
THURSDAY, 31 MAY 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon hon members. I am going to call the House to order. I recognise the hon, the Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: No, Madam Speaker, I have nothing, no motion at this stage. Thank you.

Mr P UYS: I need to say, sorry, what did the Chief Whip ask?

The SPEAKER: No, I said I recognised the Chief Whip.

Mr P UYS: And then?

The SPEAKER: He said he has no motions at this stage.

Mr P UYS: Okay. May I help him?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, we do not need your help.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please help him, please. †Asseblief! [Tussenwerpsel]
[Please! [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order, hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: There was a request at the Programming Authority that precedence be given to the Public Service Commissioner so is that not happening any more, Madam Speaker, because that was agreed in the Programming Authority? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Uys, I will direct... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: And I honour that.

The SPEAKER: I will direct the request to the Chief Whip. Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: We are exercising our discretion and we would rather have it at the normal time with motions, thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, you were properly advised. [Inaudible.]
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys. Order please members.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, I think it is appropriate that we say it here. When we are in the Programming Authority and we ask something, we honour that, and if we differ and we change then we speak to each other. There was a clear request from hon member Wiley to have that section and precedence upfront and we all agreed, “yes, no problem.”

Now what is going to happen in future when we have a subject for discussion and there is also an agreement on precedent, then all of a sudden it is not coming up first again. I have no problem when it is, Madam Speaker, but there is just a proper process... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is a process, ja.

Mr P UYS: ...and there is a proper decency built into this as well.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja. Die DA is in die sop nou. Hulle is in die sop.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes. The DA is in trouble now. They are in trouble.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you hon member Uys. The Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I have heard the lecture from the hon Chief Whip on the other side, so in light of that, I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the motion in my name in the Order Paper.

DRAFT RESOLUTION

Pursuant to the adoption of the report of the ad hoc committee on the appointment of a Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape by the House on 10 May 2018, the House hereby resolves that the nomination of Mr Leonardo Goosen as the Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape be approved as contemplated in Section 196(8)(b)(ii) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh ja, now you are coming back. This must be laughable.

The SPEAKER: Okay, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? There is no objection. It is agreed to. Hon Uys.

Mr P UYS: Nothing is agreed to, Madam Speaker. There was a request that precedence be given, correct. Then you ask do we give precedence to it and then there was nothing, nobody against that, but then you started with the

motion and then that we agree to the motion. I do not know what you said, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Well, hon member Uys, sorry, if I could just - you raised the point of Programming and I take my cue from the Order Paper and what has happened at the Programming meeting. The hon Chief Whip then stood up and said that he moves a motion after you had said that because hon member Dyantyi picked up and that is why I then asked are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice because the Chief Whip had indeed put a motion to the floor that precedence then be given. That is what happened. That is how I understand it.

Mr P UYS: You did not say that, but that is fine.

The SPEAKER: Well that is how I understood what I heard. Alright, so there were no objections and it was agreed to so we now move to the next item on the Order Paper which is the motion in the name of the hon member Mr M G E Wiley. That is the motion we are dealing with which was agreed to at Programming and there are three minutes. I have not received a speakers list but there is three minutes... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Just a point of order, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: I would like to address you, I did in the past address you and I think it is important to address you again. You will recall the last time you said you were going to call the Whips together. You sat at the back here but then you declined to speak to the Whips. You also made - I think you called it a ruling last time... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Considered ruling.

Mr P UYS: We still wanted to engage you but you were so quick to get out of the House, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die DA is deurmekaar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA is confused.]

Mr P UYS: But I think it is important for good process that I do address you on this and I would ask you that you allow me to actually do that. Madam Speaker, the report was put and the whole report, never ever, and I asked you if you can show me where half of a report was ever submitted in this House. There was a report submitted in this House and that report was dated 4 May and it came in terms of the Ad-hoc Committee on the Public Service Commissioner. You submitted the report; the report in totality. There were even members speaking to that report, hon member Joseph even spoke to the section of who the person is that must be appointed. I can refer you to page 271 of Hansard. He actually motivated that Mr Goosen be appointed so that was very clearly part of the report.

Then, Madam Speaker, also on page 271 you continued, you said: “I now submit the report for approval.”

Madam Speaker, this report was not approved at that meeting. You know the DA did not have the numbers at that meeting. They only had 16 votes. They were supposed to have 22 votes to pass this. What I further want to say to you, Madam Speaker, and I did say this in the past, it is very, very clear; there is a Section 125(2). Now Section 125 or sorry, Rule 125(2) is stating very clearly, a question has been fully put, and I must explain this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: No, Madam Speaker, give me an opportunity. You can rule whatever you want, give me an opportunity.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That is a point of order.

Mr P UYS: No-no, I am busy with... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Chief Whip, the hon member Uys is on a point of order which has now become a debating point but I am going to afford him the opportunity to finish his point of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, thank you.

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Thank you Madam Speaker. In terms of Rule 125(2) a question has been fully put once you say “ayes and noes”. We have gone through that whole process in terms of one report. This report is paragraph 1 to 6. It includes a recommendation on a name so the question has been fully put and then I would like to refer you to a very important section that has been used in municipalities. We have used it here before and it is in our Rules and that section is very clear. That is Section 145 of our Rules, Madam Speaker, and they say no Draft Resolution - and this is what we have on the table today, a Draft Resolution - may be moved in the House, which is the same in substance and it is the same in substance as the 10th May as a Draft Resolution, which was approved or rejected during the preceding period of six months. That is the principle that counts. It was rejected, Madam Speaker, as if when we set a motion of no confidence in the hon Premier, that was rejected... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: But we cannot come with a motion of that again in six months.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P UYS: Like in the City of Cape Town. Therefore, Madam Speaker, that motion cannot be entertained today. That is very, very important that you do stick to procedures and you do stick to rules.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Uys. Your point of order is noted. I did though bring the House a considered ruling on the matter on 17 May 2018 and if you wish to take the matter up you would need to take the principle of my ruling and have it placed on the Agenda of the Rules Committee for deliberation, but my understanding is that we have followed the process to the letter as I was guided so we will proceed in that manner.

I am not going to deliberate any more discussion other than to say it was a considered ruling. I have ruled on the matter and I trust that you will consider that.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, then you will have to say, we will have to bring on a substantial motion in terms of the way you conduct this House and you rule. We will have to write a letter to the Premier who must consider this and I hope she will really consider everything and of course eventually - and I hope it will not get to that point - to the President of the Republic of South Africa and he must approve it. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your comment is noted, hon member Uys. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will side with you.

The SPEAKER: I said I now recognise the DA. So do I take it the ANC will not be using the three minutes that...

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr P UYS: There is no motion.

The SPEAKER: There is no motion. Okay. I see the hon, the DA.
[Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How can you admit something that does not exist
[Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, it is important that I give background relating to the process. I want to speak on this motion.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, but you are not ready for this [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The Ad-Hoc Committee concluded its work on 4 May 2018 where two final candidates were discussed and where one candidate was recommended to the House in order to give effect to Section 230 of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Standing Rules... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is something wrong with your [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The report of the Ad-Hoc Committee was published on Tuesday 8 May by the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, the ATC document, which means enhancements, tabling and committee reports, where Mr Leonardo Goosen was recommended to the House to be nominated for appointment as Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape. The Programming Authority Committee approved the motion to be placed on the Order Paper for Thursday 10 May. The motion read as follows:

“Consideration of Report of the Ad-hoc Committee on the appointment of the Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape...”

And please note it was “consideration of the report.”

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Exactly!

Mr D JOSEPH: Political parties were given the opportunity to make declarations. The Speaker then asked if there were any objections to the report. The ANC called a division and the results after counting came to 13 / 16... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do you know we were here. Just remember we were here.

Mr D JOSEPH: Members present were in favour of adopting the report. The

ANC raised a point of order indicating... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Speak for yourself, the ANC [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: ...that the majority of the members is needed for the appointment of the Public Service Commissioner.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr D JOSEPH: The Speaker then suspended the House to consult with procedural staff whereafter the Speaker indicated to report back to the House. On reporting back at the following sitting the Speaker ruled that the adoption of the Committee report is done in terms of Rule 36(1), meaning decisions made in the House is made by the majority of the votes cast except where the Rules provide otherwise.

The Speaker further noted that a motion on the Order Paper on 10 May relating to the adoption of the Ad-hoc Committee report required a majority in the House and that the adoption was in order.

The motion on the Order Paper for 31 May, today, is to give effect for the House to adopt a resolution approving the nominee for appointment as Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape. If the resolution of the nominee is adopted by the House as per Constitution, Section 196(8)(b)(i), meaning the Committee must be composed of members of all parties and (b)(ii) means

a resolution adopted with the supporting vote of the majority of all its members.

Madam Speaker, I move that the House approves the nominee Mr Leonardo Goosen for appointment as the Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, the adoption of this nominee as per Section 196(8)(b)(i) and 196(8)(b)(ii) of the Constitution allows for the Premier to nominate the candidate to the President of South Africa. I thank you,

The SPEAKER: Thank you, in the absence of the EFF and the ACDP the question before the House is the approval of the Draft Resolution by the House. In terms of Section 196(8)(b)(ii) of the Constitution:

“A commissioner nominated by the Premier must be approved by the Legislature by a resolution adopted by a majority of its members.”

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: In order to comply with the requirements of Section 196(8)(b)(ii) of the Constitution, I am going to put the question and request those members' names in favour of the resolution being adopted to be recorded in the minutes. The bells will therefore be rung for three minutes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] This is a crazy idea; you stay out of this.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, procedurally wise nobody here asked for a division and you call a division.

The SPEAKER: Yes hon member Uys, I have. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You cannot call a division. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I can. Hon member Uys, if you have any issue around how the matter is being dealt you do know what recourse you have to do... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, I am still addressing you. You must go through a process in terms of the Rules where you say “the ayes and the noes”. After you have done that somebody can call and it must be at least five people, to call for a division. You call a division yourself! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: I am disappointed in you!

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P UYS: You cannot make it, Madam Speaker, sorry.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, if you would like me to I shall go back and

say I put the question, those in favour of the motion being agreed to will say aye; those again say no. Those in favour of the motion say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The SPEAKER: Those against?

The SPEAKER: There are no noes. So then I take it the ayes have it.

An HON MEMBER: Unanimous.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Unanimously because there is no opposition.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, I did - yes Chief Whip.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I ask that we do a count please.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely. For the record, a division has been called. The bells will now be rung. I will ask the Chief Whips, those to act as counters, Chief Whip Wiley, hon member Uys, if you could act as counters please, thank you.

Mr P UYS: This is an illegal vote. We will not participate, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can put this mess [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no dissension. There is no dissension here.
[Interjections.] [Inaudible - speaking simultaneously]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is drie minute. Ons kom terug na drie minute; drie minute. [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is three minutes. We are coming back after three minutes; three minutes. [Inaudible.]]

[Business of the House suspended at 14:36 and resumed at 14:39.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order please! The result is as follows: there are 23 ayes and zero noes. The motion is therefore agreed to.

I now need to move to Interpellations. However, I think there is an interpellation - I have been alerted to the fact that the hon member Tyatyam and hon member Dugmore are not in the House and that the matters have been referred to the Ministers so Interpellation 1 and 2... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am in the House.

The SPEAKER: No-no, I am not talking, kindly take your seat. I am still

addressing the House. So I am told that those two interpellations fall away, the one to the Minister of Economic Opportunities because the hon member Tyatyam is not in and the other one to the Minister of Human Settlements as the hon member Dugmore is not with us today. So we would need to move to Integrity Management Framework number 3.

[Interpellations 1 and 2 fall away.]

An HON MEMBER: Do we know where they are?

The SPEAKER: I could not say that. [Interjections.] Interpellation number 3 is by the hon member Dyantyi to Minister Bredell, Minister of Local Government. [Interjections.] Order please members! Let us get on with the business of the day. I now see the hon the Minister of Local Government, Minister Bredell.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Western Cape Municipalities: corrupt activities

1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What has been done regarding the increase in corrupt activities at Western Cape municipalities?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, and thank you Madam Speaker, for the interpellation. Reporting of corruption at the municipal level is done via the National Anti-Corruption Hotline (NACH), which is managed by the Public Service Commissioner (PSC), which in turn outsources the operations of NACH to a reputable auditing company to ensure the confidentiality of the complainants.

In the Western Cape Province we have 23% of our municipalities including the City of Cape Town which operate their own Anti-Corruption Hotlines while the majority of district and local municipalities prefer to use the National Anti-Corruption Hotline number for the registration of complaints relating to corruption. My Department has concluded an agreement with the Public Service Commissioner which allows the Provincial Forensic Services to provide technical and forensic support with the investigation of complaints received via the NACH and the Provincial Anti-Corruption Hotline related to corruption complaints linked to municipalities within the Western Cape Province.

