
TUESDAY, 26 MARCH 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 10:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

1. Debate on Vote 1 – Premier – Western Cape Appropriation Bill
[B 1 – 2019.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Deputy Speaker; honourable members.

The Department of the Premier's main budget for 2019/20 is R1,57 billion. Compared to the 2018/19 adjusted budget, the aggregate budget allocation represents a baseline increase of about 5%. However, the Department had to provide for an increase in conditions of service for 2019 and 2020 of 8,3% which means that the budget for goods and services remains under pressure.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is important for us to recall that the National Government went right outside the mandate and entirely exceeded the available envelope of the cost of employment to agree to an 8,3% increase which is making it all the more difficult to have the budget we require for actual service delivery and that is a massive failure of nerve and of backbone on behalf of the National Government.

Remaining budget risks that the Department would find difficult to absorb going forward, are the impact of higher inflation on the current and future Public Service wage agreements, as well as the impact of the Rand/Dollar exchange rate on licensing and capital expenditure in the Centre for e-Innovation.

Now Mr Deputy Speaker, we are caught in a double-bind here. On the one hand we are spending billions more than was budgeted for or available on salaries and on the other hand given the weakness of the Rand against international currencies, we have to take some of those precious resources to make up for the Rand's weakness in licensing costs and other things and all of this erodes the base budget for actual service delivery.

Honourable members, Government operates within the area of managing disparate data, many applications and business processes. To drive business performance, the Western Cape Government has already embarked on using Performance Measurement as a product of Monitoring and Evaluation; and Business Intelligence, through BizBrain, as a solution in delivering strategic data and information.

Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, one of the most important things that I have learnt in my period in Government is the importance of data, but not just general data, not just collecting all the information we can possibly have from our databases but purpose-driven data; data that is required to know whether we are on track to achieve our strategic plans and I think that in the last five years we have made important steps in that direction, to get strategic data linked to the purpose of informing us whether or not we are making progress to achieving the outcomes we want and we need to make progress across the board in that.

It is one thing to have huge amounts of big data. It is quite another to tailor the information you need to a purpose and an outcome and we have a lot of base-data. We need to apply it strategically to measure whether our strategies are succeeding. In line with the Global Data Agenda, the Western Cape Government is moving towards a data-driven organisation for better evidence and decision-making, and I must add here, linked to our Provincial Strategic Plan and Priorities, and for this reason Province-wide Data Governance is embarked upon as a transversal and strategic intervention to respond to the

high demand for coherence in the production and use of data and information to inform evidence-based decision-making and analysis, and I will be gone in just over a month and I am waiting for you to applaud, hon Opposition. [Laughter.] I gave you the specific break there to applaud. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Purposefully!

The PREMIER: Anyway, I will carry on. I will be gone in just a little over a month... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They will not miss you!

The PREMIER: And I certainly will not in any way try to influence the ongoing administration but if there is one bit of advice I would like to give, is for all Ministers in the future Cabinet to take data very seriously, strategically linked to their provincial strategic objectives and their transversal and departmental plans so they have good information they require as to whether they are making progress towards quantified goals. We have a lot of raw data. What we do not have is targeted data that can be used strategically for informed management decisions and we have seen that above all in this last week where we were trying to plan for the risk of a possible complete blackout.

The lack of data that we had in order to make strategic decisions was really shocking and that was not the lack of our data, because of course electricity

distribution, I mean electricity generation and transmission is a National Government competency.

Now essential to our Digital Government Strategy, the Province-wide Data Governance strategy includes the management of the availability, usability, integrity and security of data assets, and I am happy to report that funds have been allocated towards this priority over the 2019 MTEF period.

The Master Plan on Province-wide Data Governance was approved by Cabinet on 6 December 2017 so it is more than a year ago. The PWDG Programme is pursuing four ambitious missions. These are to:

- Produce reliable and accurate data and information across the Western Cape Government;
- To partner in data and information products and systems;
- To ensure accountably and transparency of data and information systems; and
- To keep stakeholders informed.

But there must be a fifth one and it needs to be the first one:

- To ensure that we identify what data is strategically needed in order to take the key management decisions we require to achieve our objectives.

That has to be number one in the Data Governance Strategy and even if that

strategy has to be amended, Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to recommend that it be amended because there is no use in having data for the sake of having data. What you need data for is to be able to pursue your objectives and understand whether or not you are on the right path and it is often not as easy as it sounds to get the right data, because working out what data will tell you whether or not you are on the right path is a very difficult thing. Often it is precisely that data that you do not have and that you still have to get so data governance is not a simple thing, it is highly complex and it needs to be led by people who are extremely strategic in their thinking and who understand the Provincial Strategic Goals, how they are transversal, what information is needed, how are we going to get it, how are we going to make sure it is good information, and how we are going to apply it in decision-making and in a sense that has to critically be the responsibility of all the Ministers in the new Cabinet. It has to be, because I cannot tell you how indispensable good data is to determining where you are going and whether you are getting there.

Alright, so I have just added another one and I am going to ask for that particular Data Governance Plan to be amended.

The next three years will see the implementation with defined PWDG delivery and results to be achieved. The scope of work relates to the identified high-level outputs which covers the following:

- Data quality management

- Master data management
- Logical data warehouse
- Data and information governance and;
- Data analytics capability

Now data analytics capability is really very important but it must start with a strategic political understanding of the data required to determine whether we are achieving our Provincial Strategic Goals.

The Western Cape's Broadband Strategy and Implementation Plan is aligned with South Africa Connect, which is South Africa's Broadband Strategy, which plans to improve broadband penetration across the country. It further acknowledges Government's role as anchor tenant, the need to aggregate demand and the need for open access.

It is anticipated that because of its foresight in this regard, the Western Cape Government will be in a position to achieve the targets as set out in South Africa Connect, even in our most rural areas. I had a report-back yesterday and I am delighted to get reports from some of our most rural schools who even only have a 10 megabyte connection that with good management and good off-net providers they are doing very well. Of course in others that is not the case and we are investigating each and every one to find out what the problems are but we are making very good progress and analysing where every single problem exists.

During the 2019 MTEF period this Department will continue its investment in phase two of the Provincial Broadband Programme by increasing the minimum network speeds to a 100 megabits per second, and where that has happened and we have already connected over 600 sites to a 100 megabits per second, it has transformed the usability and speed of the internet. There are over 500 schools that I understand have been connected to over a 100 megabits per second, and when I visit them and hear the difference in the experience between 10 megabits and 100 megabits, it is really chalk and cheese and when we get to the gigabyte connection which is phase 3, it will really make an extraordinary difference.

We will also intensify our efforts to derive consequent value from the broadband network by increasing the number of public WiFi hotspots to 1 600 and to continue effecting telephony savings by migrating more corporate sites to the Voice over Internet Platform.

The Centre for e-Innovation is providing enabling services to the DCAS, the Western Cape Education Department, DEDAT, DSD and DOCS to ensure that the key outcomes of the e-Learning, e-Skills and After-Schools Game Changers are met.

The implementation of the e-Learning Game Changer has resulted in a significant requirement for growth in the CE-I support environment and the demand in this area will continue to grow: 328 Schools, Mr Deputy Speaker, have had full LAN rollouts.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The PREMIER: 841 Schools have had SLIM labs rolled out. That is sometimes a challenge because they have been very used to connecting to their own servers and as we are moving to a cloud based solution people miss their own servers and are missing that availability of data, but we want to make it open access. That is why we are doing the cloud-link, but one massive problem has arisen, which I think I need to table in this House.

We are compelled to work through SETA. This is not an option. It is compulsory in terms of the law. In investigating very closely why we are having some problems in schools around accessing data and uploading and downloading data, we have established that SETAs link to the cloud, which is the link we have to work through is only one gigabyte for the whole province. Now that is big for one school. It is very, very small for the whole province and I am working hard with SETA to wake them up to the fact that they need to move to 10 Gigs immediately otherwise all the infrastructure that we put in is pretty much useless because it is assumed that it will be cloud-based, not individual server-based in each institution, and so the link to the cloud has to be quick and seamless and really solid and that is SETA's job. I have learnt that diagnosing where the problem is, is such a difficult thing in IT because there are so many links in the chain, and establishing that SETA was the core problem in that link has at least taken us to understanding where it is and how we resolve it. But that we must resolve and I am very glad that Mr Lance Williams, who used to head up our CE-I, is now there and is giving a

lot of assistance in this particular process.

The implementation of the e-Learning Game Changer has resulted in a significant requirement for growth in the CE-I support environment. I have already said that, and the demand in this area will continue to grow: 328 schools have had full LAN rollout; 841 schools have slim LABS rolled out and 1 242 schools are connected to broadband, which is a wonderful achievement.

Through the Digital Government Strategy the CE-I aims to coordinate and direct all provincial ICT initiatives towards optimising and transforming existing public services and to create new public services for citizens of the Western Cape through digital empowerment of residents and employees.

During the year ahead, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Department will be developing the Digital Transformation Plan, which will be the implementation plan for the Digital Government Strategy. This will be done through a series of workshops and consultations with other departments, citizens, academia, businesses as well as Local and National Government.

Cloud computing presents an opportunity for the Department to offer scalable and secure ICT services - that is if SETA will fix the link - that supports business requirements while optimising cost and efficiencies.

Cloud computing changes the traditional business and ICT model by enabling

organisations to consume resources such as platforms, applications and storage as a utility rather than having to build and maintain computing infrastructures in-house, but I have to stress again, this requires SETA to be ensuring that the link to the cloud is adequate to carry the traffic at the speed required.

The Western Cape Government is leveraging the high-speed broadband connectivity to migrate major workloads to the cloud and that will come to a grinding halt unless the connectivity is much higher than it currently is and gradually reducing our dependence on our on-premise infrastructure, but the great risk that I have found of doing this when it does not work is that people become desperate to reinstate the on-premise infrastructure such as servers. If our connectivity for example does not work in schools, because of whatever problems there are in the multiple players that have to be involved, including off-net service providers to achieve social objectives rather than technical objectives, you have a problem where people just say “forget about this, we are moving to our old service provider”, and they would prefer to pay a lot of money for a reliable service provider than take what we have paid a lot of money for and which is supposed to be a free service to the school. So these things we have to get right because we can say in theory, yes, we want cloud-based services that on-site infrastructure is not required, but then it has got to work, and SETA has to come to the party.

Another key priority focus, Mr Deputy Speaker, for the Department is maintaining and enhancing the suite of provincial transversal applications

which include, amongst other, BizBrain, BizProjects, Enterprise Content Management as well as the NPO system of the Department of Social Development. The main benefits derived from having core transversal systems are sharing of platforms, integration of data and seamless integration of solutions, but again unless all of those are linked to an objective that the Cabinet or Ministers or a transversal management team want to achieve all of those excellent platforms just sit there because you do not know how to apply them and use them in the daily work to which you are trying to devote your energies to achieving an outcome, and that link data has to have a purpose which starts with an outcome. What do you need to know; where do you get it; how do you use it; how do you make strategic management decisions from it. [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr D JOSEPH: They do not know what you are talking about. [Interjections.]

†INKULUMBUSO: Uthini? Andiva.

[The PREMIER: What are you saying? I can't hear you.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Inaudible.

†INKULUMBUSO: Hayi hayi abayazi yonke into.

[The PREMIER: No no they do not know anything.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Now look what you have done. You have woken them up.

†INKULUMBUSO: Kufuneka ufunde yonke into. Vuka maulele. Uthetha kakhulu mama.

[The PREMIER: Be alert and learn. You are talking too much lady.]

†Alright, the convergence of voice, data and video onto the network and the digitalisation of traditional non-ICT equipment, non-ICT solutions and other non-ICT periphery, is a key area of innovation as it is driving the expansion, enhancement and capacity of the network and ICT infrastructure and I must confess Mr Deputy Speaker, that I do not know what that sentence means but I will find out immediately afterwards.

This includes video conference solutions, boardroom media technologies, building security and surveillance solutions and equipment as well as building management facilities and equipment being connected over the Western Cape Government networks. Now I understand what it means. This is the “Internet of Things” manifesting internally and locally across the Western Cape Government. Yes, this is absolutely critical as Internet of Things that links everything together and enables us not only to ensure that our fridges at home can order milk from Pick n Pay when we are running low but that we can link key infrastructure to alert us to all kinds of issues in the ongoing management of all the resources that we have and the Internet of Things and artificial intelligence is literally mind-boggling when you see what it is capable of. We might be able to have MPs with artificial

intelligence to outpace what the human thing is able to do.

In recent years, the global cyber security environment has evolved significantly with a drastic increase in the volume and complexity of threat actors and attack methods used. The regulatory environment has also evolved to require more stringent compliance and data protection, e.g. the Protection of Personal Information Act, which has requirements across all the systems. In addition, the expansion of the Western Cape Government IT environment has also brought about greater complexity, risk and security requirements.

This includes the need to protect in excess of 24 500 workstations, over 350 key business applications and an extensive data environment over three networks consisting of over 2 000 sites. Sufficient funding has been allocated for this purpose. That is an enormous network.

Honourable members, the Department acknowledges that there is a need for a provincial public participation strategy which will create a platform for engagement for citizens to participate meaningfully in Government service delivery.

The whole-of-society approach is emerging as an alternative approach to service delivery within Government. It aims to encourage and put into practice a new way of working in partnership across all levels of Government, as well as with civil society, business, NGOs, and intermediary organisations.

The aim of this approach is to achieve the shared purpose of socio-economic development for the benefit of all South Africans. The approach focuses on shared purpose, the use of collated data to establish a common understanding of the problem, planned interventions and track impact and that is the strategic use of data.

It also uses a systems approach for interventions and successful community entry. The whole-of-society approach provides the impetus for community engagement. The approach seeks to engage communities in a spatial context and is important to move towards greater citizen centricity.

Now I get nervous about the spatial context because spatial context is good for some projects but not good for all projects and it is really important for us to understand that.

The Western Cape Government plans to explore innovative and sustainable models for frontline service delivery that can significantly improve the citizen experience when accessing Government information or services through every available service interface channel. The solution lies in developing citizen-centric models that are based on citizen-focused research, draw inspiration from the relative success with which both the private sector and other governments have addressed their challenges, as well as thinking out of the box to initiate novel approaches to solving local issues. But public participation, Mr Deputy Speaker, I need to say in parenthesis, is often a major challenge because people can choose what is not feasible so for

example when we were dealing with the District Six challenge, which we still are, and some very important court cases have been resolved in a positive direction to make the National Department move on this process, at last, when public participation happens one sees that people want a large plot with a single house on it.

Now in a context like the land in District Six, that is not appropriate. So the critical thing in public participation is to define the options realistically and sustainably to involve the public in debating the best outcome within the parameters that are feasible.

Through the Service Interface Strategy, the Western Cape Government aims to improve the citizen's satisfaction levels when engaging Government by listening and reacting to citizens' needs, addressing the service levels and quality of frontline service delivery facilities and services, increasing the information and service access channels and strengthening those programmes that aim to take services to the people. In order to address the challenges holistically the Service Interface Strategy will focus on four service delivery areas:

- Service experience research and monitoring and evaluation;
- Frontline service delivery improvement;
- Digital governance enhancement;
- Increased citizen access to services and information.

Hon members, we currently have 70 Cape Access Centres in our province and they are something that we can be greatly proud of. They mostly exist in small remote rural towns and are used very intensively by the local population. Cape Access is one of the key programmes for improving access to ICTs and increasing digital literacy within the rural areas of the Western Cape. At these centres, communities have free access to computers, printing and scanning facilities. By providing ICT training and access to e-mail facilities and internet, low-income communities have access to Government services and products and various online services.

They can also communicate more effectively with Government, have access to important information around new business opportunities and jobs, and can also transact online. More importantly, communities are able to connect to other communities within the province, around South Africa and around the world.

Cape Access contributes to empowering poorer communities to tackle the challenges of poverty. As such, the programme makes a significant contribution to the Provincial Spatial Development Framework and growth of potential towns. Due to severely constrained resources, the Department, in collaboration with the municipalities, will be rolling out five new Cape Access Centres during the 2019/20 financial year. I wish it could be three times that number.

Good governance is regarded as the cornerstone of a capable state that

creates opportunities for citizens to live lives that they value. Governance frameworks and maturity models were developed that provide departments with a basis to determine and improve corporate governance. Finding the right indicators to measure the right outcomes and impacts is complex - that is what I have been saying all along - in the governance space and hence the need to collaborate with other external institutions, such as the Human Sciences Research Council and Stats SA. Again though, the data has to have a purpose and be used to measure progress towards a defined objective.

This will move the measurement of governance beyond the current MPAT measurement tool which measures only compliance, and this has been a theme that I have had throughout the two terms that I have been in office.

Compliance measures whether you are sticking to every single rule meticulously and I can understand why that is necessary in such a corrupt country, but, in the new fourth industrial revolution with the Internet of Things and artificial intelligence the best governments in the world are going to be those that can innovate; that can do new things with new technologies such as the block chain and which can experiment and which can try new approaches and it is impossible to do that within our compliance environment. In fact if something has not been done before, if something does not have a regulation that exists to control it, we may not do it and I cannot tell you how much that hampers progress in government. If it were not for the extent of the corruption in South Africa we would be able to do a

whole range of innovative things that we are blocked from doing now and I would really like to urge our successors to look critically at how we speak to the Auditor-General to get a framework within which innovation is possible, obviously without corruption, and one of the best models worldwide is what is known as the “sandbox model”, where you say this looks like something we should experiment with. We will ring-fence it. It is almost like having a special economic zone. This area will be exempt from all these terrible rules so that we can pilot and test whether it can have an impact and there are so many spectacular new technologies that can transform the way we do things. I have recently been reading and looking at the block-chain - quite extraordinary what that can open up, but we cannot touch it because none of the rules or regulations or laws or compliance frameworks or directives have ever heard of block-chain before, and so instead of following on where everyone else is, we should be learning from countries how spectacularly successful, tiny countries as Malta is, now the world leader on blockchain applications in the public sector, because they got the regulation right and they got ahead of the game; and that is one of the things that I failed to achieve, Mr Deputy Speaker, in my term in office, but I am sure my successors will achieve that.

Alright, finding the right indicators - ja, okay, beyond compliance. That is what I was talking about.

A Western Cape Government Good Governance Index will be designed in 2019/20. Now please can that not just be more compliance; can we please

build in innovation obviously without corruption into it. This includes indicator selection, index development methodology, index range definitions and data sourcing.

In closing, I would very much like to thank the DG. You only have to listen to me speaking like this once in a while. The poor DG has to listen to this every single week and I greatly appreciate how he takes some of my crazy ideas and says: "That will land you in jail if you carry on that path", so he is probably the only reason that I am not in jail yet, and on the ideas that can be retrofitted into the compliance framework that that happens, and running up very close on - I get an essay on every single financial submission - is Mr Drikus Basson, who is he chief financial officer and who has kept us on the straight and narrow. Thank you very much.

Thank you very, very much to Mr Daylin Mitchell who is Chair of the Portfolio Committee, who calls me to account very regularly and to all the members of the Portfolio Committee, even the members of the honourable Opposition. When you are not trying to be...

An HON MEMBER: Clever!

The PREMIER: Well, let me just say thank you. Thank you very much.
[Laughter.] [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The hon member Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department of the Premier in the Western Cape functions in accordance with the following mission statement: to embed good governance and to enable integrated service delivery in the Western Cape through partnership, innovation and people excellence.

When looking at the budget allocation of this Department it is very clear that it has aligned itself very closely to this mission statement. We know that despite the budget cuts to the Western Cape as a result of continuous corruption and maladministration by the ANC at national level, our Government will continue to lead in governance, service delivery and economic growth in South Africa.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we are fortunate to live in a province where thanks to the leadership of the Premier over the last ten years, 82% of the provincial budget is spent on the poor. Over 80% of Western Cape schools have access to free internet. 91.5% of Western Cape residents live within 30 minutes of healthcare. R130 billion in new developments have been approved. R42 billion has been spent on infrastructure but most importantly, Mr Deputy Speaker, a R171 billion has been spent on education, skills and social opportunities for the youth of this province.

This is only possible when Government provides a solid base upon which a capable state can be built through innovation, inclusion and a commitment to rooting out corruption and spending taxpayer's money on the services that the

taxpayer expects. It is these simple commitments which have singled out the leadership of Premier Zille as one of the leading public servants of our time and I would like to sincerely thank her for her commitment to the Department of the Premier but more so to the citizens of the Western Cape.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I welcome the appropriation of just over R1,57 billion for the Department of the Premier's 2019/20 budget. Considering that this Government has received an 83% clean audit outcome, the highest in the country, I know that this money will be spent on the services needed by the people of this province and I know that the incoming Western Cape Premier, Mr Alan Winde, will continue on this trajectory laid out by Premier Zille.
[Applause.]

Although I welcome this, Mr Deputy Speaker, in light of the current weak economic and shrinking fiscal environment, the Department's manoeuvrability during this MTEF period will be constrained. However, the Department made a commitment that the impact of these limitations will be carefully monitored and managed by the Department.

In terms of Programme 4, the Centre for e-Innovation, I welcome the following earmarked allocations:

- R295 million allocated to the Broadband Project with an increase of R308 million in 2020/21, and a further R325 million in 2021/22;
- Just over R60 million for transversal ICT infrastructure needs: this is

particularly important to sustain the Province's ICT network moving forward as it forms the basis of much of the e-Innovation, which forms the basis of preparing the Western Cape for the Fourth and Fifth Industrial Revolutions in the coming years.

- R38 million to Broadband rollout of WiFi hotspots to municipalities.

Again this is crucial to get each and every resident of the Western Cape online in order to access a broader range of Government services and ensure sound and efficient service delivery to all four corners of this province. By looking at the budget allocation of this Department over the last five years and the prioritisation of the funds made available, it is clear that the political leadership in this province is aligned with not only the needs of the province but the needs of each and every citizen.

The budget of the Western Cape's Department of the Premier has been rightly focused on digitising infrastructure necessary for governance, fast-tracking the rollout of Government services and ensuring freedoms in a digital world.

Budgeting for free access to internet and ICT Services for all residents has always been at the forefront of this Department and rightly so, Mr Deputy Speaker, but access to free Broadband and internet access transcends mere good governance. The South African Human Rights Commission states that free internet access for all South Africans should be a human right.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Indeed the right to information, which can only be ensured through reliable and free internet access, is one of our constitutional rights. If we look at the National Government where digital migration has been delayed for many years and corruption at the Independent Communication Authority of South Africa is rife, this human right has been trampled upon by the National ANC.

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Hoor-hoor!

[Mr D JOSEPH: Hear-hear!]

Mr D G MITCHELL: I am happy to see that this budget not only prioritises services to the province's residents but it ensures that this DA-led Western Cape Government upholds the right to free access to information.

This is why, Mr Deputy Speaker, the R38 million to Broadband rollout of WiFi hotspots to municipalities in the 2019/20 budget is so important and I welcome this allocation.

In addition to this I also welcome an allocation of just over R60 million for province-wide data governance to further ensure access to e-Services and internet in order to deliver on the Department's promise of innovation and interconnectivity for the Western Cape.

The Standing Committee on the Premier has always made a robust

contribution to the Department, ensuring accountability and the best kind of governance that our residents deserve. I would like to take this opportunity to thank each and every member of the Standing Committee for their contribution over the past five years as we hold this Department to account and refine policy to best serve the people of this province. It has been my absolute pleasure working with each one of you.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as this is my final budget vote speech for the Fifth Parliament, I would like to express my deepest gratitude for having been allocated the position of Chairpersonship of this committee. [Interjection.]

Enforcing accountability to best serve the people of the Western Cape and South Africa at large. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: You are not going to be here!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must thank me. The DA is gone.

Mr D G MITCHELL: You are not going to be here.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] ...not for you only.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon member Dyantyi, you have made your mark, you have had made your entrance, now please, please refrain from doing it again. [Interjections.] Hon member

Mitchell, you may finish off, you may continue.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Okay, to express my deepest gratitude for having been allocated the Chairpersonship of this committee, enforcing accountability to best serve the people of the Western Cape and South Africa at large. I would like to thank the colleagues in the Department of the Premier, under the leadership of Advocate Gerber as well as Premier Zille, for providing the political leadership to this Department for the last decade.

A special word of thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker, to the very able committee coordinator, Ms Waseemah Kamish-Achmat, Ms Masintle Motsapi, the assistant coordinator, Ms Lizette Cloete and Mr Mario Sassman for their never-ending support during this term as well as the research office on the fifth floor.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is my pleasure to stand here today and support Vote 1, the Department of the Premier. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Totsiens, totsiens!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Goodbye, goodbye!]

Mr D G MITCHELL: I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Allow me to jump straight to Programme 5, without wasting time. The decrease from programme support should be rejected, while at the same time the 27% increase for subprogramme 5.2 should be welcomed. This is so because in the previous year it took the Hawks investigation to unearth the web of corruption in municipalities in this province. This was after a lengthy period of Provincial Government turning a blind eye on the challenge of corruption in municipalities. We also had the Paper Video scandal, which I believe would ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: What nonsense.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... not have happened if we had an effective Enterprise Risk Management Unit. What about the lavish birthday for MEC Madikizela, by service providers in his Department?

It would not have happened if the team was strengthened. This 27% increase is welcome... [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Bongi, next time you must invite them!

Mr K E MAGAXA: The increase in budget for legal services is really concerning. Firstly Annexure A on page 43 shows an over 181% increase in legal costs for the Department. This shows that the Premier is abusing the public purse for her personal things. For instance she praise colonialism on

Twitter. [Interjection.]

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: O jinne!

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Oh dear!]

Mr K E MAGAXA: She was taken to the Public Protector. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Cut-and-paste!

Mr K E MAGAXA: She was found guilty of contravening the Executive Ethics Code and she took the report on review using the public purse. This is abuse for taxpayer's money.

Secondly, she failed to establish an office for an Environmental Commissioner. She was taken to court to force her to appoint the Commission. Again she used public money to defend her wrong decisions.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC failed as well.

Mr K E MAGAXA: So it is clear that the increase for legal services will be used to clean up after hon Zille's mess even after she has left. Over 66% of this Department's budget is allocated to programme 4... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Just like Marius Fransman.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...where the province experienced a drop in the ICT Government Maturity Rating. The APP also identified a number of risks like increasing demand for IST Services in a resource-constrained environment. Despite all of this, the budget for subprogramme 4.2 and 4.3 had been reduced drastically.

The over 37% increase on subprogramme 4.4, “Connected Government and Infrastructure Services” will find the first step of the Premier’s promise to convert 1600 of the province’s broadband points into free WiFi sites where data will be sold to the public when the daily limit is up. For this year only 957 sites will be upgraded to Phase 2. According to the Premier’s 2014’s SOPA promises this should have happened in 2018 already. So it means she failed on her promises. Moving on to Programme 3... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Did you hear about SETA?

Mr K E MAGAXA: MEC Meyer bragged about a budget for youth referring among others to the Yebo Programme. It is really disappointing that he only budgeted just over R40 million over the 2019 MTEF for this year, this after he had thousands of applications rejected in the programme because of this small budget. This shows the DA does not take young people serious in this province.

In Programme 3, the departmental social contribution have been decreased as well as bursaries for employees. These kinds of decisions paint the picture of

a Premier that is anti-transformation and does not prioritise the wellbeing of employees. The budget cut for Compensation of Employees under the Programme 1 reveals the attitude of this Premier and her Government towards employees. The Premier must tell us how many employees she has fired to make up that 4.22% reduction in the compensation of employees' expenditure. This is a Department that boasts an 11.1% annual turnover rate. This is an indication of a toxic working environment in the Department.

We have to be worried about this trend. Solange Rosa once told us that she was forced to resign as a result of the Premier's regular bullying, abuse, threat and insult on a number of occasions as well as her lack of trust in her capacity and competency mainly because she was not a DA member.

The PREMIER: Oh rubbish!

Mr K E MAGAXA: To work comfortable in that Department, you have to be trusted by the Premier.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That your political allegiance is in the DA.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And your only leader under the sun is hon Helen Zille.

[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: She is a witness.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...and you do not trust black people also. [Interjections.]

When the ANC was in Government there were so many black people in senior management positions in all the departments. The obliteration of black senior managers in the Provincial Government is a cause of serious concern. The ANC has to resolve this immediately when we take over power. [Laughter.]

[Interjections.]

For instance out of 71 positions in the senior to top management in the Department of the Premier there are only seven Africans. The question is whether the Premier used the same bullying tactic she used on Solange to force out black senior managers in the Department.

Solange also mentioned that the Premier had no confidence in the capacity and competency of the staff in the policy unit. In this budget we witnessed the Premier's purge to the policy and strategy programme with over 9% decrease to its budget. The budget cuts for Programme 1 are setting up the next Premier for failure.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in her foreword in the APP the Premier stated that her term was a well-run race which created opportunities for the next term. The reality is that Premier's ten year reign was marked by widening inequality,

rising cost of living, racism, corruption and crime. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is her legacy. That is your legacy.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Gangsterism which resulted in the Western Cape being the murder capital and leading province in terms of women and children.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Children are dying [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let alone that they consistently work with gangsters in order to maintain power in the province. [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Your President met with gangsters in Genadendal.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let alone also the fact that she reversed the gains achieved by this province's citizens, especially the black majority, including undermining transformation in the Premier's Department, hence today this Department is among the worst departments in terms of poor reflection of the demographics of this province.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is your legacy.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact the Premier's Department went back [Inaudible]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The DA has failed the poor in the province. When DA speak of the whole society approach in actual fact it means the life of all white citizens because it does not believe that Africans including coloured majority exist in this province. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They only represent the [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Since this is a volkstaat where Africans are mere refugees from the Eastern Cape, the Western Cape under hon Premier Zille is more of a German colony.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: O ja. O ja.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh yes. Oh yes.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The Premier speaks of finalisation of the Children's Commission Bill. What she omits to mention is that it took her ten long years to finalise this process. The ANC and civil society had to work together to get her to start working on the Bill. In 2009 when she came into the office she promised to establish a Children's Commission as well as a Commission for the Environment. [Interjections.]

The reality is that she has now leaving office and none of these have been completed. She will be remembered as a stumbling block in the process of appointing the Children's Commission. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Skande!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Disgrace!]

The PREMIER: She tried to play a defensive role by claiming that the ANC did not do it either but she had forgotten also to remind herself that the ANC did not come out loud and make a wild commitment to appoint the commission and she did make the particular commitment. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No because they made a commitment to the [Inaudible.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Her term of office is over and where is the Children Commission? This is another example of how she failed the people of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is your Children's Commissioner now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me end... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue. Your time has not expired.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me end by appreciating working with her though. [Applause.] She is naturally a nice person. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: How I wish I was with her on the trip to Austria, rather than the Speaker. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Before I see the Premier, I just want to... [Interjections.] In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP I will see the Premier to respond.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC is wasting taxpayers' money.

The PREMIER: I was going to ask you, Mr Deputy Speaker, if it is parliamentary for me to cross the floor and give the hon member Magaxa a hug as a final gesture. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!]

Mr D JOSEPH: This is the first time that happens.

The PREMIER: Let me say... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are happy now because he says you are a nice person.

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Really!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order honourable.

The PREMIER: Do you see this; this is what is going on.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: You are spoiling the moment actually. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is what makes politics totally incomprehensible.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You were surprised, I can see that. You were surprised.

The PREMIER: I get many, many people asking me: "How can you ever speak to those people again?" And they are amazed [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Who are "those people"?

An HON MEMBER: Wait! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The general public, the general public. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi!

The PREMIER: The general public. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Who are “those people” you are talking about?

An HON MEMBER: There is a time to shut up and now is the time!

The PREMIER: And I say to them, you know, I even like those guys.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis hoe hulle praat - “those people”.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is how they speak - “those people”.]

The PREMIER: That is what politics is. You fight very hard in the public domain and you go and have a cup of tea or a beer or something afterwards. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not a beer, just the tea.

The PREMIER: And I had a fabulous lunch one day with the hon member Magaxa in Hermanus, I remember. We were sitting on the beachfront.

[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh my word!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Things are coming out now.
Let it!

The PREMIER: And we had a really good chat... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can stop blaming it on the Premier.

The PREMIER: And amazingly, we found each other on a lot of issues which
I will not go into now. [Interjections.]

Ja, well you know, the irony is, that I am definitely not a Marxist and I am
definitely not a socialist but in my instinct I am both of those, but I do not
try and tell other people what to do and I do not believe the State should
manipulate so I am a person who believes in liberal open societies and
freedom of choice and the choices I make are to live modestly.
[Interjections.]

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Nee man.

[Mr D G MITCHELL: No man.] †You are spoiling the day!

The PREMIER: Now as much as I like the hon member Magaxa I am going to

set him right on a few issues Mr Deputy Speaker. I am unbelievably proud of our Enterprise Risk Management Department in this Government. They investigate huge numbers of things and resolve a great many of them and must take credit for a lot of the accolades that we get around running clean government. If the very worst scandal that they can find about me is that a dedicated mathematics teacher working in Khayelitsha wanted to use Government's equipment to give free maths lessons to indigent pupils in the township during the holidays, if that is the worst scandal they could find about me, there clearly has not been corruption. [Interjection.]

Now you see the hon member Dugmore, the only way he can finger this is to perpetuate something that is totally false.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is not false.

The PREMIER: When he did that there was no company. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: I will show you the CIPRO form.

The PREMIER: I will show you the forms and whatever. There was no company in 2014. He was an ordinary teacher in an ordinary school and the bottom line, Mr Deputy Speaker, is this... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is this now?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is talking about her son now.

The PREMIER: ... in order to pretend - I am talking about the point that the hon member Magaxa made and will you please protect me, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will.

The PREMIER: So I can answer this crucial point. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: You raised it now. Mr Deputy Speaker...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] It is your son. That is it.

The PREMIER: The only way that the hon member Dugmore could try to create a scandal where there is none is by twisting and perverting and misquoting a statement from the website by inserting completely incorrectly a phrase that is not in the original to claim falsely that a company was started in 2014. That is fraud, Mr Deputy Speaker. That is fraud and I will take that matter further.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why are you waiting? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is the point that the hon member Dugmore has kept making and I would like to add another point.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The report was in the name of Paper Video...

The PREMIER: There were many, many, many other and it was not a company. It was an app, not a company. Mr Deputy Speaker, there were many, many other NGOs, companies, service providers that used the exact same equipment ten days later. There was no advantage, no conflicts of interest, not even a perception of conflict of interest. The only people that benefited... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But there was [Inaudible.] which is part of your legacy.

The PREMIER: No there was not any nepotism at all because I helped everybody else do that... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Of course the Public Protector does, but Tito Mboweni disagrees with the Public Protector. So does Pravin Gordhan. [Interjections.] So does Angie Motshekga. The problem is the Public Protector - not all of them.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this is a total manipulation of the facts to get at me and to make a completely dedicated, dedicated mathematics teacher lose heart...

[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Who is that, your son?

The PREMIER: ...and be offered options to go abroad, which I am desperately not wanting him to accept. [Interjection.] Mr Deputy Speaker, I can forgive the hon the Opposition many things, but what I cannot forgive them is when they attack my family to get at me.

Mr D JOSEPH: You must apologise. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And I must tell the honourable... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Even if this is your family.

