
THURSDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2024

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Before we proceed, I would like to remind the hon members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date hon members will participate in this Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table Staff, and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings.

The quorum requirements for the Sittings of the House are provided for in the Constitution and our Standing Rules. Hon members, unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their

votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Hon members, if you are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer, you will have your microphones muted and I will call you to order.

The Serjeant-at-Arms will record members' attendance.

Hon members, in instances that these directives do not cover a particular eventuality the Standing Rules must apply and in instances where the Rules cannot be applied the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Hon members, if you wish to raise a point of order in the Chamber please do so and I will recognise you, and a member using the hybrid system if you want to raise a point of order please use the hand-raise functionality on the system.

Hon members, the media have also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, I wish to remind the members of the press that they may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress.

Hon members, for this Sitting Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels,

and lastly, hon members, I wish to remind you that interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, that is the logistical arrangements for this Sitting. I wish to welcome to the guests in the gallery. Welcome to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and I trust that you will enjoy the Sitting today.

With that being said, I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, the hours of the Sitting on Tuesday, 26 November 2024, shall be from 10:00 till adjournment.

I so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved?

No objections? Agreed to.

We now move on to the Order Paper with Questions to the Premier without Notice in terms of Rule... Oh, my apologies! My apologies, colleagues, we

must first do Interpellations. My apologies! My apologies!

We will move to Interpellations as printed on the Order Paper or Question Paper in terms of Rule 197 and I recognise the hon Minister Londt, but hon members, before the Minister starts to speak I wish to draw your attention to the screens. Hon members, we are going to test this today and see if it works, so your time allocation will be in front of you on the screens, so you will now know when your time has expired, so I am asking you to please work with me. If there is no time on the screen it is not the Table Staff or the Speaker. [Interjections.] Alright, hon Minister of Social Development, Minister Londt.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Ms R Windvogel asked ask Mr J J Londt, Minister of Social Development:

- (a) What specific challenges did his Department identify during its unannounced oversight visit to the Beaconvale Frail Care Centre, particularly regarding living conditions, care routines, hygiene, and resident safety, and
- (b) What immediate actions will the Department take to ensure that the recommendations made following the oversight visit are fully implemented without delay?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker, and also thank you for taking this House forward with the times on the screen and I am sure we will get all the glitches sorted out.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, before you continue, there might be the first glitch. [Laughter.] Can I just ask the Table Staff why it is not appearing on the screen? [Interjections.]

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): His time has run out.

The SPEAKER: No-no, I do not want to start with that one and then the screen later on, I want to do it correctly. I just want to for the record say it did work before the Sitting. I checked it. [Pause.]

TABLE STAFF: It is not working.

The SPEAKER: Bear with us for a couple of seconds. [Pause.] Mr Secretary, are we winning? [Pause.]

Okay, hon Minister, in the interest of time and in the interest of the smooth running of the House we are going to continue. As soon as the clock appears we will then revert to that. Hon Minister, Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. With tongue in cheek in our previous lives we have done this numerous

times, setting up and testing everything and then the event starts, so I feel your pain for today, but thank you at least for trying and I am sure we will get sorted out.

To the hon member Windvogel, before I get to the answer itself, several of the Committee members have done unannounced visits, organised visits to older-age facilities across the province and I really appreciate that because the insights that we glean from your visits help us to also improve our services to the elderly, but many of these visits that we do undertake are subjective, because we go into a facility and we get a certain look and feel in that facility and that is why the Department has rigorous monitoring and evaluation that we implement across the province, so that there is an objective tool in which we can measure how these facilities function, and why do I say that? Because I am going to start off by saying something subjectively before I get to the objective part.

I have also visited several facilities, most recently over the weekend in Vredendal, I visited a facility there as well, and when you walk in some of these facilities, it really gives you a bit of a concern on how our elderly are looked after. Some of these facilities when you walk in, you are really comforted knowing that the best interests of the elderly are at the heart of those running the facilities and I start off by saying this, because when I went to Beaconvale, there were some definite concerns that we saw. However, the subjective feeling that I got also engaging with the board and the management is that there is a team that is willing to address the

shortcomings. They acknowledge that there are faults, and they say, "We will correct that," and that already is a big step forward.

I am looking forward to also giving feedback to the Committee, hon Chair, through you, Speaker, hon Kaizer-Philander. On progress on other facilities that you have flagged with us, at which there are also some encouraging signs of moving forward. But on this question, the following challenges were identified:

- The repair of the windows and doors of the bedrooms, or some of the bedrooms.
- Inconsistent implementation of the cleaning programme.
- Outstanding, updated and improved menu.
- Sometimes the lack of psychosocial activities for the residents.
- Sometimes the lack of staff training on policies and the rights of older persons.
- Lack of policies to address allegations of theft by staff as well as residents or their families.
- Outstanding compliant fire and safety reports.
- The outstanding occupational health and safety certificate.

Hon Speaker, here is a 10-page report that unfortunately I do not have the time to read in, but I will submit this to you as well as the Chairperson of the Committee, and then from my side thank you so much for members in the House raising this and also to the board that have acknowledged this and made sure that we will implement it, and from the Department's side we will

closely monitor, as is committed in this report, that the turnaround gets done. Thank you so much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, please join me in extending a warm welcome to our valued senior guests in the House. Speaker, I also want to thank the MEC for admitting there are problems and listening to our plea when it comes to the senior citizens, and I rise today with a heavy heart and a deep sense of responsibility to address the suffering of our senior citizens at the Beaconvale Frail Care Centre. The neglect and mistreatment they have endured are unacceptable and demand urgent action.

I would like to acknowledge the courageous residents of Mitchells Plain who are present today, members of various senior clubs who have stood up against this injustice and you have mobilised, raised your voices and demand accountability for the mistreatment of your peers. Your actions, including protests and affidavits, are a powerful call for justice, and as the ANC we hear your cries. This is why we have brought this issue to the Legislature to ensure that the challenges you face are not ignored but addressed.

However, while you have bravely spoken out, the response from the Provincial Government has been insufficient. The Government has sided with

the management and board of Beaconvale, ignoring the voice of the elderly citizens who depend on these facilities for care and dignity.

The allegations against the facility are grave and must be dealt with immediately, from malnutrition and poor hygiene to the lack of proper medical care. These are not mere complaints, but clear evidence of systemic failure.

The MEC for Social Development and the Department cannot afford to disregard these issues. The Chairperson of the Committee, who will speak after me, must not attempt to defend the facility management or board. Doing so would undermine her credibility. Instead she must ensure that those responsible for managing Beaconvale are held accountable. We demand that the management and board of Beaconvale Frail Care Centre be summoned to appear before the Committee to explain their treatment of the vulnerable residents.

Furthermore, we call on the MEC to provide a full report of the oversight visit conducted by his Department, including the findings, recommendations and, most importantly, the actions that will be taken to address these concerns. We want to know: did the MEC engage with the senior citizens' club, listen to their grievances and acknowledge their demands? The senior citizens clubs have made it clear that the board and management must step down if they cannot resolve the issues raised by the residents.

The ANC, we echo this demand: ensuring the dignity and wellbeing of our elderly is non-negotiable. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Windvogel. I recognise the hon member Kaizer-Philander.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, through you, I can assure the hon member Windvogel that the Standing Committee on Social Development does take their oversight responsibility extremely serious. Hon Speaker, the unannounced oversight visit by the Department of Social Development to the Beaconvale Frail Care Centre demonstrates a proactive and responsible approach to ensuring the wellbeing of our most vulnerable citizens.

This visit, triggered by social media allegations and public protests, underscores the Department's commitment to transparency and accountability. The allegations, though serious in nature, must be carefully examined against verified findings. The early morning walk-throughs and interviews conducted with residents and staff revealed that many claims lack substantial evidence. For example, Speaker, in terms of meals and nutrition, the facility provides nutritious meals with lighter evening meals and a heavier lunch in line with the residents' dietary needs. The accusation of residents being starved is unfounded.

With relation to the living conditions, there was no evidence of foul smells or the withholding of blankets. Maintenance work is actively underway, and hygiene routines are diligently followed. In terms of care practices, while residents are woken early for care-giving routines, this is a standard practice in similar institutions aimed at ensuring adequate care and preparation for the day. It is crucial to highlight that this facility is an independent NPO, supported and monitored by the Department for compliance with norms and standards. The Department has presented findings and recommendations to the Facilities Board to ensure ongoing improvements.

Hon Speaker, if the Minister can please clarify what the Department...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kaizer-Philander, your time has expired, please conclude your sentence.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. If the hon Minister can please clarify what steps the Department is taking to monitor the implementation of the recommendations provided to the board. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kaizer-Philander. Hon Christians, okay, so now we are going to test the timer, hon members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, when there are concerns and when there are complaints it must be noted, and it must be addressed. I am glad that the Minister said that looking at all the facilities and how to monitor and how to improve the services we give to the elderly, but Minister, when there are complaints of, and I heard what the previous speaker said, but when they say meals get worse and worse by the day, management needs to go. Complaints are from 2015 already. It is not a new problem. It is an old problem, and if you want to rectify the problem, you had to start long ago. So it is an ongoing thing, Minister, and please, can you give this House the assurance that you and your Department will investigate and check, because there are quick gains. Changing off menus is quick gains. Looking at access control is quick gains. Speaking to the board and improving and keeping them accountable, is quick gains, so I know there are budgetary constraints and so on, but what I am saying is, let us look at the quick gains to improve the lives of the elderly and I am sure, Minister, people will sing a different story, but you see, people just do not complain because of, for the sake of it. They complain because they are unhappy, and I think the important – I was also at the facility, and I also visited, and I also saw the smiles and all of those types of things. So it is not unfounded, but what I am saying is I think today we must put hands together, and say, how can we have our elderly live in dignity. How can we improve the lives of the elderly? We are just here to say what can we do to assist, to make sure that our elderly live in dignity and that is the question, not just to criticise, but to say let us take hands and let us improve the lives of all of our people in the Western Cape, especially our

vulnerable and elderly. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hon Speaker, the allegations against the specific Frail Centre in Mitchells Plain are very serious and disturbing allegations, to say the least, and the fact that these are frail senior citizens who cannot defend themselves or fight against any type of abuse and ill treatment. I do not believe for a second, Speaker, that the many senior citizens who gathered in front of this specific Frail Care Centre last October just woke up one morning and decided to protest for no apparent reason, and it is for these reasons, Speaker, that a serious and thorough investigation is needed in this specific facility in order to get to the bottom of what is actually happening at that Frail Care Centre, and, more importantly, that this Department of Social Development start doing a proper investigation and also conduct physical monitoring programmes at these frail care centres, especially those frail care centres who are being funded by the Department via grants or subsidies.

Speaker, last month it was said that about 300 000 registered NPOs across the country, about 170 000 of it, were non-compliant in terms of the domestic law requiring them to submit their Annual Reports to the Department.

Now this gave an indication, Speaker, that the Government does not know what is happening at 57% of these NGOs that deal with senior citizens. So,

my request today, Speaker, if we can, it is for this reason, Speaker, rather, that we call upon this Provincial Department to conduct physical inspections at all NPOs providing services to elderly people as part of its monitoring function against these entities. So my question to the Minister is, Speaker, is this Department currently initiating wide-range inspections at all of its old-aged homes across the province? If not, why not? Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. I recognise the hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, Speaker.

†Speaker, dit is eintlik hartseer wanneer die Voorsitter die *management* wil verdedig. Dit is hartseer vandag, en sy moet haar skaam, want ons is hier om ons senior *citizens* te beskerm.

Agb Speaker, ek wil nou die hartverskeurende storie ter tafel lê wat op *social media* gewild geword het, en ek wil praat oor 'n gesin wat 'n geliefde verloor het. 'n Gesin het hulle geliefde wat pas oorlede is by die Beaconvale Frail Care Centre gaan besoek. Die gesin het tot die ondenkbare ontdekking gekom: hul oom in sy laaste ure is alleen gelaat om op 'n onwaardige manier te sterf. Die gesin het hul oom dood in sy kamer gevind sonder enige ondersteuningspersoneel teenwoordig. Toe hulle uiteindelik die personeel genader het, het hulle afkeer en onverskilligheid teëgekome. Hulle oom wat sy hele lewe hard gewerk het, is gelaat in 'n toestand wat net as *inhuman*

beskryf kan word. Sy liggaam was aan die bed vasgemaak met 'n lint en hy was nie behoorlik geklee nie. Dit is die ontstellende werklikheid van wat gebeur by die Beaconvale Frail Care Centre en dit is onaanvaarbaar. In hul rou is die gesin nie net besig om oor die verlies van hul geliefde te treur nie, maar ook die onregverdigheid waarmee hy in sy laaste oomblikke behandel is.

Die vrou wat haar storie met ons gedeel het, het duidelik gemaak sy is skaam oor wat in daardie fasiliteit gebeur het. Dit is nie net swak sorg nie. Dit is die oortreding van menswaardigheid. Die oproep van die gesin en van al die ander wat opstaan en hul stories deel, dit is duidelik die bestuur van hierdie fasiliteit moet gaan.

Dit is soos die *hon* Christians gesê het, hierdie storie is nie 'n nuwe storie nie. Dit kom al van 2015 af aan. As hulle nie die veiligheid, die waardigheid en welstand van hierdie bejaarde bewoners kan verseker nie, moet hulle verwyder word.

I agree again with him, let us take hands to protect our citizens. It is unacceptable, dat ons ons senior burgers so behandel. Ons moet 'n *Government* wees wat omgee en dit is ons verantwoordelikheid om hulle te beskerm en daarom sê ek vir u dankie, agb Speaker.

[Speaker, it is actually sad when the Chairman wants to defend management. It is sad today, and she should be ashamed, because we are here to protect our senior citizens.

Hon Speaker, I now just want to table the heart-wrenching story that became popular on social media, and I want to talk about a family who had lost a loved one. A family went to visit a loved one who had just passed away at the Beaconvale Frail Care Centre. The family made the unthinkable discovery: their uncle was left alone in his final hours to die in an undignified manner. The family found their uncle dead in his room without any support staff present. When they finally approached the staff, they encountered antipathy and indifference. Their uncle who had worked hard his whole life was left in a condition that can only be described as inhuman. His body was tied to the bed with a ribbon and he was not dressed properly. That is the frightening reality of what is happening at the Beaconvale Frail Care Centre and it is unacceptable. In their mourning the family is not only grieving the loss of their beloved one, but also the injustice with which he had been treated in his final moments.

The lady who shared her story with us made it clear that she is ashamed of what had happened in that facility. It is not only poor care. It is the violation of human dignity. The call of the family and all the others standing up and sharing their stories. It is clear that the management of this facility should go.

It is as the hon Christians said, this story is not a new story. It has been coming since 2015. If they cannot ensure the safety, dignity and wellbeing of these elderly residents, they should be removed.

I agree again with him, let us take hands to protect our citizens. It is unacceptable, that we treat our senior citizens in this manner. We must be a Government that cares and it is our responsibility to protect them and therefore I say thank you, hon Speaker.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Windvogel.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel.] I recognise the hon Minister of Social Development, Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am going to start with the hon member Kaizer-Philander.

A Service Delivery Improvement Plan has been developed, and this answers the questions of many of the other members on the other side who said we must investigate, and a plan must be put up. As I said in my original response it is already developed, it is going to be monitored.

