
THURSDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated, hon members. I recognise the Deputy Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, I move that the next sitting of this House scheduled for Tuesday, 26 November 2019, commence at 10:00.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Are there any objections to the motion, hon members? No objections? Agreed to.

Hon members, guests, let me take the opportunity to recognise and ask the hon members to join me in welcoming the member of the National Assembly of Pakistan, the International Chairperson of the Commonwealth Women Parliamentary Forum. That is the wing of the CPA international branch. She has just been elected now in Kampala in Uganda. She is brand new, fresh from the box. She has been here since Monday and she has had a number of activities with our members and one of them was today where the CWP branch was re-established. Hon members, let us all please welcome hon Shandana Gulzar Khan. [Applause.] Thank you hon Khan. Please give our regards to the Speaker of Pakistan Parliament. You are welcome here.

Now hon members we have got Interpellations and the first interpellation is by hon Christians to the hon Minister of Education, hon Schäfer. I now recognise the hon Minister.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Matriculants pass rate

1. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

Whether she and her Department have a turnaround strategy to ensure that matriculants achieve a quality pass rate in Quintile 1 to Quintile 3 in the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much hon Speaker and to the member for the interpellation. Yes, we certainly do have a strategy in place. The Department prioritises schools for support that need it the most, which includes obviously Quintiles 1 to 3 but can also include schools in Quintiles 4 and 5 because as you well know many of our poorer communities are in schools in Quintiles 4 and 5. This depends on their results.

The strategy includes the following: An Examination Roadshow was conducted in all districts targeting all Grade 12 teachers in all subjects. Each teacher was provided with feedback on the NSC examinations based on the examiners' and moderators' report. The feedback included a detailed analysis of the results per subject and questions to identify areas needing attention. Each subject teacher received a subject support package containing support materials in problematic content areas. The Department has broadcast the Telematics Programme to 150 schools throughout the academic year. This programme was also accessed via live streaming which in effect provides access to all learners.

A "Tips for Success" booklet was issued to all Grade 12 learners. An "Exam Exemplar" booklet was distributed to all Grade 12s. All districts have implemented comprehensive support programmes for teachers and learners. A centralised tutoring programme targeting learners from schools in the lower quintiles was conducted during August and September. The programme in August provided six hours of tutoring in a range of subjects

where learners were able to register for two subjects in which they were either performing poorly or had the potential to achieve an excellent result.

In September the same learners went to classes over a three-day period which provided them with another six hours of tuition in three subjects. This programme targeted approximately 1 800 learners across the province. Subject advisers and senior curriculum planners have also visited and supported teachers and learners at these schools during the course of the year. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you Minister for that response. Just, Minister, and I am just reading out of the annual report, so your focus and objectives were to improve the level of language and mathematics in our schools; also to increase the number of quality passes in the National Senior Certificate and also to increase the quality of education provision in poorer communities. Now, Minister, you will agree with me that there is still a lot to be done when it comes to the poorer schools because if we look at just the statistics out of the annual report, although we show a significant increase when it comes to these quintile schools, it is still far beyond where we need to go and I am not going to give the details but in the annual report it gives us the successes of the

Quintile 1 and the Quintile 2 and Quintile 3, the bachelor passes, but my concern is, still in our poorer schools people are still not getting quality education. Let me just try to give you one example. We have been to Chrysalis not so long ago and one of the presentations that was done by Chrysalis says, and I challenged them with this when they said, “Many young black men in particular are groomed for prisons, unemployment and not reaching their highest potential, by our system of inequality, neglect and poor education.”

The CEO Dr Meyer also said that when they do get a child from Khayelitsha and a child from Rondebosch there are miles - you cannot even compare the two because they do not receive the same education. So I am just asking, I am glad and I am happy with the interventions being done but we really want to see an increase in our poorer schools when it comes to bachelor passes. Many of the learners - and we know there are other avenues that they can go to - but we would really want to encourage our learners to get bachelor passes so that they can go to university and educate themselves because we know what education does to communities, poor communities.

So Minister, like I said I am happy with what you are saying, but still when we make the comparisons we do not see equal education. When we do the comparisons we still see that our Quintile 1 to 3 are lacking far behind. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you hon member Christians. I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, we know that when the DA took office in 2009 the matric pass rate in Quintile 1 schools was 57.5% and in 2018 it grew to 70.5% so we had a pass rate increase of 10.6% in Quintile 2... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yoh!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Who was the Minister then?

Ms L J BOTHA: ...and 15.6% in Quintile 3 schools... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Dugmore.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: There we go!

Ms L J BOTHA: ...and I want to know that in terms of the WCED and the retentions of learners to be able to complete a matric pass, how does that compare for instance to our neighbours in the Eastern Cape and also in terms of the collaboration schools, how many are there in these Quintiles 1 to 3 and what will this collaboration - what will the effect be on the matric pass and, Minister, if you can speak to the number of matrics in these quintiles as asked in the questions Quintiles 1 to 3, how many will be

matriculants writing the external exam for 2019; and is there any way that the WCED with regards to our bachelor passes track these learners after they have completed and are eligible to go to an institution of higher education in terms of a bachelor pass? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Who was the ANC MEC?

Ms L J BOTHA: The Leader of the Opposition.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members, thank you hon member Botha. Hon member Sayed.

An HON MEMBER: Numbers do not lie! Numbers do not lie!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Every year over the past three years the hon MEC for Education has been claiming to have a turnaround strategy to help turn the tide, yet when the results are released we witness a regression in the matric pass rate in the Western Cape. Not only is the pass rate declining, but the quality itself is dropping, with the number of schools with a matric pass rate below 60% increasing and the majority of such schools are Quintile 1 to 3 where learners from disadvantaged and poor backgrounds are affected.

Now hon Speaker, the retention rate for learners between Grades 10 and 12 is decreasing and hon Speaker, the number of learners taking up

mathematics and science and that of learners passing these subjects is also dropping and the bachelor pass rate when compared to the previous years, is quite poor. Hon Speaker, an effective turnaround strategy should be the one which addresses the root causes of the challenges affecting the schools in Quintile 1 to 3, not piecemeal solutions and aside from shifting the focus to the budgetary constraints the MEC must tell us what is being done to address the overcrowding and the teacher-to-learner ratio. Is there a plan to alleviate the pressure by opening up the gates of schools in Quintiles 4 and 5 to learners from overcrowded schools in poor communities?

The scourge, hon Speaker, of gangsterism at our schools is exaggerated by the unwillingness of the Department of Education in the Province and the MEC to fix broken fences, a matter that I have always been raising. What is being done to keep our schools safe, for example from Homba Primary School today in Khayelitsha we received news of the computer labs again being vandalised with PCs having been stolen, despite numerous requests by the principal for the Department to build fences. Obviously you will have poor results... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and in conclusion, hon Speaker, I want to move, I want to move a motion calling on the Premier... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...to appoint a task team to assess and provide us with solutions on the poor state of education in our province if matric results again show a decline.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker. I really do not want to make this a political debate, really I do not. I really do not. The important thing is, it is a problem that needs to be addressed.

An HON MEMBER: It is the political setting.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It is a problem I need to address. I mean, one of the examples that we have is when we visited Laingsburg. One high school in Laingsburg... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): But you are part of the Opposition.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and one school, high school in Laingsburg, and those children do not have the opportunity to do pure maths because they do not offer it, so they need to leave Laingsburg for pure maths. So yes, and the more and more we hear that pupils are sent in certain directions so that schools can get better results and not thinking that maths and science are so crucial that we get and steer people in those directions where it is mostly needed. Another important thing, hon Speaker, is when it comes to - and we have always spoken about that - but if we do not fix the safety of our learners I do not think they will excel and that is a critical issue, but besides that I think the important thing is we want to see better results where the Western Cape is first again and not third. We want to see that we excel in various areas, but especially in those poor schools, especially where those pupils that matriculate just become unemployed and are roaming the streets. That is what I am talking about. Let us put in all the efforts to improve our education so that our pupils in those quintiles, Quintile 1 to 3 get quality education so that they just do not go to an institution of learning but also go to university. It is so easy to say “institution of learning”, I am here to say our percentage of Quintile 1 to Quintile 3, when it comes to bachelor passes, is lagging far behind. When it comes to, if you break down the 81% pass rate and you take it via quintile, we will be astonished to see that we are lagging behind, so it is one thing to say we have 81% but out of that 81% a lot of our Quintile 1 to 3 is not featuring there, so Minister... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You need to conclude, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Yes, Minister, I encourage what you said but we need to do something to see a turnaround at the end of this year and be proud that everybody has gained and has quality education. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much to members for the debate. Hon member Christians, yes, I do agree with you that we are nowhere near where we would like to be in Quintile 1 to 3 schools, in fact in many of our schools - even in the other quintiles. We are always looking to improve in the Western Cape Education Department but we really are doing the very best we can under an extremely difficult and increasingly difficult financial situation.

Hon member Botha, I do not have the figures of the collaboration schools. I can get them for you and I will send them through to you, but bachelor passes have certainly increased in the last year, we went up very nicely and the bachelor passes in the Quintile 1 to 3 schools in particular have increased very, very nicely, and as you have said the matric results also since we took power in 2009 have increased substantially and we will continue. I mean that is all as a result of ongoing efforts in those schools to ensure that we do the very best we can for those learners.

Hon member Sayed, I am sick and tired of hearing from the ANC that we

must come up with a plan... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shame, shame! [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No-no! [inaudible - members speaking simultaneously]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, yes, yes! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, I am. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must welcome our critique.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Do not come and tell me about budget. Well, tell me how to employ... [Interjections.] Sorry, hon Speaker. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must welcome our critique.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I do not welcome critique when the reason why we cannot fix fences at every school and the reason we cannot employ teachers in classes is because the ANC has stolen and wasted so much money, hundreds of billions of rand... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh my goodness!

An HON MEMBER: So the ANC is getting [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...that every year we get told to cut our budget. [Interjections.] We cannot increase the standard of education by giving better teachers, more teachers for maths and science, and more teachers to reduce the class size - not without more money. I do not understand how it is so difficult to comprehend. We cannot employ teachers without money. Now if we are having classes with 60 pupils in a class we need more teachers, therefore, we need more money. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are controlling... [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: So, perhaps hon member Sayed can take it to his national counterpart in National Treasury... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are building fireproof... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Billions of savings [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...and tell them what they are doing to education in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The Auditor-General's findings.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As far as the matric pass rate is concerned we have been there I do not know how many times, half of the pass rate increase last year was because of the multiple of examine opportunity, which other provinces forced their learners to not write the full matric exam. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Let us tell the truth. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: And then their pass rate went sky-high because they had fewer people writing, so all the people who were not going to pass were kept out of the system. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell them!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: So that is why the pass rate went high. We still maintained 81% with the highest retention rate in the entire country from Grades 10 to 12. [Interjections.] That is my priority, yes, so that is completely not correct and we do need to look, I agree. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Now even the elections [Inaudible.]
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We do need to look... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We do need to look at how we report matric results because if it is just going to be percentage then we are going to carry on doing this and people are going to carry on being pushed out of the schools to get better results and they are not going to take mathematics. I agree some people are kicked out because they are not going to - they are going to bring down the result. In addition, because of the ANC's abject failure in the Eastern Cape... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Now you are doing that [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...we had a 130 000 more learners coming here. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] in the Eastern Cape, where are they...

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: A third of them - they only come here in Grade 10 because they are so desperate to get a better education. Then they are not improving. 25% [Interjections.] 25% of their learners did not write

matric last year, go look, so, the point is - the point is... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You see we have retention and the full marks there... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: They are maybe improving but nowhere near what they were claiming last year. Now the point is we cannot keep on pursuing the percentage pass if we are genuinely serious about trying to get people to stay in school and take the subjects like maths and science that we so desperately need in our economy, so I agree that we are nowhere near where we should be, but our bachelor passes are hugely improved. Our retention rate has hugely improved and I also would like to just say to hon member Christians, I do not agree that we must obsess about university. Higher education yes, but not everyone should be going to university because that is not the best option for everybody and we need more non-technical and vocational skills in this country.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you need to wrap up.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We need more non-technical vocational skills in the country and that is what we need to work towards.
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: You do not care about the poor.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: You do not care about the people.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, before we go to the next interpellation, allow me to do the following. Hon Premier, Leader of the Opposition and obviously hon members present. I know that members may see some changes, maybe some new faces or one face that is new in the House. He is not a member of the public. Due to the resignation of Mr De Jager, a vacancy occurred in the representation of the Al Jama-ah party
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker in Stellenbosch [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: ...in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament...

An HON MEMBER: Really?

The SPEAKER: ...thus creating a vacancy which has since been filled by the nomination of Mr G Brinkhuis with effect from 23 October 2019. I had the liberty to preside over the swearing in of hon Brinkhuis in my office on 23 October 2019. Hon members, please allow me to welcome in this House of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, hon member Brinkhuis.

Welcome hon member Brinkhuis. [Applause.] Now you are a hon member of this House, but you have been participating in committees in any case, so welcome, sir.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: The next interpellation is by hon Mvimbi to the Minister of Finance, Minister Maynier. I now recognise the Minister of Finance.

Wasteful and fruitless expenditure: measures to prevent

2. Mr L L Mvimbi asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

What measures has the Provincial Government put in place to prevent irregular, unauthorised, wasteful and fruitless expenditure from recurring in the province?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The constrained economic and fiscal outlook requires provinces to ensure that efficient, effective and sustainable management of fiscal resources is of course implemented in the Western Cape. Good governance and fiscal responsibility are of course critical to ensure that, despite the challenges

we face, we can continue to deliver services to unlock economic growth and of course to create jobs in the Western Cape. We remain committed to the principles of allocated efficiency, fiscal consolidation, fiscal discipline and fiscal sustainability in the Western Cape. With the Provincial Treasury's mandate to promote and enforce transparency and effective management in respect of revenue and expenditure, assets and liabilities of Provincial Departments and provincial entities set out in the PFMA, the Department has sought to implement sound financial management in order to prevent irregular, unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure across all departments and entities in the Western Cape.

We have conducted assessments of departments and entities on budgetary matters, supply chain, asset management and accounting with departments and entities, reporting to the Provincial Treasury on of course the irregular, unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure as part of the monthly in-year monitoring reports. We hold quarterly engagement sessions with departments to discuss all issues emanating from the in-year monitoring reports. We have developed good governance support plans to assist departments and entities to close the good governance gaps and improve fiscal responsibility.

We also have forums for chief financial officers, supply chain management, and of course financial management and accounting. We have issued delegation frameworks and we provide a continuous analysis and guidance of regulations and instructions.

We are also workshopping versions of the irregular, unauthorised fruitless and wasteful expenditure frameworks to ensure that there is consistence; that there is a consistent understanding in the province with a standard way of evaluating, monitoring and reporting particularly on irregular, unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure. We have institutionalised these measures which has gone a long way, I think, to explain how we have become the top performing province when it comes to managing irregular unauthorised and wasteful and fruitless expenditure in South Africa. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, thank you very much. The issue was raised in the spirit of wanting to prevent instead of actually curing, so as we all know that prevention is better than cure so let us rather try and prevent it from happening instead of us having to work on fixing when it has been done. [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Tell that to the National Government.

Mr L L MVIMBI: And I am saying this in the spirit of wanting to bring and usher in good governance in the Western Cape as the Minister has alluded... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Eskom.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...but hon Speaker, allow me first to state that...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, Eskom proved this [Inaudible.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...while irregular unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure are not forms of corruption, but they are forms of non-compliance with the PFMA and other regulation, for instance irregular expenditure is defined as expenditure that was not incurred in the manner prescribed by legislation, which means that somewhere in the process of expenditure the accounting officer failed to comply with applicable legislation. On the other hand fruitless and wasteful expenditure means expenditure made in vain, that could have been avoided had reasonable care been taken. Hon Speaker, the above speaks to both the weakness and other related challenges of the supply chain management process, as well as the lack of consequent management.

