## PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 08:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

# **BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order! I want to take this opportunity to welcome our esteemed guests to the sitting today. Please note that for this sitting the Standing Rules of the House will apply. Further in compliance with the Powers, Privileges and Amenities of Parliament and the Provincial Legislatures Act of 2004, this entire hall, including all visitor seating areas, passages and ablution facilities will be regarded as the precincts of the Provincial Parliament.

Order! Before we proceed, I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. Members, please note that by agreement with all parties there are two lecterns placed on either side of the Presiding Officer's

chairs, from where the members participating in the debate will make their speeches. Members must use the lecterns on their side. Members must switch their microphones on when they are recognised by the Chair. Each member will have a separate infrared device on his or her desk, as well as an earpiece using the channel-selection buttons. So for translation select channel 1 for Afrikaans to English translation on the right side of the unit. Select channel 2 for isiXhosa to English translation on the right side of the unit; select channel 3 for Afrikaans to isiXhosa translation on the right side of the unit; and on the right side of the unit are the channel controls and on the left are the volume controls.

Members, please note the service officers are seated at the back of the entrance of the hall. The Secretary will now read the first Order of the Day.

### Debate on Premier's State of the Province Address

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Mr Secretary. I have received a copy of the Premier's State of the Province Address delivered in the House on Thursday, 20 February 2020. The address is printed in the Minutes of the Proceedings and I now place it before the House for debate. I recognise the honorary member Dugmore.

An HON MEMBER: A point of order, hon Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, honourable... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I just want to check, is the House quorate? Do we have a quorum because I see no ANC members here?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have been told that we do have a quorum. That is correct.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, I have never before been referred to as an honorary member, but I am sure you meant honourable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My full apologies about that.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, there has been much debate since President Ramaphosa delivered his State of the Nation Address in Parliament and in our country. F W De Klerk's statement that apartheid was not a crime against humanity created much anger and resentment across our province and country. De Klerk had to be reminded that it was the United Nations that declared apartheid as a crime against humanity in 1973.

President Ramaphosa, in his reply to the debate yesterday on the State of the Nation Address, described such comments as treasonous. Today in 2020 it is treasonous to actively undermine genuine efforts to implement policies which are aimed at reversing the vicious system of apartheid and its impact on black South Africans, Coloured, African and Indian, but we should also never underestimate the impact that this system had on white South Africans. Apartheid installed hatred, fear and deep-seated prejudices against black South Africans amongst many white South Africans.

On the other hand, we all know that our country does have a proud history of involvement of all South Africans - black and white - in the struggle against apartheid. We need to acknowledge that undeniably apartheid gave rise to white privilege, a privilege built on deeply embedded and structural inequalities which in fact empowered only a minority of South Africans, but it was this struggle that gave rise to the principle of non-racialism, nonsexism, democracy, equality, these principles in fact being the very antithesis of apartheid.

It was these values and the fearless commitment to destroy apartheid and oppression that brought thousands of South Africans, many from here in Mitchells Plain and in the Western Cape, to this very Civic Centre - the Rocklands Civic Centre - on 20 August 1983 to launch the United Democratic Front.

Deputy Speaker, it was in this hall that people cried out "UDF unites, apartheid divides." It was in this hall that people sang: "Senzeni Na? †Wat het ons gedoen? [What have we done?"]

They also sang "Kudala Sisebenzela amabhulo" ["It's been a long time we are

working for the boers"] and they also asked P W Botha "Kutheni na kunjenje-nje." ["Why is it like this?"]

It was here that the masses of our people called for the unbanning of the African National Congress and other liberation movements and the release of Nelson Mandela and all political prisoners. It was here in the Rocklands Civic Centre, 37 years ago, where clauses of the ANC's Freedom Charter were celebrated. The people shall share in the country's wealth. South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white. There shall be houses, security and comfort. The doors of learning and culture †sal vir almal oop wees [will be open to all.]

Deputy Speaker, I am happy to announce that after representations from the African National Congress in the Western Cape, that Minister Nathi Mthethwa has informed us that the National Department of Arts, Culture and Sport has initiated a process to have the Rocklands Civic Centre declared a National Heritage Site. We believe that it would be appropriate to mark this declaration in a ceremony on 20 August 2020 in this very Civic Centre.

Deputy Speaker, I want to argue today that in fact many of the DA's policies - not all, but many, have the deliberate intention of actually preserving the persistent racial inequality which epitomises the legacy of apartheid. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not mislead the House.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: If you look at the DA's manifesto we have fought long and hard to make sure that there is a minimum wage in this country. If you look at the DA Manifesto they actually are against the minimum wage and want workers to be able to opt out to receive R1 800 a month compared to the R3 500 which is the minimum wage. That is DA policy entrenching the very inequality when it comes to wages. [Interjections.]

#### The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Policies of anti-redress which have divided this party between those that would want to build a nation and those that would want to preserve privileges - that is why we see the divisions within the DA today. The ANC speakers will be participating in this debate. Member Mesuli Kama will be speaking about safety. [Interjections.]

## The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Member Nkondlo will be speaking about the economy; member Ayanda Bans about arts and culture, and we also have member Danville Smith that will be talking about Local Government.

The vast majority of citizens in the Western Cape are without quality

healthcare and are without medical aid. Patients at the Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha Hospitals stand in long queues, yet Premier Winde comes here yesterday and argues against universal quality healthcare for all, which the National Health Insurance system will bring. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, the Provincial Department of Health on its own letterhead - on its own letterhead - attacks the NHI at the public hearings using this official letterhead, while the very same Department is receiving NHI funding from the National Government to implement NHI pilot projects. The DA in this province has denied the youth of Mitchells Plain and the Western Cape the opportunity to study medicine in Cuba and has also refused that Cuban-trained doctors can work in our province. Inequality in healthcare is the direct result of the legacy of apartheid and the DA's resistance to the quality and universal healthcare for all must be condemned in the strongest terms.

When it comes to education, he is not only disingenuous but also false to claim that education in the Western Cape is in good shape. Deputy Speaker, we have a crisis with education provisioning and it is time that the Premier and the DA face up to this. The crisis is caused by a leadership failure both at the political as well as at the departmental level.

This province was once number one for matric performance. We now languish in fourth place after Gauteng, the North West and the Free State. As we speak, 35 days into the school year, there are still 3 800 learners not placed in our schools. [Applause.]

Even more serious are the declining literacy and numeracy levels in the lower grade. When you look at Grade 3 and 9, it is very clear that they have shown a decline, yet the Department wants to spin and talk only about Grade 9 and compare it to 2018 and 2011. This is in fact misleading the people. It is not honest. It is not honest.

Learners are not safe in our schools and the question that we need to ask is why are there ex-IMG (Institutional Management Government) advisors and teachers, who are in excess, doing tedious work in district offices, while these posts were abolished. Surely they should be deployed in our schools as teachers. We also need to be careful about creating an impression that all so-called collaboration schools are succeeding. One school in particular, which I will not name here today, has dropped from a pass rate of 60% in 2018 to a pass rate of 40% in 2019. The DA has neglected schools in historically disadvantaged communities where the number of schools performing below 60% at matric has in fact doubled.

Here in Mitchells Plain, Deputy Speaker, there are over 65 primary high schools. Can one imagine how many high schools there are? There are only 17 high schools, but what is more shocking is that over the last ten years one single high school was built. But this is not even a proper high school, if you go to Tafelsig High, A Z Berman, you see some containers, but in ten years they have not built a proper high school in Mitchells Plain. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is the reality, and instead of blaming the accommodation problems, are we surprised then that there is a dropout rate in Mitchells Plain? Instead of blaming the accommodation problems on in-migration, surely we need to be looking at alternative solutions.

As the ANC we call for the reprioritisation of the entire Provincial Budget. If R1.4 billion could be found from provincial reserves, which mainly come from unfilled posts, then surely, if there was a political will, we can better fund education in this province.

Our shadow MEC for Education, we call him the Panyaza Lesufi of the Western Cape, because he does things. [Laughter.] He actually gets things done compared to the current MEC that we have, who complains and blames in the true spirit of Helen Zille - her favourite appointment. As one possible measure our shadow MEC has proposed that we engage former Model C schools to take just an extra 10 learners per grade at every high school. This would amount to extra 50 learners in a high school at an average of only two or three learners per class.

There are about 120 former Model C schools in the province, which would if

you put that calculation together, amount to about 6 200 extra places. We believe that many former Model C schools as well as the Governing Body Associations, the Foundations and FEDSAS are willing to discuss this proposal, yet the MEC does not even think of initiating this. We are not being prescriptive, but we put this forward for discussion by Governing Body Foundation, FEDSAS and the SGBs of former Model C schools.

In the majority of our schools we have too few teachers. We have overcrowded classrooms, and we have an MEC who has chosen to bring a law to this province about allowing schools to sell alcohol in particular conditions. Whereas the majority of schools in this province were opposed to that, she listened to the voice of mainly former Model C schools in this regard.

That is what she has been involved in at the behest of the former Premier Helen Zille, instead of doing what the Premier says we should do, focus on getting the basics right. She has failed.

Deputy Speaker I have in my hand a concept note and in fact drawings for the first pilot project to build houses for teachers and public servants at schools. I wish to acknowledge in the House, Principal Robert Bantom from the Kasselsvlei Comprehensive School sitting over there, whose SGB is in full support of this proposal, which I will present to the Premier next week and propose that an intergovernmental task team including National Government, Human Settlements, Education be established to implement this pilot at Kasselsvlei Comprehensive and explore creative ways of taking this pilot project to many more schools who sit with underutilised school land. The model, which we shall hear more about, is based on simply using 1500 square metres of land that is available at the school. 27 units, of which we have the designs; you will see these designs of the 27 units that we are proposing to be built there; the financial model, which at the end of the day will help Kasselsvlei Comprehensive generate funds so that they can employ extra teachers and do other things that the school needs.

We believe that this is indeed a game-changer and we are happy that the Premier has requested us to come with this proposal and we are more than willing to work with all spheres of government to make this a reality in this school and many other schools across the province. This will help with safety. It will help to stop vandalism, and it will provide more [inaudible - technical problem.] ...having teachers at the school will actually assist.

The legacy of apartheid spatial planning has left deep scars across our city and province. We were extremely disappointed to hear no concrete plan from the Premier to identify and release well-located land and buildings to address the affordable housing crisis in the province. Instead the Premier blames those who occupied Helen Bowden and Woodstock Hospital and we want to be clear we do not support illegal invasions, but remember Premier Winde was part of the Cabinet when MEC Minister Madikizela's Department proposed Tafelberg to be used for social housing. Mayor De Lille from the City of Cape Town proposed that it be used for social housing. Yet they went ahead and sold Tafelberg to private interests and then there was a reaction and which led to those invasions, which we do not justify, but it is rich of the Premier to come here today and raise that issue in the way that he has raised it, and I would ask, Deputy Speaker, once again, is this type of conduct not conduct that actually perpetuates the very legacy of apartheid?

Deputy Speaker, we support all efforts to sort out the serious crisis that has beset Metrorail. The lives of hundreds of thousands of commuters are affected. The solution, however, is not the DA's proposal to provincialise rail. It is about working together across all spheres of government. It was no surprise that the Premier failed to even mention the MyCiTi crisis that affected thousands of Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha commuters. The MyCiTi Bus Station in Mitchells Plain stands empty - a legacy to the DA City of Cape Town's failure to deal with this problem.

We should celebrate the Children's Commissioner, who will soon be appointed, but we should never forget that the DA Cabinet, that the Premier was also part of, refused to implement the mandatory provisions of the Provincial Constitution for more than ten years - this in a province where women and children are most vulnerable. In our minds this morning and our prayers go out to the family of Tazne van Wyk who was brutally murdered. We have to protect our children and we are hoping that the Children's Commissioner, once he or she is appointed, will be able to assist working with all departments.

Our province should also be aware that this DA Government continues to

refuse to appoint an Environmental Commissioner, also a compulsory provision in the Provincial Constitution. We are not convinced at this stage of the arguments which say that we should amend the Constitution so that you do not have to appoint this Commissioner. In the context of climate change and the need to build a resilient province, we, as the ANC, will intensify our campaign to have the lawful provisions of the Provincial Constitution implemented.

Deputy Speaker, the Premier said we do not need smart cities, yet only two or three kilometres away from here we have the Swartklip land that lies between Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha. It was a former arms factory now owned by ACSA. This site has the huge potential to create a city within a city where people from Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha and its surrounds can live, can work and play. Already the Department of Higher Education is building a massive satellite campus at the False Bay College to serve the youth of this area. I want to salute the leadership of ACSA who are committed to involving all surrounding communities in this development and all the opportunities that it has to offer and I appeal to the communities of Mitchells Plain and surrounds to unite and take full advantage of this opportunity.

We also welcome the decision of the National Department of Higher Education to build a second satellite campus in Bay View. It is unfortunate that the DA City of Cape Town refuses to make land available at no cost instead of choosing to sell the land which the children of Mitchells Plain will benefit from. At the same time the DA City of Cape Town wants to renew a lease of 55 hectares of land in Rondebosch to a golf club for R1000 a year.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member your time is up. Finish off.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Is this not further evidence of a party that is entrenching apartheid spatial planning and denying opportunities to the victims of apartheid? I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Before I call on the next speaker I would just like us to pause for a moment, in terms of Rule 6, ladies and gentlemen in the galleries, members of the public attending a sitting of the House or committee may not create comment, take part or clap at all in terms of the proceedings of this House. So please may I ask your indulgence? I have heard some interjections coming from the public, but this is only the privilege of the hon members in Parliament. Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Minister Madikizela. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker, Premier, the Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet colleagues, members of the House, honoured guests and all the leaders of the political parties who are here, and I want to start by thanking you, Deputy Speaker and the Speaker for bringing Parliament to the community of Mitchells Plain. This is a clear demonstration of a government of the people.

Deputy Speaker, on Tuesday last week, 11 February 2020, the nation

commemorated 30 years since the release of our first democratic elected President, Nelson Mandela from prison. It was a sign of victory against a terrible system of apartheid which was declared a crime against humanity by United Nations, and I agree with you, hon member Dugmore, when you said that. The whole country was jubilant, full of hope, at the prospect of a better future. Unfortunately, until today that hope remains a pipedream under the ANC National Government. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Blame the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: In that year, Deputy Speaker, 11 February 1990, the unemployment rate in South Africa was 18.7%, even at the height of apartheid. Today unemployment is more double to that year, at 38.7% with more than 10.4 million South Africans unemployed under the ANC Government, which is a serious indictment of this Government.

Deputy Speaker, we need to be absolutely clear the fight against apartheid was never about replacing an oppressor with a different face. It was never about enrichment of politically few connected through BEE deals, while millions languish in poverty. It was never about looting of state resources by a few to the disadvantage of the majority, and as the DA Government in the Western Cape we take full responsibility for our shortcomings, but I am very happy because this DA Government spent every cent that is directed at it to make sure that we improve the lives of this province. For far too long hon Deputy Speaker, the National Government has been allowed to emotionally blackmail South Africans and they got away with the murder by always blaming the plight of South Africans on apartheid.

On Thursday last week, Deputy Speaker, and yesterday, the nation waited with bated breath hoping that maybe, just maybe, President Ramaphosa will rise to the occasion and provide solutions to their plight. His address came a day after the release of the Quarterly Labour Survey by Stats SA confirming that unemployment in South Africa continues to rise. Unfortunately, we did not get the inspiration that all of us were hoping for. His speech did not go far enough to show the sense of urgency needed to attract investors to grow our economy and create jobs. Instead he confirmed that things will indeed get worse for those millions of South Africans who were hoping for a different message.

Mr Speaker, I must state this categorically clear that as long as President Ramaphosa and the ANC Government continue with this absurd idea and policy decision, as in collapsed countries like Venezuela and Zimbabwe, ideas like land expropriation without compensation, nationalisation of health through NHI and nationalisation of banks, South Africa is heading in the same direction as those countries, because President Ramaphosa must understand, it is not his intentions that count, but it is what he does after that speech that he delivered in the House last week and yesterday. Deputy Speaker, I must make this point very clear that land reform in South Africa is urgent and poor landless people are losing patience and I must also say that Section 25 of our Constitution does make provision for this to be done.

Instead of dealing with the elephant in the room under the ANC Government, which is corruption and incompetence, we have resorted to a knee-jerk reaction that will bring our economy to its knees, as it is the case with Eskom, SAA and Land Bank, etcetera. All these State-owned Entities are collapsing our economy and yet this ANC Government wants to nationalise more entities.

The question that we are asking ourselves, Deputy Speaker, is how on earth do we then trust the very same government that is failing us spectacularly every day with blackouts and dysfunctional rail transport to nationalise other critical levers of our economy and health?

In sharp contrast with the State of the Nation Address, Premier Winde yesterday outlined a clear plan for this Government to keep our communities safe, provide energy security, grow the economy and create jobs. That is why this province, despite unprecedented population growth, remains the only one where people have a prospect of finding a job, with the lowest unemployment in South Africa.

Deputy Speaker, although South Africa has a certain reputation for being able

to buck trends and get away with things which internationally are not normally achieved, we do not exist in an insulated bubble. Many of our citizens along with millions throughout the world are disillusioned with our Government. Our citizens and voters are exposed to enormous pressures and are desperate for hopeful signs and indications that government cares about them as people. These hopeful signs and indications cannot be just words strung together to make promises. Instead they must be real and contain clear signs of a better life.

Deputy Speaker, with this in mind I want to talk briefly about three areas in which the Western Cape Government makes a real difference to the lives of the people living in this province. That is transport, road safety and infrastructure.

Although the Western Cape is not a direct provider of public transport it has a key role to play in its regulation, funding and monitoring. It is the interim contracting authority for Golden Arrow Bus Services, subsidised service in Cape Town and virements, which transport more than 200 000 people every day. The importance of this regular service to our residents in the context of what has been for a very long period, a disrupted, unsafe and deteriorating rail service and more recently a suspended N2 Express service, cannot be over-emphasised. One of the additional consequences of failure of the commuter rail system and the suspension of the N2 Express service has been a significant additional demand for all forms of taxi services - your minibus taxis, metered taxis and e-hailing taxis. The province is charged with the issuing of operating licences on the basis of recommendations made by municipalities. This requires a range of monitoring and enforcement actions on the part of my Department.

Deputy Speaker, I meet regularly with the recognised bodies and organisations across the spectrum of the taxi industry in order to avoid clashes and to encourage the implementation of systems which can produce higher levels of safety, greater efficiency and better service for our commuters.

The Premier referred to some of these developments in his address yesterday. Deputy Speaker, I am pleased to be able to report to this sitting about three very recent significant achievements in the public transport space. All have been made possible by ongoing interaction between my Ministry and Department and other spheres of government. I personally have met on a number of occasions with my national counterpart as well as the Executive Mayor of Cape Town in order to reach an understanding which could result in significant improvement to public transport to our hard-pressed commuters.

Briefly these three areas as follows, Deputy Speaker: One, with regard to commuter rail, since the appointment of the PRASA Administrator there have been a number of constructive meetings with PRASA and this Province, concerning the re-establishment of safe, reliable and suitable rail service on the central line, because it is very, very important, Deputy Speaker, to put politics aside so that the National Government, the Provincial Government and the City of Cape Town can work together for the benefit of the commuters of this province as far as rail is concerned. This working relationship is aimed at ensuring, hon Deputy Speaker, that the amount of R1.4 billion announced by the President is in fact converted into operational and rolling stock improvement and the restored service. Very positive indicators have emerged from these meetings on a workable plan that will need to be jointly implemented.

Secondly, on the 11th of February, it was possible to announce to over 13 000 day commuters using the GoGeorge Bus Service to roll out in March of Phase 4 of this important public transport initiative. This rollout had been blocked as a result of disagreements between local minibus taxis industries. Here too, Deputy Speaker, has been close cooperation between the Province and the National Department of Transport; and the third one, at the request of various players involved, my Department has played a role in bringing together the City of Cape Town and other contracting parties in the N2 Express Service. We are very much aware, Deputy Speaker, of the pressure that is felt by the people of Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain and the speed with which we need to move to reinstate this route. Within the last few days agreement has been reached on the appointment of a facilitator. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, if you can finish off, Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Within the last

few days, Deputy Speaker, agreement has been reached on the appointment of the facilitator. I will take the process forward and that also is good news so that we can reinstate this route. [Applause.] I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you hon Deputy Speaker. Let me welcome this morning our councillors from Mitchells Plain and the sub-council chairpersons that are joining us this morning. Thank you for your presence. We know that you are the ones doing the groundwork in bringing service delivery to our people, so thank you very much.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the State of the Province Address delivered by Premier Winde yesterday was indeed one that reaffirmed the dedication to the residents of Mitchells Plain and the Western Cape and our commitment to build for every individual to determine their destinies and strive for success. Last year voters of Mitchells Plain gave us a fresh mandate under the leadership of Premier Winde and this Government has achieved in the Western Cape what the ANC can only dream of, in the last seven months.

