
THURSDAY, 1 AUGUST 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: I recognise the Chief Whip. Order! Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House extends our sincere condolences to Premier Alan Winde and his family on the passing of his beloved father, William Dave Winde. We extend our sympathies to the entire Winde family, especially to Premier Winde's mother, Ingrid Winde, and their friends. Our thoughts and prayers are with them during this time of grief and mourning. I so move.

The SPEAKER: I would like the House to rise and observe a moment of silence.

[Moment of silence observed.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The condolences of the House on the passing of the father of the hon Premier of the Western Cape, hon Alan Winde, will be forwarded to the family accordingly. Thank you, hon members.

I recognise the Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to inform the House that absent members today have liaised with the questioners and the following oral questions will stand over: Questions 1, 2, 4, 5, 9 to 12, and 19. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Is there any objection to the motion being moved? All in ...*[Interjections.]*

Mr P J MARAIS: *[Indistinct.]* I did not hear ...*[Interjection.]*

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: ... can she speak a bit slower so I can just follow?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. Hon Chief Whip? You want to WhatsApp it to him? [Laughs.] Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

Mr D G MITCHELL: No-no, thank you, Mr Speaker. I wanted to say when the hon member rises, that he must please wait until his microphone is on so that it is on record.

The SPEAKER: Oh, okay. Thank you very much. I thought you wanted to say you are going to WhatsApp the list.

Mr P J MARAIS: He just likes my voice. [Laughs.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: The hon member did it again. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you. Thank you, hon members. Hon Chief Whip, do you mind reading your list a bit slower?

Ms M M WENGER: Must I repeat?

The SPEAKER: Yes, please. I recognise you.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. To repeat more slowly: I wish to inform the House that the absent members of the Cabinet have liaised with questioners and the following oral questions will stand over to the next sitting: Questions 1, 2, 4, 5, 9 to 12, and 19.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Are we all on the same page, hon members? Are we comfortable? Hon member Marais, you got the list?

Mr P J MARAIS: I think so.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, sir. Alright. Before we go to the Interpellations; in fact it is only the Minister of Health, but I would just like to draw the attention of the hon members to the Youth Parliament we held on Saturday. It was a very good session. I can safely say that it was well attended by young people of the Western Cape from all the districts. We were here in this House. It was such a beautiful programme.

What I have done, I have ATC'd the resolutions that were taken in that Youth Parliament, and as a result it draws the attention of the Standing Committee members of the affected committees, as per the resolutions, and also the members of the Executive. I would like to draw your attention to the resolutions as they appear on the Order Paper as ATC'd.

Now let us go straight to our Interpellations in terms of Rule 197, and I recognise the hon Minister in that order.

INTERPELLATION:

Clinic committees and hospital boards: mandate

1. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

What measures are in place to ensure that clinic committees and hospital boards fulfil the mandate given to them by the people in the different communities and to ensure that they do not become political tools?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you to Standing Committee Chair, hon member Philander, for the question, interpellation.

The Department's goal is to strengthen the community's voice to allow them to participate within a system that is designed to serve them as patients. The idea is for them to move away from the notion of being mere recipients of health services; to encourage them to become active participants.

To ensure that this happens in reality, the Department passed and promulgated the new Western Cape Facility Board and Clinic Committees Act in 2015. The regulations have been published for comment on 27 April 2017, and the closing date was 31 May 2017. The Act and its regulations came into effect on 7 December 2017.

As part of the proclamation process, Health facilities require a committee, where designated, as per the relevant prescripts. Once the Act and its regulations came into effect the Provincial Minister was empowered to cluster the facilities which was signed off on 1 January 2018.

This Act enables community members to be represented on Health

Committees, both at hospital and clinic level, to form part of the statutory role of the Health Department. This process brings the Department closer to communities to have a voice and a say in what happens within the Health system. The formalisation of Clinic Committees and their Facility Boards provides an ideal opportunity to formalise the committee governance arrangements.

In order to capacitate these structures training was conducted using an NGO which was best-positioned to do so. It developed the cost content following a core production process via stakeholder engagement. A one day induction and orientation programme for all Health Facility Boards and Clinic Committee Clusters were scheduled for the 2018/19 budget year; followed by substantially more training.

The pilot sites were in five rural districts. It was a one day orientation programme which covered topics such as:

- What is health governance?;
- what are their facility governance structures?;
- what is the recruitment process for the Committees and the Board members?;
- the roles and responsibilities;
- interacting with the members of the community;
- monitoring and evaluation; and
- general administrative guidelines.

Also they were given a pocket handbook, “Guide for Primary Health Care Facility Governance Structure Members”.

In order to ensure the optimal function of these structures, the Department is in the process of recruiting an assistant director for statutory bodies, and also two community liaison officers for the Metro and the rural areas. This is an open process and transparent and cannot be politically manipulated. The Act is clear about the appointment procedures. Positions are widely advertised thus giving an opportunity to everyone who wants to be part of these committees. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. I recognise hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. It has come to our knowledge that in some instances there is a battle for representation on these bodies by certain public representatives, and as a public representative one should be able to distinguish between party politics and not bring your political stance into such board or committee.

The voice of the patient is not that of a specific party and health issues do not ask for political affiliation. What measures does the Department have in place to ensure that the right voices are heard? Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Philander. I recognise hon member

Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Good afternoon, Mr Speaker, hon members. †Terwyl die LUR al die maatreëls uitwys, is die werklikheid dat die meerderheid van kliniekkomiteerade oorheers word deur die DA-lede en -leiers wat die eerste loopgraaf van verdediging is vir die LUR, eerder as om die stem vir die pasiënt te wees. Die Khayelitsha-raad is 'n bewys hiervan.

Bykomende werk van die rade is nie waarvoor dit bedoel is nie, byvoorbeeld in Theewaterskloof is 'n Gesondheid- en Welsynskomitee gestig, maar hulle het nog nooit gesit of enige uitnodigings gekry vir hierdie vergaderings nie. Daarom vra ek die LUR watter toesigmeganisme is daar om te verseker dat hierdie rade die beste werk, en watter stappe het haar Departement gedoen om te verseker dat hierdie rade nie spreekbuise vir die DA en voetsoldate vir die LUR is nie?

Dan watter meganisme is daar vir hierdie rade en komitees om probleme by die Departement aan te meld, en hoe lank vat dit om dit reg te stel? Ons het die komitees nodig om die inwoners te bedien en nie om te bestaan net om die gebreke van hierdie Regering te verdedig nie. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[While the MEC points out all the measures, the reality is that the majority of the clinic committee boards are dominated by the DA members and leaders

who are the first line of defence for the MEC; rather than be the voice for the patient. The Khayelitsha Board is proof of this.

Additional work of the boards are not what it is intended for, for example in Theewaterskloof a Health and Welfare Committee was established, but they have never met or received any invitations for these meetings. Therefore I ask the MEC what oversight mechanism is there to ensure that these boards function the best, and what steps have her Department taken to ensure that these boards are not mouthpieces for the DA and foot soldiers for the MEC?

Then what mechanism is there for these boards and committees to report problems to the Department, and how long does it take to rectify it? We need the committees to serve the citizens and not to just exist to defend the shortcomings of the Government. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. What I would like to do at this stage is draw the attention of the hon members to the fact that you must address the Speaker. Thank you very much, hon member. Thank you.

I recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The question itself, I could not really get my head around it, the part about them becoming political tools, because the powers of the Board are merely to advise, make recommendations, obtain information and report on what happens there. So

there is no decision-making that is permanent by Boards and clinics resort under municipalities.

†Klinieke val nie onder die Minister nie; dit is 'n munisipale funksie. Maar nou ja, ek sal graag wil gehoor het of daar enige verslag gedoen word deur hierdie *boards*, doen hulle verslag aan die Parlement direk of aan die komitees? Bring hulle verslae uit? En is daardie verslae beskikbaar as daar enige klagtes ontvang word?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Clinics do not fall under the Minister; it is a municipal function. But anyway, I would have liked to hear if any reporting is being done by these boards, do they report to Parliament or directly to the committees? Do they submit reports? And are those reports available if any complaints are received?]

†Ek was in Lentegeur Hospitaal, ek was 'n getuie, [I was in Lentegeur Hospital, I was a witness,] †a witness to somebody dying while nobody was near his bed. He was sitting on a toilet in Lentegeur Hospital where they left him, and he is a man who was on oxygen, but they did not bring him a bedpan. They took him to a toilet, and you know what? I shouted and I said, "Where is this man?" When they rushed to the toilet, they opened the door and he was dead, sitting on a toilet pot, nobody around him. I am telling you what is the purpose of these committees? I mean have they got an oversight

role?

If the access, they can only advise, investigate ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, will you please take your seat, Sir? I recognise the hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Speaker, I just want ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie. What is your point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes, Mr Speaker, just a clarity on the interpretation for me, please. Is the - because you need to be hon members of this House.

Now I know, as a Board member of the Mitchells Plain Hospital, we have reached out via Facebook to hon member Marais ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: But that is not a point of ...[Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... he has not provided the facts of this matter yet. What he is saying is not true.

The SPEAKER: But that is not a point of order. [Interjections.] It is a point for debate. I recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you. That was just a way to cut my speech because it hurts.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: You did not provide the evidence of the dead person.

The SPEAKER: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We asked you, hon member.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, please assist the Speaker. I am sure there will be time in future to debunk whatever you wish to debunk, but just allow hon ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr P J MARAIS: As jy Afrikaans praat dan sal hy nie kan antwoord nie.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: If you speak Afrikaans then he will not be able to answer.
[Interjections.]]

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Waar is die besonderhede van die dooie persoon?

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Where are the details of the deceased person?]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais ...[Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: The person does not exist.

The SPEAKER: ... it is your opportunity ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Chairman ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... please proceed, Sir.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Sir. †Ek het twee getuies. Die persoon was aangerand in Mitchells Plein, hy is hospitaal toe gebring ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[I have two witnesses. The person was assaulted in Mitchells Plain, he was brought to hospital ...[Interjections.]]

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Wat is sy naam?

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: What is his name?]

†Mnr P J MARAIS: ... en hy lê daarso, en daar is niemand wat na hom omsien nie, hy lê met 'n *oxygen mask* op sy gesig. Hy het gevra, met gebare gewys, en ons het gaan sê hierdie man wil iets sê, en 'n verpleegster kom, en hy wys vir hulle hy wil toilet toe gaan ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: ... and he was lying there, and there was no-one to look after him, he lies with an oxygen mask on his face. He asked, indicated with gestures, and we went to say this man wants to say something, and a nurse came, and he indicates to them he wants to go to the toilet ...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr P J MARAIS: ... hulle neem hom so en toe ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: ... they take him and then ...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: ... your time is up, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Sir.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Sir, thank you. I now recognise hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. As we serve in our different capacities we should be mindful of exactly why we serve and we are now very happy that this is one of the values of the Department. Also the purpose and values we wish to add to structures of community concern.

Mr Speaker, this initiative of community representation is welcomed across the province. Patients indeed have a voice, so their voices need to be heard; ensuring that a better Provincial Health Service be put in place for actual citizens and the actual patients.

We commend the Western Cape Health Department on the strides already made, and welcome the credibility of these bodies and ask that it be ensured and sustained. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Philander. I recognise the Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. As I indicated earlier, this is legislated, it is an Act and has got regulations in terms of how things are supposed to happen.