In this regard the Auditor-General has been consistently making calls to pay urgent attention to improving supply chain processes. The PFMA makes it clear that:

“Accounting officers are responsible for preventing the above transgressions.”

Instead of applying consequent management, the Provincial Government must not move in to condone some of these expenditures. Action must be taken against the individuals that have been responsible for this.

As an example there are departments that have irregular and fruitless expenditure. I would have expected that the Minister would say ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Cederberg.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... in these departments, these are the actions, these are the activities that are going to be done. [Interjections.] Instead, the Minister has mentioned that they are the top performer, but ...
[Interjections.] if you are a top performer we want you to move beyond having irregular and unauthorised expenditure, and instead there must also be action there, and then also politicians must stop defending and covering up for officials that are involved in irregular and fruitless expenditure.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You must try and wrap up, hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI: You should, as responsible politicians, especially the executive authority, they must be the first to say that, "This official has been responsible and we are taking action."

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr L L MVIMBI: We do not expect that ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... there must be cover up. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. I now recognise hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The role of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts in the WCPP is to hold the Executive to account for the financials in their respective departments, but firstly two things. I would like to thank the Ministers, every single one, and the Premier, for availing themselves. I have seen every single Minister here during the SCOPA annual reports during the season.

Mr P MARRAN: On our request.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Secondly I would like to congratulate the Minister of Health and her Department for being the first Health Department in South Africa for getting for getting a clean audit. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you for listening, Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, Sir.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Mr Speaker, when it comes to irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A good Premier.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ... the reason why the Health Department is actually such a beacon of light is because in the *ad hoc* nature, in the emergency situations that exist in the health sector, it is truly a remarkable feat to receive a clean audit.

In SCOPA we heard various examples of minimal amounts of irregular expenditure, where it was crucial to ensure service delivery, but due to red tape certain legislation imposes, the particular regulations could not necessarily be complied with, and I will give you some examples. In many of these, for example, you would get two quotes instead of three, but there were only two companies in the whole municipality that could deliver the particular service.

In the Health Department – and remember hon member Mvimbi is the chair of SCOPA and, you know, we sit on the same committee so I am surprised he forgets some of these things. Health, for example, had to get a new machine, but with this particular machine only the particular branding of that machine could be bought, otherwise it would not comply with any

other technology in the whole department. I am not sure if hon member Mvimbi wanted the Minister to buy a different machine.

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up ... [Interjections.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: In, for example, Social Development
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ... the majority of irregular expenditure was local content. If you do not comply one hundred percent, if it is 99% then all of a sudden it is non-compliant.

Agriculture, which is arguably the worst ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ... had a fifth of a tenth of one percent.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.] I now recognise

hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. It has quite been interesting that when I raised this issue I did not make mention of any specific department because I was actually saying that we must make sure that we do prevent irregular and unauthorised expenditure. But, out of political expediency, some Members of Parliament have chosen to mention their department; for example ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): We did not [Inaudible.] Eskom.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... while most ...

Mr M K SAYED: Eskom is not run by the Province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members. [Interjections.] Please proceed hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I have actually found it very strange, We should be working together on making sure that we prevent irregular and unauthorised expenditure. Some members of the Provincial Legislature seem to be refusing to hold the Executive to account, which I think that you will see in most instances ... [Interjections.] I did not even mention a department, but hon member Baartman mentioned the Health Department. [Interjections.] And actually for as an example in the Health Department

there is an irregular expenditure that was incurred of over R3 million because incorrect bidding processes were followed, and a further R1.3 million ... [Interjections.], so – but that, for some reason, because you have got an act, you have got a situation where most members of the Provincial Legislature are supposed to hold the Executive to account but what do they do? They praise the Executive and I keep on telling them that, “You cannot praise the fishes for swimming.” [Laughter.] A fish must swim, you cannot praise the fish for swimming. [Applause.] They are doing the work that they were supposed to be doing, but you can see ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But then the ANC [Inaudible.].

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... here that some members are actually singing praises for the Executive that they are supposed to be holding accountable. [Interjections.] Something is actually not right with some of the members of the Legislature. They should be holding them to account, not to incur irregular and unauthorised expenditure, but they are actually defending them; they are actually supporting them, Mr Speaker. It actually talks to the notion of this clean audit. [Interjections.] The Western Cape is known for bragging with its clean audit but in spite ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... of this clean audit we are still surrounded by poverty.

Most of the departments have clean audits after clean audits. Go to Mitchells Plain, there is poverty there, but there is clean audit. Go to Khayelitsha, there is poverty there, but there is clean audit.

You can go anywhere in the province and there is still poverty in spite of all these clean audits that they are actually bragging about, and you have MPLs here that have the nerve to defend the Executive to account when they are supposed to be accounting. [Interjections.] Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I see the Chair of SCOPA is certainly more animated this afternoon than I have seen him in a long time. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, I would like to begin by associating myself with the comment made by the hon member Baartman and taking this opportunity to congratulate the hon Minister of Health on the clean audit ...

An HON MEMBER: It is impressive.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: ... which, if I understand correctly, was not just the first clean audit of the Health Department in the Provincial Government, but was in fact the first clean audit of any Health Department ... [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in South Africa. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, I would like to associate myself with the point made ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... by the hon Chairperson of SCOPA when he said the real objective should be to prevent irregular, unauthorised and of course fruitless and wasteful expenditure. And, of course, it is precisely for that reason that the Provincial Treasury has worked so hard to institute the package of measures which I outlined earlier: conducting assessments; quarterly engagements; Government support plans; forums for chief financial officers, for supply chain management and financial management, and accounting; and of course providing continuous analysis and guidance of regulations and instructions.

I would also like to associate myself with the second main point made by the Chair of SCOPA and that is to the extent that it is recognised and required, there must be action taken against officials, and I certainly associate myself with that point; but Mr Speaker, I think we need to put this debate and the points made by the hon Chair of SCOPA in perspective, and have a look and consider the performance of this Province when it comes to irregular, unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure, compared to other provinces in South Africa. [Interjections.]

Now Mr Speaker, if you take a look at the 2017/18 audit outcomes, what do we find? The Western Cape has the lowest level ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... of irregular expenditure ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... with the second best province in this case the Eastern Cape ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... incurring ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... irregular expenditure twenty times higher.

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat, hon Minister. I recognise the Minister of Social Development.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I think it is inappropriate. We cannot hear the speaker on the floor. You need to protect the speaker and ensure that we maintain the dignity and decorum of this House, please.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: As the former Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order. I recognise the hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The hon members of the Opposition seem determined to censor the very good news that I was about to announce.

Let us take a look at the 2017/18 audit outcomes. The Western Cape had the lowest irregular expenditure of all the provinces. The second best province in this case, the Eastern Cape, incurred irregular expenditure 20 times higher than the Western Cape and Gauteng incurred irregular expenditure 150 times higher than the Western Cape. [Interjections.] KwaZulu Natal incurred irregular expenditure of nearly 200 times what we experienced in the Western Cape. But let me not stop ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... there. What about ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Gauteng's fruitless and wasteful expenditure?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It was over 1,000 times higher than the Western Cape.

†Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Sjoe! Skande! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr R D MACKENZIE: Phew! Disgrace! [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But at the end of the day, Mr Speaker, I think that what we need to do is to ensure that the package of measures that I have outlined earlier is in fact institutionalised over the next five years, and that we work hard over the next five years to ensure that the Western Cape remains the top performer when it comes to managing irregular, unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure in South Africa. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I know you probably have missed each other so much, but can we control the excitement so that it does not deter our role of holding the Executive to account? But equally that the Executive must feel free to express themselves and report on the Government programmes; is that okay?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Yes.

The SPEAKER: We are in agreement? Thank you very much.

I now recognise the member – in fact the next interpellation is an interpellation by hon member Makamba-Botya to the Minister of Education, Minister Schäfer. I now recognise the Minister.

After-school Game Changer Programme

3. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Education:

- (a) What are the benefits of the After-school Game Changer Programme and (b) how many townships schools benefit from this programme?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you, hon Makamba-Botya for the interpellation.

The Western Cape After-school's Programme is in fact managed by the Department of Culture Affairs and Sport, not Education, so I have received an answer from them, which I trust is in order.

In 2015 the Western Cape Provincial Cabinet identified After-school programmes as a key priority for impact. DCAS was mandated to set up the programme office which was formerly the Game-Changer, build the After-school movement and coordinate a transversal programme which has been

working to improve firstly the quality, secondly the coordination and thirdly the capacity building of After-school programmes and practitioners.

The other departments involved are WCED, Social Development, Department of the Premier, Community Safety, as well as the City of Cape Town and the NGO sector.

After-school programmes are evidenced to have an impact on both education and whole-child development, as they expose children to activities in academics, sport, arts and life skills.

The polls and other global studies have found that it is access to these activities, along with their home environments which give learners the advantage to be able to compete on the global stage.

After-school programmes help to close the opportunity gap and offer learners from under-resourced schools the opportunities and access that their more resourced peers do already get. These programmes are focused on learners from Grade R to 12 and take place each afternoon after the formal day finishes – the formal school day. They can take place on school premises or where children are able to access them, e.g. community halls, NGO sites, religious institutions and so on; and as also seen in a recent Harvard study where they found that criminal and risky behaviours are in fact reduced if After-school programmes are offered between the hours of

three and 6 p.m., where, if they are not offered there, these behaviours increase.

The After-school programme office only targets interventions in no and low fee schools. Of the 1,048 no and low fee schools in the province, 568 report having some form of After-school programme running on their premises, either led by themselves or in partnership with a Government department or the NGO sector.

DCAS runs programmes at 350 of these schools through the MOD Programme, the Neighbourhood School Programme, Year Beyond and Scouts, and the Department of Social Development funds 13 partial aftercare centres that are based on school premises. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you to the Minister.

Hon Minister, the After-school Game-Changer Programme is a very good initiative in that it aims to assist learners with various needs, including taking them off the streets where they would otherwise pick up bad habits such as alcohol abuse or the use of drugs. It is also aimed at making sure that learners have access to a choice of sports and recreation in schools,

amongst other things. For that to happen schools must have sport facilities.

Can the Minister assure us or assure this House that the schools in townships and in rural areas have adequate sports facilities for this programme to work in this regard, and then on your website you have also indicated that you have a target, you have actually targeted about 112 children to be enrolled in this After Game-Changer Programme.

So is that the case? Because now we are ending at, it is almost the end of the year 2019, so could you shed some light on that? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. I now recognise the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister, I note that there has been increases of learners with regards to the programme over the last four financial years, and I note that in the 2015/16 financial year 42,000 learners participated, and then year-on-year increased up until the 2018/19 financial year.

I want to know if there is an anticipated budget increase to have this programme rolled out to more schools or to strengthen the programme? And how has the discipline of learners that participate in this programme improved? And also if you can speak to the effect that it had on their school attendance; and then with regards to the programme now being between WCED, DCAS and DSD, is there in the Metro in the City of Cape

Town and some NGOs that are also part of it, a plan to have this programme just in the Department of Education and not to partner? And who takes the lead responsibility for this programme? Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Indeed this idea of an After-school Game-Changer is a very-very creative one and we welcome it. There are many-many benefits to it, especially for our learners in the vulnerable communities.

However, Mr Speaker, there are challenges with the implementation as the hon member Makamba-Botya also pointed out, for example in the Metro South Education District alone there are 55 high schools, five intermediate schools and 141 primary schools, yet the MOD programme is only run in 181 schools across the province.

This is not enough, Mr Speaker. More of these centres are needed, not only in township schools, but in farming communities where there are many challenges, including poor facilities and resource constraints.

Mr Speaker, yet another challenge is that since its inception the programme has struggled with having regular and consistent participation.

To a certain extent this is caused by safety and security issues at our schools. School safety, which the hon MEC for Education and her Department refuses to prioritise, is a serious impediment to the success of the After-school Game-Changer.

While the MEC for Sports and Cultural Affairs is making every effort to make this Game-Changer Programme successful, we find that it is being undermined by the failure on the part of Education ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M K SAYED: ... to prioritise safety.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

Mr M K SAYED: Mr Speaker, while it is claimed that one of the benefits of the programme is the creation of employment opportunities, in practice this is not the case as the number of staff employed in the MOD Programme has decreased from 543 in 2016 to only 470 currently.

Mr Speaker, I however trust that the hon MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sport will also look into the integration of the MOD programme with the various sporting federations such as SAFA, for example. I thank you.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member Sayed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Hon members order! [Interjections.] I now recognise hon member Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I just disagree with the Minister if the Minister says that it is only run by DCAS. The briefing that we received by the district directors told us there is an After-school Game-Changer and DCAS were the MOD Centres. That is the briefing we received.

An HON MEMBER: Mmm, mmm.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Now that is why I disagree, and I would want to ask the Minister, they need to bring some synergy and bring the two together, because there is definitely two different programmes, and to bring them together so that one department takes the lead, because we know that in certain areas and as the hon member said, in certain areas it is very far for a child to walk to a MOD Centre, because of the dangers of areas.

So somehow – I did not bring the documentation now, but some of the

district offices said that the budget is too small. So there is definitely a budget and they are running with the After-school – but that is separate to the MOD Centre.

So I am asking the Minister to look at combining the two that one department takes the lead and that we can roll out this programme even further. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Minister, I just want to pose this question: since the formation of the After-school Game-Changer, is there a significant impact that you can share with us towards the results at school level? And how many learners have actually opted out of this programme? And if there are any, what has the Department done in terms of assisting those learners, and what could be the common reasons for them to opt out of such a brilliant effort? And ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... has the After-school Game-Changer Programme been successful in minimising the dropouts of learners at schools? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Hon member Makamba-Botya, thank you for acknowledging that it is a good initiative.

School sports facilities are not always there, as I am sure you are well aware. They are on our never-ending list of priorities, including all kinds of infrastructure, to ensure that we do upgrade them. Many schools have had good sports facilities like sporting fields, for example, but have not maintained them, and they are no longer in a fit state; which is greatly unfortunate, but they certainly are part of our infrastructure programme.

As far as the figures that you are looking for regarding how many targeted versus how many came; how many dropped out and so on. I am afraid you are going to have to ask my colleague who is taking responsibility, and it is falling, hon member Christians. I did not say they were the only one involved, but the department that is taking the lead is the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. They sit with the office for the After-school Programme, even though there are other departments involved in the programmes – obviously Education being probably the main one.

Hon Botha, the same goes to your increases over the last four years. You will have to ask that to Minister Marais.

I have anecdotal evidence that discipline has improved with a number of the programmes, particularly the marching bands. Apparently that really has made a difference – but we have not had enough time really to do a proper study of issues like retention and so on, which I think still should be done in the future.

As far as hon member Sayed is concerned, the same story. Regarding infrastructure; yes, once again he is peddling the absolute untruth that we do not prioritise school safety, and once again refers to issues that happened outside school properties to try and make sure that the Education Department has to take responsibility for those, which we cannot do, because we have no mandate. [Interjections.]

That is why Premier Winde has prioritised ... [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: Running away again.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... safety around the entire province as a holistic issue which we are part of and completely agree with and support.

As usual running away, when National Government does not comply with their mandates on anything. [Interjections.]

As far as the number of staff employed ... [Interjections.] in MOD centres – sorry, Mr Speaker, can we all have a chance to make our inputs, if you

do not mind? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

An HON MEMBER: There is a mic.

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. As far as the number of staff in MOD Centres are concerned, that falls under DCAS, so I will leave that to my colleague, if you wish to direct an interpellation or a question to her.

Hon Christians, I have answered that about the synergy. It is DCAS that is taking responsibility. They are in charge of the entire programme, but obviously other departments have, DSD has their partial care programmes which fall under it, but they coordinate it there.