With the persistent lack of support from the National ANC Government, the DA-led Government consistently continues to implement ground-breaking plans of action, despite the lack of support from the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Colleges... [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Member Dugmore earlier on talked about ACSA, but hon member Dugmore, we invited, and the Chairperson Deidré Baartman invited ACSA to Parliament and they presented comprehensive plans what we are going to do on Swartklip site... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: National Government [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And many of the councillors were at the meeting and as we see this morning half your colleagues are absent, so at those meetings, at the meetings at ACSA... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: With ACSA your councillors were also absent, as it clearly indicated... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...when we started only 26% of your MPLs were present and that the people of Mitchells Plain should take note of that. It is very serious because all of our MPLs are here. All of our councillors are here. The ANCs are absent. The ANC MPLs were not present and they earn a million rand a year, so when we go to elections in 2021 the people of Mitchells Plain must notice how little the ANC cares about them. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, order! [Applause.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, in the year 2001 former President Thabo Mbeki... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...introduced the Urban Renewal Strategy and he made a promise to the people of Mitchells Plain by their useless Mayor, then ANC Mayor, who ironically is now appointed as the Ambassador to the US, and hon Ghalib, we all know that Premier or the former Ambassador Rasool did great work in restoring relations with America, and I can only imagine the chaos and destruction the new Ambassador is going to take on in America like she did when she was Mayor of this town. [Interjections.]

Hon members, we know whatever the ANC says translates into nothing. It does not even translate into action. Yesterday they were supposed to Mitchells Plain. mobilise people in Ι think they had а *†handjievol mense hier!* [handful of people here!] A community as big as Mitchells Plain, they could only pitch - I think there were 15, 20 people. That is how little support they have because the people of Mitchells Plain know

they do not deliver. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Thank you. They are irrelevant, thank you Minister Fritz. You see, unlike the ANC, the DA actually has a plan and we want to welcome honourable Premier, the Western Cape Safety Plan delivered, because the SAPS is not delivering. And our honestly good men and women in Mitchells Plain - thank you for being here Brigadier, that works hard every day. On a political level and at a higher level we all know SAPS is completely destroyed under the ANC-led Government. [Interjections.]

This Government actually delivers and I want to thank the Premier for the Premier's Advancement of Youth Project for which we received 8 000 applications... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...of which 1100 people will be employed and many of those youth are here today. Robin, where are you and your crew? Can you stand up quickly so members of this House can see the youth of Mitchells Plain are benefiting from this programme, and starting on Monday, hon member Dugmore, 100 youth from Mitchells Plain will partake in our Youth Development Programme where we will take youth on a three-day programme and those youth are away from drugs, gangsterism and substance abuse and those are out of the 99, hon member Dugmore, that participated last year. I am sorry, 107. It was a 99% success rate, hon Deputy Speaker, 99%. So of that youth none of them are in drugs, alcoholism, gangsterism, and 77 of them are currently working at schools as safety ambassadors, and that is what we are doing, hon member Dugmore.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, one minute. I know I cannot tell you to take your seat, if you can just move back. I recognise you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, and I am raising it because it is just at the start of the debate. We do not want to set a precedent. The hon member Mackenzie must address you as The Speaker [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and not address the hon Leader of the Opposition directly, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Absolutely noted, thank you very much hon member Sayed, if you can address me.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, thank you Deputy Speaker, noted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, you may proceed. [Interjections.] An HON MEMBER: You need to stay focused.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Laughter.] You break my concentration, but anyway, Deputy Speaker, we also want to welcome the Western Cape Children's Commissioner... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And hon member Dugmore always refers to the last ten years, but he fails to tell the people of Mitchells Plain when they were in power they failed to deliver it. The Western Cape initiated the process and I was proud to be part of that process that we are going to have the first Children's Commissioner in the Western Cape, and member, shared by member Gillion Bosman, and thank you, member Bosman. Not only the first for the Western Cape, the first for the country, the first in Africa and that will contribute in dealing with some of the challenges in our community. [Applause.]

This, Premier, hon Deputy Speaker, consistently reduces red tape, to create jobs. Last year with the challenges with the Mitchells Plain fibre, I remember a Sunday night when the Premier made contact with me, "we need to sort out". There was a bit of an issue with the fibre and through my interaction with the councillors late Sunday night, our Mayco members from the City of Cape Town met on the Monday afternoon with our members – I will just finish the sentence... [Interjection.] The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish your sentence.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And Monday afternoon we met with our members and the City of Cape Town Councillors and fibres have continued because of the intervention with this Premier, because when we are in Mitchells Plain, hon Deputy Speaker, †ons vang nie slange nie, ons vang krokodille [we do not catch snakes, we catch crocodiles.] I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the hon member Xego from the EFF. [Interjections.] Order please, can we give him some time. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon member, if you can just step aside. I recognise you, hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just put your mic up, I cannot hear you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I would like to make a humble plea that the guests that are here do not participate in any activity that is taking place here. The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I again reiterate Rule 6. I have also heard some cell phones ringing. Please, if you are going to leave your phones on they have to be on silent otherwise we will unfortunately ask you to leave the parliamentary precincts because it is an interruption for our members speaking. Thank you very much. I ask your indulgence. You may proceed, hon member.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, Deputy Chairperson of the EFF in the Western Cape hon member Makamba-Botya, distinguished leadership... [Applause.] ...and members of the EFF present today, members of the Western Cape Provincial Legislature and staff, respected members of the public. It is a great honour and privilege for me to stand before you today on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters and respond to the State of the Province address by the hon Premier. But before I do so, let me earnestly also join calls in terms of extending our sincere, deepest condolences for the passing on of the eight-year-old Tazne van Wyk. May her revolutionary soul rest in eternal peace.

Mr Premier, you were indeed correct in your speech yesterday that the people of the Western Cape want a government that focuses on getting basic services right and most importantly to deliver them. And yes, that is exactly what the people of Mitchells Plain and the surrounding areas want to hear today and now.

Mr Premier, you went further yesterday to make sweeping statements that were without substance, very much uninspiring, claiming that your government has delivered in the past seven months. However, the truth is that you have not delivered even a half quarter of the promises you made in 2019.

In terms of unemployment, Mr Premier, the sad case reality is that the province's unemployment remains and the people here remain poor. The households are without breadwinners; that is what you promised last year, that you will make sure that there is a breadwinner in each and every household. [Interjections.]

In terms of the statistics they show that in the last quarter or the third quarter of 2019, the expanded unemployment rate in the province stood at around 24.5%, while youth unemployment at the fourth quarter currently stands at 26.2%. When you mentioned the 24 000 new jobs that you created in the past seven months you omitted to outline that the very same job losses happened in the very same period. You failed dismally to tell us how many people lost their jobs under your stewardship.

Mr Premier, you further omitted to mention your Government Department's

spending without filling the top management post and with the guise and hiding behind the excuse that you do not find a suitable candidate. That is the report of last year and yet you claim that you have created jobs. The number of jobs that we are bragging about here, they are predominantly unsustainable casual and contract jobs that you and your Government are bragging about in terms of internship and unsustainable jobs, such as call centres that you were bragging about here yesterday, that our people are working as call centre agents. [Interjections.]

Transport: in terms of transport indeed there is a serious transport and dysfunctional challenge, especially when it comes to trains, but you have a very serious challenge, even the one that is under your stewardship because I know very much you are going to shift the blame and move the goalpost and blame the National Government, which is what you do normally best and then you will fail dismally to explain to us as to what is your Government provincially doing, in terms of making sure that the taxi and the bus service, in terms of infrastructure, become functional.

In terms of human settlement, Mr Premier, the issue of land and shelter is an issue that is non-negotiable. We are going to take the land. We are going to amend the Section 25 of the Constitution. It is a reality that you need to wake up to and smell the coffee, together with your disciples next to you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

In terms of all these areas that you have highlighted that you will bring our

people closer to the cities; last year you came here with excuses of people that are occupying those areas and yet you come with no proper solution, a practical one as to what you are going to do, that you ensure that you bring our people closer to the cities instead of pushing them to the outskirts of the Metro. In terms of safety, furthermore, Mr Premier, safety is a very paramount sphere in our province, a very serious war waged against our people and our people are losing lives on a daily basis, and then this needs no politicking but a collective approach in terms is of seeing to it that our people become safe. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. Sorry, hon member I have to interrupt you, can you just put that on pause. I am hearing a telephone ringing and I am also hearing some interjections.

An HON MEMBER: It is the Leader of the Opposition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we please have your cell phones and mobile phones switched off and I also heard some interjections on this side. I am going to ask our Table, our staff to actually look at that and if that persists I will have to ask you to leave. My apologies, hon member.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much. In terms of education you have a serious crisis of education. We have dropped from the ranks nationally to number 4. [Interjections.]

There, exactly! Let us get to the why that you are looking for, together with your MEC of Education over there, whom you claim that the reason behind all this is the migration of people from the Eastern Cape. That is very much that is a very good assessment that is made by the DA, which is definitely a clear identity of who you are. [Interjections.]

#### An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M XEGO: You, together with your predecessor Helen Zille, have seen that people who move from Eastern Cape and come here become refugees and they must be labelled all sort of foolish funny names, and behind that is a quest to ensure that you establish a stigma towards black people that are coming from the Eastern Cape. You are not different from De Klerk and everybody else who see black people as "swart gevaar", a direct danger to the economy... [Interjections.]

### The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M XEGO: ...and everything else that is happening in the Western Cape. Can I continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Yes. You are not managing any time. There is only one speaker here. Do not be excited! [Interjections.] So in terms of what, how you are doing things, the kind of manipulation that you are putting to the voters of the Western Cape, it is an insult and a spit in the face of the man just next to you whose origin is in the Eastern Cape, just like the Speaker who is presiding over this House who comes here, who is a direct threat to you and your organisation in terms of being here. [Interjections.] So as the EFF we are saying it categorically clear that you need to stop your racist quest that is manifested as a solution of some sort in the Western Cape; that it is not a solution whatsoever, because you are creating hatred amongst the indigenous people of the Western Cape. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you hon Deputy Speaker, the Premier, MECs and members of the Provincial Parliament.

An HON MEMBER: A beautiful blue tie.

Mr M KAMA: You know, I do not blame you, Premier, for continuously coming to this House making promises and not being held accountable, because the Chair of the Committee that is supposed to hold you accountable stood here in front of the people of the Western Cape and exposed himself that he cannot even calculate what is a half. The ANC has 12 members in this Parliament and 11 of them are present, but he says less than a half are not present. [Interjections.]

#### The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: Deputy Speaker, even though I do not agree with the DA's endless attempts to steal the ANC's struggle credentials... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member Kama, best you start your speech so that you have enough time. Can we have some order in the House please? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He was not here.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Even though I do not agree with the DA's endless attempts to steal the ANC's struggle credentials I must however thank you on behalf of the Mitchells Plain people for bringing us to this revolutionary place today, the home of the UDF. I have, however, hoped that the majority of the guests will be veterans who were present during the historical launch of the UDF in 1983 as well as the Mitchells Plain residents. What was the point of bringing this SOPA here if the people are not given an opportunity to be part of this occasion and raise their challenges to the Premier? For God's sake, we have spent R2 million to be here today. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No! We did not.

Mr M KAMA: Or were you afraid that people would remind you about the

goal of the UDF which was to establish a non-racial united South Africa in which segregation is abolished and in which society is freed from institutional and systematic racism?

For as long as things remain this way in the province, the UDF members, even those who have crossed over to the Nats, should be reminded that the UDF unites, apartheid divides.

A constant feature of the DA rule in the province in the past decade has been a strained relationship with SAPS. Even though the Premier spoke at length about the good relations he has forged with the Provincial Commissioner, this has not yet translated into action. The Premier is still forging ahead with the intergovernmental dispute against Minister Cele. The Premier has failed to reprimand the Department of Community Safety on their half-baked research into Detective Services which was aimed at attacking SAPS. We urge the Premier to show his commitment to support SAPS in action as a strengthened relationship between the two institutions will be of benefit to the people of the Western Cape.

The disinformation that the Western Cape is allocated fewer police resources and thus unfairly treated, was repeated again yesterday. This deliberate mistruth has been clarified a million times. While the establishment has not responded to the growing population across all provinces, our province still maintains a better police-to-population ratio as compared to other provinces. To put this matter to rest, which is what the DA does not want to talk about, SAPS must speedily address the skewed allocation of police resources in the province and set targets to complete equitable redistribution. We are of the view that more police resources must be taken away from leafy suburbs which are even more protected by private securities and be deployed to Mitchells Plain and the Cape Flats where residents are anguished by gangs on a daily basis. The Courts have already ruled on this. It is now our role to support the Provincial Constitution to act accordingly.

Deputy Speaker, we welcome the commitment that safety will be the number one priority of the province and I want to use these remaining minutes to talk about the Premier's Safety Plan. Although as a Standing Committee on Community Safety we are here to be presented or briefed about this plan or even see the plan, we have opted to be more proactive than simply complain and we wonder whether the DA really takes the fight against crime serious in the Western Cape when even the Chair of the Committee is not part of the speaker's list when safety is the number one priority in the province. [Applause.]

The ANC's view is that if implemented correctly it can go a long way into aiding the work of SAPS to address safety challenges in the province. Whilst we cautiously welcome the deployment of additional boots on the ground, we want these officers to fall under the command of SAPS including their deployment as the Premier also yesterday assured us. We hope the Premier was being genuine when he said these officers will be under the command of SAPS and we should be taken into confidence with their training they receive
and their competence, not only to hold guns but to protect the people of the Western Cape.

The plan recognises apartheid spatial legacy, inequality, unemployment and poverty as some of the contributing factors to crime and violence, yet there is no plan and budget to address them. As the ANC we demand immediate plans to address this. Every safety plan should have communities in the centre of things. For this reason, as the ANC, we propose a pilot project for street committees to act as safety officers in their respective areas. Through the more than R1 billion rand Budget the Government should be able to support these street committees. These volunteers will ensure safety of not only members of that community but teachers and learners that are targeted daily by gun-wielding criminals.

Deputy Speaker, not all Neighbour Watch structures are applying for accreditation from DOCS. You hardly have unemployed volunteers in disadvantages socio-economic areas that apply versus those in affluent areas. It is a fact that DOCS has put in place a tedious process to apply for Neighbourhood Watch accreditation. The very same DOCS continues to encourage and divide Neighbourhood Watch structures between those that are accredited and those that are not. The same with the EPP programme for the CPFs. DOCS must give evidence of how the likes of Delft, Khayelitsha, Nyanga, Mitchells Plain and Philippi areas compare with the other areas and rural areas where there are not really crime hotspots. Local Government, Deputy Speaker, is obliged by the Constitution, the Constitution of the Republic in Section 152(1)(d) to promote a safe and healthy environment. Through the MEC of Local Government we should encourage municipalities to adopt safety of their communities as their number one priority and that it should be a major feature in the IDPs. [Applause.]

In closing, Deputy Speaker, the Premier did not say a word about the incident where a law enforcement officer murdered an on-duty undercover officer who was pursuing a wanted criminal. That incident on its own raised many questions about the competence of these law enforcement officers. It is such incidents that make us have reservations on the Premier's obsession with Boots-on-the-Ground.

We would once again wish to take this opportunity to send our deepest condolences to the family of Constable Thando Singh.

Lastly, gender-based violence and femicide remains one of the evils that our society is confronted with. The situation that the Van Wyks find themselves in as they have lost their beautiful daughter at the hands of another man, calls on us to double our efforts to end this pandemic. We congratulate SAPS on the work that they have done diligently to make sure that the perpetrator of this violence is arrested, and thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama. I now recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, Premier Winde, Cabinet colleagues, members of the Provincial Legislature, Director-General, heads of Departments, officials, colleagues, partners, residents of the Western Cape, media present, ladies and gentlemen. Good morning!

People forget that the Western Cape was once run by the ANC. I got into office ten years ago after the people of the Western Cape had decided to kick out the ANC because of their continued broken promises, corruption and lack of service delivery. When I joined the Western Cape Government in 2009, I found that not one out of 30 municipalities in this province had a clean audit. The Provincial Government responsible for Local Government functions was in complete disarray and this chaos impacted negatively on the ability of our municipalities to deliver even the most basic services.

Fast-forward to 2018 and the DA-run Provincial Government managed to deliver 12 out of 30 municipalities with clean audits. In addition, and including the 12 municipalities mentioned, a total of 26 out of the 30 municipalities received unqualified audits, which is still a significant achievement if compared to the previous years and to the national benchmark. <sup>†</sup>Agbare Speaker, nasionale verslae wat kyk na dienslewering in ons munisipaliteite landwyd; hierdie Nasionale Regering wat deur die ANC beheer word stel hierdie verslae op. Elke verslag, of dit nou die Ouditeurgeneraal, Statistiek Suid-Afrika of enige ander onafhanklike entiteit is, het een ding in gemeen, daar is een ding deurlopend, die DA regeer beter as enige ander party. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Applous.]

Daar is nie 'n munisipaliteit in die land wat beter regeer as die DA nie. Ons rekord van lewering van basiese dienste aan die armste van die armste is een waarop ek trots is. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Twee voorbeelde, agb Speaker, die mees onlangse Algemene Huishoudingsensus wat deur Stats Suid-Afrika uitgevoer is, het aangedui 93% van ons huishoudings in hierdie Wes-Kaap het spoeltoilette, 93.1%. Nagenoeg 4 000 skole regoor Suid-Afrika, met uitsondering van die Wes-Kaap, sit na 25 jaar van demokratiese regering onder die ANC, vandag met puttoilette. Nie een enkele skool in die Wes-Kaap het 'n puttoilet nie, agb Speaker.

Die onlangse Water en Sanitasie Meesterplan van die Nasionale Minister van Water en Sanitasie het gevind dat meer as die helfte van die rioolwerke van hierdie land wanfunksioneel en of heeltemal buite werking is. In die Wes-Kaap voldoen 83% van al ons rioolwerke aan die minimum vereistes. Ek kan aangaan, maar kom ek stel 'n uitdaging aan die ANC en aan die lede van hierdie Huis. Ek vra u om 'n lys saam te stel van die tien top of selfs 20 top munisipaliteite in die land. Gaan dan vanaand en kyk wie beheer daardie munisipaliteite.

### [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Speaker, national reports looking at service delivery in our municipalities countrywide; this National Government controlled by the ANC compile these reports. Every report, whether it is from the Auditor-General, Statistics South Africa or any other independent entity, has one thing in common, there is one continuous thread, the DA governs better than any other party. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

There is not a municipality in the country that governs better than the DA. Our record of delivery of basic services to the poorest of the poor is one of which I am proud. [Interjections.]

Two examples, hon Speaker, the most recent General Househould Census conducted by Stats South Africa indicated that 93% of our households in this Western Cape has flush toilets, 93.1%. About 4 000 schools all across South Africa, with the exception of the Western Cape, after 25 years of democratic government under the ANC, today are stuck with pit toilets. Not a single school in the Western Cape has a pit toilet, hon Speaker.

The recent Water and Sanitation Master Plan of the National Minister of Water and Sanitation found that more than half of the sewerage works of this country are dysfunctional or completely non-functional. In the Western Cape, 83% of all our sewerage works adheres to the minimum requirements. I can carry on, but let me put a challenge to the ANC and to the members of this House. I ask you to draw up a list of the ten top or even the 20 top minicipalities in the country. Then go and look tonight who is in charge of those municipalities.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the people of the Western Cape are no fools. They know when the Government cares for them and values them and sees them as important and not worthless voting fodder. No wonder that the DA won a two-thirds majority in the City of Cape Town as well as growing support in all areas in this province. [Interjections.]

The DA won an outright majority in 21 out of 30 municipalities in the Western Cape. The councils where the DA did win an outright majority, hon Premier, well, let us leave it to the members to determine how those councils perform. [Interjections.]

As Minister I am responsible for every citizen in this province, whether they vote DA or not, and my actions are open for scrutiny without fear or favour. My actions confirm that even in DA-run councils I have not hesitated to designate independent investigators to look into allegations of fraud, corruption and maladministration. [Interjections.]

### The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, when it comes to the George Municipality, for example, the record shows that I immediately ensured that the Hawks received these reports of alleged fraud and corruption activities, which resulted in the raid by the Hawks, regardless of the fact that two days later there was a by-election in that municipality, and you call me biased? Please!

If it must be noted that neither me nor the DA undertake these investigations, but rather specialised independent investigators whose report containing findings and recommendations are handed to the affected councils for action.

I have adopted a zero-tolerance approach towards corruption and fraud and have stated repeatedly if your hands are in the till I will not hesitate to slam it shut regardless of the colour of your T-shirt.

I challenge the ANC to show me a single council where they are in control where this has been the case in the Western Cape; in fact the opposite, hon Premier, the opposite. This was evident in the recent opening of the National Parliament when the disgraced former EThekwini Mayor was an honourable guest in the benches of the ANC. They reward corruption.

There are many other examples, but hon Premier, let us just look at Judge Zondo and ask... [Interjection.] The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Let us just ask Judge Zondo, who is chairing the Commission of Inquiry into State Capture that is daily recounting how the ANC-led councils and parastatals have been looted and stealing the future of our children; the future of the children of Mitchells Plain. If the ANC stops looting and stealing there will be money to build more schools in Mitchells Plain; there will be money to build more hospitals; there will be money to fix our infrastructure. So, hon member Dugmore, it is all on the ANC.

