
THURSDAY, 7 NOVEMBER 2024

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order, hon members! Before we proceed, I would like to remind you about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in this Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table Staff, and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings.

Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues, who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

Hon members, the quorum requirements for the Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

Hon members, the Serjeant-at-Arms will record members' attendance.

Hon members, I wish to remind you that in instances where these directives do not cover a particular eventuality the Standing Rules must apply, and in instances where the Rules cannot be applied the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Hon members, the media have also been granted access to the MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, I wish to remind the members of the press that they may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual who is not a member of this House, activates their microphone and video camera, such an individual member will be exited from the Sitting immediately.

Hon members, I also wish to remind the members that are here today in the gallery, who are not members of the House, to please observe the decorum of the House, and not to participate in the proceedings of the House.

Hon members, for this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels.

Hon members, I wish to remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move:

That the House resolves to revive the consideration of the Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Amendment Bill [B8–2023] introduced during the Sixth Parliament, and hereby refers the Amendment Bill to the Standing Committee on Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning for consideration and reporting. I so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved?

No objections? Motion agreed to.

I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP: Hon Speaker, I give notice and move:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1) that precedence be given to the Matter of Public Importance. I so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? Agreed to.

Hon members, we will now deal with the Matter of Public Importance as printed on the Order Paper in terms of Standing Rule 143 and I recognise the hon member Jacobs.

MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE (in terms of Standing Rule 143)

The recent mass shootings that occurred in Bishop Lavis,
Atlantis and Khayelitsha

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, Speaker. Greetings to all!

I greet you all in the name of the Most High, *!goas*.

Premier, Speaker, today I rise with a heavy heart, but before I start can we all just rise and have a moment of silence for all the lives that was lost over the past two weeks.

[Moment of silence observed.]

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you. Thank you, Speaker. Premier, in one of your speeches you said our children are dying and I was thinking to myself, who are our children, but let these names be remembered: Ashley Claassen, Lee-Ann Hendricks, Dylan Desmore, Laverne Swarts, Ricardo Hofmeester, Dylan Thomas, Sergio Baron, Luciano Watson, Dylan Johannes and Kyle Nicholson, and the list goes on and on and on and on.

Hon Speaker, these are the names that will continue to echo through the streets of our communities, because these are our children. These are Coloured children. These are the indigenous children of the Most High; may their souls rest in peace.

Speaker, in the next few days a total of 21 families will be and had already been standing next to open caskets and open graves. These are our sisters, our brothers, our daughters and our sons violently taken away in mass shootings across the Cape Flats.

Hon Speaker, our hearts go out to the families and the victims of these hideous crimes, and we offer our deepest condolences, but, hon Speaker, the sad part is most of our wards are governed by Democratic Alliance Councillors. None of these Councillors, not the MAYCO, not Party Leaders, not the Mayor, nor you, the Premier or the MPLs or any MECs have taken the time out to go and see these families.

Now the crime stats reported in September 2024, 270 gang-related deaths in the country, 234 in the Western Cape; 373 attempted gang murders in the country, 334 in the Western Cape.

Hon Premier, are you aware of the 14-month-old baby that got shot on Monday in Tafelsig, or the Down-syndrome boy that got shot on the farm a few days ago?

Are we in the business of correcting the threats in our communities, because 21 violent murders in six days cannot be the norm in our society – never! It cannot be!

Since 2020 the Provincial Government, in conjunction with the City of Cape Town, embarked on the deployment of so-called LEAP officers. Currently there are 1040 LEAP officers deployed in the Metro, but since 18 September it has been stated that LEAP officers will double up in areas such as Delft, Khayelitsha, Philippi-East, Nyanga and Gugulethu. A Reaction Unit of 120 officers will be deployed in areas such as Manenberg, Hanover Park,

Atlantis, Kraaifontein and Elsies; areas where there are no LEAP officers. Again, we have war on the Cape Flats. Still, we are not being considered to be top priority. Hon Speaker, the mandate of these officers was that they will be deployed in high-crime areas to supply Law Enforcement Services such as the LEAP officers, but we must ask ourselves, was this funding correctly spent? When we see three mass killings in a week, we need to urgently and seriously look into our programmes and plan, and concede, the Government of the Western Cape has failed the Cape Flats, and ultimately the people of the Western Cape.

We need to ask a serious question: Can the deployment of the LEAP officers in the whole be redesigned? We cannot have LEAP officers that were deployed to Atlantis to fight crime, be withdrawn and then deployed to beaches to protect the rich and wealthy. Haibo!

Speaker, these officers were deployed as first responders in high-crime areas and if they were taken away from that main task, then we must acknowledge that this is a huge concern. Leap officers were deployed in high-crime areas, but the crime stats indicated that Cape Town has the highest murder rate in the country. Now this must be an indication that people of the Western Cape, and the people of Cape Town in particular, are left on their own. For the rest of the province, I feel sorry. Looking at the small amounts other municipalities receive compared to what they under-spend on safety and security, it is clear – crime is not high on their agenda, and the Western Cape Safety Plan a huge failure.

Hon Premier, with your Opening of Parliament Speech, all Opposition parties expected you to outline the Safety Plan of the Western Cape, which you failed to deliver. Today we can see the result of that. The Cape Flats is at war. Is this a deliberate move to divert our attention from seeing how our land is being sold to the Jews or is it just simply true that the White person can never drop the crime rate in a Coloured area?

Premier, as the Western Cape Government, you, Speaker, and all of those represented, we need to fix this, and it is up to you to correct your ancestral wrongs.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Jacobs. Hon members in the gallery, you are very welcome in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, and to observe the House Sitting today, but I wish to remind you again that you may not participate, including clapping or participating in the proceedings of the House, but you are very welcome.

I recognise the Minister of Health and Wellness, Minister Wenger.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear! Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Today we debate a topic of critical importance to each and every resident in our province: Crime and Gun Violence in the Western Cape. The recent mass shootings in Bishop Lavis, Khayelitsha and Atlantis have claimed the lives of 15 people, and another five have been hospitalised; not to mention the emotional and psychological trauma it has caused these communities. These horrific incidents are believed to be gang related.

According to the Institute for Security Studies (ISS) between 2017/18 and 2019/20, police recorded 314 incidents in South Africa where three or more people were killed in a single attack. Disturbingly, these crimes increased by almost 50% in that period. Fast forward five years and we continue to experience these horrific and devastating acts of violence in communities. This debate is therefore important, so that we, as law and policymakers, can look at the trends, the data, the reasons, and find ways to stop these atrocities so that never again will such a debate be necessary.

So, what does the data tell us? The Department of Health and Wellness has a Data Centre that collects and analyses trauma data from our Emergency Centres, our Ambulances and Emergency Response, and data also collected from our facilities. The Hospital and Emergency Centre Tracking Information System, or HECTIS, was developed in 2022. HECTIS is the first and only of its kind in South Africa and is a web-based Patient Management System for Emergency Centres that allows the capturing and monitoring of each patient's journey through the system from triage onwards. It is the only system of its kind to exist in both the public and the private sectors and is

now implemented in 69 health facilities in our province.

The HECTIS system helps us to understand the percentage of patients presenting at Emergency Centres due to interpersonal violence or victims of firearm violence at sub-district, district or provincial level. This has led to the development of the Provincial Safety Dashboard, which provides us with invaluable data for sharing with our safety stakeholders.

The number of homicides recorded annually has been steadily increasing, even though the per capita murder rate has decreased. The per capita annual rate of murder in 2022/23 according to the same report by the ISS, puts it at 56 per 100 000 people. To put this into perspective, the United States, which has experienced the highest number of public mass shootings globally, has a homicide rate of 6,3 per 100 000.

Murder trends in the province have also steadily been shifting. In 2017, the number of homicides committed by guns and sharp objects were roughly the same. At the time, 42% of homicides were committed using guns and 41% with sharp objects. By 2021 51% of homicides were committed using guns, a 9% increase, while the use of sharp objects decreased to 32%.

The data points to a worrying picture of communities and healthcare facilities that are held hostage and placed under tremendous strain to deal with what appears to be easy access to illegal firearms and bullets.

This increase in firearm injuries has a direct impact on healthcare facilities right across our province. On average gunshot wounds are seven times more lethal than stab wounds. Patients are also more likely to be shot multiple times. Multiple points of injury create more complex cases and need more complicated and costly medical intervention. Gunshot victims require exhaustive, complex management, including repeat surgeries, critical care and prolonged admission and of course, extensive rehabilitation.

A recent study on the burden and outcomes of firearm injuries at the Mitchells Plain in Heideveld Hospitals found that in 2019 30% of gunshot wound victims sustained more than one firearm injury and required, on average, 3,7 theatre hours and 12 in-patient bed days each. For the Mitchells Plain Hospital alone in 2019, around 2090 theatre hours were used for victims of gunshot wounds. This translated to 87 days of theatre time, and it is predominantly our young men that fall victim to this. Since 2019, men have systematically represented just above 90% of homicide victims.

[Discussion in background – microphone not switched off.]

Distressingly, more than 63% of these men are between the ages of 18 and 25. If we are going to address the systemic issue of violence in society it will take more than the efforts of the Provincial Government. It will take a determined commitment by every resident, civil society, business, and community groups.

[Discussion in background – microphone not switched off.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, my apologies for the interruption. Hon member Kamfer, can I please ask that you mute your microphone or if the Table Staff can assist me.

[Microphone muted.]

My apologies, Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: As I was saying, Mr Speaker, it will require all of us, every resident, civil society, community groups and the South African Police Services and the Provincial Government to approach this issue from various perspectives, and over years reduce and ultimately prevent violence, because we know that prevention is better than cure. Ultimately, the goal is to prevent mass shootings like those in Khayelitsha, Bishop Lavis and Atlantis. That is why, in partnership with the Western Cape Education Department, the Departments of Social Development and Cultural Affairs and Sports, as well as the University of Cape Town, we are working with parents and communities to strengthen social protective factors, and thereby prevent violence.

Research has shown that meaningful connection to one's community during childhood is a strong indicator for future substance abuse and health outcomes.

With our partners, we have launched one of our Pilot Projects, Planet Youth. Planet Youth seeks to strengthen community bonds and aims to prevent our boys and young men from falling victim to gangs or falling prey to gangs. In addition, we are working on family and parenting strengthening programmes, evidence-based socio emotional skills development programmes for children and youth interventions, and although these programmes are very much in their infancy, I am hopeful that strengthening these kinds of social protective factors will prevent many forms of violence, including these horrific mass murder incidents.

By taking hands as society, we cannot only reduce violence but also prevent it. In the immediate term, however, hon Mr Speaker, as this Legislature, we must make it known that this kind of violence and mass murdering can never be allowed, not ever, and as the late Nelson Mandela once said, "Take your guns, your knives and throw them into the sea." [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Ngqentsu. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you speaking?

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I am not recognised, I am sure...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: We have not yet activated your time, but hon member, can you please then take your seat, and I will recognise you again, because once you stand up I will activate your time. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is this excitement all about?

The SPEAKER: Hon member, I recognise you. You may continue.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Thank you very much, Speaker, members and esteemed guests. Given the fact that this debate affects those we represent in the Movement, we therefore sought to use it to focus on the root causes of violent crime in the Western Cape, make connections of those forces involved and respond to the question what is to be done. Unlike mass shootings in the US, which are in most cases linked to race hatred, the phenomenon in the Western Cape is similar to that of narcotic gang violence in Mexico. In Mexico, like in the Western Cape, there is a nexus between certain elements from law enforcement authorities, politicians, government bureaucrats and the underworld criminal network. I argue that the illicit economy is becoming pervasive as it plunges our communities into insecurity.

A case in point is the murder of the Anti-Gang Unit Section Commander, Charl Kinnear. The report from IPID revealed that nine police officers, including two members of the Hawks, were suspects in his murder.

Also, the case involving Malusi Booi of the DA and his alleged links with the underworld criminal network exposes the complicity of the DA-led Administration in the operations of the underworld criminal network here in the province.

Further, the elimination of Mark Lifman, who has known ties with the underworld criminal network, was gunned down last Sunday in George by co-conspirators implicated along the Sexy Boys Gang boss, Jerome Donkie Booyesen.

In the case of the murder of the steroid king, Brian Wainstein, an international steroid smuggler who was wanted in the US, cannot be treated as an isolated incident.

Given this background is the DA-led Western Cape not imitative towards the Mexico route?

Speaker, the three heinous acts of violence we are called upon to debate, the brutal murder of five individuals in a car on the road between Mamre and Atlantis, followed by the massacre of seven lives in Bishop Lavis, and the tragic loss of three lives in Khayelitsha, are not isolated incidents, and thus they must be understood within a broader context of this pervasive underworld criminal network.

How did we get here, Speaker? The weakened capacity of the organs of the State, including the intelligence, the capture of some elements by the underworld criminal network, and what appears as passive citizens, further compounds the problem.

What is the root of this crisis? It would be naïve, hon Speaker, to de-link the violent nature of the Western Cape from the crisis of capitalist social reproduction, a system that reproduces poverty, inequality, blood, birth, unemployment and chronic underdevelopment. As a result, working class households, families and communities are unable to support their lives. The gangs terrorising our communities are not merely criminal enterprises. They are symptoms of a broader malaise, a reality where young people are led into lives of crime due to desperation and lack of opportunities. This Government must take full responsibility as it cannot claim authority whilst people are slaughtered by the criminal network.

As a result, in the first quarter of this year, 2 250 murders were recorded in the Western Cape with a staggering 1 384 victims being Africans and 884 Coloureds. This expresses the class and the national content of the violent crime in this province. These criminal activities and murders are not taking place where the DA's elite leadership live.

Do the DA leadership elite truly understand the plight of those they claim to govern, or they turn a blind eye to the suffering of our communities because it does not affect their voter base?

Hon Speaker, given the above, the DA's so-called evidence-based decision making is nothing but an empty slogan. The inability of the so-called Safety Plan to reduce the murder rate proves the emptiness of the so-called evidence-based decision making and this Government must account about the billions pumped into this plan.

It is evident that the DA leadership elite is not aware about the nature and the sources of these violent crimes. MEC Marais is here and given her culture, is hard evidence that this Government has no plan. In her good mind, she believes that tailing behind the DA's golden boy, JP Smith, LEAP officers and now devolution of Intelligence Services to the municipal level, is a silver bullet. You are making a big mistake, madam.

Hon Speaker, what is to be done? As the ANC had an alliance of [Inaudible – audio distortion] the Legislature, we are not here to lament. We are here to offer solutions. Therefore, in answering the question, what is to be done, we call for strategic allocation of Government resources to address chronic underdevelopment such as houses; access roads where the workers and the poor live; streetlights, etcetera, in working-class communities. There is a need for substantial investment in education, skills development, a youth employment programme to provide our young people with the opportunities they need.

Secondly, strengthening of law enforcement and the intelligence in the spirit

of the recent signed cooperation agreement, the role of law enforcement partners, the SAPS and specialised units like the Special Task Force, Angi-Gang and others, must be fully supported, so that they can have the capacity to effectively deal with this organised crime.

We call for increased intelligence driven operations under the leadership of SAPS, not municipalities. Ensure that SAPS and other securities are adequately resourced and equipped to respond swiftly to these challenges.

Thirdly, in an effective role of communities in the fight against crime, communities are an integral component of Intelligence Services and also thus crime cannot be defeated by law enforcement agencies alone and thus we call for pumping of more resources to CPFs as well as Neighbourhood Watches in particular. Hon Speaker, as we condemn, hon Speaker, we submit that our law enforcement authorities need to strengthen the intelligence and investigative capacity, as the most immediate measure. However, as an attempt to get to the root and the branches of the problem, the majority of people of our province cannot remain in the margins of our economy. The wealth of this country must benefit the majority of people, not the White few.

As the Freedom Charter declares: "The people shall govern in the country as well."

Speaker, as we condemn these senseless killings of Black people in the poor working-class communities, let us not allow this tragedy to fade into the

obscurities as media headlines. Let us channel our outrage into action, action that dismantles the structures perpetuating violence and build a future rooted in equality and justice for all South Africans.

Together as the ANC, we can forge a path forward, a society free from fear, a society where every citizen can live with dignity. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the hon member Petrus.

Mr B PETRUS (PA): [no audible reply]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Stephens, I recognise you, hon member.

Hon members, just for the record, and I know that this is the first time for this term that something like this occurs, that the names during a debate may change as part of the Rules, so, I just want to put that on record. So, hon member Stephens, you may continue.

