
THURSDAY, 19 SEPTEMBER 2024

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order! Order, members! Before we proceed, I would like to remind the hon members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in this Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table Staff, and via Microsoft teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House.

Hon members, the quorum requirements for the Sittings are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules, and unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the

House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

Hon members, the Serjeant-at-Arms will record members' attendance.

Hon members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those hon members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order and I will recognise you. When an hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order such an hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested to not sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device.

Hon members, the media have also been granted access to the MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, I wish to remind the members of the media that they may not use the chat room, or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress.

Hon members, for this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels.

Hon members, please be reminded that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, with that being said, please allow me an opportunity to welcome you to the Sitting today, and to the guests in the gallery from the Worcester Junior Town Council. Please feel welcome to the WCPP and enjoy the Sitting.

Hon members, with that being said we will now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper and I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Londt.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Ms W F Kaizer-Philander asked Mr J J Londt, Minister of Social Development:

In relation to the new Social Work Integrated Management System (SWIMS) app, how will this app improve the daily lives of social workers in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker, and hon members and also welcome to the Worcester Junior Town Council. It is good to have you in the House as well.

So, we talk about technology and we talk about the use of technology in this Government and quite often when Government speaks about something, that is where it stays. However, the Department of Social Development, through its social workers, have initiated the SWIMS app, the Social Worker Integrated Management System.

This is a tool that allows our social workers to save millions upon millions of minutes that they can reinvest, putting it back to those that are in need. It starts as simple as, if I see a client and I capture their details, I only have to capture it once on the system and then those details are dragged through to all the other reports that need to be complied with; if you fill in a home address that gets pulled through to all the other reports.

It is to switch from a paper system to a 90% digital system, because if you have ever engaged the services of a social worker or have come across a social worker where he or she does their work, you probably have seen them walking around with brown files, brown envelopes under their arms, but social workers do not just deal with one or two files, one or two cases at a time, they often have 10, 11, 12 active cases. There are still many other dormant cases, but this also ensures that there is better security because now if a social worker after a long day looking after the most vulnerable in our

province, if they go back home and they put the file down on the dining room table and they now have to pay attention to their own family after they have looked after so many other families, kids running around, maybe the partner coming home, that file can be misplaced in a household that is often chaotic when everybody comes home. This is one example showing how we are ensuring the security of this system being upgraded, because now case files can easily be tracked, kept record of, and we do not have to put this extra pressure on the social workers.

The other thing that is amazing about this Social Work Integrated Management System is that it can be used offline because it does not matter if you come from the West Coast or you go into the Karoo, if you go and see a client you can actually get that client, where there is no signal, no reception, you can capture all of those records on the system, and once you get back to a place where there are signals or WiFi, all of those records are pulled online.

It also helps with the better management, because what we say is we need a fair allocation of resources in our province. That is what our refrain has been, that we are the third biggest province but we are only getting the fifth biggest resources, so we need to make do with what is available in our province, even though we are fighting for more. But what the social workers now have done, they have said let us make sure that we share the workload and the caseload evenly amongst one another. So if you find a social worker that, for whatever reason, does half of the job of somebody else, that social

worker manager can make sure that that caseload gets spread around.

It is also important to say that with this increased attacks on our social workers we now have to double up in the buddy system, in the hotspot areas to get our social workers out. That is why, as members of the Standing Committee are well aware, we now have to budget an additional R20 million to... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please conclude. Your time has expired, your first opportunity, so finish the sentence. You will have another opportunity.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, this is such an amazing topic, but I will finish off at the end ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You will have another opportunity.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...and I am looking forward to hear what the colleagues from the other parties and from my own party are saying. Thank you so much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Kaizer-Philander.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Minister, thank you very much, hon Speaker. The Democratic Alliance proudly welcomes the

launch of the Social Work Integrated Management System, the SWIMS app. This innovation tool reflects the Western Cape Government's ongoing commitment to improving social service delivery, particularly for those on the frontline of care, our social workers.

Social workers are often the unsung heroes of our communities, dedicating their lives to the well-being of our most vulnerable citizens, especially children in need of alternative care. Yet, the challenges they face on a daily basis are immense. These include navigating outdated paper-based systems; managing complex administrative tasks, as the Minister has indicated, and dealing with excessive stress.

Speaker, the Provincial Department of Social Development recognised these challenges and responded with a solution. The SWIMS app directly addresses inefficiencies within the system, reducing the administrative burden that has long plagued social workers by automating workflows, minimising respective tasks and enhancing monitoring and reporting functions. This app will enable social workers to spend more time on the crucial human centred aspects of their work, providing care and support to those in need.

This groundbreaking app, the first of its kind in South Africa, is a clear example of the DA's commitment to harnessing technology to improve service delivery. It promises to streamline the alternative care management process for children, providing much needed control and accountability while boosting the morale of our social workers.

By eliminating cumbersome processes, this app empowers social workers to operate more efficiently and effectively, thus directly benefiting the communities they serve.

Hon Speaker, with your indulgence, with this app now in place, could the Minister perhaps provide more detail on whether there are any plans to expand this functionality potentially through the public / private partnership. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kaizer-Philander. I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the ACDP welcomes SWIMS, the Social Work Integrated Management System. It is quite an innovative step in order to, as the previous speaker says, improve. I think, at the end it has improved the daily lives of social workers. Just a couple of weeks ago, we spoke about the safety of social workers and this will help immensely.

Just a couple of questions to the Minister, I saw in one of the *Weekend Argus* papers that social workers in the province see up to 100 cases at a time and if you go to the rural areas, it is per social worker, the ratio is 2 500 per social worker.

Will this app help that social workers will see more people, meaning we know that we have a shortfall of social workers when it comes to our most needy areas, but also at our schools; you know, schools have social workers per district. But people are crying out because of the need, the drug abuse, the gangsterism, the bullying and all of those types of things, so social workers will always have a massive, massive workload.

How does this assist his Department and social workers to see more people and maybe get done with cases sooner? So the ACDP wants to commend the Minister and his Department for this excellent app and we hope that it will be as hon member Kaizer-Philander said, there will be a partnership with the private sector so that this can be expanded. So less paperwork, but more effective work being done by our social workers; safety is not a problem, because they do it via this app. So thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Christians. I recognise the hon Marais.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, I want to on behalf of the Freedom Front Plus welcome the move to a more efficient way of running services. I however... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, is there an issue on the floor?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Your mic.

The SPEAKER: Can you rise?

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): But my mic is on, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): My apologies, Speaker, just to indicate to the member to put on his mic.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, no, it is not a point of order, I am just getting messages now from members of the media that they are logging in onto the YouTube and they are unable to receive anything here. There is nothing playing so I am not sure whether that is the case, if we could just double-check, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you. [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I do not know why it is the joke that we as the Opposition engages with the media. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members, thank you very much to the Leader of the Opposition for alerting us. I am asking that the Table Staff please – I am just, hon member, hon Leader of the Opposition, and just to the House, I am just being informed that it is in fact up and running. So hon Marais, my apologies, you may continue.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus notes the efficiency and I think it is much needed in these times that we are in. Technology certainly makes life a bit easier.

However, we must at the same time take cognisance of the safety issue currently when social workers have to visit homes with devices. Devices in hand, instead of a paper, does it draw a bigger target on their backs in terms of the work that they have to conduct in very unsafe communities?

The issue of personal information in terms of the POPI Act, are the information, sensitive information of this nature, protected sufficiently to give the public the assurance that only those authorised to have access to this personal information is in place and then spending, and I am under correction, Minister, you can let me know, if the R6 million spent on this particular SWIMS was worth versus employing a backlog of social workers?

We have more than 500 vacancies. Is this worth the investment in terms of the effectiveness and what we want to achieve in the Social Development Cluster? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. I recognise the hon Kamfer.

Mr F KAMFER (ANC): Hon Speaker, can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: Yes, I can hear you, sir.

Mr F KAMFER (ANC): Can you hear me, Speaker?

The SPEAKER: You are indeed audible. You may continue.

Mr F KAMFER (ANC): Thank you, Speaker. †Baie dankie, Speaker. Ons as die African National Congress, Speaker, ons erken die bekendstelling van die Geïntegreerde Maatskaplike Werk se Bestuurstelsel en die potensiaal daarvan om die manier waarop maatskaplike werkers hulle werk bestuur, die tyd wat benodig word om die gevalle te verwerk van 15 tot agt minute te verminder; SWIMS verteenwoordig 'n merkwaardige stap vorentoe in die stroomlyn van administratiewe take.

Dit is inderdaad 'n positiewe ontwikkeling en 'n maatskaplike werker verdien elke hulpmiddel wat hulle las kan verlig en hulle doeltreffendheid kan

verhoog, maar terwyl ons hierdie tegniese vooruitgang waardeer, moet ons ook dringende kwessies aanspreek wat steeds onopgelos bly, Speaker. Die SWIMS-toepassing, al is dit voordelig, kan nie alleen ernstige tekorte aan personeel wat ons ondervind oplos nie. In die areas soos die Weskus-distrik Munisipaliteit is 'n wanbalans opvallend, 60 maatskaplike werkers vir meer as 476 miljoen mense??.

In Cederberg is die situasie meer kommerwekkend met slegs sewe maatskaplike werkers per 60 000 individue. Hierdie syfer beklemtoon 'n kritieke en 'n wye tekort wat geen toepassing kan regstel nie. Dit gebeur terwyl honderde gekwalifiseerde maatskaplike werkers werkloos is, ondanks hulle geleerdheid en begeertes om hulle bydrae tot maatskaplike dienste te lewer.

Speaker, die hoofvermoë om maatskaplike werkers tot die bevolking tot ons provinsie in 'n stelselprobleem wat ons onmiddellik 'n strategiese aktiwiteit voor vereis. SWIMS maak 'n positiewe stroomlyn maar dit spreek nie die fundamentele behoefte van meer hande op die dek aan nie.

Terwyl ons die voordeel van SWIMS erken het ons ook dringende duidelike planne nodig en hierdie toepassing sal help om die breë kwessies van maatskaplike werkertekort en die werksessies... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Thank you, hon Speaker. We as the African National Congress acknowledges the potential of the Integrated Social Work Management System and its potential to reduce the way in which social workers manage their work, the

time needed to process cases, from 15 to eight minutes. SWIMS represents a remarkable step forward in the streamlining of administrative tasks.

It is indeed a positive development and a social worker deserves every source of aid that can relieve their plight and improve their efficiency, but while we appreciate this technical advancement, we have to also address urgent issues that still remain unresolved, Speaker. The SWIMS app, even if it is advantageous, cannot alone solve the serious shortages in staff that we are experiencing. In the areas like the West Coast District a malbalance is notable, 60 social workers for more than 476 million people.

In Cederberg the situation is more worrying, with only seven social workers per 60 000 individuals. This figure emphasises a critical and wide shortage which no app can rectify. This happens while hundreds of qualified social workers are jobless, in spite of their education and desires to make their contribution to social services.

Speaker, the main capacity of social workers to the population in our province is a system problem that immediately requires a strategic activity; SWIMS makes a positive streamline but it does not address the fundamental need of more hands on deck.

While we acknowledged the advantage of SWIMS we also need urgent clear plans and this app will help to address the wide issues of social worker shortage and the work sessions... [Interjection.]

†Die SPEAKER: Agb lid, jou tyd is verstreke.

[The SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.]

†Mnr F KAMFER (ANC): Speaker, ter afsluiting wil ons ook dan net vra dat die MEC dan hierdie verduidelik en die doeltreffendheid wat die SWIMS bepaal, sal vertaal. Ek dank u, agb Speaker.

[Mr F KAMFER (ANC): Speaker, in conclusion we just want to ask that the MEC explains this and translates the efficiency that determines the SWIMS. I thank you, hon Speaker.]

Die SPEAKER: †Baie dankie, agb lid.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.] I recognise the hon Kaizer-Philander.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and I think once again I want to stress the fact that any measure of intervention that makes it possible for social workers to go about their daily job in a more efficient and effective manner is indeed welcomed.

Speaker, I just also want to make mention of the open invitation by the Minister to the Standing Committee of Social Development to actually come and see for themselves how this app works and therefore gaining the insight knowledge as to how these apps, or rather this app, makes a difference in the daily lives of the social workers in the Western Cape.

Speaker, with the success of the SWIMS app in managing alternative care processes, if the Minister perhaps could also just give an indication as to whether there are any plans to adapt or expand this app to other areas of social services such as elderly care or support to persons with disabilities? Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kaizer-Philander. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. I will start off where the Chairperson of our Standing Committee have correctly said that there is a standing invitation for members of the Committee that we can take you through how it works, the back end, how it will address the security. So Minister Marais, every single thing that – Minister Marais! [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

That is unlikely to happen. But, we have a Minister Marais. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member Marais.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: All the things that you have raised, it is addressed. I think it is important that you as a Committee take up that invitation that I have extended, see how the system works, because hon Christians, if you just do a quick calculation, the social workers in the Western Cape Department of Social Development, in one year at a bare minimum, will save the equivalent of about 40 years of time.

Now imagine if we can roll that out, and that is the question that was asked by the member Kaizer-Philander as well. If we can roll it out to the private sector to take it on board, Local Government that can take it on board, other Government departments that can take this on board.

The referrals between departments, if you have a kid that have problems and they go to the school close to The Craggs and that kid moves to the City of Cape Town, the social worker here in the City of Cape Town does not have to start from scratch during their interventions and walking the journey with that kid. They can just pick up where the other had left off. So, hon Christians, we hope that eventually this will be rolled out to schools as well; to the health sector as well; to Local Government, because we do believe that this is a revolutionary app that will change the lives of social workers and you can then ask about the money that is being spent. Should it not be better spent in employing more social workers?

†Die ADJUNKHOOFSWEEP (DA): Ja.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Just by rolling out this app, we have already got more social worker hours to reinvest to the vulnerable. So if we can take this to the next step, over a term, I have just quickly given you the timeframe saved in one year, but if you save that in a term, if you save that over two terms, the cumulative hours that you are saving by using this app and fully rolling out, it is immense, and then when we have the money and getting our fair share from the national fiscus and making sure that we can get more social workers, they can start and hit the ground running and make sure from day one they do not have to walk with those brown envelopes under their arms. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Nice!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So colleagues, I do want to give credit here because quite often we come up with great ideas, but the rollout does not land. This came from the social workers, so this is why it is so successful. They identified the need and they said: "Help us make this work," and with the Department of the Premier, who took our hands and said "Let us get this thing out." We are now in the rollout phase of the Social Work Integrated Management System.

The big challenge, and this I put to every single member on both sides of the House, we need to make sure that we take this up across the board. We have already met with private sector, private companies and they are incredibly

excited about the potential of this.

It is businesses that see what is the value of a good product, the return on investment would be incredible. So by rolling out these devices, yes, there might be some risk about putting a device in the hand of every social worker, but that is also why we are so encouraged by the Memorandum of Understanding signed by the National Police Commissioner, the National Police Minister, the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town, so that through data... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired, please conclude.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...so that we can put up policing resources based on the needs in the province and that our social workers do not have to buddy up and look over their shoulder when they go and service the most vulnerable. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that includes Interpellation 1. I recognise the hon Petrus?

Mr B PETRUS (PA): [No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: Is that in order, the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [No audible reply.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, we then move on to Interpellation 2, I recognise the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism, hon Minister Meyer.

2. Mr N P Masipa asked Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

In relation to Karoo Lamb being classified as a SA geographical indication (GI):

- (a) What impact will this classification have on farmers in the Karoo region of the province, and
- (b) What support will his Department provide to ensure that the Karoo Lamb classification results in increased economic benefits for the Karoo?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Dankie, agb Speaker. Ek verwelkom in die Huis vandag 'n leerder, Delarey Engelbrecht en sy moeder al die pad daar van Mpumalanga en dit is sy intensie om volgende jaar politieke wetenskap te studeer aan die Universiteit Eduvos, 'n fantastiese instelling. Beide my seun asook dié van Minister Bredell het daar gestudeer. So sterkte, voorspoed, welkom in die provinsie wat werk. [Applous.]

Agb Speaker, dankie aan die... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Today I welcome in the House a learner, Delarey Engelbrecht and his mother all the way from Mpumalanga and it is his intention to study Political Science next year at the University of Eduvos, a fantastic institution. Both my son and Minister Bredell's have studied there. So all the best, godspeed, welcome in the province that works. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, thank you to the ... [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you please take your seat? Hon guests in the gallery, you are very welcome today in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and in the Chamber, but can I please remind you that you may not participate in the proceedings of the House, so just a kind reminder to everyone in the gallery. Hon Minister, you may continue.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Baie dankie aan my Voorsitter van die Staande Komitee vir hierdie interpellasie.

Ons weet dat die mense van die Karoo het baie min tot hulle voordeel. Reënval is laag. [Tussenwerpsels.] Reënval in die Karoo is laag. Hulle het ook 'n droogte gehad in die tydperk van 2017, en agb Speaker, natuurlike

hulpbronne is uit die aard van die saak baie beperk. Die bevolking is wyd versprei en die armoedevlakke is reeds gedokumenteer.

Die teenoorgestelde kant van hierdie munt is egter dat die toestande in die Karoo skeep unieke uitdagings maar ook unieke geleenthede; die unieke kombinasie van die Karoo se geologie, reënvlakke, asook die harde klimaat, die unieke plantegroei, die lam en die skaapvleis. Ek is jammer dat ek sien agb Lekker is reeds nou in die lamvleiskategorie want sy het haar lippe so pas afgelek. [Lag.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you to my Chairman of the Standing Committee for this interpellation.

We know that the people of the Karoo have very little to their advantage. Rainfall is low. [Interjections.] Rainfall in the Karoo is low. They also had a drought in the period of 2017, and hon Speaker, natural resources are naturally very limited. The population is spread widely and the poverty levels have already been documented.

The other side of the this coin is however that conditions in the Karoo create unique challenges but also unique opportunities; the unique combination of the Karoo's geology, rain levels, as well as the harsh climate, the unique vegetation, the lamb and the mutton. I'm sorry to see that hon Lekker is already now in the lamb meat category as she has just licked her lips. [Laughs.] [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Die skaapvleis en die lamsvleis is baie uniek in die Karoo en dit het unieke asook onskeibare sensoriese eienskappe. Ek weet sy eet vanaand lamsvleis. Dieselfde toestande maak dit ook vir besoekers in die Wes-Kaap baie aangenaam, veral die besoekers wat 'n wye ervaring wil hê van die natuur en die oop ruimtes, die kalmte en die sout van die aarde-mense van die Karoo, hul samekoms – dit maak hulle gesog – is onder plaaslike en internasionale toeriste van kritieke belang.

Hierdie sinergie van klimaat, omgewing, die mens, die plantegroei, maak dit juis uniek vir beide nasionale en internasionale toeriste, maar hier is 'n sinergie, agb Speaker, tussen verbruikerspersepsies en unieke kos wat versterk word. Wedersyds verbeter dit, en dit verskaf vir 'n mens 'n lieflike reputasie van die streek en sy produkte.

Lamsvleis, Karoo Lamsvleis, in die besonder, agb Voorsitter van die Staande Komitee, lid Masipa, ek sien jou lippe is ook al droog. [Lag.]

Hierdie lamsvleis is uniek aan die Karoo, maar daar is 'n risiko, agb lede, daar is. Reputasies kom ook met 'n gevaar. Een hiervan is dat mense ook 'n poging kan aanwend om 'n pryspremie te ontvang of om verkoopsvolume te verhoog, nabootsing, baie keer, agb Lekker, deur die Speaker, mag die mense

op die pakkies skryf: "Lekker Karoo Lam." Maar dan is dit lam daar van Calvinia. Agb Petrus weet waarvan ek praat. Die mense bemark skaap en lamsvleis. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The mutton and lamb is very unique to the Karoo and it has unique and also distinctive sensory characteristics. I know she's eating lamb meat tonight. The same conditions also make it very pleasant for visitors in the Western Cape, especially visitors who want a wide experience of the nature and the wide spaces, the tranquility and the salt of the earth people of the Karoo, their gathering – it makes them sought after – it is of critical importance amongst local and international tourists.]

This synergy of climate, environment, the people, the vegetation, makes it unique for both national and international tourists, but here is a synergy, hon Speaker, between consumer perceptions and unique food that are strengthened. Mutually it improves, and it provides one with a lovely reputation of the region and its products.

Lamb meat, Karoo Lamb meat, especially, hon Chairman of the Standing Committee, member Masipa, I see your lips are dry already. [Laughs.]

This Lamb meat is unique to the Karoo, but there is a risk, hon members, there is. Reputations also come with a danger. One of this is that people can also attempt to receive a price premium or to increase sales volumes, imitation, often, hon Lekker, through the Speaker, the people may write on

the packets, "Lekker Karoo Lam." But then it is lamb there from Calvinia. Hon Petrus knows what I'm talking about. The people market mutton and lamb meat. [Interjections.]

†Die SPEAKER: Agb Minister, jou tyd is verstreke.

[The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired.]

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Haai!

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hey!]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please take your seat.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Ek blameer die lam. [Lag.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I blame the lamb. [Laughs.]]

The SPEAKER: Order members! I recognise the hon Masipa.

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, Minister. During the recent prolonged drought, farmers in the Karoo were forced to sell off a significant portion of their livestock due to the limited carrying capacity of their farms. This highlights just how severe the drought was.

Under normal economic conditions this situation could have presented an opportunity for farmers to increase their prices. The principle of supply and demand is clear. When the supply of product is lower, the price of the product typically rises.

Now, with the Karoo Lamb having attained local geographical indication status, one would expect that this will provide some level of protection for farmers against the challenges posed by climate change, such as extended drought, like the one we experienced a few years ago. However, we know the opposite occurred and many farmers incurred significant financial losses.