Similarly in George Municipality where in spite of the recent ... [Interjections.]

#### The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... forensic investigation into leadership in the council, the ANC still supported the implicated people. Why? In whose interest is the ANC acting? It is definitely not in the interest of the people. [Interjections.]

I want to take a moment to touch on the issue of alleged double standards

between the treatment of the Mayor of George and the Mayco member. This is a favourite bugbear of the Good Party to whom continually I claim that no action was taken against the councillor. Again, as my office has been in pains to repeatedly point out, the matter was sent directly to the Hawks when it came to my attention in 2018. Seriously, please, just do your research. [Interjections.] My position is clear, my responsibility is to serve the people of the Western Cape in every community, regardless of whom is in charge. [Interjections.]

<sup>†</sup>Agb Adjunkspeaker, as dit kom by die ANC in die Wes-Kaap, die party het die afgelope paar jare 'n legio van leierskapskandale. Ek hoef nie eers die name te noem nie, maar die ANC in die Wes-Kaap [Tussenwerpsels.] is 'n totale gemors. Daar is nie eers op die oomblik 'n permanente leier nie. Hulle ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

### [Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, when it comes to the ANC in the Western Cape, the party has had a legion of leadership scandals. I do not even have to mention the names, but the ANC in the Western Cape [Interjections.] is a total mess. There is not even a permanent leader at the moment. They...[Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... dien deur interim leiers. Die situasie is so ernstig dat die President verlede jaar na die verkiesing nie eers een, vir die eerste keer in die geskiedenis, nie 'n enkele ANC-lid van die Wes-Kaap in sy Kabinet aangestel het nie. As dit nie was vir die aanstelling van die leier van die Good Party as Minister nie, was daar nie een persoon van die Wes-Kaap in die Kabinet nie. Is dit nie 'n skande nie, agb Adjunkspeaker?

Is dit nie 'n aanduiding van wat die ANC dink en wat hulle voel vir die Wes-Kaap nie? Die ANC vandag het ons al lankal uitverkoop, Agb Adjunkspeaker. al waarin in die ANC se leiers belangstel is wat hulle en hulle vriende en families kan kry. Hulle wil net skep, agb Adjunkspeaker. Vir die res van ons voel hulle vere. [Applous.] Vir die arm mense van Mitchells Plain voel hulle vere. Vandag, 25 jaar na demokrasie, staan Distrik Ses nog leeg omdat die Nasionale ANC-regering in beheer is. Hulle weier om aksie te neem; hulle weier om ons mense se waardigheid te herstel.

Die Premier in hierdie provinsie het op verskeie kere gevra, "Gee vir die Stad en die Provinsie die mandaat, en ons sal die mense herstel, hulle waardigheid herstel, hulle terugbring stad toe binne vyf jaar." Dit is 'n skande en die skande is op die ANC, agb Adjunkspeaker.

Ek kan net afsluit met 'n belofte: hierdie Wes-Kaap Regering is 'n regering vir al die mense van die Wes-Kaap, en ons is vasbeslote om 'n verskil te maak in die lewens van die mense in die Wes-Kaap. Ons is vasbeslote om ten spyte van die ANC se inmenging en kriminaliteit aan te hou bou. Ons sal aanhou bou en aanhou geleenthede skep vir die mense van die Wes-Kaap. Die rede is eenvoudig, die mense van die Wes-Kaap het 'n waarde vir hierdie DA-regering. Hulle is ons mense, agb Adjunkspeaker, ons ag hulle, en ons dien hulle met 'n passie, agb Adjunkspeaker. Ek dank u. [Applous.]

# [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... serve through interim leaders. The situation is so serious that last year the President after the election did not, for the first time in history, appoint even one single ANC member of the Western Cape in his Cabinet. Were it not for the appointment of the leader of the Good Party as Minister, there would not have been a single person of the Western Cape in the Cabinet. Is that not a disgrace, hon Deputy Speaker?

Is that not an indication of what the ANC thinks and what they feel for the Western Cape? The ANC today has sold us out long ago, hon Deputy Speaker. All the ANC's leaders are interested in is what they and their friends and families can get. They just want to scoop, hon Deputy Speaker. For the rest of us they feel nothing. [Applause.] For the poor people of Mitchells Plain they feel nothing. Today, 25 years after democracy, District Six is still standing empty because the National ANC Government is in charge. They refuse to take action; they refuse to restore our people's dignity. The Premier in this province has asked on various occasions, "Give the City and the Province the mandate and we will restore the people, restore their dignity, bring them back to the city within five years." It is a disgrace and a disgrace on the ANC, hon Deputy Speaker.

I can just conclude with a promise: this Western Cape Government is a government for all the people of the Western Cape, and we are determined to make a difference in the lives of the people in the Western Cape.

We are determined to continue building in spite of the ANC's interference and criminality. We will continue to build and to create opportunities for the people of the Western Cape. The reason is simple, the people of the Western Cape have a value for this DA Government. They are our people, hon Deputy Speaker, we respect them, and we serve them with a passion, hon Deputy Speaker. I thank you. [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the hon member. [Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: Tjoepstil. [Tussenwerpsels.][An HON MEMBER: Dead silent. [Interjections.]]

†'n AGB LID: Tjoepstil. [An HON MEMBER: Dead silent.] The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B N HERRON: Let me start by reminding the hon Bredell that it was his own National Party that created apartheid, created Mitchells Plain, and the reason we are here is because his own National Party forced people from District Six to Mitchells Plain and left them here. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Let me also say to the hon Bredell ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B N HERRON: ... that we know that there have been charges laid against George councillor, Stag Cronjé. The DA took action against Melvin Naik, but the DA, as a party, have not taken action against Cronjé. You have not suspended him, you have not asked him to resign, and I want to know did you benefit from the referral fee that Cronjé's son got from Old Mutual? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

#### The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr B N HERRON: ... last year the Minister of Finance brought an LO to the National Assembly, and our Minister of Finance brought a *spekboom* to our Parliament. Hon Deputy Speaker, this is a protea ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sorry, sorry ...

Mr B N HERRON: ... and I cannot ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon one minute. Hon member, if you can just step aside. What is your point of order, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I think the hon member was casting aspersions on the MEC. [Interjections.] He asked ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can I please listen to the point of order?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He asked ... [Interjections.] Keep quiet!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lili, I am the Chair [Interjections.], you are the member. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He asked whether – I do not know, perhaps I heard wrongly but I think he asked whether the MEC benefited from the transfer of the funds. I just want to check. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will revert to Hansard if it was an accusation rather than a question. You may proceed.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, I can clarify. I asked if the DA benefitted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted.

Mr B N HERRON: So, this is a protea, the icon of the Western Cape fynbos. The protea is named after the god Proteus, and Proteus apparently could see into the future and he told the truth about it.

Now we do not need a Greek god, Deputy Speaker, to tell us about the future. The world scientists are already telling us what is happening in the future. Our future is a changed climate and we are running out of time to avoid the worst impacts of it.

Everyone here knows this too. We live through and survived a drought that in a normal climate would have been a one in 3,000-year drought, but we no longer have a normal climate and we will probably see worse droughts in our own lifetime. What can we do to stop it, hon Deputy Speaker? Well, climate change is caused by carbon emissions. During the SOPA I was hoping to hear a plan on how we are going to reduce carbon emissions. We have the highest biodiversity of any region in the world and this province has a duty to lead the way, but because of development and climate change, thousands of species are at risk, including this protea and its R460 million a year industry.

Protecting the environment, the air we breathe, the water that we drink, is the responsibility of all of us and Government must lead the way. What I wanted to hear the Premier say is this:

1. That the province will get to work on fixing public transport. No meetings, engagements, facilitators, blah-blah-blah-blah-blah. This means not protecting the useless leadership in the City of Cape Town that stopped the MyCiTi service to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain in June last year and have been unable or unwilling to restore it. It means not wasting time visiting empty train stations. Action means working with Metrorail, PRASA, SAPS, Metro Police, to start trains and stop the metal chop shops. [Interjections.]

We cannot accept, hon Deputy Speaker, that in September we will get a limited service of a train every 30 minutes, that only goes as far as Philippi. That is not good enough. Public Transport is better for the planet, for the economy and for our commuters' pockets.

- 2. Hon Deputy Speaker, every town and city must plan for inward growth with well-located affordable housing. This means the Province will have to identify well-located public land for affordable housing, regardless of what Patricia de Lille and the National Government does. Stopping urban sprawl means we can protect farmlands, reduce travel distances, reduce traffic congestion and carbon omissions.
- 3. We must prepare for the new energy economy. Patricia de Lille took the Minister for Energy to court in 2016. She did this to fight for the right of municipalities to procure electricity themselves. She knew she had to fight for safer, cheaper electricity. No mayor before and no mayor since has done it, and I know the DA likes to claim this as their work, but they are clinging to her coattails, because an original thought never entered their heads. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wanted to hear a plan from the Premier. What the Premier presented yesterday was limp, trite and unimaginative. We need a plan that ensures that renewable energy projects are developed in a way that benefits all our people, not just DA politically connected mayors and landowners throughout our province. We need to make sure that this new energy economy creates work for everybody; the opportunities are there, there is no plan to meet those opportunities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, why is it urgent? You can hear in my voice it is urgent. Climate change is already having a devastating impact on agriculture, water costs, fire risk and our overall economy.

In Mitchells Plain a resident had a heart attack when she received a R60 000 water bill from the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.] Your City government is sitting on billions of cash reserves, fleeced through high water costs from families like those living in Mitchells Plain.

Our farms are experiencing lower crop yields and seeing massive job losses. Those impacts will make unemployment, poverty, inequality, hunger, disease and social instability worse. I was hoping to hear a plan that would manage this. Instead we got business as usual and a repeat of all the promises that were made last year. Every single one of them was made last year. [Interjections.]

### An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Mr B N HERRON: Last year the Premier promised to run a clean ethical government. The lifestyle audits have not been done. Some of its MECs have been implicated in cadre deployment; theft of municipal services and driving irregular, overpriced land purchases, and nothing has been done.

The Premier says he is committed to spatial integration, but the DA leader in the province only buys the outermost land, worst located land for Government housing, even though Government has land in better locations. [Interjections.] The DA says they cannot build affordable housing next to floodplains in Rondebosch, but hell, they can build affordable housing next to floodplains in Doornbach in Dunoon.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off your last sentence.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, we have less than 500 weeks to act. I call on all parties, all spheres of government, every person, to acknowledge we are in a climate emergency and we must act with the speed the global crisis needs. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Applause.] I recognise hon member Philander. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, Premier, all guests present. Hon Deputy Speaker, I think the previous speaker must just accept the fact that the Minister's job is to release land. We are not asking for special favours here but that the National Government abides by its constitutional obligations. We will then fulfil ours in respect of due process. [Interjections.] Just accept and do.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

<sup>†</sup>Me W F PHILANDER: Agb Adjunkspeaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.] [Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

<sup>†</sup>Me W F PHILANDER: ... as politici moet ons ten alle tye die feite aan ons gemeenskappe voorhou. Ons moet oopkop en eerlik wees oor wat ons belowe, wat moontlik is en wanneer dit gedoen kan word, agb Adjunkspeaker. As ons as verkose leiers hier staan voor ons gemeenskappe terwyl ons mekaar kritiseer as Opposisiepartye, moet ons dapper genoeg wees om die verantwoordelikheid aan ons opgedra, voor die korrekte deure te lê, en nie mekaar te mislei omdat ons politieke punte wil inwin nie.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, die Staande Komitee vir Onderwys het 'n besoek gebring aan Dias Primêr in George, en eerstehands waargeneem van wat nog gedoen moet word.

By Cedar Hoër hier in Mitchells Plain het die prinsipaal 'n beroep gedoen op besighede en die behoefte uitgespreek vir ekstra opvoeders en hoe die skool die salarisrekening van ekstra opvoeders nie kan dra nie.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, die oneweredige nasionale kwintielsisteem het tot gevolg dat onderwysers moet besluit watter kinders by die betrokke skool kan deelneem aan die voedingskema op watter dag. Nou hoe sê 'n juffrou vir 'n kind, "Vandag kan jy nie kos kry nie", terwyl sy weet dit is die eerste en die enigste maaltyd wat daardie kind sal geniet, agb Adjunkspeaker, en dit terwyl ons by die Saldanha polisiestasie was en besoek afgelê het en verneem het dat oortreders geregtig op drie maaltye per dag.

Hierdie, agb Adjunkspeaker, is wat fout is met ons land. Die Nasionale Regering maak beleide wat kinders minder gee as wat hulle oortreders gee. Die Nasionale Regering is onbekwaam en te arrogant om te wil weet of te wil verstaan wat die werklikheid van sake is in hierdie land van ons.

# [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms W F PHILANDER: ... as politicians, we have to present the facts to our communities at all times. We have to be open-minded and honest about what we promise, what is possible and when it can be done, hon Deputy Speaker. When we stand here in front of our communities as elected leaders, while we criticise each other as Opposition parties, we have to be brave enough to lay the responsibility entrusted upon on us before the right doors, and not mislead each other because we want to score political points.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee for Education visited Dias Primary in George and observed first-hand what still needs to be done.

At Cedar High here in Mitchells Plain the principal has appealed to businesses and stated the need for extra educators and how the school cannot afford the salary account of extra educators.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the unequal national Quintile system has resulted in teachers having to decide which children at the specific school can partake in the feeding scheme and on which day. Now how does a teacher tell a child, 'Today you cannot receive food," while she knows it is the first and only meal that child will enjoy, Deputy Speaker, and this while we had been to the Saldanha police station and visited and were informed that offenders are entitled to three meals per day.

This is what is wrong with our country, hon Deputy Speaker. The National Government creates policies that give children less than they give offenders. The National Government is incompetent and too arrogant to want to know or want to understand what the reality is in this country of ours.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to rectify the ANC misconception on equality and its link to the Democratic Alliance. Inequality is written into the proclaimed transformation policies by the ANC Government, and perpetuated to existence by the failure to eradicate corruption and to rather protect party interests to the point where they are too occupied to see the challenges this poses to the delivery of the very basic services in our country. It is a vicious cycle that started with negative growth of the economy to a gutted state of education, justified by a heavy public wage bill, land appropriation without compensation, and failing SOEs. <sup>†</sup>Agb Adjunkspeaker, ongeag die uitdagings, die konstante vermindering van die begroting en ons weet in wie se sakke hierdie geld beland, het van ons matrikulante 82,3% geslaag, en 'n aansienlike verbetering getoon in wiskunde en tale in Grade 3, 6 en 9 [Tussenwerpsels.]

Agb Adjunkspeaker, in die Wes-Kaap bestaan die wil om te doen, die wil om gemeenskappe te verbeter. As mnr Semmery, die prinsipaal van Weltevrede Hoërskool in Wellington, vir 'n aantal aande by die skool kon slaap om te verseker dat die skool nie geplunder word nie; as ons ouers hand aan die ploeg slaan, hoe kan ons nie doen wat ons veronderstel is om te doen nie? En ons sal nie ons gemeenskappe in die steek laat nie.

Die DA-regering in die Wes-Kaap het sedertdien drie nuwe skole gebou en nie een van die 13 swak-presterende skole in die land is in die Wes-Kaap geleë nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ons doen ons bes met wat ons het. Staan by ons, die mense in die Wes-Kaap.

In die Wes-Kaap staan ons nog 'n kans; ons kinders staan nog 'n kans om die leer van sukses te klim en wat ons in die Wes-Kaap doen kan ons in die res van die land doen. Ons kan Suid-Afrika regmaak, staan by ons. Met ons geheel samelewings-benadering, soos in die Premier se Provinsiale Rede genoem gister, beteken dit nie omdat jy arm is jy nie 'n kans het op ekonomiese geleenthede, kwaliteit onderrig en gesondheidsorg nie, en jy kan deel wees van 'n voorspoedige gemeenskap. Dis net in die Wes-Kaap, agb Adjunkspeaker, waar elke liewe departement hulle gewig ingegooi het teen geweld.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, in die Wes-Kaap werk ons hard saam vir almal. Dit is die enigste provinsie waar die werkloosheidsyfer inderdaad krimp. Staan by ons.

Ons is bevoeg en ons gemeenskappe, ons wil hulle dien. Adjunkspeaker, ons mag nooit die ANC 'n kans gee om hier te mors soos hulle opmors in die res van die land nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Staan by ons hier in die Wes-Kaap.

### [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, in spite of the challenges, the constant reduction of the budget, and we know in whose pockets this money ends up, 82,3% of our matrics passed, and showed a considerable improvement in mathematics and languages in Grades 3, 6 and 9 [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape there exists the will to act, the will to improve communities. If Mr. Semmery, the principal of Weltevrede High School in Wellington, could sleep at the school for a few evenings to ensure that the school is not plundered; if our parents can work hard, how can we not do that we are supposed to do? And we will not leave our communities to themselves.

The DA Government in the Western Cape has since built three new schools

and not one of the 13 poor performing schools in the country is situated in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] We do our best with what we have. Stand by us, people of the Western Cape. .

In the Western Cape we still stand a chance; our children stand the chance to climb the ladder of success, and what we can do in the Western Cape, we can do in the rest of the country. We can fix South Africa, stand by us. With our whole of society approach, as mentioned in the Premier's Provincial Address yesterday, because you are poor does not mean that you do not have a chance to economic opportunities, quality education and health care, and you can be part of a prosperous community. It is only in the Western Cape, hon Deputy Speaker, where every single department threw in their weight against violence.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape we all work hard for everyone. It is the only province where the unemployment figure actually decreases. Stand by us.

We are capable and we want to serve our communities. Deputy Speaker, we may never give the ANC any chance to mess up here as they do in the rest of the country. [Interjections.] Stand by us here in the Western Cape.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

†Me W F PHILANDER: Agb Adjunkspeaker, daarom verwelkom ek die

Premier se Provinsiale Rede en in besonder die verbintenis om elke moontlike hulpbron tot ons beskikking aan te wend tot voorspoedige ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

### [Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, therefore I welcome the Premier's Provincial Address and in particular the commitment to apply every possible resource available to us to the prosperous...[Interjections.]]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†Me W F PHILANDER: ... ekonomiese groei ...[Tussenwerpsels.][Ms W F PHILANDER: ... economic growth...[Interjections.]]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

<sup>†</sup>Me W F PHILANDER: ... en gemeenskappe ...[Tussenwerpsels.] [Ms W F PHILANDER: ... and communities...[Interjections.]]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

<sup>†</sup>Me W F PHILANDER: ... wat floreer in vooruitgang. [Ms W F PHILANDER: ... that flourish in progress.] Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker!

<sup>†</sup>Me W F PHILANDER: Ek dank u. [Ms W F PHILANDER: I thank you.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker! The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... your time is up.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Sorry, did someone interject?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, yes, hon ... [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think you are very

biased. That hon member's time was up long time ago. That five minutes ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I have just said her time was up.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... was over.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have actually given everybody an opportunity to finish their sentence, and that has been across all parties.

Ms L J BOTHA: Who woke up and made you timekeeper?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I recognise the hon member Bans.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Beaufort West.

An HON MEMBER: Beaufort West!

†'n AGB LID: Hoe gaan dit met Beaufort-Wes?[An HON MEMBER: How is it going with Beaufort West?]

<sup>†</sup>Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Dit is eintlik Murraysburg.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is actually Murraysburg.]

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

†Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Dit is Murraysburg.[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is Murraysburg.]

Ms A BANS: In a diverse province like the Western Cape one would really expect in the speech of a Premier to hear Cultural Affairs being mentioned, because Cultural Affairs and Sport is the Department that brings people together.

<sup>†</sup>Maar nietemin, ons gaan voort, al is die omstandighede soos dit is, ons gaan nie moeg raak nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die betreurenswaardige sporttoneel soos hier in Mitchells Plain is 'n bewys van 'n groeiende ongelyke [Onhoorbaar.] en apartheidsbeplanning. Ons mense word afgeskeep. Die meeste dinge wat hierdie elitistiese? regering in die Wes-Kaap vir armes doen is blote skynsdiens en is te min.

Die Departement wat mense nader aan mekaar moet bring, kry te min en doen minder om eenheid te bevorder, soos wat sy doelwit is. Geleenthede gaan maar verby en ons almal weet daarvan. Veral in arm gebiede moet nog groot werk gedoen word. Adjunkspeaker, kyk na die geriewe in Mitchells Plain en elders, en sien hierdie Departement is aan die slaap en sommer baie vas aan die slaap. Die Departement mag sê alles is nie in sy taak nie, maar hy behoort 'n groter rol te speel om kultuur en kuns te bevorder. Hy kan ook help om koste en huur van geriewe laag te hou of te betaal. Nou word sport net vir politieke punte gebruik. Dit is nie reg nie. Dit is nou 'n skande.