The PREMIER: I must tell the hon member Dugmore one thing. He, who hid in my house when he was running away from the security police and saw my kid when my kid was this high.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thanks again. That is fine.

The PREMIER: I will never forgive him for that, and you know...
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So he must keep quiet [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: The karma in the universe will come back to him on this issue, believe me, because there was never any corruption, any maladministration [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: There is nepotism.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

The PREMIER: ...any nepotism, none. I assisted everybody who came to me and I can prove it with all the emails and everything there is.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No we do not take that aid away from you at all.

The PREMIER: And so the manipulation... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Guys!

An HON MEMBER: So why did you mix the two?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Even the officials in your Department disagrees with you, you know that.

The PREMIER: They absolutely did not. They absolutely did not. You show

me one thing where people disagreed with me.

An HON MEMBER: You know, they will go fetch them.

The PREMIER: Let me come to Ms Rosa that was also mentioned here. I was going to go through everybody sequentially. I will come to Ms Rosa. Ms Rosa worked in the policy unit.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And you found her there.

The PREMIER: I found her there.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it!

The PREMIER: I found her and many people who have been appointed in positions they should not have got. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Virginia Petersen.

The PREMIER: Now I would also like to say I found Virginia Petersen there. I found a whole lot of other deployees there. The amazing thing is that we did not have an Enterprise Risk Management Unit at that stage that could actually get to the core of all the corruption that happened there, but now we have got one.

Now Mr Deputy Speaker, in a policy unit in any government anywhere in the world the policy unit has to understand the mandate of the voters. In the Western Cape 59% of voters voted for the DA's policy mandate.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is what you are appealing [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: I made it clear to the members of the policy unit that if they were able and willing to research and implement the voters mandate according to DA policy competently and well, they were welcome to stay.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Just watch this space!

The PREMIER: If one thing above all else needs to be aligned to the government of the day, it is obviously a policy unit. Ms Rosa, and her name was raised here, so let me tell you quite frankly, thought I think that she was working at a university because she took a six months sabbatical to complete her PhD and still did not complete her PhD and she was [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay that is now getting personal. Now that is getting personal... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: It is not getting personal. It is explaining... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: It is explaining why I called people to account.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, that is personal.

The PREMIER: Because people cannot do what they like when they are supposed to be doing a job of work and I would have failed in my responsibility had I allowed a dereliction of duty such as had been happening in that policy unit, and then I wanted to see some of the policies that were being produced there and I could not believe my eyes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You just did not like them; that is all.

An HON MEMBER: That is the mindset... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Yes, of course I did not like them because they were not based on even the basic points of departure of the voters' mandate which is DA policy.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, nobody can think [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: We cannot produce ANC and EFF policy and even incoherent policy, an incoherent policy from a policy unit in this Government.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, Premier.

The PREMIER: I can show you some of the policy papers.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You differed on Paper Video and you differed about the politics. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Paper Video never came into the issue. It never once came into the issue, never once. What did come out, what did come out very clearly - Paper Video was not discussed. What did come out very clearly... [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, what did come out very clearly was that they were quite incapable of switching to a demand-driven approach. They were focused on a supply side approach driven by “Government knows what is best and we in the ANC understand what the people need.”

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that Rosa now?

The PREMIER: And if you cannot switch your mindset from that you do not belong in a policy unit of the DA Government. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Only DA people.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Only DA people [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I cannot just explain this, I do not ask anybody's political affiliation but if they work in a policy unit they have to understand the voters' policy mandate. They have to understand the voter's policy mandate. [Interjections.] And they work in the Premier's Department and I did not even know what policies they were working on. It was totally compliance-driven. So what happened was they had to on the APPs they had produce let us say five policy papers a year. Tick-tick-tick-tick-tick, all five policy papers are produced. I say: "Please may I read these policy papers."

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is still happening in all the departments.

The PREMIER: I looked at those policy papers and they were totally shocking! I did not understand why those policies had been commissioned, who commissioned them, what research they were based on, what the findings were. I have got to call somebody to account for that and believe me... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The consultants, that is why the DA...

The PREMIER: Believe me, I did it - I do not bully people. I do not bully people. What I do do, is call people to account.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: What are you doing now? You are a big bully.

The PREMIER: I am answering the points that would be made here without any basis. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: No Premier, she is not here to defend herself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: Well then you must not raise her here, because then I tell you the truth.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No-no-no!

The PREMIER: Then I will tell you the truth.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No! You are personal now.

The PREMIER: I gave her many, many chances.

Mr M G E WILEY: Coming from you?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, she is personal.

Mr M G E WILEY: Are you serious?

Ms S W DAVIDS: Oh, Bird Island, please, please Bird Island.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Davids, asseblief!

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, please!]

The PREMIER: Now you see now that is so outrageous, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, because you did the same!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: That is so outrageous.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms S W DAVIDS: You did the same thing now.

The PREMIER: It is exactly the same thing as attacking people's family members to get to them... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, I will give you back the same thing.

The PREMIER: ...with innuendo and distortions and misinformation...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: I will give you back the same thing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Davids, please quiet - hon member Davids, stop the dialogue now with the Premier.

The PREMIER: Disgraceful, Mr Deputy Speaker, disgraceful.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes, you are also a disgrace.

The PREMIER: So of course, all the hon member Magaxa can do is to quote another complete invention of his - no-one here has ever praised colonialism. No-one here has ever praised colonialism, least of all me. I probably spent far more time and effort in my life fighting the legacy of colonialism and apartheid than the hon member Magaxa ever did.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really!

An HON MEMBER: You also bring it back in reverse.

The PREMIER: What I did say was the legacy is not only negative.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh okay.

The PREMIER: Oliver Tambo said that. Nelson Mandela said that on numerous occasions. Mbeki says that and every single history book except Frantz Fanon says that and I will not ask any permission to differ from Frantz Fanon.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Repeat the insult of us, repeat it.

The PREMIER: His vision will lead us all to Venezuela which is exactly where the ANC would like to go.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can repeat it because that is your style.

The PREMIER: So do not - the only thing they can come to discredit me, Mr Deputy Speaker, is untruths in this House and distortions and fraud to insert things into quotations that do not exist.

Yes, there is increasing demand for ICT services and we cannot meet them because we had to pay 8.3% salary increases which were unbudgeted for and way outside the envelope.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You can blame the ANC there, I am sure.

The PREMIER: I will certainly blame the ANC because it is their fault.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Laughter.] I knew.

The PREMIER: Now Mr Deputy Speaker, we all know that the size of the State has to shrink. Let me use one example. Eskom according to the World Bank has 66% more employees than they should. If you compare the rate of energy generation per employee in Eskom and any other utility that generates electricity anywhere in the world, you will see that we are massively, massively behind the productivity curve and that is partly why Eskom is in what I call the “utility death spiral”. And when I spent such a long time talking about data, that is the kind of data you need. 66% over-employed in a utility death spiral that cannot be reserved under those circumstances and will lead to the complete permanent collapse of the generation utility despite the fact that the Western Cape has a plan and a programme that we have presented to national to prevent that from happening and electricity is not even our mandate... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Exactly! I was going to go there, why do you? You should talk about provincial issues. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: You take it personally.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ah please man!

Mr D G MITCHELL: Of course!

The PREMIER: ...but because we see it is so critical we develop a plan to save South Africa and it is there and we can do it. I am quite happy to say, and I am quite proud of saying Mr Deputy Speaker, that in my office and Department to talk about a toxic working environment is about the furthest possible thing from the truth and I would like you to do an anonymous survey between all my colleagues and find out. Everybody who works with me knows they may differ from me, knows they may challenge me, knows they may have an entire different approach from me and they will never be bullied and they will never be undermined because I welcome thinking, committed people... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Others know that you stabbed them in the back. We know that about you.

The PREMIER: ...who are totally focused on the cause and will challenge me if they believe I am wrong.

An HON MEMBER: But you do not qualify.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the truth, Madam Premier, you stabbed them.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We know that too.

Ms S W DAVIDS: We know that. [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Now what this Government, more than any others, believes in transformation, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are absolutely committed to transformation and we understand transformation as being to improve the opportunity and life circumstances of all people but particularly the poor to live a better life and to live lives they value and when that happens we will have achieved transformation in South Africa... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Koebaai! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Goodbye! [Interjections.]]

The PREMIER: ...to ensure that we get people in Government that can achieve that objective is our common purpose. We have tried to build a capable state operating under the rule of law with a culture of accountability and that is the legacy that this Government leaves for South Africa and if South Africa builds that everywhere this country will be a great democracy that will achieve real transformation... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please!

The PREMIER: ...in which life gets better for everybody. Thank you.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Not all of them are standing for you.

The PREMIER: That is fine.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is a faction that is not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, I cannot... [Interjections.]
Order! I cannot compete with you now please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: A faction, ja.

Mr D G MITCHELL: You do not have a faction.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh-oh!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on this Vote. We will suspend business for five minutes to allow for the officials to take up their seats and also preparations to allow for the live streaming of our facilities. Each vote is streamed separately so we need about five minutes break after each vote. The House is suspended for five minutes.

[Business of the House was suspended at 11:13 and resumed at 11:17]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements – Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 - 2019].

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Madam Premier in absentia, the Leader of the Official Opposition, Cabinet colleagues, hon members of the House and to all the Mayors, Deputy Mayors, Human Settlements Executive Councillors who are here, the Chairpersons and CEOs of our Human Settlements entities, the service providers, the NGOs and all the stakeholders in Human Settlements, ladies and gentlemen.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it has been a privilege to serve you and to serve with you since the Premier appointed me as the Provincial Minister of Human Settlements almost ten years ago. It has been a very challenging but yet fulfilling journey with many lessons learnt.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the mandate of this Department is derived from Chapter 2 of our Constitution, the Bill of Rights.

Section 26, subsection 1 and 2 of the Constitution states, “Everyone has the

right to have access to adequate housing” and “the State must take reasonable legislative and other measures, within its available resources, to achieve the progressive realisation of this right”.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in *Government of the Republic of South Africa v Grootboom* the Constitutional Court interpreted the right to have access to adequate housing as follows:

“...housing entails more than just bricks and mortar. It requires available land, appropriate services such as the provision of water and the removal of sewage and financing of all these” – [Interjection.] – “including the building of the house itself. For a person to have access to adequate housing all of these conditions need to be met: there must be land, there must be services, and there must be a dwelling. The right of access to adequate housing also suggests that it is not only the State that is responsible for the provision of houses...”

I think it is a very, very important part of this.

“...but that other agents within society, including individuals themselves, must be enabled by legislative and other measures to provide housing.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, in 1994 the housing backlog in South Africa stood at an estimated 1.5 million households. Since then, almost 5 million houses have

been built, but the current backlog is estimated at 2.2 million households. This is a clear indication, hon Deputy Speaker, that our approach in housing provision needs to change, starting with the criteria that we are using, because to just say that if you are 18 and you have a baby you must get a free house, I do not think that is helping.

That is why, hon Deputy Speaker, a paradigm shift is needed in South Africa.

Now, if you look at the lessons that we have learned as a sector in South Africa, not only in the Western Cape, as part of our discussion nationally, we need to go back to basics, by making sure that we provide land, by making sure that we invest in bulk infrastructure and service that land by making sure that we subdivide that land and provide sites to people so that ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] You sold them out, why?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: so that people can start to build their own homes. And in fact, in South Africa we know that there is a very strong saving culture and people have proven previously that if they are given land, they can be able to save towards servicing, building their own houses. [Interjections.]

Secondly, we need to make sure that as Government we focus on the most vulnerable groups of our society. These are your elderly people and these are

your disabled people. And we must conclude our partnership with the Department of Social Development and Department of Health so that we can build institutions so that these elderly people can be taken care of. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: No such luck, no such luck.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We also need to make sure in order to ensure that many people who live in informal settlements are provided with the necessary services because we do know that the rate in migration in South Africa, particularly in two provinces, which is Gauteng and Western Cape, is a big challenge. So instead of just focusing on building houses we must make sure that we upgrade the informal settlements, make sure that there are access roads, provide water, provide sanitation, so that those people can maintain dignity. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We still have [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We also need to unlock the housing economy in South Africa. [Interjection.] I think since 1994, Mr Deputy Speaker, we have always looked at housing provision by Government as some kind of social intervention. [Interjection.] Now that needs to change.

We must also look at housing as an economic lever that contributes massively

to the property market in South Africa which is currently worth R6 trillion. Instead of discouraging people from selling or letting their houses, we need to educate them how to do it properly.

It is very clear that the pre-emptive right clause that exists in our policies that prohibits people from selling their houses before eight years is not working and, quite frankly, I do not agree with this clause because it locks poor people into perpetual poverty ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... instead of allowing people to become players in the property market. What we need to do is to educate people on how to do that properly.

We also need to accelerate the use of alternative technologies, hon Deputy Speaker. Climate change is a reality and, as Government, we need to do things differently. In fact, I think the recent drought was a huge wake-up call and it is a clear indication that the weather pattern is changing. So we need to build resilient houses that respond to the climate change in South Africa and that is why it is so important to make sure that we build homes that are warm in winter, that are cooler in summer, because clearly we cannot rely on the provision of power, given the state that Eskom is in, in South Africa.

We also need to make sure that we densify, hon Deputy Speaker. The

Western Cape, as I said, with a province like Gauteng, is experiencing a massive population growth. According to a Community Survey conducted by Statistics South Africa (Stats SA), our population grew by almost 2 million people in just 15 years, that is between 2002 and 2017.

We therefore need to use well-located land wisely and optimally. There are people who still believe that they have a choice between a free-standing house with a big plot and a unit in a five-story building. We actually do not have the luxury to have this choice anymore. People can only exercise that choice if they decide to buy their own homes but with limited resources like land, we have no choice but to densify.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these are some of the bold steps that we need to take to change the way we do things in housing if we are to succeed.

Let me now turn to our track record and successes ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me now turn to our successes in the last 10 years and also report on the current and future projects.

Between 2014 and 2019 we focused on three strategic goals as the Department of Human Settlements in the Western Cape.

We said we need to prioritise the most deserving people in South Africa and in this province so that we can deal with an anomaly in many areas where younger people are getting houses before their grandmothers and grandfathers.

The second thing that we embarked on is the upgrading of informal settlements. I have already explained how we are doing that and we must also accelerate the provision of housing in the GAP market.

Hon Deputy Speaker, since 2009 almost 213,000 housing opportunities were created in this province. This is a massive achievement. While we are faced with many challenges, I do not think this achievement can be taken lightly and it contributed to the lives of 850 000 people in the Western Cape.

And since 1994 we have been dotting the landscape, building a string of houses without emphasis on property ownership. I think that is one of the things that we are now changing, particularly in the Western Cape. Since 2009 we have issued 103,000 title deeds, which guarantee ownership for people who are now home-owners – and I think the backlog is largely due to the fact that a number of other processes that were not followed are preventing us from doing this for a number of other people, but we are putting measures in place to make sure that property ownership is something that is ensured for our people. [Interjection.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, my Department has, since 2009 ... [Interjection.] made

an investment of just over R19.3 billion into the construction and real estate sector. This investment has gone a long way in achieving our three main goals. Our responsibility as this Department is to make sure that we house people, we empower especially those who were previously disadvantaged individuals as emerging contractors, but also to make sure that we create jobs and that is why the Province of the Western Cape is the leading province when it comes to job creation. We have created thousands of jobs in this sector.

If you look at our programme in terms of upgrading of informal settlements, as I explained before, the rate of informal settlements in the Western Cape has been increasing. We are now sitting at just over 503 informal settlements in the province. And I think, hon Deputy Speaker, we need to deal with this misperception about informal settlements in South Africa and why they exist.

In some cases, mushrooming of informal settlements is not an indication of poverty or a housing need.

There are three main drivers of informal settlements in South Africa.

The first one is that many young people who now want to be independent, who want to leave their homes because they have been living with their parents, they are now turning 18, they become adults. They live in backyards and they choose to leave their homes and build their own shacks because they want their independence.

The second reason is that there are many people who are employed in informal settlements but the biggest challenge is that they are within this gap that we have been talking about. They are earning too much to qualify for a free house but they are earning too little to get a bond from the bank.

Of course, we also have to make sure that people who are living in these areas then are provided, as I said, with the necessary basic services so that we can improve their living conditions.

That is why, hon Deputy Speaker, that for any government to ever think that on its own it will ever eradicate informal settlements, is a pipe dream. We need to partner with the people themselves, as I said before, to partner with the private sector and as Government so that we can be able to create an environment that is conducive for us to be able to change the lives of those people.

Our job is that people have the necessary and required services, as I said, such as water, sanitation, electricity and refuse removal. Guided by the Informal Settlement Support Plan ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...that we approved as a department, while taking into consideration the dynamics and the distinctiveness of individual informal settlements, pro-active measures have

been embarked upon to ensure that challenges encountered are fully mitigated. Amongst such measures is the assignment and appointment of NGOs and professional service providers to each identified informal settlement that we have identified.

These NGOs are to serve as the intermediaries in the communities and support the Department to plan and execute the upgrading of the informal settlement. These NGOs are also providing assistance to the informal settlement dwellers with regard to participatory planning, social facilitation and mobilisation.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I spoke about a gap that exists in our policy. Many hard working South Africans who are contributing to the fiscus in order for us to be able to provide free services like houses to those who qualify, are getting a raw deal from the Government. Under our Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme, or FLISP, people are struggling to qualify because of a prerequisite to get approval from the bank. We must change that. In fact, we have started already nationally as the Department of Human Settlements, to make sure that people are able to qualify for FLISP first before they go to the bank because the reality is that if you say to people they must first go to the bank, they are rejected and then it means they will not be given this subsidy that we believe will go a long way in assisting them.

Furthermore, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department introduced a Housing Consumer Credit Readiness Initiative. Now, the intention of this initiative is

to effectively rehabilitate those who are unable to access bank finance due to impaired credit records, because we do know that some of these people do not qualify to get a bond because they owe shops like Truworths, Markhams – you owe these shops R1,500 and you are in the red and you are unable to get a bond. Now this programme is so that we can rehabilitate them from the start of the project so that by the time the project is finished they are rehabilitated and they are able to access this financial assistance.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Why are you taking so long?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the audit outcome is an indication of how well we are spending taxpayers' money. [Interjection.] And it is very important that we attract investors and create jobs.

Since 2009, my Department received five unqualified audits and four clean audits - which means we can account for every cent spent in the last ten years. Now in the case of the Western Cape Housing Development Fund, we received two clean audits in two consecutive years, and we are now busy de-establishing the fund because part of the problem with the fund before was that you had properties that you did not know who owned them. So I am very happy that from now, going forward, we will no longer have the fund.

Hon Deputy Speaker , we are on track to achieve the targets we set for ourselves for this financial year. We committed to deliver 18 180 housing

opportunities.

An HON MEMBER: Those targets, you do not worry.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, current and future projects. Hon Deputy Speaker, in my previous budget speech I indicated that our delivery approach now includes mega projects catering for different incomes and needs. Through these initiatives, your Catalytic Projects and Provincial Priority Projects, we will be, you know, building 144 798 housing opportunities. We are contributing to urban regeneration and even developing new towns. These mixed development projects include houses for the indigent, gap housing, rental units, social housing and serviced sites. This would ensure integration of different income groups.

I am pleased to report that these projects are at different stages of construction and planning.

To date, the Southern Corridor Integrated Human Settlement Programme, a joint initiative with the City of Cape Town – and I am glad that the MMC for the City of Cape Town is also here – which includes Barcelona, Gxa Gxa, Vukuzenzela, Kanana, Kosovo, Thabo Mbeki, Tsunami, Lusaka, and Europe, all of which are in the Gugulethu, Nyanga and Philippi areas, in these areas we will be providing 51 540 housing opportunities, with priority backyarders

in these areas also benefitting. Now this project is making very good progress and we are already in the planning stages of it and construction will be commencing soon and tenders have been awarded.

Belhar CBD: an initiative in the City of Cape Town to provide mixed use high density and different income level residences, will yield 4 188 housing opportunities and is currently at different stages of construction. This project has 1 000 opportunities for the income group that I spoke about that belongs to FLISP and also, as I said, with 755 units 60% complete and the remainder of 245 will be constructed very soon.

Greater Retreat: a project aimed at catering for the residents in the areas of Plumstead, Ottery and Ferness Estate, Lotus River, Parkwood, Ottery East, Seawinds, Vrygrond, Lavender Hill, Steenberg, Retreat, Grassy Park and Cafda. To this effect, pockets of land of approximately 279 hectares have been identified for the purposes of development and implementation of this project. The Department has commenced with planning and design for these projects and again we will be building 7 500 housing opportunities here.

In Dunoon: Killarney Gardens – again, this project is to cater for residents in the area of Dunoon and adjacent areas. Land of approximately 17 hectares has been identified and purchased in Killarney Gardens for this development and implementation and again we will be building mixed income housing there. Planning and designs are currently in progress and, when completed, this project will yield approximately 11 000 housing

opportunities.

In Hout Bay, again this project is to cater for residents in the Hout Bay area of Imizamayethu. Land of approximately 7.9 hectares has been identified and secured in this regard and, when completed, the project will yield 1 400 opportunities and will be mixed income, mixed use and different tenure. And again, planning and designs are currently underway.

In Bokaap, Oranjezicht and Inner City infills: this project is to cater for residents in the areas of Bo-Kaap area, Oranjezicht, Tamboerskloof and Central Business. Various pockets of land of approximately 8.4 hectares have been identified and secured in this regard. When completed, the project will yield 10 000 housing opportunities, which will again be for mixed income, mixed use and different tenure for high density.

In Leonsdale, a project aimed at catering for residents in Leonsdale/Goodwood area. Land of approximately 10.8 hectares has been identified, hon Deputy Speaker, and secured in this regard. A professional team has already been appointed and planning and designs are currently underway and when this project is completed it will yield 2 000 housing opportunities.

Scottsdene, of which 336 will be FLISP, are 80% complete and will yield 668 opportunities when completed.

The Conradie Better Living Model, I think we all know that we turned a sod in January this year. This project will yield over 3 000 housing opportunities. We spoke a number of times about this project in the House and again the contractor has been appointed and will be commencing there soon.

In areas of Taiwan and YB Section: a full professional team has been appointed and has commenced with the planning and design phase. The first major deliverable is the conceptual development framework which will be presented to the Department in April 2019, which is next month. This project will yield approximately 5 000 housing opportunities and will also cater for a range of beneficiaries in line with different housing programmes. Social Development Facilitators have been appointed as part of the Project Steering Committee (PSC) and will complete the enumeration study very soon.

In Vlakkeland, an initiative in the Drakenstein Municipality will yield 2 653 housing opportunities, hon member Sharon Davids, and in that particular area construction is now in full swing and is about to be completed.

Dal Josafat in Paarl also will yield 2 078 opportunities when completed. And in Ceres, Vredebest and Bella Vista project will yield 3 417 opportunities when completed.

Madam Speaker, we are also on course as we are in the planning phase with

regard to De Novo which will yield 300 opportunities.

Equally, in Grabouw the construction is underway there and once that project is completed it will yield 8 000 housing opportunities.

In Transhex, again this is an initiative in the Breede Valley Municipality; this project will yield 8 873 housing opportunities. That project is currently underway in bulk and internal services, with construction of top structures to commence soon as the tender has been awarded to a service provider, which will happen very soon.

In Thembaletu, Syferfontein and Wilderness Heights, again initiatives in George in the Garden Route region, these projects will yield 10 281 housing opportunities and are currently at different stages of planning and construction.

In Louis Fourie, again 4 000 opportunities will be realised and tenders have been awarded and construction is about to commence very soon.

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I just reported now.
[Interjections.]

Now with regard to Vredenburg Urban Regeneration, that is in Saldanha

Municipality, we have concluded the process of securing the land and the Municipality has been provided with the necessary finances to commence with the design and when this project is completed it will yield 1 400 housing opportunities.

In Greater Hermanus, this project, as we are aware of the situation there, is aimed at catering for residents in the Overstrand Municipality, which will include the areas of the Greater Hermanus, Mount Pleasant, Thembelihle, Zwelihle, Hawston, Sea Farms, Paradise Park, Sandbaai Commonage, Westcliff, Fernkloof and Schulphoek, to name some of the areas that will be benefiting and, to this effect, land of approximately 40 hectares has been identified and we are in the process of securing it, and when this project is completed it will yield 7 500 opportunities.

Now, all these programmes and projects, Madam Speaker, are a clear commitment of our Government to restore the dignity of our people by providing shelter, creating jobs and also contributing to land reform in South Africa because, as I said, we are catering for different types of people. So this is a very clear indication that this Department and this Government is on track to change the lives of our people in this province.

And I do want to take this opportunity, Madam Speaker, to thank the team that has made it possible for this Department to reach the achievements that we have over the last 10 years. I will start by thanking the team in my Ministry, since this is my last budget vote in this term of government. Let

me start by thanking Elizabeth Cloete who is the Head of Ministry. Thank you very much, Elizabeth, for ... [Applause.] To thank Zimkhitha Ngoma, my PA; Ntomboxolo Makoba-Somdaka, my spokesperson; to thank Wiseman Masindwa who deals with stakeholders in my office; Vuyokazi Ludidi who is welcoming people to my office as receptionist; Olga van Zyl who deals with all the correspondence as a registry clerk in my office ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: The only Bantu Department ...[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Keith Dennis, who has been very instrumental in assisting; Maurizia Louw, my office personal assistant and Nam Daki, who has been helping me as my parliamentary officer in my role as the leader of Government Business.

And to the Department ... [Interjection.] to my Department team, I want to thank the leadership of our HOD Thando Mguli ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: ... Matanzima at this [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... assisted, of course, by capable Chief Directors; Phila Mayisela, Jackie Samson and Francois de Wet

and all our directors and senior staff members in my Department, and most of them are here. I do want to thank you very much for all the work that you are doing. I know that working for this Department is a thankless job, given the challenges and pressures of this Department and I think your contribution and the successes that we have made speaks for itself and you must continue to do the work that you have been doing.

Madam Speaker, it has been a roller-coaster ride ... [Interjection.] It has been a roller-coaster ride but a ride that, looking back, it was all worth it. I am grateful for all the passion and dedication. Let us continue now, to this team, let us continue to fly the flag of this Department and the flag of this Government. [Interjection.]

And last but not least, I want to thank ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Magaxa, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I want to thank ... [Interjection.] I want to thank my family, represented here by my son Sihle, who is here to listen to my budget speech today and with his friend Phumzamo Zikalala.

To Premier Zille and my party, the Democratic Alliance, I am really grateful for the opportunity that I was given to serve the people of this province and to all my colleagues, thank you very much for the collegiality, not only this

side but also to the hon members of the Opposition for always keeping us on our toes. And I think, as the hon Premier earlier said, with the Leader of the Opposition, that we are political opponents but first and foremost we are citizens of South Africa and we are citizens of the Province of the Western Cape. Everything that we do, we do because we love our country and we love our province and let us continue to do that in the Sixth Parliament to make sure that we put this province on the map.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.] Hon Dyantyi ... order, please members. If I may, I would like to remind the guests in the gallery, you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings. That includes clapping, interjections and anything connected in that manner. Unfortunately I have to appeal to you, it is one of the rules of the House.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Not today ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Tyatyam, are you giving me permission to allow the guests to clap today?

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Oh, so you decide the rules? Okay. [Interjections.] All

right, I now see the hon member Maseko. [Applause.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Sharon, luister nou baie mooi. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr D G MITCHELL: Sharon, listen very carefully now. [Interjections.]]

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Speaker, with a shrinking budget and an increase in demand, our communities will always be disgruntled with regards to housing. Thus, allocations made to this Department will never be enough.

The Democratic Alliance in this province has made significant strides through this Department, evident in its outstanding record of delivering housing opportunities.

We welcome the total budget for this Department for this financial year, valued at R2.4 billion, that will create over 105 000 housing opportunities by 2020. This is what value citizens get for their money.

Let us see what value you get from the ANC.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Do not go there, please.

Ms L M MASEKO: The National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform for District Six requested an additional 2.4 billion to correct the

medical schemes they created ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Shame ... [Inaudible.]

Ms L M MASEKO: ... with the first three projects of District Six Restitution Programme and that will only avail 108 units. It does not take a rocket scientist to see that this is looting. [Interjections.]

Let me reiterate what the DA's budget represents. It is a budget for jobs, opportunities, good governance, safety and security and accelerated service delivery. [Interjection.] This budget prioritises the vulnerable within limited resources.

Now, our President Cyril Ramaphosa and, of course, Mr "Brown Envelope" Rasool, in their stuporous moments to win over this province, tried to deny the progress that the DA has made in the province ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... unfounded allegations that this Department under-spent its budget.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please man ... [Inaudible.]

Ms L M MASEKO: The fact is ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Maseko, kindly take your seat, please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi ... [Interjections.] No, no, no, that is rude and disrespectful. I am cautioning you in that you cannot engage the member on the floor directly. Should you wish to ask her a question, you pose it through the Chair and I will then ask the member but to do constant interjection that drowns out the speaker is not allowed. Thank you, hon Dyantyi. You may proceed, hon Maseko.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And behave yourself.

The SPEAKER: Excuse me. Hon Maseko, take your seat, please. Hon Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I would like to ask the member a question.

The SPEAKER: If you can take your seat I will check with the member. Hon Maseko, are you willing to take a question?

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Speaker ... [Interjections.] I only respond to the leaders for that party. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The member is not prepared to take a question. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Speaker, let me repeat again, President Cyril Ramaphosa and Mr “Brown Envelope” Rasool, in their stuporous moments to win over this province, tried to deny the progress the DA has made in this province by unfounded allegations ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: ... that this Department under-spent its budget. [Interjections.] The fact is, since 2011 we have spent 100% of our Human Settlements Development Grant. I am going to help and give them factual information with the hope that my colleagues will transfer the message to the President, of course. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is too much noise on the floor, please. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: The Human Settlements Department in the Western Cape,

with the limited funds at its disposal, remains committed to accelerating housing opportunities in a way that is sustainable, qualitative and promotes social ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Maseko, kindly take your seat, please. Hon Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can I ask ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat, please. Hon Maseko, will you take a question? [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Speaker, I am only going to take a question from the leader of the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Sorry, hon Magaxa, the member will not take a question, hon ... [Interjections.] Hon Magaxa, you must take your seat. The member is not taking a question. [Interjections.] She is not prepared to take a question. Thank you. Kindly take your seat, please. No, hon Magaxa, take your seat.

Ms L M MASEKO: You are a leader by default; I am not going to take your question.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Kindly calm down, everybody.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Speaker, the Human Settlements Department in the Western Cape, with the limited funds at its disposal, remains committed to accelerating housing opportunities in a way that it is sustainable, qualitative and promotes social inclusion because the DA in this province understands that having a place of safety and being a homeowner is key to economic prosperity. But, more importantly, this is evident in our track record over the last 10 years.

As the hon Premier stated during SOPA, and since the ANC was not here I will have to say it again, over 200 000 housing opportunities were completed since 2009. The DA-led Government spent R500 million in supporting 357 land reform projects since 2014 alone. We have exceeded our combined targets for housing and service sites in every financial year since 2014.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

Ms L M MASEKO: And by the end of this term we will once again meet 100% of our target. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, the enabling environment of service sites that the DA created in this province, as showcased by a group of women from Philippi, Crossroads,

Khayelitsha and Strand, who now have the opportunity to build houses on their own. Their project started off as a food stokvel, but now each of the 12 members contributes 2 450 on a rotational basis to buy building materials for a roof over their heads. I applaud this group of women for taking the initiative in helping Government. They are taking ownership by being innovative and soon they will be living in their own houses. [Interjection.]

Now again, hon Speaker, since 2009, 103 000 people ... [Interjection.] can call themselves proud homeowners via the DA-led Government. That is when we give a title deed, hon member, just for your info. [Interjection.]

During this term we have exceeded target by at least 2 000 transferred title deeds. That is from our target, an extra 2 000. [Interjection.] This shows excellent planning by the Provincial Department and the best part is that these opportunities are aimed at our poorest residents.

Our Game Changer, Breaking New Ground, which focuses on spatial integration, have reached execution stage and will avail 3 600 units in Pinelands ... [Interjection.], 4 188 units in Belhar and 300 units near the Waterfront.

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.]

Ms L M MASEKO: I am [Inaudible.] former President Zuma, do not worry.

Furthermore, 11 towns gained approval status which will enable grant funding for more affordable units. [Interjections.] I am telling you. [Laughter.]

We have delivered 23 000 social rental housing units and 19 000 affordable units for ownership purposes. That is the Department of Human Settlements under the DA-led Government in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, over the 2019 MTEF, R7.4 billion will be appropriated to the Department to continue with its ground-breaking performance. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi, hon Dyantyi.

Ms L M MASEKO: We ensure quality delivery ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Maseko, kindly take your seat please. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Hon Speaker, before you came in the House, ever since the hon member sidled into this House he has been a disruptive influence for the House ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: ... making inane, facetious, snide remarks, no bearing on

the debate.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] I have cautioned the member. Hon Dyantyi ... [Interjection.] No, hon Dyantyi. No, hon Dyantyi, your behaviour leaves a lot ... [Interjection.] No, hon Dyantyi, your interjections, your ongoing howling, I have cautioned ... [Interjection.] I am speaking. Take your seat, hon Dyantyi. [Interjections.] Take your seat. And it has been ongoing to the point that it has become disruptive and drowns out the speaker. So for you to question the member and say: is that your speech? Not once or twice but three times ... [Interjection.] But it is an opinion, hon Magaxa, but your opinion is becoming overbearing to the point that it is now constituting a running commentary and I need to caution you. So kindly manage yourself in order for us to proceed. You may proceed, hon Maseko.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is an interjection.

The SPEAKER: You are allowed to interject, but the minute it constitutes a running commentary in terms of Rule 41, I have to caution you and should you persist, we will continue to Rule 44. Thank you. You may proceed, hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjection.] Hon Speaker, over the 20 ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Maseko, the hon Magaxa is on his feet.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: As you referred to hon Dyantyi, which is acceptable in this House, is it parliamentary for hon Bonginkosi Madikizela to refer to hon Dyantyi as Richard? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Oh, sorry. It certainly is not. I did not hear it but ... [Interjections.] hon Minister Madikizela, will you please refer to the hon Dyantyi and not Richard? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The hon Dyantyi, but can he please act honourably?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. [Applause.] [Interjections.] It is honourable. Thank you. Now may we proceed and get on with the business of the day? Hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, over the 2019 MTEF, R7.4 billion will be appropriated to the Department to continue with its ground-breaking performance. We ensure quality delivery and sustainability by thorough execution of the upgrading of the informal

settlements programme.

We will increase the capacity of affordable Gap housing projects for those who do not qualify for bonds and we will ensure that the most deserving citizens also become homeowners via the BNG Programme.

The additional R56 million allocated to the Department will build the necessary capacity to execute Catalytic Projects along with the R43 million required for the infrastructure. We will continue to focus on some special planning, with R86 million for the Integrated Urban Development Framework and Small Town Regeneration Programmes in collaboration with the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning to address apartheid spatial legacies.

Madam Speaker, this budget will thus travel the length and breadth of this province to accommodate all the settlement needs of our people.