During the drought, your Ministry responded quickly by providing much needed fodder support. Without this intervention, many farmers might have lost their farms entirely. Some even had to move their livestock to other regions, including the Overberg, where farms had the carrying capacity to sustain them. What remained puzzling is that despite the high demand of Karoo Lamb, the expected market response, higher prices did not materialise in a way that benefited these farmers.

South Africans, particularly those in the Western Cape, are known for their appreciation of Karoo Lamb – *soos hon Lekker* – and one will think they will have been willing to pay a premium for such a sought-after product. As the saying goes, those who can afford it will pay for what they believe is worth their money.

The question, Minister, given the GI status of Karoo Lamb and the economic principles of supply and demand, will the farmers benefit from the increased prices during the drought and what further steps will your Ministry take to ensure that farmers are better supported and protected from climate-related economic losses to keep the Karoo economy going during drought season?

I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Masipa. I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for that answer. Just, Minister, we know that according to the 2020 European Commission Study, Europe's economy grew by €75 billion in 2017 due to the sale of value of the GI products. Now also other countries have benefited because of the GI factor. It is proven in countries like Italy, France, Spain, Portugal and Greece.

The question I think the hon member has already asked is with all the risks involved, what is your Department doing in order to protect those risks that the farmers are facing when it comes to climate change, but also a lot of other challenges that we have and as you said, with challenges, there are opportunities, but like if you go overseas and they speak about South African Rooibos Tea, it is a known phenomena if you go to other countries. They know it comes from South Africa. So the question is this, Minister, how are

the farmers going to protect that and how is your Department going to assist those farmers to make this really one of the flagships of the Karoo, because, as you said: †"Karoo Lamvleis is lekker vleis." ["Karoo Lamb is tasty meat."]

†Maar ook almal kan dit nie bekostig nie want dit gaan uit die mark vir sekere mense. So gaan daar mense wees wat ook, jy weet, as hulle daai lamvleis wil koop, dit is nie net vir sekere mense nie, maar dat die ander gemeenskappe ook daaruit kan baat.

[But everyone cannot afford it because it goes out of the market for certain people. So there will also be people, you know, if they want to buy that lamb, it is not just for certain people, but that the other communities can also benefit from that.]

Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise hon Jacobs.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Greetings to all. I greet you all in the name of the Most High, †goas.

Hon Speaker, the NCC rises to congratulate those farms that have been recognised as Karoo Lamb farms receiving geographical indication on 27 October 2023. Hon Speaker, this opened up markets in Europe and BRICS

countries, knowing that farm owners will surely benefit financially. Karoo Lamb meat is seen as a delicacy across the world and this qualification will increase income and sales. However, Speaker, we therefore call out on the Minister of Agriculture and Labour to make sure that the biggest assets on these farms are protected – the farm workers. They must be protected from full scale exploitation.

Speaker, the Human Rights Commission has recently tabled the report on farm workers being exploited in areas like Worcester and Ceres. Some of the concerns raised by the Human Rights Commission in this report is the non-payment of salaries and residence for farm workers and salaries not paid as per the National Minimum Wage.

Speaker, as unique as this development is to the Karoo, the recognition must align with the principle of its people, the indigenous, just like the Springbok and the Protea. It was taken from the indigenous, with no recognition.

Speaker, the NCC moves that the two departments work closely in the Karoo to avoid exploitation of workers by the farmers and the replacement of Coloured farm workers by cheap foreign labour. I thank you. †goas.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Jacobs. I recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): *Enkosi Somlomo. Somlomo.*

The ANC in the Western Cape Legislature welcomes the significant milestone achieved with the registration of Karoo Lamb as a South African geographical indication effective from October 27, 2023. This designation is not just a victory of our farmers, but a momentous step for the entire Karoo region, encompassing parts of the Northern Cape, Eastern Cape and Western Cape. We extend gratitude to the Karoo Lamb Consortium and all stakeholders who have made this achievement possible.

South Africa has several other recognised GIs, including Rooibos, Honeybush and various wine GIs. However, as we celebrate this achievement, we must also address the need for greater transformation within our agri sector, ensuring that the benefits of the GI status extend beyond a selected few. It requires a concerted effort towards the sector-wide transformation and we hope our Minister will be able to drive that.

Our focus must be on inclusive growth, ensuring that the advancements in the Karoo Lamb industry contribute to the overall upliftment of all communities involved, particularly as our member Petrus has said, the farm workers, their conditions of living and their human rights. This classification will not only protect the integrity of the name, Karoo Lamb, but also enhance its market value. The distinctive flavour profile of Karoo Lamb derived from the unique vegetation of the Nama-Karoo Biome, positions it as a premium product, both locally and internationally. Consequently, farmers can anticipate improved

farm-gate prices due to this added value.

This GI status is expected to provide a competitive edge in global markets, leveraging the renowned quality and uniqueness of Karoo Lamb to attract higher premiums. Moreover, the economic benefits of the GI classification extend beyond just higher prices. It has the potential to drive job creation and stimulate local economies within the Karoo region... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, your time has expired, please conclude.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Definitely we will be seeing a different MERO from this current situation in that region. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the hon Masipa.

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. It is widely known that Karoo Lamb is farmed exclusively within a radius of approximately 19,3 million hectares, making the geographical mapping of production easier for reference and traceability. Preserving the reputation and authenticity of this product is essential. One of the major challenges for Karoo farmers is that they require a minimum of 10 000 hectares for a viable operation to survive the harsh conditions of the Karoo.

Additionally, to qualify as a Karoo Lamb the animals must graze on specific

Karoo shrubs that give the meat its distinct taste, which other lamb varieties do not provide.

†En dit maak die vleis baie lekker! [And that makes the meat very tasty!]

Thus, the regulations and cooperation between producers, retailers and abattoirs are critical. It is crucial to list and inspect retailers and abattoirs that use the name Karoo Lamb to ensure authenticity. However, this can be a lengthy and costly process without Government and sector support.

Notably, South Africa does not have specific geographical indication legislation, but relies on the common law approach using various statutes to protect its valuable agricultural products. The current GI Regulations empower assignees appointed under the Agricultural Product Standards Act to monitor and enforce compliance with registered product specifications. These assignees are also responsible for ensuring the protection of South African GIs in trade. However, we recognise the challenges involved in this process.

Moreover, the National Department of Agriculture knows that GI registration provides producers within a defined geographical area the collective right to use the GI logo on products that meet the prescribed standards.

It also grants them the ability to prevent non-qualifying producers from using the GI logo on products not produced in the designated area or in accordance with the required standards. This helps protect the reputation of the GI from

misuse.

The question to the Minister, will the Minister kindly respond to some of these challenges and outline possible mechanisms that could assist farmers and assignees in navigating these issues and challenges?

I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Masipa. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon members who took part in this interpellation. I want to thank hon member Masipa, hon member Christians, hon member Jacobs, hon member Nkondlo and the conclusion by hon member Masipa. I get the sense that they all appreciate the value of Karoo Lamb. I get the sense that they also appreciate the contribution of farmers and the contribution of farm workers in this particular situation. I value their contributions.

†Agb Speaker, dit volg op die reputasie van 'n produk soos Karoo Lam wat beskerm moet word en een meganisme is hierdie geografiese aanduiding – *the geographical origin*.

Vir hierdie doel moet 'n produkbeskrywing wat onder meer 'n afgebakende

gebied dokumenteer, interaksie tussen die produk en die geografie, aanvaarbare produksiepraktyke, sertifiseringsprosesse, bewaring en bestuursreëlings insluit.

[Hon Speaker, it follows on the reputation of a product like Karoo Lamb that must be protected and one mechanism is this geographical indication – the geographical origin.

For this purpose a product description should include amongst others a documented demarcated area, interaction between the product and the geography, acceptable production processes, conservation and management arrangements.]

And the way this works, hon Speaker, my Department, the University of Pretoria, as well as an organisation in France have been working together since 2005 with farmers and farm workers to do a product description to develop the system and also, as hon member Masipa correctly pointed out, we had to develop a system in the absence of a regulatory framework. To put something like this in place, to develop a product of GI system and the most recent one to members of this House, was a consortium that was established by the European Union. It is called the Consortium for Karoo Lamb, and in terms of the European standards they make available €130 000 for three years for this study to be conducted and they asked that a local institution, which is my Department, make a contribution of 10% of that amount, which we have given to allow this research to happen and I am very happy that Professor Johann Kirsten from the University of Stellenbosch, the Bureau for Economic

Research, was instrumental as part of this Consortium, to get this. We have to understand that Rooibostee has now an international GI classification. Karoo Lamb has only up to now a South African GI classification. It is my intention, it is my purpose, it is my goal and it is my vision to get Karoo Lamb into the international GI classification because what that means is that on the packet, hon member Lekker, will be a sticker that will say: "EU and GI originally from the Karoo" so that the people of the Karoo, as members have asked in this House, that they must also benefit directly, not only the farmers, and this is the story.

If you want to farm and export internationally, you need SISA and VITA accreditation. The VITA and the SISA accreditation says: "Do not abuse farm workers; make sure that there are International Standards and Good Practices." You cannot export even grapes or any fruit if there are not International Standards and Best Practices in terms of how you treat your farm workers.

We will insist that that also happens with Karoo Lamb when it is internationally exported and so this is a great day for the Karoo. I want to thank all the people who did the research, the farm workers, the farmers and the Consortium.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: I want to conclude to thank people, hon member Nkondlo; excellent contribution! Thank you for recognising the great work that this product, and when I meet you again... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...the two of us will enjoy! [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Minister.

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): A lamb shank... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Order! That brings us to the end of Interpellation 2.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is not a point of order, hon Speaker, it is just a proposal to move a motion in relation to the Subject for Discussion, hon Speaker.

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I wanted to move without notice:

That the Subject for Discussion takes place immediately after the Interpellations before the Questions, given the importance of the topic at hand, in view of the fact that we still have an audience here. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Leader of the Opposition. Hon members, the Rules make provision for a motion to be moved to give precedence because the order of business is normally or it is stipulated in the Rules. With that being said, there was no request for precedence at the start of the Sitting and for that reason I am going to continue as per the Rules, the Order of the Rules dictate on the sequence of events. So we are now moving on to Questions for Oral Reply in terms of Rule 202 and I wish to remind the members that a reply, once the hon Minister has started the reply to the Oral Question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for those members who are online, and those in the House must please indicate if they wish to ask a follow-up question.

Hon members, please be reminded that there are four opportunities for follow-up questions and the first opportunity will be provided to the person posing the initial question to the Minister. Thereafter any other hon members who wish to remain, who wish to use the remaining three opportunities, must

please give me an indication.

Hon members, as per the Question Paper, Question 3 has been withdrawn.

[Interpellation 3 withdrawn.]

The SPEAKER: We then move on to Questions for Oral Reply, to New Questions, the first question, and I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, it is my understanding that there was a request to the Office of the Premier from the member that the question stands over.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Question 1 under New Questions, hon members, will stand over.

[New Questions to the Premier: Question 1 to stand over.]

The SPEAKER: We then move onto Questions Standing Over from 12 September 2024, as agreed by the House, and I recognise the hon Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism, Minister Meyer.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 12 September 2024, as agreed to by the House:

4. Mr B Petrus asked Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:

- (a) What support has his Department provided to emerging farmers in the 2023/24 financial year, and
- (b) How do farm workers benefit from this support?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Dankie, agb Speaker, en ook baie dankie aan agb Petrus dat hierdie vraag kon oorstaan. Ek het sy toestemming gevra dat hierdie vraag mag oorstaan aangesien ek verlede week ander verpligtinge gehad het by NAMPO in Bredasdorp.

Agb Speaker, aan agb Petrus, gedurende die verslagdoeningstydperk 2023/2024 het my Departement die volgende bydraes gelewer:

- Ons het ondersteuning gebied aan 13 produsente in die rooivleiskommoditeite en twee in die graankommoditeite.
- Ons het ondersteuning verskaf aan 19 Swart kommersiële produsente.
- 26 Boeredae het ek gereël en plaasadvies ook verskaf, aan 4 393 produsente is aangebied.
- Daar was ook voltooide vaardighedsoudits gedoen vir 62 landboubesighede, *so-called skills audits*.

- Agb Speaker, daarbenewens het ons ook voortgegaan met die implementering van sleutelintervensies wat daarop gemik is om opkomende produsente te ondersteun, wat insluit huishoudelike gemeenskaps- en skoolvoedingstuine. Die volgende is daar gelewer: ons het 3 930 huishoudings bygestaan met die vestiging van voedseltuine; ons het verskaf ook produksie-insette, toerusting, en infrastruktuur ook aan 41 opkomende produsente; ook ondersteuning gebied aan 142 bestaansboere met gemeenskapsvoedseltuine en ook 24 skooltuine daar gelewer wat ook dan 'n voedingsbron is vir die skool se voedingskema.
- Agb Speaker en agb Petrus, ons het ook ses voedseltuinbewustheidsveldtogte uitgevoer wat ook insluit die *so-called World Food Day* wat elke jaar op 6 Oktober plaasvind. Dit het plaasgevind by Kranshoek Sportveld in Plettenbergbaai se omgewing. Daar was ook 'n aantal deelnemers van my Landbou Opleidingskollege. And for the interest of the hon member, he is from that area, the Garden Route, this year I will have another World Food Day event which will take place this year in Uniondale.
- Agb Speaker, benewens die ondersteuning wat ons gegee het, ook dan die volhoubaarheid van werkskepping op plase tot gevolg gehad het, het ons ook 'n bydrae gelewer tot werkskepping veral in terme van ons ondersteuning van ons omvattende landbou-ondersteuningsprogram. Daardie inisiatief het gelei tot 325 permanente en 763 tydelike poste.

Altesaam het ons 1 838 individue wat opleiding ontvang het waarvan 698 onder 35 jaar oud was en waarvan omtrent 765 ook vroue was.

Dankie, agb Speaker.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker, and also thank you to hon Petrus that this question could stand over. I asked his permission that this question stand over as I had other commitments last week at NAMPO in Bredasdorp.

Hon Speaker, to hon Petrus, during the reporting period 2023/2024 my Department made the following contributions:

- we offered support to 13 producers in the red meat commodities and two in the wheat commodities.
- We provided support to 19 Black commercial producers.
- I organised 26 *Boeredae* (Farmers' days) and also provided farming advice offered to 4 393 producers.
- Completed skills audits were also done for 62 agricultural businesses, so-called skills audits.
- Hon Speaker, in addition we also continued with implementing of key

interventions to support emerging producers which include household community and school feeding gardens. The following was delivered there: we supported 3 930 households with establishing food gardens; we also provided production input, equipment, and infrastructure to 41 emerging producers; also provided support to 142 subsistence farmers with community food gardens and also to 24 schools gardens which then is a feeding source for the school's feeding scheme.

- Hon Speaker and hon Petrus, we also conducted six food garden awareness campaigns that also include the so-called World Food Day that takes place every year on 6 October. It happened at Kranshoek Sportsfield in the Plettenberg Bay area. There were also a number of participants from my Agricultural Training College.]

And for the interest of the hon member, he is from that area, the Garden Route, this year I will have another World Food Day event which will take place this year in October in Uniondale.

- [• Hon Speaker, apart from the support we provided, that also then resulted in the sustainability of job creation on farms, we also made a contribution to job creation in terms of our support of our extensive agricultural support programme. That initiative led to 325 permanent and 763 temporary posts. Altogether we had 1 838 individuals who received training of whom 698 were younger than 35 years and of whom about 765 were women.

Thank you, hon Speaker.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Minister.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.]

Hon members, hon Petrus before I recognise you, I only have an indication from hon Petrus, hon Marais, hon Masipa and hon Nkondlo. Those are the four opportunities, in that order.

Hon Petrus?

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Dankie, agb Speaker, dankie Minister. Al wat ek wil vra is dat die Minister alles wat hy nou genoem het net vir ons beskikbaar stel op skrif asseblief.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Thank you, hon Speaker, thank you, Minister. All I want to ask is that the Minister makes everything that he now mentioned available to us in writing, please.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb lid. Agb Minister?

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister?]

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Agb Speaker, ek doen dit met die grootste liefde, ek sal einde van die dag of môreoggend sal ek hierdie net oortik, want ek het nou op dit geskryf, dan sal ek dit aan die agb lid verskaf met die grootste plesier.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Hon Speaker, I will do it with the greatest pleasure, at the end of the day or tomorrow morning I will just retype this, because I have now written on it, then I will provide it to the hon member with the greatest pleasure.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Minister.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.]

I recognise the hon Marais.

†Mnr G P MARAIS (FFP): Baie dankie, Minister, vir die inligting. Ek wou net geweet het, agb Minister, in terme van die ontluikende boere, of daar uitvoermarkte is waar daar wel 'n suksesstorie is, in terme van die koppeling van 'n nuwe jong man wat begin boer het en hy het 'n uitvoermark gekry in terme van die ondersteuning wat die Departement aan hom gegee het. Het ons so 'n suksesstorie om te vertel?

[Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, Minister, for the information. I just wanted to know, hon Minister, in terms of the emerging farmers, whether there are export markets where there is indeed a success story, in terms of the link of a new young man who has started farming and he found an export market in terms of the support that the Department has provided him with. Do we have such a success story to tell?]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. Hon Minister?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Agb Speaker, daar is verskeie voorbeelde want my visie is om nie net ontluikende boere te vestig nie, maar ook opkomende kommersiële boere sodat hulle internasionaal mededingend hulle produkte kan bemark. Daar is verskeie voorbeelde daarvan.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon Speaker, there are several examples because my vision is not also emerging commercial farmers so that they can competitively market their products internationally. There are several examples of that.]

There are now persons and a delegation will be led by one of my staff members who will soon go to Shanghai in China. Two years ago I went with some farmers from the Western Cape to promote their wine in Maputo. Our products are there. There is also an emerging farmer in Ceres. He is also producing deciduous fruit, also being exported.

If you want a list of all those farmers, emerging Black farmers, who are now exporting to the rest of the world, hon member, Speaker, I am happy to bring to this House or directly to the member a list of those Black commercial farmers who were initially emerging farmers, to become commercial farmers. We have also now seen some women entrepreneurs. Black and Coloured women are now exporting to the United States and to Europe. I facilitated also an engagement with SANEC, which is the South African - Netherlands Chamber of Commerce, from my interaction with the gentleman, Mr Mark

Achten Den Bos, facilitated also that the Black lady exports also wine to Europe. So we have a number of such cases, but I am happy to bring a detailed list to this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Masipa.

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, for the love of agriculture, can the Minister provide details on how the Government, your Democratic Alliance Government, in collaboration with the commodity sector, is working together to benefit both farmers and farm workers?

I thank you, Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A good question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Minister, just a reminder, and hon members, that you are allowed one follow-up question and not multiple follow-ups when you do your follow-up question. Hon Minister, I will not dictate to you how you answer that, but hon members, please note, you are entitled to one follow-up question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker, you are now defending me so I can pick and choose what I want from that particular question and I exercise that

parliamentary democratic right, right now. I want to respond, I choose the easiest one. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Obviously, that is the nature of the game. So the one that I choose is what is my Department doing in terms of using the commodity approach to also empower other people in this industry.

Well, this is a unique approach. It does not happen anywhere else, in my Department, in this Western Cape Province, we use the commodity approach to empower emerging Black farmers, so if you are in the apple industry, we use the apple industry through Hortgro, for example, and let empowerment happen through Hortgro; White commercial farmers the same commodity, the same industry, mentor, and then we come in and say, let us prepare you for the market.

That is the commodity approach. We use it also in Vinpro, which is the wine industry, we get you a winemaker, in fact there are numerous examples of people who are exporting wine who do not even have a wine farm. That is my goal. I do not want people... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Everybody wants land, and then with all the disasters and the floods, so I want people to rather buy the grapes, we supply them with bottles. We assist them with the labels. We assist them with the market and, boom, there your bank account balloons. That is what I want to do and in that process, we use Vinpro. We use winemakers. We use mentors and that exponentially put your product through the commodity approach in the right trajectory so that is exactly what we do.

In the meat industries the same; we use the RPO, the Red-meat Producing Organisation. In winemaking, we use the same; we use Hortgro, so the commodity approach is not a generic approach. It is a sector-specific approach and through mentorship, through skills, through blended finance, Land Bank, the Jobs Fund, National Treasury and my Department's support.

I want to focus more on getting Black farmers their products internationally on the market. Now how do you do that?

Every year I take people to the Netherlands into Rotterdam to see the global value chain. I take people to Germany to see the global food logistical hub so that they can network with people and that network facilitates also this international trade relation. So, hon member, the commodity approach does not exist anywhere in South Africa. We pioneered it. We are the role model. We are ready to export it to the other eight provinces. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Enkosi somlomo.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you to hon member Nkondlo. The question is relevant. We had severe rains, severe storms. We had four floods last year. But thanks for the great assistance, to my Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs. Through his work we do a diagnostic assessment. We do assessments on the farms. When there is rain he immediately activates a JOC, bringing all the role players together and in terms of the farmers specifically, we put the farmers in the JOC. Minister Bredell allowed the farmers to be present in the JOC so that they do not get second-hand and third-hand information. They get first-hand information in the JOC and based on that information; we also, and sometimes it is very difficult to visit the farm when it is under flood. You cannot go in with the car. So my Department has made available an app so where people can then on their farm take photos, and then we coordinate it. When it is better, we go in to see that we do a proper verification of what has happened on the farm and through my state-owned company, Casidra; we visit these farmers to see to what extent we can use the conditional grants to provide the necessary assistance.