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, esteemed members and all those listening across the Western Cape. I stand before you today with a heart weighed down by the undeniable truth of a crisis we can no longer ignore. Our communities no longer trust the very police force meant to protect them. This is a tragic reality, and it is our duty as enshrined in Section 206.31 of our Constitution to build and strengthen the bonds

between our people in law enforcement. Yet, across the province, too many people feel abandoned, neglected and at times even unsafe in their own homes.

The recent tragedies in Bishop Lavis, Atlantis and Khayelitsha, where the victims were often our youth, barely out of their teens, and caught in the web of gang violence, should send shock waves through us. We can no longer turn a blind eye to the fact that in these areas our young people are dying, and the cycle continues.

In one case, a 17-year-old has been arrested, a chilling reminder of how far we have fallen. We cannot accept this as a norm. This is not just about crime. It is about broken trust. It is about broken families, and it is about broken futures.

In these three days, 16 young lives were lost in the Western Cape. These were not just youth. They were future leaders, dreamers, children we failed to protect, and the harsh reality is, we, our Government, our police have failed them. We cannot in good conscience continue to turn a blind eye.

I call upon all members of this Provincial Parliament, regardless of political affiliation, to put aside our differences and come together with urgency. We must address this crisis as one, not tomorrow, but today. We owe it to our children, to their children, and to every single citizen of this province to demand action. We cannot afford to sit idly by while the violence and distrust

spiral further.

The time for debate and division is over. The time for bold collective action is now. Let us not let this moment pass in silence. Let us speak for the children who no longer have a voice. Let us act for those who have lost their lives and for those who are still fighting to survive. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Stephens. I recognise hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the assertion that the Western Cape is a crime den is not only an assertion, but a fact that is backed by evidence and statistics. It was clear that when we reached the decade mark of this DA-led Province, and so little intervention on drugs and gangsterism back then already, especially in Coloured and African communities, it was clear that there would not be much effort thereafter.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape High Court in October 2022 delivered a judgement which warned that there is evidence which suggests that police officers and gangs in the province are colluding. The sad part is, hon Speaker, that following that judgment IPID pretended to initiate an investigation, but two years later there is still nothing that turned out from that investigation as our people continue to be slaughtered like animals.

What is even more shocking, hon Speaker, is that when asked how many drug

houses were shut down in the province in the last five years as a form of intervention from this Province, the Minister instead opted to turn the issue to National, stating that SAPS has indicated to them as a province, that they do not have the functionality on its corporate system to monitor or record the requisite information in this province, which is quite concerning. To add when we questioned the hon Premier about the escalation of crime in the province and the role of the Safety Plan, the response that we received was the Safety Plan was not intended to deal with general crime, but rather that it is a whole-of-society approach intended to deal with the murder rate in this province, but hon Speaker, a whole-of-society approach cannot be selective with regards to which crime it chooses to tackle, as all forms of crime are concerning and must be dealt with as a matter of concern.

Hon Speaker, millions of rands have been spent by the Premier in the last five years, including that of taking budgets from Health and Education in order to improve the Safety Plan but the reality is it continued to fail.

In conclusion, hon Speaker, the slaughter of our people is a pain that we constantly have to bear and deal with while this DA, with no proper plan, sits back and waits to see who is killed next. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Cassiem. I recognise hon member Marais.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, Speaker.

Speaker, no-one feels safe in the Western Cape. These mass shootings and formation of gangs are symptoms of a deeper socio-economic rooted form of poverty, lack of opportunities for employment. That is what is giving rise to these types of crime. It is not addressed. This Government has the responsibility of redressing the injustices towards these previously disadvantaged communities, and that has not been done. If you look at the spatial design of our City, the apartheid spatial design is still in existence in the Western Cape, and that has to be addressed. Crime of this nature is also a source of income to some of these young men, and that has also not been addressed in terms of opportunities to earn a living.

Now I know that the police are doing all they can, but the socio-economic side of things must be addressed. You cannot use fire to fight fire, hon Speaker. [Interjection.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, your time has expired.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): I just want to end off, please, sir. This is a very important debate, and you have given me one minute.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): One minute when it affects my people.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): I want to put that on record. Thank you very much.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, thank you very much. Hon member Marais, please take your seat. Hon Marais, please take your seat!

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): There is a lot to go through.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, please take your seat. Hon members, hon Chief Whip, hon member Marais, I just want to also put that on the record that the Speaker does not allocate the times. It is a predetermined formula during the beginning of the term which all political parties have agreed to and then it goes to the Programming Authority. If you have any issues with the time allocated, this is not the platform, hon member Marais, to raise it.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, I would like to just respond to what you have said.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, I am not going to get into a dialogue. I just thought it is important for the record to state that the Speaker does not allocate the time. I merely adjudicate the Speaker's List.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Speaker, I do want to apologise, but I also want to inform you that the first communication stated two minutes and then it was followed up with another email that said one minute. That is why I was upset about this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Marais. If you have an objection there is a mechanism to raise that objection, but during a debate is not the mechanism. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, Speaker, good afternoon to everybody.

Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim.

The Al Jama-Ah party extends its condolences to the families of innocent victims killed in the recent mass shootings in Bishop Lavis and Khayelitsha. The surge of mass shootings on the Cape Flats is nothing new, neither is the failure of the Western Cape DA-run Province to effectively deal with gangsters new. Like the gang violence on the Cape Flats, the mass shootings have become just another horrible cycle of gangsters fighting over drug trade and other criminal turf. The increasing number of illegal shebeens are springboards for not only gang violence, but also drug trade and gender-based violence. We have a history of ongoing gang violence involving firearms.

In May 2022, there was a spate of mass shootings in Khayelitsha, so the recent mass shootings were not the first for Khayelitsha and Bishop Lavis. The question is why is the Province not handling these mass shootings as a crisis? Imagine if these mass shootings should take place in Sea Point, in Constantia or in other leafy suburbs. We would have seen a heavy-handedness approach to prevent the reoccurrence of mass shootings.

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, your time has expired. Please conclude your sentence.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The daily shootings of children and innocent people in gang hotspots equate to massacres. Just last week in Eastridge a mother... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. That is a new sentence.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Okay, I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister of Social Development, Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker, Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature and guests, and

those listening in and watching.

I do want to thank hon member Jacobs for that moment of silence at the beginning, because one life lost is one life too many and we have lives that we lost across this province, not just in this area that you raised now. The Western Cape Department of Social Development's mandate in instances of this is to provide psychosocial support services such as trauma and bereavement counselling, where it may be needed. One of the things that we need to ensure is that we make residents aware of those services that the Department offers, because, quite often we hear afterwards they were not aware of that. So that is something that each and every one of us must communicate so that we can provide that services that are available from Government. But however, when we provide these services, we often also forget the impact it puts on the social workers that provide their services.

There is the negative impact of crime on the individuals, the communities, but also those that need to support the families afterwards and Opposition members like hon Ngqentsu can blame the Western Cape Government, but crime is largely a SAPS failure. Now I know you are a member of the South African Communist Party, but you are part of a tripartite alliance that ensured that the SAPS does not have the necessary resources here in the Western Cape.

We have recently signed an agreement that is taking us a step forward so that we can then allocate the resources correctly in this province. So, in that sense

I want to thank the City of Cape Town, hon J P Smith, the Mayor and the Premier Alan Winde and Minister Anroux Marais, plus the National Minister, who have taken the step forward to ensure that we move forward towards taking hands and addressing this.

Shooting hinders these services. Staff must often wait for a police escort to go into a community, but sometimes that is impossible because there are not enough police officers available or there are not enough police vehicles available, and yes, it is not their job to escort, but we need to provide services to the clients and quite often it is those vulnerable citizens that then also suffer because we cannot provide that necessary support after they have gone through the bereavement.

Now these shootings have a ripple effect compounding the trauma on communities, and we also then need to take hands to make sure that we can step up and provide those support services. Another tragedy is the number of children and youth who became involved in the shooting because quite often they are used because there is a shorter term imposed on them. The Department provides psychosocial, therapeutic, and statutory support services, such as school-based and community-based crime prevention programmes, which focus on life-skills mentoring, anti-bullying and substance-use disorder services.

During the previous financial year almost 9 500 learners participated in school-based crime prevention programmes. An additional 1 329 participated

in community-based programmes. That is not enough. We need to expand that, and we need to fight to have our share of the budget in this Province so that we can be invested in doing preventative work where it is needed.

Something positive: since 2015, the Department of Social Development has implemented an Early Discharge Programme for children, sentenced children and youth with behavioural challenges. This Early Discharge Programme takes place after a young person has completed interventions such as therapeutic programmes, educational programmes and other vocational skills training. Since the implementation, 3 100 young people have had an early discharge, and of these only 3% had their early discharge revoked, which currently indicates to a 97% success rate.

We are in conversation with the National Minister of Correctional Services to also see how many are pulled through back into the Correctional Service system, so that that success that we do get in our CYCCs can be rolled out elsewhere.

Since the start of the 2024/25 financial year, 2 600 adults have gone through diversion programmes. These are first time offenders whose behaviours we have tried to improve through programmes that prevent recidivism.

Simultaneously, these job skills programmes for at-risk youth from crime hotspots like Khayelitsha are aimed at providing skills for employment like barbering, hairdressing, hospitality and seamen's training. This is ongoing

and since the start of the 2024 financial year, just over 100 youth have gone through this programme.

Hon Speaker, I have met some extraordinary individuals from CYCCs who have turned their lives around. One young man, Maruwaan, who was a resident at Horizon, said he was afraid to go back to his community, being pulled back into the gangs, but through the interventions and the work that the DSD staff has done he is now studying office administration at Boland College. He is the captain of the College Aid Team, and he has dreams of starting his own NPO that uses sport to keep children away from gangs. It is youth, like Maruwaan that make me hopeful that we are doing something right and we must do so much more if we get that necessary support.

We are in the process of securing a significant partnership with a business in George that will take hands with youth in our CYCC facility to give them even a further leg-up so that they can break that cycle and be the change for themselves and their community. In a time of fiscal uncertainty simply pointing fingers when crime happens is no longer an option. We are working hard behind the scenes... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...to find creative solutions to the socio-economic circumstances. We need out-of-the-box thinking. We need to take hands and with a crisis like this we cannot point fingers.

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We need to stand together.
Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Speaker, Edmund Burke said:

"The only thing necessary for the triumph of evil is for good men to do nothing."

Hon Speaker, today that ACDP is speaking on behalf of those families who lost their loved ones in the recent mass shootings in Khayelitsha, Atlantis and Bishop Lavis. But, hon Speaker, a few months ago, shootings happened in Lavender Hill and Delft. Next month it will be in a different area, Kraaifontein maybe, maybe Philippi. Criminals move from one area to another, outsmarting law enforcement agencies. Speaker, the ACDP is calling communities to step forward to expose these criminals who are roaming the streets freely. They are roaming the streets, but our law-abiding communities live in fear on a daily basis. All levels of society are affected, from homes to schools and public places.

Hon Speaker, communities must stand up. Police and law enforcement agencies cannot do it alone. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians, your time has expired. I recognise the hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, August and October, approximately 39 people were reported killed in mass shootings across Cape Town. That is about 13 deaths a month. The connections between gangsters and politicians in the Western Cape raise serious concerns about our crime and safety system.

Individuals like Mark Lifman have reportedly leveraged their political ties to protect their operations from scrutiny, allowing criminal networks to operate with impunity. There are also concerning allegations regarding potential ties between the Western Cape Police and criminal gangs such as the 28s. This troubling alliance between gangsters, politicians, police and municipal law enforcement officials jeopardises community safety, erodes public trust and creates a safe space for Western Cape crime to flourish.

This Government has invested billions, but in some places the investment is directly under the control of those already involved in crime. We urge the Western Cape Government to call a Provincial Crime Summit. This will ensure engagement between law enforcement, Government and those who are deeply ranking in crime. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Herron. Your time has expired.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon member Kaizer-Philander.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you very much. Hon Speaker, hon members, today we confront the tragic reality that far too many communities across South Africa are gripped by relentless violence in Bishop Lavis, Atlantis, Khayelitsha and many more other areas. Mass shootings are not isolated incidents, but brutal reminders of a daily struggle for safety, a fundamental right that too many of our people are denied. Hon Speaker, I think this afternoon for me, it is so disappointing that the sponsor of this debate, we must not make a mockery of this critical issue. All Lives Matter, Speaker, and who of us goes and looks what the colour of your skin is, when we see someone lying on the streets, either in this province, or in South Africa.

Speaker, I want to encourage the hon member of the ANC to share his speech with the President of this country and ask the President, what happened to Crime Intelligence in this country? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Hon Speaker, in response to the hon member Cassiem, the DA does not sit back and wait on the next victim, hence the Safety Plan and the whole-of-society approach and our repeated call for devolution to be able to do more and to fight crime. Join us in that cause! Hon Speaker, let us start where it cuts the deepest in our schools. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Me W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Dit is die gemeenskappe wat gebuk gaan onder geweld waar ons kinders, die toekoms van ons provinsie, nie net ons provinsie nie, ons land, grootword in vrees. Om skool toe te gaan vir hulle is 'n risiko en die klaskamer, 'n veilige hawe vir 'n opvoeding, word nou oorskadu met die bedreiging van geweld. Kinders in die gemeenskappe word gedwing om nie skool toe te gaan nie, om veiligheid bo opvoeding te kies, en watter boodskap stuur dit aan ons jongmense dat hul potensiaal en beroepinge met vrees beroof word. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): It is the communities suffering under violence where our children, the future of our province, not only our province, our country, grow up in fear. To go to school for them is a risk, and the classroom, a safe haven for an education, is now overshadowed by the threat of violence. Children in the communities are forced not to go to school, to choose safety above education, and what message does it send to our youth that their potential and professions are robbed by fear.]

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): This is not merely a delay in education. It is a tragedy that diminishes their prospects, perpetuates cycles of poverty and traps entire families in generational struggles. Beyond our schools, the economy itself bears the scars of this violence. Persistent shooting drives away investors; deters business owners and strangles economic growth in these areas. What entrepreneur would willingly risk setting up a business where extortion, intimidation and violence reign? In these communities, hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, member! Hon members, I have allowed a little bit of latitude or actually a lot of latitude because it is a political debate. Hon members, I wish to remind you that I have granted this request in terms of Rule 143 in the interest and the importance of this debate, in the interest of the citizens of this province. It is only fair that we allow the citizens to hear the inputs made by the lawmakers and Members of Parliament that they have elected to serve them here.

Hon Members, this is not a normal Subject for Discussion. Can I please ask that you bear that in mind with your interjections and the running commentary. Hon Kaizer-Philander, you may continue.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

†Die waarheid maak seer want ons almal het 'n verantwoordelikheid. [The truth hurts because we all have a responsibility.]

In these communities, every shooting shatters the local economy, reduces job opportunities and narrows the path towards financial independence for families. The lack of economic opportunities only deepens socio-economic inequalities, creating environments where survival becomes a daily battle. This violence also puts a strain on social services already stretched thin as they try to respond to the unrelenting demand for trauma support, healthcare, and community resources. The mental toll on the residents who witness or experience violence, is immense, and the need for counselling continues to grow.

Yet, despite this growing crisis, it is essential to remember that policing, our first line of defence, is a national competency. The SAPS carries the constitutional mandate to ensure the safety of our communities. However, when this mandate is under-resourced or unable to fully meet the unique needs of our province, we in the Western Cape are left to do what we can do within our own means.

The reality is that our Provincial Government must often step in where the national mandate falls short. We do this not because it is our duty, but because our communities need urgent support through partnerships and

innovative programmes. We strive to supplement policing with additional resources and local interventions.

†Agb Speaker, om werklik die tragedie van *mass shootings* te verstaan, moet ons kyk na die sosio-ekonomiese landskap waar dit plaasvind. Werkloosheid en armoede skep voorwaardes waar misdaad dikwels gesien word as die enigste oorlewingsmaatstaf. Hoë werkloosheidsyfers en 'n beperkte toegang tot gehalte-onderrig is 'n broeiplek vir geen hoop en dwing sommige na misdaad.

[Hon Speaker, to really understand the tragedy of mass shootings, we have to look at the socio-economic landscape where it takes place. Unemployment and poverty create conditions where crime is often seen as the only measure of survival. High unemployment rates and a limited access to quality education is a breeding ground for no hope and force some to crime.]