There will be follow-ups on the Service Delivery Implementation Plan. [Note later on refers to Improvement Plan.] We will follow up directly with the Chair of the Board, the Manager at the facility and also a visit that engages the people in the facility, and to answer the question asked by hon member Windvogel, I do engage with people at every facility. I walk into the kitchen, myself. I go and open the pot; I make sure that the food that they serve is proper and if it is not, I ask a question about it. But it does remind me of something. There is a lady that works in the kitchen, Berenice Jasson, who I

met at my oversight visit, and sadly she passed away a week after that visit, and it breaks your heart, because that is somebody that when I walked in there, there was just absolute joy serving the elderly. Absolute joy, pride, and passion in her job in serving those that are in the facility. So, as I said, follow-up visits, we will be also requesting proof of evidence that what is said there is supporting documentation and if the home does not comply with the Service Delivery Improvement Plan within a period of at least six months, there will be deregistration that can take place.

And hon Cassiem, maybe because you have recently been in Thabazimbi more than in the Western Cape, the Western Cape has got 31 000 NPOs registered. Of those 17 000 are non-compliant. We have an NPO Help Desk that ensures that NPOs are compliant and if they are not compliant, they assist, but this is the National DSD function where we have taken extra resources from our side to ensure that we help that NGOs / NPOs, they are compliant. So once you get back from Thabazimbi, you can come and reinvest your time into the Western Cape and make sure that we speak the truth, because unfortunately you are missing that at the moment. [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): A point of order, Speaker, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Minister, please take your seat. Is there a point of order?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Yes, yes, Speaker, there is a point of order. It is

member Nkondlo.

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, can I just remind you if you want to raise a point of order on the hybrid system that you do so by using the raise-hand functionality and then I will recognise you. What is your point of order?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): My apologies, hon Speaker. I just want to check, is it parliamentary for Minister to keep on being personal to the member instead of answering the question.

Where does Thabazimbi get into the response to a question that the member has asked? That is actually highly disrespectful to be allowed, as if it is normal, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. Hon Minister, you can continue. That is not a point of order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, you are correct, that is not a point of order but I am also glad the members from, I think, from Mitchells Plain, you were welcomed earlier to the House and you were not in yet, but welcome to the House, and I think you would also be able to follow what happened in the debate up to this point, but just to quickly recap, I only have a minute.

There is a 10-page Service Delivery Improvement Plan about Beaconvale.

That plan, I will make sure it is submitted to the Chairperson of the Western Cape Standing Committee on Social Development. I will also make sure that the Speaker of the House has this, and we will make sure that this Service Delivery Improvement Plan is monitored and, as I said right at the beginning it is good to see. When you go into a facility, sometimes people deny that things are not going right in the facility, but other times you get people that say, listen, there are things that can improve, and I found that in the management that we have engaged there. So, thank you for joining us in Parliament today. I hope you enjoy the rest of the day. Here is the commitment from my Department so that we will make sure that within the finite budget, the limited resources we have, we do the best possible services to those. Thank you so much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Interpellation 1.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We move on to Interpellation 2. I just want to welcome the guests in the gallery. Hon members, I also want to draw your attention that you cannot engage members on the gallery because it is unparliamentary for that reaction from the gallery. So, you are more than welcome, but I wish to remind the members of the gallery to also not participate in the proceedings of the Sitting. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Bredell.

2. Ms B Stoffel asked Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (a) How many times has the Senior Management Team in the Department of Local Government met during the current financial year, and
- (b) what steps will you take to ensure that these meetings are held regularly and effectively moving forward?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon Stoffel for the interpellation. The answer to the Interpellation:

†Die Senior Bestuurspan in die Departement het vyf keer tussen April 2024 en November 2024 vergader. Weens bedryfsvereistes soos die bestuur van rampe in die Weskus en die Tuindistrikstroete, is vergaderings minder gereeld gehou. Vier van die vyf vergaderings is tussen die Departementshoof en die Hoofdirekteure gehou. Op hul beurt het die Hoofdirekteure ingevolge hul eie ooreengekome skedules met die Senior Bestuurspanne vergader. Die Departement sal voortgaan om seker te maak dat vergaderings onderworpe aan bedryfsvereistes tussen die Bestuursdepartementshoof en die Hoofdirekteure geprioritiseer word. Daarbenewens sal ander personeellede wat direk aan die Departementshoof rapporteer steeds genooi word na vergaderings oor items wat met hul portefeuljes verband hou, soos Korporatiewe Dienste, Finansies en Beplanning.

Hon Speaker, net so sal die direkteure voortgaan om gereeld met die Senior Bestuurspanne te vergader om kwessies te bespreek wat met hul portefeuljes verband hou asook terugvoering van die vergaderings tussen die Departementshoof en die Hoofdirekteure te gee. Om te verseker dat die kwessies wat uitgelig is gedurende vergaderings tussen die Departementshoof en die Hoofdirekteure oorgedra word na die vergaderings tussen die Hoofdirekteur en hul Senior Bestuurspanne, is alle Hoofdirekteure opdrag gegee om sodanige terugvoering as 'n standaarditem op hulle agendas te plaas. Dankie.

[The Senior Management Team in the Department has met five times between April 2024 and November 2024. Due to operational requirements such as the management of disasters in the West Coast and Garden Route District, meetings were held less regularly. Four of the five meetings were held between the Head of Department and the Chief Directors. In turn the Chief Directors met with the Senior Management Teams in terms of their own agreed schedules. The Department will continue to ensure that meetings are prioritised subject to the operational requirements between the Management Head of Department and the Chief Directors. In addition, other staff members that report directly to the Head of Department will still be invited to meetings relating to their portfolios, such as Corporate Services, Finance and Planning.

Hon Speaker, in the same way the Directors will continue to meet regularly with the Senior Management Teams to discuss issues relating to their

portfolios as well as give feedback of their meetings between the Head of Department and the Chief Directors. To ensure that the issues that are highlighted during meetings between the Head of Department and the Chief Directors are transferred to the meetings between the Chief Director and their Senior Management Teams, all Chief Directors have been instructed to place such feedback on their agendas as a standard item. Thank you.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Minister. [The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.] I recognise the hon member Stoffel.

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Speaker, as the African National Congress we note and welcome the release of the First South African National Gender Based Violence Study 2022, a baseline survey on victimisation and perpetration which was released earlier this week by the National Government and Human Sciences Research Council. The findings of this study are alarming, revealing the scale of violence faced by women in South Africa with nearly 8-million women having experienced physical and sexual violence in their lifetime.

Hon Speaker, the statistics from the study are not just numbers. They represent a lived reality of thousands of female employees in the Western Cape Government. If it is not a female official in the Department of Mobility suffering under the sexual predator who is her boss, it is the CFO in the Department of Local Government suffering secondary victimisation at the hands of the HOD, who faces ongoing allegations of sexual harassment. The

situation is even more concerning when we consider the impact it has on the functioning of the Department.

During the last Standing Committee meeting on Local Government it was evident that the unresolved sexual harassment case against the HOD is now affecting service delivery in the Department. Despite the standard expectation, the Senior Management Team meets at least once per quarter. These meetings in the Department of Local Government are not taking place. The sole explanation of this appears to be the HOD's reluctance to confront the consequences of his actions, resulting in a failure to convene SMT meetings.

Speaker, it is deeply disappointing that despite knowing about this situation's impact on service delivery, MEC Bredell has failed to take appropriate action. This is a textbook case of abdication of duty, and it is not acceptable. As the political head of the Department the MEC has a responsibility to provide leadership, especially in matters of women's rights and sexual harassment. He must start by conducting an internal investigation into the allegations against the HOD. Why was no internal investigation, MEC, conducted when the matter was reported to you?

Secondly, what step has been taken to ensure that SMT meetings are convened on a regular basis? I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Stoffel.

The PREMIER: That information is incorrect. That is not true.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Bryant.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, I think... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bryant, please take your seat. Hon member Stoffel, is that a point of order?

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Speaker, I am being intimidated by the Premier. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: How?

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Stoffel, I note your comment. You are protected in the House. [Interjections.]

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon Masipa, is that a point of order?

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Hon Speaker, I just want to state that heckling is allowed in the House. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. That is a Rule, so I will recognise the hon member Bryant.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, I think we were all a little bit perplexed when we saw this question on the Order Paper as an interpellation because it seemed like a very strange interpellation in the context of what we have had up until now, but it makes sense now hearing from member Stoffel that this was an attempt to get another question in through the back door, so to speak, but we have discussed this question ad nauseam at our previous Portfolio Standing Committee meeting.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Where answers were given to the member and to other members who were present by Minister Bredell that indeed an investigation is underway and that there have been previous undertakings to address this matter, and I am sure the Minister will expand on those when he has the opportunity to do so. But, Speaker, it really is a case of misleading the House to say that no investigation is underway, as member Stoffel has said, because that is not the truth.

But Speaker, if we are going to talk about meetings and I see my time, I have 45 seconds left. If we are going to talk about meetings, let us talk about what happens in between those meetings and not just meetings for meeting's sake,

and one of the things that we have found, notwithstanding the number of meetings that have taken place with the Department of Local Government, is the success of the Department under Minister Bredell and as we know of the 34 municipalities in South Africa that received clean audits, 60% of those came from the Western Cape and for me that is far more important than having a lot of meetings, but if indeed this question was merely a way to get another question in through the back door, I am sure Minister Bredell will be able to answer that in chapter and verse later. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bryant. I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, during the Annual Report I also heard that the CFO is not attending Senior Management meetings so I was not in the meeting, a Local Government meeting, but I heard this, so I just want to know from Minister Bredell, is it true or false, is he attending meetings or not attending meetings because I think that is the actual question and I just want to pose it so that we have it out. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise the hon Lithakong.

†Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Enkosi kakhulu Somlomo. [Thank you very much Speaker.] [Interjections.]

Can I be protected, †Somlomo, [Speaker] please. I am in a good mood today!

The SPEAKER: You are protected. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Hon member, can you speak to me?

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker]

The DA-led Department of Local Government has lost its relevancy and the purpose for which it was established. This Department is now used as an instrument to fight DA battles in the Western Cape municipalities where DA could not garner enough votes and obtain an outright majority in the previous Local Government Elections. What is currently happening in Theewaterskloof Municipality, where member Isaac Sileku comes from, is a deliberate attempt by the DA to circumvent democratic principles... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): ...and desperately hold on to power by using any means possible such as a court of law and evoking Section 139 of the South African Constitution. The reason why this Department is placing the Municipality under administration is because they are aware that the court order that returned the DA Mayor Lincoln de Bruyn at the helm will be short

lived as he will be removed again. However, since the Democratic Alliance is not so democratic after all they will not stand or allow this democratic process to unfold. So the aim now is to control the Municipality through the Provincial Government by placing the Municipality and administration so that no other party or a coalition outside the DA can run that Municipality.

The situation is so unfortunate, but... [Interjections.]

You are disturbing me. The situation is unfortunate but is exactly what happens when you are dealing with the dictators and the power-mongers. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lithakong. I recognise the hon member Stoffel. [Interjections.] Order, members! Hon Stoffel.

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, with disappointment I cannot agree today with MEC Bredell as well as the Chairperson of the Committee, in terms of the data, because we requested as a Committee the data where that meeting took place and who was in the meeting, and that data, we are still waiting for it. So I do not believe what is being said by the Chairperson and I disagree with him because we are in one Committee.

Speaker, in just three days, our country will kick off with 16 Days of Activism for the Non-violence against Women and Children, a critical

campaign aimed at raising awareness and combating gender-based violence. It is with great disappointment; however, I must highlight a disturbing and recurring pattern of negligence and complicity with the DA-led Administration under Premier Winde particularly in addressing serious allegation of sexual harassment and GBV involving senior officials. This failure to act is betrayal to women of this province.

Take, for example, the case of the CFO in the Department of Local Government, who reported abuse and bullying of the HOD. Instead of protecting, she faced secondary victimisation, with her performance scoring dropping to 23%, is that correct, with no justifiable reasons? To make matters worse, she has been isolated from the Senior Management Team and relegated to sitting in Finance Team meetings. [Interjection.]

†Me P Z LEKKER (ANC): Sies, kry julle nie skaam nie?

[Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Siss, are you not ashamed?]

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Speaker, how can this Department function and the CFO and HOD cannot sit in the same room to discuss crucial departmental matters like finance and programming expenditures? Despite multiple attempts by the CFO, she raised the matter to Premier Winde, former MEC Fernandez and MEC Bredell. No meaningful interventions have been made. This, hon Speaker, so that the DA-led Administration is soft on sexual harassment and GBV, effectively sweeping the case under the rug. The lack of leadership is unacceptable.

Speaker, the MEC and the Premier do not have the luxury to choose whether they intervene as such in this serious matter. This is the duty and responsibility to intervene, please.

Speaker, this incident of bullying and harassment is intolerable. The Committee Chair must urgently call the Premier, MEC Bredell and DG Miller to account for the mishandling of the case.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Stoffel, your time has expired. Please take your seat.

Ms B N STOFFEL (ANC): Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Stoffel and hon members, I did not want to interrupt because it is the first interpellation of this nature. Hon Members, I want to draw your attention to relevance on the questions that you posed, and I have listened very carefully to your responses. The interpellation speaks to meetings and whether or not it took place. The substance of that contribution leads to something else, so I will revert to Hansard, and I will, based on the question in front of the House for interpellation, will then adjudicate on that submission and come back to the House.

Hon Minister, with that being said, can I please ask you to respond to the interpellation on the Order Paper.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Protectors of abuse. [Inaudible, 00:44:52]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, there are certain things that also we cannot just let it hang. Obviously the study that has been referred to by the member Stoffel is worrying for all of us. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): You cannot do that.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, members! [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): You cannot be saying that this is rubbish.

An HON MEMBER: He did not say that.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a member on the floor There were submissions made. Hon members, I ask you to please allow the person on the floor to make his or her submission, in order for all of us to be able to, according to the Rules, have an opportunity. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, ja, so the studies that have been referred to, speak to a deep-rooted problem in South Africa and we all need to take note of that, and we all have a role to play to see to it that over time we rectify that. But we must also not come to the House and misuse privilege, and I dare the hon member Stoffel to go out there, out in the community and say what she said. She will end up in court. I can promise you that, because between myself and the Premier, I can tell you, hon Speaker, that we take this kind of allegations very seriously, but we have the responsibility to find the proof; to get independent people involved, because we are not judges.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are not judges and where the hon Stoffel listens to one party, we need to get the whole picture. We have done two independent investigations, and the results will come out and we will manage the results and then you can judge us.

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Manage those, ja.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So, we will act when it is necessary because this is crucial for us to manage this province in the right direction.

Hon Speaker, and hon Chairperson, I agree with you, and we will deal with this. Hon ACDP, hon Christians, I do not have the information in front of me, but to tell you that in my Department I meet with my two HODs, with the one HOD every Monday with the Directors, and the other one every Tuesday, and I do not go back to the departments and micromanage them. They must do their job and the results in this Province speak for itself. We have a proud unit, a unit that delivers services throughout the Municipality. [Interjections.]