Gemeet aan ander plekke in boomryke buurte met dik grasperke, waar gras beter as mense versorg word: Constantia / Khayelitsha – 'n groot verskil - is Mitchells Plain en ander agtergeblewe gebiede 'n woesteny. Jy kan dit sommer ooglopend sien.

Die jammerlike toestande wat in ons woonplekke heers, wys te min is gedoen om werklik 'n verskil te maak, met 'n afskeepbegroting daarby gaan dit der miljoene rand kos om gelykheid en reg daar te laat geskied.

# [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[But nevertheless, we continue, even if the circumstances are as they are, we will not tire. [Interjections.]

The regrettable sports scene as here in Mitchells Plain, is proof of a growing unequal [Inaudible.] and apartheid planning. Our people are neglected. Most of the things that this elitist Government in the Western Cape do for the poor are mere show service and too little. The Department that has to bring people closer together, receives too little and does less to promote unity, as is its goal. Opportunities just go by and we all know about it. In poorer areas, especially, a lot of work needs to be done.

Deputy Speaker, look at the facilities in Mitchells Plain and elsewhere, and see that this Department is asleep and in fact quite asleep. The Department may say everything is not within its task, but it should play a greater role to promote culture and art. It can also help to keep costs and rent of amenities low or to pay for it. Sport is now only used for political points. That is not right. That now, is a disgrace.

Compared to other places in leafy suburbs with thick lawns, where grass is treated better than people: Constantia / Khayelitsha – a big difference -Mitchells Plain and other disadvantaged areas are a desert. One can just see that immediately.

The sorry circumstances existing in our living areas showed that too little has been done to really make a difference, with a neglect budget it is going to cost millions of rands to bring about equality and fairness.]

<sup>†</sup>Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Soos die *Youth Hub* in Beaufort. [The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): As the Youth Hub in Beaufort.] †Me A BANS: Ek was geskok onlangs ...[Tussenwerpsels.][Ms A BANS: I was shocked recently...[Interjections.]]

<sup>†</sup>Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Soos die *Youth Hub* in Beaufort. [The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): As the Youth Hub in Beaufort.]

<sup>†</sup>Me A BANS: Ek was geskok onlangs, agb lid Mitchell, toe ek van ene Eddie moes hoor wat sy been in rugby gebreek het omdat hy in die afgeskeepte voorstede oor 'n ongelyke stuk grond geval het.

Hierdie soort van onaanvaarde onaanvaarbare sandputte en grasperke is 'n alledaagse gesig en is ook in gebiede van die Karoo en ook in die Overberg. Jy kan dit in die Boland ook sien.

Dit is ook te duur vir talle en ver om te ry om deel te neem. By 'n ander geleentheid sal ek verduidelik hoe moeilik dit is om in die plattelande gebiede deel te neem aan sport. Dit is 'n baie moeilike taak en 'n duur taak.

## [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[Ms A BANS: I was shocked recently, hon member Mitchell, when I had to hear from one Eddie that he had broken his leg in rugby because in the neglected suburbs he fell over an uneven piece of ground.

These sort of unacceptable sand pits and lawns are an everyday sight and

found also in areas of the Karoo and also in the Overberg. One can also see it in the Boland.

It is also too expensive for many and far to travel to participate. At another opportunity I will explain how difficult it is to participate in sport in the rural areas. It is a very difficult task and an expensive task.]

<sup>†</sup>Die AJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Soos die dorp [Onduidelik - praat gelyktydig].

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Like the town [Inaudible – speaking simultaneously].]

<sup>†</sup>Me A BANS: Die Provinsiale Departement moet meer doen om sake te koördineer met die plaaslike regering en Nasionale Regering, en nie 'n eiland wees op hulle eie nie.

[Ms A BANS: The Provincial Department should do more to coordinate matters with the Local and National Government and not be an island by itself.]

†'n AGB LID: Ja! [An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

<sup>†</sup>Me A BANS: Veral die afskeep van inheemse- en gemeenskapsport is 'n skreiende skande.

Met die verdere verpligting om naskoolse programme met sport aan te bied, moet die Departement dit laat slaag in die belang van ons leerders wat uitval, om tienerswangerskap te voorkom of dwelm- en alkoholmisbruik te kan hokslaan.

Let wel, Adjunkspeaker, ons mag Chester Williams verloor het, maar dit is nie die einde nie. Daar is baie spelers in die platteland, in ons gemeenskappe waar ons vandaan kom. Wat doen ons om hulle potensiaal uit te bring? Ons het Lundi Msenge van Swellendam; Gilroy Philander van Paarl. Hulle is tans in die EWK Liga in Paarl. The Black Pearl is alive in them. Daar is potensiaal al die pad, maar ons doen niks om daardie potensiaal na vore te bring nie.

Sport is een van die maatskaplike teenvoeters om gemeenskappe op te hef; mense vertel die Departement sleep voete en help net bolangs. Dit weet ons ook. Dit is net sekere plekke wat gehelp word.

Party geriewe is in 'n skokkende toestand of staan flenters onbenut, veral waterpype, pompe en besproeiingstoerusting het baie aandag nodig. Kyk net hier rond soos in Swartklip, Dolomite, Portlands, Lentegeur, Westridge, Woodlands, Strandfontein en hier in Rocklands, hoe die geriewe verval het. Wat het ons daaraan gedoen? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Veiligheid moet ook verskerp word. Ons hoor net van die *Safety Plan*. Ons het rondgestap hier in die stadions hier in Mitchells Plain. Drade is af en niks word daaraan gedoen nie. Waar is die *Safety Plan*-aanstellings wat ons gedoen het van 500 persone? Waar werk hulle? Te veel gebruik geriewe wat dit onder 'n groter druk en agteruitgang plaas. Te min gimnasiums is beskikbaar met te klein ruimtes en uitgediende toerusting. Opelug-geriewe word polities bemark, maar die weer met wind, reën en sonbrand asook die wegwys van jongmense is 'n groot probleem.

Talle geriewe is ontoeganklik vir mense met spesiale behoeftes en ook vir vroue. Dis is onvergeeflik, dit is baie onvergeeflik dat die Departement nie ingetree het toe die gholfbaan in Khayelitsha aan Golden Arrow vir 'n busstaanplek verkoop is nie. Ons almal weet as ons ontspanningsplekke wegneem en busse daar laat staan, dit is waar die kriminele rekords begin. Dit is 'n skande.

In die sogenaamde bevordering van sport en ontspanning word te min gedoen om Wes-Kaapse sport in die agtergeblewe gebiede aan te <del>moeg</del> moedig. Die agtergeblewe gebiede bly maar net agter; kinders speel nog steeds met plastiekballe. Daar is nie 'n verskil nie.

#### [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow:]

[Ms A BANS: Especially the neglect of indigenous and community sport is a crying shame.

With the further obligation to offer after school programmes with sport, the

Department has to make it succeed in the interest of our learners who drop out, to prevent teenage pregnancy and counter drug and alcohol abuse.

Please note, Deputy Speaker, we may have lost Chester Williams, but that is not the end. There are many players in the rural areas in our communities where we come from. What are we doing to bring out to their potential? We have Lundi Msenge of Swellendam; Gilroy Philander of Paarl. They are currently in the EWK League in Paarl. The Black Pearl is alive in them. There is potential all the way, but we are doing nothing to bring that potential to the fore.

Sport is one of the social counter measures to uplift communities; people say the Department is dragging its feet and is only helping on the surface. That we also know. It is only certain places that are assisted.

Some amenities are in a shocking state and are standing broken, unutilized, especially water pipes, pumps and irrigation equipment require a lot of attention. Just look around here as in Swartklip, Dolomite, Portlands, Lentegeur, Westridge, Woodlands, Strandfontein and here in Rocklands, how amenities have deteriorated. What have we done about it? [Interjections.]

Safety should also be stepped up. We only hear about the Safety Plan. We have walked around here in the stadiums in Mitchells Plain. Fences are down and nothing has been done about that. Where are the Safety Plan appointments we made of 500 people? Where do they work? Too many use
amenities which places it under greater pressure and deterioration. Too few gimnasiums are available with too small spaces and outdated equipment. Open air amenities are marketed politically but the weather with wind, rain and sunburn, as well as the turning away of youth, are a big problem.

Many amenities are inaccessible to people with special needs as well as to women. That is unforgivable, it is very unforgivable that the Department did not step in when the golf course in Khayelitsha was sold to Golden Arrow for a bus station. We all know that if we take away recreational places and let busses stand there, that is where criminal records begin. It is a disgrace.

In the so-called promotion of sport and recreation too little is being done to encourage Western Cape sport in the disadvantaged areas. The disadvantaged areas simply remain disadvantaged; children are still playing with plastic balls. There is no difference.]

## [The Speaker takes the Chair.]

<sup>†</sup>Die Departement sal homself natuurlik op die rug klop, maar die vraag bly, is dit genoeg om net die minimum te doen? Ek dink nie so nie. Waar nie ingemeng word nie het hierdie Departement al ingedons soos in Boland se atletieksake. Die Minister moet vertel wat sy baie meer vir kuns, kultuur en sport gaan doen as die ANC ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

## [Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows:]

[The Department will of course pat itself on the back, but the question remains, is it enough to just do the minimum? I do not think so. Where there is not being interfered, this Department has already barged in as in Boland athletics matters. The Minister has to say what more she's going to do for art, culture and sport than the ANC ...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...

†Me A BANS: ... versoek steun ...[Tussenwerpsels.][Ms A BANS: ... support request...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: ... Bans ...

†Me A BANS: ... in Rocklands se Nasionale Erfenis ...[Tussenwerpsels.][Ms A BANS: ... in Rocklands' National Heritage...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: ... will you please wrap up.

<sup>†</sup>Me A BANS: Die Minister moet vertel wat sy baie meer vir kuns, kultuur en sport gaan doen en die ANC se versoek steun om Rocklands 'n Nasionale Erfenisplek te laat verklaar.

[Ms A BANS: The Minister must say what more she's going to do for art, culture and sport and support the ANC's request to have Rocklands proclaimed a National Heritage Site.] I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

#### An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon members, I now recognise the Minister of Agriculture, Minister Meyer.

†'n AGB LID: Gooi kole! [Tussenwerpsels.][An HON MEMBER: Throw coals! [Interjections]]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, hon Premier and Cabinet colleagues, the Leader of the Official Opposition, our leaders of political parties present here today and hon members of the Western Cape Legislature; colleagues, friends and citizens of the Western Cape, and more appropriately citizens of Mitchells Plain. I want to acknowledge all our councillors from Mitchells Plain, our sub-council Chairs. I also see Councillor Woodman, Councillor Mark Kleinschmidt. I see my friend Fred David Arendse. I see Councillor Sumaya Taliep, Archie Klaas, the Deputy Mayor of Overberg Municipality. I see Councillor Sumaya Taliep. Thank you for joining us here today, but I also see community leaders here of Mitchells Plain and our faithbased organisations and our religious leaders. Thank you for your presence and thank you for councillors from Drakenstein that are also here, and I also see Councillor Kleinschmidt and I also see Councillor Anda and many other councillors.

Hon Speaker, when Premier Winde delivered his State of the Province

Address yesterday, he reminded us that when he took office he committed his Government to get to work. Hon Speaker, and this is exactly what we have done. We got to work so that the people of this province can benefit.

Hon Speaker, Premier Winde is correct when he says, and I quote:

"But we also know that the majority of people do not hunger after a life of crime. Our residents are hungry for opportunities and there can be no such more of it in every community, in every town, in every region across our province, if we get our approach right to economic growth."

Hon Speaker, agriculture plays a significant role in the economy of the Western Cape. It constitutes 10% of the GDP, 17% of the labour force. Despite the worst drought in a hundred years, R4 billion direct investment in 2017. In the first six months of last year, R350 million investment in agriculture, but more importantly, hon Speaker and members of this House, we have seen 2018 agriculture value production of R43 billion, and in 2018 we have seen R21 billion income from agriculture.

So agriculture is significant in this economy here in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, as highlighted by the Premier of the Western Cape, the economy can only grow to its full potential in a safe environment, and therefore the Ministerial Rural Safety Committee, which I chair, is a subcommittee of this Cabinet to ensure that rural safety receives the strategic attention it deserves. A call for proposals is right now out and we are looking forward to receiving input from the public on how we can improve rural safety in the Western Cape.

Furthermore, I intend to sharpen the rural safety by means of partnership, innovation and technology and radio-controlled systems. All agricultural role players have undertaken to work together to promote rural safety. Together we can make a difference, because we are better together. Safety is a key priority in the Western Cape.

But, hon Speaker, growing the economy and facilitating market access, which is my job, is now not only threatened by crime, but is now being threatened by a criminal state, because they want to steal your property through expropriation without compensation, and the ANC did this because they saw the EFF is winning ground in the National Parliament, and they have to give somebody something because they are fearing they are going to lose the elections in 2024. [Interjections.]

And so we see the amendment of Section 25 has got absolutely nothing to do with land reform; it has everything to do with abdicating your responsibility, because the EFF is blowing in their neck. They cannot even run a parliament. [Interjections.]

And so it permits expropriation without compensation at the whims of

Parliament. Now Parliament cannot run itself, how can they give authority to decide the value of your property? [Interjections.] They cannot run Parliament but let us hear what the President has to say about it. [Interjections.] He says ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat?

An HON MEMBER: Take your seat.

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon member Sayed. What is your point of order, sir?

Mr M K SAYED: No, hon Speaker, I want to know if the hon MEC is willing to take a question about the dispossession of land of our people in this country? [Interjections.] And it was colonialism and ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member.

Mr M K SAYED: ... apartheid that dispossessed our people of land. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, that is now a statement.

Mr M K SAYED: Our land was stolen. Is he willing to take a question on that ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, take your seat.

Mr M K SAYED: ... matter?

The SPEAKER: Please, take your seat, hon member.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I only... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... take questions from intelligent members of this House. [Laughter.]

But, hon Speaker, †kom ons luister na wat sê die President oor die onteiening van grond. Die President sê onteiening van grond in Suid-Afrika sal ordelik geskied. Dit is 'n paradoks. Jy kan nie mense se goed ordelik steel nie. Dit is 'n paradoks, maar wel, kom ons kyk wat sê die graderingsagentskappe, Moody's. Hulle sê hulle glo nie die President nie. Moody's het onlangs die Landbank [Tussenwerpsels.] tot rommelstatus afgegradeer.

Inwoners van Mitchells Plain, inwoners van die Wes-Kaap, moet weet dat die Nasionale Regering tans beplan om jou eiendom, jou grond te onteien. In kort die Staat neem jou eiendom, maar volgens die Landbank en die banksektor, gaan jy nog steeds verantwoordelik wees om te betaal, want jy het 'n verband op jou lening.

Soos dr Annelie Raad-Lotriet onlangs gesê het:

"Die Staat neem jou eiendom en jy moet nog steeds betaal."

Daar is 'n term vir dit in Kriminologie, agterbanker. Dit staan bekend as "Staatsdiefstal". Dit is diefstal wat deur die Staat gepleeg word, want in Suid-Afrika het ons 'n kriminele Staat. Wanneer jy eiendom soos grond besit, dan het jy die titelakte, maar die Staat wil jou titelakte oorneem, dan sit jy in Mitchells Plain met jou skuld, maar wanneer jy eiendom koop moet jy 'n verband neem by 'n finansiële instelling. As die Staat jou eiendom steel is dit net logies dat jy nie meer jou verbandverpligtinge kan nakom nie. Dit beteken net een ding: die banksektor in Suid-Afrika gaan *collapse*. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit gaan disintegreer.

# [Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Let us a listen to what the President says about the expropriation of land. The President says that the expropriation of land in South Africa will occur orderly. That is a paradox. You cannot steal people's land orderly. It is a paradox but well, let us see what the rating agencies, like Moody's, say. They say they do not believe the President. Moody's recently downgraded the Land Bank [Interjections.] to junk status. Residents of Mitchells Plain, residents of the Western Cape should know that the National Government is planning to expropriate your property, your land. In short, the State takes your property, but according to the Land Bank and the banking sector you will still be responsible to pay, because you have a bond on your loan.

As Dr Annelie Raad-Lotriet said recently:

"The State takes your property and you still have to pay."

There is a term for it in Criminology, backbencher. It is known as "State theft". It is theft committed by the State, because in South Africa we have a criminal State. When you own property like land, then you have the title deed, but the State wants to take over your title deed, then you sit in Mitchells Plain with your debt, but when you buy property you have to take out a bond with a financial institution. If the State steals your property it is only logical that you cannot meet your bond obligations any longer. That means only one thing: the banking sector in South Africa is going to collapse. [Interjections.] It is going to disintegrate.]

But it is more important to note the following: you will not only be able to face this crisis at your home, you will face this crisis at the bank.

Andile Lili, when you go to the bank, this is what is going to happen ... [Interjections.] The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, let us please refer to hon members as "hon members".

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Okay. [Interjections.] The hon member Andile Lili, [Interjections.] when the banking sector collapses, like they have collapsed in Zimbabwe and in Venezuela, you will hear one morning on the national television that you cannot draw money from the ATM.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The hon member, one day you will only be able ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... to draw R100 per day.

The SPEAKER: ... will you please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The next morning ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... you can only draw ... [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Speaker! Hon Speaker, is this ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... will you please take your seat. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are misleading ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat, hon member Sayed. May we please switch off that mic, hon member Windvogel. Can we please get a seat somewhere here. I do not want the Minister to run up and down. It seems he is getting many points of order, so he is going to be tired by the time he finishes. [Interjections.] I recognise you, hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Speaker, with due respect, I think your authority in this particular sitting is being undermined by the MEC yet again. I raised a point of order earlier around hon member Mackenzie who gracefully listened to the ruling of the Deputy Speaker and did not refer to the hon member directly, but here we find the hon MEC yet again referring directly to hon member Lili, even when you say he must not, he continues to say "you" for hon member Lili. Please call him to order, hon Speaker. The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon Minister, will you please adhere to the Rules of the House.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I apologise, but the fact of the matter remains that in the expropriation of your land, the banking sector will collapse and the people of Mitchells Plain must know that when you go to the bank, they will tell you today you can only draw R100, because the bank system of the EFF and the ANC will collapse. [Interjections.]

This has happened in Zimbabwe, it has happened in Namibia, in many other countries, particularly in Venezuela. The next morning, hon members, they will tell you today you can only draw R50. The next day they are going to tell you you can only draw R10, and the next day there is no money. [Interjections.]

This is what expropriation without compensation will mean in practical terms, and I think the people of Mitchells Plain understand the situation; they understand what happened in Zimbabwe, they understand what happened in Venezuela. This is what has happened in Venezuela. [Interjections.]. In 1999 they decided to expropriate land without compensation. In 2011 they effected the constitutional change. There was a lack of food security ... [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lili ... [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker, I am ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, please, wait. Hon Minister, will you please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: Take your seat.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon member Lili?

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker, I am worried.

The SPEAKER: What Rule is that? [Laughter.]

Mr A LILI: I am worried, hon Speaker. Wait a minute, hon Speaker. [Laughter.] The hon member seems to have a lot of cash in his boot [Laughter.] and he is displaying this money in the presence of many poor people of Mitchells Plain ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, that is not a point of order. Please, take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, we need to stick to the business of the day. Hon Minister, I will give you one more minute to proceed. Your time is nearly up.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, there is an alternative for

land reform, because we believe in land reform; we believe in giving people title deeds; we believe that people must own their property, not rent a property from the State [Interjections.]. We believe in sweating your assets; we believe in using your assets to build a foundation for your children; we believe in the rule of law; we believe in choice architecture; we believe in personal responsibility, and we believe in excellence. [Interjections.]

This is a declaration today here in Mitchells Plain: stop expropriation without compensation, or the people of Mitchells Plain will stop you from stealing their land, but because the people of the Western Cape are peaceful, we ask you nicely. Stop stealing people's property ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker ...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... stop destroying our country ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I am rising ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise you hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... because is it parliamentary for hon member Xego to say that hon Minister Bredell stole the land? [Interjections.] The SPEAKER: Alright. Let me just establish that. Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon member Xego, did you say what the hon member Mitchell says? Please, stand up, hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Did you say that?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, I said the National Party. When he was in the National Party, yes. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He said it himself.

Mr M XEGO: Ja. When he was in the National Party, during the Group Areas Act, yes. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And he also said ...

The SPEAKER: Please, remain standing, hon member – please, rise there. Did you say that hon member Bredell stole the land?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, during the National Party ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please withdraw that.

Mr M XEGO: I withdraw it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M XEGO: Sure-sure. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You know, political parties can steal land, it is fine, but individuals in terms of the House Rules, we cannot, you cannot say that. Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I conclude. We have made a declaration today here in Mitchells Plain, but because the people of the Western Cape and the people of Mitchells Plain are peaceful people, we ask you nicely: stop your plan to steal people's property; stop destroying our country; stop turning Parliament into a circus. [Interjections.] Let us follow the Premier of the Western Cape; unite behind a shared vision. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Order, hon members! Hon Minister, will you please take your seat again. [Interjections.]

Hon members, there is one presiding officer, so let us work together. I recognise hon member Sayed. What is your point of order, hon member?