As far as safety to get to MOD centres is concerned, I agree with you completely and actually, hon member Botha, my ideal is for these programmes to take place as part of the extended school day. There is the provision in the PAM document for teachers to do after-school programmes, but given the excessively high class sizes that many of them are dealing with and poor communities, I have been reluctant to try and add additional duties onto them, but ultimately I do think that the school

day should be longer. I think it will benefit the teachers also in the long run, and also the learners.

So as far as the impact of results is concerned, as I said we will have to, we have not done a formal study on that yet. I think it is a bit early still, but I do think in the next year or two, hon Marais, maybe we need to look at that as a combined effort. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the Interpellations, hon members.

Now we are going to oral questions. The first question is by hon member Marram to the Premier. I recognise the Premier.

New questions to the Premier:

Brandvlei Dam feeder canal

1. Mr P Marran asked the Premier:

With reference to the amount of R20 million that was set aside for the raising of the wall of the Brandvlei Dam feeder canal that was announced in his State of the Province Address:

- (1) Whether any progress has been made in rolling out of the project; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what is the role of Provincial Government in the project?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, and also to the hon member Marran for the question.

As a feeder canal to the Brandvlei Dam, this is the property of the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation. They subsequently indicated that they will cover the cost of the construction from their own maintenance budget. It was determined that the appropriate funding which is now included in their estimate of revenue and expenditure. It was not previously, but it is now; and then part 2.

When I was the Minister of Agriculture we introduced Project Khulisa which was a new bold approach to growing the economy and creating jobs, with agri-processing being one of the three sectors that this project focused on.

Although this opportunity of raising the wall of the Brandvlei feeder canal has been known for a couple of decades, one entity had to take the lead in the coordination of the project; a role which the Western Cape Department of Agriculture then took on.

The Brandvlei Dam or Brandvlei, is the second biggest dam in the Western Cape Province, and is an off-channel dam; in other words it is not built in a river, but this feeder canal can only fill the dam to 73% of capacity. By increasing the wall of the canal by just 30 centimetres over a 4 kilometre stretch at a cost of roughly R20 million, 33 million cubic metres of additional water can be stored; depending on a range of variables it is expected that this land will attract investment of up to R2,2 billion, which could lead to 8,000 on-farm and 6,500 secondary jobs.

Furthermore this project could unlock the transfer of R836 million worth of land to previously disadvantaged persons, which is 56% of the land reform target of the Breede Valley and Langeberg Municipalities.

It was clear that the project will require the cooperation between various organs of State, and so the Western Cape Department of Agriculture had to get the buy-in from 17 different State organisations or departments covering all three spheres of government, for the project to commence.

These organs of State formed the Brandvlei Project Steering Committee, and have completed the following:

- (a) A greater Brandvlei regional agricultural development framework to develop the most appropriate use of the additional water as well as the potential impact.

- (b) A research project on the hydraulics and fluvial morphology of the Holsloot/Brandvlei Dam diversion upgrade.
- (c) The assessment to determine whether an environmental impact assessment would be triggered if the height of the wall of the canal was to be increased.
- (d) A consultative process between current and new farmers, as well as relevant organs of State to reach consensus on key criteria for the allocation of the additional water from the Brandvlei Dam. However it is important to note that the allocation of water rights must take place in accordance with procedures and criteria established by the Department of Water Sanitation.
- (e) A pre-feasibility study of options to increase the yield of the greater Brandvlei Government Water Scheme in preparation for a potential phase 2 project; and lastly
- (f) Guidelines to facilitate the EIA's of individual farming projects, and as a result of the work of the Brandvlei Intergovernmental Steering Committee, all objections against the project were removed and funding has been obtained to commence with the construction of this project.

And perhaps just to add that of course this is a four year process of when I was responsible for that specific project, Project Khulisa, reporting to me

in a six week cyclical process, and I must say it was one of the big frustrations. I mean you can understand, 17 different departments and organisations, and I think that is why when the President opened up the opportunity for Premiers to be part of the strategic planning process and had extended Cabinet, this was one of the issues that I raised there, and we very happily welcomed the Minister's announcement shortly thereafter that the Department would actually fund this and it actually would become a project to be started this month.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker.

†Agbare Premier, die Brandvleidam is tog al baie, baie jare gelede gebou. Waarom dan nou eers hierdie potensiaal ontsluit? Wat het intussen gebeur dat 'n projek wat duidelik soveel voordeel kan inhou vir die Wes-Kaap, vir soveel jare vertraag moes word? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon Premier, the Brandvlei Dam was after all built many, many years ago. Why then only now unlocking this potential? What has happened in the meantime that a project that could clearly hold so much advantage for the Western Cape, had to be delayed for so many years? Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

†Die PREMIER: Baie dankie vir daardie vraag. Ek dink dit was 'n paar redes - nog nie reg nie?

[The PREMIER: Thank you for that question. I think it was because of a few reasons – not ready yet?]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, will you please take your seat?

Mr L L MVIMBI: There is no interpretation.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The translation?

The PREMIER: In the interest of time ... [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: There is no translation.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Premier. The ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: In the interest of time, Mr Speaker, while they are repairing that ... [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you to the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Premier, will you please take your seat? Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I did not hear what the hon member was saying, because he was speaking in Afrikaans. I would like to hear, maybe I will also have a question after I have heard what he has actually said. It is my right to hear the language ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... that is my mother-tongue, ja. I do not think people should feel indifferent when I want an interpretation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: All of you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mvimbi. I would like the Table staff to address this quickly. Where is the glitch? Can someone respond to the translation problem? We are not going to proceed until this is resolved.

An HON MEMBER: This is an official language. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the Serjeant-at-Arms has just gone out to investigate what may have ensued. So ... we will wait.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, he is back.

The SPEAKER: Is he back now?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Has the translation been made available?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Not yet.

The SPEAKER: So you still want to hear? Now let me do the following, please bear with me, hon members, for the sake of procedure. I will recognise again hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. Is the translation ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... services on now?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member, it is back on.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie. Agbare Premier, die

Brandvleidam is tog al dekades gelede voltooi, en hier is duidelik 'n projek met soveel potensiaal wat soveel waarde kan ontsluit, wat vir baie jare al beskikbaar was, of bekend was, waarom is dit so dat daardie vir soveel jare vertraag is en nou eers ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. Hon Premier, the Brandvlei Dam was after all built decades ago, and here is clearly a project with so much potential that can unlock so much value, that has been available for so many years, or was known to, why is it so that this has been delayed for so many years and only now ...[Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Again ... [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: There is no translation. It is not happening.

The SPEAKER: Hon ... [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: They say it is 6.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, translation for Afrikaans to English is channel number 2.

So press channel number 2, and then we can talk again. It is quiet now

because no one is talking. Can I request the translators to say something?

We are fine now?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Can I explain, Mr Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Ja?

Mr L L MVIMBI: I was told that there is interpretation on channel 6. Then I listen on, it was not there. Then I listen on channel 6. When I listen on channel 6 it was interpreting, but the moment hon member Van ...

The SPEAKER: Van der Westhuizen.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon member Van der Westhuizen started speaking, it stopped. It stopped.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Now I am told it is 2. Channel 2 is interpreting Afrikaans. I am listening there, it is Afrikaans.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Let us ... [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: It is Afrikaans.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. The procedure – please take your seat, hon member Mvimbi. We do not have a crisis, hon member Mvimbi, but the issue is that, the procedure is that Afrikaans to English is channel number 2, and then isiXhosa to English is channel number 6, and then Afrikaans to isiXhosa is channel number 4.

Now from Afrikaans, which is first language, hon member Van der Westhuizen, that channel would be number 2. That is Afrikaans to English. Are we all in order now? Alright. May we please proceed. Hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie, mnr Speaker, en baie dankie vir u geduld ook, agb lede, en dat ek my taal kan praat.

Agb Premier, die Brandvleidam is dekades gelede al gebou en dit is baie duidelik dat hier nou al baie jare gelede geïdentifiseer is dat 'n relatief klein belegging van – nou in vandag se terme – R20 miljoen 'n baie groot potensiaal kan ontsluit en 'n baie groot belegging in ekonomiese groei tot gevolg kan hê. My vraag aan u is daarom waarom moes die Wes-Kaap soveel dekades wag voordat 'n projek van relatiewe klein aard en wat tog baie duidelik aan almal bekend was vir sy voordele, dat dit nou eers geïmplementeer word? Baie dankie, mnr Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you for your patience as well, hon members, and that I can speak my language.

Hon Premier, the Brandvlei Dam was already built decades ago and it is very clear that many years ago it has already been identified that a relatively small investment of – now in today’s terms – R20 million can unlock a very large potential and can have a very large investment in economic growth as a result. My question to you is therefore, why did the Western Cape have to wait for so many decades before a project of relatively small nature and that very clearly has been known to all for its advantages, that it is only being implemented now? Thank you, Mr Speaker.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, [The SPEAKER: Thank you,] †hon member Van der Westhuizen. I recognise the Premier.

†Die PREMIER: Baie dankie vir daardie vraag, of vir die opvolgvraag, en ek moet sê as die vraag nou kom, jy kan maar dink dat hierdie “net R20 miljoen” wat soveel hektaar oopmaak, ek dink in Engels was dit gesê vier jaar of vyf jaar terug, “This is a no brainer,” maar ek dink soos ek dink almal gehoor het in my antwoord, dit was nie maklik nie; dit is ’n komplekse proses.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The PREMIER: Thank you for that question, or for the follow-up question, and I have to say when the question comes now, you can only think that this “only R20 million” that unlocks so many hectares, I think in English it was said four or five years ago, “This is a no brainer,” but I think, as I think everybody has heard in my reply, it has not been easy; it is a complex process.]

†I think that there were many objectors. There are 17 different organisations and departments, and it took four years before we even could get to a budgeting process or a time when someone would take it on.

†Maar ek dink nog steeds, jy weet, na hierdie proses is ek baie bly dat ons nou gekom het waar ons nou is, en veral as jy kyk na 5,000 hektaar besproeiing vir R20 miljoen, [But I still think, you know, after this process I am glad that we have come to where we are now, and especially if you look at 5,000 hectares irrigation for R20 million,] †and you think about the Clanwilliam Dam on billions for 9,000 hectares, I mean it is a no brainer.

†So definitief, maar ek dink dit is hoekom toe ek inkom in die portefeulje van Landbou, en ons moet kyk en sien waar kan ons groei kry in landbou en in die landbousektor, het ons onmiddellik gesien hierdie is iets wat ons nou moet op fokus, [So definitively, but I think that is why when I came into the portfolio of Agriculture, and we had to look and see where we could achieve growth in agriculture and the agricultural sector, we

immediately saw that this is something that we now have to focus upon,] †and of course that is what that project was about. It is about saying how do we unlock this potential; and I really am happy that it is now unlocked. We just need it and I will make sure that it happens, because I think, and as I indicated, in the big picture of things this is a huge opportunity for not a lot of money, compared to some of the other dam potentials; but maybe also it is not only the two dams that I have just spoken about. I think there are other opportunities for other irrigation systems and agriculture, and I think in the context of climate change, it is something that we really need to have a look at with urgency, and I know that the Department at the moment is looking at some of those other options as well. They probably fall in the same category.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I am not going to play the blame game, Premier, because at your breakfast briefing and through our Leader of the Opposition we have said we are going to support you in terms of that. That is what we have said.

So we are not going to ask you a small amount for a very big investment and why it took the Western Cape Government 10 years to invest R20 million of their own money. So we are not going to ask that particular question. You understand? So if it is a small amount, why not?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Is it a provincial competency?

The PREMIER: No.

Mr P MARRAN: Premier, 8,000 jobs – in fact 14,000 jobs will be unlocked with this particular project. In February this year you approved R20 million for this particular project. It is the total cost of this particular project, and we appreciate the fact that you are willing to put your money where your mouth is. If I can put it like that, but if I look at the presentation, Premier, I only see Brandvlei Dam and the total costing, even for a second phase, whilst in your own words there are other projects that can unlock many opportunities. Everyone agrees that the biggest creator of job opportunities will be agriculture.

In Witzenberg, for instance, the PALS Project, a similar request that can unlock almost 5,000 hectares of land; a similar amount of jobs. What happened to the R20 million? You do not have to spend it anymore on the Brandvlei Dam because it was approved for infrastructure. Is there a possibility, Premier, that those particular monies can be shifted, whether to – because there is a dam called – if I am not mistaken – Buffelsjags Dam, and you know when the dam was built the infrastructure for a second phase was built already into the amount that is there for a second phase, and it will cost more or less the same amount of money.

What is the possibility of shifting that particular money to those projects

to unlock the same amount of hectares of land that also can create thousands of jobs, Premier?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that follow-up question and very skilfully put in the beginning to say, "We do not want to make politics of this." So I have got to be quite skilful in my answer, because I think the hon member does know that whether it is the Brandvlei Dam, whether it is the Buffeljags Dam, whether it is the Theewaterskloof Dam, whether it is the Clanwilliam Dam; that none of those are provincial competencies, and in actual fact when we budget for them we put a risk on our own system, because the Auditor-General is going to say, "But why are you spending this money on a competency that does not actually belong to you?"

And that is why it took us, I mean I would have liked to have perhaps put that R20 million in for building that dam wall four years ago, to say, "Why do we not just do it?" But of course you cannot just do it, because there is risk. You got to have shown that there is a process and of course all of these dams sit with the National Department, and I can say to you now as in that previous follow-up question, and also interaction with the local authority on the Buffeljags Dam.

They are busy on that work at the moment as we speak on raising that wall, but not only raising that wall, actually looking at the viability of the

second dam in that region, because I think as you know the river below the Buffeljags Dam has got some very deep ravines and our big problem is that the last few big dams that were built in the province are big in area, and the big problem at the moment with climate change is evaporation and the loss of water, and specifically we find that in the Theewaterskloof Dam, which is a big, wide dam, and we lose a big percentage to evaporation versus say the Steenbras Dam, which is deeper and obviously we do not lose that much water.

So I mean there is a couple of possibilities just in that region around Swellendam, but we are busy doing that work and we will again, exactly the same way as this, we obviously interact then with the National Department because this mandate does belong with them. And of course the question that you have asked around the budget, I do not have the exact detail with me because of course that was in the Agricultural Department budget; we will have to ask that question to the Minister of Agriculture, but I am pretty certain that when the National Department said, “Do not worry, we will budget for it,” and in the process that we have just gone through now, where we are having to cut huge amounts of money out of the budget of this Government, because the taxation is just not there, that that money would have probably gone to something else more of a core mandate or perhaps even to the safety plan, but that exact detail we will have to see when we engage with the Department of Agriculture.

But I can assure you that – and I agree with you – as we can get more

irrigation opportunities, it will definitely be to the advantage of creating proper future jobs in our region and we support that idea of yours one hundred percent.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie, agb Premier. U het nou verwys na die belangrikheid van water, die risiko van klimaatsverandering, ensomeer.

Nou – en ook dat ons baie water verloor as gevolg van verdamping, maar oor die algemeen lyk dit vir my word dit aanvaar dat die grootste verliese van water is as gevolg van die swak instandhouding van die verspreidingsnetwerke.

Hoe vergelyk die Wes-Kaap se verspreidingsnetwerke, soos deur munisipaliteite in stand gehou, met dié van die plaaslike owerhede in ander provinsies? En is daar enige aanduiding dat ons plaaslike owerhede die instandhouding van waterpype, ensomeer ernstig opneem? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Premier. You have now referred to the importance of water, the risk of climate change, and so

forth.

Now – and also that we lose a lot of water because of evaporation, but in general it seems to me that it is accepted that the biggest losses of water are because of the poor maintenance of the distribution networks.