Pertaining to awareness raising measures as part of the Department's key performance areas, support was rendered to all municipalities in raising anti-corruption awareness by providing training, developing anti-corruption material as well as brand merchandise on whistleblowing to be used in municipal awareness campaigns. During the 2016/17 and 2017/18 financial period my Department has created awareness of the Protected Disclosure Act

or the Whistleblowing Act through a targeted distribution of the anti-corruption material to all municipalities which includes posters, pamphlets, booklets and branded merchandise on fraud prevention plans. By way of monitoring my Department has ensured that all municipalities have developed fraud prevention plans which in essence reflect the strategic objectives of the Local Government anti-corruption strategy. Many municipalities follow the structures proposed by the municipal integrity framework which incorporates leadership, commitment to fighting corruption, the establishment of governance and oversight structures, the implementation of anti-corruption measures relating to prevention, detection, investigation and the resolution thereto and reporting thereof.

Integrity management plans of the National Treasury in conjunction with the National Department of Cooperative Governance have introduced the Integrity Management Framework as an amendment to the Local Government Anti-Corruption Strategy.

The amended Local Governance Anti-Corruption Strategy now requires that all municipalities must implement and develop their own integrity management plans over a period of three years with effect from 2017 to 2018 financial year. My Department... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly finish up, Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: My Department in collaboration with the National Department of Cooperative Governance have commenced with the rollout of training in the following districts, and then I mention all the districts where...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I was looking forward before I start to see where my colleague is who will come after me, hon Mnqasela. I cannot see him. Maybe he is missing in action but... [Interjections.] I am very happy to take his time and include it in mine... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi that is not allowed. You have three minutes. You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much. No, I have enough time today during his absence. Let me start this way and this is an opportunity I think the MEC is missing. You would have started here. Let us remind each other we are in the best-run province, †die Wes-Kaap, [the Western Cape.] This is where we are. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are the joke of the century.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The ANC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now this best-run province, amongst the other things that it prides itself on, the first one, if you put the awards on the side, is the issue of clean audits. This is where I thought the MEC would have started. [Interjections.] But let me remind him, I know my time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You have three minutes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have got full three minutes and I am so relaxed. Now let me remind the MEC about the clean audits in the municipalities. We have eleven municipalities that are being investigated for corrupt activities.

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Ou storie, nuwe punt.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Old story, new point.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now amongst those I just want to pick up what we know are municipalities with clean audits. It is your George Municipality. I am

starting now.

The SPEAKER: No, the clock has started a little while ago.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Cape Town Municipality, Bitou, Theewaterskloof, Langeberg, Stellenbosch, your Laingsburg. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, speak to me please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And out of that eleven... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Do not forget about Beaufort West.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We know of them. No, that is where I am coming. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Out of that eleven we have four which is your Oudtshoorn, Beaufort West, Cederberg. We are not necessarily on the pure clean audit stuff.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is three, you said four.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now I am doing this Madam Speaker, even before we get to the question because I have listened to the Minister. He has not even come close to answering the question but I will come back to that later. Now this is the point I want to make in raising these municipalities.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is not a question. It is a debate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now George Municipality had a clean audit but the Department presented to us and to the Standing Committee... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you need to finish off your first three minutes are just about up.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is about, just about. I am getting there.

The SPEAKER: No, you still have...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You might have to allow me to finish because I am the only one here standing.

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Dyantyi... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon Mngasela is not here. The Minister will speak last.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, take your seat please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can we just arrange that arrangement. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us just agree. I must just be all stages [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: The hon member Mngasela is not here.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I have long said that he is not here.

The SPEAKER: Yes, no and I am aware of that. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And the Minister is last after me.

The SPEAKER: So now we give you your next two minutes please. There we go.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, there you go. Now out of that...

The SPEAKER: Two minutes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is where I was coming to, hon MEC. So in presenting the Department in presenting what work it is doing, the George Municipality is listed as having so many corrupt activities.

Ms P MAKELENI: Like your George.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is a municipality with a clean audit. I am trying to make a comparison.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Investigations!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Bitou the same, because if you go to George these are the issues that we are talking about in George. There is only Section 106 that the Minister is putting in. The only highlight the Minister can tell about us in George is that the Hawks have come in. It is the only thing that he can talk about. Everything else is still to be investigated. Now the question is going straight to him, not to the Hawks. The question is very clear: what has been done regarding the corrupt activities at the Western Cape municipalities? His Department did the best to write things down and present them but in everything else the Department has done they are basically saying nothing because it is about investigation.

Let me stay in George. It was not presented when the Department came to the Committee. In George you have R15 million, hon MEC, R15 million that has been spent on mediation, R15 million. Now even a court of law would not spend so much money on mediation and in fact if we were to use that R15 million you could easily have appointed ten directors in that municipality. I am hoping the R15 million in George is part of what you are still going to investigate. I am hoping that the Hawks - that is what you are

sitting on because that is a serious corrupt activity in George. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: This is a cover-up. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: R15 million.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So what we are having also from his report, the Minister has only told us the following things: he has plans, plans and plans. That is what he presented just now. “We are planning to do this. This is what we are going to be doing. This is what municipalities are doing in terms of the National Anti-Corruption.”

He is not able to tell us exactly as an MEC and from the Department this is what - except asking for the Hawks to come in. “This is what we have done in terms of...” So I can give you a tick for the awareness programme. That is super. Well done on that! But the awareness programme does not deal with corruption. It makes citizens and everybody else aware. You have a big tick on that from me so well done on that, but that means nothing.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, if I could just alert you, you are into your final two minutes now.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, I am the only one standing so please allow me.

The SPEAKER: I see so. You still have two minutes left.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So in the tabling from the Department we are getting the following: there are invalid appointments across municipalities. The MM in this municipality, Rhode in Kannaland, and the CFO have been invalidly appointed. The question you ask, where is this, MEC? Are you only waking up when you are beaten and then you start making a noise? Because why would invalid appointments be happening under your watch across all of these municipalities and you have to refer things to the Provincial Treasury that have got nothing to do with Provincial Treasury, because there are appointments of MMs just not where Provincial Treasury comes in.

You have tender irregularities across the municipalities, each one of these municipalities that I have listed here, something common are your tender irregularities. It cannot be. There is something wrong about the health of those municipalities as if there is no MEC that is able to be proactive and attend to this. All you are waiting for is the result of your Anti-Corruption Hotline nationally and then the awareness programme that you are doing and therefore I put it to you that as an MEC for Local Government in the Western Cape you are failing these municipalities. The only thing you do, you claim them when they have clean audit. Maybe you do not even know how this clean audit have come about and then you spoke about 23% which is part of one of your own things that you are kind of doing and therefore, I mean for example if you go to Kannaland there are further investigations on racketeering, non-compliance of the MM, CFO. You cannot wait for a hotline or Hawks to deal with those issues. You suppose you have sections in your Department that are reporting to you on a weekly and monthly basis about the

emergence of these issues. What it means is that you are not proactive. What you have are policies and plans and you are hoping that those policies and plans would do a job by themselves and I do not know why, what you are being paid for.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please finish off, your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are having this increased number of irregularities and corrupt activities in the Western Cape municipalities. This is what I want to put to you. In your last two minutes please find an answer to this point.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon, the Minister, Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you. Thank you Madam Speaker. We live in the best-run province and we are proud of it. Clean audits, it is a shock that the ANC does not understand that there is a difference between clean audit and forensic investigations but obviously if you belong to the ANC and you are in such a weak position that you cannot brag about clean audits... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just leave the ANC and [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...then you will not build on it because they made a promise in 2014 that by 2019 all municipalities will have clean audits and they could not adhere to their own promise. We invest a lot of municipalities and we will keep on investing the municipalities; we believe as a party in accountability and we will keep our leaders accountable to the people out there. We have a no-tolerance attitude towards corruption and if you look at independent reports like Africa Rating, MPAT report, the last one, the financial, Best Financial Municipality in the Country, it is all in the Western Cape and we are very proud of that. Eight days after we alleged or received complaints on alleged corruption within George we have acted. The ANC cannot do that even in their wildest dreams.

The difference between the Democratic Alliance and the ANC, let me put it out there...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, the DA is going down and the ANC is going up. That is the difference.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...and to show you that we are the only party who is serious in clamping down on corruption, is that we did not interfere in any Hawks investigations; two days before a by-election we have let the Hawks walk in, rate the municipality. We still won that by-election because the public is not stupid. [Interjections.]

They understand that the ANC is not serious getting rid of corruption and the DA is the only party who will protect their interests. Thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that your answer.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: That concludes Interpellations. We now move to Questions for Oral Reply and the new question on the Order Paper, the first question is from the hon member Uys to the hon Premier Zille. I see the Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

Inequalities in the Western Cape

***1. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

How is she and her Government confronting white privilege and black poverty to address the major inequalities in the Western Cape?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The hon member Uys has asked me how I and my Government are confronting white privilege and black poverty to address the major inequalities in the Western Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In your ten years. Just add that part.

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: I welcome the question and the interjection.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you hon Premier.

The PREMIER: And as usual I will do my very best to answer it as honestly as I can. Let me begin on this question of inequality by saying that it is well known that Cape Town is the least unequal City in South Africa and that...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a good start.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: And that the Western Cape is the least unequal province.

Mr P UYS: The most unequal.

The PREMIER: No, we are the least unequal and the statistics and the empirical research confirm it.

Mr P UYS: Read your own MERO and PERO.

The PREMIER: I read my own MERO and PERO and I read the research coming internationally. Even *Africa Check*, which is very critical of all politicians actually, but does a disproportionate amount of checking on what we say, has found that it is indeed true that the United Nations have found that Cape Town is the least unequal city, the most equal city in South Africa and that in fact Buffalo City, Johannesburg and Ekurhuleni are the most unequal cities in South Africa.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is news to me.

The PREMIER: Well it is news to you but you should actually...
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Look at your own documents. Why do you not look at your own documents?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am going to read it. I am going to read that.

The PREMIER: Please do.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is news to me.

The PREMIER: I did in fact give it to you.

The SPEAKER: Interjections ... sorry hon Premier. I am just reminding the hon member interjections, but not a running commentary. Thank you.

The PREMIER: And when you come to the province as a whole, Madam Speaker, you find the quite extraordinary statistic that rural unemployment has gone down to 14%. Now that is quite exceptional.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thanks to National Government. [Laughter.] Yebo. Go further. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The PREMIER: It is quite extraordinary that according to the hon member Dyantyi the only place that the National Government is eradicating poverty is in the Western Cape. That is his logic. In fact that is the last place they would do it because this province is run by the Opposition but the most extraordinary thing is that we have pushed unemployment in the rural areas down to 14%, not only at a time when national unemployment is climbing but at a time that we have had our worst drought in living memory and according to the experts a one-in-400-year drought and of course that affects the rural areas disproportionately. But despite that, we have managed to bring unemployment down, which is quite an exceptional feat. I would like to read from the Quarterly Labour Force Survey which shows, again, that when it comes to job creation the Western Cape outperformed all the other provinces creating 123 000 jobs out of the 165 000 created in the whole country since

the first quarter of 2017.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you are still coming to white privilege? [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: I am definitely coming to white privilege. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

Mr P UYS: Ja, we are waiting for you.

The PREMIER: I am coming to white privilege, okay. So the factor that causes poverty and inequality most, is unemployment, Madam Speaker.

Mr P UYS: It is a long day. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: A very long day. It is a long day for sure.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And I must say I support the liberal party initiative.

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Hon members, we have the hon Premier on the floor. Please afford the Premier the opportunity to respond.

The PREMIER: And in fact in any ideology the common factor for reducing poverty and inequality is to get a job.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not liberalism.

The PREMIER: And everybody understands that getting a job requires investment and economic growth. That all ideologies, even communism understand. So, the results have been quite extraordinary and the number of jobs in the City of Cape Town itself grew by 78 000 year-on-year.
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: Primarily for people with low skills because that growth was jobs in the tourist sector.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Tell us, tell us.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, sorry, can you kindly take you seat please. Hon member Dyantyi, if you wish to pose a question there is an opportunity for four follow-ups. Please do not pose a question directly but through the Chair. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Now everyone knows that the best antidote to poverty and inequality is a job and everyone also knows that you do not get investment and economic growth unless there is a capable, corruption free state and what we have been doing, Madam Speaker, over the past ten years is creating a capable state operating under the rule of law,

which is one of the reasons we react so promptly for example to reports of corruption.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh you do?

The PREMIER: And for that reason we are getting more investment and growing more jobs than anywhere else in the country and that is a direct reflection of the work we have done to reduce poverty and to reduce inequality in the Western Cape over the past ten years.

Now I am not denying that there is a thing called white privilege and that it continues... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a big thing in society.

The PREMIER: M-mmm, it is such a thing as ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: A thing?

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] It is not just a big thing!

The PREMIER: It is such a thing as ...