My first priority when there is a flood is the safety, the people, and that is also the methodology of Minister Bredell when he then distributes the

resources to make sure the first prize is lives of people. Second is also the safety of – in my case – livestock on the farms. In some cases when animals need to be transferred to other areas we provide some of that assistance through Casidra, and so with big rains, the best thing we can do, and we do it, it is not after the fact, because once you are flooded and everything is under water and your animals and livestock have died, it is a little bit too late.

What we recommend and we give that advice during rainy seasons, we know the patterns of climate change are evolving all the time, so one of the things we have regularly with our farmers are information days, programmes to mitigate the risk. We indicate where they must plant, for example, at least when a flood comes how you need to lay out your farm. We do proper farm planning for our farmers.

Obviously when things are very difficult and tough, we try to assist through Casidra. Many times it is things like you have just planted, the seeds are gone. We assist with the seeds. Sometimes your fencing is gone. We assist the farmer with the fencing and this happens on a continuous basis, but here is the thing: climate change is now permanently part of everybody's business and that is why, hon member, the Premier has just left now this afternoon to visit New York, part of the Global Climate Change Interventions. We are also part of the Mediterranean Climate Action Programme, where we are locked into the COP28 and that is drawing down many funding because many of our farmers actually need funding. But we believe in the redesign of the farm but

also particularly, my heart bleeds when an emerging farmer begins a farm; he had just planted and the rain comes and washes everything away and in that case it is very difficult. Not everybody has what we call also "crop insurance" but I am happy to report, hon member Nkondlo, the Minister of Local Government has now gone to the Cabinet and he said this is no longer on. Where we face major disasters he has now brought the proposal to the Cabinet and say he will now initiate a discussion with all the insurance companies because they must come to the table when there are major floods and disasters. The Government will never have all the money to cover the depth of these disasters, but it is in the business of insurance companies, and there are certain proposals which the Minister will table and I have also had some discussions with my Chairperson of the Standing Committee who has some knowledge about these types of insurance and I am happy to learn more, because my heart bleeds when I see what farmers are going through and their workers and the destruction. But, I want the National Department also to inspect all the farms that are in the Western Cape, because some of the dam levels broke and the Minister has received a report from the National Minister about the dam and the consequences and the risk. But I am so glad the GNU is working. Instead of pointing fingers the National Minister came and said: "Let us take hands and try jointly to fix this." [Interjection.]

For the first time there was acceptance of accountability. It never happened in the last 30 years. Accept accountability, join hands and work together and I think the hon member Nkondlo is so happy that the Government of National Unity is delivering for the people of the Western Cape. [Applause.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: GNU!

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members!

An HON MEMBER: But you are still clapping for 1910 policies.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon members, that concludes Question 4 on the Question Paper. We move on to Question 5, and I recognise the hon Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism, Minister Meyer.

5. *Mr B Petrus asked Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:*

What is the impact of illegal foreigners on the labour market, with specific reference to the sectors of agriculture, construction and domestic work?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Ja, agb Petrus, hierdie is 'n baie sensitiewe saak. Dit is 'n baie komplekse saak want dit handel oor onwettige immigrante, maar hierdie vraag handel nie net oor onwettige immigrante in die landbousektor nie. Dit

handel ook met onwettige immigrante. Prinsipieel strategies, hierdie Kabinet is verbind tot die regstaat.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes, hon Petrus, this is a very sensitive matter. It is a very complex matter because it deals with illegal immigrants, but this question does not only deal with illegal immigrants in the agricultural sector. It also deals with illegal immigrants. Principally strategically, this Cabinet is committed to the legal state.]

The rule of law. Anybody that enters the Western Cape, that enters South Africa must come through the legal ways and means. But we know the facts, we know the history. I have documents here of showing the patterns of illegal foreign nationals. So I have convened a working group, together with the industry, and we have done, to say, what are the system and processes that deal with what we call "undocumented foreign nationals."

We looked into this and we have also brought Agri Western Cape to the table. Agri Western Cape has also spoken to all their farmers to make sure that we have only people working in the sector that are legally here. I think I am so happy that the National Minister of Home Affairs is working now also with this situation, but I personally went to see our borders. I went to Lesotho, absolutely no borders. People walk over the stuff, and this is the risk.

If you want to deal with foreign illegal immigrants, the first order of business is to make sure that you have a proper Border Management Authority, better

policing and work with international organisations and see that you can facilitate it.

The question directly was what is the impact? Obviously it will have a major impact in different aspects, in different spheres, because what we see, in 2011 Minister Bredell had to deal with the issue of xenophobia, for example, foreign nationals, legal and illegal clashing. We believe in the rule of law. We want people to enter South Africa legally, legitimately and make a contribution.

I do not subscribe to Donald Trump that wants to build a wall to keep people out. Your heart must be open for people who want to be legitimately, legally within our rule of law, being accommodated. There are many people, irrespective of where they come from, they can add value. But I think there is a trend and a pattern that we have seen in South Africa that things are now getting out of control and I think, hon member, there are also norms and standards about undocumented forced migrants.

I have also a report to show what the international norm is, and I think our situation is now above the international norm in terms of a specific number of people that are illegally in the country. So I am now calling on this House to assist us through research, evidence and data so that we get people in the country legally and I welcome them who are legally in this country, because what we are not wanting to see is that things are going out of control and that people who are also illegally in the country, they are a risk and the risk of

illegal people have been well documented in the research document. The question is: what is that risk?

Here is the risk, documented from people who are illegally in South Africa and they are causing trouble and this is the trouble they cause. We have to be frank, we have to be open and we have to be direct.

The research indicates, not all but some foreign nationals that are illegally in the country are busy with drug trafficking. They are busy with smuggling of abalone, crayfish, prostitution, smuggling of arms, car theft.

The Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety gets regular reports through the Police and Intelligence Services. This is a crisis, but we have to deal with this crisis within the framework of the rule of law. We have been elected to this Parliament to act responsibly, and so this calls for a responsible debate in this House but also this calls for maturity and leadership in redefining our national legislation, because there is a legislative vacuum that is currently being abused, and we must make sure that we do not ignite xenophobia, but we must also make sure that we do not allow people to abuse citizens of this country. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Petrus.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Baie dankie, Speaker. Baie dankie, Minister. Eerstens, dankie dat u erken dat ons hier te doen het met 'n krisis. Ek wil

kom by die punt van die oorsake. Nou die meerderheid van Bruin en Swart mense in die provinsie het nie plase nie, het ook nie geboue nie, het nie eiendomme nie. Nou sekerlik is daar mense, beland hier onwettige immigrante by daai geboue, hulle maak besigheid daar. Hulle slaap daar. Hulle betaal daarso. Iemand kry die inkomste. Die eienaar van die gebou kry die inkomste. Die eienaar van die... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Thank you, Speaker. Thank you, Minister. Firstly, thank you that you acknowledge that we here are dealing with a crisis. I want to get to the point of the causes. Now the majority of Brown and Black people in the province do not have farms, also do not have buildings, do not have properties. Now certainly there are people, illegal immigrants geet to these buildings, they conduct business there. They sleep there. They pay there. Someone receives the income. The owner of the building gets the income. The owner of the ... [Interjection.]]

†Die SPEAKER: Agb lid, ek wil u net herinner dat u nie nodig het om u vraag te motiveer nie, maar dat u 'n opvolgvraag aan die Minister kan stel.

[The SPEAKER: Hon member, I just want to remind you that you do not have to motivate your question, but that you can pose a follow-up question to the Minister.]

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Baie dankie, Speaker. Ek wil weet, wat is in plek om diegene wie hulle skuldig maak om onwettige immigrante toe te laat om onwettig besigheid en werk te doen op hul plase, op hul geboue, waar ook al hulle is, wat hulle ook al besit, te bekamp? Wat is in plek gestel deur hierdie

Regering, hierdie Wes-Kaapse Regering, om dit te bekamp? Indien nie, volg ek op dat ons daadwerklik iets moet doen om hierdie situasie aan te spreek.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Thank you, Speaker. I want to know, what is in place to deal with those who are guilty of allowing illegal immigrants to illegally conduct business and work on their farms, on their buildings, wherever they are, whatever they possess? What was put in place by this Government, this Western Cape Governemnt, to deal with this? If not, I follow up that we have to actively do something to address this situation.]

†Die SPEAKER: Weereens, agb Minister, lede kan een opvolgvraag vra en nie byvoegings by die vraag plaas nie, so Minister, ek gaan nie vir u voorskryf hoe u moet antwoord nie. Net weereens 'n herinnering aan die lede.

[The SPEAKER: Again, hon Minister, members can ask one follow-up question and not place additions with the question, so Minister, I'm not going to prescribe to you how you should reply. Just again a reminder to the members.]

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Weereens, agb Speaker, baie dankie aan agb Petrus. Ek dink hy is korrek, hier is 'n krisis.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Again, hon Speaker, thank you to hon Petrus. I think he is correct, there is a crisis here.]

The first law of politics, if you want to make progress, acknowledge there is

a crisis; then you can move on. If you duck and dive, do not acknowledge, then you cannot make progress. So the first law of politics, accept there is a problem and let us see how we can proceed.

I am deeply concerned. I was in Johannesburg, for example, earlier this year. I went to that road that was blown up and I went there and I saw some buildings.

I said: "What is this?" They told me: "These are all hijacked buildings." I said by whom? They say: "By illegal foreign nationals. They squat in the buildings." I said: "But how is this possible? Where are your building regulations? Where are your building inspectors? Where is the..."

This was in Johannesburg, the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department. There was absolutely no law enforcement. This is an economic crime that you refer to, people squatting in buildings and collecting rent. This is a mafia operation.

You will have now seen that the Government of National Unity is now making these mafias a top priority of people that annexed a building that does not belong to them. You cannot go to any of these foreign countries and decide to hijack a building and live comfortably and use water, use electricity, and you do not pay, because this is the situation. This speaks to the depth of our need to maintain law and order.

In fact, the first function of a government from historical days is, even before collecting tax, is the safety of the citizens. Tax is second. Firstly is the safety and I think we have found now an agreement in South Africa, there is consensus.

Also, with the National Police Commissioner, the Provincial Police Commissioner, you would have seen what the Police Commissioner is doing in KZN. He said: "In my province there will be law and order." And I think this matter is now receiving proper attention.

I am sad, saddened when I hear the National Minister of Public Works speak and say there are more than 800 buildings belonging to the National Department that have been hijacked. This is completely unacceptable. It is an economic crime and Minister Marais has prioritised economic crime together with the Provincial Commissioner. So what is being done, this is now something that will receive more resources in this Government, but also within the South African Police.

The days of people hijacking buildings, using municipal water and electricity and not paying, are over. This is a clear warning from this Parliament to them that their days are numbered. The police, the resources from both the City, all the municipalities, Minister Marais, their days are numbered and if you know of any such incidences, hon member, please bring it under the attention of Minister Marais and I can guarantee you she is working around the clock to make sure that we deal with economic crime. It is completely unacceptable

that people can use these buildings.

But, hon member, in conclusion, I am so happy that the National Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure is now on record. He said those buildings will be cleaned out and many of those buildings for which we pay tax, are standing empty, it is open for abuse by drug lords and other people. It will now be sold off so that we do not have buildings that stand empty in South Africa. People pay tax and there is no value, so the concept of creating public value will now become paramount and this is not something that is going to happen overnight, but you flagged the issue. It is receiving major attention. The days are numbered. We are not going to accept it. Just close-by here, many years ago, there was a building here, hijacked. It was cleaned out by the City of Cape Town. That trend is going to continue faster than any time in history before.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. The next speaker will be hon members Ngqentsu, Masipa and Nkondlo. Those are the four opportunities.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Ja, thank you very much, Speaker. Given the impact of the use of undocumented foreign nationals, as also described, what have you done in confronting both farm and construction bosses in the Cederberg belt, Ceres, Grabouw and across the province, right, who are using undocumented foreign nationals as cheap labour for super profit beyond limitations?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon Speaker, the hon member has now referred, what have I done in certain specific areas in terms of undocumented foreign nationals?

I would like to receive that and I am happy to come back with that detailed information as I do not have it right now. [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): You are so predictable.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But what I have done, hon Speaker, I have brought all the farmers and the farmer's associations together, together with Home Affairs, the South African Police Services and there were some other people that I brought together and Home Affairs and the United Nations High Commissioner of Refugees, the international body that deals with migrant workers. We brought them together and said: "Listen here, this is a mess. How do we create a framework?" And what my Department has subsequently done, based on that workshop, we developed a protocol so that these things that the hon member has spoken about do not happen, but he asked me some specific areas for which I do not have the answer right now.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. Hon Masipa – is that a

point of order, hon member?

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Yes.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): The question which was posed here...

The SPEAKER: Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): It is in respect, I mean, to suggest that it is only specific, yet the question indicated that in the agricultural sector, yet Cederberg is part of the heartland of agriculture.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, that ... [Interjection.]

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): So he is out of order for not being able to respond.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, that is not a point of order. The Minister has made a commitment and he will come back to the House. Hon Masipa?

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, once again for the love of agriculture. Minister, you are known for saying, use science data and evidence to make decisions. The Democratic Alliance, the party you belong

to, is an evidence-based party. Now that the DA is in the Government of National Unity, Minister, how do you intend to collaborate to bring fairness in the labour market for the employed and the unemployed while dealing with the unfairness and irregularities in the job market? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is a very good question.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, again, hon members, I do not need assistance at the Chair. Hon Minister, again, that question I am not going to dictate how you respond. It is up to you.

Hon members, for the last couple of Sittings I have reminded members about the Rules; how you pose your questions. I have asked that the Table Staff engage members on how to pose these questions in order, within the parameters of the parliamentary mechanisms available to you. [Interjections.] I do not want to stifle debate and accountability, but members, I please ask that you work with me. Hon Minister, you may continue. [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Just rise above, and do not respond.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon member, thank you for your contribution. Hon Speaker, I listen to this question. This question has three dimensions. The first dimension deals with data, evidence and science as a form of our decision-making.

The second dimension of his question deals with, how do I see the Government of National Unity can make a contribution, and the third dimension is a more complex one in terms of the fairness and the labour law and the practices and how this will work in the different sectors.

I will now restrict, as you suggested, I want to restrict myself to the first dimension. As you said I can choose, and I choose data and science.

Hon Speaker, within the context of the National Government of National Unity, the President and hon member Lekker will then appreciate it, if she can listen, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, [Interjections.] please speak to me. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon Speaker, I hope hon member Lekker is listening because her President, my President, spoke about the three priorities of the Government of National Unity.

Hon member Lekker will know that the President spoke about building an inclusive economy. Hon member Lekker will know that the President spoke about let us deal with the issue of poverty. Hon member Lekker will know that the third priority was focusing on building a capable State.

One of the principles of building a capable State is to have a governance architecture that says be data-led evidence-based governance. Not just wake up one morning and then grab an idea untested, and even in the case with the discussion on undocumented foreign nationals, let us get the data, let us get the science, the numbers of people, where they come from, why they come and let the data-led governs.

This Government is now facing a major fiscal crisis. The Minister of Finance is now dealing and unpacking the fiscal implications using data, science and evidence, looking at the best formula. The hon Minister of DCAS asked yesterday in the Cabinet that we look at the reconfiguration of the Conditional Grants. Those will all be subjected to scientific evidence-based Government practise. When you do that you maximise your efficiency, you create greater value and so that is the situation.

I think the second dimension that speaks to the Government of National Unity; we now have an unique opportunity to no longer point fingers of who did something wrong 10 years ago, 15 years ago, because that simply does not help us, and we are now driven by a philosophy that says honour the past, but live in the future, and I think the Government of National Unity says what happened in the past is there. The election came, the election gave the people a mandate and I am so happy that hon member Nkondlo is agreeing that we must look into the future, working together, strengthening society and stop petty ideological debates, but rather focus on how do we strengthen

the Government of National Unity so that her children and my children can have a better life. [Interjections.] I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, thank you, hon Speaker, and I think we once again, through you, hon Speaker, welcome that there is an engagement with Agri Western Cape to deal with the matter in terms of the agri sector and hopefully we will get the report, and when Minister speaks about research I am sure actually there is anecdotal evidence in all the sectors. You can walk in the Waterfront now and go to a restaurant for that Karoo Lamb. You will find illegal foreign nationals. [Interjections.]

I think, hon Minister, my question is ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He indulges.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...in your research that you were punting here, has your research revealed what is known by an ordinary person in the street that what drives this employment of illegal foreigners by industry in particular, is cheap labour and what could be termed apartheid labour conditions, where people are enslaved, they work in conditions that are beyond what is regulated.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, I wish to remind you ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): So that is my question, whether ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ...you do not need to motivate your question.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...your research ...

The SPEAKER: You can just pose your question. In the interest of consistency for everyone please just pose your question. No need to motivate.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Does your research actually confirm what is there and is known by everyone of what drives this industry itself?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon member Nkondlo always ask intelligent questions, so I will give an intelligent answer.

I think, hon member Nkondlo, there was an article that was published also in a journal about “Heading for Canaan: A reflection on illegal migration in South Africa”, and in this article, in terms of the specific question, is what is

driving this and you actually put a second question.

Are there ways, disparities that fuel this in terms of employment? Well, the argument in this research is confirming your hypothesis that there is a depressing effect on wage levels, so this confirms your statement that you just made.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the question, Question 5 as printed on the Question Paper.

We move on to Question 7 and I recognise the hon Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, Minister Bredell.

7. Mr D W Bryant to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

How does poor financial management in a municipality impact its ability to (a) plan effectively for and (b) respond to potential disasters?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for asking the question.

Poor financial management in any municipality has a huge negative impact on planning and responding to disasters.

The part (a) of the question, plan effectively for potential disasters. Poor financial management, inadequate budget allocations for disaster risk reduction, inefficient investment in critical infrastructure and inadequate human capacity negatively impact disaster risk reductions and preparedness.

Hon Speaker, the amendment to the Disaster Management Act, Act 57 of 2002, acknowledges the need for adequate capacity at the municipal level and the lack of adequate disaster management resources remains a challenge.

The appointment of a dedicated disaster management manager impacts the municipality's ability to carry out the necessary disaster management planning as required by the Disaster Management Act and to coordinate major incidents and/or disasters effectively.

Hon Speaker, furthermore, poor financial management in municipalities significantly impact the municipality's ability to reduce the impact of disasters through proactive measures. It is not sustainable for municipalities to implement disaster management reactively. Rather they should be implementing proactive disaster management through disaster risk reduction measures undertaken by sector departments.

Disaster risk reduction is the responsibility of all departments and this should

be budgeted for and included in their operational activities. Such measures can include the awareness campaigns to inform communities about their risk and how to prevent these risks.

Secondly, infrastructure projects, structural mitigation, for example, increasing the size of bridges and culverts to prevent damage during flood events; installation of gabions to prevent erosion; preparedness planning, including seasonal preparedness; clearing of stormwater drainage, etcetera, early warning systems, river maintenance plans, etcetera, are crucial for longer term sustainability.

The part (b) of hon member Bryant's question, responding to potential disasters. Inefficient emergency funding delays disaster response, placing more pressure on the Western Cape Government to assist in coordinating disasters which increase community risk and vulnerability to disasters.

In addition, the poor financial management lead to inadequate budgeting for first responders, such as the fire and rescue services, leaving already vulnerable communities more vulnerable to disasters. Without the necessary trained staff and sufficient resources, many lives are likely to be lost during disasters.

Hon Speaker, the Department supports municipalities and builds resilience and capacity through various disaster risk reduction and capacity building projects. To strengthen the provincial institutional arrangement, the

Provincial Disaster Management Advisory Forum meetings adopted a hybrid approach to facilitate collaboration, coordination and partnerships, while minimising travel cost. The Advisory Forum meetings aim to advise on impending risks and integrate efforts to reduce the impact of disasters.

The Department also provides support to municipalities in updating or developing disaster management and seasonal plans that integrate preparedness and response.

In a further demonstration of our commitment, the Department provides financial support to district municipalities and municipalities to build Disaster Management and Fire Services capacities through various programmes, namely enabling them to appoint seven Disaster Management interns.

As the Province continues to face the challenges of compound disasters, there is an increased need for well-funded Disaster Management functions at a local level. This is critical to effectively plan and respond to disaster incidences and minimise the impact on our communities, critical infrastructure as well as the environment. I thank you.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon member who posed the question. Do you have a follow-up, hon member Bryant?

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for that very, very comprehensive response.

Hon Minister, just to follow on from your response, in cases where municipalities are financially distressed and are unable to respond effectively to disasters, what role can the Provincial Government play in stepping in to assist them to avert potential humanitarian or infrastructural crises?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for the follow-up.

It is a very important question, it is something that we grapple with a lot because normally the financial distressed municipalities are also less dense. Our population growth, our economic growth areas, City of Cape Town, Stellenbosch, Drakenstein, George, Mossel Bay, Saldanha Bay, those municipalities.

It is also those municipalities that need a lot of resources so that we can protect lives as well as property, because if a disaster hits them obviously it is dense, so to move people around becomes crucial, but it is also for us very important during our – or let me just give a step back.

I think what we have done successfully was also to pull together a risk

profile of the province and the risk register so that we can understand the kinds of risks that we need to prepare for and to deal with long-term.

So we have started with Climate Change 2010, the preparedness, the training of staff, etcetera, and today we can see the impact of climate change and how we actually need to scale up and step up. We are far from where we should be, but if we have not done it we would have lost a lot of lives.

Then in 2014 we have started with an international grouping with international training on building collapse, and I think people thought are we mad, why do you do that? Because normally our province are prone to fires and floods, but when the George building collapsed, you could have seen the investment, international training, investing in equipment, as well as in people, and through that investment we have saved a lot of lives and we can stand very proud and be very proud of our Disaster Management and rescue workers.