The advertisements that go via the radio, the community newspapers and so forth, reach out to everyone, and then, in addition, at the facilities they put it on the notice board so that anyone can have access, specifically because at the facilities it is the patients who access the services anyway.

So these are the people who apply, and in terms of the Act, in terms of the application, nobody applies as an individual. There is a nomination where a group, whether it is through an NGO or it might be a group of the mothers, or a group of concerned youth, but it is a group that nominates so that you avoid a situation where the person only leads himself or herself. So that is why that person has the responsibility to feed back to the group that nominated him or her.

In the case of Khayelitsha, for example, the Hospital Board, to get representation, the nomination comes from the KDF. The KDF is a multi-party platform. So if they have decided that they want to nominate this person, then let it be.

You get the nominations coming from the Ward Committees, the councillors there. Those nominations are from the ward councillors. They are from other political parties. They are not necessarily from the DA. So it is up to them when they nominate a person who is a Health representative in their Ward Committee. So there is no opportunity or space for one to represent him or herself, but of course the personalities keep on changing. Some of them might not necessarily feed back to the people who nominated them.

And then in terms of the Act there is an Annual Health Day where we provide an opportunity for these structures to feed-back, as a group, to the people in that area. So if we are talking about Khayelitsha again, it is when the Hospital Board has to have a Health Day where they have to engage with the community outside, not necessarily in the hospital.

In terms of how we track that, in terms of the Act, there are quarterly meetings that are supposed to happen, compulsory meetings, but at the clinics, the smaller clinics it might not be necessary quarterly. It might be once a month if it is a small †nyana [small] clinic. For facility managers, for Clinic Committees, it is part of performance management in terms of holding these meetings, they are being managed in terms of their performance. And then the minutes of the meetings go to the District Health Council, to the district manager. The Hospital Board meeting minutes go from a district manager to the MEC, for example, so that they are able to take forward all that is needed.

The issue of the individual, hon member Marais, of individual cases, is difficult to respond to, because firstly we have to look in terms of confidentiality. Even if you could say so-and-so, give the name, I would never be able to respond, because from an ethical perspective we do not discuss patients generally. But from what I understand it is about, we are painting a picture as a case study in terms of what is happening generally in some context.

Mr P J MARAIS: Correct.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes. So that is why we always say that in order for us to be able to make a person account, to respond, it is better to target that specific person. If Dr Mbombo is the one who treated you rudely or whatever in that particular hospital – everyone has got a name tag, and on the notice board, everywhere, there are ‘Please Call Me’ numbers, the hotline numbers, where you are supposed to immediately register your complaint so that we can act on it.

We do not deny that there are areas where we will find that we do fail the people, but we listen and then we act. We apologise if needs be, and then we also advise the person if he has to take it upwards. In Primary Health Care, where you see a headcount of about 14 million at the clinics, you are bound to have some of them where you have got complaints.

†USOMLOMO: Ndizocela ubengathi uyaqhobosha Ncibane

[The SPEAKER: I will ask that you conclude Ncibane.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [Inaudible.]

†USOMLOMO: Enkosi, Mphathiswa.

The SPEAKER: [Thank you Minister.] †That concludes the Interpellations, hon members. Thank you for your cooperation. Now we will go straight to the questions as printed in the Order Paper. I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

Questions for oral reply

[Questions 1, 2, 4, 5, 9 to 12, and 19 stand over]

Places of worship: noise-control regulations

3. Mr B N Herron asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (1) Whether sounds from places of worship, such as church bells and calls to prayer, are regarded as “disturbing noise” in terms of the Western Cape Noise Control Regulations, 2013; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether Regulation 12(1)(a) of the Western Cape Noise Control Regulations, 2013, permits the City of Cape Town or any other local authority to exempt places of worship from the provisions of

these noise control regulations; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. †Baie dankie vir die geleentheid. [Thank you for the opportunity.]

†Met die toestemming van die agb lid Herron sal ek graag 'n opsomming wil gee. Dis 'n bietjie tegnies, en dan kan ek dit ook inhandig. Anders gaan ek heel middag staan en lees. Dit is 'n lang antwoord ook. [With the consent of the hon member Herron I would like to give a summary. It is somewhat technical, and then I can also submit it. Otherwise I am going to stand and read all afternoon. It is also a long reply.] Will it be fine if I give you a summary and then we can ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, †weereens baie dankie. [again, thank you very much.]

†Ingevolge die Wes-Kaap Geraasbeheerregulasies PN200 van 2013, hierna “Geraasregulasies”, beteken:

“Steurende geluid; 'n geraas, met uitsondering van 'n onversterkte

stem van 'n mens, die grondvlak van 7 dBA oorskry nie.”

En die residensiële geraasvlak met 3 dBA oorskry, waar die residensiële geraasvlak laer is as die graderingsvlak.

As ons kyk na die volgende paragraaf:

“Ingevolge die bogenoemde, omskryf die Geraasregulasies die graderingsvlak as die toepaslike buitelig-ekwivalent deurlopende graderingsvlak aangedui in Tabel 2 van SANS 10103.”

Terwyl die residensiële geraasvlak gedefinieer word as:

“'n Alomvattende geluid in 'n gegewe situasie op 'n gegewe tydstip, gemeet as die lesing op 'n geïntegreerde impulsklankpeilmeter ...”

Verder dink ek wat belangrik is, is dat:

“In terme van die steuringsgeraas hou dit nie verband met die tipe of die bron van geraas nie, maar eerder die vlak van geraas soos hierbo gedefinieer.”

Ook belangrik is dat:

“Die vereistes om die redelikheid van 'n geraas-oortas te bepaal

sluit die indiening van 'n beëdigde verklaring, insluitend die duur, die frekwensie en die aard van die geraas.”

Regulasies 12(1)(a) stel dat:

“Die Plaaslike Regering mag enige persoon of enige lokaal of tipe lokaal van enige van die bepalings van hierdie regulasies vrystel indien hulle 'n proses gevolg het.”

Die munisipale sfeer is verantwoordelik vir die toepassing van hierdie regulasies, en ook die vrystelling daarvan, nadat hulle deur 'n proses gegaan het. Baie dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[In terms of the Western Cape Noise Control Regulations PN200 of 2013, hereafter “Noise Regulations”, means:

“disturbing noise”; a noise, excluding the unamplified human voice, which exceeds the rating level by 7 dBA;

and the residual noise level by 3 dBA, where the residual noise level is lower than the rating level.

If we look at the following paragraph:

In terms of the above, the Noise Regulations define the rating level as the applicable outdoor equivalent continuous rating level indicated in Table 2 of SANS 10103.

While the residential noise level is defined as:

“The all-encompassing sound in a given situation at a given time, measured as the reading on an integrated impulse sound level meter...”

Further I think what is important is that:

In terms of the disturbing noise it does not relate to the type or source of the noise, but rather the level of noise as defined above.

It is also important that:

The requirements to determine the reasonableness of a disturbing noise include the submission of an affidavit, including the duration, the frequency and the nature of the noise.

Regulation 12(1)(a) states that:

“A local authority may exempt any person or venue or type of venue from any provision of these regulations,” if they have

followed a process.

The municipal sphere is responsible for the application of these regulations, as well as the exemption thereof, after they have followed a process. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. I recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for the reply.

If I understand the Minister correctly, the measurement for noise is what determines whether it is a noise or not, and it has nothing to do with the source of the sound, but more importantly, the local municipality has the authority to exempt a particular sound or a venue from the Noise Regulations.

The reason I posed the question was because the City of Cape Town has been engaging with the Zeenatul Islam Mosque in District 6 around a noise complaint, and the City of Cape Town has been attributing their action against the Mosque to the Western Cape Noise Regulations.

If I understand the Minister correctly, when the Mayoral Committee Member for Community Services in the City of Cape Town says to me, “Brett, please help us review the Western Cape Noise Regulations now that you are at the

Western Cape Provincial Parliament, so that the provincial level and the Regulations and by-laws can speak to each other cohesively,” – that is wrong. That in fact the City of Cape Town can amend their by-law or implement their by-law in a way that exempts the Quarter prayer or church bells from breaching Noise Regulations.

Can the Minister confirm then that the City of Cape Town has the authority, in terms of the Noise Regulations, to exempt religious sounds from enforcement?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. I recognise Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ja. Hon Chairperson, I think what we need to do is also if we want to change the regulations, we can do it through the Standing Committee and bring it to Parliament, and we can debate the issue further.

The Province is the responsible government sphere to make the regulations under Section 25 of the Environmental Conservation Act, but the Local Authority is the implementing agent according to 156 of the Constitution.

So what we do as a province is that we train municipalities, we do it in conjunction with our air quality monitoring team. They go out, they train

officials within the municipality how to determine and how to use the handheld devices, etcetera, but the enforcement thereof is definitely a municipal function, and they can implement it and they can also go through a process where they interact with the community. †Ons noem dit “kwytskelding van” as daar so ’n behoefte is. [We call it “exemption of” if there is such a need.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie, agb Speaker, Minister, dankie vir u antwoord en u toeligting.

Baie van ons was voorheen stadsraadslede en as iemand wat in Stellenbosch gedien het, wat bekend is vir studentepartytjies ensomeer, weet ek hoe dikwels die publiek by hulle raadslid kla oor geraas.

My vraag dan aan u is net hoeveel van ons munisipaliteite is in staat om geraas te meet op ’n vlak wat uiteindelik in ’n hof sal staan? Hoeveel munisipaliteite kon byvoorbeeld geraasbeheerbeamptes aanstel met die nodige tegniese opleiding, ensomeer?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker, Minister, thank

you for your reply and your highlighting.

Many of us had been town council members previously and as someone who had served in Stellenbosch, which is known for its student parties and so forth, I know how often the public complain to their council member about noise.

My question then to you is just, how many of our municipalities are able to measure noise at a level that eventually will stand up in court? How many municipalities, for example, could appoint noise control officers with the necessary technical training, and so forth?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ja, agb Speaker, ek dink in die meeste gevalle het jy geklop aan 'n deur en jy praat met mense, dan kry jy, dan kry ons die geraasvlakke redelik af, maar as 'n provinsiale regeringsfeer het ons die opleiding verskaf aan munisipaliteite, soos ek dit gestel het lewer ons ook lugbesoedeling; dit is 'n volgende een wat ons ook in die hof moet gaan bewys, en ons het byvoorbeeld 11 moniteringstasies wat ons beskikbaar stel in verskillende areas, en ook op aanvraag aan munisipaliteite. Ek dink die Stad het 13 daarvan.

Wat betref die geraas het ons in die provinsie vier *level meters* wat hulle noem, om die klank te bepaal. Die Stad Kaapstad het sy eie, so hulle het die toestel. Daar is 10 munisipaliteite op hierdie stadium, agb lid Van der

Westhuizen, wat wel oor hierdie toestelle beskik. Die Rade is, en ek kan dit vir u gee, dit is:

- Stellenbosch
- Oudtshoorn
- Breede Vallei
- Die Stad Kaapstad
- Drakenstein
- Knysna
- Swartland
- Theewaterskloof
- Mosselbaai
- George

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, hon Speaker, I think in most cases you would have knocked on a door and talk to people, then you get, then we get the noise levels reasonably down, but as a provincial government sphere we have provided training to municipalities, as I said we also deliver air pollution; that is a next one that we have to go and prove in court, and we have for instance 11 monitoring stations that we make available in different areas, and also to municipalities at their request. I think the City has 13 of those.]