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ... white privilege... [Interjection.] Well, you know if you knew ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] colonialism things, they are revealing. You have just revealed yourself.

The PREMIER: I have not revealed myself at all.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore!

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, if he actually looked on all the websites that discuss these matters, people say white privilege is a thing and then they unpack it and it is usually the Woke Folk who do it.

Mr C M DUGMORE: How about in reality? How about it is a reality? Like what about that?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, if you want to direct questions to the Premier, I have provided guidance to the House.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is interjection.

The SPEAKER: Yes, but you cannot have a running commentary of an interjection, hon member Magaxa. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: There is such a thing as white privilege and it continues to exist 24 years after apartheid and despite stringent affirmative action legislation and preferential procurement, with which incidentally this Western Cape Government complies. But I also reject the denial that there has been any progress.

The middle class in South Africa, the black middle class specifically, is now considerably bigger than the white middle class which is as it should be. The problem is that the growth of the middle class has now hit a ceiling because the number of people the State employs cannot be stretched any further and has grown by a third at least and probably more than that during democracy.

So the State cannot employ any more people and now the only answer to increase the middle class is to grow the economy and simply changing the composition of the State and state-owned enterprises will not cut it. So it is very important for us to understand that when it comes to employment equity you will see that in fact the Gini coefficient, which is a measure of inequality, shows that in South Africa as a whole, inequality narrowed. One of the major contributing factors to the situation, where we have the highest level of inequality in the world, the place where it has dramatically widened, is amongst black South Africans and that is what has contributed to it.

So there is such a concept also as black privilege and we can discuss that in some detail as well but the widening gap between black Africans is what has driven the Gini coefficient as we have seen it in recent years. Statistics South

Africa said that.

Now, Madam Speaker, the tragedy is that the ANC's application of BEE and affirmative action has become one of the key drivers of inequality and poverty. The ANC's driving of affirmative action and their affirmative model has become one of the key drivers of poverty and inequality and let us look at some examples.

I spoke last week in this House about what happened at Eskom and how the price of electricity is continually increasing because of bad policy decisions and because of the cost of literally billions in the supply chain to make provision for middle men and women who add no value but make up quotas. So that is all they do and the blockage on the green economy sector that could bring prices down for everybody in order to protect the corrupt elite network and their ill-gotten gains, to meet the kind of quotas that the ANC sets for affirmative action.

So the result of the ANC's policies of affirmative action and black economic empowerment has meant that electricity for the poor is getting more and more expensive. They are cut out of green economy interventions and middle class people, who are able to afford the installations in their homes provided by the market are getting cheaper and cheaper electricity and that shows you why legalised corruption, which is what we see with Trillion, what we see with Goldfields, actually is responsible for broadening the inequality in our country and massively increasing poverty.

The DA believes very strongly in Broad-based Black Economic Empowerment but we believe it genuinely has to be broad-based and opportunity driven. We believe that the primary objective is one of dealing with inequality, not one of enriching the already advantaged and that is the fundamental difference between our approach to genuine Broad-based Black Economic Empowerment and the black elite enrichment, which really involves legalising corruption, which is what the ANC does. And we can see the consequence of the ANC's policy because we could have had economic growth all over the country in the same way we have had in the Western Cape and we could have brought down unemployment in the rest of the country as we have in the Western Cape, despite massive demographic growth, except that the opposite has happened.

Madam Speaker, I have looked at the statistics for unemployment and compared with 1994 when about 3,2 million people were unemployed we now have 9 million people unemployed under the ANC's policies. So the trajectory in the Western Cape has been to contain unemployment and bring it down despite the massive demographic growth we have faced and in the rest of the country unemployment is now up to 9 million people so you can see what we are doing about inequality and poverty. We are bringing down unemployment and the time has come to ask this question of every other Provincial Premier to find out what they are actually doing.

Let us look at some other things. We believe that economic growth and opportunity-based BEE are the best way to deal with unemployment and

poverty and many other countries are learning the same lesson. I have just read a very instructive analysis of race-based affirmative action in Malaysia, which has fundamentally failed poor people, but just like in South Africa re-enriched a small very wealthy elite, to the great detriment of the poor masses. Equally, in the United States where I have just been, the challenge is to bring the poor black community out of poverty and 50 years after introducing affirmative action and racial targets that has not happened.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You know you are answering a question, not delivering a speech hey?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly!

The PREMIER: The question, Madam Speaker, is why? [Interjection.] Now, it is very important because if you are serious about dealing with inequality and poverty you have to know why certain strategies fail and it is very important to look at the real reasons. Now I have piles and piles of research on the real reasons, but I can really summarise them here.

The key factors that keep the poor underclass poor in the United States are:

1. The collapse of family life leading to single parenthood and absent fathers and teenage pregnancies;

2. The high rates of crime;
3. Widespread alcohol and drug abuse;
4. A street culture that celebrates violence and challenges authority;
5. Bad schools and often uncaring teachers;
6. A reliance on welfare and a more general dependence on government to provide;
7. Debilitating perceptions of victimhood;
8. A mistaken reliance on affirmative action measures which generally benefit an elite while bypassing the poor.

That is the summary of the many analyses there are.

Now I think that if you look at the situation in Malaysia and the United States and increasingly, given unemployment and inequality, in South Africa, you will find that it is the same factors in all these countries and so the real question is what are we doing about such things as the collapse of family life and single parenthood. Now it is absolutely true, Madam Speaker...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We also want other MECs to answer questions.

The PREMIER: ...that the hon member Uys worked tirelessly and was indeed an elected public representative of a party that did a lot to break up family life through influx control. So it is critically important to deal with that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is not answering the question.

The PREMIER: It is answering the question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are just all over the place. Answer the question.

The PREMIER: It is answering the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are all over! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, allow me to rule on, please do not...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please, [Inaudible.] to the relevance there.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: And indeed we are trying to do our very best to re-enforce the family life.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Play the ball. [Inaudible.] Play the ball.

The PREMIER: ...and deal with single parenting. Now it is absolutely true

that when teenagers have babies and when fathers abandon their children it entrenches poverty, profoundly, and all the statistics will tell you that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is very obvious.

The PREMIER: And so we have done everything we can within our mandate to deal with that problem. Let me just give one example, Madam Speaker. If single parenting entrenches poverty, orphans are that much more vulnerable and you will recall a time not long ago where the DA Government in the Western Cape was the only one that bucked National ANC policy and ensured that people living with HIV/Aids were given antiretrovirals.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Started by the ANC in 1994 by the MEC for Health. Just to remind you, in case you did not know about that.

The PREMIER: We definitely know who started it against... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Mother and Child Programme. [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ... against the national policy that was supported. In fact South Africa has the highest HIV/Aids, the highest number of people...

An HON MEMBER: Yes we know.

The PREMIER: ...living with HIV/Aids in the world and we also have the

most comprehensive and extensive antiretroviral roll-out pioneered against ANC policy ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the same Rasool [Inaudible.] in 1994.

The PREMIER: ... in the Western Cape. And, indeed, Madam Speaker, if it was not for the DA Government ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please.

The PREMIER: ... there would be many, many more orphans in this province and many, many more single parent families.

Ms P MAKELENI: Tell more lies [Inaudible.] Premier Helen Zille.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, if you look at the other ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Premier, kindly take your seat, please. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: I heard the hon member on the other side there say: "Tell more lies." Now she must indicate whether she is ... [Interjection.] whether she is directing it towards a member of the House here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Chief Whip, I was ... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: [Inaudible.] more lies.

The SPEAKER: ... not aware of that. Would you care to point out the hon member?

Mr M G E WILEY: Say again?

The SPEAKER: Would you care to point out the hon member?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He does not even know her name.

Mr M G E WILEY: I think it was hon member Makeleni, but I stand to be corrected. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Okay. In the absence of doubt we will proceed. [Interjections.] Hon member Lekker, please compose yourself. You may proceed, Premier.

The PREMIER: So, Madam Speaker, when you look at ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...

The PREMIER: ... single parenthood ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, kindly take your seat, please, Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: May I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is the Premier's right to respond to a question but we have a Speaker in the House who needs to direct us. We are now almost 30 minutes ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: On one question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... on one question being responded to. There must be something wrong with that. You have got to direct because she has gone beyond the relevance ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She has gone beyond the relevance.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, firstly, do not point your finger and then secondly, if I could – you know what the Rules are. I am not responsible for the substance of the Premier's response.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But for the relevance you are, the relevance.

The SPEAKER: Yes, certainly ... [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] exactly how many pages she has.

The SPEAKER: Well, the Premier has obviously prepared for this question, hon member Makeleni, so I am going to allow the Premier to proceed. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I must say, Madam Speaker, that ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: ... if you compare the number of white children growing up in two parent families compared to the number of black children growing up in two parent families, it is true that white children have an enormous advantage.

Mr P UYS: Where is your Children's Commissioner?

The PREMIER: Because 80% of white children grow up in two parent families and only approximately 30% of black children do.

Ms P MAKELENI: Where is the Children's Commissioner?

Mr C M DUGMORE: She promised it in [Inaudible.][Interjection.]

The PREMIER: So that is where this white privilege certainly has a bearing.

Ms P MAKELENI: Where is the Commissioner?

The PREMIER: High rates of crime.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Ask Mr Brown Envelope, Ebrahim Rasool.

The PREMIER: Well, obviously we do not have a mandate over crime ... [Interjections.] in this province, Madam Speaker, because crime is a national mandate.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: High rates of crime and widespread alcohol and drug abuse. But the one other factor that we have a mandate over is education, but that is why it is really interesting to see, Madam Speaker, how we get opposed when we do the things in education that are aimed at bringing down the discrepancy, like holding trade unions to account, like holding teachers to account, like ensuring that all teachers do their jobs and like introducing things like collaboration schools. Those are all efforts aimed to reduce inequality and increase opportunity, and those are precisely the kinds of things that get marginalised and side-lined by the ANC. [Interjection.] If you look at how we distribute resources under the norms and standards ... [Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Hulle luister nie een nie.

[An HON MEMBER: Not one of them is listening.]

The PREMIER: ... you will see that our poorest schools get almost 12 times as much as our least ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can you email us the answer?

The PREMIER: ... poor schools. So those are the things that we are doing, Madam Speaker.

Now, in Human Settlements we work day and night. In Social Development ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Your DA caucus is not listening.

The PREMIER: ... almost all the budget ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please can you answer the question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is too much noise on both sides of the House. Can I please ask you to cooperate, the Premier is on the floor. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: In Human Settlements we would have built double the number of houses that we have built ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: 1 June.

The PREMIER: ... if it were that communities would simply cooperate with us and help us get on with the job. This morning I spent a long time with Minister Madikizela in a meeting, discussing precisely the resistance we get from communities to delivering houses for them, and it is a very important set of considerations that we need to take.

Now, Social Development as well, we spend almost 100% of our budget trying to reduce inequality and beat poverty. I cannot go into all the details there.

Now, Madam Speaker, I cannot speak for all whites at all, because I was not elected to represent a race group. I was elected to represent a set of values and principles and policies.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: So I can only speak for myself when I say that I am profoundly privileged, profoundly, and not specifically in material terms ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Let me listen.

The PREMIER: ... because my parents arrived here literally as penniless

refugees. For a reasonable part of my childhood we were poor, and I can almost say very poor, and although they managed to save enough to keep themselves in reasonable comfort until they both died at age 96, there was not, certainly not for me, any kind of significant inheritance. When my father came here, Madam Speaker, he was not allowed to work ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: This is a Natasha speech, man.

The PREMIER: He was not allowed to work because he was a German and South Africa ...

Mr P UYS: Do not copy her.

The PREMIER: ... was at war with Germany, and yet he went to fight in the South African Army against the Germans.

So why was I so privileged, Madam Speaker? I had really good and committed parents. They applied discipline and boundaries. They believed in service and personal sacrifice. [Interjection.]

They were absolutely strict on personal responsibility and deferred gratification, and thrift. No one was allowed to spend money that they did not have or did not earn, because we did not have it, and a great commitment to truth and the courage to stand up for it. In all of that both of them always stood up and did what they could to ensure that every South African had

equal rights and equal opportunities.

I do not have to go into all the challenges that my family faced, because there were lots and I do not want to be self-indulgent, because that was the worst crime in my family that you could be. There was absolute rejection of self-indulgence of any kind, because we all knew that life is unfair, but what they taught me is that consistent hard work and perseverance will get you much further in life than intelligence or talent.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The PREMIER: And I can tell you I came with that bank of values and that is unbelievable privilege. I cannot think of anyone who is more privileged than I am.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: ... in those things that really matter. [Interjection.] And it was on that basis, and on that basis every South African within one generation can get out of poverty, and that is what everybody on this side of the House is working for. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see – sorry, I see the hon member Uys and then hon member Mitchell.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, yes, hon Premier. I believe you referred to the National Party. You recall the days we sat next to each other in the Cabinet of the National Party? You recall that?