On your smaller municipality, I think before I get to the smaller municipality, it is also important to understand our transport corridors, the N1, the N2. If you drive those roads you will see more and more you get petroleum and chemical trucks, etcetera, and something that we are very worried about.

So we have started a HAZMAT team for the N1 and we are now busy building the HAZMAT team for the N2, and through that you also build capacity in

your smaller towns along that corridor, like in Laingsburg, in Prince Albert and Beaufort West, which will be the main hub for the unit, as well as on the N2, directly to the municipalities, to the smaller capacity municipalities since 2015.

We have started 2015 with the project, where our own Disaster Management people designed a smaller kind of fire truck and they build it in modules so that if the truck is in an accident that you can just replace the module on the truck, and also it is a normal Isuzu or Ford or Datsun truck that you can service within the smaller town so that they do not have to send the truck all the way to Cape Town to get it serviced, etcetera, and we as a province, our Disaster Management people with the City of Cape Town, design those trucks and we then started to budget for that.

So from the period round about 2015 to 2020 we have provided 62 fire trucks to smaller municipalities, to municipalities where there was an urgent need and also about 20 of that fleet were bakkies, because as we started to roll out the smaller trucks we also realised that you actually need a smaller vehicle to get quicker to households, because these smaller towns they are also further away from big towns, so you need capacity within those municipalities.

So we then started with the bakkie concept with a very good pump and if they can connect they can get very quickly to a household, etcetera. Unfortunately with COVID we had to stop in about 2001 with that programme, but being able to help the municipalities to build that 60 trucks

capacity throughout this province, helped us also with the relationship between the municipalities, the MOU, to understand that when your municipality is in trouble you can rely on a neighbouring municipality to come and support you. That was crucial for us to get that right and I think we have built that capacity through working with the smaller municipalities and the City of Cape Town.

We also use the expertise within the City of Cape Town and the secondary cities for training and getting people in from smaller municipalities, because looking back round about 2010, I think 15% of the firemen were trained and had the right skills within this province, and none of us will want to take the responsibility. We never want to lose a rescue worker, but the responsibility is on our shoulders to at least see to it that they get the right training and the right equipment to do their jobs because they save our lives.

So I think through these systems we have built a lot of goodwill, a lot of capacity within the smaller municipalities and obviously we are under financial strain and it is going to be difficult because Government must find the right balance, but we need to keep on investing in our people and helping and supporting our smaller municipalities, because population growth put pressure on the system, as well as economic growth and we are committed to keep on building this capacity within the province. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Minister, in light of, I think, this question about responding to potential disasters and your response, which is more, I think, building capacity to treat when the disaster is there, one is entrusted to check whose role it is to actually do disaster mapping that will actually assist more forecasting and forward planning, to rather prevent than actually build capacity to have to deal with these disasters in these municipalities? Thanks.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Chair, I hope I got the question right, because we do both.

Obviously you can do as much as possible to prevent any disaster, but when climate change will hit us, we will never have all the resources in the world, but we do communicate a lot and our municipalities understand it through our various training programmes, etcetera, for instance, the Winter Clearing Programme. Before every winter we send it out, they clear their stormwater, they get ready for it and, yes, we can say but in some instances it did not work. It is also to do with education of the public because in some stormwater areas, in Drakenstein especially, a double bed mattress was thrown in the stormwater and that blocked the stormwater and then it causes chaos, but also working with institutions like weather services, and I can tell you that I am worried as I stand here, because over the years we also neglected to invest in weather services.

So we are busy talking to our National Government to see how we can start to invest in weather services, because also it is important for us to manage fires when we enter into a difficult fire season. Remember last December 9 000 fires burning over 130 000 hectares. It is huge and to be ready for that you actually need very accurate weather predictions. Wind conditions play a huge role, especially in our mountainous areas. If we, and if the rescue workers do not know when the wind is going to change, their lives are under huge pressure or risk.

So I am very worried that we have not over the years and that we will need to now step up through the Government of National Unity to get together and say, "Listen, it is time that we do rebuild the capacity of predictions."

Then obviously in our Department we do a lot in the Disaster Centre and I think the Standing Committee visited the centre. We plot where the high risk areas are and we prepare for that.

So we will hire in resources, it will be about eight helicopters and four planes. We will hire them in and we have got 36 landing strips throughout the province where we will place them according to pre-data that will tell us last year this area burned, so most likely it would not burn this year.

So we take the older vegetation and we put the planes closer to those areas because it is all about responding, responding times, etcetera. So there are various aspects, but again I think the Standing Committee visited the centre

and I think they have got a very good sense on how we manage and how we plan for this.

Also on flooding, if they design it and provide assistance that I think we can all be proud of because our own people designed it, our own IT in the Disaster Centre also designed a system that if weather services tell us that they expect 50 millimetres of rain tomorrow in Drakenstein, we can put it in a computer and it will plot you exactly which areas you must vacate because it is going to flood. It also helps the municipalities to protect the infrastructure. They can remove pumps, etcetera, that stands within that.

Obviously with our scenarios and our informal settlements that are close to water courses, there is still a huge risk and it is a long-term programme that we will need to put on the table to safeguard their lives as well. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. That is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.

We will now afford political parties to provide the House with the Members' Statements. I will recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr M BOOYSEN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Over the past weeks we have heard much regarding budget shortfalls both within our Province and across the national and provincial spheres. It has become clear that our Province is severely short-changed by National Government and that our frontline services tend to suffer as a result.

There is a definite limit to what our Province and our country can afford and yet we see National Government continuing to forge ahead with policies and priorities which we simply cannot justify financially.

As the Standing Committee Chairperson of Health, I am deeply concerned regarding the implementation of the National Health Insurance Act and what it will do to our Province financially.

A recent report from the United Kingdom indicated that that country's National Health Service will require an additional £38 billion per year to continue, a figure that equates to a staggering R883 billion. While not directly comparable, this figure gives some idea of the cost of the model National Government hopes to introduce to our country. A cost which even wealthy countries cannot afford.

Today I urge all members of this House to join me in asking National Government to consider the effect which this disastrous policy will have on our doctors, nurses and patients. Universal health coverage is a noble goal, but not if it collapses the very system which is designed to support.

The National Health Insurance Act in its current form is not a means to get South Africa to universal health coverage. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Booysen. I note the ANC.

†Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Agb Speaker, hierdie week het ek die geleentheid gehad om my kollega, agb Ngqentsu, te vergesel na Durbanville Kliniek.

Die ontbrekende algemene publieke gesondheidsdienste in Klipheuwel en omliggende plaasgemeenskappe van Durbanville, Fisantekraal en Kraaifontein, het sterk aan die lig gekom.

Eerstens was die lyne verskriklik lank buite die kliniek en daar was nie veel beweging na binne nie. Ons ou mense, verswakte sorg pasiënte en kindertjies het vir ure gewag om basiese gesondheidsdiens te verkry. Hierdie verskynsel is geheel en al onaanvaarbaar. Ons mense verdien beter en het die reg tot tydige en toeganklike gesondheidsdienste sonder hierdie onnodige vertragings.

Agb Speaker, die oorsaak van hierdie uitdagings is as gevolg van die ernstige tekort aan gesondheidspersoneel. In Klipheuwel was dit skokkend om te verneem dat alle pasiënte net een keer per maand gesien word. Die tekort aan gereelde kliniekbesoeke onderwerp ons mense aan die risiko van snel

agteruitgaande kondisie en dit is kritiek dat ons die erns van hierdie saak identifiseer, want mense se lewens is op die spel.

Bygevoeg, is die mobiele kliniek wat Klipheuwel dien een keer per maand sonder 'n dokter, en dat dit nie effektief genoeg is nie. Die mense wat werk deur die dag het nie toegang tot hierdie diens nie, want hulle werkgewers weier om hulle af te gee.

Dit is veral 'n probleem vir diegene wat afhanklik is van kroniese medikasie. Hierdie mense is geforseer om dikwels lang afstande te reis, wat nie altyd prakties moontlik is nie, en ek kan aflei dat hulle die ontvangs van maandelikse medikasie mis en sodoende gaan hulle gesondheid agteruit en moontlik sterf van hulle.

Agb Minister van Gesondheid, ek versoek u asseblief om dringende aksie te neem in die geval van Klipheuwel, Durbanville en Kraaifontein Daghositaal. Ons gemeenskappe verdien beter gesondheidsdienste. Ons benodig ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hon Speaker, this week I had the opportunity to accompany my colleague, hon Ngqentsu, to Durbanville Clinic.

The general public health services lacking in Klipheuwel and surrounding areas of Durbanville, Fisantekraal and Kraaifontein, came strongly to light.

eFirstly the queues were very long outside the clinic and there was not much

much movement to the inside. Our old people, ailing care patients and children waited for hours to receive basic health service. This phenomenon is totally unacceptable. Our people deserve better and have the right to timely and accessible health services without the unnecessary delays.

Hon Speaker, the cause of these challenges is as a result of the serious shortage of health staff. In Klipheuwel it was shocking to learn that all patients were only attended to once a month. The shortage of regular clinic visits exposes our people to the risk of rapid deteriorating conditions and it is critical that we identify the seriousness of this matter, because people's lives are at stake.

In addition, the mobile clinic servicing Klipheuwel is without a doctor once a month, and that is definitely not effective enough. The people who work through the day do not have access to this service, because their employers refuse to give them off.

It is especially a problem for those who are dependent on chronic medicine. These people are forced to travel long distances, which is not always possible, and I can gather that they miss the receipt of monthly medication and thus their health deteriorates and possibly some of them die.

Hon Minister of Health, I ask you to please take urgent action in the case of Klipheuwel, Durbanville and Kraaifontein Day Hospital. Our communities deserve better health services. We need ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon member.

Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC):...’n omvattende plan om die personeeltekort te benader, om personeelbywoning te verbeter en mobiele klinieke te verskaf op ’n meer gereelde basis vir diegene wie dit die meeste nodig het.

Kom ons werk saam ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC):...an extensive plan to address the staff shortage, to improve staff attendance, and to provide mobile clinics on a more regular basis to those who need it the most.

Let us work together ...[Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

†Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ...om seker te maak dat die mense van Kraaifontein ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ...to ensure that the people of Kraaifontein ...[Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have allowed – hon member, please be seated. I have allowed you to complete that sentence.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are starting a new sentence. I now recognise the PA. [Interjections.]

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the current crisis in the Education Department highlights a dire need for attention and action, particularly regarding the lack of access for local learners to schools in their own communities.

Today I want to bring to the forefront the stories of two young learners from Kraaifontein, Nayam Pienaar and Carl Paulse. Carl Paulse, a 10-year-old, has never stepped foot inside a classroom due to limited space at the local school in his area. Similarly, Nayam Pienaar, a 12-year-old, faces a significant challenge after the board of Jan Kriel School for special need learners deemed him capable of attending mainstream education. Despite living across the street from a school, he was denied admission because there was no space. This rejection came while foreign nationals were able to enrol their children in the same institution.

Nayam's mother, struggling financially, was forced to place him in a private school and has since accrued over R30 000 in arrears. The Legal Department is now threatening to prevent Nayam from returning to classes until the fees are paid clearly.

A failure on the part of the Western Cape Education Department to support

these learners. What steps can be taken to assist these learners and prevent similar situations from occurring in the future?

Additionally, the influx of undocumented and illegal foreign nationals has placed enormous pressure on the system, leading to local learners being overlooked and denied access to schools. The Department must provide transparency on the criteria they use to determine the documentation status of foreign learners.

Moreover, clarity is needed on the challenges the Department is facing due to this growing issue and the impact it has on allocating resources and space for our own children.

This is a call to action for immediate solutions to address the injustices faced by these learners and to ensure that local children are prioritised in the allocation of school placements. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the DA.

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, Tuesday's derailment at the Dal Josafat Station where a Metrorail train from Cape Town to Wellington went off the tracks, injuring about 25 passengers, has once again spotlighted the pressured state of our rail infrastructure. While we are thankful there were no fatalities, this incident underscores the urgent need for action.

Earlier this year the DA highlighted the severe safety issues within our rail network, revealing that several passenger bridges and underground tunnels had been deemed unsafe. With repair costs nearing about R16 million, the uncertainty surrounding whether these essential repairs have been addressed further leaves commuters at risk. The recent extreme weather conditions have likely worsened the existing infrastructure problems.

In light of these concerns the DA calls for an immediate and comprehensive safety inspection of all rail infrastructure by the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa and Transnet. It is critical that PRASA and Transnet prioritise a full safety audit to ensure the safety and reliability of our rail services.

Our citizens deserve dependable and secure public transport and it is the responsibility of these agencies to provide it. Should they fail to deliver it is imperative that responsibility for rail services be devolved to Local Governments equipped to manage and improve our rail infrastructure. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mbombo. I now see the EFF.

An HON MEMBER: They are not here [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have two EFF members online. I see the EFF.

An HON MEMBER: Do we want them in the House? [Interjections.]

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Chief Whip decide now.

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): The Economic ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are audible, hon member.

Ms T LITHAKONG: I would like to take this opportunity and condemn the DA-led City of Cape Town [Audio distorted.] library situated in Philippi.

The library and the other facilities, which include Ward councillors office and a community hall, were vandalised during the August 2023 taxi shutdown in the area, which led to the library being closed indefinitely. Windows remain broken while those books, computers and electrical infrastructure [Audio distorted.].

Hon Deputy Speaker, the library [Audio distorted.] mainly used by school learners for learning purposes [Audio distorted.] use the internet and computers to try and apply for jobs online. Without these resources the community remains hopeless and learners' education remain negatively

affected and job seekers are beginning to lose hope as the majority of them cannot even afford to buy data or travel in order to submit their curriculum vitae to potential employers.

Somlomo, the response coming [Audio distorted.] available to fix the library. This means that when the City Council drafted a new budget for the current financial year, the library was not even considered, even though the damage occurred in the previous financial year.

While this [Audio distorted.] led municipality remains distasteful, it is not shocking to the EFF as we know how much their leadership hates Black people and despises Black communities. [Interjections.]

The situation would have been different if a similar incident would have occurred in a library based in their suburbs dominated by White people. The municipality would have ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please concluded, hon member.

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): ...made provision to shift funds in the same financial year in order to accommodate the fixing of the library as a matter of urgency.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, thank you ...[Interjections.]

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...your time has expired. Hon members, once again, as per the directives, I wish to echo that those that are participating online, it is the member's responsibility to ensure that they have a stable internet connection. I will now note the NCC.

An HON MEMBER: They must stop ...

An HON MEMBER: The internet is as stable as the party leadership.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Are you done?

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I recognise the NCC.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the NCC rises again to synthesise this august House of the shocking rise in teen suicide cases in the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as we speak, about 10% of all teen deaths can be contributed to suicide. That means that one out of 10 teens who pass away die by their own inflicted deaths. Hon Deputy Speaker, this alone is a shocking statistic. It is a huge concern in the public health environment.

20% of these suicide deaths are in the high school environment. Peer pressure, bullying, outside pressures are of a huge concern.

Although it is very difficult to find the exact statistics, it is said that up to 23,5% of teens harbour suicidal ideas. Hon Deputy Speaker, on the Cape Flats we see this is a growing trend and if you are lucky to survive, gang violence awaits you.

Now looking at the statement, this is an ever growing problem and we are sitting arms folded and watching a generation crumble away. From 1 January 2019 to 31 September 2021, a total of 2 188 suicides were recorded and 90% of those can be contributed to mental health. The Western Cape Health Department shows that mental health uptake in hospitals is increasing year-on-year since 2018. As the NCC we find this very concerning. Hon Deputy Speaker, this is extremely worrying that a lurking disaster is so easily sidelined.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, if our kids are our future this is a huge problem. We cannot allow this to continue. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I note the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as the ANC we welcome the recent arrest of Malusi

Booi, former DA Human Settlements Mayoral Committee member in the City of Cape Town and his co-accused, which include high-level gang flyers. This case uncovered a disturbing web of corruption and criminal enterprise involving prominent members of the DA, particularly concerning the extortion ring that has plagued an important industry in our economy, construction.

In light of this development the ANC calls for a Commission of Inquiry into the extortion and construction mafia in the Western Cape. The Commission should look into the extent of the DA's involvement and the effectiveness of oversight mechanism in preventing such corruption in the City.

The gravity of these allegations cannot be overstated. They indicate a well-orchestrated scheme to exploit the public sector for personal gain, undermining the trust that residents place in the elected officials and public servants.

What is particularly alarming is the implication that this scheme was able to operate with apparent impunity, raising serious questions about the oversight and auditing processes in place. How did this corruption occur despite the DA-led City of Cape Town's acclaimed zero tolerance approach to fraud and corruption? How did they continue to receive clean audit ... [Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Presies!

[An HON MEMBER: Precisely!]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...after clean audit, earning praise for their fraud prevention and corruption measures in light of these realities?

What exactly are internal control measures in the City of Cape Town and what is the role of the Provincial Treasury in this Provincial Government and Local Government in ensuring such? [Interjections.]

We ask what role the Provincial Department is playing, especially given MEC Bredell's swift action towards municipalities not governed by the DA.

Our witnessing complacency and parties and governance with the DA applying different ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...scrutiny levels of municipalities under its control, compared to those under coalition ruled by other parties.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...came and gone. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now see the DA.

An HON MEMBER: He will never [Inaudible.]. †Hy is bang vir JP. [He is scared of JP.]

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

As we confront the growing urgency of the climate crisis it is essential that local governments are not only heard but actively shape the national response to climate change.

The Presidential Climate Commission, or the PCC, now established as a statutory body under the new Climate Change Act, represents a critical platform for this engagement.

Section 10 of the Act calls for a coordinated approach to climate change, ensuring that all levels of government, national, provincial and local, work together to mitigate the devastating effects of climate change.

Local governments are at the forefront of this challenge. It is in our cities and towns that the impacts of climate change are felt most acutely, whether through floods, droughts or increasingly erratic weather patterns. These are the communities that must adapt quickly and it is local governments that are best positioned to implement responsive and context-specific strategies, whether it is managing water security, improving infrastructure resilience or reducing carbon footprints through local policy interventions, municipalities play a pivotal role in making South Africa climate resilient.

In this regard the role of the South African Local Government Association, or SALGA, in the PCC is crucial. By nominating Mayors to represent local governments on the PCC, SALGA has made an important commitment to ensuring that the unique needs of municipalities are considered in national climate planning. These appointments ensure the voices of local governments are included when key decisions are made, especially when addressing the localised impacts of climate change.

Inclusion of SALGA's representatives on the PCC underscores the importance of having diverse municipalities, whether large Metros or smaller towns, contributing to the national climate dialogue. The leadership and innovation shown by many of our local governments across the country, especially in the Western Cape, in areas such as renewable energy, water management and infrastructure resilience, highlight the capacity of municipalities to play a transformative role in shaping South Africa's climate future, but beyond this, it is a reminder that all municipalities, regardless of size or location, must have a seat at the table when decisions about South Africa's climate future are made.

Climate change does not discriminate by geography and our national strategy must reflect the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): ...diverse realities of urban and rural municipalities alike. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now see the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr G MARAIS (FF+): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus notes the City of Cape Town's proposed amendments to the Municipal Planning Bylaw that creates extensive changes to the current processes and we welcome the extension by the Mayor for the public to give additional inputs for 90 days, up to 25 November, but the purpose of the amendment must ensure the safeguarding of residents who fear for their safety whenever they object to proposed developments.

There is a desperate need to develop much needed housing infrastructure which must be balanced with the rights of residents to participate in the public participation process without fear and without retribution when they object to any development.

The Western Cape Government in its oversight function must ensure that municipalities, as powerful spheres of Local Government, avoid any policies or bylaws that will lead to a flawed or compromised public participation process.

To which degree are municipal officials able to give independent opinions without political influence? Their opinions must be objective when it comes to certain developments, especially if it is going to affect the environment, and so it is important that this province, that is a growing province, must ensure that consideration for the natural environment must be a high priority as it impacts our tourism sector.

We encourage ratepayers to make use of this opportunity to give their inputs and that the Western Cape Government will hold municipalities accountable. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the Al Jama-ah party online.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AJ): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The Indian Army Central Reserve Police Force and border security personnel have been accused of committing severe human rights abuses against Kashmiri civilians. According to the Human Rights Watch these include mass killings and forced disappearances, torture, rape and sexual abuse to political repression and suppression of freedom of speech.

Freedom, fairness and diversity are values enshrined in our Constitution to which the DA confirms its commitment to constitutionality, rule of law, rights of individuals, the universal declaration of human rights and social

market economies.

Western Cape over the years has built strong bilateral trade with India. Whilst committing to these values and principles, this Province should view them as universal. Apart from violating general human rights, the Indian Government has no regard for the rights of children.

I quote President Nelson Mandela who said:

“We owe our children, the most vulnerable citizens in our society, a life free from violence and fear.”

In its functions of forming strategic partnerships with provincial governments around the world, this House has a responsibility to address matters of human rights violations. The House, through the required channels of protocol and etiquette, plays a role in promoting calls on India to end the hostilities, commit to human rights and to end its illegal occupation of Kashmir. I thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Brinkhuis. I see the ACDP.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape opposes the BELA Bill

that was signed into law. It is our contention that the Act in its current form fails our nation. The ACDP has spoken out against the BELA Bill at every opportunity. We marched, we picketed and we even made our voices heard in the public hearings ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How many people?

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...but it seems all in vain.

An HON MEMBER: Three picketed. Yourself ...[Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): The public signing of the Bill makes a political statement [Interjections.] that the ANC can flex its political muscle and force flawed legislation into law. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, President Cyril Ramaphosa, by the very act of postponing Clauses 4 and 5 for three months, concedes that the Basic Education Law Amendment is flawed.