The TWK case, I think it was not part of the interpellation, but the 139, just to help the member, it is a financial recovery plan to support a collapsed municipality under their ruling and National Treasury will come up with the recovery plan and we will monitor and support the municipality. They can be very grateful that we took it over because now we need to fix their mess. With that, I want to thank you, hon Speaker.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): So you cannot answer that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Interpellation 2.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Interpellations are done. I recognise the Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I rise on Rule 39 and Rule 40. The hon Chief Whip emeritus of the ANC is constantly interrupting the speakers, and she is constantly conversing aloud. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. I will listen very carefully. Hon members on both sides of the House, because for the one to converse, the other one needs to respond, so can I please remind both sides of the House to please adhere to the decorum of the House.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of Interpellations. We move on to questions as printed on the Question Paper for Oral Reply. Hon members, I wish to remind you that once the hon Minister or the Premier starts with the reply to an oral question, as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must please use the chat facility if they wish to ask a follow-up question for those members online and for those members in the Chamber to please give me an indication by a show of hands.

There will be four opportunities for a follow-up question, but the hon member that poses the initial oral question will get the first opportunity for a follow-up, if he or she wishes. Thereafter any other member that wishes to ask an additional follow-up question can pose a question. Hon members, I am going to be very strict on the ruling going forward and I want to just remind you, you are allowed one follow-up question. There is no need to justify or to motivate your question. Just ask the follow-up question. With that being said,

I recognise the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

1. Mr B N Herron asked Mr A R Winde, Premier:

With reference to his reply to question 10 of 1 April 2021:

- (1) What success, if any, did the Economic War Room have in the 2021/2022 financial year;
- (2) whether the Economic War Room is still an ongoing initiative, if not, why not;
- (3) how much did it cost the Western Cape Government to implement the second year of the Economic War Room?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Herron for the question. The question that he has asked about is the Economic War Room.

- (1) The aim of this initiative was to pioneer innovative methods to tackle complex, burning issues negatively affecting growth and the creation of jobs in our economy. As you know, one of my foremost priorities has always been to tackle unemployment, and I embrace every opportunity and avenue to do just that.

In its pilot phase, the Government received a considerable donation from the Growth Lab at Harvard University so that we could pioneer a new way of addressing our stubborn issues. Harvard worked with our teams and trained them to use the globally renowned PDIA problem solving methodology.

As mentioned in the 1 April 2021 reply of course to the same question by the member, in part 2 (a), to which the member has made reference in this question, our goal in 2021/22 was to mainstream the PDIA methodology within Government as part of innovative and integrated service delivery.

I am pleased to report that in line with this, we have curated and are implementing the rollout of a training course on the PDIA methodology, which officials across the Government can take at our Government School, the Provincial Training Institute or PTI. This is part of our goal to ensure that our employees have options to upskill themselves in ways that not only provide them with career advancement opportunities, but also contribute positively to how we are able to serve our residents. I am very excited to see the PDIA methodology being used in teams across our Government. It is a wonderful way to get new thinking and problem-solving embedded towards more agile, more innovative delivery.

In respect to the projects that were still ongoing in that year, as per the

response on 1 April 2021, the hon member will recall that we had a team working on commuter safety on buses. In 2021/22 this team continued to look at the iterations in Bus Technology, Fare-box enhancement, Communications campaigns and Corridor improvements and great progress was made in terms of the Bus Technology Project in particular, with GABS having installed CCTV cameras on 762 buses. By March 2022, the data showed that attacks were about half of what they were in the previous year.

The Fixed Capital and Property Development Team also showed success in that year by effecting legislative change and expanding collaborative platforms aimed at improving the industry, such as the Provincial Planning and Development Forum. Team members reported the following efforts, amongst others:

- Within the City of Cape Town there was a successful transition to e-systems to enhancement of communication platforms.
- Heritage Western Cape (HWC) and South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA) worked together to adapt to a remote working and online process, improve efficiencies and turnaround times, and address capacity constraints.
- DEDAT's Red Tape Reduction Unit (RTRU) significantly reduced the Deeds Office backlog and facilitated UIF payments for the construction industry.
- The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

promoted the synchronisation and integration of approval processes.

In respect of the safety intervention, which the member will recall was based on addressing the issue of people arrested multiple times for violent crime but not convicted or kept behind bars, the team members had a more difficult time, and I can understand why. Without substantive cooperation from the police and the justice system, both of which we all know are nationally controlled, little headway can be made, or should I say, was made, and we continue to suffer the effects on the lives of our residents of the failure of these entities.

Perhaps also just to add there that this obviously was in the previous term. In this term I really hope that the work done here as part of the MOU that has now been signed, post the formation of the GNU, that we can then start to bring some of these issues to the fore and start to engage in a positive way where we can start to deal with these matters.

- (2) On the member's second question, as mentioned, the PDIA methodology is being mainstreamed with opportunities for teams from across Government to upskill themselves to use it in their space or service delivery work. I was inspired to see the use of this thinking by our skilled employees who worked together on the Growth for Jobs Strategy which now guides our economic efforts. Just last week, we saw unemployment in our province drop below 20%, a vastly different picture from anywhere else in South Africa. I have no doubt that the

hard work of our officials, and their willingness to embrace innovative thinking, contributed to this outcome and I am proud of our team.

What I can also guarantee the member is that we will stop here. We will remain committed to our pledge to create an environment for jobs and are invigorated by the challenge of doing so; and then:

(3) R856 318.75.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the Premier for the reply. Premier, the follow-up question is really why did the Premier announce an Economic War Room which has a great sense of urgency sounding about it that would save the economy of the Western Cape, is what it was proposed, and achieved 2,5% annual growth and then allow it to fizzle out into a Problem Driven Iterative Adaption (PDIA) method that is now a training programme that is vaguely available to Government employees. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So, first of all, in the War Room, that was the whole reason for the War Room and right from the very beginning, it was how we can use this new methodology which was being developed and

used in one or two countries around the world. That was the PDIA methodology.

If you also remember that at that stage this was a programme to say how do we really inject economic growth and within a year of launching of that programme we were in the middle of a major pandemic and of course that created a focus of Government in some various other areas, but as soon as the recovery phase was kicked back in we were back in, in our working groups to make sure that through this methodology we identified those problem areas to try to get the economy going, and all you have to do is have a look at the difference in this province versus any other province when you come to the economy and, you can say, well, of course he says it was a failure. I say it was a success and the data shows that it supports what I have been saying.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon member Bans. So it will be hon member Bans, hon member Van Minnen and the last opportunity will be hon member Herron.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, in response to a similar question posed in 2021 to the Premier, the Premier indicated that millions had been spent on the Economic War Room, yet there was little tangible progress, especially regarding the War Room's focus on community mobility and safety. In the light of the continued violence and extortion in our communities, particularly linked to the taxi industry, can Premier... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans, can I remind you that you can ask a follow-up question. You do not need to motivate your follow-up question. Just please pose your question.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION (ANC): Can the Premier provide specific details on how the War Room is addressing these critical issues of the taxi industry and the extortion that is at hand currently, Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier, that is a new question in my view, but I am not going to dictate how you respond to it.

The PREMIER: So my answer to that last part is no, because it was not part of what the War Room was dealing with, with PDIA, but it is an interesting question because perhaps it is something that the methodology should be used in some of the conundrums, so in other words, the PDIA methodology is identify a really sticky problem and then how do you unpack that problem, bring all the role players together to find a solution and of course, that was in what I have just explained now, in the Golden Arrow Bus Services, which was being hijacked, I explained in the answer that one of the areas was getting camera systems, making sure those drop-boxes were secure inside the buses themselves, which took away the sort of hijacking of the buses, need to get the cash, because you could not get it. Camera systems picking up the

pictures, but another part of it was where Local Government came in because we did the GIS mapping of where the actual hotspots were, where the Golden Arrow buses were being hijacked, and we then noticed that the road infrastructure was not up to scratch. There might have been potholes or perhaps some problem with the stop and go and so that was fixed, retarred or potholes fixed, so you could actually enable the vehicle to move, the bus to move at a better speed and that again was what led to the halving of the incidents within that year. I hope that helps the hon member.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Van Minnen.

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, I wanted to ask the hon Premier to please expand on exactly what the PDIA methodology is and encompasses.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Okay, thank you, hon member. So it stands for Problem Driven Iterative Adaptation. It comes out of the Economics Department at Harvard University, and I mean the one thing was that this was the latest discussion that was happening around the world. It was happening in South Africa at a national level of course, because Professor Hausmann, who heads up this faculty, was part of the National Government's interventions at National Treasury and at that stage picking up on this and engaging myself, it was an area that really interested me, and that is how the PDIA was then

brought in, in this War Room Project. The interesting thing for me specifically, maybe two.

The first is that it was amazing to go to the report-backs and actually see a single presentation on a conundrum, be it the buses or be it mobility issues or whatever it was, and you would see a single presentation to the City, to the Province, to whoever were the authorisers in that process and in that presentation the presenter would be from the City. Then they would hand over to someone from an entity; then they would hand over to a National Government person, then to a Provincial Government person. It was amazing how the conundrum, which says we must bring all role players together and actually get them to find that solution, and there was like almost a seamless working together. So it was really, that for me just stood out immediately that you found officials working across Government spheres. And then perhaps the last point about PDIA itself and the War Room, was that so far I must just double-check, this was as of last year, but we were the first government then to take it out of that space and it was driven, I think, by innovation to bring it internally into our Government, but also driven on costs.

You know, we did not want to enter into long expensive agreements with Harvard. We got the methodology. We got the training in it. We said let us embed it in our government and at that stage we were the first government that started to embed it internally in our departments.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, hon Premier.

If I understood the Premier correctly, he said that the PDIA and the Economic War Room was disrupted by the pandemic. Post-pandemic have we used the PDIA and the Economic War Room to drive economic growth within our Government, and where?

The PREMIER: So as I said in the reply – so first of all yes, and as I said in the reply, it played a major role in the Growth for Jobs Strategy because we drew on those learnings and we used it to identify areas that we needed to focus on to get our R1 trillion economy going, and so it was key in driving the Growth for Jobs Strategy, and now it is part of our own training programme and it can be used across any department, but of course hopefully at the end of the day it all links towards getting a space of economic opportunity and growth.

I cannot think of a place now where it is more necessary than in the safety and security and policing and building safer society environment, and so all of that work that we developed now that was not going anywhere when the then Police Minister, Bheki Cele, said, “No, not over my dead body and we are not going to engage in this space,” that in actual fact now, as I said earlier, through the MOU we can start to reduce some of the horrendous,

horrendous happenings that are happening in our communities.

Just this week how many of our young lives have we lost again in gang violence and crossfire?

So I really look forward to now embedding that through the MOU and, again, drawing from that work and feeding it in to opportunities to build our economy and jobs, and we can build a safer society, again, you just lift it to the next level of opportunity. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 1 on the Question Paper. We move on to Question 2 and I recognise the hon Premier.

1. Ms B M van Minnen to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

Whether he can provide insight into the success of the Mobile eCentre and how it connects people in rural areas to the rest of the country?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and to the hon member Van Minnen for the question.

Since the launch of the Mobile eCentre in April 2024 in Pacaltsdorp, the Mobile eCentre has served 16 municipalities all over the Western Cape in the

following manner:

- Regular Mobile eCentre visits. These are the community outreach visits.
- It was used in the Disaster Management assistance during the disaster in George with the collapse of that building, and although there was a joint operations command, as per Disaster Management, it acted as a JOC or a Joint Operations Command site office because the bus could be taken right to site and it served that purpose.
- It was also then used in Thusong outreach programmes.
- Municipal outreaches, including Youth Outreaches across all regions in the province, but primarily where areas do not have the fixed eCentres. That is what the Mobile eCentre is about. So a lot of work done in the Karoo.

The municipalities that have been assisted:

- Berg River. The areas there are Porterville, Redelinghuys, Wittewater, Aurora, Goedverwacht.
- Breede Valley Municipality: Rawsonville and Touws River.
- Cederberg is in Citrusdal, and that was also part of a Thusong outreach.
- Drakenstein in Hermon, Saron and Gouda.
- George in Pacaltsdorp and George Central. That obviously refers to the collapsed building.

- Hessequa: Albertinia and Gouritsmond.
- Kannaland at Ladysmith, Zoar, Van Zyl's Dam and Calitzdorp.
- Knysna at Karatara and Smutsville.
- Langeberg at Montague, Bonnievale, Ashton and McGregor.
- Matzikama: Koekenaap, Lutzville, Nuwerus and Molsvlei.
- Oudsthoorn in De Rust.
- Overberg in Hermanus, Kleinmond, Stanford, Gansbaai.
- Theewaterskloof: Riviersonderend, Villiersdorp and Caledon.
- Swartland Municipality at Abbotsdale, Kalbaskraal, Darling, Malmesbury and Moorreesburg.
- Swellendam at Swellendam and Railton.
- Witzenberg at Prince Alfred Hamlet, Wolseley and Pine Valley.

And then (b). During visits to the different areas, the Western Cape Government experienced the needs of different communities of our services, namely free ICT access to the internet. This is obviously connecting them to the rest of the country and the world, and then free ICT skills training.

Rural communities connect to the rest of the country in the following manner, namely:

- Doing research for various proposed school projects or youth educational programmes.
- SMMEs can also use the facility.
- Online applications for:

- NSFAS
- Western Cape departments' jobs applications
- SARS
- SASSA
- Home Affairs
- Department of Labour
- Learnerships
- E-Skills, Non-Accredited Basic ICT and e-learner accredited training, which was also provided.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Van Minnen.

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

I just want to ask the hon Premier if this assists in reducing the distance that exists between citizens and their Government in the same way as sort of First Thursdays? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Yes, absolutely. I mean obviously rolling out connectivity to our citizens, it is an ongoing project from quite a long time ago, even before my coming to being the Premier. It was in the previous Premier's term where I was then in Economic Development, and we, in advice from the

World Bank, showed that if you connect communities that are not connected, you actually get GDP growth rates happening.

I mean back in those days many of our citizens, specifically in poorer areas, did not have connectivity, and that was the start of the Broadband project, and now we have more than 2 000 sites of connection with free connectivity with 2 gigs of free data per month linked in to libraries, linking our Government spaces and then of course the free Wi-Fi hotspots, but there are small communities, and many of them that I read out in that answer, that do not have a fixed centre, and that is where these mobiles are, and of course this is the first one that we have launched. There is quite a lot of demand, people saying, “What about us? What about us? We want one too,” and just going with that bus out into deep rural areas where suddenly you have got connectivity to the world. It really makes a big difference.

I cannot wait until we can get Starlink activated, because it will even give us more connectivity and higher speed capability in the most rural parts of our province, but it creates opportunity. It is where people go and in places that I have gone, you would go in deep rural Karoo and someone will be on that computer busy applying for one of our bursaries or applying for one of our posts in YeBoneers or the Premier’s Programme on Youth, or perhaps Chrysalis, and it gives that kind of opportunity, but even more so I think the school projects and the education enhancement capabilities really for me stand out and make it really worthwhile.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions on that question? If not, that brings us to the end of Question 2 as printed on the Question Paper. We move on to Question 3. Hon Premier.

2. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

With regard to the serious charges faced by the former MMC of Human Settlements:

Whether the issue has been discussed by the Provincial Cabinet; if not, why not; if so,

(a) (i) what were the contents of these discussions and (ii) what proposed actions were considered to address the crisis and (b) why has the Provincial Government not yet intervened or launched its own independent investigation into the full extent of the allegations and the impact on public trust?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon member Bans for the question.

As the question does not specify the municipality in which the former MMC in question served, I must just assume that the question refers to the very serious charges brought against the former MMC of Human Settlements in the City of Cape Town, Mr Malusi Booi.