Mr M G E WILEY: She was not in the National Party.

The PREMIER: I was never [Inaudible.].

Mr P UYS: Do not pretend you were not there. [Interjections.] Do not pretend. You took those decisions, hon Premier. You were part of it. You took those decisions, you were part of it. You were only two out of 11.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Are you confessing here? [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: So do not forget it, and we can go back on that line. We can even tell you what decisions we took. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: But, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.] I would like to ask the Premier, because when she came back from Singapore – and it is relevant to this – she was on about colonialism. Now, when she got back from Quebec she is on about whiteness.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wow, wow!

Mr P UYS: You wrote that liberal whiteness article, nothing better than that.

The SPEAKER: It is a follow-up question.

Mr P UYS: But, Madam Speaker ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, he is going there. He is also taking the long route.

Today is the long route theme.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: ... I want to say this ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... please assist your member who is on the floor. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: You must be a bit tolerant ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am listening to your ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: ... and sometimes you will watch what is happening at National

Assembly as well. There is a lead to a question and then you ask your question. [Interjections.] But let me get to the question, Madam Speaker.

Hon Premier, you did not refer to how you would confront white privilege and black poverty. The budget is just this big, so somehow you must explain to us, and this is part of the question, how that will shift? You cannot just create something in the middle, in-between, there must be a shift, and then I want to ask you the following ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hayi, listen!

Mr P UYS: I want to ask you the following; the measures you have taken in the Western Cape – and we did not hear now on inequality – do you agree with your leader, because you have been referring to the DA, although you are not allowed to speak on their behalf? You referred to the DA where the leader of the DA said the only measure for inequality is race, and I want to ask you do you agree with that? He said there is no other way to measure it, not even salary, not income, as you tried to reflect on to today.

So your position is a very clear difference to that of the DA, so please, Premier, I do not think you can speak as the DA.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the hon the Premier.

Mr M G E WILEY: She spoke about herself.

The PREMIER: I certainly cannot ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Oh yes, it is herself. Okay, sorry.

The PREMIER: I would like to be protected, Madam Speaker, so that I can actually answer ...

The SPEAKER: I will afford you the protection.

The PREMIER: ... what I will try to turn into a question. The bottom line is that MEC Koornhof, who had abandoned the NP in disgust, was the DP's MEC for Health at the time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I know that.

The PREMIER: And he drove the decisions and he made the decisions, because we were not answerable to Premier Morkel, we were answerable to the leader of the DP, Hennie Bester, at the time, and that was fundamental to the coalition agreement. [Interjection.] And that is true. So that is the first point.

But, I must also congratulate the hon member Uys. He has managed to be a member and public representative of two parties that have really driven inequality and poverty ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!

The PREMIER: ... amongst the poorest in this country. [Interjections.] Quite extraordinary. He managed to come from one political party that did it, and he is now ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Well done!

The PREMIER: ... in the second political party that is doing it. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The ball is in front of you, deal with it. Get back on the ball. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Where is he going next?

Mr M G E WILEY: Fit for purpose.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is going nowhere near next.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, we have hon members in the House. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Premier, the hon Premier is going nowhere next.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I am going to my next point next.

Mr P UYS: My question or point?

The PREMIER: Thank you. The hon member Uys is quite right, the budget is only so big and the biggest budget item is Health, and we spend well over 90% of the Health budget on health services for the poor, and most of the DSD budget, the Department of Social Development, I think 100% of that budget is spent on services for the poor.

And in Education, while we provide public education across the board, middle-class people massively subsidise and cross-subsidise education for the poor. The norms and standards funding, as I said, is almost 12 times greater for our poorer schools than our least poor schools. [Interjection.] It is absolutely true.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I am sure it is.

The PREMIER: And in fact, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: She says 12 ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I said almost.

Mr P UYS: Almost [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: And, Madam Speaker, the work that we are doing to ensure improvement in quality, in schools for poor learners, is massive, including getting tens of millions of rands in donations to help us fix some of the worst of those schools.

The R3 billion in Broadband and e-Learning that we are putting in, we would not have to do for the middle-class schools, because they all have their tablets and they all have their private sector providers. We are doing that for the poor, Madam Speaker.

So our budget is overwhelmingly and quite correctly skewed to the poor, but as the hon member Uys says, there is only so much budget. Our Department of Human Settlements' budget is 100% directed to the poor, but there is only so much budget and in the end the only way to deal with that is to grow the economy and get people into jobs, and anybody in South Africa who does that knows that we have got a tiny, narrow tax space of 13% of our population. We have got 7 million personal registered taxpayers and we have 17 million grant recipients. There is only so much you can do.

So the critical thing to bring down poverty and to bring down inequality is to grow the economy and create more jobs, and the only way governments can

do that is by creating a capable state under the rule of law, and creating an environment for investors to invest and keep their money in here and expand their businesses, and that is what we are doing better than any other province.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The PREMIER: As for race being a marker of inequality, well, that is how Statistics SA measures it, and that is why we know, on the basis of the Gini coefficient, on a racial basis, that the inequality between wealthy black South Africans and the poorest black South Africans is really what is driving the upward spiral of the Gini coefficient. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi daai [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw those [Inaudible.]]

Mr D G MITCHELL: I just want to ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi [Onhoorbaar.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw [Inaudible.].]

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... start off by saying thank you, Premier, for your

commitment to building an inclusive Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ha-ha!

Mr D G MITCHELL: I think years from ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are really wishing.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... years from today when you will not be here and I will still be here ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You will still be here?

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... we will honour that commitment.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are talking [Inaudible.].

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you very much.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are right, she will not be here.

Mr D G MITCHELL: But I want to ask the Premier ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Madam Speaker, I want to ask ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are so right.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... the Premier that how can the empowerment of young people and the youth, especially the rural youth, contribute to address the inequalities that are still currently faced in this province?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Madam Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It looks like a caucus question, but it is fine.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, hon members. I am going to move to Rule 44, so please, let us cooperate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not so quick. Not so quick.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, we have got a potential great dividend and a potential great burden. We have got lots and lots of young people, and the great dividend of countries with young populations is that if they have skills and entrepreneurial drive, you really propel that country forward. In Quebec, for example, they have got massive economic growth and they are worried that they will not have enough people, so they are requiring people and putting incentives in to have more babies.

In South Africa we have got very low economic growth and lots of and lots of young people, and so unless we can change that particular downward spiral into ensuring that our young people are drivers of growth and drivers of opportunity, we are in deep trouble, and that is why this Government is doing almost everything it can to ensure that young people become an advantage and an opportunity for South Africa as a whole, and that is why four of our Game-Changers are directed at the youth.

Broadband is essential for everyone, but primarily for getting young people connected and preparing them for the economy of the future, so our e-Learning Game-Changer is pivotal to that. All the skills and opportunities in our After-Schools Game-changer is pivotal to that. Our Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-Changer is trying to get young people out of the vicious spiral of becoming dependent on alcohol for recreation early on in life.

Mr C M DUGMORE: So you want to sell it at schools?

An HON MEMBER: Just his starting again.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, *jirre*. You know.

The PREMIER: I cannot work out which school we might want to be selling alcohol at, but obviously hon member Dugmore knows more than any of us on this side of the House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The PREMIER: Such ignorance is really hardly worth worrying about.

[Interjections.]

Now, Madam Speaker, the Alcohol Harms Reduction, the After-Schools Game-Changer, the e-Learning Game-Changer, the Broadband and the Apprentice Game-Changer are absolutely critical to getting young people into work, and if we can do all of those things we will turn what could potentially be a burden of angry, alienated young people into a talented workforce that can really build the country of the future. Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Well done.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Hon Premier, why did you keep on saying “to confront inequality”? You do not have to confront inequality between white privilege and black poverty, but between black people themselves, and that is what you have been saying. You say there is a growing group and there is a poor group. Why do you not want to admit there has been white privilege? Why not?

The PREMIER: I said there is white privilege. Of course I said there is white privilege.

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: Well, you see ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members. Kindly direct your questions through the Chair.

The PREMIER: There is white privilege of course. I mean if 80% of white kids are growing up in two parent families and only 30% of black kids are growing up in two parent families, that is your start of the division right there.

Mr P UYS: Now you put the blame on the number of children, now you are blaming it on that.

The PREMIER: Not on the number of children. I am not blaming anyone for the number of children. I am saying that that is the root cause of the division between white ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] children?

The PREMIER: Mmm? I am not talking about the number of children, for goodness sake. I am not even mentioning ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: [Inaudible.] the number of children.

The PREMIER: I am not even alluding to the number of children, I am talking about the number of parents.

Mr P UYS: You said children.

The SPEAKER: Premier, kindly take your seat, please. Chief Whip.

The PREMIER: I am talking about the number of parents.

Mr P UYS: You said children.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, would you take your seat, please.

Mr P UYS: You said children.

Mr D JOSEPH: Hon member Uys is misleading the House.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I address you please?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

Mr M G E WILEY: This is the way malicious rumours start.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: No, no.

Mr M G E WILEY: Where the Premier has not said that. [Interjections.] What hon member Uys has accused her of doing and he has repeated it and repeated it, trying to get her to say it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Check the Hansard.

Mr M G E WILEY: She has not said what he has said.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Check the Hansard.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you.

The PREMIER: I definitely did not say that. I said 80% ... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

The PREMIER: ... 80% of white children grow up with two parents.

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The PREMIER: That is the only number I ...

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

The PREMIER: ... mentioned.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Listen carefully.

Mr M G E WILEY: What have the children got to do with it? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Can we get some composure here, please? You may proceed, Premier.

The PREMIER: I gave a long list of the real reasons in countries that have had affirmative action for many, many decades ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You do not like [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: ... as to why poverty endures and inequality endures. I gave that list. The hon member Uys does not like the real reasons, and I have explained what we are trying to do about that. We have tried to keep people alive with antiretrovirals so that they can parent their children, while the ANC's policy was not to give out antiretrovirals.

Mr P UYS: That is not true.

The PREMIER: We are trying to make sure ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: That is not true.

The PREMIER: We are trying to make sure that children get opportunities in the growing economy, and I have spelt out how we are doing that in Education and our Game-Changers. I have spent all this time trying to explain what we are trying to do to eradicate inequality and poverty, driven both by the National Party and the ANC, and this Government is doing its best to overcome it where we govern, and we are doing far better on every measure than any other part of the country. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: This is the final follow-up, thank you.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Premier, what steps have been taken to reduce the Gini coefficient in the Western Cape?

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar kom dit [Onhoorbaar.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There it comes [Inaudible.].]

The PREMIER: Well, the critical thing that you have to do to reduce the Gini coefficient is get people into jobs. That is the critical thing you have to do to reduce the Gini coefficient, and that is why we are the least unequal

province, because we have got more people into jobs. It is as easy as this. We ignore the rich people and we ignore the middle-classes, they look after themselves. They pay for their health, they pay for their education, they pay for their safety, they pay for everything on their own, and they pay their taxes so that we can help the poor and spend 100% of our Health budget on the poor, 100% of our Department of Social Development budget on the poor, 100% of our Human Settlements budget on the poor, all of our strategies on the poor. [Interjection.]

That is why we do that. And the bottom line is ... [Interjection.] that when you create more jobs, Madam Speaker, you reduce inequality. If I can just take the hon member through, that out of 165,000 jobs created in South Africa from the beginning of 2017 to the beginning of 2018, 123,000 were in one province alone, the Western Cape. That is what we do. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the first question. I now move to Question 2. Hon members, there is too much noise and engaging across the floor. Can we do that after the sitting? The next question is the hon member Uys to the hon the Minister of Finance, Minister Meyer. Sorry, am I correct?

An HON MEMBER: Minister Madikizela.

The SPEAKER: My Order Paper, my Question Paper has ... [Interjections.]
Am I correct? It is the hon member ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are correct, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are. He is not the Speaker, I know.

The SPEAKER: And I [Inaudible.] you, hon member Dyantyi. [Laughter.] I see the hon the Minister of Finance.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 17 May 2018, as agreed to by the House:

Municipalities: capital expenditure

***3. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Finance:**

Whether he monitors the capital expenditure of municipalities; if so, what is he doing about the underspending by the City of Cape Town?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The answer is, yes ... [Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: *Check hom nou, hoor.*

[An HON MEMBER: Check him now, hey.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... my Department does monitor the spending

of capital budgets by municipalities and it is monitored specifically in terms of Section 71, of the monitoring process.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the chair.]

The Provincial Treasury also administers the following transversal projects to address the underspending of budgets.

- There is the monitoring of the top 10 capital projects per municipality.
- In addition there is the development of the Western Cape Supplier Database and related interface with the Central Supplier Database to assist municipalities with awarding of tenders and prevent the awards to people in the service of the State.
- In addition we also have the supply chain management and asset management information as an assessment tool to also monitor the capital spending of the City of Cape Town but also the other 30 municipalities.
- In addition we have the local economic development and supply chain management district engagements, specifically also focusing on infrastructure development.
- We also have accredited municipal budget cash flow, asset and supply chain management training for all the municipalities, that is done through the universities.

