to question these irregularities – †ek is Afrikaanssprekend, my tong haak ʼn bietjie, agb Speaker. [I am Afrikaans-speaking, my tongue gets twisted a bit, Madam Speaker.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Nou praat jou moedertong, praat in jou moedertong.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: Now your mother tongue is speaking, speak in your mother tongue.]

Ms M N GILLION: Most times without following any disciplinary processes ... [Interjections.] I wrote my own speech ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Ms M N GILLION: I do my own research. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: This is the case in almost all the other hospitals in the province. Through this process the MEC was presented with an opportunity to address these challenges and as always she failed to rise to the occasion.

I want to ask the MEC if she thinks this budget will assist to address the challenges in our public healthcare systems. Will it assist to achieve the situational analysis ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... indicators ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... sorry, I am really sorry to interrupt you, but your own members are drowning you out now. I see the Chief Whip is trying to get their attention.

†Me M N GILLION: Ai, jinne!

[Ms M N GILLION: Oh, my!]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms M N GILLION: Situation, no analysis indications like average length of hospital stays and in-patient bed utilisation ratios at district hospitals. In the Western Cape, Madam Speaker, there is a shortage of doctors, nurses, EMS personnel, forensic pathologists, pharmacists and other critical posts.

The decision to curtail Adjusted Appropriation for Compensation of Employees by R42,6 million, as well as an additional R14 million that has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund is ill conceived. The Western Cape cannot afford to make such unwise decisions. The decisions comes at a point where National Government has committed R350 million to employ more healthcare workers.

Madam Speaker, this Department is known for its high under-expenditure and fruitless expenditure as we were told by the AG last year. Over R190 million was not spent. On top of that there were roll-overs which amounted to over R106 million. That is over R290 million that could have

employed more staff and procure the much needed machinery and equipment.

It is a concern for me that in the first six months only 45% of its Budget was not spent with programmes, like the Health Facility Management spending only 30%. R53 million was not spent last year and rolled over to this year. The Department moved over R8 million from community health facilities and the Adjusted Appropriation for Emergency Medical Rescue Services is decreased by over R7 million, while all of us know the challenges we face in that Department.

This can only mean that the much needed infrastructure developments in our hospitals will not be finished on time. Lest we forget that the same thing happened before Jooste was closed down, budgets for its maintenance were not used. Who knows, maybe Tygerberg is next in line of this planning.

The MEC must also tell us where is the budget for the hospital to replace GF Jooste, which she promised the people in 2015 already.

With all the challenges at our psychiatric hospitals, the Adjustment Appropriation for the psychiatric mental hospitals is reduced. What nonsense is this?

Madam Speaker, the same problems in Khayelitsha District Hospital which

I explained above, are also persistent in these centres. Everybody knows about the challenges at Valkenberg and Lentegeur Hospitals. Yet the MEC decreases the budget for these hospitals.

The MEC is aware, because I wrote a letter to the MEC and the Department, of the challenges at Ceres Hospital where there are 12 patients being treated for drug-related illnesses, placing at risk the lives of other patients. They should be treated at psychiatric hospitals not a district hospital, but still the budget for those patients and centres are removed; not only in Ceres, but throughout the province.

Madam Speaker, the Professor has decreased the funds for health sciences and training by over R24 million. The R27 million for training nurses has been taken away. At first it was blocking an opportunity for poor students from disadvantaged backgrounds to go for free medical training in Cuba and now it is taking the budget for training nurses away.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, if you could finish up, your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: Okay.

The SPEAKER: Just finish your sentence, thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: I am going to finish now.

I am just going to talk about AIDS Day. In closing, tomorrow is the World AIDS Day, in which the world unites in the fight against HIV, AIDS and to show support.

Lastly let me wish all health professionals and workers well over the Festive Season. Thank you for being in service of all the people of the Western Cape during this Festive Season. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: And I reject the Budget. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP [Interjections.] I see the hon the Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Again I just want to thank the Department in absentia and also the coal face, not only the senior management that are there. I want to thank the Standing Committee, starting from the Chairperson and also some of the other people who have also chaired, assisted you in the chairing. The whole of the Committee, inclusive of hon member Gillion. [Interjections.] Yes, of course. I mean the Committee does play their role, very crucial ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You are the first one that appreciates it.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... in terms of challenging us. We get the blows and then we return the blows. Blow by blow. Thank you for that.

Now responding to what has been said now. The first part [Inaudible.] I must I say is below the belt. Probably let me also ... [Interjections.] probably – if it is below the belt maybe probably let me just pretend I am a professor and maybe ... [Inaudible.]. be like a tree, even if people throw a stone to harm you, drop a fruit in order to benefit them.

The PREMIER: Nice, nice.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Now going forward, where what are we supposed to do.

Again the issue of quoting statistics out of the blue, it becomes problematic. I understand hon member Gillion is trying to play politics, but unfortunately some of us are taking this responsibility very seriously. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Excuse me, people are dying [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I think probably ... [Interjections.] – let me also again, because I thought I was not going to talk about Khayelitsha because the members they have asked to visit and we are waiting for their report so that we can engage, let me pretend I am a professor and say that

Khayelitsha will always be judged differently from other Level 1 hospitals because it caters mostly for the people of Khayelitsha. [Interjections.]

In that community you will know each other. When someone has gone to the hospital and did not return – it is true when someone says that the hospitals are the end when the people are sick and then they will end up dying. There will always be death in a hospital but the question is about what is the average? Is it still within the sub-structure norms? Because Khayelitsha [Inaudible.] is the same sub-structure. Is it still within the Level 1 hospitals? It is still within the levels of the provincial and how do you compare with other Level 1 hospitals in the same context nationally and internationally? I still say Khayelitsha actually is doing fairly better than other Level 1 even in the province.

But the reason now people find that become so emotive to say, “I know someone died,” because it caters for the people who know each other in Khayelitsha. Compared, Victoria is a Level 1. Victoria takes patients from Wynberg, takes patients from Retreat, take patients from Lavender Hill.

So someone who died who is from Retreat [Inaudible.] will not be known by someone from Lavender Hill. The same applies with the False Bay. It takes people from the Masiphumelele, Ocean View and so forth.

So if someone is from Ocean View he might not know many people who have died from – and so forth and so forth. The same applies with the Karl

Bremer, who takes people from Durbanville and so forth.

So the reason for Khayelitsha is that everyone is put like on the spot if people die, because it caters for the same vicinity. You will know Nozamile went to the hospital, did not come back. You will know Ntate [Inaudible.] comes [Inaudible.], that is the point, but the issue is about the statistics, it is doing fairly well, and also the sub-structure on its own it has got more health facilities than any other sub-structure. But as we have indicated the issue is about the population increasing, the disease profile, because where you get a lot of mixed diseases – compared for example with the [Inaudible.], where you might have cardiovascular diseases and others, you do not have communicable disease.

In Khayelitsha you will have the communicables, they are here. We have the violence, inter-personal violence, they are all here, so you get the whole fruit salad under one hospital.

And the number of beds. It started as 300 beds. We have increased now up to 50. We are going to have a psychiatric unit. It is going to go more and more up to 40, and the disciplines that are there. You do not get them in Level 1, you get them at Level 2.

So that is where we are in terms of Khayelitsha.

Now ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You forgot to mention you brought in people of [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... health systems.

The health systems, again I am still putting that cap on, that I am pretending I am a professor. Health systems ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are getting obsessed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... you cannot divorce from health. When people are ill it means that they end up not going to work, because that has also impact even on their own status in terms of work production.

So if now we have got an economy that is [Inaudible.] at this level, yet you will find that the prices of medicine is going up. It means that that of the budget you get, we have to rob Paul and pay Pauline.

So when we get this money, equitable share, it is not in proportion to the population. Also not only the numbers, but also the disease profile.

So one person who goes to the Eastern Cape at Izingolweni Clinic will come there with a cough and so forth, so there is an increase in the number, but here it is not only about the cough, but because of the inter-personal violence; the gangs and also those issues.

Then it means that that person needs more advanced intervention than the other.

So the issue of the economy, the issue of poverty, the issue of unemployment, the issue of inequality, they impact on health. Like now we are speaking about safe travel and so forth. The road accidents that are going to happen is going to be my problem. Just like the gender-based violence becomes my problem. HIV, AIDS becomes my problem, and so forth and so forth.

Now going to under-expenditure, the R300 million, I think it was also indicated when I hear that the members are [Inaudible.] about R300 million that were committed by National on more staff members and so forth. The money is money that was underspent from NHI.

So that is why the civil society and everyone are up in arms against fighting the National Minister, because they were given the money for NHI; they played games. So it is not new money.

Now that money [Interjections.] ... it is not new money, it is money from the NDOH, which now ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You played more games when you ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... the President, because we had a presidential part of where Health and Education participated.

So that money now is about what must we do with the money. It is now about the commitment, it is about let us do the HR, and that money is only for the three months. It was supposed to be through the MTEF.

Instead of being committed for the three years, which is year one, two, three, it is three months left now for 2018/2019; another three months, so there is still a shortage.

So you must not think there is no new money. The health system is underfunded. Of course the issue of corruption and mismanagement and so forth that is happening everywhere, now it has an impact.

About the under-expenditure, fruitless, whatever. We are the only department for the past 14 years that has an unqualified audit. We are the only department ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Or ticking the boxes for us, nè?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are the only department for past three years [Interjections.] where we have clean finance. Only department in the country that has got clean finance. There is no other. [Interjections.] There is no other. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members. If you wish to pose a question do it through the Chair. You may proceed, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay. And, then lastly, again the issue about Jooste and whatever. I think I have answered that many times. I have answered that many times, because my understanding, members they understand that it is completely different when Auntie Sarah is asking me questions about when is it going to be Jooste, where now I have to explain from the Committee perspective.

Now we are the Legislature here; we have got an access to information: what are the phases of the delivery system for infrastructure? The last time we spoke here we provided the information where we are out of the eight phases. So everyone knows that hospital that has been planned for now, you will not see the construction, the building... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... until [Interjections.] – for example, previously ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo, kindly take your seat, please. Sorry, there is a point of order. Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I would like

you to caution or make a ruling, because as I am sitting here I can relate that hon member – what is her surname?

An HON MEMBER: Mbombo.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mbombo is casting aspersions on members on this side. So I think that on its own is against the Rules of this House.

The PREMIER: You are lucky it is only aspersions.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Hayi, thula Makhulu.

[Ms P Z LEKKER: No, keep quiet grandmother.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Lekker, I will have to check the record. I am not quite certain what it is, but we will have to revert to Hansard and come back to the House. [Interjections.]

Order, please, hon members. You may proceed, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay. I am responding to each and every one that was mentioned, so I am not sure exactly what was the casting aspersions.

So the issue, I think it was the last point about the Jooste Hospital, where it was, because at the time we indicated that the previous site was too small for the Level 2, because they wanted to increase from the Level 1 to the Level 2,

because the previous hospital did not even have maternity, did not have paediatrics and so forth. [Interjections.]

So it needed the whole package, because as we are already saying that the whole population has increased, the disease profile has changed. So we also wanted for the [Interjections.] – it must be a training ... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Explain the trauma [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... it must a training for where the medical students, the nursing and whatever, form part of it, so that is what we said.

Hence the issue, firstly it was about the issue of the site, which at the time we were not able to identify, but when we identify it, we cannot pre-empt it, in terms of talking about the school before the whole process, the school [Inaudible.]. So the whole issue has been like that.

So you will see that Jooste is going to rise; whether not in our term, it might be the other term. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Well done, Prof. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on this Vote. The House will be suspended for the officials, for the next Vote to take their seats. The House is suspended.

An HON MEMBER: We will be calling you Prof next year. [Interjections.]

[Business of the House was suspended at 11:15 and resumed at 11:19]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the third Order.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon colleagues in the Cabinet, hon members of this House, ladies and gentlemen, some of our officials from the Department.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the desire of every resident in this province is to live in an environment that is safe and secure, where they do not have to be fearful that they might be attacked, injured or worse, even killed. They dream of a safer Western Cape.

The unfortunate reality is that many people are living in fear and in fact in

many communities in this province, residents say that they feel like hostages in their own homes as the violence, shooting and muggings make it impossible for them to leave their homes.

In the 2017/18 Victims of Crime Survey this also paints a dire picture of how residents view crime in the province, with 84% of respondents believing that it has either remained the same, or getting worse.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is completely understandable. When you look at the front page of a newspaper, you find story-after-story of people being assaulted, mugged or killed. Indeed, a dire reality that we are all faced with.

It is for this reason that it is welcoming to note that our Main Appropriation of R316 617 000 has been adjusted upwards to R343 424 000. This is an adjustment of R26 807 000. This is an adjustment or an increase of R26,870 million.

This upward adjustment is very important as our 2017/18 crime stats clearly demonstrate that there is a need to address crime, especially gangsterism in our communities. The stats shows that murder increased by 12,6%, attempted murder increased by 9,2%.

84% of all gang-related murders across South Africa were committed in this province. 22% of all murders here are due to gang violence. And, hon Deputy Speaker, at the moment we are in the midst of 16 Days of Activism, this is

activism and a campaign of no violence against women and children, and it will be amiss of me not to mention that domestic violence is the cause of 5,6% of all murders in our province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is our poor communities, it is the vulnerable and the innocent that are facing and experiencing the brunt of these violent acts.

As a department, our aim is to achieve community safety. We will continue to do this by promoting professional policing through effective oversight as legislated, capacitate safety partnerships with communities and stakeholders, meaning the Whole-of-Society Approach, while also promoting safety in all public buildings and spaces.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we understand that it is impossible for the police to ensure our safety by themselves, even though this is their mandate. If you are not given the necessary resources, as the National Government should, then of course your task becomes very difficult.

We have allocated R7 million from Programme 2, of which R5 million will be used to combat community and social unrest. And as we speak right now there is unrest at the moment in Malmesbury, happening as we speak. Businesses are closing their doors and people are marching through Malmesbury at the moment. And these are the kind of things that are happening at the moment across communities in this province.

We have all witnessed the increased number of violent protests throughout our province. The Overstrand and Saldanha areas come to mind, where protestors vandalised, destroyed and looted public property; this is valued in the millions. Infrastructure that is supposed to serve the community is being destroyed and you ask yourself – to what end?

I implore honourable members of this House to engage with their constituents so that alternative mechanisms are used to address these issues that communities might face, instead of these violent and unlawful protests that we are experiencing.

To strengthen the purpose and functioning of our safety kiosks, hon Deputy Speaker, R2 million will be used for WiFi, linking these kiosks to police stations.

And hon Deputy Speaker, just in the last few days I have engaged with a number of community neighbourhood watches and whether it was the 61 neighbourhood watches that received accreditation two nights ago or the neighbourhood watches that I have met in Philippi East or the neighbourhood watches I met, six of them, last night, every single time you engage with these neighbourhood watches it is about enabling them to do their job and of course that is where this province steps in. That R2 million, I can assure you, will definitely be something well-used by these neighbourhood watches.

In Programme 4 - Security Risk Management, an allocation of R17,750

million has been appropriated.

As part of the revenue retention, R1,272 million is allocated for the operationalisation of the Safety Plan in the Saldanha Bay Municipality and is again a Whole-of-Society Approach Project.

Hon Deputy Speaker, technology and innovation can play a major role in combatting crime in our province, and we have to embrace this. This is why R750 000 will be used for safety and security technology, which is a further effort to ensure that residents are protected. Just yesterday, the Premier announced that the public Wi-Fi service will be expanded and upgraded, giving more residents access to faster broadband. It is through these types of innovation that we will be able to further enhance the utilisation of technology to also improve people's safety and security.

From day 1, I have been stating that we need to effectively support our volunteer community safety structures. It is through these structures that property-related crimes, which includes residential and business burglary and the theft out of motor vehicles have year-on-year reduction of 6,8%. And I really commend these community watches and the work that they do in the partnerships that they build, specifically with their communities but also with the crime-fighting forces like the Metro Police and the South African Police Services.

I am therefore pleased that R2 million will be allocated to the

professionalisation of neighbourhood watches. I have been travelling around the province, meeting with various community safety structures and what struck me most of all is that all neighbourhood watches are not on the same level. We want to ensure that each structure has the basic equipment needed to be effective in their functions. These are committed men and women, who freely give of their time to safeguard their communities, and they deserve to be supported fully.

I have had the opportunity to go out on patrol with a number – and if I think about the Lavender Hill, Steenberg Neighbourhood Watch and Community Policing Forums, I saw first-hand the difference that the presence of these individuals in these communities is making in their streets.

So we have these community safety structures in our areas and they are quite effective, but we still see drugs and guns removed. We see them seeping through our communities and are causing havoc, are causing pain and are really, really the driving force of what is holding everybody captive at the moment.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am of the view that through our allocation of R15 million for a provincial K9 dog unit and highway patrol safety initiative, we will be able to not only make a difference or a dent in these transfers of illegal activities, but also be able to attack directly the supply line. In due course further details will be made available about the operational deployment of these units.