And as illegal firearms flow unchecked into our communities, what might be a manageable disagreement spirals into deadly violence. We see a constant escalation of conflict, a conflict fuelled by the easy availability of illegal guns. Violence and crime weaken the very fabric of society. In neighbourhoods where people cannot rely on the protection of the police, where family structures are under constant constraint, community bonds fray. When there is no cohesive social structure, Speaker, crime becomes normalised, and people lose faith in both their communities and themselves. Breaking the cycles of poverty and violence starts with better education, expanded job training and more robust economic development initiatives.

These programmes offer people real, viable alternatives to crime. We must recognise the importance of mental health services in these communities.

Trauma is a silent epidemic and without adequate support, it continues to spread; by increasing access to mental health resources, we can offer solace to the victims and empower communities to heal.

Lastly, hon Speaker, while policing is a national mandate, the Western Cape is committed to supporting SAPS through every available avenue. Through the MOU we are working to extend resources to policing efforts, strengthening their ability to serve our community with the effectiveness and dedication that our residents deserve.

Hon members, through you, hon Speaker, I appeal to you to embrace a common threat that runs through every solution, every strategy we employ, the understanding that an all-of-society approach is essential to safety in our communities. The challenges we face are multi-dimensional and they demand responses from every sector – social, economic and governmental.

Where National Government faces constraints, the Western Cape steps up. We do so because we believe in the potential of our communities and in the resilience of our people.

†Ons staan voor 'n keuse, Speaker, ons kan of toelaat dat geweld en vrees die lewe van ons gemeenskappe voorskryf of ons kan voortgaan om onself te

verbind tot die skep van 'n veilige samelewing.

[We stand before a choice, Speaker, either we can allow violence and fear to prescribe the lives of our communities or we can continue to commit ourselves to the creation of a safe society.]

The road will be long, hon members, and the challenges vast, but I am confident in the strength of our communities' ability to enact meaningful change. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kaizer-Philander. Hon members, hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety, in terms of Rule 143(4), hon Minister, do you wish to reply to the debate? Do you wish to reply to the debate?

Hon Minister, in terms of Rule 143(4), I recognise the hon Minister responsible for Police Oversight and Community Safety, the hon Minister Marais.

†Die MINISTER VAN POLISIE-OORSIG EN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID:
Dankie, agb Speaker, agb lede. Dit is vir my 'n groot voorreg om vandag hier deel te neem aan hierdie belangrike debat en ek bedank die agb Jacobs dat hy hierdie debat op die agenda geplaas het.

My innige meegevoel met elke slagoffer se familie en dierbares. Dit is belangrik dat ons op 'n deurdagte en koelkopwyse planne beraam om saam op

te tree teen geweldsmisdaad op die Kaapse Vlakte. Enige iemand wat op emosionele wyse poog om politieke munt te slaan uit 'n tragedie wat reeds dekades lank voortduur, is eintlik maar iemand wat in eie belang dans op die grafte van die slagoffers. Dit is nie die tipe gedrag waarmee ek myself vereenselwig nie so ek sal nie daaraan deelneem deur tot daardie vlak te daal nie. Veel eerder wil ek, agb Speaker, en agb lede, u op hoogte bring van verwikkelinge wat 'n impak kan hê in ons stryd teen geweldsmisdaad op die Kaapse Vlakte.

[The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you, hon Speaker, hon members. It is a great privilege for me to participate here today in this important debate and I thank the hon Jacobs that he had placed this debate on the agenda.

My deepest condolences to each victim's family and loved ones. It is important that we make plans in a thoughtful and cool-headed manner to counter violent crime together on the Cape Flats. Anyone who in an emotional way tries to gain political points out of a tragedy that has been going on for decades, is actually merely someone who is dancing on the graves of the victims. It is not the type of behaviour that I can reconcile myself with so I will not partake in that by sinking to that level. I would rather, hon Speaker, and hon members, bring you up to date on developments that can have an impact in our battle against violent crime on the Cape Flats.]

The LEAP Programme is funded by the Western Cape Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety. We are immensely proud of the role that

the LEAP Programme plays in the war on gangsterism and other violent crime. It is a programme of the Western Cape Government to support the police by deploying more than a 1 000 additional crime fighters available on any given day. LEAP is managed by the City of Cape Town and LEAP officers are specifically deployed in areas where the murder rate is the highest. After a successful trial in Delft we requested the deployment of available LEAP officers in greater numbers in fewer locations so as to maximise the impact. As a Government led by data, facts and evidence, the decision was taken to concentrate LEAP officers in the six worst hotspots, namely Mitchells Plain, Delft, Nyanga, Philippi East, Gugulethu and Khayelitsha.

In order to ensure that no area is left behind, we created the LEAP Rapid Response Unit to deal with flare-ups in other hotspots all over Cape Town. The strategy to double-up in six areas and have a rapid response unit will be reviewed after six months, once we have seen its impact on the data.

†LEAP werk saam met ons Buurtwaglede, ons *Community in Blue*, en ons gemeenskapspolisiëringsforums vanuit ons gemeenskappe om ons gemeenskappe veiliger te maak. Die bydrae van LEAP-offisiere maak my baie trots. Sedert 2022 het hulle reeds 31 764 arrestasies uitgevoer. Ek wil vervolgens verwys na 'n paar ander kwessies waar ons daadwerklike vordering maak met die bekamping van geweldsmisdaad op die Kaapse Vlakte.

[LEAP works in conjunction with our Neighbourhood Watches, our Community in Blue, and our community policing forums from our

communities to make our communities safer. The contribution of LEAP officers makes me very proud. Since 2022 they have already made 31 764 arrests. I want to further refer to a few other issues where we are making real progress in combating violent crime on the Cape Flats.]

The first big change in the crime fighting environment was the Government of National Unity. Its impact is felt on every level, including the political, legislative and practical implementation levels.

Insofar as the political level is concerned, the appointment as Minister of Police of Mr Senzo Mchunu in the place of General Bheki Cele has meant a sound improvement. Gone are the days of flashy cavalcades and lustre.

I have found the new Minister, Minister Mchunu, to be open to suggestion and to be someone who means well and who will put his money where his mouth is. He is, to put it plainly, someone you can do business with.

In a few months he has been in office, he has broken with the ways of his predecessors. He has not discriminated against the people of the Western Cape, and he certainly scores lower on a vanity index than the man he replaced. These are early days yet, but so far so good. We worked well together.

One of the manifestations of this spirit of cooperation has been the much publicised Memorandum of Understanding between the National Government,

the Western Cape Government, the South African Police Services and the City of Cape Town.

In addition to Minister Mchunu, as my colleague Mr Londt mentioned, much credit is due to Premier Alan Winde, Mayor Geordin Hill-Lewis, MAYCO Member for Safety and Security, JP Smith, and Provincial SAPS Commissioner... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Minister, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Order, members! Hon members, again I wish to remind you in terms of Rule 143(4), the Minister must be afforded an opportunity to reply to the debate without interjections or interruptions. It is stipulated in the Rule, when it comes to this type of debate. As I reminded you earlier on this is not a Subject for Discussion, so the Minister will be afforded an opportunity to reply. Minister, you are protected. I wish to remind all members in terms of the Rules. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you, hon Speaker, and Provincial SAPS Commissioner, Major General Thembisile Patekile.

†Die dringendheid en spoed waarmee Generaal Patekile byvoorbeeld bykomende magte in Bishop Lavis en Atlantis ontplooi het tydens die huidige opvlamming van gewelddadigheid daar, spreek boekdele.

[The urgency and speed with which General Patekile deployed additional

forces in Bishop Lavis and Atlantis during the present increase in violent crime there, for example, speak volumes.]

Of course the MOU remains a matter of good intention until it is put into practice by its implementation agreement. It gives me much joy to report to you that the process of writing and agreeing to the implementation agreement is progressing very well, and the practical benefits to the people of the Western Cape will be felt soon. Another Cabinet member with whom we are cooperating is the Minister of Correctional Services, Dr Pieter Groenewald. Together we have started the journey to address an issue of major concern to members of SAPS, Community Policing Forums and Neighbourhood Watches in the Western Cape.

According to new resources in this ground level war on crime in our province, whom I have encountered during oversight visits, as a major stumbling block, is that much of the violent crime in our province is committed by parolees who have just been released from prison. At this moment, there is no compunction on the Department of Correctional Services to inform the local SAPS Station Commander that a parolee is about to be released into his or her area.

My discussion with Dr Groenewald was to ask him to initiate a regulatory or legislative change so that it would be compulsory for the Department of Correctional Services to inform the SAPS Station Commander that a parolee is about to be released into the policing precinct, so that SAPS and the

community policing structures can be aware and prepared. Dr Groenewald is very receptive of this initiative and the Western Cape Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety has already commenced discussions about implementation. But the formation of the GNU has had an impact way beyond the National Cabinet. Within the National Parliament, in the National Assembly, the new Chairman of the Portfolio Committee on Police is Ian Cameron. Together Ian and my Department have commenced the process in collaboration with all cell phone providers to write legislation to make it easier to use data from the mobile phone companies to locate criminals and victims of kidnapping for ransom. It will focus on tracking mobile devices in the so-called Golden Hour, the first hour after the kidnapping. This process will take a while yet, but it is out of the starting blocks, and I have high expectations of this process.

†Ter afsluiting wil ek fokus op 'n kwessie wat my naby aan die hart lê en wat groot impak het oraloor, maar ook betreffende geweldsmisdaad op die Kaapse Vlakte. Dit is eenvoudig verstommend hoeveel misdadigers aangekla word met onwettige vuurwapens en onwettige ammunisie. Die navrae wat my Ministerie tot dusver in hierdie verband gerig het, dui op drie kwessies waarop ons in die toekoms sterk gaan fokus.

Eerstens is daar hopeloos te veel polisieledes wat hulle wapens verloor op verskeie maniere. Dringende en swaar strawwe moet hiervoor opgelê word.

Tweedens toon die polisie se ondersoekes tans dat heelwat van hierdie wapens

wat op die Kaapse Vlakte hulle opwagting maak, oral oor die land gesteel is, in KwaZulu Natal, Gauteng en die Oos-Kaap, selfs vanuit Namibië. Dit dui op 'n groot onwettige verspreidingsnetwerk van vuurwapens. Die omvang van hierdie netwerk moet spore laat wat opgevolg kan word. Die LEAP-offisiere het sedert 2020 beslag gelê op 677 onwettige wapens, waarvan 139 tuisgemaak is.

Derdens is dit duidelik dat ammunisie op groot skaal onwettig bekom word. Ek het die polisie versoek om op groter skaal te monitor wie ammunisie koop en verkoop en in watter hoeveelhede. Ek hoop om binnekort hieroor aan u terug te rapporteer.

Agb Speaker, en agb lede, hierdie debat het gewys dat die Wes-Kaapse Regering 'n omvattende gemeenskapsbenadering volg om gewelddadigheid op die Kaapse Vlakte te oorkom. Dit het ook getoon dat almal in hierdie Provinsiale Parlement werklik passievol omgee oor hierdie kwessie. Kom ons sit hierdie energie om in passievolle eendragtigheid om gewelddadigheid te oorkom. Ek dank u.

[In conclusion I want to focus on an issue close to my heart and that has great impact all over, but also with regard to violent crime on the Cape Flats. It is simply astounding how many criminals with illegal firearms and illegal ammunition are prosecuted. The enquiries my Department has made so far in this regard, point to three issues on which we are going to focus strongly in future.

Firstly there are hopelessly to many police members who lose their weapons in several ways. Urgent and heavy punishment should be administered for this.

Secondly, the police investigations show that a whole lot of these weapons that emerge on the Cape Flats, were stolen all over the country, in KwaZulu Natal, Gauteng and the Eastern Cape, even from Namibia. It points to a large illegal distribution network of firearms. The extent of this network must leave tracks that can be traced. The LEAP officers have since 2020 confiscated 677 illegal weapons, of which 139 were home-made.

Thirdly it is clear that ammunition is acquired illegally on a large scale. I have requested the police to monitor on a large scale who is buying and selling ammunition and in which quantities. I hope to report back to you about this soon.

Hon Speaker, and hon members, this debate has shown that the Western Cape Government is following a comprehensive community approach to overcome violent crime on the Cape Flats. It has also shown that everyone in this Provincial Parliament truly cares about this issue. Let us convert this energy into passionate unity to overcome violent crime. I thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate on this subject.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We now move to, or we proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper in terms of Rule 197 and I recognise the Minister of Health and Wellness, Minister Wenger.

INTERPELLATION

1. Mr D G Jacobs asked Ms M M Wenger, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Whether:

- (a) the Enhanced Recovery After Surgery Programme is yielding results and
- (b) her Department has any plans to implement this programme in other areas.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thanks to the hon member for the question. The Enhanced Recovery After Surgery Programme, or ERAS Programme, is an innovative Service Delivery Platform that is a patient-centred data-driven evidence-based multidisciplinary team approach to Perioperative care. Perioperative care includes the period during the operation, but also pre- and post-operative stages. This is important because surgery plays an important role in the management of the majority of patients who have been diagnosed with cancer.

This programme is based on three pillars. Pillar one is the use of standardised evidence-based guidelines. This includes about 20 to 25 elements of care in the pre-admission and pre-, intra- and post-operative period that are applicable to most cancer operations. Addressing these elements of care will likely lead to a faster recovery of patients.

Pillar 2 entails the Implementation Programme. Through the programme, a well functioning, multidisciplinary team is established who are able to implement evidence-based guidelines over eight to 10 months. The members of this team include the patient and their families as well as their healthcare and other hospital workers.

Pillar 3 is the use of a monitoring and evaluation tool. This interactive web-based audit system allows the teams to continuously monitor adherence to the guidelines, to measure outcomes and to make changes where needed. The ERAS pilot programme was implemented at Groote Schuur Hospital for colorectal surgery in 2016, urology surgery in 2018 and liver-related surgeries and gynae oncology from 2023.

The results have been positive overall in terms of a decreased length of hospital stay, particularly for patients in those programmes that have been running for longer periods of time, as well as a reduction in mortality. For colorectal surgery at Groote Schuur, there has been a significant reduction in the length of stay from eight days to six days, once the ERAS Programme was

implemented, whilst the national average is 12 days. There has also been very low readmission rates and utilisation of the post-anaesthesia care unit for this type of surgery. For urology surgery at Groote Schuur there has been a 70% reduction in mortality in just three years.

A proof of concept has therefore been established at Groote Schuur and the hospital is considered a fully fledged ERAS hospital and the first ERAS Centre of Excellence in Africa. The learnings at Groote Schuur can therefore be used to hopefully scale to secondary hospitals in future.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Jacobs.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon Minister.

Hon Speaker, the Enhanced Recovery After Surgery was launched in Sweden in 2010 as part of a Care Programme to give care and a better recovery rate after operations in cancer patients.

Hon Speaker, in 2017 this programme was implemented in Groote Schuur Hospital initially for colorectal surgery and as of 2022 cervical cancer and other cancers in female gynaecology.

Hon Speaker, this programme is the only programme of its sort, not only in the Western Cape, but in the whole of Africa. Hon Premier, the statistics

from the Health Department clearly shows a year-on-year increase in females, and this can be contributed to a plethora of reasons. It is not always possible to identify these contributing factors, but what we do know is these women are treated in our hospitals.

Premier, as the Western Cape Government, we must agree that Groote Schuur covers the bigger Metro and the surrounds, bearing in mind that Groote Schuur Hospital is being bombarded by foreign nationals. Now, having seen this programme and its success, the question is will we praise this programme only or will we actively advocate for this programme to be implemented in all the hospitals across our province.

Hon Premier, cancer by its very nature is a death sentence to many, especially when you are receiving the news. The ERAS Programme is a programme that makes patients feel cared for.

Special treatment after such traumatic operations and the peace of mind and comfort it brings will definitely assist with the recovery of patients. Hon Speaker, it is clear that this province needs this programme. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Jacobs. I recognise the hon member Booysen.

Mr M BOOYSEN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Minister, it is very encouraging to see the Department of Health and Wellness implementing forward-thinking programmes such as the Enhanced Recovery After Surgery Programme, also known as ERAS.

Studies from around the world have shown that ERAS programmes can make a substantial impact in colorectal and orthopaedic surgeries, amongst others. The evidence is clear, when ERAS protocols are followed post-operative complications and hospital stays can be reduced by as much as 40 to 50%.

These are remarkable results that speak to the potential of ERAS to transform patient care, minimise the risk of prolonged hospital stays and improve resources efficiency across our healthcare facilities.

Here in the Western Cape I am pleased to see that the Department is piloting this project as it offers an opportunity to elevate the standard of care to our surgical patients, but more than just improving clinical outcomes, ERAS also reduces the burden on healthcare staff and resources, enabling facilities to accommodate more patients and provide quicker and more effective treatment.