Also, Mr Deputy Speaker, there was a Local Government MTEC engagement

with the City of Cape Town on 24 April, and I also personally attended that particular meeting, and more concerted efforts are required to accelerate capital spending, noting that the City has implemented a project portfolio model which compels a planning methodology.

Do not worry, hon member Uys, I will not read this full pack, but it is available for you to read after this session. It is quite extensive, but I will not read this full pack of minutes, but I am happy to do so if you require me to do so.

Capital spend is also monitored on a weekly basis at a high level by the executive management team, that is my senior management team, between us and the City of Cape Town, specifically with the senior managers and the CFO. The capital spending is also closely monitored by the accounting officer through monthly meetings with his executive directors in the City of Cape Town.

This was quite an extensive meeting that we had with the City of Cape Town. We looked at the capital budget for the next five years specifically, and also specifically we have looked at whether the City of Cape Town, in the capital budget, have reprioritised the capital budget in the context of the current drought that we have seen. I am pleased to report, Mr Deputy Speaker, to this House that of the top ten capital infrastructure projects, eight of those projects have been reprioritised to deal with issues of the drought. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you, MEC, for that response. MEC, you referred to your monitoring and you showed a thick document there, but all of that is not helping at all, because we do not see the results, and I want to ask you specifically ... [Interjections.] in the Western Cape, after the third quarter, municipalities were supposed to spend 75%. All of the municipalities in the Western Cape only spent 40% ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

Mr P UYS: ... and the City of Cape Town only 39% of the total capital budget. So all of those words, the monitoring, the thick documents ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar's hy!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!]

Mr P UYS: ... are not helping.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Awareness!

Mr P UYS: What are you really doing?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just plans, plans, plans. That is what they do.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS: [Inaudible.] is part of the success.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... what we are doing, the hon member knows, as a former MEC for Local Government, he knows fully well ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why he is helping you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why he is helping you.

Mr P UYS: Not knowing anything.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I do not need his help.

Mr P UYS: No [Inaudible.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You need help!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You are the last one whose help I will need.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, in terms of the lifespan, the hon member knows very well, he is a learned scholar, he knows that in terms of the lifespan of capital projects ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... this LG MTEC assessment that we have dealt with covers the capital budget over a five year period. The hon member is fully aware that many of these capital projects are multi-year projects. Implying that you start with the first year, you start with the feasibility study, you start with the development in the second year sometimes, and eventually in year three or four or five, the real capital work starts. The hon member is also fully aware ... [Interjection.] that you never ... [Interjection.] The hon member knows that countrywide ... [Interjection.]

The hon member can look at the National Treasury statistics ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: No, but it is not Western Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and see that this is not ...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Terug huis toe.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Going back home.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... a sign that we are not spending.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I have the figures here.

Mr P UYS: 40%.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No. The hon member knows very well ...

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that it is not always possible to have in the third quarter that he is talking about, 75% expenditure on the capital project, that is not the benchmark. No municipality in the country has that particular indication. [Interjection.]

So he knows that very well. What we are seeing, Mr Deputy Speaker, is we are monitoring the cash flow management, we are monitoring the tenders, we

are monitoring the implementation.

The hon member is also aware that in some cases ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question. Stop [Inaudible.].

Mr L J BOTHA: No man!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dyantyi, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The hon member is also aware that what sometimes happen, if a contract, for example, is cancelled, a contractor gets, goes under, then you cannot spend, but unlike in the ANC provinces ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ah.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... when a contract is bankrupt, they still pay the contractor. [Interjections.] We do not do that in this Western Cape Province, because we do proper cash flow, but let us get down to the basics of the situation. [Interjections.]

When there are certain issues of gross underspending, we are reporting it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Like Cape Town.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We are reporting that particular underspending, we engage with the particular municipality, we ask specific questions about the specific things. But, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have seen and I am satisfied that 90 ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: With 39%? You are satisfied?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In the previous financial year, Mr Deputy Speaker, we assessed, at the end of the financial year, the full scale of the capital budget spending trend in the City of Cape Town, and I am glad to mention that there was a 7% variance, and there was a 92% expenditure in that specific 12 month cycle.

So in short, I am satisfied that the measures that we put in place, with a 7% variance and 92% spending trend, that that is the best record of all the metros in the country.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: 39%. Wow!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys and then I will get back to hon member Joseph.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is serious and the MEC is not answering it. If you get a municipality like the City of Cape Town spending 39% of their capital expenditure ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And you are satisfied.

Mr P UYS: ... and the total expenditure on capital – I mean, it is not even happening here in province – 40%. Mr Deputy Speaker, the MEC must explain to us. You get a municipality like the Eden District Municipality that is on 18% after the third quarter, when they are supposed to spend 75%. You get Cederberg on 20% ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: ... and now this big municipality of ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, just get to your question please.

Mr P UYS: Yes. Please explain it. It is not enough to say you are monitoring this. What are you really doing to spend it? Reprioritisation is not helping. There has been an IDP, you must spend the money where the people say it must be allocated.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have before me the City's 2016/17 annual financial statements.

Mr P UYS: I am talking about this year.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: 2016.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This current year is not yet completed, because this shows in the process.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh no!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, because we are looking at the trend, the capital budget that was approved in 2016/17 is R6,3 billion ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The capital budget actually was R5,9 billion. There was a 92% spending on the benchmark. Mr Deputy Speaker, that hon member was a MEC.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, I know that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So he should be familiar with what the benchmarking exercise ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is why we are asking this question.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... is in the current financial year.

So for the end of this financial year the benchmark that we now have to meet in terms of capital expenditure trend is 92%. 92, in fact 93%. I want to see a 94% spending on capital budget in this financial year that we are currently in.

So the hon member asked about that specific trend of the capital budget. I am quite satisfied that the measures that we have put in place, the commitments that the City of Cape Town has made, they will be able to achieve that specific spending benchmark that we have put in place, and with the 7% variance, not entirely my specific expectations, but I am quite satisfied that the measures the Provincial Treasury is putting in place through the Section 71 reports, we will make sure that the spending patterns of the City of Cape Town do improve.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ai, shame. [Inaudible.].

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Help tog daar! Help tog daar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please help there! Please help there.]

†Mnr P UYS: Hy kan nie help nie, man.

[Mr P UYS: He cannot help, man.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, if the ANC can only help the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D JOSEPH: ... in the other provinces, the country would be in a better place. The country would be in a better place! [Interjections.]

Hon Minister, approaching the financial year, please tell us about the meetings between yourself and the City of Cape Town, and the Provincial Treasury with the City of Cape Town, in approaching the financial year, how this underspending will be managed. [Interjections.] Thank you, Minister.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are asking the [Inaudible.] themselves. Yoh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon member Joseph. We have regular interactions between the City of Cape Town. I have also specifically, Mr Deputy Speaker, met with the Mayco member of finance in the municipality of the City of Cape Town, to deal with that specific matter ... [Interjection.] I have also ... [Interjections.] Both Minister Madikizela and myself are also involved ... [Interjections.] and specifically engage the City – because one of the underspending ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Leave Madikizela out of that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No. [Interjections.] – no-no-no ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr D JOSEPH: Listen.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You see, your party does not work as a collective. [Interjections.] You work on individualism. [Interjections.]

So that is why Magaxa is not here. [Interjections.] This is why ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Tell them, Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That was on his own. [Interjections.] That was on his own.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Tyatyam is on his own, hon member Lekker does not even know where she is coming from. [Interjections.] They have no clue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order!

An HON MEMBER: You can only joke around, MEC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, I am not joking. This is a collective government, we take collective responsibility and there is a problem. [Interjections.] Hon member, let me ... [Interjection.]

No, because you are a serious man I will talk to you. You are a serious person. [Interjections.] Let me be serious.

An HON MEMBER: Account to Parliament.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will account to you.

An HON MEMBER: To Parliament.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: [Inaudible.] because you work individually. You are not ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay, I will do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister Meyer, just one second.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, there are some issues that are currently being dealt with. Minister Madikizela and I are looking at this underspending, for example, specifically about the USDG grant. It is a matter of concern because it impacts poor people, and I have looked at these figures this morning. It is in the region of R1,3 billion and R1,4 billion for next year. These are serious matters ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] municipalities.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and for this specific – the question was from hon member Joseph, what other plans are in place? We are now setting up the next inter-governmental coordinating committee where this matter will also be discussed and Minister Madikizela is in constant contact about the underspending on the USDG grant.

However this morning, Mr Deputy Speaker, I also had the privilege of looking ... [Interjection.] I also noted the spike ... [Interjections.]

C M DUGMORE: Writing lots of letters.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: At the end of the fourth quarter there was a massive spike in the Human Settlement Development grant of the City of Cape Town.

So we are monitoring it almost on a daily basis, the current spending patterns, specifically as it relates to infrastructure, because this Cabinet ... [Interjection.] Minister Alan Winde ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: They have stopped listening.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Minister Donald Grant, Minister Anton Bredell and Minister Madikizela, are part of PSG 1 where they have prioritised infrastructure-led growth, and since 67% of the Budget of this Government finds its way in the geographical space of the City of Cape Town, through what we call the space of budgeting, we are specifically zooming into that and I am thankful for the work that my colleague, Minister Donald Grant ... [Interjection.] is doing in that specific space.

Infrastructure-led growth is a priority of this Government and part of that priority is we are looking in detail, in this week, if the hon member Joseph wants to know, we had this meeting four days ago, on Monday, where we again looked specifically into the infrastructure-led growth. We are determined to make sure that the infrastructure budget is on the increase, but also, Mr Deputy Speaker, I have also looked this morning at what that means on infrastructure?

I looked specifically at the purchasing of new infrastructure, I have looked at repairs and maintenance, I have also looked at, Minister Grant, specifically, the resealing of the tar roads, because for us ... [Interjection.] those things are very important – about infrastructure spending. I am particularly happy that the infrastructure spending and the infrastructure-led growth of this Government is intact. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, we have also spoken to all of the 30 municipalities. We have also spoken to the hon member Denis Joseph and to the 30 Mayco members of Finance, to specifically zoom into infrastructure-led growth strategies.

Two weeks ago, I went to the Central Karoo and I have asked the district mayor and all the local mayors to please make sure of the top 10 infrastructure projects, that they keep in the book; we gave them a map of where these infrastructure-led projects are, the amounts, and we have asked them also to assist this Government ... [Interjection.] in oversight over that infrastructure.

So I think, hon member Joseph, the systems are in place, but I am happy to report no system is perfect. If there is anything that we need to improve we are happy to learn because we govern with humility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys, the last opportunity?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The MEC referred to the 10 priority or 10 top projects. The question related to the City of Cape Town and can the MEC please tell us where is the lowest spending in the top 10 priority programmes within the City of Cape Town?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He would not know that, no.

Mr P UYS: Well, he referred ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, no, he would not know.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Uys, as I indicated to you and I am happy to come back with a detailed answer ... [Interjection.] because I want to be factual. [Interjections.] No-no-no, you do not have to worry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I want to be factually correct. I am not like Zuma that just shoots from the hip. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member, that is a question that I am happy to come back with an answer, but I am happy to give the context, and I will come back ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: When you come back.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am happy to come back.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: When you come back.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have seen now that of the top 10 infrastructure projects, eight of those projects relate specifically to the drought and the water crisis. I would be very happy to come back to this House, to give the hard figures.

The hon member is also a member of the Standing Committee on Finance and he is also a member of the Budget Committee.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Of course!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE. You are most welcome ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So what are you saying?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... to ask that particular question. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question. New questions. First one hon member Uys to Minister Meyer again. Minister Meyer, Question

2 under new questions.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And you must know the answer to that.

New questions

City of Cape Town: money owed to

***2. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Finance:**

(a) What outstanding amount of money is owed to the City of Cape Town and (b) what caused the situation?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member, thank you for this question about the outstanding amount of money that is owed to the City of Cape Town.

At 31 March, we published through the *Provincial Government Extraordinary Gazette* in this House, dated 30 April 2018, that the total outstanding debtors owed to the City of Cape Town amounts to:

- R9,6 billion of which households owe R7,4 billion, which is 81,7%.
- The organs of state owe R27,98 million, that is 0,3%.
- Commercial consumers owe R1,7 billion, which is 19,2%, which is R1,7 billion.

- And other consumer debtors reflect a credit balance of R116,5 million, a 1,3%.