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Speaker, the hon MEC is misleading the House. Which

ANC member said that we must steal land? Who is stealing land here?

An HON MEMBER: The ANC.

Mr M K SAYED: Likewise if he is accusing hon member Xego ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of, that is not a point of ...[Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: ... if he is accusing hon member Xego ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, take your seat!

Mr M K SAYED: ... of saying that ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, take your seat, hon member.

Mr M K SAYED: ... he is stealing land, he must say who is stealing land here ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat.

Mr M K SAYED: Herman Mashaba took land without compensation .. .[Interjections.] The SPEAKER: Please, take your seat. Please, take your seat. Let me provide a ruling on this matter. The manner in which the hon member is raising his argument, it is a point for debate, but the ANC still has speakers, so argue that. On the right or on the left, if you have a serious matter to raise, use your speakers to argue your point. The Rules say that, so you can only do it by a substantive motion if you want to do it in a more substantiated form.

Now let us proceed. Hon Minister? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon members and members of the Mitchells Plain community, when the ruling party wants to do something ugly they give it nice names.

An HON MEMBER: Is it ugly?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Expropriation without compensation ... [Interjections.], it is pure theft, finish *en klaar*.

An HON MEMBER: Is it ugly? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: There is another thing they call "prescribed assets". People of Mitchells Plain must know "prescribed assets" means the ANC wants to steal your pension. [Interjections.] So they give nice names to steal your stuff. [Interjections.] I want to conclude to say let us unite ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The people want [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... let us unite; stop turning the National Parliament into a circus ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time is up now, thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... let us unite behind the Premier of the Western Cape. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Let me just say to the hon members, the more we do what we do, it is going to extend the sitting.

So it is at your pleasure, I am at your pleasure. If you want a longer sitting, then give it to me. Let me recognise hon member Marais. Hon member Marais. [Interjections.] No, he has got a family inside. [Laughs.] [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, Premier, hon members and people of the Western Cape, my mother tongue language is Afrikaans, hon member Xego, but I pray that one day soon this Parliament will learn to respect it, even when we sing the National Anthem. [Interjections.]

The Premier's speech was visionally one which was meant to instil hope, but the Province lacks the legal authority to implement it without Central Government's approval. That is a fact.

Control over the deployment of the SAPS; the quality of social housing; education curriculums; school feedings; land reform; spatial planning; taxation, are all the prerogative of the National and not Provincial Legislatures. That is why even the trains are not running this morning.

Let us face the truth: provincial governments are mere administrative extensions of National Government. [Interjections.] What we need in the Western Cape is federal autonomy; whether we like it or not. Then, and only then will we be able to implement our five year plan without budgetary constraints or constitutional constraints. Without devolved powers to provinces they stand the risk of becoming mere burdens on South Africa's economy.

Yesterday we observed a moment of silence for the death of Tazne van Wyk who was brutally and savagely murdered by a man released on early parole. You know what? Our liberal justice system is the real killer of this girl, because they give parole, early parole to murderers and rapists.

Hon Speaker, last year during SOPA I asked the Premier, "Are you prepared to call for an amendment to the Criminal Procedures Act 51 of 1977, to prevent early parole for murderers and rapists?" and he answered me abruptly, "No, I am not." Premier, after what happened to Tazne, do you still say no?

The Western Cape's Constitution Chapter 3(9) gives the Western Cape Parliament the right to recommend by resolution, that the National Government make such an amendment to any Act which is outside our authority.

Premier, if you want to implement all your lofty ideals; if you want to improve the quality of our education; if you want to build affordable, durable houses for poor people; deploy police to wherever, we may decide in the Western Cape. If you want to make households energy self-sufficient; develop an own policy with regard to land redistribution, and if you want to reinstate, if the people want the death penalty, then we need to become a federal autonomous state. We need self-determination.

The Freedom Front Plus wants the State to start negotiations with us to implement Article 235 of the Constitution, and give the Western Cape and other provinces the right to self-determination if they so seek it, through a provincial referendum.

We want a corruption free federal state where Christian norms and values will be respected, and all cultural and language rights are recognised as of equal importance. We seek a system of government where race will no more determine your value or your self-worth, but where all cultural minorities will be protected from domination by any major majority culture.

We are currently closing many schools for lack of sufficient resources, which we claim are being withheld by National Government. Thousands of children have still not been admitted to schools in especially Coloured and Black areas. We have poorly trained police; we have no detectives that can investigate crime and we are hamstrung by labour equity laws passed at National level.

For us to succeed, Premier, and for the Western Cape to flourish as the jewel in Africa's crown, we need federal autonomy.

<sup>†</sup>Kom ons praat 'n bietjie baie meer plaaslik. Wat is ons plaaslike bekommernisse? Premier, ek word oorval deur mense wat klagtes het ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Let us talk a lot more locally. What are our local concerns? Premier, I am inundated by people who have complaints...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member Marais.

<sup>†</sup>Mnr P J MARAIS: ... dat Communicare buitensporige huur vra aan arm mense. Ek het 'n vrou, mev Sylvia Mqniswa. Sy woon al 15 jaar in Ruyterwacht; sy verdien maar R1,800 pensioen, maar haar huur is R2,300 'n maand, en omdat sy dit nie kan betaal nie ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

## [Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[MR P J MARAIS: ... that Communicare is charging poor people excessive rent. There is a woman, Ms Sylvia Mqniswa. She has been living in Ruyterwacht for 15 years already; she earns only R1,800 pension, but her rent is R2,300 per month, and because she cannot pay that...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ... [Interjections.]

<sup>†</sup>Mnr P J MARAIS: ... is sy nou besig om...hulle wil haar uitsmyt. [Mr P J MARAIS: ... she's now busy to...they want to throw her out.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member Marais, thank you very much. Your time is up.

<sup>†</sup>Mnr P J MARAIS: Ek sal die volgende op Facebook sit, baie dankie. [Gelag.] [Applous.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: I will put the next on Facebook, thank you. [Laughter.] [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I now recognise hon member Smith. Or before then, hon the Leader of the Opposition. What is your point of order, sir?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would just like to on a point of order, ask if hon member Marais was not misleading the House in regard to his reference to posting his speech on Facebook, because as I understand it, hon member Marais is not very consistent and active on Facebook. [Laughter.] I might have it wrong, but could he just clarify ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... is he misleading the House?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition. [Laughter.] Hon member Marais seem to be objecting to that point of order.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I must thank all the parties for their very deep interest in what I have to say. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. I now recognise hon member Smith. [Applause.] Here, this side, sir. [Interjections.] No, here. [Interjections.] Okay, go to the Premier. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Now, hon members ... [Interjections.] we have witnessed a floor crossing. [Laughter.] Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Speaker. No, this is not a floor crossing. [Interjections.] I just actually, I am standing next to the Premier. I want the people of the province to see the response of the Premier on my speech. First of all Naledi Pandor, MEC Bredell ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Point of order.

Mr D SMITH: ... is from the Western Cape, and she is in Cabinet, and also Ibrahim Patel ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Smith, will you please take your seat. I recognise the Chief Whip. Is that a point of order, Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Has the hon member crossed the floor? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What the hon member did, he crossed the line.

So what we did, not the floor, but the line, but those are the Rules. We created the two places for hon members to speak so that you do not have to do that. [Interjections.]

Now I am just going to allow the hon member, it is my ruling, to do that, but it is not going to be allowed going further. I am not, I do not want to set a precedent [Interjections.] He begged me nicely, so I will allow him to do so. Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, if this is an issue I can always go back. I do not want the ....[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, proceed. You said you missed the Premier, so do that.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

Minister Patel is also from the Western Cape, MEC Bredell, so just to correct that lie that you just spread earlier. I would forgive all those after listening to the Premier's debate yesterday. I would be mistaken in believing that we have a caring Government that works for the people of the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: There is another point of order. Sorry, hon member Smith, will you please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I am rising to ask is it parliamentary for the hon member to say that hon member Bredell lied to the House? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Okay. [Interjections.] Thank you, thank you, hon members, there is one presiding officer, so may I request to establish from the hon member, did you say that the hon Minister lied?

Mr D SMITH: I said the hon MEC lied based on the fact that the MEC said earlier ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Oh, then ... [Interjections.] Alright.

Mr D SMITH: Sorry?

The SPEAKER: Wait, wait, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, hon members, this is the House of Parliament, there are Rules. So the Presiding Officer has not asked for your assistance yet.

Will you please withdraw that statement, hon member? It is unparliamentary.

Mr D SMITH: Let me withdraw and continue, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr D SMITH: As someone who works in the Local Government space, the sphere closest to the people, †laat ek vandag die waarheid en die ware stand van Plaaslike Regering en munisipaliteite aan u deurgee [let me pass on the truth and the real state of Local Government and municipalities to you.]

This Premier made a few remarks yesterday. He said, "Our goal is to govern with integrity." You cannot be a government of integrity facing serious investigation by the Public Protector for violation of the Members Ethics Code.

ANC members submitted a complaint to the Public Protector against MEC Bredell for allegations of interfering in staff appointment loans to the value of R2,184 billion in the past decade, and has only repaid about R554 million in debt. Over R70 million worth of MIG funding was given back to the National Treasury by Drakenstein – not being spent – just last week.

Hon Speaker, this money could have been used to build sports facilities in Drakenstein. This money could have been used to build roads in Drakenstein, but the municipality failed to spend this grant. We have to ask what is the impact of this on service delivery? Cederberg was taken away from the DA in October last year, and guess what? There was only R36 000 in the running current account of the municipality, after the three years of the DA. [Interjections.]

Matzikama Municipality, who is now led by an ANC/EFF coalition, is basically in the red after your Government has stripped the municipality's funds. [Interjections.]

All of this happened under the watch of the MEC. If the Premier needs any convincing of the need to suspend the MEC, then they need only look at what has happened in George. There is evidence that the son of ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Smith, will you please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I am rising on ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... Rule 59(2), and I quote:

"Any member who wishes to bring any improper or unethical conduct on the part of any member to the attention of this House, may only do so by way of a substantive motion, comprising of clear, formulated and properly substantiated allegations."

I please ask you caution the hon member to withdraw and stop doing that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, will you please take your seat. The same Rule, hon member Mitchell, says:

"No member may impute improper motives or reflect on the integrity or dignity of sub-sections 1(c) or verbally abuse the other member."

And therefore gets to the point where you have read sub-section 2 of Section 59 of the Rules. It is correct, hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Democratic Alliance.

I would like to request hon member Smith that if you wish to make those allegations, no matter how true or false they are, you do that by means of substantive motion, because what you have done can lead to a hon member being expelled from the Cabinet, therefore losing his job, and if it is correct what you have said, it must be done properly in terms of the Rules, and I will therefore request that you withdraw and continue with the debate. Thank you.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, it seems to me the truth hurts ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There are further points of order. I therefore wish to request that you take your seat, hon member. I will start with the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I wish to address you on your ruling. My understanding, hon Speaker, is that there is a formal complaint registered at the office of the Public Protector against MEC Bredell, and that complaint contains serious allegations about this particular MECs conduct, and the alleged breach of the code of conduct for ethics, and that is why we have asked the Premier to suspend him.

So surely that is a matter of public domain, and references to those issues are part of the debate in this House. This is not personal ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... it is about the Government in this province.

The SPEAKER: Yes. Thank you, thank you very much, hon the Leader of the Opposition. Before I even recognise any other member, you are correct in what you are saying, that there is a matter of public interest. Of course you may well be correct in saying that, but this particular Rule 59(2) specifically – to respond to your specific point that you have raised – says you may do so, but by means of a substantive motion. We do not have that motion here. Give me that motion – and it has not been tabled to the Speaker.

So therefore you may not do it here as a surprise, because it is not in line with the Rules. Open the Rule book and look at this specific rule, then we will work better together.

So, on that point then, I rule that we proceed and rule the statement that made reference to the Minister in that manner, to be withdrawn and ruled out of order in this case, but then we proceed with the debate. Hon member Smith, I recognise you.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Speaker. There is evidence that the son of the Finance MMC in the municipality of George, benefited millions through the investment of the municipality into Old Mutual. The DA's own investigation into the allegations of corruption in George swept this matter under the carpet ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Smith, please take your seat. Hon member Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I apologise for rising and I ask you to indulge me.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The hon member has not withdrawn his statement and continued ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He did!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... with his speech.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: He did withdraw!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Smith, will you please take the podium. Alright. I have asked in my ruling that hon member Smith withdraws that part ... [Interjections.] Mr D SMITH: Which part?

The SPEAKER: ... the reference to the Minister, and proceed with the debate, and you have not done so. [Interjections.] Will you please withdraw that part?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, I did withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr D SMITH: I was interrupted by the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You withdrew?

Mr D SMITH: ... Leader of the Opposition.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr D SMITH: So I did withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Have we, can we now confirm that he did withdraw so that I do not get another point of order.

Mr D SMITH: Hon members are intensely listening to me I see.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, thank you, hon member Smith. Please proceed, Sir.

Mr D SMITH: Allegations of corruption in George was swept under the carpet and used Mayor Naik as a scapegoat so you could be seen as taking action against corrupt officials. If it were George only that would be bad enough and reason enough. However, there are also issues of underspending in Overstrand where R22 million of MIG funding was taken back for not spending it. Funding that could have been spent on sport facilities in our communities, and the upgrade of our roads.

There are many examples of corruption, capture, cadre deployment and racism in the DA ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr D SMITH: ... run municipalities.

Premier, we want to hear from you, how are you going to deal with these challenges? The City of Cape Town, the supposed crown jewel of the DA good governance and the City that works for all, has failed the people of Cape Town and in particular the people of Mitchells Plain.

The AG found that the City failed to spend almost R2,5 billion in capital budget, and R1,5 billion in operating budget. These are billions that were

meant to change the people's lives in Mitchells Plain. Mitchells Plain people, the City does not work for you, it only works for those who live in the leafy suburbs and areas.

You need only to look around you, at your sports facilities; look at your roads; look at your streets. This is what the City of Cape Town DA Government thinks of you.

Can we really be surprised that over the past several months more and more municipalities have been lost by the DA, mostly in rural areas. [Interjections.] People are seeing through your blue lies. [Interjections.] †Mense begin sien die waarheid. [People are beginning to see the truth.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Smith ... [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Local Government oversight ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... will you please wrap up?

Mr D SMITH: Local Government oversight under the MEC, who is held over from the Zille days, is nothing but a sham. It is clear that the interests of the DA come before the interests of the municipalities and its people, that suffer from a lack of services as a result.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Smith, your time is up.

Mr D SMITH: Something has been brewing in the Western Cape, hon Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr D SMITH: ... and that something I cannot call, but I ask the Premier to attend to these issues.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, Sir.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Thank you, thank you, hon member Smith.

I am going to request – as I said, as I indicated earlier, hon members, that I gave hon member Smith a special grant, so I will not give this grant anymore. So, let us remain on either side of the tables to speak. I just wish to request also from the hon members that we just work together in terms of the Rules. The Whippery, please assist me on both sides, on either side. It will be easier if we do that, then we do not have to go through what we have just gone through now with the previous speaker. And it is not fair to do that. May I then request hon Baartman to take the podium? I recognise you, hon Baartman. [Interjections.]
Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, fellow South Africans. Energy security is currently the biggest risk to the South African economy. Hon Marais, earlier you mentioned that the trains are not running. I can truly tell you today, †die treine loop nie want PRASA wat aan die Nasionale Regering behoort, het nie hulle Eskom elektrisiteit bill betaal nie. PRASA moet Eskom betaal. In terme van die Energie sekuriteit, [the trains are not running, because PRASA which belongs to the National Government has not paid its Eskom electricity bill. PRASA should pay Eskom. In terms of the energy security,] the National Treasury confirms that Eskom did not spend the R250 million last year, that was meant for electrification, hon Speaker, for hon Marais' question.

Hon Speaker, per hour per stage of loadshedding the Western Cape economy sheds approximately R75 000. The Premier indicated in his SOPA that the Western Cape Province will help municipalities procure energy from Independent Power Producers (IPP's). The Premier must please ensure that when this process occurs that it is honest, it has integrity and it allows the platform for municipalities to appoint the most competent IPP's, to show that Western Cape governance is different.

23 municipalities already have the necessary legislation in place for this procurement processes, 19 of which already have regulator approved feed-in tariffs. It is further encouraging that Bid Window 5 in terms of the IRP will be opening soon. An announcement also welcomed by Eskom. It will reduce electricity prices and allow Eskom the space to conduct critical maintenance on its various plants. Maintenance for Eskom stations should be legislated in order to prevent this in the future.

Hon Speaker, while this announcement needs to be welcomed, President Ramaphosa needs to provide us with concrete deadlines for the implementation of his undertakings. The reason I mention this is because on 9 February 2001, the then President Thabo Mbeki made a similar undertaking during his SONA address, stating, "With regard to the energy sector among other things, our decision will entail restructuring the electricity supply and distribution industries to introduce greater levels of competition. Independent Power Producers will be allowed into our energy system and localised energy grids for rural areas to be developed."

Hon Speaker that was more than 19 years ago! Every resident should have the opportunity to generate their own electricity, to sell their excess electricity back into the grid, or even wheel extra energy to larger consumers within their vicinity, therefore generating an extra income for their household. And thus it is welcoming that solar PV will be rolled out even further in this province. It is further welcoming that NERSA will continue registering small scale distributor generation for under 1 Megawatts without requiring a license, but ideally we need to increase this to 10 Megawatts, and I urge the Western Cape Government through the Premier's office to engage the Minister on this front.

Further, the Western Cape Government has recently released a feasibility

study into the integrated liquified natural gas, and this should be applauded as the study shows that Saldanha Bay Port is the most suitable port for the importation of liquified natural gas, given that Ankerlig and Gourikwa stations are already originally built to accommodate gas. And I went to go see this for myself at Eskom at Ankerlig to speak to the officials, to show me the turbines and how the pipelines will be rolled out. It is thus imperative that Transnet upgrades the Saldanha Port, as well as that the Eskom Board approves the full conversion of the Ankerlig station, from an open cycle gas turbine diesel power station to a combined cycle gas station. Serve as the anchor offtake of liquid natural gas and therefore generating an additional 700 Megawatts. By simply converting Ankerlig power station there will be a saving of USD16.4 billion between the 2024 and 2050 forecast period. And in the Western Cape province this could amount to a 13% investment return. Hon Herron, you spoke about carbon emissions [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Baartman you need to wrap up.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ... and I would like to applaud you for that. Please, the liquified natural gas, by replacing just one 500 Megawatt coal fuel powered plant it will be the same as liquified natural gas taking 557 000 cars off the road. Hon Speaker, if Eskom is unable to generate electricity for us, then we must do it ourselves. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Baartman. I now recognise hon members; I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You are welcome, Sir.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, we heard the Premier's State of the Province Address and I, hon Speaker, I just want to go straight on two things. The election promises that the Premier has made. A Provincial Police Service and a Provincial Metrorail Service. Yet the Premier knows that he does not have the mandate to have a Provincial Police Service. He knows that! And yet he makes empty promises to the electorate.

He comes with a Safety Plan that is going to cost the taxpayer R1.4 billion. Make communities safer, a Safety Plan that will rot to the end, because listen what Bheki Cele, the National Minister says. He says, these law enforcement officers walking around, killing a policeman is a bunch of thugs. They are not properly trained. They are not properly trained.

So we need, they say they were people walking around carrying guns, minus certificates, and they need to be in prison. They killed a policeman and the policeman reached for his certificate. They shot him more than once. These law enforcement officers are not trained, and they need to be trained. But like I said before, Metro Police is the solution. Neighbourhood Watches is the solution, because Neighbourhood Watches walk day in and day out in the communities and they know what is happening. But when we came to Mitchells Plain the other day there is a fight between the Neighbourhood Watch and the CPF's.

The CPF's are supported by the ANC. That is what I hear, and the Neighbourhood Watch is supported by the DA. So you have problems. If that is true, that these two political parties must shame themselves because of political agendas driven before the safety of our people. And let me say this further. Let me say this further. Yes, we all talk about Tazne van Wyk, and we mourn her death, but we do not forget, we will not forget Uyinene that was killed going to a post office. We will not forget Jesse Hess that was murdered, and we ask this Premier to speak to the President and have a referendum of the death penalty, because the ACDP supports the death penalty.

Our schools are out of control when it comes to safety. Our schools are out of control, and we say, †wat vir ons gewerk het dan sal nou werk [what worked for us then will work now.] Corporal punishment must be brought back to our schools. †Buig die boompie terwyl hy jonk is! [Bend the tree while still young!]

I want to further say, that we do not agree with the National Health Insurance. We cannot agree with that. The ANC cannot even control Eskom. Cannot control SAA. Now they want to take our money and steal our money. We cannot allow that. We must stand up and I want to support the Premier with that. The other thing that I want to say is this taking land, our land. †Dink jy ons arms is af? [Do you think we have no arms?] We must enable our people to protect their land and we will stand for that. The ACDP says there must be fair redistribution and not stealing of land. So, we will fight when it comes to our rights and the people in Mitchells Plain must remember, they are not just talking about the farmers. They are talking about your land and my land. That is what they are talking about.