I also note that the Municipal Manager and the Mayor played an important role in making sure that the charges were laid, the investigations were started and that as soon as those allegations and charges were laid, the Mayor immediately removed the MMC from office.

The charges against Mr Booie have not been discussed within the Provincial Cabinet because he was a municipal public representative and not a provincial representative. The remainder of your question is therefore not applicable.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Bans, hon member Van Minnen. In that order.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon Premier as well for assuming correct on general knowledge.

Hon Speaker, I want to check why has the Premier and his Government not utilised then the full powers afforded by Section 106 of Municipal Systems Act to initiate an investigation into the City of Cape Town, and what specific obstacles or concern have prevented the Provincial Government from taking this necessary step to ensure accountability and transparency? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

Hon Premier, before you respond, I wish to remind hon members you are allowed one follow-up question as per the Rules of the House.

Hon members, I ask you to please work with me. You cannot knowingly have one follow-up question, put in another question just for the sake of having it on the record. I am going to be strict on that going forward and I will rule accordingly. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much.

I think it was not necessary. The Mayor had taken action and we know that the Hawks and the South African Police Service and the Special Investigation Units are busy and they are investigating.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Van Minnen.

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

I want to ask the hon Premier, what mechanisms does the Western Cape Government have to in fact monitor corruption at Local Government level?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So of course we do have the Minister and the Department of

Local Government, and we do have an oversight role from a Provincial Government point of view, but relating specifically to this question and what other role would we play in the instance of this case?

It was not as if I would just ignore what was happening. I mean we saw it. We saw a dismissal of an official because of very serious allegations and charges, and of course we have seen between then and now the allegations and the information are now surfacing because it is now in the court of law, but what I did – not via Cabinet, but what I did do as the Premier – is on 6 April I wrote to the Western Cape Commissioner of the South African Police Service, Lieutenant General Patekile, and in that letter I noted that the Minister of Infrastructure had issued the instructions to review all documents that may pose any concern with regard to human settlement contractors.

More importantly, I pledged my and my Government's full support to any investigation of the SAPS into any of the companies which had been implicated in the investigation into the Booï matter, or any other criminal matter. I pledged to proactively make any necessary documentation available and to assist the SAPS with its investigation wherever possible.

To my knowledge my office has not received any response to that letter.

Then on 20 July 2023 I wrote to Adv Batohi, the National Director of Public Prosecutions, at the National Prosecuting Authority. In that letter I urged the NPA to take swift and decisive action to root out any companies named or

associated with those implicated by the Zondo Commission, and to ensure that the said companies do not do business with the Western Cape Government, or any other government, while under suspicion of any form of corruption.

To my knowledge my office has not received any response to that letter.

Then lastly on 20 July 2023, the same day, I also wrote to the then National Minister of Justice and Correctional Services, Minister Lamola. In that letter I made the same request of the Justice Ministry that I had made of the NPA, to root out corruption and to ensure that dubious companies could not do business with the State.

While I believe Minister Lamola's office acknowledged receipt of that message, to my knowledge my office has not received any further correspondence or response to that letter.

This Government has taken every step to be transparent and accountable, and we need to make sure that when this does happen we all play our part in making sure that corruption gets dealt with decisively. It is a cancer across our country and our system and we have to deal with it decisively.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon member Bans.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you once again, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, this thing of casual answers when we are bringing serious issues, it must come to an end from the Premier, just because we are sitting in an Opposition bench.

Anyway, hon Speaker, what actions are being taken to hold the City of Cape Town accountable for any potential mismanagement or corruption within the Human Settlements Department of the City from our side as the Province? If the Premier can just respond to that seriously now.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Then you, hon Speaker.

I actually take exception to that. I was not making a casual answer. She asked specifically on a section in the Constitution and I said no, it was not necessary because the police are investigating this case already. That is not a flippant answer. That is totally unacceptable, her comment.

Then on her question right now. Of course we follow up. We have a proper functioning Local Government unit that – and you can just see that from the number ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): On a point of order, Chair.

The PREMIER: ...of interventions in our local governments. You can see it from the Section 139s where they are activated ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): On a point of order, hon Speaker. I am member Bans.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bans, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am member Bans, hon Speaker. That is who I am to the Premier. I am member Bans. I am not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...his “she”. I am not his “she” and “her”. I am hon, just like him.

The SPEAKER: Yes, indeed, indeed you are an hon member. Hon Premier, if you did, I did not hear. If you did not refer to the hon member as hon member Bans, please do so in future.

Hon members, we are all hon members of the House and when you address one another through the Chair, please do so in terms of the Rules. Hon

Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

To the hon member Bans, I apologise if there was any misrepresentation, but I do state again that I took exception to that, that my answer was flippant. It was not. It was direct and to the point, and that being the point, that we have oversight mechanisms. We use the Constitution in those oversight mechanisms.

I host all Mayors and all Municipal Managers to the PCF regularly. We invite the Auditor-General, we invite National Treasury, we invite all spheres of Government into those platforms. We take it very seriously, all roles, and you can see as per even earlier in the discussion, you can see it in what happens in local governments in this province.

Where we do intervene, it is because those local governments are absolutely failing the citizens of those towns. For example, in Theewaterskloof where money is missing, where people have got no money to pay salaries. That is when you intervene.

In Knysna, when sewage is running down the street and people week after week have no water, and the mountain of refuse cannot get removed. That local government is failing the citizens of those towns and that is when we put in the diagnostics.

We make sure we follow the rule of law. We follow the Constitution and sometimes it takes a long time to the frustration of those very residents in those towns who get no service, but we follow that to the letter of the law and we will follow it through to make sure that we bring about those changes where those local governments are failing.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? If not, that brings us to the end of Question 3.

Hon members, just for the record. I have been informed that Question 4 has been withdrawn, so we move on to Question 5 as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the Minister of Mobility, Minister Sileku.

5. Mr N Constable to ask Mr I M Sileku, Minister of Mobility:

What (a) policies and (b) measures are in place to prevent nepotism in his Department?

†The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Somlomo mandibulele ithuba lombuzo, ingakumbi imibuzo echaphazela abantu abasebenza kwi department ye mobility ngoba lonto kwakubela umbuzo ongoluhlobo. Somlomo, lonto inobangela ukuthi kungabikho mvisiswano kubasebenzi okanye abantu

bajongane ngendlela engalunganga enochaphazela indlela abantu abawenza ngayo umsebenzi wabo. Ingakumbi lombuzo usukela kwimbalelwano okanye kwinto eyathunyelwa kumalungu elendlu ngamalungu akwi national apho khona kukho izithyolo kubantu abathile, kuthiwa ilungu elithile liye laqesha umntu ahlobene naye. Kodwa xa kulandelelwa ukuthi khanisinikeze incukacha ezithe veshe ukuze sizokwazi ufumanisa ukuthi ba ubunyani balento bungakanani. Manditsho ke ngelitsolileyo ke, somlomo, ukuthi ngelishwa akukabikhonto uza ngaphambili and ke enye into endizayithanda ke mhlambi nakugxa wam lo othe waza nombuzo njegoba ebengomnye wabantu abathe bafumana imbhalelwano eveza okungalunganga esebeni okanye kwi department. Mhlambi naye angasebenzisa ilantuka abhalele kulomntu oze nezizithyolo afune incukacha ezithe vestshe ukwazi sizokwazi uqabelisana nalomba. Ngoba lombu uzawubangela ukuthi kungabikho mvisiswano kwelisebe, ngoba sonke siyazi elisebe alidalanga noko linonyaka luzimele geqe and kubalulekile ukuthi sisebenzisane nabo bonke abantu. Ukuze sibekwelinqanaba bakhona sizokwazi usebenzisana sikwazi sibone ukuthi silisaphi elisebe ke, somlomo, ke ndizawuza ke nempendulo ngoluhlobo lulandelayo:

[Speaker, let me appreciate the opportunity for the questions especially to questions that affect the employees that work for the Department of Mobility, a question like this has been raised before. Speaker, this creates a division between the employees or it causes them to look at each other in a different manner and that affects how they do their work. Especially this question was raised from the letter that was sent to the members of this house by the members of national where some people were allegedly falsely accused.

Where one member was accused of employing someone they are related with, when follow up was done on these accusations to say we want to be provided with proof to see how true this is. Well, I must say, speaker, that unfortunately no evidence has been brought forward up until now. And I would also like to add and say to my friend who raised this question that he can also write to the person who came up with these accusations to ask him for further evidence so, that we can deal with this matter and move forward. Because this matter will cause division on the department because as we all know that this department is new, it is only a year old operating on its own and it is important that we work well together with everyone. So, that we are able to grow this department together and grow forward as a department with that being said, speaker, I will give you answers as follows:]

The below policies and measures are in place to combat nepotism in the Public Service. These policies are transversal and therefore applicable to all departments.

The regulatory framework mandates that all officials prevent nepotism by complying to the Code of Conduct (Chapter 2, Public Service Regulations, 2016, as amended) and the Prevention and Combatting of Corrupt Activities Act, 2004.

These key requirements include:

- Declaring conflicts of interest, recusing oneself from decisions

involving personal gain, and reporting nepotism or misconduct (Regulations 13(d)-(f)).

- Ensuring merit-based recruitment and equitable treatment (Regulations 14(j)-(k)).

The Western Cape Government's transversal Recruitment and Selection Policy (2018) addresses nepotism prevention in paragraph 13.2.16. It requires vested interest in recruitment to be declared. The Appointment Authority or delegate evaluates risk and may replace committee members to ensure impartial and transparent processes.

The following measures are in place to further combat nepotism in the workplace:

- Recruitment panel members must disclose potential conflict, example, family or close friends applying, to the Selection Committee without delay. This ensures merit-based, unbiased decisions.
- Misconduct, including nepotism, can be reported via People Managers, the HOD, or the National Anti-Corruption Hotline. Whistle-blowers' identity will be protected to ensure fair investigation.
- Employees receive ethics training on impartiality and integrity. Violations may lead to warnings, suspensions or dismissal.

These policies and measures uphold fairness and transparency in recruitment, ensuring all appointments are based on merit. Thank you, *Somlomo*.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Constable.

Mr N CONSTABLE (PA): [No audible response]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Constable is not online. Are there any further follow-up questions? Any other members? No follow-up questions, hon – oh, there is a follow-up question.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Thank you very, hon Speaker.

We have noted the background and what the MEC has outlined.

Given the question, is there no nepotism in your Department currently or under your leadership as the MEC?

†The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, Somlomo [Speaker.]

Mandiphendule ke Member Ngqentsu ndithi ngokwenyani akukabikhonto eze kum ethi akhona amalungu akhoyo kwicandelo lam ngaphandle nje kwezityolo esiye sazifumana, enkosi. [Let me answer you, member Ngqentsu, and say that in an honest truth there has nothing that was brought forward to me in my department that claims I have members of some sort except only the accusations, thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Is that another

follow-up question, hon member Ngqentsu?

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Given the allegations he has just admitted, MEC, can the MEC take this House to confidence in respect to attending to all the allegations laid as he is aware?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Like I was saying to hon member Ngqentsu, when there is an allegation – I would just also like to put this one in English.

When an e-mail was sent there were a lot of issues that were raised and, one, if you look in terms of the question that I am currently addressing, it comes from that particular e-mail and they have just been put aside, and, two, when there is an allegation, what you do as a department you will have to refer to the PFS, to the Provincial Forensic Services, and they will do their initial investigation.

All I can tell you now as the MEC is that that particular process is undergoing. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? If not, that brings us to the end of Question 5 on the Question Paper. We move on to Question 6 and I recognise the Minister of Mobility, Minister Sileku.

6. Mr N Constable to ask Mr I M Sileku, Minister of Mobility:

Whether his Department investigated the tender awarded to a certain company whose name has been furnished to his Department for the purpose of his reply; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

†Die MINISTER VAN MOBILITEIT: Baie dankie, agb Speaker.

Ek is net teleurgesteld dat my vriend en kollega van Beaufort-Wes nou nie teenwoordig is om hierdie vraag se antwoorde te kan hoor nie, maar ek sal maar voortgaan met die antwoord.

[The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I am just disappointed that my friend and colleague of Beaufort West is not now present to hear the replies to this question, but I will proceed with the answer.]

On 31 January 2024 the former Head of Department received an anonymous email from a Gmail account alleging of relations between officials and the company in question.

On receipt of this e-mail the former HOD duly referred the matter to the Provincial Forensic Services Unit for review and investigation. The Provincial Forensic Services Unit, within the Department of the Premier

Corporate Assurance, deals with cases and/or suspicions of fraud, theft and corruption affecting the Western Cape Government.

Therefore my Department does not undertake investigation into suspected fraud or corruption.

Hon Speaker, now let me go back to the chronological order of this particular matter.

On 1 February 2024 the Provincial Forensic Services Unit responded to the anonymous email account requesting additional information. The Provincial Forensic Services Unit felt that the information provided was largely general in nature and therefore required additional information to undertake a proper and thorough investigation into the allegations.

† Ongelukkig het dit nie die addisionele inligting ontvang soos versoek nie.

Op 17 Oktober 2024 is 'n ander e-pos ontvang, maar vanaf 'n ander anonieme e-posadres. Hierdie e-pos het soortgelyke inhoud gehad, maar met bykomende inligting.

[Unfortunately, it did not receive the additional information as requested.]

On 17 October 2024 another e-mail was received, but from another anonymous e-mail address. This e-mail had similar content, but with additional information.]

In response to this Provincial Forensic Services Unit requested additional information, but to date this has not been received.

On 19 November 2024 Provincial Forensic Services Unit sent a follow-up email to both anonymous accounts requesting the additional information, with a deadline of 26 November 2024, which is next week Tuesday, †want op hierdie stadium kan hulle nie vorentoe beweeg nie [because at this stage they cannot move forward.]

As such they have only conducted a desktop study of the limited information provided and the way forward will be determined by whether they receive the requested information or not.

Hon Speaker, I wish to emphasise that the Western Cape Government maintains an unwavering zero tolerance for corruption or any unbecoming activities. I am resolute in embedding this principle in all our departmental operations.

With that said, it is imperative that when serious allegations of this nature are brought to the fore, whistleblowers must cooperate with the investigators.

At this stage the Provincial Forensic Services Unit is struggling to get cooperation from the whistleblower in relation to the requested additional information.

It will be appreciated if the hon member who raised the question, or any other person or hon member, could come forward with this information to put this matter to bed.

In the absence of such evidence we risk descending into baseless witch-hunts, which could destabilise and demoralise organisational cohesiveness, whilst undermining our integrity. †Baie dankie. [Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Petrus.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): [Onhoorbaar.] na die agb lid is ... by die hospitaal wees... [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): [Inaudible.] to the hon member... be at the hospital] [Inaudible.]

†Die SPEAKER: Geen probleem. [The SPEAKER: No problem.] I note the apology for hon member Constable.

Hon members, are there any follow-up questions to the Minister? Hon member Petrus.

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Dankie, agb Speaker.

Ek wil net deur u verneem na die Minister toe. Wat is die inligting wat verlang word?

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

I just want to ask through you to the Minister. What is the information wanted?]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN MOBILITEIT: Agb Speaker, baie dankie vir die geleentheid.