At the beginning of this year the National Department further revealed that a mere 35% of title deeds were issued during the previous financial year and only 22% of the new homes built have been transferred to owners.

Furthermore, National Government recently released 3 million hectares for land reform, mainly in the North-West, Limpopo and Eastern Cape.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you in the North-West now?

Ms L M MASEKO: But no land within cities. To date, the Presidential Committee revealed that R21 billion has been spent on land reform and R14 billion in the form of restitution, all of which, after 40 years District Six claimants have no benefit of and have to wait an additional 20 years to be repatriated.

Furthermore, it is unfortunate that the General Household Survey for 2017 revealed that approximately 10% of the 13% of people living in state-subsidised housing units provided by the State, are concerned about the quality of houses. [Interjection.] This is due to the poor maintenance and beneficiaries simply do not have the necessary funds to maintain homes. The ANC's mission has been rendered inadequate. These ineffective methods of transformation and redress are no longer excusable. [Interjections.]

In contrast, via an inter-governmental approach, we prioritise jobs along with housing developments to enhance the economic livelihoods for the people in our province; in order for them to be able to take care of their homes and families, indeed under Programme 3, R3 million is earmarked for job creation by this Department.

As I said earlier, we sympathise with need in our province and the wellbeing of our people. Therefore, 93% of this budget will go to providing housing opportunities.

Madam Speaker, more can always be done but rest assured that in this

province we do not regard our mandate on human settlement plans as a mere handout programme. The DA has proven over the last 10 years that it is capable of establishing viable housing opportunities, which is still an aspiration for National Government. It is on the basis of this outstanding track record that we welcome the Human Settlements Budget of 2019 so that we can put this remarkable work forth.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the visionary leadership of Minister Madikizela, the entire Department under the HOD Mr Mguli, also Mr Francois de Wet and ... [Interjections.] Jackie Samson and I am going to call them this way because throughout the five years we have become a family as the Standing Committee, holding the Department accountable and the Department has not even once, that when we ask the questions, whether we are in the Standing Committee or not, not given a response. So we are interacting as a family of Human Settlements for the communities of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

So on behalf of the Standing Committee I would love to say to the Department: thank you very much and the strides that you make within the Western Cape, I am definitely sure that the communities appreciate each and every footprint you put in their lives.

And as for the Standing Committee, I would love to say thank you. For the longest standing member in the Standing Committee, hon member Dijana and myself and also hon member Davids, thanks for all the hard questions you

have asked the Department that has made them really identify ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... where there was a loophole that needed to be addressed and definitely they did that, and for holding the Department accountable.
[Interjections.] And with those few words, hon Speaker, I welcome – because I said few words – and I support Vote 8 as it will assist in the creation of integrated and resilient Human Settlements arrangements.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Maseko. I now see the hon member, member Davids. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, allow me to speak on the Vote 8, Human Settlements. The Western Cape Provincial Department of Human Settlements reported in 2018 that there had been major alignment problems between itself and Cape Town which had affected the implementation of Urban Settlements Development Grant projects.

The National Department of Human Settlements commented that they had

held a meeting with the Western Cape Department, or they had attended a Ministers' and members of the Executive Council meeting as this would have given both the national and provincial departments an opportunity to form synergy in an attempt to speed up the projects.

Thus far, the Provincial Department has failed to spend 100% of its USDG. The Department has applied for a rollover of funds to the 2018/2019 financial year. The expenditure between July 2017 and January 2018 ... [Interjections.] has been R456 million, which was only 85% of the total grant received.

The City of Cape Town was faced with numerous challenges and constraints in serving informal settlements. These include unplanned and intensive dense settlements that made it difficult to install services, a lack of community ownership and a high level of theft and vandalism.

The Director General (DG) of the National Department of Human Settlements said in 2017 that the City of Cape Town should try its best not to shift funds from one project to another. He stressed that there were performance reviews in place and that the figures presented there came directly from the CoCT and that they needed to manage the risk of losing the money back to the fiscus.

The City of Cape Town had sat at 24% of spending in December, which means that they were at risk of facing lack of delivery and rather than lose the money back to the fiscus, it should stay within the Department.

Looking at 2017 and 2018, it is clear that the DA Human Settlements in the province and city failed to annually spend R100 million of human settlements. The DA is not keen to improve the lives of the ordinary citizens.

And now I want to come back to one of the statements that the MEC made. The MEC said they have three objectives: one is to make sure that people who do not get a bond be assisted – if they do not get a bond at the bank they must be assisted – and the second, he only mentioned the second one, he did not mention the third one. But I want to come in there, MEC, if we do not spend our informal settlements grant and every time it comes back, it comes back, how are we improving the lives of the poor? Because when you go to an informal settlement, it is the poor people who stay there. Yes, there are some people [Interjection.] that have sufficient jobs, but not everyone.

Then I want to come to the second point that the MEC made. The MEC said that 80% of the people in the informal settlements are children who leave the homes of their parents, they have a child and now they want to be on their own. I do not support that view, MEC, because if you go into an informal settlements you will see the majority there are elderly people. It is mammas and pappas that stay there; a few are young people.

Then I want to come back to my speech. The National Department of Human Settlements DG reported that in 2016 the Department had been monitoring

the COs, Cape Town, very closely and during their meeting last year they had wanted to take funds of about 150 million as they were worried about the pace at which the projects were moving. [Interjections.]

He conceded that they had been doing this consistently since 2012 and that the former head of Human Settlements had had a series of meetings with the City of Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dyantyi that is how you [Inaudible.]. Sorry.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Then I want to come also to a comment that the MEC made about the Title Deed Registration Grant.

The SPEAKER: I am trying to caution the hon Mitchell.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Hon Speaker, you are out of order.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, I am not. [Interjections.] I am trying to caution the hon member Mitchell. Hon member Mitchell is having a conversation with the hon Dyantyi that is out of order, sorry. Hon member Mitchell, if I could caution you, please? Thank you. I apologise. Hon member Davids, you may proceed.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The hon MEC said R64.4 million was for the restoration of title deeds, the Title Deed Restoration Grant. We must just remember that that grant is from National Government directly to the province.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The taxpayer.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, do not say taxpayer because when you speak about deliveries of the province you say DA, you do not say taxpayers. [Interjections.] So do not come and teach me now to say taxpayers. It is the ANC Government that is feeding ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Davids, may I ask you to please address the Chair and not the Minister, please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Now they know.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Ja, now you know that the ANC Government nationally gave that grant to the province so they must restore the people's dignity, to give them a title deed. [Interjections.]

Now I want to come to the Chairperson of the Standing Committee.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So you do not have a speech.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, I have a speech, here is my speech. I just ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I want to come to the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on the District Six issue. There would be no District Six if there was not the Group Act.

Mr M G E WILEY: Group Areas Act.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Group Areas Act, ja, Group Areas Act ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... there would be no District Six. So it is not only the claimants of District Six that are waiting. There is a whole country of claimants that is waiting. So do not confuse the people of District Six by thinking that National Government do not want to give them what they want. National Government is busy with a country, not an Oranje state like the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, members.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Because the Western Cape belongs to a country, it is not an island.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, kindly take your seat. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Hon member, please tell the District Six residents they are confused. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do not make noise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon member Davids, if you can address the Chair and try and manage your volume please. Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] done.

Ms S W DAVIDS: No, I am not done. [Interjections.] Then, Chairperson, hon Speaker, I want to say that we have a big backlog, as the MEC said, on Human Settlements before 1994 because 30 years before 1994 houses were last built by the then government. And that is why we have a backlog and that is why National Government is still struggling with the MEC, because I can say here today it is only this MEC that really has the people at heart, not the DA. It is the MEC and his Department that have the poor people of the

Western Cape at heart with his Bantu state, like my leader has said, his Bantu department.

And then, comrades the last thing I wanted to say ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Davids, we are all hon members. Thank you.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Hon members. Sorry, comrade. Sorry, hon Speaker. Comrades, the last thing I wanted to say ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Davids, we are hon members.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Hon members. Sorry, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The last thing that the MEC said is about housing people and you say about empowering people through their houses and that you are saying that the eight years are not assisting us. I will partly agree with that but what the National Department means by the eight years is exactly what you said about people selling their houses. We can go all over, you can see people are selling their houses to foreigners, people are selling their houses to people who maybe had a house and lost their house and so I do not think it is the eight years, MEC, of the National Department that is the problem. It is the education of the people, that that house is a property for them.

[Interjections.] It is a property for them, it is empowering them economically but it is also an asset to them. And that is the education that must go out to our people out there.

And then also, MEC, the issue of the deliverables in the municipalities, that is also a thing, I think the capacity building that the Department must look into. And that is why, in the Standing Committee, I said that the planning is very important because planning must go down to the municipalities so that they can plan how to do a project in time. Because if we are not going to do that we are going to have backlogs and backlogs and backlogs forever.

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Davids. In the absence of the EFF and the ACDP – sorry, Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hon Speaker, I would just like to note for the record, this is the second vote that both the ACDP and the EFF have not fulfilled its constitutional responsibilities in responding to a budget.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] ... must talk to them, ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip, that is noted. [Interjections.] I have

received, my office has received an apology from the EFF but I cannot recall saying that I have seen an apology from the ACDP. [Interjection.] Hon members, I can only accept the apology; I cannot account for where the members are.

May we then allow the hon Minister to conclude this debate? I see the hon the Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and all the hon members who contributed. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, to the Chairperson, Me Maseko. I do want to just make one comment because when hon member Maseko was presenting the figures, I heard some members cite – unfortunately hon member Dyantyi has just left now – and now clearly these members missed a very important thing, is that the achievement that we are talking about is linked to what was transferred to us in terms of the budget.

So the question is whether the achievements justify the allocation that was given to us and the answer is: yes. Because even if we would like to achieve more than what we achieved, but the reality is that housing is a competing need in South Africa. We spend all our money in order to achieve what we

achieve. So we could not achieve more, I think that is what needs to be understood.

Now just on the next point that was raised by hon member Davids, because again you know the ANC totally misunderstand how government functions in South Africa. [Interjection.] No, no, no, please wait. Wait, let me say what I want to say. When we get money from National Government ... [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, can I have your protection, please?

The SPEAKER: I need to protect you too, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: When we get money from National Government they are not doing us a favour because there is this thinking that the ANC is doing us a favour, the ANC Government is doing us a favour ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The money that gets transferred to the provinces ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The money that is transferred to provinces is the money that is due to those provinces in terms of the

Division of Revenue Act.

An HON MEMBER: We know that.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So they are not doing us a favour. So they think that we must be grateful to the ANC for giving us money. No, no, it is not ANC money, it is taxpayers' money that we are ...
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must be grateful to the ANC. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon Magaxa.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The second point that I want to make is that the contribution in terms of tax that this province is making is far more than what we are getting in return. So no-one is doing us a favour here. [Interjection.] I just want to make that point.

Now, again hon member Davids lost me completely and I do want to make this point very clear again to educate some of the people. I am presenting here a Human Settlements Development Grant, not Urban Settlement Development Grant.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So I will not engage you on the Urban Settlement Development Grant because this is not the grant that I am presenting. That is a grant that gets sent directly to the municipalities or metros and what I am presenting here is HSDG. And everything that I spoke about is around HSDG, not USDG.

So when you went on and on about USDG, it had nothing to do with the budget that I am presenting. [Interjections.]

Now the issue of the title deeds – I have heard this before again as well from other hon members here. Before this grant actually was conceptualised – because again it is the prerogative of each and every province, when you get your grant, to decide what is it that you are going to prioritise - before that grant was conceptualised we took a decision. In fact we took a decision as this Department to say what we are going to prioritise here, one of the priority areas is going to be title deeds. Because we believe strongly that over and above just building houses ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, kindly take your seat, please. Hon Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I cannot allow the MEC to continue to mislead this House. The DORA document is very clear, hon Speaker, if you will allow me. The DORA document is very clear. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, take your seat, please. [Interjections.] There is a member on the floor. Hon member Beerwinkel, the point you are raising is a debating point, it is not a point of order unfortunately. So I cannot allow you ... [Interjection.]

Ms C W BEERWINKEL: May I address you, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may. [Interjections.]

Ms C W BEERWINKEL: Thank you, hon Speaker, for allowing me to address you. We need to remember that there are visitors in this House who will take away this misinformation where it is ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Beerwinkel, unfortunately I cannot sustain that point. It is not a point of order. You may proceed, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now even if we were to say that the restoration grant is coming from national, because let me just entertain hon member Beerwinkel ... [Interjection.]

Ms C W BEERWINKEL: That is not the point ...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, let me just entertain hon member Beerwinkel. The point is that if you look at how the Western Cape has spent this grant, we are spending this grant far better than any other

province in South Africa. That is the point.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is the point. I am talking about the Title Deeds Restoration Grant now. This province is sitting at ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is agreement, hon Madikizela, so can we please allow the Minister to proceed without ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I did not interrupt them when they were speaking.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now we have spent 72% of this grant; in fact the second province in South Africa has only spent 43%.

Ms C W BEERWINKEL: That is not the point.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So just to entertain you to say this grant is coming from the National Department of Human Settlements, even if we were to say that, the point is that this grant has been spent much more productively in the Province of the Western Cape because we take the

issue of issuing title deeds very, very seriously. [Interjections.] That is the point.

But in closing, Madam Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Minister Madikizela, can I just ask you to take your seat? Hon members, the Minister has a right of reply. I cannot attest to what the Minister is saying, that is not my role. So unfortunately you might hear things that you do not agree with but we cannot deliberate it in the Minister's speaking time. I would like to recommend that if there is clarity that needs to be gained, it happens outside of this Chamber. But let us proceed with dignity and respect and get through the business of the day. You may proceed, hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In closing, Madam Speaker, I want to once again take the opportunity to thank all our partners in the Human Settlements space who attended this budget vote and I want to apologise on their behalf in some instances for the childish behaviour that sometimes some people show in this House.

We are here to do very serious business, to account to the people of the Western Cape as to how we are spending – even as I am responding – to account to the people of the Western Cape, how we have governed this province. Let them be the judge, how we have spent the money that was given to us as the Government of this province compared to any other

province in South Africa. Because this is what this is about. We can howl and shout; at the end of the day, people who are here are here to listen as to how this Government has fared against any other government in terms of the taxpayers' money that was given to us.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is your wish.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And today we are here to account and I think this Department has given a very good account of what we have done with taxpayers' money and I want to thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. [Applause.] That concludes the debate on this Vote. The House will be suspended for just three minutes to allow the officials to vacate the bays and for the next team to take up their seats. Thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended at 12:28 and resumed at 12:31]

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. The Secretary will read the third order.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 6 – Health – Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 - 2019].

The SPEAKER: Minister Mbombo, Minister of Health. [Applause.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Hear-Hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, honourable Premier in absentia, Cabinet colleagues and members of the Provincial Parliament, Chairperson of the Standing Committee, Head of Department and management of the Department of Health, the citizens of the Western Cape, †kubacholi-choli bendaba abakhoyo, [to the journalists present,] †molweni [greetings].

Today, I deliver the final budget for this political term for the Health Department.

This budget is about maintaining the dignity of the millions of patients that we serve. We are highlighting the work we have done, but also to show how we work smarter and technically maintain and preserve the patients' dignity. With this budget, we are all about business unusual, to ultimately deliver patient centred care without compromising the quality.

The Department of Health continues to grow and this is unlikely to change in the short-term given the trends in the social determinants of health and wellbeing. [Interjection.].

The health sector, generally, is under severe pressure as result of the budget cuts with about a R9 billion cut over the MTEF, nationally. The Western Cape Health cumulative budget cuts over the last three years at R602 million

and in the next current MTEF at R574 million equates to about R1,2 billion and that is approximately 6% of the Department's budget. Over the same period of this MTEF, patient numbers would have grown and at the current rate we might see about 12% that is not sustainable.

The challenges we also face are urbanisation and in-migration; a [Inaudible.] service platform; drought and water shortages; disease outbreaks and an escalating burden of disease; Staff safety – the attacks on EMS staff is undermining service delivery as staff often are traumatised and put on leave for extended periods; natural disasters like fires; and load shedding is coming back to haunt us, again.

This situation places the provincial health system under enormous strain, and in the context of the above, the 2019/20 budget is likely to be a very challenging year. Despite these challenges, the Western Cape has the best health outcomes out of all the provinces. Western Cape citizens enjoy the best care compared to the level of services elsewhere in the country.

We have consistently had the highest life expectancy over the years due to better population health outcomes, specifically on lower mortality rates. We have better coverage and access to health services. Where there is no physical facility, we bring services through mobile or by other means like public private partnerships.

Access to health services is crucial for where we are going with the Universal

Health Coverage. We have made great progress with the Universal Health Coverage feasibility. We will continue to engage to influence national policy. We have initiated inter-provincial collaboration with KZN and the Eastern Cape, where we have already begun to strengthen the health system towards the implementation of the new health coverage.

Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.] as you may have noticed, there are no guests in the gallery today. Business is unusual. As I indicated we are up to disruption, so we take the disruption of space at all levels. But I want to acknowledge the VIPs. You will see again that it is business unusual. Usually you find the Chief of Staff and senior people but in the gallery it is my staff, those are the people who are behind the scenes but who are not necessarily recognised.

Grant Adams, Mama Mjoga, Sisi osebenzayo Peyena, Olivier Daniels, Unathi Mayinje and also Anniqua Cupido, I just want to acknowledge them because people do not know them. [Applause.] So these are my VIPs.

So in this budget I am presenting to you today, that we have also presented to the stakeholders, so that is why you do not see the guests here. So we did it another way around where we presented to the people and now we are presenting to the legislatures. These stakeholders include our statutory bodies, which are the health recipients themselves through the health committees, the hospital boards, the mental health review board, the Independent Health Committee Complaints Committee, the District Health

Council, the Provincial Consultative Council, the academics, the councillors, health professionals from community health workers to the senior ones, specialists, private health and business. In 2015 when I presented my first budget I said “nothing about them, without them”. So that is why this budget is a budget of the people in the true sense. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So about 300 people at the time that we hosted were part of it. I want to acknowledge member Reverend Gopie who as part of the Standing Committee was also there and I just want to thank her for her invaluable input, also on behalf of the Standing Committee.

We took these priorities to them because health is everybody’s business. Health is about partnerships. We had representatives from as far as Beaufort West and Matzikama, *Oos-Wes, Noord-Suid, nè, alles*. [East, West, North, South, yes, everything.] More than 300 participants who participated.

Participants at the aka State of the Department Health Address raised pertinent input which I would like to share.

Mama Annelize from the Heideveld Health Committee reminded us about the social ills such as drugs and alcohol, and gangsterism that impact on health services and indicated that there was dire need to have a health and social development integrated approach and budgeting to tackle these. Again I

assure Mama that as part of PSG3, which is about increasing wellness and safety and tackling social ills, we have looked at all of these and currently we are still working and involving the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Social Development, Community Safety as well as us in this transversal engagement.

The Department of the Premier led the Alcohol Game-Changer which led to interventions that focused on youth as well ... [Interjection.]. Health also, contributed to investing in the Young Women and Girls Project, with R80 million from the Global Fund to empower young women and girls. Heideveld, which is part of Klipfontein, is part of this project where we saw over 50 000 young women and girls participate over the last three years.

Although this project, which also includes men's dialogue, comes to an end in this financial year, as we were funded for three years, we want to reassure the communities that through Whole of Society Approach (WoSA), we will continue the transversal projects with these departments beyond international funding. We are actually already doing that in Saldanha where we use our own Department funds and Saldanha is one of the four sites where we want to pilot the Universal Health Coverage.

The second person that I want to mention is Mr Anthony Vaughn from the Vredenburg Hospital Board who wanted reassurance relating to medico legal claims as they keep on escalating, even elsewhere. I can report that the Western Cape has the lowest medico legal claims bill of all nine provinces

and for us, what is important, it begins with fixing the "medico" which is the prefix portion to avoid the latter which is the 'legal claims'; improve the quality so that you can worry less about the rest. I want to thank Dr Bass and his team for the outstanding work they are doing in this field to ensure we do stick to this promise.

The third person, actually there are two that I am putting together, Mr Mike Hofmeester, I think from Bishop Lavis and Mr Michael from the Metro. They have questions around the construction of G F Jooste. I can confirm that the Klipfontein Regional Hospital is no longer going to be a district [Inaudible.] level hospital. Jooste is in the planning phase and I will elaborate more under the infrastructure sector later.

Mr Wellington from Murraysburg in Beaufort West raised concerns about the town being forgotten as it is next to the Eastern Cape and also in the Northern Cape, plus also it is too far to access health services for patients, especially for check-ups. I reminded Mr Wellington, now I am reminding everyone, that we go beyond the call of duty and have put in place unofficial arrangements where patients in the far remote rural towns are being picked up from home in areas like Slangrivier in the Garden Route, Haarlem, Avontuur, De Rust in Kannaland and so forth and also inclusive of the Central Karoo, Maraisburg, Merweville and Leeu-Gamka that are already doing that. As I already said: †geen gemeenskap sal agtergelaat word nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] [no community will be left behind. [Interjections.]]

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Swartbeck from District Six shared his concerns about the negative, exaggerated reporting in media that affects staff morale. He urged the media to be considerate and not to be one-sided in their reporting. Thanks Mr S, as I call him. Indeed our staff are major building blocks to strengthen health systems, and if one link is weakened unfairly, especially for political score points, you are actually weakening the whole health system.

Yes, we are not perfect, we err, sometimes we are wrong and irritate our clients, but we do not dismiss their truth. We investigate, we sit over a cup of coffee and we apologise. That is why we are the only province with an Independent Health Complaints Committee which is constituted by skilled people, that are not even employed by Government, to look at those cases where the clients still feel aggrieved despite the interventions.

I want to thank Professor Fannie Sonn, Advocate Mdludlu and Mama uRoss who are current members of the committee but I also want to extend our appreciation to the previous ones who served; Advocate Gerrie de Kock, Professor Sinegugu Duma, I want to thank them.

The last one, regarding the input, because I am being selective, Professor Julie from the University of the Western Cape, who raised questions about the training of nursing staff and academic support to strengthen nursing. I

can report to the House that the Nursing College and the Ambulance College are in the process of getting accredited to be one of the leading higher learning institutions that will provide the best training for future nurses and emergency medical personnel. Watch this space. [Interjection.]

In terms of the clinic committees and hospital boards, because I know if member Gillon was here, she was going to ask ‘what did you do after you passed the legislation in 2016?’ In addition to appointing all these hospital boards and clinic committees I can report we have started training and so far we have trained Wesfleur, Helderberg, Ladysmith, Laingsburg, Otto du Plessis and Khayelitsha Hospitals and also their clinic committees.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as I continue this theme of maintaining patient dignity, I also want to start by focusing on five key elements that really highlight the length and depth of this Department and what we have done so far to deliver a service despite the challenging environment where we operate. Minister Motsoaledi once said that that health services are under distress.

Firstly, the Management Efficiency and Alignment Project (MEAP). This model of redesign of organisational efficiency and alignment is to make the organisation leaner and strengthen the service delivery. Critically, MEAP is mainly about changing the way the Department functions, how teams support a culture of continuous collaboration, learning and growth, and values driven leadership across the whole system.

Ideally we want to achieve at least a 10% cost saving which we can plough back into other programmes, to ensure we continue providing a high quality service. We have concluded the first phase, if you recall that I did mention in my last year's budget speech. So we have concluded the first phase which involved extensive engagements with staff on the redesign of how we can improve alignment and efficiencies in the management system. The next phase intention is to have the senior management staff matched and placed within the first quarter of 2019 to provide some certainty and stability especially as we have now done a lot of work at the lower level.

The second part is Innovation. I call it #4IR, because it is part of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. I think the Premier did indicate that if you do not go in an innovative way, in the current context of where we are generally in all governments internationally, it means that you are really left behind.

Technology as part of our innovation is a key enabler and disruptor in doing business unusual. We have implemented several key initiatives, most importantly to maintain the dignity of the patient that I mentioned earlier. The issue about the waiting times, we have to reduce these waiting times and I want to mention a few relating to the waiting times at theatres, at ECs and facilities. There are many interventions. At the last Indaba we had, we identified about 20 but I want to flag a few. I also want to thank all other facilities and staff who also have contributed to some of the innovations from cutting edge world operations, orthopaedic beds and so forth. I just want to mention a few.

Last year I did mention the Unique Patient Identifier which has now been implemented across the Department, including city services. This allows patients to move from one area of the province to the next, from a hospital to a clinic and their medical records will still be available on the data system. We are one of the few places globally with an integrated data system across the service platform. Now we do not have to wait longer for your folder. Electronic Continuity of Care Record aka E-discharge. It aims to support the patient's journey between hospitals and primary health care, through a web-based application. This reduces the time patients spend at facilities post discharge, and lays the foundation to establish Diagnostic Related Groups which assist with fair resource distribution.

Third one is the Data Centre which allows us to integrate provincial health data, which we can use to generate actionable information, giving managers a powerful tool for improving healthcare. The potential is incredible and it is possible to develop tools for almost every medical condition.

The Hectis Project: this one is particularly crucial in our ECs where we see the most pressure. This electronic system shows the triage code for every patient, how long they wait, and flag it when an elderly person or child is waiting. This continues to support our drive to improve the dignity of vulnerable patients. This has been rolled out already in Mitchells Plain, Heideveld, in George, in Groote Schuur. It follows the patient from the time of entry into the EC unit, until the patient leaves the EC. The ultimate purpose is to keep track and movement of the patients throughout the

emergency centre. I also would like to commend the team under Dr Moosa Parak, Naadir Fredericks and Mr. Jashmeer Maharaj.

Lastly, I want to flag the Theatre Admin Projects. In theatre you will find that there are emergencies like obstetrics, trauma, internal medicine and so forth and theatres are the most expensive units in a hospital, and also the scarcest resource units. So optimising theatre performance requires good management information. This initiative is already happening in rural areas, for example in Worcester. So this is part of the innovation but we also have others in public private partnerships. Remember we are talking about maintaining dignity and reducing waiting times. This is key in our mission to preserve patient dignity. The Department has entered into several partnerships that have allowed us to provide access to much needed health services, for example, family planning and immunisation services where it has been implemented. We have formulised partnerships with retail pharmacies like Dischem and Clicks and other small pharmacies to improve access to healthcare services. Now when you go to the Mall to do shopping, you can go next door and have your contraceptives and then you immunise your baby and you can check for testing and so forth.

The other one that I want to flag is the Private Farm Owners, for example the Du Toit's Group around Witzenberg, Lutzville Wines in the Matzikama and the Thornlands Group in Swellendam. These private owners have also established access to health services to agri-workers to ensure a healthy work force. I visited all these farms personally and saw first-hand how this added

value to the health of the farmworkers. I must state that not a cent is coming from us. They built these state-of-the-art clinics, they appoint their own staff and all we have to do is give guidance.

Mr D JOSEPH: Well done!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Operation 100: this initiative supported Mandela Day and aimed to perform 100 elective surgeries, that is to cut the theatre time, the theatre slate, because some people wait three to five or even seven years for knee or hip operations, for example. The team surprised us and reached 195 for 2018. This initiative evidences the commitment to the dignity and care to our vulnerable patients, who received life-changing surgical procedures. [Applause.]

These operations were additional to what the Department planned and budgeted for the year, but with the help of generous sponsors and donors, we were able to improve the quality of these patients' lives for the better who were on the Department's central waiting list for surgeries. And this year, we have got more we will showcase. I will be back, I will showcase again.

Now the Infrastructure, Mr Deputy Speaker, is one of the building blocks within the health system and forms part of our priorities as a way to address patient experience and service pressure plus also the maintain their dignity.

I am also proud to announce that we spent the whole of our entire allocation

on infrastructure in 2018/19. Just to brag, in the past 10 years we have done a lot. We built two district hospitals, 10 emergency centres that were replaced and upgraded, 14 new primary care facilities completed, building of 11 new ambulance stations. We also prioritised psychiatric units like in Paarl, Vredenburg and Mitchells Plain hospitals. In 2018/19 we also have some key projects, District Six, Thembalethu, Khayelitsha Hospital Ward and CT scan, Napier Clinic and De Rust Clinic upgrades, and R172 million for Vredenburg Hospital upgrades.

For this year we have earmarked the following infrastructure which amounts to about R1,2 billion: the construction of Gansbaai Clinic; Laingsburg Clinic; Caledon EMS Communication Centre; Victoria Hospital EC; Swartland [Inaudible.] Hospital EC. We have got a site for the hospital, but it takes long, not less than five years to build a hospital but we have to do something with the current arrangement. Services are underway for the Helderberg Hospital, Observatory, Salt River, for their forensic lab; the De Doorns Ambulance station; the Klipfontein Regional Hospital which is in Phase 3. Some of the challenges were allocating the site plus the business case and we are some way in terms of advance that by the end of this month, April, we will be able to have a community engagement where we can speak with the people of Manenberg and Gugulethu and so forth to talk about Klipfontein Regional Hospital to reassure them that it is going to rise.

In addition to that, of course the Tygerberg maintenance. I want to add that we are not only focusing on the mortar and cement and so forth but we also

have to focus on water and energy. There have been some of the interventions for water savings. We also have a prepared plan. Some will recall at the time of the drought we invested in borehole drilling at key facilities. At Lentegur Hospital for example we have about 10 boreholes that were already there. We do have a water saving plan for all our facilities just like we have an energy saving plan including now with the load shedding in terms of our generators and so forth. So we are prepared.

Human Resources: I would like to commend our staff for their resilience amidst the challenging circumstances. Our frontline staff is at the core of service delivery, which is why we need to ensure that we continue to create an enabling environment for our staff to deliver a high quality service. We survived the fires, we survived Day Zero, we survived Listeriosis, we survived the political smearing campaigns and so forth. So we really want to thank our staff for that.

I would also like to congratulate all our staff who managed to achieve success under these pressurised circumstances.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: For example, Ms Patience Shipalane was named as the Democratic Nursing Association of SA's most caring nurse of the year, in this year. [Applause.] Dr Delpont received a great honour after she was recently nominated as the Integrity Idol 2018. [Applause.] What is

that? It is a world-wide campaign which was established to give credit to the honest government officials for their work. I am just mentioning a few. There are many of those. I mentioned those international and national ones. There are many of those who have received quite a lot of accolades.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in my budget speech last year, I shared that we are the only province that prioritised junior doctors commuted overtime to reduce stress but there is still more that National Health has to do in regard to the overall time that the doctors spent, but I just want to indicate that at least we are doing something. There was a time when some of the psychiatrists treated nurses where they work in certain environments where they did not have a danger allowance. We introduced that so they do receive a danger allowance.

We received R135 million that was allocated for the Human Resources Capacitation Grant and we have appointed community service medical officers, medical interns, and in the process we are filling critical posts. In addition, I must just add that with the medical interns we added 204 to the existing ones that we have. So roughly we have got over 500 medical interns that are within our system.

I also promised, there was a time where we had an issue related to the waiting times at the mortuary. We are still talking about the waiting times where I promised additional staff so I want to now share the fact that we have now appointed additional specialists, forensic pathology officers and we have increased the forensic assistants from 9 in 2017/18 to 50 in the 2018 budget.

We have also increased our investment in primary health care, hence you will see the largest slice of the budget is 40% allocated to District Health Services. Through this we have earmarked an increase in the remuneration for Community Health Workers. We urge communities to support these foot soldiers who are faced with crime and the potential to be mugged and raped in these households. They walk distances in the rain and sun, dodging stray bullets during their visits. At the end of the day we need these people because the health system does not start at the clinic, it starts with the communities. In the communities we need these health workers.

Staff safety remains a concern for the Department. Like Saturday evening, yet another EMS vehicle was attacked in Khayelitsha. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Two EMS staff members were robbed at gunpoint and left traumatised.

We view criminal attacks on our staff as an extremely serious matter and a number of measures have been implemented in response. For example we launched Operation Khuseleka to raise awareness and solicit community support for staff safety.

We are already part of the CT Transport Management improved collaboration,

where together with SAPS, DoCS and Traffic Department we are in the same space in Goodwood. We have through the DotP, in places like the Red Zones and Khayelitsha, installed additional cameras.

We also co-operate with Neighbourhood Watches together with Department of Community Safety, where we participate in the Provincial Joint Operations. Remember our core business is to render health services but now we see ourselves that we are in the space of security and safety and we have signed a memorandum of understanding also with the City of Cape Town to this effect.

Now to the finances, Mr Deputy Speaker. Health has the largest footprint in the community. We provide health services to 75% of the population, 24 hours, 365 days a year from the unborn child to the oldest which is from the cradle to the grave and this includes the deceased. So that is why for us for the past year, we acceded to calls from communities to improve services, in particular in those pressurised facilities. From time to time we will keep on adjusting in cases where there is a need for such. We have to this end for example, developed improvement strategy plans for the Khayelitsha District Hospital, because we encounter many challenges out of the blue; at Helderberg Hospital we have got an improvement plan and at the Grabouw Hospital in recent weeks. For example in Khayelitsha, we have opened a new 30-bed ward, a new CT scan and we have improved nurse governance.

In Helderberg Hospital the new EC is underway and in Grabouw we are

extending the operation hours, to even include the weekends as well as the 24-hour emergency that Grabouw will receive by the end of April. [Interjection.]. These are all ways in which we aim to improve ... [Interjections.].

Mr Deputy Speaker, I would commend the Department for the 14 year record of an unqualified audit. We have had a clean finance audit, the only government actually in South Africa to have a clean finance ... [Interjections.]. I understand that we even contribute towards the goods and services. [Interjections.] I rest easy tabling this R24,8 billion budget which is the biggest slice in the Western Cape Government.

In terms of the budget and this R24,8 billion you will find that in terms of the budget allocations, 59% goes to staff, it is only for salaries; 38% goes to goods and services so you can understand in terms of the stress that we work under it is not easy to avert an unqualified audit. But we have done it.

This budget includes the National Conditional Grant which is about R6,4 billion. I think what is important in all these budget programmes, is that there has been an increase throughout from Programme 1 to Programme 8. Programme 2, District Services, amounts to about 40% of the total vote just to show how serious we are when it comes to service delivery.

If you look at Programme 8 it is has a nominal increase of 25% of the budget. That is just to show that the business is really unusual. We have to make the

point that the Tygerberg is being maintained, the Jooste has to rise, the Swartland will also have to rise, all those that were affected.

In conclusion, none of this incredible work would have been done without the support from our staff. Firstly, thank you to the Premier and Cabinet colleagues for their support. When I started here as a novice, of course I was nervous, but they gave me such support; our members of Provincial Parliament ... [Interjection.], the Standing Committee for their assistance. It is a pity that member Gillion is not here but I want to thank her and also member Gopie, from the Opposition, who have been the shadow MECs, for their help.

And then to the Chair, Mama Lorraine Botha, thank you together with the staff from Parliament for giving us assistance. I think what is also crucial, I must share, despite the fact that when we are sitting here we want to play to the gallery, we find that within the committees, the committee do their work, they hold us to account, they ask pertinent questions.

I used to check when they asked for a lot of documents, do they read them and then found that actually when they asked for these documents they really needed them to find out actually in terms of what is needed. But what is most important is that they are not representing themselves at the committee. You can see that the person is talking about the pertinent issues on what is happening, related to the patients in that area. So I want to thank the committees for that.