How does the Western Cape's distribution networks, as maintained by municipalities, compare to those of local authorities in other provinces? And is there any indication that our local authorities are taking the maintenance of water pipes, and so forth, seriously? Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Die PREMIER: Baie dankie vir daardie opvolgvraag. Dit is baie moeilik om sommer nou net uit my duim uit daardie syfers te suig, maar ek weet dat veral die Stad Kaapstad het baie hard gewerk om daardie stelsel, om hulle pypstelsel deur te gaan, en ek weet, as ek dink dit is omtrent 14 tot 17% is waar hulle nou sit, daar iewers, en ek weet dit is 'n baie goeie syfer as jy daarna kyk, in vergelyking met ander munisipaliteite oor die land, maar ook internasionaal is daardie syfer taamlik goed, maar jy is ek dink 'n honderd persent korrek, dit is nie net verdamping nie, dit is die hele stelsel waarna ons moet kyk.

Ek dink miskien 'n opvolg of om weer terug te kom na *hon member Marran*.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The PREMIER: Thank you for that follow-up question. It is very difficult to just now suck those figures from my thumb, but I know that the City of Cape Town, especially, worked very hard to check their system, their pipe system, and I know, if I think it is about 14 to 17% where they are sitting now, there somewhere, and I know it is a very good figure if you look at it, compared to other municipalities across the country, but also internationally that figure is quite good, but you are a hundred percent correct, it is not only evaporation, it is the whole system we have to look at.

I think perhaps a follow-up or to get back to hon member Marran.] †I think about that system and it is not only the pipe system, it is the collection system as well, and so I remember at one stage, because of the drought we actually spent money again in the province which should have been at national on the clearing of the canal system. That was on the 24 rivers in the canal system into the Voëlvlei Dam. †Ons het daardie geld gespandeer om dit oop te maak, want hy – [We spent that money to open it up, because it -] the silt filled it up and the water was going directly past into the ocean instead of going into the dam, and so I remember taking out the Treasury and everybody going to have a look and they say, “If we do not do this urgently now we will not be able to put the water in the dam,” and I know just that intervention gave the City of Cape Town something like 40 days’ worth of extra water just because of that one intervention, let

alone agriculture.

And then of course I also think about the canals from the Clanwilliam Dam and the maintenance of those canals, and that is also under huge pressure, and of course it is a complex maintenance system where there is the infrastructure belonging to the National Department, but there is water user associations who pay a fee and that account builds up. It is generally never enough for the maintenance. Some of those canals are really old and deteriorate, and also the Department of Agriculture does budget and help those water authorities every now and again with maintenance, or in disaster times, and sometimes when those canals have burst we have had to move in very-very quickly.

We have put the money in for the pumps – because you obviously have to then stop the canal, and then you stop everything below and a number of municipalities also get their water from those canals.

So I cannot give you the exact details municipality by municipality, but it is something that we definitely work on and it is something we need to continue to work on, because it is about the whole water system: collection, storage and reticulation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Is there another follow-up? That is the last follow-up from this one? Hon member Marran.

†Mnr P MARRAN: Mnr Speaker, dankie, miskien moet ek in Afrikaans praat.

Een van die *issues* wat genoem is was water *losses* en die *infrastructure*, maar ook die diefstal van water, en los daardie nou doelbewus uit, en as ons kyk na die Clanwilliam-omgewing byvoorbeeld, waar van die boere *gefine* was; hulle bou damme en hulle het nie die nodige toestemming gehad nie. As ons gaan kyk na die aksie, vanaf die Bergrivierdam na die Misverstanddam deur die rivier en hoeveel water wat vrygelaat is, en hoeveel water by die dam uitgekom het, hope is gesteel.

So daar is nie net sekeres nie, maar daar is 'n hele klomp en van die boere is skuldig daaraan.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

Mr P MARRAN: Mr Speaker, thank you, perhaps I should speak in Afrikaans.

One of the issues that was mentioned was water losses and the infrastructure, but also water theft, and now leave that out on purpose, and if we look at the Clanwilliam region for example, where some of the farmers were fined; they built dams and they did not have the necessary approval. If we go and look at the action, from the Berg River Dam to the Misverstand Dam through the river and how much water was released, and

how much water reached the dam, a lot was stolen.

So there are not only certain ones, but there are a whole lot and some of the farmers are guilty of that.

Premier, you said that ... [Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: [Onhoorbaar.] mense doen nie hulle werk nie.

[An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] people are not doing their work.]

Mr P MARRAN: Ja. You said, Premier, that the issue of water is not your mandate, and I fully agree, but so is police not your mandate ...

An HON MEMBER: Correct.

Mr P MARRAN: ... and you found R1 billion ... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: For safety and security.

Mr P MARRAN: ... for that particular project. Safety and security.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: For law enforcement.

Mr P MARRAN: Job opportunities is also safety and security. It gives you ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You need to ask the question, hon member ...
[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Yes, I will. It gives food security, it gives security to safety and many other issues. [Interjections.] Understand?

So when you have said, hon Premier, that you were willing to spend R20 million, even if it was not your mandate, then our understanding was that when it comes to those particular projects you are willing to spend your money.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Tell Kramer that, tell Kramer that.

Mr P MARRAN: You are willing to spend your money.

So the issue is, Mr Speaker, it is difficult to understand when you are responding by saying it is not your mandate. We agree, but it is you that is willing to spend your money on projects that are not your mandate.
[Interjections.]

That is why we are asking are you willing to spend that money that was available for that particular infrastructure project on other projects, even if it is not your mandate? To make sure that there are job opportunities and other security issues? Thanks. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: So thank you very much for that follow-up ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: ... question, and the answer is an emphatic “yes”.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†’n AGB LID: Dankie.

[An HON MEMBER: Thank you.]

The PREMIER: I will spend – but you see obviously spending money on a non-core mandate is a choice and a difficult choice. [Interjections.] A very difficult choice, because for every Rand that we spend in this province on a non-core mandate, we have to take it away from Health and Education.
[Interjections.]

†’n AGB LID: Die ANC mors met alles.

[An HON MEMBER: The ANC wastes with everything.]

The PREMIER: We have to take it away from other spaces.

So quite frankly right now I would love to be able to spend money on water, which is not our mandate. I would love to be able to spend money

on energy, on electricity, which is not our mandate. Both of those are total failures and we have to step in.

Policing is horrendous; it is a massive failure and we all feel the pain of crime in this province, and we have to make a choice.

So I have got to make a choice between policing; between water; between energy; between all of these areas where there is failure in the system, and you have to make those choices.

So, and as I said in that answer, I made a choice around the R20 million because I believe in those jobs, and then I really-really-really welcome the National Minister stepping up and say, “Do not worry, we will cover that cost.”

Now I can take that money and go back and put it into children’s education – that was actually meant for that children’s education, and I can put it back into there, and those are the choices we have to make.

Right now I wish I could make a choice around energy, and of course we are in court at the moment to try and make that choice around energy, because Eskom is broken and not able to supply the energy that this country needs. That is why our debt is becoming so much more expensive, because we cannot even get that right, and so we have to borrow more and more money, and now we got into the space where we cannot borrow any

more money, but we cannot provide the energy, and so the rating agencies downgrade us.

It becomes more and more difficult, but the answer is always “Yes”, because at the end of the day you have a responsibility. When you stand up in front of this bench, everybody in this House; or when you stand up in front of the judge when the front benches here have to swear allegiance to the Constitution, number one, but also to look after the mandate and look after the people of this province ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: ... you are faced with choices every single day, and I mean today of all days, and I am pretty certain someone might say something about it, but today of all days was a tough day, because I changed my arrangements this morning to go and visit another family of a policeman that was taken out.

I mean, these are the real tough things that we have to do, and my sincere condolences to their family, but it happens and so many families had that happen to them just today, and of course that is why we have to make these choices, and these are tough choices, they are not easy choices.

I wish we could have enough money to actually make choices on every single one of those areas and budget for them, but unfortunately we cannot

and we will make those choice in the budget process. The Adjustments Budget will be coming soon, and we are also working at the moment on next year's budget. The first round completed; next year, early next year the next round completed, but maybe also in the Standing Committee, it is the right place to ask those questions as well – because I really believe that at the end of the day it is about jobs, as you say.

Jobs make the biggest difference in a family. A family without a job versus a family with a job is ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Create crimes.

The PREMIER: ... a massive difference. It reduces crime, it helps education, it reduces health burdens; it is a massive changer in any family when we can actually ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do you hear, hon [Inaudible.].

The PREMIER: ... put jobs in place.

An HON MEMBER: Do you hear?

The PREMIER: So thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Julle moet ophou mors. Ons is rommelstatus.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: You must stop wasting money. We are junk status.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Ekskuus?

[An HON MEMBER: Excuse me?]

The SPEAKER: The next ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Rommelstatus.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Junk status.]

The SPEAKER: ... question is by hon member Sayed to the Premier. I recognise the hon Premier.

Forest Village site: facilities for children

2. Mr M K Sayed asked the Premier:

With reference to his announcement in the State of the Province Address that his Government was building much more than only new houses at the Forest Village site but also creating spaces where there

will be gardens, grass and space for children to play and for families to enjoy:

What plans are there to ensure that the children do not only have space to play but can also get quality education in the area?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, and to the hon member for the question.

Provision is made for extensive landscaping and recreational facilities which include various parks and play equipment; walkways around the wetland and communal braai facilities, but over and above this a new high school, Apex High School, was recently built along Bobs Way, which is adjacent to the development, and a primary school is currently being constructed immediately behind the high school.

The Western Cape Government builds on average of six schools per year, but it must be noted that there is strain on the schools across the province due to large increases in learner numbers over the past few years.

This is due to increased retention rates and inward migration of learners who we welcome, but it does not help that the Education Department budgets are also decreasing and costs are increasing due to national cuts.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: In this current financial year we are spending over R1,7 billion towards infrastructure projects which includes new and replacement schools; upgrading and additions; and refurbishment and rehabilitation of our schools.

Maintenance of our existing schools also remains a priority with many of our poorer schools unable to keep up with maintenance and repairs; over R600 million will be allocated towards maintenance of schools.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much to the Premier for the response, and we welcome the response, but can the Premier perhaps tell us what circumstances led to the primary school learners from Forest Village getting formal education from a temporary school situated at the back of the high school, when there were plans that were supposed to be in place for schooling? And what do the schools, why are the two schools not catering for various grades? Because we see that the high school admits learners basically up to Grade 10, and the primary school only up to Grade 3. Ja. Perhaps the Premier can just give us some clarity on that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very-very much for that follow-up. I cannot give you clarity on that, I mean I can assume; I can assume that because it

is a new school it only takes in certain grades and grows as it goes, but, you know, that would be me just assuming something, and I do not think that that would be a good idea.

So I think for actual detail – I mean I have mentioned now the two schools; the primary and the high, but I think for actual detail that would need to be put to probably the Minister of Education.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjections.] I recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. To the Premier, I just want to sneak this question to you on the very same subject.

You also spoke about creating affordable mixed-use residential developments, and you emphasised the proximity of the old Conradie Hospital Housing Development that has proximity to the CBD as an important step towards undoing apartheid spatial planning.

So I just want to find out what has the Government done to make sure that the City of Cape Town develops an inclusive housing policy in the proposed new developments such as the Vogue Development in the City Centre and the Harbour Arch? Just to mention a few. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Okay, I think I am going to say the same thing that I said to the hon member Sayed, but obviously that is a brand new question; I do not have those kinds of details on me now; I could give you a thumb suck, but I think if you want to know the exact detail on that, there are two Ministers that you would need to ask that question to. Obviously if you are talking about the Conradie Hospital site, we have thousands of units coming available there; probably even that has already been announced – it could be a Standing Committee visit to go and have a look, and of course that would be Minister Madikizela, but also along with Minister Simmers, and then the policy stuff, hon member Simmers, I think that probably would be a good idea to ask the Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Mr Speaker, thank you very much, and I want to acknowledge the fact that the Premier, when he does not have the response ready he admits to that; he says, “Look, we must refer the matter to the MEC.” We want to thank the Premier for that; that is leadership, Mr Speaker, but what I do want to ask though is that, and perhaps the Premier can actually ask the MEC to give him that particular information, given that it is a plan that the Premier spoke about in the State of the Province address.

He spoke about integrated human settlements, which we welcome. Perhaps he can ask the MEC what are the plans in place for the improvement of the

capacity of those two schools that were mentioned, to cater for all grades? And when will it be implemented, what is the timeframe? Perhaps in the next Cabinet meeting he can ask and then revert to the House on that particular matter.

Also why are there no public schools in the area? I think that would be important to ask, because we are confident that if the Premier understands the problem, the Premier will be able to ensure that there are solutions, that the problem is rectified, because I want the Premier to agree or disagree that given the very-very positive plan but to a certain extent there was poor forecasting on the part of Human Settlements, Public Works and Education in the province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier please take your seat. I would like to request, hon members, that we use the opportunity for questions to ask questions but also to ensure that questions are not far from the original question. It also helps us to ensure that we do quality oversight over the Executive and equally when the question is being posed that we ask the question and do not treat it as an interpellation. I would just like the hon members to take note of that and thank you hon members. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I noticed in the wording of the follow-up question from the hon Sayed, he said why are there no public schools? Well, in my original answer I spoke about two public schools that are being built because of this new development but the questions that are

being asked are the right kind of questions. I know that myself, visiting the site, and of course it is not all completed yet, but visiting the site, you ask yourself the questions, not only about education, what about economic activity and what are the policies around how do you open a business, can you open a business in one of these homes that you have just been given?

Of course, some people have already opened businesses. I visited one lady who runs a catering business out of her home in Forest Village and of course these are issues that also get raised from the community themselves as they move in and take occupation and you start to identify the needs. The real question is about integrated planning and making sure that that integrated planning is giving you a holistic view of the change that is going to come about because of this Government investment and what happens around it and what other Government investments need to take place. I think it is something that we work very, very hard at, at making sure that we find those integrated investments – and I do not know if we always get it right – but we do work hard at it because I think in the past we have seen that you build a school but maybe it is far away from something else that was needed, or you build a sewerage plant but that has only got five years to go until you are going to have different developments.

We have got to make sure that we integrate our investment in a way that makes much more sense to make the biggest impact and difference to communities and where you invest in. So I think that is sort of the gist of

the question and of course I do not need to ask the Minister, the Minister heard the question, but of course there needs to be a process if you want a formal answer to that question – we need to either just write it down, send me an email and we will pass it on.

But maybe the last point is, I think in both of these questions, the first question that I got today from the hon Pat Marran and of course, now this one as well. Both of these questions, I could have said hang on a second this is Human Settlements or this is Education and sent them on, but I do not think that is the way to do it because obviously you also want to ask me my position on these issues. That is why I did not pass it on, I said well let me actually answer this question. But of course I have to go and get the detail and so that does create some complexities with getting to the nuts and bolts of the answer because I am sure that if you asked that question to the Ministers, they would rattle off the answers just like that, because these are excellent Ministers down here. [Laughter.] So you must not be scared of asking them a question either. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon Premier. That concludes the questions for the Premier. I now recognise hon Minister of Community Safety, hon Fritz.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 3 October 2019, as agreed to by the House:

Court Watching Brief Programme: successes

5. Mr M Kama asked the Minister of Community Safety:

How many cases involving violence against women and children were successfully resolved since 2004 because of the work of the officials of the Court Watching Brief Programme?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. In asking some of these questions, I would like the researchers used by members to do a bit of research so that they do not ask me stuff that I cannot answer. For instance, and I am saying to the hon Kama, that in 2004 we were not in existence, we were not in government, the ANC was in government and there was nothing called a Court Watching Brief in 2004. Now I am not sure whether it is a typing error on the hon member's side, it may be a typing error because we started in 2014 but we must also just proofread these type of questions to see whether there are typing errors because it changes the answer. So, hon Kama, I think you meant 2014.

Mr P MARRAN: Where were you Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Probably with the ANC. [Interjections.] Not too long before I was here with the ANC. You are right, you are right.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is not too late to come back.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, no I am in a very happy space.