An HON MEMBER: Facts! [Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): It is our view that these clauses undermine the constitutional rights of our people.

An HON MEMBER: Consultation.

An HON MEMBER: Ja [Inaudible.] does not understand ... How can they ...

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Children belong to the parents and not the State. This Bill seeks to criminalise parents. This Bill is also a high-handed top-down approach to the language policy.

†n AGB LID: Jô, skandelik!

[An HON MEMBER: Jô, digraceful!]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): The Bill seeks to reduce the powers of the SGBs. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, our education system needs clear-sighted and well-planned policies to take learners and educators along a path that ensures quality education for all. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I see the GOOD Party.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, today in the National Assembly the DA has sponsored an important debate, which we support, that the proposed national electricity tariff increase of 36% on top of the 4% recovery charge is unaffordable and

should be resisted, [Interjections.] but it smacks of opportunism and hypocrisy for the DA to campaign against national tariff hikes at the same time as it is fighting in the High Court for the right to implement higher tariff increases than those set by the Regulator, as it has done in Cape Town for the past two years. [Interjections.]

In the 2022 financial year NERSA approved a 7,4% tariff increase, but Cape Town implemented a 9,6% increase.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): In the 2023 financial year NERSA approved a 15,1% increase, [Interjections.] but the City implemented a 17,6% tariff hike on top of its hiked price from the previous year. [Interjections.] Cape Town's overcharges have unlawfully forced residents to cough up at least R660 million extra over the past two years.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): If the DA loses against NERSA in the High Court, the City will have to refund this money to residents ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): ...who are incidentally funding the litigation

arguing for the City's right to charge them more. [Interjections.] This is more or less equivalent to motorists funding a court action demanding the right to pay more for petrol.

Instead of waiting for the court's decision, the City could demonstrate that it is genuinely concerned about residents' plight by pulling the plug on the litigation and refunding its overcharges now. It has the cash reserves in the bank to do so.

Given the economic constraints in the country and the levels of unemployment and poverty, citizens, including those in Cape Town, should not be charged a cent more than is necessary for electricity. [Interjections.]

The municipal funding model allowing municipalities to generate profit from marking up electricity prices, must be rethought. If municipalities can charge whatever they wish for electricity, more and more South Africans will return to living in the dark.

An HON MEMBER: You are right.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Instead of moving forward ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon member.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): ...the developing state will be reversing back to

the era of apartheid electricity. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: [Onhoorbaar.] hy praat die waarheid.

[An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] he speaks the truth.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon member Herron. I now see the DA.
[Interjections.]

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): Hon Deputy speaker, the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape is proud to announce that the DA-led Prince Albert Municipality has obtained an unqualified audit opinion for the 22/23 financial year.

An HON MEMBER: The same thing happened in the City of Cape Town.

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): The Auditor General of South Africa issued the unqualified opinion following an audit of the municipality's financial statements, Annual Performance Report and compliance with legislation. We congratulate Mayor Linda Jaquet and her dedicated team of DA councillors for this achievement.

The audit outcome indicates that the municipality is in capable hands ...[Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Dit is die mense [Onhoorbaar.]

[An HON MEMBER: It is the people [Inaudible.]]

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): ...with sound, financial management and proper internal controls. However, it is worth noting that the municipality narrow missed out on a clean audit opinion.

The AGSA found that the administration had not fully complied with relevant legislation as they neglected to upload the final version of the 22/23 Annual Report on the municipality's website within the required timeframe. While this unqualified audit opinion is still a significant achievement, the DA and the residents of Prince Albert look forward to the municipality building on this success.

An HON MEMBER: Service delivery!

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): We encourage the administration to strive for continuous improvement with the ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Service delivery!

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): ...goal of achieving a clean audit in the coming financial year.

It is fundamental for residents to experience the benefit of improved financial management through the provision of effective and efficient service delivery.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): A clean audit should not only be reflected in the financial statements, but should translate into tangible improvements in the daily lives of our community.

The commitment to excellence in governance and service delivery will further benefit our community and reinforce public trust in our Government. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: No service delivery.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members! Hon members, we are approaching a subject for discussion still on the Order Paper. I have noted at least three particular members who is consistently running commentary. I would then at this particular stage caution against that. Although

interjections are allowed, the running commentary should cease moving forward.

I will now allow members of the Executive in terms of Rule 154(6) and give them an opportunity for no more than five minutes collectively should they wish to respond to any of the Members' Statements. I see Minister Wenger at this time. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

I welcome the recognition by the hon member that the healthcare sector is indeed under severe pressure and a lack of personnel is as a direct result of austerity and an underfunded wage agreement which was nationally negotiated and despite assurances, even by the then Minister of Health, was not forthcoming and we were short-changed by approximately 30% of the cost, [Interjections.] but, hon Deputy Speaker, the problem is much deeper than that, and I do think we must have a conversation about how the health sector in South Africa is funded generally. [Interjections.]

As we speak, per capita health funding for South Africans in 2023 is less than what it was in 2017, which means the sector as a whole is being underfunded. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape, as it is, is the province that has one of the highest

...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are going to take responsibility.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ...proportion of its budget spent on health. So we are giving it absolutely everything that we have got, but we do have a growing population and we do need the funding to the Western Cape to be increased to be able to service the population in the way that they need and the way that they deserve. [Interjections.]

In respect of the specific complaints that the hon member raised, and if she would perhaps listen then I would be able to provide the response. [Interjections.]

We do have a complaint ...[Incomplete.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! Have you concluded, Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I just cannot hear myself. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Verbal diarrhoea.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...just prior to the Minister using the option in terms of 145(6), I cautioned against the running commentary. We have stopped the clock our side. Please let us allow the Minister in order to respond in this particular segment. I now see the Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

We do have a codified complaints mechanism and I would ask the member to please submit that complaint formally to us so that we can investigate the specifics that were raised. I have also provided those details to the Standing Committee.

Also I would like to share with the House that we do have a fixed wellness site in Klipheuwel which is run by an NPO partner and that is open every day. Chronic medicines are delivered to this wellness site and chronic meds are also available on the mobile unit.

I would also be happy to share with the House that we are currently working on expanding the service package offered by the mobile clinic and I hope this to be in operation or available within the next six months for the Klipheuwel community. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Mackenzie.

The MINISTER FOR CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and I want to thank the colleague for highlighting the matter of the libraries. It is something that is close to our heart as Western Cape Government.

I would like to inform our colleagues that I know our City is working very hard to restore that service. Strikes are horrible and it is during this period that the hooligans and criminal elements in our communities are burning down public services and we should all condemn it, but I want to assure the member there are two other libraries in the vicinity, which is Philippi East Library and Crossroads Library, that are fully operational and functional, and whilst the City is busy working on fixing the other library that must be open for the community, we would encourage the member to ask the communities in the meantime to make use of the other two fully-functional libraries which are within 1,1 kilometre and 2 kilometres by a simple Google search on Google Maps. But in the meantime I know my colleagues in the City will be working hard to fix the other library, but the bigger issue is the criminal elements in our community taking advantage and looting and burning public infrastructures and those are the ones we should all condemn and get rid of in our communities and put them in jail. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now see Minister Baartman.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, without having received too much information on the particular court case, I believe the court case is referring to the NERSA and the AfriForum one, so I will respond on that particular matter.

AfriForum took NERSA to court because NERSA imposed guideline requirements on municipalities for cost of supply for the respective energy tariffs. So some municipalities across the country submitted according to the NERSA requirement, which is the guideline, and some submitted a cost of supply, which is higher than the requirement that NERSA gave.

AfriForum won the court case against NERSA and what the court essentially said is you must go back and you must submit a cost of supply study.

Now across the country some municipalities already had a cost of supply study, so NERSA then approved the cost of supply study and the purpose of a cost of supply study is exactly in the name, it is to cover the cost of the supply.

Now because of what happened on that court case, the judgement was on the last Friday of that particular month when the municipalities across the Western Cape had to implement the new tariffs on the Sunday. So municipalities, some of them only got their letters on the weekend when they could not necessarily increase or decrease their respective tariffs, and what happened is there are municipalities that run the risk of losing their revenue.

The Provincial Treasury is currently assisting Kannaland, Cederberg, Hessequa, Oudtshoorn and Prince Albert with their cost of supply studies, and also the City of Cape Town's subsidised electricity tariffs ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and is currently the lowest of all Metros in the whole country. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much, hon members. That is the end of Members' Statements.

In terms of Rule 151 all Notices of Motion by hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have duly been submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the pending dismissal of 47 LEAP officers, especially now during this period of escalating crime in our communities.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the recently withdrawn 2022 national census data on the Western Cape's financial well-being.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the importance of the memorandum of understanding signed by the City of Cape Town, the Western Cape Government and South African Police Service on 30 August 2024 and its impact on policing and policing resources in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L D VAN WYK (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the Basic Education Laws Amendment Act on education in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the recent rise in attacks on social workers and its impact on the Western Cape's social support network.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the necessity for provinces to have expedited access to disaster funding in the light of recent extreme weather events and climate change.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Auditor-General's Consolidated General

Report on Local Government Audit Outcomes for the 2022/23 period.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P JOHNSON (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the feasibility of the current Division of Revenue in providing sufficient funding for provinces to fulfil their mandates.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will now deal with Rule 150 and move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform each member that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolences, congratulatory, were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to the plenary on 17 September 2024.

Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have also been informed that the Programming Authority meeting on 17 September 2024, political parties did submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without

Notice in the Sitting of the House.

I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The following members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: the hon member Jacobs, the hon member Brinkhuis, the hon member Bosman and the hon member Walters.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): I move without notice:

That the House raises to dip its flame, as we mourn the untimely demise of Cape Town and world renowned music maestro, Alvin Dyers, Uncle Alvin, as he was affectionally known, who passed away on Sunday, 8 September, at the age of 71; notes that jazz lovers will remember with affection tunes coming from the Alvin Dyers Trio. South Africa and Cape Town have lost a true son of the soil and we send our condolences to the family and friends of this jazz icon.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AJ): I move without notice:

That the House notes that struggle icon, Ms Elizabeth van der Heyden,

also fondly known as Ma Betty, has passed away at the age of 88, towards the end of August 2024 at her Gleemoor home in Athlone; further notes that she passed away a few days before her 89th birthday in September; further notes that she was the only South African female who served a full 10 years' imprisonment sentence for conspiracy to overthrow the former apartheid regime; recognises that she was a member of the New Unity Movement (NEUM) who later joined Yu Chi Chan Club and National Liberation Front which engaged in guerilla warfare against the apartheid regime; further recognises that she worked closely with other revolutionaries such as Dr Neville Alexander, Frank van der Horst, Dorothy Alexander and Dulcie September; recognises her contribution to liberate South Africa from apartheid and colonialism and sends a message of condolences to the Van der Heyden family.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move with notice:

That the House expresses its condolences on the passing of Dr James Matthews; notes further that Dr Matthews was a wonderfully talented and inspiring poet and journalist whose work spoke truth to power during apartheid through both his literary work and staunch anti-apartheid activism; notes that he was the recipient of a national honour, the Order of Ikhamanga (Silver), in December 2004, for his excellent achievements in literature, contributing to journalism and his

inspirational commitment to the struggle for a non-racial South Africa; notes further that Dr Matthews received numerous other awards during his lifetime, including the Woza Afrika Award in 1978, he was named to the Kwaza Honours List at the Black Arts Celebration in Chicago in 1979 and was recognised as a Freeman of the towns of Lehrte and Nienburg, Germany in 1982, and that the House sends its best wishes to Mr Matthews' family and friends during this difficult time.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

†Mnr T WALTERS (DA): Mosie sonder kennisgewing:

Dat die Huis die Hoër Landbouskool Oakdale gelukwens met hul onlangse oorwinning in die Internasionale Toutrek Federasie Wêreldkampioenskap in Mannheim, Duitsland. Die 560kg span het ten spyte van hewige teenstand van lande regoor die wêreld hul derde agtereenvolgende wêreldtitel ingepalm; die Huis moet kennis neem van hierdie uitmuntende prestasie en die span gelukwens met hulle puik vertoning op die wêreldverhoog.

[Mr T WALTERS (DA): Motion without notice:

That the House congratulates the Oakdale Agricultural High School on its recent win in the International Tug-of-War Federation World Championship in Mannheim, Germany. The 560kg team won their third successive world

title despite heavy competition from countries all over the world; the House should note this outstanding achievement and congratulate the team for their excellent performance on the world stage.]

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put these motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of Proceedings and in Hansard in each individual member's name as if the member had read it out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to the hon members to move Motions without Notice as per standing Rule 150(2)(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes as per Standing Rule 150(2)(d) will start now. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes advances in technology and condemns crime in the strongest terms. Ever-present crime has diminished the convenience of ATMs. Most ATMs are situated in shopping malls where there is a sense of security. ATM fraud is an ever-present threat. Many an unsuspecting victim has had their accounts emptied by fraudsters. I am sure that all of us know of someone who has fallen victim to unscrupulous scammers. Some are robbed in shopping mall parking lots of the withdrawal they have made at the ATM. Cash-in-transit heists, particularly of vehicles that serve ATMs, raise a fear factor of withdrawing cash. Because of this some clients withdraw cash when shopping at supermarkets. Contributing factors for the decline in ATM numbers are sporadic violence and ATM bombings. Some banks do not replace ATMs that have been bombed. Over the past five years major banks have closed ATMs across the country. This is largely due to a reduced demand of cash in transactions. The numbers of ATMs countrywide have declined from 33 171 in 2019 to 28 967 in the 2023/2024 year. ABSA had the most ATMs in 2019 closed, an amount of almost 3 500 of its ATMs. Standard Bank moved from 9 321 into 6 200 over the last five years. The closure of ATMs in our country will escalate exponentially as crime increases. Crime robs our nation of peace that is promised to us by our God. It is the prayer of all like-minded citizens that crime will be eradicated through our unity against crime. I so move. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objections, agreed to. I now see hon member Lithakong.

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Thank you, *Somlomo*. I move without notice:

For the House to note that on Friday, 13 September 2024, the President of this country officially signed the Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (BELA) into law, a move which must be welcomed by all South Africans; further notes that the purpose of this BELA Act is to respond to administrative challenges which continue to face schools in this country as well as transforming our basic education system. The good thing about this new piece of legislation is that it makes Grade R compulsory, as well as giving power to provincial heads of department to have a final say when it comes to administering language policy in schools, a function previously reserved to school governing bodies and which was abused. In the past SGBs from former Model C schools would use language, such as Afrikaans, as the only medium of instruction in schools as a gatekeeping mechanism so that they can exclude majority of African learners from being admitted in those schools. We hope that the President would not be held at ransom by certain political parties and organisations in incorporating the outstanding provisions of this Act into law after the three month period. I so move, *Somlomo*. Thank you very much.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now see the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you. I move without notice:

For the House to note that on Tuesday, 17 September, a train derailed in Paarl, carrying between 300 to 400 passengers, where 25 of those passengers sustained moderate to serious injuries; further note that some passengers complained that throughout its journey from Cape Town and destined for Wellington, that the train kept making unusual sounds in-between its carriages, signalling that something was not right; further call on the Passenger Railway Agency of South Africa and Transnet to remove all old and ageing yellow trains from its fleet and to make sure that the rail lines are properly maintained at all times for the safety of our people, and conclude by wishing a speedy recovery to all injured passengers who are still recovering in various hospitals, as well as those who were discharged and call for a thorough investigation with regards to what caused the accident and for those responsible to be held accountable. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objections, agreed to. I now see the hon member Bryant.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): I hereby move without notice:

That the House notes the positive steps being taken to establish an African Penguin colony in the De Hoop Nature Reserve; and notes further that the African Penguin is an endangered species and that it is under severe threat of extinction; further notes that the African Penguin is a big tourist attraction amongst eco-tourists and that the House urges all South African nature authorities to prioritise efforts to save this indigenous and rare penguin from extinction. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are the any objections to the motion being agreed to in the House?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection, agreed to. I now see the hon member Ngqentsu.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the accident that occurred on Tuesday, 17 September, in Dal Josafat, Paarl, where a commuter train derailed, resulting in several commuters sustaining injuries and others being trapped in the train coaches; commends the emergency services for their swift and efficient response, as well as the dedication of the healthcare workers at Paarl District Hospital and other medical facilities who are providing care to the injured; extends heartfelt wishes for a speedy recovery to all affected commuters and calls on the Railway Safety Regulator to conduct a thorough investigation into the circumstances leading to this accident, focusing mainly on uncovering the root causes of the accident and to prevent future occurrences and ensure the safety of all rail commuters. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objections, agreed to. I now see again the hon member Ngqentsu.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern and condemns in the strongest

terms possible, the attempts by the City of Cape Town to dismiss approximately 47 Law Enforcement Advancement Plan officers without following due processes; notes further that this action is particularly alarming given that the cases of about 108 LEAP officers who were unfairly dismissed earlier this year are still pending before the Bargaining Council; appreciates the leadership role of the SAMWU as it continues to challenge these unjust dismissals, particularly by the anti-worker DA-led City of Cape Town; acknowledges that the fighting capacity of SAMWU will reveal the underlying political rationale behind the treatment of LEAP officers and how they are exploited; calls for the immediate reinstatement of the 108 LEAP officers and demands that the City abandons the planned unfair dismissal of the 47 officers; accepts that the continued unfair dismissal of these vulnerable LEAP officers suggests a double standard on the part of the City, contradicting its assertion that LEAP officers are essential and effective in combating crime in Cape Town; reiterates calls for J P Smith to be summoned to appear before the committees to account about the implementation of the Western Cape Plan which continues to be a big expensive failure and further calls on the DA-led City of Cape Town to come clean on this LEAP officers project. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion

will be printed on the Order Paper. I again see the hon member Ngqentsu.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and extends its heartfelt congratulations to comrade Yershen Pillay, the Chemical Industries Education and Training Authority's CEO, for his outstanding leadership and the achievement of a clean audit; notes further with great admiration that under his stewardship, CHIETA has not only met but surpassed its targets, as evidenced by the clean audit award; appreciates comrade Pillay's recent statement that clean audits must translate into sustainable livelihoods which acknowledges CHIETA's commitment to sustainable livelihoods through exemplary governance and impactful skills development; commends Yershen, a communist, for his dedication to enhancing the quality of life through job creation and skills development, as evidenced by the creation of about 7 893 jobs, the support provided to 630 entities in the Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises sector, and training of about 2 286 artisans which is testament to his effective leadership; extends congratulations to Yershen Pillay and the entire team for their unwavering dedication and exceptional performance, hoping that their achievements will inspire the DA-led Administration in the Western Cape Provincial Government and various municipalities to understand that clean audits are not merely a celebration of compliance, but a stepping stone towards continued performance and positive impact on our communities and country, and appreciates that Pillay's exemplary

leadership is a demonstration that the ANC and SACP continue to produce cadres par excellent. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now see the hon member Windvogel.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I am a communist.

An HON MEMBER: We love jobs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon member Windvogel, are you able to take your seat? Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise in terms of Rule 156. I have a proposed amendment to the motion, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Put it to the House.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Excuse me, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may put it to the House.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we rise to object to the Motion without Notice proposed by hon member Windvogel as it does not fully reflect the steps that have already been taken by this House, particularly the Standing Committee on Social Development, to address the issue of attacks on social workers and other Government employees.

We proposed the following amendments in terms of Rule 156 to ensure a more accurate representation of the current situation and to emphasise the urgency of action from the National Government. Hon Deputy Speaker, the amended motion:

“That the House notes with deep concern the alarming rise in extortion targeting social workers and other Government employees operating in vulnerable communities in the Western Cape; notes further that the recent incidents in Delft where social workers were threatened and the recent series of hijackings involved wastewater vehicles operated by the City of Cape Town, highlight the urgent need for action; furthermore, this House recognises that the

Standing Committee on Social Development has unanimously agreed to approach the National Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development to declare these attacks on social workers as an attack on the State. We have written to the National Minister four times on 21 August, 28 August, 9 September and 18 September 2024, yet we have not received any response from the National Minister. This House therefore calls on the National Minister to urgently address this request; finally this House condemns these senseless attacks on Government officials whose continued targeting not only endangers their lives, but also negatively impacts the communities that rely on their vital services. Decisive action is needed to protect Government officials who dedicate their lives to serving the most vulnerable amongst us. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of Rule 156.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. Hon members of the House have duly noted that particular submission. I will now go to Motion 8. I will afford hon member Windvogel to read out her motion should she take into account any particular amendments to be made, but the House will ultimately decide whether it objects or approve. I will now see the hon member Windvogel.

An HON MEMBER: We [Inaudible.] object.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon

Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the alarming rise in extortion targeting social workers and other Government employees operating in vulnerable communities in the City of Cape Town; notes further that the recent incidents in Delft, where social workers were threatened and the recent series of hijackings involving waste services vehicles operated by the City of Cape Town, highlight the urgent need for action, and we recognise the continued targeting of Government officials not only endangers their lives, but also negatively impacts the communities that rely on their vital services. We condemn these senseless attacks on Government officials and call for decisive action to protect Government officials who dedicate their lives to serving the most vulnerable among us. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, there was an amendment proposed in terms of Rule 156 to the motion. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That particular Rule 156 deals directly to that particular motion needing to be delivered in writing and it needs to be signed

and delivered to the Table Staff. We have not as the Table Staff received any particular motion in writing with an amendment.

An HON MEMBER: [2:40:45] Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Then we propose that the motion be declined and we can come back to that motion at a later stage.

An HON MEMBER: You propose the motion be declined?

An HON MEMBER: Just reject.