Agb lid Petrus, as u nou die e-pos gesien het was daar bepaalde aantygings gemaak van 'n individu en van sekere maatskappye, maar wat ... die mense wat die ondersoek gaan loods het vir addisionele informasie gevra.

Tot op hede het ons nog nie informasie gekry nie, want ons kan nie net gaan op hoorsê nie, daar moet feite wees om seker te maak sodat ons kan voortgaan met die ondersoek, want elkeen kan enige stelling maak en sê, "Ek het iets gesteel," maar daar is geen bewyse nie.

So om voort te gaan moet ons bewyse hê. Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, thank you for the opportunity.

Hon member Petrus, if you have now seen the e-mail there were specific accusations of an individual and of certain companies, but which ... the people who are going to launch the investigation asked for additional information.

At present we have not received information, because we cannot just depend on hearsay, there must be facts to make sure so that we can proceed with the investigation, because anyone can make any statement and say, "I have stolen something," but there is no proof.

So to continue we must have proof. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Petrus, is that a follow-up question, another one?

†Mnr B PETRUS (PA): Agb Speaker, dankie.

Ek wil nie in 'n debat met die Minister gaan nie. Die Minister het gesê die agb lid, as ek dit reg verstaan, moet basies die inligting voorsien of help om die inligting te kry.

Nou ons wil weet wat is die inligting? Wat moet ons gee vir die Minister om voort te gaan met die saak?

[Mr B PETRUS (PA): Hon Speaker, thank you.

I do not want to go into a debate with the Minister. The Minister said the hon member, if I understood it correctly, must basically provide the information or assist to acquire the information.

Now we want to know what is the information? What do we have to give the Minister to proceed with the case?]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: *Somlomo*. Hon member Petrus, †daar moet bewyse wees. Dit is wat ons versoek.

As ek... as iemand sê ek het 'n lekker gesteel by 'n winkel, dan moet ek dit kan bewys en dit is wat ons... wat die Provinsiale *Forensic Services* verwag van die anonieme e-pos.

Daar is korrespondensie gestuur aan die mense vir addisionele informasie, vir bewyse, en dit is wat ons sê, en dit is hoekom my versoek aan u ook is, as een van die mense wat die e-pos ontvang het, om miskien uit te reik, uit te reik na die mens wat die e-pos gestuur het, om te sê, "U het dit genoem, is u bereid om bewyse te gee sodat ons kan vorentoe gaan met die ondersoek?"
Baie dankie.

[There must be proof. That is what we request.

If I... if someone says I stole a sweet at a shop, then I must be able to prove

it and that is what we... what the Provincial Forensic Services expect of the anonymous e-mail.

There was correspondence sent to the people for additional information, for proof, and that is what we are saying, and that is why my request to you is also as one of the people who had received the e-mail, to perhaps reach out, reach out to the person who sent the e-mail, to say, "You have mentioned it, are you prepared to provide proof so that we can proceed with the investigation?" Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Petrus, is that another follow-up question? You may. Hon member Petrus? Okay.

Hon members, are there any further follow-up question on that question? If not, that brings us to the end of Question 6 as printed on the Question Paper for Oral Reply. We move on to Question 7 and I recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

7. Mr B N Herron to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

With regard to the application to the High Court to have the Knysna Council dissolved:

(1) Whether his Department will intervene or join the court

application;

(2) *Whether his Department will intervene in Knysna if the Council is dissolved; if so, what are the relevant details;*

(3) (a) *what has been the main cause behind the Knysna Council's alleged failing and*

(b) why has his Department not intervened sooner?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to hon member Herron for the question.

The first part. The State law advisors within the Department of the Premier have agreed with the Department's recommendation that the application be opposed.

The second part of the question. A recommendation to intervene in another sphere of government will only be made if the relevant threshold of an intervention have been met.

The third part.

(a) The political and administrative instability appear to be the main causes behind the issues being experienced.

- (b) On 16 April 2024 a notice of intention to intervene in terms of Section 139(1)(a) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996 (the Constitution), was issued to the Knysna Municipality (the intention notice), as there were reasonable grounds to believe that the municipality cannot or is not willing to fulfil certain executive obligations.

This notice was intended to afford the Municipality, together with the Municipal Council, the opportunity to consider the content hereof and revert to the Provincial Executive, via my office, on why the proposed intervention should not be initiated in line with Section 139(1)(a) of the Constitution.

Following the 139(1) intervention notice and the exchange of various correspondence between the Municipality and myself, I considered both the responses presented and the current situation, including the significant risk posed to both the environment and the community.

Based on the above assessment I proposed that the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and the Department of Local Government provide assistance to the Municipality in drafting a consolidated executive obligation monitoring and enforcement framework plan to mitigate the continuous failure by the Municipality to execute its executive obligation.

Hon Speaker, the Municipal Council was advised that should it adopt the consolidated executive obligation monitoring and enforcement framework plan, no intervention would be recommended to the Provincial Executive and the Provincial Government would instead closely monitor the implementation of the consolidated executive obligation monitoring and enforcement plan.

However, in the event that the Municipality refused to voluntarily adopt the plan or fail to implement such, I would then proceed to recommend to the Provincial Executive that it intervenes in terms of 139(1) of the Constitution.

On 6 June 2024 the Municipal Council voluntarily adopted the plan. The Department of Local Government, Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, the Provincial Treasury, together with the National Department of Cooperative Governance, have been closely monitoring the situation and providing support to the Municipality. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. I got hon member Herron, hon member Sayed, hon member Bryant. In that order. Hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, before I ask my follow-up question, may I ask the Minister just to clarify what date that Section 139 notice was? I could not hear him.

The SPEAKER: Sure, no problem. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: [Inaudible 1:36:33]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, hon
Minister for that response in clarity.

I mean the situation in Knysna sounds absurd really and chaotic and
certainly, I would say, crisis-orientated. What are the reasons for the
Provincial Government having decided or been advised to oppose the
application by the community action group TAG, who seeks to dissolve the
Council, given the precedent that, I think, exists in Makana, the old
Grahamstown? Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIR
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, to the hon member
Herron.

The Department is of the view that TAG's application is legally flawed.
There are mistakes legally, they quote the wrong legislation, etcetera, and we
cannot – we are also of the view that we – and we are monitoring this for a

while.

We, as a department, will institute any measures to get Knysna back on track, but there is a process. When one government sphere needs to intervene or wants to intervene to another, we need to tick all the boxes, and actually if we would have stepped back a year ago, last December, I think we would have been there already, but when we received notice that you sit with refuse, a pile of – it was at that that stage 40 metres by 60 metres by 5 metres high, with rats running around, with water shortages within Hornlee, those areas, with sewage running in the rivers, and we then intervened by supporting them, because that is the first thing the courts will ask us, “What did you do to support the Municipality?” and between us, Provincial Treasury and National Treasury, we actually solved the refuse issue.

Three weeks ago we received calls. Again there is a water issue. We helped them to fix the pumps, replace the pumps. So we are monitoring that.

We are also very cautious about the environmental risk as well as the risk to humans. So the pressure is on, but where we currently stand we think that TAG’s application does not have grounds to go through the legal process. Thank you.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the hon member Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and welcome to the Chair for the day.

Hon MEC, I want to thank the MEC for the responses so far and for the spirit when it comes to handling issues of Local Government. We do have our critiques at times, but we cannot doubt the fact that we all want to do what is right.

I want to know then in that particular spirit of the interventions that the MEC is speaking about, is the MEC going to follow a similar line with the Matzikama Municipality, given the fact that the leadership, the current leadership that is in place, we do not know how long they are going to be in place, has actually undermined the forensic investigation which the MEC published and which the MEC tabled in this particular House? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon member Sayed, and the short answer is yes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we do not distinguish who is in control of a council. Our main purpose is to manage the legal framework within, and to support our municipalities.

Obviously a lot of – and I understand that members want – and that is why

the public in Knysna is upset again because of the speed things are happening at, but the legal system is a slow system because you need to listen to the other side. The Municipality has got a right to reply and then we need to deal with those kind of things.

So the short answer is yes, we treat all municipalities the same, but I think it is important that I do say this, is that nationally there is a big debate on 139 because we do not get the results we wish.

The one question to the National Minister was can we get one example of a 139 intervention where the municipality has come out better than when it went into that? Because normally when you get into a 139 and you send administrators there, everything is just, the bottom has just fallen out. So to replace that and to rectify that take a huge team effort.

So on a national level we are also busy interacting with them to look at how can we change the system so that we can support municipalities before they get to that state where we need to intervene. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the hon member Bryant.

Mr D W BRYANT (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to the Minister. The case that was brought by the accountability group, notwithstanding the legal opinion that has been

received, it is heartening to see and understandable to see some of these local interest groups being upset, because they are sick and tired of seeing bodies in the water and sanitation failures and financial crises, and this complete collapse of this Municipality under the existing leadership.

What I would like to ask you, hon Minister, is there any timeline or estimated timeline as to how long this process will take? Or will it simply be a case of having to wait until 2026 to vote the ANC out?

The MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Chair, it is a difficult question.

It is something that that we as, between us, the Department, Treasury and National, we monitor Knysna. We help Knysna where we can because we need legally to support them, otherwise when we get to court the judge will ask us, and we had this kind of examples, I think it was in Overberg in 2009, where the Court sent us back and say, "But go and support them."

So we monitor it. I understand that the public is upset, but we need, and it is on all of our shoulders, that people need to understand you change government at the polls, you change it at the election.

When we start with these kind of processes the courts actually do not like it and we have got a huge responsibility to see to it that there is not a complete

lapse of services, whereas that happens we will need to intervene.

In the meantime we have got the Green Scorpions on board, we monitor with National also the lagoon, the estuary, the river system. I think the refuse is sorted out. So the water is still an issue, but it is not – ja, and it is the quality of water as well, but especially the pump system, and to get the pumps up and running and the maintenance of the pump, and we made money available to support the Municipality. The problem with the Municipality currently is there is also – and I must be honest, there is a trust issue. So I cannot transfer R8 million to the Municipality and say, “Fix your pumps,” because I do not know if it is going to disappear.

So we need then to get the Municipality to pay the service provider. They must send us the invoice and we will then reimburse them. Now they do not pay the service provider, so the pumps are in the store and a week later the Premier gets the calls.

So it is up and down. It is a slow process, but we are moving forward and we must just keep on pressing and keeping a close eye on them. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see no further – I see the hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker.

Just listening to the Minister describe what is going on now and how they cannot transfer money to the municipality because it is going to get stolen perhaps. What makes the TAG case different to the case that was brought in Makana? Where it sounds almost exactly the same situation and where the High Court dissolved the Municipality?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chairperson, I do not have the TAG case in front of me. I think it is kind of a new question and we can provide it to the hon member, but – and again, if TAG wins its case, then we need to deal with those consequences.

Personally I think they have quoted the wrong legislation. They are on 139(7). It is not a 139(7), etcetera, etcetera. I know how the courts will look at us and I cannot advise the Premier or the Cabinet that I am confident we will win the case currently. It does not mean we will not win it next week, because we keep a very close eye on this, and if the Municipality keeps on playing us, we might get there, but our responsibility, as I stand here in front of this House, is to support the Municipality, to rectify the issues and to see to it that there is quality service delivery to the residents. Thank you, hon Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. With one minute remaining I will still acknowledge the hon Minister Londt.

8. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr J J Londt, Minister of Social Development:

(a) How many After School Care Service Centres are funded by his Department and (b) what is the monetary value of the support to the centres?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Everything works out the way it should, hon Deputy Speaker.

The answer to the question is short and sweet. The number of After School Care Facilities funded for the 2024/25 financial year is 71, and the total budget commitment is R5 720 814. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much.

Hon members, that is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.

In terms of Rule 204 we now come to Questions to the Premier Without Notice as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Stephens.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Premier, at the launch of the Anti-Extortion Campaign in October last year, Mayor Geordin Hill-Lewis stated that R55 million was allocated in 2023 for additional security to protect construction sites from criminal elements.

Despite this investment the construction mafia continues to disrupt projects through violence and extortion, resulting in delays, cancellations and significant financial losses for the City.

Hon Premier, while these funds are necessary for security, should we not prioritise using resources for job creation, poverty alleviation and youth development? Why is the construction mafia still able to hold Cape Town hostage with extortion tactics despite increased spending on security?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Obviously the question is about another government and their spending, but the issue is a very serious issue. I note that on extortion that yesterday there was a major conference in Durban where the – sorry the day before in Durban, where the Minister of Infrastructure, the MECs of Infrastructure, the Minister of Finance, the Minister of Police, were all present.

They actually launched a new direct line to report this kind of extortion and of course, I mean it is an interesting question from the hon member because basically the question is saying should we be putting money into stopping extortion, or should we be putting money into jobs, and of course it is about getting the balance in that budget. We have just had last week when we were here, the debate in the House was about the crime that is affecting our citizens every single day, and we cannot just sit back and say, "Well, we are not going to do anything about it." We have got to like get the balance in the budget and we have got to try things if we are being failed at other of levels of government, and quite frankly in South Africa the extortion problem is a major, major problem. So absolutely.

Whether the Municipality budgets differently, I mean I do not really want to venture into that space. Of course we ourselves will do whatever we need to do, but we will not create a whole new budget stream in the province to deal with it, we will work with those teams.

I mean, we have from the very beginning when the Anti-Extortion Unit was put in place, it took a long time after the announcement of that unit to actually get it going, but it is a major issue and it faces not just the construction industry, it faces small businesses, it faces even individual citizens. They get extorted on payday.

It is an unbelievable cancer and we have got to make sure that this gets dealt with.

Of course I do believe in devolution of power. I do believe that we actually need a different model for policing in our country, but while we are having that debate, of course we have got to do whatever we can from an oversight point of view, which is our job here in the province, whether it is at a municipal level or a national level, and so I think that coming together yesterday was a good idea.

I just obviously again say that our problem is that our policing is totally under-resourced. For the last eight years police resources have diminished and as opposed to giving money for bailouts of SOEs, and that has had consequences, and here we are with the problem with the under-resourced provincial policing.

We should have 26 000 police officers in our province, we have 18 000. We actually have less police officers in our province than we had in 2019. That cannot be. With our children getting shot, with the gangsterism that we have and of course in the extortion space that you are talking about.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Stephens, is there any follow-up question?

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

What concrete steps has the City of Cape Town taken over the past year to

dismantle the construction mafia's operations and to ensure that public funds are spent on development rather than repeatedly mitigating criminal disruptions? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Premier.

The PREMIER: I would very much prefer that if that question could be sent to me in writing. I will actually get the exact detail. You know, this is Questions to the Premier Without Notice generally about our Government and where we are going, not necessarily about detailed questions on other governments, and of course perhaps that could also be a question to our oversight through the Minister of Police Oversight, but – ja, again I will just reiterate that I think it is a very serious issue that faces so many of our citizens, probably more than we even know because people are so petrified to even go and report these things because they do not want their name associated to any report or any police investigation, because these criminals, these thugs, these gangsters, they threaten you with your life.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Stephens, the Rules allow you one final follow-up, or are you covered? Thank you so much. We now see the hon member Masipa.

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Premier, in relation to the latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey, which

showed the Western Cape's unemployment rate dropping below 20%, to what does the Premier attribute the decrease in unemployment in the Western Cape? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon member.

When I come here I have got as much preparation as I think I am going to get these questions and I am very happy that I have got some detail on this specific question.