Let me say further, let me say further. We visited the province and in the province we need more Schools of Skills. Here I have got an article with the *Weekend Argus* 2019, 39 000 high school students brought out, but when we went to schools we saw the School of Skills, where people can become carpenters, where they can become mechanics, where they can do hairdressing. That is what we need. We need more Schools of Skills and that will take our youngsters off the roads.

Mr Deputy Speaker, let me just say this further and this is so important. I want to come back because our Neighbourhood Watches, when they walk the streets, they get R10 000 for the year. It cannot be! You do not have the same problems in Mitchells Plain like we have in the other areas. Even in Mitchells Plain, the Tafelsig is not the same as the Portland. So we need to look at how we resource these people, because they give their lives and the one thing they ask us as a Standing Committee when we came they said, can you maybe look at somehow that the Department gives us something to have some life cover? These people protect our properties and they know what's happening. I believe that if we do that, and resource our Neighbourhood Watches, we resource our Community Police Forums, we will not sit with crime, because the solution is not more law enforcement officers – the solution is get our communities involved. The Safety Cabinet Premier, I did not hear once that there are community members or heads of Neighbourhood Watches or CPF involved. Get them involved, they know the answers. And they know exactly what to do.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Christians [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So, we want you, Premier, to look at these things [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...because safety is everybody's problem and your child is my child. And when he touches my child, I will come for you. So, hon Speaker, in conclusion, I want to say the ACDP is serious when it comes [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...to community safety.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I would like to recognise the hon Minister of Health, hon Mbombo. Hon Minister, your time is now.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Premier, hon Speaker, members of the House, guests in the gallery and the media, †goeie môre [good morning.] First of all I would like to thank the Premier for giving direction and hope to the people of the Western Cape, specifically for Mitchells Plain. Also, hon Speaker, the Premier has commanded that this year we do not talk, we act. Let us get to work.

But I just want to add, as Health, we are using the motto of the Universal Health Coverage, "Leaving No One Behind". I want to state it categorically that the Western Cape Department of Health supports Universal Health Coverage and we are advanced when it comes to piloting that. UHC is an international approach implemented in about 23 countries already all over the world The pillars are based on human rights and justice. By virtue that you are a human being, you deserve quality health services. The packages are preventive, promotive, curative, rehabilitative and palliative care. All these must be accessible and cover the whole population irrespective of age, the location: whether you are rural or in urban, and it must be affordable to all without any financial burden and there should be no payments at the point of service. This is a matter of justice. This is a matter of equity and it is a matter of human rights. That is UHC.

Hon Speaker, the NHI, which the ANC highlighted – by the way this is phase two of the NHI that they are introducing – the bill. They introduced phase one of the pilot of the NHI 2012-2017, for over five years, but if you look at the evaluation, their own evaluation, the proof shows that the country does not need NHI. The country needs UHC.

Five years, in 11 districts they piloted this. In KZN they even have three districts. In the Western Cape they piloted in the Eden. Now in terms of looking at all of those, like KZN which is piloting three districts, look at the health system of the KZN where they do not even have specialists, where they have no oncology, where we have to save them and bring patients plus the doctors who still have to finish their training, to the Western Cape, and they have piloted the UHC. Just look at that.

The budget, if you look at the budget, the under expenditure. For the five years the budget expenditure was about 76%. They only spent 76%. Look at Gauteng. Only 56% of their NHI for the whole five years. Look at those. The people of George, Pacaltsdorp, they are still waiting for their extension of the clinic which was part of the NHI, and they are still waiting. It is the pilot, phase one, that we are talking about.

Hon Speaker, guess what. Do you know where the money of that phase one

pilot of NHI is? The President, not at this SONA, the previous SONA, if you recall made a promise of a human resource stimulus package. They were going to appoint more staff. We were all excited. And then he even said whether it is porters, whether it is cleaners, and all of those, appoint more staff, and we were all excited that there would be more, and even the National Minister of Health also made a promise about that. Guess what? Dololo. There is no money. The President was going to use the NHI pilot one, that was underspent, to use it as a stimulus package and the National Treasury said, no ways, I am the boss here. They took the money back. So we are sitting with nothing. Shocking, Mr President!

The Province's individual receivers indicated no money. Health staff across the provinces are experiencing services pressure. More people are presenting with a cocktail of burden of disease. The more people are unemployed, the poorer they become and more they will depend on the public services. The long waiting times are not only in the Western Cape. It is everywhere. Again, let us not politicise health because it is about the health of the people. It is happening everywhere. We are keeping on bailing out the SOE's. How many SOE's have been bailed out? Have you ever heard when they say they will bail out Health? Never. They have never bailed out Health. Read again.

Look at the bill. NHI Bill. Read it again. There is nothing that talks about Health services. It is all about the centralisation of funding, from the provinces to the National Department by appointing extra staff. I think about 100 staff, 88 for now, that they were going to appoint in order to manage the NHI. Do you know what the provinces will be doing? It will be forensic pathology. It is only going to be the medical services but nothing else. Everyone knows and it is undisputed, that Health is wealth. Wealth is Health, and investing in health has triple returns: economic development, a healthy population and bridging inequalities. This has been the compelling reason why the Western Cape is the only province where it has prioritised health, has got the biggest slice. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon members.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: If you look in terms of the slice from the Provincial Government to the Department office and if you look at other provinces, the Northern Cape is about 7%, KZN is below 30%, which is the required norm by the way. They say it should be around that at least 30%. Check how National Treasury has also been decreasing the Health Sector budget, because we are talking about prioritising health. If you say that Health is important for the National Government or for the ANC government, how come the Health sector budget has been decreasing for the past years? The central hospital budget, which is the hospitals like Tygerberg and Groote Schuur, there was a time where there was no budget allocations for those, and the Western Cape Government had to pick up and save the hospitals.

And now, in phase two of the NHI, they say they will take those hospitals. Mitchells Plain will be left with no central hospitals if you allow that NHI to happen. Yet, we are the ones who used our money to bail out those hospitals when there was no money at all. Yes, we do have challenges. The current South African Health System is not working. It fails the Auntie Sarah's. They are valid reasons for Health reforms, hon Speaker, that these should happen. NHI in this form is not a solution. We need to fix the current system, but the ANC must not lie to people just because they are desperate, and say NHI is the solution.

We cannot gamble with people's lives. You must not lie. You must not lie. The National Finance Minister has indicated that NHI is expensive, therefore everyone is unsure even if budgets will be reduced for any other year, but as the Western Cape we are already working with the stakeholders and private partners to ensure we implement Universal Health Coverage.

Hon Speaker, no UHC without human resources. Now I am being reminded that in 2020 the World Health Organisation declared 2020 as the year of the Nurse and Midwife. Nurses are instrumental in ensuring that we achieve UHC. The Western Cape has over 13 000 Nurses serving communities and it is not enough, because we have seen the increase of the population in the Western Cape. We have seen the battle of disease. We need more, but we will celebrate to make sure that we recognise them. We have got a yearlong provisional plan. It is upcoming.

The emergency medical services – I recall the last time I did oversight, I went with an ambulance here in the Mitchells Plain, in the middle of the night where we had to go via the police station. The issue now of crime necessitates that ambulances go via the police station for an escort. It impacts as a priority one ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. What is your point of order, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: No, I want to know if the Minister is prepared to answer a question please.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I do not have much time. Sorry, Sir. I do not have much time. Just WhatsApp me.

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Staff security and safety remains a serious risk. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, there is another point of order. Will you please take your seat?

## The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Must I sit?

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat? Yes, Minister. What is the point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, just on a point of order, could you please rule on this particular issue relating to hon Marais' question. It is not often that the hon member wants to ask a question and I think it is always interesting to hear what that question will be, but [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But the Minister said she is worried about her time [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, that is not a point of order. Please take your seat.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But is that, can she not get given extra time to answer that question?

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order, no. No, I cannot. The programming authority give me the time. So I cannot. Please proceed, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: Can you give an extra one minute so that she can respond to that question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Minister. No, thanks hon members. Order. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay. Thank you. As part of safety we have to ensure that we prioritise our staff, not only for emergency services but we appeal to the communities, they must understand that an attack on the EMS is an attack on the whole system. It is also an attack on the Constitution itself because Section 27 of the Constitution does state that no-one can be denied medical services. But now when we ended up having staff that have not been able to pick up the patients, it impacts on that.

Also hon Speaker, the Premier spoke about the Safety Plan, where Health contributes through the first 1 000 days. Let me share some of the additional activities that we have already implemented in the Metro, noting that we have already piloted the first 1 000 days outside the Metro, in Saldanha and Drakenstein. In the Metro, specifically in Mitchells Plain, one part of it is about, we have strengthened contraceptive methods and child spacing by improving access, especially to emergency contraceptives. I must indicate also as well that we have got a challenge. Stock-outs when we come to contraceptives. Although Western Cape is doing far better because we round the national, we have heard where we find that there are no contraceptives anywhere in parts of the country, but we have managed to be able to improve

that access. And this we are able to do through the public private partnership.

If you go to the Promenade Mall now, when you go to Dischem, you go to Clicks, you go elsewhere, we are providing these contraceptives, plus also vaccines for children, free of charge, so that you can have access everywhere. Is not that Universal Health Coverage? It is a coverage. Access, access, access. We also link all pregnant woman who gave birth in our hospitals and everywhere, to community based services so that they can be followed. The children can be followed at house calls, so that we are be able to limit the traffic that goes to the Health facilities.

To this end you must also focus on integrating community outreaches, promoting WOGA, which is the Whole of the Government Approach, where all Departments, Social Development, Safety, decals and all of those including the local government, City of Cape Town in the Metro and also the WOSA, which is the Whole of Society Approach where we work also with the NGO's in order to ensure that there is access. We are be able to identify at risk mommies and babies, especially the teenage moms where also in the families there is substance abuse and alcohol abuse. This ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you must try and wrap up.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... has led – sorry?

The SPEAKER: You must try and wrap up.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay. This has led to stimulation of the baby's boarding, education and support. We even have got mom-teen support groups. For example if you go to Macassar, the post-natal community groups in Khayelitsha and so forth. And then lastly hon Speaker, probably I will talk about it in my budget speech, the Cuban doctors. The Cuban doctors. I must take the time ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I must [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes. I must state categorically that that we do not take Cuban doctors based on ideology – it is not true, but I will expand. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members. I would like to draw your attention hon members to the following. As we all know the convention in the House, the next speaker, hon Brinkhuis, this is his maiden speech. Now I would like to equally warn hon Brinkhuis that the maiden speech is dependent upon your conviction. If you provoke a response, you will get it, but if you do not, you will get none. I now recognise you, hon Brinkhuis. [Applause.] [Interjections.] It is a rule. Hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, sir.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Hon Premier, hon leaders of political parties and members of the Legislature, heads of provincial departments, respected guests, As-salāmu 'alaykum [speaking in the vernacular]. Good morning. †Molweni. †Goeie môre. Just recently we have all taken an oath to uphold the National and Provincial Constitution and to respect all laws that govern our country and province. The Constitution professes a better life for all citizens. Thousands of people, young and old, made many, many sacrifices. Some paid with their lives against oppression. We honour and remember our fallen heroes.

Education is very close to the heart of Al Jama-Ah as it shapes the lives of our future generation and that of our country. I quote Malcolm X: "Education is our passport to the future, for tomorrow belongs to the people who prepare for it today." Al Jama-Ah is opposed to the comprehensive sexuality education, CSE, and view the content of the explicit sexual material as porn. The comprehensive sexual education to be taught from Grade 4 to Grade 12 learners, does not cover morality associated with sex. Sexual dysfunctions and deviations and the institution of marriage; the CSE is devoid of morality and is in many ways unacceptable to our value system. Members of the public have lodged several, several complaints at the National and Provincial Parliament constituency offices against the CSE. Parents are against the CSE and feel their role in this matter has been undermined. Al Jama-Ah will not hesitate to lay criminal charges against the Western Cape Education Department. Teachers and principals who are teaching porn to our children, exposing children to explicit sexual material, it is a violation of the current sexual offences act.

Hon Premier, still on education, we commend the Province for coming to the assistance of struggling private religious schools in poor areas. Prior to the new South African Schools Act, many of these poor private schools were compliant, however, with the new Act they face challenges and thus fell behind with meeting the necessary requirements. You have also stated that schools in the province are faced with overcrowding and we have not enough schools. We appeal to you not to close the private religious schools who have been non-compliant due to administrative issues, but rather to put a strategy in place to train and assist these schools with their challenges that they are facing. The Ieglaasi Nieyah School is now compliant and accommodates children from townships and surrounding areas. We thank the Western Cape Education Department for assisting them and appeals to the Department to assist other poor private schools too. Hon Premier, you have stated very proudly of the increasing pass rates at schools in the Western Cape and we indeed are happy to hear that, but you have failed to mention the high number of schools where there had been no or little improvement on pass rates. At the beginning of your speech you said, the people want Government to give their basic rights and that the Western Cape Government has delivered [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please wrap up, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Where are the basic rights of our children on the Cape Flats and in the townships who are exposed to gangsterism, drugs and other crimes? Where are the basic rights to be taught in a safe environment? Where are the basic rights [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time is up [Interjection.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ... of teachers to teach in the safe environment?

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Brinkhuis. Thank you. [Applause.] Hon members, I now recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you hon Speaker. †Mandizibulisele kumntu wonke okhoyo apha namhlanje. [I greet everybody who is here today.] Let me start by following suit to thank your leadership, hon Speaker that has brought Parliament and SOPA to Mitchells Plain in 2020, an intention that is no-go to provide communities their constitutional and democratic right to participate in decisions about their daily lives. Important for us that this is not just a sheer tick box exercise, but as the ANC we commit through the Leader of the Official Opposition that as the ANC we will convene in people's assembly in Mitchells Plain to listen to the people of Mitchells Plain and work out what we can do with the help of our National Government in this community.

It becomes important when you reclaim the United Democratic Front, which was a uniting platform and was launched in 1983 here in this venue, that when the State then introduced Tricameral Parliament to entrench divisions amongst the black majority, it called for a single united and unfragmented South Africa. A South Africa that we will continue to fight for and acknowledging and respecting hon Marais, the notion of federalism, that we have actually seen being led by the DA here in this province, to create through the decade of their leadership an Oranje in this province, where actually the 6 million citizens of the Western Cape who remain are and continue to be South Africans and are part of the 54 million citizens, are actually kept into an enclave of white supremacy.

So if there is any conversation about revisiting the CODESA declarations regarding how we structure our country in terms of its governing system, surely within the rules of this country we must then recall or ask for a CODESA too, so that we can also include in that conversation their discussion about land. It is important that we do not sit here in this House and actually be denialists about the situation of land. As we listen here with many members that have spoken, especially from the Democratic Alliance that actually create a scary movie and actually theatrics as a lobbying group for those that they represent.

They stand here and provide lies about a process, a legal process that the ANC-led Government has actually ushered, that South Africa continues to be a constitutional democracy and indeed the process of land reform has actually been called for through a constitutional amendment. So I'm not sure, where the members talk about a stealing of land. Indeed our land, which now must actually be returned through a legal process was stolen, it was taken illegally.

Democracy affords all of its citizens to actually review any process. That is why there is nothing wrong in South Africa if to date the members and citizens of South Africa are calling to actually revisit the land situation in the country. And if the DA is protecting property rights, as we heard from the Provincial Minister Meyer, it is important to note that also the Inequality Report by STATS SA continues to tell us who is owning property in this country and also in this province, that he actually stands and defends here. That is the asset and wealth inequality, actually very stark in this particular province with black people, both Coloured and Africans, the worst in as far as us owning assets or wealth. And therefore when you talk about this cash in the bank, who are you talking about? Because the same banks that you are referring to, actually majority of our people, including the people of Mitchells Plain, have got savings accounts in their name in those banks. So theirs is to deposit and withdraw money and still continue to pay extra cost of actually withdrawing their money from the same banks. So who are you speaking for in this particular platform? And actually we have not heard your voice, Provincial Minister Meyer, about the rampant evictions in this particular province, the deplorable working conditions of farm workers in this particular province. So, whose interest and who are the people on whose behalf you are speaking on in this platform?

Allow us, hon Speaker, to indicate that actually it is important for us to remember that here again in this particular province of ours, we ought to be saved by the UDF spirit, that the toddler serving leadership style that is always portrayed in this House should help our people in the province to invoke the spirit of the people's power that the UDF and people who are sitting here spoke about. Clearly from 2019 till now, anyway, a common feature in the governance style of this DA-led Government, the concept of people is a very skewed one. It is left to semantics and political rhetoric and never found in their ethos and planning paradigm. This Government has confirmed by the Premier and his predecessor knows to engage private sector as their key constituency to drive their program of governance in this province.

Other social partners or social forces in the form of civil society and labour as part of the non-state sector, are viewed with suspicion and rather left to the sidelines. In most if not all of its Government engagement to find solutions of the people, the Premier tells us he passionately is working for the people. He clothes himself with engraft solutions with the big guns. The commercial sector, the academia and no information about how he has engaged communities' low labour as if they do not have views on how their lives can be improved. A known feature of a liberal approach and their belief that only elites and those affluent individuals have a voice, as the saying goes, "Money talks" or in township slang: *†Fak'imali uzobona* [put money in, then you will see.] This has produced a type of income and wealth inequality that the STATS SA inequality trends reported. Western Cape is experiencing the highest inequality where the top 10% of the population in the province shared nine times more of total provincial expenditure than the bottom 40%. This is the stark reality and we want to hear you, Premier, speaking about that.

The Provincial Government through its Provincial Treasury has been producing two reports over the years. The Provincial and Municipal Economic Review Outlook, that is the Pero and Mero. Both of these, especially the latter has been revealing what the inequality trends confirmed. The question is, what has this Government been doing with such data and analysis? So, these blue books remain just blue books, with no effect to policy and decision-making of the province. The World Economic Forum (WEF), that I am sure this Provincial Government has attended, in 2017 and 2018, warned countries that an economy is not a business. And history and scholars have shown that there is a feedback loop between the bottom and top lines which is growth and equity in a national economy. They further argue, most citizens evaluate their respective countries' economic progress not by published GDP growth statistics, but by changes in their household standard of living. Agreeing with that sentiment, we can hope, Premier, that clean audits should not only be the only measure of this Province's clean government, including in your clean Government should be service delivery and the satisfaction of citizens. We repeat as we said last year in your SOPA, a nation should not be judged by how it treats its highest citizens but it's lowest.

Let us remind you Premier, on the promises that you have made last year in your SOPA. You said that the province has attracted R100 billion in foreign direct investment. Please tell the Mitchells Plain community, of this R100 billion, how much of that investment was shared with this community? The once booming town centre that even myself growing up in Gugulethu, I used to travel and come and buy things in the town centre, has become a ghost town where infrastructure is debilitated and home to criminal activities.

So hon member Mackenzie, what have you been doing to ensure that actually this billions of investment also touched the town centre here in Mitchells Plain? Cape Town has been named, you said Premier, the top financial centre in the Sub-Saharan Africa. The question is, the financial sector we heard last year, that it is abusing employees to the point that they resorted to a public strike that had to be halted. The City of Cape Town was last seen here, abusing the same firefighting workers that were expected to parade yesterday. And clearly a behaviour in this province that is non-compliant with the international obligation of the right to work.

Again we spoke about a job in every household, Premier. Where are those?

How many have been realised in the job numbers you gave yesterday for households in the Cape Flats and many others in the non-Metro. You spoke about Mfuleni as an example. Actually a secretary of Mfuleni business hub... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, will you please try and wrap up.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...was telling us of how in Mfuleni to date that particular Mfuleni business hub you have been referred to, actually it does not have water, it does not have electricity. So there is still a lot of work for you. As the ANC, we believe that a lot of our challenges can be addressed through a shared and inclusive economy. It is the Freedom Charter which said the people shall share in the country's wealth. In this regard, we want to hear the Premier talk about plans he has for local economic development in Mitchells Plain [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Your time is up.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... and the other areas populated by poor people. Nkosi.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Nkondlo. [Applause.] Thank you hon Nkondlo. I now recognise hon Minister of Community Safety, hon Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Good morning colleagues. Good morning, Mr Speaker. Premier, good morning colleagues on my side, the

cabinet colleagues. The community of Mitchells Plain and other places. It is not just Mitchells Plain; it just happens to be in Mitchells Plain. All our councillors, councillor March, I see you! It is good to see you. And all our colleagues in the red at the back. Very welcome to our parliament.

We have an inclusive government, hon Speaker, a very, very inclusive government. [Interjections.] I want to start off on a very sad note, Mr Speaker and Premier, and I am very serious now. Do not make jokes. Listen please. Mr hon Speaker, we start with a very sad note and again as we all know, another child was murdered in this province. Another young girl, 8 years old, by almost a system that failed the child. You know ... [Interjections.] a child who was kidnapped, murdered and possibly, we were looking at the evidence of whether the child was raped, Mr hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, a very basic issue that we raised with National government, and I raised it on Tuesday with some of the officials, that the early parole system must be evaluated. It must be reassessed. [Interjections.] It must be looked at.