The programme of the Court Watching Brief was initiated by the Department of Community Safety in 2014 and I think that is what you meant. It began operating with only two staff members and started operating as a full component in 2016 with five staff members, which it still retains today. The unit's purpose is to identify cases that were struck off the court roll, I think it is important to underline, due to alleged poor performance by the South African Police Services. During the last financial year, the unit reported a total of 1,198 serious cases to the Western Cape Provincial Commissioner of SAPS who is responsible for taking the necessary remedial action.

Of these cases, 635 fall within the category of serious violent crimes. We are however unable to distinguish which of these cases involved women and children because such information is not collected and it is not reflected on the charge sheet but also there is no category at this point for domestic violence cases. So that is the reason why we cannot make that distinction. And by the way this information we get from - no that is our case, that is our Department. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I am pleased that the Minister picked up that it was a typo but disappointed that he saw an opportunity to make fun, especially about such a question. Hon Speaker, I am asking this question because we have committed as a House to fight gender-based violence and use all avenues that we have. Now I want to check, is the Minister willing or in the response thereof, that we have committed ourselves, willing within the unit, to make sure that we have a strategy of prioritising cases that are struck off the court roll, and are there in this particular category – because as we have said, many people do not report because they think nothing will happen. They see perpetrators walking in the streets day in day out. Now what strategies are we looking at, putting in place to make sure that we address this challenge? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Kama. I was really not making fun. No, I am quite serious. You need to also ask the correct Minister the question. It requires a bit of research because you ask the wrong Minister questions like we had in the case earlier where she could not answer the question because she is not in charge of that particular programme. But I also just want to say, that is a very good question because the Department of Community Safety already hosts what

is called a Domestic Violence Act Compliance Forum and on that forum we also have the South African Police Services, we have VISPOL.

We also have discipline management interventions and we have the Crime Registrar represented on that forum and we are specifically targeting those cases that affect women and children and so I think we will soon be able to report properly on those cases, but that is not necessarily linked to the Court Watching Brief.

That is the broad issue and what I am doing – yesterday we saw the arrest of a perpetrator, a person the police think was involved in the Hess case. We have now taken out a Court Watching Brief on that, we have already taken a Court Watching Brief out on a young woman, the young lady that was murdered in Claremont. So we are now starting to do Court Watching Briefs on gender-based violence because I think it is so serious. And I think it is also very, very important to note – remember the Court Watching Brief – in one of the answers you will see what exactly we do in a Court Watching Brief so I will speak to that in a later question. But the point is we actually look at the docket, why is the DNA not here? Because many times the magistrate kicks out the case because of outstanding DNA evidence or results not coming back and I think the Court Watching Brief absolutely brings that to the attention. Magistrates and prosecutors are aware in a Court Watching Brief, because we try and make it very known, they are aware that there are some senior advocates sitting in court watching the case going on and so they do not play around, they take it far

more seriously. But thank you for that question, for the seriousness around gender-based violence.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I wanted to mention specifically the Jesse Hess case because I believe that the perpetrator was out on parole and then he killed her grandfather and then Jesse Hess and now he committed another crime. Hon Minister, this question was asked but for us, just to brief us, if we know of such cases, what do we do, how do we submit something to you or your office or whoever, to say listen we want this case to be placed on the Court Watching Brief? Thank you, hon Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I think that is a very, very important question. Now yesterday when the Minister of Social Development learnt about the arrest, she immediately – and what all her colleagues know, and I want to also suggest to the House, any member – she immediately obtained the CAS number of that case, and all we need is that, so forward them to us. I then forward it to advocate Gerber, who is a SC and immediately he makes work of it and every Minister and any member will tell you how seriously advocate Gerber takes that work.

But I think you make another important point and it is perhaps unrelated to the direct question of hon Kama, and that is the issue of parolees. We are going to do proper research on this issue. We are of the opinion that if we deal with this re-offending or any re-offender, specifically those ones who are given early parole, we will be able to more than halve the crime problem in the province. So we are going to do some research on it and then look at proper interaction with the Department of Correctional Services because we are seeing that communities need to be consulted on the issue of parolees. Remember the law makes provision for that. The Correctional Services Act says that the community and the victim must be consulted. Now many times the victim does not know, I think it is an easy process to get – and I know prisons are overcrowded. I also know communities have issues and I think when people are rehabilitated genuinely, I think one must give people a second chance – but when you are coming out to murder again – a very, very interesting stat that we always refer to also, is the Worcester area and the violence in the Avian Park. Now remember there two maximum prisons in Worcester, Brandvlei and Worcester itself and what happens when people leave on parole, they leave there with R160. They stay in the area of Worcester and they all go and look for their buddies from prison and that is why the violence, you can just see how it flares up.

So I think it is an important point that we need to monitor and make sure that that is dealt with and I am saying we want to work with Correctional Services, with all our national departments around those issues. Thank

you, hon Christians. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Herron?

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. I wonder if the Minister will recall his commitment to assessing how police stations are dealing with complaints of domestic violence and violence against women and children and whether his Department has made any progress in implementing that assessment?

Yesterday when I was in Mitchells Plain I spoke to a woman whose daughter had been raped several times by a member of her family. But the daughter is mute and so the police would not deal with her case because they said how can she explain what happened, even though as a mother, she was saying I am able to interpret what my daughter is saying. So here is an experience in Mitchells Plain, in our province, in a police station. So I think, hon Minister, it is really urgent that we get this assessment done of how women and complainants are being treated when they go to the police stations. Are we making progress with that? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, hon Herron. I just spoke about the Domestic Violence Act Compliance Forum

and that is precisely why it was established. I think what is important in what you are saying, I think we need, specifically in terms of people living with disabilities – and we had a case yesterday also, around a death situation, also at a police station – we need to really get to the sensitisation of police officers in general. I think that is a very specific case and we need to look at that and perhaps if you can send me some of those case details we can investigate.

But I think the systemic point we are making, is to look at whether police stations are properly dealing with domestic violence but also with gender-based violence in general, the broader kind of thing. But I want to give the House the assurance that we are going to move beyond just checking and ticking a box at the police stations but to actually look at substantive issues around some of those gender-based and domestic violence issues. So I thank you for that question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. We are now moving to Question 9 by hon Philander to the hon Minister of Health. I recognise the Minister.

National Insurance Health Bill

9. Ms F W Philander asked the Minister of Health:

(a) How will the proposed National Health Insurance Bill (NHI Bill) influence the current quality of healthcare in the province and (b) what will the financial implications of this Bill be for the provincial health budget?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. No, the National Health Insurance is a funding mechanism towards universal health coverage. So it is only about how to establish the National Health Insurance fund and also what are the duties and functions and its powers. So that is all it is, in terms of the Bill. So there is nothing that talks about the quality of care, there is nothing that talks about access and coverage. It is only about insurance. That is it. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. Any follow-ups? Thank you, none. Alright thank you hon Minister. The next question is by hon Christians to Minister Schäfer. I recognise the Minister.

New questions

Schools: learner-to-toilet ratio

3. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:

(1) How many schools in the province meet the minimum learner-to-toilet ratio;

- (2) whether she and her Department have measures in place to address the sanitation crisis at schools in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. The answer to part 1 is 1015 according to the latest conditional assessment by Public Works. The second part, the WCED has briefed the Department of Public Works to provide additional ablution facilities this financial year to 30, of a total of 174 schools found to have a shortage of ablution facilities.

The WCED has prioritised the list of schools needing additional facilities, according to greatest need and the ability of the governing body to resolve the issue using their own school funds. The Department has allocated R30 million for this work in the 2019/20 financial year. We have briefed the WCED management contractor to provide mobile ablutions to a further 15 schools. Meanwhile scheduled maintenance of ablution facilities is continuing at schools scheduled for maintenance during the current financial year.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister for that answer. I am just referring to what happened just a couple of months ago – where learners were sent home because of no sanitation and electricity at this one school.

It was a school close to Mfuleni, Fairdale Primary School, where pupils were sent home because of a lack of those facilities. If the Minister can just answer, so we will not have a reoccurrence of what happened at this school, and secondly, are there schools where boys and girls use the same toilet? If there are any in the province? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The issue with Fairdale School in Mfuleni, that was a rather complicated situation because there was a mobile school that was put up at the beginning of the year. Parents then refused to let the children go there, the community on the other side did not want people to move in there so there should still have been mobile facilities at the school. I understand there has been a delay by the City of Cape Town in providing services there, but now there are facilities there. So we also do rely very heavily on the school to ensure that they let us know immediately if there are no facilities at all because that is obviously unacceptable. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I just want to question something.

The SPEAKER: There is the next question by hon member Makamba-Botya. You will follow after that question.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The question was not answered, the second part of the question was not answered.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Sorry, hon member. Hon Minister?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I will just repeat it so that the Minister can just answer it. The second part was: are there toilets where girls and boys use the same toilet in the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I honestly cannot answer that. I really cannot answer that off-hand. I can ask my Department if they are aware of that. I am not sure if we keep separate records of those kinds of issues. There certainly should not be.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, the hon Minister as much as she is trying, the question is totally different from the original question, but you are allowed to put that question to the Minister so that she goes and finds out and comes back to this Parliament. So at least we have that opportunity here so that she can come back to us. May I then request that we move from that question, we go to hon Makamba-Boyta.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOYTA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Hon Minister, I just want to find out, do we still have any schools that still use pit toilets in the Western Cape, in rural areas and if there are any, what is the Department doing about that? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. The answer is no we do not.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that is it for now. Let us go to the next one. I am sure that you can pick up that the time is running out. The next one is hon Mvimbi to the Minister of Transport and Public Works. Hon Minister?

Taxi operation permits: George

4. Mr L L Mvimbi asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether there is a moratorium or suspension in the allocation of permits for taxi operation in George and the surrounding areas for short and long distances; if so, (a) why, (b) when was it implemented and (c) what are the time frames for this moratorium or suspension?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. In December 2009, the George Council took a decision not to support any new operating licence applications in George Municipality area. It should be noted that this decision was never formally communicated to the Western Cape Provincial Regulatory Entity or PRE. This meant that the lodging of applications could not be stopped by the PRE, however, the PRE still required, in terms of the law, to refer applications for public transport operating licences to municipalities for

directions based on the integrated transport plan for any area or any municipality.

In disposing of applications for operating licences, the PRE is bound by the direction of the Municipality. The direction provided by the Municipality has been in line with the decision taken by the George Council. It was not clear initially whether the Council decision was applicable to all public transport services or only minibus taxi type services. At a special Council meeting on the 17 August last year, at which members of the PRE were present, the issue around the moratorium was clarified. It was resolved that the so-called late renewal taxi operating permits lodged as new applications, not to be regarded as new applications for the purpose of the moratorium dated 2 December 2009.

It was further resolved that a distinction be made between minibus type taxi services and other forms of public transport services. Therefore the moratorium adopted by the George Municipality is therefore only applicable to minibus taxi type services and not to other categories or types of transport services like scholar transport, charter bus, metered taxis etc.

This was confirmed in meetings with the Municipality. So it is therefore our understanding that a decision has subsequently been taken to conditionally lift the moratorium provided that a list of qualifying operators is submitted to the Section 79 Committee of the Municipality for

ratification. This must be confirmed by the Municipality.

So in terms of Section 39 of the National Land Transport Act No. 5 of 2009, a municipality that is in the process of rationalising public transport services in its area may impose a moratorium on new operating licences if it is found, based on its ITP that there is a surplus of legally operated services by operators on that particular route.

The initial decision not to support new operating licence applications in the George area was taken in December 2009. The position was clarified at a special Council meeting on 17 August last year. It is our understanding that the moratorium has been lifted by the Municipality subject to certain expressed conditions which includes the ratification of qualifying operators by the Municipality's Section 79 Committee. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think the Minister should really tell us what is going on in George. The moratorium may be lifted but as the Minister correctly says, the National Land Transport Act makes the local government or the municipality the planning authority. And if the planning authority refuses to support an application for an operating licence, then the PRE or the Provincial Regulating Entity should refuse the application.

Now we have a case in George, where a director of GoGeorge and a shareholder in the operating company, GoGeorge link, is an applicant for a minibus taxi operating licence. The Municipality writes to the Province to say, "We are refusing this application". Yet, Mr Heathcote, who is the Director, is granted a licence. So can the Minister explain to us how an individual, who is already under contract not to compete with the GoGeorge BRT system, managed to get an operating licence when the Municipality did not support it in the first place?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much for that question. I am not aware of such information. But it might be possible. Maybe member Herron can give me more information. It might be possible though that the member he is talking about, did apply for an operating licence from George and then it was rejected, but what might have happened and subsequent to that is that he might have just come directly to the PRE and applied for a charter licence, which is a common occurrence because you do not need to go via the Municipality to apply for a charter licence. But, if it is indeed a normal operating licence, then I would like to get that information, because I am not aware of that. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I am actually very surprised that the hon Minister is not aware of this, especially the matter that was raised by hon Brett Herron, in particular with that Director. Because apart from him having a permit, the question also is, how can he, being the Director of GoGeorge still have a permit and compete with other taxi operators?

This takes me to my next question, hon Speaker, which is why this moratorium is only on minibus taxis and those minibus taxis are those that are operating in George only? I would really like to know what is the real reasoning behind that moratorium being only in George because you know how complicated the issue of GoGeorge is. There is suspicion among taxi operators that the Provincial Government and the Municipality want to force the taxi operators into accepting GoGeorge because there are some taxi operators that want to compete. They said they have no problem in competing with GoGeorge but the Municipality and the Province are using their authority to suffocate those minibus taxis. Maybe it will be good if the hon Minister can just elaborate more as to why it applies only to minibus taxis that are operating in George and not in others?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I think it must be understood, hon Speaker, that in terms of the history of the George Integrated Transport Network System, or your GoGeorge as you might call it, is that after a number of negotiations with the taxi owners - because I will come to the point member Mvimbi is making now, because some of

these are new entrants - way after the discussions and the decision were taken for the taxi operators to buy into the system, those taxi operators who bought into the system.

In fact there are two types of taxi operators that were part of the negotiations. There are those who bought into the system, who are now part of George Link, which is the company that is operating the GoGeorge buses. Those people are shareholders in GoGeorge and therefore they cannot again be issued with operating licences to compete with their company. That is the first thing. But there is a second group that was bought out, for example, that opted out, that did not want to be part of that particular company, but because the route – in terms of the agreement – is dedicated to GoGeorge, it is precisely for that reason there was a moratorium to make sure that the agreement that was reached between the taxi operators, in terms of those who are now part of George Link, because once that agreement was reached, it was a common understanding from all parties that no taxis would operate on the route where GoGeorge is operating.

But what happened, subsequent to that, is that there are new entrants, people who have entered the fray, who are now demanding operating licences. But I must also add some of the people who are shareholders in GoGeorge are also working with the people who came late, who are now demanding the operating licences, which poses a serious problem. If there was an agreement for the route to be dedicated to GoGeorge and people

who were part of the negotiations which resulted in an agreement, you can understand then why there was this moratorium, particularly on that route.

But we have now an outstanding meeting with the National Minister and it is unfortunate it took us so long because of the unavailability from the National Minister's side. We had a number of discussions with those groups, member Mvimbi. We have an outstanding meeting in terms of making sure there is a follow-up to try and deal with those issues. Because when we engage the group, particularly from Uncedo, because the people who really are opposing the rollout of GoGeorge are those people who were never part of the initial agreement, who belong to a different organisation and some of the people who are shareholders saw an opportunity to jump onto this bandwagon so that they can double-dip. They are shareholders from George Link but they also want to operate on the same route. Now of course, you can understand why there is that challenge and the Municipality cannot issue operating licences in a situation like that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Yes, I see you hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I am glad that you raised the issue that part of the reason that they are not given licences is that they are not supposed to be competing with themselves. I just cannot understand how a director can be issued with a licence, and I

am surprised that you do not know that director, because that is the main bone of contention, that while everybody cannot get permits, one of the directors of GoGeorge himself was able to get a permit in spite of the moratorium that is there. A moratorium is in place, other taxi operators are not allowed to have permits, but the Director of GoGeorge is given a permit? And he is actually contesting against himself. You seem not to find anything wrong with that. The taxi operators find it wrong. They cannot compete themselves but the Director can. Maybe it will be good if you could put some clarity on that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I did not say that I do not find anything wrong with that. I think, as I said, I need to go back and get clarity because there are two possibilities as I said. The moratorium was lifted in August last year. I am not sure when the Director got this licence. But the second possibility, and it is the biggest challenge that we need to deal with, is the issue of charter licences. I am not sure what kind of permit the Director got. Because unlike the normal operating licence where you need to apply for that via the Municipality, when you want to apply for a charter licence whether it is for scholar transport, you go directly to the PRE and get it without going through the Municipality.