I think first of all I must say that, and I am sure that everybody in the House should feel the same way, that we saw a decrease in South Africa and we saw a decrease in this province of our unemployment rate. We saw the number of jobs grow.

I must say that I am also super proud of what this province has achieved, or its businesses and those that employ people, invest and help our economy grow, and it is always – I have got the full Quarterly Labour Force Survey document with me, but it is amazing reading and when you look at these graphs they really stand out for me.

So the first thing is 19,6, of course that is narrow unemployment rate. The broad unemployment rate is 25,6, but the interesting thing on the graph is that 19,6 is by far the lowest in South Africa, but even our expanded unemployment rate is lower than the narrow unemployment rate of every

other province or South Africa put together, and the interesting thing is that even between our narrow and the rest of the country's narrow, there is not one other place that is under 30%, let alone under 20%.

So it feels good to see the economy reacting and changing, [Interjections.] and I would actually say to these members that are jibing in here and making these kind of comments, that it would actually be very good reading for them to go and read this document, [Interjections.] especially the communist in the room. It would be good for him to read this document [Interjections.] and then what he should do, hon Deputy Speaker, is he should then go and align that document with policy positions, especially his party's policy positions, and then ask the critical questions: Why? [Interjections.]

Why is this the Western Cape and this is all the other provinces?

An HON MEMBER: Why would he not answer the question? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: What is happening here? Why are we not getting the economic traction that we should be getting [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Premier, what is the question?

The PREMIER: ...in those provinces?

An HON MEMBER: What is the question [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Hon Deputy Speaker, can you let the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...can you let the hon member know that this is Questions to the Premier Without Notice?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you please be seated, hon Premier?

An HON MEMBER: What is the question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the running commentary, and considering the time and the vital opportunity to ask questions to the Premier, I would not want us to have consistent running commentary. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and I asked him to go and analyse, to ask himself why, because the graphs tell a story and he should be asking himself the question why.

So our unemployment rate, and I really am excited that it has come below – it is only just, it is 19,6. Of course we have got to make sure that we keep driving programmes, we keep driving interventions, enabling programmes to try to make sure this number keeps going down, because nothing stops a

bullet like a job, nothing gives you dignity like a job and nothing puts food on your table like a job.

It is not only those figures of 19,6, it is the other numbers that also – it is the absorption rate and [Interjections.] – it is the absorption rate and how our economy is able to absorb the jobs that are out there. [Interjections.]

It is also about how you look at those jobs, the 75 000 more people in the last quarter that actually got a job in our province. It is also how you look at the construction jobs and just go around our province, go and have a look at the cranes, at the construction, whether it be roads, whether it be buildings, whether it be human settlement development, lots of construction happening.

That means there was investment. Investment equals jobs at the end of the day, and looking at the number of construction jobs also really excites me, because that says down the line we are going to be getting more jobs, and we have got to make sure that we keep on driving and we have got a strategy called Growth for Jobs, and we have got to keep focusing on that strategy of Growth for Jobs in all of its sectors.

At the same time there is also looking at energy, looking at water, looking at safety, looking at health and education, which is a very key component of the Government work that we do, and making sure we are building a healthier, well society and we are building a society that is educated and ready to take up the jobs. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Masipa.

Mr N P MASIPA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

On the questions of the why, hon Premier, why is it important for institutions such as Wesgro to keep clean audits in its efforts to attract investments that are important for job growth as it relates to investor confidence? Thank you, hon Premier.

An HON MEMBER: You have already answered the question.

The PREMIER: I have not answered the question, I am now going to answer the question and that question is that of course, whether it is an entity that gets clean audits, or whether it is a government that gets clean audits, what are clean audits? They are a signal of good governance, and good governance is imperative [Interjections.] before you get investment, and that is why these graphs and what the hon member on the other side, when he asked himself those questions about policy positions, go and have a look at just that. Which of these provinces have got good governance and good audit outcomes, and does that commensurate, or is that is that commensurate with investment and jobs? And he will very quickly see that good governance is a key foundation of getting investment and creating jobs.

Of course Wesgro itself, as the promotion agency, it needs to be trusted. You

cannot go out to the world to say, “Come and invest, come and build a factory here, come and invest and come and give jobs in a call centre here. Come and invest in a hotel in our tourism industry.” You cannot as an entity go out when there are all sorts of questions around your own governance and of course that is critical that we get that right, and then they themselves start to produce documents and start to produce programmes that can be totally trusted.

Let us first of all start off with even our own Government when you get to trust, and you look at the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook, and you look at agriculture in the last 10 years grew at 190,7%, and of course international tourist arrivals by 1058% [2:00:31].

Now Wesgro plays a role in making sure we attract those investments, create the trust in the system, but it is not only about the external, it is about the internal investments.

Drive around the province, areas that you come from. You will see more and more investment into agriculture, orchards being planted, nettings going up. These investments equal jobs.

Perhaps also, hon member, you mentioned Wesgro and I will just talk about probably two things out of Wesgro that were really exciting for me.

The first is that we held a meeting with National Department of Transport.

Wesgro hosted it. It had Transnet in the room, it had ourselves as the Province in the room, and municipalities, and we were talking about issues like the harbour, which is a blockage, the rail concessions and things like that, and how we are growing our exports, and we know that that is a blockage and we have got to get change, but the interesting thing is when you have got products and you have got markets and demand, and what really stood out, and this is a great report and, members of this House, you should go and get it, it is the *Outlook on Logistics Cape Town and the Western Cape*, a Wesgro document, and, wow, it was amazing to see when you have programmes like Airlift, which bring more and more planes into the region, you increase tourists, you increase business tourism, but what you also increase is the ability to put product underneath the plane.

The PREMIER: And while our port is constrained and our ocean exports in the last five years grew actually by 7% despite that constraint.

The interesting thing is when they produced this document the air exports that go in the bottom of the planes, because you have got more and more planes, went up by 18% at the time of drafting the document, which was the May data, 18% that year, year-on-year growth. Then, in June it went up by 47% and a further 40% in July. So, we are seeing massive increases and that comes from a Growth for Jobs project. You go and find ways of getting more aircrafts here, and so you start expanding.

Then, of course, I think we have all known about the tech industry and some

of our tech entrepreneurs, and some of that tech stuff like Mzansi Meat which also blows my mind how we are getting into the new kind of production of carbon friendly proteins. It is Mzansi Meat right here.

Stellenbosch Nanofibers, I have spoken about that before, helping in programmes around eyesight in the US where we are building that technology here and linking in with companies, international companies. This Medical Diagnostech is actually a young guy from Mitchells Plain who now is probably one of the bigger global players when it comes to building test units. Out of Mitchells Plain, Medical Diagnostech, and now globally renowned exporting across the world. TiTaMED is doing infrared systems of implants where an implant grows in a child's arm because you put an infrared signal and the bone on the left hand side, which is not a transplant which is the human bone, grows at x-millimetres per month and the infrared actually gets the mechanism in the titanium implant to grow at the same rate. Unbelievable stuff that comes from here in this region.

But perhaps their latest document which came out in the last month, is Edition 7 which is called Space Innovation in the Cape. And when you say to members 'How much work happens here in the Western Cape with regards to space tech and outer space', you would go like, 'What? Not us.' I mean, we all heard about NASA coming to invest here and that is great, but what about our businesses, our businesses that are here?

Well, this is an unbelievable document. I will just give you one statistic:

20% of all satellites circling the earth, 20% of all satellites circling the earth have got some component developed in the Western Cape. Camera systems developed here in the Western Cape. When you saw NASA having to break up that asteroid that was coming towards earth and you saw them send an intervention to blow up that asteroid, all the visuals that happened, happened on cameras developed here in Somerset West. When you think about the electronics of direction finding, not only on NASA spacecrafts, but on Elon Musk's spacecrafts as well, that technology and innovation come from here in the Western Cape.

So, I would encourage all hon members to actually get and download these documents because they really start to tell a picture of what is happening in this ecosystem. That is the ecosystem that creates jobs, and that is why we can stand up with a graph like this that says our unemployment rate is dropping. It is way better than anywhere else in South Africa. Not just better, but way better. The expanded unemployment rate is better than every other province's narrow unemployment rate and that is, of course, why I say that the hon members should really go and have a look at policy, have a look at what work is happening within party-political policy because it applies, and it applies to all of us.

So, I was referring to our hon colleague here who believes in communist policy and saying go and apply those points not only internationally, which was the book I showed you that you should read as we started this Sitting of failure of communism but go and ask yourself the question ... [Interjections.]

why those policies are not working in these other provinces. They are failing our citizens absolutely. [Interjections.]

But, of course, the other hon members must not get away with it either because, of course, these other hon members are also in government in this province. In the very Knysna. Go and have a look at what you are doing there and how you are messing up in that municipality. Your policies really need some good looking at because they do not work ...[Interjections.]. The Economic Freedom Fighters in the municipalities where they are in government, are not fighting for any freedom of the economy. In actual fact, it gets worse, and it gets worse. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, that concludes Oral Questions to the Premier without Notice. I have noted the hand of the hon Nkondlo. We were dealing with Questions without Notice in terms of Rule 204 and not Rule 202, unless you have a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: I still had another question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Administration will lower your hand, thank you. Hon members, we will now deal with Statements by Members, and I will afford and recognise the first political party, the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms B M VAN MINNEN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I want to take this opportunity to highlight the developments on the beaches of the Helderberg, the constituency to which I am allocated, and their season readiness for the summer season. Strand Promenade continues with its upgrade and will feature at the same design, look and feel as the Strand Seawall Phase 1 project, commencing later this month. When completed, this will bring continuity to the entire promenade from the mouth of the Lourens River, a protected natural environment, all the way along to the Greenways Golf Estate.

Along with the sculptures that will be installed, and the small business opportunities being created, this gives an elegant and clean feel to the residents and visitors who walk, run and otherwise use the walkway along Melkbaai. Harmony Park between Strand and Gordons Bay is ready for families and visitors, with its tidal pools, games areas and peers, while Bikini Beach in Gordons Bay has again been awarded Blue Flag status meaning it is one of Cape Town's top beaches with excellent facilities, cleanliness and wonderful safety standards.

Then, out along the R44 we have the Kogel Bay facility, one of the most beautiful stretches of coastline in the country. Part of this site will be opened for camping as the damage caused by the winter storms is in the process of being repaired.

The City of Cape Town is up and ready for the festive season. Lifeguards

will be deployed and the Helderberg is ready for the summer season. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, today the African National Congress addresses the urgent need to build an inclusive Western Cape, free from racism, intolerance and injustice, both locally and globally. In Gaza, genocide unfolds before our eyes. This week, the Israeli army destroyed Gaza's last ambulances, whilst hospitals lie in ruins. At least 45 000 people are dead, many of them children. South Africa, true to our legacy of justice, has referred Israel to the International Court of Justice.

This is about defending humanity, yet the DA distances itself from these efforts. How can a party claiming to champion rights, remain silent as hospitals are bombed and children are killed? Closer to home, racism remains deeply rooted in the Western Cape. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: At the Bishops College, Council Chairperson, Chrispin Sonn, a champion of transformation, was forced to resign after expressing his views on the genocide in Palestine. His silencing highlights the hypocrisy of a school community that claims to promote moral courage but punishes free speech. Racism in our schools from

Bishops to Herzlia, reflects the systemic failures of this DA-led Provincial Government. This cannot continue.

To build a truly inclusive Western Cape, we call on the DA to support justice abroad by aligning with South Africa's stance at the ICJ. Transform education by making our schools safe spaces that celebrate diversity and moral courage. Challenge the corporate complicity holding entities like Discovery Health accountable when their actions inviting the Israeli apartheid government to a meeting, contradicts these values. The Western Cape must lead by example, embracing diversity in action, not just in words. Let us build ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...a Western Cape free from racism ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...intolerance and indifference. A province of justice and inclusive ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...not one that supports

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...genocide deny
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. ...[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Patriotic Alliance.

Ms D R STEPHENS (PA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yesterday, the Minister of Electricity and Energy, Kgosisentsho Ramokgopa, urged households to upgrade their prepaid electricity meters ahead of the 24 November deadline. Over 2-million households relying on Eskom and municipal electricity supply still need to migrate to the new prepaid meter Key Revision Number (KRN) system. Failure to comply will render the old metering system inactive as KRN1 electricity tokens will no longer be accepted.

While the urgency of this migration is understood, the Patriotic Alliance is deeply concerned that many households will not meet this deadline. More importantly, the rising cost of electricity is crippling our communities. Many

of our people are already struggling to afford basic services and further increases will only deepen their hardship.

We call on all the National Government to intervene urgently and provide meaningful relief to those who cannot afford electricity. This is not just about ensuring compliance with technical upgrades, it is about protecting the most vulnerable members of our society from being left in the dark. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the DA.

Mr M BOOYSEN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, as we approach World Aids Day on 1 December, we have an opportunity to reflect on the significant milestones in the fight against HIV and Aids. This year marks the 20th anniversary of Antiretroviral Therapy, also known as ART in South Africa, a life-changing intervention that has saved millions of lives and given hope to countless individuals and families. ART has transformed HIV from a death sentence to a marginal chronic condition, enabling those affected to lead long and healthy lives.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness continues to lead in this fight. The recent research released by the Human Science Research Council highlights encouraging progress in our province, showing a decline in HIV prevalence. This is a direct result of targeted intervention, public health campaigns and the hard work of healthcare

professionals who have been relentless in their commitment to education, prevention and treatment.

However, this progress is not merely statistics. It represents healthier communities, fewer children orphaned by HIV and a growing generation that is empowered with knowledge about prevention and care. The Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness, alongside civil society partners, has been instrumental in the rolling out of initiatives like HIV testing, prevention programmes and ART access that prioritise not only urban areas, but also the rural communities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, while we celebrate these achievements, we also acknowledge the work that remains. HIV and Aids continues to affect too many lives, and the stigma still lingers in many communities. Our fight must be focused not just on reducing prevalence, but also in creating an environment where every person feels safe, seeking testing and treatment ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon member.

Mr M BOOYSEN (DA): Together, we can ensure that the next five years will bring an even ...[Audio distorted.] society that is Aids free.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the EFF.

An HON MEMBER: Are they in the House?

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. *Somlomo*. Today, the Economic Freedom Fighters would like to take this opportunity and condemn both the DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government and the City of Cape Town, for deliberately neglecting residents of Malgas Camp informal settlement in Mfuleni when it comes to service delivery. Almost 800 families living in the informal settlement had to contribute money in order to buy materials to install two taps so that they can have access to water supply. Moreover, even these two taps are not adequate as it takes an individual almost 30 minutes standing in a queue in order to fill a single bucket with water.

The settlement is still without communal toilets since the year 2020 as residents have resorted to digging holes in order to bury human waste. There is also no attempt by the City to collect refuse in the area and the lame excuse from City officials is that their attempts to distribute refuse bags is always hampered by robberies. We have now entered an era where the DA Government will hide behind robberies as part of their concerted effort not to provide services to poor Black people in townships and informal settlements. Their move has nothing to do with robberies but is a racist tendency ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag, come on!

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): ...similar to those used during apartheid in order to make sure that limited or no services are rendered to Black people as the Government's budget must only be used to serve Whites at all costs.

It is sad to see a Matric learner who is currently writing final exams, queuing for 30 minutes in order to fill a bucket of water so that they can bath and go to school, while on the other hand their counterparts living lavishly in suburbs, just ran a shower for five minutes and they are done. The current inequality in society is now led and it keeps on going on and we refuse that. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon member.