## An HON MEMBER: You have failed!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And unfortunately we do not have any competency over the prison system, and you know last year December, I must remind this House, that 2 500 prisoners [Interjection.] An HON MEMBER: You have failed! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Can you keep quiet? 2 500 prisoners ... [Interjections.] we are quite serious member, Mr hon Speaker, we are very serious debate. And there is a child ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...dead and that man is laughing. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You have failed us!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: 2 500 in December [were released on early parole. Prisoners were released ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Let us allow the Minister to proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: †Dit is 'n absolute skande! [It is an absolute disgrace!] Of that something like 14 000 prisoners were released nationally on early parole in December, because of a criminal justice system and I am speaking specifically about the correctional system that failed us. [Interjections.] And so we want to extend our sincere condolences to the family [Interjection.] The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat? Is that a point of order, hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Point of order, Chair.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr D SMITH: The hon Minister made mention that the hon Lili laughed because of a child that is dead. Can the hon Minister please clarify that statement, because that is not the case? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order, hon member. If there is a point that the member needs to raise, you can use Rule 65 to deal with that. I recognise you hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Speaker, and I think the point I am emphasising is, we are talking serious stuff. This is serious. You know we are people sitting here. This is not time to joke and to laugh about serious issues. And so again we want to say, what we are doing practically, we want to really extend our sincere condolences to the family, but we are also asking, and I can tell you there is some interesting movements Premier, on the issue of getting this case fast tracked in the criminal justice system. Getting this case to, it is today, this morning it appeared in the Goodwood Magistrate's Court.

I can tell you we are calling on the National Department of Prosecutions and the National Prosecuting authority to fast track it to the High Court, so that we can, even on the charges of murder and of kidnapping, if we can secure those two convictions and the DNA tests and the results will come later, we can just secure it so that our communities can see that we are doing something to hold these criminals to account and not to let them get away with murder, literally, what is happening under the ANC government. [Interjections.]

I want to further say, and I am very happy to say, that I know at a very high level they are looking at this and that they are paying attention to fast tracking this case to go to the High Court. Not to stay in the Magistrate's Court forever and to move fast. I also want to say on a more happier note, because the ANC seems to be the only people to be able to claim history. I was in this hall in 1983 when the UDF was launched. I was one of the members in this hall. [Applause.]

So history does not belong to you. In fact, most of those people are now on the DA side, governing this province. I just want to remind you because some of you are so young, you have no clue of history and perhaps we must give you a lesson in history. I want to make that point. [Interjections.] [Applause.] And so it is very, very interesting when the hon Dugmore suggests that ... [Interjection.] The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. Is that a point of order, hon Sayed?

Mr M K SAYED: Yes, hon Speaker. Again, hon Fritz is repeating what certain other speakers have done by saying "you", when he is starting to promote his sense of ageism here, that he is saying "you". He must not say "you". He must speak through you, as the hon Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Sayed. [Interjections.] On the point that you raised; I am going to request ... [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Lili, please switch off your mic..

Mr A LILI: Oh.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Now let us also observe Rule 40 of our standing rules so that we do not have running commentary throughout the speech as the member is speaking. Hon Minister will you please address the House through me?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think also it speaks to how young some of the people are. They are so childish. They get up all the time on points of order. So, it is so. I do not know whether they are bit early for politics. Perhaps they must go to the crèche next door. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, I find it interesting that the hon Dugmore is now suggesting that this hall, has already been declared a provincial heritage site by our Department of Arts and Culture ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon Minister, will you please take your seat. Is that a point of order, hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order hon Speaker. You have been referring most of us, especially right through the session, in terms of Rule 59, where you were saying that members should not cast aspersions on other members without submitting a substantive motion. And when hon Bredell was referred to by hon Smith, that he has stolen or something to that effect, he had to withdraw that. Now I was watching, it is now the second time, hon members from your right hand side. They are always casting aspersions on this side. The first one was when hon Sayed wanted to raise a question to the hon Dr Meyer, on asking, he says, he does not take questions from unintelligent people. That was exactly what he said. Meaning that either the ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He said so!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...hon is stupid or he is not intelligent. That is what he said and the second issue now, the [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order hon members. Let us hear the point of order.

Mr L L MVIMBI: The hon member now is saying, other members here are children or they are childish, they do not know what they are talking about. So if I may request, if can that hon member withdraw that statement to say that other members here, they are still childish, or they are still children. If I may just request that he withdraw that statement.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: We are not his children.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Ja were not your children, ja.

An HON MEMBER: And he was not [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon – thank you very much hon member. The hon Minister, Minister please take the podium. Hon Minister, did you say the members are children?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I said childish. There is a difference between being a child and childish. Adults can be childish, perhaps you must teach a lesson in .. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...in grammar or in ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, hon Minister, hon members please allow me to provide the ruling here. Hon Minister, hon members are hon members throughout.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja.

The SPEAKER: And there is no childish hon members. So please withdraw that.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will withdraw. It is a subjective opinion ...

The SPEAKER: And proceed with the debate.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...but I will withdraw. I will withdraw. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: To get on because the people can see how you are wasting time. So, thank you Mr hon Speaker. I just want to remind the hon Dugmore that it is indeed this Provincial Department that declared this UDF venue of 1983 a provincial heritage site and it is us asking for it, to be a national – not the Minister – it is us asking for it to be a national heritage site. So just is the point of clarity for the hon member, who is a very good man in person if he does not need to be on television.

I also want to make the point, and I found it interesting listening to all our political parties. Yesterday the Premier asked that all of us must endorse this new ethos of working together, supporting the new Provincial Commissioner of Police. Not one, in their speeches came out in support of the new Provincial Commissioner and I want to again say, unequivocally this morning ... [Interjections.] unequivocally, I want to say, we support the new commissioner because we want crime to be beaten in this province. We want the criminals arrested and behind bars and we want all the criminals put away forever. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

We do not even take note, when you make this point about Bheki Cele, I think hon Christians made the point. We do not even want to respond to that because it is in our interest of the people, it is our job to get a relationship with hon Bheki even though he said all the stuff he said, which is completely factually, legally incorrect. We want to continue ... [Interjections.] with the relationship, Mr hon Speaker, to get results in this province and to get more police officers appointed in this province and I want to say to the Premier, thank you for driving that personally and that relationship building exercise, personally. [Interjections.]

And so we really take this very seriously, because this is the first time in the history of this province, where we have three different spheres of government working actively together. You know, people say stuff in parliament, that is why we do not want to comment on it. In private many of us sitting here ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and everywhere may say complete different stuff. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members. Let us please [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: When they talk privately with you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. I have requested and I do not want to refer to specific members, but I do not want to get to that point, but I am observing this, and it is continuing, and I am requesting, let us please not have a running commentary. Let us exercise and observe Rule 40 of our standing rules, because it is going to be you next time. So let us protect it so that it is not directed at any of the members when they are taking the podium. It is, this happens. So let us avoid it so that we have a house that functions properly. Hon Minister.
The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I completely lost my thread of thought, because to be interrupted all the time is not, is quite an issue. [Interjections.] And it shows the disrespect, hon Speaker, that some of these members, that is why they do not get elected in this province. They get elected in other provinces, not here. I can now understand why no-one in Mitchells Plain is ever elected, because they are so irrelevant. [Interjections.]

I also want to move on to the point that the hon Leader of the Opposition said, you know this interesting point he makes, and everyone is making about how we are dropping to the fourth level – first, second, third, fourth. And noone says, have you ever thought and gone to those provinces and check how many kids are excluded in Grade 11 before they must go to Grade 12, to write and to register for the matric exam and 40% in many instances are excluded from writing the matric exam and they are kept one side, †want julle is die dom kinders! [because you are the dumb children!]

Not in this province, hon members and ladies and gentlemen. [Interjections.] In this province we respect every child. We give every child the opportunity to be fair and to write, because children also have dignity. And I think that is the difference, and of course if we get everyone in, of course, even at the fourth place it is brilliant, because remember we do not chuck children out of the system. [Interjections.] The other point that we forget, and they do not want to listen to, hon Speaker, is that our retention rate is the highest in this province and my figure that I have for retention rate is that we have a 64% retention rate! †Met ander woorde, mense ...[Tussenwerpsel.] [In other words, people...[Interjection.]]

An HON MEMBER: Order Speaker.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: ...kinders wat in die skool bly, die naaste ander provinsie [Tussenwerpsel.] [The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...children who stay in school, the closest other province...]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: God, this guy must go from ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is the point of order? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sorry, sorry Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is the point of order, hon member?

An HON MEMBER: Speaker, can the hon member speak in a way so that we can hear him correctly, not to shout, because at some point in time we want to ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order hon member. Please take your seat hon member. Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I am rising on Rule 66.4 where a member may not disrupt the proceedings by raising points of orders that do not comply with the rules. I think the hon members of the ANC are trying to break the speed of the speaker and I ask you to please protect him. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May I please address that? Just in response to hon Mitchell? [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The nearest other province ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: It will be difficult, sorry hon member. Your time is safe.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell, it is not always possible to know what the member is going to raise, but I think the Whippery must help me so that at

that level. [Interjections.] Hon Lili please help me. What is important is that when we come to the House, it must have gone through that process so that the Whippery helps members to know what rules to raise. What kind of point of orders they must raise here. But in this case let us proceed so that we are able to continue the program.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So I said our retention rate in this province is 64% Mr hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The nearest other province in terms of retention rate – the children are dropping out like flies in other schools in other provinces – is a pure, pure, small amount of 49.6% in Gauteng. Now you must compare apples with apples. And perhaps some of our colleagues in the opposition must perhaps also get – MEC, through the Speaker, perhaps to arrange a workshop for them, because they do not attend the committee meetings where the stuff is being told.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! Do not lie! Do not lie!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And so that is the other problem. I also want to say further that ... [Interjections.] An HON MEMBER: Do not lie! An HON MEMBER: Misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I also want to say [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Do you have a speech or not?

The SPEAKER: Order. Minister, please try and wrap up.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The hon Leader of the Opposition also says that we must use Swartklip, you know the land, for the Smart City, but we are arguing we want to get people out of the *boendoes*. We want to get people away, we want to bring them nearer to the sea or nearer to the City. You know, we do not want to have them on the outskirts. [Interjections.]

And this is the other point, the contradiction that some of our members have. Also, I will not respond to some of our DA members, because I really want to get through to the opposition, but I think some points that hon Madikizela made are quite, quite interesting because in this province we want to say, we will continue whatever you say. We will continue to create jobs.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Our youth need jobs in this time. We are creating jobs.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. Thank you [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And you can sit and make a noise, hon Speaker, through you, they can sit and make a noise, we will continue to create jobs. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up Minister, thank you. Your time is up. Minister, your time is up.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, ja, ja. Is my time up?

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, Sir, man! You did not stop the clock. [Interjections.] That man disrupted me all the time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I gave an extra minute. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, I think he must go back to school somewhere.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, please take your seat. Thank you.

[Interjections.] Order, order. Hon members, distinguished guests, ladies and gentlemen, we are now going to adjourn this process. We will suspend the House until 11:35. So we will be back at 11:35 for the Premier to respond to the debate by members. So, I would like to request that all the hon members go to the minor hall and the guests, there is refreshments just in front of the hall. Thank you very much. The House is suspended.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, can, hon Speaker, could I just ask [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Can I request hon members and guests, please do not move. We are going to conclude the procession and then when we come back we come as we are standing but do not leave now, until the procession is concluded. Hon member?

Mr P J MARAIS: I would like to ask for my Muslim guests, has the food also considered their dietary needs? Would it be Halaal?

The SPEAKER: The answer is, yes. Thank you. The answer is, yes Sir. Thank you very much.

[Business of the House suspended at 11:10 and resumed at 11:38]

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Hon members, thank you. I will now request the Secretary to read the last order.

## Reply by the Premier to the Debate on the State of the Province Address

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Speaker, and thank you very much to all the hon members for taking part in this debate in reply to the State of the Province and, if you would allow me once again, thank you Speaker for actually bringing this Parliament to Mitchells Plain.

I would like to start off by saying that I have already received a number of calls and emails saying 'please can you bring the State of the Nation Address' next year ... [Interjection].

An HON MEMBER: Province.

The PREMIER: ... to our town or our space – State of the Province Address. Sorry I am getting ahead of myself there. [Laughter.] But Speaker, obviously it is not to me that people need to send this, they would need to send it to you Speaker. And so I want to say to you, the Deputy Speaker, the team at the Provincial Parliament, to all of you who spent those hours and hours setting up this space, thank you very much and I look forward to where you decide where the next one will be, but thank you. [Applause.]

Speaker, I want to say that I am going to continue in the same vein that we need to find ways in how we work together to bring the biggest difference that we can to all the communities, all the residents of this province. I said yesterday that our country is in deep trouble and I am going to say it again, our country is in deep, deep trouble. We cannot keep the lights on, our SOEs are failing us and much of the debate that I heard today was a debate that was picking up on small issues that are actually as a result of state failure. And it is interesting that in our focus with this Government, in many of those areas, we are having to step in as a government because other spheres of government are not able to delivery or offer the service or do not have the wherewithal to enable the citizens to actually feel the difference.

And so, in this reply, obviously I will continue with our drive and our focus. I have said that safety is the number one focus of this Government. We will continue focusing on safety, the boots and the investigation space will be focused on by Minister Fritz. The rest of the Cabinet will be looking at violence prevention.

At much of the debate and it was really, you could feel the tension. I could feel it outside of here because once again another one of our children has been found, a body of one of our children has been found – Tazne. And I think that is really exactly why we need to do what we need to do in safety with more and more and more vigour because that has dominated this debate – Tazne. But it was not so long ago that someone else dominated a debate in the Parliament and a discussion. Now when I was sitting here and I heard some of the comments coming across the floor, and even some of the laughing that was happening while Minister Fritz was speaking, it hurt me because a family right now is in deep, deep trauma, Tazne's family. And the reason that their family is in deep, deep trauma and Tazne is not with us today, is because our systems are failing us. There is a Court case happening right now with the alleged perpetrator and we will see what that process delivers but if that is the person, our system failed us.

We let people out of jail too early, there are insufficient consequences and people go back and do exactly the same thing again. We have to fix that. We have to make sure that we get convictions and those convictions put those people behind bars forever. We cannot allow our system to fail and that is why, and it is difficult, I promise you it is difficult to go and find the extra money in our system, to make sure that we can also go and find a way, where not the Province puts the boots on the ground, we have to find a way around the regulatory environment or the legislative environment so we can go out there and put those extra boots on the ground and put them into the hot spot areas. Deployment across the Cape Flats where murder is the highest. We will deploy them there.

There was a question asked in the debate about deployment of police officers. I do not understand why we do not do it. It was said in this debate that the leafy suburbs have the deployment and where the deployment is needed it does not happen. That is not our Provincial Government competency, that is an ANC National Government competency, why do you not do it? I have met with the National Police Commissioner. I have made suggestions to him to say if the statistics that you show us – when we say that there are too few police officers in this province – the reason that we say it is because SAPS statistics get given to us via questions asked in the Parliament. We take those statistics, we extrapolate them, to show us where the deployment happens. It does not happen where crime happens. Now surely that is an easy thing to do. Why is it not happening?

Do not come here and talk about – go to National and say 'make it happen'. I have said we will support you one hundred per cent of the way and in actual fact I am pretty certain we can deploy City Law Enforcement Officers to fill police stations that are not high crime police stations, so we can put as much resource into fighting this scourge as possible. That is what we need to do. But that is what I mean working together. We need to make sure that we are doing that together.

But I also agree – because there were statements made in the reply on Neighbourhood Watches and on CPFs. Now let me tell you that our Neighbourhood Watches enable the volunteer system. You will know that a few months ago when I sat in Minister Fritz' space, the first thing we did was we ask how do we enable them more because they are volunteers? These are men and women, mostly women and grannies that walk the streets at night to try and make their community safe.

They themselves are putting themselves into a difficult space, into a dangerous space. These are amazing volunteers. So, we said let us try and empower them more. I hear the point made here about how do we enable them to at least have some kind of life cover? It is something that the Department

has been looking at, it is something the Minister is looking at. I know that right now, still in this financial year, there is still R4 million available for support to Neighbourhood Watches but we need to have Neighbourhood Watches registered. Whether it is a street committee that becomes a Neighbourhood Watch, whether it is a 'walking bus' that becomes a Neighbourhood Watch, whichever volunteer space it is, use the piece of legislation, of regulatory space that we have created to register.

Why do we want you to register? So that we can use forced multipliers that we can work together, that we can communicate. Imagine the Safety Plan continues where we eventually get every single Neighbourhood Watch to be on an App so we know when they go on duty, or onto the watch, when they come off, they get their life cover, they get their cover from joining up with law enforcement officers and police services. Because I really do value the police service that walks alongside those Neighbourhood Watches but they cannot always and they do not always walk alongside those Neighbourhood Watches.

How do we get a better system that actually enables volunteers on the ground level to communicate, link up and join forces as a forced multiplier, not only with the Neighbourhood Watches and the CPFs but also linked in then to law enforcement, Metro Police, traffic police, South African Police across the board, that we really start managing our systems. We join into that with joining up our big data systems and finding new data systems. Some of those 'techies' in our region who come up with the most amazing Apps, how do we allow them to actually come in with solutions for us so that together we can find solutions and make this the safest province.

A question was raised that said we politicise this space. I have done more to try and break those political lines than ever before and anybody has ever done before. We really do try to take the politics out of it. People say that CPFs are ANC and Neighbourhood Watches are DA. What rubbish! This Government has got R3 million that goes to the CPFs, to help them do their work, to enable them to do their work. But what we need to do is then to also follow proper process. They cannot be CFPs for life. They have to go through a process where the public reaffirms their position, where the public has a say in what happens because they are the community link between the public and the police. They play a very important role, so let us not politicise it.

I promise you from this Government we support all spheres whether it is CPF or Neighbourhood Watches. We make sure that that support is there because these are volunteers who are giving of their time and we need them to be linked up to creating a safer space, it is very, very important.

The Court Watching Briefs, I said it in the speech, it is something that originated here. I know already that the Court Watching Briefs are already on Tazne's case. I also want to commend those policemen that went out there and really put effort into actually bringing this perpetrator to book. I heard the – yes, you can give them a clap. [Applause.] I want to say to the investigators that are on the case right now, all strength to you. Please let us not have a docket landing in the Court that is ineffective, not complete and actually allows someone to get off. We want to give you the full support that you need to make sure that we have a proper docket that actually shows that there are consequences in this system because quite frankly, the failure in the system has actually put us in the space that we are right now and it is totally unacceptable.

Speaker, I would also like to say that when we finish this session today, that we actually on behalf of this whole Parliament and all of the visitors here today, we send our sincere condolences to Tazne's family and perhaps as a gesture of this Parliament, we have got some beautiful flowers up here that they actually get delivered to the family on behalf of this Parliament. [Applause.]

But Speaker, I want to say one last thing on safety, our number one priority. I commended the Minister Bheki Cele two days ago when, no it was yesterday, when he gave us the extra police, men and women in this province. I really do try to work hard to build relationships at a National level and so does Minister Fritz. But I want to say that what I do not accept is what the Minister said in Parliament in the SONA reply. Do you know that I sat in his office on Tuesday. We first had a one-on-one and then we had a meeting and in that meeting was his team, his legal team, his lawyers, General Matakata and a number of police officials. I am not going name their names but some of those police officials are the officials that personally sign off on every law enforcement officer in this city. Those 500 law enforcement officers that the

Minister said were criminals along with their leaders and should be put in jail, that was absolutely unacceptable, unacceptable. He cannot say that because do you know that the South African Police signs off on every single one of those.

In that meeting he asked us are there any of these law enforcement officers that do not have the wherewithal for a firearm and do not have their full competency and training signed off by the police, by SAPS? In actual fact he has got in his possession those records because they signed off on it. But I want to say, where we did say we needed some work to be done. Because remember the law enforcement officers are signed into law through a different piece of legislation and it is not the same piece of legislation that enables police officers and Metro police and therefore the oversight body IPID does not have oversight over the law enforcement officers.

And there is a problem because they are not forced or by implication to actually play a role. And we heard it raised here again today about that very unfortunate shooting accident that happened where a law enforcement officer ended up shooting a police officer. But I want to say that we agreed in that meeting not to prejudge the outcome. We have given every single piece of evidence requested for that to the Hawks and the Hawks are busy with that investigation and whatever happens with the outcome of that investigation must happen, but we also need to make sure that where we have oversight roles that are perhaps a slight bit weaker because they do not fall under the same piece of legislation, we need to find ways to close that gap. And so I look at the Chair of the Standing Committee and say we know that there is a gap at the moment, we have ombudsmen, we have Standing Committees, we have oversight processes so we will use those processes please, to make sure that we do our job while we change the legislation.