Hon Speaker, in light of these benefits I would like to ask the Minister if she can share her insight on the current outcomes of ERAS programmes here in our province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Booysen. I recognise

the hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, while the Enhanced Recovery After Surgery Programme is focused on revolutionising patient care and enhancing post-operative outcomes to minimise hospital stays, the pressing issue of surgical backlogs continues to undermine these efforts.

It is crucial to acknowledge that the existing approach to patient care is not the root cause of the delays. The Surgical Recovery Project at Groote Hospital was specifically established to tackle the backlog of elective surgeries.

This initiative has received significant backing through private donations, as well as notable allocations of R6,5 million from the Western Cape Government Department of Health and Wellness. This funding is part of a larger R20 million commitment aimed at alleviating patient backlogs across provincial hospitals.

Despite this financial support many hospitals are still grappling with considerable delays, for instance, Tygerberg Hospital is experiencing a backlog in obstetric surgeries, particularly elective C-sections, even after this cash injection.

Although the Surgical Recovery Project has demonstrated potential, there is concerns around the lack of transparency regarding its scope, future targets and possibilities for expansion to other hospitals facing similar challenges.

Rural hospitals, which frequently operate under financial constraints, stand to benefit immensely from initiatives like this as they would enhance access to essential healthcare services without imposing the burden of long distance travel.

Thus one must ask would addressing the surgical backlog not be more prudent than simply implementing a new approach to patient care? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Herron. I recognise the hon member Jacobs.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, the ERAS programme is a multi-disciplinary approach to patients' care and it aims to improve clinical outcomes and patient satisfaction. The ERAS programme can reduce the length of stay, reduce post-operative complications, reduce hospital cost, improve pre-operative functions and the success of the ERAS programme is based on multi-disciplinary care, including dedicated ERAS nurses now, hon Speaker.

Being part of the Health and Wellness Standing Committee, I was privileged to go on an oversight visit where we went to various hospitals on the Garden Route, and to my observation and what I have experienced on this visit, was that many of our facilities are understaffed and under-resourced.

My plea to you, hon Premier, and my plea, hon Minister, let us never and never again shift money from this Department to assist other departments.

Hon Premier, let there be healthcare services for all without regards to race.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Jacobs. I now recognise the Minister, hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you to the hon members for the debate.

As noted previously the ERAS programme has the potential to improve outcomes for patients who require surgical interventions. However, in order to increase or expand the ERAS programme, additional resources are required. The cost of implementation depends of course on the size of the hospital and an expanded rollout of the programme has not been fully costed, but in the current tight fiscal envelope it would make it challenging to implement provincially.

Initial indicators of this pilot are positive, not only in its financial efficiency,

but also in terms of patient outcomes and patient and family experiences. The Operational Management Team of the Department is considering the expansion of the ERAS programme, depending on available resources and we are exploring partnerships and potential additional sources of funding.

In particular the Department is currently exploring the possibility of expanding the programme to the George Hospital in the Southern Cape.

For George Hospital specifically the cost of implementing the ERAS programme could be upwards of R2,5 million. This would include the cost of employing a nurse care coordinator, the cost of training staff and the cost of the proprietary software package.

Employing a dedicated nurse care coordinator in a hospital is a key component of the ERAS programme as the patient-centred care is facilitated by this healthcare worker, and includes:

- Text message to patient's family intra-operatively by the anaesthetist.
- Call to patient's family by surgeon post-operatively.
- Daily three to five telephonic follow-up post discharge.
- Single emergency contact number available 24 hours a day seven days a week.
- A free SMS service and Please Call Me; and
- A 30 day follow-up visit.

Innovation is one of our values in the Western Cape Government and we will always pursue new evidence-based programmes aimed at improving the health and wellness of our residents.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper and we will now move over to Questions for Oral Reply in terms of Rule 202.

Hon members, I wish to remind you that once the hon Premier or the Minister has started the reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for this Sitting of the House to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question, and this is obviously for those members that are on the hybrid Sitting. For those members in the Chamber, if you could please raise your hand and the Table Staff will notice you.

Hon members, there are four opportunities for follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question and thereafter other hon members may then use the remaining opportunities to follow up.

Hon members, I wish to just inform the House that we will deal with Question 1 as printed on the Question Paper, and that is a question that stood over from Thursday, 19 September 2024, as agreed by the House. I recognise

the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Question standing over from Thursday, 19 September 2024, as agreed to by the House:

1. Ms T Lithakong to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

What mechanisms have been put in place by his Government to ensure that members of his Cabinet and officials in the respective departments remain answerable and responsive to members of the public when complaints are brought to their attention?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and to the hon member Lithakong, thank you very much for the question.

As the Western Cape Government we are fully committed to ensuring that every resident that interacts with any Government service is treated as a priority. Our *For You* motto is more than a simple slogan. It is the embodiment of the culture we aim to create in our Government.

Our citizens must be at the forefront of everything that we do and we are committed to making sure that our core values, that is of competence, accountability, integrity, responsiveness, care and innovation, underpin every

interaction between our residents and their Government.

To do this we have embarked on a journey to ensure that our staff are inspired to serve our residents, and are as inspired as we are as this Cabinet.

We are immensely proud of the way in which our 80 000 strong Western Cape Government has come together to go on that journey with us.

The Western Cape Government, having been awarded the status of top employer in South Africa, is clear that we are creating a shared culture of service and excellence.

As we continue to put our residents first, we have created a number of ways for our citizens to engage with their Government more conveniently and more efficiently.

The Western Cape Government Contact Centre serves as the primary point of contact for residents, for them to log queries, file complaints or request Government services.

Interactions with residents are governed by the Western Cape Government Digital Channel Management Protocol, which is designed to support both Western Cape Government business operations and citizen service delivery through digitally enabled channels.

The Contact Centre implemented and maintained high service standards to ensure that its overall efficiency and responsiveness to residents would continue. These include:

- Answering calls 96% of the calls received.
- Answering 85% of calls within 20 seconds.
- Providing responses within 60 minutes during office hours or business hours.
- Resolving complaints within 36 business hours.
- Resolving 85% of queries on the first contact basis; and
- Achieving a 95% resolution rate.

Residents can access the Contact Centre through 15 channels, each managed according to our standard operating procedure, the Western Cape Digital Channel Management Protocol and acceptable service standards.

The Contact Centre follows a structured ticket life cycle.

1. The ticket creation. All resident interactions are captured in a CRM system, ticketed, ensured proper documentation and efficient management responses and resolutions.
2. Ticket capture and first contact resolution, or FCR. The Contact Centre aims for the FCR by ensuing annually verified FAQs through departments. Residents with a CRM profile can log their own tickets

online through our website and monitor progress until resolution.

3. Escalations. If the Contact Centre is unable to achieve a FCR, or if a ticket requires special attention due to its complexity or priority, it is escalated to the Department for response, or the departmental manager, who is responsible to then deal with this escalation. Residents are informed about the escalation process and provided with the expected resolution timeframes.
4. Resolution and feedback. The ticket is updated according to the progress and ultimately, if it is resolved, including the evidence to that effect.
5. Citizen satisfaction. After a ticket is resolved, citizen satisfaction is measured through formal surveys in CRM.
6. Quality assurance. The percentage of staff engagements with residents undergo quality assurance checks to ensure that Contact Centre agents meet acceptable performance standards and error thresholds.
7. Data and reporting. The Contact Centre compiles a POPIA and provides the Departments with regular reports according to and agreed upon reporting schedule. The Contact Centre Office hours are Monday to Friday, 07:30 to 17:00; weekends 08:00 to 13:00, and afterhours the Contact Centre has a voicemail facility that is available outside of

agreed operating hours, and responses are made within 60 minutes of business hours activation. Please Call Me SMS and emails are received afterhours and responses are made within 60 minutes of business hours activation.

Additionally we have First Thursdays, it is another mechanism where residents are able to raise concerns or complaints. Every resident's case is registered by the Contact Centre staff and their details captured, including the nature of the case and whom they have come to see. Every Minister and Head of Department has a scribe that records the conversation and the nature of the case. That correspondence is then disseminated to the officials or the programmes as directed by the Minister or Head of Department. Each office will have their own prescribed way of managing and resolving these cases.

In the Office of the Premier all cases are logged on the CMAT system and given specific reference numbers. Should any case from First Thursdays be related to other departments or their mandates, an email will be sent by my office to the relevant Minister and department, which includes the case background, and request that that matter is addressed. Furthermore they are requested to contact the resident to discuss possible solutions of their concerns as raised.

Once the matter has been referred to the relevant department and Minister, my office will send an email to the resident, who will be

provided the background of the case, the resolution and introduction of residents to the office that will be dealing with that case and be copied into the mail.

Through platforms such as the Contact Centre, First Thursdays, the Western Cape Government is working to be as responsive to the enquiries and complaints of residents as possible, and to live out our values of transparency, responsiveness and care to residents. Thank you very much, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon member Lithakong.

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Thank you, *Somlomo*, and for the response.

I only have one follow-up question, hon Speaker, and it is what is the recourse of the public if correspondence from members of the Executive in their department is not forthcoming?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon ...[Interjections.]

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): [Inaudible 1:24:39]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): What will these helpless members of the public do?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lithakong?

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Yes, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: We lost you. I think you might have a problem with your connectivity. Can I ask you to repeat your question?

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Okay, thank you, *Somlomo*.

What [Inaudible 1:25:12] if correspondence from members of the Executive [Inaudible 1:25:17] in other words, what should these helpless members of the public do next?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lithakong, I am not sure if the Premier heard your follow-up question, but as always I am not going to dictate how a member, or in this case the Premier, responds.

Hon Premier, there was a question posed to you. If you are not able to respond please just say that for the record.

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think I got the gist of the question.

It was what happens if a member of the public has not received an answer back and so I think from the comprehensive component of the answer that I have just given, if they have received that message back, but not received any further update, I would then say would they please engage back again through that system.

If it was outside of what I have just spoken about now, so perhaps it was a message sent directly to myself or one of the members of Cabinet or one of the departments, then I would suggest that they then make use of the actual Call Centre system to say, "I have had this kind of engagement. This is what I am missing in a reply," so that then the recorded system onto CMATS or onto the recorded system, as I have spoken now, could then track it.

If it is already in the system and they raise it, then they must just say this has already been in the system.

So we can then also track it to say this is now not answered correctly and then we can actually deal with it, and as I have said in the beginning, it would be forwarded to those relevant heads of department or Ministers.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon member Bryant.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Premier, in terms of sub-programme 3.2, which is the organisation development in the Department of the Premier, we do see in the Annual Report that 100% of the target was achieved in developing a Citizen Satisfaction Index to facilitate alignment between the Western Cape Government service commitment and the citizen user experience.

Could the hon Premier please highlight how this assists in terms of dealing with accountability?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you to the hon member Bryant for the follow-up.

Obviously I am very proud of the results that end up in our reports, because what I spoke about in the question was where the standards or the benchmarks are set, and we have got to continually strive to make sure that we meet those, at least those benchmarks.

Of course if we manage to get to 100%, I mean that is really outstanding, and that goes to the process or the programmes of dealing with the culture of our organisation to be that organisation that is responsive, that organisation that cares for its citizens and is wanting to go back, and so of course on that side I am really excited about achieving and overachieving, and we will continue

to strive to do that, because I think as a government that lives by those sets of values I think it is critical that we get those things right. That is how you need to be responsive and engaged.

I also think that perhaps this is where I must also mention, I mentioned the mechanisms of engagement, but also the facilitation of enablement of engagement and that is another area that I am really proud of.

I remember being part of the initial pilot stages of the Broadband Project and seeing how it is rolling out over the years, and now we have got to more than 2 000 sites across this Government that are available to citizens for free.

Over and above that it is our school sites, it is our health sites, it is our library sites and other public facilities that enable that kind of engagement, so free Wi-Fi connectivity, also to make sure that citizens can not only obviously engage with their Government, but also utilise that facility to enable their businesses or any other issue, but I think the primary message, as part of this question, is that it is just extra investment to make sure that we have an enabling environment for our citizens to engage with Government as they need and see fit.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through

you.

Hon Premier, I would like to highlight a specific concern. I think we went through all those processes as the processes you explained to us, but I would like to highlight a specific concern raised by the community regarding the planned development of the Gugulethu Hospital on the site of an existing sport field.

The community has made it clear that they do not want to lose the sport facility and it is my understanding that all of your Cabinet members are aware of the issue.

How is your Government and how are your Cabinet members responding to the community concerns and their demands to preserve the sport field?

Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Premier, before you respond.

Hon members, I wish to remind you once again that when you ask a follow-up question you must ask a question related to the initial question. When there is a new question or with details other than what has been posed in the original question, it is up to the member of the Executive to answer it in whichever way he or she deems necessary, so you might not get the answer that you are looking for if you ask a brand new question.

With that being said, hon Premier, I am not going to dictate how you answer it. I recognise you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you very much to the hon member Windvogel.

I think in actual fact to follow-up on that question, if you could just give me when that question was asked, at which platform it was asked, and I will track it and see what answer was given back.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions on this question?

No further [Interjections.] – order, hon members. Are there any further follow-up questions? If not, that brings us to the end of Question 1 on the Question Paper.

Hon members, we now move over to New Questions and it is also Question 1, and, hon Premier, I recognise you.

New questions:

1. Mr B N Herron to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

With regard to comments made during an interview on 13 August 2024:

(1) (a) How much more should be paid to the Province over the next three years (2024–2027) and (b) from which part of the National Treasury's budget should it be financed;

(2) what (a) about the method of calculation of the Equitable Share of the Province's budget is wrong and unfair and (b) other components should have been considered (excluding education, health, the poverty rate, the population size and economic activity)?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member Herron for the question.

In the first part of the answer, this is 1(a) and 1(b). Compiling the national budget involves complex trade-offs and we would not want to reduce that complexity by saying that there is one number that we are asking for.

Our aim is to get the best possible deal for residents of the Western Cape and I would hope that that is obviously the aim not only of the Government, because that is what we are driving here in getting our fair share, but obviously of this Parliament as well, because we all represent, every one of us represent the citizens of this province.

In the National Treasury's own numbers they show that they allocate less per

person, this is including the PES and conditional grants, to residents of our province than almost any other province.

In a paragraph published in the explanatory memorandum to the Division of Revenue Bill of 2024, the National Treasury shows that the DORA allocates, and we must listen to these numbers here:

- R10 700, R10 700 per resident in the Western Cape.

It allocates in other provinces, for example:

- R16 300 per resident in the Northern Cape;
- R14 600 per resident in the Free States; and
- R14 000 per resident in the Eastern Cape.

I think also, as we have said before and perhaps also referring to National Treasury presentations, you will know and I have used that graph in this House before, that as the third most populous province in South Africa we still get only the fifth highest budget.

We want to narrow this gap so that we receive more to spend on quality public services for each of our citizens.

We are also not just asking for a fair share of the national transfers to the Provincial Government, we are asking for a fair share of the national

spending on national functions within this province.

That is why, for an example, we engage National Government on ensuring more police are deployed to the Western Cape, and in the debate that we have just had now, and I refer here to the policing, and if I refer here to page 21 of the Policing Needs and Priorities Report, you will see that in 2011/12 our province had 22 011 police officers. So let us just call it 22 000 police officers deployed to this province. We now sit at 18 800.

So our police number is diminishing constantly year after year. If you look at that graph it just keeps on going down.

That is why at a national level when the Minister of Finance and myself, when we go to the extended Cabinet, and of course Cabinet discussions are not public, but I can say that, and the Minister can verify this, that in this province we were punting for more money for education, more money for health and more money for policing, and not only for this province, we were getting our fair share on all three of those across all provinces, because it is provinces across South Africa that are facing similar budget shortfalls, but in our province we need to make sure that we get our fair share.

This is what we mean when we argue for the fair share for citizens of the Western Cape.

Although we are not fixed on a particular number in our engagements with

the National Budget process, one can get a sense of the scale of what we are asking for if you look at the reductions we are asking to be reserved, and that the pressures that these have created on our budget.

At a minimum we would want to see the National Government reverse the R6,7 billion in budget reductions made to our Equitable Share over the 2024 medium-term expenditure framework. That means this framework now says that this Province is getting a reduction of R6,7 billion.

At the end of September 2024, six months into the 2024/25 financial year, the Province is already projecting spending shortfalls to the amount of R896 million.

By the end of the financial year, and most of the spending pressure, R673 million, is projected by education and health, and this comes despite stringent cost-cutting implemented across service areas in our province.