An HON MEMBER: We object! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! I have already indicated and asked the question, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: We object. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I will now see the hon member Nkondlo. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 12 September 2024 a well-coordinated intelligence-driven operation conducted by the SAPS Maitland Flying Squad, in collaboration with Provincial Crime Intelligence, the Stock Theft Unit and the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, resulted in the confiscation of 3 281 units of dry abalone and 1 359 units of wet abalone, with a combined estimated street value of R1,4 million and the arrest of four suspects aged between 19 and 33 in Schaapkraal, Philippi; appreciates that the successful seizure of the abalone, along with the equipment used for its processing and three vehicles, demonstrate the effective and dedicated efforts of SAPS members in combating illegal activities; and welcomes these arrests and extend our commendations to the SAPS for their diligent work and their commitment to addressing and disrupting illegal practices in our communities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move

without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the recent surge in criminal activities within Table Mountain National Park, including muggings on hiking trails, break-ins and theft from vehicles, which have negatively impacted the park's reputation and raised alarms about public safety; notes further that the incidents of crime have become more frequent in 2023 and 2024, affecting both local visitors and international tourists, and posing a significant risk to Cape Town's global image as a safe and welcoming destination; recognises the vital role of TMNP, that is the Table Mountain National Park, in the local economy, with SANParks, the managing authority, earning approximately R300 million annually from park activities and events, including from events such as the RMB Ultra-trail Cape Town, scheduled for 22 November to 24 November 2024, which bring significant economic benefits, including an estimated R50 million boost to the local economy; and calls on the Provincial Government, the City of Cape Town and SANParks to take immediate and visible action to address the increase in crime, enhance communication about safety measures and ensure the effective implementation of security improvements so that we continue our thriving tourism industry in the province. I so move. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. Hon members,

are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern and condemns in the strongest possible terms the recent display of the Ukrainian flag at the Cape Town City Hall on Ukraine Flag Day; notes further that this was a desperate and reprehensible act that disrespects the legacy of Nelson Mandela and undermines South African sovereignty; [Interjections.] concurs with the sentiments expressed ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Oder, hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC):

I concur with the sentiments expressed by Lindiwe Sisulu, who condemns this incident as an example of “performative White supremacy” and an attempt by Ukrainian nationalists to exploit a historically significant location of their own agenda; we recognise that the Cape Town City Hall is a site of immense historical importance, symbolising the end of apartheid and the birth of a new democratic era in South Africa and that its use in this context diminishes the sacred memory associated with Nelson Mandela's first public address following his release from prison in 1990 ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We reject that one.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC):

Accepts that the action of the Ukrainian Association of South Africa in facilitating this display was distasteful and disrespectful to our national sovereignty and that such acts threaten to undermine the historical significance of our monuments and institutions, which should serve as a reminder of our struggle for freedom and justice; and calls for the implementation of appropriate measures to prevent similar incidents in the future and to safeguard the integrity of our historical sites. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

[Interjections.] There is an objection and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. *[Interjections.]* Order, hon members!

Hon members, I wish to remind you that as part of the parliamentary process you will have an opportunity to object if you do not agree with the content or

the motion itself. Can I please ask that when a member is on the floor that you afford that member an opportunity to deliver his or her motion in terms of the Rules. I move on to hon member Lekker.

An HON MEMBER: She is not here.

The SPEAKER: In the absence of hon member Lekker I move on to hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the decision by the Western Cape Department of Education to impose sanctions of a restorative nature on the learners involved in the recent incident at Pinelands High School where a video surfaced depicting Coloured learners selling off their African peers as slaves; notes further and welcomes this approach, which includes participation in workshops, learning programmes and community service, with the aim to foster a deeper understanding of the incident's impact and promote personal growth; appreciates that the sanction have been supported by the parents and learners involved, including the victims, and that the school has demonstrated a commitment to promoting non-racialism and diversity; supports the use of restorative justice measures as a means to address and rectify instances of racial misconduct, and endorsing continued efforts to educate students on the

importance of respect and diversity; and encourages the ongoing dialogue and education within schools and communities to prevent further incidents of racism and promote a culture of inclusivity and understanding. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon member Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the recent petition titled “Petition to Premier Alan Winde: Release Tafelberg for Social Housing Now”, initiated by Reclaim the City and NU; notes further that the petition which advocates for the use of the Tafelberg site for social and affordable housing, particularly for domestic workers who serve in the area, has gathered over 60 signatures; supports the call for the Tafelberg site to be handed over to the City of Cape Town for development into

much-needed social housing units and acknowledges that this petition aligns with the broader goal of addressing spatial segregation, socio-economic exclusion that have persisted since the end of apartheid; and calls for a comprehensive and inclusive approach to spatial redress in the City of Cape Town, which includes the development of affordable housing in central areas that have historically been excluded from such initiatives. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection and the motion will be printed ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Of course.

The SPEAKER: ...on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Nkondlo. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the recent joint inspection operation carried out at Babel Restaurant in Menlyn and Ocean Basket, which revealed both establishments owe their workers over R1,3-million in unpaid wages, and the serious noncompliance with the National Minimum Wage Act and other employment regulations; condemns in the strongest terms the gross violations of labour laws and the exploitation of workers by Babel Restaurant and Ocean Basket, including failure to pay minimum wages, noncompliance with UIF and Compensation Fund regulations, and abusive employment practices; commends the Directorate of Priority Crimes Investigation (the Hawks), the Department of Labour, Home Affairs, and the Bargaining Council for their decisive action in uncovering these violations and their commitment to holding the offending employers accountable; while recognizing Ocean Basket's public statement is refuting these reports, urges that both Babel Restaurant and Ocean Basket be compelled to immediately pay all outstanding wages owed to their workers, and to rectify all noncompliance issues by adhering to minimum wage laws and other employment regulations; encourages all Western Cape workers who experience unfair labour practices to report such incidents to come forward and report these matters to the nearest Labour Department so that their complaints can be taken seriously and addressed urgently; urges the National Government take stronger measures to ensure that all companies adhere to minimum wage regulations and other labour protections, thereby safeguarding the rights and livelihoods of all workers; and calls on the National Government to implement more

rigorous and frequent inspections of companies, especially in the Western Cape to ensure compliance with labour laws and to address violations promptly. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the recent decision by Stellenbosch University Council to close the Wilgenhof residence and reimagine it as a new male residence that will align with modern values and compliance standards; notes further that the decision to close this residence in its current format was a necessary and commendable step that is addressing and rectifying past issues related to the unacceptable practices and initiation-like incidents; acknowledges the University's commitment to ensuring that the renewed residence will uphold and embody the principles of transparency, respect, and inclusivity. This includes a

decisive break from the problematic customs such as the Vleisfees and Nagligte, and a commitment to aligning with the Department of Higher Education and Training's Policy on Minimum Norms and Standards for Student Housing at Public Universities; commends the Stellenbosch University's proactive approach in engaging with current Wilgenhof residents, student leaders, and other stakeholders to shape the future of the residence; and supports the University's decision to consider proposals for the new name of the residence and to engage with relevant stakeholders regarding visual redress initiatives, as this approach demonstrates a commitment to acknowledging and addressing the legacy of the old residence while fostering a positive and inclusive environment moving forward. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is no objection, motion agreed to. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and expresses its profound concern regarding the recent trench collapse at the intersection of Broadway Boulevard and Broadlands Road in Strand, where workers were engaged in the

installation of the new Gordon's Bay rising pipeline; notes further that this tragic incident led to several construction workers being trapped in the sinkhole and suffering injuries; commends the swift and courageous response of emergency service personnel, whose prompt actions were crucial in rescuing the trapped workers and transporting them to the hospital for medical attention; also welcomes the visit of the ANC MPLs to the site, as they sought to understand the causes of this accident and engaged directly with the affected workers; and calls on the DA-led sub-council and ASLA, the company responsible for the construction project, to prioritize and strictly adhere to the highest safety standards to protect the welfare of all workers on site. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, hon members, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You object again ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...all the time.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You have got two parties ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, and that brings us to the end of the 30 minutes allotted for Motions without Notice. In the beginning of Motions, the Presiding Officer would have informed the hon members that there are 30 minutes, whichever comes first, and all these interjections hinder your opportunities to deliver Motions without Notice.

With that being said, that brings us to the end of Motions without Notice, and we move on to the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon B Petrus, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Petrus. Agb Petrus.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

Mr B PETRUS (PA):

The Western Cape Constitution's lack of relevance in South Africa and how it undermines national unity and hampers efforts to achieve cohesive governance

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Dankie, agb Speaker. [Thank you, hon Speaker.] Hon Speaker, hon members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, officials and citizens. I speak on behalf of the Patriotic Alliance.

This is not an attack on the constitutional order of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Petrus, please just bear with me. I just wanted to make sure that your microphone ...[Interjection.]

Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, this is not an attack on the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: There we go.

Mr B PETRUS (PA): ...constitutional order of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, but what is the benefit and relevance of this Constitution for the millions of destitute people in the province. The aim and objective of any constitution must be to give hope and change the lives of our people. This is not the case with this Constitution.

†Agb Speaker, as die Wes-Kaap se Grondwet nie die ideale van ons mense verwesenlik nie, is dit nutteloos. Hierdie Grondwet bring niks fundamenteel om die hoop van Bruin, Swart en opkomende Blanke besighede te vervul nie. Ons mense is nog steeds uitgesluit van die grootste gedeelte van die

ekonomie, hetsy formeel of informeel. Ons kwalifiseer nie vir die groot kontrakte nie, maar ons doen die werk. Duisende mense van ons wag nog steeds op huise en op grond. Ons onderwys staar 'n krisis in die gesig en so kan ons aangaan. Dieselfde probleme soos al die ander provinsies wat nie 'n eie Grondwet het nie.

Deur hierdie Grondwet probeer ons 'n gevoel van andersheid kweek, maar ons is glad nie anders nie, agb Speaker. Dit is hierdie Grondwet wat toelaat dat onwettige immigrante geleenthede van ons mense steel. Ons is glad nie meer 'n koloniale verversingspos nie, maar deel van die Republiek van Suid-Afrika. Ons skree outonoom, maar as ons probleme het blameer ons die Nasionale Regering. Die vraag is: wil ons 'n agterdeur oophou vir afstigting? Die PA sal dit nie toelaat nie. Enige poging van afstigting sal hewig teengestaan word.

Agb Speaker, Skedule 4 en 5 van die Nasionale Grondwet gee vir ons reeds die funksies en werksaamhede van die verskillende regeringsvlakke. Die Nasionale Grondwet verleen reeds aan ons meganismes vir 'n samewerkende regering, alles in belang van ons mense en nasiebou. Hier verwys ek, agb Speaker, na Hoofstuk 3 Artikels 41, en ek haal aan (a):

“Beginsels van regering van samewerking en interregeringsbetrekkinge

41. (1)(a) dat die vrede, die nasionale eenheid en die onverdeelbaarheid van die Republiek bewaar word;

(b) die welsyn van die mense van die Republiek verseker;

(h) in wedersydse vertroue en goeie trou met mekaar saamwerk deur–

(i) vriendskaplike betrekkinge te bevorder;

(ii) mekaar te help en te ondersteun;”

Dit is wat die Nasionale Grondwet van ons vereis. Agb Speaker, ons sal u ondersteun om sterk stelsels te vestig, want dit is sterk stelsels wat ons hier het, maar kom ons los die valse narratief dat hierdie Grondwet ons beter maak as al die ander mense. Kom ons bou saam vir 'n verenigde Suid-Afrika en bemagtig ons inwoners wat vir jare benadeel was. Baie dankie.

[Hon Speaker, is the Western Cape's Constitution does not fulfil the ideals of our people, it is useless. This Constitution brings nothing to fulfil the hope of Brown, Black and White businesses. Our people are still excluded from the largest part of the economy, whether formal or informal. We do not qualify for the big contracts, but we do the work. Thousands of our people are still waiting on houses and land. Our education is facing a crisis and so we can continue. The same problems as all the other provinces that do not have an own Constitution.

Through this Constitution we are trying to cultivate a feeling of being different, but we are not at all different, hon Speaker. It is this Constitution that allows that illegal immigrants steal opportunities from our people. We are not a colonial refreshment post any longer, but part of the Republic of South Africa. We shout autonomy, but if we have problems we blame the National Government. The question is: do we want to keep a backdoor open

for secession? The PA will not allow that. Any attempt to secede will be opposed heavily.

Hon Speaker, Schedule 4 and 5 of the National Constitution already give us the functions and activities of the various levels of government. The National Constitution already provides us with mechanisms for cooperative government, all in the interest of our people and nation building. Here, hon Speaker, I refer to Chapter 3 Section 41, quote (a):

“Principles of co-operative government and intergovernmental relations

1. All spheres of government and all organs of state within each sphere must
 - a. preserve the peace, national unity and the indivisibility of the Republic;
 - b. secure the well-being of the people of the Republic;
 - h. co-operate with one another in mutual trust and good faith by -
 - i. fostering friendly relations;
 - ii. assisting and supporting one another.”

That is what the National Constitution requires of us. Hon Speaker, we will itizens support you to establish strong systems, because it is strong systems that we have here, but let us leave the false narrative that this Constitution makes us better than all the other people. Let us build together for a unified South Africa and empower our citizens who for years have been disadvantaged. Thank you.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Petrus. [Applous.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Petrus. [Applause.]] I recognise the hon Minister of Agriculture, Economic Opportunities and Tourism, hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker, hon members of this House. I am grateful to the Patriotic Alliance for bringing this topic, very crucial topic, to this House. This debate is of utmost importance as it will allow us to unpack historical and contemporary context. When there is a noise, you create a new narrative.

The thesis statement of this topic of debate of this hon member, is that the hon member believes that the Western Cape Constitution does not promote social cohesion. That is not the job of a constitution, that is the job of people. [Interjections.]

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Yebo!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And so, your and my behaviour must promote social cohesion.

Thank you, hon Speaker, for approving the topic of this debate in this House. My party, the Democratic Alliance, believes in constitutionalism and the rule

of law. We believe in non-racialism. We believe in a social market economy. We believe in the protection of private property rights. So, hon members, Section 142 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa allows us to pass a constitution for any province where applicable and amend it by a two thirds majority. It is, therefore, a constitutional imperative.

Section 143 of the National Constitution further determines that a provincial constitution must be consistent with the National Constitution. Hon members, Section 144 then further determines that once a Provincial Legislature passes, this body passes a provincial constitution, it must be submitted to the Constitutional Court. The Constitutional Court will then make a determination and certify it through the Constitutional Court.

Hon members, this ensures that the Provincial Constitution is compatible and in line with the provisions of the National Constitution. Hon member Petrus will appreciate that the amended text of the Provincial Constitution was certified by the Constitutional Court on 18 November 1997. From a constitutional, legal, and technical point, the existence of the Provincial Constitution is therefore valid and a significant asset in this House.

The hon member who put this topic on the Order Paper or the subject for debate, undertook in terms of this Constitution an oath of office in line with the National Constitution. Hon members, when you take an oath of office, it is a solemn commitment and should not be taken lightly. During that oath, we all undertook to respect and uphold the Constitution of the Republic of

South Africa and all other laws of the Republic.

Hon member, you swore an oath to the Western Cape Provincial Constitution. You are an hon member of this House. If you want to distance yourself from the Provincial Constitution, you can do so. You can write to the hon Speaker and say, ‘I am no longer bound by the oath that I took. I, therefore, would like you to consider my resignation with immediate effect.’ [Interjections.]

But, hon member, if you do not align yourself, you can distance yourself from this, but I do not want you to resign. You have been elected. I rather want you to apologise and learn to respect your oath with dignity. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Social cohesion is the second important matter that you raised in your motion. †Agb lede, sosiale kohesie is vir ’n vak in die aanhef van die Grondwet van die Republiek van Suid-Afrika, en ek haal aan. Dit is die sosiale kohesie se konteks, en ek haal aan uit die Provinsiale Grondwet. Die Grondwet sê:

“In diepe besef dat vrede, versoening en geregtigheid noodsaaklik is, In ons strewe om die ontwikkeling van Wes-Kaap en ’n beter lewensomstandighede-gehalte vir al sy inwoners deur regverdige en

doeltreffende regering te bevorder.”

Die konteks is: dit is reg. Verder sweer die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Grondwet:

“Ek sweer getrouheid aan die nasionale Grondwet.”

Dit verskyn, om die waarheid te sê, in die aanhef tot die Grondwet. Not in the post text, not in the text, in the pre-text. And so, it is clear that there is absolute consensus that this Constitution is aligned. Die aanhef van die Wes-Kaapse Grondwet begin soos volg, en sluit af met:

“God seën Suid-Afrika, Nkosi Sikelel’ iAfrika, God bless South Africa.”

[Hon members, social cohesion is for a subject in the preamble to the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, and I quote. It is the social cohesion’s context, and I quote from the Provincial Constitution. The Constitution says:

“Recognising and striving to heal the injustices of the past,
Recognising the need for peace, reconciliation and justice,
Endeavouring to promote the development of the Western Cape and a better quality of life for all its people through just and effective government;

The context is: it is right. Further the Western Cape Constitution swears:

“I swear allegiance to the National Constitution.”

It appears, in fact, in the preamble to the Constitution. Not in the post text, not in the text, in the pre-text. And so, it is clear that there is absolute consensus that this Constitution is aligned. The preamble to the Western Cape Constitution starts as follows, and concludes with:

“God seën Suid-Afrika, Nkosi Sikelel’ iAfrika, God bless South Africa.”]

So, this notion that we do not want anything to do with South Africa is a false narrative. When there is a noise, you change the narrative.

Hon Speaker, I do not want the Western Cape to succeed. I want South Africa to succeed. † ‘n Mens bevorder sosiale kohesie deur ‘n regverdige en doeltreffende regering daar te stel. Agb lede van die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Regering was voorheen gemeet aan die Impact Management Performance Assessment Tool. Four indicators.

“Strategiese beplanning;

Sinansiële beplanning;

Menslike hulpbronbestuur: en

Dienslewering”

Die Presidensie het besluit hierdie Kabinet en daardie vier internasionale indikatore wat opgestel is, [One promotes social cohesion through establishing a fair and efficient government. Hon members of the Western Cape Government were previously measured against the Impact Management Performance Assessment Tool. Four indicators.

“Strategic planning;
 Financial Planning;
 Human Resources Management: and
 Service Delivery.”

The Presidency decided this Cabinet and those four indicators that were drawn up,] the Office of the President says this Cabinet, this Government is the best in South Africa.

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Not us, not my word, from the Office of the President. ...[Interjection.]

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Yebo.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU, EKONOMIESE ONTWIKKELING EN TOERISME: Jaar na jaar het die provinsie die beste gevaar. Jy bou en

bevorder deur sosiale kohesie deur goeie dienste te lewer aan die mense. Statistiek Suid-Afrika meet vier goed elke jaar: watervoorsiening, sanitasie, rioolkwessies, vullisverwydering, elektrisiteitvoorsiening. Jaar na jaar sê Statistiek Suid-Afrika: die Wes-Kaap is die beste. Dit is hoe jy sosiale kohesie met jou gemeenskap bevorder ...[Tussenwerpsels.] want jy lewer dienste. Die visie van die Wes-Kaap is om 'n regering te bou wat vertroue skep.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Year after year the province has performed the best. You build and promote social cohesion by delivering good services to the people. Statistics South Africa measures four things every year: water supply, sanitation, sewerage issues, waste removal, electricity supply. Year after year Statistics South Africa says: the Western Cape is the best. That is how you promote social cohesion with your community ...[Interjections.] because you deliver. The vision of the Western Cape is to build a government that creates trust.]

That is the tool of social cohesion. When there is noise in politics, you are driven by a new narrative. So, an election is a fundamental tool to decide who and where the trust level lies. The voters have spoken on 29 May. That is now history. Under the leadership of this hon Premier, he has continued to outperform all other provinces. The Auditor-General confirms that. While this happened under the leadership of the hon Premier, let us examine what happened under the performance of the Patriotic Alliance.

The PA parachuted leaders into the Central Karoo ...[Interjections.]
announcing with much fanfare job creation, projects, bakery ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.
[Interjections.]

† 'n AGBARE LID: Dit is sy plig.

[An HON MEMBER: It is his duty.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: I want to conclude ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Your time is up, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: I want to conclude, hon member Lekker.

An HON MEMBER: He said your time is up ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: I must conclude.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: I conclude, hon Speaker, with your permission. History will judge the Patriotic Alliance, and they will be on the wrong side of history because Beaufort West was told it would become Dubai City ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and there is nothing left.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: ...hon Minister. [Interjections.] Before I recognise the hon Sayed. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, the fact that the powers of the Provincial Constitution of our beloved Province must now be discussed in a debate, reflects our growing concern with the DA's

consistent push for policies that undermine the integrity of our country's National Constitution. The Provincial Constitution of 1998 which we support and uphold, was adopted knowing full well that the law requires that it must remain fully aligned with the principles, mandate, spirit and letter of, and subject to, our National Constitution Act [No. 108 of 1996], which is the supreme law of the land. The Constitution of South Africa establishes the foundation of a unitary state where national, provincial and local governments are bound by the same laws and principles. ...[Interjection.]

† 'n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: As representatives of the people, we are all bound by it regardless of our political affiliations, ideology or personal ambitions. At the heart of this particular debate, hon Speaker, is the fundamental question: what kind of province do we want to build and how do we want to govern it?

The DA's incessant calls for greater provincial autonomy and a form of federalism, raises concerns about their commitment to national unity, social cohesion and nation-building. The success of the Western Cape is inextricably linked to the success of South Africa as a whole. History shows us that divided governance leads to fractured communities, increased inequality and greater tension between different levels of government. Let us be clear. The ANC is committed to national unity because we know that a

strong united South Africa is the key to a successful Western Cape. Inclusive economic growth, social development, job creation are not possible in isolation. It is only in cooperation, synergy and synchrony with National Government through shared resources and efforts that we will uplift our province. We are part of an interconnected economy, an integrated social fabric and a shared future.