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I have noted neither online, nor in the House, any representation from the NCC. I see the ANC. The ANC.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ANC?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ANC.

An HON MEMBER: They are not in the House.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): We are always in the House, hon member. Thank

you, hon Deputy Speaker. †Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek staan hier vandag om die Wes-Kaapse Department van Onderwys te veroordeel vir die ontwrigting van leerlingvervoer wat gesinne in armoede onregverdig benadeel. Die besluit om vervoerdienste vir skole in die Witzenberg en Tulbagh areas insluitend Morrisdale, Ceres, Wanganella, TJG Primary, Mountridge?? en Drostdy te kanselleer, het 'n ernstige impak op die onderwys van kwesbare kinders.

Teen Januarie 2025, sal 396 leerders sonder vervoer wees, wat hul toegang tot onderwys bedreig. Hierdie leerders van die volgende skole: Morrisdale Primary 61 leerders, Ceres Primary 30 leerders, Wanganella Primary 29 leerders wat nuwe skole moet soek. TJG Primary 95 leerders, Mountridge Primary 90 leerders en Drostdy Primary 91 leerders. Leerders in die Tulbagh area wat voorheen na plattelandse skole gereis het weens oorbevolking, by Waveren Primary word ook geraak. Die besluit om ouers R3 000 vervoer te vra, wat aanvanklik gesubsidieer sou wees, is 'n verdere las op gesinne wat reeds sukkel. Hierdie finansiële las beteken dat baie kinders nie meer na skole sal kan gaan nie, wat die ongelykhede in ons onderwysstelsel vererger.

Verder toon die afwysende houding van sirkelbestuurder Jenny Hawker wat geweier het om met die betrokke ouers te vergader, die gebrek aan empatie en verantwoordelikheid by die WKDO. Alhoewel ek hierdie kwessie in Augustus aan die agb MEC David Maynier aangedui het, het sy weiering om aksie te neem die DA se minagting vir die werkersklas blootgelê. Ek staan in solidariteit met die Witzenberg Justice Committee en alle betrokke gesinne en ons sal aanhou veg vir geregtigheid om te verseker dat hierdie kinders se reg

op onderwys beskerm word. Dankie.

[Hon Deputy Speaker, I'm standing here today to condemn the Western Cape Department of Education for the disruption of learner transport that unjustly disadvantages families in poverty. The decision to cancel transport services for schools in the Witzenberg and Tulbagh areas including Morrisdale, Ceres, Wanganella, TJG Primary, Mountridge and Drostdy has a serious impact on the education of vulnerable children.

By January 2025, 396 learners will be without transport, that threatens their access to education. These learners of the following schools: Morrisdale Primary 61 learners, Ceres Primary 30 learners, Wanganella Primary 29 learners, who have to search for new schools. TJG Primary 95 learners, Mountridge Primary 90 learners and Drostdy Primary 91 learners. Learners in the Tulbagh area who previously travelled to rural schools due to overcrowding, at Waveren Primary are also affected. The decision to charge parents R3 000 for transport, that initially would have been subsidised, is a further burden on families already struggling. This financial burden means that many children can not go to schools any longer, which aggravates the inequalities in our education system.

Further, the indifferent attitude of circle manager Jenny Hawker who refused to meet with the affected parents, shows the lack of empathy and responsibility at the WCED. Although I had mentioned this issue in August to the hon MEC David Maynier, his refusal to take action exposed the DA's contempt for the workers class. I stand in solidarity with the Witzenberg

Justice Committee and all affected families and we will continue for justice to ensure that these children's right to education is protected. Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much, hon member. I see the DA.

Mr L D VAN WYK (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the World Bank has released a report on its Education Sector Analysis for the Western Cape, which aims to improve the educational outcomes throughout the province. The Education Sector Analysis, which began in February 2023, gives a thorough report of the educational system, as well as recommendations for addressing key concerns.

According to their analysis, the Western Cape has higher learning levels than other provinces in South Africa, but functional literacy levels remain low, and Mathematics and Science performance remains challenging. Specific strategies to address this learning crisis include improving the foundations of learning while providing access to high quality Early Childhood Development Services and focusing on teachers' continuous professional development to supplement curriculum and assessments.

The Rapid School Build Initiative recognises the Western Cape Education Department's swiftness, strategic awareness and innovative thinking in issue responses allowing thousands of students to enter the system each year. Furthermore, improvements in education service delivery should be implemented through public/private partnerships. Also, we need to closely

monitor to ensure that implementation is on track with data utilised to analyse progress and adjust programmes as necessary.

We would like to thank the World Bank personnel and contributors who worked on this report, as well as the Western Cape Education Department officials who helped with the process. The Standing Committee and the Western Cape Education Department will now analyse the findings and recommendations, with a view to further improving learning outcomes and giving our children a better future in the Western Cape. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr G P MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the interpellation of today with specific reference to Beaconvale Frail Care Centre in Mitchells Plain is welcomed by the Freedom Front Plus. In fact, upon receiving the complaint I immediately emailed the Chairperson, the hon Ms Kaizer-Philander, asking for an unannounced visit because of the complaints I have received. It is disappointing that the DA is still not able to resolve this serious problem and the Service Delivery Improvement Plan mentioned by the hon Minister is, in fact, an old plan with reference to a *News24* article on 7 November 2023, entitled and I quote:

“Western Cape investigates allegations against Beaconvale Frail Care in Mitchells Plain.” [Interjections.]

This proves that this plan is ineffective. The Freedom Front Plus calls on the hon Minister Londt and the Social Development Department to take action and address these long outstanding issues. It is not fair upon the elderly to endure such long issues that never get resolved. So, the Department must come to the table and the planning must become an action plan in addressing these problems and then, restore the wellbeing of our frail and our elderly. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, good afternoon. Good afternoon to all the hon colleagues. *Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim*. Al Jama-ah extends its heartfelt condolences to the parents of the Ravensmead 14-year-old high school boy who was shot dead outside his home on his way to school. We pray for the speedy recovery of the other learners and innocent bystanders injured in the attack carried out by gangsters.

Earlier this year, the Elsies River Community Police Forum raised concerns about the escalation in gang violence, robberies and shootings which law enforcement agencies dismally failed to take any action against. This is even though there is a disproportionate allocation of resources for police in the City of Cape Town. This week's tragic and similar attacks on school children elsewhere on the Cape Flats causes tremendous trauma to learners, especially

Matrics who are writing exams. The fact that our children are not safe in public spaces and at schools, is a blot on this DA-run Provincial Legislature. This Province has failed to secure safe places of learning for our children on the Cape Flats.

Al Jama-ah further questions the DA's so-called reputation for clean governance, whilst our children in schools are deprived of quality education, safety and security. We take note that the Western Cape Education Department is under scrutiny over a tender scandal involving alleged irregularities for awarding a R1,2-billion Local Area Network services contract for provincial schools. The WCED officials found guilty of this scandal or fraud and procurement mismanagement, must face the full might of the law ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Kindly conclude, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Must face the full might of the law. I thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the primary focus of the LEAP officers as stated by the Western Cape Government in 2020, was the deployment of more law enforcement officers in the top crime areas in the Western Cape. Hon Deputy Speaker, the

Kraaifontein community are up in arms because according to them, the LEAP officers were withdrawn from their area. The CPF chair, Mr Bisset, is disturbed to say that Kraaifontein is seen as the seventh most violent suburb in the province and hence, they do not understand the withdrawal of the Law Enforcement Advancement LEAP officers from Kraaifontein to other areas in Cape Town.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these officers were deployed to make spaces like Kraaifontein a safe haven where children can walk to school, where women can walk to the bus stop, but now they are under siege. The ACDP is asking the hon Minister of Community Safety and Police Oversight to intervene because this Province gives a big chunk of money to the LEAP officers and we as the ACDP, call on the hon Minister to take action to make sure that the people in Kraaifontein's cries are being heard. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank so much. I see the GOOD party.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, like the hon Windvogel, I rise on behalf of 378 children from the Ceres area between the ages of seven and thirteen years old, who recently received letters informing them that they no longer qualified for learner transport.

For children living in the Vredebes area, a community primarily consisting of IRDP housing, what this means is having to walk 9,6 kilometres to get to

school and back each day. They do not just walk; they risk their lives and limbs navigating ganglands and crossing highways because their homes fall 200 metres short of the 5-kilometre distance required to qualify for learner transport.

The National Learner Transport Policy excludes children living within 5 kilometres of schools, but there is very little that worried Vredebes parents can do about it. Schools which are closer to home are already overcrowded and paying up to R490 per month for private transport is unaffordable, so their children must take their chances on the road.

To compound the injustice, as they walk, the children are passed by busses with empty seats that instead of affording them safety will drive right past them. Cancelling their bus rides perpetuates inequality creating barriers to education for working class families and compromising the safety of young learners. It seems obvious that children should not be forced to undertake hazardous journeys to get to and from school when there is a ready solution, unoccupied seats on busses within easy reach. But this is not obvious enough for civil servants.

So, we call on the Provincial Government to urgently re-evaluate these bus routes and the withdrawal of services from these children. The rule about having to live at least five kilometres from school to qualify for free transport, is arbitrary and too rigidly applied. Let common sense and leadership prevail. Education policies must prioritise safety, dignity and the

right to education of all children, and none should be left behind. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see the DA.

An HON MEMBER: I have been living with this and in that culture.

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): I rise on behalf of the DA ...[Audio distorted. – 2:30:23] can you hear me, hon Deputy Speaker? I keep on breaking the connection. Would you please ...[Audio distorted.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker.

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): ...in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mbombo?

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): Sorry? Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you able to speak clearly into the mic? We are unable to hear you clearly.

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): I will try again. I probably ...[Audio distorted.]. Let me try. During the ...[Audio distorted.] all residents qualify for ...[Audio distorted.] and traffic will be heavier as usual. We must all be conscious and take all the necessary precautions ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mbombo? We have checked the network ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): ...[Audio distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mbombo, we have checked the network in the Chamber and previous submissions were quite clear, but I believe it might be your network. We are unable to hear you clearly on our side. Are you able to try one more time, please?

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): Let me try again. Can you hear ...[Audio distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are unable to hear you clearly on our side.

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): I can hear you clearly. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mbombo, we are unable to hear you on our side. Hon member Mbombo, are you able to hear me?

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): I can hear you clearly. I can hear you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please try one more time and if you are not audible on our side, I will then conclude the Statements as per the Order Paper. Thank you. Are you able to try one more time?

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): I am trying again. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed.

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): Thank you. ...[Audio distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mbombo? Hon member Mbombo, at this particular time ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MBOMBO (DA): I can hear you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...we are unable to hear you on our side. I will rule at this particular time that I will conclude Members' Statements. I trust that you find that in order. Hon members, on that particular note, in terms of Rule 145(6), I will now allow one or more hon members of the Executive, should they wish to respond to any of the Members' Statements.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you. There is no need for us ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. One of the things that the Department of Social Development is incredibly proud about ...[Audio distorted.] is the 13 clean audits we had in a row. We get that by

doing regular monitoring and evaluation. Unlike the hon member Marais from the Freedom Front, it was disingenuous in the House today by saying we are using old reports. There were regular reports every year, sometimes even every six months, sometimes every three months even. This is what happened at Beaconvale. I am sorry that he missed the opportunity to participate in the debate. Next time, put your hand up a lot sooner and maybe you can then participate when we have the Interpellation. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. We will suspend the time. Is that a point of order? I see the hon Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. I understand that hon member Marais is not physically in the House, but that does not permit the hon MEC to speak directly to the hon member. He must still accord him the respect that he deserves as an hon member of this House. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He is rude!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, let us please follow the decorum of the House. I see 4 minutes and 10 seconds. Hon members of the Executive?

An HON MEMBER: The hon Minister Maynier is online.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister of Education.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I do wish to associate myself with the comments made in the House about the terrible incident which took place outside Ravensmead High School. I also want to remind the hon members that the Department transports about 67 000 learners to school every day, precisely so that we can expand access to education, particularly for children in poor communities. Despite imposing R2,5-billion worth of budget cuts, we have tried our level best to protect, of course, learner transport.

On the whole question about Morrisdale Primary School, learner transport has in fact not been cancelled. Learners who qualify are currently being transported and I would remind the hon members that schools are aware that they are permitted to submit appeals in relation to learner transport to myself. In this case, to the best of my knowledge, the school has not lodged an appeal.

On the whole question of SITA, I would also like to remind the hon member that the procurement process to which he refers, was in fact run and administered by SITA, not the Western Cape Education Department. The forensic report to which he refers, makes no findings against the Western Cape Education Department officials. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see no further; I see the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I was wondering if hon Minister Marais would come in, but maybe she is not able to. I wanted to respond to the hon Christians and specifically say that, you know, when and I agree with him absolutely. There are communities that are feeling this gangsterism and this crime, and it is totally unacceptable. I understand what he says about deployment of LEAP officers and, of course, we have from the beginning said that this would be done according to or using data and evidence.

I will say on behalf of the hon Minister Marais that I am sure she would be more than happy to engage so that we can have a look and say well, if this data is actually showing us something else, we need to deploy in a different way. Because we have to deploy to effect change and the real reason for it, because we cannot, there are no ways we can fund 20 000 officers across this province. We have got a very small budget. We have got to be impactful, but we must understand the real reason. We are trying to make sure that we can use that data to influence change in overall policing: get more deployment, get them into the right places at the right time so that we bring down crime. But we are very happy to engage on that basis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have 54 seconds. I see the hon Londt.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I also think it is. I saw there were a few seconds left which I really appreciate from the timer. It also important to give credit where it is due. Today, people that are working with the Victim Empowerment Programme, the Department of Social Development got caught in a gang shooting. LEAP officers escorted them safely out of the area. So, let us give thanks also for looking after our assets, the staff of the Western Cape Government, so well. Thank you duly. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I see 18 seconds.

The PREMIER: Hon Deputy Speaker, ...[Interjections.] I see we are allowed to rise more than once. Hon Minister Marais was not able to respond because she is actually with the families of the victims at the moment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. Hon members, that concludes Members' Statements.