With regard to the noise we have in the province four level meters as they call it, to measure the noise. The City of Cape Town has its own, so they have the device. There are 10 municipalities at this stage, hon member Van der Westhuizen, that do have these devices. The councils are, and I can give it to you, they are:

- Stellenbosch
- Oudtshoorn
- Breede Valley
- The City of Cape Town
- Drakenstein
- Knysna
- Swartland
- Theewaterskloof
- Mossel Bay
- George]

†While seven municipalities have the handheld sound level meters.

†So ons is ook besig om te kyk na die ander, die kleiner, hoe ons hulle kan versterk.

So op 19 Augustus is daar weer 'n opleidingsessie waar ons dan meer toeligting gee aan munisipaliteite en hulle nooi om 'n persoon te identifiseer in die munisipaliteit wat ons kan oplei om sulke klagtes te hanteer. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[So we are also looking at the other, the smaller ones, how we can strengthen them.]

So on 19 August there is again a training session where we then provide more information to municipalities and invite them to identify a person in the municipality who we can train to deal with such complaints. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. Hon member Van der Westhuizen?

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie, mnr Speaker, dankie, Minister Bredell. Minister, een van die ander probleme wat ons met geraas het is dikwels wat vir my lyk na onvermybare geraas, byvoorbeeld wanneer mense langs 'n vliegveld of soos 'n lughawe, of in die pad van aankomende vliegtuie hulle huise oprig, ensomeer, en my vraag is net wat is die situasie wanneer ontwikkelaars 'n ontwikkeling doen reg langs 'n vliegveld? Is daardie Provinsiale Regulasies dus ook van toepassing op aanloopbane, vliegvelde, en ook konstruksieterreine? Want dikwels, jy weet, daar is feitlik geen konstruksie wat sonder geraas gepaard gaan nie. Wat is die regulasies in die verband en is daar 'n verligting vir eienaars van eiendomme naby hierdie persele?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Minister Bredell. Minister, one of the other problems we have with noise is often what to me seems to be unavoidable noise, for instance where people erect their dwellings next to an aerodrome or an airport, or in the way of oncoming aircraft, and so forth, and my question is just what is the situation when developers do a development right next to an airfield? Are those Provincial Regulations then also applicable to runways, aerodromes, and also construction sites? Because often, you know, there is almost no construction that is not accompanied by noise. What are the regulations in this regard and is there relief for owners of properties near these sites?]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Wel, dis 'n moeilike een, agb Speaker, want dit is 'n baie lang proses. Wanneer daar natuurlik gebou word in sekere areas, en ek wil nou nie die EIA-proses noem nie, want dan raak dit nou weer 'n nuwe debat, maar deur NEMA-regulasies word al hierdie faktore aangespreek, en daarom vat party van hierdie ondersoek baie lank, want mense sal spesifiek, as jy nou nader aan 'n lughawe gaan is dit een van die groot goed wat hulle na kyk is geraas, en dit word in hierdie publieke deelname en in die goedkeurings of al dan nie afkeuringsproses, word dit hanteer.

Natuurlik het eienaars ook 'n reg, maar ons moet ook die redelikheidsbeginsels

in berekening bring. By 'n bouperseel is daar gewoonlik meer geraas, en 'n mens moet redelik wees. Jy kan nie - ek meen as ons hier iets moet regmaak gaan daar geboor word, of ons nou hou daarvan of nie, anders kan ons dit nie herstel nie, maar die aansoeke word hanteer in 'n proses waar die publiek gekonsulteer word.

Dieselfde gaan met wanneer jy naby 'n vleiland kom, daar is sekere prosesse om die waterbronne te beskerm. Dieselfde met lugbesoedeling; en baie van ons items wat ons vandag mee sukkel in die omgewingsektor is veral eintlik weens swak beplanning, dat ons dalk foute gemaak het jare gelede met sekere beplanningsaansoeke.

So daardie beplanningsaansoeke moet baie deeglik gedoen word, en by lugvelde, wat u spesifiek noem, moet ons onthou daar is ook ander rolspelers wat daardie lisensies gee, en hulle kyk ook na geraas en die faktore op menslike lewe. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, that is a difficult one, hon Speaker, because it is a very long process. When of course building takes place in certain areas, and I don't want to mention the EIA process because then it becomes a new debate, but through NEMA Regulations all these factors are addressed, and therefore some of these investigations take a long

time, because people will specifically, if you now go closer to the airport, one of the main things they look at is noise, and this is dealt with in this public participation and in the approvals or refusal process.

Of course owners also have a right, but we also have to consider the reasonable principles. At a building site there is usually more noise, and one has to be reasonable. You cannot – I mean if we have to repair something here drilling will take place, whether we like it or not, otherwise we cannot repair it, but the applications are dealt with in a process where the public is consulted.

The same goes for when you get near a marsh, there are certain processes to protect the water resources. The same with air pollution, and many of the items we struggle with today in our environmental sector is especially because of poor planning, that we may have made mistakes years ago with certain planning applications.

So those planning applications have to be done very thoroughly, and at aerodromes that you mention specifically, we have to bear in mind there are also other role players granting those licences, and they also look at noise and the factors upon human life. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. Hon members, that concludes Question 3.

I now recognise the Minister of Community Safety, hon Minister Fritz.

SANDF deployment in the province

6. Mr R I Allen asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the National Minister of Police communicated with his office with regard to the deployment of the South African National Defence Force in 10 precincts in the province; if so, (a) how many troops are being deployed, (b) what steps have been taken to ensure that troops are fully prepared for deployment, (c) how long will the troops be deployed and (d) what are the further relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and also thank you to the hon member Allen for asking the question.

The (a) part of your question: in terms of Military Protocol the number of troops who are being deployed will not be divulged.

The second part of your question, (b), the Mission Readiness Training Programme has been conducted in support of the South African Police Services operations.

Part (c); the troops will be deployed as per the request which was approved by the President; and (d) no other relevant information. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fritz. I recognise hon member Allen and followed by hon member Herron, in that order. I recognise you, sir, hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you to the Minister.

Although we know that the deployment of the SANDF is not a silver bullet, I would like to know whether there has been any positive outcomes since the deployment, sir? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think one of the general outcomes that one can regard as positive, because it is a very relative concept, is that I think we have found general stability on the Cape Flats; specifically on the Cape Flats. You still have, of course, incidences of violence emerging in some of the hotspots.

So you will find sporadic violent actions in certain parts of the place, and I think that will always be, and that is why we have always said from the beginning that the military's intervention can only be temporary. We need to do all our other interventions at the same time while there is stability.

So I think that is the point, but I want to say, I have also seen a huge coming together of communities; mobilising themselves, organising themselves, and I

just got back now from Mitchells Plain where the CPFs and the Neighbourhood Watches and the religious sector, all of them were there. Christians, Moslems, everyone who is against violence, today, in a full hall in Rocklands.

†So, mnr die Speaker, ek wil ook net beklemtoon dat totdat gemeenskappe dan daai eienaarskap gaan neem van ons eie veiligheid, dat veiligheid nie net polisiëring is nie, gaan ons aan en aan in 'n wentelbaan van geweld, en ons moet daai wentelbaan van geweld stopsit, mnr Marais, dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[So, Mr Speaker, I also want to just emphasize that until communities take that ownership of our own safety, that safety is not just policing, we will continue in a cycle of violence, and that cycle of violence we have to stop, Mr Marais, thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fritz. I recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you to the Minister for the response.

As we understand it the SANDF was brought in as a three month measure to bring some stability to mostly gang ravaged communities on the Cape Flats,

but last week Wednesday new reports and witnesses described the SANDF as present when a raid occurred on the Woodstock Hospital.

So I would like the Minister to explain to us what the SANDF was doing assisting in a raid in Woodstock, which has nothing to do with gang violence on the Cape Flats; and how easy is it to pervert or divert the intention of the SANDF, which was to bring stability to the Cape Flats, and not to intimidate occupiers of a building in Woodstock.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon member Herron, for the question. We have - in fact we do not have any operational control, as you would know, from a legal point of view, but what we have heard in the Woodstock area, there were some kind of, you know, disturbances in the Woodstock area. You must actually provide me with the full information so that we can follow it up, because wherever there is a kind of illegal action or an action that - we still have, not over the SANDF, but over the police, under whose control they actually operate.

So I think just to follow it up properly and to get a proper answer for you as to what exactly happened. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I have not recognised you. I know you asked a question, but I had hon members indicating to speak. I recognise hon member

Kama, then followed by hon member Allen.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Mr Speaker and the Minister, for the answers. My question would be then, hon Speaker, whereas the army has been deployed for stabilisation we continue to see like last weekend where, I think the previous weekend, we had about 23 murders, but the last weekend it then doubled to 46.

Now our question would be what support is the Department giving to the deployment of SANDF to ensure that the purpose that they were deployed for is achieved? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think that is quite a good question, and the reason why it is, is so that we can once and for all get the context for these numbers of statistics, and I really want to say, hon member Kama, we were at a pay weekend last weekend.

Now if you compare the other pay weekends of May, June, July; in May it was 71 deaths; in June it was 66; and it came down now to 46. I just want to emphasise the pay weekend. Anyone who knows the province and everywhere, if you go into towns you see the link also with alcohol abuse and all of that.

So that is, I think, the first point. The second point is that a lot of that violence and those murders were interpersonal murders; related to people who know each other. In many instances domestic – in fact the one case we had a boyfriend that stabbed his girlfriend to death in Beaufort West.

So you have those, and it is not all ascribed to gang violence. Gang violence, of all of that, is about 10%. It is still high, do not get me wrong, but I think when we talk to the approaches to this violence, you will see how other departments become involved with the trauma counselling, with family values and family strengthening programmes; that we look at that.

A very interesting statistic. Now you know sometimes we like some people and we do not like some other people, but let me just give you a very interesting statistic. In Bonteheuwel on 30 June, the neighbourhood safety team was deployed, and since the 1st – they were deployed on the 1st – the last murder occurred on 30 June. So there has not been a murder up to today, 1 August. I am just making – it is very interesting, and so we must learn from those lessons. It look like boots on the ground help, but we must also bring our social interventions – so that the army can really leave in three months' time when they have assisted with stabilisation.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You are really beginning to speak.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Fritz. I recognise hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to know what steps the Department of Community Safety, together with the Western Cape Government, is taking to ensure and to keep us safe when the troops are no longer here?

The SPEAKER: The hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, Mr Speaker, the Premier has convened a Premier's Safety Priority Committee, and that Committee, the whole idea with that Committee is to – he personally convened it, that is how seriously we regard that Committee, or the whole issue of safety, and that Committee brings along all departments; from Health – who pays R25 000 for every death. You know, every murder you pay – after the person is dead they pay R25 000; to Social Development that will assist with trauma counselling and other interventions; to Economic Development, they must create work. But our environments must be correct, so that why can't we have a tourism setup in Manenberg? You know, why can't we? Why can't people come and have lunch in Manenberg without fear?

The point we are making is we need youth employment, entrepreneurship and I am starting to answer your other question, hon member Kama, but those are the issues that we need to deal with, Mr Speaker, because until we deal with that, until we deal with kids dropping out of school, getting them to stay in school and finish matric, and letting them go in for skills development with, again, Economic Development. All of that. We are going to have this, as I

said – the Afrikaans is such a beautiful – *wentelbaan* in Afrikaans; 101 quickly: *n wentelbaan* is like a rotating cycle of violence. We must disrupt it, we must stop it, we must end it, all of us, and we can do it. We can never allow evil to survive and to conquer us. And I like the kind of spirit in the House, because I must say hon member Kama works very closely with us. That spirit is going to solve the problem. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.], thank you, hon members and hon Minister Fritz. [Interjections.] Hon members, order please. That concludes this question. The next question is asked by hon member Philander to hon Minister Mbombo. I recognise hon Minister Mbombo.