I thank the over 32 000 of our staff members who are dedicated, under the leadership of Dr Beth Engelbrecht, assisted by the top management that is sitting there. Thank you for understanding that there are more than 24 hours in a day. Your phone will never be off if mine is still on. The support from our strategic partners, the private sector, academic sector, our community structures, my office sitting there and the other, the Chief of Staff spokesperson, colleagues, all sitting there who are the wind beneath my wings.

I know I am a difficult person to live with, to work with but they understand that at the end we do it for the Aunty Sara's and the Oom [Inaudible.]. And lastly, my family who is not here, they are still busy, I just thank them for giving me the opportunity and also understanding that we do not rest because we are tired, we rest only because we reach our destiny which is a very rich destiny. The patients still need us. Thank you very much. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lorraine Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon members of the House, HOD and the Department of Health. As the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Health in this Parliament I am entrusted with the task of performing oversight over the Western Cape Department of Health. Furthermore it is exceptionally important that I perform my oversight function in the interests of the people of this province and in a way that ensures that capacity building continues to

take place in this respective Department.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the demand for public healthcare services has increased significantly over the past few years. Not only in the Western Cape but across the country. Furthermore it is no secret that the current economic climate provides limited room for growth in terms of Government spending across all departments. However, regardless of severe financial restraints, the capable DA-led Western Cape Government remains dedicated to ensuring that Tobogo, John, Riaz, Laeeqa, the affectionate Marco Marlo and Aunty Sara and all the other residents of our province who make use of public healthcare services are not denied access to world class healthcare facilities.

In order to ensure that the Western Cape Department of Health continues to provide our residents with the necessary services to ensure that all residents are bestowed with dignity, R24,76 billion will be appropriated over the 2019/20 MTEF period. This budget allocation is higher than any other Department and once again proves that this caring Government remains committed to providing adequate healthcare services to all the residents of the Province.

As the Minister of Finance, Ivan Meyer, highlighted, the DA-led Western Cape Government has established a budget focused on consolidation for maximum citizen impact. The pro-poor budget will assist 75% of the total Western Cape population who are unable to pay for private healthcare services.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the reality is that for millions of South Africans living in vulnerable, rural and urban communities, their public hospital is an important and often their only source of healthcare. As transformation in the hospital and healthcare fields advances with the use of new technologies adopted by our progressive Government, we are eliminating or at the very least, reducing the risk of some communities losing access to healthcare services and the opportunities and resources they need to improve and maintain their health.

Mr Deputy Speaker, health is not simply the absence of illness but is also more than a state of physical, psychological and social flourishing and includes an individual's ability to adapt to physical, social and mental adversity. It is affected by many factors including access to healthcare and especially the social departments of health and its renewal are similarly multi-dimensional.

Furthermore, Mr Deputy Speaker, as a society and especially as public representatives, we are tasked with being the voice for the voiceless. In this regard we have an obligation to make access to an adequate level of care available to all residents of our province regardless of one's financial standing.

In this regard the DA-led Western Cape caring Government dedicated more than one third of its provincial budget to providing quality healthcare services to the people of our province. It is our caring and capable Government that recognises that quality of care is a key component of the

right to health protected by the South African Constitution and is significant to equity and dignity for women, children and other vulnerable groups in society.

Regardless of one's social economic status, age, race and ethnicity or whether they are a person with disabilities, no person deserves to be denied access to healthcare services. This capable DA-led caring Government continues to ensure that its residents live lives longer than anywhere else in the country.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape the life expectancy for women and men is ages 70 and 65 years respectively, higher than the national average of 67 years and 61,5 years for women and men, respectively. The reality is if you live in the Western Cape, individuals are more likely to live a longer life. Taking this into consideration it is not surprising that everyone around the country is wanting to live in our province where they will be guaranteed not only better healthcare services but better services generally speaking. Unlike the ANC-led Gauteng Province where their very own MEC of Health allegedly contributed to the death of mental health patients under their care. [Interjections.] Our province differs tremendously.

In the Western Cape residents have access to as many as 52 state of the art hospitals across our province. Unlike many provinces across the country, ask the people in the North West for instance, when one steps into a hospital in our province, access to health services is concerned with helping people

access appropriate healthcare resources in order to preserve or to improve their health.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as a caring Provincial Department we have taken an holistic approach to how we service the residents of our province in terms of how we go about providing healthcare. From my analysis of the 2019/2020 budget and annual performance plan, it is clear that this Department of Health remains committed to doing the greatest good to the greatest number of people, adding the greatest value, always prioritising the poorest of the poor and other vulnerable groupings in our society.

Other health departments across the country can learn many great lessons from how provincial health departments ought to be run and shown under the trusted leadership of our Provincial Minister, Nomafrench Mbombo. Our capable state has shown the significant impact of using integrated comprehensive strategies to reform healthcare delivery within which vulnerable communities can make individual choices based on their needs, support structures and their own preferences. If we are to continue to bring the healthcare services to all the people, the medical profession and the Government must work together.

Obviously the Government cannot achieve this objective without the cooperation of the medical profession because medical services must be furnished by the medical profession. I believe it is equally true that the medical profession cannot achieve their objectives without the help of the

Government. In this regard we are in a 'catch 22' in the province's current situation concerning the safety of our EMS staff in particular.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as a caring Government, we can no longer sit by and merely watch our EMS staff continue to be ambushed by criminals. In respect of these selfless health practitioners and in respect for their respective family members without the assistance of the very communities that these health practitioners service, these respective communities will inevitably be denied crucial services as we cannot continue to put these health practitioners' lives in danger.

Also, hon Minister, I would like to highlight here that there are minuscule pockets of health facility personnel who serve patients with an undesirable attitude and therefore paint this Department in a bad light. As for the vast majority of health personnel in the province, through you Minister, I would like to use this opportunity to give them a ten out of ten for their tireless commitment to serving the people of our province.

I would like to thank Minister Mbombo, the Head of Department, Dr Beth Engelbrecht and all the personnel that steered this Department but most specifically, Mr Deputy Speaker, the nursing personnel for their continued hard work, dedication and commitment to making healthcare accessible to all residents in the Western Cape.

A heartfelt thanks to the committee coordinator, Nomonde Jamce and the

assistant coordinator Mary-Ann Burgess. I acknowledge that it was not always easy. Thank you for the support throughout this term of committee service. To my colleagues in the committee, thank you for your dedicated support. With all things considered, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is clear that this budget has been drafted with the Department's strategic objectives in mind to fund its most important projects in pursuit of its stated aims and policy objectives. This budget is a responsible and caring budget. In conclusion the Democratic Alliance therefore supports Vote 6 Health. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can I start my speech by saying if there is anything that does not need to be put aside, it is health. Health in this province has always been, even during apartheid times, the best, not only in South Africa, on the continent.

I am saying that, Mr Deputy Speaker, because I am the product of that particular system. My mum was born paralysed and she was helped by the doctors in Groote Schuur here and she could walk at the age of 14. I take it very, very bad when I hear someone using politics when dealing with the health system while our people are dying every day. [Interjections.]. I am happy that our Minister, our National Minister, does not do that. He is very careful when it comes to health. Let me say if there is anything we need to unite and address, as this political leadership, it is health and we need to accept first that we are experiencing a lot of problems in our health system.

We also need to acknowledge that a lot of other challenges are more of a self-orchestrated nature. The appointment of health facility boards and clinic committees is but one example. The MEC in the APP claims this was to improve the patient's voice, but in reality this killed the patient's voice. Our hospital boards and clinic committees are dominated by DA puppets, that is why these boards never present to this House a fair reflection of our hospitals. Instead they always try to protect the Minister. [Interjections.] The City administration will have to look into this problem.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in South Africa March is recognised as TB month and March 24th is World TB Day. This year it was celebrated under the theme 'It is Time', it is time for a world without TB, it is time to treat 40 million people affected by TB by 2022 and it is time to know your TB status.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Spoken like an MEC.

Mr K E MAGAXA: To mark World TB Day, Doctors Without Borders celebrated TB survivors and activists for the role they played in striving for better TB treatment in South Africa. [Interjection.]. TB activists demand that their basic right be respected and they want a less toxic, shorter treatment. One of the TB activists celebrated by MSF was former TB patient, Pumeza Tasile, from Khayelitsha, who went permanently deaf from daily Kanamycin injections. She was finally cured of XDR TB in 2014, following two years of treatment. She has now become a powerful activist for better treatment.

Another celebrated TB activist is Noludwe Mabali, also from Khayelitsha, who was diagnosed with MDR TB in 2017 and declared cured this year. Due to her treatment she suffered intense side effects, especially damage to her kidneys and some hearing loss. As this House, we should stand in solidarity with all these TB activists I am referring to and the others and support their call for improved care and less toxic drugs.

TB remains the leading cause of death in South Africa especially among the poor people. More concerning for me is that the Western Cape Health Department admitted that it is struggling to deal with the retention of TB patients on treatment. It is also struggling with retention of patients on ART in care and cannot deal with the TB death rate. Through this budget MEC Mbombo was given an opportunity to show patients, activists and health workers that she was serious about their plight. Unfortunately she failed to rise to this occasion.

Allow me to express gratitude and appreciation to the National Government for the increased equitable share [Interjections.] and conditional grants for this province. These conditional grants include a comprehensive HIV/AIDS and TB grant which is over R1,6 billion. Overall the conditional grants increased to over R6,5 billion. This shows a caring ANC Government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the robberies and attacks on our ambulances still persist as the MEC referred to. On Sunday evening MEC Mbombo shared on her Facebook page the ordeal of two EMS staff members that were robbed at

gunpoint on Saturday evening in Harare. They were robbed of their cell phones, wedding rings and other belongings and were left severely traumatised. These are mothers, wives, daughters and we cannot continue to place their lives in danger in this way. Safety of our EMS personnel is the responsibility of our MEC and the Department. The MEC has failed to come up with new and effective interventions to deal with this societal problem. I know it is not a problem of an individual. It is our societal problem. It is part of the problems of capitalism, hon Premier. [Interjections.].

Why is there no budget for safety of EMS personnel? Why is it the MEC cannot partner with MEC Winde to have safety volunteers in the Red Zone escorting them as personnel. I think we need to find a solution, we need to find a solution on this one. We need to negotiate with the police, with MEC Winde to find a way of escorting these people. Every time they are called we need to find a way of connecting with the police.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What is the role of the community in this space?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, the community have to rise to it. There is no doubt about that but I am saying we need a collective effort with the police. We need to find some negotiating kind of a deal to assist to protect. The important thing is that they should be protected, we need to use all efforts. In the APP on page 71, we see that the number of ambulances will be increased from 247 to 249. The Blue Book also shows a 4,22 increase on the budget.

This shows the EMS will remain under-resourced and under-staffed. Our people will continue to wait hours for ambulances. The decrease in the budget for Sub-programme 3.2 is a recipe for disaster. To make matters worse this MEC then decreased the allocation of the EMS Training Colleges. I also cannot think of any justification for the decrease in the payment for capital assets under Programme 4.

The 7% increase in the budget for this Department will not have much impact on the poor people using our public health facilities. People in Khayelitsha District Hospital will continue to sleep on the floors and chairs. This is so because out of a budget of over R24 billion the DA is only allocating R511 million over the 2019 MTEF. R511 million.

When one looks at all the challenges in our health facilities we have to agree this is a [Inaudible.]. Mr Deputy Speaker, we are told that 27 health facilities will undergo major and minor refurbishment during this year. In the recent past two hospitals made headlines in the province. The first the closure rumours of Tygerberg Hospital because of dilapidating infrastructure. In response over R425 million is allocated over the 2019 MTEF. This is not enough and will not assist. The second hospital is the missing G F Jooste Hospital. The MEC must tell the people of Manenberg where the budget is for this one. [Interjections.]. I also have to raise my concern with regard to the decreased transfers and subsidies.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The nursing ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member your time has expired I will allow you to finish your last sentence please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Okay let me lastly say, in the past I have complained about this province blocking students from poor backgrounds from participating in Cuba's South African Doctor Programme. To me this represents a government that does not want to see a black child escaping the shackles of poverty through education. They have now taken this agenda ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ... to the next level with over 14 [Inaudible] in the budget for Sub-programme 6.3. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member, your time has already expired. The hon Minister to respond in the absence of the EFF and the other small parties. The Minister is next. Sorry, the Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, Deputy Speaker. I again rise to raise this side of the House' great concern at the absence of both the EFF and the ACDP in fulfilling their constitutional roles. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. It is noted. The Chair also

noted that. [Interjections.] Minister Mbombo you may respond.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you to the members for their input. Standing Committee Chair, thank you also for the contribution you have made, especially with regard to staff attitude. I always use this example: if you have 33 staff members or you have, I do not know how many, millions, but in primary healthcare facilities, you see about a 40 million head count. I am not including any others. We do not expect that everyone will have the same attitude. Just like a bag of apples, you will always have a rotten one inside. But what matters is how do we make people account? How do you throw away that apple, to identify that apple first so that it does not spoil the rest. It takes one matchstick to burn the whole forest. Hence we have got measurements in place. For example, the patient's voice. I think the member alluded to that too. We use hotlines where people, even if they do not have airtime, can use their phones to message a "please call me".

We do make use of the clinic committees which I am going to respond to, members of the community on hospital boards. We changed it completely. It is no use appointing someone to a board when they are not utilising that facility, who do not understand what is happening surrounding that facility. So they become their eyes and their ears. That is why we have layers and layers of processes or structures where people can raise their voices, for example the independent health committees and so forth.

One of the other crucial things is where everyone has got a name tag,

including myself, when I go the facilities, so that you can identify the person who has wronged you. You are able to do something about it immediately.

It is true hon member, we cannot politicise health, it is too important to be reduced to a political football. But as I go along I think I may need to respond to all of that. With regards to the appointment of clinic committees and hospital boards, in 2016 we amended the original from 2001 where we said now we need to go beyond the hospital boards to the facilities and clinics. In all of those facilities adverts were placed where anyone could apply. It did not say you must wear a T-shirt or you must have membership. It was open to everyone.

Firstly, it was advertised in community newspapers ... [Interjections.], all the national newspapers, all the radio stations and so forth. And then, secondly, we even extended it when we did not get much of a response. We even extended it. Thirdly, adverts were put in every facility for people to apply, for the clinic committees specifically.

Fourthly, the Standing Committee was given the task that if they knew of anyone who wanted to apply, then they could apply. So the people who have applied are the people who responded to the call, not to the Mbombo call [Interjections.].

Now with the hospital boards, it is in the Act. The Standing Committee has the responsibility to appoint the members of the Legislature that have been

recommended for that. So we have not done any appointments. What is supposed to happen is that you are supposed to fill all your community members. So we have done that. Therefore the member does not have evidence for what he is saying.

Now let's move onto politicising. He said we must not politicise TB ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I just want to thank the TB ambassadors, specifically the local ones like Miss South Africa, Tamaryn from Paarl, who is part of the local ambassadors and all the others. It just gives confidence to people to show that anyone can have TB. Our doctors even. That is why we have got the slogan that says 'behind the mask, we are all the same'. Even our doctors suffer from TB. As you know that Tata Mandela and Tata Bishop Tutu also suffered from TB.

In terms of recent awareness you might have seen that we have done the 'open the windows' theme at the taxi ranks. We have been into the trains where we are creating an awareness but what is different about this theme, which is an international theme, it is about where you mobilise religious leaders, parliamentarians, the legislators and the National Government. We did it at the Cathedral this time around. We have worked around that because we do not politicise health, we work together.

In terms of the grants, we acknowledge the increase in Programme 8 related to infrastructure but the whole of our budget does not talk to what is happening in terms of the population. I must just take some time to explain this.

In 2011 we had about 5,3 million people. Now we are at about 6,7 million people. In terms of the formulae that are being used at a national level, which we have raised now and again, the [Inaudible] sub-model, it looks in terms of counting the number of the population and then in that number they check which ones are insured and uninsured and then they allocate – I am talking about the equitable share.

Now, if there has been an increase in numbers in Mpumalanga and an increase in numbers in the Western Cape, you find a similar kind of allocation because it is based on the quantity but it does not take into consideration, for example, that in the Western Cape we have got central hospitals and in Mpumalanga they do not. Their people might only be coming for normal chronic conditions, communicable or non-communicable, but in the Western Cape we talk about injuries, traumas and personal violence which costs about R25 000 per person in terms of issues related to trauma.

In the Eastern Cape they talk about the battle where people come with eight bullet wounds and so forth, like it is a battlefield. It takes more, not only resources but actually everything, in terms of impacting on those who have to wait to undergo these surgeries. So that R200 that a person has been allocated

by National versus that the R200 allocated to that person in Mpumalanga does not talk to the same thing. You might get some chronic medication which is far cheaper compared to the amount we pay for a person because it is related to injuries and trauma. So the budget might look big to some but in real terms it is not actually. We have got a R187 million shortfall in the budget. [Interjection.]. The allocation of the budget is being politicised.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, no!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is being politicised. Even with all of these grants it is being politicised. The Western Cape [Inaudible.] retention. We have the most number of people being retained in the ART Programme. Whilst we may have the lowest HIV in terms of incidents, of course in terms of the prevalence it might be high but the issue, like you have mentioned now, is about TB. Previously we used to be the highest, the highest in the country but the Western Cape, Eastern Cape and the KZN, from the 2015 figures – actually KZN is the highest followed by the Eastern Cape and then us. But the issue of course for them, especially KZN is the issue of the twins, HIV and KZN but we must also acknowledge that it is now coming down because they are very rigorous when it comes to medical male circumcision.

What is different in the Western Cape, as I said, is we have the lowest HIV rate but some of the contributors are related to the loss of follow up because of seasonal workers coming in and going out of the country and so forth. But also ... [Interjections.] it is an academic exercise because the researchers still

have to find out exactly. But the mere fact that we have got one of the highest TB treatment success rates means that when people are diagnosed we are making a point that they must take their treatment and they get cured. That is what matters. It means they do not infect others. With the issue of mobility, people coming in and out of the province, they ended up losing them in terms of follow-up. But we will talk of those in my lecture 101 sometime. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is your job. It is not a lecture.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Then, with the issue of the ambulances, as the member has indicated it is a societal issue. It needs everyone, the whole of society. But what pains us is that the people who need these services the most are the ones who are also doing these things but again we are not saying that specifically. There is no evidence that they are specifically targeting the EMS.

We have seen police in police vans being targeted, like in the garage. We have seen police stations where the police have got actually security guarding them. We have even had some instances on the highways where they are not necessarily in the [Inaudible.] being attacked. So it is a reflection of the safety concern that is happening throughout society. But the EMS are being targeted because everyone knows that in that vehicle there will be medicine, there are only two people in that vehicle and therefore they become soft targets.

What matters though is about how we have managed, especially now, to make it a point that people pay for this. Instead of now reporting that there have been stolen phones, they have been attacked and then it vanishes we have made a point of making a case in the courts where people end up being convicted. It becomes a heavy sentence that we show actually it is not only about attacking this person but where you have impacted Aunty Sara where she cannot get an ambulance on time, managing priority one.

With regards to the issue of escorts, Red Zones and working with the police, maybe the member did not hear me, maybe his speech was already prepared so he did not want to deal with it. I mentioned that we do have the plan. We do work with the police and we know the Red Zones through intelligence. So they go via the police station, they are escorted but in some cases, one for example in the Gugulethu, where they will be escorted but when they enter inside that is when they are actually being attacked – inside. So the safety plan has been there, we work with the police. I mentioned the provjoints and whatever so the member should just go to the website and check our safety plan. [Interjection.].

I want again, to lastly, just thank everyone. It was good working with you. Thank you to the Standing Committee and thank you to the Department. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on this Vote. Business will now be suspended. Order, order, order! Business will now be suspended

until at least 14:15, the bells will be rung to indicate the resumption of business. The House is suspended.

[Business of the House was suspended and resumed at 14:19]

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon, hon members, guests in the gallery, the administration present here. We are going to proceed with the business of the day. I am going to call on the Secretary to read the fourth Order of the Day, which is Community Safety, yes.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 4 – Community Safety – Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 - 2019].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the Minister, Minister Winde.
[Applause.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. [Applause.] Thank you, Madam Speaker, I rise on Budget Vote 4: Community Safety.

Madam Speaker, the ultimate goal is to create a safer Western Cape for every single resident and visitor. We want this to be the safest province in the country, as well as on the African continent.

This process started, Madam Speaker, when I became Minister of Community

Safety in November, and this budget is the social contract in achieving that.

Madam Speaker, the situation in the province has reached epidemic proportions and for this reason we have to ensure that maximum citizen impact, which will make a difference in the lives of residents.

We only have an oversight mandate over the police, but we have started to, and will continue, to push the mandate to its limit.

I commend the former Minister and my colleague, Mayor Dan Plato, for his unwavering commitment to fighting crime in the province. Also the manner in which he, to this day, engages communities and not only to improve safety, but people's lives in general.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Like those empty [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is evident [Interjections.] in the allocation of R165 million to the Safety and Security Directorate in the City's annual adjustments budget, his first move when he got to be Mayor.

Madam Speaker, unfortunately our efforts are being derailed by the Minister of Police and the ANC-led National Government ... (intervention)

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... who is failing the people

[Interjections.] of the Western Cape. Mothers are burying their innocent children ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ag sies man.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh siss man.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... their toddlers.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sies, Alan.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Siss, Alan.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Children have to do their homework underneath the table in the kitchen [Interjections.] for the fear of being shot or hit by stray bullets. [Interjections.] Residents are being held hostage in their homes, fearing that they might be hit by a bullet or a gang attack [Interjections.] at any moment.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Social network, Alan, social network.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The reality in the province is,
Madam Speaker:

- Murder increased by almost 13%, from 3,311 in the 2016/17 year, to

3,729 murders in the 17/18 year.

Mr D JOSEPH: ANC.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, that is 10 murders every single day. [Interjections.] And then on top of that there is another 10 attempted murders every single day [Interjections.] under the watch of this ANC Government, because that is where the responsibility for policing lies. They have got the blood on their hands, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] of the province.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, between April 2013 and March 2018, Nyanga has consistently been the murder capital of the country. 1,273 people killed during this period. This is just in Nyanga, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Reports say - you ask why?

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because of the failing ANC Government. [Interjections.] The failing ANC Government lost it.

An HON MEMBER: Start with you.

An HON MEMBER: Instead of complaining, what are you doing?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, it obviously hurts. [Interjections.] Reports say for February alone, 25 people were killed in Mitchells Plain. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is too much noise, hon members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Since the beginning of the year [Interjections.] 20 people killed in Bonteheuwel alone.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And of course you would have seen one of councillors with a young boy of 5 years old, three bullets in his body in hospital, in a serious, critical condition. This is under the watch of this political party.

An HON MEMBER: You are the cause of all the crime in this province. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Between November 2018 and February 2019, Madam Speaker - this is from November last year to end of

February this year - 1226 people murdered in this province. [Interjections.]

In this province, Madam Speaker, and what are the police doing about this?

Ms M M WENGER: Very little.

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, if we have a look at the previous year, same period and now, hardly any difference in the numbers, yet in November we launched, what we have been calling for for 10 years, the Anti-Gang Unit. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You were calling for the army, Sir.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But still [Interjections.] we have not seen the impact ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You were calling for the army.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and the difference, and that again is this political party who runs ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You wanted the army.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... who runs that.

An HON MEMBER: You wanted the army.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, the hon member Richard Dyantyi [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Behave yourselves, member.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... has just said that we wanted the army. He is obviously not in touch with the people ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mind that finger.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... of this province.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He obviously does not walk the streets.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh really?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And you know, this ANC Government ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mind that finger.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... are very happy to send the army to other countries in Africa to do what?

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, yes!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: To do what?

An HON MEMBER: Peace-making.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Peace keeping.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is the army role.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Did you hear it? [Interjections.]

So why do we not get them to come and [Interjections.] keep peace here in this province? [Interjections.] Why do we not get them to come and keep peace ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... here in this province [Interjections.] so the police can go and do their work?

Mr K E MAGAXA: You must improve the living conditions.

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde ...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because you guys - and he lives in Durbanville, of course [Interjections.] he is totally out of touch [Interjections.] with what is happening on the ground.

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, may I request that you take your seat, please? Hon members, we have a right to interject, but too much interjection is drowning out the speaker, [Interjections.] and then, Minister Winde, if I can ask you to please address the Chair ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy, ja!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There it is, yes!]

The SPEAKER: ... when you speak, thank you.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There it is.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam? [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, Madam Speaker, can you also ask the hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] your Premier candidate.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ... to stop pointing at us.

An HON MEMBER: We have one, you do not have one.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hopeloos.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hopeless.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Because he is pointing at us [Interjections.] and as if we cannot do the same.

The SPEAKER: Alright, then you, hon member Tyatyam. Minister Winde, could you put your finger in your pocket, please?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But he was saying, he was pointing at you when you said they must stop pointing.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, yes, yes.

The SPEAKER: Yes. Do not worry about it, I ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will try to control my finger,

Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But, Madam Speaker
...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: For a long time.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that is murder in our
province. Let us talk about the abuse of women ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What are you doing about it?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... in our province.
[Interjections.] Let us talk about the abuse of women in our province.

An HON MEMBER: And children [Inaudible.] Children's Commissioner
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Over the same period our
women are also highly affected, with 25,796 cases of domestic-related crime
recorded. 4,744 cases of rape reported. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, you know, I visited a Thuthuzela Centre the other day, one of 7 in our province. When I visited the centre, this centre deals with, on an average of 300 women coming to look for help at this one centre, of which only 150 pluck up the courage to actually even lay a charge.

So in actual fact that number that I have just quoted is probably way less than even half of what is happening in our province every single day.
[Interjections.]

370 women are murdered; 279 children were murdered. This is 60 girls and 219 boys. We are under-resourced by 4,500 police men and women to get to a number that should be the average across the province - I mean across this country, so that we are all treated equally, but no, this political party that runs the South African Police Service out of Pretoria, decides to punish the people of this province and under-resource us.

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is absolutely true.
[Interjections.] It is absolutely true.

An HON MEMBER: You are misleading the people.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So now I have just heard from the hon member Dugmore that it is not true. Let me quote to you

...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... the numbers. I have got the numbers of every single police station, and you know what is quite scary? The hon member Dugmore is actually the one that raised this and I am quite happy to react to it.

So Nyanga, let us have a look a Nyanga.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Give us the provincial figure.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: 1:628 ...[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And compare it to national.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... but you know, I was in Grabouw the other day ...[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, give us the [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and when I was in Grabouw ... (intervention)

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Give us the [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... the police used the population ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Minister Winde ...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... rate ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, you cannot pose a question to the Minister across the floor.

Mr M G E WILEY: 15 times.

The SPEAKER: You have to - hon member Dugmore, you cannot ask a question across the floor, you have to do it through the Chair, please. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Madam Speaker, but I did hear the question, so I am reacting to it.

So in Grabouw, when I visited Grabouw the other day and in speaking to the station commander and the neighbourhood watches and the civilian oversight,

their numbers are based on 65,000 inhabitants of Grabouw, but as we have it right now in Grabouw, there is a Brenthurst Foundation Project that is being done there at the moment, and the first thing they did was get to the reality of the population numbers, and the population in Grabouw - while the police are basing their police resourcing numbers on 65,000, there are actually 113,000 people that live in Grabouw now.

So that shows you that not even these numbers that we are using - and perhaps I will give you one other area. Last night I was interacting in Table View, and in Table View the police stats number, and this comes from a question that was posed ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He was together with Dan Plato in that empty hall.

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So they are asking another question. They are asking another question, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

So quite frankly I know that Minister Bredell and Minister Meyer were with me and it definitely was not an empty hall. [Interjections.] But ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So you are working with Dan Plato?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... the official answer to us is one police officer to 506 people in the Table View area.

†'n AGB LID: Dis 'n skande.

[An HON MEMBER: It is a disgrace.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But in actual fact the oversight body as well as the local neighbourhood watches have finished their census, and it is actually one police officer to 965 now. [Interjections.] That shows you the growth rate.

Mr C M DUGMORE: What does STATS SA say? What does STATS SA say?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: STATS SA says what the SAPS guys base it on, and it is not the real population.

So in actual fact even ...[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Oh, so the neighbourhood watches were correct?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... even the numbers that they are giving us [Interjections.], even the number that they are giving us ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... is way under the real number.

So again, totally under resourced. The National Government, ANC, Minister Beki Cele, punishing the people of this province.

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, that is a lie.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Absolutely. Let us get to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, kindly take your ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... the Nyanga Station, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat, please. Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: That was a direct accusation against the Minister that he is telling a lie.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja. [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I did not say he is telling a lie.

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, where those [Interjections.] ... were those indeed the words you uttered, "That is a lie"?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I think I should withdraw that and say that he ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is "he"?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... is telling this House a deliberate untruth.

An HON MEMBER: Who is "he"?

The SPEAKER: That too is ...

Mr D JOSEPH: Who is "he"?

An HON MEMBER: Who is "he"?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. "Deliberate untruth" is as bad as a lie.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, the use of “deliberate” is considered unparliamentary as well. Kindly just withdraw, please. Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, could I withdraw and rather just use the word that he is telling an “untruth”?

Mr M G E WILEY: No, you cannot, it is not a negotiation.

The SPEAKER: It is not conditional, hon member Dugmore.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is not a negotiation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Just withdraw. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I obviously withdraw that as per your request.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore, accepted. Minister Winde, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, I will show very shortly how wrong the hon member Dugmore is, because I will actually show how even the Minister admitted to what I have

just accused him of. [Interjections.]

But before I get there, let us talk about [Interjections.] Nyanga.
[Interjections.] One police officer to 628. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is an election speech. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member - Minister Winde, take your seat. This is the budget debate. Every Minister has an opportunity to present a debate. The Opposition parties have an opportunity to respond, but you simply cannot howl and shout someone down, because it is the right of an individual to speak.

So you might not like what you hear, but please listen and try and cooperate. We have been together for nearly five years, let us not spoil it now, please. You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Maybe I will lower the tone a little [Interjections.] bit and maybe that will help.

An HON MEMBER: He must compose himself.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So I am just confused with another speech, because I heard that Fact Check got agricultural statistics

wrong at 62% success rate in land reform ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are not in that portfolio.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and in actual fact [Interjections.] 62% success rate in the land reform is actually wrong, because now the latest is at 72%. [Interjections.]

But we will come back to Nyanga, and the national average in South Africa is one police officer to 375. [Interjections.] Nyanga 1:628; Delft 1:642; Kraaifontein 1:609 [Interjections.]; Harare 1:745; Gugulethu 1:590; Khayelitsha 1:521; Mitchells Plain 1:472.

An HON MEMBER: Where are the social services for those many people? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: These are the numbers that are given to us in an answer, Parliamentary question answer from the Minister. This is the actual fact that the Minister gives us.

An HON MEMBER: They do not care.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Now the first thing that happened to really deal with these numbers, was an Equality Court challenge, and in the Equality Court challenge, Madam Speaker, the finding of that

court case was really damning against the South African Police Services and the Minister, and it found that in black and poor areas of our province we are way under resourced.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, you know that today [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And you know that it was quite interesting ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because it is elections.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that the Minister then immediately appealed the outcome of the court case, but as soon as he was challenged publicly, he publicly said, “No, I am withdrawing the appeal.”

You know, it took him six weeks to eventually get to withdraw that appeal. That just shows you the kind of space that he is in at the moment. He wants to appeal a finding of a court that says he, under his watch, are under resourcing poor and black areas when it comes to policing, and guess which areas they are? They are the murder capital of our country. They are the place where our people are hurting the most.

1,226 people in four months murdered in this province. Do we understand the impact that that has on families? The impact that that has [Interjections.] on mothers that are burying their children? [Interjections.] Do they even

understand that? [Interjections.] I do not think they understand that at all.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And then of course in trying to support this [Interjections.], while we are challenging this allocation and this resource [Interjections.], we also make offers of support, like let us put some money on the table. It happened in this House in the budget where I made money available for reservists ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Look who is joking.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... to try to make this ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Just listen who is talking.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... place safer.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi [Interjections.] ...

An HON MEMBER: You help to divide the police in this province.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Do you want an answer to that

one? Because I have got the emails. [Interjections.] And your name is on those emails, Mr Dugmore.

†'n AGB LID: Vertel vir hom.

[An HON MEMBER: Tell him.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So ...[Interjection.] I made offers R5 for reservists. We have [Interjections.] really - and perhaps maybe we should say ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Reservists!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh please [Inaudible.]]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that - perhaps maybe we should say, Madam Speaker, that in the space ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... of the comment that the hon member Dugmore has just made, which is very unfortunate actually, because it is a very, very serious issue. There are two sides in a fight amongst generals in our province. I am not take the side [Interjections.] amongst either of them. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Say it!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And if he wants to say it, then he must prove it, because you will see [Interjections.] how I have gone on both sides giving me information, sent it both to IPID and the Minister on a number of times, and we still have not seen any finality, and when that kind of fight is happening in your senior police echelons in a province - this is where it really shows that we should not be the oversight at a provincial level. The oversight should be at a national level like all democracies in the world.

Because right now the status of crime in our province is such that a Minister should be putting this province and its policing under administration.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But how can a province with an oversight role now put the National Minister and SAPS under administration ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... in this province. That is what should be happening right now, because it is such a disaster. It is such a disaster [Applause.] and it effects the people of our province.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA [Inaudible.] Legislature, you are joking.
[Interjections.] Please, man. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... I am going to move now to what this Department and the interventions that we have been busy with while we have this fight at a national level to actually get to real grips of how policing should be happening in a democracy, to make sure that we make this safer for the people of our province. That is a constitutional mandate that we as Government, whichever side of this House you sit, or which whoever side in government you sit, our position or in government, to make it safer for our people.

This Department has played the lead in the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game Changer and we have seen ...[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But you sell alcohol at schools.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... what is happening in that

space. [Interjections.] And again, listen to the hon member Dugmore. Every time he makes a statement, he really is looking for an answer, and it is totally untrue.

An HON MEMBER: That is a contradiction [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Secondly the [Interjections.] the support of neighbourhood watches in this province post the piece of legislation, the only province in South Africa that has its own piece of legislation covering oversight, and the support that we are giving to CPFs last year, nearly R2,5 million, and almost every single one of them now are in the process through the registration. We have now also in the support of our neighbourhood watches, more than 300 registered neighbourhood watches, and the support of them continuing post the December Cabinet decision that we also do not only give them their starter kits, but we also resource them, because of course they need bank accounts, they need to be able to procure for their own special needs, depending on where they are offering their volunteer services, so they get a R10,000 support once they have registered and are up and running, and that seems to be going very, very well, thanks to the Department for rolling that out.

The project Chrysalis, R13,327 million that they received during the 2017/18 financial year; an amazing programme. Again next time we have the passing out parade I again ask the members of the Opposition to come along and see how amazing this programme is. The difference it makes in young people's

lives.

If we look at the Youth and Safety Religious Partnership Programme which looks at school holidays, getting young kids off the street, making sure that they are safe during our Festive Seasons and our holiday seasons, and R6,219 million going to that programme; and really amazing when you interact with these various NGOs and churches on what they do, and the kind of operations they put in place from sports and camping, down to robotics. It really was amazing to see what they do and again thank you very much to the Department for the kind of work in establishing that partnership with civil society.