We have been highlighting the fact that our men and women in blue are under-resourced in this province, hon Deputy Speaker, and this curtails what we should be able to achieve. We know that in this province we are already 4 500 police officers too short. We know that our role is just an oversight role but I have committed to Gen Jula, our Provincial Commissioner, that I will fight with him to ensure that police in this province acquired the necessary support that they need, but is also declared by law.

Taking it further, I would like to say today that we offer the national Police Minister, Minister Bheki Cele, R5 million for SAPS reservists, so that they can assist our dedicated police officers in creating a Safer Western Cape. And we really need to make a strong point here and if someone could just pass me this cheque – and I wonder if anybody in the ANC would be prepared to hand this over to your Minister. I am making R5 million available to support the police officers in our province. [Applause.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: [Inaudible] leadership.

The PREMIER: Hear, hear! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, just last week ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Put it back [Inaudible]. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Allow the Premier now – or allow the Premier candidate. Hon Minister Winde, you may continue. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.] Hon Deputy Speaker, just last week the Provincial Ombudsman reported back to this Parliament, that in the last three financial years this province has lost 326 police reservists. This translates into 5 216 policing hours that are lost, gone and never to be retrieved. Over the last decade the number of active reservists serving the police and our communities decreased by 84%. In the 2015/16 financial year the number of active residents, of reservists totalled 1 050 but this year the total number of active reservist totals 724, a decline of 31%.

This report came after the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, Mireille Wenger, requested that the investigation be launched into the decline of reservist numbers in the Western Cape.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And you decided to ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very for that, Chairperson.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And your Department decided ...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Police reservists play a critical

role in assisting the SAPS, functioning as a force-multiplier, hon Mr Dugmore. Their role cannot be underestimated. [Interjections.]

So, hon Mr Dugmore, just listen to this. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: For 10 years, hon Mr Dugmore, we have been asking for this Gang Unit to be reinstated – for 10 years, while thousands of people have been murdered in this province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible] apologetic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, hon Deputy Speaker, Minister Cele yesterday said that we are willing to work hand-in-hand in crime fighting. And when he came to our two-day conference, he said that he has been saying that we want to work together. We will talk about perhaps this just a bit later because I have not heard whether the hon Rasool has retracted this yet or not, or he accepts that he was lying when he put out this press statement – everywhere there are talks about how we are supposed to work together and it is quite ironic that the hon Minister was quoted in

today's *Cape Argus* newspaper. The first thing that was asked is, where yesterday the hon Minister was reporting back to Mitchells Plain on the anti-gang Unit, this unit that he says that everyone is working together on ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: So why can't you get report-back?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Of course you get report-back. [Interjections.] He was asked a direct question. He was asked a direct question by a journalist to say: "Why is DOCS or Winde not here?"

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why do you work [Inaudible].

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja, we know that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why do you have to read that?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He denied. He said that I had been invited. [Interjections.] He said that I had been invited because this is not a political ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Are you complaining ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is something where the National Minister has said that the province and national will be working on together, right? [Interjections.] He was asked directly why I was not invited and he said there, in open public: “Winde was invited.”

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He said it. He said: “Winde was invited.” [Interjections.] That again, just as Rasool, is a blatant lie. And very interesting, after he was asked the question, at 12:27 pm yesterday – because he said I was invited but at 12:27 pm an invitation was sent to my office. [Applause.]

But that is not the point that I want to make because the invitation that was sent to my office was an invitation, it was actually inviting me to accompany hon Minister Bheki Cele on Monday as he goes to Port Elizabeth to talk about and report back on the Gang Unit. [Interjections.] Because it says the office ... [Applause.] It says the office of the Secretariat must invite the MEC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The office of the Secretariat must invite the MEC. Today as I stand here I still have not been invited. So again the hon Minister lied on the platform. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

An HON MEMBER: And it worked.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mitchells Plain was not happy because they were not even allowed to ask a question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They were not allowed to ask questions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please come to order. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But the hon Minister went on in the meeting to say that: “We do check the availability of MECs.” This is a blatant untruth being told by a supposed hon Minister.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Minister further quoted by stating: “Policing is one area where the Constitution and legislation put the onus on the national office to do policing work.”

The hon members across the floor have, for ages in this House, and the hon Rasool in this article, kept on saying that this is a provincial responsibility where the province has failed.

The hon Minister then said, and he quite clearly said that policing is a national competency. He quite clearly said it in answering this in Mitchells Plain. So that quite clearly draws the line of where we say that we need to work together; they do not want to work together, they want to play politics. Where this House says it is our failure, he quite clearly takes responsibility for that.

So this House must think very carefully about what they say in the future. And my warning to this House is that we do not play politics with people's lives. [Interjection.] We do not play politics with people's lives. We will be watching this 10-year call for the Gang Unit. We also note how even the headlines there, "The Anti-Gang Unit is Illegal," because it was done in a two-day discussion in the hon Minister's office. There has been a week, there have been 11 months' worth of work ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Dugmore.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: There have been 11 months' worth of work on the Anti-Gang Unit and even that unit in this province was not consulted, Mr Deputy Speaker. So this House must be very careful when they play politics with crime in this province. They absolutely play politics with crime in this province. [Interjections.]

But again, Mr Deputy Speaker, I reiterate that we in this province want to partner, we want to build partnerships. We make money available for these

partnerships so that we can work together between the Province and the City and this national police force. We want to work together to reduce crime. We want to make sure that we actually build a safer Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: That is what they called for.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, it cannot be denied that crime has a major impact on all areas of our lives. If we are to achieve our aim, which is to ensure that our residents are able to live a life of quality, a life of opportunity, a life that they deserve, we need to make sure that this is a safer Western Cape, a safer Western Cape for everybody in this province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department of Community Safety has received nine consecutive clean audits and the Department has received so many accolades from both national and provincial awards that it probably needs to procure a new trophy cabinet. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to begin by welcoming hon Minister Winde to the portfolio and in his first month he has already made a significant impact on this Department. Hon Deputy Speaker, this must be the most exciting Budget Adjustment for the Department of Community Safety this term.

In a context of continued revenue shortfalls, the fact that this Government has prioritised safety with an additional allocation of R27 million, speaks volumes.

Even though the Provincial Government has no operational control over the police, it recognises its role in police oversight, ensuring professional policing and its important role in increasing safety ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. I want to be able to hear the hon member speaking.

Ms M M WENGER: Ensuring safety underpins our dream of a successful South Africa and our dream of one South Africa for all.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I would highlight some of the projects that this Adjusted Budget will fund.

The police say that they are being swamped with documents that need to be certified and which takes up time to be used for fighting crime. The Paarl East Station Commander, Col Mabhuti Stephans, was quoted as saying that on some days there were so many people waiting in a queue outside his police station that he actually had to withdraw officers from the street to help clear the backlog. [Interjections.]

The police spoke, this Government listened. R1,5 million is being set aside

in this budget for Western Cape Government employees who will volunteer to certify documents at police stations. While willing Western Cape Government employees will be performing this civic duty on a volunteer basis, the money set aside will be used for setting up desks and stationery.

This is a textbook example of better together, if ever there was one.

In another example of better together where citizens and Government collaborated to make a better society ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Better alone.

Ms M M WENGER: ... neighbourhood watches must be that shining example. R2 million additional funding is being made available to assist neighbourhood watches with equipment and training.

The Department, along with residents of this province, work together as a team, as team South Africa, because crime prevention strategies are only successful with community participation.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in an exciting development, R15 million is being set aside for the establishment of a provincial K9 unit. This is something that I have long been advocating for and the budget for the support unit is most welcome. The K9 unit will be able to support the SAPS, the Metro Police as well as Provincial Traffic to stop the flow of drugs on our Western Cape roads and to make a dent in the trafficking of poached marine products.

[Applause.]

In another attempt to help the police, this Government is making R5 million available for SAPS police reservists. Hon Deputy Speaker, through my oversight role, I exposed in 2015 that the number of police reservists in our province had declined by 66% in 2008, and in continuing to monitor this it was clear by last year that the situation has not improved, it has gotten worse. The number has dropped to an 84% decline since 2008.

It was then that I was compelled to request the Ombudsman to formally investigate it and he has confirmed that in the last three financial years there has been a 31% decline in the number of police reservists.

But what does the opportunity cost? What does that mean? It equates to a total of 217 policing days lost over three years and in 2017/18 alone, as much as 109 policing days were lost. The equivalent of a third of a year of policing was lost because of reservist cuts. But this Government recognises the important role that policing support volunteers play, such as neighbourhood watches and police reservists.

Because this Government subscribes to the Whole-of-Society Approach, it has made money available to assist the SAPS to deploy police reservists in our communities over the festive season, which is when we know crime and specifically murder, increase.

What is worth noting, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that the money for reservists comes from the over-collection of fines relating to liquor law infringements. So this R5 million is going directly towards crime fighting. And this province is the only one that fully uses the extent of Section 206, the powers contained therein, contrary to what members or our colleagues on the other side of the bench may say. We are the only province to have provincial legislation for oversight in the form of the Western Cape Community Safety Act. We are the only province to have a Police Ombudsman and we have rationalised neighbourhood watches in law.

And then also in fulfilling the Western Cape Community Safety Act, I would like to congratulate the Department and the hon Minister on the inaugural safety awards that occurred recently, in which valiant men and women in blue are recognised for their contribution to society.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in absentia I would like to thank the hon Minister Plato for his work in the Department over the course of the financial year. [Applause.] I would also like to thank the Community Safety Head of Department, Mr Morris and his team, the Provincial Police Ombudsman's Office, the Liquor Authority and the Cape Town Metro Police for having appeared before our Committee on several occasions during the year and for their transparency.

I equally thank Lieutenant General Jula and the provincial SAPS management team for having appeared before our Committee and being accountable to

Parliament.

I further wish to thank the Standing Committee members for their constructive engagements and productive participation and I am grateful for the parliamentary staff, specifically Mr Waseem Matthews, Ms Mary-Ann Burgess and Mr Ben Dasa for their professionalism and assistance throughout the year past. I also thank Mr Chigomi for his research assistance.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, this Budget Adjustment for the Department of Community Safety is fully supported by the Democratic Alliance. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. The hon Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think – I am sure you will not forget that – the biggest problem is having a different understanding of what the role of this Department is supposed to be in keeping our communities safe. For the DA this is merely a department to monitor police work, mainly for the failures in the province.

This is why the majority of the spending of this Department is on things that will not involve taking physical action to keep our people safe in communities. This Department would rather spend money on Youth Religious Safety Programmes and the Chrysalis Academy as well as the court watching briefs, instead of investing money towards fighting crime structures in the

community, like the Bambanani Programme.

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible] nothing about it.

Ms P Z LEKKER: For the ANC this was the understanding of what is supposed to have been, Section 206 was pushed to the limits. The ANC is of the view that you will only win the fight against crime if we can allow the crime-fighting structures to play their role. For many years the DA did not take this Department seriously. It was amongst the least funded in the province. Only now, a year before the elections, it is given an increase of 26,8 million in the form of the slush funds.

The hon MEC Winde's slush funds will be used for safety initiatives in times of community and social unrest.

Mr M G E WILEY: We will [Inaudible]

Ms P Z LEKKER: This means that instead of spending the budget on safety communities ... [Interjection.]

Ms D SCHÄFER: [Inaudible] slush fund, this is budget.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... on safety of communities, hon MEC Winde would rather spend the funds on policing communities not to protest against their grievances. More of those funds will be used for Wi-Fi and safety kiosks.

[Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, another will be used for professionalising neighbourhood watches. Neighbourhood watches are fully-funded and resourced, skewed by this Department while CPFs are underfunded.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is a national funded
[Inaudible]

Ms P Z LEKKER: This is wrong, hon Deputy Speaker, and it must be condemned. The Department and the MEC know about the challenges faced by the CPFs in this province. With the new MEC I had hoped that new relations would have been forged but instead there has been a point where I think the MEC is continuing on his predecessors, while capacitating neighbourhood watches who come from the affluent areas. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, over 50 million of the slush funds will be used for the K9 unit. We went on an oversight in the K9 unit where we were told of all the challenges the unit has faced, including the request that was made of the people that need dogs for this unit. That was two years ago. In all that period there was no interest from this DA-led Department to assist that unit and now, all of a sudden, they are showing an interest.

Indeed, this is a budget to make the failed Premier candidate to look good. This is a budget for the DA's 2019 campaign. This is to give time and space

to the Premier candidate to go to communities and launch his campaign. We are not surprised that the DA's candidate has been deployed to this Department, the DA organiser who was recently employed in the Department, which is one form of the cadre deployment of the Democratic Alliance.

This is why over R202 million for bursaries and operating licences have been shifted to the MEC's office. This shows lack of commitment for personal development for its employees.

Hon Deputy Speaker, over 564 000 from Chrysalis Academy has been shifted to the Youth Religious Safety Programme and this is only, in our view, as a one-day soup kitchen and compensation of the DA-aligned pastors. It is another indication that this budget is indeed for campaigning. Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA dumps money into these programmes and does not bother to conduct impact assessment of this programme.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Premier candidate thinks this is a federal state. I say that because of the R2,3 million that is earmarked for the online intelligence. What nonsense is that? At first it was the Zille spook and now the Premier candidate already has a budget of its own spook. [Interjections.]

The DA wanted to militarise youth through the Chrysalis Academy over the past year. The interest in the programme seems to be dwindling. This is not surprising, given the recent exposure of the Bird Island shenanigans. The budget is slowly abandoning its mission of militarising the youth and we are

not surprised. [Interjections.]

Programme 2, the 7 million set aside for Wi-Fi connectivity is unacceptable. The so-called safety kiosk is nothing but a total waste of money. In a visit to one of the safety kiosks in the CBD, it was reported that the safety kiosk was locked and this is a daily experience in most areas. You can go to town, to Harare now, you would see exactly what I am referring to. [Interjection.] Or rather this expensive machinery is meant for an elite few areas like Paarl North and Bothasig. [Interjection.]

The MEC spoke about the police reservists and even put forward a meagre budget for it. I understand such things happen when you take a civilian and ask him to lead Community Safety.

I want to assist him because we want more police visibility on the ground. The MEC must train and professionalise the graduates of the Chrysalis Academy to be able to do basic things like administration at police stations and taking affidavits so that the police can go to the ground. Fund the Bambanani Programme so that we can have more crime-fighting structures. Fund CPFs so that we can have better functioning, resourced CPFs on the ground. The neighbourhood watches can better function if they work hand-in-hand with CPFs and protected by the statute. I understand the MEC wants neighbourhood watches under his watch for full control.

Hon Deputy Speaker, all community crime-fighting structures are needed.

The neighbourhood watches are doing a lot to gain work in some sections of the society but there are other cases where they work alongside Metro Police and the Red Ants to evict homeless people. Just last week there were two incidents where they reportedly threatened the homeless people down De Waal Road. We need crime-fighting structures to be harsh on criminals. We need them in the place and in the Cape Flats to deal with gangs, assisting CPFs and police and not fighting homeless people.

Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, to prove this is a budget for campaigning, the budget for travelling of the MECs has been increased. And it brings more to the fact that indeed even the use of the money that will be used for the K9 unit is something that they do not understand properly, because with the K9 dogs you do not only focus on drugs. You have K9 dogs that are used for [Inaudible], you have K9 dogs that are used for a number of different criminal activities ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You cannot have [Inaudible]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... including firearms. So indeed, you really work to work harder and the DA members in the Standing Committee needs to do some homework on how the K9 dogs operate. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.] In the absence of the ACDP and the EFF, I see hon Minister Winde again, in reply.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and first of all thank you very much for all of those that have taken part in this debate and this discussion. I think perhaps just on to the Chairperson, hon Wenger, thank you very much for your contribution, not only in the oversight but also in working committees and also the knowledge that you bring to this portfolio. It is really, really valued and of course it continues to grow knowledge and becoming a specialist in crime-fighting. Thank you very much, it is great to have you in this space and with that kind of knowledge being placed as a chairperson, as oversight of this specific Department.

An HON MEMBER: That is nothing [Inaudible]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The points on the audits, I think we stand out. And of course we need to make sure that we continue to spend this money in accordance with the rules and so, very interestingly, how it gets accused that the extra funding is a slush fund but I will assure you that this money will be spent in accordance with the rules and the way that we have determined within the Budget documents. [Interjections.]

It would be quite interesting, and I will speak a little bit later about the Bambanani and I wonder whether you can read that in any of the national documents at the moment, but we will leave that question there for now.

You also spoke about the safety awards and yes, it was a great pleasure to

give that award, the first one, the inaugural one this week to Inspector Van Noy from the Manenberg Police Station, someone that really goes above and beyond duty and if you read his record, really an outstanding police officer. But specifically what was highlighted was what he did around an emergency medical services person. He arrived where an emergency medical person, a lady, was actually attacked by four individuals as she was coming out of a home where she had been called to for medical services. And she was attacked and robbed and stabbed and Inspector Van Noy jumped onto it and by 10 o'clock the next day he had already effected the arrest and those perpetrators are now in a prison, 12 years in prison.