Order or prioritisation of patients

7. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

- (1) What system is currently being used at health facilities, especially at hospitals, to determine the order or prioritisation of patients;
- (2) whether this system has been adjusted at all; if not, why not; if so, how does this benefit patients?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you again, Chair of the Standing Committee on Health. When it comes to the prioritisation of patients, more specifically at the EC, emergency care, it is not about first come, first served, but it is about the severity of the illness.

We are using a triage scale that was developed in round about 2005, and it continues to be monitored. It started in the Western Cape, but almost all the hospitals throughout the country have adopted it. It is evidence-based, and how does it work? Triage recommends several reasons:

- For each emergency, treatment delivery is accelerated for patients with life-threatening conditions or injuries.
- All patients requiring emergency care are categorised according to their clinical status.
- Patient flow through the emergency centres improves, thus you can decrease the overcrowding.
- Patient satisfaction increases and aggression may be prevented when you put all of them in one place.
- The length of stay can decrease.
- Allowance is made for streaming of less urgent patients.

More specifically the next point about:

- The improvement of infection control, especially where you need to manage blood spills as well as patients with potential infectious diseases.
- Improved personal satisfaction, particularly in the frontline, in reception personnel.

The South African Triage Scale, SATS, also uses different tools according to

the age, and each tool consists of what we call the Triage Early Warning Score, because they do scoring. It is scientific method where it looks at:

- Patients in terms of mobility, if a patient is able to move;
- Respiratory rate, if the patient can breathe or not;
- Heart rate, where they check, using a stethoscope, your heart rate, and they check your blood pressure, they check your temperature. They also look your level of consciousness, for example, are you alert, are you responding to voices, are you responding to pain; whether you are unresponsive, and then using the scale.
- And then, also, if there has been a history of previous injuries, especially trauma.

They look at all of those. So this is a scale, as I indicated, that has been adopted through South Africa, that is used in the Emergency Care Services.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. Just before I recognise hon member Philander, I am not canvassing for hon members to highlight whether they want to speak, but at times I see hon members get more and more involved as the questions continue.

So I would request that if you want to speak, please indicate upfront so that you do not get to a point where you think that you are being denied an opportunity.

I recognise hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. We now understand how the system works. I would like to know how does this impact or how has it influenced the turnaround time on patient assistance? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mbombo, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It depends on the severity of the illness, for example, if you have got a multiple gunshot wound it might take longer to manage, compared to probably you are bringing a child with a difficulty in breathing, because within that EC you have got the patients who are coming as an emergency through trauma, blood and so forth. They might need operations; and then you have got chronic cases who might have developed complications. Whether it is a 8-year old; a mom who has got diabetes, but now she has got complications, so it depends.

However, previously you would find that you might not be able to know when they come in and then up to the time that they went through the process, you might not be able to track the patient. For example, you call, “There was a patient who came there, where is he or she?”

Now we are using a technology called Hemis where people get punched in within the system, and then you are able to track each and every station they go to. It will become easier to know how long – because there are some

people who call and say “I have been here for six hours,” and then when you check in the system they are actually still at the X-Ray department and have been there for only one hour.

So as we evolve we keep on using innovation and the technology to be able to check that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. I recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Mr Speaker, I hear the good intentions of this wonderful system, but I want to understand now, how does such a system help improve patients’ experiences when challenges of staffing and bed shortages remain unaddressed. The bed shortages and staff shortages.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Unfortunately the demand is more than the supply because we need resources. It is true. You may go to an emergency centre where the person has been served throughout but he is waiting for a bed in terms of admission, for example. When I go on oversight visits in the emergency centres I will find that there will be a folder, like a yellow or orange folder where patients who have been seen – because once you enter, there may be a lot of patients, but the question is have they been seen? So you can check whether everyone has been seen; whether the box is empty or

not; and then you can check on those who have not been seen.

So the point is there are patients who might be sitting on chairs even for three days. They are waiting for the beds in terms of admission, and unfortunately the bed occupancy rate is above 85% generally across the province. By internationally accepted norms, 85% means the beds are full, but we go to hospitals like Helderberg, Wesfleur and whatever, where for instance like in Khayelitsha are at 110%.

So what matters is, that whilst the patient is sitting, they might be sitting on a couch, are their vital signs being taken, is their medication being given? Of course the discomfort of sitting on a chair will make you feel, “No, it is too much, let me take my blanket and put it on the floor” but what matters is that the person been seen.

Unfortunately it is across the country, you can go anywhere, the burden of disease, where you will find patients that come with different illnesses. The more people are unemployed, the poorer they are, the more ill they get and then present with comorbidities. So it is no longer only one illness. People will have hypertension, diabetes, arthritis and so forth. So there is going to be lots of waiting.

Now also, in terms of resources, you probably might have heard that our budgets to the provinces have been cut by 5%, meaning for us, we normally have a R24 billion budget. R1.3 billion for 2020/21 – it is a minus. If I could

equate that, it is the budget, the yearly budget, for Karl Bremer Hospital, Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha combined. It means that for R1.3 billion you might have to close all those three hospitals if you do not get such.

Yes, we are under pressure. We do as much as we can, we try innovative ways to do many of the things. That is why we do not dismiss patients when they complain. We go out of our way, but unfortunately the whole Health system in the country is under distress. It is in ICU.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. I recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think some of the questions have been partly covered by the Minister.

I just want to emphasise one issue. The Minister spoke about a system that has been put in place, a device, to track patients in the ward, or I mean the hospital. I want to know when did it start and how effective is it because we have recently received numerous complaints about people dying, waiting at hospitals for more than a day and so? So I want to know how effective it is.

Also, you mentioned that the hospitals are in ICU. Have you tried to conduct research in other countries to find out how you can combat this situation in South Africa? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. I recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. The MEC for Safety has just mentioned now how crime impacts on Health. As I always say the Health budget actually goes to crime.

I was just mentioning in terms of the normal kind, the average that we are used to. With crime now you will find that most of the patients, the multiple bullet wounds, the stab wounds and so forth, come to the EC. So in terms of triage they will be red patients, which means that the interventions must be within terms of preventing death and also complications.

Now for argument sake, there is Zuma Mbombo, there is a child or whoever, who might have been triaged as a yellow or as green, probably there since five a.m., but with the amount of people – like, for example, in Khayelitsha this weekend, Friday, Saturday, Sunday; each and every payday weekend, there were more than 100 cases at the EC, an average of 26 each day for resuscitation, meaning that people who might not necessarily have been red patients, emergencies, will end up waiting, because we have to save the lives of the red patients.

Now the question you were asking about us tracking that. You would have tracked that actually as the patient came, we triaged as a yellow or as a green, and then people came with stab wounds and whatever, prioritised.

Whilst he was green, once she or he end up being assessed, actually he had gone from green to yellow. So there is that kind of the whole of the system.

Then actually even the deaths. Whether they die in the hospital or they die outside, they go to our mortuaries for post-mortems. To assess a patient for a post-mortem, hon member Lekker will understand how it works, because she has been so passionate about it. For a multiple bullet wound where it needs a forensic pathologist, which is the top, where the people have got 20 years' experience and they are specialists, they are professors, it takes longer to find the cause of death. Then down the line, the people they are calling, "Can you please release the bodies of our loved ones, because we want to bury them," but unfortunately for the sake of justice, part of the inquest, because it is a crime scene, we have to do some justice. In some cases the same pathologist has to go to be witnesses in court in terms of the cause of death.

So that is why I am saying that whilst we are trying to strengthen our systems you will find that with the lack of resources we will always have these kind of situations in terms of the response. As I indicated, it happens everywhere. At Baragwanath Hospital, you will hear the same but understand also that the Western Cape and Gauteng, because of the in migration, the patient numbers, are completely different. For example, in the Eastern Cape I know that the bed occupancy is even below 76%. It is 60 something in others. So they might not have some of those challenges if you go to Cecilia Makiwane and whatever. There might be those that are rated communicable diseases.

Now in terms of other countries that is why we are welcoming the Universal Health Coverage, UHC, that is coming, it is long overdue and is happening in all other countries. It is related to the quality of care, financial risk protection so that you do not only need to have money in order to be able to access care; and also the issue of the equity, so we are welcoming that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. It does appear that no more member - hon member Philander? Alright, you are welcome, hon member.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. This system that we are referring to, is this implemented nationally? Of course there is always room for improvement, but there is a world of difference; or is it a Western Cape initiative? I would like to establish that. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Initially it was tested as part of research by the Western Cape in 2005, then it ended up being adopted by South Africa.

So it is well-researched with various inputs across the board but this is a customised intervention that is done internationally. Everywhere you go they use the triage system, but because of the changes of the disease profile in South Africa we have to keep on customising it, because in some parts, like in Japan, it might be a 120 year old who is only presenting with a sore thumb as an emergency, compared to here.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. Unfortunately, hon member Marais, I recognised you late, because, again, as I requested earlier, you indicated a bit late, and that now exhausts the time for questions to this specific question.

Mr P J MARAIS: I did indicate three times, but I accept your ruling; you did not see me three times.

The SPEAKER: Ja, I ...[Laughter.] I now know that I will see you first in the next one. [Laughter.] My apologies, hon member.

The next is Question number 8 asked by hon member Bosman to hon Minister Fernandez, the Minister of Social Development. I recognise you, hon member.

Bosasa: corruption at

8. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Social Development:

- (1) Whether the people of the province has been disadvantaged by the corruption at Bosasa; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) (a) what is the involvement of Bosasa in youth care centres in the province and (b) how is the Provincial Government mitigating the impact of the liquidation of Bosasa?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, I wish to thank

the hon member for the question. The question has two parts, I will deal with Part 1 first and it is regarding Bosasa.

Provincial Treasury has finalised a report on its transversal investigation into all of the Western Cape's dealings with Bosasa. The Provincial Forensic Services has furthermore being tasked with investigating allegations which were made at the Zondo Commission relating to payments to two former employees of the Department of Social Development by Bosasa. The findings of Treasury and the Provincial Forensic Service investigations will be able to determine whether the people of the province have been disadvantaged by the alleged corruption at Bosasa. The Treasury report is currently with the AG who is studying the content thereof.

Part 2 of the question: Bosasa had previously been contracted by the Western Cape Department of Social Development to run two secure Child and Youth Care Centres, one at Horizon facility in Eerste River and one in Clanwilliam. Bosasa itself is no longer involved in the rendering of these services since the company was placed under liquidation. The continued rendering of these services is now the responsibility of the liquidators who have undertaken to maintain operations at the two centres until the expiry, in May 2020, of the existing contract for these services originally held by Bosasa.