National Government could fund this by stopping the fiscal leakage emanating from corruption and ending bailouts to State-owned entities. The bailouts to State-owned entities by the end of June was R280 billion over the past five years, and this syphons much of the needed money that is needed for specifically those three, but a number of other areas across our province.

In actual fact if you go to the eight year line, you will see that is nearly half a trillion rand that went to bailouts, and if you look at that graph again you

will see where did that money come from? It came from underfunding education, health, policing. That is where the underfunded money came from so that we could bail out bad management at SOE level.

2(a) With respect to the Provincial Equitable Share formula the following could be regarded as unfair and wrong:

- (i) The formula does not keep up with our growing population. Every year the formula is updated with population data for the previous year's population estimates. That data then takes three whole years to phase into the formula.

So the formula is always funding the population figure from four years ago. In a province with a population that grows on average of 2,4% per year, this delay is unacceptable, or I would like to say is not fair, and we need these public services for our residents and of course you have got a higher growing population and a slow response in budget allocation to that growth in population.

- (ii) Some of the data used in the formula is more than a decade old. The poverty component, with a weighting of 3%, is still based on the 2010/11 Income and Expenditure Survey data. This is still not clear if the updated income and expenditure data will be available by December 2024, and of course remember we are going into, just post that, our own MTEC too and we will need to get clarity from National

Government. Even if the data becomes available it will only be used to determine the allocations for the 2026 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework.

The economic component with a 1% weight is still based on the 2019 data up to the allocations of the 2024 MTEF, and these are also now a delay of five years. This is now being updated for allocation for the 2025 MTEF. If economic growth and jobs are a number one priority of ourselves and this country, this component should be allocated a bigger share with the Provincial Equitable Share formula.

- (iii) Problems with the health component with a weight of 27%. The health component assumes that no public funds are needed to fund health services for people with medical aids. This means that 25,2% of our residents receive no funding for health services, despite many of these residents coming to public clinics and hospitals, especially in emergencies and when their medical aids have run out.

The formula claims to fund provinces based on the use of our health services, but the output sub-component does not take into account the innovative methods of delivering health services.

In the Western Cape the Department of Health and Wellness introduced telehealth services. However, patients who receive their services through this telehealth service are not coming to our clinics

and therefore are not counted, so that again is a further burden on the percentage of our formula.

In addition, for the risk adjustment factor only accesses to GEMS medical aid is being used as a proxy for access to medical aid. This is incorrect and access to the data of other medical aids should also be taken into consideration.

- (iv) Not all learners are accounted for in the education component, with a weight of 48%. The education component does not include data on learners with special education needs. We, in this province, are proud of our special need schools that cater for over 22 000 learners or students.

However, currently these learners are not counted in the learner numbers used in the PES formula. This is despite the higher costs of providing for their special needs in education.

Then (b), although the components of the formula capture most of the core aspects of provincial functions, they do not capture all of them, for example:

- The current formula does not make explicit provision for all social development services, which the Western Cape Government considers a critical frontline service. That is not fair.

- The formula does not make any provision for the special needs of older persons and in this province we have the longest average life expectancy, and have pioneered now to adapt our services to the need of an ageing population, but we do not get the commensurate formula. That is not fair.
- The weights of the existing components of the formula also urgently need to be reviewed. The formula attaches a weighting of only 27% to the health component, but provinces spend more than a third of their budgets on health services. In the Western Cape 35% of the Equitable Share funding for 2024/25 is spent on health.
- We also believe that increasing the weighting of the economic component from its current 1% will be an incentive for provinces to grow their provincial economies, and through that the overall GDP associated with tax receipts, and of course our biggest problem, despite this formula, is that in South Africa we now only got 0,4% GDP growth and you have seen them now in the latest Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement reviewing down, once again, our growth and all of those other pressures of inflation rate, negotiations of wages higher than budget for an inflation rate. All of those impact on our province and of course the demand that our services need.

Then the most important is the fastest growing population in South Africa and not getting the commensurate budget to deal with those demands, and of

course that is why we need to fight for it to be fair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much Hon Premier.

Hon members, I have got hon member Herron, then hon member Bans and then hon member Johnson, in that order. Hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker.

That was a long answer that followed a sit-down interview, I assume, where the Premier said it is not fair, we are not getting our fair share, but the Premier seems unable to explain to this Parliament what is the fair share, what is the number.

In fact in the interview he said we are not getting the correct amount or the fair share of money, but he cannot tell us how much that fair share is, and he also does not seem to understand mathematics. 100% ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Herron, I wish to remind you that you are allowed to ask a follow-up question based on the initial question posed and the response by the Premier. There is no need to motivate your question. So please just ask your follow-up question.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, thank you, hon Speaker. I just want to frame the question.

The question I am framing is that there is 100% that could be allocated in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share. 91% is made up proportionally, but the Premier cited numbers. He would like to increase the allocation to health, increase the allocation to economic disparities, but does the Premier accept Section 214 of the Constitution dictates how the funding must be allocated, and that the Fiscal and Financial Commission is implementing Section 214 of the Constitution? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Herron. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I think I have been at length to tell this House exactly why we are not getting our fair share, and the hon member Herron asks for a number. Well, I have put a number in the answer, he obviously did not listen to that number, but that was what we saw as removed from our budget of R6,7 billion, but in actual fact since the 2021 MTEF the Western Cape PES allocation has been subjected to a fiscal consolidation resulting in a net reduction of R8,5 billion up to the 2024 MTEF, and of course we know why and he is talking about the framework and how these allocations are made, but I am pointing out exactly why it is not fair.

You cannot use those bases, you have to change those numbers and those percentages, and you have got to make sure that they get changed faster.

We cannot wait five years, 10 years and four years for those changes. We

cannot wait for that because the population grows in those four years, and we can feel it at the frontline of education, we can feel it at the frontline of health and we can feel it at the frontline of social development every single day.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Bans.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. While we are on fair share, hon Speaker, through you to the Premier.

Given Equitable Share, hon Premier, taken into account demographics, what plans are in place to ensure that budget aligns with its own population here in the Western Cape, particularly the working class community where the majority resides? While we are on the Fair Share. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So obviously that is a very different question, but it is how you allocate your money that you get. We are saying the money that we get is not fair and it needs to be increased commensurate with the population and demand, exactly the point now that the hon member is now raising, and of course, how is your budget spent?

We have got a thick Blue Book. You can go through every single department and you can see GIS geographically mapped where that money is spent.

We have just had a debate in this House around LEAP officers and where LEAP officers are deployed, and in actual fact it was not true what was said by the hon member as that LEAP officers are deployed into the City or to the beaches. That is not true.

Our LEAP officers, just over a thousand of them, are deployed specifically to certain areas, and where are those areas? If you want me to go into those actual areas I can, but they are in all of these documents, they are where the murder rate is the highest. They are not to the beaches. That is not LEAP deployment. That might be law enforcement at a municipality level. That is not what this Province's LEAP and Safety Plan is about. Those LEAP officers are deployed exactly to those communities that you are talking about.

The Booster Fund in the Economic Development Portfolio. Where is the Booster Fund?

So you will see that that is about 80% of the budget that goes to the poorer communities in our province. It is in the Blue Book and you can go and have a look at the GIS map by region, by municipality and across this whole province. The data is there for you to see.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Johnson, and the last opportunity goes to hon member Herron.

Hon member Jacobs, my apologies, the four opportunities are exhausted after hon member Herron. Hon member Johnson.

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Premier, with respect to the first question, how has the underpayment of the Equitable Share to the province by National Government affected the services that the Province could have provided had it been getting the updated payments? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Johnson. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So of course we know that we declared a dispute last year because of that in-year cut. When we come to this Parliament with our budgets we get approval of our budget by every member of this Parliament. We debate it and we agree to that budget.

Once we had agreed to the budget then every department then starts to do their business according to that budget, and we know that last year the first whammy that hit us was the R1,1 billion that we had to find over and above our budgeted for salaries because of the outside of this process agreement, and then National Treasury saying the Province must just find the money.

So when you have got to find the money, what happens? You have to take it away from services and that is exactly what has now hit this province, and

that is why we have this question, that is why we have the question about getting, do we get our commensurate and fair share?

So when you have to take away from services you then put pressure, and specifically in this Government for every rand, you know it, just short of 80% of that rand is going to our core frontline services, and that is where the effect is felt.

So it is felt in social development, it is felt in health and it is felt in education.

So the question says so what are the consequences for the citizens of this province? The consequences are if you do not get any more money you have got to then understand that classroom sizes are going to get bigger, queues are getting get longer at your hospitals, and your social services practitioners, your social workers, are going to get a much bigger demand on each one of them.

So what it does is it puts more and more pressure on those frontline services because of course as the fastest growing province in South Africa we have two forms of growth.

The first form of growth is our natural population growth and the second form is other people moving to this province because they want to come for education, they want to come for healthcare, they want to come for social

services, they want to come for jobs and the economy.

Why do they do that? Well, I mean just have a look at the audit outcomes, it will show you why they do it, because there is good governance here and good governance [Interjections.] – good governance enables citizens to make decisions around, well, if there is good governance there the service levels are way better on top of that good governance foundation, and because our services are better here than anywhere else, more and more people come, but then we have got to fight for their fair share of the budget.

Please, you are welcome, but you need to come with your money and when you come with your money that comes from National Treasury, and we have got to fight for that share of the money, and I really wish that this whole Parliament would join us in fighting for that fair share because it is every person in this province that deserves that fair share of the budget.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Order. Hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, the Premier is correct. Many organisations agree that the outdated data results in skewed effects and one, for example, says the formula underestimates the number of learners in most provinces, especially the Eastern Cape, Limpopo and KwaZulu-Natal, and overestimates the

number of learners in the Western Cape and Gauteng.

So perhaps we are not getting our fair share, maybe we are getting more than our fair share, hon Premier? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: The question was kind of a perhaps question and I will say perhaps not.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

Hon members, that concludes Question 1 on the Question Paper. We move on to Question 2. I recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, I request that Question 2 and Question 6 please stand over, as arrangements has been made by the Minister with the relevant members.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, we then move on to Question 3 and I recognise the Minister of Health and Wellness, Minister Wenger.

3. Mr D G Jacobs to ask Ms M M Wenger, Minister of Health and Wellness:

With regard to the shifting of funds away from the Department of Health and Wellness to fund the Safety Plan:

What (a) is the impact of this on service delivery and (b) plans has her Department implemented to mitigate this impact?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

No allocated funds were shifted away from the Department of Health and Wellness to fund the Safety Plan.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Jacobs.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Minister, are you misleading the House? Are you misleading the House?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Jacobs, can you please speak to me.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Apologies. Ja, thank you, hon Speaker, thank you, hon Speaker.

I just wanted to check with the Minister. The Premier took some money from education and health to fund the Safety Plan. Is that true or untrue?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: Not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: [Inaudible.] let me be clear, no funds were shifted away from the Department of Health [Interjections.] and Wellness to fund the Safety Plan.

I am informed that ...[intervenes] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH WELLNESS: ...in 2019 the Western Cape Government allocated R1,1 billion over the MTEF from the Provincial Revenue Fund.

My recollection of what the Premier said is that the funds that were reallocated to the Safety Plan five years ago, represented or were equivalent to just over 1% of the combined Health and Education budget, but perhaps, I note that you are also on the Order Paper to ask a question to the Premier without notice, you could then just check in with him on exactly what he said.

My recollection is that he put the quantum in respect of Health and Education

budgets, but it is not necessarily to say that those were taken directly from the Health budget.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon member Booyesen, hon member Bryant and then, hon members Jacobs, I recognise you again.

Mr M BOOYSEN (DA): Thank you, Chairperson. Hon Speaker, through you.

In the current financial year there is a shortfall on Health and through you, hon Speaker, hon Minister, what has led to the shortfall and what is the impact of the shortfall in Health?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you and thank you to the hon member.

There are several reasons. The first is the underfunded Wage Agreement. As the House is well-aware that after our budgets were passed the National Government agreed to a wage deal, which was above inflation, and then did not provide the funding to support the increase in the wage deal.

That caused us to put up a fight and a charge, which the Premier led. We were then given some relief in respect of the increase in the wage deal, but in

respect of the Department of Health, our COE pressure was R1 080 billion and we were only allocated R763 million. So we had to reprioritise internally in order to cover those costs.

In addition, because of the austerity measures and the large reduction in the Provincial Budget, which the Premier has just spoken to, the Health budget increased by 2,7%, which is below inflation, and in addition to that in the health space medical inflation is higher than ordinary inflation, which meant we are left with a significant goods and services pressure, which we have been dealing with ever since.

The effects of these budget pressures are severe and I am sure every member in this House has had some form of contact with what that has meant for frontline service delivery, and we warned that this would happen and we are now seeing the effects of it every day.

We have seen surgical procedures, the backlogs are increasing. Coming out of COVID we were able to eradicate those backlogs in here but now unfortunately, between January and July of this year, we have a backlog again in the order of 10 500 procedures between January and July.

It also means that we are seeing increasing gaps in the immunisation of children and we are really concerned about it, because tracking children who have missed vaccines and catching that up is resource-intensive, and because of austerity measures we are faced in an unenviable position. We cannot risk

outbreaks of diseases such as measles in this province because it affects children acutely.

The other very grave consequence of this is increased waiting times. We have staff that have to do more with less and we are seeing massive pressure and increase in the number of patients seeking care, and so that means our emergency and hospital waiting times have increased.

At the same time our mental health admissions are 50% higher than what they were before COVID, and so all of these contribute significantly towards the work that we are able to do, and it is really an awful position to be in, and I am very concerned about our staff who are burning out, but are trying their best.

So what are we doing? We are doing everything we can to cushion the impacts of these cuts.

- We are squeezing as much efficiency as we can.
- We are managing the cost of employees. We already have the leanest staffing structure in South Africa.
- We are strengthening our contract management processes for efficiencies there.
- We are reducing inefficiencies in any wastage that we can find.
- We are maximising our resources.
- We are looking at revenue enhancement, collection and billings.

- We are exploring alternative financing models, donor funding, alternative financing, in particular on the infrastructure side; and
- We are looking at technological advances in how we can be more efficient and continue to provide quality care.

So I hope that answers the hon member's question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Bryant.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, just following on from some of the points that have just been made by the Minister, in particular the underfunded wage agreement challenges, the cost of medical inflation, etcetera, but the impact that that has had on staff and the hardworking medical practitioners that work within her Department. I know she has met many of them on occasion doing oversight visits.

What has her experience been of interacting with those individuals and what is it that gives them the drive to continue to provide those services?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, before you respond, I wish to remind members you are allowed to ask one follow-up question.

Hon Minister, I am not going to dictate how you respond to that more than one follow-up question.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker, and to the member for the question.

The staff and the medical professionals in the Department are truly extraordinary. In my listening and learning tours, I have not been on a single visit where I have not been absolutely struck by the dedication and commitment of staff members under extraordinarily difficult circumstances.

They really are health heroes and I would ask this House to join me in supporting them in the best way that we can so that we can weather the storm in providing the best quality of care that we can. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, and the last opportunity, hon member Jacobs.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, you shall know the truth and the truth shall set you free.

I attended the debate session just before the elections and the Premier was there, and the Premier himself indicated that he took money from Education, he took money from Health to fund the Safety Plan.

My question is if it is not true, where was this money..., where was this money channelled to?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Jacobs. [Interjections.]
Order, hon members! Hon Minister, I am not going to dictate how you respond to that question, but I recognise you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I think I have answered the question, but I will reiterate it.

My recollection of what the Premier said in this House was that the funding for the Safety Plan in 2019 was the equivalent of. He did not say it was directed to [Interjections.] – ja, there is a difference. The equivalent of ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must listen to the answer, Mr Jacobs.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order! Hon members ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Hon members, there was a question posed to the Minister. The Minister is responding. We cannot dictate to the Minister how the Minister should respond. [Interjections.] If you do not like the answer that is unfortunately the way it goes.

The point of the matter is it is now the Minister's opportunity in terms of the Rules to respond to that question posed by hon member Jacobs. I think, hon member Jacobs, you deserve an answer.

So can I please ask that the remainder of the House [Interjections.] – order, hon members! That you allow the Minister to respond to the member that posed the question. If you wished to ask the question to the member or to the Minister, you had an opportunity to do so. You did not take that opportunity and now you need to wait for a next opportunity to pose your question, but now, hon Minister, you can respond to hon member Jacob's question through me.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Hon Speaker, as I have mentioned before no allocated funds from the Department of Health and Wellness was allocated or shifted away from the Department to fund the Safety Plan.