And that highlights key things: one, there is of course real crime that is faced by the general public but I mean in a society where your emergency services are targeted, I think is just incomprehensible – how emergency services are targeted and a female coming out of offering an emergency service gets attacked. But it was really good to award him and we call on everybody to highlight your crime-fighting heroes in this province so that we can recognise these people that really go above and beyond in making this a safer place.

I am not really going to focus on any of the other issues that you raised, but maybe perhaps the Provincial Government volunteers and I think this is a very exciting programme and every single police station that I have visited has welcomed this with open arms.

The interesting thing is that we have written a letter to the hon Minister and

we still have not had a reply yet on how we are going to implement it. But in our discussions with Gen Jula and the various police stations we are going to just come up with a plan, even if we do not get that national support.

Then coming on to the Opposition and listening to the items put on the table today in this Budget debate from the Opposition, I mean some of these issues raised really astound me. When a statement is made that CPFs are not funded by or supported by this Department – I mean how long has the hon member been the oversight of this specific Department? In actual fact, CPFs in this province are supported more than in any other province. [Interjection.] R2 million goes to the CPFs in this province where, if you look at the Eastern Cape, the CPFs get R200 000 from their provincial department. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, just one second. Hon Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Is the hon Minister prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister is prepared to. You may ask him, put your question.

Mr M G E WILEY: Can you confirm that the creation of CPFs as a statutory body is described in the Police Act and is therefore a responsibility of the police to form them and administer CPFs? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That is absolutely correct. It is within the Police Act. They have a board, they have the representation on that board. In actual fact I have already attended their board as a guest. The guests at that board meeting, which happened last week, were myself, Lennit Max as a guest invited from the Minister's Office, and Leonard Ramatlakane who is a Member of Parliament, was also invited to that board. But it is a police competency – as you say, the police board of CPFs.

It is in the National Act, in the Police Act and of course we do not have any direct relationship there other than a programme that we have been instituting over the last few months where we already have been working with those CPFs from the ground upwards and that is where that R2 million of funding actually goes, to those CPFs to enable them and help them in doing their job.

Perhaps while on that point and the board, it was very interesting that at that meeting, when I arrived at the meeting and the advisor to the hon Minister had to give a report, he gave a report on the Gang Unit, he gave a report on Bambanani. It was interesting that he was the one that was giving the report on Bambanani, seeing as he was the MEC that actually closed down Bambanani, which was quite interesting. [Interjections.]

But then Leonard Ramatlakane - hon Deputy Speaker this is the most interesting aspect ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is the most interesting aspect of a body like the board of the CPFs where the oversight body, which is National Parliament and the Committee of National Parliament – has to make sure that the Executive is implementing programmes and projects, the money is being spent properly, et cetera – that the oversight body came to brief the CPFs on Bambanani and how it was going to be rolled out.

So I thought that was quite interesting and I actually asked the question specifically in the meeting as to how this worked and it was told to me that it worked because this individual comes from the oversight body. And I thought, well, that is interesting because I do not know if that is exactly how Government should be working.

But then it goes a little bit further because once I started asking these questions, you could see the tone of the meeting changed because then suddenly people realised that this was a little bit of a difficult scenario to be sitting in. Because we are talking about R36 million here, we are talking about R36 million and of course if we roll this out to, as Leonard Ramatlakane said, they are going to be appointing 1 500, so they already know how many – 1 500 Bambanani. They have got R36 million, that is R4 000 per month that these individuals are going to be paid. It is going to be interesting to see if that is the kind of money that they are going to be paid every month.

How that money is going to be transferred and what oversight is going to happen with that money when it gets transferred, will it be transferred to the CPF board, I wonder? How are they going to, from the Government's point of view, transfer this money? [Interjection.]

We have already asked whether we are going to be involved at all as DOCS, whether I am going to be involved at all as the MEC. [Interjections.] If I think about the dog unit, they are going to totally exclude us. But the big point that I put on the table that was found very, very interesting by the CPF individuals was, I said: Do you know that the lead-up to the closing of this unit, do you remember the marches to this Legislature? I remember them very well, people marching here to this Legislature to the MEC then, Leonard Ramatlakane, saying: close these things down, they are not working; they are destroying society; you are paying cadres. [Interjections.]

Those marches, go and have a look at the records on what actually happened in how Bambanani was closed down and the process that happened and the absolute mess that it created out there. And 1 500 Bambananis versus, at the moment, the neighbourhood watches which are volunteers across this province where we are already on 17 000 – run properly, run effectively, run efficiently. I have met with so many of them.

The Department does an amazing job in supporting these volunteer organisations and really, really, it is going to be very interesting to see how the ANC plays this roll out of, I want to say political canvassing campaign

for their political party going forward.

Then let us talk about the hon member raising the issue of Chrysalis and Youth Safety Programmes, saying we must stop wasting our money on Chrysalis and Youth Safety Programmes. Does she understand what Chrysalis does? Does she understand what these Youth Safety Programmes do?

It was interesting at Chrysalis on Saturday at the graduation of 190 young women, and I am not sure where the hon member was, because she was invited to come along to this graduation but again, when invites have been put out from our side, they are not adhered to or not even followed through.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You must tell him I was there [Inaudible]... I was there.
[Inaudible]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon member. Hon Wiley? Order! Hon Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Will the hon Minister take a question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, are you prepared?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister is prepared. [Interjections.]
Order, order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, in light of the comments that have been made by the ANC to close Chrysalis down because it is discredited, can the hon Minister please tell us who was on the guest list and who did attend Saturday at the graduation of ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for that question. [Interjections.] Chrysalis was attended not only by General Jula himself and the discussion that happened afterwards with the HOD and the General on how Chrysalis can be used to help in our police station, because we have not had a reply yet from the National Minister on our offer of supporting our police station. But General Jula was very interested. [Interjections.]

But, more importantly than that, four heads of departments from other provinces attended Saturday's event, four heads of departments – [Applause.] - to come and see what this programme is like, the benefits of this programme and it is an amazing programme that makes a huge difference in many, many people's lives across this province. [Interjections.]

Then of course the holiday season Youth Safety Programmes; the hon member

says we should stop wasting money on Youth Safety Programmes in the holiday season. [Interjections.] I mean, can you believe a statement like that? This is when young children out of school are on the streets and most susceptible in this crime-ridden space that we have to deal with. These are the perfect kind of programmes that we need to put in place in order to make sure ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, just one second, please. Hon Minister Wylie?

Mr M G E WILEY: Will the hon Minister take a question, please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, are you prepared to take another question?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: Will the hon Minister give this House the assurance that Chrysalis graduates will never be deployed at a political rally, as was done under Ebrahim Rasool? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, I definitely will give that assurance, I definitely will. [Interjections.] No, Rasool is not back. Rasool is trying to get back, but he is telling too many lies to be taken seriously. Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much.

Then, of course, the hon member went through all of these programmes. She calls it slush fund and then she says this slush fund will be used for a dog unit, the slush fund will be used for Wi-Fi, the slush fund will be used for community projects. This is a slush fund that is going to be used for community safety projects, she said that. And that is exactly what this money is going to be used for. It is exactly what this Appropriation is used for. [Interjections.]

This Appropriation and this Budget is used to help to make the Western Cape a safer province, to put programmes in place to deal with the issues out there that are not being covered at the moment. She had a whole lot to say about the K9 unit. It is very interesting; obviously she has visited it once. Our K9 unit will be set up, it will be focusing – because dogs can only do two things, they cannot do all sorts of things. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: She spoke about the two things

that they can do. Our dogs will be trained to sniff out drugs, they will be trained to sniff out explosives and arms, they will be trained to sniff out abalone because we will use them also for poaching, and they will be specific for the areas that they are going to be deployed to. And this is just another operation that will be put in place to minimise or to start to really deal with some of the big issues that our society is finding out there that are affecting their every single day lives.

So it is very interesting, the comments that are made by someone who has probably been on this Committee for a very long time. It shows that she actually does not understand this Committee. She needs to come along to our events, come and see what happens at those events, come and meet those people, those men and women that are working very, very, very hard to make this a safer province.

And with that, I want to thank the Committee for the role that they play; I want to thank the Chairperson and I specifically want to thank the hon Minister of Finance in this province and my colleagues in Cabinet for actually allowing this Adjustment to take place so that we can make this a safer province.

And lastly, can I say to the hard working officials in the Department: thank you very much First Respondent all that you do every single day ... [Interjections.] to make this a safer province. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Lekker, you have had your turn. That concludes the debate on this Vote. We will suspend for a couple of minutes before we start with the fourth Order. The House is suspended.

[Debate concluded.]

[Business of the House was suspended at 12:08 and resumed at 12:12]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the fourth Order.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature, ladies and gentlemen.

We are living in increasingly difficult times.

Climate Change is wreaking havoc across the globe, yet the most powerful leaders in the world are ignoring the danger signs and instead driving a fake news agenda stating climate change is not real.

Well, locally we are only too aware of the massive impact climate change can have.

We have just seen the tail-end of the worst drought in 400 years in the province, I still believe we are not really out of it yet, and therefore we continue to urge continued water savings and permanent behaviour change to our residents.

As Government we must lead and we must drive the agenda and the idea of resilient cities and towns. We must become better prepared and better enabled to withstand the massive shocks that keep hitting us, whether it is the economy, fires or drought.

The reality of resource constraints, ecological limits and growing socio-economic needs reinforces the importance of planning and environmental management. In this regard the work of this Department is becoming more and more important.

While this Department plays a key role, it is important to realise that a 'Whole-of-Government' and 'Whole-of-Society' response is required. There must be a shared vision and a common agenda, but very importantly, also a joint action.

Continued population growth in this province impacts many of the things we do, for example waste management which is also fast becoming a challenge

as we start running out of landfill space. The development of the Second Generation Western Cape Integrated Waste Management Plan has revealed a number of challenges which are exacerbated by certain legal provisions. These challenges are having unintended consequences, unnecessary expensive landfill construction costs, which are resulting in a shortage of landfill space in many municipalities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the original Budget allocated to the Department and CapeNature of R604,62 million decreased with R19,085 million in this year.

This includes a reduction in the Budget allocated to CapeNature of R12 million.

This reduction was effected on the capital expenditure of CapeNature specifically on the Kogelberg Nature Reserve and was due to delayed implementation of the development of the reserve. The R12 million has been deferred to the 2019/2020 financial year.

The Budget for CapeNature moved therefore from an amount of R302,5 million to R290,5 million.

Goods and Services are projected to decrease mainly due to an amount of R7,335 million that has been realigned over the MTEF period to ensure maximum benefit on projects.

The funds will be included in the 2019/20 budget.

Further an amount of R1,25 million was shifted to Vote 1: the Department of the Premier, to maintain and provide technical support towards the Integrated Waste Information System.

The Department will further receive an amount of R1,5 million from Vote 3: Provincial Treasury, for the development and enhancement of the Department's Integrated Management Information System.

An amount of R1 843 000 million has also been shifted to Payments for Capital Assets as a result of the modernisation of the Property Centre Building and Ground Floor Utilitas Building, as well as the provision for replacement of computers equipment and portable air quality monitors.

Furthermore, an amount of R399,000 was allocated to Transfers and Subsidies.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agbare Speaker, ek is trots op die werk wat CapeNature doen en ek wil weer eens 'n oomblik neem om CapeNature se personeel te bedank vir hul harde werk en die goeie gesindheid die afgelope jaar.

Dit bly 'n voorreg om met sulke kollegas geassosieer te word en hul spanne

verdien ook melding.

Die werk om ons omgewing te beskerm terwyl ons belangrike aspekte moet in ag neem, soos voortgesette ontwikkeling ter wille van ekonomiese groei en die verbetering van gemeenskappe, raak beslis al moeiliker.

Ons sien omstrede kwessies wat al meer opkom rondom beplannings- en ontwikkelingsaspekte in die provinsie wat moeilike besluite benodig en in die toekoms steeds verdere besluite sal benodig.

Die enigste manier om vorentoe te kan gaan met 'n mate van sukses is deur te steun op ervare en wêreldklas kollegas.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, I am proud of the work CapeNature is doing and I again want to take a moment to thank CapeNature's staff for their hard work and the good attitude over the past year.

It remains a privilege to be associated with such colleagues and their teams also deserve mention.

The work to protect our environment while we have to consider important

aspects such as continued development for the sake of economic growth and the improvement of communities, is definitely becoming more difficult.

We see controversial issues emerging more and more around planning and development aspects in the province that require difficult decisions and in future will require still further decisions.

The only way to advance with a measure of success is through the support of experienced and world class colleagues.]

Looking ahead, tough economic conditions remain the order of the day and will probably not be improving soon. This has already had an impact on available budgets and will certainly affect all our programmes moving forward.

†Mnr Adjunkspeaker, ek wil ook van hierdie geleentheid gebruik maak om my Department te bedank vir al hul harde werk onder leiding van die HOD Piet van Zyl, sy totale span. Dit is werklik 'n voorreg om met sulke kundige mense te kan werk.

Met daardie paar woorde lê ek die Begrotingsaanpassings vir die Departement Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning aan die Huis voor.

Ek dank u. [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to thank my Department for all their hard work under the guidance of the HOD, Piet van Zyl, his full team. It is really a privilege to be able to work with such knowledgeable people.

With those few words I table the Budget Appropriations for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning to the House.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Philander?

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape is a great province. Our Provincial Government is doing everything in its power to adapt to the increasing demands on our natural and built environment, especially in terms of unavoidable factors, such as climate change and the continued rise in population growth being experienced in our province.

†Die beveiliging van ons natuurlike omgewing in die Wes-Kaap vir die wat na ons kom, terwyl die landskap wel ontwikkel word, is 'n absolute prioriteit vir die Departement.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The safe-guarding of our natural environment in the Western Cape for those coming after us, while the landscape is being developed, is an absolute priority for the Department.]

I welcome it that our Provincial Treasury remains committed to building its capacity in light of the poor economic growth being experienced throughout the country and, as a consequence, several budget cuts have been made across several of our provincial departments.

†Agb Adjunkspeaker, as 'n DA-regering is hierdie Departement geen uitsondering nie as dit kom by 'n professionele en verantwoordelike regering wat kwaliteit diens lewer aan almal in die Wes-Kaap.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, as a DA Government this Department is no exception when it comes to a professional and responsible government that delivers quality service to all in the Western Cape.]

The reality remains that economic growth nationally remains at a dismal level, at just over 1%. Poor economic growth requires an increasing need to address existing challenges through the application of new ideas, new technology and improved skills. Under the guidance of hon Minister Anton

Bredell, his Department has continued to embark on creating social systems that can cope with increased crime and stress, develop infrastructure and the necessary expertise to deal with changes to the environment or economic externalities.

This Department has proven to be one of those, Business Unusual, and now, more than ever, has it been important for the Western Cape Government to squeeze inefficiencies and corruption out and increase the value for money with regards to public spending. This requires prudent, technical, capable provincial treasuries with strong political champions, as we have become accustomed to seeing in all DA-led governments across our country.

Hon Deputy Speaker, during the 2018 Adjustment Estimates the original Budget of 604,621 million decreased by 19,085 million to 585,536 million. A major contributing factor for this realignment of funds is seen in the CapeNature capital expenditure, namely the Kogelberg Nature Reserve and minor maintenance work due to delays in the project which have led to a differentiation in the 2019/20 financial years.

Other notable changes include the realignment of funds for the Berg River Improvement Plan, the Coastal Management Programme, the Water for Sustainable Growth and Development Project and the Regional Socio-Economic Project, violence protection through urban upgrading, all having funds to be made available in the 2019/20 financial year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to welcome the Adjustment Budget Appropriation of Vote 9. This is an effective budget that reflects the needs and priorities of the people of our great province, especially those who are the most vulnerable within our society. As the DA in the Western Cape, we will continue to advocate for responsible and transparent spending and long-term investment in public infrastructure and services required to ensure that every resident of our province enjoys a decent quality of life and that we iron out inequalities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in this great province we promote a resilient, sustainable and inclusive living environment in support of human wellbeing. We want our residents to live happy and dignified lives. We continue our commitment to the people of this province in providing service excellence. Through the increased pressure on natural resources to meet the growing demand, we pledge to the people of the Western Cape that we will continue to plan and manage accordingly to ensure that their needs and demands are met.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we can only build on those successes and do more. We live in a great province under the DA. [Interjection.] Hon Deputy Speaker, our residents are accustomed to the very best and we will continue to provide the very best, and more, to our residents.

Hon Deputy Speaker, our promise to our residents of the great Western Cape is that money that is meant for them will never land up in our stomachs.