So those are the total amounts owed to the City of Cape Town.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The MEC just said that in Cape Town the debt owed is R9,6 billion, and I would like to ask what measures did they and also the City of Cape Town put in place to actually curtail this, seeing that, just looking at the municipalities in the Western Cape, there was a growth, in one quarter, of 7% of debt. So what would that project over a year of growing debt? It cannot continue like that, something must happen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a valid point [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But Zuma caused it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a pointed question.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. What we have done, we did debtors age analysis by income source, we also did a debt

analysis by customer group and we have seen that of the total of the debt - and we specifically looked at the debt by age - 27,3% falls within the 0 to 30 days category, what is also known as current debtors. 2,6% falls within the 31 to 60 days, in other words one to two months category, and 2,9% falls within the two months to three months, that is 61 to 90 days category, and 67,2% falls within the 90 days category.

Now the most significant income sources contributing to the total debt are at the moment in the City of Cape Town, and we are in discussions with them about this, the water services ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is all you do, discussions, discussions.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and property rates.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is all you do.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We also, the hon members will know that we respect the separation of powers ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... but we facilitate through cooperative governance, also in these specific matters. This is also a matter that is of

concern to this Cabinet. It is also of concern to the national landscape in South Africa, and so we must not treat this as if it is just a specific Western Cape issue. We will have to address ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are here.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... this within the national situation and I am particularly concerned about the situation. The question may be what caused this situation? That is the real question, and the deteriorating current state and the outlook of South Africa and the sub-regional economies, as expressed by both the National and the Provincial Treasury medium-term budget policy statement, hon members, coupled with the increase; the Premier also gave earlier a context of the increase of unemployment levels and the rise of poor people, specifically the 9 million unemployed people that she has alluded to, the access to free basic services such as water, electricity, refuse collection, sanitation, necessitating municipalities to widen their indigent support. It does not favour revenue optimisation and debt initiatives in municipalities.

The City of Cape Town, however, does have a debt management policy and strategies in place and are exploring various initiatives and fiscal efforts to ensure improved collection of revenue. In this regard the arrears confined in the various stages of implementation: the credit control procedures, for example, the classification of the indigent debt, which will be written off pending the installation of water management devices; the evaluation of [Inaudible.] arrangements; debt handed over to attorneys; deceased estates,

Section 118 transfers and Article 74 admin orders are excluded. The arrears open for collection amount to R1,18 billion.

Also, hon members, I think this is a particular serious matter for concern, and one of the things that this Cabinet has done, hon member Joseph as well, we have asked that the Western Cape Government not contribute to the increase of the debt of municipalities, because we are also using the services of municipalities: our schools, our hospitals, our clinics, we use water, we use electricity, we use refuse collection and we pay property tax.

Minister Grant, thank you for the great work that your Committee is doing, because we are paying our debt that we owe to municipalities. You cannot have a capable state by owing money to other municipalities for services that you have.

I have seen some trends and I am particularly happy, Minister Grant, that we are trying our best to make sure that there is fiscal stability within the City of Cape Town relating to that.

It is also our responsibility to make sure that we continue to engage with the municipality, because if municipalities fail in South Africa, South Africa will fail.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph first and then I will come to hon member Uys.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Minister for the answer. If I hear the amount of R9,6 billion it is concerning. Towards the end of his previous answer the Minister spoke about the Cabinet and Government, so I would like to ask are there any Government departments who owe money to the municipality? And if there are, could the Minister provide us with a list and those amounts? Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As a capable state ask the Province who is owing. Just go straight.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member Denis Joseph, thank you very much. I will combine your question with the interjection.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief [Onhoorbaar.].

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please [Inaudible.].]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Because I think the two things will ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! It is actually a running commentary,

hon member Dyantyi, please, contain yourself now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon member, thank you for that question. Hon Chief Whip, I think this might also be of interest to you and to hon member Mngasela, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Local Government.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] wake him up.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have also ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are sleeping.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have a thing called debt to municipalities, owed by each province, and, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is a shocking state of affairs. If you just look at debt owed to municipalities by provincial governments, if you look, for example, at the Eastern Cape, half a billion rand. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talk about the Western Cape. R9 billion is here.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Okay. The question was other provinces. He asked for comparative figures.

So, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Free State debt owed to municipalities, a billion

rand.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can you give us evidence of this now [Inaudible.]?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Gauteng owes R300 million to municipalities, KwaZulu Natal, hon Chief Whip, owes municipalities – this is the Provincial Government – R700 million ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister Meyer, just one second. Hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I address you, Mr Deputy Speaker? The question is very specific: what outstanding amount of monies are owed to the City of Cape Town. This is what ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi. There was a follow-up question. The Minister is responding to the supplementary question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But I am asking you to intervene on relevance. We are not even in the province, we are outside of Cape Town.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That cannot be. We must come here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have ruled on that one. The Minister may proceed. There was a question on that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am responding to ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Kom huis toe, kom huis toe.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come home, come home.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... a question from the hon member Joseph, and he asked for the comparative figures, how many provinces owe money to municipalities.

Mr P UYS: Tell us what is happening here.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will tell you what is happening here, because you will be shocked. †Jy sal skaam raak. [You will be ashamed.]

Mr P UYS: I know what is happening here. I know exactly.

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Jy gaan skaam raak, Pierre, moenie nou vra nie.

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You will be ashamed, Pierre, do not ask now.]

†Mnr P UYS: Nee, ek weet presies ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr P UYS: No, I know exactly ... [Interjection.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Jy, Pierre, jy gaan skaam raak.

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You, Pierre, you are going to be ashamed.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle doen niks nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are doing nothing.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In the Eastern Cape R472 million from the Provincial Government is owed to municipalities, so they are not paying their bills, that is what it means. In the Free State it is a billion rand, they are not – that is why the Free State is falling apart, because the Provincial Government ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is R9 billion here just for the City of Cape Town.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... gets services but they are not paying their services. In Gauteng, R300 million. And if you want to know about Emfuleni and many of these municipalities, the ANC Mayors get arrested. That is why they are in jail. It is a result of stealing this money ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you coming to George now?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... that is why they cannot pay this.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That sounds like George.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In KwaZulu Natal the Provincial Government owes the municipalities R713 million, hon member Joseph. Limpopo is a little bit better. Mpumalanga R90 ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the amount in Limpopo?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Well, it is a lot.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: How much is a little bit better?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Well ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are running away now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is not better.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well, mention it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: R167 ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... million. It is not better. Northern Cape

R700 million. This is money that is not in the books, this is money that municipalities have to write off. This is money ... [Interjection.] that they do not owe, this is less services. This is why the provincial governments of those provinces are now going to switch off the lights of the municipalities so that they will be in the dark. I hope that does not happen, because they like to steal in the dark. [Interjections.].

Also, North West. North West is R371 million. Now I come to the Western Cape, Pierre Uys, because you asked.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The R9 billion, tell us [Inaudible.].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In the Western Cape, as he has seen himself, because the National Treasury made the presentation in this Chamber, he has seen those figures.

An HON MEMBER: Was he present?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is minus R49 million, and this means it is money that municipalities owe to the Western Cape Government, because Minister Grant has put measures in place that we have a proper payment system and a payment schedule and a verification of the various invoices.

So we are the only province that have fully paid those municipalities and he has seen those figures, and he is trying to test us, but he failed.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I did not ask that question, but you tried to respond on why people do not pay. Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like the MEC to answer to that, because it is very clear and it was stated by the City of Cape Town, businesses simply refuse to pay, and let me add to that, because they do not trust the DA in the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.] That is what is happening, and the question now, hon – wait, wait ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sit down, sit down.

Mr P UYS: Wait. I am busy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister.

Mr P UYS: I am busy, man.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The question is still coming.

Mr P UYS: The question, Mr Deputy Speaker, is, what are you doing about the thousand largest debtors in the City of Cape Town that is business and sectional title development? The thousand highest debtors ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr P UYS: ... that is business and sectional titles. You are doing nothing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Meyer to respond.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because it is white privilege. [Interjections.]

†Mnr P UYS: Nou maar *answer* dit man, jy ken dit mos. Jy is vier jaar onder [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr P UYS: But now answer it man, you know it. You have been four years under [Inaudible.].]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Nee-nee-nee, wag, wag, wag, wag. Jy is ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No-no-no, wait, wait, wait, wait. You are... [Interjection.]]

†n AGB LID: Stadig nou.

[An HON MEMBER: Hold on now.]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Jy raak nou voorbarig, Pierre, hang aan.

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You are getting ahead of yourself now, Pierre, hold on.] †Just a minute, I have that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, he is looking for it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Just a minute, Pierre, I will get to that. I have those figures here now. Yes, the commercial. I think, Mr Deputy Speaker, that the impression that the hon member wants to give this House, in the quantum and in the scale, in the depth and the magnitude of it, it is still excessive. It is R1,76 billion, but I have given an indication of the commercial and the consumers that owe the City of Cape Town.

I am confident that the City of Cape Town has put measures in place, but of households, I indicated it is 81,7%, the organs of state are 0,3% and I agree 19,2% is too high, but I am confident and satisfied that they put systems in place to deal with these specific matters, and I will also, on a regular basis, monitor commercial consumers in this specific regard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on to the next question? Which is Question 3. Hon member Schäfer to Minister Winde. Minister Winde.

Youth: skills mismatch

3. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

How does his Department deal with the skills mismatch, the gap between an individual's job skills and the demands of the job market, of the

youth in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and the question around the mismatch of skills is a very, very important one, specifically one that we focus on in the province, but also a very, very important one for South Africa.

For me the big numbers that stand out and we know we always talk about the youth unemployment problem in our country. Of all of the unemployed in our country, 7% are graduates, and that means there has been a wrong choice or a mismatch. And of course that then filters down from graduates down to vocational and technical training, and it just carries on through the system.

We need to be addressing this specific issue of mismatch of skills or finding out what the demand is, and of course that is what we say within PSG 1, we need to be demand-led.

I think the Premier spent a bit of time talking about the province and the work that we do in trying to make sure that the demand is being fed by the correct skills, and of course nothing stands out more than the latest jobs numbers that the Premier spoke about.

So of course, as she mentioned, in the last quarter report, 165,000 jobs were created in South Africa. 123,000 of the 165,000 are in the province. As I

normally say I always like to gauge myself against the Gauteng Province, and there, where they are 35% of South Africa's economy, they lost 124,000 jobs in the same period, and of course – so what is it that we do?

We have got to make sure that we engage with the economy in trying to establish what that demand is in a number of those arenas, one of them being the Apprenticeship Game-Changer. We really had a look at what the lack of sufficient skills was around artisanal skills and we are getting closer to 60 years old now, which is the average age of an artisan, and that is where we see a massive gap. Of course that is why we set up the Apprenticeship Game-Changer, making sure that we focus in this arena, making sure that we try to correct one of the biggest mistakes, I think, we made around skills in our country post '94, where we said we will do away with apprenticeships and that our FET Colleges are going to be able to make sure that we produce the correct skills. We have to bring back the business partnerships with our colleges and that is the work that we are doing in that apprenticeship Game-Changer or artisanal development, and of course we put a fair amount of focus on there for the 2018/19 year. We have got 13 million focused on it and we have got almost 500 artisanal candidates that are currently at host companies, obtaining their portfolio of evidence and we pay a stipend towards this process to try and influence an outcome.

We also do industry training and there we looked at business analysts and we have been doing this for a while now. 135 unemployed graduates are going into the programme and we are doing that in partnership with business again.

We have got R3,9 million allocated in 2017/18 and then 2018/19, R2,5 million and that is the allocation to rejig some of those qualifications that are also going, specifically, into ICT and tech companies.

We also, to fill that gap in the demand, work with software companies and we have got the schools Java Project, 300 students currently in Grade 11 in that project, in 10 schools in the province. There I must really say to capacity to the City, the Cape IT Initiative, thank you very much for the partnership that they have with us as a province to make sure that we are influencing the supply side into what the demands are of the economy.

And then we go on to our industrial programme up the West Coast, identifying where those demands lie and then partnering with our FET Colleges up the West Coast and making sure that we are filling that. We can go on to talking about how we affect changes within the Khulisa space, that is hospitality, agri-processing, the block men specifically, ICT and Tech. So, we have a number of initiatives there and then of course there is the Work and Skills Programme that we continue to be in partnership with businesses, making sure that the work placement program is in place.

We allocate R8 million for the 2018/19 year to meet the demand and at the moment we have just facilitated 624 jobs and placed 2 222 learners at host companies across the province. And of course, that can only happen if there is demand, because that is how you will build that partnership.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. To the Minister: well, I appreciate the current programs that you are doing because you are looking very much at the present demand and the present need, but Minister, what about skills absolence? When in other words, Government and education institutions training up skills that will ultimately not be relevant in the future. How are you planning to bridge that gap?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is a very relevant question, specifically considering how the world is changing at the moment around jobs and specifically the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

We will be releasing very shortly the study that we have been involved with between the Department of Agriculture and Stellenbosch University, having a look at what the Fourth Industrial Revolution means for us as a region and then of course, then that starts to get us to change those processes, those different curricula that are in our colleges and in our universities, to start aligning that sector.