The 2019 allocation over the MTEF towards the Safety Plan came from the Provincial Revenue Fund for the purpose of safer communities.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 3 on the Question Paper. I move on to Question 4 and I recognise the Minister of Education, Minister Maynier.

4. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

With regard to the budget shortfall of R3,8 billion over the next three years:

What (a) impact will this shortfall have on the building of much-needed schools and classrooms and (b) plans will his Department put in place to mitigate this impact on teacher employment over the three-year term?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question.

Our Department, as the hon member knows, because he is a long-serving, possibly the longest serving member, of the Standing Committee on Education.

As he knows we have a budget shortfall of about R3,8 billion over the three-year medium-term expenditure framework.

This contributed towards our decision of course to reduce the number of teaching posts in our schools by 2 407 posts. To ensure that the reduction in the number of posts was not higher, we imposed R2,5 billion in non-personnel budget cuts across the board, including on administration, on curriculum and on infrastructure.

The infrastructure budget for the 2024/2025 year was cut by R441,6 million to contribute towards saving teacher posts. Of course despite these budget cuts the Department still has a residual budget shortfall for the 2024/2025 financial year and this shortfall will have to be covered via reprioritisation during the 2024/2025 Adjustments Budget process.

The Department of course is currently considering all its options, which could impact on our infrastructure delivery plan and of course once this has been finalised, it will be communicated.

As we speak circuit managers and districts are working closely with schools to implement the reduction in posts, taking into account the specific curriculum priorities of each school. Our curriculum coordinators and subject advisors are also on standby to assist schools that need additional help with reorganising their timetable for the new year.

I want to give the hon member, and indeed this House, the assurance that I am doing everything in my power to mobilise additional resources for education and to fight for our teachers here in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, hon Minister, for the response.

Hon Minister, I just saw in the media that the WCED was called to National Parliament to appear there, and if my memory serves me correctly, then it came out that it is only two provinces; the Western Cape and I think Gauteng, that are getting, that are reducing their teaching posts. I do not know if that is accurate, but that was reported in the media, and I know that you have given the assurance that you will fight to retain posts.

I am just very concerned, hon Minister, and this is my concern because we had protests all over the Western Cape, Steenberg, Rondebosch...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, hon member Christians, I wish to remind you that you are allowed to ask one follow-up question. There is no need to motivate your question. Can I please ask that you pose your follow-up question to the Minister?

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Ja, thank you, thank you, hon Speaker.

The question is simply, hon Speaker, that we are going to have still, I

believe, a lot of protests happening when we get into the new year about the teachers losing their posts.

Is it true that other provinces – it is only two provinces that are reducing their teaching posts, and it is only the Western Cape, I think, and Gauteng? Is that true, and how did the other provinces manage to retain their teaching posts? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. Hon Minister, before you respond, I wish to remind members once again that you are allowed one follow-up question.

Hon Minister, there was more than just one question posed to you. I am not going to dictate how you respond to that.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon member, of course I do share your concern. I do not wish to be drawn to speak for other provinces, but I am sure that as the hon member realises, and as hon members in this House are aware, that our province is not the only province of course that has been affected.

Every province is facing a fiscal emergency because of National Government's failure to fully fund the 2023 Public Sector Wage Agreement. Of course every province will have to find a way to foot the enormous cost of

the nationally negotiated wage agreements.

Now how provinces of course cover that shortfall, how they respond to the fiscal emergency, will vary, but what I can say, hon members, is that there are no good options. Every option, every option will have a negative impact on our children's futures.

Now in the Western Cape we have taken the tough decision to reduce our basket of posts. Other provinces of course have made different choices, which will also negatively impact on teaching and learning, and a good example which has been traversed in the media during the course of the last week of course is KwaZulu-Natal, where unions are protesting because the Province is now unable to make norms and standards transfers to schools.

The Province has also reportedly stopped paying teachers increases, and has also in the previous year, because of the failure to make norms and standards transfers to schools, schools in some areas in KwaZulu-Natal, were unable to write exams.

Gauteng is another example, where learner transport has been cut significantly, which of course affects children's ability to get to school.

So, hon member, every province is affected. There are no easy options and this is a shared problem, and that is why I have been so encouraged by the response from our National Minister Siviwe Gwarube.

Now some hon members may have read the hon member Brett Herron's article in *Politicsweb* on 9 October 2024. The article, I am sure you would agree, was generally incomprehensible and does raise a serious question about whether the hon member comprehends the budget process, but I do not often take his advice, but in the article he does suggest that I whisper in the National Minister's ear on this very important matter, which, as the hon Premier knows, I have done, and I have been very encouraged by her response.

I am sure hon members, or some hon members, may be aware of her statement after the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, where she made the argument, given the fact that this is a shared pressure, given the fact that there are no easy options for provinces to deal with this fiscal emergency.

The National Minister said that budget pressures faced by Provincial Education Departments continue to pose a significant threat to the delivery of quality education.

She went on to say that these pressures have been years in the making due to progressive budget cuts, economic stagnation, fiscal mismanagement, especially of State-owned enterprises.

The National Minister goes on, and I can see the hon Speaker is listening attentively. The National Minister goes on to assure the provinces that she

will continue to engage with the National Minister of Finance on the continuing budget pressures facing the sector, ensuring that provincial departments across the country are able to fund their basket of posts and programmes, to ensure quality education, not just in this province, but all provinces across South Africa.

The Department, she says, remains dedicated to securing an education system that supports learners today while building a stronger, more resilient economic future for South Africa, and I hope that that gives the hon member, and indeed hon members in this House, some assurance. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Van Wyk, hon member Masipa and hon member Herron, in that order. Hon member Van Wyk.

Mr L D VAN WYK (DA): Thank you, thank you, hon Speaker.

I would like to ask the Minister what his reaction is to the comments by the National Minister of Finance, Enoch Godongwana, that the budget shortfall in the Provincial Education Departments is self-inflicted?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member.

I have to say that I think that the hon National Finance Minister, the hon Enoch Godongwana, was incorrect and I fundamentally disagree [Interjections.] – I fundamentally disagree with his view and certainly that view could not have been aimed ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...at the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Masipa. [Interjections.] Order! My apologies, hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, I am just getting started replying to this question. I am barely through the first paragraph.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am going to allow you an opportunity to conclude that sentence. The time for Questions for Oral Reply has expired.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I fundamentally disagree with the National Minister of Finance and I do not believe that his comment was directed at the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of oral questions, or Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we now move on to Questions to the Premier without Notice in terms of Rule 204. I wish to remind the hon members that two follow-up questions by the hon member posing the question which relates to the original question or reply, will be allowed. So, only the hon member that is posing the question to the hon Premier without notice, can ask follow-up questions and it must relate to the initial question that is being posed to the hon Premier. I recognise the hon Brinkhuis.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through you, the month of November is Disability Awareness Month. Al Jama-ah's Deputy Minister of Social Development, hon Ganief Hendricks, wrote a report on Social Development to the hon MEC, hon MEC Londt, and hon MEC Londt was very, very supportive.

Hon Premier, are you willing to give a wheelchair to every disabled person who needs a wheelchair in the Western Cape? Nobody must be left out. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you very much to the hon Brinkhuis for that question. I thank him for that question, and I am so happy that his party is in Government at a national level. And with the national funding that he gives to this Province, we will give every single person a wheelchair.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Brinkhuis, do you have a follow-up question?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): No, thank you very much, hon Speaker. I think the hon Premier is making it very, very clear[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...to the citizens of the Western Cape that he will, indeed; that every disabled person in this month of Disability Awareness, will receive a wheelchair who needs a wheelchair. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. [Interjections.]
Order, hon members. Hon members, questions to the hon Premier in terms of this Rule, are guided by the Rules that you adopted at the beginning of this term. If you are not willing to participate and treat this with the respect and in the interests of the citizens in the manner that you have adopted, then we might as well scrap it. But this is not a joke. There was a question posed,

hon Premier, to you. A follow-up question. I now recognise you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The follow-up was not really a second question, but I mean, as I said in the beginning, obviously, if the National Department is prepared to give us the commensurate budget. But let us also, I mean, this is a serious question because many people need support from Government who are disabled, in whichever or differently abled, let us say. Of course, I think, everybody needs and deserves care from this Government.

I think it is also a bit disingenuous of him in the way that he has asked the question. You know, obviously everything is about making sure that we have got commensurate budgets, making sure that we have got processes to identify those that are in need and then, prioritising those who are mostly in need because that is exactly what a caring government would do. Obviously, asking me in a Questions to the Premier in this space, he must just understand that I am going to give him that kind of answer.

If he is really serious and as he said, the Deputy Minister engaged with hon Minister Londt, then that is where the seriousness of this discussion comes in. You know, if he had said to me, 'Do we take differently abled citizens seriously', I will say 'yes', and I will go back to probably the first question I was asked in this House, and it was about our value system and making sure.

But I will also go to the second part of some of the discussions that we have

been having around budgets and budget shortfalls. Of course, these are very serious issues. As our population grows, obviously, the percentage of people who need different care in our province would need to get that care. I spoke about citizens who need different kinds of care in the education system, 22 000 learners in that system and we do not even get the commensurate budget with it.

So, that is the difficulty that we face. But absolutely, in answer to his question, we must make sure that we offer that caring service to our citizen: number one. But again, in the question that he asked, obviously, if his National Minister and he are committed to this kind of policy, we are very committed to making sure that from a budgetary point of view, we get the best possible service across to every single person in need that is in a disability situation in this province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Brinkhuis, you have one final opportunity.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. No, I do not have a second follow-up question because the hon Premier has been very clear that from the Premier's Office, all the disabled people of the Western Cape, will be seen to. Everybody that needs a wheelchair, that needs a wheelchair ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis! [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, you are completely out of order now. I have provided you with an opportunity to ask a follow-up question. You said you did not have a follow-up question, so then please do not utilise that opportunity to make a statement. You have a statement in the next segment of the Order Paper. I recognise hon Wessels.

Mr D J WESSELS (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, I want to take you to your previous home in the town of Knysna, where I read an article last week about the eminent collapse of their water infrastructure. You know, a crisis that is attributed to the ANC, EFF and PA coalition, the neglect of maintenance and the investing in infrastructure.

What I would like to know is what role the Western Cape Government plays in assisting underperforming local municipalities in the province. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, to the hon member. I think first of all, obviously within our Constitution we do have a role to play because, of course, we do not have levels of government, we have spheres of government and local government is an independent sphere of government. Citizens vote for their governments and those governments have to then do what is best for

those citizens.

So, that is obviously within the Constitution, Section 154, Section 155 and specifically, Local Government has a major role to play there, an oversight role as well as our Provincial Treasury. We have regular reporting to Cabinet on issues of concern in our Local Government sphere. We also play a role around making sure that we can help when it comes to financial matters, audit outcomes. We know that 70% of our municipalities now have got unqualified audits, clean audit status. That is the basis of getting your Government to perform. It is a foundation. We always say that good governance must become a habit and then you focus on service delivery. But you cannot do service delivery if you have not got good governance, if your finances are in a mess, if the money is disappearing, if there is corruption in your municipality.

You mentioned one municipality and it is really sad to see what is happening in that municipality. To see the horrendous governance that those citizens are receiving in that specific municipality. I mean, we have spent in this province more than R40-million towards helping that municipality. You would remember, last season it was piles of refuse, the whole new region specifically were months without water. When it did get water, mud was coming out of the pipes, let alone water. It was horrendous the kind of services that citizens were getting. Bodies floating in the water system. It really was. It was a total mess, and it still is.

We have instituted Section 139 post our diagnostic, post our analysis. We have got, there are charges laid, there are investigations happening. We are continuing with the Section 139. There is a civil society court case that is happening at the moment. I think it is probably this week that that court case is going to be dealt with. So, it is a very concerning issue. I know that I spent last Sunday on this, because they ran out of water. The water pumps were not operational because the municipality could not pay just for the servicing of the water pumps. So, it is a concern in that one. But that is the role that a province plays.

Then we have got this sphere of government. We do not just step in. We are not able to do that. We have got to follow due process, but that comes with your oversight role that you play within the Constitution.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Wessels.

Mr D J WESSELS (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you. If the hon Premier can maybe just provide an update on the measures that are currently underway in the failing municipalities across the Western Cape, not maybe specific to Knysna.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Obviously, for the full detail, I would have to have a proper worded question for it, but Cabinet does get regular reports so I can speak to,

remembering parts of those reports.

So, I have just spoken to Knysna which is in deep, deep trouble. We are processing a Section 139. I think it is imperative that we get that right. It would be great if we could get other political parties' support to do that, but there seems to be a funny business going on in that municipality. We have another one which is Theewaterskloof Municipality. The SIU are busy with investigations there. There are some ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Matzikama.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: There are some issues in that municipality. I hear the interjections around Matzikama and there are some issues around the appointment of certain staff members in Matzikama. I think of Kannaland and our financial interventions and our oversight from Treasury, but the Municipality themselves then barring us from participating. That, again, is absolutely unacceptable when we are trying to help rectify a situation. And who suffers at the end of the day? It is the citizens in those municipalities. We know that some of these municipalities have got financial situations where they probably are not going to be able to pay salaries very, very soon, let alone give any services to their clients.

Maybe I must. I spoke about the Auditor-General and it was interesting that

when we had the Auditor-General give reports to the PCF, this is where all municipalities are represented and their municipal managers. The Auditor-General giving us a report on the whole province. When it got to the Knysna Municipality, I saw the Mayor kind of slink down and duck out of the room instead of saying listen, let us face it together. We will put mechanisms in place. Let us help. Let us get this Municipality up and running. These are citizens in our province that need services.

I think of Beaufort West and the interventions in Beaufort West where we put in financial interventions over a period of time, and you can already start to see some of the turnaround strategies. So, we want municipalities not to think, they legally try and push us away sometimes and I think that is where politics comes in. And at the end of the day, what happens in those municipalities? It is the citizens that suffer the most. They suffer the most. They do not get water; they do not get the services they deserve and that is totally unacceptable. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Cape Town, and Cape Town?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. This is not your opportunity to ask questions to the hon Premier. This is hon Wessels' opportunity. Hon Wessels, you may have your second opportunity.

Mr D J WESSELS (DA): No, I have completed. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Walters.

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): Hon Premier, what is the Western Cape Government's position on the proposed 36% electricity tariff hike and how it will impact municipalities and residents in the Western Cape? I think it is particularly pertinent given the remarks you have made about economic growth.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Walters. Absolutely! We are totally against an above-inflation rate electricity increase and 36% is totally unacceptable. In actual fact, when you look to municipalities where there is an excess of 40%, this does not make any sense at all. Our citizens out there cannot afford these massive electricity hikes. Then, of course, we have had power now for a while in South Africa, but these massive increases at the same time with a very precarious energy system.

So, we have objected absolutely to the increases that have been proposed by Eskom. Of course, it is not only these increases. There are also other levies that they want to add, a further 4%. So this all starts to push these increases up. That increase is actually 36,15% and we cannot accept those kinds of increases because what happens is, you have got to pass those on to the

citizens.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Walters, your first follow-up question.

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): Ja, hon Speaker, one follow-up question has been covered by the hon Premier already. What challenges has the Western Cape Government faced in their efforts to cut red tape and enable municipalities to procure their own electricity? We know we cannot wait for the pre-TNU mess and Eskom to sort it out. So, what initiatives can we take with the residents at a local level?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Okay, so obviously, the red tape issues and specifically, I want to then refer to our Energy Plan. We have got a 5 700-megawatt Energy Plan. I do not want to go into details because we have spoken about it at length here, but I will give you one example.

So, the City of Cape Town gets permission through National Treasury, to buy back energy from its citizens. So, if you have got an excess of energy because you have got a solar panel on your roof, you can sell that power back into the grid. You will be paid cash for it. So, without going through individual procurement processes to each and every household, you can set those buy-in tariffs and you can make it available to anybody. That, of

course, then relieves the kind of pressure on your system. We know that when we had loadshedding, there was one municipality in South Africa that was always at a better loadshedding level than the rest of the country, and that was the City of Cape Town. That was the City of Cape Town.

But the interesting thing is when George applied for exactly the same thing, then they came back and said no, this cannot happen. This is the exact red tape that gets in the way of creating a resilient energy system. You know that in our Energy Plan and perhaps, just the last item I am going to say on this answer that we have got to remove those barriers.