[Interjection.] The people of the Western Cape can trust their Government to serve them and our communities and not just family and friends.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

Ms W F PHILANDER: We live in a great province. We acknowledge the growing demand and we have the political and administrative will to meet those demands.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank the hon Minister Anton Bredell for his hard work, commitment and dedication. Alongside that, the Department, the HOD, the previous Chair next to me, hon Tertius Simmers, for handing the baton over, all Standing Committee members, the co-ordinator Ms Van Niekerk and all support staff on the fifth floor.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, this Budget Adjustment 2018 for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is supported by the Democratic Alliance. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dijana.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Beautiful in blue. [Laughter.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. This Budget, this adjustment period has seen a decrease of 19 million in the Adjustment

Estimates from the Main Appropriation. This once again proves that the DA Western Cape Government is not taking its role seriously.

The role of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is twofold: safeguarding the ecosystem of the Western Cape for future generations, while sustainably developing the landscape in which we live. The following programme decreases of 12 million for biodiversity management and 1 million decrease of development planning further illustrates this point.

The Department does not take protecting the environment seriously. They report year-on-year that there is an entity called the Commissioner for the Environment but by their own admissions, they confirm that they failed to establish the office through enabling legislation and subsequently appointing a person according to constitutional prescripts.

The R12 million reallocated to CapeNature, why was money taken away from the Biodiversity Management Programme and not another unit? Last year R176 million was taken from biodiversity for the same reasons.

This Department should consider the importance of transformation. They have only spent 17% to date on environmental empowerment services. This should have been 15% by now. It will lead to serious under-expenditure on a very important issue.

The transformation of the environmental sector, here is again evidence of how the DA Western Cape Government undermines transformation. This was probably taken from their Federal Council stance of ditching black economic empowerment. This is exactly what the DA's broader economic empowerment framework looks like.

The timing of the German Development Bank loan to the City of Cape Town is quite suspicious, after the bank made donations amounting to R14 million to this Department which is part of Local Government MEC Anton Bredell's Ministry. Were there no cheaper loans available to the City? [Interjection.] Like, for instance, Brics Bank entities, the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and the African Development Bank, International Development Association. Finance costs on R1,3 billion is a tremendous amount. Further, the loan will burden the people of the Western Cape when the DA is no more in government.

Since mid-2017 there have been many calls for action to clear pollution in Zandvlei urgently. There was a need to investigate the shocking state of pollution in the Zandvlei area and immediate action was recommended to mitigate the problem. The Sand River between the Little Princess Vlei and the opening into the Zandvlei Nature Reserve was pictured polluted with the carcasses of dogs, plastic, rotting vegetables and other waste.

Mike Ryder, a volunteer who assists in cleaning the area, wrote a letter to the City appealing for help.

“I was appalled and embarrassed at the amount of detritus, plastic, tyres, condoms, sanitary products, wrappers, bottles, et cetera, floating and suspended in the water and washed up in the reeds and on the shores. In April 2018 the City of Cape Town temporarily closed the Zandvlei water area as a precautionary measure following water quality concerns. The test results showed a high level of fecal coliforms within the water body, which indicates an elevated risk to human health. The public is therefore advised to avoid all contact with the water at Zandvlei until these levels fall back within National Recreational Water Use Guidelines.”

This situation could have been avoided had the Local Government MEC acted swiftly. Instead his Environmental Affairs Department has abandoned their environmental oversight function.

To our dismay as the ANC, we have learned that the Department of Environmental Affairs has been caught as an active player in heritage impact assessments relating to the Two Rivers Urban Park at Liesbeek [Inaudible]. What business does Environmental Affairs have, paying for Heritage specialists and consultants, when that is the function of Heritage Western Cape?

This Department appealed the decision of Heritage Western Cape in order to assist property developers Liesbeek Leisure Properties Trust. This is clear evidence of state capture. When a private developer's interests are in harm's

way the DA Provincial Government will say: to hell with its constitutional mandate and intervene in favour of their donors, the various property developers.

The ANC rejects the Budget Adjustment and reminds the people of the Western Cape that the ANC supports the heritage and environmental rights of all citizens who reside in the Western Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ACDP and the EFF are not here, so hon Minister Bredell to reply. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. This will be a short reply. I want to thank the members of the Standing Committee under the leadership of member Philander. I want to say thank you very much for your commitment, for your leadership as the Chair of the Standing Committee.

I also want to take this opportunity because for a long time the hon member Simmers had been Chairperson. It was also a privilege and an honour to work with them. It is always important to understand the oversight role and to work together as a team to better the Western Cape for all.

I am not going to reply on hon member Dijana because the researcher has not done his homework and have not spoken on the Budget or the Adjusted

Budget, the City of Cape Town. If they have got issues they can take it up with the City of Cape Town. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] That brings us to the end of this Vote.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The business of the House will now be suspended for lunch. I would like to remind hon members of the Speaker's lunch in the dining hall area. Business is suspended. The bells will be rung to indicate the restart of business.

[Business of the House was suspended at 12:33 and resumed at 13:57]

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Okay. Order please, members. The Secretary will now read the fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2018].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. I now see the hon, the Minister. Min Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Speaker, I thank

you for the opportunity to engage on this very important Budget Vote debate today. I sincerely hope to constructively discuss the Western Cape Government's commitment to service delivery and citizen impact and not simply chasing numbers, ticking boxes or political grandstanding to ensure that those we serve are enabled with greater opportunities to be better versions of themselves, while uplifting the communities in dire need of empowerment.

I thank Minister Ivan Meyer, the Provincial Treasury team, my Cabinet colleagues and the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport Executive Management Team and officials for understanding the value cultural affairs and sport has in not only nation building but to offer all who call the Western Cape home, a sense of belonging in a national climate where the majority feels abandoned by the ANC Government.

Speaker, in May this year the national Minister of Arts and Culture noted in his Budget speech, to which I agree, and I quote,

“It is important to note and acknowledge the glaring reality that South Africa's freedom would remain hollow for the majority of the population, predominantly black, if they remain on the fringes of the economy”.

Yet, Speaker, the majority of the population who are our vulnerable and previously disadvantaged are further pushed into despair and blocked from

opportunities by allowing taxpayers' money to instead fund maladministration, mismanagement, state capture, SAA bailouts and the sorts.

Speaker, I can then also agree with Minister Mthethwa that, and I quote,

“The road to our democracy in South Africa is drenched in blood and punctuated by centuries of racial and economic subjugation, discrimination and oppression, with many ordinary South Africans, especially the youth, making the ultimate sacrifice in the quest for freedom and democracy”.

I have witnessed first-hand how Western Cape athletes and creatives, mostly youth, have been locked out of national opportunities as a consequence or sacrifice of political grandstanding. This is absolutely unacceptable as our youth are still dying in townships, on the flats and in our remote rural areas as a result of hopelessness caused by national nonchalance.

†Geagte Speaker, dit is om hierdie redes dat ons die R500 000 van die Departement van Gemeenskapsveiligheid verwelkom om die Vermindering in Alkoholverwante Skade Spelwisselaar verder te bevorder. Dit het reeds groot sukses met ons loodsprojekte in Khayelitsha en Fairyland, Paarl, beleef. Hierdie projekte volg 'n holistiese benadering waarin gedragsverandering beklemtoon word deur positiewe ontwikkelingsprogramme waar lewensvaardighede en maniere ondersoek word waarop individuele

probleemsituasies hanteer kan word terwyl sportvaardighede tydens sportaktiwiteite geslyp word.

Die gebruik van sport- en kultuursake as instrument om ons mense geleenthede vir selfbemagtiging en sosiale inklusiwiteit te bied, staan sentraal in ons pogings by die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Kultuursake en Sport. Ons het groot vordering gemaak met die skep van 'n bemagtigende omgewing waarin ons kiesers holisties kan floreer. Met ons beperkte jaarlikse begroting het ons ons belegging in die jeug geprioritiseer deur geleenthede vir toegang en deelname aan kultuursake en sport te vermeerder; deur befondsingsorganisasies te finansier, platforms waar talent ten toon gestel kan word te vermeerder en nuwe, innoverende vennootskappe met ander te smee sodat groter geleenthede kan materialiseer. Daarom is ons baie dankbaar vir die bykomende R250 000 wat ontvang is om te verseker dat die Suid-Afrikaanse Fietsrykampioenskap vanaf 11 tot 16 Desember 2018 by die Bellville Velodrome kan plaasvind. Hierdie toekenning gaan beslis meer geleenthede aan ons jeug bied, aangesien dit 'n inspuiting is vir die ekonomie as gevolg van die werksgeleenthede wat geskep word. 'n Bykomende voordeel is dat interaksie van die jeug met positiewe rolmodelle moontlik gemaak word en die Wes-Kaap as die fietsrybestemming van Afrika beklemtoon word.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Madam Speaker, it is for these reasons that we welcome the R500 000 from

the Department of Community Safety to further promote the Reduction of Alcohol Related Harms Game-Changer. It has already experienced great success with our pilot projects in Khayelitsha and Fairyland, Paarl. These projects follow a holistic approach in which behavioural change is stressed through positive development programmes where life skills and ways are explored in which individual problem situations can be managed while sports skills are being honed during sports activities.

The use of sports and cultural activities as instrument to offer our people opportunities for self empowerment and social inclusivity is central in our efforts at the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. We have made great progress with the creation of an empowering environment in which our voters can flourish holistically. With our limited annual budget we have prioritised our investment in the youth through increasing opportunities for access and participation in cultural affairs and sport; through financing funding organisations, increasing platforms where talent can be exhibited and new innovative partnerships established with others so that bigger opportunities can materialise. Therefore we are very grateful for the additional R250 000 we received to ensure that the South African Cycling Championship can take place from 11 to 16 December 2018 at the Bellville Velodrome. This grant will definitely offer more opportunities to our youth, as it is an injection to the economy as a result of the job opportunities that are created. An additional advantage is that interaction of the youth with positive role models is made possible and that the Western Cape is promoted as a cycling destination of Africa.]

Speaker, critical thinking, consciousness and a sense of belonging contribute to nation building and identity. At the Department we are committed to changing mindsets to offer positive alternatives to already negative circumstances. Each day a greater amount of national funds is announced as stolen, misused, mismanaged and privately pocketed by ANC heavyweights. This angers and frustrates us, the Western Cape Government and our enabling partners, as we too often receive, what has now become the default response from the national ANC Government that there are no funds available to optimise on our already functional and successful programmes through which lives are changed and communities uplifted through the work we do at our Department in the Western Cape.

The arts, sport and cultural affairs allow people how to think, not what to think. Thus, the work of the Department is serious business, often misinterpreted as simple fun and a time passer-by, when in fact it is a fundamental branch of government. It is concerned with the wellbeing of the mind, body and spirit and Madam Speaker, if the minds, bodies and spirits of our people are not equipped in our diversity, it is less likely that they will take up the opportunities rightfully to be availed to them.

Cultural Affairs and Sport challenges and dismantles the idea that “Because we are different, we cannot be together”. We have made incredible progress in promoting the beauty and power in our diversity and will continue to show in real terms that the ANC’s propaganda has polluted [Interjections.] the minds of our people for far too long with no sustainable solutions to living

lives our people can value. [Interjections.]

In contrast Madam Speaker, key to our efforts at the Department is the creation of an enabling environment in which all who call the Western Cape home feel a sense of identity, belonging and unity. There have been significant developments in the Province's commitment to identify, conserve, protect, manage and promote the heritage resources in the Western Cape so that we are aware of our cultural, historical landscape. [Interjections.]

We welcome the R1,5 million appropriated to the further development of an Archaeological and Palaeontological Heritage Tourism Route. This route aims to promote heritage tourism in the province, affording job opportunities while documenting where we come from and advocating the significance of our beginnings as a diverse people.

While the ANC spews division, propaganda and consciously allowing taxpayers' money [Interjections.] to enrich the already rich, our officials are placed under severe pressure and are less capacitated as salaries do not remunerate their sacrifice, hard work and selfless contribution to nation building. Speaker, R4,4 million was re-appropriated and translates to surrendered Compensation of Employees to the Provincial Revenue Fund for Fiscal Consolidation. [Interjections.] Due to the ANC's "Let them eat cake"... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...attitude, our staff have become despondent as very little financial growth is available in this very difficult economic environment also forced into by the ANC Government.

It is clear that our Western Cape residents are speaking and are more vocal about their grievances, [Interjections.] because they have been accustomed to a transparent, responsive and capable Provincial Government. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape Government promotes diversity and will ensure vigorous public participation processes in which all interested voices will be heard, considered and democratically implemented. Hon Dugmore, Makeleni and Gopie, our people deserve freedom, fairness and opportunity. How better to honour Tata Madiba on his centenary by proactively building the all-inclusive nation he once was prepared to die for. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape Government firmly believes that we are better together and only once we understand the perspectives and lived experiences of others and act accordingly ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ... in reconciliation can we move forward as a nation. [Interjections.] I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. [Interjections.] If we could just compose ourselves and allow the members to take up their seats.

An HON MEMBER: We are still waiting for the Department to account!

The SPEAKER: Alright, let us go. I now see the hon Mackenzie.
[Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Makeleni.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is a great pleasure to participate in this debate today. The Western Cape Government's theme for this year's MTBBS is "Consolidation for Maximum Citizen Impact".

An HON MEMBER: Yes but you are [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: This is set in a volatile, complex and ambiguous environment our country is going through [Interjections.] hence we fully understand the Adjustment of the R21 million.

An HON MEMBER: Oversight [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: The Western Cape Government remains committed

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to growth and creating jobs and enhance the impact through targeted interventions and create one South Africa for all.

[Interjections.] One of the target interventions is Wi-Fi, broadband and enterprise content developments, which include contents for our libraries in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is a government during the medium term, you look at your strategies of how you respond to budgeted items and the needs of the communities that we serve. Madam Speaker, when you are in a tough economic environment, created by others, you look at ways to save money, some innovative and you look at the best ways at how to respond to these significant challenges. This is the purpose of the Adjustments Appropriation Bill and which is done in all provinces and I can safely say, is probably done in all governments around the world.

The Department's savings in cost and employment has been reallocated to the Provincial Revenue Fund and these funds, like many others will go to much needed services in other departments. The fact that the Department with the Budget of under a billion can find these savings, clearly illustrates the

competence and the ability of the Department to contribute to the wellbeing of the citizenry in the Western Cape and the contribution to create one South Africa for all.

It reminds me of my grandmother, Speaker, who could feed a family of 14 grandchildren with a local bread. It takes rare skill to efficiently and equally allocate resources to fulfil your objectives. I thus commend Minister Anroux Marais and her Department for having “Ouma-vaardigheid” – Grandmother skills, to do what they do with the little that they have and ensure everybody benefits.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Nou praat jy!

[An HON MEMBER: Now you are talking!]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, when we talk about the R13 million that was allocated to Enterprise Development Content of the Department of the Premier, it gives me great joy. The reason is that Wi-Fi, broadband and enterprise development is important for any government to succeed and deliver to its people. [Interjections.] A government that is not online and provide e-services is a government that is destined to fail.

Madam Speaker, libraries are the cornerstone of our society. As a government we always look at ways of unlocking opportunities. Where you build libraries, expand libraries, expand Wi-Fi and broadband and e-services, you do exactly that. You unlock opportunities, create jobs and assist in

dealing with the social challenges in our society. This is what this Government is all about. We unlock opportunities by providing content enterprise development.

So, it was a pleasure, Madam Speaker, when I visited Beacon Hill High School in Mitchells Plain on behalf of my colleague, Minister Albert Fritz and I saw how they are expanding their library and the Principal, Mr Kannemeyer, told me how they opened up the library for the community of Mitchells Plain. What does it mean, Madam Speaker?

It means that the communities of East Ridge and Beacon Hill and Beacon Valley do not have to travel to Tafelsig to use the library. So, for an unemployed person who needs R50 to get to a library in Town Centre, to get a job, that person can now walk to Beacon Hill High School, use the e-services, use the library to apply for a job and this is what the allocation of this Government is doing.

We therefore welcome the allocation to the computer equipment for the rural library connectivity's project, Madam Speaker, but more importantly, in the Adjustments Appropriation Bill, which I am sure some members on the side did not see, there was a very important allocation. That allocation that we all know, is the grand old Luxurama or the Lux. And this is the historic venue in Wynberg in Cape Town. The Lux hosted some of Cape Town's greatest stars in its heyday. The late Kallie Pietersen, the late Robbie Janson, the Rockers, the Pacific Express and I am sure hon member Kivedo was also

present on the dance floor many years back.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I was therefore pleased to see the funding allocation to document the importance and the history of the Luxurama and looking forward to watching this important documentary, and Minister Marais, I know the Lux is being used now for an education facility but when this documentary is launched, I hope that you will convince them to open the Lux and launch the documentary about the Lux at the Lux.