Building walls around the Western Cape through populist separatist policy rhetoric only hurts us in the long run. All of us in this House are required to be more deliberate and intentional to ensure that intergovernmental relations and cooperation between our national sphere of government and the Western Cape Government, as well as this Legislature and the Houses of our National Parliament envisaged by the Intergovernmental Frameworks Act, are effective, strengthened and optimised. Through an effective intergovernmental system, we can work more purposefully within the current constrained fiscal environment to attain our national and provincial development goals. At the core of this is at all times to uphold the normative principles of cooperative government through which decentralisation of State power is enshrined in our Constitution.

Scholars of public administration and management in our country, including L P Malan of the University of Pretoria School of Public Management, have established a formidable body of knowledge on the subject matter. As far back as 2012, in an authored article titled *Intergovernmental Relations in South Africa*, Malan wrote that this normative framework is not based on

competitive federalism, but on the norms of cooperative governance.

As leaders and representatives in this Legislature, we cannot afford to be opportunistically selective about constitutionality in this Province. Let us dispense of the obsession of devolution at all costs. Let us make the Western Cape a national leader that drives intergovernmental relations and cooperation, to address issues of policy alignment, fiscal relations, integration and harmonisation in pursuing common objectives and a joint programme of work. This lies at the heart of what it means to be a capable and developmental state.

The reality, hon Speaker, is that our municipalities are the frontline of service delivery, and we cannot afford to let political rivalry get in the way of providing essential services to our communities. The ANC firmly believes that local government is not a battleground for narrow political posturing, but a space where collaboration and cooperation are vital. In every town across our beloved province, people rely on us to ensure that their needs are met: water, sanitation, electricity, housing, health, education. These are not abstract concepts. These are real issues affecting real people and they cannot be addressed by a province that is consistently at odds with the national leadership, and focused on abstract issues of federalism and power, rather than delivery. We cannot allow our communities to suffer because of a political contestation across our spheres of government.

The ANC is thus committed to working together in the spirit of national unity

and the GNU, to ensure that local government serves the people, not selfish political agendas. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In closing, hon Speaker, we must remember that the future of this province, like the future of South Africa, depends on unity, cohesion and nation-building. The ANC will continue to fight for a non-racial, non-sexist, democratic and prosperous province that works for all people united in diversity. I invite the Democratic Alliance ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, your time has expired, and I have allowed you some latitude to conclude.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...in this province to show us whether, indeed, they are builders of unity or breakers of nation-building, as their leader the hon Steenhuisen, our hon Minister of Agriculture, has so aptly put it. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. I recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, while Section 142 of the South African Constitution gives Provincial Legislatures power to

pass their own constitutions, Section 143, on the other hand, provides guidelines and limitations with regards to the contents of such provincial constitutions. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Constitution is just a copy and paste exercise from the National Constitution and it offers nothing, except a clause where the DA wants to call its members of the Executive Council Ministers, instead of just calling them MECs. Hon Speaker, they do so because they view the Western Cape as a mini-state because they know very well that they will never, ever govern the rest of South Africa. So, they might as well just view this province as a country.

Hon Speaker, the preamble of this Provincial Constitution outlines its purpose as that of enduring to promote the development of the province and to create a better-quality life for its people. However, hon Speaker, the lived reality by the majority of people in this province is totally opposite as the majority of African and Coloured people in this province do not experience a quality life under this DA Provincial Government, except for that of White people.

Segregation in this province starts with African and Coloured children of school going age who are constantly refused entry in the so-called former Model C schools and then told that the Provincial Education Department will find them suitable space in under-developed township schools. Hon Speaker, the difference between former Model C schools and previously disadvantaged township schools is so massive when it comes to learning, resources and sports facilities. It is not a coincidence that the majority of Coloured and

African learners cannot find space in these former Model C schools and by luck, White learners manage to gain entry almost immediately, because it is very much deliberate and intentional, which chief aim is to segregate and oppress.

Hon Speaker, the majority of White people continue to occupy senior management positions within this DA-led Provincial Government where they are just escalated to the top whilst African and Coloured jobseekers are told to apply for simple internships in which permanent employment is not guaranteed in the end. To add, the majority of our people still live in shacks within townships or stuffed up like sardines in a so-called Breaking New Ground shared housing units where if one flat catches fire, then the entire block of flats burns down.

In conclusion, it is a reality that this is what it is because this Provincial Government does not value the dignity of our people. Thank you.
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. Hon Jacobs, just before I recognise you. Hon members, I have allowed for some interjections because it is a political debate and I do not want to stifle freedom of speech and your rights during a political debate. So, I am saying that because the hon Petrus has been looking at me because I am not asking the House to keep quiet. It is a political debate and in the interest of all members, that is why I am addressing it now. I will only intervene, hon Petrus, once they are

drowning out the speaker on the floor and it affects the decorum of the House, and that did not happen yet.

With that being said, Hon Jacobs, I recognise you.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I am glad you mentioned freedom of speech, because now I am going to release myself. Hon Speaker, and ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You have all the privileges imparted by law, hon member.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): Thank you, hon Speaker. [Laughter.] Hon Speaker, the NCC rises to state that the Western Cape Constitution as mentioned by hon member Petrus, indeed lacks relevance. Hon Speaker, Section 4 of the Provincial Constitution clearly states that this constitution is subject to the National Constitution. The National Constitution is the only constitution that guides with the help of the Constitutional Court and deals with constitutional matters.

Hon Speaker, one of the biggest failures of this constitution was that since 1998, hon Minister you can learn something, this Constitution ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I am happy to learn.

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): ...clearly states the appointment of an Environmental Commissioner. This was only addressed in 2022. The lack of relevance is clear.

Hon Speaker, let us be honest. The Western Cape Constitution cannot overrule the National Constitution. As the NCC, we support the notion that this document is irrelevant. For example: it was an Act made by Government to declare the indigenous peoples were a pest and the commandos were sent in to get rid of the pest. Hon Speaker, it was an Act made by Government to call the Group Areas Act to declare Coloured areas as White areas.

Now, hon Speaker, going back to the forceful removals and dispossession of land, one would have assumed that the Provincial Constitution would speak out on these atrocities and deal with corrective measures. The fact that it does not, just confirms this. We believe this is an irrelevant document that only protects the colonisers' Roman Dutch custom laws. I thank you.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Jacobs. I recognise the hon Van Minnen.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. As hon members of our House, it is our sworn duty to promote constitutionalism and the rule of law. This is not a duty which should be taken lightly, given the fact that so many of our laws were so hard fought for over our history. Our National Constitution is recognised across the globe as one of the world's best and it is that document from which the authority for our Provincial Constitution derives.

The Constitution of the Western Cape is subject to the Constitution of South Africa and written in terms of Chapter 6 of that National Constitution. The Provincial Constitution was enacted by the Western Cape Provincial Legislature and came into force on 16 January 1998, after being authorised by the approved Constitutional Court. The Western Cape is, in fact, the only Province that has successfully managed to write and pass a Provincial Constitution ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): ...in terms of this Chapter which, incidentally, also for the information of the hon Cassiem, was at least two years before the DA was formed in the year 2000. The Provincial Constitution is there to regulate the structure and powers of the Government to the Western Cape ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): ...and to determine the values of our Province.

What is critically important to note is the fact that our Constitution has been legally certified to enshrine and remain consistent with the values of our hard-won National Constitution. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): While tailored for the diverse needs of our province, there can be no mistake that our Provincial Constitution is, itself, an offshoot of our National Constitution.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): It is thus surprising that the PA, which incidentally does not seem to have any policy or concept of government structures or provincial capacities, is of the view that this constitution is somehow lacking in relevance; but the Provincial Constitution despite its legislative and executive powers and functions emanating exclusively from our National Constitution, somehow undermines national unity.

Could it be that the Patriotic Alliance objects to the Western Cape's Constitution's founding principles of democratic values, the recognition of human rights, the recognition of the family, responsible and accountable

government, the rule of law, the principles of mutual trust and cooperation, and loyalty to the National Constitution? Are they of the view that this somehow undermines national unity and hampers efforts towards cohesive governance, though their leader certainly battles with the idea of cohesive governance. As of the last count, he seems to have promised his salary to about five different schemes and initiatives.

An HON MEMBER: [Laughter.]

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Can it be that the values enshrined in both the National and Provincial Constitutions ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Van Minnen, please take your seat. Hon Petrus, is that a point of order?

†Mr B PETRUS (PA): Ja, agb Speaker, dat ons hou by die debat, asseblief.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Ja, agb Speaker, dat ons hou by die debat, asseblief.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Kom ons hou by die debat. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Let us stick to the debate. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: The ...[Interjections.] Order, hon member. There is an hon member on the floor. So, you are rising on relevance? I will listen carefully,

but the hon member on the floor is still very relevant in my opinion, so I will listen very carefully, hon Petrus, for relevance. Hon Van Minnen, you may continue.

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Can it be that the values enshrined in both the National and Provincial Constitutions contradict their ideas of xenophobia and the reintroduction of the death penalty, both of which, hon Speaker, have been ruled by the Constitutional Court to be unconstitutional. Given that anyone with a mere smidgen of understanding of constitutional law would understand that the Provincial Constitution is indivisible from the National Constitution, it would in fact appear that the real issue that the PA has is that it views our National Constitution and the values that underpin that, as the problem.

Hon Speaker, it goes without saying that there is a reason for our National Constitution, a reason for our Provincial Constitution and a good reason for a constitutional order to exist. We must resist any and all attempts to undermine that order to move our country and our province towards an authoritarian and darker future. Our Constitution in this Province is more than a document which gives rise to the House in which we stand and while it is an extension, an augmentation of our hard-won National Constitution, it is more than a mere modification of that document.

Constitutions are symbolic things and ours enshrines and venerates the collective values of a diverse group or people we represent here in

Parliament. Our Constitution has also formed the legal framework in which South Africa's best run and most capable provincial government exists. We boast the lowest unemployment in our nation, and we punch above our weight in terms of job creation. We boast the majority of clean municipal audits awarded in all of South Africa, evidence of the strong environment of fiscal control and the safeguarding of public money that this Government holds dear. Once again, this is evidence of our values in this Province that the people should be served by those whom they elect, not taken for granted as a source of income, but everything the Government does should be in the best interest of the freedom, prosperity and wellbeing of our people.

In conclusion, our Constitution has formed the bedrock of a unique place in South Africa, one of unparalleled national beauty and one of tenacious and caring people that make this province the greatest in our nation. As more and more people forget the reason for these documents to exist, their relevance becomes ever greater and so, too, does the need to defend them. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Van Minnen. I recognise the hon Marais.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the one thing that is most relevant in South Africa is this Constitution. The topic for debate seems like a direct attack on the very basis of our constitutional democracy. The Western Cape's Constitution was ratified by the Apex Court

...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Amen!

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): ...because it is perfectly aligned with the National Constitution.

An HON MEMBER: Amen.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): And the drafters of this Western ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): ...Cape Constitution ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, please take your seat. Hon Minister, you cannot partake if you are not in your bench. [Interjections.] So, I just want to remind the hon members, you cannot participate ...[Laughter.] if you are not in your bench.

An HON MEMBER: You can say Minister. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: My apologies, hon Marais. You may continue.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the drafters

of the Western Cape's Constitution were true visionaries. They envisioned a prosperous Western Cape Province with devolved powers over some of their own affairs. A Parliament with Ministers unlike other provinces currently that are referred to as Legislators and MECs and the Constitutional Court had no problem with that.

Who did the PA consult? That the Patriotic Alliance in the Western Cape questions the relevance of this Constitution is shocking, foolish, and I think every Christian voter should flee from the Patriotic Alliance. Why do I say that? Because the opening of this Constitution reads:

“In humble submission to Almighty God”

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Unlike the National Constitution, where it does not appear. That is why we pray in this Parliament, yet the PA says this is irrelevant. Is God irrelevant? As the Freedom Front Plus, we believe language and culture are a strength and our diversity is a strength. That is why the Western Cape's Constitution gives equal status to Afrikaans, English and isi-Xhosa. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, there was time taken from me during

the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: The clock was stopped. The clock gets stopped every time I ask you that they proceed.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): I will conclude.

The SPEAKER: Please conclude.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): I will conclude. Hon Speaker, the very thought that the Western Cape's Constitution is considered irrelevant is ludicrous. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. I recognise the hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. *Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim*. Today I rise to address an issue that affects not just the people of the Western Cape, but the entire nation. The relevance. The Western Cape Constitution crafted within the context of South Africa's Constitutional framework was meant to empower provincial governance. However, in practice it has often fostered fragmentation, rather than cooperation. The recent provincial autonomy granted by this Constitution risks distancing the Western Cape from the shared values and national objectives. We seek to achieve a united South Africa.

This Provincial Constitution, while enabling local decision making, often contradicts or complicates national efforts aimed at fostering inclusive development, social cohesion and effective service delivery across the country. Its existence at times encourages the perception of provincial exceptionalism, creating a sense of division, rather than solidarity amongst the provinces in South Africa. In a country like ours where the scars of inequality and division still run deep, we cannot afford to be governed by documents that detract from the spirit of unity enshrined in the National Constitution. Our efforts to achieve cohesive governance are hampered when provincial interests overshadow the greater national good.

Hon members, our commitment should be to both a country where all provinces work together towards common goals. We need governance frameworks that unify not divide. It is time we reflect on how the Western Cape Constitution can be better aligned with the principles of national unity and cooperation ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, your time has expired.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...to serve all South Africans more effectively. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I recognise the hon Bryant.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in direct contrast to the topic of today's debate as put forward by my hon colleague from the PA, the Western Cape Constitution is, indeed, extremely relevant for South Africa and, in fact, helps to foster national unity and further our efforts towards cohesive governance. Hon Speaker, it is perhaps for this exact reason that certain new hon members of our body politic are so vehemently opposed to a Western Cape Constitution. These new populous movements have gained traction by actively encouraging us to fight with each other. The Western Cape Constitution in contrast, is designed to unite us as South Africans ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): ...and to quote from the preamble:

“Recognising and striving to heal the injustices of the past,
recognising the need for peace, reconciliation and justice.”

Hon Speaker, one can understand why these words would be an anathema to certain populous political parties that are only able to win votes at the ballot box by finding someone else to blame in order to distract from their own glaring inadequacies.

I mean, we have seen it here in the Western Cape, hon Speaker, where some populous parties have actively worked to stoke tensions between Black and Coloured communities, and to place the blame for low national economic growth and higher unemployment solely at the feet of immigrant families from other parts of Africa. Now, these populous parties are usually built around one big personality who claims to be the hero, sweeping in to save the day and vowing to address all grievances, and promising change.

But be under no illusions, hon Speaker, lurking beneath the big, broad ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bryant, please take your seat. Hon Petrus, is that a point of order?

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Ja, daar is. Daar is nog. Die DA het hulle eie *heroes*, nè. [Lag.]

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Yes, there are. There are more. The DA has their own heroes, nè. [Laughs.]]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Hulle het hulle eie *heroes*.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): They have their own heroes.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, honourable ...[Interjection.]

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Hulle bou rondom hulle eie *heroes*.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): They build around their own heroes.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Petrus ...[Interjection.]

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): En hulle weet wie dit is.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): And they know who these are.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Bryant, before you continue, I want to address that. Hon Petrus, that is not a point of order, just for the record. Frivolous points of order are also against the Rules. So, I wish to caution the hon members on rising on frivolous points of order. Hon Bryant, you may continue.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. But be under no illusions. Lurking beneath the big, broad smiles, the over-enthusiastic handshakes and the lofty promises, there lies a significant threat to the very values we hold dear. You see, populism has a knack for simplifying complex issues, creating an us-versus-them narrative. This kind of division can stoke social unrest and by dismissing the nuances of the many challenges we have faced, populous governments risk making hasty decisions and decisions that may not serve the common good. Moreover, populist leaders tend to hoard power like a kid with a packet of sweets or perhaps a pocket of popcorn, eroding the

checks and balances that keep our democracy robust. This sets a president and opens the door to authoritarianism, and we must not let this happen.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): We must instead continue to champion thoughtful, inclusive discussions that respect diverse perspectives and uphold the principles of democracy, and together we can build a society where every voice is heard, not just the loudest person on TikTok.

Hon Speaker, I would like to come back to the preamble of the Western Cape Constitution. It goes further to state, and I quote:

“Affirming that the Western Cape, a province of the Republic of South Africa, is founded on —
democratic values,
the recognition of human rights,
the recognition of the family,
responsible and accountable government,
the rule of law,
the principles of mutual trust and co-operation, and
loyalty to the National Constitution”

These are fantastic words, and I do not know how anyone would be opposed to them. But hon Speaker, I would like to focus on one particular part of this

section I have just quoted: responsible and accountable government.

Now, hon Speaker, one thing is clear, this DA-led Administration along with all our DA-led administrations across the Western Cape, strives to ensure a responsible and accountable government. Where we identify challenges, we deal with these head-on and we know we are not perfect. But, hon Speaker, this is certainly not the case everywhere in the Western Cape.

While DA-led municipalities take action against alleged fraudulent and corrupt activities, there are those under the control of other parties or other parties in the past, which have required intervention from this Province. The recent Western Cape High Court judgment of two days ago, regarding the Central Karoo District Municipality is a prime example. Here, the applicant, the leader of another political party, was denied leave to appeal and this serves as a potent example of the Western Cape Government's commitment to clean governance.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): This judgment squashes any attempt to overturn a previous ruling that may expose financial impropriety within that municipality. The Court's decision to uphold hon Minister Bredell's actions, particularly concerning the appointment of investigators to scrutinise the use of funds, demonstrates that no-one, regardless of their political standing, is above the law. This Court ruling showcases the Western Cape Government's

unwavering dedication to ensuring transparency and accountability in the management of public resources.

Hon Speaker, it is becoming clearer every day that voters want clean, effective and accountable governance. Nowhere is this more evident than in the most recent by-election results. For instance, in Ward 2 in the Cederberg where our Disaster Risk Management teams have worked tirelessly to reduce the impacts of severe flooding. In that by-election, the DA surged from 15,96% to 40,58% in 2024.

In Ward 17 in Stellenbosch, one of the top performing municipalities in the country, our support grew from 74% to 96%, and in Ward 58 in Cape Town, we grew from 84% to a massive 98,32%. ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Also tell where you are living.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Hon Speaker, the message is clear. The people of the Western Cape want high quality government, ethical leadership and a commitment to a set of values such as those set out in the Western Cape Constitution. I can assure you that the DA will continue to provide this where we are in government, and we remain fully in support of the Constitution of the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bryant. [Applause.] I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the ACDP is very proud of the Western Cape Constitution, with Michael Louis being part of the Western Cape Provincial Cabinet, the ACDP was part of drafting the Western Cape Constitution. The ACDP is proud because it is the only province that has its own constitution. We know that KZN attempted to pass their provincial constitution, but it was not certified by the Constitutional Court.

As previous members have said, our preamble should bring us together in humble submission to Almighty God, talking about the recognition of human rights, talking about the recognition of family, responsible and accountable government. It goes on and on, and that, the preamble, should bring us together. I cannot think that an hon member of this House will come and put a topic like this on the table to say that the Western Cape Constitution lacks relevance. Well, in South Africa that undermines national unity.

I want to remind the hon members that we have sworn an oath of office and that we will be faithful to the Republic of South Africa and the Provincial Constitution; that we will obey and respect and uphold the National and Provincial Constitutions. It is because of things like this, when we make remarks like this that people lose respect for the rule of law. I think it is shameful of the PA to bring this topic to the House, that will divide us more ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...and that ...[Audio distorted.] disunity to this province. I want to ask the PA to bring topics to the House that will unite us, that will bring us closer together because that is what the Province needs and that is what the people are looking forward to. Leaders that can lead, leaders that can bring reconciliation and that is what the ACDP wants to do and say let us build on this Constitution ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...taking forward. Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thanks ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Constitution is not irrelevant, and it does not undermine national unity nor cohesive government. Political leaders and political parties must resist the populous temptation of blaming the Constitution for the failure of our

governments, whether national or provincial, from achieving meaningful change for the people of South Africa and the Western Cape. Both the National Constitution and the Provincial Constitution impose a duty on our governments to transform our province from a society that is socially, economically, spatially and environmentally structured for apartheid, to a society based on justice, equity and equality.

The fact that our country, including the Western Cape, has failed to make more progress in tackling the entrenched apartheid legacy is not a failure of the Constitution. It is a failure of the leaders elected to government. Our National and Provincial Constitutions are documents of justice. We just need those in whom we place our trust to implement our Constitutions. It is a travesty that more often than not, it takes civil society to force governments to do the most basic things using our Constitution. Why must Ndifuna Ukwazi, acting for citizens who need housing, not take this Government to the Constitutional Court to enforce the right to adequate housing? Not because the Constitution empowers them to do so, but because our Government has failed to implement the Constitution. Why do we not have an Environmental Commissioner? Not because the Constitution has failed us, but because Government has not appointed one.

Hon Speaker, we have a Provincial Constitution that is like a provincial manifesto and Chapter 10 imposes active obligations on this Government to improve the quality of life for the people of our province, from providing adequate housing, sufficient food and water, creation of job opportunities, to

the protection of our environment. We can embrace this Constitution as the Western Cape's promise to the people who live here, and it is this Parliament's obligation to hold the Executive to account to deliver it. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Herron. I recognise hon Bans.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Constitution is a relic of privilege that stands in strong opposition to ...[Audio distorted] shared vision and [Audio distorted.] unity of progress. For 15 years, the Democratic Alliance, DA, has been the power in the Province, championing a misguided ...[Audio distorted.] government undermines national unity and hampers our collective efforts towards ...[Audio distorted.] dominance.