Our volunteer certification programme. Now that again is one of those offers that we made to Minister Beki Cele on how we could actually help policemen and women, because we are so under resourced. Could we offer perhaps some of the staff that work in this Government, the 84,000 people that work in this Government, are they able to volunteer to perhaps do administrative jobs within the police service?

We never got an answer on it, but what we did to is the Department itself said, "Well, let us actually do the project and run the project by ourselves."

So within the Department we did a quick survey who would be prepared to volunteer their time. We took some of our Chrysalis students and some of us went down and we starting spending time at the Cape Town Central police

station, after speaking to the station commander, and from 12 February to 4 March we assisted 2,582 persons with 4,216 documents being certified.

This again relieved policemen and women so that they could go out and do their job in fighting crime, and I can tell you and I will speak for myself, but I am pretty certain, and I speak also for those volunteers in the Department, that it really was an amazing time to be out there, seeing how you brightened up people's days who thought they were going to be waiting for four and five hours in a queue to get a certification to attend college or to make a job application, and they were helped very, very quickly. Really an amazing feeling of volunteerism, and I want to thank everyone of those individuals within the Department of Community Safety who gave up their time in volunteering in this programme and really show that it can work.

We also were involved in a Reward for Illegal Firearm. If you knew where an illegal firearm was hidden, you could actually report that and once the police had found that firearm, it would then have to go obviously through its ballistics, but they would report it to us and there was a R10,000 reward.

I can say to you that the first recipient of that reward, which really amazed me - and obviously these people's names must be kept confidential - once the recipient received his award, he actually donated that award again to his own neighbourhood watch in the region that he lives, so that they could put it towards licence recognition cameras.

That is really amazing and it shows the kind of commitment [Applause.] of people, the people in our province really trying to make a difference. [Interjections.]

But, Madam Speaker, we are here today [Interjections.] for a budget of ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] rubbish.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Which area is that? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are talking rubbish.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, for today we are here for a budget R359,301 million that goes to trying to make this a safer province.

This is a nominal increase of 4.99% and in the programmes:

Programme 1, Administration - R97,788 million

Programme 2, Civilian Oversight - R76,562 million

Programme 3, Provincial Policing Functions and

Programme 4, Security Risk Management

And, Madam Speaker, for this new financial year, we want to ensure maximum citizen impact, as we want to create a #SaferWesternCape.

So of course in this programme to promote police efficiency we have got the Police Ombudsman, also part of the legislation that we have put in place, with an allocation of R11,123 million and also to say this is an increase of 8% to ensure that community members who are receiving poor service, that we can actually have an eye on making sure that we improve that.

The monitoring and evaluation, which includes the Watching Briefs, and I will say a few things about that, but the Watching Briefs another R14,974 million, and again to the team that are out there on the Watching Briefs, thank you very, very much for what you do, because monitoring and evaluation plays a critical role and the recent Watching Briefs report, just for the period 1 October to 31 December 2018, found that 312 cases had to be struck off the roll due to dockets not being at court, incomplete investigations, unavailability of forensic reports and many other reasons. 312 cases.

These are serious cases, where individuals who have been arrested should have been convicted and face the consequences of their crime, and guess what? Due to shoddy workmanship, bad investigation - and one even wants to say to oneself: is it really bad investigation and shoddy workmanship, or is there actually a motive behind getting these 312 cases kicked out? Getting these 312 people not to face conviction, not to face the consequences of their crimes, and guess what, Madam Speaker? This tells us that in Nyanga was responsible for 20% of these dockets not being at court.

So in the murder capital, in the worst resourced space that the courts find where there is worst resourcing in black and poor areas, the actual processes in those same areas, when someone does get arrested, you have got the biggest chance of getting off scot-free. What kind of an indictment is that on this ANC Government and their resourcing and their policing in this country?

The PREMIER: It is typical, it is typical.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And that shows you what the role of an oversight is supposed to be doing, and that shows you the impact.

Now guess what? [Interjections.] The Minister, hon member Dyantyi, the Minister, then I reported ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am talking to the Premier.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... on this last lot of Watching Briefs and send it to him in writing to say - now he never-ever replies to us, but in this one, for once, he replied, and in actual fact what he did was he said, "This is how we need to have oversight," and he has now instructed - not asked, not called for a meeting - he has instructed all the other provinces to start implementing Watching Briefs. That shows you what the Western Cape can do. [Applause.]-

Madam Speaker, Programme 2: Civilian Oversight – which amongst others

seeks [Interjections.] to promote safety aimed at women and children, as well as facilitating the effective functioning of CPF's. We believe in a whole-of-society approach is the [Interjections.] approach to take.

WOSA receives an allocation of R5,7 million and there is further R2,5 million allocated to Wi-Fi, linking communities for greater safety. Because lots of communities out there are not able to report the crime because they have got no airtime, they have got no data, so now we have got a programme in empowering the community so that they can actually become effective when they are there reporting on crime that is happening, and especially where we have got kiosks in areas that we have no police station or a station nearby.

Madam Speaker, Programme 3: Provincial Policing Functions. It includes safety partnerships, and I am pleased with the increase of 55,84% and the allocation now of R45,436 million.

This allows, amongst others, the following allocations:

- R10 million for the EPWP programme.
- R4,159 million for the community stabilisation unit to assist in addressing and combatting the increase in violent protests; and
- R7,42 million to the Youth Religious Safety Programme that I spoke about in this past year.

Programme 4: Security Risk Management – seeks to provide strategic leadership, which includes making provision for the optimal use of electronic infrastructure and the accreditation of our neighbourhood watch formations.

Part of the strategic leadership goes to sub-programme 4.1. R17,1 million allocated to the establishment and support of a new K9 Unit. This is so that we can sniff out the drugs, the abalone, the weapons and anything else that is used to smuggle our region, that supports the gang and gangster economy at the moment, which is actually holding so many of our communities to ransom, and holding so many of our young people to ransom.

Madam Speaker, as also part of the sub-programme 4.1 is the allocation of R2,4 million to the professionalisation of our neighbourhood watches. We have got neighbourhood watches in our province who are very-very well resourced. They are right up here. They have got control rooms, they have got body cams [Interjections.], they have got number plate recognition, they have got lots of resources. We have got neighbourhood watches who walk at night, mainly women, keeping communities safe, and sometimes do not even have a torch.

So this programme is how we really level the playing fields, really start to support those neighbourhood watches to give them the pride, to give them the resourcing and the support that they can actually be recognised in this great work that they do as volunteers in effectively combatting crime, and where neighbourhood watches are working well, you can see the difference, you can

feel the difference.

So while the ANC might be forgetting about the people of this province, might be just allowing people to be murdered and raped in this province, we are supporting the people of this province [Interjections.] in those neighbourhood watches to make it better here. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have lost it, *boetie*. 36 days left.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, you are right.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker ...

An HON MEMBER: For you. For you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, can I also say [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that perhaps not spend too much time on it, but if you look at some of the research that is being done, the Inimai Chettiar research from the Brennan Centre of Justice at the New York University on how we are, “Adding more police officers, adopting strong and proven management techniques - which we are not putting in place

at the moment within our South African police service - we actually reduce crime.”

If we look at an article by a German Lopez, “6 proven policies for reducing crime and violence without gun control.” There we can see as well the same thing, it talks every single time to the gap in the system that we are seeing at the moment, where we have got police managed out of Pretoria, where they have got no idea what is happening on the ground. We are missing that management principle, and so these research documents go on and on and on, and that is why we are really pushing for a decentralisation of decision-making, of management of policing, and you make the oversight role at a national level.

We need to flick it on its head. We are the only democratically elected government [Interjections.] - the only democratically elected government that does not have this system of policing. We need to change that, not for the Western Cape, we need to change that for the people for South Africa. We need to change it for the whole country, for every other province as well.

And, Madam Speaker, lastly I really want to thank the HOD, Mr Gideon Morris, and all the staff in the Department. Thank you very, very much for what you do in making this a safer province within the framework, and within the resource that we have, for really pushing those boundaries and for accepting this task that we want to make it even safer. For all that you do, I really value your input. This Parliament, I would like to say also values your

input and dedication, and so do the people of this province. A safer Western Cape is what we need. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Can I also say to the Standing Committee ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Well done.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Can I also say to the Standing Committee thank you very much for your role, for your input, for your constant vigilance on also helping make this a safer province, and lastly to the staff in the Ministry - I am not sure if they can see me right now - but I want to say to them thank you very much for the early mornings, the late nights, the dedication also in making this a safer province under the circumstances, and we will continue to fight. Where it is broken we will continue to push, to fix where it is broken so that we actually do make it a safer province. The crime levels at the moment are totally unacceptable. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Department of Community Safety's budget is set to increase by 5% to a total of R359 million for the 2019/20 financial year, in comparison with the revised estimates of R342 million for the 2018/19 financial year.

The Department will receive additional funding over the 2019 MTEF for projects that will be implemented concurrently with the existing projects in support of creating safer communities. This includes the establishment of the K-9 Dog Unit and highway patrol safety initiatives. This new unit will have the ability to stop the flow of drugs into and out of our province. Criminals must see a great, big, red stop sign if they intend to use our roads to pedal drugs and poach perlemoen.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: For what is that now?

Ms M M WENGER: This budget, Madam Speaker, is a forward looking budget ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen!

Ms M M WENGER: ... and provides for innovation and the use of technology. [Interjections.] By provisioning for Wi-Fi zones and outreach activities and making data available for neighbourhood watches, as well as Community Police Fora, not only can awareness be improved and citizens armed with information to make them safe, but safety and security technology improves, as does coordination and responses.

In this budget civilian oversight is set to receive R76,6 million. This includes policy and research, monitoring and evaluation, safety promotion and community police relations.

As this House is aware, the Western Cape Government instituted the O'Regan Commission of Inquiry into a breakdown in the relationship between the police and the community of Khayelitsha. It is interesting to note that the ANC [Interjections.] claims that the DA Government did not implement the recommendations of this Commission.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Did you? Did you?

Ms M M WENGER: However, what they will not tell you is that the vast majority of the Commission's recommendations ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, the vast majority?

Ms M M WENGER: ... concern the SAPS and require [Interjections.] direction intervention and political will from the ANC National Government to make these changes within the SAPS.

The ANC will also not tell you that all these years later the Police Minister - all three of them - have still not signed the Memorandum of Understanding that the Commission recommends ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Wegner ...[Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: ... be signed to be able to cooperate.

The SPEAKER: Would you kindly take your seat, please? There is a member on the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can the hon member talk to us about recommendation 12 of the Commission ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... and speak to this, which is directly to this province.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, you are out of order. You have to ask me will the hon member take a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay.

The SPEAKER: Then I will ask the hon member and then you pose the question.

An HON MEMBER: He is a slow learner.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can I ask a question?

An HON MEMBER: No, we [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: So take your seat and I will check. Will you take a question, hon ...[Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: The hon member will not take a question. [Interjections.]
Take your seat please, thank you. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: We will perhaps focus on all the other recommendations aside from that one.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a provincial one.

Ms M M WENGER: But ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no-no-no.

Ms M M WENGER: ... the thing is that no one from the ANC speaks about the real policing issues and ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is running away from it now.

Ms M M WENGER: ... why there is no will [Interjections.] to actually

improve policing in Khayelitsha, even though it is their oversight responsibility to do so.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: They do not care.

Ms M M WENGER: It is almost as if the lives of the people living in Khayelitsha do not matter to the ANC. [Interjections.] Because if they did, if they did, the National Police Minister would have done everything possible ...[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is the truth.

An HON MEMBER: You are so out of touch with reality.

Ms M M WENGER: ... to ensure that policing is improved in Khayelitsha.

Let me remind this House that the Commission has found [Interjections.] and I quote:

“The evidence overwhelming suggest that the ...”
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: ... “... quality of detective work in Khayelitsha is very

poor. Many cases are simply not investigated properly or at all. The proportion of cases reported to Khayelitsha that result in convictions is tiny, possibly as few as 1%. Moreover, detectives very rarely provide regular and comprehensive feedback to complainants or bereaved family members.

There is a range of reasons for this:

- The first is that detectives are simply overburdened with work. Many detectives are carrying more than 150, some more than 200 dockets. It is not manageable.
- Detectives, for example, are not given SAPS email addresses, nor access to the internet.
- Detectives also fail to take dockets to court, which results in the charges being withdrawn, or the cases being struck ...”
...[Interjections.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Ms M M WENGER: ... “... off the roll.”

The Commission has established that there are dockets every week that do not get delivered to court. This is a serious inefficiency, they said, that has grave implications for

complainants, witnesses and family members.”

So the Department of Community Safety has taken this oversight seriously and used budget from the programme previously mentioned, to conduct Court Watching Briefs, to monitor precisely these grave policing failures at court, and so the institutionalisation of the Court Watching Brief Programme has been strengthened to ensure that serious cases are in fact placed back on the court roll. The programme has now been expanded to 42 district courts in the province, and not just Khayelitsha. By visiting various courts in the province to monitor police conduct and efficiency, the primary objective is to promote professional policing.

Now the latest report, which Minister Winde has referred to, shows that of these cases monitored in court, 168 were struck off the court roll, because investigations were not complete. This includes cases of assault, aggravated robbery, attempted murder, possession of a firearm, car theft, rape and murder. A rape case, a murder case, and in all other of these 168 cases, the matter was remanded, sometimes as many as three times, only to be struck off the roll because the investigation was not complete. 168 serious criminal cases [Interjections.] in which justice was denied.

Madam Speaker, on top of that, a further 182 cases were removed from the court roll because the dockets were not in court, and a further 48 cases ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We heard you say that before.

Ms M M WENGER: ... because the witnesses were simply [Interjections.] not subpoenaed. How can we even pretend [Interjections.] to have a criminal justice system if the very basics of police detective work is deficient? But will we hear a word about this from the ANC?

An HON MEMBER: Nothing.

Ms M M WENGER: Will we hear a word of how detective work by SAPS is failing us and failing victims of crime? Let us listen carefully to the ANC's contribution to the real policing issues in this province.

Madam Speaker, under Programme 3 Provincial Police Functions shows an increase of 43% for the 2019/20 financial year. The increase is due to the additional funds of R10 million made available in support of the EPWP programme.

Funding for the Youth Religious Safety Programme shows an increase of almost 10,5%, up from R6,7 million to R7,4 million in the 2019/20 financial year, and safety partnerships have an earmarked allocation amounting to R4 million.

This funding includes support for Community Police Fora, or CPFs as we know them as. The Department is again setting aside budget for Community

Police Fora to continue supporting these entities through training, support interventions and funding for work done through the expanded partnership programme, as well as matching grants.

We must congratulate the Western Cape Department of Community Safety which appears to be a leader in this regard.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms M M WENGER: Our peers in the Eastern Cape Department of Safety and Liaison, do not budget for CPFs at all. Instead the budget comes from the SAPS Visible Policing Budget ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Typical.

Ms M M WENGER: ... and even so, a sum of R135,000 was spent on CPFs in the Eastern Cape last year, and shockingly ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Hoeveel?

[Mr T A SIMMERS: How much?]

Ms M M WENGER: R135 000.

†Mnr T A SIMMERS: Daai is mos niks.

[Mr T A SIMMERS: But that is nothing.]

Ms M M WENGER: And shockingly, of this expenditure, 70% of the net spend was to pay for flights, meals and accommodation of one person. [Interjections.] Money for ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: For KFC.

Ms M M WENGER: ... was used for one [Interjections.] Mr Mceta to attend junkets across the country. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Finger licking good. Finger licking good.

An HON MEMBER: Typical ANC.

The SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Finger licking good.

Ms M M WENGER: And if we again [Interjections.] compare budgets and support between the Western Cape and our peers in the Free State, the Free State [Interjections.] Provincial Government budgeted R3,8 million in 2017/18 for CPFs, but [Interjections.] spent zero, and last year ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How much on KFC?

Ms M M WENGER: ... they budgeted half of that amount, R1,7 million, and spent ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They get KFC during load shedding.

Ms M M WENGER: ... zero.

An HON MEMBER: Zero?

Ms M M WENGER: They spent not a cent on CPFs in two years.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is your speech?

An HON MEMBER: That is the facts.

Ms M M WENGER: Which is [Interjections.] in comparison with the R1,4 million [Interjections.] actually spent on supporting CPFs in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Order! Both sides.

Ms M M WENGER: It is a disgrace that ANC Government have ignored and side-lined these very important legislated police oversight bodies.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms M M WENGER: CPFs play an important role in holding police to account and act as a crucial link between local policing agencies and communities.

Madam Speaker, in the budget cycle under review, the Department will continue encouraging CPFs and cluster boards to enter into a joint MOU based on the safety plans with municipalities. They will also be supported through training and matching grants.

The Department also proposes within Programme 4, by making additional funding available for neighbourhood watches, as the Minister has alluded to, so that over time neighbourhood watches can be resourced equally.

During this term this Department has punched well above its weight and has been a leader in community safety across the country. The Western Cape is the only province to have provincial oversight legislation. It is the only province to have a Police Ombudsman. It is the only province to run Court Watching Briefs.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Shame. It rhymes so well.

Ms M M WENGER: It is the only province with a [Interjections.] Safety Advisory Board. It is the only province with [Interjections.] legislated awards for meritorious service in safety and so the list continues.

This budget is [Interjections.] a stable and responsible budget that we are

leaving for the next administration and next term, and the Democratic Alliance supports this budget.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

Ms M M WENGER: But, Madam Speaker, as I conclude my final speech in this House for this term ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It must be your final.

Ms M M WENGER: ... it would be remiss of me not to say [Interjections.] a few thank you's. In absentia I wish to thank the ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Change is coming.

Ms M M WENGER: ... former Minister of Community Safety [Interjections.], Dan Plato, for his work over the years ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Change is coming. [Applause.]

Ms M M WENGER: I thank the Community Safety head of department, Mr Morris, and the Community Safety Department officials for their hard work and dedication, and for always being accountable to our committee, as

well as for providing reports and assistance in our oversight visits.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not like them, man [Inaudible.]

Ms M M WENGER: I wish to thank the Provincial Police Ombudsman's office, the Liquor Authority and the Cape Town Metro Police for having appeared before our committee on numerous occasions over the years, and for their transparency.

I equally thank Lieutenant-General Jula and the provincial SAPS management team for having appeared before our committee and for being accountable to Parliament.

I wish to thank the Standing Committee members for their constructive engagements and productive participation.

I also thank the Parliamentary staff, specifically Mr Waseem Matthews, Mr Mary-Anne Burgess and Mr Ben Daza, for their professionalism and assistance over the term.

I consider myself very fortunate for having had a chance to work with experts and colleagues of such high calibre, and finally, Madam Speaker, I thank Minister Winde, who in a very short space of time has made some remarkable changes and set the course for an even more impressive Community Safety Department. We look forward to welcoming him as the new Premier of the

Western Cape come 9 May. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. I now see the hon member Lekker.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou kom warm kole. Nou kom kole.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Now the hot coals come. Now coals come.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, afford [Interjections.] your member ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals!]

The SPEAKER: ... an opportunity to speak. Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Number one on the list of Premier [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: The killing of [Interjections.] ...

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole! Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals! Throw coals!]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] Premier candidate.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle is bang.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are scared.

The SPEAKER: Order, please!

Ms P Z LEKKER: The killing of Tori Shortemane in Limpopo should ring alarm bells for the province. I say this because young people in the province are targeted and recruited by gangs to be hitmen.

Secondly, in Nyanga, Philippi, Guguletu and Khayelitsha, young people are attacking each other with pangas and knives on their way to and from school. This has now also made its way to the schools around the CBD and in Claremont.

The hon Zille Commission made a recommendation for multi-sectoral ...[Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: That is not the name.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... task team on youth gangs.

Mr D G MITCHELL: That is not the name.

Ms P Z LEKKER: MEC Winde [Interjections.], as one of the longest serving members of this House, knows about this recommendation. He must tell the parents of Khayelitsha whose children are in danger of being killed on their way to and from school, when he is going to implement this recommendation. The recommendation was clear: that DoCS should establish and lead this task team.

So the MEC must not tell us about the National Anti-Gang Strategy, the recommendation was on youth gangs.

The Walking Bus Programme and the Safe School Call Centre are not assisting. Safety is not a police responsibility only.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Ms P Z LEKKER: The MEC must tell us about exactly what he is going to do to realise the PSG-3, namely increasing wellness, safety and tackle social issues.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mmm, that is it.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thus far he has not ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Those are real issues.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... done anything significant besides grandstanding ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... we were subject to a few minutes ago.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Election year.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The MEC and the Department are doing little to tackle social ills. The DA's only solution to crime is the deployment of the army. This has a bitter taste for we know how the army dealt with our people in the 80's. [Interjections.] People were killed, men and women were raped under the state of emergency.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is not the same army, it is a new army.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The ANC will not subject communities to this torture every again. [Interjections.]

Allow me to also commend the SAPS for the work it has done through Anti-Gang Unit and other operations, like Operation Thunder.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is the ANC's army.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Coming to the Blue Book. The total budget for this Department is not enough to ensure [Interjections.] safety and tackling social ills. This is so because the crime gangsterism issue mainly affects the poor and not the DA constituency.

To see this you need [Interjections.] to look at the top 10 murder stations across the country. The majority are those in the Cape Flats, Nyanga remains a murder capital and Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha, and Harare feature prominently in the list.

The people of the province are looking at the Provincial Government for answers not excuses as to why the above is the case. Instead of providing solution, the DA Government is fuelling the crisis.

Firstly, Madam Speaker, Khayelitsha will not get a cent from the City's R62,5 million budget ...[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daarsy!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go!]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... for public lighting. [Interjections.] The hon Zille Commission also made it clear that lack of adequate lighting contributes to crime.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There you go.

Ms P Z LEKKER: This is then one of the ways ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because you cannot allocate money [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... in which the DA is failing [Interjections.] to ensure safety. [Interjections.]

Last week MEC Winde ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must be ashamed.

An HON MEMBER: No, shame on you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must be ashamed.

An HON MEMBER: No-no, you must be.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Last week MEC Winde challenged to make his views on the Glomix House Brokers CC of R43 million housing tender. Today is an opportunity for him to tell the public whether she agrees with the tender or not.

Gang killings are a serious challenge in the province. We cannot have a silent MEC when his government is aiding gang murders in the province.

The Department of Health, in its APP, explained that there has been a huge increase in gunshot injuries during interpersonal violence. It is stated that while the workload norm of autopsies or specialist is 350, provincial staff are doing between 800 to 950 per specialist per year. This is the legacy of the DA through its failures to ensure safety in the province. I always maintain that he is misplaced in this Department.

Ms P MAKELENI: Exactly.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The DA thought it was giving its poster boy an opportunity to shine. Little did they know that they were exposing him and his understanding of safety.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So true, so true.

Ms P Z LEKKER: To the DA safety is a ticket for cheap political scoring.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

An HON MEMBER: Now what are you doing?

Ms P Z LEKKER: MEC Winde ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is it.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... and the DA [Interjections.] do not care about the lives of the poor.

A few minutes [Interjections.] ago we heard in this House ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And your Premier candidate.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... that the SAPS does not do adequate investigation of dockets. As a result the cases are withdrawn and the criminals are walking free. I want to state again that MEC Winde is misplaced.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Jip!

Ms P Z LEKKER: Cases are provisionally withdrawn and as an when SAPS gets its technical evidence ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He would not know that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... from some of the Department of Health, they get it ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He would not know that.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... at the time it has been withdrawn provisionally.
[Interjections.] Gangsters, crime people are not withdrawn.

An HON MEMBER: From experience.

Ms P Z LEKKER: They [Interjections.] will come back as we receive the documents [Interjections.], reports from the office ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Talking for experience.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... of the MEC of Health.

Ms M M WENGER: Are you defending a 1% conviction rate?

Ms P Z LEKKER: The 10,8 decrease in the budget [Interjections.] for Programme 2 ...[Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: That 1% is enough?

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... civilian oversight, shows how this Government is failing the poor.

Ms M M WENGER: And 3% gang murders is [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: MEC Winde always tells us that he has an oversight

responsibility and that his job is not [Interjections.] policing.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Programme 2 is the programme that [Interjections.] you do oversight. Under this programme you have the monitoring and evaluation which monitors police conduct. The budget for this sub-programme has been decreased. Under this programme you also have safety promotions, which deals with the implementation of safety programmes with an emphasis on youth, women and children.

Western Cape recorded the highest number of murders; women and children. MEC Winde's response to this is to decrease the budget for safety promotion by over 14%.

Then, Madam Speaker, under this programme, you have community relations, community police relations, which administers and manages the EPP, a payment model for CPFs based on performance.

The over 24% increase is welcomed. However, the challenge remains between the relationship of the police and the Department. The genesis of this breakdown in relationship was the introduction of this EPP. The introduction of the EPP is an attempt by this Department to capture the CPFs ...[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yebo!

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... and to force them to spy on SAPS.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Ja!

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Ms P Z LEKKER: CPFs that do not cooperate will be purged by not being given funding. To receive more funding a CPF will have to provide details, briefs, to the Department on the failures of SAPS.

The Department knows the consequences of this as they listed them in the APP under “risk management” on page 65. It is like to result in a non or limited functioning of CPFs, as it is happening as we speak.

The priority of this Department is the partnership that it is funding under sub-programme 3.1, which has been given an over 55% budget in the budget.

The sub-programme also has Chrysalis Academy as well as the Safety and Religion Partnership Programmes. I do not need to repeat my views on this programme, suffice to say the issue of gangsterism will never end for as long as millions are thrown into ineffective programmes. Let us invest in community partnership that will keep our streets safe and ensure safety of our schools.

The EMS personnel are attacked on a daily basis in the province. What is the Department doing about that? Absolutely nothing, because money is used to pay for children's holidays.

In the sixth administration we will have to conduct a proper evaluation [Interjections.] of these programmes. We will have to determine their impact. The Court Watching Briefs should be also be added here. We continue to throw money, yet we do not know its impact.

Programme 4 of this Department takes a large chunk of the budget, the neighbourhood watches are under this programme. The MEC continues to accredit, strengthen neighbourhood watch structures while continuing to purge the CPFs through EPP.

In fact, Madam Speaker, we must say that there is no truth to what the Democratic Alliance is driving, because in the Western Cape the police ratio is better than that of the national average in terms of the provincial capacity and national, which is 1:324. If the support personnel and police officials are included, it will be a better average. In fact we must also ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... say it here ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... kindly take your seat, there is a member on the floor. Hon

member Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am checking if the hon member can just take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, will you take a question?
[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: I will, Madam Speaker. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, the hon member will take a question. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Did [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, please! Allow the hon member to pose his question.
[Interjections.] You may proceed hon member.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, with your permission, hon member Lekker [Interjections.], did I hear you correct when you said ...[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: No, you did not.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... the Khayelitsha Zille Commission [Interjections.], amongst the findings it found, was that part of the contributing factor

[Interjections.] to crime in Khayelitsha was ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you making a statement [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... was the absence ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... of streetlights?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And did I get you correct - this is a question, that is a question.

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Dyantyi [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please protect me.

The SPEAKER: Please direct your question to the Chair.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Redirect ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: And not make a statement ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja.

The SPEAKER: ... but pose a question. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here is the question ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Repeat the question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... I am ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... I am asking ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Joseph, as soon as hon member Dyantyi is finished I will take your point of order.

An HON MEMBER: He must first ask for leave.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you, Madam Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Just ask your question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... for that protection.

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you for that. I am asking hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Point of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the point of order? [Laughs.] [Interjections.] †Ek weet dit byt. [I know it bites.] I am asking hon member Pat Lekker did I get her correct ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is the question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Did I get her correct ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Ask a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... when she says [Interjections.], when she says

...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: How many questions?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... in the Khayelitsha Zille Commission ...[Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: How many questions?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: .. part of the findings was that the absence of streetlights is a contributing factor to crime ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So is that your question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... and that now she says [Interjections.] in the R62 million which has just been allocated now [Interjections.], nothing has been allocated to Khayelitsha for street lighting which comes out of that?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Did I get you correct, hon member Pat Lekker?

The SPEAKER: Okay, sorry [Interjections.]. Yes, Chief Whip Wiley? [Interjections.] Sorry - hon member Lekker [Interjections.], before you

answer [Interjections.] ... No, I have afforded hon member Joseph the opportunity. Order, please!

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Before the hon member answers, there is no such thing as Khayelitsha Zille Commission. [Interjections.] It is wrong, it is the wrong name. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr D JOSEPH: There is no such commission as Khayelitsha Zille Commission. There is no such commission.

The SPEAKER: That is noted. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are lousy.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, on a point of clarity, the point has been made, there is no such thing as [Interjections.] Khayelitsha - so, hon member Lekker - sorry, Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can I get clarity?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The question needs to be answered by Pat Lekker.

The SPEAKER: Yes? But we are still busy with points of order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, okay, okay.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can I get clarity, Madam Speaker?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, just today. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Can an ordinary member ask a question to an ordinary member?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Under which rule? Under which rule? [Interjections.] No, under which rule? [Interjections.] Under which rule? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, Minister Madikizela, you put me on the spot now, I will have to find out which rule, and if it can indeed [Interjections.] ... I will have to take guidance from the Table staff and revert. Thank you.

Those are the points of order. Hon member Lekker, you may proceed. I think the question ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You still have your time left.

The SPEAKER: I think the question posed was a simple yes or no ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You can respond to that [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: May I check how much time do I have? Considering this [Interjections.] thing.

The SPEAKER: You actually have 15 seconds when we stopped the clock. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, he asked a question.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Okay. [Interjections.] Indeed, Madam Speaker, the R62,5 million budget does not cater for lighting.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Jô.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Now let me come to the issue of the R5 million that MEC Winde brags about. I think it is important that we note that the R5 million reserved for reservists, is nothing but a ploy and nothing but an

electioneering strategy for the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.] I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker, your time has expired, thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: And the R56 million for [Inaudible]

The SPEAKER: Can we get some order in the House, please? [Interjections.]

Both sides of the House, please. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The worst performing MEC [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not even have [Inaudible] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is your Premier candidate? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We do not do those things. [Interjections.] We do not do those funny things.

The PREMIER: Where is your Premier candidate? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Can we - hon members, may we proceed after all your deliberations? Minister Winde, you are recognised, you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes, it is now or never.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. First of all to the hon member Wenger for her role as Chair, but also in her contribution in the debate, also again highlighting the K-9 Unit ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, will you kindly take your seat, please? Hon member Lekker is on the floor. You are standing.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to check if the MEC can take a question.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Okay. If you take your seat I will ask the MEC. Minister Winde, will you take a question? [Interjections.] The Minister will take a question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because he does not have any response.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to get an understanding from MEC Winde whether his standing intention of putting the R5 million every year for the recruitment and the payment of the reservists?

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker. Minister Winde, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much. I will see if I get to that when I do my reply. [Interjections.]

But the [Interjections.] - hon member Wenger, thank you very much [Interjections.]. The K-9 Unit obviously is a start, because while we understand that we have an oversight role, we cannot just be oversight when we have the kind of crime, the kind of gangsterism, the kind of effect that we have on society in this province, we have got to go further, we have got to do more and that is why beyond our mandate we are starting to put these units, for example the K-9 Unit, in place.

You also spoke about the O'Regan Commission, which obviously kind of gets mixed up on the other side of the House often, and three years and still no MOU, and it really shows you that whether it is that Commission of Inquiry, whether it is a judicial process where a judge comes out after the Social Coalition Courts ruling, where a judge takes a ruling. You can actually see that Minister Beki Cele, the ANC and the National Government do not take the safety of our people seriously whatsoever, because they take so long to even take recognition of something like a commission like that, and ...[Inaudible.] nothing happening.

You mentioned the Watching Briefs, and I think I am going to talk a bit more about the Watching Briefs when I answer the hon member Lekker, so I will leave it over until then, but you also then spoke about two other provinces where you mentioned how other provinces are specifically looking at the support of CPFs, and we heard now the hon member Lekker and the way that she was talking about CPFs, and it is interesting, because the hon member Lekker obviously - I am not sure how long she has been a member of this committee, although we are reaching the end of a term, one would presume it has been ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Right back at you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... for five years, but she obviously does not understand the legislation of the regulation ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Right back at you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and what role a CPF actually has to play and how it is supposed to be non-political, and the role that it is supposed ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And you understand it?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... to play in oversight itself

...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Right back at you. You do not even know the court procedures.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and support for SAPS and she obviously, by the way that she was speaking, she has no clue whatsoever ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh, you do [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and in this province, if you have a look at the process this Department has been following ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are clueless.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... around CPFs - and when you attend the board - I am not sure if she has ever attended a board meeting of the CPF - but when you attend that board you speak to their Chairperson ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: I do, and your people are never there.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... who is very political

...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You just happened to be there the last time.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... but interesting when I attended the last board meeting ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ja, that was the first and the last.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... when I attended that meeting ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and one wonders, this hon member, whether she actually did not, she did not seem to make much use of her time, because she seems to be wanting to make use of the time now while I am speaking - but it is ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ja, because you are talking nonsense.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... obvious that the politicisation of that body ...[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Which is what you wanted.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... is a big concern for the ANC, because in actual fact when we do it properly, when we do it according to the rules and the law, then quite frankly that should not be politicised at all, and we have worked very hard to make sure that it is not, and it is very interesting to watch that space, how it is evolving over time and I really believe if we continue to work the way that the Department is working with them, that we are going to develop a body that is going to be beneficial to making sure that we fight crime in this province.

I want to say that the hon member, and it was interesting how she got a question from her own back bench ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... but it [Interjections.] was a bit of deja-vu when I saw that question. When I saw that question I actually thought it was Zinski asking a question of Rasool.

Mr D JOSEPH: Oh my word.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because I saw like one faction, the outgoing faction ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, we are going to be missing him.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... asking a question of the incoming faction.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not like the question that [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The outgoing faction, where I looked on the list - I have got their list here, I did not find his name once on this list ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not like that. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... for this province. Number 64, but I saw that the hon member who spoke is number 1 on the provincial list. One would imagine that she is the Premier candidate. [Interjections.] But she brought up ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, we bring them young.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... but she brought up [Interjections.] our school safety programme ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the province.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and of course it is really interesting to have a look at that School Safety Programme and how it interacts with those schools, how it monitors how many students actually belong to which gangs. It is really interesting when you read the documentation, when you see the kind of work that is happening, and you see the kind of fight that we have got at the moment in trying to make our schools safer, and really I commend this programme and thank the partnership between the Department and the Department of Education and they really are working very hard to make our schools a safe space.

I know that the Minister of Education and I visited a school the other day, and it is amazing to see when you visit classrooms and the police are actually doing their searches [Interjections.], taking arms, weapons, drugs, etcetera [Interjections.], but a really funny note was a young girl [Interjections.] had a knife on her ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: A young girl had a knife on her when we were at a school the other day, and the knife got confiscated by the police [Interjections.] - oh, she had - ja, they got told, "Before we search your bags, have you got anything to hand in?" and she handed in this knife, and here is this young girl handing in a knife, so the hon Minister of Education [Interjections.] went up to her and said to her, "What have you got a knife for?" [Interjections.] She said, "It was to cut my mango."