There is a difference and that is why if you look at the taxis that were impounded in Dunoon, a hundred per cent of those taxis did not have

operating licences but all of them had charter licences. There is abuse in the system where people are by-passing the local authorities when they do not get operating licences and go straight to the PRE to apply for charter licences. So that is what we need to get to the bottom of, but I will get clarity on the type of licence because if indeed the Director received a normal operating licence then it is a cause for concern, which is something that I need to get to the bottom of. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of Questions. Please note that any questions that have not been answered will now fall off the Order Paper and you will have to resubmit them as this is the last sitting. We are now moving over to Questions to the Premier without Notice. I recognise the hon Christians.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, you know the abuse of alcohol is a big problem in this province. Binge drinking among youth is the highest in the country. Alcohol abuse puts tremendous pressure on the healthcare system and also we have about 300 alcohol-related deaths per month in South Africa. I want to know Premier, how successful is the implementation of the Alcohol Harms Reduction Strategy pertaining to this. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question and I think you are absolutely correct. When we look at not only the murder rate and the harms that come to citizens through crime, when you link it to our hospital visits and hospital emergencies and you see how alcohol plays a prominent role, if you look at any of the policing reports, it is a major problem. I think this House is quite aware of the work that was done, many years ago, in putting the new alcohol legislation in place, number one. Then also in the last few years where we have had a focus on the Alcohol Harms Reduction and the game-changer that was in place and I think we have got a couple of wins, but we have not found the secret recipe.

You will see now that it is also part of a discussion we are having where Minister Fritz, as each Minister has a priority, a safety priority, but included in Minister Fritz's priority, not only the rollout of the Boots on the Ground, on the investigators, part of his priority is also about how we try to get to grips with, what are those interventions we can put in place to curb this problem. And it is a problem and I wish it was one of those simple solutions that we could find.

We engage with our universities and we have been in this process. We had areas that we focused on and we find reductions here and there and we found some successes, some of them linked to licencing, some of them linked to pricing, some of them linked to – you know on the ground, increasing the investigations, looking at the investigators. I said earlier condolences to the policeman that was shot today, Colonel Kay. I have

fond memories of Colonel Kay, of walking the streets at night, going on these blitzes, the work that we did in creating the legislative environment.

These are difficult things and I do not know what those exact answers are. I know we have found some successes but we have nowhere started to really get to a real dent in this, so it carries on as one of his priorities, Minister Fritz, on looking at the different issues; we are looking at issues of pricing, licence pricing, you have got to look at issues of hours and availability and it is also complex because it is about a balance. If we think and we look back at history you have got to go and look where things have worked in the past or failed in the past and some countries have even had prohibitions, and what that does is that actually opens up illicit economies. We see that in the drug space all the time, how the illicit economy then get fuelled and we see the same thing in alcohol and liquor. It is about finding that balance between the number of licences, the hours that they trade in and the ability to police those licences and that is also a big issue. So you have got to have individuals who are prepared to go out there in the middle of the night.

The focus that we are putting in place now is much more citizen responsibility. How do we get the other side of the equation working because it cannot only be policing? It has got to be at a stage where the space owner and the citizens who are participating in alcohol in a space actually have 15 minutes to go before closing time, finish up, pack up and leave, that people do not over-indulge. But I mean these are very, very

complex questions and obviously I would also like to say, any ideas and any help because we really need to tackle this. It is a major problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you for that, hon Premier. If the Premier can just enlighten us on the intergovernmental relations regarding municipalities because municipalities are now granting licences, extending the trading hours between six and eight in the evening, Saturdays and Sundays. So as a province we try to sort out the problem, but municipalities are giving licences. Just the one case, I mentioned it in our Portfolio Committee, they are asking to open a big bottle store on Sundays, next to a church. So it seems to me there is no synergy between the municipalities and the Province. So what are you going to do Premier, about those type of things in the Western Cape because that impacts on where you are gaining, the municipalities allowing liquor stores close to schools and churches?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: Again, thank you for that and obviously this is a very, very complex environment. Your first point about trading on Sundays - obviously there is also part of the regulatory environment that allows municipalities to make decisions as well because their responsibility is not licences, the municipality are not giving the liquor licence but their

responsibility is around zoning and making sure that zoning is in place.

Their other responsibility is hours of trade and deciding on hours of trade. Now, I remember when we were creating this piece of legislation, in those days I actually sat on that side of the House and I think it took us something like seven or eight years in the drafting of the legislation and then of course, I ended up on this side of the House and in this side of the House it was implementing that piece of legislation. And I remember it is about a balance, because sometimes things that you think would have worked did not work and things that you said no this will never work, and I remember the trading on Sundays.

An example is Sedgefield. I remember in Sedgefield when licences were granted and trading happened on Sundays, suddenly you found the illegal operators could not trade or make a profit on a Sunday, so they closed and suddenly you had licenced operators operating according to the rules and the illegals closed down because they could not compete.

So to me that was really good news but then of course I saw again in Laingsburg where the trading hours were closed down they actually restricted the trading hours there, the trading hours were restricted to six o'clock. I think they did trade up till eight o'clock, they were restricted to six o'clock, they were closed on public holidays, they were closed on Sundays. All that happened was I remember the licenced operators sending me an email to say it is all very well restricting the hours of trade. I used

to employ five people and I now employ three people because I have restricted my business hours and my trading times, but there is no policing so over the road, the illegal guy has now opened up, he has now increased his employment, he is employing people that used to work for me, but now they are illegal and they operate all hours of the day and night and on weekends and on Sundays, but there is no policing so how does that help the economy and these guys are illegal and I am trying to follow the rules. And so it is about finding these balances and that is not easy.

I think also with regard to trying to find a decision around uniformity and zoning; when we started the public hearings and the process of regulatory reform and bringing in the licences of the liquor authority, I also remember us as a province trying to say well we will take control of and make sure that we manage the hours and make sure that we will deal with the zoning. We had threats from local government who then said if you continue with it and do not remove it, we will actually go to the Constitutional Court because you are unconstitutional in this process. And I remember in that process, we actually had to change that legislation and so it is about finding that balance and making sure that people understand that licencing is a control measure and it does not help if you actually have rules over here for licencing and then you discard anybody else who is abusing the rules.

We have got to make sure it gets policed, whether it is provincial or even at a local government level and then perhaps it also about planning, and

this is also a difficult conundrum because if you go and have a look at a GSI map of licenced outlets across the province, you will see that in actual fact, in densely populated poorer areas, the number of licences are greatly reduced to other areas that are perhaps advantaged areas, more business zoned like Long Street or the Waterfront versus economic zones in poorer areas.

And there is actually a disproportion and so how do you create and what is the right balance because people say that you must control how many licences should be allowed – well I do not know, I believe in the free market – and competition should be able to determine whether you open another one or not, but these are complex, this is difficult stuff, it is not easy because you are controlling a substance. You are controlling a substance as in the first part of your initial question which affects our crimes rates, affects our hospitals and all I can say is it is very complex.

The Minister will be bringing back to this House a new round of legislative process so that we have can these conversations. I can tell you what I think and I know you asked in the last part of answering this question, you said there is an application for a licence next to a church and of course, there again, these are very difficult.

I will give you two examples. We initially said let us have a five hundred metre exclusionary zone around a church or a school, but there are many, many places in this province where you would then have to actually close

down all the licenced restaurants in Long Street because of the number of mosques and churches just in Long Street, and if you put the 500 metres between all of them, then none of these restaurants would be able to have a licence.

I know in some of our small towns where their main streets are so short that it also would become a difficult conundrum in how to deal with that. I also remember that we made a decision and I remember being in that committee, I thought it was a great decision. We said no selling of alcohol anywhere near a filling station and we gave an exclusionary, because we said, you know drinking and driving really does not go well together. I remember somebody giving us the example in other countries where you can go to a vending machine at a filling station and actually get a beer from a vending machine. We said no this cannot be possible. And as soon as we did that, what we did it then means that an erf could not have, if it was within 500 metres of a filling station, a liquor licence. We had a huge conundrum because every single liquor licence at every single Waterfront establishment was now null and void because there is a filling station on the erf of the Waterfront. And so this shows you the unintended consequences, the difficulties that come with it.

But, again, I say to you, these are difficult things, but we are going to have an opportunity once again where our specialists and the drafters on this side of the House, are going to put their minds to it, and then they are going to make it available to all of you on this side of the House to go out

to public comment to go and say what else should we be doing differently? So we can actually manage, through a liquor licencing regime, the pros and cons, an economy that employs 200 000 people in the liquor industry versus the harms that actually come within the system and these are very, very complex. I do not have all of the answers. I am sure Minister Fritz does not have all of the answers and I think in sketching this answer, even when I was on that side of the House or this side of the House, it is difficult, it is not easy, but we are going to be given that opportunity once again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see hon Herron.

Mr B HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, my apologies. I made a mistake, hon Herron. My apologies. It is hon member Christian's question. I got the two mixed up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Premier. I mean you are honest to say it is a difficult question. I was just reminded of being in Vredendal again and that when I was walking there, people were saying †*Sondag is nasionale drinkdag*, [Sunday is national drink day,] you know and you just see the chaos happening and those type of things. That is why Premier, I do not know but maybe there can be some talks with municipalities and say listen, until we sort this thing out – I am just thinking about those now

that are impacting churches because the pastor came to me, he said to me on Sundays I try to keep the people off alcohol and now they can go get alcohol right next to the church. So it is difficult because I got them off and now they will go back. So this is a problem. I am also worried about the extending of trading hours where municipalities give it, irrespective of where it is situated. So when they apply, you can do all the objections and when it comes to the end, you still lose the objection. So I just want to know from you Premier, will you speak at your forum with mayors or whoever it is, just to say listen we need to sort this out before we grant liquor licences, especially close to schools or churches or even mosques as the case may be? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: The engagements that we are having with our municipalities have been specifically around the Safety Plan. What you are talking about links directly into safety in communities. But I want to actually go further. I have got in this question, saying you know it is affecting churches etc. and Government must put rules in place that will sort this out. Now the problem is that Government are going to put rules in place to sort this out but that is actually not going to be the solution, and I am going to link it back to the safety plan and that is why we have made the safety plan not actually about policing, it is about behavioural change.

It is about how do we get citizens to actually step up to the plate and we

need to actually work together in this. This is about how we get the whole of society saying we have all got a role to play and when you see your brother or your sister stepping off the path, when you see them, we need to actually start saying, "Come". Churches and mosques and community organisations have got a major part to play in partnership, as how we build this sustainable society going forward, where we see these things happening. We have got to be able to help each other and to build a whole of society approach to ask how do we reduce the harms that are happening in whichever guise they are.

But obviously in line with this question, it is around alcohol but of course, the same thing applies to drugs, the same things applies to so many other things in society, so absolutely we already have this discussion at a local government level at our PCF and our mayors' forums and I will continue with it. I think also what is going to happen now with the implementation of a new piece of legislation or review of the legislation, it is also going to be the opportunity to come up with whether we allow competitiveness in the system around times or not? At the moment the way it is structured is municipalities should be saying that you have got until two o'clock in the morning as per the framework. If you want to go outside of the framework then it is a separate licence application.

I do not know if they are all following the application process correctly because you are right. The idea of maybe going till four o'clock in the morning should be in an area that does not affect people. So for example,

perhaps Long Street or an area where nightclubs are focused, but of course if it is in a residential area, well then it should not even be two o'clock. But the process does allow for municipalities to even bring that in to ten o'clock, or nine o'clock. I mean there are places who actually are managed that way. But I think you are correct as well that it is not managed properly and maybe that is also something that the Standing Committee can also look into – even before we get the legislation process that we actually go on some of these night time blitzes, walk with some of the inspectors so that you get to grips with what it is, so we can actually start writing it in that legislation and of course, as you say, engage with municipalities where that competency lies.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We are moving on to the next question, we have not got much time but I will give you the first bite, hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier it is with regard to the First Thursday Initiative, how many people have been reached so far and what are the kind of enquiries that have been made and the nature of those enquiries?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question. Well, if I have to think about the numbers, I remember the first 'First Thursday', it was about 800 various enquiries. Of course that is more than the number of meetings that take place. I looked at the last report and I am just trying to

think – it is over 200 meetings that took place amongst the Executive and the public, sometimes it is 300. I think the last one was 291 if I remember correctly, looking at the report. But so you can say probably between 200 and 300 and there is probably, I do not know, may be up to a 1000 people involved on a First Thursday, taking their numbers and of course, we learn as we go because when I used to run the First Thursday before just out of my office, it was a much easier space in which to operate, we had much stronger control.

Now it is in an open public thoroughfare and we ask entrepreneurs to come along depending on the theme and some people just come to network and not necessarily meet anybody. But I think if I am correct it is between 200 and 300 meetings that take place. I notice some of my Ministers have shorter lists of meetings than others. [Laughter.] I mean that is what this is about, this is about openness, this is about saying to someone if you cannot get an appointment, come and see us.

You asked about the kinds of questions. I mean some of them are people coming with ideas and other times are people coming with problems. I mean I know that I have even dealt with HR issues where perhaps someone did not want to go and see a Minister, to say I have already exhausted that and now I am coming to see you and this is my problem which in a way is also good because you get a sort of different kind of oversight through the process and anything from business ideas, to HR, to safety and security, which has a lot of people coming now because of the safety plan, a lot of

people coming with technologies and innovative ideas.

It really is across the board. Every single Minister has their desk there with officials and interestingly the City of Town came along to First Thursdays and last time they actually got a bigger desk and we have more people coming from the City. Hayley, in my office, has already gone out and spoken to one municipality. So it was Overstrand on the last First Thursday. They ran an open Thursday in Overstrand and of course I cannot dictate to the municipalities but it would be very nice if every single municipality was open on a First Thursday until nine o'clock at night, open for any issue, anybody could come in with anything.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Botha, are you fine because time is up? Okay. Thank you very much. I am terribly sorry Hon Premier we are ending with those, that is the final time allocated to the Premier, we will now move over to Statements by Members. In terms of Rule 145, I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms D BAARTMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans. Recently we learned that a major manufacturing plant in Saldanha Bay, ArcelorMittal South Africa, will be winding down its operations, a company that contributes significantly to the local and regional economy. The main reason the company is winding down is because it is no longer

economically viable. The company aims to complete this process by the first quarter of 2020.

Steel sales decreased in July as well as September 2019; ArcelorMittal, South Africa, lost approximately 50% in its share price during this year and they are faced with shedding approximately 1000 jobs.

We are currently faced with an extremely challenging period in our economy so the shedding of even one job in Saldanha Bay in the Western Cape in South Africa, is one job too many.

As a province we need to continue cutting unnecessary costs and red tape in order to create an enabling environment for businesses to grow. In particular the Western Cape has already invested R1 billion in Saldanha Bay IDZ and seven new factories will be built in the area with one already having broken ground. Further, the world's longest production manganese train in the world has rolled into Saldanha Bay on the Cape West Coast after travelling more than 800 kilometres from the Northern Cape and we now have a direct flight from Langebaan to Cape Town, which will further contribute to economic growth.