We also welcome the R301 000 allocated for the Provincial Heritage Bill and are looking forward to receiving this Bill in Parliament, so that our collective heritage can be preserved. Madam Speaker, I know what member Gopie is going to say. She will talk about the shifts in the various program, which is okay, because a government that cannot adapt to economic changes is a government that does not deserve to be in government. [Interjections.] So this is why it is great to see, despite all the planning and despite the fact that they have managed to shift funds to accommodate the needs of the community, this DA Government continues to deliver.

I want to thank the Department for being accountable to the Committee and sharing everything with this Committee. [Interjections.] This great level of accountability, Madam Speaker, is unlike many other government

departments where we all know, in the ANC-led governments, accountability is a swear word.

I want to thank the Minister and her team, the HOD and all members of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and all its entities for the work they have done in the last financial year under difficult circumstances and under severe constraint.

As a committee we fully supported this Bill, knowing the ANC's minority view because they do not support good governance [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: Ah, do not say that!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I want to take the opportunity to thank our Committee assistants, Waseem Matthews, Ms Mary-Anne Burgess and Masintle Motsapi, who tirelessly served this Committee in engagements, including all our interpreters who really worked hard. [Interjections.]

I also want to thank members of this Committee for their constructive engagement in the work of this Committee ... [Interjections.] members Makeleni, member Olivier, member Dugmore ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: My colleague, member Mitchell, member Botha

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...and member Wenger and also the father and mothers of our Committee, member Kivedo and Madam Speaker, no MPL can function without his backbone and in this regard, I want to thank our DA fifth floor staff, who are the backbone of support for many of my MPL's.

I therefore want to thank Ms Brenda Harrison, Colleen Makobo, Stian Carelsen, our Chief of Staff, Desmond Samson, Ms Joshua Chikomi, Mr Ryan Smith, Mr Neo Mokwane and several other members of our staff members who tirelessly work with this Committee and they served the Committee.

I also want to thank Mr Kabelo Mahlohlo, Ms Ashlin Apollos, Ms [Inaudible.] Van der Poll, Ms Shamiela Osman, Ms or now Mrs – she got married – Ms Julia Stone, Ms Tanya Steyn-Dowie, Ms Nereen Schulde, Ms Belinda Sickel and lastly Ms Virginia Davis who serves, particularly me, with great skill. I want to thank them all for creating an environment for one South Africa for all and wishing them and every member of this House a peaceful, joyful and merry happy Christmas! Ho-ho-ho!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Members, I understand we are getting to the end of the day, but can we please afford hon Gopie the opportunity to speak? And hon Gopie, I am going to be addressing your

colleagues behind you to allow you the opportunity to speak without interruption. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As we are in the initiation season, I wish all those boys undergoing this rite of passage well and a safe return, and also convey my condolences to the family of the young man that hung himself in the initiation school during this week. The rite of passage is still not respected in this province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam.

Ms D GOPIE: The rite of passage is still not respected in this province as people do not have land.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ag nee!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh, no!]

Ms D GOPIE: The MEC keeps on telling us that she cannot do anything. This Budget is also silent on ways to assist those people.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Ms D GOPIE: An Adjusted ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is easy with [Inaudible.]

Ms D GOPIE: ... Budget Appropriation that is taking away R21 million from the people is definitely not a budget for safety and citizen impact.
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I will accept that. I will accept that.

Ms D GOPIE: This reduction is rejected. Someone looking at this budget can easily categorise it as a budget of reduced spending for compensation of employees as well as decreased spending in goods and services. Everything in this budget seems to be decreased. Even the transfers to the underfunded departmental agencies and accounts are cut.

The budget that receives the smallest allocation has failed to use over R7 million which has been surrendered back to Provincial Treasury. MEC, is this serious business? [Interjections.] †Noko khanibeni nentloni. [You should be ashamed of yourselves.]

Programme 3 for Library and Archive Services was the most affected by the decrease in these appropriations. MEC, is this how the people are being serviced? The R7,3 million surrendered was also for this programme. On top of this, the Department had failed to spend over R834 000 for broadband funds for Rural Library Connectivity, which was rolled over to this year.
[Interjections.]

On top of this the Library Services with all its challenges had its budget

decreased. The libraries in the rural areas will feel the impact of this. The biggest decrease was for the Archives, over R21 million. This programme is tasked with the responsibility to provide archives and records management services in this province.

The Department last year told us about Digitisation Policy of Western Cape Governmental Bodies. In this the Department said the rapid pace of technological innovation in information handling such as digital technology, has created new opportunities to improve the accuracy and availability of information.

The Department conceded that the digital technology has brought about new challenges that the Western Cape Archives and Records Service needs to deal with, such as management of digitally born records, transformation of the largely paper-based current, semi-current and historical records to digital formats, digital preservation and short life cycle of technology.

Given all these challenges that need to be addressed, the Department chose to decrease a budget for this program. The decrease includes Compensation of Employees and over R25 million for Goods and Services. It is difficult to imagine how the set target for Programme 3 will be met with this kind of budget.

Provincial Strategic Goal 3, which deals with creating healthy, inclusive, safe and socially connected communities. Increasing wellness, safety and tackling

social ills is the part of this Department's responsibilities. MEC Meyer told the House about different plans to build inclusive, safe and healthy communities. He then said MEC Marais would provide more details on this.

Madam Speaker, I hope when the MEC gives those details the MEC will also explain how big decrease in the budget will help her achieve these plans. The high youth unemployment contributes immensely to the safety issues, drugs and substance abuse as well as other social ills we are faced with. Clearly this budget will not help us to increase safety and tackle social ills.

Provincial Strategic Goal 2 also aims to tackle these challenges by improving skills and capabilities of youth as well as to end poverty – again this Department is one of the departments jointly responsible for this. In terms of this strategic goal, the Department is assisting in the pursuit of improved learner outcomes and creation of opportunities for youth by among others making use of the MOD Programme as well as the School Sport.

In this Budget the MOD Programme is increased only by R13 000. This means the Provincial Government does not have plans to expand the MOD Programme to other areas particularly in the farming communities. For the existing MOD Programmes it means the challenges that exist will not be addressed. My disappointment is with the decrease in the budget for school sport. I do not know how that is going to assist the Department. Where is the citizen impact when the budget for school sport is decreased?

Under Programme 4, not only is the Compensation of Employees decreased but also Transfers to Non-profit Institutions are decreased. Such institutions depend on this Department for survival, yet the Department decreases the transfers.

The Budget for Programme 2: Cultural Affairs shows an increase of R1,2 million. Out of its five sub-programmes only two received an increase. Those are Sub-Programme 2.1: Management and Sub-Programme 2.3: Museum Services. Other sub-programmes including Arts and Culture; Heritage Resource Services and Language Services were all decreased.

The Arts and Culture sub-programme focuses on the development, preservation and promotion of arts and culture in the province, through the creation of inclusive, effective and vibrant functioning arts and culture structures, activities and environments; and to support and assist the Western Cape Cultural Commission to execute its legislative mandate.

During the annual reports we raised several concerns around the inadequate funding to arts and culture structures in the poor communities which are not funded by this Department. Majority of funding goes to well established organisations, while organisations on the ground are not funded.

With this budget those organisations will never be funded. I also do not know how the target will be met. The budget for Sub-Programme 2.4: Heritage Resource Services is decreased, while there is a growing need to protect,

conserve, manage and promote heritage resources for communities like the Bo-Kaap and Liesbeek.

The SPEAKER: Hon Gopie, sorry.

Ms D GOPIE: I am not happy with the decrease [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: If you could, your time has expired but you can finish up please.

Ms D GOPIE: I am not happy with the decrease in the budget for Sub-Programme 2.5: Language Services. R780 000 to promote multi-lingualism in the Western Cape; as well as to actively promote the development of the previously marginalised indigenous languages, has been moved to other programmes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Gopie. In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP I see the hon, the Minister. [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, Speaker. Dankie aan elke komiteelid, die koördineerder en Komitee Sekretariaat vir die afgelope jaar. Dankie, agb Mackenzie vir jou leierskap as Voorsitter, jou konstruktiewe oorsig en dan ook die integriteit waarmee oorsig gedoen word. En ek sal definitief die organiseerders versoek om te hou by die Lux en dan te kyk of ons nie ook kaartjies kan kry nie.

Agb Gopie, sedert ek in hierdie portefeulje is, het ek gereeld afprake met die voorsitter van die inisiasieforums en indien daar probleme sou wees word dit onmiddelik aangespreek, en onmiddelik opgelos en die munisipaliteite werk almal saam en is almal die inisiate goedgesind en nooit was 'n stuk grond enigsins 'n probleem gewees nie.

Soos ek gesê het, ons het innoverende verhoudinge wat ons vorm met organisasies en besighede om ons reeds goeie en effektiewe dienslewering te verbeter en ons begroting is besnoei omdat Nasionaal ons deel wat na ons kant toe moet kom besnoei het. En ek wil nou nie sê dit het gegaan in staatskaping nie, en dit is gesteel nie, maar dit is eintlik die werklikheid van die situasie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you to every Committee member, the coordinator and Committee Secretariat for the past year. Thank you, hon Mackenzie for your leadership as Chairman, your constructive oversight and then also the integrity with which oversight is being conducted. And I will definitely request the organisers to stay with the Lux and then see if we cannot also get tickets.]

Hon Gopie, since I have been in this portfolio, I have regularly had appointments with the Chairman of the initiation forums and if there should

be problems it is addressed immediately, and resolved immediately, and the municipalities all cooperate and are all well disposed to the initiatives and never has land been a problem at all.

As I have said, we have innovative relationships that we establish with organisations and businesses to improve our already good and effective service delivery and our budget was cut because National cut our part that had to come to us. And now I do not want to say it did go into state capture and that it was stolen, but is actually the reality of the situation.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Dit is die ander antwoord. Dit is die antwoord.

[An HON MEMBER: That is the other reply. That is the reply.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: En ek wil net sê ek wens u almal ‘n geseënde en vreugdevolle feestyd toe. Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: And I just want to say I wish you all a blessed and joyful Festive Season. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debates.

[Debates concluded.]

The SPEAKER: I will now ask the Secretary to read the sixth Order of the Day. [Interjections.] Sorry? Oh sorry. I think we just need two minutes to suspend if there are any officials coming in. Thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended at 14:28 and resumed at 14:31]

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. The Secretary will now read the sixth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2018].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary. I now see the hon Minister, Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, Members of the Provincial Parliament, Heads of Departments, all the staff of the Department of Agriculture, and citizens of the Western Cape.

For the first time ever, and as a result of this year's adjustments, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture's budget has exceeded R1 billion. [Interjections.] When you consider the importance of this sector in terms of our provincial economy, job creation and food security [Interjections.], R1 billion does not sound like much at all.

Agriculture and agri-processing contributes a combined R54 billion to the provincial GVA. Of all the province's exports, 52% come from the agriculture and agri-processing sectors. As a sector, it represents 10% of the

Provincial GDP and employs 340 000 people, mostly in the rural areas.

The drought in this province hit the agricultural sector hard. At the peak of the drought, crops were about 20% smaller, and the combined economic impact on agriculture was estimated to be approximately R5,9 billion. Between the first and second quarters of this year, 27 000 jobs were lost in the sector.

In most areas across the province, we have recorded good rains and dams in the province currently stand at just over 60% full - almost double what they were at this time last year. We have started to see growth in the agricultural job numbers once again, but we estimate that it will take the agricultural sector a full three seasons to recover. In areas like the Karoo, the situation remains dire as we await their summer rainfall.

We are very grateful that Minister Guguile Nkwinti and his Department [Interjections.] have acknowledged the importance of the agricultural sector while making their annual water allocations and we welcome the fact that the sector will operate with 90% of the water allocations that they were receiving prior to the drought.

The majority of our budget adjustments have gone towards drought and disaster relief efforts. The Department's budget has increased by R286 million since the Main Appropriation and of this, R266 million has been allocated towards drought and R11 million towards fires.

Programme 2 - Sustainable Resource Management received R249 million in funding from the National Government, all for drought relief projects, as well as R1,3 million for fires. A total of R208 million in funding, received from the Provincial Disaster Relief Grant and the National Conditional Grant, has been used for the provision of livestock feed for farmers.

Over the past year, the Department has provided livestock feed assistance to approximately 2 200 farmers across the province. The Land Care Programme received R41,9 million from the national conditional grant.

The Land Care Programme has done excellent work in the clearing of alien invasion species and the management of irrigation channels, making more water available to farmers and communities living near our canals and water systems.

A further R8,7 million came from the Provincial Drought Relief Reserve which has been allocated to funding Phase 2 of the Lower Olifants River Water Users Authority Emergency Supply Project, and for the drilling of boreholes to ensure water supply in the Matzikama Municipality.

R2,4 million of rollover funds has been earmarked for drought, water and food security and other agricultural disaster relief and a further R1,3 million in rollover funds allocated to drought aid for stock farmers.

Speaker, the Garden Route has suffered devastating fires two years in a row

now. An amount of R1,305 million was received from the National Government in CASP funding which went towards the repair of four farms which were really badly damaged in the 2017 Knysna fires.

In October and November, fires in George and surrounding areas on the Garden Route claimed a number of lives and destroyed thousands of hectares of land. As a result, R10 million in emergency provincial funding has been allocated for this.

In other adjustments for the period, R2,3 million has been allocated to Casidra for alternate crops fund. This money is used to conduct research into high export value crops, which are water wise and labour intensive.

A further R1,5 million has been allocated towards Agri-business Investment Indaba which has just been held this week in Cape Town. This conference is the biggest agricultural investment gathering in Africa, bringing together 800 delegates from across the continent. And finally Madam Speaker, R11,6 million in the Cost of Employees Funding has been returned to the Provincial Revenue Fund. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Schäfer. I now see the hon member Simmers.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Western Cape's 2018/19 Medium Term Budget Policy Statement is set in the context of a

volatile, uncertain and at times a very complex environment. With the impact of global warming on our weather patterns and environment becoming more evident and financially measurable, no other sector experiences these harsh and financially crippling impacts more than our agriculture and agri-processing sectors.

†Voorsitter, die Minister het nou tereg vir u die goeie nuus gegee wat sy gedurende verlede week gekry het van die Nasionale Department van Waterwese en Sanitasie, dat daar nou meer water beskikbaar sal wees vir die landbousektor, maar Voorsitter, alhoewel hierdie aankondiging welkome verligting vir ons landbousektor bring, beleef ons Sentraal- en Klein-Karoo tans die ergste droogtegreep in sommige boere se heugenis.

Tydens my en die voormalige Minister se besoek aan die Kannaland- en Oudtshoorn-gebiedso plus minus drie maande gelede, was dit onder ons aandag gebring dat baie plase alreeds aan die Department groot verliese in kudde-totale gerapporteer het en baie van hierdie boere staan op die punt van bankrotskap.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Chair, the Minister has now rightly given us the good news that she received from the National Department of Water Affairs and Sanitation, that there will now be more water available to the agricultural sector, but Chair, although this announcement will bring welcome relief to the agricultural sector, our

Central and Little Karoo are currently in the worst drought grip in some farmers' living memory.

During my and the previous Minister's visit to the Kannaland and Oudtshoorn areas about three months ago, it was brought to our attention that many farms have reported large herd losses to the Department and that many of these farmers are finding themselves on the brink of bankruptcy.]

Madam Speaker, it is therefore welcoming that 96,56% of the total of R269 582 000 of the total Adjustment Vote 11 will be focused on the systems to this crucial sector for the provision of livestock, feed and drought relief.

†Maar Voorsitter, hierdie welkome addisionele fondse gaan ook verseker dat die 2300 geaffekteerde boere hul broodnodige ondersteuning elke tweede maand sal ontvang, natuurlik met die uitsondering van die boere in die Klein- en Sentrale Karoo-distrikte, waar hierdie ondersteuning elke maand sal geskied weens die grootskaalse kuddeverlies wat hulle tot hede ondervind het.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[But Chair, these welcome additional funds will also ensure that the 2300 affected farmers will receive their very crucial support every two months, of course with the exception of the farmers in the Little and Central Karoo districts, where this support will occur due to the large scale herd losses that

they have experienced to date.]

Madam Speaker, as the caring DA-led Government, we invest in today to ensure a sustainable and thriving agricultural sector tomorrow. It is therefore that R8,7 million has become available under Programme 2, to fund Phase 2 of the Lower Olifants River Water Users Authority Emergency Supply Project in the Matzikama Municipality to ensure further water supply to this area as well. Then Speaker, to support our Urban Agriculture Gardens programme, R1,7 million has also been made available under Programme 3 for this.

†Voorsitter, om te boer is nie vir sissies nie. Ons landbousektore en hul omliggende gemeenskappe is veerkragtig en hulle hoop vervaag nie waar hulle verseker is van die kaliber mensgedrewe leierskap wat hierdie provinsie tans regeer nie, om te verseker dat ons almal beter tesame sal wees in die toekoms.