We have got to give support to our local authorities to enable them to have energy systems and then, what we have also got to do is if we enable and we welcome the splitting up of Eskom into the different companies which is going to enable grid transmissions separately from power generation. We need to have trading platforms because trading platforms will allow you to sell power between each other, as happens in all modern democracies around the world and we need to move to that. But Eskom is blocking that. That is another piece of red tape that just does not make sense. But if we get our plan right, by 2032 the Western Cape will be an energy positive province. In other words, we will be able to export energy to other provinces.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Walters, your second opportunity.

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): Hon Speaker, I was actually covered. My second one was covered by the hon Premier in his response.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Jacobs. You may ask your question to the hon Premier.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Good day, hon Premier. Hon Premier ...[Laughter.], speaking in Parliament in 1977, Senator P Z van Vuuren said:

“We make no apologies for the Group Areas Act and for its application. And if 600 000 Indians and Coloureds are affected by the implementation of that Act, we do not apologise.”

I think the world must simply accept that the National Party came into power in 1948, and it said we will implement residential segregation in South Africa. We put the Act in the Statute Book and as a result in South Africa, out of the chaos which prevailed when we came into power, we created an order and established decent, separate residential areas for White people.

Hon Premier, we are now in a new democracy. When will the Democratic Alliance address the forceful removals of the Coloured people?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and to the hon Jacobs for that question. I thought you were going to ask me about the previous question on policing or LEAP allocation. Maybe, I will try and weave it into this answer so that you get both answers at the same time.

The SPEAKER: No, hon Premier. You must answer the question that is being posed to you.

The PREMIER: [Laughter.] You will see, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, but thank you very much and thank you for the question. Obviously there are various responsibilities at different government levels and one of the biggest issues that I think is not being dealt with, which is probably the most symbolic of forced removals in our region, in our province and in our City, is District Six itself. I mean, it cannot be 30 years later when we are sitting with the position that we are sitting in.

Of course, we know that the land reform process sits at a national level. The land allocation process sits at a national level, but what we are doing in the province, and you will see it in, obviously where we are redeveloping housing processes, how we are making sure that we are trying to up the production of square metres to address that exact problem. So, you will see releasing of more and more land both at municipal level and the provincial level. You will see our current programmes where we ran the pilot at Conradie Park where we put thousands of opportunities into one space.

The interesting thing there was once we decided to develop in this way, it was quite interesting. There were a lot of objections to correcting the past and court cases. And what I say is that people are called 'nimbys'. Not in my backyard. The most interesting thing about Conradie Park is when it was developed, then you saw the surrounding suburbs actually change from 'nimbys' to 'yimbys'. Not in my backyard to yes, in my backyard. We are now following through with that process, and you will see down where, I do not know if you know where that tent is outside the Artscape. You will see the ZipZap tent is going to move now and there are going to be towers going up of redress.

You will see a number of other projects. If you ask for exact details from our Infrastructure Minister, you will get each and every one of those projects of densification. How do we make sure that we within our mandate, make sure that we break down those absolutely unacceptable shackles of the past. We have got to get that correction right and in actual fact, it is embarrassing that it is taking 30 years to really get traction.

But I think the most symbolic and what we would love is this whole House to stand together to say let us actually, while we are doing these other things, let us get District Six evolved down to Province and City level, and let us actually get that happening because that will make the biggest and quickest visible and physical difference to people who are carrying and suffering with the pain of those forced removals.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! ...[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that brings us to the end of ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members! That brings us to the end of Questions to the Premier without Notice. We move over to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. Hon members, there will be an opportunity for Member Statements. I recognise the Democratic Alliance. I recognise the DA, hon Walters.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): Hon Speaker, in the Western Cape, gang violence and mass killings have been rapid with incidents like accused gangster and murderer Mark Lifman's shooting occurring in broad daylight. In Lifman's case, the South African Police Service swiftly arrested suspects. I would now like to call on the SAPS to bring that same energy, determination and dedication to solving crimes against innocent victims of crime. You should not have to be a notorious underworld figure for your case to receive the urgency and attention required to secure justice for you and your family.

Insufficient resources in the SAPS have led to a decrease in detectives and staff shortages resulting in a significant increase in unsolved crimes. The current national policing model has not effectively addressed the unique challenges faced by regions like the Western Cape. A fresh approach recognising the specific needs and context of local communities, and

empowering provincial governments to act decisively could be a game changer in the fight against crime.

Gang involvement and crime are major issues in the Western Cape, particularly amongst youth. A provincial approach to policing could address these issues by strategically allocating resources based on local crime trends which could increase accountability, faster community policing, especially in high crime areas. Together, we can build a safer, stronger Western Cape for all.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Walters. I recognise the African National Congress.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, it is with profound sadness that I rise to mourn the passing of Mandisa Monakali, the founder and president of Ilitha Labantu, who died on Sunday, 3 November, after a brief battle with cancer. Mandisa was a true pioneer in the fight against Gender-based Violence. As a survivor of domestic violence herself, she dedicated her life to empowering women and children through her organisation, Ilitha Labantu, which founded over 30 years ago during the apartheid struggle.

Her vision was clear: to provide shelter, counselling and support for victims of GBV, while raising awareness and mobilising communities for change. Mandisa's legacy as an activist and a leader transcends borders. Her work

was internationally recognised, and she tirelessly advocated for the rights of women and children on local, national and global platforms. Her leadership, the resilience, compassion and a commitment to justice. From her humble beginnings in Gugulethu, Mandisa's unwavering spirit built Ilitha Labantu into a lifeline for countless survivors. Her contribution to gender equality and the fight against violence will continue to inspire us and guide us as well.

Mandisa's passing is a monumental loss not only for her family, but for our entire country and the African continent. As we grieve, let us also honour her memory by continuing the vital work she started, fighting GBV. We extend our heartfelt condolences to her family, friends and all those whose lives were touched by hers. May her legacy live on in every act of courage and community upliftment. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. I recognise the Patriotic Alliance.

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Hon Speaker, the older people are experiencing that the SASSA grant is insufficient to take care of their needs. Some elderly people need to look after their children in extended families, and do not experience a quality life. Their personal care supplies must be subsidised by the State such as linen savers and adult diapers, which are very expensive, giving them some dignity.

The Dial-A-Ride service is no longer operational and there is a need for specialised transport services for the aged and frail people. More training and development for carers and nursing professionals who have to deal with older persons who often suffer from dementia and have limited mobility. There is a need for more old age homes in all areas, more beds to be made available where families are unable to look after their older people. Regular visits and also hampers to be given to the aged to sustain themselves. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the DA.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Hon Speaker, I wish to highlight the vital steps being taken to protect our critically endangered African penguin population in the Western Cape. This week, the Standing Committee on Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning visited the Stony Point penguin colony in Betty's Bay. The Committee fully supports the expansion of this colony, an initiative essential for the survival of the African penguin. Cape Nature, our province's conservation entity, is not only expanding Stony Point, but is also working to establish a new colony at the De Hoop Nature Reserve, diversifying the habitat of this iconic species to improve its chances of survival against numerous environmental threats.

With fewer than 8 400 breeding pairs recorded across South Africa, CapeNature's strategies under the leadership of hon Minister Bredell, including artificial nests, brush packing and regulated visited access offer

critical protection for penguin eggs and chicks against predators and harsh conditions. CapeNature is also prepared to respond to potential oil spills in collaboration with SANCOB and addresses food shortages by monitoring fish populations and advocating for fishing exclusion zones.

These conservation efforts also bring sustainable job opportunities to nearby communities like Mooi Uitsig, through initiatives such as the On the Edge restaurant. As custodians of this unique coastal heritage, we support CapeNature's work and the expansion of penguin colonies, ensuring that the African penguin remains part of our natural heritage for generations to come. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the EFF.

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters is appalled by the conduct of the DA-led City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Provincial Government officials with regards to their unlawful revenue-generating scheme which is aimed at impounding minibus taxis with [Inaudible.] for the State.

This comes after the circulation of an audio clip which made rounds on social media, recorded from one of the enforcement management meetings where the City of Cape Town Commissioner for Public Safety and Operational Coordination, Mr Petrus Roberts, is heard giving orders to different departments to impound taxis in line with specific set targets. In the clip, Mr

Roberts can be heard telling each municipal entity of their deficit with regards to the number of taxis they should impound in order to reach their daily targets. He also made it clear that he is being monitored daily and put under pressure by the Office of the Mayor, and the Provincial Task Team.

The move by the City of Cape Town working alongside the Provincial Task Team, as well as the Provincial Regulatory Entity is nothing but an act of provocation against the taxi industry in the province. The City and the Provincial Government have no basis to complain about bad driving behaviour from taxi drivers as it was the decision of the Provincial Government to scrap the Blue Dot project on 30 November 2022. The Blue Dot project was an incentive aimed at promoting good driver behaviour on the part of the minibus taxis industry and ruled those abiding by the rules in the monitored term.

In the province, only Golden Arrow Bus Services is heavily subsidised by the Provincial Government because it is White owned, while those operating in the taxi industry are constantly punished just because they happen to be Black and Coloureds. We call upon the DA-led City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Provincial Government to stop targeting the taxi industry, release their taxi operating licenses and reinstate the Blue Dot project. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the NCC.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the NCC rises in this august House to tip its proverbial cap to those unsung heroes we easily take for granted. Hon Speaker, today we dedicate our statement to no other than the employees and the support staff of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Hon Speaker, today, our heartfelt gratitude goes out to all those who make it possible for us to serve the population of the Western Cape and its hon members of the Provincial Parliament.

Hon Speaker, from the procedural officers who make it happen every day to the admin staff who are ready to support with answers. Where there is clarity or issues, you will get directed in the correct way. Even at night, these committed staff are ready to assist. Our logistical team is always ready to assist with any issue, transport, or day-to-day running from supply chain right down to the cleaners who keep our Chambers and offices clean and tidy. The NCC rises to thank these members and individuals as they are the engine that makes us look good.

Hon Speaker, when I first set foot in this House, I knew nothing about Parliament and the businesses of Parliament. But the staff took my hand, and they led me through this process, so I bless you all. Today, hon Speaker, I want to thank you and your team for the guidance and the support. God bless you, my brother. Hon Premier, today I want to personally thank each and every one of the staff of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and to the staff: you make it a pleasure for us to be here. But let me assure you, 2029, when we take this Province over ...[Laughter.], you will be well looked after.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much. I recognise the ANC. The ANC? [Interjections.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, it is now hon Lekker's opportunity. ...[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): ...is disturbing me.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip? Hon Lekker, I will protect you. Hon members, please.

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): I rise today to express my deepest condolences to the family of Luvuyo Vimba, a taxi driver whose life was tragically cut short following a violent altercation with members of the South African Police Service on 1 November 2024. The footage and images of the physical confrontation between Luvuyo and members of SAPS before he was chased and physically assaulted by officers, which have been widely circulated on social media, are deeply troubling and demand our full attention.

Hon Speaker, police brutality has no place in our democratic society. We must stand united in strongly disapproving of this unfortunate and unjustifiable incident. It is crucial that SAPS leadership, particularly in the Western Cape, take swift and decisive action to address this matter. The people of South Africa demand accountability and the family of Luvuyo Vimba who have shown remarkable strength in their pursuit of justice,

deserve clear answers.

The IPID must expedite their investigation into this matter and ensure that those responsible for Luvuyo's death are held accountable. It is not enough to simply launch an investigation. We need swift and meaningful justice to prevent such tragedies from happening again. As we await a thorough investigation, let us remember that the fundamental rights and dignity of every South African citizen must be upheld, regardless of their background or circumstances. We will continue to stand with the Vimba family in their quest for justice and we will not rest until all those responsible for his tragic loss are held to account. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the DA.

Mr L D VAN WYK (DA): Hon Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to wish all Matric learners currently undertaking their matriculation examinations, all the best as they work their way through their exams. As you enter the final stretch of your years of learning, it is crucial to remain in a positive frame of mind and prepared. Keep working diligently and confidently as you enter the next phase of your life.

Remember, being positive and having self-confidence are essential traits for your future. Remember that we are well aware that the journey through the twelve years of learning has been challenging. We look forward to receiving excellent examination results from the class of 2024 learners. The world that

you are entering continues to advance as new technologies and challenges emerge. South Africa, under the leadership of the Minister of Basic Education, Siviwe Gwarube, is focusing on the global education agenda, preparing young people for the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

The G20 education working group is the platform for collaboration addressing pressing issues in education. The presidency will emphasise preparing young people for artificial intelligence, large language models and robotics. South Africa's commitment to an equitable approach to education ensures no learner is left behind, contributing to a global movement prioritising growth, safety and the wellbeing of all children. Thank you, too, to the dedication and enthusiasm of teachers and the Western Cape Education Department in successfully bringing you to this milestone. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Good day, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus is a political party that believes in promoting good moral values, hard work and political policies that will revive citizens to embrace responsible life choices. The US election results yesterday ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): ...revealed that liberalism has been rejected. Many

are turning to conservatism as reflected in the results yesterday. There is a silent revolution taking place all across the world, including France and Argentina. Issues of morality and conservatism, preservation of good moral and cultural values are starting to feature high on the global stage.

The sanctity of human life must be restored once again, and we want the Western Cape and South Africa to similarly move away from the precipice of the immorality in all its forms. Unlimited rights, as espoused by liberalism, should not be legalised to mean immoral and reckless behaviour, which is an affront to any conservative Christian and religious society, and camouflaged as freedom. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. hon Speaker, the crisis in the education in the Western Cape continues as the Department is determined to carry out its DA mandate to deprive our learners from quality and equal education. Out of the nine provinces who are avoiding cutting on teaching posts, this province has chosen not to. The cutting on teaching posts will negatively impact on the education of children in disadvantaged communities.

We appeal to the WCED to take heed from other provinces who have avoided cutting on their teaching staff. Stop blaming the budget cuts and the increasing population growth. This province boasts to be the best run

province in South Africa but it is only so for the privileged minority. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Speaker, the ACDP calls on the Health Department to send out health inspectors to visit spaza shops in communities. Two teenagers are on the mend after being treated in hospital for consuming chips from a spaza shop in Tafelsig, Mitchells Plain. Ashlyn Johnson, 17, and Zhiwario van Rooyen, 17, were in hospital after consuming Cannon Ball Maize Nakks from this shop. Ashlyn's father said that he was shocked when his son could not move and did not feel well. He said he was in shock because when he saw his child not moving his body, he was extremely concerned and both of them were hospitalised.

Hon Speaker, this is a major concern not only in Tafelsig, but in many communities where spaza shops open and I do not know if they are visited by the health inspectors. The ACDP is calling. This is just one case of many that are happening, food poisoning is happening, and our youngsters are going to these spaza shops and do not care if they buy there because they are cheaper than the normal shops and they are just around the corner. So, we are asking the Health Department to send out inspectors to spaza shops and make sure that when our youngsters and our children consume anything from there, that it is safe to eat. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, today we want to voice a deep concern regarding the behaviour exhibited by the Democratic Alliance and Patriotic Alliance in the recent by-elections in George, in Borchers, in particular. It was brought to our attention that people claiming to represent these parties had been handing out food parcels, distributing drugs and intimidating voters, tactics that undermine democracy and prey on our communities' hardships. The people of Borchers face severe challenges with food insecurity and substance abuse. These are issues demanding empathy and real solutions, yet instead of offering support and solutions, the DA and the PA have taken advantage of these struggles for political gain, exploiting hunger and addiction to manipulate voters.

These actions do not reflect the behaviour of leaders, they resemble the tactics of drug dealers. It is particularly hypocritical that a group of DA members, while representing a party that invests heavily in policing and under the banner of law and order, would undermine the community's wellbeing by allegedly offering drugs to manipulate public support. On the one hand, they claim to protect our safety, on the other hand they fuel the very crisis that threatens it. Our democracy rests on the principle of service to people, not manipulation of people. When parties resort to tactics like these, they reveal their disregard for the community's dignity and rights, showing they are willing to act more like dealers than leaders. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the DA.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, this week the City of Cape Town hosted the Earthshot Week for 2024. The Earthshot initiative, driven by Prince William, aims to empower and energise people in the fight against climate change. In the Western Cape, we have seen firsthand how devastating the effects of climate change can be as our province has seen an increase in drought and wildfires on the one hand, and devastating flooding on the other. The Earthshot Prize was awarded last night to five innovators, along with a £1-million prize for them to implement the climate change mitigation and adaptation plans for the winning finalists.