Given the devastating news, we welcome the Western Cape Provincial Government's commitment to assist the company in reducing costs by providing water tariff relief by the Saldanha Bay Municipality, as well as working with the Department of Trade and Industry, nationally, to include

the company in the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone to reduce energy and freight costs. We further welcome the Western Cape and national departments' co-operation to assist those employees who may be affected by the closure of the company.

This situation further highlights the need for Independent Power Producers, which will assist in the region and province's energy needs and we thus urge the national Minister of Mineral Resources and Energy to approve Section 34 determinations for municipalities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the ANC. Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The ANC in the Western Cape Legislature is alarmed by the plans of ArcelorMittal South Africa to close down operations in Saldanha Bay, that may result in almost a thousand job losses. The big question is: where is the DA-run Provincial Government in assisting this business with all the many wonderful things it so often brags about? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Where is the assistance to business from red tape reduction to advice, where is all that? [Interjections.] The DA in this Legislature is fast to act when national departments and entities are called to so-called "account" here where this Province has no mandate or

jurisdiction, like with Home Affairs up to SAPS. But why is it so inaudible on the biggest disaster that hit that IDZ of Saldanha with massive possible layoffs?

We will write an urgent letter calling on the Legislature's Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism Committee to get into action, engage with the relevant stakeholders to gather more details of the situation, as well as its impact on that area through a committee meeting or an oversight visit to the ArcelorMittal South Africa premises. Our major concern is the future of the workers and the immediate plan for them. We believe that everything possible must be done to save jobs and thus all options must be explored.

An HON MEMBER: But we are already doing that. But we are already doing that!

Mr L L MVIMBI: The DA must now wake up and save this institution.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must wake up.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Wake up! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Moving over. Thank you members. We are now moving over to the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters calls on the Western Cape Provincial Government to liaise with the City of Cape Town on the issue of an inclusionary housing policy with regards to housing developments taking place in the Cape Town CBD. Cape Town remains a racially divided city, which faces a housing affordability crisis. In its centre lies a lack of racial and economic integration, with the best land reserved for the wealthy, predominantly white population, who live close to good hospitals, jobs and schools, to mention a few.

The Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act is a national legislation, which requires different spheres of government, including the City of Cape Town, to provide for the inclusive developmental, equitable and efficient spatial planning. The Western Cape Provincial Government needs to put pressure on the City of Cape Town to conform to this legislation by urgently adopting an inclusionary housing policy that will regulate private developments in the city by securing a portion for affordable housing for those without bigger financial muscle.

The advantages of an inclusionary housing policy are that people without means will save up to 40% of household income, which is currently used on public transport as they will now be closer to their jobs. Their children will have better access to schools and grow up in mixed income communities as opposed to high poverty areas, to mention a few. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. It is crucial that in the Western Cape we deliver services which are targeted squarely at the real needs of our residents today. [Interjection.] This is why policy must continually be revised and updated where necessary, as the needs of residents change and so the strategy to provide services needs to change along with them. Our stakeholders and industry experts play an important role in these processes, and I am glad to see that in DA-led governments, their concerns are being heard and included in our service delivery roll-out.

The reality is that the provision of social housing in post-apartheid South Africa is not only the provision of a basic service, but the active reversal of apartheid spatial planning, which continues to segregate our communities. Therefore, the policy governing this service must include the views and inputs of civic organisations, the private sector and the residents themselves in order to change the face of our cities and begin to reconnect people to opportunities and growth. It is therefore vital that social housing includes industry ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... expertise, and the research compiled by organisations representing the poor and the disadvantaged. [Interjections.]

Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am watching. I am watching the front desk.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.
[Interjection.] There is only one member Maseko.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you are quite correct, hon member.

Ms L M MASEKO: It is for this reason that I welcome the City of Cape Town's Housing Policy Feasibility Study, which will commence in January 2020 as it provides the perfect platform for a social housing policy which is inclusive, ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: More delays.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... comprehensive, and which will not only build communities, but break down barriers to social unity. I am very happy to see that where ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... the DA governs, the dream of a united and equal South Africa is finally coming to light by including people and residents at ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order members, please. [Interjections.] I have to stop the clock then, allow member Maseko to finish now because she has been interrupted. Please finish off, member Maseko. [Interjections.] I am listening.

Ms L M MASEKO: Okay. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I am very happy to see that where the DA governs, the dream of a united and equal South Africa is finally coming to light ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: ... by including people. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! I am going to allow her to repeat that because she was shut down. [Interjections.] No, it is only fair. It is only fair. I did not even hear what she said, actually. So may I ask that you repeat whatever you said so that I can hear. [Interjections.] It is only fair.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If they shout you down, I will give you the same opportunity.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am very happy to see that where

the DA governs, the dream of a united and equal South Africa is finally coming to light by including people ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: I cannot hear Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please. [Interjections.] Hon members, I really ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Let her start from the beginning.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Again, she has to finish her sentence. It is out of respect. I will give that respect to anybody that is being shouted down. So please, the longer you do it, we just repeat it and so, can I just ask ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is a matter of principle. [Interjections.] So the principle on the rule is really that she has to be allowed to finish her speech without being shouted down and I would like to give her that opportunity in the fairness of this House. [Interjections.] Hon members, please.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Can member Maseko finish?

Ms L M MASEKO: Member Maseko is so happy to see that where the DA governs, the dream of a united and equal South Africa is finally coming to light ... [Interjections.] by including people and residents at all levels in the policy making processes. This is another way that we are not only building houses for our people but creating communities and restoring dignity. I thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr A LILI: Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member?

Mr A LILI: Can I ask you a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may, but as one of the perpetrators of noise in the House ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Thanks, Speaker. No, my question would be ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He cannot even let the Speaker finish.

Mr A LILI: Do you concur?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr A LILI: ...with the hon member?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No!

Mr A LILI: I mean, talking that way with the DA that recently, recently ...
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We concur!

Mr A LILI: ...the entire continent witnessed the divisions from within ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not a point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, yes, it is not a point of order.
[Interjections.] Thank you very much. I am moving over to GOOD. I
recognised GOOD. Hon Herron?

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. For hon

Maseko's information, an inclusionary housing policy was prepared and drafted from late 2017 to mid-2018. So it has been available to the DA in Cape Town since August 2018 ... ([Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr B N HERRON: ... when it was presented to the Mayoral Committee by myself. I am happy that they are reviving it a year later. Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the Premier and MEC, or Minister Fernandez, for recognising good policy when they see it. [Interjections.] The DA's "One South Africa for All 2019" manifesto promised to overhaul SAPS and to provide provincial policing, although many international examples proved, policing alone cannot solve crime. But not once in the many pages that are in that "One South Africa for All 2019" manifesto does the DA even consider improving social services to tackle the underlying causes of crime in our neighbourhoods. On the other hand the GOOD manifesto promises to, and I quote "Address the root causes of crime... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B N HERRON: ... by ensuring improved professional policing works hand in hand with effective social services and social development." So I am pleased that the Premier and the MEC spoke about adopting good policy in the Provincial Safety Plan. I support their announcements published in the *Cape Argus* yesterday ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: ...of improving policing combined with more effective social services.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member Marran.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, I hope this House will soon be provided with a copy of this yet to be seen Safety Plan ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr B N HERRON: ... but I will leave a copy of the manifesto here in case you need any other bids. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Order members!

Mr B N HERRON: This time, hon Deputy Speaker, I congratulate the DA on abandoning your manifesto and I agree with you that our policies will make this a good and safe place to live. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Deputy Speaker, yet again I saw on ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Can I just hear the hon Christians please?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Yet again, hon Deputy Speaker, I saw on the Western Cape Government website, highlighted about substance abuse. And we know, I have said it earlier that substance abuse amounts to violent crimes within our communities, and it is a main ingredient that destroys our homes. Even more work needs to be done by this Government to have preventative measures in place and also to intervene within our communities and our schools.

The ACDP is referring to the statistics from July to December 2018, that the drugs of choice are cannabis, tik, alcohol and heroin. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is damaging our societies and the ACDP wants to know, what is this Provincial Government doing? Are they doing enough? They are definitely not doing enough to curb this abuse of substances. We realise it is a transversal issue, so there is more than one department, but surely there must be a plan, otherwise in the coming years there will be no stopping it.

Let me just give you an example, hon Deputy Speaker. Cannabis is recorded to cause 30% of crimes that happen in our society. Cannabis plays a big role. Tik plays a big role. Heroin and alcohol play a big role.

So I think this Government must do more in order to intervene or to bring this message. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ANC.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In the gallery today, we are joined by the communities of Darling and Leonsdale. They join us while the nation is in a jubilant mood, following the victory of the Springboks in Japan, bringing home the Webb Ellis Trophy for the third time. Making this victory sweeter is the inclusion of players like Makazole Mapimpi who grew up playing rugby in the dusty streets of East London.

The victory of the Springboks, the win by Chad le Clos and the victory of the national SA Netball team has ignited hope in the face of many young people against the realities of an ailing economy and crime which continues to say to a child of Elsie's River and Darling "you don't have a future".

On 6 November 2019 I was invited by the community of Leonsdale and Elsie's River at large, which has united itself beyond their individual political or religious affiliations, against the City of Cape Town which is planning to rezone the Sleepy Hollow sports ground, the only stadium in the area, for human settlements. This is against a subcouncil resolution which recommended upgrading of this sports ground in October 2017.

Sleepy Hollow is situated in the same street where gangs fight each other all the time, yet there has never been a single murder reported on the ground. This is because everyone in the community, including alleged gang members knows the value of the stadium to the community. By closing it, the City of Cape Town will be systematically condemning the youth to crime and gangsterism.

It is for this reason that I wish to call on the Premier and MEC Fritz and MEC Marais to accompany me to the area before the end of the year to listen to the grievances of the community around the rezoning of the stadium that has produced stars like Ryan Baartman of Cape Town City, Wayde van Niekerk and other local players who are now in Spain. With me, hon Deputy Speaker, I have a file of memorandums from the community of Elsies River and Darling, which I intend to give to the Premier as we approach the situation of the area. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am happy that hon Brett Herron admitted on the record now, he was a failure as a Mayco member. He said he was a housing inclusionary member ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: He said there was a housing inclusionary policy and as the Mayco member for Urban Development his job was to implement it. So, I am happy he put it on the record that ... [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: It was ready in November 2018.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Post-apartheid South Africa has given birth to one of the most liberal constitutions in the world, one that affirms the democratic values of human dignity, equality and freedom. We all have a responsibility to respect these rights, and public representatives in particular have a responsibility to enact accountability and transparency if we are serious about driving good governance.

The fact of the matter is that accountability seems to be a buzzword in main South African politics and is being perpetuated as such by the intelligentsia without any proper interrogation and conviction. Under the ANC, the ever-increasing hostility towards accountability mechanisms and open debate on important matters will only be to the detriment of our democracy. In fact, democracy means nothing in the absence of transparency and accountability.

This has recently been defied by the Democratic Alliance after the May

elections this year, when accountability and transparency was put into action. Unlike the ANC, the DA breathes life into these terms, both internality and where we govern. [Interjections.] In fact, Deputy Speaker, in the ANC ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...accountability is a swear word. [Interjections.] The supposed New Dawn is an indictment on the Orwellian tendencies that have come to define South Africa under the ANC. A clear example of this is the shuffling of former Premiers to Parliament, such as the former Premier of the North West and the former Premier of Limpopo, who is now dubbed the Deputy Minister of Police, even after bankrupting his own province. Accountability should therefore be declared taboo in the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Corrupt Ministers and mayors often get rewarded with ambassador status or other cushy government jobs. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: In fact, hon Deputy Speaker, I cannot recall one instance where the ANC opened a criminal case of corruption against any

of its senior leaders, including any of these members, having once opened a criminal case against ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... any of the members in the Western Cape, accused of corruption.

An HON MEMBER: For what?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Instead, they are being protected – listen to that! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: For what? Corruption, not for what, member. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Instead they are being protected at all costs ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to avoid having more webs – hon Deputy Speaker, I cannot hear myself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. I can hear you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... against more webs of patronage systems and ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...corrupt deals unmasked. The DA on the other hand, holds its leaders accountable from councillors ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... to mayors, to even its national leader. That is the DA difference. We walk the talk on accountability, something that will only ever exist as a phantom phenomenon to the ANC. Thank you.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the hon, from Al Jama-ah. Are you doing a statement, sir? No? [Interjections.] Okay. Noted. And then I see the DA as a final statement.

An HON MEMBER: We have evidence.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can I have some order please? I cannot hear the hon member. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: The allegations against MEC Kwazi Mshengu for Education in KwaZulu Natal are serious. Not only because it is a blatant abuse of taxpayers' money, but because of what it could have bought within the educational sector for our learners instead. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L J BOTHA: Moreover, over the last two financial years the total losses from SOE amounts to R96,46 billion. This amount is four times the Western Cape Education Department's budget. The WCED who aims to provide quality education to every learner in our province – it could have done so much more, hon Deputy Speaker.

But instead of recognising this incredible injustice, the ANC on 31 October in the *Cape Argus* blames the DA for everything that is wrong, even if it has made significant strides since 2009. The opinion piece missed all the facts. The WCED remains vigilant and continues to place emphasis on fiscal consolidation, cost cutting measures ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms L J BOTHA: ...as well as streamlining and rationalising projects, while remaining committed to its vision of quality education for every learner in every classroom in every school. We are, Deputy Speaker, cognisant of the gaps in achieving this mission.

An HON MEMBER: Where? What gaps?

Ms L J BOTHA: Within budgetary constraints the WCED ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lily.

†Me L J BOTHA: Miskien moet julle net bietjie luister. Luister.

[Ms L J BOTHA: Perhaps you should just listen a bit. Listen.] †Within budgetary constraints the WCED incorporated ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms L J BOTHA: ...20 000 new learners for the current academic year and will receive outstanding results nonetheless. Amassed, the Department spends the bulk of its budget on poorer schools and its pro-poor policy exceeds every other province. [Interjection.] Luister! Listen!

The facts do not lie, hon Deputy Speaker. We must acknowledge ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Ms L J BOTHA: We must acknowledge the new dawn ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can finish off, hon member.
[Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: ... to free corruption in order to expand and improve on our services from the ANC Government, however, we are at the dusk with regards to train delays, impacting on unemployment, power outages and SAA falling out of the air. SABC employment incompetence ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms L J BOTHA: ...which cost this country billions and no one is held accountable. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Hon members. Is there a Minister who wishes to respond as contemplated in the Standing Rule 145.6? I see the hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is such a privilege for me to do this. The Western Cape Government, under the leadership of Premier Alan Winde is leading the

way in provincial safety. [Interjections.] On 19 September 2019, Premier Winde launched his Safety Plan, the most comprehensive safety plan ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... in the country, which will see:...

An HON MEMBER: Where?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

- 3 000 new law enforcement officers deployed where and when crime happens;
- Deployment based on data-led technology;

An HON MEMBER: What are you doing?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The third point is:

- 150 investigators to prepare ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are out of order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY:

- ...dockets for prosecutors;
- A world-class, evidence-led and integrated violence prevention programme; and lastly, hon Deputy Speaker,
- A safety priority for every Cabinet Minister with accountable and transparent metrics.

Very, very important. Every single Minister. The intention behind the Safety Plan is to halve the province's murder rate over the next 10 years.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Safety Plan calls on each Minister to take a collaborative approach to safety as each of us has our own respective safety obligations. [Interjections.] Premier Winde has assigned safety priorities, and all Ministers have undertaken to personally account for the delivery of each of those outcomes.