Vir ons landbougemeenskap se veerkragtigheid verseker hierdie regering, agb Voorsitter, dat ons die daad en die fondse by die woord sit, sodat ons werklik vir almal 'n beter lewe kan skeep, ongeag die moeilike omstandighede waarin baie hulle tans bevind in die landbousektor. Daarom wil ek hiermee vir ons nuwe Minister gelukwens met haar dertigste dag vandag in haar nuwe posisie.

Ek wil my mede-kollegas op die Staande Kommittee baie dankie sê vir hulle hulp en bystand aan my, wat ook in dieselfde periode aangesluit het by die Minister. Ek wil vir almal in hierdie Huis 'n geseënde feesseisoen toewens.

Laat ons ook onthou, ons is in 'n bevoorregte toestand. Daar is baie ander individue in hierdie spesifieke sektor wat regtig swaar gebuk gaan. Laat ons vir hulle bid en bid vir reën, want reën is al wat werklikwaar hierdie erge droogte vir seker kan breek. Baie dankie, Voorsitter.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Chair, to farm is not for sissies. Our agricultural sectors and their surrounding communities are resilient and their hope does not fade where they are ensured of the calibre of human-driven leadership currently governing this province, to ensure that we will all be better together in the future.

For our agricultural community's resilience, hon Chair, this Government ensures that we suit the action and the funds to the word, so that we can really create a better life for all, despite the difficult circumstances in which many in the agricultural sector find themselves at the moment. Therefore I wish to congratulate our new Minister on her thirtieth day today in her new position.

I would like to thank my colleagues for their help and assistance to me, who have also joined in the same period as the Minister. I wish all in this House a blessed Festive Season. Let us also remember, we are in a privileged situation. There are many other individuals in this specific sector who are really struggling. Let us pray for them and pray for rain, because rain is all

that can really break this severe drought. Thank you, Chair.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Simmers.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Simmers.] I now see the hon Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. This Adjustment Budget comes in the period, and we have seen a humungus increase of this Adjustment from all budgets that we have seen; this one is the major increase that we are dealing with.

The National Government has consistently supported the Western Cape. Even during this drought, the ANC Government should be commended for caring for all the people. With this positive news of the support of the agriculture sector, we can now that the National Government supports the farmers [Interjections.], but not only the farmers, the budget must also go to the farm workers. This positive note is however spoilt, Madam Speaker, by the failure of the Provincial Executive authority to account for 2016/17, 2017/18 and this is a smack in the face of the so-called clean DA.

On top of that, the DA wants at the end this fired MEC to be the future Premier of the Western Cape. [Interjections.] We must ask ourselves, how .. [Interjections.] do you think people are just voting cards and people are just stupid ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...to continue to vote for someone who is a failure to account.

An HON MEMBER: The best candidate!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Let me take this opportunity to also welcome the new MEC ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Okay. He is not deaf.

Mr S G TYATYAM: And just some cordial advice MEC, just some cordial advice. Do not copy and paste from the previous MEC. [Interjections.] Write down your own novel and you are capable and we know you can do that. [Interjections.]

Unfortunately for this Budget Adjustment, MEC, everyone can see the footnotes of the former in this Budget Adjustment and therefore it cannot be supported. It must be rejected as it is, so that you do your own and you know the discussion that we are having in the Committee in relation to how you should be dealing with issues of farms and farm workers.

Speaker, the arrogance and the failure of the relegated MEC to provide direction and oversight to the Department, that is where we find ourselves. It is because of the MEC, not the Department, not the management. And I can tell you, Madam Speaker, there is no communication spinning or gymnastics

that could put a political perspective as to why this Department in the province and probably in SA as a whole, have gone up to Table Mountain but refuses to account on how they have used the taxpayers' money. [Interjections.] Indeed, under the ex-MEC this Department ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...would have not deserved to be allocated ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... taxpayers' money under the former MEC. [Interjections.] In fact the SCOPA was refused by members of the DA ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What? SCOPA now?

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...to make this MEC to account. The SCOPA on 30 October were forced by the Speaker's office ... [Interjections.] not to deal with the matter. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are the Chair!

An HON MEMBER: You are the Chair! You are the Chair! [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: You know, eventually [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members [Interjections.] Order.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...brought the issue of Rule 61. [Interjections.] He must come inside. I am waiting for him. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, we must not probably deal with ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: SCOPA.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... it is what happened that day, because from the Speaker's office we got a letter that said there is a Rule 61 that you must deal with. [Interjections.] And from there [Interjections.], the Speaker, when we question this, then the Speaker writes another letter, "No, I did not write a letter." But she signed the letter! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Tyatyam [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: The question that you must ask, the question that you must ask ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Legal advice. Legal advice!

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam, kindly take your seat, there is a point of order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Speaker, I just want to know, what is the relevance because that is absolutely not in the Blue Book and if so, can the member refer us to that page?

The SPEAKER: Member Mitchell, I will allow the member to continue, because I will deal with this matter at the end of the sitting. Thank you. You may proceed hon Tyatyam. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thanks, Madam Speaker. You know, it was so difficult because now Mr Botes wrote the letter; we are told that no, “the letter was not written by me, it was written by Mr Botes” but where does he get the signature of the Speaker?

An HON MEMBER: Oh, haibo [no ways] Chair!

Mr S G TYATYAM: I mean that is very much unfair, because it means that some of the rulings that have been signed by the Speaker, we must call them null and void, because the signature it seems, can be copied by everyone. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: If [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam, I would like to address you. I deem it

inappropriate – please take your seat – to discuss a matter that I cannot engage you on in my role as the Speaker here. So, kindly refrain.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Oh. Oh.

The SPEAKER: If you wish to bring a substantive motion ... [Interjections.] you may do that, but I can assure you that I will deliver a ruling before we leave today in response to your allegation, which will then have to be tested and you will have to provide the necessary detail. So, kindly refrain from casting aspersions on the Speaker. Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much Speaker, at least we are clearly aware in how we must attend to this issue.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely. I have got a clear way forward. [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: This is the way to provide the detail you need. [Interjections.] Thank you very much Speaker. [Interjections.] Where is the Christmas spirit? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mr S G TYATYAM: But even there we could not deal with the report, that is the unfortunate part. Even when we got the legal advice from the Legislature, the member said, no-no-no, now we do not want the legal advice,

we want the Department to tell us what we must not ask. What we must ask. Where have you heard that where the Department tells the SCOPA what should be asked or not asked? [Interjections.] It is clear that it was an attempt from the members of the DA [Interjections.] just to defer their Premier candidate. Nothing else!

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam, we are busy with Vote 11 [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Which deals with Agriculture not SCOPA. [Interjections.] If I can just ask you to get back to the point. Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No, [Interjections.] we are dealing with Vote 11.

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because Vote 11 could not be finished because of this [Interjections.] Thanks for the reminder, Speaker. This Department has received more money in this Adjustment, particularly from the National Government of the ANC [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is the taxpayers' money!

An HON MEMBER: Taxpayers' money.

An HON MEMBER: Oh please!

Mr S G TYATYAM: R249 million [Interjections.], being 249 million, immediate drought disaster relief [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just give him a chance.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Disaster relief about ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: DA, please!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...more than R38 million. CASP about R170 million. Land Care about forty-one-nine-hundred-thousand-million. [Interjections.] The ANC cares. We can see that. [Interjections.] Member Wiley, you can see that. We are with you, going forward. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam, kindly take your seat please. [Interjections.] Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Could the hon member please just repeat that figure. It sounded very Zuma-rescue. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: No! Unfortunately!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You throw your love – no, we are sure. [Interjections.] No, I like numbers, I will show you. However, Madam Speaker, we must say that this Adjustment comes particularly at the background of a serious drought that devastated the industry and all the [Inaudible.] related to it.

We will come and appreciate the agility shown by the industry to the prevailing quote material conditions at the time. That is the reason that some of the farmers were able to assist the Provincial Government and Local Government with the release of water in their private dams. This happens though the Provincial Government under the current Premier was warned about the scourge of drought that was imminent for the Western Cape a decade ago. No plans were done by the Provincial Government. The industry was not caught “flat for tat”. They were able to embrace the instrument of the Fourth Industrial Revolution to mitigate the weather challenges.

Chair, amongst the issues that we do not see in this Adjustment in particular, which we have raised with the former Minister, which we are hoping that the current Minister will take them very seriously, is the whole matter of the evictions that are currently taking place in the majority of farms of the Western Cape. And we know that in December and June, those are the months where people are just thrown away. And the unfortunate part, Speaker, is that when there is retrenchment, most of the people that are retrenched are local labourers. People from South Africa.

What we see now is that farmers prefer people from the foreign countries. We are not saying we have problem with them, but we are saying you cannot replace our people, because they have the same skill as the skill of the foreign labourers [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Who is “our people”?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Our people.

An HON MEMBER: Who is “our people”?

Mr S G TYATYAM: I will tell you tomorrow when I meet you [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is much also [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no ANC voter on a farm [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, very concerning for us is that Programme 8, where some of the farmer CASP programmes and development are taking place, have seen an increase in household expenditure, meaning that there are many people from there who are either living, who are resigning, who are going to other places because we know and are told of the conditions of some of them in that Programme 8, particularly with their

health, is unbearable and to the extent that some of them, though they might have resigned, are still having cases against the Department ... [Interjections.] We think that the Minister should be able to deal with some of the issues [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam, your time has expired. You may finish your sentences.

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is a good one. I have ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, your time is up, thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you Speaker, and thank you to the two members that contributed to this debate. I think, just to member Simmers, the Klein Karoo area is really in a serious crisis and I know that we were delivering fodder for livestock farmers every second month and I think it now has been increased to every month, because we understand that it is just getting worse.

And you know, also, that the Western Cape is incredibly short of fodder and we have to locate fodder from the Northern Cape to assist our farmers in dire need and this is really where we thank our provinces, our neighbouring provinces, for having an incredible collegial approach towards looking after farmers and the farming sector, whether it is farmers and agricultural workers working in the farming sector to assist with those that are really struggling

with drought.

So, you know one thing we must note is that if our livestock are being incredibly hit like they are, we are going to see an increase in the price of meat and that I think is just a matter of time. And then of course, this just relates to water and I just want to again reiterate and thank Minister Nkwinti for coming to the fore and really opening up the opportunity for water to go back into the agricultural sector, because as you know, if we do not grow the food, for one, the jobs are being lost, but secondly, we can perhaps re-employ a lot more people again, but really it is around food and food security and we know that our food exports aid to those increase in jobs and economic growth for this province.

To member Tyatyam, you know the Budget does go to farms, farmers and agricultural workers. We are the only one that has a farm worker support unit and we know that with every land reform project that happens in the Western Cape, we certainly provide support to all our agricultural workers who become future farmers.

But I challenge really, and I think maybe the issue you are raising then, you have linked it with evictions. The challenge around agricultural workers is, how do we bring better living conditions into the space? Which has historically always meant that we are the only sector in the world that is forced to house or provide housing in an economic sector and that is in agriculture and that always is a challenge. And I am certainly open to

looking at new solutions going forward at how we can solve that continuous problem, because I do not think it is a sustainable model that we presently find ourselves in. I do not think that generations of people can continue to be added into a farming area. What happens if the farm is small enough? Then the village of people living on it would be bigger than the farm.

So we need to look at these solutions and they are not easy to identify, but they are certainly things that we must tackle. And I think the other thing around evictions, member Tyatyam, is the estoppel must be enforced. It is no use having legislation like the estoppel that has been written to protect any illegal evictions and they are not being enforced. So, we need better collaboration with our national counterparts on that and we certainly work together [Interjections.] but you know, that has to happen.

And then again, we are talking about the drought, but remember, I think we have forgotten that both you and I were in this Committee when the three drought areas were declared in 2015. So you know, agriculture always is the first sector that gets hit by climate change and so we did respond as a province. We declared a provincial crisis in those three areas and then it moved to being a far bigger crisis in the province [Interjections.] but we were responsive as a government and I think it has just been such a long time and it has placed a huge burden onto the budget constraints that this Government has found itself in. I think that really is a concern, but I think we must also worry about going forward, that is the next challenge, which is the flash floods, because we know with climate change and El Nino we have got flash

floods coming. Are we prepared for that? Have we made provision? Do the people on farms and agricultural space understand what that means and are they taking some provisions going forward?

And then just finally, in conclusion I would like to thank my Cabinet colleague and former MEC for Economic Opportunities for his commitment towards the agricultural sector, particularly during the very difficult drought periods over the past three years. I would also like to thank the Department HOD, Joanne Isaacs and her team Eisenberg for their assistance and for ensuring that the Western Cape Department of Agriculture runs like a well oiled machine. And to the Standing Committee, thank you very much to those who have walked this journey with me and lastly I would also like to thank the members of the agricultural community and all those across Government and the private sector, who have been involved in the disaster relief efforts which have helped us to get through to this point. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: That, hon members, concludes the debate on this vote. We will suspend for two minutes. Thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended at 14:58 and resumed at 15:01]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated. The Secretary will read the seventh Order.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works –

Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 6 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, honourable Premier and Cabinet colleagues, honourable members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, officials of the Western Cape Government:

It is my pleasure to present the Adjusted Estimates for the Department of Transport and Public Works for 2018.

I am very conscious that it is late-ish on a Friday afternoon and that this is the 14th vote of this nature tabled over two days. For all of us it has been a marathon session. I now understand why it is a centuries' old tradition in the United Kingdom House of Commons, that the Chancellor of the Exchequer, known in this House as the Minister of Finance, is allowed to consume an alcoholic beverage while delivering the Budget. [Laughter.] I hasten to add that this is a privilege afforded to the Chancellor only and to no other member of the House.

Those of you who are historically curious may be interested that in the role of Chancellor, Winston Churchill chose brandy, Selwyn Lloyd drank whisky and Hugh Gaitskell opted for orange juice and rum. The availability of these sorts of beverages may well have been the cause of the longest budget speech

on record – the four hour, forty five minute speech by William Gladstone in 1853. So Minister Meyer, I hope you will not exceed that target today. [Laughter.] By contrast, Mr Deputy Speaker, I intend to be brief and to abstain.

Members of this House will know that Section 31 of the Public Finance Management Act deals with the Provincial Adjustments Budgets and what they provide for. The details of these provisions are set out clearly in the introduction to the Adjusted Estimates Blue Book, currently before this House. These provisions include the shifting of funds between and within votes, the utilisation of savings and roll-overs of unspent funds from a preceding year.

These are all important tools in the management of various circumstances and events stipulated in the Public Finance Management Act. Given the wide-ranging nature and scope of the services provided by my Department and its support to most of the other departments and entities in this province, it is essential to be able to accommodate and account for a range of adjustments which will inevitably occur in any financial year.

In his speech in this House on 22 November, Minister Meyer confirmed this Government's commitment to infrastructure led growth – a commitment in which my Department has to play a key role, particularly in a climate in which the overall construction industry is under stress. I am proud of the way in which the Department of Transport and Public Works continues to ensure a

quality built environment while also pushing the boundaries of technology as a multiplier.

This is reflected, for instance, in the development and the implementation of our large data Integrated Transport HUB and in the important reduction in water and energy consumption in Government facilities – outperforming the private sector significantly. This latter achievement is clearly recorded in the 7th edition of the Property Efficiency Report – the only report of its kind produced in government in South Africa.

All of this has taken place against the backdrop of a 6th successive clean audit by a department which delivers 65% of its budget through supply chain management.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Main Appropriation of Vote 10 increases by R139 581 000 to R7, 869 billion – an increase of 1,8%. The increase is made up of the following:

Roll-overs from the previous financial year, R23 819 million;

Revenue retention from previous financial years, mainly related to increased own revenue collected from over collected motor vehicle licence fees R71,872 million, and thirdly;

The Provincial Asset Financing Reserve, R43,890 million.

It is not my intention to deal in detail with all the allocations and adjustments. These are set out in the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure for 2018, as tabled. I do, however, believe it is important to highlight some of these, as follows:

- Roll-overs – R23,81 million has been applied to Programme 2 - Public Works Infrastructure – R17,771 million. Of that R4,7 million to secure eight Social Development Child and Youth Care facilities and 10 Western Cape Government Command and Control facilities in terms of the Water Business Continuity Plan.

R5,683 million to finalise construction of the dormitory at the Child and Youth Care Centre in Clanwilliam.

R4 million to provide for increased property rates tariffs.

R3,388 million for alternative infrastructure delivery mechanisms for Health and Education and;

- Programme 3: Transport Infrastructure – R6,048 million for financial assistance to the Swartland Municipality for a bridge project in Malmesbury.
- Then from the Provincial Asset Financing Reserve – R43,890 million to Programme 2 - Public Works Infrastructure.

R11,423 million for implementing Phase 2 of the construction of an office block in Maitland for GMT and the balance R32,467 million for the acquisition of six properties relating to Health facilities, six to Education facilities and one for a shared service centre in Caledon.