[Interjections.] It was to cut her mango. [Laughs] But she had to hand it in. Anyway, the poor girl.

But getting to the army [Interjections.]. You have heard a lot of ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Minister Winde, there is a private conversation between hon member Magaxa and Minister Madikizela that is actually drowning ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: No-no, apology, apology. It is actually the Doc. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Oh, is it the good Doctor? Alright, okay. So ...[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He said he liked me and I said that I appreciate it.

The SPEAKER: Oh, alright, thank you.

The PREMIER: Someone liked you? What?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Just like you, Premier. I think ... [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: It is a good thing. Hon member Magaxa [Interjections.] ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are only jealous.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, it is a good thing. It took them five years to like you, you should feel flattered. You may proceed, Minister Winde. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, this outgoing team is getting bigger and bigger, Madam Speaker. But anyway.

There has been a rethoric in the speech around army. Even the hon member Lekker had to bring up the army again.

Ms P Z LEKKER: †Ewe, [Yes.] †That is what you want.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And it is really interesting that, in this country it was not so long ago that the Emfuleni Municipality actually used the army ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are still using them.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... when they were doing their water infrastructure.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And you know that is in this very province and this really shows me ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We use the army in Mozambique.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... this really shows me that these members [Interjections.] have not got a clue of what is going on in the real difficult spaces where gang violence is terrorising families every single day. [Interjections.] They are obviously out of touch with the community. They obviously have not walked the streets.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Really?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because when you walk the streets [Interjections.] - when you walk the streets it is the people [Interjections.] that say to you ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You never walk the streets.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... “We are desperate, we want the army,” [Interjections.] and I want to ask them now, can any of them say when last was the army deployed in the Western Cape? [Interjections.] When last was the army deployed in Western Cape? [Interjections.] It was deployed in 2011 [Interjections.] ... It was deployed in 2011 ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... in Lavender Hill
[Interjections.] to calm down the gang violence. [Interjections.] And the
people remember that. [Interjections.] The people remember that.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, you are howling. Sorry ...[Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: But the Minister is howling.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is howling. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, across the board, you cannot engage in this
way.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: It is undignified and it really [Interjections.] does not bode
well. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is your Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, you are right, that is the Premier, yes.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Premier-in-waiting. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, you have had [Interjections.] - hon member Lekker, you have had a speaking opportunity of 10 minutes. Will you ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: But I did not shout at anyone. [Interjections.] You are shouting. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: If we could all just compose ourselves ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Huh-uh!

The SPEAKER: ... and calm down, and then you may proceed, Minister Winde. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not shout.

The SPEAKER: And please talk to me, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: You see, there you go again.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You see, I am trying to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni ... [Interjections.] He is speaking to me, hon member Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: But he is gawking at me. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, I am going to speak quite calmly. [Interjections.] I am going to speak quite calmly, but unfortunately if I do get drowned out from that side of the House, I will have to raise my voice to be heard ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You always shout.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... but the hon member raises the issue of the army [Interjections.] ... and when I come in and I address the issue of the army, then she freaks out and starts screaming and shouting, so it causes me to raise my voice, but she raised the issue of the army and I am now telling her when the army came in last into Lavender Hill and you speak ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You raised the army yourself.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... to people in Lavender Hill [Interjections.], they say to me, “Please ...” ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It has been a DA [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... “... we are desperate, because the police are not able to do their jobs ...” ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] is a social issue.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... “... so please [Interjections.] bring some extra support, because we are desperate ...” ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a social problem.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... “... waking up in the morning to gunfire, going to bed at night with gunfire. It is unacceptable, it is unsafe, our people are dying like flies, and the ANC does not care a damn.”

Mr D JOSEPH: Ja, ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, then moving to the next point. The hon member raised ...[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You fail then you blame the ANC for your failures.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The hon member raised [Interjections.] ...

Ms P MAKELENI: It is your own failures. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni, I have a duty to protect the Minister. You cannot do that.

Ms P MAKELENI: Do what? I interject.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makeleni [Interjections.], please. Interjections are allowed, but the rate at which you have been going this last five, seven minutes - thank you. [Interjections.]

Minister Winde, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Then the hon member [Interjections.] ... Then the hon member raises the next issue [Interjections.], and what she raises [Interjections.] is public lighting.

Now we have dealt with this in the House before [Interjections.], because ...

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Minister Winde, kindly take your seat, please.

[Interjections.] Hon member Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I see [Interjections.] a page [Interjections.] with a logo of an organisation. Is that allowed?

The SPEAKER: I would not know what is on the page.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly. That is the ANC logo.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: It is a free advert for the ANC, it is [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Okay, sorry, Minister, I do not know what is on your page, but if it is offensive then I would recommend that you not use the page as a shield. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is quite offensive, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Oh, okay. I am really sorry then.

An HON MEMBER: Can you see? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. [Interjections.] Maybe take a blank page, please, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, it is the Basasa AGM attendance list.

An HON MEMBER: It is the AGM attendance register. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. [Interjections.] Hon members, time is going on. There are still two votes to be deliberated. It is a serious matter. Can we get on with the business of the day? [Interjections.] Please compose yourselves. Minister Winde. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, there are two - there are actually [Interjections.] three more issues I want to speak about.

The first one is that the hon member Lekker raised the issue around public lighting and I agree with her, but you know she RSVP'd [Interjections.], she RSVP'd to come to the SAFA Conference, she did not pitch. If she had come to that conference [Interjections.] she would have seen the presentation on street lighting and how we really have got to become much more innovative. We have got to become much smarter with [Interjections.] how we put street lighting specifically in poor and informal areas. [Interjections.] We are busy working on that at the moment. It was an amazing presentation ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: That is what you always say.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and if she just pitched when she said she would pitch [Interjections.], she would have seen it, but she can still go onto the website, she can still [Interjections.] download the presentation, it is a really good presentation, Madam Speaker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I walk the streets.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And then the last thing ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: I do not need [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: She does not walk the streets, because I have never seen her once. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, the next thing is ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: You never see me because you do [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: .. that she spoke about the Watching Briefs, [Interjections.] and quite frankly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker ... Chief Whip Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Ja, please. She was the one contesting about [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] from the bank there. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is speaking to the Speaker [Inaudible.].

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You just stand [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, I cannot determine what and how the Minister is going to respond. You had an opportunity to speak, you were afforded the space, the silence, the time to speak. Please afford the Minister an opportunity ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I request to speak?

The SPEAKER: ... to respond - yes, you may.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can I address you, Madam Speaker? [Speaking in vernacular] In his comment he says I do not walk the streets, and I want to clarify him [Interjections.] through you, Madam Speaker, that ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: But you cannot ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... I walk the streets and he only [Interjections.] goes to Table View ...(intervention)

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, that is not ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: He goes to Table View and not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, that is not a point of order.
[Interjections.] That is a debating point, I am so sorry. Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: He must leave the bodyguards and walk on his own.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, compose yourself, please.
[Interjections.] Minister Winde.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I think the Minister is over-excited.

An HON MEMBER: He is a joke. Really.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And he is doing his job.

Ms P Z LEKKER: He is making a joke about the streetlights [Inaudible.]
there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: If we ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ended up in court. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I want to see [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: If - hon member Magaxa, if you could just get your bench just to calm down, then we might get some serious [Interjections.] ...

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am the coolest guy. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: You are indeed calm today, hon member Magaxa. Minister Winde, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am not excited like him.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The hon member must not ask questions in her debate and then not expect to get an answer.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So the last point that she raised ...[Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: And if the answer is not true?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... was around the Court Watching Briefs. The Court ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: Must you accept that and say thank you? I am not a “*Ja Baas.*” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry.

Mr M G E WILEY: Can we please go to the next action, Madam Speaker, and [Inaudible.] to leave.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Do not tell the Speaker what to do. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It is not your place. It is not your place.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker ...

Mr M G E WILEY: She is out of control.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, that is the best [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: There is the issue of the dignity and decorum of the House. Every statement the Minister make you respond with an interjection, which

you are allowed to in terms of your freedom within the House, but it is becoming disruptive to the point that I have to ask the Minister to sit down or I need to ask for order. Can we just afford the Minister the opportunity to finish his responses to the statements that were made, please?

You may proceed, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much.

The last point that I want to raise that the hon member Lekker spoke about is the Court Watching Briefs, and the Court Watching Briefs, when the Minister Beki Cele said, “Thank you very much, this is a great programme,” he acknowledged that there is this massive failure on investigation and getting criminals that are arrested, through a process to get to a conviction and consequences for a crime, and by accepting that this Court Watching Brief is the mechanism that is really showcasing the weak points, or the weakest link in our system, that showed that there was at least commitment that the Minister even sees there is failure in this space and saying, “We actually need to adopt that,” and I know that people were excited when I mentioned it earlier on in the speech, but it really is. It is a huge step forward in policing in our province, it is a huge step forward in dealing with crime in our province and that last point - I notice the hon member Lekker was not very - there was not much ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Lekker.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, she was not very “*lekker*” about that. Her commendation was not too good, but the Minister’s acceptance is what we really thank him for. If that is the only thing we get right now in the last couple of months, it means a huge amount, because the kind of 3% conviction rate in gangs is just unacceptable, because crime is out of control and this is a process brought about by this Department and dedication from men and women who go out there to make sure that we hold those that are the perpetrators of massive, disgusting crime in our system to account.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you for holding [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And we get them through a process. So it is really an amazing piece of work, and I really thank everybody involved in that.

And then lastly, Madam Speaker, what I want to say is [Interjections.] I want to give a message, because this debate and generally in this House [Interjections.], what we speak about in this House is the mismanagement out of Pretoria, the failure of the ANC and we really attack the South African Police Service ...[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: You are a loser, Sir.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... because they are not

delivering a safer society.

Mr K E MAGAXA: And you affect the DA.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But my last message is: there are still so many really good men and women [Interjections.] in the South African Police Services, and I want to thank them. Despite the difficulties, despite the space in which they operate, despite the hectic space and going to work, they do not even know if they are coming home [Applause.], I want to thank them, those people who day and night work damn hard to help us towards a safer society. [Interjections.]

And then, Madam Speaker, this is the last time that I am going to be speaking in this House in this portfolio ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... it is the last time, and this portfolio - just hang on a second. [Laughter.] It is the last time in this portfolio [Interjections.], I want to thank everybody [Interjections.], the Opposition, those small parties that have been missing for the last while and specifically my colleagues here in the Democratic Alliance in these benches. Thank you for the last five years, for the term, [Interjections.] the Government officials, all those support agencies [Interjections.], thank you very much. It has been a great five years, and I am really looking forward to

the next five. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Winde. That, hon members, concludes the debate on this Vote. The bells will be rung. The House is suspended for three minutes for the administration to vacate and to come back into the Chamber, thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended at 15:40 and resumed at 15:44]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please be seated.

The Secretary will read the fifth order of the day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government – Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 - 2019].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see Minister Bredell.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, agb Premier, agb Kabinetskollegas, lede van die Wetgewer, die burgemeesters vandag teenwoordig, die departementshoof en die amptenare van die Departement, baie welkom en baie dankie vir die geleentheid.

Die Wes-Kaap Departement van Plaaslike Regering het verskeie pligte en

mandate, maar die een ding wat alles onderskryf, die fondasie van ons bestaan, is om te verseker dat al ons mense 'n menswaardige lewe kan leef - *a dignified life*.

Ons het in die Departement met verskeie rampe gewerk, onder meer Wupperthal se brande oor Kersfees, die brande in Khayelitsha, die brande in Knysna, George-brande en die mees onlangse brande in Hermanus, om maar enkeles te noem, en nou het die wiel skynbaar, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, gedraai soos wat ek hier staan met die elektrisiteitskrisis waarvan die einde onbekend is. Die kans is al groter dat die land afstuur op 'n nasionale ineenstorting van die kragnetwerk. Die ANC het oor die afgelope nege jaar ons land tot op die randjie van die afgrond bestuur.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, hon Premier, Provincial Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature, heads of departments and guests of honour, good afternoon. The Western Cape Department of Local Government has various obligations and mandates, but one thing that underwrites it all, the foundation of our existence, is to ensure that all our people can lead a dignified life.

We have worked with various disasters in the Department, amongst others with Wupperthal's fire, the fire in Khayelitsha, the Knysna fires, the George

fires and the recent Hermanus fires, to name only a few. And the wheel has now apparently turned and as I stand here the country again is in an electricity crisis of which the end is unknown. The chance is becoming greater that the country is heading towards a national collapse of the power network. Over the past nine years the ANC has governed the country to the edge of the abyss.]

†Die PREMIER: Ja!

[The PREMIER: Yes!]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die party se hoofverkiesingsbeampte in die Wes-Kaap ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The party's chief election officer in the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Praat van jou provinsie, boet, praat van die provinsie. Ons is hier.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Speak of your province, brother, speak of the province. We are here.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die party se verkiesingsbeampte in die

Wes-Kaap ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The party's election officer in the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Los die [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Leave the [Inaudible.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... bruinkoevert Ebrahim Rasool ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... brown envelope Ebrahim Rasool [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Los die [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Leave the [Inaudible.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... het dit dan self nou die dag in die Kaap erken, en ek haal aan:

“Dat die afgelope nege jaar onder die ANC katastrofies was.”

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... has indeed acknowledged that here in the Cape the other day, and I quote:

“That the past nine years under the ANC have been catastrophic.”]

†n AGB LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dis een ding waarmee ek saamstem.

Ek moedig mense aan om nie die DA se woord te neem nie, toets ons aan die onafhanklike studies waarna die agb lid Dugmore verwys het, die Ouditeur-Generaal en Statistiek SA. Ek lig twee dele vir uit, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

Die afgelope 10 jaar het die Wes-Kaap regering nie een sent aan vermorste of verkwiste uitgawes gehad nie. In die Wes-Kaap bestuur ons mense se geld korrek.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: That is one thing I agree with. I

encourage people not to take the DA by its word, but to test us on the independent reports to which the hon Dugmore referred to, the Auditor-General and Statistics SA. I highlight two parts for you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The past ten years the Western Cape Government did not have one cent of wasted or squandered money. In the Western Cape we manage people and money correctly.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons steel nie van ons mense nie ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We do not steal from our people ... [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... ons bou.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... we build.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek is op pad.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am on my way.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: 10 jaar gelede het net die Stad Kaapstad van al 30 munisipaliteite in die Wes-Kaap 'n skoon oudit ontvang. Teen 2017 het 21 van ons munisipaliteite skoon oudits ontvang. Landswyd was daar slegs 33 uit 257 munisipaliteite wat skoon oudits ontvang het.

Ons is trots daarop dat 82% van ons provinsie se 2018 begroting bestee is aan dienslewering onder die arm gemeenskappe. Ons provinsie en ons regering het verlede jaar altesaam 83% skoon oudits oor die departemente ontvang. Die naasbeste provinsie was Gauteng met 52%. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dis eenvoudig 'n feit dat as 'n mens op die data oordeel, is daar geen enkele vergelyking tussen provinsies nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ten years ago only the City of Cape Town of all 30 municipalities in the Western Cape received a clean audit. By 2017, 21 of our municipalities received clean audits. Countrywide there were only 33 in total from 257 municipalities.

We are proud of the fact that we have spent up to 82% of our Province's 2018 budget on service delivery amongst our poorest communities. Our Provincial

Government last year received 83% clean audits in total through our departments. The second best province was Gauteng with 52%. [Interjections.] It is simply a fact that if one judges on the data, there is no comparison between the provinces.]

†Mr Deputy Speaker, this Department of Local Government monitors and support 30 municipalities in the Western Cape, including the Metro. In the context of the current economic and fiscal environment, the Department's budgets amount to R335,5 million in the 2019/20 financial year, R315 million in the 2020/21 financial year and R331 million in the 2021/22 financial year. The Department's allocation increased over the 2019 MTEF period by R38 million in 2019/2020, R8 million in 2020/2021 and R8 million in 2021/22 respectively.

Mr Deputy Speaker, may I add, this Department is the department with the smallest provincial budget, but yet it is required to monitor and support municipalities so that good governance and service delivery are sustained and strengthened.

Included in the Department's 2019 MTEF budget are the earmarked priority allocation for, amongst others, drought, water augmentation, appointment of geohydrologists and engineers, fires, disaster management, hazardous material capacity, municipal support and additional capacity amounts to R254 million.

In addition, the Department received over the 2019 MTEF an amount of R81 million in the form of provincial priority allocations to assist with municipal broadband, municipal infrastructure, Thusong Centres and mobile Thusong Centres and fire-fighting capacity across the province.

The Department of Local Government has positioned itself in the province as “the Gateway to Local Government”, assuming the responsibility of taking the provincial departments to local government and bringing municipalities to the provincial departments.

Put differently, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is the methodology of strengthening the interface between the spheres of government, premised on co-planning, co-budgeting and co-implementation.

As part of this methodology, I am strengthening the Provincial and Local Government interface through the District Coordinating Forums, the DCFs. While this approach ensures administrative traction on implementation, it secures the required political oversight on delivering services to our people. Mr Deputy Speaker, everything that we do must directly or indirectly influence the lives of our citizens in a positive manner. Work to serve and not to steal. [Interjections.]

Over the next while I will, together with the Department, review the integrated planning and service delivery methodology, particularly between the three spheres of government.

You see, Mr Deputy Speaker, our communities and citizens do not draw a distinction between the spheres of government when it comes to service delivery.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dit is waar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: A typical example is the provision of bulk water during the drought.

Although the provision and augmentation of bulk water is a national competency, the Province, together with many municipalities, had to fork out millions, for various water augmentation initiatives, at significant opportunity cost of provincial competencies, because we could not see that our citizens suffer at the hands of an incompetent and bankrupt National Department of Water and Sanitation.

Mr Deputy Speaker, many RBIG allocations by the Department of Water and Sanitation to municipalities, as published in this year's DORA, had to be stopped, could not take place, because why, Mr Deputy Speaker? There is no money in the Department.

An HON MEMBER: Jô.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: An example of this is that the Department provided co-funding to the Cederberg Municipality as a contribution to the brine fall-out of the desalination plant.

The National Department of Water and Sanitation gazetted to transfer R22 million to co-fund the project. Two weeks ago the Municipality was informed that the funding will not flow in the current financial year while the Municipality has already appointed the contractor, and I think personally that is criminal.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the reason presented is reprioritisation, but the truth is the National Department of Water and Sanitation is bankrupt.

We were at a recent soil turning event at the Clanwilliam Dam, which signalled the raising of the wall of the dam. Not being officially informed, but we understand that the work is being delayed by a full year, while some of the staff is on site, being paid for doing nothing.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are speculating, you are speculating.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Why the delays, Mr Deputy Speaker?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Give us stats, Anton.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Why the delay, Mr Deputy Speaker? It is not rocket science, it is a simple fact ...[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not speculate.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... the Department is bankrupt, there is no money, and Minister Mokonyane again is on the ANC's list to represent the ANC in National Parliament.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] the list, not to the province. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What a disgrace!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Leave the list.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What a disgrace. [Interjections.] Talking about water ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and sanitation [Interjections.] let me tell you how it should be done, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Ek wil noem van die geleentheid verlede week in Wellington waar ek 'n nuwe water herwinningsaanleg geopen het. Die Drakenstein Munisipaliteit herwin die vuil rioolwater vir ses gemeenskappe in sy munisipale grense. Die bedien meer as 250,000 mense. Die druk om die gemeenskap te bedien met die diens het oor die jare toegeneem. Wat gebeur in ANC beheerde rade of in Eskom?

Die bestaande infrastruktuur word bloots gery tot dit ineenstort. Op die oomblik moet die weermag in Gauteng die Vaalrivier probeer skoonmaak en red na al die menslike afval wat oor die jare toegelaat is om die rivier te besoedel. Nie in die Wes-Kaap nie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Hier glo ons in die herstel, die onderhoudswerk en die opgradering van ons infrastruktuur.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[I would just like to mention an event last week in Wellington where I opened a new water recycling plant. The Drakenstein Municipality recycles the dirty sewerage water for six communities within its municipal boundaries, for more than 250 000 people. The pressure to serve the community with the service has over the years increased. What happens in the ANC controlled councils or in Eskom?

The existing infrastructure is put under strain until it collapses. At the moment the army in Gauteng has to try and clean up and save the Vaal River after all the human waste that for years has been allowed to contaminate the river. Not in the Western Cape. Here we believe in the repair, maintenance work and upgradings of our infrastructure.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die projek in Wellington het R305 miljoen gekos en 'n klomp jaar geneem om te voltooi, maar weet u dit het die kapasiteit vir Drakenstein Munisipaliteit om afvalwater te herwin, vergroot van die bestaande 6 megaliter tot 16 megaliter per dag.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The project in Wellington cost R305 million and took several years to complete but do you know, it has increased the capacity of the Drakenstein Municipality to recycle waste water from the existing 6 megalitres per day to 16 megalitres per day.]

†Die MINISTER VAN VERVOER EN PUBLIEKE WERKE: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Good!]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die Wes-Kaap Regering glo beleggings in infrastruktuur sal lei tot werkskepping. Ons is noodwendig deeglik bewus van die kleiner dorpe se finansiële uitdagings wat dikwels beteken dat sommige dorpe eenvoudig nie altyd geld het vir dié soort werk nie. Dit is waarom die provinsie instaan om sulke dorpe te ondersteun waar ons kan. Ek moet vra dat munisipaliteite nie moet ophou met instandhouding nie. Sit daardie geld opsy, belê in infrastruktuur en die res sal volg. As ons goeie infrastruktuur het, lok ons beleggings en daarmee saam skeep ons werk en verseker ons 'n beter lewe vir almal.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government believes investments in infrastructure will lead to job creation. We are obviously aware of the smaller towns' financial challenges which often mean that some town simply do not always have the money for this type of work. That is why the Province is ready to support such towns where we can. I want to ask that municipalities should not stop maintenance. Put that money aside, invest in your infrastructure and the rest will follow. If we have good infrastructure, we lure investments and along with that we create jobs and ensure a better life for all.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, on governance. The key priority for this Department is to

embed good governance within Local Government environment. I believe that when you want others to change their behaviour one should set the example. For this reason I acknowledge the Department for setting a sterling example in governance performance, by creating a platform for others to follow.

I am glad to announce in this House today that the Department, through the Management Performance Assessment Tool, was rated the best performing department in the province on governance, as indicated by the results [Applause.] released by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation in 2018. Congratulations to Mr Graham Paulse and all the staff in the Local Government. [Applause.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not clap in a hurry. †*Just wag 'n bietjie, wag 'n bietjie.* [Just wait a minute, wait a minute.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In addition, Mr Deputy Speaker, as proof ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Wait a minute.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In addition, Mr Deputy Speaker, as proof that this Department has institutionalised good governance as part of

its day to day operations and as recognition was awarded the Gold Award for the Best Ethics Department, an award given by the Office of the Public Service Commissioner.

Furthermore the Department has also received its fourth consecutive clean audit opinion, clearly setting a good example for municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In order to promote good governance in municipalities, the Department has in the current financial year done work on a draft Standard Rules of Order By-Law, a Code of Conduct and a System of Delegations, just to mention a few.

Over the 2019/20 MTEF, a priority allocation of R46 million was received to further strengthen governance in municipalities. We will therefore continue our work around good governance with the aim to promote accountability, transparency, efficiency and rule of law in our municipalities.

The real test of good governance is when citizens feel secure and trust a government to conduct public affairs in the best interests of society as a whole rather than for the privileged few. In this case not the privileged few and corrupt ANC politicians who have now need to explain themselves to the Zondo Commission.

Turning to citizen interface. Mr Deputy Speaker, as part of strengthening citizen interface, the Department supported municipalities with an accredited training programme, an Integrated Community Development Planning Programme. The focus was to train and to build the capacity of municipal public participation officials, using various topics and contemporary approaches to public participation.

Another example of strengthening the citizen interface is the recent development of the Client Service Charter which was piloted in Prince Albert Municipality, and I have got it here, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I hope the Mayors will take note. I really think that it is time that we need to enter into a contract with citizens. This Charter is a social contract between the municipality and its citizens. It is a demonstration of the municipality's commitment to fulfil its constitutional mandate of delivering quality services and improving the quality of the lives of the residents of the Prince Albert Municipality.

The residents will therefore keep the municipality accountable when the published service standards are not met. Equally the communities must assume its responsibility by actively and meaningfully participate in policy development, programmes, budgets, plans and indeed payment of services and protection of infrastructure. I am really looking forward and I want to congratulate the Department for this initiative.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the 2019 financial year, mainstream budget is

available to develop client service charters for some of our municipalities and we will phase this in. The Ward Committee System has as its foundation to strengthen the citizen interface. During this year, the Department have reviewed all Ward Committee Operational Plans of all local municipalities. The result was significant improvements in the quality of Ward Committee Operational Plans.

Mr Deputy Speaker, notwithstanding that the assessment report on the functionality of the ward committees indicate that all is in good stead, I know in some cases challenges remain. I have therefore requested the Department to develop contemporary responses to the remaining challenges so that indeed, through the Ward Committee System, democracy is enhanced. The budget in the 2019/20 financial year will fund the initiatives to further sophisticate the Ward Committee System.

The Thusong Programme has been tailored to ensure that citizens of the Western Cape Province can seamlessly access a wide range of integrated services in one location, irrespective of where they live. For the past year the focus of the outreach events was on the farming and rural communities, reaching over 50 farms in the rural nodes.

In addition, four emergency interventions were implemented in support of communities affected by the impact of drought, social unrest and fires, including the recent fire at Wupperthal, where this Department, with the Cederberg Municipality and the Mayor is here today, as well as the District

Municipality, joined heads and in a matter of days repaired the water, the power and communication to that community, despite all the challenges, and thank you, Mayor, for your cooperation.

In the Western Cape the Back to Basics Programme was implemented during 2015 at 10 of the most vulnerable municipalities in the province, with the aim to providing support to address challenges in the respective municipalities. To date, two municipalities have successfully exited the programme, namely the Cape Agulhas Municipality in 2017/18 financial year and the Swellendam Municipality in the 2018/19 financial year.

In 2015, following the intervention notice in Oudtshoorn Municipality, the Department implemented the Back to Basics Support Plan, aimed at addressing the challenges highlighted during the intervention process. Oudtshoorn Municipality is on track to soon exit this programme.

During the year under review, the Department in partnership with the Hanns Seidell Foundation, conducted a Winter School Programme for councillors, where the focus of the Winter School was on ethical and responsible leadership.

Regarding the Municipal Property Rates Amendment Act 2014, the Department received accolades from the Department of Cooperative Governance for the best performing province in terms of monitoring and supporting municipalities with the implementation and compliance of the

MPRA.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Department of Local Government is the lead department responsible for the co-ordination of the drought response in the province. Working with various stakeholders during the 2017/18 and 18/19 financial year, the Department developed the Integrated Drought Response Strategy which adopted a two-pronged approach to ensure domestic water security in all towns within the Western Cape. The approach focused on reducing water consumption through water conservation and demand management programmes, while simultaneously increasing the availability of water through water supply augmentation programmes. Amongst others, the municipalities were supported with financial and technical support in order to augment the water supply in various drought stricken towns.

The Department engineers and project managers conducted drought assessment in all our municipalities in order to determine the extent of the drought and the risk of water security. Geohydrologists were appointed in each district to support municipalities with the geophysical investigation and borehole siting as well as the supervision of drilling and testing of boreholes in the province.

High risk towns include Beaufort West, Laingsburg and Kannaland. The Department is currently providing these municipalities with dedicated professional support and technical advisory services. Several interventions were identified for each municipality to mitigate the risk of experiencing

water shortages.

A fire, flood and drought awareness campaign was also conducted in 80 schools in the Central Karoo District area, reaching a total of 35 258 learners over the past year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, when it comes to the drought, we are not out of the woods yet, although we certainly are much better off than we were a year ago.

Still, I want to take this moment to reiterate the call to continue to save water. We must be wary of complacency and we must seek – all of us – to adapt to long-term behaviour change when it comes to water and, in general, the way we live.

I want to end off by thanking the head of the Department and the personnel for their dedication. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Mngasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, let me appreciate in good spirit the debate, but firstly let me greet the hon Premier, hon Executive, the Executive Council of this Parliament, hon members, heads of department, South African Local Government, which is SALGA, Executive Mayors, municipal speakers and councillors, members of

the media, ladies and gentlemen.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it has been five years that we have been doing this business in this very House but it has been not without challenges. [Interjections.] But, of course, it has been a very successful story, a story that the hon Premier stated with a very passionate message that she gave when she presented the State of the Province Address.

The message was clear: we are celebrating 10 years of good governance in this province. [Interjections.] And the message that she gave is the message ... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... is the message that says this province functions and this province works and this province is a province that serves all people of this province and serves all people of this country who find themselves in this province, and the people of the world. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, as the Chairperson, in my Standing Committee, we have performed our constitutional obligations as per the Rules of this Parliament and we further ensured that for the past five years as the Standing Committee ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon Dyantyi. You are the next speaker

on the list. Please ... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... we encourage a culture of accountability, a culture of non-partisanship and a spirit of oversight which has been sacrosanct in our performance as the Standing Committee. And I think we have done that exceptionally well and I thank the members of this committee for having achieved that. [Interjections.]

This budget vote is an embodiment of the values of freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity that we espouse in this province. This is a budget that puts at the centre of government, our people and all people of this province.

It recognises that for any successful local government, hon Deputy Speaker, we must give credence to the principle of a tripartite alliance of the people, municipal administration and municipal council, because without that you cannot function as a government. The local government is at the coalface of the people. That is where things happen, so you have got to recognise that without the people themselves as part of that government, it cannot function properly.

This is the recipe for the successes that we have seen in this province. [Interjections.] Because for this province to succeed, hon Deputy Speaker, the Democratic Alliance-led Western Cape understands that if any government leaves people behind, that government is the enemy of the people

... [Interjection.] and this province understands that principle. I do not know about others up north.

If there is anything we can celebrate here, it is what the hon Minister Bredell has shared with us, that they have become innovative, recognising that the Fourth Industrial Revolution is not something that is spoken about far away in the desert, it is here. And people are beginning to say: we need to be engaged differently. We cannot always go to public meetings because at times it is difficult to reach everyone at the same time, but this Government has recognised that and become innovative by instituting means that will encourage people to participate in the decision-making of Government. And we commend yourself, hon Minister, and the Department of Local Government seated there – HOD and your team – through you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, Minister Bredell has not only understood this principle but, together with his very able Department, they have created a mechanism that he has presented here, that people are going to be using an App with a cell phone to say: I am happy with this decision, I am not happy with this decision.

And I have said to hon Dyantyi on the other side, he must learn to now go to Facebook and also download the App because he is not on Facebook and he does not really believe in the new culture of technology. But I think it is about time, so that we can police properly, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Interjections.]

But what the hon Minister has done, he has spoken extensively about what key budgetary items of each of the four programmes of the Department will do. And I think part of that will support how he intends to spend that money and as the Standing Committee we said we support that, hon Dyantyi, we said we support that.

And what we also said, chiefly among that ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ... is that the budget, especially on Programmes 2 and 3, which is what the hon Minister has spoken about here, that we want to make sure that we support the capacity of building resilience in fighting fires, building resilience in fighting the ever-growing disasters which, in the main here, is the fires as well as the informal settlements where we have seen many people dying in some of the informal settlements, trying to install fire alarm systems and trying to invest in other modalities to be more creative in fighting fire.

So those are the kinds of things that this Department has said, but also central to that is to say we no longer have the luxury of water in this province, so he says we are going to invest in that space. So the response as the Standing Committee is that we said we support that because that is what

we need in this province.

The Minister has also said to us that one of the things that he wants to focus on as the Department - unfortunately he cannot himself guarantee that he is going to come back in that same department because the Premier must decide after the elections. [Interjections.] But what he said –because the ANC will not be implementing this programme, it will be the new DA Government and the new Minister implementing – is that we need to focus on ensuring that the capacity of councillors and the capacity of [Inaudible.], but also the role of oversight committees needs to be strengthened. And I have seen some officials sitting that side who are doing that – Mr Magamang that side, hon Deputy Speaker, and Mr Michel – who work with municipalities directly in ensuring that the capacity of councillors and the oversight role is played sufficiently and effectively.

So who cannot support that? So we support it as the Standing Committee and we say it is a very good thing that this Department is doing.

Let me just share some worries, hon Deputy Speaker.

The first worry: I spoke to the Minister of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and one of the things I raised with him in another committee is the SPLUMA implementation and of course the serving of the members from the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the committees, which is, in this case, in the tribunals. It is

something that has a potential to create a conflict of interest and we need to monitor that because you cannot be a referee and a player. And in many cases that is something that the Department has acknowledged and that is something that the Department and also the Minister of that Department said that he is going to look at, revising how the participation of the officials gets to be amended in terms of recognising the spirit that SPLUMA encompasses.

So that is one of the technical issues that we, as the Standing Committee, also highlighted.

And I also think, hon Deputy Speaker, one of the other things that we recognise is that in some councils, a very small portion of municipalities, you have this hunger, you know, by some administrators – which is municipal officials – wanting to use the power of the executive authority, the power of the oversight bodies. And we need to make sure that we clamp down on that appetite because it is going to destroy the fabric of democracy. It is going to compromise the role of municipal councils and the manner in which decisions are taken. So that is something that is important to acknowledge, but also without even appreciating that it is happening.

There are areas where we have seen that it also at times breeds corruption and we have been working as a Standing Committee to say that if a municipal official or a councillor or a mayor has been found to be corrupt, we need to act with speed because too much power is a problem and absolute power is even more problematic. And I do not even want to go to the lecture in the

history of that.

On the Khoisan leadership, I think it is important that I highlight the position that this Parliament took, that this Parliament said, hon Deputy Speaker, we want to appreciate and support the role of the Khoisan leadership but the spirit within which we do that, it must be done in a way that recognises justice, fairness and the whole spirit of equal treatment when it comes to traditional leaders. But what we have acknowledged as a fact, which is very disappointing and very unfortunate, is what the National Government has done in dealing with the traditional leaders, specifically Khoisan leaders, the Nama, the Korana, the Griqua and of course the Cape Khoi and others, that they think these are street committees that should be juniorised in approach and they treat them as by the way, as second class citizens. [Interjection.]

And we are saying we do not appreciate it and we will not support that kind of nonsense where you are going to treat them as second class citizens. We want everybody to be treated equally and fairly in this country and recognising the statutes that set this democracy which we all believe in.

Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to request that you put on those gadgets, because I am going to speak with the language – I know that the officials do not have the gadgets, but please put it up.

†Okokuqala mandibulele uMhlonipheki obekekileyo Hon Richard Dyantyi sisebenze kakuhle kakhulu kule 5 years sikule Komiti khange sitshintshe

nakanye. Siyabulela kakhulu. Zange ndabona sisithi makuvotwe xa kuthathwa izigqibo kule Komti sihlala sixoxe singavuelani sivumelane kodwa ekugqibeleni sithi siyavumelana ke ngoku xa sigqibe ukuxoxa so yimaturity endifuna ukuyibulela kuwe Mhlekezazi, ndiyabulela ngokusebenzisana nathi kakuhle.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Firstly let me thank the Honourable Richard Dyantyi. We have worked very well with you in the past five years we have been serving in this committee, we have never changed even once. Thank you very much. We have never said there should be a vote when we needed to make decisions by this committee. What we do is we always discuss our issues and sometimes we do not agree and sometimes we agree but in the end we agree after we have engaged in discussions. That is the maturity which I appreciate from you Sir. I thank you very much for a good co-operation with us.]