The Province has held numerous engagements with the liquidators of Bosasa to ensure operations continue at Horizon and at Clanwilliam and has undertaken an urgent organisational design process to create posts on the

structure of the Department of Social Development to ensure and enable the Department to take over the running of the two centres when the liquidator ceases operation. The structure has been finalised and consulted with the unions. It was signed off by Minister Fritz on 26 March and it is currently with the Department of the Premier who will have to send it to the Minister of Public Service and Administration for consultation as required. Thereafter the posts on the new structure will be advertised and filled from the 1st June 2020 to ensure a seamless handover from the liquidators to the Department. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon, the Minister. Are there any follow-ups? None whatsoever. That concludes Question number 8. Now we are on Question number 13 and that is to Minister Mbombo and the question is asked by hon Windvogel. I recognise the hon Minister.

National Health Insurance rollout: state of readiness

13. Ms R Windvogel asked the Minister of Health:

(a) What is the state of readiness for the rollout of the National Health Insurance (NHI) in the province and (b) which lessons were learned from the NHI pilot project?

†Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Arme foeitog. [Gelag.]

[The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Oh shame. [Laughs.]] It shows it is Women's Month.

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] *foeitog*?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I said *arme foeitog*.

The SPEAKER: Oh. [Laughs.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is me again.

The SPEAKER: Right.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I have been baptised because it is Women's Month. Thank you member Windvogel for the question about the state of readiness for the rollout of NHI in the province and what lessons were learned for the project.

The National Minister is convinced that the NHI, as conceptualised, is the answer to take us towards universal health coverage for all. NB! NB! NHI and universal coverage is not the same thing but the Western Cape does not agree that is the right path, especially in the form it was presented to the National Council of Provinces, noting that the NHI Bill was only sent to Parliament last Friday. So when the Minister spoke at the National Council of Provinces, that is what he presented.

We are committed as a Government to UHC, that is the need to ensure access to quality health services and financial risk protection. We welcome UHC as

a vision for addressing equity, quality of care and access to care. What we do not agree with is that NHI will address the current challenges, because we are facing challenges and as I painted for you, understanding what the NHI Bill is not about, to what extent can these challenges be addressed.

We welcome the signing of the Presidential Health Compact as it signifies a move which is committed to strengthening the health system, especially public health towards Universal Health Coverage. That was a good thing that was brought, that Health Compact, because as you look at it, it strengthens the whole system because you cannot strengthen one component of the system, say child health or whatever, all those silos. He said the whole system and we agree, in terms of that Compact.

And it actually has the potential to improve equity, quality of care and access to care and as the Western Cape we are open for business to be the steward for the whole province. Note when I say the whole province, I mean not only for public services inclusive of private but also in terms of the civil society part of this. To this end, we will be convening a consultancy forum with all stakeholders on the 5 September 2019. I am not sure whether the Standing Committee has received the invite. Across health departments, across the country, as I indicated, they are facing similar challenges; a high burden of disease as evidenced by the increased bed occupancy as I have mentioned.

According to the NHI Bill and its thinking, the answer to these problems is the nationalisation of health resources. Probably just to explain, instead of

reading the whole thing, what the NHI Bill is about is where all the resources of the provinces must be nationalised, creating an NHI fund that will be managed at a national level and then they will buy pockets of services.

For example, if they say in Beaufort West they will need services for child health, for children with diarrhoea problems, which service provider is available to do that and then for those that have been accredited that child will be sent there. Provinces have got lesser roles, there is nothing. Private also has a lesser role and they do not talk much in terms of the 15% that are not dependent on public services, they are dependent on private services. They are not saying anything about that. Now in terms of readiness, we might not say we are ready because the Bill has only been passed now and they have not yet sent it to the Province officially so that we can make an input.

In terms of the NHI Pilot site for the Western Cape, it was the Garden Route and there were over 10 or 11 other pilot sites throughout and the report has been made but actually there is nothing you can learn from it. All that was promised, that was supposed to happen, to learn from that, has now been rolled out and you hear how actually nothing has improved, so that is where we are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Minister. I see member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. With the country

over R200 billion in deficit, does the Minister know where this money for implementation will be coming from?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In terms of the projections that were calculated by the then Minister, remember it was just a thumbsuck and it was also based on a three per cent growth in terms of the economy which is now far below that. So at this stage, when you scan the Bill, the possible areas to obtain money, the first thing would be reducing equitable shares from the provinces; secondly to reduce or take away conditional grants from the provinces. Hence there was talk about the centralisation of the central hospitals because we do get a grant, although it is not enough for these two hospitals on our side. I think in Gauteng there are four. In total there are ten and then thirdly, it is about piggybacking and seeing from the medical tax returns, but they are not sure yet.

So where we are is still based on the principle that firstly let us take the money away from the provinces so that 5% bill that I was talking about, although it was not necessarily for the NHI, I mean the 5% for our budget, it is meant for saving the SOE's, so nobody knows where the money will come from, except to rob Paul and pay Pauline. That is the evidence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see the hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Minister, given that the team in the report said that they spent nearly R4 billion on the pilot sites for the NHI and in the

report they concluded that there is no evidence that they improved the life of the clients of the hospitals, why is National Government so adamant [Interjections.] on implementing the NHI, and also given the experience of SAA, Denel and the incompetence of National Government in running these SOEs, how ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... do they think they will be able to run the NHI and why the adavance of implementing another loot pit. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Again ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No one is denying the need for the Universal Health Coverage, it is a must. It cannot be that when you are ill, you end up being very poor because you have to pay for the services. It should not be your income and affordability that becomes the driving factor in terms of being healthy. So we all agree around that. Hence it is crucial, actually just like with other insurance, car insurance, life insurance, funeral insurance, the same applies with health services – you pay before.

It is the nature of the State where they have subsidised the ‘have-nots’ for

example at schools you know that we have got a school rebate ... [Interjections.] for those parents who cannot afford to pay school fees and those who can afford to pay they are also going to be part of that, yet you are all going to receive the same quality education. So the same applies with health. By virtue of the fact that you are a South African citizen, you deserve the best quality of care, irrespective of your affordability, that is UHC.

Now in terms of the pilot sites, one of the flaws – you hear the President came up with an HR stimulus package where it was sort of saving the provinces and then we had our list, for example for the Western Cape. I think we asked for an additional 190 health professionals and so forth and so forth. That money, it was not new money, there were monies that were not spent, for the NHI grant that they kept. So that is why they were now releasing that money, as if they were saving the situation. Note it was only for a three month period, 1 January to March 2019, that the Province received the money and yet the Province ended up appointing almost all of those people. Now we are sitting here with a situation that these people are within the system and we have no money to pay for them. We have not received the money, that is the money that is coming from that NHI previously.

In the Western Cape, because the question was has this improved, we must reflect in terms the Garden Route. Yes, in terms of the improvement in the infrastructure, we opened the new Oudtshoorn Hospital. Others are delayed, like the Pacaltsdorp Clinic that was supposed to be extended. We are still talking about their language even now and so forth and so forth. They tried to

come up with school health; we find that those school health buses and whatever are still standing there and so forth and so forth.

But the most important thing is the grant for GPs. You will recall that there was supposed to be GPs who would be able to assist and see a patient within the health system. In all other provinces, National created a middle person in order to manage, in terms of appointing these GPs. They ended up not meeting the requirements in terms of meeting their achievements. They could not achieve it because you appoint people at a central level, yet those people are supposed to render services there in the remote areas and then when the doctor is absent, nobody knows in this area. They will say I did write to Pretoria. In the Western Cape we chose that we want to have that money so that it becomes parts of the pool and allocated to the districts so that for the Garden Route, they could be able to see where to send the people right throughout, so that is where we are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Minister. Hon member Philander?

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The health budget is already aligned and structured towards this financial year, with increased spending of 36% over three years, does the Minister perhaps know what is the clear plan in terms of how that will be implemented? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That is too technical for me to be able to have

the answers right now because it is not necessarily linked directly to the question that was raised. It is going to be difficult because it needs specific information but I can follow up.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Thank you. That concludes the Questions for today. We move on ... [Interjection.] No terribly sorry. Hon member, you need to understand that there are four responses per question, so if you are not actually putting your hand up then unfortunately you lose. [Interjections.]. Thank you very much. Yes, I see you Chief Whip.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to draw your attention to the fact I have noted one of the members from this side raised her hand several times but you could hardly look at this side. So next time can I just ask that you look around the House and not focus on one side.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So noted. Absolutely, thank you. We now move onto Statements. I see the hon Deputy Chief Whip.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D G MITCHELL (DA): Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, we do not put up

our hands in this House, you get up if you want to speak.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You really do not have to be so petty. You are being so petty. [Interjections]. You would rather ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So noted, thank you. Order members. Can we move onto Statements. I recognise the DA. [Interjections].

Mr R I ALLEN (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape deserves a police service that is responsive, effective and efficient, led by a competent and experienced policing professional who always puts the safety interests of the entire province first.

As such, the permanent appointment of a Western Cape Police Commissioner should be handled with caution and media comments by anonymous sources as to who should be appointed, does not bode well for the stability in the ranks of the South African Police Service.

All the relevant stakeholders within the Western Cape have agreed to act in a unified manner in the best interests of safety in the province and any pressure to finalise the appointment of a permanent Police Commissioner in the Western Cape by the end of August 2019, might hinder a necessary transparent process where appointees should be thoroughly vetted.

Chapter 11, Section 207 of the Constitution provides that the National Police

Commissioner with the concurrence of the Provincial Executive must appoint a man or a woman as the Provincial Police Commissioner. In exercising this provision, we will ensure that a non-partial individual with traits of accessibility, transparency and accountability that is beyond reproach, with the necessary experience and qualifications, be appointed.

We will also press that the appointment be completed in a timely manner but stress the importance of an open and transparent process. Lastly, we urge the current Acting Police Commissioner Lieutenant-General Sindile Mfazi, to prioritise stability in the ranks of the police and to ensure the continuation of policing services in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the ANC.

Mr A LILI (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Our statement is read as follows: What is the DA doing about its new Human Settlements MEC, hon Tertuis Simmers ... [Interjections.] and the many allegations against him? [Interjections.] No wonder people are losing confidence in the DA. Newspaper archives are long overflowing with information of wrongdoing. What example does he set for the DA followers to emulate by ignoring the many allegations, yet the DA preaches to other parties on taking steps against their public representatives? There are those allegations of driving around party-faithfuls without a valid driver's licence and that another senior DA member ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Member could you just take your seat please. I see the Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I rise on Rule 59, Reflections Upon Members, and I would like you to rule on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If I can consult the Hansard and actually refer back to you. Thank you because I did not hear that.

Mr A LILI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Do not panic hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can continue.

Mr A LILI: There are those allegations of driving around party-faithfuls without a valid driver's licence and that another senior DA member of this Government supplied the vehicle. But it is in the newspaper stories this week that speak to averred ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lili, can you please take your seat. I see the Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on Rule 59.2 under Reflections Upon Members, and I want you to rule on that. [Interjections.]. Go and read the Rules. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members again, once again, I will actually consult the Hansard. As far as I can see, can I just check with the Table staff, is your time up? Yes it is. Your time is up hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: No, no, no [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, no that is unfair. You cannot allow that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No he did not ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ... hon member to interrupt me.

Mr D G MITCHELL: That was a point of order.

Mr A LILI: No that is really out of order ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ... on your part.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, let me explain. Your time was up before he rose.

Mr A LILI: No, no, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am watching the Table staff

Mr A LILI: Chief Whip please. Chief Whip at all times you must be partial.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just have a seat. I see the hon Chief Whip. Give me a second hon Lili. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The Rules are very clear ... [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: That is an example of biasedness.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am trying to establish what the facts are. Hon member just sit down for second please.