We will be following it through with some of our other Khulisa sectors. Then perhaps also just to say that it is interesting, we have just had a contact from Harvard University who wants to come out and see us. They have actually now put Khulisa as one of their industrial policy modules and they

are going to come and talk to us about it.

So, we are going to influence not only our own education space on what the demand is and what the new jobs within those sectors are going to be, but we are seeing international universities also interested in what we are doing here, and I am sure that is also going to help us get that alignment right.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thanks you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, do you think that our, and I am going to leave “our” in the broad sense, do you think our current policies are aligned to bridging the gap fast enough?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is also an interesting question. I think we have got to continually ask ourselves that question, but also, we have got to be weary of chopping and changing.

So, I think, because what we have learnt now in the last while of making decisions on how we can enable an environment that creates jobs and the proof is in the pudding, because you see it in the jobs numbers that we have made those right decisions. But, the big trick is going to be when does that morph into the next stage? What is the Khulisa Stage 2? And you know, I am pretty certain - but we obviously have to do the work - that it is going to move much more to the ICT and tech, because that is the future and we have

got to make sure that we are relevant and competitive.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question.

Question 4. Hon Lekker to Minister Plato. Minister Plato.

Partnership with the Nyanga CPF at Dr Nelson Mandela High School

4. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether his Department is still in partnership with the Nyanga CPF at the Dr Nelson Mandela High School; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon member for the question. The answer to the question is no. The Department is not in partnership with the Nyanga CPF at Dr Nelson Mandela High School anymore.

Although the Nyanga CPF, on 25 May 2017, signed a transfer payment agreement as a legal prerequisite to the expanded partnership agreement with the Department of Community Safety, they unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker, failed to comply with any of the conditions set out in the said agreement and therefore this disqualified them from receiving any further funding.

However, the Department continues to engage with the Nyanga CPF to ensure that they perform their statutory functions as set out in Section 18 of the South African Police Act, so that the Department can continue to fund them. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I appreciate the response from MEC Plato, but I want to understand whether the developments pertaining to the partnership that the CPF with the Department had engaged in, was communicated to the relevant parties, meaning the Neighbourhood Watch members that were deployed at Mandela High School. I am asking this because when I had a conversation with those members, they alleged that they were not paid by the Department for the services rendered at the school premises.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY AND SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I cannot answer on the non-payment. I will definitely go into that. I will investigate that. If services were indeed rendered and people not paid, that is a problem. They need to get their payment for what they have done. That will be dealt with, but the Department is in continuous engagement with the Neighbourhood Watch.

We want the Neighbourhood Watch to become accredited. We had officials talking to them, but I will follow up on that as well, how far they are with

that process, because hon Deputy Speaker and member, if the Neighbourhood Watch could become accredited very soon, then we do not need to work via the CPF.

Then we can work directly with and through the Neighbourhood Watch and I would love the hon member to assist me in that respect that we do get the Neighbourhood Watch accredited, because they can then also comply in the same breath, for additional funding from the Department as well, but accreditation is key.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr MEC, the Neighbourhood Watch that I am referring to is registered. At the moment the same Neighbourhood Watch is in partnership with the City of Cape Town on a monthly contract, where on a daily basis they patrol the area of Nyanga.

Now I am really puzzled, but I want to ask MEC Plato, what measures are there in place besides the two school resource officers at Mandela High, because when the Nyanga CPF wrote the letter to request a partnership, it was as result of the lawlessness that was taking place on the school premises of Mandela High School. So, I want to check what measures are there in place besides the two learner resource officers that are deployed at Mandela High School?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY AND SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, if there is a request for more people to do security work at a specific school, they put in an application for that with the Department of Education through their Safe Schools Programme.

They look at it and if they find there are grounds for additional security, it gets done, but there is a difference between what the City of Cape Town is doing versus what Provincial Government is doing.

Accreditation does not get done via the City of Cape Town. It gets done via my Department of Community Safety. I am aware of the fact, Mr Deputy Speaker, to the hon member, that the City of Cape Town is currently also in a process, a similar kind of process, to fund Neighbourhood Watches of some sort to fulfil certain functions and maybe that is exactly what the hon member is referring to, but I think what we need to do, the two of us maybe need to sit and look at those issues with our officials.

We do have a dedicated field worker from the Department that is working in Nyanga and engaging with the CPF as well as the Neighbourhood Watch and I am willing to facilitate such a meeting between us. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That also brings us to the end of the time allotted for questions. The extended time today for questions has expired. The remaining replies will be printed in Hansard. We move on to

Statements by Members. I see the DA first, hon member Joseph? Thank you.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D JOSEPH (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, the Public Audit Amendment Bill passed by the National Assembly on Tuesday was a significant step, giving the A-G more authority to deal with maladministration and corruption.

The office of the A-G will now be able to refer adverse findings in its reports to be investigated, and where necessary, recover funds from accounting officers, that might have been lost due to non-adherence to the Public Management Act.

The DA supports the Amendment Bill as it would go a long way in fighting corruption and holding officials to account.

The report shows that 33 of the 257 municipalities received clean audits in the 2016/17 financial year, and that irregular expenditure rose from R16,2 billion to R28,4 billion.

Several officials and accounting officers will no longer be able to ignore warnings, and the corrupt officials who threaten staff of the A-G should face the full might of the law.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is high time that mayors who give instructions to municipal managers, chief financial officers and senior personnel, that contradict the Municipal Financial Management Act, be held accountable for their actions.

Political responsibility is important in government, however political interference against rules for self-interest, must be condemned in the strongest terms.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr D JOSEPH: We would like to take this opportunity to thank the A-G in the Western Cape for their high standard of work and commitment to their mandate. We would also like to encourage the A-G to implement the new Public Audit Amendment Bill without fear of favour. I thank you.

†‘n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC, hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI (ANC): Mr Deputy Speaker, a hard-core race fixated faction in the DA is executing a party capture project ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja!

Ms P MAKELENI: ...to regain control of that English libertarian institution, as it is not satisfied with the direction by the DA to fight white privilege and black poverty or poor demographic representation. [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Ramaphosa [Inaudible.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is noted this pink clique of the pale backroom boys club even had failed secret meetings led [Interjections.] by the SA Institute of Race Relations to break away from the DA as a so-called true liberal party. [Interjections.] But true to its conservative blue colour, the clique instead opted to hollow out the DA's new more progressive leaders; and to allow the small gang of control freaks to continue with their oligarchic stranglehold on ... [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Zuma [Inaudible.]

Ms P MAKELENI: ... the fear and hate driven DA. The DA leopard may try to change its spots, but it will still devour its own ... [Interjection.] and cling to past privilege. If passage gatherings and social media rumours are to be believed, hon members Mark Wiley ... [Interjection.] Debbie Schäfer, Alan Winde and Helen Zille are allegedly determined ... [Interjections.] to fight from the inside to win back their party from those thought to drive it astray.

An HON MEMBER: Move along!

Ms P MAKELENI: Watch this space. The DA split is inevitable.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Liberals!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: I would like to fight for my privilege to be called an hon member and the Premier too please. [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: I did, Mr Deputy Speaker, I did!

Mr B D JOSEPH: Ja, ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that, but if the member says she did refer to hon members, hon Wiley ... [Interjections.] so she did say that. I then move on to the DA again. [Interjections.] Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape condemns, in the strongest terms possible, the taxi violence in the taxi industry [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ai shame!

Mr N E HINANA: ...and consequently the murder of 10 and the injury of four people in the Western Cape. These taxi attacks took place over a 24-hour period from Friday evening through to Saturday in Cape Drive, Bongweni and Khayelitsha.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I commend the South African Police Service who have so far arrested 2 people in Gugulethu in connection with 9 of the murders. It is therefore essential that all guilty parties are arrested and trialled as soon as possible, as they place individuals' lives and livelihoods in jeopardy.

I call on the various taxi organisations to continue to cooperate with the authorities and taxi organisations must work together with the authorities in order to resolve their differences without resorting to violence. Further, effective and lawful solutions must be found to discipline those drivers and owners who transgress traffic laws.

Mr Deputy Speaker, taxis play a vital role in ensuring our residents are able to get to their places of work, learning, leisure and prayer. The DA in the Western Cape is committed to ensuring that our residents have access to a safe and reliable public transport network which residents can be proud of and enjoy. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In the absence of the EFF it is again the DA, hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It was recently revealed that the South African Council of Educators (SACE) which has the task of screening teachers, has not had access to the sexual offenders' list for a decade.

The WCED is however, using a private organisation to do the vetting as SACE clearly does not have the capacity to perform this function. Ensuring that the teachers entrusted with our children are vetted properly must be a top priority. It is therefore appalling to learn that most of the Provincial Departments in the country may not be vetting teachers at all.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is high time that we put the safety of our learners first. Children should not have to choose between getting an education and their safety. With a rise in reported incidents of teachers sexually abusing school kids, this means that many more sexual predators are prowling in the system undetected.

Schools are supposed to be safe spaces that are conducive to learning. In most cases, the perpetrators are known. The same applies to educators involved in incidents of sexual harassment and abuse in schools, they too are known.

To move away from a world that allows sexual harassment and violence to happen, we must ensure everyone's right to participate in education free from fear, in a culture underpinned by mutual respect. This can only be possible

with well-informed educators who have taken the time to understand the problem and support young people in engaging with the consequences. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. The ANC, hon Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. As the ANC we are deeply concerned at the ongoing conflict within the taxi industry, the loss of life and violence, which has gone along with this conflict. It is critical that key to resolving these issues are firstly the question of governance of the industry itself and secondly, issues relating to regulations and permits.

In this particular instance we need to ask whether the DA Provincial Government has actually by its inaction, contributed to this particular crisis. [Interjections.] It is very clear that [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]. We are not Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... we have a situation where the DA MEC had the advantage of the Farlam Commission of Inquiry. The Farlam Commission of Inquiry was very clear as to what needed to be done. Instead of actually listening to those in the industry who felt excluded and were simply wanting to approach the court to get the Farlam Commission implemented.

Now almost 7 months later, that Commission's recommendations remain unimplemented, because the MEC has allowed himself to get involved in a court case where he could have simply agreed ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Rubbish! We were a respondent!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...that these resolutions get effected. That is right. You did not have to oppose. [Interjection.] So, we have a situation now where a judge was appointed last year. The recommendations could have been implemented, but now this conflict has worsened, essentially because the taxi industry - and there is a legal authority of the MEC in any particular province to oversee the regulation of the industry organisations and MEC Grant and the DA have failed the people of the Western Cape in this regard.

Secondly ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes! Secondly ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] believe that that makes you in the right?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... we have a situation where there needs to be the commitment to deal with this and I want to challenge the MEC today that if

the MEC is not able to deal with this, we need to approach the Premier and the full Cabinet to actually look at the quickest route ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...to implement the Farlam Commission. Therein lies at the heart of this ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time has expired. Thank you. I see the DA again. Hon member Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, pursuant to the media reports that 11 municipalities in the Western Cape are being investigated by the Hawks, the DA in the Western Cape would like to categorically state that it is in fact 4 municipalities, not 11, which consist of George, Kannaland, Beaufort West and Oudtshoorn, all of which have been probed by the Hawks.

George, where a raid by the Hawks took place in April, is being investigated for fraud and corruption. [Interjection.] Kannaland for alleged racketeering; while Oudtshoorn and Beaufort West, for alleged fraud and corruption. It must be noted that Kannaland and Beaufort West relate to matters that arose when the ANC was in government, before the 2016 Local Government elections.

I once again commend Minister Anton Bredell for his astute and well-

deserved leadership of very good DA governance in this province ... [Interjection.] and also, for leading by example. When this matter was reported to him, within 8 days the Hawks were there, informed by him, to act ... [Interjections.]

We are determined to eradicate any form of maladministration in all municipalities in the province, because the DA Government cares and the DA Government is serious about dealing with corruption. Not talking about it but dealing with it decisively, because we believe that people deserve the best and we will not fail residents. When they put us into power, ours is to ensure that we do not fail them wherever we are in government. [Interjections.]

In Cederberg Municipality it is a matter relating to tender irregularities on grant funding. Mr Deputy Speaker, in Bitou it is issues around the appointment of the Head of Corporate Services, and the ANC is involved there ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time has ... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and their partners are not the DA. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, your time is almost done.

Mr M MNQASELA: In ending, I would like to also highlight that in Theewaterskloof Municipality it is a matter of supply chain management, not

corruption but the media obviously has reported otherwise. I would like to state that those are the facts. [Interjections.] And that is what ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time has expired. The ANC, hon member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI (ANC): More than 4 municipalities, actually 11, are being investigated ... [Interjections.] by the Hawks for various crime breaches. This is more than a third of Western Cape municipalities that are a hotbed for law-breaking. [Interjections.]