Do you know, Speaker, six years ago J P Smith at local government level and SALGA requested them to change the legislation to enable that oversight. For six years we have been waiting for it. We really need that to happen. But perhaps this is also where we need to – and I heard a number of members in the reply talk about things regulatory changes, legislative changes, whether we have more power devolved to provinces, many of those areas I fully agree with and I think we need to start seeing more private members' Bills starting to look at regulatory environment and legislative environment, not only just in this Parliament but also at the National Assembly as well, that we actually start looking at that regulation. Even if you do not get anywhere, you create the space for the debate. You put the legislation or the draft Bill on the table and let us do that. We are first and foremost signed in and sworn in as legislators before we get our respective jobs.

There is nothing stopping any of us in this room or at the National Assembly of starting to put in those private members' Bills so that we can start at least asking the question in a much more serious way.

Speaker, I would like to move onto the economy. And of course, as I have said and I will reiterate – and in actual fact – where my real passion lies is

with jobs because nothing stops a bullet like a job. Nothing changes a family's life like a job. That vision and that goal of a job in every household – just imagine what it would be like at that space. You heard me at the end of the speech talking about what does that future Western Cape look like? It looks like that prosperous space and really in the economy, that is why we are focusing on safety because quite frankly, safety or should I rather say crime, is getting in the way of the economy.

Crime is deterring investors; crime is hurting our communities; crime is stopping our communities from getting education. Crime, drugs, violence, especially right here in Mitchells Plain, puts such pressure on young people trying to get to school so that they can get an education, so that they can play a role in the future economy. Exactly what members have said, why are we here in Rocklands remembering what was said here so many years ago by people saying 'we need change in South Africa', so that our kids can have a better opportunity at playing a role in our future. That needs the economy. That really needs the economy.

I spoke about the jobs, the 24 000 jobs. I am sorry that it was only 24 000 jobs. It should be many, many more. But why only 24 000 jobs and why going backwards as a country, because a lot was said about policy in this debate. A lot of issues raised by policies, specifically, from the African National Congress in this debate. But I promise you it is failed policy in South Africa that has actually put us in this position. Our country has everything that we need. This place should be massively prosperous, this country South Africa.

We have got raw materials, we have got amazing people, we have got every single thing that we need, but as a country we keep on slipping back, we keep regressing. We keep on going to World Economic Forums and being told that people do not even consider us anymore as a place to invest. Why? Because of failure of policy, failure of government.

SAA under rescue. The Cape Town/Johannesburg air-leg is the 10th busiest in the world! But because of massive corruption and really bad management, really bad management, it is in the position that it is in.

Eskom, the big thing that is holding back investors now – because we cannot even keep the blooming lights on – why? Massive corruption and seriously bad management. Who is in charge of that management? And again, what happens, whether it is safety and a province having to step in or whether it is energy and a province having to step in, we having to step into these spaces because of massive failure at a national level. But we will step into them because we will make sure – we all swore an oath to our Constitution – that we will do whatever is necessary to make life better for the citizens in this province, even if it means we have to go beyond what our normal work should be.

In actual fact, what should be happening is Education and Health should be getting more and more money, should be actually able to build the schools they need to build, put the teachers they need to put in place so that we can actually create that environment that was spoken about those years where Albert was, that was what was spoken about, right here in Rocklands.

But why are we not able to do that? Because our economy is failing. We are getting downgraded. The world looks at us as a failure because of all of these failed policies and these failed National Government programmes. Twenty-five years into democracy we should be flying. We should be flying but we are not because we carry on with policies, bad management – it is just ludicrous.

We had a debate here today on NHI. We cannot afford NHI. If you read the document, it says we need 3% GPD growth to even think about implementing NHI but †ons moer aan [we rush on.] It is like the Titanic sinking and we just keep the band going, guys.

We talk about expropriation without compensation. Our Constitution allows us to expropriate but it puts a question. It asks for fairness. You want to take the fairness away, but guess what happens, you want to take the fairness away, in NHI you want the National Minister to have the centralised power. Everything you centralise fails. In land expropriation you want to have the ANC have centralised power and make decisions on whose land gets expropriated or not – no oversight from the Courts – what rubbish! It just keeps us going down with the Titanic. That is totally unacceptable.

So, jobs need energy. Jobs need mobility, jobs need mobility. And you know, there was a lot said about the train system and you know what I believe? I

believe we should be allowed to put management spaces into the train system. [Interjections.]

You heard that PRASA has not paid its bills. I want to tell you a very interesting story about PRASA. I was called by Alwie Lester of Eskom the other day. At the same time as this was happening we were in a Cabinet meeting, I was called by Alwie Lester to say 'I am just giving you a head's up, in two hours' time we are turning the power off to PRASA. We are turning off the switch.' So I said, 'Thank you very much' and then I thought about it because while we were sitting in our Cabinet getting this message, the President was sitting in Gauteng holding the Investment Summit asking the world to come here and invest in our country so we can create those jobs.

And guess what happened? I phoned the President and said 'Mr President, they are turning off the trains, not only in the Western Cape but in Gauteng, KZN and the Western Cape'. I said, 'Mr President you need to intervene here because for me the reason you need to intervene is you need to give the commuters at least fair warning because you cannot suddenly have the trains turned off and you cannot get home to feed your child, or your child is then left at school and you cannot get home in time to collect your child from one of our aftercare centres where we are looking after your child, so that your child is safe and away from the gangs. You cannot get home to take your child home safely. Guess what we have? We have another Tazne. So, I said please stop this. There was intervention and Eskom was stopped from turning off the power. I said to Eskom next time you do it, at least give a few days' notice, which they did. Do you know that they are turning off the power to the trains right now because PRASA still has not paid their Eskom bill.

They cannot even run this business and pay the basics of their Eskom bill. No wonder the lights are not working. Who is managing PRASA? I have got no idea because there does not seem to be any management what so ever. Who is responsible for PRASA? There you sit. There you sit. You are responsible for PRASA. Take charge or if you cannot, give it to us because we will. We will show you how to make it run. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

But you know what? It was really scary because that you know for two hours Eskom did actually turn the trains off. No radio station heard about it. There was nothing on social media. For two hours without power, no-one realised it because everyone had already moved to different modes of transport. When the train does not arrive, people do not care – I mean they have just given up. They just walk across to the train or the bus so they can actually get to where they want to go.

Last thing on Eskom, three of our municipalities are not paying their bills. We very proudly said when the rest of the country were asked and we saw how many people were not paying their bills, that we are up to date in the Western Cape. Eskom tells us now that we are not up to date anymore. Three municipalities are not paying their electricity bill. The first basics that you should be doing. I wonder who runs those municipalities? I wonder who? But also, the last point on the economy and what is holding us back in the economy is the MyCiti bus. The MyCiti bus and why we are in such a difficult predicament, specifically here in Mitchells Plain around MyCiti. Now we know that MyCiti is in trouble because of contractual failure in setting up the contracts for the MyCiti bus to run and Minister Madikizela along with his national counterpart and the City are really trying hard to fix this mess.

Now why did we get into this mess? This contractual mess? I ask a question in this House. [Interjection.] I ask a question in this House. The contractual mess happened not once but it happened twice. In the City of Cape Town this contractual mess happened and it happened at a time when the hon Herron was the Mayco member. [Interjections.] So my question to this House ... [Interjection.]

Mr B HERRON: Order. Mr Speaker, the buses were running when I was there.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, excuse me, hon Herron. Order hon members, order. Order, order, order. Order hon members. Hon member Herron, we do not press the mic and speak. No matter how aggrieved you are. You do not do that and when the Speaker speaks, you do not talk back. The Rules apply in this House. I respect every single member of this House so I expect the same from the members. So there may have been areas where you feel you would love to respond but this is not the opportunity and not the way to do it in the House. May we please respect our Standing Rules. The hon Premier, please proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. You know I need to take responsibility for everything that happens on my watch, right?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The PREMIER: Even if something ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, will you please take your seat. Is that a point of order, hon Mvimbi? What is your point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, hon Speaker. Now again out of consistency, hon Speaker, we have always maintained the fact that we should not cast aspersions on other members here. Now the hon Premier said that there were problems in the City of Cape Town when hon Herron was there. So I think that can only be entertained if there is a substantive motion that is submitted regarding the issue of hon Herron. So therefore I will request the hon Premier to withdraw that statement.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. The specific Rule 59 limits what can be referred to as out of order in that regard. So, this does not fall within that rule and we have no rule that deals with that specific matter. The Premier has not spoken to the member about having done one, two, three but he referred to the system but not said the member did this and this. Because we need to be careful that we do not curtail debate in the House. [Interjection.]

I am sorry I am still talking, I am still on the platform, hon Leader. The Whippery must deal with this but here I am dealing with the Rules. If there is an area that is a bit grey in the Rules, the Rules Committee must deal with it. Any member can bring a matter to the Rules Committee to amend our Rules but I cannot amend the Rules here. So the Standing Rules that we are dealing with were adopted in the Fifth Parliament and the Sixth Parliament; we simply said we will continue with these Rules so there is a subcommittee now led by hon Mitchell dealing with the amendment of these current Standing Rules but let us not do it here right now. So, we will proceed hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So, I, when I hold office must take responsibility for what happens within this Government and whether a contract is being signed in one of the departments, I still have to take responsibility. And so my message here today is to say that we are dealing with not one failed contract but two failed contracts, one after the other and trying to fix it and this happened on the watch of a member that sits in this House right now. Exactly the same thing, that things happened in municipalities when some people in this House were also on watch in some of those municipalities. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier will you please take your seat. Hon member Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, thank you very much Speaker. I think Speaker, on this matter there is also a decision that was made, I think if I remember very well it was regarding member Maurencia Gillion, where there were comments that were made that when she was Mayor and then people said there was corruption and all that. The decision was because it was casting aspersions on the member, the decision was that it is out of order.

Now the Premier says we are dealing, and that is a wrong thing that has happened, with contracts that have not worked and they were signed under the watch of a member in this House and earlier on he has referred to that member as being member Herron. I think Speaker, he is casting aspersions on the member.

The CHIEF WHIP: Point of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I think also the Chief Whip of the DA must be the Speaker if she wants to be the Speaker and then you will be made the Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. I recognise the Chief Whip. Point of order there?

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, Mr Speaker. You have made a ruling and the

Rules are very clear that a member who is aggrieved may not challenge a ruling in the House and there is a process if they do wish to take it further.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Hon Kama. the specific reference you are making, I ruled on that matter earlier and I may not revisit my ruling in the same sitting. The Rules make provision for that but what I will do, the Premier is now referring to a member, not to a specific person and if he refers to a specific member by name and still contains the same argument and sentiment, it will then be ruled out of order. And currently it is not out of order. Premier, please proceed. May I please request the Premier to sit down. Hon Lekker, the Chief Whip of the Opposition?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to actually mention the fact that when we are here, we are bound by the Rules of this House and that simply means there shall be no Rules for one hand and different Rules for the other. Rules must be the same. Now there is a precedence that was set here. I understand that you are saying you may not revisit the ruling that you have made in this House, but I think Mr Speaker in all fairness, Rules are Rules and Rules must apply to everybody. From what I can judge, the honourable thing that should have happened was to ask the hon Premier if he is referring to any member seated here. And that question was never posed and for me it leaves me with a doubt that there is an application of Rules for one person and for others that rule may not be applied in the same manner. So, I am responding to say, my plea is to request, Mr Speaker, that you will be consistent in terms of the ruling. I thank you. The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip of the Opposition. The difficulty, I do not want to interpret what the hon Chief Whip has referred to which if read in the context that you have raised, casts aspersions on the integrity of the presiding officer. I am not going to go to that extent but I will simply appeal to the hon members that working together also means that once a particular Rule has been applied and the ruling has been made, only in the next sitting can that be revisited, through a process that we must follow as members.

But in this case, the hon Premier, I can ask him that question, but simply because he did not refer to a member in the second statement, he simply referred to a member in the House but I am not a Whip. The Chief Whip from the ruling party can rise on that matter, then I must then hear the argument and then make a ruling. But based on what I heard, that is what I thought the Premier was saying, hence then the statement that I have made that it does not link directly with what he may have said earlier in terms of referring to member Herron, and I then said in this House, hon members if the Premier, and I mentioned this verbatim, if the Premier does mention a member and referred to the same statement or allegations that he has made in the same statement it will not be consistent with the Rules of the House and therefore it will be violating Rule 59 of the Standing Rules.

Can we then proceed in that manner and I request your support. May I continue? Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Thank you for that ruling and perhaps also to add that I did not link this to corruption. I linked it to responsibility that we hold, when we hold office. And of course, we cannot close down – people cannot ask questions and push blame and then not be able to have a response to it. But Speaker, let me move from that, the economy and why we need to fix the basics so that we can actually allow businesses to open, remove that red tape burden, so that businesses can start employing more people, that we can actually get an answer to jobs and an answer at the end of the day to more and more jobs in more and more households across the province.

Something else that blocks the economy, something else that blocks the system, which is also linked to crime, although we are focusing on the safety component but it also within the crime space, and that is corruption. Corruption in our country has really pulled us down. Corruption that is not being dealt with has really hurt this country so badly and the big problem that I have, is it seems to now have become like a cancer. It is entrenched in every single space that you look at. You find it all over the place. It really is something that we all have to agree that we need to stop. When we see it happening, we need to report it, we need to deal with corruption. Because corruption, the stealing of the peoples' money means that service delivery does not happen and it is happening all the time. We have got a Zondo Commission that is looking at state capture and corruption, but it is way deeper than just where the Zondo Commission is scratching. And we really

have to make sure that we clean up the acts and where it happens, and it is not always just in Government because it takes two to tango. Wherever this happens we need to deal with it decisively.

That is why we are pushing with our lifestyle audits and I heard some statement about where are these lifestyle audits, etc.? It has been advertised, the audit company is busy with it as we speak and I promise you, we will be the first province and the first government in this democratic South Africa that will actually have a report on lifestyle audits of these members sitting here in the front row of this House. Because we take corruption seriously. We cannot expect to be able to deal with the corruption inside of the spaces that we take responsibility for if we are not showcasing what we are doing ourselves. And we take it really very, very seriously.

But you know, the interesting thing about municipalities and corruption, the really interesting thing – but before I get to that, I was just looking at an item that was brought to the attention of this House. We took over a municipality and it only had R36,000 in the bank. The interesting thing is, if you go back to when the DA took over that government from the ANC, they did not have R36,000 in the bank, they had R20 million worth of debt. [Interjections.] They also have this R1,8 million golden handshake cheque that was handed out on their revolving door of cadre deployment between their municipalities. So once you have stolen here, you get a handshake and they move you to another municipality so that you can loot and steal over there and when they catch you, they will fire you early enough with a golden

handshake to move to the next one [Interjections.]. That is corruption. That is corruption.

But let us talk about local authorities – and you know I first of all want to say, the hon Leader of the Opposition, you might have seen him. Mr Lili I am talking about your leader. [Laughter.] The hon Leader of the Opposition, at the end of his speech and after a phone call as well that I had with him the day before, spoke about the case that he has lodged with the Public Protector. The Leader of the Opposition brought me that document because he said he would and I give you a guarantee, that we will investigate.

## The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: When?

The PREMIER: We will investigate. We will follow proper due process but, do you know you are calling for a suspension but the Public Protector has not even agreed to investigate yet. [Interjections.]. No, she has not. She has not even agreed to investigate yet but also imagine taking a case, a political case to the Public Protector, I mean – but anyway let us talk about this.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members.

The PREMIER: Let us talk about what the ANC are doing here. It is really interesting to me that the Minister ... [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Order hon members.

The PREMIER: ... that the Minister has a forensic unit that does an investigation and without fear or favour, party alliance or not, actually goes and does his job and the first thing the ANC do is they attack the Minister. Huh? Where on earth do you get that from? But then of course that is going to be the original point that I made is that if we do not deal decisively with corruption, if we start protecting where we should not be protecting, we end up with the state that we are in as South Africa, in a very, very tough space. But I will investigate that process but what we should be doing ... [Interjections.] is also having a look at where those individuals are suddenly finding themselves politically and then ask ourselves the question, why attack the messenger? [Interjections.]

And I want to move on and I probably do not have too much more time but I want to move on and I think I have said a few things about the NHI and the pilot and universal health care and what Minister Nomafrench Mbombo had to say and quite frankly, I think we all know in this country, if we take our health care system and specifically a funding mechanism for health care when we do not have the 3% GPD growth rate and we centralise it under ANC control, just imagine the disaster in health care. [Interjections.]. Just imagine the disaster. We cannot allow this to go forward and we will fight it as hard as we can.

But let us get to education. A lot has been said about education, specifically about the funding of education. A lot has been said about people coming to this province to look for opportunities. [Interjections.] Hon Lili, please if you want to, you cannot just continue talking.

The SPEAKER: Premier, please speak through ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Let us talk about education.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, will you please talk through the Speaker. I will do my job and hon Kama do not make it difficult for the Premier – hon Lili, excuse me. And you sit next to each other you see but hon Lili please help me. Hon Premier, please proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Speaker, through you. There was an analysis after the 2019 matric results. This analysis was done by Michael Jordaan, the ex-CEO of First National Bank and he was talking about the jobs of the future, those jobs that you are talking about, our children here in Mitchells Plain, the jobs that they are going to have in the future and specifically the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

We know that children are learning now for jobs that do not actually even exist yet because how things are changing so fast. If you take all of the children that started school twelve years ago, that matriculated at the end of 2019 and you take all of those children and you measure them through the twelve years until matric, and then you say that of those students 40% is the pass rate to actually be able to play a role in the Fourth Industrial Revolution, 40%. All of those that started twelve years ago, with a 40% pass rate, guess how many passed maths in South Africa? 7,7% passed maths in South Africa. That cohort – we spoke about drop-outs, many people spoke about it. Do you know why it is only 7,7%? Because the ANC allow all of our young people to fall out the system so you do not have to measure them at the end of the day ... [Interjections.] but that is the real tragedy in South Africa. That is the real tragedy because you are actually setting up those children to not have a positive future. You want to keep those young people on social grants forever.

But let us also talk about migration. It is a serious issue. So, if you go to the King Dalindyebo District Council right, you know where that is? King Dalindyebo District Council. At the moment, as we speak, there are 80 primary schools in that District Council, 80. The number of schools in use, are 33 ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the Western Cape.

The PREMIER: The children have come here for education because it is failing them, in that province. [Interjections.] 80 primary schools and they only need 33. High schools, 58 high schools and they only need 21!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: We do not have sufficient high schools because they are

being built there and ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...they are being funded there and the teachers are being employed, ghost teachers and all. [Interjections.] We should be having that budget here in this province. That is what should happen. [Interjections.]

Let us go to the Nyangeni District Council: 71 primary schools with only 38 being used and 70 high schools with only 24 being used. That is the tragedy of education today in South Africa. That is the real tragedy and it is not only happening to us, it is happening to Gauteng as well because you are totally failing in those provinces. What should happen, the budget should be transferred across here where the need is so that we can actually make sure that those young people have a future in South Africa ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Lili. Order. Please proceed Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you. I am going to wrap up now. I was expecting the alternate State of the Nation Address from the Leader of the Opposition, but I did not get the alternate State of the Province.

We all know that there are serious challenges for us in this province, very serious challenges. We will workday and night to make sure that we make a difference as quickly as possible for the people of this province. It is hugely difficult when we are facing the environment, or we are trying to do this within the environment that we have. We have spoken about NHI and we have spoken about expropriation, about the failure of our State-owned Enterprises, about the diminishing economy and the slow, or almost no growth in our system. It is getting worse and worse and worse in South Africa under ANC rule and what that does is it puts massive pressure on this Government, on our budgets. You cannot believe the amount of time people spend juggling budgets to try to find solutions with less and less money, all because we are failing at a national level.

But I want to say to you, that I again want to say we want to work together. We want to find those spaces, that as South Africans we can make the biggest difference for the people of our province. We are all committed in this Government to do that, whether it be the politicians, or you see the heads of department here representing those departments. I am absolutely 100% positive that these people are absolutely dedicated to making the biggest difference we can because we love South Africa. We do what we do in this province because of South Africa.

And with that, once again Mr Speaker, thank you very much for bringing Parliament out of those buildings in the city here to be amongst the community. It was amazing interacting with the community in the weeks that led up and we will continue to work with the community to bring the biggest difference. We cannot do it alone, we have to do it in partnership. We have to do it with civil society, we have to do it with our business sector and we have to do it with Government, working in unison, to make sure tomorrow is better than today. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, guests before we adjourn ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Will the lights stay on?

The SPEAKER: ... that concludes the debate on the State of the Province Address by the Premier. May I please have order, hon members, your attention please? When we decided to come to Mitchells Plain, we wanted to make sure that we get closer to the people and I think this exercise has been validated by the debates that have taken place here.

Thank you for your co-operation, thank you for putting people at the centre of Parliament because without people there is no Parliament. We will be going to other regions in this province. We have now made history but will repeat it as we go out to other areas. So, let us work together and thank you very much hon members for your support.

Hon Premier, your request has been granted. After this sitting the flowers will be distributed to the family of Tazne van Wyk. They will be delivered. [Applause.] As we pray for the family, may her soul rest in peace and many other gender-based violence victims and other crime victims in this province. On that note I would like to request that members remain standing and that guests rise for the procession and then the members must be allowed to walk through and the guests can then follow thereafter. That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 12:32.