†Also there were times, hon Deputy Speaker, where we dealt with difficult situations in Oudtshoorn, difficult situations in Kannaland, difficult situations in Beaufort West, in Cederberg and, lastly, in George. [Interjection.] We took a collective decision and we were very clear in taking those decisions that we would be non-partisan but we will put the people of this province first. [Interjection.] And we have done so because we believe that the work of Parliament is through the committees. Without committees, there is no Parliament. Because here we often do not agree when we stand on

this podium but in the committees, that is where the actual work gets done and we have seen it being done in this committee and with the hon members there, and thank you very much. [Interjection.]

And I also need to appreciate, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Kananjalo ndifuna ukubulela Sekela Somlomo oBekekileyo intsebenziswano yoMphathiswa uAnton Bredell ngoba ngaphandle kwakhe alikho ela sebe ngoba xa eza kumane engenelela sisebenza alizusebenza ela sebe. Ndithi ukuba xa sisebenza avale ukuba ela sebe lingezi awuzucaca umsebenzi wela sebe ngoko ke xa sisebenza usoloko evulile ukuba ikomiti isebenze kwaye usebenze njengoMphathiswa engenaxhala esivumela siwenze umsebenzi siyikomiti kwaye ephendula xa sibuzo imibuzo kuye njengoMphathiswa. Siyabulela kakhulu Mphathiswa uBredell. Ndiyabulela kakhulu egameni lekomiti intsebenziswano yala magosa karhulumente onke naba babukele kumabonakude

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[I also need to appreciate, honourable Deputy Speaker, the support we got from Minister Anton Bredell because without him that Department does not exist. Had he intervened and disturbed the work of the committee, that Department would not have performed well. What I am saying is that had he

intervened and prevented that Department from coming there, its responsibility would not have been realised. He is always giving us, the committee, opportunity to do what we have to do and as the Minister he was welcoming towards us and he would give us answers when we ask him questions, as the Minister. We thank you very much Minister Bredell. Also I would like to extend my thanks, on behalf of the committee, for the co-operation we received from government officials, to all of them, including those watching their televisions at this moment we are saying ...] † your cooperation has made us the committee that you have seen, because without the culture that we have seen in the Department, as public servants we would not have been able to do our job in the manner in which we have done our job; because we performed our responsibilities knowing very well that you are there to serve the people of this province and you have done so without fail and thank you very much for the work that you are doing to serve the people of this province selflessly. [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

†Okokugqibela ke ndiyacinga ukuba kubalulekile ukuba ndibulele abantu abasancedayo ukuba sizise iinkonzo zikarhulumente eluntwini.

[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]

[Lastly I think it is important that I extend words of gratitude to those who help us deliver government services to the public.]

†The most important segment of our Government and that is all the Mayors

sitting there, to recognise the role that you have played in making our job easier as the Standing Committee. And of course your officials, your councillors and the speakers for making our job a little bit easier than what it could have been, because you understood that in the spirit of inter-governmental relations we have a job and that job is clear in Chapter 7 of the Constitution, what you should be doing. But Schedule 4 and 5 of the Constitution says what this Parliament must be doing and you have not given us any reason to doubt your commitment and thank you very much for that, because you often take the blame when things do not go right; when things go well we want to claim victory and successes. So thank you very much.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let me end by saying there is a growing conversation in the corridors of Local Government and SALGA and all the municipalities have been raising this issue. We need to redefine the role of district municipalities and how we are funding the district municipalities, because it is not fair to continue expecting them to perform certain functions, but there is not enough budget given to them.

And also if you look at the media population estimates by Statistics South Africa as delivered last year, it says this province is the third biggest province and that is sitting at 6,6 million South Africans living in this province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: And this is following from ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just, member your time has expired, but just finish off.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... from DP and KZN, but the money that we are receiving in this province in terms of the division of revenue is not pointing at that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member, your time has expired [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you very much. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Dyantyi, now is your opportunity to speak.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Maybe just before I get to my speech, if I would ask you to just follow me. There is a little exercise I want to do with you.

[Singing:] *We are ready, we are ready for Ramaphosa* [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Singing:] *We are ready ...*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. [Interjections.] Order.

An HON MEMBER: We are ready for you to go to [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] Marx.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Daylin Mitchell.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Yes, thank you [Interjections.] hon Deputy Speaker
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order! Hon Mitchell.

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Deputy Speaker, is it parliamentary [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ...for a member to speak on two mics? So he is
occupying two seats. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I will look at that but as long as we can hear
the member properly it is fine. Member, you may continue with your speech
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker [Interjections.] Maybe Deputy Speaker, let me start by [Interjections.] let me start by by thanking [Interjections.] let me start by thanking [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are speaking on the wrong mike!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...the professional work of that Department, support staff in the committees [Interjections.] the able leadership of the Chair, despite the pressure from your own Chief Whip to do wrong things. So I want to start there because I might not end with some thanks. So, that is where I end the clapping of hands, at that point. [Interjections.] I want, Deputy Speaker, to also make a point [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order member. Just one second. [Interjections.] Order. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: On a point of order. Speaker, with all due respect, the point has been raised by the member. The two mics, he is not speaking from his bench. He is speaking from another bench. So he must make up his mind [Interjections.] that is the first thing. Second thing, through the whole of this day this man has been grandstanding and now he is trying to build up for a crescendo. That is fine. That is his right, but we do not have to aid and abet him by giving him double volume mic. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, member. I am not going to rule against that.

If the member stands in the passage it is fine [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is no rule for two mics [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no strict requirement on that but I will watch the member [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am going to continue using the two mics because I am standing here [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your speech and carry on.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker for ruling in my favour in terms of that [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Can the controller of the microphones please turn off the second microphone [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You sit down! Sit down, Wiley! Sit down! Sit down!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. Let us proceed with the debate please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Department of Local Government – †that is eina, dis baie seer, ek kan dit sien – [that hurts, that hurts a lot, I can see that] - the Department of Local Government is responsible for promoting good governance [Interjections.] in local authorities to enhance municipal service delivery, stretching goals for the Department, compliant and accountable municipalities underpinned by good governance, effective monitoring of local government.

Let us see how this has been going and if any resources has been allocated to champion these goals. A damning report presented by provincial authorities reveal that six DA-run municipalities may be hot beds for tender irregularities, mismanagement and invalid appointments of senior officials, and that include George amongst others [Interjections.]

In the DA-run George Municipality an employee allege supply-chain management irregularities and gross deviation from tender specifications dating back to 2014 and involving two companies. Allegations of fraud and corruption at the George Municipality were brought to the attention of the Department and the MEC by assessment of the information and documentation, could not find substantive evidence and requested additional information. This is a cover-up.

George was not the only problem in the province, with eight other municipalities rocked by allegations of maladministration, including, Bitou, Kannaland, Oudtshoorn, Beaufort West, Cederberg, Theewaterskloof,

Langeberg and Stellenbosch. Now I am raising this because we are in a province that is best run according to the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Best in the country!

An HON MEMBER: Thank you for saying that!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In Bitou a Section 106 intervention was in place. There was also a probe into racketeering in the Kannaland Municipality. The appointment of a municipal manager and the chief financial officer were also found procedurally flawed under your watch, MEC Bredell.

An HON MEMBER: Under ANC [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is your legacy. I hope, I am trying to show you part of your legacy. In the DA-led Oudtshoorn Council, allegations of tender irregularities, irregular expenditure and appointments of staff in contravention of procedure have been received. And if we were to talk about effective intergovernmental relations the Cape Watergate has left behind many casualties. [Interjections.] One of them was the blatant disregard for intergovernmental principles. The DA faction in the City of Cape Town stripped the Executive Mayor of her powers and appointed their [Inaudible.] Ian Neilson to salvage what they call Day Zero crisis. [Interjections.] He was clearly not up to the task and then Mmusi Maimane crossed the state party lines to have a go at practicing to be a Premier, next to the real Premier

candidate, MEC Winde with his blue jeans and Day Zero T-shirt.

An HON MEMBER: Is that all you have got?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Province effectively blamed the City for the mess. The City tore itself apart in courts for many months during 2017/2018. [Interjections.] Today, the residents of Cape Town are stuck with exorbitant water bills [Interjections.]. The DA's governance failures has resulted in ratepayers footing the R1 billion surplus which was collected through high water tariffs.

An HON MEMBER: At least they have water!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA has priced ratepayers [Interjections.] out of their constitutional right to access to water [Interjections.] up to a point of 600% rate increase. This is this party. [Interjections.] As we have ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order member [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...less than 40 days to go [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member Dyantyi, just one second. Hon Mitchell [Interjection.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Hon Deputy Speaker, I know that you have ruled on this

but the hon member's microphone is now off and he is speaking now on a microphone that is not his bench. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member Mitchell, I will look at that. At the moment both mics are on and I can hear the member pretty well. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: What is the problem?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue. [Interjections.] Order, order. Please continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This circus has no end and all the DA can say is the Province's function, oversight. I am sure they forget that they are the governing party many times, instead of them speaking about oversight. And let's go to some of the things that MEC spoke about. He spoke about the crisis in Eskom, that the National Government is fixing. [Interjections.] Like many others that it is fixing. [Interjections.] But he is not even mentioning [Interjections.] he is not mentioning that they stayed for a year not being able to manage a drought crisis, that forewarned them for many months, because under that you could not deal with your demand management that you are mentioning here even as you sit down, as you make your last speech [Interjections.] I ask a question in this House: Are you able to tell us as you sit there, you spoke about boreholes here, the question was asked to you, how many boreholes do we have in this province that are illegally done? And how

many private? How many public? [Interjections.] You still cannot answer that yet you are the MEC of this province, under those kind of issues. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is no such thing as an illegal borehole!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You leave as you make your last speech today, you have not even been able to fulfil your own three dreams.

An HON MEMBER: You do not have a clue!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You said your dreams were the issue of infrastructure. You leave with nothing, no plan in place. [Interjections.] The issue of maintenance of the bulk infrastructure [Interjections.] as well as revenue generation. As you finish your term after 10 years we have nothing of those in sight. And as for member Mngqasela, in the point that you are making [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just one second. Min Winde?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Will the hon member take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.] Order. Hon Dyantyi, are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Magaxa. [Interjections.] I am listening to your member there.

An HON MEMBER: Take a question!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am prepared to take a question, hon Deputy Speaker, just as I finish this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fine, the answer is “no, not now”. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In terms of the Khoisan leadership, the ANC in this House supported the Bill that was sent to the NCOP. So even as you go to the election we know that we said, we support the Khoisan leadership and we were in the public hearings. [Interjections.] We were in the public hearings. [Interjections.] You were not there. So I think it is going to be important for the DA to go out there and say, we do not support you to be part of the others in this country [Interjections.].

Let me also make the next point because the MEC here, and this is something new that I have just picked up as we are finishing the term [Interjections.] This Department ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. You are competing with your own leader there. Hon Magaxa please allow your member behind you to speak.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This Department, hon Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is the best in the country!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... it thinks that it is the best in the country now, but let me get to that point.

An HON MEMBER: No, we do not think!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For the last two years we sit here, we have dealt with your annual report. In that annual report, for all of those two years following each other [Interjections.] this department had a high turnover rate of staff. There was an issue about HR. Exodus of staff. We even declared it as a sick department at some point and yet in the program they are presenting to us, about embedding good governance, which he mentioned in his speech, that apparently they are saying they have now been awarded as the best department by the MPAT and the issues that MPAT was looking for was accountability, governance, strategic management, HR and financial management.

Now I am saying that is a new thing because it is a revelation. What it means is that basically you have a department that we have all agreed that it has got

problems around these issues, but yet it is getting an award. I do not want to blame them. The blame does not go to the DA or the Department [Interjections.], there is a misdiagnosis that has happened, which was saying the National Department [Interjections.] and we are taking this issue, because we could not understand for a very long time, poor departments come back and they come with awards. We just could not understand, but now we understand there is some form of misdiagnosis which we are going to take up with that Department of Planning and Evaluation because [Interjections.] if they can give us this Department as having been the best in the country, something is wrong. [Interjections.] In their own way of doing things [Interjections.] So the blame is not on you. We have to fix how they diagnose these kind of departments. [Interjections.] Because ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Because?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...the next point he makes is about the issue of the gold awards on ethical leadership and yet I have just read to you under the watch of that MEC and the Department what is happening to the municipalities. [Interjections.] How do you get gold when you have got such mess in your best run province? [Interjections.]

So the ANC [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, we are very clear in terms of our own role and input here that as you complete your 10 years, we are now left with less than 40 days. We are saying thank you and good riddance to the DA because we are very clear that change is coming [Interjections.] When we

spoke with the Department [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...we did say [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...to that professional staff that we want them to be professional [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Member your time has expired. I will allow your last sentence. Please finish off.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We want to say that the Department must remain professional because come 9 May there will be new chiefs [Interjections.] in charge of this office [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expire.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you. It is the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. Please come to order before I see the Minister.

An HON MEMBER: There is another shock of your life.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie. Agb Adjunkspeaker, laat ek begin deur my amptenare te bedank onder die leiding van die hoof van departement, Graham Paulse, ek sien daar sit amptenare daar bo, ek sien daar sit amptenare hierdie kant van my, baie dankie vir julle lojaliteit. [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to start by thanking my officials under the leadership of the head of department, Graham Paulse, I see there are officials sitting up there, I see there are officials sitting on this side, thank you for your loyalty. [Applause.]]

†As I sit here hon Deputy Speaker, I just think I must mention it, the first time I came to Parliament I walked into it – he will not recall it but, Mr Mitchell, over the years he has become more grey and I have got a beard, but we are still here, and I hope we can continue. I really want to congratulate the Department. This is a team effort to govern, to serve the people and

always remember that you are just as good as your team and I think in Local Government we have managed to build a very, very good team. So I really want to thank all of you for your dedication and for serving the people in this province with a passion because it is no easy task, that I can promise you.

To all our Mayors who are on a daily basis doing the right things, serving the people, thank you very much. To Masizole Mnqasela, my colleague, our Chairperson, for your commitment [Interjections.] for your, the hon, †en nou het die man nog lyk my graad ook gevang, so hy het ‘n mooi swart jas aangehad [and now it seems to me the man had graduated, so he was wearing such a nice black coat.] I must say, thank you very much. Congratulations with that.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is a privilege to come to the Standing Committee knowing that they are hard on you, but it is all in the best will of the people in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] †Ja. [Applous.] [Yes. [Applause.]] [Interjections.] To the hon Dyantyi, first of all ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: First of all, to drill a borehole is not illegal. To subtract water is illegal.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There are illegal boreholes, you know that!

[Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Om ‘n boorgat te sink is nie onwettig nie, om water te trek is onwettig, so [Tussenwerpsels.] Maar agb Adjunkspeaker, kom ons gaan gou daar verby, want die agb Richard het ‘n klomp munisipaliteite genoem.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: To sink a borehole is not unlawful, to draw water is unlawful, so... [Interjections.] But Mr Deputy Speaker, let us quickly go past that, because the hon Richard has mentioned a lot of municipalities.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Agb Dyantyi, nè.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon Dyantyi, nè.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die... ag, ons gee nie eintlik vreeslik om nie want die ANC het jou in elk geval afgeskryf.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The... oh, we really do not care much because the ANC has written you off in any case.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, orde.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ons sit vandag hier, hy het byvoorbeeld Cederberg genoem. Cederberg se burgemeester het die munisipaliteit die laaste twee jaar gekry na 'n skoon oudit toe uit 'n gemors van 'n ANC-beheer [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, we sit here today, he has for example mentioned Cederberg. Cederberg's Mayor took the Municipality over the last two years to a clean audit from the mess of ANC control. [Applause.]] To take that municipality from a corrupt, bankrupt ANC Government to a clean audit will take something.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Minister, voor ons verder gaan. Kan ek net die gallery daarop wys dat hulle nie deel is van die verrigtinge op die vloer nie en nie moet hande klap of saam "cheer" nie.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, before we continue, can I just draw the gallery's attention to the fact that they are not part of the proceedings on the floor and should not clap hands or cheer along...]

†'n AGBARE LID: Saam bly wees nie.

[An HON MEMBER: Be happy along with us.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Minister, u mag voortgaan. [Applous.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, you may continue. [Applause.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Adjunkspeaker, in ander gevalle van munisipaliteite [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, in other cases of municipalities [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons het nog altyd as Department nie polities opgetree nie, maar in die beste belang van die gemeenskap The [MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We have always as Department acted non-politically, in the best interest of the community,] †in the best interest of

the community. If there were any allegations we will investigate. We sent in the Hawks in George. The frustration is we do not get the report of a failure of National Government – another national failure! [Interjections.] That is the frustration, because if we get the report, because everybody is innocent until proven guilty.

†Dit sal selfs die agb lid vir my gee want hulle speel ook daardie hand, en dit is reg, [That even the hon member will concede because they also play that hand, and it is right,] because if you believe in the rule of law, you are innocent until proven guilty, but give us the report so that we can deal with it [Interjections.] irrespective of what political party you belong to because we want the best for our citizens.

†Ek gaan nie lank wees nie, agb Adjunkspeaker, ek wil net sê in 2010 het die mense van die Wes-Kaap die hon Richard Dyantyi ge-fire. Vandag soos ons hier staan het die ANC hom ge-fire. Die arme man. Ons moet seker maar vir hom jammer kry. Maar agb Adjunkspeaker, [I will not be long, hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to say in 2010 the people of the Western Cape had fired the hon Richard Dyantyi. Today as we stand here the ANC has fired him. The poor man, perhaps we should feel sorry for him. But hon Deputy Speaker,] †what is more...what is more important, can you imagine, why we can stand and brag here today is because of the people in 2009 voting in the DA.

If the people nationally voted in the DA we would have discussed today not the failure of Eskom [Interjections.] and electricity and SAA and a corrupt

state, a looted state. We would have discussed an accountable, transparent, efficient rule of law state. We would have been [Interjections.] a country, a leading country in this planet, hon Deputy Speaker. I really cannot understand how anybody can defend the looting of the ANC. [Interjections.] And the voters will deal with them 8th of May. Thank you very much [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. That concludes the debate on this Vote. The House will suspend for a few minutes to allow the galleries to be cleared for the new officials to come in. The House is suspended.

[Business of the House was suspended at 16:42 and resumed at 16:45]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Sixth order.

The SECRETARY: Provincial Parliament – Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B1 - 2019].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, members, guests in the gallery and the fellow South Africans, thank you for the opportunity to present the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's Budget for the 2019 MTEF period.

The 2019/2020 Financial Year marks the final year of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's five year strategic plan and this budget is also the final budget for the fifth parliamentary term. In this context, I would like to inform the House of some of the achievements and challenges of the last four years.

Over the years receiving a clean audit has become the norm at Western Cape Provincial Parliament, which is as a result of its commitment to good governance in executing its core functions. In addition to this, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament will continue to implement its governance framework, which sets out the governance components, principles and requirements to enhance the internal control environment and achieve the fiduciary responsibilities of the accounting officer and other officials as set out in Section 12 of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act.

The Western Cape Provincial Parliament has successfully implemented stage X3, enterprise resource planning system and has had successful salary runs since going live in April 2018. In addition to providing an integrated system, the functionality also allows the WCPP to process claims and payments with double the regularity of Persal and Bas (Basic Accounting System).

Notwithstanding the successes as with any new system, there are still a few teething problems that are currently receiving attention and I am confident it will be resolved in the early part of the new financial year. In 2019 the

Western Cape Provincial Parliament will continue to stabilise and optimise the ERP system and therefore has allocated a budget of R500 000 for functional enhancement; R640 000 for support and maintenance and R432 000 for licensing fees.

In terms of law making and oversight, WCPP will continue to provide quality support to the House and its committees. Huge progress has been made in the finalisation of the review of Standing Rules. The subcommittee completed its work and made a presentation to the Rules Committee on Wednesday 20 March 2019. The Rules Committee agreed to the amendments in principle and the report on the review of the Rules will be considered by the House tomorrow, 27 March 2019. Provision has been made in the goods and services budget for the printing and publication thereof. I wish to thank the Deputy Speaker and all the members of the sub-committee in this regard.

In 2019/2020, Western Cape Provincial Parliament will seek to expand its outreach to the people of the Western Cape and will use digital means to foster relationships with its stakeholders. In 2018 we committed to conduct a baseline study aimed at providing the institution of relevant data to enable proper future impact assessment of public participation interventions. However, during the development seminar of the legislative sector, which was hosted by WCPP in this province, this matter was discussed and deliberated on at length. The sector experienced similar problems with public involvement in their legislative activities.

Going forward, WCPP will continue to engage with the sector in this regard. The Department of Community Safety continues to provide security support for standing committees during oversight visits in line with the approved service level agreement. In the 2019 budget R241 000 has been allocated for this outsourced service.

2018 has seen an increase in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's involvement in sector activities. The administration has contributed on various levels in projects in the sector, including the development sector which took place in December last year.

WCPP was also instrumental in developing the Communication Strategy Framework for the sector and is also represented on the sectoral team responsible for the overall preparation for the Sixth Parliament. Going forward into 2019, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament will continue to be responsive to public outreach initiatives coordinated by the legislative sector, including sectoral parliaments and commemorative events.

Going to 2019, considerable work has commenced on the preparation for the Sixth Parliament. A task team under the leadership of the Secretary has been established to drive the process, in establishing the Sixth Parliament and a total budget of R2 302 000 has been set aside for this purpose. This budget will cover expenditure relating to the opening of the new Parliament, promotional items, IT equipment, furniture and members' relocation costs where applicable. Included in this budget is also provision for the printing

and publication of a legacy document which will highlight the major achievements of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's committees and the administration for the fifth term. This publication will be presented to all members of the Fifth Parliament and a limited number of copies will be kept as corporate gifts and included in the library collection of WCPP.

Since November 2017, WCPP was involved in a project on functional enhancement with an external service provider which concluded in September 2018. The 2019/2020 Budget is based on the new organisational structure which flow from the findings of the report issued by the external service provider and adopted an amended by the Exco. The Western Cape Provincial Parliament has commenced with a staggered implementation of its functional enhancement project and received from the Provincial Treasury additional funding of R2 million in 2019/2020; R3,5 million in 2020/2021 and R8 millio in the 2021/2022 financial years.

The Western Cape Provincial Parliament's establishment increased from 109 positions to a total of 118 positions. Since the approval of the new organisational structure, we have finalised the appointment of three director positions who will commence duty with effect from 1 April 2019. To date we have also managed to finalise one manager position and we are in the process of finalising the remaining two.

I am also happy to announce that a new Secretary to Parliament, Mr Romeo Adams, will commence duty on 1 April 2019. I am confident with the

appointment of the new Secretary, together with the implementation of the results of functional enhancement project, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament will optimise the effectiveness and efficiency of all its functional units and continue to fulfil its constitutional mandate and deliver enhanced services to members and other stakeholders.

WCPP is always mindful of the scarcity of water in the Western Cape and to this end we take this reality into consideration in all our planning and operations. We will continue to review our water scarcity business continuity plan, that will inform any activities required to ensure business continuity in the possibility of an extended water supply disruption and water shortages in Cape Town.

In terms of human resources, skills development and employee wellness, we will continue to receive focus during 2019. During 2018 a new employee wellness model was introduced with overwhelming positive feedback. This programme aimed at providing support in critical areas which included mental health sessions; sessions on real relationships, as well as a very well attended health day which covered a broad spectrum of assessments, information, as well as the beauty and relaxation stations. An amount of R185 000 has been allocated to continue with similar programmes into 2019. A budget of R667 000 has been set aside for functional training and R134 000 has been allocated for bursaries to staff.

In 2019 WCPP will continue with its successful roll-out of live streaming of

all parliamentary sittings on the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's YouTube channel. The Western Cape Provincial Parliament will also build on its steady increase in social media activity across all platforms and continue to provide support to standing committees with regard to activities on social media, arranging interviews on radio stations, recordings, editing and dissemination of sound bytes to radio stations.

We have not yet resolved the challenges around the accommodation shortage and the issueing of the fire rationale security clearance certificate for the Legislature building. We are in constant engagement with the Department of Transport and Public Works and hope to have this matter resolved as soon as possible.

Mr Deputy Speaker, allow me to present a high level summary of the 2019/2020 Budget. WCPP's receipts increased with R50 220 000 from the 2018/2019 revised estimate of R143 874 000 to a total budget of R159 094 000 in 2019/2020. This equates to an overall 10.58% increase from the 2018/2019 revised estimate.

WCPP's own revenue for the 2019/2020 Financial Year is R817 000. This revenue source is made up of surplus donor funds of the LSS Programme of which R750 000 has been allocated each over the 2019/2020 and 2020/2021 MTEF's. The balance of R67 000 is mainly sourced from revenue items such as accrued interest on our bank account, interest on debt, commission earned, sale of corporate gifts, sale of meals and retained parking fees.

The 2019/2020 Budget is as follows:

Programme 1 is R70,423 million which is an increase of 14,11%.

Programme 2, Parliamentary Services is R22,150 million which is an increase of 7,37%.

Programme 3, Public Engagement is R13,206 million which is an increase of 35,13%.

Lastly, Programme 4, Members' Support is R53,315 million which is an increase of 3,01%.

The summary per economic classification is as follows:

Compensation of Employees will increase by R15,261 million, which is a 24,15% increase from the revised estimate of R63,188 million, to R78,449 million in 2019/2020. This increase relates to the provision for salary adjustments and the changes to the structure and phased in implementation of the Functional Enhancement Project.

The Goods and Services budget shows an increase of 4,5% from R30,783 million in the 2018/2019 revised estimate to R32,191 million in 2019/2020. This minimal increase in Goods and Services budget is as a result of the net effect of the provision made for inflationary increases, the increase in the base line of the LSS funding earmarked for sector specific programmes relating to the establishment of the Sixth Parliament, continued enhancement, maintenance and licensing of the Enterprise Resource System, training and

development and the reduced provision made for the ERP Project which was concluded in the 2018/2019 Financial Year.

Included in the Goods and Services budget is an inflationary increase for the members' enabling allowances and a 15,94% increase on audit fees. The provision for transfer and subsidies is further broken down as follows:

The minimal increase of 7,14% in Departmental Agencies and Accounts budget from R28 000 to R30 000 is due to the estimate provided for television licence fees. Under Foreign Government and International Organisations, R299 000 has been allocated for the payment of subscription fees to the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association. There is a 0,97% or R410 000 increase in transfers to political parties which is made up of the secretarial and constituency allowances.

For the 2018/2019 financial year, National Parliament did not provide for an annual increase in the constituency allowances, which effectively meant the original figure provided for in the prepared 2018/2019 budget was more than what National Parliament provided. Taking this into account, the effective increase for secretarial and constituency allowances for 2019/2020 is 5,15%. Under Household Budgets R1,747 million provision has been made for the payment of medical aid contributions for the continuation members as well as a nominal amount thereof for the payment of incentive rewards to qualifying staff.

The Capital Expenditure budget for 2019/2020 decreases by 32,62% from the 2018/2019 revised estimates to R3,5 million to R4 million since the majority of the hardware purchases and network refresh is anticipated to be completed in the 2018/2019 financial year.

In conclusion, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament would like to thank Dr Ivan Meyer, the Minister of Finance and his Treasury team for the engagement and assistance around the compilation of the budget and his support and guidance with the implementation of FAMPLA. WCPP would also like to thank the Minister of Community Safety, Alan Winde and his Department for their assistance given to the committees of WCPP during their oversight visits.

A special word of appreciation to the Parliamentary Oversight Committee under the Chairpersonship of hon Wiley for the role he plays in ensuring and maintaining oversight over the financial management of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. At this stage it would be remiss of me not to thank the hon Uys for his insightful questions in unpacking the budget and helping to understand. Hon Uys, I will certainly miss that engagement.

I would also like to thank all our stakeholders and assurance providers, the Auditor-General of South Africa, the Audit Committee and internal audit for their oversight and advisory services. Lastly I would like to thank the Deputy Speaker, the Secretary and his entire team for their contribution, commitment and continued support. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip Wiley.

An HON MEMBER: Your last speech! Your very last speech!

Mr M G E WILEY: You wish. [Interjections.] Right, Deputy Speaker, thank you very much [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: I am not going to repeat what the Speaker said about the increases to our budget. It is a well-known fact that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is still in transition phase with the various different things that are being applied at the ERPM, functional enhancement and the like, but the Western Cape Provincial Parliament remains a beacon of hope in the South African legislative sector. It has the smallest budget by population, the smallest staff complement but it remains the busiest legislature in the sector, in oversight including that of SCOPA – and I am very sorry that once again the Chairperson of SCOPA has failed in his duty to be here to participate in this debate. [Interjections.]

The Auditor-General has confirmed in his reports that our oversight is good in this Legislature. Our public hearings processes and other legislative functions frequently follow thorough and due process [Interjections.] and we are often praised for that, but Deputy Speaker, it is another area that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is also the smallest and that is that their

quantum of MP's in this Chamber here is also the smallest per capita in the province.

In 1997 when the final Constitution was ratified by the Constitution Assembly and I had the privilege of actually having been a member of that Constitution Assembly, the Western Cape was given 42 members for a population of 4,2 million people.

In 1998 the Western Cape Constitution, we being the only province in this country that fulfilled its obligation of creating a provincial constitution, we entrenched that line in our Constitution that we have 42 members. [Interjections.] So we have another step to cross if we want to change it.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, it will change.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is a fact that the residents of any province are entitled to their fair share of public representation in order for their needs to be serviced and for oversight and to be able to be a thermometer to go into the communities to find out what is going on. For that we do need to have more public representatives. Since 1998 this province has grown to, I understand, today was corroborated as 6,8 million. Now if one takes the rough rule of thumb that was used previously of one representative per 100 000 then that would increase this Chamber from 42 to 68 members.

Efforts by the DA governing party to get the ANC to agree to a change in the

Western Cape Constitution began in 2015. First they dragged their feet. Then they said they were waiting for Secretary-General Mantashe at the time to take a decision on the matter and then in the post-Zuma area everything just died through decision paralysis as is so often the case with so many things of the National Department [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Just collapsed.

Mr M G E WILEY: This has to happen sooner rather than later.

An HON MEMBER: You are very unhappy.

Mr M G E WILEY: Western Cape Provincial Parliament and the Western Cape Government must start to take steps now to prepare for this reality. I am absolutely convinced that the need is greater than ever to increase the numbers and I get the impression from discussions the other side recently that they too want to see the numbers of this Legislature increased. But Deputy Speaker, there are some other threats as well.

The one is the independence of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament as an institution. The Legislative Sector Bill that they wanted to bring about is a centralisation of efforts, having a bargaining chamber with regard to all the staff complements right around the country, with the Speaker of the National Assembly being in charge and being seen in the superior capacity, for instance, to the individual Speakers of the legislatures.

There is a standardised rules and procedures threat. And a single staff roster which may well mean that if they like the clerk of papers over here, the Limpopo Government can demand that that person be sent over there. In other words, we are not able to select our staff to the level and standard that we require here and may I say that our staff and I'll get onto it in a second, are second to none.

Then there is the role of the National Council of Provinces. The National Council of Provinces exists because of the provinces, not despite the provinces. It is there to be a voice for the provinces and to protect the provinces, not to be there to rubber stamp the National Assembly and to run simply as they see fit. Currently there is chaos in the ANC factions on the other side and that has rubbed off [Interjections.] on the ability [Interjections.] of the scheduling and the programming of the NCOP. And I will give you an example [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You want example? You want [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen to what he says! This is an example!

Mr M G E WILEY: Yesterday [Interjections.] in fact this morning [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjections.] order [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...I received from the Acting Secretary [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You still at the conspiracy theory!

Mr M G E WILEY: ...a letter that was sent [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The war is over! [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...through relating to the agenda for a plenary on Thursday. Thursday! Our programme was set six months ago for our budget process. Yet, on Thursday they have got almost 30 items that they are going to try and rush through in a plenary on the other side. Denying us the opportunity to be represented as a province with regard to Bills, with regard to considerations and reports, a whole host of things [Interjections.] There are about 1-2-3-4, there are four Section 76 legislations there for which we are entitled to go and voice our opinion.

An HON MEMBER: Then go there.

Mr M G E WILEY: But the unfortunate thing is that they [Interjections.] treat us with such an afterthought, they often tell us the day in advance [Interjections.] about important bills that are in the other House [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order members [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And we are not able to select special delegates for those important debates and bill processing [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Shame, hon Wiley. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Well, the unfortunate thing is, coming from a communist, that is perfect because [Interjections.] in a communist country they do not have elections! They do not have multiple parties! They have no processes for passing legislation! [Interjections.] They pass legislation [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...by dictate!

An HON MEMBER: Order yourself, member.

An HON MEMBER: The cold war is over.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yep, well please will someone get the coffee to [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order[Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...go to his direction so he can also understand that communism is over and the Cold War is over! [Interjections.] There is not a

country on the face of the earth that has succeeded under communism. The only thing that has happened is about 100 million people have died as a result of it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: For parliamentary community!

Mr M G E WILEY: The NCOP is being rendered irrelevant and a threat to the existence of the provinces and becomes also an anti-Western Cape forum for those provinces that are so inadequate they cannot run their own affairs.

An HON MEMBER: Are you sure? [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: I would like to speak about the Western Cape staff, if I may, Deputy Speaker. They remain an outstanding and professional body of people and we wish Mr Adams well, the incoming Secretary. Our Western Cape staff are dedicated to law making, frequently questioning both national and provincial bills. We do send it back on occasion to the departments, tell them to please alter things or bring about amendments. Our public hearings are extensive and thorough. More so than any other province [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you sure?

Mr M G E WILEY: ...and we frequently hear about this in the NCOP [Interjections.] where bills fail because it is pointed out that negotiating mandates and final mandates have not even been put to the committees. They

never even had a public hearing. In fact, fraudulent activity has occurred on occasion.

An HON MEMBER: Problems!

An HON MEMBER: And we do not hear a word [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: To all - from the senior management to the long serving staff and ordinary members doing essential services, thank you for your services. The lawyers, the translators, the catering staff, the Table staff, Hansard, the committee section [Interjections.] the HR service offices, IT, public education and relations and the paper staff. If I have left anybody out, I apologise. Also to South African Police Services and the parliamentary provincial staff who keep us safe, and especially the serjeant-at-arms. Thank you very much for [Inaudible.]. [Applause.]

I want to especially mention one individual and that is Alwyn Poggenpoel who is always in my office [Interjections.] making sure that I have done my work or giving advice with regard to the Order Paper. Alwyn, thank you very much. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

To my own caucus staff, I also thank you for ensuring efficient service that has seen five years of generally well run and busy programming. I would loathe to single out anyone, but I would like to mention Noreen Schulde and Belinda Sickle, who work constantly with the other political parties and

members and thank them very much for their work in that regard. Lastly Deputy Speaker and on a rather otherwise note [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You still have minutes. You can go [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The Speaker has referred to the Rules changes which are going to be in front of us on Thursday [Interjections.] This applies to all members. Congratulations, first of all as far as members are concerned, to Masizole Mnqasela, on getting his post graduate diploma yesterday at LSS, which is one of the positive things [Applause.] that WCPP do make available for the members. But we can change the Rules every day of the week all day if we wish. If the members ignore them individually or collectively, they are meaningless. In [Interjections.] my experience in politics we have to change the system of representation at this sphere.