All the DA's spins, lies and more lies, smoke and mirrors cannot detract ... [Interjection.] from the fact that serious excesses took place under the DA control at these municipalities.

No matter how many times bookkeeping achievements like clean audits are referred to, it does not verify good governance or service delivery and this spate of investigations again shows that.

Instead of serving the needs of the poor residents, the DA cronies and pals at these municipalities lined their pockets, syphoned public money and greased their palms. [Interjections.]

We saw the recent Hawks swoop down on George, which had been a subject

of various forensic audits and other probes. [Interjections.] Besides George, the probes are also progressing in Cape Town, Oudtshoorn, Bitou, Kannaland, Beaufort West, Cederberg, Theewaterskloof, Langeberg, Stellenbosch and Laingsburg. [Interjections.] You wish that there is no corruption there or you are trying to hide. [Interjections.]

There is a lot of it here and it relates to issues of corruption, fraud and tender irregularities. You were late with dealing with those issues here; misconduct and irregular appointment of employees from MM and CFO's under the DA watch.

There are also sinister motives as the upcoming elections of 2019 ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... draws nearer ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, this hon member was absent when the Department came to talk to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. [Interjections.] Order! Please continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He thought that the truth would not come out. [Interjections.] What we are fearful of is that that MEC is not going to investigate the factions in the DA ... [Interjection.] depending which faction he wants to expose.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS: All of them.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS: All the municipalities!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is corruption!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. I see the DA. Hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it is time to listen to something more interesting.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are right, though the DA is not ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L H MAX (DA): The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape commends the provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports for its commitment to promoting and conserving cultural practices, such as *ulwaluko* or “the bush”. The Department’s Customary Initiation Programme aims to create a safe passage and an enabling environment for the effective rite of passage to responsible adulthood and citizenship.

Mr Deputy Speaker, these secretive and sacred ceremonies are practiced by the amaXhosa, amaHlubi and BaSotho traditional communities ...
[Interjection.] here in the Western Cape.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes!

Mr L H MAX: These communities are supported by DCAS who offers consultation and advocacy, stakeholder management and coordination, minimum standards for practitioners, training and development, site management, support and monitoring.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Order, hon Mitchell, hon Dugmore. Allow member Max the sole opportunity to speak.

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is imperative that *ulwaluko* is coordinated with the utmost care and attention as this process shapes the

value systems of our future fathers, uncles, and grandfathers. It is imperative that instructors and traditional surgeons are vetted and registered, without which our boys could fall prey to substance abuse, sexual violence, genital mutilation, dehydration or animal attacks.

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr L H MAX: The DA in the Western Cape is committed to ensuring our young initiates are safe throughout this important procedure because we are committed to a socially inclusive, creative, active and connected Western Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of Members Statements. [Interjections.] Order. We move on to Motions. Are there any Motions where Notice is given? None?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo?

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates farm evictions under the DA-run Government in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that. Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the National Minimum Wage Bill and its impact on the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the negative effects of gentrification under the DA in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that one. Any further? For the last time. We then ... [Interjections.] Hon member Kivedo, are you trying to get up?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are still looking for your ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are halfway there. [Laughter.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: I cannot find it. May I – I have got it here.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh! Do not do that! [Inaudible.] Get up again!
[Laughter.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Here it is.

Mr D JOSEPH: Okay, right, †gooi! [throw!]

Mr B D KIVEDO: No man, it †is nogals ... [Tussenwerpsel.] [is quite ...
[Interjection.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, are you ready to move one?
[Interjections.] Hon member Kivedo, I am afraid we have to move on.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Okay.

Mr D JOSEPH: Do it next week.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, thank you!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We then move on to Motions without Notice. Hon member Dugmore?

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride that the 26-year-old Siyamthanda Kolisi, representative of the Stormers, Western Province, is the new South African rugby captain elect and notes that this flanker and multi-talented player will lead the national side a few days before his next birthday as the first fully appointed black captain and welcomes his selection on merit and wish him, his team mates well in all their endeavours under his leadership. I so move. [Applause.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion being moved without notice? Nor is there any objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns those individuals who incited and participated in recent violent protests and looting, which took place in Woodlands, Mitchells Plain. Further notes that the police and the relevant crime intelligence authority identified these individuals and detained them immediately. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I move without notice:

That the House condemns in the strongest terms possible the sexual abuse of a 9-month old infant girl from Delft; that this House further condemns the brutal and inhumane actions of Mortimer Saunders who confessed to the murder and molestation of 3-year old Courtney Pieters, in her Elsie's River home; the murder and sexual assault of the child and woman is far too prevalent in our society; and as a nation that has already overcome so much, we can no longer stand for the torture and

abuse of our women and girls. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dijana?

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and commiserates with the family, friends and comrades of ANC and ANC Women's League veteran, Grace de Klerk, from Belhar who will be laid to rest on Saturday 2 June 2018. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Kivedo?

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the school robbery that took place at Lwandle Primary School in Khayelitsha earlier this week. We thank God that no-one suffered major injuries during the incident, although it was reported that teachers and learners were held at gun point; no arrests have been

made as of yet; we urge anyone with information concerning the incident to please report all necessary information to SAPS. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the Nkhoma family which lost four of its members who perished in a Vrygrond fire at the weekend; notes further the deceased included three children, 6-month old Chiya, 7-year old Mbali, 10-year old Onako, as well as their 35-year-old father Humphrey and conveys condolences to the wife, family and friends.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends Tamryn Green, a final year medical student

from Paarl, Western Cape, who won Miss South Africa 2018. The 23-year old will represent South Africa at the next Miss World pageant. Tamryn's passion for medicine and uplifting South Africa is a testament to what true beauty is, namely being selfless, kind and generous. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Beerwinkel, you are giving it a miss now?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No-no, I admit I did not have one. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes, on Tuesday, Parliament, by an overwhelming majority, passed the National Minimum Wage Bill, despite DA opposition and will now see millions of workers earning at least R3 500 a month ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Notes further – I will wait for you, MEC. Thanks.

Notes further that the Bill is meant to reduce inequality, stimulate economic growth and alleviate poverty in the country; and notes once the Bill becomes law, all low-income workers can start earning more dignified salaries. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That in light of Child Protection Week, the House notes and acknowledges all volunteers who are working with children; not only are these volunteers developing our little ones, but they are also ensuring that the most vulnerable in our society are protected; furthermore, that they also actively support initiatives to find children that might have gone missing. They are true unsung heroes. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the appointment of Ugandan Professor, Mahmood Mamdani, as an honorary professor of the Centre for African Studies at the University of Cape Town, as part of the university's stated path towards decolonising the institution and to mark Africa Day; and further congratulates Professor Mamdani for this appointment which will be his second stay at the university after he left almost 20 years ago following a fallout with his faculty that had rejected the implementation of a foundation course on Africa which the professor had developed. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the current Stormers Captain and loose forward, Siyamthanda "Siya" Kolisi who has just made Springbok history, by becoming the first black test captain as he will lead South

Africa against England next month. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. We will have a look at the actual wording and see if it is exactly the same. If it is the same, the first one will have preference.

†Mnr P UYS: Jy is aan die slaap man!

[Mr P UYS: You are asleep, man!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion. If not, then the motion is agreed to, but subject to what I have just said. Hon member Kivedo?

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Geagte mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die brand wat die Boetman Junior Skoolkoshuis van die De la Bat Skool vir gehoorgestremdes in Worcester, vernietig het, met leedwese betreur. Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar dat die voorstel sonder kennisgewing

is nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie? Goedgekeur.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House laments with regret the fire that destroyed the Boetman Junior School Residence of the De la Bat School for the Deaf in Worcester. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern reports from women on farms that Drakenstein Municipality is preparing itself for a large scale farm eviction as farmers have approached courts for eviction orders which will affect thousands of farm workers; notes it is reported that the new National Government legislation to benefit and protect farm workers' rights, prompted farmers to start turning their farms into holiday cottages and evict workers to live in informal settlements; and calls for the intervention of National Government to institute an investigation

into farm evictions in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection – there is an objection I sense there.

[Interjection.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Hinana?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you for objecting.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sincerest condolence to the bereaved family of the deceased and wishes a speedy recovery to those who were injured, due to yesterday's alleged train arson attack; that this House further commends the train crew for their speedy response to the emergency as they decoupled the burning coaches to prevent the fire from spreading to other coaches. These alleged attacks are barbaric and reflect PRASA's inability to beef up security for its commuters and infrastructure. Metrorail must ensure that all trains and coaches are fitted with CCTV cameras and security personnel. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the taxi violence has erupted afresh over the weekend leaving at least 13 drivers and commuters killed; notes further that the latest violence between rival taxi associations broke out after the hon MEC for Transport, Grant, had failed as is his responsibility to mediate in the previous Delft taxi violence; further commends the intervention from the police, which included deploying the South African Police's tactical response unit, as well as the National Intervention Unit teams, to complement station deployments at identified hotspots and calls on all role players to cease the conflict and appeals for calm in the industry and appeals finally as this House for the MEC to urgently resolve the governance issues which beset the industry.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Max?

Mr L H MAX: I hope member Dugmore did not get this one. Mr Deputy

Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends Cape Town born current Stormers player and lock, Pieter-Steph du Toit, who will become the 60th man to lead the Springboks ... [Interjection.] when they play Wales in Washington this Saturday. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? Is there an objection? No objection. Agreed to. I see the hon member Beerwinkel. [Interjections.] Hon member Beerwinkel, you may proceed.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the nonsensical and clownish accusations by J P Smith and hon Mark Wiley to reduce people's grievances over poor service delivery by the DA, as part of a plot to make the Western Cape ungovernable; notes further that the accusations are not only unfounded but also borders on stupidity, as everybody knows the communities are up in arms against the DA that continues to give substandard services to the poor; appeals for calm in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You give no services.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We do not govern in the Western Cape.

Appeals for calm in the Western Cape amidst all these tensions; appeals to all to desist from illegal acts and calls on the Provincial Government to prioritize service delivery to the poor communities in the province.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

AN HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Mr David Green, a WCED Life Science Curriculum advisor and his wife Ellirene Green, on the crowning of their daughter, Tamryn Green as Ms South Africa 2018. We share in your joy and we wish her well in her journey. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] can read that restatement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell that is fine footwork. That one is acceptable. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the initiative by the National Department of Public Works for the rollout of the first phase of R400 million to upgrade 13 provincial harbours to boost the small-scale fishing industry and tourism in the Western Cape; notes further and appreciates the delight of stakeholders who say the project will change the lives of many fishing communities and tourism operators who rely on the harbours in the province and commends the Department for taking on this real game-changing intervention. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Hon member Hinana?

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Democratic Alliance for winning the by-elections yesterday in Saldanha and Oudtshoorn; further confirms to build the quality of its citizens by providing quality services. I so move.

[Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved ...

[Interjections.] Is there an objection? It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon member Dyantyi you may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have to listen to this one. [Interjection.] You have to listen to this one. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ANC is growing while the DA is still in a tailspin ... [Interjections.] heading downward as was seen in yesterday's by-elections in rural areas; [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. Order members. Allow the member the opportunity to proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI:

Further notes the ANC gained 15% support in Saldanha and is 17% up in Oudtshoorn. The DA lost 17% of its support in Saldanha and lost 9% of its support in Oudtshoorn. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. [Interjections.]
Order. Any objection to the motion being moved?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the
Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon member Botha?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: Have you not worked out who won yet? Must we help you?
[Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates our own Professor Laetitia
Rispel, who has been elected as the first woman from Africa as the new
Head of the World Federation of Public Health Associations. This
remarkable achievement speaks to what South African women can
accomplish. We salute her for demonstrating what is possible and for her
continued fight for health equity. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without
notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. Are there any further?

Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates DA activists, professional staff members and all public representatives for ensuring well-deserved and hard earned victories in both the Oudtshoorn ... [Interjection.] and Saldanha Bay by-elections;

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA:

Further notes that the House extends its gratitude to both communities ... [Interjection.] for their continued trust in the Democratic Alliance.
†Qina DA, Qina! [Stay strong DA, stay strong!]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being moved? [Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Chief Whip did you want to move something?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without

notice:

That the House requests from the Minister of National Public Works why the R400 million for the Small Boats Harbours to be spent has been reduced from the original announcement of R1 billion?

[Motion as moved by Member.]

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being ...

[Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon member Mngqasela is there another one?

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes. Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Overstrand Municipality will from 1 June 2018 implement Level 2 water restrictions, barring the use of hosepipes to wash cars and boats; further notes that the First Level water restriction tariffs will apply accordingly. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P UYS: They waited too long!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection ... [Interjection.] Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed then on the Order Paper. Are there any further?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: For the last time?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then just before we adjourn may I, from my seat also welcome Judge Mmusi and his delegation to the House. They will shortly engage with us on a very important matter. The members are requested to remain behind and not to disappear when the House is adjourned. That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:00.