- And then from Self-financing Expenditure, R71,872 million – including Programme 2: Public Works Infrastructure R15,660 million.

R12,5 million of that for scheduled maintenance at general provincial buildings and R3,16 million for legal fees and for machinery and equipment for new staff.

- To Programme 3: Transport Infrastructure – R3,781 million for the Garden Route District Municipality to respond to the fire damage at Knysna during June 2017.
- Programme 4: Transport Operations – R12,666 million. R9 million for the further development of the Integrated Transport Hub for enhancing reporting capability through the innovative use of information and R3,666 million for the protection and remedial intervention at the Glencairn Beach rail infrastructure.
- Programme 5: Transport Regulation – R38,765 million.
R445 000 for claims against the state and vehicle accident loss.
R3,038 million for the provision of breathalyzer equipment.

R5,282 million for in-vehicle technology for traffic officers, scholar patrol uniforms and the development of a Law Administration System.

And then finally R30 million for agency fees payable to municipalities in respect of the collection of motor vehicle licence fees.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in closing, in tabling these Adjustment Estimates, I would like to record my thanks to the Chair of our Standing Committee and other members, as well as my Cabinet colleagues and to the HOD and her staff, some of whom are present here today as well as to my Head of Ministry, Mr Clive Roos. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is with great pleasure that I welcome the Department of Transport and Public Works Adjustment of the 2018/2019 financial year which is over R7 billion, with an increase of R139 million. The increase will without doubt go to other Public Works infrastructure, adding to the service that is needed by Transport to support and service community programmes.

These priorities, Mr Deputy Speaker, will ensure that we are able to intensify our safety efforts as we head towards the festive season, encouraging motorists to ensure that their vehicles are roadworthy and that they are complying with the traffic laws. This is essential in order to turn the tide

against the carnage on our roads that happens on a daily basis and especially increases during the festive season.

I must therefore commend the Minister of Transport and Public Works, Mr Donald Grant and his Department, on consistently achieving clean audits for six consecutive years. This is a true statement to the fact that the DA Government in the Western Cape Province is going above and beyond to deliver most critical services to the people of this province.

I want to add, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this is not self-recognition, the Department or the Premier of the Western Cape, Helen Zille, or MEC Donald Grant patting themselves on the back. [Interjection.]

This is being done by an independent Auditor-General, Kimi Makwetu, to say that the Western Cape is the best run province under the Democratic Alliance and for that we therefore congratulate them and say we move forward.

Any contrary view against the A-G report, any member is free and obliged to take it on review, to dispute and challenge the A-G. This can only be achieved through clean governance, forward looking innovative solutions to the most pressing issues and sound financing planning.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Minister in the Western Cape, Donald Grant, has done an impressive job in stabilising the province's public transport. The Minister's commitment in stabilising our transport infrastructure is indeed

bearing fruit. We are very pleased with the deployment of the rail enforcement unit officers, after the Western Cape, jointly with PRASA and the City of Cape Town, financed this project of the rail enforcement unit to the value of R16 million each, with the intention of destabilising the problems that we have on a daily basis on the railways.

This was done with a view to counter the chronic delays, constant cancellation of trains, dysfunctional CCTV cameras, death on the trains, injuries by commuters that are causing a great deal of disservice to the commuters.

I want to add as well, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this carnage and these problems have been brought to the attention of the Public Protector to investigate infrastructure on trains and why commuters are getting poor services. We are therefore earnestly awaiting the report by the Public Protector of what causes the problems that are in the department of PRASA. I trust that these officers will continue to work diligently, together with other law enforcement agencies, to root out criminal activities on trains, protect the rail infrastructure and ultimately guarantee the safety of our commuters.

Mr Deputy Speaker, some of the successes include the construction of the KwaFaku School in Philippi. You will remember that, after conducting the public engagement public participation in the very same House here, the members of the community were so angry about the services that they are getting from the Department, saying that the quality of their school and the

service that they are getting is so very poor and that disruptions will happen.

But as we speak today, despite the community school disruptions and with public engagement, this Department has already implemented the construction plan and the contractor is on the site, moving on with the outcomes. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, we must surely condemn the disruption and damages suffered by the MyCiti bus service that frustrates the commuters and creates an economic burden. I want therefore to applaud the availability of the traffic officers and the City law enforcement police that are accompanying the MyCiti buses to protect the infrastructure and to protect the commuters, so that people do get to their destinations in peace and come back safely.

This undermines the hard work being done by the Western Cape Government and we cannot allow such elements to cripple our ability to ensure that the delivery of the service that the citizens deserve. Mr Deputy Speaker, the City of Cape Town has estimated the financial loss due to the burning of MyCiti buses at a staggering R18 million. This is something that must be stopped and condemned because we cannot raise our issues by being destructive and destroying the very infrastructure that is of service to our communities.

The element of responsibility of the people who are frustrated, who need more services, to protest or do any other thing, must be guided within the pretext of the law and obedience. The existence of infrastructure is there to

serve the community.

I must appeal to the newly elected Mayco member, Felicity Purchase, to make sure that the grievances that were raised by the drivers are addressed and that the respect of the rule of law is at all costs being complied with, so that drivers go back and deliver services to the people that daily need them to get to their places of work and back home.

We must consider the citizens of the Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker, to zealously guard the infrastructure from being abused and being damaged and frustrating the people who need more than what they are getting, which is quality services.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I trust that the alternate plan to roll out hospitals like Jooste alleviates the problems experienced in the neighbouring hospitals like Khayelitsha District Hospital and Mitchells Plain.

With all the plans of both the Departments of Transport and Public Works and the Department of Health they must make an effort to bring Jooste Hospital back so that the services that the people are supposed to be getting are rolled out. Because at the moment Mitchells Plain Hospital and Khayelitsha Hospital are over-crowded with patients and there is a need for the hospital to be completed. I know that there is a plan that is in place but the urgency is that the communities must be serviced. Jooste Hospital was servicing a number of communities from Manenberg, Nyanga, Philippi,

Athlone etc., and the people in those areas need quality health services. I therefore appeal to the Minister that they speed up the process of having the hospital ready in time.

I have been pushing for regulations with the local taxis, called Amaphela, in the townships, which are not regulated and are operating without permits. Anyone who has been in that area will know how Amaphela are frustrating drivers and frustrating pedestrians because they are operating without licences. They are operating without any kind of regulations and I therefore put it that all the mechanisms are in place for the licences to be provided.

As the Minister has just highlighted Amaphela must be regulated so that they operate within the pretext of the law and provide quality services to the commuters because we will never at any time get rid of Amaphela. Amaphela are providing a very good, quality service. All they need is to be regulated so that they operate within the framework of law.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I also trust that we will also be able to recruit more enforcement officers to ensure that the laws are respected by all road users. These are the steps we need to take to make our roads safer. There are some challenges that we need to prioritise going forward. In the police we talk about volunteers or reservists. We cannot have so few traffic officers and yet the number of cars on our roads are increasing every day. Therefore we need to get more the traffic officers and make this possible so that our roads are safe and commuters travel with all the necessary support from the law

agencies.

I want to thank the Minister for the decisive leadership that he has been undertaking and the team under the leadership of the HOD that has made the Department one of the best in the province .

I wish everyone here well during this festive season, that the people who enjoy the festive season and travel to see their relatives and to visit their places of entertainment would be safe, that everything that is done in this province reflects that the people in the Western Cape are law abiding and our roads are safe. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It was actually quite ironic that on the day that the Standing Committee met to discuss this adjustment, I and I know for part of the time, member Nkondlo, were actually stuck in traffic for an hour and a half because of a very tragic accident and actually missed the discussion. But I have managed to get a report from member Nkondlo and go through the documents. But what that reminded me of was a very clear statistic that I think we should remember: that public transport and the time that it takes commuters in our city of Cape Town to reach their destination is the worst in South Africa.

It was obviously worsened by this tragic accident but we need to understand,

because very often we are glib, especially from that side of the House, to say we are the best run province but I think we have failed and we continue to fail to actually understand that probably the biggest crisis facing our city is the issue of public transport and this does not require grandstanding ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Metrorail.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... it does not require ... [Interjections.] Yes, Metrorail is, let us be honest, a key part of the problem but it is not the only problem. So I think it is very easy for us to get into the temptation of blaming and complaining. In fact that is one of the things which I think will characterise the legacy of 10 years of this Provincial Government, led by the Premier, where there has been a tendency to blame and complain as opposed to actually finding solutions.

I think when we discuss an Adjustment Budget like this, we need to actually understand that there are certain issues such as public transport where we need to focus on actually finding solutions because other cities are going to get ahead of us where they take less time to get to their place of work, compared to the City of Cape Town. Let us acknowledge that as a problem and begin to deal with it.

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, when we look at the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and the Adjusted Estimates and then you actually hear what, for

instance, the MEC for finance says, it is clear that either he has not studied these books in detail or he is simply playing politics because nowhere in these adjustments and in terms of the allocations that we have received from National, is there any person who can justifiably say that this province has in any way been penalised or been punished. And yet we have a situation, for instance, where member Wenger has been trying for the last couple of years to spread an untruth that the allocation of police to this province is unfair and based on penalties. [Interjections.]. The facts actually show ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: And again when we come to these adjustments, you will see that the National Government treats this province like all other provinces. Yet when the MEC stands up he tends ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You are delusional!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... actually talk something different but nothing in these books will show you that there is any penalisation of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]. So these estimates, as well as ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement show that

the constrained fiscal environment which affects our whole country, impacts on all provinces and departments like the one that we are discussing now in a fair and in a transparent way. There is nothing about penalisation of the Western Cape if you actually look at these stats.

These adjustments that we are discussing, Mr Deputy Speaker, reveal choices made by the Cabinet and also say something about the spending patterns and the performance information available to us at this stage of the year. I would like the MEC to respond to this because one of the other documents that we had when we looked at these adjustments ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Member just one second. Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... were which are linked to the Adjustment Appropriation are the 2018 second quarter performance indicators.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just one second. Are you giving a declaration of Vote now on behalf of all the votes or are you talking about transport now? [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am specifically talking about Transport because what you will notice when you look at this is that the information in regard to the Department of Public Works and Transport, in terms of Quarter Two, which links to the Adjustment Appropriation, because it indicates spending patterns, is that this Department

had 36 targets and only 13 were achieved by the end of Quarter Two. This impacts on this adjustment and what we look at here is that the average performance for all the other provincial departments was 78%, but this Department is in fact the worst of all provincial departments by in fact having only met 35% of the targets achieved in Quarter Two.

The reality of this under-achievement on targets is impacting on the very adjustment that we are discussing here today. And I think the MEC owes us an explanation as to how his Department is the worst performing when it comes to the meeting of targets at the end of Quarter Two. 36% only, the worst of all provincial departments.

How this affects the adjustment, Mr Deputy Speaker, is that we have had a situation where R61 million has been returned to the Treasury for what is referred to as slower than expected filling of posts and staff attrition. Now when one looks, and hon member Hinana knows very well that in our Standing Committee, in the time of Lennit Max and in his time, we have made active and strong motivations to increase the visible presence of traffic police in our province as a way of deterring accidents.

But what we have here, for instance in Sub-programme 5.4 under Law Enforcement Transport Regulation, an amount of R7,75 million returned due to slower than expected filling of vacancies and yet we are told this province is serious about road safety. We have argued that vacancies need to be filled in regard to law enforcement. We have argued that additional posts need to

be created, yet, in this adjustment we have a close to R10 million allocated to a data centre which we are not undermining the importance of, but for some reason this Department fails to recognise that the visible employment of traffic officers on our roads will contribute to deterrence.

I think a large part of the responsibility on fatalities is attributable to the fact that this province does not have enough traffic officers, although it has the money, which it simply has not used to make these appointments. I think that is shocking and it comes back to the point which we would like the MEC to respond to, why has this Department only met 36% of the set targets?

I think this is unacceptable and it is shocking and it also demonstrates, Mr Deputy Speaker, that all of us, clearly from this side of the House, need to celebrate clean audits. We need to celebrate clean audits and we also need to celebrate the emerging culture where the Auditor-General in terms of proposed regulations is going to be able to take action against those officials responsible for irregular and unauthorised expenditure.

But that does not mean that you have the best government because when you fail, for instance, to fill posts, to make our commuters and our travellers safer, you are not the best government. You are not actually appointing those officers to do the job that they have to do.

Hon Hinana also spoke to the Amaphela, that is a huge issue in the township. So you might have a clean audit but if your Department has failed to deal

with the public transport matter in the townships of the Western Cape, that does not mean that you are the best government. You might have a clean audit, but you have not addressed the real issues facing our people.

So our Committee over years has bemoaned the lack of visible traffic officers and we have called for the filling of vacancies but this adjustment shows that the Department has failed to actually fill those posts. It is clear, Mr Deputy Speaker, that the DA must accept responsibility for the shocking failure to actually fill these posts and to make our roads safer.

When we come to Public Works Infrastructure, we note that R11 million has been allocated for Phase 2 of the Risper Street Office Block but we really need some answers. When will this Phase 2 be completed? What was the actual cost of Phase 1 and can we ask the MEC to give us a clear timeframe for when the completion of the move of Government Motor Transport will actually happen? Because these delays are in fact becoming symptomatic of this Department.

MEC Madikizela is not here, but both he and MEC Grant promised, in the presence of the Premier, for instance, that the first sod would be turned on the Better Living Model in Conradie before the end of this year. Can you give us the date today MEC as to when that is going to happen? Because you promised the Premier, you promised this Committee that there would be the turning of sods and you would tell us who has been appointed as the successful contractor there. We would love it if you could use this occasion

today to make that announcement.

This brings me then to the issue of the actual property portfolio. It is common knowledge that this House, not once since the DA was elected in 2009, has honoured a law which governs this province, which requires that the Provincial Property Committee produces a report which is discussed in this House.

We often hear the Premier making appeals to the President about releasing Ysterplaat, releasing this piece of property but this Department, in all these years, has not in an open and transparent way said these are the properties that we have in this province for social housing, these are the properties - they have not come clean and indicated. Because what we need in this province is to actually bank the National land that we have, the Provincial land that we have, the City land and say how can we deal with the needs for social housing in the inner city.

But this Province has held back on that and the only impression that we can create is that the agenda is being determined by property developers and not actually by the social needs of our people. [Interjections.]. So this property portfolio is not being governed in a way which meets the needs of the people. Once again, we welcome and we applaud the Department for a clean audit but if you are not utilising the assets of this Provincial Government such as land, to deal with the needs of the people then you are not the best government. You are actually failing to deal with the real needs of the people. So we have

no plan in regard to provincial property, we have no transparency in regard to this and we have the dictation of terms by property developers.

We also talk a lot about infrastructure led growth and MEC Grant even said that MEC Meyer has made a bold statement that our growth is going to be infrastructure led. It is very dangerous when you focus only on that because the question that you really need to ask is: how many of the small contractors have you empowered in this process, when that spend is over, those businesses are able to be sustained ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... in a sustainable way. So those are the reasons that we have a problem with this adjustment and that we cannot support it. It ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... indicates a Department that it is not meeting its objectives. Thank you. [Applause.][Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. In the absence of the ACDP and the EFF, I see minister Grant to reply.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me start off by thanking both members who participated in this Budget Adjustment Appropriation Bill. Thank you, hon member Hinana for your comments and suggestions. We have taken note, particularly around the Manenberg area and your comments on safer roads.

Member Dugmore, I cannot say that we missed your company but I am very sad that you were not there because there are many issues that we have dealt with in terms of the questions that you have raised. Not only in that particular forum but in previous discussions with the Department.

Let me also say that, for our Department, the setting of targets, we are different to other departments. In fact, the 36% that you referred to, are not verifiable targets, they will be verified at the end of the Third Quarter and you will see a significant increase in that number, simply because of the nature of how we sign off, for example, on road contracts. We are not able to sign off on a project until everything is in place and the creditors have been lined up for payment.

So the other thing is that firstly nothing has gone – our targets are also a snapshot in time and I those quoting about the unverified results and nothing has been returned to Treasury. I also want to say that posts are being filled. We have advertised a large number of those posts, particularly in traffic and that we will be filling, through recruits, from Gene Louw.

You did not speak about it, but our reduced drinking and driving is the one beacon which stands up.

Ever since the reintroduction of the Draga in August 2016 and the subsequent roll-out of random breath testing from December last year, we have seen a reduction at our provincial traffic roadblocks, where the incidents of drinking and driving were over 3%, where it is now well below 1% at about 0,8%. If you look at the gold standard for that, it is Australia at 0,2% but it has been a huge improvement. That is why the allocation of funds for RBT is an important part of this Adjustment's budget.

I then want to just end off by saying that many of you will be on our roads over the coming holiday and festive season. I want to appeal to all of you to please set the example and obey the rules of the road and respect other road users. Secondly, while you are resting, a large proportion of our staff will be working to ensure to the best of our ability, that the wheels in the province continue to turn and then may I conclude by wishing you all a blessed festive season and may you all return safely home to this House in 2019. Thank you.