An HON MEMBER: Correct. Let us hear.

Mr M G E WILEY: There are too many members who are not honourable, nor dedicated to public representation [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you talking about [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Their failure in this last budget, the failure to pay debt, a normal debt, like for instance when you owe something for lost equipment or for instance you say you are going to go on a public outreach or public

hearings and you do not arrive or you make use of the parliamentary transport and then you do not sit in the hearings – you are liable like anybody else for incurring that debt!

The fact that there are four members, some dating back to 2016, is not only unheard of but disgraceful and if it was not for the spotlight that I have put onto it – and the rest of my committee put onto it in the last couple of months, it would have been double that amount. None of them [Interjections.] may I say, on the right hand side, my right hand side of the House here, thank you very much for that [Interjections.] There is also a total disrespect for the House and WCPP procedures and we have seen this where the Registrar has routinely gone and stood on the doorstep of members' offices, asking them, pleading with them to do their ethical and moral responsibility with regard to declaration of interest, which they fail to do, and the House has censured some members in this regard. But the arrogance displayed by members in this regard is frightening! Absolutely frightening!

An HON MEMBER: Do not shout. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And then I suppose [Interjections.] stronger weaknesses. Just use the same words with less anger.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja. Hy is baie [Onhoorbaar.] 31:52

[An HON MEMBER: Yes. He is very [Inaudible.]]

Mr M G E WILEY: In fact, the last member that speak is the epitome of what I would call a person who is a dishonourable member. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Patent dishonesty is a hallmark.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order Chief Whip. I think that is a direct reference to a member of this House, which can be identified as a member of this House. So, that would not be parliamentary to call a member not [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Well, Deputy Speaker, if that hon – as you know, I cannot see very well these days. I only heard a voice. Not sure who it was [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ah please man!

Mr M G E WILEY: So I just said it was a patently – that individual, but if that person would like to identify themselves then I will withdraw. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Member Wiley, can I ask you this way, did you refer to a specific member of the House by calling him dishonourable? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, he did not mention it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If that is so, then that is unparliamentary
[Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Deputy Speaker, if you are alluding to the fact that I mentioned hon Cameron Dugmore, then answer is “yes” and I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just because we stand up to your bullying, you do not like us. That is it. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Well, talking about – let us talk about bullying. When three members pack up and attack an elderly visitor to this Parliament in crude and rude language – and he wants to talk about bullying! That is the epitomy of a disgraceful, dishonourable behaviour. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You know, and the thing that gets me, Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] the thing that gets me is that there is this constant referring that we do not take responsibility individually. It is a collective responsibility. Well I want to tell you something, I hope that my successor takes individual responsibility. I take responsibility for everyone of the

members here! [Interjections.] If they stuff up, I will take responsibility for it [Interjections.] that is the role of a Chief Whip. There is no such thing as collective responsibility [Interjections.] There is only something called [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: There is only something called common purpose and when I was – bad old days – when people packed together [Interjections.] and literally gang raped people or collectively burnt them with tyres, then they went to court because they said, they were charged under common purpose and that is what I am talking about. There is no such thing as collective responsibility. You either are individually responsible because that is what the law recognises or [Interjections.] it was common purpose, in other words, it was a “sameswering”. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Lastly [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...in conclusion [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member, just one second. [Interjections.] Order!

Hon Lekker [Interjections.] Order! Please come to order now. [Interjections.] I am talking specifically, hon Lekker, hon Dijana and hon Makeleni [Interjections.] Hon Lekker, I have just mentioned your name, please refrain from making comments now. You may continue.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. In conclusion, Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Hi, you must conclude indeed.

Mr M G E WILEY: I would [Interjections.] I would really ask that whoever sits in the corridors of power in future, that they relook at the system of public representation [Interjections.] I would suggest that they dust off the study that was done by Van Zyl Slabbert. We have got to develop public representatives who are there for public representation, not there for the salary package [Interjections.] and that we have like in the ward system, we have also at provincial level people who are geographically representative. So that the people can [Interjections.] recognise and understand who represents them [Interjections.]

In this election campaign I come across it on a daily basis where people say, who is my public representative? Who is my parliamentarian? And that is because people are not prepared to stand up there and take ownership of the career of public representation as being a politician, restore it to its honourable state that it should be and to go out there and to be proper public representatives and to be answerable for the role they play. Instead people

hide as much as they can and I am speaking [Interjections.] generally because I want to say as a last point [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But you have stopped almost a [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...is that it has been an absolute revelation to work with my own colleagues who are not that sort of public representative. Who are prepared to be accountable [Interjections.] Who do work with the communities [Interjections.] Who do hold projects in the communities and can be considered to be upholding the honour that public representation should be [Interjections.] I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Good riddance from everybody, thank [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I want to see the hon Uys but there is too much communication across the floor. [Interjections.] Hon Uys. I see the hon Uys. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you for that input from the Speaker. In the 10 minutes I would like to respond to hon Wiley, but hopefully I will get to that. I just want to reflect on the five last years [Interjections.] and specifically on some of the staff issues, and here I really want to thank the staff. They worked extremely hard.

The staff that remained behind – some staff left, and I do not think this

House really understands and knows the difficult circumstances that this staff work under. We know the accommodation has not been increased and there has been a growing number of the staff here, so let me thank each and every one of the staff members. Those that were here the last five years. Those that remained here, and specifically also their families, because we could see them going through a very, very difficult period, and I am not going to go into detail, but I would like to highlight some of the issues here.

We first had an Acting Secretary and here I must say, thank you to Mr Hinde. I think it is the fourth time in these five years or something like that, you are acting here. I mean it is uncalled for and unasked and you will get it at any other Parliament.

Ms Fakira was appointed in February 2015. Very soon after that, hon Deputy Speaker, she came in August out with her report and really reflected on the staff and how bad it is going with the staff. And I am not going to reflect on it. It was quite a substantial report, but she was saying that there is an increasing incidence of fatigue, burnout of staff, sick leave are increasing and there is the decline to meet standards and timelines. That was very bad. That was in 2015. The end of 2015, it was so bad for the Deputy Secretary, that she resigned here end of 2015. Ms Fakira, the Secretary to Parliament, consequently had to go the same route because of that. That was in January 2016. That was just in that short period of time. And you can see the instability that was created here.

Then there was a Secretary appointed and I really referred to the Secretary many, many times here, and it is not personalising it. In February 2016, there was a Secretary appointed without any due process. No consultation. No advertising. No transparency and that individual was appointed till now 31 March 2019. By the way, it is interesting to see that a Secretary take leave in the last month of employment.

Also strange, hon Deputy Speaker, was a Secretary appointed on a 7/8 contract. You will never find it. You will never get it anywhere – I want to say – in the world. And what we also experienced here, Deputy Speaker, what the Chief Parliamentary Officer – and he was also at that stage the Acting Secretary because he had to carry that action of burden alone, resigned.

The Manager, ICT, resigned. The Manager, Public Education and Outreach, resigned. But worse, Deputy Speaker, none of those posts were filled and that is the pressure that we see that emerges and that is on the staff here. And then even to add to this uncertainty that is happening within the Provincial Legislature, in September 2018 the PriceWaterhouseCoopers' report of R1,5 million in terms of organisational restructuring was released. And in that report 38 posts would have been abandoned here and people would have lost their jobs.

Now, you can understand what uncertainty that caused. Again the wrong management of a report. [Interjections.] Yes, that report was eventually in November 2018 abandoned. None of the issues of the

PriceWaterhouseCoopers' report of R1,5 million was implemented [Interjections.] and really that caused demotivation, uncertainty and put major pressure on staff and of course their families.

It is behind this background that I would like to thank all staff and I wish you well. I would like to say, have faith. There is a new dawn. There is a new dawn coming [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to [Interjections.] I would like to deviate just very [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shh!

Mr P UYS: ...very, very briefly before getting to the budget itself. [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, the MPL's and the size and number of this Provincial Parliament – we all know there is due process. This Legislature cannot just go about and say we want to change our Constitution. There is due process via the national legislative sector, and I know you started more towards the end and that time was not sufficient to really do it, but to create the impression there were ANC members here that were not cooperating! This is not an island. This is not a federal state. You cannot just change what is happening here and have a national constitution, but I think there was a will here, a will from all sides here to say, let us take it forward. So, let us put that into proper perspective. [Interjections.]

The next one that was raised here, hon Deputy Speaker, was that the NCOP and the issues in the NCOP. The NCOP – I do not understand what is the

issue at hand? Legislation comes here. There is a timeframe. We attend to it. But Deputy Speaker, the last legislation we had here around the National Gambling Amendment Bill, there was not one member of the DA, that is supposed to be here, because they are the majority in the Western Cape, in terms of that legislation. I would even say it is illegal because that person was not here, but we continued.

Not at one of the sessions – not at the hearing, not at the discussion, not at anything that would [Inaudible.] of that year. Then hon Deputy Speaker, there was also referred to debt and there is always a reflection on members of the ANC. If there is debt, the debt must be managed via the administrative processes. If there was no proper administrative processes, where they had legion opportunity for the member to put his or her case why it happened. And we all know, sometimes there is an outreach programme in Citrusdal or wherever the case may be, and there is miscommunication or there could be miscommunication. Therefore it is important just to not only point fingers at hon members here, but really to also understand what is the issue at hand.

And then hon Wiley referred to the declaration and really, people, just do not ignore it. The last report we received from the Registrar [Interjections.] was that all members, “all”, and I am including the DA – 42 members [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You just passed a report that cannot go on [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: ...all 42 members timeously by before 30 April declared their interest. So, I do not know why he is casting aspersions on [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Who are you talking about?

Mr P UYS: ...on members that are sitting here and that is a major problem that we see [Interjections.] and a major concern that I need to express. I want to briefly get to the budget and again, hon Deputy Speaker, we see that not all the money is spent in the last financial year. Again R3 million had not been spent, but Deputy Speaker, worse! We picked up now in the budget as the Parliamentary Oversight Committee, errors in the budget. This is the budget in front of us, hon Deputy Speaker, but no effort to put an errant in the ATC. Nothing. I saw today the Premier did that. I mean you cannot go forward with mistakes and not even try to rectify it after it has been pointed out to you. That is what is happening.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Speaker, referred to the R750 000 transfer from the legislative sector, but when asking the Speaker in this House, for what will that R750 000 be used, there was no answer. We will come back to you. How can your budget have R750 000 and you do not know what you are going to use that money for?

There is also the issue around what hon Wiley referred to as the independent, almost like, legislature and this big brother or this big something out there. The Parliament that is going to influence, impact here. We asked that

question, hon Deputy Speaker.

Legal services in this budget will increase by 63%! 63%! And the reason why? On the one hand we get praise for the legislative sector, so-called good work that is happening there. We participate and we like to participate and the next moment we say, we put more money aside, we are going to fight national in terms of the issues that is coming to the fore [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the allocation to political parties. The Speaker tried to explain, I do not think it is a fair, reasonable, good answer that she actually reflected because we referred to the Blue Book here. There is only an increase of 0,97% to political parties. We must break it down. We must go look at the adjustment estimate, the revised estimate and the new estimate that we find here. 0,97% increase to political parties and that is to cover services, increase in rent, increase in salaries.

Again a total disjuncture of what is happening in the office of the Speaker and what is happening on the ground with political parties and how they need to address it. But let me give you another example of what is really happening in this Legislature and let us refer to a very simple thing that I hope we all can very easily understand and associate with and that is catering services.

Hon Deputy Speaker, can you believe this? Can the House believe this? There is not a dedicated or a designated service provider for catering? I mean that

is a simple thing. [Interjections.] For catering. So. Any committee, if there are four committees or 10 committees, the staff must go out on a quote of three for each and every single committee. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr P UYS: Now, you can think for yourself what is happening to this staff. What they must do is [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must be embarrassing!

Mr P UYS: They must go out. So, if there are four committees [Interjections.] there are three tenders for each one. Every single day. Every single committee [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No wonder there is [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: And now we can see how absurd this is, a waste of time of staff, additional security vetting and how do you do quality control? [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must be embarrassed [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: ...last one. [Interjections.] The hon Speaker referred to accommodation [Interjections.] We took a decision on accommodation. We said we want to look at the third floor, but nothing is happening. [Interjections.] There is nothing in the budget. Speaker, if you look at the fourth floor, and I do not know what the fifth floor looks like, it is in a mess. It is not being maintained and kept up, but hon Deputy Speaker, and I am going to conclude there [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, when there was a problem with your car, I believe there was a cockroach in your car the other day [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Cockroach!

Mr P UYS: What did you do?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: What did you?! You had the car, a full valet. You hired the Mercedes Benz for three days [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A cockroach? A cockroach!?! Oh!

Mr P UYS: ... but here we as members [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: ...here we as members [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P UYS: ...we do not get any services and they are cramped up in offices
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. On that note we must stop the debate
[Interjections.] Order. [Interjections.] The Speaker [Interjections.] Order.

An HON MEMBER: The Boere [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can I apologize on behalf of all of us to hon Joseph for
being objecting to you for hon Wiley. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That is the frivolous point of order. I see
the Speaker, to respond. [Interjections.] Order. Hon Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Deputy Speaker, I would just like to again object to the
fact [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: ...that the ACDP and the EFF are once again missing from this important Vote [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are correct. [Interjections.] I see the Speaker, to respond. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: We apologize [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no need.

Mr K E MAGAXA: We made a serious error!

The SPEAKER: In conclusion I wish to thank all the members of the House for their cooperation and active participation in the matters affecting the [Interjections.] Provincial Parliament. The hon Uys reminded everybody during the Parliamentary Oversight Committee meeting, last committee meeting [Interjections.] on the budget, that one should not take criticism levelled at the administration personally and that it is done in the spirit of oversight responsibility of members. I fully agree with him on that score.

Allow me then, in the spirit, to share a few observation of how this oversight responsibility was exercised by certain members over the past four years. Nothing personal, of course. [Interjections.] Pepping of corridor gossip as

gospel, that the functional enhancement process will result in job losses in the WCPP. Truth is, that the functional enhancement process resulted in additional jobs of the establishment to ensure better services to our members, with not a single staff member losing his or her job as a result of functional enhancement.

Accusations of closing the democratic space in the Legislature. Truth is that the biggest closure of the democratic space happened when the Premier was not allowed by members [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Awh!

The SPEAKER: ...to deliver her State of the Province Address in 2015 as a result of [Inaudible.] busting of the worst kind in true EFF style. [Interjections.] The Western Cape Provincial Parliament has successfully concluded the review of the Rules, which hopefully will better regulate the democratic space, going forward.

†'n AGBARE LID: Moenie *worry* nie hoor [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Do not worry, hey [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Some of the most peculiar and sometimes bizarre interpretations of the Standing Rules. [Interjections.] I suppose the Afrikaans saying that †“in die land van die blindes is eenoog koning” [in the land of the blind the one-eye is king] [Interjections.] best describes the particular

situation.

The revelation of a scandal of epic proportions in the office of the Speaker regarding irregular expenditure, the procurement of a Gatsby from Petty Cash and the huge fall out [Interjections.] yet another – I never ate it! I never purchased it. I never tasted it. Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why not? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yet another [Interjections.] yet another clean audit, but let me, Mr Deputy Speaker, talk to the sheer hypocrisy of this very ANC who will take the Speaker's office to task for a Gatsby, yet in their ranks they have members who owe this very institution money but they will not exercise oversight over their own members. [Interjections.] Fearmongering by members that the parliamentary administration is on the brink of collapse because of the loss of senior staff [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Or is it because there is no back bone?

The SPEAKER: Staff being under enormous stress and not well paid at all. Truth is that we have a solid administration, ready to respond to the challenges of the Sixth Parliament.

What is even more interesting, Deputy Speaker, is that people who have left this institution are actually now applying for positions to come back here. So

it cannot be such a bad place after all. [Interjections.] Our staff are well remunerated and a significant [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Your response was predetermined yes, for sure!

The SPEAKER: ...number of internal staff have been appointed to senior positions in the administration after a rigorous recruitment [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, it is a take-over [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You know you are so predictable, I can call you out on everything you do, thank you.

An HON MEMBER: That is called paying somebody [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The SPEAKER: I could actually prepare a speech – after four years I know this man so well. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The SPEAKER: Same old, same old. Help me to understand please, unpack this [Interjections.] it is the same story man, come on! [Interjections.] Significant however, is [Interjections.] Well you should go to that

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...and see what it is about.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Speaker, I want to protect you. [Interjections.] I want to protect. You may continue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Significant however is that in March 2009, and I need not to remind the members here, in 2009 WCPP had a vacancy rate of 26%. This has been brought down to the current 3.2% of funded vacancies. So much for a collapsing administration. [Interjections.] But as the hon Uys says, nothing personal, all in the spirit of our members doing our jobs. Let us do vigorous oversight. By the way we are the only legislature in this country subjected to scrutiny to this extent. I can tell you that in other legislatures the Speaker of the House presides over the Parliamentary Oversight Committee.

†'n AGBARE LID: Ag nee!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh, no!]

The SPEAKER: We are the only legislature that does not do that. We cannot be the judge and jury [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must speak up [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: So, let us talk about this. Then the hon Uys talks about my being a professional traveller and I was quite worried [Interjections.] I thought now, he travelled with me to Los Angeles on a trip what was he talking about? So I did some research and low and behold Mr Deputy Speaker, I stumbled across a media article that talks to a certain Mr Shaun Byleveld who was forever travelling and apparently spent more time out of the country [Interjections.] than at work. It says, “he visited 52 countries in less than 4 years. So hon Uys, your comment about a professional traveller pales into insignificance. [Interjections.] Again the sheer hypocrisy of the ANC. You want to call this side of the House up [Interjections.] sweep before your own door before you sweep somewhere else. [Interjections.]

Then the fire rationale, the catering. [Interjections.] There is a long term catering service contract on the way. Hansard, all of the other stuff we have dealt with. I am not going to go there.

Mr P UYS: So I did not say anything about that [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The [Inaudible.]55:34 travelling, you will step down now. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Magaxa [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: I thought you are [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am not going anywhere, thank you. [Interjections.] I know you are going somewhere, but I am not going anywhere.

An HON MEMBER: Enjoy your journey before I move [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Professional travellers.

The SPEAKER: I just want to get to my last little bit, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] I think it is important to thank the Secretary, in his absence, Dr Lawrence for very ably assisting WCPP together with its stalwart team of staff for steadying the ship this last three years. [Interjections.] We can certainly say that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is the best parliament in the country and very soon we will be the best in the Southern Region [Applause.] And we will become the best parliament on the continent because we have the right people to make it happen.

I also want to thank every staff member, every service provider and stakeholder for ensuring the Western Cape Provincial Parliament delivers on its mandate. I would also like to thank my office staff for their support over the last some 58 months. They have gone the extra mile to ensure that the office of the Speaker runs smoothly.

Finally, Mr Deputy Speaker, I wish to express my immense gratitude and

appreciation to you. You have acted as a coach and mentor to me. You have shared freely and guided me through moments of sheer terror and for that I thank you. [Interjections.] Your knowledge, experience and contribution to the sector is immense. And you will be sorely missed, I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. On that note we conclude the debate on this vote.

An HON MEMBER: But what about Wiley? You forgot. What about Wiley?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The House will just suspend for a brief while and then restart with the next order. The House is suspended.

An HON MEMBER: You will not [Inaudible.] Wiley.

[Business of the House was suspended at 17:42 and resumed at]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the seventh Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration and finalisation of the Western Cape Commissioner for Children Bill [B4 B - 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I do not have a speakers' list but there is an

opportunity for declarations of vote if parties do want to take up the opportunity. From the ANC's side, hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, this is actually a victory for the people of the Western Cape who could not accept that the Premier of this province could stand up in 2009 and promise a Children's Commissioner. One year went by, a second year went by, a third year went by and it was clear that there was no intention on the part of Premier Zille or the DA to actually establish a Children's Commissioner [Interjection.]

Mr D MITCHELL: Starting since 1994.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: When you were in government.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and this, like the Environmental Commissioner was based on the fact that they did not want the attention of the public to be cast on the plight of children in our province... [Interjection.]

Mr D MITCHELL: That is just untrue.

Mr M G E WILEY: How long did the Child Justice Act take?

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...this in a province where we all know so what happened was that through the pressure brought to bear by the ANC, by the Opposition parties here, we continually raise this issue. Then there was a very subtle and underhand attempt to actually make the appointment of this Commissioner not compulsory, in other words to make it discretionary, which was simply yet another delaying tactic. We went out on public hearings across the province and there was an unequivocal mandate from those public hearings... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are searching for answers really... [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...both in support of the Children's Commissioner and the Environmental Commissioner. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There is nothing they said... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are confused. That is all. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: And out of that particular process increasing pressure was born to actually appoint this Children's Commissioner. In fact it is an indictment that we meet here just a couple of days from the last session of this Legislature and as much as we are going to be approving this legislation after the process we have undertaken, we will not actually have appointed a Children's Commissioner before the end of this term. So that effectively

means that the Premier on behalf of the DA made a promise ten years ago, which has not actually physically been realised through the appointment of that Children's Commissioner. [Interjections.]

Mr D MITCHELL: It started in 2004. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is her legacy.

Mr C M DUGMORE: But we should celebrate the fact that in the new term we will appoint a Children's Commissioner and I think that is one of the reasons also why... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, we are, yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...why the ACDP has got a particular problem with the way the DA has governed this province because it was them in those initial discussions around the Provincial Constitution that motivated very strongly for a Children's Commissioner... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It was started by the ACDP.

Mr D MITCHELL: But it did not go on a public hearing! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: But the DA has effectively ignored that so I think we literally have a situation where the trauma of our children, the rising

gangsterism, the rising abuse of children actually lie at the door of this DA...

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That continues. That continues. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...who for ten years failed because we all know that if the Premier had honoured her promise, we would have had a spotlight on children. [Interjections.] There would have been a spotlight on children. [Interjections.] There would have been an integration of our responses to the province affecting children so that ten years - a wasted ten years - lies completely at the door of this Democratic Alliance... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But you were not at the public hearings! You were not at the public hearings hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...and it is the legacy of the DA's Premier Helen Zille... [Interjections.] And in fact this province remains in defiance of that Constitution by still not having an Environmental Commissioner. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: So we welcome this, it is a victory for the people of the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member your time... [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: ...because the ANC failed.

Ms L J BOTHA: Your time is up.

Mr C M DUGMORE: We need to move to get the best possible Commissioner appointed, without fear or favour... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Mitchell. [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor-hoor-hoor! Hoor-hoor-hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear-hear-hear! Hear-hear-hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA.

Ms L J BOTHA: And you know that song [Inaudible.] You were not even there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where is the Chairperson of the Committee?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is none of your business.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oh no, know what is happening here. Are you not the Chairperson of the Committee? [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The member was in the committees but he is still [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr D MITCHELL: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The PREMIER: I have only got three minutes to speak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: Member Gopie was there. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You have to behave yourselves!

The PREMIER: First of all, let me make a very clear prediction, that however hard the Children's Commissioner works and whatever they do within their constitutional mandate, tragically children will continue to be raped and murdered and shot in this province. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh my word!

Mr C M DUGMORE: How cynical; how absolutely cynical.

The PREMIER: And there is nothing cynical about that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You should have kept quiet [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Because there is absolutely nothing in the powers of the Children's Commissioner that can prevent that or even bring to book the perpetrators. [Interjections.] That lies with different institutions. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: That is arrogance!

The PREMIER: That is the first thing. The second thing is that the powers defined in the Constitution are so loose and most of them are already fulfilled by other institutions... [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: They vote against this. .

The PREMIER: ...that when this was brought to my attention, like all sensible people, when the circumstances change I change my position.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Sensible! Sensible!

The PREMIER: Every rational human being in the world does that...
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You failed, Premier.

The PREMIER: Otherwise evidence would make no difference.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And through your failure children are dying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, please!

The PREMIER: The very fact that the ANC never ever instituted the thing that they had wailing about proves the point.

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Exactly!

The PREMIER: The disingenuousness and the hypocrisy is all on the other side. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It must be a pain.

The PREMIER: Then it comes to Mr Winston Erasmus and ANC Youth League leader... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It does not matter who he is, it is the issue he is raising.

The PREMIER: ...who is a new advocate and whose case was kicked out of court. [Interjections.] Here is a man, here is a man who poses on the internet with a set of rifles and guns, who shoots beautiful animals dead for fun and he is the person... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay you are diverting now. Come to the Children's Commissioner.

The PREMIER: He is the person who takes us to court demanding an Environmental Commissioner. [Interjections - speaking simultaneously.]

The hypocrisy is mind-boggling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P MAKELENI: You are worried about the animals and not about our children that die every day.

The PREMIER: There are scores of institutions under the Child Justice Act, which by the way took eight years - eight years for the ANC to promulgate, which is the framework legislation for all of the institutions that now exist to protect children. We will create another one, not because it is in any way going to add value to all of the others, but because it is constitutionally required and we are a party of the Constitution and the rule of law.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Oh so you say ten years later.

The PREMIER: You never did it. So the bottom line is this: there are scores of institutions... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There is nothing about it [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: There are scores of institutions. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is hypocrisy.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Premier, just finish... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: There are a range of organisations doing precisely what the Children's Commissioner would do.

Mr C M DUGMORE: In principle they vote against the [Inaudible.] of this Bill.

The PREMIER: And we will not vote against this Bill... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay! Wow!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Because constitutionally, constitutionally we are now bound given the fact that the ANC would not help us amend the Constitution.

Mr D G MITCHELL: And the Environmental Commissioner as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Premier. Your time has expired. Order! That concludes the declarations on this Bill. Are there any objections to the Bill being finalised? No objections? Agreed to.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is mutatis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Commissioner for Children Bill [B4 B - 2018].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the next order, the eighth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the National Credit Amendment Bill [B30 - 2018] ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Legislature received the report of the Standing Committee on Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture on the National Credit Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate was sent to the NCOP.

Do parties want to make declarations of vote? I will see the ANC first, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. As ANC we have always welcomed the introduction of this Bill because we know that the majority of our people, particularly the poor and lower income earners are always affected directly and indirectly by unhealthy lending that is ending up impacting on the whole family. There comes a time that Government must intervene to protect its people and this is that time, because the big banks,

the five main banks have refused to play the ball and allow a process where they participate mutually with our people in this process. BASA confirms this by refusing to change the current system and even warning us about the possible big volume of debt intervention applications that could be received. What is wrong with that when people are applying for that? We must remember that these banks at some stage were refusing to open bank accounts for the majority of our low income earners in South Africa.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, oh yes.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It took many campaigns by different sectors of the society led by the South African Communist Party that we saw new packages and bank accounts from the banks being opened with the focus to low-income earners. This is what we are doing in South Africa if we enact this. It is not something new that has not been done in other places. It has been done in the UK using the Debt Relief Order. It has been done in India where millions benefited from government intervention, so as ANC we are supporting this particular Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA, hon member Simmers.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The National Credit

Amendment Bill which seeks to provide for broad debt intervention in South Africa is a problematic piece of draft legislation which the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape does not support. It is now a shock to hear now that the ANC actually suddenly supports it after they had concurred with us in the Standing Committee.

An HON MEMBER: You are confused. [Interjections.]

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, this Bill is fraught with inconsistencies and a number of contradictions with existing legislation, which brings into question numerous matters pertaining to both the borrowing and lending of funds between parties in South Africa and the powers assigned to the National Minister responsible for these activities.

We do not support the Bill for the following reasons:

- (a) It is a contradiction with Section 25(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa which deals with property rights.
- (b) The Bill's extinguishment measure in Section 87(a) will interfere with property rights in a manner which constitutes a deprivation of a property as outlined by the Constitution.
- (c) The Bill, through debt intervention procedures will arbitrarily deprive credit providers of their rights which will not be procedurally and substantively fair.
- (d) The Bill assigns the National Minister with the power to make

regulations as debt intervention measures to alleviate household debt which provides too broad powers and too much discretion and is tantamount to giving the Minister legislative powers.

- (e) The Bill contradicts the National Credit Act of 2005 by excluding refugees and asylum seekers from protection instead of applying to all consumers who are natural persons, regardless of nationality and immigration status.
- (f) And finally, the Bill discriminates against married couples by being exclusive of spouses married in community of property with a combined household debt of R50 000 or more.

With this in mind it is clear that the National Credit Amendment Bill is both in contravention of provisions outlined by the Constitution, problematically blurs the line between the National Minister and Legislature and does not remain consistent with the existing National Credit Act. It is for this reason that the Bill needs to be revised. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Democratic Alliance therefore does not support this Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill?

There is an objection. I will then put the question, those in favour will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ayes have it. The ANC’s objection will be recorded.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I hope you understand the implication of this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the next order, the ninth Order of the Day.

Mr S G TYATYAM: You should be understanding; you should be...

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the National Public Health Institute of South Africa Bill [B16 D - 2017] ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Legislature received the report of the Standing

Committee on Community Development on the National Public Health Institute of South Africa Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate was sent to the NCOP. Is there a need for declarations from parties?

If not, then I will put the question: any objection to the question being agreed to? No objection? Agreed to.

The report is therefore agreed and the Secretary will read the next order, which is Order number 10.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on the National Land Transport Amendment Bill [B7 D - 2016] ratification of final mandate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The Legislature received the report of the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works on the National Land Transport Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate was sent to the NCOP. Is there a need for declarations by parties?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the ANC first. Who is the ANC? Hon member Dugmore, if you do know about it, but you must do it now.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It seems it is sprung on you now.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it is indeed unfortunate that we have a situation where a piece of legislation which is actually going to assist in regard to public transport and in regard to what needs to happen on our roads and in public transport generally... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What needs to happen?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Sorry?

Mr M G E WILEY: What needs to happen?

An HON MEMBER: He does not know. He is trying to work it out.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: He is trying to work it out. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I was just interrupted by the Chief

Whip.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You were doing well up to that point.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can he just repeat what he was saying?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja-ja, sit down, sit!

Mr C M DUGMORE: So I think that at the end of the day those that are actually going to indicate their opposition as clearly the DA members of this House actually are, they at the end of the day need to accept responsibility for actually standing against progress in regard to public transport, the regulation of driver behaviour, the regulation in fact of the e-hailing, which has become so critical to our public transport, to our system of transport. The reason they have given, I think, are not convincing and effectively what we have here is this inability to be anything else but a blame-and-complain kind of party whereas in fact all of us should be united together in making sure that this legislation actually helps our overall system of transport and public transport in particular. So that is why we will be supporting this Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Just like you are managing Transport.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA? Nobody? Hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Ja, thank you, thanks Mr Deputy Speaker. On 14 March when the Standing Committee on Transport and Public Works was in session it took a decisive and a final solid mandate that it does not support the Amendment Bill. Thanks.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Why? You have got no reason?

Ms L J BOTHA: You were there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferment of authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill? There is an objection. I will then put the question, those in favour will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it and the ANC’s dissent will be recorded. The Secretary will read the last and the 11th Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Finance on the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B–2018] ratification of final mandate.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The ANC supported the Bill, they said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Legislature received the report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the Infrastructure Development Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate was then sent to the NCOP.

Is there a need for a declaration from parties, hon Uys?

Mr P UYS: Which one are you referring to hon Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is number 11.

Mr P UYS: Number 11 is the National Gambling Amendment Bill, the back page of the Blue... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, I think my [Inaudible.] that I am using here is wrong.

Mr P UYS: Can the Table just - the blue page?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. [Interjections.] I will then repeat myself then and say that the name of the Bill is the National Gambling Amendment Bill.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. From the side of the ANC we support this. This is really tightening down on illegal gambling and strengthening that. Just a couple of motivations, what is in the Act, so if the DA votes against this piece of legislation they are also voting against tighter control on illegal gambling. Banks will be required to stop business with any proven illegal gambling operator. It is not there now. This will be in. Once illegal gambling operations are proven, the inspectors will also advise landlords to lawfully evict the illegal operators from the premises. This is new. It was not there in the previous one.

“Required operators to remove excluded persons from their mailing list”, meaning people that is not allowed to gamble they cannot get a mailing list, meaning not to entice them to go and gamble.

The next one is to “beride the automatic forfeiture of unlawful winnings to the National Gambling Regulator.” It was not there. They had to go via a court process. Now, “no, sorry, if it is illegal we take your money.”

Section 10(A) which empowers the National Gambling Regulator to keep a register of unlawful gambling operators and also that the said operator will be disqualified for five years from applying even for a licence to operate - an excellent process.

There is one that we do not agree with and we put that forward. That is an amendment to Section 63(A) and that states that the Gambling Policy Council - the National Gambling Policy Council in the first meeting - if they do not have a quorum, the second meeting if there is still not a quorum, and the same issue is on before them, then they can move ahead. We cannot agree with that.

I have told the Department upfront it is unconstitutional. You cannot have a quorum for one set and then the next round there is no quorum. We support this Bill. We think it is a good Bill but we must be objective, not reject the total Bill, we reject the amendment and the addition of clause 63(A) to that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Provincial Parliament received the Bill called the National Gambling Amendment Bill [B 27B-2018] referred to the Standing Committee in terms of Rule 220. The Committee decided to advertise for public hearings. Many stakeholders in the gambling industry participated with oral and written submissions, including the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board and the Western Cape

Provincial Treasury.

The amendments referred to the following:

- Replacing the National Gambling Board with the National Gambling Regulator;
- Replacing the current non-functional Gambling Board with the CEO and an administration. The board is currently under administration for the last four years.
- To increase law enforcement in the provinces with a National Inspectorate Unit. It is one of the amendments.
- To change the quorum of the National Gambling Council from five provinces out of nine provinces to a Minister and one MEC, in other words should there be no quorum at the next meeting a Minister with one MEC - hon member Uys have agreed here, the ANC, that is undemocratic to accept that.
- To introduce a new Central Electronic Monitoring System.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the intention of the Bill is to strengthen and enhance applicable legislation. It is not to strengthen or influence political power. The Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board and its operation is a good governance model in the Western Cape. More law enforcement from National Government or the National Gambling Board may lead to duplication whilst the motive is to channel unlawful winnings from provinces to the National Gambling Regulator. Gambling is a law enforcement function of provincial

and national legislatures. It is the concurrent function, and the Western Cape says that unlawful winnings must come to the Western Cape Revenue Fund.

Under the Gambling Act or the proposal of five provinces as being a quorum, we support that with the ANC and the ANC did not support the DA on the rest of the proposals but I think I have news for hon member Uys. It went back to the NCOP and three ANC provinces supported the DA in the Western Cape forcing the NCOP to refer the National Gambling Amendment Bill back to the next Parliament. So the DA did not support it and that is a victory for us. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Since there is an objection to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape's delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill, the ANC is dissenting, I put the question, those in favour will say "aye".

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against "no".

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC's dissension will be recorded.

That then brings us to the end of the business for the day. Before we adjourn

may I just remind members the House will sit at ten o'clock tomorrow morning.

That concludes the business of the House today. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:07.