The Western Cape is the only province in South Africa with its own Constitution, a devious distinction that reflects a desire for autonomy at the expense of our national identity and unity. This Constitution serves not the people of the Western Cape, but a privileged few, perpetuating economic disparity and racial division. It is a testament to a party that seeks to preserve White privilege while the majority languish in poverty, unemployment and violent crimes.

South Africa is a unitary state, and federalism has no place in our vision for a non-racial, non-sexist democratic and prosperous society. It is said that it is

a false narrative that the DA Government does not want to be a part of South Africa yet let us be reminded of the following. The DA's recent attempt to pursue an unconstitutional Provincial Powers Bill to illustrate this alarming trend. Despite legal advice stating the Bill's illegitimacy, millions of rands were wasted on a bid to usurp the National Powers Bill, powers in policing, rail, trade and energy.

This blatant disregard for our unitary state structure is not merely misguided, it is a direct attack to our democratic fabric. In a province with a legislature designed for representation, we currently see a gross under-representation with only 42 seats serving over 7,2-million people. This is not exceptional governance. It is a mockery of our democratic principles. In other provinces there is one seat for every 100 000 people and in the Western Cape, it is a totally different story.

Hon Speaker, we cannot ignore the painful truth. The DA's governance has driven us into a quagmire of racial polarisation, tribalism and division. W B Yeats writes the following, I quote:

“Things fall apart; the centre cannot hold.”

The oppressive DA has successfully divided the Western Cape by race. Under its rule, we have witnessed the dismantling of our common ground, hindering our ability to address the most urgent challenges we face. The race-based unemployment affecting primarily African and Coloured

communities, remains a blight on our conscience and as it does, the rising tide of violent crimes and poverty in working-class communities. Instead of fostering inclusivity, the oppressive DA perpetuates a system that benefits a selected few, while the majority of our communities continue to struggle against these harsh realities.

†In plaas daarvan om inklusiwiteit te bevorder, het die DA 'n stelsel verewig wat 'n geselekteerde paar bevoordeel, terwyl die res van die gemeenskappe teen hierdie harde werklikheid stry. Verder moet ons nie die taktieke wat die DA gebruik vergeet nie wat vrees en rassiespanning vir politieke gewin benut nie. Voorvalle van rassisme, soos voorvalle in Pinelands High, is nie 'n geïsoleerde saak nie. Hulle is simptome van 'n politieke kultuur wat floreer op verdeeldheid. Wanneer ras 'n hulpmiddel vir mobilisering word, keer ons terug na 'n verlede waarvoor ons so hard geveg het om oor te kom.

Die ANC staan as die enigste party wat so toegewyd is aan 'n visie om 'n nie-rassige, nie-seksistiese en demokratiese en 'n welvarende samelewing te skep. Ander partye in hierdie eerbiedwaardige Huis wat verteenwoordig word, floreer op rasse-polarisasie en bevorder skadelike verdeeldheid onder ons gemeenskappe, veral tussen Swart en Kleurling.

Laat ons ons gedeelde geskiedenis onthou: Swart, Kleurlinge en Indiërs het almal onder die wrede apartheidsonderdrukking onteiening en uitbuiting ervaar. Dit is nie net moreel verkeerd nie, maar ook diep in ons verantwoordelikheid vir enige politieke party om taktieke te gebruik wat

poog om die eenheid van die onderdrukkers te breek. Ons moet die narratief verwerp wat ons teen mekaar opstel, in plaas daarvan moet ons solidariteit en samewerking onder alle onderdrukte groepe bevorder, met erkenning dat ons krag in ons eenheid lê. Die enigste manier om die opofferings van diegene wat vir ons vryheid geveg het, te eer, is om saam te werk. Praat eerder as om mure te bou en 'n gemeenskaplike pad na 'n regverdig en 'n billike samelewing vir alle Suid-Afrikaners te vorm.

[Instead of promoting inclusivity, the DA perpetuated a system to the advantage of a select few, while the rest of the communities had to struggle against this harsh reality. Further, we should not forget the tactics that the DA uses for creating fear and racial tension for political gain. Incidences of racism, like the incidences in Pinelands High, are not isolated matters. They are symptoms of a political culture that thrives on division. When race becomes an aid for mobilisation, we go back to a past which we fought so hard to overcome.

The ANC stands as the only party that is so committed to a vision to create a non-racial, non-sexist and democratic and prosperous society. Other parties in this august House who are represented flourish on racial polarization and perpetuate damaging division amongst our communities, especially between Black and Coloured.

Let us remember our divided history: Blacks, Coloureds and Indians all inexperienced dispossession and exploitation under the cruel apartheid suppression. It is not only morally wrong but it is also deep in our

responsibility for any political party to use tactics trying to break the unity of the oppressors.

We have to reject the narrative that we put up against each other instead of promoting solidarity and cooperation under all suppressed groups, with recognition that our strength lies in our unity. The only way to honour the sacrifices of those who fought for our freedom, is to cooperate. Rather talk than building walls and build a path for a fair and just society for all South Africans.]

Hon Speaker, despite this progress we have made, our struggle is far from over. The deep-rooted inequality in our society remains, largely due to the deliberate obstruction by parties like the DA. The opposition to transformative legislation, whether the Expropriation Bill, whether the NHI Bill or the Public Procurement Act, amplifies their resistance to the very changes needed to uplift our communities.

As we debate the relevance of the Western Cape Constitution, let us remember that our National Constitution binds us together. It is a document that should unite and pursue a more equitable society reflecting our collective aspirations. We must reject the divisive tactics of the DA instead. Work collaboratively to build a South Africa where every citizen can ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Let us work collaboratively to build a South Africa where every citizen can thrive free from the shackles of inequality. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very ...[Interjections.]

† ‘n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor! [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. [Applause.] Order, hon members. I recognise the hon Minister of Social Development, hon Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. The hon Acting Premier, Cabinet colleagues, hon members of this House and the citizens of the province. Today's debate topic is ironic because the only thing that is being undermined this afternoon is the South African Constitution, thanks to hon member Petrus and his party. †Nou, hulle hou daarvan om te sê die hond is los, maar die hond was los en die kar gevang, nou weet hulle nie om met die kar te doen nie. [Now, they like to say the dog is loose, but the dog was loose and the car was caught, now they don't know what to do with the car.] I thought between three hon members you could come up with a better debate topic. That is why you get a constitution or a parliamentary allowance to appoint researchers to put you on the right track

when you go down the wrong road.

But, hon Petrus, maybe because this is the first one, we can forgive you and it can become better in the future because this very Constitution, the National Constitution, enabled the Western Cape Constitution to pass. A Provincial Constitution that was passed nearly three decades ago and it states:

“The legislative authority of a province is vested in its provincial legislature, and confers on the provincial legislature the power—

(a) to pass a constitution for its province.”

It states so in our National Constitution, and we can also amend this Constitution in terms of Section 142 and 143. The hon Petrus, †jy sê dat die Wes-Kaapse Grondwet ons die valse gevoel van meerderwaardigheid gee. [you say that the Western Cape Constitution gives us the false feeling of superiority.] Brinkhuis used the same: exceptionalism, a false sense of exceptionalism. But, you know, hon Brinkhuis and hon Petrus, that exceptionalism is not in this Constitution, it is in the delivery of these governments in this province. That is where the exceptionalism comes from. It is that exceptionalism that makes a difference between Knysna where the ANC and the EFF and the Patriotic Alliance are running that town into the ground ...[Interjections.] compared to a Mossel Bay, where the DA shows exceptionalism. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Cape Town, Cape Town.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is the difference between ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Honourable ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Cape Town!

The SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: The City of Cape Town. Exceptional ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Minister, please take your seat. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And they are saying it.

An HON MEMBER: And racism!

†An HON MEMBER: Los maar.

[An HON MEMBER: Just leave it.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Petrus, I recognise you. Is that a point of order? [Interjections.] Hon members, there is an hon member on the floor and you continue with your interjections. There is a reason why there is a parliamentary process and privileges and mechanisms, and a point of order is

one of those privileges. If you have an issue with a parliamentary process or a Rule, please rise, but you cannot shout across the floor to one another if you object to anything or the content. Hon Petrus, my apologies for your hon colleagues on the floor for not allowing you that opportunity to raise your point of order, but I am now going to give you that opportunity if you so wish.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Dit is reg.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): That's alright.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Lithakong. Is that a point of order?

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Yes, thank you, hon Speaker. Can the previous speaker withdraw ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Can the previous speaker withdraw and stop lying because the EFF is not in government in any way in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Well, hon Lithakong, before I address ...[Interjections.] before I address you. The content of an hon member's contribution ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members! I am on the floor! The content of an hon member's contribution in any debate or statement is not for the Chair to

adjudicate. But what I am going to adjudicate on, hon Lithakong, is the fact that you are referring to an hon member in this House as lying and that is unparliamentary.

Hon members, there are Rules that guide the proceedings of this House. We have gone through the Rules on numerous occasions. We are all here representing citizens that elected us. I have allowed latitude during this debate because it is a political debate, but the minute it degenerates and it affects the decorum of the House, I am not going to tolerate it. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. There is a saying: †Die waarheid maak seer en leë blikke maak die meeste geraas. [The truth hurts and empty vessels make the most noise.] So, we will continue with the debate. [Interjections.] But hon Sayed, you say that the DA is against national unity, yet it is the DA that ensured that there is now a Government of National Unity ...[Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Ag, jy mag...

[An HON MEMBER: Ag, you may...]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...propping your party up. [Interjections.] So, I mean, ...[Interjection.]

† 'n AGBARE LID: Sies!

[An HON MEMBER: Siss!]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I do not think you realise how you can say the one thing, and then come and contradict yourself in the House. However, do you know what the real matter is? I think you are sour. I think you are sour because you failed to grow in this party. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, on a ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are liars!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order.

† 'n AGBARE LID: Sies!

[An HON MEMBER: Siss!]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! I have just addressed this matter. There is an hon member on the floor that wishes to raise a point of order. I have seen all the hands, but I have recognised hon Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, on a ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...point of order. In addition to the factual inaccuracy that the DA are the ones that have propped the ANC up because the GNU is a multi-party formation, the hon Minister in the Province and hon MEC in the country ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...is not supposed to speak directly to the hon members. He should speak through you. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members. Hon Minister, can I please remind you to please speak to the Chair. Hon members, I am not going to address the matter of contributions and the factual accuracies or inaccuracies, whichever side of the House you are on on the day. It is not for the Chair to adjudicate. Hon Lekker, is that a point of order?

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I was actually going to speak on the latter part of hon member Sayed.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much and it has been addressed. Hon

Minister Wenger, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: It is, indeed, hon Speaker. Is it parliamentary for hon members of this House to use blasphemous remarks?

The SPEAKER: That is absolutely not parliamentary. Hon Minister, are you referring to a particular hon member in the House?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I am, indeed. The benches of the Opposition who shouted out a blasphemous remark, and I would like to ask you to review the Hansard, please.

The SPEAKER: I will do so. Hon members, I will revert to Hansard and if there is a need for me to come back to the House with a ruling, I will do so. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. So, I am so glad that the hon Leader of the Opposition stood up and corrected himself now on what he said in his debate. Because he said we are against a Government of National Unity and then he actually now acknowledged that we form part of the Government of National Unity. So, that just speaks to the †gesplete tong benadering van die agb Leier van die Opposisie. Maar ek dink die werklike ...[Tussenwerpsel.] [forked tongue approach of the hon Leader of the Opposition. But I think the real ...[Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, while you have indicated you are not going to go into the content, but the hon Minister of the Province and hon MEC in the country ...[Interjections.] is misleading the House. You can look at the Hansard ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I can even give him a copy of my speech. In no way did I say in any words that the DA is opposed to the Government of National Unity.

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I said it is opposed to national unity and cohesion.

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They must listen.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I understand that he is excited ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You have raised your ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...to go ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You have raised your point of order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...all around and to destroy municipalities ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member! Hon Sayed, please take your seat!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But he must please not get excited.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we have come to the end of this debate. Can I once again remind hon members, when you rise on a point of order, you address the point of order. You do not need to motivate your point of order because that is for me to adjudicate on. Hon Walters, is that a new point of order?

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): Hon Speaker, I am slightly confused, but I was wondering whether he was misleading the House by saying the DA is not part of the Government of National Unity and that you have grown in the last election. [Interjections.] So, my apologies. I am left, I am confused. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Walters, that is not a point of order and hon members, you are now raising on frivolous points of order, and it is now my duty as the Presiding Officer in the interest of the work of this House to continue, and I am not going to allow any further points of order. Any further points of order. I have ruled and just for the record ...[Interjections.] hon members, if you consult your Rules, misleading the House is unparliamentary. [Interjections.] Hon Londt, hon Minister Londt, please continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. So, I think the real reason why the hon Leader of the Opposition is so sour because him and everybody on that side of the House, tried everything to get the DA below 50%. Every single party from the ANC to the Patriotic Alliance, to the Freedom Front, to the ACDP, to GOOD, to Al Jama-ah. Every single one of them tried to get the DA below 50% and you know what? The voters said no, because we want to trust this Government to give us another five years.

†En dit is waarom die Leier van die Opposisie so suur is want hy wou 'n lid

gewees het van a Provincial Government of Unity en die kiesers het gesê ‘nee’. [And that is why the Leader of the Opposition is so sour because he wanted to be a member of a Provincial Government of Unity and the voters said ‘no’.] And you know what he wants to do? Now, he wants to get into Government through the back door where voters have rejected them again and again and again. †En steeds gaan die kiesers vir julle sê: ‘nee!’ [Tussenwerpsels.] [And still the voters are going to say to you: ‘no’ [Interjections.]]

Hon Petrus, through you, hon Speaker, the Constitution of this country is protecting you today as it has protected you before. The Constitution of this country gives you freedom of association and to exercise your political rights. So, you are now speaking against the Constitution of the country. That Constitution that allowed you to be part of the GCI party, to be part of the ID party, to be part of the SAC party, to be part of the GOOD party, to be part of the Blue party and now, to be part of the Patriotic Alliance. So, do not undermine the Constitution that gives you the right ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...to bring things to the House today.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members ...[Interjections.] Hon Petrus and hon Lekker, please take your seats.

[Interjections.]

Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker.

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): It is not blasphemy.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Petrus, please take your seat.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, nêrens ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, nowhere ...[Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Petrus, please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): So, the hon Minister is not blaspheming now.

[Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: is it true that ...[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): The hon Minister is enjoying blasphemy now.

[Interjections.]

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, nêrens in die ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, nowhere in the ...[Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Petrus, I did not recognise you.

Mr B PETRUS (PA): Okay, no. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Lekker and hon Petrus, I have previously ruled I am not going to allow any further points of order on previous rulings that I have made. So, is this a new point of order? In that case, hon Lekker, what is your point of order?

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Hon Speaker, the hon MEC is treading on dangerous ground by reflecting on the integrity of the hon member. Can you rule on that one.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely. I will ask hon Minister. Hon Minister, please rise. Hon Minister, were you reflecting on the integrity or reflecting on any hon member of this House in your ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, you are welcome to rule me out of order. I was reflecting on all the political parties that hon member Petrus has joined over the years, as allowed by the

Constitution. So, I was stating facts.

The SPEAKER: Alright, so I will revert to Hansard in that case and ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members! I will refer to Hansard and look at the pretext, the context and the post text, and if the need be ...[Laughter.], I will revert back to the House with the ruling. [Interjections.] Hon Petrus, is that a new point of order?

An HON MEMBER: Focus on the debate, not the man.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Agb Speaker, nêrens en u kan dit ook nagaan, ons kan dit ook aanraak, nêrens in my toespraak het ek die Nasionale Grondwet aangeval nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Inteendeel, ek ondersteun in my toespraak die Nasionale Grondwet.

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, nowhere and you can also check it, and we can touch upon it, nowhere in my speech did I attack the National Constitution. [Interjections.] On the contrary, I support in my speech the National Constitution.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Petrus, that is not a point of order. Hon members ...[Interjections.] Hon members, I have been very lenient because I understand that it is a new environment and that we are all trying to work within the parameters of the Rules. If you do not agree with a statement or an input from any hon member on either side of the House, there are various parliamentary mechanisms at your disposal to rebut those statements. This is

not a dialogue, this is a debate, hon Petrus. So, you do not need to correct the input. There are other mechanisms as contemplated in the Rules for you to utilise. Hon Minister, let us hope that this is the last time. My apologies. You may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, would it be possible to just give an indication of my time remaining?

The SPEAKER: You have three minutes and 24 seconds remaining.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. We will also have to check the Hansard how often I got interrupted and time taken away, but I will make sure that I will stay to the text that I have written and continue the speech.

So, this Western Cape Constitution would not have been passed if there was an inkling that it was against the Federal Constitution. So, hon Petrus standing here today saying that the Western Cape Constitution, and in his words:

“Has a lack of relevance within South Africa and undermines national unity and hampers efforts towards cohesive governance.”

It is false. It is completely false, and he stood up in this House, and he swore an oath to uphold and protect the Constitution of the country and the

Constitution of the Western Cape. In fact, hon members:

“I, Basil Petrus, solemnly affirm that I will be faithful to the Republic of South Africa and the Province of the Western Cape, and will obey, respect and uphold the National Constitution, Provincial Constitution and all other.”

Thank you, hon Speaker. So, there it is stated that the hon Petrus said he will uphold the Provincial Constitution in this House, in his own words, he said he will uphold the Constitution and yet he comes here today and speaks against that very Constitution that he swore an oath to uphold. So, there are two things, hon Speaker. Hon ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Honourable ...[Interjections.] Hon Windvogel, is that a new point of order?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Yes.

The SPEAKER: Because frivolous points of order, hon members, in terms of the Rules are also not allowed. This is now. I think I have counted eight points of order during these eight minutes allocated to the hon Minister. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Well, mine is, hon Speaker, I just want to check if the hon Minister is prepared to take a question.

The SPEAKER: Okay, I will ask the hon Minister. Please take your seat.
Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, will you give leeway for a bit more time?

The SPEAKER: Absolutely not.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Then I will gladly take any question after this, but I would love to finish and if there is time left, then she can pose the question.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Ai, it is actual bribery.

The SPEAKER: The hon Minister is not prepared to take a question, hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): It is a form of bribery.

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members and hon Minister, you may continue.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Speaker. So, as not just the hon members in this House, but every citizen in this province heard, hon Petrus from the

Patriotic Alliance swore to uphold and protect the Constitution of the Western Cape. Now, he brings a motion undermining this very Constitution that he swore to uphold and protect.

So, the question is simple, hon Petrus were you truthful on the day you took your oath of office ...[Interjections.] or were you not truthful. And if you were not truthful, you cannot swear to uphold and protect this Constitution that falls fully in line with our National Constitution, and you should in fact, resign your seat today because you then lied in front of the House by swearing that you will uphold and protect this Constitution. I thank you. I will take the question. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You have disrespected this hon member [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Sayed, is that a new point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is a new point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The hon member is ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...claiming that another hon member is lying. I do not think you can use that terminology. You cannot say that the hon member is lying. Rather use the word 'misleading' the House, but not lying.

The SPEAKER: Okay, please take your seat. Hon Minister, did you refer to any hon member in this House as lying?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, I put the question on whether he was lying when he swore to uphold ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please. You do not need to justify it. I am asking you 'yes' or 'no'. Did you refer to any hon member in this House as lying?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, I have addressed it, so I will move on. Hon Sayed?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, can I propose that for the sake of progress, that you consult with Hansard and in our next Sitting, you come back with the ruling after having consulted with Hansard. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, that is the process to follow. As parliamentary practice, that is what I would have done in any case, but yes, absolutely. But it is also only right that I afford the hon member an opportunity to indicate whether or not that person, in fact, did transgress.

Hon members, with that being said, there are 51 seconds left. So, if the hon Minister has indicated that he will allow the hon member Windvogel an opportunity to pose a question, hon Windvogel you can now pose the question because there is still time.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I just want to ask the hon Minister was he so prepared to try to bribe one of our councillors in Swellendam? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, honourable ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, point of order. Point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I know. There is no need for a point of order. I will address it. Hon Windvogel, that is unparliamentary. You are now directly reflecting on the integrity of an hon member ...[Interjections.] and that is against the Rules, and for that reason that is unparliamentary. I have already ruled. Hon Sayed?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, with due respect, it was a question. I did not hear, if you listen and again, maybe you can refer to this to Hansard again and come back next week with a ruling. Because I did not hear the hon Windvogel saying to the hon Minister, 'this is what you did.' She asked, 'did you do that?' You must be very careful not to utilise ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...the concept of what is parliamentary to curb discussion inside of the House because when, on the other side of the House, you have got hon members reflecting on the character of hon members of the Opposition ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...then it is ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, honourable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...just shrugged off and people are asked ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I do not ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...if they said that or not.
Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I do not ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I have had my say. Thank
you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I am not going to entertain that because there are
other mechanisms for you to use if you do not agree with my rulings as the
hon Speaker. But the question posed for the record was from hon Windvogel
to the hon Minister, was, 'were you so prepared to bribe.' Not a question, it
was a statement and that is unparliamentary, and hon Windvogel, please
withdraw. Hon Windvogel, can you please withdraw.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hon Speaker, I refuse to withdraw.

The SPEAKER: In that case, can I please ask you to leave the Chamber. With
that being said, hon members, that brings us and that concludes the debate on
this subject, the Secretary ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, hon Speaker. I do have
51 seconds remaining ...[Laughter.] and I want to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. I have already concluded the debate. [Laughter.] That concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting, and the hon members will be exited from the Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:30.