[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the 8th Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedules – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2018]*.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will afford the parties the opportunity to make a declaration of vote, on behalf of the ANC on all the Votes. Hon member Davids, You may speak.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ANC thanks our National ANC-led Government for giving more money to this province but disagree with the spending and aims of the DA. The ANC cannot support this very weak Adjustment Budget presented by a very racist DA. [Interjections.]

The vast sum of money cut from the payment of staff is more proof that this DA-run Government does not care for the people it serves or those that work for it and the Western Cape failed to create the number of jobs it predicted. The DA is not pro-poor. [Interjections.]

The DA's Premier candidate, hon MEC Winde, failed for two years in a row in the Department of Agriculture to get a clean bill of health from the Auditor-General, failed to properly account for what happened on his watch and, failed trying to play it down. Worse was this Government's failure to plan for drought in a dry region and to react to the disaster that followed. Even now the promised measures are still not fully put in place. There is no real meaningful additional funding or plan to deal with this crisis that will reoccur in future as climate change sets in.

The Province is still in breach of its own Constitution without the promised

Environmental Commissioner and feet are dragged with the Children's Commissioner. We remain in a very unequal situation with two provinces in one, with one, rich and developed and the other neglected by apartheid spatial planning and poverty. The arrogant DA makes it impossible to support a budget that mainly maintains former privileges. [Interjections.] The ANC therefore opposes every Vote and wants its objections noted and the ANC does not agree with the policies and directions of the DA-run Government of this Province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Does the DA also want to make a statement?
Not. Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: This side of the House supports every Vote.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC has indicated they are dissenting on all the Votes so I am going to put Vote 1 to 14 as a group.

1 to 14, I put it to the House with the dissent of the ANC. ANC's objection will be recorded.

I now put Clauses 1, 2, 3 of the Bill. Any objections? The objections of the ANC will be recorded.

I put the Schedule. Any objections? The objections of the ANC will be recorded.

I put the Title. Agreed to. The Secretary will read the 9th Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: *Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.* [B 6 – 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: As I do not have a speakers list are there any objections to the Bill being finalised? There is an objection by the ANC, it will be recorded. The ANC's objection will be recorded. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will be sent to the Premier for her assent. Before we end off and I vacate the Chair to the Speaker I need to give a ruling which is long outstanding and I want the House to bear with me. It is a little bit longer than usual but I want to do it still in this term.

In his Member's Statement on 14 June the hon member Christians defended the actions of the Mayor of George who had condemned the Boston Gay Choir Concert which was to be held in his town. The Mayor has said, inter alia, and I quote: "This is all due to my Christian conviction and belief system. It does not carry my approval, this concert."

The hon member Uys raised a point of order and contended that the "principle of right to equality" had been violated, that the hon member was

“really coming out against gay people” and that his statements were unconstitutional.

In determining whether the hon member had indeed gone too far, let me quote the applicable law. Firstly, in terms of Section 9 in the Bill of Rights in the Constitution:

“Everyone is equal before the law and has the right to equal protection and benefit of the law. In terms of Sub-sections 3 and 4, the State or any person may not unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone on a number of grounds including on the grounds of race, gender, sex, ethnic or social origin, colour, sexual orientation, religion, conscience and belief.”

Further, in terms of Section 15 of the Bill of Rights:

“Everyone has freedom of conscience, freedom of religion, freedom of thought, freedom of belief and freedom of opinion.”

In terms of Section 16 of the Bill of Rights:

”Everyone has freedom of expression.”

However such freedom of expression does not extend to inter-alia”

“Advocacy of hatred based on race, ethnicity, gender or religion and that constitutes incitement to cause harm.”

Also, Section 117 of the Constitution provides that:

“Members have freedom of speech in the Legislature and its committees, subject to its own Rules and Orders.”

In terms of the promotion of equality and prevention of unfair discrimination Act, Act 4 of 2000, certain actions are declared unlawful. Inter-alia unfair discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation. The Act determines that no person may communicate words based on one or more of the prohibited grounds and that includes discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation against any person that could:

“ ... reasonably construed to demonstrate a clear intention to be hurtful, harmful or incite harm or promote or propagate hatred.”

On the other hand, the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, Act 4 of 2004, also regulates actions by members and in terms of Section 6, members have freedom of speech in the House.

There are therefore two clear sides to this matter. On the one hand, the member has freedom of speech and freedom of expression in this House, subject to the Standing Orders and also freedom to hold a view on his or her

religion.

On the other hand, the Constitution and other laws are clear that the State or any person may not unfairly discriminate against anyone on the basis of inter alia sexual orientation.

The Chair is now required to rule whether it is acceptable for members in the House, under protection of Parliamentary privilege, to criticise or reflect on people on the basis of their sexual orientation or whether such reflection or criticism will in all instances be in conflict with the Constitution and the Equality Act, that is despite the possible protection of Parliamentary privilege.

In reaching a decision it is important to note what the hon member Christians had said or had not said. He did not directly reflect or discriminate against gay people, however, his support of the stance of the Mayor who had objected to the gay choir concert being allowed to perform, could be viewed as indirectly reflecting on and discriminating against gay people.

The Equality Court in 2014 found a member guilty of making statements about gays and lesbians which:

“were likely to encourage hatred and cause emotional, psychological and physical harm to members of this community”

In a sequel to this case, the Western Cape Equality Court found that the specific comments were discriminatory and dehumanised gays and lesbians.

The Court specifically considered the defence of the accused that his comments were protected by his religious views but found that none of his comments fell within the parameters of his right to religious belief of freedom of speech.

In *Chairpersons of the National Council of Provinces versus Julius Malema and one Other*, case number 535 of 2015, Supreme Court of Appeal 20 May 2016, the so-called Malema Judgement, the Court dealt with an instant where a member of the National Assembly was suspended for refusal to retract a statement made in the House.

In paragraph 1 of the Malema Judgement the Court said:

“Freedom of speech is a privilege essential to every free Council or Legislature:”

As it was put by the English House of Commons,

“The members must be as free as their Houses”.

And further, in paragraph 1 of the Malema Judgement:

“Freedom of speech and debate in Parliament are matters of the highest constitutional importance. Parliament by its very nature functions through a deliberative process. Debate is key to the performance of its functions. That process can only be meaningful if members are afforded sufficient room to freely express themselves.”

And in paragraph 2, the Court said:

“A member must have the complete right of free speech in Parliament without any fear that his motives or intentions, or reasoning will be questioned or held against him thereafter. By law a Legislature is competent to determine and control its internal arrangements, proceedings and procedures and to make Rules and Orders concerning its business with due regard to representative and participatory democracy, accountability, transparency and public involvement and the Legislature may accordingly maintain internal control and discipline in its proceedings”.

It is not an issue where the hon Christians can be held liable in a civil or criminal court for his statement in the House. He cannot. Parliamentary privilege applies. What is an issue is whether the Legislature, by means of its Rules and Orders, and by extension also by a ruling by the Chair, can prohibit a member from making this sort of statement that the hon member

has made.

In paragraph 18 of the Malema Judgement the Court found that:

“The standing order does not and constitutionally cannot go as far as impeding political speech. It does not sense a criticism of the government or its ruling party.”

There is therefore space in parliamentary debate referred to loosely as “political speech” where a Legislature cannot restrict or interfere with or prohibit members’ freedom of speech in its Rules and Orders. In the Malema Judgement part of this space is referred to by the Court as:

“Criticism of the government or its ruling party.”

The legal questions at hand are therefore: can a member claim that a statement in the House that amounts to discrimination in terms of Section 9 of the Constitution and in terms of the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act is political speech and can therefore not be prohibited by the Rules and Orders or by the Chair in the application of the Rules? And if so, does the statement by the hon member Christians qualify not to be prohibited?

In paragraph 24 and further of the Malema Judgement, the Court referred to:

“Other species of political speech, in addition to political speech that criticises the government or ruling party”.

Since the question was not before the Court, the Court did not proceed to elaborate on what such “other species of political speech” that would be free from prohibition by the Legislature might be. It would appear though that there is no other case law covering that specific aspect. In that sense then the legal question here could be nil.

Although the Malema Judgement cannot be seen as direct authority that the hon Christians’s statement is political speech and is therefore protected, the facts are distinguishable. One can however rely on the Malema Judgement to note that there is a space in parliamentary debate where a Legislature cannot prohibit a member from saying certain things.

The question here is therefore whether the comments by the hon member Christians could be regarded as falling within such “other species of political speech” and serves a legitimate parliamentary purpose? A legitimate parliamentary purpose can be said to relate to a Legislature’s broad functions, namely oversight or criticism of governments or political parties, the interrogation of or reflections on law, including the Constitution, or that relate to policy issues in the public domain.

Since Legislatures make laws, a member must be able to say things or proposed things that may motivate for reinterpretation or amendment of the

law. This is after all one of the fundamental purposes of the Legislature to consider whether and where the law falls short, to debate the issue in a public space and to change the law.

In coming to a decision, the Chair is not led by the morality or decency of what the hon member Christians had said, although he had identified with a view that certain persons should be denied certain opportunities, purely on the basis of their sexual orientation.

The matter raised by the member appears to be a matter concerning public policy and the question on how such policy impacts or should impact on our laws. In this sense, the statement, offensive or otherwise, discriminately or otherwise, appears to fall in the scope of a statement made for a legitimate parliamentary purpose, that is to advance deliberative democracy.

It is this spirit that should inform the scope of permissible free speech in our Legislatures. Even if the law prohibits the saying of certain things outside of our Legislatures. This is so because it is in our Legislatures where our laws like the Constitution itself are debated and created. Undue restrictions on what members may or may not say in the Legislature, where such statements serve a legitimate parliamentary purpose, undermine the ability of the electorate to express itself on the system by which it is governed and in that respect may be undemocratic.

No doubt our Legislatures have dealt and will have to deal with controversial

and complicated policy matters that impact on fundamental rights. The right of the elected to freely express the views of their constituents on such notice should be preserved. It would not serve the purposes of representative participative democracy for Legislatures to, in their Rules and Orders and through rulings from the Chair, prohibit free speech of this nature.

For all these reasons, I am of the view, in response to the legal questions stated above, that member Christians's statement, although offensive or hurtful, was political speech and cannot be prohibited by the Rules and Orders or by a ruling from the Chair and is therefore not unparliamentary. Thank you. I will now vacate the Chair for the Speaker to take over. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order. I am now going to deliver a considered ruling. On 15 November 2018, during the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of Western Cape Adjustments Bill, the hon Minister of Community Safety, hon Winde, responded to what hon Magaxa had said during his speech that resourcing of hot spots was not by accident, it was by design.

Hon Magaxa refuted that, he had said that and said I quote:

“Madam Speaker, I never said that nonsense he is saying I said.”

As there was a dispute on whether such a remark was made by hon Magaxa, I undertook to revert to Hansard at the request of Hon Magaxa. He even wanted

me to promise to do that. According to the Hansard transcript hon Magaxa in his main speech remarked as follows:

“The Western Cape had 10 stations in the top 30 murder stations in the country, that these 10 stations are not in the leafy suburbs, but in the Cape Flats is not by accident but by design.”

I therefore confirm to this House that hon Magaxa indeed uttered those words. [Interjections.].

My second advice is that in the debate on Vote 11, the hon member Tyatyam alleged that the Speaker's signature is being used by officials on official documentation. This is a very serious allegation which will be fully investigated. I will inform the members of the outcome of the investigation as soon as it has been concluded. I will furthermore study the Hansard transcript of the hon member Tyatyam's speech and will appropriately deal with any aspersions cast on me in my role of Speaker.

On the same subject matter, I wish to inform the House that during the debate on Wednesday, the hon member Beerwinkel saw fit to directly implicate the Office of the Speaker in the proceedings of the Public Accounts Committee in its deliberation on the Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture and asserted that the Speaker was the reason that the Public Accounts Committee has not yet been able to deal with the Department's Annual Reports of the past two years.

The hon Beerwinkel furthermore rejected a response from me as arrogant to a request from the Committee for the reason which gave rise to the delays. The hon Beerwinkel also informed the House that the Speaker had received information from the Minister about the then impending Court challenge on the 28 September 2018 already. But by way of a letter only confirmed the Committee on the 30 October, which letter ostensibly stopped the Committee in its tracks, inferring a delay informing the relevant stakeholders. The hon Beerwinkel proceeded to implicate an official who felt the need to stop the Committee from doing its work.

Not only are these statements patently untrue but regrettably the member has also chosen to use a public forum to draw the Office of the Speaker into the political arena, by involving the Speaker in whatever political squabbles are being played out in the PAC, not to mention the fact that she chose a forum to raise these issues knowing full well that I am not allowed to speak in the debates, to respond to these allegations. So what are the facts?

My office was informed on the 28 September 2018 of the Minister's intention to bring an application before the Western Cape High Court which will seek to set aside findings and return to the A-G for reconsideration. What did I do? On that very same day I caused the Minister's letter to be published in the ATC and distributed it to all members and stakeholders for their attention.

On 30 October 2018, my office received communication from the Head of

Legal Services of the Provincial Government that papers were indeed served at the High Court on the 22 October. What did I do? I immediately informed the members of the PAC of the developments and drew its attention to the Standing Rule governing matters *sub judice*. To imply that I tried to influence the Committee on the applicability of the *sub judice* rule is disingenuous and blatantly untrue. I could not have done so because I had not had sight of the Court papers at that stage. Furthermore I do not have a mandate, nor the authority to interfere in the proceedings of a Committee of this House.

On 22 November 2018, I received a letter from the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee requesting a report. The letter did not say what I had to report on. Nowhere in the letter was I requested to give reasons which gave rise to the delays as asserted by the hon Beerwinkel. What did I do? I responded on the same day and informed the PAC that Committees must operate within the ambit of the Rules and it was up to them to ensure that they perform their functions and interpret their mandates and that I had nothing further to add to my letter of the 30 October.

I challenged the hon Beerwinkel in her absence to provide evidence of my response to the Public Accounts Committee as being contradictory and false as she asserted, failing which I cannot but come to any other conclusion that her comments were meant to mislead this House.

Furthermore, and this is very important, if there is an official who felt the

need to stop the Committee from doing its work as the member contends, I need the full detail since I, as the employer of the staff of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, cannot be a bystander to officials trying to undermine the work of Committees of the House.

More importantly, depending on the circumstances, such action could be a transgression of Section 7 of the Powers and Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act. I have instructed the Secretary to do an investigation into this matter and I trust the hon Beerwinkel will cooperate and provide the necessary detail in this regard.

Hon members, we have now reached the end of another year and as is our tradition, I will now afford representatives of parties the opportunity to address their House on the occasion of the end of year and the end of this session. The EFF is not here. The ANC, hon Davids?

†Me S W DAVIDS: Dankie, agb Speaker vir die geleentheid. Ek wil net graag aan almal wat hier is sê dat julle jul vakansie met jul families moet geniet en dat ons almal moet dankbaar wees vir die Here want vir vier jaar het ons almal elke keer veilig teruggekom. Niemand van ons of ons families was beseer en so nie. So geniet julle vakansie met jul families en weet dit dat die seisoen wat ons ingaan is 'n bedrywige seisoen maar dit is ook 'n seisoen vir ons om te rus. Dankie. [Applous.]

[Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Madam Speaker for the opportunity. I just

want to say to all here that you must enjoy your holiday with your families and that we should all be grateful to the Lord because for four years we came home safely every time. None of us or our families had been injured or such. So enjoy your holiday with your families and be aware that the season we are entering is a busy season, but it is also a season for us to rest. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you member Davids. In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP, I recognise the DA.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. In the absence of the Leader of Government Business, I rise to convey the DA's grateful thanks to this Parliament, to the Presiding Officers, to all of the staff of this Parliament for dedicated and committed work during the course of this very difficult year and to all members of this House, for participating in, always robust and sometimes very tough debates. We are all in need of a break especially after a year that has been so challenging and in the run-up to a year that will possibly be even more challenging.

The hon member Davids raised the issue of our families and we too convey our deepest good wishes to all spouses, partners and members of members' families. But I do feel it would be inappropriate not to add that we need to pay respects to our families, even those of our opponents, at all times during the course of our deliberations. They are not politicians and it is entirely wrong to drag them into score settling and point scoring in this House and

that has been one of the very sad and regrettable factors of the past year.

So, as we go our respective ways with families who have to put up an enormous amount by virtue of the jobs we try to do for the country, may we in the Democratic Alliance wish you all a very blessed holiday season, whether or not you are Christians and whether or not you celebrate Christmas, and come back refreshed to tackle the enormous challenges of the year in which our democracy's apex, a National General Election, will be a feature. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members and to all the staff of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, I want to thank you for your hard work throughout this year and I want to wish you well as you travel on your different journeys to your way home. Take the time to rest and come back refreshed.

That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:04.