I have personally been tasked with the overseeing and training and deployment of additional law enforcement officers ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... as I said over a period of five years ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and 150 investigators ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to the places and times where and when violent crime happens. I will also be working to expand the highly successful Chrysalis Programme, enhance police oversight and work ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to change legislation to ensure that cheap alcohol pricing is altered. [Interjections.] Additionally, Premier Winde will form a Safety Cabinet where the Ministers, the SAPS and other stakeholders in the Criminal Justice System will be held accountable to delivery metrics which will in turn be communicated directly to the public. In this regard, we have already met with the National Minister, Bheki Cele and the Deputy Minister to implement this Safety Plan and I hope these members of the Opposition can go and ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...ask the Minister for some information. By working Better Together in this way, we will make the Western Cape a safer and ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... happier place for everyone to live in! I hope they take safety seriously. [Interjections.] Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fritz.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the end of Members' Statements.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to – my apologies. Yes?

Mr B N HERRON: I am wondering if the Minister or the Premier will take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. No questions on the statement, unfortunately. Now we move over to notices. [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: We never get the truth in this House! It is a waste of time!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Herron, you have to use the tools available to you, a written question perhaps or a question, but I cannot actually comment on that unfortunately. Notices of Motion in terms of Rule ...
[Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: I asked a question ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... 151 [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: It takes them three months to give an answer!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any motions where notice is given?
Hon Mvimbi, I see you, sir.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Notice is given?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Notice is given. Yes, you put your hand up.
[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Motion with notice?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr L L MVIMBI: That in a ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What you will read is "With".

An HON MEMBER: With, not without.

Mr L L MVIMBI: With?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notices of motion with notice.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr L L MVIMBI: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House acknowledges and appreciates the efforts and contributions made by members of the Provincial Legislature, during the presentation and consideration of the Annual Reports and Auditor-General Reports; especially the members of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, who had to leave these premises late in the evening due to their commitment to hold the Executive to account. As special word of thanks to hon Baartman, hon Maseko,

hon America and hon Xego as well as hon member Nomi Nkondlo who stood in for me in an acting capacity when I was away.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. Thank you very much. And we move other. Any other notices? I see – I will move across, one side, one side. I see the DA and then I see you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the 5% Budget cut and the impact it will have on services provided by the Western Cape Department of Education. I so move. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see you hon member. [Interjections.] Order members. Yes?

An HON MEMBER: I wonder where is that money?!

Ms A P BANS: I move with notice ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I cannot hear. [Interjections.]
Okay.

Ms A P BANS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern the recent reports of suspension of a senior employee in the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport; on the grounds of sexual harassment; notes further that this is concerning given the issue of GBV and sexual offences in the province, thus highlighting the importance of a previously mentioned motion presented by the ANC to implement a vetting system for all Government employees in the province; and calls on the MEC to ensure that the official remains suspended until the case is concluded.
I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Over to you. [Interjections.] It is motions where notice is given.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. Can I just be clear? We are doing motions where notice is given. Am I clear?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is it. Chief Whip you want to, well, Acting Chief Whip, do you want to make a comment? Yes. Yes please.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Because everyone is getting so excited, there is no opportunity to object to motions where notice is given.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct. Noted. Thank you. We are moving over to hon Dugmore. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members [Interjections.] Everyone is being rusty here in terms of the Rules. [Interjections.] Hon Lili! Hon Marran!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we have attention.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the implications of the recent judgment by

Judge Malebo Habedi in Gauteng High Court which dismissed the application by former Premier Helen Zille, who is now Chairperson of the DA Federal Executive Council, to set aside the Public Protector's finding that the former Premier's tweets about colonialism ... [Interjections.] did not comply with the provisions of the Constitution as well as the Executive Ethics Code ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION:

... contained in the Executive Members Ethics Act 82 of 1998. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other motions with notice? I see the hon Baartman. [Interjections.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: I hereby ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot hear you. I cannot hear a word from you hon member. If we can just have some silence please. Yes?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall

move:

That at its next sitting the House debates the 2019 Integrated Resource Plan. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other motions with notice? I see the ACDP.

The PREMIER: That is something serious.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: That is like a debate.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Comprehensive Sexuality Education (CSE) curriculum for 2020.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Any other motions with notice?

Over to you, hon Sayed, it is over to you. If you put hand up.

Mr M K SAYED: Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern reports of ill-treatment of teachers by other teachers at De Bron Primary School in Stanford which has since led to the resignation of one educator; notes further that the alleged ill-treatment has resulted in divisions amongst parents at the school, leading to the formation of groups like the Xhosa Parent group who are feeling very frustrated with the attitude of De Bron Primary School and the School Governing Body and the lack of urgency to address their concerns; notes further that their concerns include racism at the school which includes a teacher at the school who allegedly slammed a child's head on the desk and called him the K-word; that learners endure racist slurs and bullying at school on a daily basis, and we call for an urgent investigation and an intervention into these concerns. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other motions where notice is given? No? That concludes the notices of motion. We now move over to Motions without Notice. I see the hon Mackenzie and I will move across.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Washiela Harris on her election as the new councillor for Ward 82 in Mitchells Plain; may she continue to serve the people of Mitchells Plain and Tafelsig; residents have once again entrusted us to bring good governance to their communities, and we thank them for putting their faith in the DA. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Are there any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Over to you, hon. Yes.

Mr M KAMA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the sudden passing of amaXhosa King Mpendulo Zwelonke Sigcawu this morning after he was taken to hospital last night; send our condolences to the amaXhosa nation and the Sigcawu family. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Allen.

An HON MEMBER: No objection?

An HON MEMBER: No, there is no objection. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections. Hon Allen.

Mr R ALLEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the murder of Lieutenant-Colonel André Kay, who was shot in front of his house in Bishop Lavis earlier today; we send our heartfelt condolences to his family, friends and the entire safety fraternity; Lieutenant-Colonel Kay was a dedicated police officer and his death is a tragic loss to the entire Western Cape; he will be sorely missed by many and may he rest in peace. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ongoing decline of the DA in the province and that it continues to lose support on a daily basis ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D SMITH:

... and besides the by-election blow in Matzikama yesterday where the ANC has taken the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr D SMITH:

... DA ward in Vredendal North, to govern that municipality. The DA also lost their Speaker of Stellenbosch Municipality, Wilhelmina Petersen who resigned unexpectedly and without a reason given.
[Interjections.] I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being

moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.] Shh.

†'n AGB LID: Stilte asseblief.

[An HON MEMBER: Silence please.]

Mr M KAMA: Do not say "Shh". [Inaudible.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sincere condolences to the family and loved ones of Allison Plaatjies, a teacher from Cedar Primary in Clanwilliam, whose life was taken at a tender age; we extend our sympathy, thoughts and prayers to the entire family for their loss during this time of grief and mourning. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates all South African sports people on the success they attained in their international competitions, including the national senior rugby players who became the world champion team, the netball team who has taken the African championship, and even our Paralympians who are making us proud with their records and world medals; and noting this, we say “Well done South Africa, you are a winning nation in the world!”

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Botya, yes.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Springbok national rugby team for winning the 2019 Rugby World Cup; the Rugby World Cup also is a reminder to South Africans that sport-like society is still untransformed; it is also a reminder that 25 years into democracy the country is still divided along racial lines with a huge gap in equality; moreover, following this rugby triumph, there has been a huge excitement about the rugby team representing unity whilst in Japan; however the same cannot be said with regards to the situation here at

home; listen – there are two types of unity ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA:

... principled unity and ad hoc unity; principled unity endeavours to unite a society around a common outlook and how that particular society intends achieving their common goals and for that to succeed clarity of ideas and practice is fundamental; ad hoc unity is based on the foundation that one may discard it once short term goals have been achieved. It does not last; true unity must be lived on a daily basis and cannot take place once-off; however, the fact remains that the unity that was achieved by the South African national rugby team is an ad hoc temporary tactical unity. It does not exist. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member, a little bit long for a motion. Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Lieutenant-Colonel Marthinus from

Ladismith who in the Kannaland Municipality has just been promoted as Colonel; we thank him for his service and we wish him well in his new position as he works with the Western Cape Government to create a safer Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House today sings the praises of the 90-year old iconic pioneer, one of Cape Town's most phenomenal poets, writer and publisher – Mr James David Matthews; notes that Mr Matthews was born in District Six on 29 May 1929; he grew up in a household with no books; his father was illiterate and his mother read to him *Oracle* and *Miracle* which were hardly considered as literature; he was recognised at the age of 14 by his English teacher as a writer; notes that his first writings were published in 1946 at the age of 17; he worked as a journalist over the years; he contributed to many national newspapers with short stories he wrote; Mr Matthews explored other issues and his first book, *Cry Rage*, was banned by the apartheid government; in 1976 he was detained at Victor Verster Prison and was

repeatedly denied a passport ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: A statement.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS:

A keen sense of purpose led him to establish the first black-owned gallery in Cape Town and to set up his own publishing house, Black Literature, Culture and Society; being a worldwide poet and writer, but he was isolated and deprived from the commercial royalties that were due to him. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. I see the hon Allen.

Mr R ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Kholo Montsi, aged 16, from Cape Town, who finished the 2019 tennis season as both South Africa's and Africa's top ranked junior boys player; he also landed himself the rank of number 18 in the world, after winning numerous tournaments for this year. We wish him all of the best. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the good news announced by the National Government to allow small scale fisheries to catch West Coast lobster during the upcoming season and thanks Minister Barbara Creecy for this consent.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. I see the hon Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that again in the next academic year many learners face being unplaced at schools as we have been inundated with many cries for assistance from parents whose children were rejected with reasoning that is not consistent being applied and

calls for an investigation into the allegations that 90% of children from poor and working class backgrounds have not been accepted at these schools, when they applied on time and submitted all required documents. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the sickening account of a Swellendam farmer who shot a bystander at Buffeljags after the farmer shot another's cow; and further notes nobody from this Provincial DA-run Government has even attempted to have this incident investigated despite numerous invites to have such abuse of workers by farmers reported to the DA Government. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objections [Interjections.] There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order

Paper. Without notice. That is correct. I move over to hon Botha and then I recognise member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns in the strongest terms the rape of a 16-year old girl in Hanover Park on Monday 11 November 2019; the alleged perpetrator is linked to the gruesome murder and death of Jesse Hess and her grandfather, Chris Lategan; I move that we further welcome the arrest of the alleged suspect. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion is agreed to. Hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the sudden withdrawal of the Western Cape DA leader Bonginkosi Madikizela ... [Interjections.] and the third contender for the national leadership and notes commentators find it strange that a favourite of the DA's English liberal Helen Zille jumped even before the race started. I move so. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see one hand up in the DA. I see hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the top ten teachers who received awards for excellence in teaching and education leadership in their respective categories; an incredible 33 000 teachers were eligible for nomination, despite the fact that teachers face several challenges in our public schools such as classroom size, lack of parental involvement and poor student behaviour and attitudes; excellent performance must be awarded to every teacher even if they had not received the top reward; their efforts in learner development do not go unseen. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? First I have to give hon Smith and then to you, hon Bans. Hon Smith. I mean sorry, hon Marran. My apologies. I am looking at you.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Provincial Department of Agriculture to assist farm workers who are to lose their jobs as the Hoogland Farm in Touws River is liquidated.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion [Interjection.]

An HON MEMER: We did not hear.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

An HON MEMBER: You were talking.

An HON MEMBER: No we're not talking. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, would you mind, but then you must really keep quiet, so that we can all hear. Thank you very much, hon member.

Mr P MARRAN: They must listen, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. [Interjections.] Hon members, can we have order please?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls on the provincial Department of Agriculture to assist farmworkers who are to lose their jobs as the Hoogland Farm in Touws River is liquidated.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. I have said hon Bans first. And then I will come back to you, sir.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay the employment at great expense of outsider artists for the upcoming switching on of festive lights in Cape Town – thereby snubbing the many local artists who could have served their local community better at this level. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being

moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? [Interjections.]

There are objections.

The PREMIER: It is the wrong Legislature.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that eight people were killed in Athlone fires over two days in that area and calls on Cape Town and the Province to enhance assistance to the people at risk to prevent these devastating reoccurring disasters. Thanks.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House denounces the looting of freight trucks in De Doorns where goods were stolen, televisions; and commends SAPS for its work to retrieve and arrest various suspects. So I move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA stands behind the door in its attempt to blame shift political meddling to the ANC in the matter of the appointment of a Provincial Commissioner ... [Interjection.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: That is the truth!

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr M KAMA:

...as the DA has for many years led a campaign against certain senior SAPS officers; and also notes that it is the DA MEC Albert Fritz that serves on a panel that looks at the available candidates. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.] One minute. [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, can you protect me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you are protected. And I can ask hon Marran to help not to contribute. [Interjections.] And the hon Minister, not to contribute to the noise. [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, are they done?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Think they are done.

Mr M K SAYED: Okay. Thank you. I move ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Marran, running commentary? Hon Minister? [Interjections.] Yes because your own member is speaking and he cannot get a word in.

An HON MEMBER: What I do not understand what is she talking about because we are listening now to the honourable Chairperson of the [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: If I may rise on a point of order. In terms of the Rules you need to be recognised before you raise a point of order. You cannot address the Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Quite correct.

Ms S G FERNANDEZ: ... from your seat [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sitting down.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So I think we need to revisit our Rules and the manner in which we conduct ourselves in this House. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So noted, thank you very much. [Interjections.] Hon members, please. [Interjections.] Can we have some decorum in the House so that I can allow hon Sayed to actually speak? Thank you.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Now that the debate about the Rules has been completed, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that Northpine School that is next to a church will be hosting a karaoke event on 22 November 2019, in which people are encouraged on the pamphlet to bring their own liquor to the event; notes further that in the circulated leaflet, there is no mention of sale of liquor, but rather people are encouraged to bring their own liquor to the event; accepts that the Western Cape Education Department has now effectively converted our schools to alcohol consuming spaces; and calls for an urgent investigation into this event. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Marran. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I have some order please? Otherwise we are going to be here for a long time. Hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town is in serious trouble with dissatisfied motorists and is about to change its parking and charge system to please the electorate ahead of the coming municipal elections. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the petty slander case by a senior SAPS officer against community activist Colin Arendse was yesterday dismissed in the Mitchells Plain magistrate's court. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Windvogel. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I move without notice ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House feels for the Muslim community ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just, hon Windvogel, can you just sit. Are you rising on a point of order?

Ms L M MASEKO: Deputy Speaker, I just wanted to find out if Colin Arendse is a real person? We hear a lot about him. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not a point of order, member. Hon Windvogel, can you continue? Order members. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House feels for the Muslim community after two incidents of the desecration of graveyards in Cape Town. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being

moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Smith.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Point of order.

Mr D SMITH: Last motion without notice... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon member. If you can just take your seat. We have a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to find out. Is it parliamentary that a cell phone be used to record while the proceedings of the House are in session? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a recording happening? Okay. [Interjections.] I can only, I can only respond to what the Leader of the Opposition is saying. One minute hon members. [Interjections.] Can I just hear the Acting Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, are you saying that the hon Leader of the Opposition has admitted that he is not taking a video?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well he did say “no” to me.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Okay. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Not a video!

An HON MEMBER: Not a video.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. He did say “no” to me. If we can carry on to the hon Smith. Hon Members!

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, it is part of the successful campaign of the West Coast.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the wealthy of the Atlantic Seaboard including Sea Point, now joined Cape Town in seeking an interdict to enforce its bylaws to fine homeless people and to further rob them of their earnings. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objections to the motion itself?

[Interjections.] There are objections. Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed.

Mr K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the ongoing sexual harassment of learners like the four boys at Delft who were raped at The Hague Primary School and again calls on the Western Cape Education Department to have proper guidelines and assistance for victims. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. [Interjections.] Hon members, are there any more motions without notice? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Has it been reported?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If there are none, that concludes the business of the day. [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members! If you can all please stay by your seats and let us get back into a routine that works for this House. Thank you.

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I still have my ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The House is adjourned!

An HON MEMBER: Next week.

An HON MEMBER: Go to Cuba!

An HON MEMBER: Wide awake! Wide awake, please!

An HON MEMBER: Next year.

The House adjourned at 17:34.