Mr A LILI: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Definitely, but if the Chief Whip rises we have to let you sit down. [Interjections.] Relax, yes.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The Rules are very clear that members may make statements for not more than two minutes. So unfortunately if the member speaks slowly and does not get to the point within two minutes, that is hardly the fault of the Chair and the Rules so provide.

Mr A LILI: Unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker, my phone is just in front of me. Maybe she is misleading the House by suggesting that I even passed two minutes. [Interjections.]. You are misleading us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can I ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Please allow me to finish.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... I speak. May I speak, address you?

Mr A LILI: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So there is no malice here. When the Table staff tell me that the time is up, then the time is up. It honestly is no particular malice towards any member in this House.

Mr A LILI: Can I ask you a question, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes you may.

Mr A LILI: How many minutes did I speak?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table staff? For a full two minutes.

Mr A LILI: How many?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A full two minutes.

Mr A LILI: No, but you must be honest here in this House, Deputy Speaker.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please hon member ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: My phone was just in front of me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are starting on a good note please do not cast aspersions on the Speaker. [Interjections].

Mr A LILI: That hon member interrupted me twice. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear you but I am telling you now that the Table staff had alerted me that the time was up. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: No, [Interjections.] No. You see, Chief Whip, I do not think, I am sorry ... [Interjections.]. Hon Deputy Speaker, what you are doing is really unfair on my part. I am not sure whether now you are ruling on the basis of party politics or on the basis ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not at all.

Mr A LILI: No because ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

Mr A LILI: ... my time is just in front of me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You know I think that we are going to have another solution to this time issue ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... because if the Speaker's office decides to display time on either side then there is going to be no flexibility. [Interjections.]. So I think that we have to stop thinking that anybody that sits in this Chair is deliberately trying to take time away from anybody. There is absolutely no reason for you to actually cast aspersions at the Table staff or to myself hon member. I think that we are only being fair.

Mr A LILI: It is in the open for everyone ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: A point of order.

Mr A LILI: ... even in the gallery, everyone can see ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, we will certainly look at that.

Mr A LILI: ... that you are just biased ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: A point of order.

Mr A LILI: ... on that side of the House. [Interjections]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

Mr A LILI: Two of them, they interrupted me ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: A point of order.

Mr A LILI: ... without even finishing my statement because I ...
[Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can I ask you to sit so that I can actually hear the Chief Whip. Thank you very much. Chief Whip?

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Deputy Speaker, it might be worth informing the member that if there are interjections that the clock is stopped during the point of order and then the member's time is resumed only once the point of order is concluded. So the time allotted to the member is two minutes in toto, excluding a point of order. Is that correct?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is quite correct.

Mr A LILI: Again that is not true. [Interjections]. That is not true. It did not happen like that.

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

Mr A LILI: You must allow ... I mean Speaker you must, even if my statement hurts the hon Chief Whip, at least he must allow me to finish my statement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately, hon member, the time was up.

Mr A LILI: Less than one minute because I only spoke less than one minute. Then you are saying I spoke more than two minutes. I mean it is unfair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not being unfair.

Mr A LILI: And it is wrong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is actually just fact.

Mr A LILI: Chief Whip, if you are going to ... [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please hon member, thank you much. I see the Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Deputy Speaker, can you please rule ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am rising on Rule 62, the reflection on the holders of the office. It is quite clear if there is an issue with the Chair that there is a process to be followed. Can you please rule so we can continue. [Interjections.].

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Again, no Deputy Speaker. I will not allow this ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have not recognised you.

Mr A LILI: I will not allow this member to continuously quote the Rules without even a [Inaudible.] ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: No, he cannot.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have not addressed ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: He must not mislead here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili you cannot just stand up every two minutes and take the floor. [Interjections.]. Okay, this is how it works. You stand up and you wait until I recognise you ... [Interjection.].

Mr A LILI: It is unfair because they just stand up and speak as and when they wish.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, this is the last time. I am asking when you stand up and want to be recognised, stand up and allow me to recognise you.

Mr A LILI: That is what I did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you are shouting as you are getting up.

Mr A LILI: No, that is what I did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please may I ask that you abide by the way that the House operates.

Mr A LILI: I did the same thing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on. I recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. Living in a home with intact asbestos does not necessarily pose a health risk but when the asbestos material in your home deteriorates over time or becomes disturbed, damaged asbestos fibres can be released into the air. Asbestos is a material with lots of staying power, fibres can stay around for a very long time. Research has conclusively proven that asbestos over time plays a health risk to people. For a long time asbestos was used for the building of older homes and for roofs as well. This was the case in a small town on the West Coast called Hopefield. A number of families in Hopefield can now live in asbestos free homes thanks to the DA led Saldanha Bay Municipality. These families lived in formal accommodation units which were purchased in 1992 by the former Hopefield Municipality and rented to the occupants.

The informal accommodation units were initially purchased for a group of 45 families living in Hopefield from the then Spoornet which is now known as Transnet and were manufactured from asbestos. To address the serious health risks posed to inhabitants by the asbestos units, the Saldanha Bay Municipality set out to help these residents with more suitable living accommodation. The Municipality engaged with the Western Cape Provincial Government with the aim to replace the structures with a subsidised low cost housing project. The project was initially designed to replace the initial 42 asbestos units but an additional 20 units were added to ensure that residents on the Hopefield housing waiting list could also be accommodated and I am

happy to say Madam Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Member, your time is up.

Mr D AMERICA: Today we can confidently say that those ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time is up.

Mr D AMERICA: ... occupants and their children have been freed from ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Member, your time is up. [Interjections].

Mr D AMERICA: ... the dangers of asbestos.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. [Interjections.] Your time is up. I see the Good Party.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is regretful that the Premier is not here but obviously we understand why he is not here and we share those condolences. Last week the Premier in his reply indicated to the House that he would unlock all blockages to affordable housing at Tafelberg and Woodstock and I welcome that statement that he made. But it would be useful for this House to understand how that is going to happen.

The Tafelberg site was earmarked for social housing. The previous Cabinet

made a decision to sell that site and the sale of that site is now on review before the Western Cape High Court. So I would request that if a Cabinet Minister is going to reply in terms of Rule 145(6) that we get some clarity on whether the Cabinet is going to rescind its decision around Tafelberg and if they are going to concede the review and rescind applications. There are two of them before the High Court, one brought by activists and one brought by the Minister of Human Settlements and those two High Court matters are combined. So is the Cabinet going to rescind their decision and concede that and rescind those applications before the Western Cape High Court? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you. I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is on record in this House that we oppose the deployment of the army in our Cape communities. In this House the Premier said in his reply that the army is making an impact because the previous weekend there were 25 murders. Before the army, it was 42 murders. But this past weekend, as was said, there were 46 murders and Khayelitsha is once again one of the areas with the most murders. Before that it was Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha the previous week.

I ask and we urge, the ACDP urges, the Community Safety Budget to be increased significantly to make an impact in the communities and also to resource our community, our Police Forums and also our Neighbourhood Watches. The answers are in there, give the communities more power, give

them more resources and then we will be able to combat crime. The army is not the solution. R23 million for three months is down the drain. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the ANC.

Mr D SMITH (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, DA run municipalities are in chaos in the Western Cape and people have lost trust in the DA councils. In Matzikama this week the DA was voted out of power. [Interjections.]. The people have spoken through their councillor's ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH: ... votes of no confidence [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH: This follows the Cederberg where the DA lost control in a motion of no confidence in the mickey mouse DA leaders in the party as a whole.

An HON MEMBER: With your money.

Mr D SMITH: Almost on a weekly basis another municipality sounds the call to be delivered from the DA. Who will be the next DA led municipality to fall and to be replaced? [Interjections.] Watch this space, hon Deputy

Speaker. [Interjections.] To add fuel to the fire ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH: The DA brags of its so called readiness for the fire season. In the latest fire disaster, the Masiphumelele area was hit the hardest with a resident killed, almost 1,300 structures destroyed and three firefighters injured. Clearly Cape Town struggles to get a grip on killer fires and floods. On the water front, the DA still struggles to get supply in drier areas on course but also on overcharging Cape Town where its restrictions are set high for the supply that has been restored by the bountiful rain. And in Tshwane, the DA refuses to disclose fully the golden handshake for a senior official [Interjections.] who is said to have taken R7 million. That is the DA fleecing the people. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you. I recognise the DA. [Interjections.]
Order. [Interjections.] Can you put her microphone on?

Ms D BAARTMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans. Recently Eskom reported a R20,7 billion loss for the 2018/19 financial year, its second consecutive multi-billion rand annual loss. This is the National Energy Supplier that is responsible for 95% of South Africa's power. Further, Eskom requires a R59 billion bailout over two years. We are still waiting on the President's promise that Eskom will be broken up into three separate entities. However, the following interventions would empower the

communities of the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... to become more energy secure. Firstly, NERSA should remove the cap on tariffs and licencing for the Independent Power Producers, IPPs, that prevent them from producing more than one megawatt. Secondly, the National Minister of Energy should approve procurement of electricity for municipalities directly from IPPs so that every community in the Western Cape has the freedom not to use Eskom. Finally, the taxes received by the National Treasury from the Western Cape for Eskom should be reallocated back to our province to ensure that we are able to make energy affordable for all communities ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... in the Western Cape. We are wasting precious money ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... that could have been spent on service delivery. The Western Cape Government is bearing the brunt of National Government's failures, greed, sloth and gluttony. By relying on Eskom we will continuously fear the possibility of children not being able to pass exams due to load-

shedding, we will continue to fear businesses having to close up shop.
[Interjections.] We do not need Eskom ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms D BAARTMAN: ... hon Deputy Speaker, Eskom needs us. Let us bring power to the people. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I do not see the Freedom Front Plus so I recognise Al Jama-ah. No? Okay, I recognise the DA.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Statistiek Suid-Afrika het hierdie week aangekondig dat die werkloosheidskoers in Suid-Afrika tot 29% gestyg het en dat die Wes-Kaap die enigste provinsie was wat daarin geslaag het ... [Tussenwerpsels.] om die werkloosheidskoers te laat verminder.

Om die 29% in perspektief te stel, toe die Groot Depressie van die 1930s op sy ergste was, was werkloosheid in Amerika maar 25%. Baie Suid-Afrikaners het al moed verloor en opgehou soek na werk. So die werklike werkloosheidskoers is waarskynlik meer as 40%.

Maar tien jaar gelede het die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan verskyn en dit het ons met 'n klomp hoop vervul en President Ramaphosa was nogal die

ondervoorsitter van daardie paneel kundiges. Hierdie plan spel in detail uit hoedat die landbousektor onder andere deur sinvolle grondhervorming en staatsbesproeiingskemas daarin sou kan slaag om een miljoen addisionele werksgeleenthede te skep tussen daardie tyd en 2030.

Ongelukkig was die implimentering van die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan nooit 'n prioriteit van die ANC-regering nie. Kyk maar na die verdragings in die konstruksie van belangrike staatswaterskemas in die Wes-Kaap. Ook die oordrag van grond aan opkomende boere het tot stilstand geknars. [Tussenwerpsel.] Nou is daar 'n nuwe stok in die speek van werkskepping. Planne vir die onteiening van grond sonder 'n billike vergoeding het ernstige implikasies vir ons bankstelsel en die uitbreiding van landbou. So sal die eenmiljoen werkskeppingsteiken nooit behaal word nie.