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 151, all notices of motions by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have duly been submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Health Department budget cuts as stated in the National Medium-Term Policy Statement; and the effect it will have on this critical front-line service in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with grave concern the serious allegations of corruption, cronyism, capture and maladministration within the Western Cape Department of Mobility, particularly the alleged involvement of senior officials such as Deidre Ribbonaar, Kyle Reinecke, Ricardo Collins, Gamza Martin, and Farrel Payne, who are accused of personal enrichment through luxury properties, fleets of expensive vehicles, and the appointment of family members to cushy Government positions; Further notes companies allegedly linked to these officials, such as PEGASYS and ROUTE MASTER, have been awarded lucrative multiyear contracts, raising concerns about conflicts of interest and corruption; notes further that despite Premier Alan Winde acknowledging knowledge of these allegations, the implicated officials have not been suspended pending investigation, leading to concerns

about the Premier's complacency and lack of decisive action; and therefore calls on Premier Winde to furnish the House with the timelines and scope of the investigation he claims to have instituted into these matters, and for the Standing Committee on Public Accounts (SCOPA) to summon the Department of Mobility and its MEC to appear before it to account for these serious allegations; and further calls on the House to take decisive action to ensure that corruption in the Western Cape Government is eradicated, transparency is upheld, and those responsible are held to account.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed in terms of Rule 150. We now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 19 November 2024. Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting on 19 November 2024, political parties submitted the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting. I will therefore, just for noting and for purposes of the

Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following hon members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority and it is as follows: hon Walters, number one. 2. Hon Walters again; 3. Hon Jacobs; 4. Hon Bans; 5. hon Constable.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Haroun Pietersen from Mitchells Plain who was crowned the African continent's powerlifter champion; notes that it is great to see someone from our province representing us proudly on the continental stage; expresses pride in this achievement; and wishes Mr Pietersen all the best as he continues to work hard to make us proud in the World Games next year in China.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr T C R WALTERS (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates *KykNet* for 25 wonderful years of excellence in Afrikaans media; acknowledges that *Kyknet* has not only promoted the Afrikaans language and culture, but has also filled

people's hearts by delivering trustworthy and inspiring content; acknowledges the dedication and passion with which *KykNet* approaches media, which has made it a true leader in the industry; and wishes *KykNet* well for the next 25 years of excellence in Afrikaans.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D G JACOBS (NCC): I move without notice:

That the House commemorates the 16 Days of Activism; notes that every six hours a woman dies at the hand of her intimate partner in South Africa; notes that we are deemed one of the top five countries that is the most unsafe for women; notes that Statistics South Africa has declared this a hyperendemic; conveys heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of these women who have violently lost their lives; notes that we deem the family as the cornerstone of communities, and the lives and safety of our mothers and daughters in the community are paramount; notes that we are in tears for those women; and demands that authorities leave no stone unturned to bring to book the perpetrators of these hideous crimes.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates His Excellency Ambassador Ebrahim Rasool on his appointment as South Africa's Ambassador to the United States for a second term and commends the national government for making this exceptional choice, which demonstrates their confidence in Ambassador Rasool's diplomatic acumen and leadership; further notes that Ambassador Rasool's appointment comes at a critical juncture in international relations, as the United States prepares for a new political landscape and his ability to engage across party lines and his proven track record in navigating complex geopolitical dynamics will be invaluable in strengthening the South Africa–US relationship during this new phase; acknowledges that in his first term, from 2010 to 2015, Ambassador Rasool worked tirelessly to bolster South Africa's standing on the global stage, contributing to the deepening of bilateral ties between our two nations, and that this second tenure, under different political leadership in the US, will undoubtedly benefit from his experience, strategic foresight and commitment to shifting the narrative towards a more inclusive and collaborative future; and wishes Ambassador Rasool well on his new tenure, as we trust that his leadership will continue to foster goodwill, drive economic diplomacy and promote South Africa's interests in Washington and beyond.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr N CONSTABLE (PA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Bafana Bafana and the South Africa Football Association for qualifying for the 2025 African Cup of Nations in Morocco; wishes them well with their preparations and believes that they will do us proud; and notes that this shows again that we, as South Africans, are indeed a winning nation.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? There are no objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual member's name as if the member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford an opportunity to the hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes time limit, and I see the hon Ngqentsu.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates our national team, Bafana Bafana, on their outstanding 3-0 victory over South Sudan in the AFCON Qualifiers on 19 November 2024 at the Cape Town Stadium;

further acknowledges that this victory is a testament to their determination and patriotism, and appreciates the pride that Bafana Bafana brings to the nation; however, the House also notes with concern the failure of the DA-led Administration in the province and the City of Cape Town ...[Interjections.] to provide support to Bafana Bafana's supporters, exposing the hypocrisy of these administrations. [Interjections.] Laments that while the DA Government readily provides the free MyCiTi bus services and other necessary assistance for supporters attending rugby games for instance, no such provisions were made for the supporters of Bafana Bafana, the pride of our nation; further laments that, due to the neglect and lack of assistance from the DA-led Government, thousands of Capetonians and Western Cape citizens who came out in numbers to support their national team were forced to walk long distances from the bus, taxi, and train stations in the city centre to the stadium, while those who drove their own vehicles were stuck in traffic for hours; acknowledges that this lack of support for the national football team stands in stark contrast to the resources allocated to predominantly White-supported sports; accepts that if the DA-led Government truly represented all the people of the Western Cape, it would have coordinated an interface between the City of Cape Town and Western Cape Government to provide free MyCiTi bus services for Bafana Bafana supporters; acknowledges that the absence of such services reflects a disregard for the working class, particularly Black working-class supporters of football, and is reminiscent of the apartheid regime's discriminatory policies of separate development and

its neglect of the majority; and that the House calls out and condemns the DA-led Provincial Government and City of Cape Town for their failure to support Bafana Bafana's supporters, and for their continued neglect of Black working-class sport. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

Hon MEMBERS: Objection! Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved?

The PREMIER: That is absolutely an objection ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are many objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And where were you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now see again the hon Ngqentsu. [Interjections.]

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and acknowledges the cultural and sporting significance of the Bellville Velodrome for the people of Cape Town and the Western Cape; further notes that the Bellville Velodrome represents a rich legacy of sports in the province, having been part of South Africa's Olympic bid and having served as a key venue for various sporting events, as well as a space that has shaped countless memories and legacies for local communities, and for these reasons rejects the plans of the DA-led City of Cape Town to redevelop the historic Bellville Velodrome; expresses deep concern that the City of Cape Town, instead of restoring and maintaining this important sports facility, has allowed it to fall into disrepair, and now proposes its redevelopment for commercial purposes, potentially turning it into a second CBD for Cape Town, despite the fact that this could displace an irreplaceable community asset; notes further that the redevelopment plans are not an isolated incident as they come at a time when the City has shown a consistent pattern of neglecting sports grounds across the Cape, poorly maintaining such spaces and forcing communities to choose between sports and other essential services, as seen in Gugulethu and Kraaifontein where residents have been asked to choose between sports fields and clinics or schools; acknowledges that the DA-led City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government have shown a lack of commitment to sports as a means of addressing social ills and fostering the development of future athletes, as shown in their continued prioritisation of property developers over the needs of communities and athletes; that the House agrees that sports infrastructure, such as the

Bellville Velodrome, is crucial not only for preserving our heritage but also for its role in promoting active lifestyles and the development of young athletes, and therefore it is vital that this venue be restored to its former glory and fully functional status, rather than being sold off or repurposed for commercial gain; calls for unity across political parties, community organisations, and residents to form a Broad Popular Front against the displacement of sports grounds in Cape Town, and to fight against the greedy interests of private developers at the expense of our sporting heritage; and demands that the City of Cape Town prioritise the restoration of the Bellville Velodrome, ensuring that it remains a fully functional and accessible venue for future generations, and that it upholds its duty to provide and maintain sports facilities in line with national policies on sport and recreation. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The PREMIER: Yes, of course.

Hon MEMBERS: Object! Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed

on the Order Paper. I again see the hon Ngqentsu.

An HON MEMBER: He still must note all the work that we have done for Bafana Bafana.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not available. Take your seat, sir.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): No, not ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I again see the hon Ngqentsu.

The PREMIER: The one-man party.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Yes, he is right. ...[Laughter.] I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the tragic killing of 14-year-old Grantham van Reenen, a Grade 8 learner at Ravensmead High School, who was shot and killed on his way to school ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is so sad!

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC):

...on Tuesday, 19 November 2024; extends heartfelt condolences to the

family of the deceased and the entire Elsies River community; and wishes a speedy and full recovery to the two other teenagers who were injured in the same attack, which was carried out by heartless gang members; further notes that, not far from the scene of the shooting, a 55-year-old man was also shot and injured, and is currently recovering in hospital; acknowledges that this senseless act of violence highlights the unsafe conditions that learners in gang-ravaged communities face, and highlights the urgent need for the Provincial Government to intervene to protect these young people, especially those on their way to and from school; calls for the mobilisation of communities, as was done in the past through the Walking Bus initiative, where parents and community leaders accompanied learners to and from school, providing a shield for them against gang violence; further calls for the deployment of School Resource Officers to all schools in communities plagued by gang violence, in order to ensure the safety of learners, educators, and staff; in addition, the House calls on law enforcement authorities to leave no stone unturned in their pursuit of justice for the victims of this shooting, and demands that they intensify efforts to apprehend the perpetrators of this crime, who remain at large; and further calls for the permanent deployment of visible policing and intelligence services in all gang-infested hotspots in Cape Town, to ensure the protection of learners and the broader community from ongoing gang-related violence, and to restore safety in these communities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Objection that it is moved without notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now see the hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the severe health risks posed by unsafe and expired food products sold in spaza shops throughout our province; further notes recent incidents, such as the case of a five-year-old child in Kensington who fell ill from consuming a mouldy pie, along with several other reported incidents where children bought consumables containing foreign objects like capsules, highlighting the dangers of these contaminated products; acknowledges that these incidents, along with the major discovery of sausage manufacturing in Mfuleni under unsanitary and unsafe conditions, and reports of expired food and other products being dumped in an open field in Khayelitsha by spaza shop owners, some of which were reportedly consumed by children illustrating the alarming prevalence of food safety violations in spaza

shops, particularly in townships and rural areas; further notes that while the Foodstuffs, Cosmetics and Disinfectants Act 54 of 1972 and the National Health Act of 2003 empower municipalities to conduct food safety inspections, fine transgressors, close noncompliant shops, and make arrests, it is deeply concerning that, despite numerous reports and public outcry, authorities have been slow to act, with City food inspectors failing to address the ongoing sale of hazardous food products, raising questions about their effectiveness and possible complicity, thus allowing dangerous practices to persist and putting vulnerable populations at risk of foodborne illness. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see no objections, agreed to. I now see the hon Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The African National Congress moves without notice:

That this House notes with absolute disgust the corrupt actions of the DA-led Western Cape Government regarding the R1,2 billion IT tender awarded to Blue Network Consortium, and they can laugh as much as they want, for the provision of Local Area Network (LAN) to schools; further notes that a forensic investigation presented to Parliament's National Assembly by Cliffe Dekker Hofmeyr Incorporated has revealed

a web of alleged corruption ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Have you read it?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION:

...collusion ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: You obviously have not!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION:

...maladministration, and abuse of power by officials within the Provincial Government and the State Information Technology Agency (SITA) (in fact, I was invited to attend that particular briefing, and I did, and I have read the document) with this tender being tainted by widespread irregularities and criminal conduct; acknowledges that it is absolutely unacceptable that despite these serious findings, the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) and its MEC have chosen to turn a blind eye to the corruption uncovered, opting to continue honouring this dubious contract, even in the face of clear evidence of wrongdoing. The DA's National Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies, Solly Malatsi, has grossly abused his power by pleading ignorance, failing to act against the implicated SITA officials and allowing for their reinstatement. This not only undermines the rule of law but also

exposes the DA's complicity in this corrupt scheme; further acknowledges that this behaviour is an affront to the people of the Western Cape, the people of South Africa, and to all who believe in transparent and accountable governance; accepts that the DA's failure to act against the implicated officials involved further exposes the party's inherent corruption and its complicity with the looting of public funds. Their inaction and attempts to cover up this corruption must be condemned as an endorsement of theft and abuse of power; calls on this House to condemn the actions of the WCED, its hon MEC, and the DA's National Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies, Solly Malatsi, who have shown a complete disregard for the people of this province and the institutions of Parliament; and commends the Chairperson of the National Assembly's Communications and Digital Technologies Portfolio Committee, Khusela Diko and her collective for the steadfast commitment to transparency and accountability on this matter, and for providing a shining example of leadership in the face of malfeasance. I thank you. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: How much did he say ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objections

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon Lithakong. [Interjections.]

Ms T LITHAKONG (EFF): *Nkosi*, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

†*Somlomo*. The EFF moves without notice:

For the House notes that next year on 31 May 2025, the 5-year term of the current Children's Commissioner will be coming to an end; further notes that whilst the current Commissioner did her best to run the office to the best of her abilities, her attempts were structurally constrained and restricted by the allocated budget to run the office. The office continues to grapple with meagre staff complement with only two permanent staff members and two contractors, whereas the plan was to have a total of 12 staff members. There is just no way that the office would have been run successfully with a meagre allocated annual base budget of R5-million and the office to hire 12 people and use the same money to implement the mandate in which that office was established for; concludes by stating that if the DA wants to take the people of the Western Cape seriously and wishes to continue with that office, then they must allocate a respectful budget in order for that office to run

efficiently. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker. *Somlomo*. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to that motion?

The PREMIER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be duly printed on the Order Paper. I now see the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

For the House to note that on Saturday, 16 November 2024, a fire broke out at Phumlani Village Informal Settlement in Pelican Park at around 4 PM, destroying 58 shacks and leaving 204 people homeless and stranded. I further note that prior to the blaze that engulfed their homes, residents previously lodged complaints with the City regarding the faulty electric transformer which kept releasing sparks; and conclude by stating that if the Province would be true to its efforts of the de-densification process of congested informal settlements in the Western Cape, then people's lives would not be facing such high risk, and they would certainly not be incurring such devastating losses. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections, agreed to. I see the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The ACDP moves without notice:

That the House notes the ever-increasing incidences of extortion and construction mafia activities within our communities. Notes with concern the article; *Extortion Nation Project* by Jonathan Ancer in *News24* that describes the activities of extortionists and the construction mafia. The article reveals that their activities are not limited to the province, but countrywide. The construction industry is hard-hit with wide ranging negative effects on multi-billion-rand construction projects. Notes that because of this, building costs are increasing and completion deadlines are not met. Notes that these criminal activities are spreading rapidly across the country. The article notes that extortion goes beyond the construction sector. Notes that small businesses are targeted and forced to pay ‘protection fees’, otherwise they will become victims of violence and have their property destroyed. Notes that people are held in a grip of fear preventing them from speaking out against extortion gangs. Owners of hair salons, taxi drivers, and landlords amongst others are all exposed to the extortionist demands for protection fees. Businesspeople in Khayelitsha, Gugulethu, Nyanga, Langa and

communities across the country are crippled by extortion fee demands. Some cannot afford to relocate and must endure the hardships brought about by paying protection fees. Notes that only a fraction of 6 000 cases reported over the last five years have led to convictions. Notes that criminologists warn of catastrophic consequences for our communities and our country if effective strategies are not developed to bring about the demise of extortion, countrywide. Notes that there is a call for all spheres of government to develop strategies that will effectively put an end to extortionists in our province and the country. I thank you. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see no objections, agreed to. Hon members, I will afford the hon Windvogel, hon Ngqentsu to follow through on the motions submitted in the name of the hon Lekker which we have received as the Table. I also wish to, at this stage, send my sincere condolences to the Lekker family on their bereavement and we wish them strength and all the peace during this time. Hon Ngqentsu.

Mr M B NGQENTSU (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and reminds all prepaid electricity meter customers that the deadline for re-coding their meters is fast approaching, with only a few days remaining until the critical Sunday deadline on 24 November 2024; further notes that failure to meet this deadline will result in meters becoming inactive, leaving consumers without electricity and forcing them to bear the high costs of meter replacement and installation; acknowledges that this is a hard deadline with no extensions, and those who miss it will face significant disruption and unnecessary expenses; and urges all Western Cape citizens to take immediate action and re-code their meters before the deadline to ensure continued access to electricity and avoid being left in the dark. I so move, including the hon Premier. ...[Laughter.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I see no objections, agreed to.

Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice as well as the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting, and all the hon members will be exited from the Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:17.