If we are to slow down or reverse the damage to our environment, initiatives like the Earthshot Prize must be supported. There has been an unmistakable air of excitement in Cape Town this week and I urge all residents of the Western Cape to take that excitement and channel it towards saving our environment. In this province especially, we have so much natural beauty and biodiversity to protect for the next generation. I commend the City of Cape Town for their tremendous work in hosting such a prestigious event and look forward to seeing the projects of last night's winners make a lasting impact in the fight against climate change. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Members' Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more hon members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to

Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Are there any hon members of the Executive? I recognise hon Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. Hon Speaker, so there are two matters that I want to touch on. The first: the hon Stephens. I mean, we sit as a province, the Department of Social Development, SASSA does not reside under DSD. At times, that is incredibly frustrating because there are some serious issues around that that need to be addressed.

But since I came into office, we went on a proactive effort to take hands with SASSA to raise matters directly with them, and to their credit, they have tried to step up as well within their limitations to address it. Even tonight, we will have SASSA joining us at First Thursday, which shows that commitment that we are trying to take hands and servicing the residents, the most vulnerable of this province, in a quick and more efficient way.

But we do need to get our fair share of the money to look after the most vulnerable. Our bottom line has not changed, but the demand has increased and increased and increased, and our social workers, our social auxiliary workers and other professionals are doing a tremendous job under incredibly trying circumstances to continue delivering a quality service. So, that is just on that matter.

Hon Herron, I remember the previous byelection. There were also 110 reasons that you tried, during the course of the day when you saw you were

going to get an absolute hammering at the polls, to give reasons why you are going to lose that. Now, I do not know whether you did that for the benefit of the broader public or for internally in your own party, but you are bleeding and you are bleeding at an alarming rate. With this by-election, again in George, you now come and make unfounded statements in the House. In fact, you should in fact be charged for making such false accusations ...[Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): I have all the papers!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...because the Democratic Alliance fought an honest ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Herron. Hon Herron, you have had an opportunity. This is now in terms of Rule 145(6). Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So, hon Herron, through you, hon Speaker, we actually go and we walk the streets. We do not just sit in an office and write 110 statements and go and compete on X or Facebook. That is why your party's results are going backwards and backwards and backwards and backwards and backwards. You barely kept your one seat in this Legislature. So, please refrain from making unfounded remarks. We respect democracy and to the Patriotic Alliance that retained their ward: congratulations.

But to the hon Wessels and the team from the Democratic Alliance that went and worked day in and day out and grew by 20%: well done! Well done on fighting a clean campaign and showing the growth the party can achieve and trouncing GOOD who now needs to come here with false claims and accusations to, I do not know, defend himself and his own party for the continuous. Well, I do not think there is much left to bleed out, so now we just need to bury the corpse. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. Just to the hon Ferlon Christians. I certainly share his concern, and I will get a report on the incident which he mentioned, but I would ask him and other hon members to bear in mind that there is a large amount of fake news in this environment and many of the events are not, in fact, linked to spaza shops as social media claims.

To the hon Brinkhuis. We are, obviously, doing everything we can to fight for our teachers. To the hon Van Wyk, thank you for recognising the hard work of the officials in my Department and wishing our Matrics well. To the hon Marais, considering, of course, your poor electoral showing, perhaps you would like to consider a new slogan inspired by the President, Donald Trump, and try perhaps something like ‘Make the Freedom Front great again!’ ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Order, hon members. Are there any further, hon members of the Executive? If not, thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements.

MOTIONS

The SPEAKER: We now move on to Notices of Motions in terms of Rule 151. All notices of motions by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have duly been submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House hereby expresses its profound dismay at reports indicating that Eskom intends to petition the National Energy Regulator of South Africa (NERSA) for an increase in electricity tariffs ranging from 36% to 44%. Should this information be accurate, it is evident that such a substantial price increase would place an untenable burden on vulnerable populations and small enterprises across our nation, jeopardizing their very survival. In the Western Cape, numerous

municipalities have resorted to cutting electricity supply to households due to non-payment, leading to a concerning rise in allegations of tampering within the City of Cape Town. This situation has resulted in hardship for many diligent citizens who will find it increasingly difficult to bear the financial strain imposed by these proposed increases, and therefore moves that a urgent and decisive action to explore viable solutions to mitigate the adverse effects of this impending crisis, with particular emphasis on safeguarding the interests of the Western Cape and its residents.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern the ongoing reluctance of certain municipalities within the Western Cape to account to the Provincial Legislature, citing their autonomy as a reason for non-compliance; notes further that while the autonomy of Local Government as enshrined in our Constitution, should be respected always, the Constitution also recognizes the clear mandate provided by Section 155(6)(a) and (b) of the Constitution, which empowers the Provincial Legislature to monitor and support Local Government, as well as promote Local Government capacity to enable effective performance of their functions; and in light of the above, instructs its legal advisors to provide a comprehensive legal opinion on the legislative mandate of the provincial sphere

concerning the monitoring and support of municipalities, and that this opinion should clarify the extent of the Provincial Legislature's oversight capabilities and the mechanisms available for promoting accountability within Local Government.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That this House acknowledges with deep concern the ongoing challenges within the Department of Local Government arising from the senior management team's failure to convene regular meetings; further notes that this situation has been exacerbated by significant tensions between the Head of Department (HOD) and the Chief Financial Officer (CFO), resulting from serious allegations of sexual harassment and subsequent claims of bullying and abuse of power against the HOD; further notes that it came to light during the recent committee meeting regarding the Department's Annual Report that no internal investigation has been initiated to address the sexual harassment complaint, undermining the integrity of the Department and the wellbeing of its staff; and in light of these troubling developments, call upon the MEC for Local Government to intervene immediately and ensure that remedial action is taken against the HOD for his failure to convene senior management team meetings, which has hindered departmental functioning and that a thorough and impartial investigation is conducted into all allegations levelled against

the HOD, including the claims of sexual harassment, bullying, and abuse of power and furthermore calls on the MEC and the Premier to release to this House all internal and external investigation reports related to the serious allegations against the HOD.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The SPEAKER: We now move on to Motions without Notice in terms of Rule 150. I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary of 5 November 2024. Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 5 November 2024, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members' which names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following hon members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon A P Bans, hon N D Nkondlo.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing of Danie Odendaal, a legendary figure in the South African television industry, who left us on 30 October 2024 in Langebaan after a brief illness; further acknowledges that Danie was not only a remarkably talented actor and producer but also a pioneer in creating beloved television content, most notably the iconic Afrikaans soap opera *7de Laan*; appreciates that under his vision and leadership, *7de Laan* became a cultural phenomenon, captivating audiences and achieving unprecedented success on SABC 2; recognizes that his contributions extended beyond *7de Laan*, having served as head writer for *Egoli: Place of Gold*, where his creative talents flourished for eight years; acknowledges the profound impact he had on the industry, leaving an indelible mark on the hearts of viewers and colleagues alike; and conveys heartfelt condolences to his family, colleagues, and loved ones.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing of former Labour Minister Membathisi Mdladlana, who departed this life on

Friday, 18 October 2024, at the age of 72; further notes Membathisi Mdladlana was a guiding star in our struggle for liberation, embodying resilience and commitment to social justice and he was a champion for workers' rights, advocating for fair treatment and protections under the law; acknowledges that he was a progressive educator who was a founder member of the Democratic Teachers Union (DETU), a then member of the UDF, now SADTU, where he championed the cause of non-racial education against the apartheid Bantu Education system; and honours the legacy of Membathisi Mdladlana and remembers his contributions as an activist, unionist, and leader dedicated to the upliftment of others; and conveys sincerest condolences to his family, friends, and all who had the privilege of knowing him.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual member's name as if the member had read them out aloud.

Hon members, I will now afford an opportunity to the hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes as per

Standing Rule 150(2)(d), will start now. I recognise the hon Stephens.

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the leadership of the PA for their outstanding achievement in winning Ward 20 in Borchards, George, with an impressive 52% support. The significant victory not only marks a successful ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, I did not recognise you. I will recognise you now. Hon Stephens, please continue.

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA):

The significant victory not only marks a successful retention of this key city in the Garden Route, but also highlights the party's continued growth with support doubling in the region. As the third most popular municipality in the Western Cape, this outcome further solidifies the Patriotic Alliance's commitment and presence within one of the province's largest municipalities. It is a testament to the trust and confidence the people of George have placed in the party. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Stephens, I allowed you to continue with your motion because I did not want to interrupt you, but there was a point of order. So, I did not want to interrupt in the middle and then rule, and then allow you because it just makes Hansard for the decision and for the record. Hon Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, thank you very much. Hon Speaker, the motion that the hon member is delivering in the House is significantly different from the motion that the member gave notice of.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there are two ways to deal with it. The one way of dealing with it is to put it to the House and then, because there is no rule that is preventing. That is just an agreement that is happening within the Programming Authority. So, I am going to put the motion as delivered by the hon member to the House. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I move on to hon Constable.

Mr N CONSTABLE (PA): Hon Speaker, thank you very much and be greeted in

the Mighty name of Jesus Christ, all the hon members in the House. I move without notice:

That the House convey its condolences to hon member Nkondlo with the passing of her mother and extend our heartfelt condolences to our respected colleague, hon member Nkondlo. We wish to express our deepest sympathy on the passing of her beloved mother. The loss of a parent is an immeasurable sorrow, leaving a void that words cannot fill. We share in the pain that the hon member is experiencing during this difficult time. We acknowledge the enduring impact that a mother's guidance, love, and strength has on each of us, shaping our lives and guiding our paths. Her legacy lives on in the values and the dedication that hon member Nkondlo brings to this House and in the lives that she touches. May the comfort of family, friends and the support of this House provide strength in the days to come. We request, hon Speaker, that this House observes a moment of silence in the remembrance of hon member Nkondlo's mother and in support of our colleague, hon member Nkondlo and her family during this time's loss. Thank you, hon Speaker. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Constable. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I note that hon Petrus is not here. Is there anyone that

is going to deliver the motion on his behalf or can we move on? Hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that last week Gugulethu residents took to the streets to demand a construction of District Hospital that was promised by the Provincial Department of Health few years ago; further notes that the residents are against the idea that the hospital should be constructed where their sporting field is currently situated as the field serves a good purpose to society. Residents further complained that the KTC Community Centre no longer serves its purpose as it can no longer meet the needs of a growing population and it is in the state of disrepair with poor service, not being wheelchair-friendly, and with no proper parking area. As the EFF, we call upon the Provincial Departments of Health and Infrastructure to work together and to ensure that Gugulethu has a District Hospital with a Trauma Unit. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Lithakong. Hon Lithakong? If not, I move on. Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern reports that at least 20 learners from Mzamomtsha Primary School in Driftsands, Cape Town, were rushed to a local clinic on Wednesday morning after complaining of stomach cramps; notes further that while 18 of the learners have since been discharged, the cause of the incident remains unconfirmed, and that circulating rumours suggest food poisoning as a possible cause. We call on the WCED and other relevant authorities to investigate the cause of the incident thoroughly and ensure that no stone is left unturned in identifying the source of the problem. We further call on the WCED and the relevant health authorities to implement stricter measures regarding the food sold in schools and provided to learners through the National School Nutrition Programme (NSNP), to safeguard the health and wellbeing of all learners across the province; and expresses support for efforts to ensure that proper health and safety standards are upheld in school environments, especially in relation to food safety, and that corrective action is taken as necessary to prevent any recurrence. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): We object that it is moved without notice.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, hon Windvogel, that it is moved without notice and the motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I recognise honourable. I note hon Lekker was next, is there somebody that is going to deliver hon Lekker's motion? Hon Bans?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. On behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House notes the action of the Disability Revolution group, which led a picket at the Civic Centre on 5 November 2024, to demand better access to public transport for people with disabilities in the City of Cape Town; supports the group's call for the City of Cape Town to include specific measures in the Comprehensive Integrated Transport Plan (CITP) 2023 to 2028 to address the transport needs of people with disabilities, particularly those from poor communities and informal settlements; acknowledges the challenges faced by people with disabilities, as highlighted by the group, including inadequate public

transport infrastructure, lack of consultation on the Dial-A-Ride business plan, and the inaccessibility of certain transport services and facilities such as taxis, trains, and stations; recognizes the dignity of every individual and the urgent need for equitable transport access for people with disabilities, including affordable, reliable, and accessible transport options in both formal and informal areas of the City; calls on the City of Cape Town and other relevant authorities to heed the call made by the Disability Revolution group, to update the CITP to include comprehensive, actionable plans for improving transport access for people with disabilities, and to ensure that their voices are properly heard in the planning and implementation of transport policies; and calls further on the City of Cape Town to ensure that future public transport services, including the Dial-A-Ride system, are designed with input from people with disabilities and that accessibility is prioritized, so that no person is left behind due to their mobility needs. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Object that it is moved without notice.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Bans.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the protest action by the residents of Gugulethu, Cape Town, who, while acknowledging the urgent need for a new healthcare facility in their community, have expressed strong opposition to the proposed site for the hospital on the existing sports field; recognises that the Gugulethu community, particularly the youth, rely on the sports field for recreational activities, and that the loss of this space would significantly impact their wellbeing, especially in light of ongoing social challenges and the involvement of youth in gangs; supports the community's demand for the construction of a new hospital with the necessary facilities, including a trauma unit, obstetric unit, and maternity ward, to address the health needs of the growing population of Gugulethu and surrounding areas such as Philippi, Lusaka, and informal settlements; acknowledges further the critical importance of preserving existing recreational spaces, such as the sports field in Gugulethu, which serves as a vital outlet for physical activity and social cohesion, especially given the social ills affecting the youth in the area; calls on the Western Cape Department of Health and the City of Cape Town to identify an alternative site for the construction of the new hospital, one that will meet the healthcare needs of the community without sacrificing valuable recreational spaces; urges that a consultative process be

undertaken, involving the relevant stakeholders, including local sports clubs, schools, and residents, to ensure that both healthcare and recreational needs are balanced and adequately addressed; and calls further on the Government to prioritize the development of both essential healthcare infrastructure and accessible spaces for youth engagement, in order to promote holistic community development and wellbeing in Gugulethu. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to that motion statement being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and it will be placed on the Order Paper, printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Stoffel.

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the recent reburial of the remains of Basil February, a courageous and selfless freedom fighter who gave his life in the battle against the brutal apartheid regime in 1967, at the young age of 24, in Zimbabwe; affirms that Basil February, also known by his operative name, Paul Peterson, was a dedicated member of Umkhonto we

Sizwe (MK), the armed wing of the African National Congress (ANC), and remains a symbol of the unwavering commitment of the liberation movement to fight for the freedoms we now enjoy; recognises that February was not only a brave soldier but also an intellectual, deeply engaged in the political struggles of his time, and an accomplished writer, serving as the editor of both the ANC's publication *Sechaba* and the MK publication *Mayibuye*, through which he contributed to the ideological and strategic direction of the movement; welcomes the solemn reburial ceremony in Somerset West, which allowed his family to lay him to rest in their ancestral grave alongside other cherished loved ones, providing much-needed closure after nearly six decades of searching for his remains; acknowledges that the reburial of Basil February serves as an enduring reminder of the sacrifices made by countless individuals in the struggle against apartheid, whose contributions must never be erased from the pages of our history; emphasizes that Basil February's legacy, like that of many of our fallen heroes, should continue to inspire future generations to fight for a society founded on the values enshrined in our Constitution: equality, justice, human rights, and unity in diversity; conveys heartfelt condolences to his family, who, after decades of uncertainty and grief, have now found some measure of closure, and calls on all South Africans to recognize the significance of this moment not only as a personal family matter, but as a reflection of our shared struggle for freedom and dignity; and urges the House to honour the legacy of Basil February, and all those who gave their lives in the fight against

apartheid, by ensuring that their contributions to our democratic journey are never forgotten, and that their ideals continue to guide and shape the South Africa we are building today. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Stoffel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Stephens.

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and considers the following: the Western Cape Minister of Social Development, Mr Jaco Londt, and the Department of Social Development are urgently called upon to intervene at Benevolent Park Old Age Home in Mossel Bay; the reports from the community indicate that residents who express views differing from those of the management face discrimination and victimization. This institution, which should be a haven of comfort and respect, risks failing its duty to the most vulnerable in our society, our elderly. It is both a moral and legislative responsibility of our Government and community to ensure that our senior citizens live in safety, dignity, and freedom from mistreatment. This House, as the voice of the people, must prioritize the welfare of our elderly and act to eliminate any form of neglect or abuse in facilities entrusted with their care. I trust that this matter will be met

with urgency and a comprehensive investigation to uphold the standards of care expected in our province. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ha, it is an embarrassment.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a decision of the House on that question already, so we have moved on.

Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice and that also concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting, and all the hon members will be exited from the Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:41.