Dit is duidelik dat die ANC sy rug gedraai het op die armes en werkloes terwyl die elite met mekaar kompeteer oor die duurste motors, oorsese reise en Ministerswonings. En hou dop, grootskaalse onteiening van grond sonder vergoeding sal die korrupsie met grondhervorming en werkloosheid hand oor hand laat toeneem. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Statistics South Africa has announced this week that the unemployment rate in South Africa has risen to 29% and that the Western Cape was the only province that has succeeded ...

[Interjections.] in reducing the unemployment rate.

To put the 29% in perspective, when the Great Depression of the 1930s was at its worst, unemployment in America was only 25%. Many South Africans have already been discouraged and stopped looking for work. So the real unemployment rate is probably more than 40%.

But ten years ago the National Development Plan appeared and it filled us with a lot of hope, and President Ramaphosa was the deputy chairman of that panel of experts. This plan spells out in detail how the agricultural sector amongst others, through sensible land reform and state irrigation schemes can succeed in creating one million additional job opportunities between then and 2030.

Unfortunately the implementation of the National Development Plan has never been a priority of the ANC Government. Just look at the delays in the construction of important state water schemes in the Western Cape. The transfer of land to emerging farmers has also ground to a halt [Interjection.] Now there is a new spoke in the wheel of job creation. Plans for the expropriation without compensation have serious implications for our banking system and the expansion of agriculture. In this way the target of the creation of one million job opportunities will never be achieved.

It is clear that the ANC has turned its back on the poor and jobless while the elite compete with each other for the most expensive cars, overseas trips and

Ministers' houses. And just watch, large scale expropriation of land without compensation will see corruption with land reform and unemployment escalate hand over hand. Thank you. [Interjection.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, that concludes the end of the Statements. Is there a Minister who wishes to respond as contemplated in Standing Rule 145.6? I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Chairperson. Yes, I want to respond. I want to respond to hon Smith's statement on Cederberg. The illegal takeover of the Council was rectified by the Court and we are very pleased about that. [Interjections.]. I really hope that the ANC will bear the brunt of the cost because it was a cost order against the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chairperson, the takeover of Matzikama, the people will take the pain of the ANC greed. We will see that in future. I can assure you of that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chairperson, we accept it. We accept it because it is a choice ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It was a legal takeover and we have accepted it. Cederberg was an illegal takeover. The ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: If the ANC can convince the people that they must vote for them, the people will pay the price at the end of the day and we will see it, we will see it with appointments, we will see it with the promises that will happen over the next month and we will bring it back to this House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Chairperson, on the water, I just want to rectify and want to bring it to the attention of the hon Smith that bulk water is a national function. [Interjections.]. He must read the

Constitution. It is a national function. It was the DA run province ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and the DA run Metro who saved us
from Day Zero ... [Interjections.] and we will continue ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Because of a bankrupt National
Department of Water and Sanitation, we need to pay the brunt, we will come
up with a water plan, a long term water plan and because of the inefficiency
of the ANC Government, we will need to fix all our resources, electricity,
sanitation, refuse etc. because we are going to pay a dear price for the mess
that Eskom is in. R59 billion. We will at a later stage explain to this House
how much money that really is. Thank you hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, very much, hon Minister. [Applause.]
Hon members, if I can just have your attention before we move on with the
business of the day. Before we proceed with the Motions, I would like to
remind members that all Motions must be typed, signed and be handed to the

Table staff immediately after they have been moved.

Members must also ensure that all particulars of the people or the organisation you mention in the motion, including addresses, must be provided if you would like any copy to actually go to those persons concerned. So, we will now move to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the DA.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of learner numbers on education increasing in the Western Cape and the fact that the equitable share does not make provision for the complete budget to follow the learner to this province. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates crime and safety in the province. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the member from GOOD. Hon Herron, did you put your hand up? No? Sorry. I see the DA.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the attacks on members of the SAPS and the Emergency Services and to find solutions to prevent further attacks.
Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the skewed patterns of land ownership and the spatial legacy in this province.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the importance of Women's Month and the upcoming National Women's Day as a tribute to the women's march that took place on 9 August 1956. We celebrate the women who lead our governments, drive legislative changes, help our communities and keep our families safe. We also remember those women and mothers who have lost their lives and children to violence, as a woman also has the right to live her life safely and free of violence and where the criminal justice system is failing our women today, as women remain the most vulnerable members of society, our struggle still continues today. We salute the brave women of our time. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that the Provincial Department of Health has failed to adhere to the Auditor-General's call to address the identified risk of

its central database which does not verify the BBBEE status level of suppliers, which it said it would address by 1 October 2016; calls on MEC Mbombo to take the House and the emerging business people into confidence that this would be addressed soon; and calls for a review of the supplier database for all departments to check how many BBBEE compliant companies are awarded contracts in the province. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the DA.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, at its next sitting, debates the unemployment rate in the Western Cape with particular emphasis on the impact of the Eskom bailout on the province's economy. I thank you. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the ANC.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern the poor state of water systems in the City of Cape Town after people's lives were put at risk following a

process control fault at the Faure Water Treatment Plant which resulted in discolouration of water affecting large parts of the Eastern, Central and Southern Suburbs; condemns this and calls for a further investigation and action to be taken against the responsible individuals. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other Motions with Notice? I see the hon member .

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes. Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern the challenges facing the BRT system in the Western Cape, which has resulted in chaos in the operation of Go George and MyCiti; further notes that there are a lot of commonalities in the problems affecting the two projects, which in the main revolve around the non-involvement of stakeholders in the decision making process and the lack of capacitation of some shareholders who are part of the project, especially the taxi owners; also, the persistent delays in the rollout of some of the phases of the project; and we therefore call on the House to place on its agenda for the discussion the causes of the delays in the BRT system.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. So just, as it is our first Motions with Notice, their's differ slightly if you have come from the National Assembly. They are much shorter. So we could just check that your motions are short, to the point. Thank you. I see the hon member.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the state of health in the province.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other Motions with Notice? That concludes Notices of Motions. We now move over to Motions Without Notice in terms of Rule 150. I recognise the DA.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the High Court ruling on the unlawful motion of no confidence against the DA in Cederberg Municipality and that the ANC, together with those who initiated this injustice, will be held responsible for legal costs – hon Smith – [Interjections.] in accordance with the Constitution. Hon Deputy Speaker, I so move. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges Mondale High School in Mitchells Plain for excellent work; on Tuesday 30 July 2019, the Standing Committee on Education did an oversight visit in Mondale and we were surprised and amazed to see the infrastructure and the maintenance of the school
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, DA Government!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS:

Hon Deputy Speaker, the school is doing exceptionally well under the leadership of the Principal, Mr Bridgens, and the school has obtained 24

merit awards and has been recognised as the fourth top school in South Africa 2015 by Prof Jonathan Jansen. The learners also represent the school in various sports codes; very good in soccer and Springbok colours in various activities. So we want to congratulate them and say, well done to Mr Bridgens and his team. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If no, it will be printed in the Minutes. I recognise the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sincere condolences to the family of Wayne Donavan April, a contract worker who died tragically at the Forest Village Housing Development site on Tuesday, 30 July 2019. We share our deepest sympathies with his wife and family during this difficult time of grief and mourning. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No? Then objection agreed to. I recognise you, hon member.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commiserates with the family of 30 year old Anthea Thopps, whose body was found inside her home in Beaufort West during the early hours of Sunday morning, 20 July; notes further that Thopps' murder follows that one of Samantha May who was stabbed in the town earlier last month and no arrests has been made in both cases; calls for police to expedite the investigations into these murders and for urgent interventions to improve safety of women and children in the town.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the hon member. Yes.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the City of Cape Town after a successful inter-governmental bid, which included National and the Western Cape Government, including Netball SA, to host the 2023 Netball World Cup

to be played at the Cape Town International Convention Centre; Cape Town will be the first city on the continent of Africa to host this event and it is a major boost for Netball South Africa; the netball world will further elevate the sport and plays a vital role in giving hope and opportunities to aspiring future netball stars. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections being moved? No? The motion is agreed to. I recognise you, member, first and then member Mackenzie is after.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that in order for us to solve safety issues and murders amicably, we need an integrated strategy involving all three spheres of government and communities, coupled with maximum unity of all stakeholders; notes further that this will never happen as long as the DA and Premier Winde still view gang murders as a politicking tool as shown by calls for a provincial police force as well as the entire governmental dispute against Minister Cele; rejects these calls and actions by the DA and condemns the Premier for playing politics with people's lives. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the deployment of the army to bring stability in the Western Cape as it affords much necessary help to the provincial police to contain gangsterism and to thank the DA-led Government for calling for the deployment of this army over many years. I so move.
[Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the brutal murder of Mr Bradley Maritz who was tragically stabbed in Beaufort West on 28 July, and conveys our deepest condolences to his family members as well as the broader community of Beaufort West; and we call on the South African Police Services to accelerate its investigation into the murders in this region. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. I recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with a great sense of sadness the passing of Umtato Peter Makhaya Gonono on 19 June 2019; notes further that Mr Gonono was admitted to the hospital on 18 June 2019 and discharged 30 minutes later. He collapsed and died outside of the hospital gate as he was going home. I call on the MEC to account on why a seriously ill patient was discharged from the hospital; we convey our deepest condolences to the wife and family of Umtato Gonono.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sincere condolences to the family of Councillor Moira Opperman of the Overstrand Municipality who passed away on 14 July 2019; we share our deepest sympathies with her family

and loved ones during this difficult time. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the ANC.

Ms A BANS: I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Chuma Matsaluka from Nyanga who has been selected in the top 16 of Miss SA and supports calls by the Nyanga community and Capetonians in general for Premier Winde and MEC Marais and her Department to provide all the necessary support to this jewel of Cape Town on her quest to be crowned Miss SA 2019. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion?

[Interjections.] Motion agreed to. I recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the dam levels in the Western Cape have increased significantly following the good rainfall recently, our largest

dam, Theewaterskloof climbed 8,6% in the past week to reach 61.7% of its capacity; three of the City of Cape Town's dams are now 72% full; the latest average levels with dams across the Western Cape is 56%; this House wishes to acknowledge and express its appreciation to the people of the Western Cape for their continued efforts to conserve and save the precious resource. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? Motion is agreed to. I am going to move over. One over to the ANC and then I will come back to the DA.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that a provincial survey on substance abuse conducted in 2011 found that 66% of learners in the Western Cape used alcohol; notes further that while the Provincial Government is allowing the sale of alcohol in schools, over 50 learners were found to have used alcohol and drugs between January and June and 13 learners were expelled; and supports calls for another high school survey looking at adolescent risk behaviour now that alcohol is sold in schools. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I recognise that there are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the DA, whoever stands up first.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, if you can just say who you are recognising.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

MR A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I know. Yes. [Interjection.]

MR A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move on behalf of the DA
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member has been waiting a long time.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape's traffic police on their innovative use of technology such as computer aided accident and driver fatigue analysis; the installation of cameras in patrol vehicles and the rollout of handheld scanners to verify drivers and vehicle licences, all in

its endeavours to improve road safety. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise – there you go, hon member.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that thousands of learners missed out on the first school term in the province this year; notes further that hundreds remain unplaced despite the fact that we are already in the third term of school ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Not hundreds!

Mr M KAMA:

... and calls the MECs to be held accountable for this. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion?

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House sends condolences to the family of the victim of the fire; well wishes for the injured fire fighters and support to those families affected by the fire in Masiphumelele this week.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objection to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Adelaide Claassen, a hypertension patient, almost died when she was given the wrong prescription by a pharmacist at a Day Hospital; notes further that following a two-day use of the medication she was always sleeping, and could not walk or breastfeed her child, who at this point was also getting sick; condemns the gross negligence by the health care workers in the province and calls for an urgent investigation and remedial action to be taken against workers in question. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the DA-led Western Cape Government for once again having the lowest expanded unemployment rate in South Africa. Further encourage the Western Cape Government to continue with their excellent programmes and initiatives to create the right environment for more job creating opportunities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion?

[Interjections.] The motion has objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the high number of women and children that have died in the province in the past 12 months; notes further that while the carnage continues unabated, the Department of

Social Development has not yet drafted a program of action to end child and women murders as mandated by the Provincial Cabinet; and calls on the Premier to take action against the MEC and for rigorous interventions to end all child murders in the province. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion?
[Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends its sincerest condolences to the family of Mr Maxwell Swartland, executive assistant to the previous Deputy Speaker, Mr Piet Pretorius; Mr Swartland was an instrumental addition to the running of this Legislature, and we honour his life and the work he performed in the best interest of all the people of this province; wish our deepest sympathies with his family and loved ones during this difficult time. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion?
The motion is agreed to. I recognise the ANC. There we go. Hon member.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the implosion of the DA continues in municipalities across the province following another successful motion of no confidence in the DA Mayor and Speaker in Matzikama; notes further that the motion of no confidence that was submitted on 19 July 2019 and signed by 8 out of the 15 councillors, saw the DA removed from power at the full council meeting on 30 July 2019; takes this moment to congratulate the African National Congress and the UD in support with the EFF ... [Interjections.] for taking over the leadership of the embattled ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH:

...Matzikama Municipality. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion [Interjections.]
Objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon
Bosman.

†‘n AGB LID: Dis ‘n seer saak!

[An HON MEMBER: It is a hurting matter!]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN: On behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I move without notice ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! I cannot hear.

Mr G BOSMAN: I hereby move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament hosted a successful Western Cape Youth Parliament in Cape Town on 27 July 2019, with 40 delegates from towns across the province; that the House further notes that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament hosted a successful “Take A Girl Child To Work Day” initiative on 31 July 2019, sponsored by Cell C, with 25 girl children from Trafalgar High School in Cape Town; commend the delegates in both programmes for their robust engagement on the various topics that were pertinent to the Youth of the Western Cape Community including crime, youth unemployment and education; that this House encourages more frequent engagement with the young people and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and caution community members and organisations to

exercise restraint in bringing children to committee meetings during school hours outside of formal and prescribed programmes as this interrupts their schooling and we congratulate the Parliamentary Executive ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute ... [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH:

...for hosting these successful programmes ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon members!

Mr D SMITH: ...and we thank Cell C for their sponsorship.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, may I just remind you that motions are short and succinct and if we, and as I have cautioned earlier, if we can for the next sitting please make sure that that is adhered to. I move over to – are you on again? Hon member Bans. I recognise you.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that today marks the beginning of Women's Month,

which is used to commemorate the 9 August 1956 women's march against draconian apartheid pass laws; notes further that many women in the province are still trapped in the triple challenge of poverty, unemployment and inequality and there are no Government plans for women development; and calls on the Provincial Government to prioritise women development and introduce pro-women programmes. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That it is moved without notice. We do not object to the motion itself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, it is either agree or object. So, do we have any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Baartman and then I recognise hon Lili.

Ms P Z LEKKER: You cannot allow men to abuse us! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I hereby move without notice:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please.

Ms D M BAARTMAN:

That the House notes that Ms Poppie van As, also known as Aunty Poppie, a 63-year old entrepreneur runs a small roadside “Roosterbrood” stand on the N1 in Laingsburg; further notes that Italian representatives of the Eroica South Africa event in Montagu were so impressed with her story that they invited her to Giaole, Italy, to attend the main Eroica event as a special guest in September 2019; encourage the Western Cape community, businesses and Government to support Aunty Poppie by donating funds for her trip through Eroica South Africa on Back A Buddy – link provided – (<https://www.backabuddy.co.za/champion/project/poppie-van-as>) and to follow her journey on Instagram #Poppievanas; commends Eroica for supporting a local entrepreneur in achieving a life-long dream; congratulates Aunty Poppie for this amazing feat that she has achieved and wish her well in her journey and in future endeavours.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion?
[Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the
Order Paper. Hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern reports that MEC Simmers has not
paid R6 947.77 ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Eskom!

Mr A LILI: ... to the George Municipality for the theft of electricity
amounting to [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: To Eskom!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr A LILI: ... over R8000; calls for an urgent investigation into the matter;
and calls on the Premier to reprimand MEC Simmers and find means to
recuperate the stolen money ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. On a point of order?

Mr A LILI: The MEC must pay back the money!

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? [Interjections.] I have a point of order. Hon Chief Whip?

Ms M M WENGER: I rise on ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members, can I ... [Interjection.]

Ms M M WENGER: ... Rule 59(2). A member who wishes to bring any improper conduct on the part of another member to the House may only do so by way of a substantive motion. And therefore this should not be allowed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted. We will disallow the motion. [Interjections.] Can we move on to the DA? [Interjections.]

†Me W F PHILANDER: Dankie, Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis kennis neem van die heengaan van raadslid Mirriam Ali Wilsnach ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without

notice:

That the House notes the death of councillor Mirriam Ali Wilsnach ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Me W F PHILANDER:

...wyksraadslid verbonde aan Saldanha-munisipaliteit en DA Vrouenetwerk-voorsitter vir die kiesafdeling; 'n dinamiese vrou met 'n passie vir haar gemeenskap en 'n ware agent vir verandering; ons medelye en innige simpatie word betuig aan die Wilsnach-familie, naasbestaendes, vriende en gemeenskap. Ek stel so voor. Dankie, Adjunkspeaker.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[Ms W F PHILANDER:

...ward council member of the Saldanha Municipality en DA Womens Network chairman for the constituency; a dynamic woman with a passion for her community and a true agent for change; our

condolences and deepest sympathy to the Wilsnach family, next of kin, friends and community. I so move. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. I see the DA.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the Councillors of the City of Cape Town to whom the honour and title of Alderman was conferred upon on 31 July 2019. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I see the hon Leader of the Opposition.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice, notwithstanding the previous motion from the Chief Whip:

That the House extends its sincere condolences to Premier Winde on the sudden passing of his father, William David Winde. We also extend our condolences to Ingrid, the wife of Mr Winde, as well as his daughter in

law, Tracy and the grandchildren, Jason and Lauren. In particular, and on behalf of the ANC MPL's represented in this Legislature, we would like Premier Winde and his family to know that we hold them in our thoughts and prayers as they come to terms with the loss of someone they held so dear. It is only a few months ago that some of us had the opportunity to meet Mr Winde when he attended the swearing in of members of this House on 22 May and witnessed the election of his son as the Premier of the Western Cape. May the soul of Mr William David Winde rest in eternal peace.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the DA.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends our sincere condolences to the Mazembi family after their son, Kungawa Mazembe's body was found after he went missing on Tuesday, 30 July 2019. We extend our sympathies, thoughts and prayers to the extended family of Kungawa and the community of St Helena Bay on the West Coast for their loss during this time of grief and mourning, I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the ANC.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that hundreds of people have been murdered in the province since the beginning of the year; notes further that even after the deployment of the army, the carnage continues, which shows the crisis is way deeper than what the Provincial Government made it to be and calls on the Provincial Government to put in place drastic measures to address unemployment, poverty and inequality as well as to improve service delivery in poor areas like Marikana, Philippi and the Cape Flats. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to Mr Michael Pokwas on his victory of the by-election in Ward 2, Barrydale in the Swellendam Municipality on 24 July 2019. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. I recognise hon Allen who has been waiting patiently.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Homeless Street Soccer team that is currently competing in the Homeless World Cup in Cardiff in the UK. The Homeless World Cup challenges societal perceptions of homelessness and provides a platform for players to compete on an international stage. Homeless people are entitled to pursue their dreams and we wish Team SA all of the best. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion? Motion agreed to. I recognise the hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that over 1200 of Masiphumelele residents have been displaced by a fire which gutted over 256 structures in the informal settlement on Sunday night, leaving one person dead; notes further that this is not the first fire in the province which led to

the death of a person and loss of property by the poor; condemns the Provincial Government and Municipality's unwillingness to develop an informal settlements plan in the province, as shown by the failure to spend the USD DG grant over the years and calls on National Government to intervene as soon as they possibly can.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion? The motion will be written on the Order Paper. I see the hon Leader of the Opposition.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with great sadness the passing of celebrated South African artist, David Koloane, earlier this month. He was an artist, a writer, a curator, an art critic, a father, a husband and a loving teacher and a resilient visionary. David Koloane was a pioneer of South African anti- and post-apartheid art. We acknowledge the impact of his life as an artist in our province and the broader art community of the Western Cape in South Africa. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. I recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that Alpine Primary School has been burgled ten times this year; the damage done to the schools can be replaced but the emotional damage done to learners whose school projects have been damaged is immeasurable; we call on communities to stop buying stolen goods and work with police to bring these culprits to book. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. I recognise the Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the Houses note the passing of Advocate Estienne Pretorius, who served as the Head of Ministry for Agriculture in the Western Cape Government and wishes to extend our sincerest condolences to his family, friends and loved ones during this time of grief and mourning. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. Members – yes, I recognise the hon Leader of the Opposition.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House noting the appointment of former Premier Helen Zille to the Institute of Race Relations and believing:

- 1) That it has now become obvious that the Institute of Race Relations has become an effective faction of the Democratic Alliance ... [Interjections.] representing the right wing liberals who have resisted the attempts by some in the Democratic Alliance to advance the redress and employment equity imperative and believing;
- 2) that the former Premier will continue to wage an ideological battle within the DA, thus abusing her position in the Institute of Race Relations, therefore resolves to call on all funders of the Institute of Race Relations to investigate the abuse of IRR Funds for factional DA purposes waged from within the Institute of Race Relations. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion? The motion has objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Smith. [Interjections.]
Order.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its deepest condolences to the family of Neville Delpport in Van Rhynsdorp, whose mother passed on last week, Ms Sophia Delpport. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. Are there any other Motions without Notice? Yes? Hon member Philander.

†Me W F PHILANDER: Baie dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis kennis neem van die tragiese heengaan van ‘n gesin van vier; oorledene Stewart Claassen (20), Charis Titus (30), Miguel Titus (14) en Chad-lee Titus (3), woonagtig te Chicago-woonbuurt in Parow-
Oos wat in die oggendure van Sondag 21 Julie 2019 in ‘n brand

omgekom het; hiermee ons medelye en simpatie oordra aan die Claassen- en Titus-families, hul naasbestaendes, vriende en gemeenskap. Ek stel so voor.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the tragic death of a family of four; deceased Stewart Claassen (20), Charis Titus (30), Miguel Titus (14) and Chad-lee Titus (3), residing at Chicago suburb in Parow East, who in the morning hours of Sunday 21 July 2019 died in a fire; herewith convey our condolences and sympathy to the Claassen and Titus families, their next of kin, friends and community. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? Motion agreed to. Any other further Motions without Notice, members? That concludes the business of the day.

The House adjourned at 16:23.